



Gowland, Penny A. and Glover, Paul (2014) Comment on ICNIRP guidelines for limiting exposure to electric fields induced by movement of the human body in a static magnetic field and by time-varying magnetic fields below 1 Hz. *Health Physics*, 107 (3). p. 261. ISSN 1538-5159

Access from the University of Nottingham repository:

<http://eprints.nottingham.ac.uk/29565/1/static%20field%20limits%20response%20letter.pdf>

Copyright and reuse:

The Nottingham ePrints service makes this work by researchers of the University of Nottingham available open access under the following conditions.

- Copyright and all moral rights to the version of the paper presented here belong to the individual author(s) and/or other copyright owners.
- To the extent reasonable and practicable the material made available in Nottingham ePrints has been checked for eligibility before being made available.
- Copies of full items can be used for personal research or study, educational, or not-for-profit purposes without prior permission or charge provided that the authors, title and full bibliographic details are credited, a hyperlink and/or URL is given for the original metadata page and the content is not changed in any way.
- Quotations or similar reproductions must be sufficiently acknowledged.

Please see our full end user licence at:

http://eprints.nottingham.ac.uk/end_user_agreement.pdf

A note on versions:

The version presented here may differ from the published version or from the version of record. If you wish to cite this item you are advised to consult the publisher's version. Please see the repository url above for details on accessing the published version and note that access may require a subscription.

For more information, please contact eprints@nottingham.ac.uk

Michael T. Ryan

Editor, Health Physics Journal
Editorial Office
219 Barnacle Circle
Lexington SC 29072

Dear Mr Ryan

We are dismayed by the way in which ICNIRP have apparently used our 2007 paper (Glover *et al.*, 2007) to draw up its the recent Guidelines on low frequency magnetic field exposure (Ziegelberger, 2014). It appears that these Guidelines are going to be incorporated into the EMF Directive and made legally binding within the 28 member countries of the European Union without further scrutiny (Directive 2013/35/EU See Article 11(2) (2013)).

The guidelines' limits aimed at preventing vertigo are based entirely on our paper, which was effectively the first in the field, and which has not been replicated by anyone else. Although we stand by our data, it was a very small study, and the lines on figure 1 of the guidelines have been drawn about single data points from a single subjects at two frequencies (Ziegelberger, 2014). This seems to be a remarkably flimsy basis on which to make international guidelines.

However we are keen to point out that there was a more serious problem with using that data in this way. At the time we wrote the paper we proposed that the dominant mechanism was induced electric currents. However, as ICNIRP noted in the new guidelines, this mechanism has been questioned by Roberts who proposed a Lorentz force mechanism (Roberts *et al.*, 2011). Crucially ICNIRP apparently failed to realise that this Lorentz force mechanism depends on the amplitude and direction of the field, whereas the induced current mechanism depends on the absolute rate of change of field. In our experiment we asked subjects to move their head at high field: this would induce an electric current and would have also produced a Lorentz force, so our previous data was consistent with both mechanisms.

We have now carried out further studies that support Roberts' Lorentz force mechanism (Antunes *et al.*, 2012; Glover *et al.*, 2014; Mian *et al.*, 2013). Furthermore the new mechanism explains the previously anomalous observation of apparent vertigo-type effects in small rodents which are physically too small to be able to develop sufficient current densities in their heads to cause nerve excitation (Haupt and Haupt, 2010).

It now seems likely that the perceptual effects of the changing Lorentz force are the primary reason why movement causes vertigo. Unfortunately this does not lead to neat, frequency-dependent limits that can be dovetailed with other limits. We propose that at the current stage of knowledge, a practical way to limit the experience of vertigo would be to accept some disconnect in the limits, and simply apply the previous static field limit. I.e. 2 T for uncontrolled exposure and 8 T for controlled exposures.

Yours Sincerely

Professor Penny Gowland

Dr Paul Glover

School of Physics and Astronomy

University of Nottingham (UK)

References

- 2013 DIRECTIVE 2013/35/EU OF THE EUROPEAN PARLIAMENT AND OF THE COUNCIL: on the minimum health and safety requirements regarding the exposure of workers to the risks arising from physical agents (electromagnetic fields).
- Antunes A, Glover P M, Li Y, Mian O S and Day B L 2012 Magnetic field effects on the vestibular system: calculation of the pressure on the cupula due to ionic current-induced Lorentz force *Physics In Medicine And Biology* **57** 4477-87
- Glover P M, Cavin I, Qian W, Bowtell R and Gowland P A 2007 Magnetic-field-induced vertigo: A theoretical and experimental investigation *Bioelectromagnetics* **28** 349-61
- Glover P M, Li Y, Antunes A, Mian O S and Day B L 2014 A dynamic model of the eye nystagmus response to high magnetic fields *Physics In Medicine And Biology* **59** 631
- Haupt T A and Haupt C E 2010 Circular swimming in mice after exposure to a high magnetic field *Physiology & Behavior* **100** 284-90
- Mian O S, Li Y, Antunes A, Glover P M and Day B L 2013 On the Vertigo Due to Static Magnetic Fields *Plos One* **8** e78748
- Roberts D C, Marcelli V, Gillen J S, Carey J P, Della Santina C C and Zee D S 2011 MRI Magnetic Field Stimulates Rotational Sensors of the Brain *Curr Biol* **21** 1635-40
- Ziegelberger G 2014 ICNIRP GUIDELINES: For Limiting Exposure to Electric Fields Induced by Movement of the Human Body in a Static Magnetic Field and by Time-Varying Magnetic Fields Below 1 Hz *Health Physics* **106** 418-25