A comprehensive review on e-commerce research

Vivian Khoo, Aidi Ahmi, and Ram Al-Jaffri Saad

Citation: AIP Conference Proceedings **2016**, 020069 (2018); doi: 10.1063/1.5055471 View online: https://doi.org/10.1063/1.5055471 View Table of Contents: http://aip.scitation.org/toc/apc/2016/1 Published by the American Institute of Physics



Get 30% off all print proceedings!

Enter Promotion Code PDF30 at checkout

A Comprehensive Review on E-Commerce Research

Vivian Khoo^{1, a)}, Aidi Ahmi^{2, b)} and Ram Al-Jaffri Saad^{2, c)}

¹Kolej Matrikulasi Perlis, 02600 Arau, Perlis, Malaysia. ²Tunku Puteri Intan Safinaz School of Accountancy, Universiti Utara Malaysia, 06010 Sintok, Kedah, Malaysia.

> ^{a)} vivian@kmp.matrik.edu.my ^{b)} Corresponding author: aidi@uum.edu.my ^{c)}ram@uum.edu.my

Abstract. Based on the review on the available literature sources, this paper comprehensively discusses the identified studies which have been done in the context of e-commerce adoption. Seventy-three (73) papers have been extracted from Elsevier's Scopus database. Those papers were analyzed based on the distribution of publication, the scope demography, the research approach and research method and the adapted theory or conceptual framework. The result of the study found that publications in e-commerce research rose to peak year in 2015. Most of the e-commerce adoption studies were carried out in Southeast Asia (26%) and determining factors of e-commerce adoption was the most popular theme across region. Despite of its popularity, the findings were inconclusive in terms of specific determinants that significantly contributed towards e-commerce adoption. However, it is found that variables from the organizational context and external environment context significantly contributed towards e-commerce adoption. Most of the studies preferred quantitative approach (71.2%), especially in employing questionnaire methods. The result of the theory analysis reveals that the most frequently used conceptual framework was TOE framework, while many studies (24.7%) did not take into account of specific conceptual framework. Only a few researchers (11%) had used self-developed conceptual framework rather than existing framework. In term of scope, majority of the studies focused on the factors that encourage ecommerce adoption. Such limited scope of studies efforts could only provide a partial understanding of the diffusion process. Future research shall go further to investigate the post-adoption stages of e-commerce. The limitation of single database and keywords might fail to give more extensive retrieved number of articles in the study.

INTRODUCTION

The Internet has changed the business environment and further created opportunities for businesses throughout the world. The worldwide development in information technologies has introduced the electronic commerce (ecommerce) phenomenon. Although the Internet was common among the public in 1994, e-commerce became a phenomenon in developed countries only by 2000. A great number of businesses in the United States and Western Europe started to represent their services online and public started to purchase goods and services over the Internet using secure connections and electronic payment services. The overwhelming public attention and rapid use of the internet over the years has contributed much in facilitating electronic commerce in global business environment [1]. Now, e-commerce is growing rapidly, affecting all industries in terms of changing the business model of organizations [2].

E-commerce has a great deal of advantages over the "brick and mortar" shopfront. Effective e-commerce adoption is beneficial to organizations in terms of substantial cost savings, revenue maximization, and improvement in product delivery and customer service [3]. Therefore, e-commerce is a significant area for research due to its potential positive impact on business performance. Prior studies have empirically confirmed the factors affecting e-commerce adoption [4], [2]. However, much is not known on the overall review on e-commerce adoption studies, as this review has not been done by previous studies. Thus, the novelty feature for this study is the fact that it is the first attempt to comprehensively review on the previous studies on the e-commerce adoption studies. Therefore, this study's approach is unique as it focuses on examining the prior studies published in Scopus databases. Hence the novelty of this work stems from the fact that it is essential to not only investigate the determinants and barrier of e-

Proceedings of the 3rd International Conference on Applied Science and Technology (ICAST'18) AIP Conf. Proc. 2016, 020069-1–020069-10; https://doi.org/10.1063/1.5055471 Published by AIP Publishing. 978-0-7354-1734-2/\$30.00 commerce adoption but also any other relevant issues in e-commerce adoption process. Substantial understanding of activities and factors associated with existing e-commerce adoption are important to guide future e-commerce preadoption, during implementation and post-adoption efforts and to suggest directions for further research in the field.

The structure of this paper is as follows: section two illustrates the background of e-commerce adoption framework. Section three discusses the method. Section four analyses the findings and the last section conclude the paper and present the limitation and future direction of the study.

E-COMMERCE ADOPTION FRAMEWORK

According to [3], there are two adoption frameworks underpinning the e-commerce adoption research, namely diffusion of innovation (DOI) and technology acceptance model (TAM). The five factors of DOI (relative advantages, compatibility, complexity, trial-ability, and observability) imply that the traits of an innovation itself would determine its adoption. On the other hand, technology acceptance model (TAM) views that the extent of technology acceptance is affected by two key determinants, namely perceived usefulness (the extent of belief that application of particular system would enhance ones' job performance) and perceived ease of use (the extent of perceived difficulties and challenges in using a particular system). However, due to the limitation of these two determinants in explaining various external contextual influences, TAM has been extended (such as TAM2, TAM3 and Unified Theory of Acceptance and Use of Technology [UTAUT]) through introduction of additional external variables to further improve its predictive power [5].

Despite of well received in adoption studies, DOI and TAM share mutual limitations [5]. Similar to TAM, DOI also focuses on technology perspective and therefore unable to take into account of various external contextual influences (the organizational and environmental perspectives). Furthermore, both models examine technological determinants that may influence e-commerce adoption at an individual level. Therefore, it is difficult to explain the organization top managements' perception on IT. Furthermore, the decisions to adopt innovative technologies into organization are bureaucratic, subject the consensus of the management and board of directors of the organization rather than individual end user.

Being consistent with DOI, Technology-Organization-Environment (TOE) framework has been widely applied in business research as well [3]. TOE could explain an owner's intention to adopt e-commerce from the perspectives of technological, organizational, and environmental contexts. The technology context describes both internal technologies (the existing practice, equipment and technological infrastructure possessed by the organization) and external technologies relevant to organization. The organization context refers to the resources, scope, size, culture, and structure of the organization, employees' knowledge of e-commerce and role of management; while the environment context includes management support, organizational and national readiness, government support, and environmental pressures derived from partners, customers and competition. TOE framework has been proved to be a useful theoretical model in explaining and understanding user behavior in technology implementation through extensive empirical support [4].

METHODS

A search has been conducted in the study using Elsevier's Scopus database for E-commerce adoption studies that were carried out between the years 2011-2016. Figure 1 indicates the selection process of the articles reviewed in the study. The rationale of using Elsevier's Scopus database is due to its wider coverage of journal range, offering about 20% more coverage than Web of Science in keyword searching and citation analysis [6]. The keywords used for the search were as follows: [title (e commerce) and title (adoption)]. The selection has been limited to articles and conference papers between the years 2011-2016 by setting [doctype (ar or cp) and pubyear>2010]. The search for articles has been conducted in November 2016. Accordingly, there is a total 106 research articles which are relevant with e-commerce adoption in one way or another. These publications have been filtered to only full-text articles that can be accessed and 88 publications have been obtained eventually.

Next, the full text publication being narrowed down based on the inclusion and exclusion criteria. Inclusion criteria consists of articles that present the e-commerce adopted within business firms and articles which have proposed and tried to validate proposed research models or frameworks empirically. Meanwhile, exclusion criteria consist of articles which are only conceptual paper or review paper, articles which listed e-commerce as keyword, but were in fact discussing about m-Commerce and t-Commerce. Finally, a total of 73 relevant studies has been

obtained for literature analysis. The literature analysis is based on full text reading and uses of Microsoft Excel for documentation and summary purpose.



FIGURE 1. Selection Process of the Articles

RESULTS

The data collected is presented according to the distribution of publication between year 2011 to 2016, the demography of the studies; the research approach and research method and the adapted theory or conceptual framework. The analysis is conducted to identify literature gap that will provide direction for future research.

The Distribution of the Year of Publication

The distribution of journal articles and conference papers between year 2011 and 2016 in the area of e-commerce adoption is shown in Table 1. The number of publication has been stable from 2011 to 2016 except for a significant fall to the extent of below a total 10 articles in 2013 and 2014. It started to increase and peak for the following year in 2015 with 16 publications. It is expected that the number of publication indexed in Elsevier's Scopus database for 2016 is subject to further moderate increase as there will be articles which are not in full text access yet in November 2016 or in coming publication issues.

Year	Number of Publication	Percentage (%)
2011	14	19.2
2012	14	19.2
2013	8	11.0
2014	9	12.3
2015	16	21.9
2016	12	16.4
Total	73	100.0

TABLE 1. Distribution of Publication by Year

The Scope Demography of Studies

Researches on e-commerce adoption have been studied worldwide both in developed and the developing countries. The analysis of the literature from the perspective of geographical context provides would provide further understanding on the focus or theme of studies being conducted in different region. Therefore, differences of between the research themes of regional areas could be highlighted.

Comparative study across geographical region received the least focus (merely 4.1%) [7], [8], [9]. The themes of comparative studies were not similar with the themes that were popular in other geographical region. For instance, [7] investigates common critical success factors for e-commerce system in SMEs in Australia and China within the setting of service industry. Instead of studying various variables that render to e-Commence adoption, [8] employs social network classifiers to predict e-commerce adoption. [9] compares the B2B e-commerce adoption process of the grocery industry in Indonesia and Bahrain, which are relatively different in social, economic, cultural, political, legal and technological context.

TABLE 2. Distribution of Geographical Context of Studies				
Geographical Region	Number of Publication	Composition (%)		
Africa	8	11.0		
America (5 from the US, 1 from Canada and 1 from Chile)	7	9.6		
Australia	1	1.4		
Comparison/Combination Across Region	3	4.1		
Middle East	18	24.7		
Other Asian	8	11.0		
Southeast Asia	19	26.0		
United Kingdom and Europe	9	12.3		
Total	73	100		

TABLE 2 Distribution of Geographical Context of Studies

As shown in Table 2, most of the e-commerce adoption studies were carried out in Southeast Asia, contributing 26% of the selected articles for this literature analysis. Most of these researches [10], [11], [12], [13], [14], [15], [16], [17], [18], [19], [20], [21], [22] in the Southeast Asia focused on driving factor of e-commerce adoption, except for minority that respectively investigated readiness for e-commerce adoption [23], [24], [25], e-commerce adoption level [26], barrier of e-commerce adoption [18], and post-adoption performance and business impact [27]. The popularity in studying the determinants that contribute to the implementation of e-commerce implies that the firms in developing countries are in demand for e-commerce to fulfil their business need [10]. Furthermore, this phenomenon suggests that not only academician but business owners and management in Southeast Asia are well aware of the strategic value of e-commerce, being willing to engage in adoption as well as investigation of e-commerce.

TABLE 3. Scope of the E-Commerce Adoption Studies in Southeast Asia, Middle East, Africa and Other Asian Countries

Theme	Southeast Asia	Middle East	Africa	Other Asian Countries
Assessment of e-commerce adoption	1	2	1	0
Barrier of e-commerce adoption	2	4	3	1
Driving factor of e-commerce adoption	13	13	4	4
Performance and business impact	2	0	0	1
Readiness for e-commerce adoption	3	0	0	0
Required organization capabilities	0	0	0	2
Total	21	19	8	8

It is found that variables from the organisational context and external environment context significantly contributed towards e-commerce adoption. This is the mutual findings of the studies conducted in Southeast Asia. Nevertheless, it is not conclusive in terms of which specific factors from these contexts are the determinants for e-commerce adoption. This is because despite of the similarity of underlying theoretical framework (majority adapted TOE framework) of the studies, academicians have adapted different variables, varying from the range of minimum 5 item of variables [21] to the extent of 20 item of variables [12]. An only common factor from the organisational context that can be recognised is the role of management.

Also, the number of studies in Middle East was close to that of Southeast Asia. E-commerce adoption studies in this part of the world had the same trend with Southeast Asia. Driving factor of e-commerce adoption has received much attention in the pre-implementation stage (refer to [28], [29], [30], [31], [32], [33], [34], [35], [36], [37], [38], [5]). However, it is interesting to note that none has been studied under the theme of evaluation of performance and business impact.

Number of studies from other Asian countries and African countries were almost equivalent. The scope of studies conducted in Africa focused on driving factor of e-commerce adoption [39], [40], [41], [42]. Besides, it seems that the scope on the barrier of e-commerce adoption [43], [44], [45] was also fairly attractive for researchers in Africa. Likewise, to Africa and Southeast Asia, studies in other Asian countries, such as Sri Lanka, Taiwan and China, focused on driving factor of e-commerce adoption [46], [47], [48]. In contrast to other developing countries, some of the Asian countries have already initiated to evaluate e-commerce from the resource-based perspective, focusing at the required organizational capabilities at the stages of pre and post-implementation. For examples, Cui and Pan's process model [49] demonstrated that the predominant competitive environment at each phase of e-commerce adoption requires a particular focal capability. From the investigation of the importance improvisational capabilities (the alignment between the environment and the capability) on the outcome of e-commerce adoption,

[50] found that Taiwanese companies learn to use e-commerce more creatively through improvisation, and in turn contribute to higher performance.

On the other hand, as shown in Table 4, developed countries such as Australia, European countries, and North America had relatively lower percentage of studies which focused on the determinants of e-commerce adoption [51], [52], [53], [54], [55], compared to 57.9% of that conducted in Southeast Asia. The themes of research were much more diversified. Explicit differences include the extension of study towards the driving factors of non-adoption [56], [57], development and validation of novice theoretical model (eCAM, the e-commerce attraction model) [58], and the potential interdependency between m-Commerce and e-commerce [59]. Furthermore, contrasting to studies in Southeast Asia which only assessed the adoption level of e-commerce, the studies of that in developed countries were much more advanced as they have extended into the scope of adoption level improvement [60].

TABLE 4. Scope of the E-Commerce Adoption Studies in Developed Countries				
Theme	America	Australia	UK and	Percentage
			Europe	(%)
Driving factor of e-commerce adoption	1	0	4	27.8
Comparison of theoretical model	1*	0	0	5.6
Development of e-commerce theoretical model	1	0	0	5.6
Interdependency between m-commerce and e-commerce	1	0	0	5.6
Driving factor of e-commerce adoption	1	0	2	16.7
Improvement of e-commerce adoption	0	0	1	5.6
Assessment of e-commerce adoption	0	1	1	11.1
Performance and business impact	3	0	1	22.2
Total	8	1	9	100

*Including a study from Chile (developing country)

The Research Approach and Research Method

Table 5 presents the distribution of research approach and research method applied in e-commerce adoption studies. It indicates that the studies preferred quantitative approach (71.2%), especially in employing questionnaire methods (51 out of 52 quantitative studies). There were various means to deliver questionnaire to targeted sample, such as via in person, fax, mail, e-mail, social media and delivered hardcopy. Online survey was the most common method than hardcopy survey as it could ensure quick response from the respondents and efficiency in data collection.

On the other hand, qualitative approach covers 17.8% of selected review. Most of the selected studies investigated respective research questions through multiple case studies [61], [62], [19], [21], [63], [38], [64]. Due to the limited number of qualitative studies in e-commerce adoption, future research in this area would be recommended to adopt qualitative approach of data collection. This is because further qualitative studies would enhance the understanding of the view of stakeholders regarding adoption, during implementation and post-implementation issues of e-commerce. For instance, case study method would be particularly useful when the investigated phenomena are within the context of the participants' perspectives and experiences are complex and social in nature [62].

TABLE 5. Research approach and research method of the studies analyzed				
Research Method/Research Approach	Mixed	Qualitative	Quantitative	
Case study		7		
Focus group		1		
Interview		2		
Secondary data		1	1	
Secondary data and interview	1	2		
Questionnaire			51	
Questionnaire and focus group	2			
Questionnaire and interview	4			
Questionnaire; interview; secondary data	1			
Total	8	13	52	

The least used approach in the selected studies (11%) was the mixed approach. Similar with quantitative approach, the questionnaire method was the dominant instrument employed. This is evident from Table 5 as 7 out of

8 mixed approach studies combined the instrument of questionnaire with another method [65], [30], [43], [54], [7] [5]. Furthermore, [31] even combined the use of the questionnaire, interview and secondary source of data.

The Adapted Theory/Conceptual Framework

There are many theories that are widely used in e-commerce adoption. They could be classified into 4 categories: technological frameworks, organizational and managerial frameworks, environmental and cultural frameworks, and interactionism frameworks [5]. The result of the analysis presented in Table 6 reveals that the most frequently used conceptual framework was TOE framework. This model is originally constructed by Tornatzky and Fleischer in 1990 to examine contextual factors and it has been widely used in Internet-based innovation adoption studies [5]. Table 6 also indicates the minority of past researchers (11%) had used self-developed conceptual framework rather than existing framework. On the other hand, many studies (24.7%) did not take into account of specific conceptual framework.

Theory/Conceptual Framework	Frequency	Percentage (%)
No model	18	24.7
TOE	16	21.9
Self-developed model	8	11.0
DOI	3	4.1
Stage model of e-commerce adoption	3	4.1
TAM	2	2.7
TAM and TOE	2	2.7
Theory of planned behavior (TPB)	2	2.7
Business Environment framework	1	1.4
Combination of various models	1	1.4
DOI and National Institutional Perspective (NIP) theory	1	1.4
DOI and TAM	1	1.4
E-commerce Business Satisfaction model	1	1.4
EDI and TOE	1	1.4
Inter-organizational Systems adoption process model	1	1.4
Network based classification techniques	1	1.4
Organization Information Processing Theory	1	1.4
Resource-based theory	1	1.4
SOG and TOE	1	1.4
Stakeholder Theory	1	1.4
Structuration theory (3 dimensions of interactions)	1	1.4
TAM (subset)	1	1.4
The European Union e-commerce impediments framework	1	1.4
TPB and TOE	1	1.4
TPB and TRA	1	1.4
Treatment effects model	1	1.4
UTAUT and PERM	1	1.4
Total	73	100

TABLE 6. Analysis of adapted theory/conceptual framework

CONCLUSION

Despite of the claim regarding the uneven diffusion of the Internet and e-commerce between developed world and poor developing countries [5], most of the e-commerce adoption studies (26% of the selected articles) were actually carried out in Southeast Asia (developing countries). Therefore, it seems that digital divide concerns no longer relevant in recent years as businesses in developing countries have taken the opportunity offered by ecommerce. Nevertheless, contrasting to studies in Southeast Asia, the studies in developed countries were much more advanced as they have started to seek for adoption level improvement. Post-implementation stage of ecommerce has begun to receive attention in developed countries while studies in developing countries still focused on pre-implementation stage of that.

Despite of the popularity of the research theme of determinants of e-commerce adoption across regions, the findings are inconclusive due to the difference of variables being studied in researches (even though the same

conceptual framework was employed) and the difference of context of studies. However, it is found that variables from the organizational context and external environment context significantly contributed towards e-commerce adoption.

It is found that the majority of the selected studies in this literature analysis has been based on a single perspective (at the adoption stage), particularly focused on the factors that encourage e-commerce adoption. Albeit the importance of the understanding towards the behavior or decision regarding 'intend to adopt or not' and 'adoption versus non-adoption', such efforts can only provide a partial understanding of the diffusion process and therefore suggesting a need for a further exploration of the post-adoption stages [5]. Future research shall go further by moving beyond the classical intention and adoption decision that looks at determinants of extent of use to take into account for various stages in the adoption process from the initial adoption to post-implementation of e-commerce system.

There are some limitations in this literature analysis. Since the study has used "e commerce" and "adoption" in the search for articles and conference papers from the Elsevier's Scopus database, studies which use the other interchangeable keyword such as "implementation" are therefore excluded from this literature analysis. This limitation possibly has minimized the retrieved number of articles in the study. Besides, the limitation of single database might not give more extensive number of related papers.

REFERENCES

- 1. L. Fernandes, "Fraud in electronic payment transactions: Threats and countermeasures," Asia Pacific Journal of Marketing and Management Review, **2**, 3, pp.2319–2836 (2013).
- 2. M. Esmaeilpour, S. Y. Hoseini, and Y. Jafarpour, "An empirical analysis of the adoption barriers of Ecommerce in small and medium sized enterprises (SMEs) with implementation of technology acceptance model," Journal of Internet Banking and Commerce, **21**, 2, (2016).
- 3. D. Libu Paris, M. Bahari, N. A. Iahad, and W. Ismail, "Systematic literature review of E-commerce implementation studies," Journal of Theoretical and Applied Information Technology, **89**, 2, pp.422–438 (2016).
- 4. A. A. Abualrob, and J. Kang, "The barriers that hinder the adoption of e-commerce by small businesses: Unique hindrance in Palestine," Information Development, **32**, 5, pp.1528–1544 (2016).
- 5. M. Aldwsry, and P. Mayhew, "E-commerce adoption and utilisation in developing countries: An exploratory investigation from a GCC country". In IADIS International Conference Information Systems 2011, pp. 249–254 (2011).
- 6. M. E. Falagas, E. I. Pitsouni, G. A. Malietzis and G. Pappas, "Comparison of PubMed, Scopus, Web of Science, and Google Scholar: Strengths and weaknesses," The FASEB Journal, **22**, 2, pp.338–342 (2008).
- 7. M. Wu, R. Jewell and E. Gide, "An eyeball diagram: Illustrating the common CSFs in e-commerce business satisfaction for successful adoption of e-commerce systems by SMEs," International Journal of Electronic Customer Relationship Management, 6, 2, pp.169–192 (2012).
- 8. T. Verbraken, F. Goethals, W. Verbeke and B. Baesens, "Using social network classifiers for predicting ecommerce adoption," In *Proceedings of the WEB 2011: E-Life: Web-Enabled Convergence of Commerce, Work, and Social Life*, edited by Shaw, M. J., Zhang, D., Yue, W. T., Lecture Notes in Business Information Processing, 108 (Springer, Shanghai, China, 2011), pp. 9–21.
- 9. S. Kurnia and M. Ali, "B2B e-commerce adoption by the grocery industry in developing countries: Indonesia versus Bahrain," In *The 45th Hawaii International Conference on System Sciences* (IEEE, Hawaii, USA, 2012), pp. 3100–3109.
- 10. S. C. Lim, A. S. Baharudin and R. Q. Low, "E-commerce adoption in peninsular Malaysia: Perceived strategic value as moderator in the relationship between perceived barriers, organization readiness and competitor pressure," Journal of Theoretical and Applied Information Technology, **91**, 2, pp.228–237 (2016).
- 11. L. S. Chee, B. A. Suhaimi, and L. R. Quan, "Understanding the determinants of e-commerce adoption: Evidence from manufacture sector in West Malaysia," Indian Journal of Science and Technology, 9, 10 (2016).
- S. K. Yeng, A. Osman, Y. Haji-Othman and M. Safizal, "E-commerce adoption among small and medium enterprises (SMEs) in Northern state of Malaysia," Mediterranean Journal of Social Sciences, 6, 5, pp.37–43 (2015).
- 13. S. Z. Ahmad, A. R. Abu Bakar, T. M. F. Tengku Feissal and K. A. Mohamad Zaki, "An empirical study of factors affecting e-commerce adoption among small-and-medium-sized enterprises in a developing country: Evidence from Malaysia," Journal Information Technology for Development, **21**, 4, pp.555–572 (2015).

- 14. A. H. M. Sobihah, and Z. M. Lukman, "Organizational culture mediates between E-commerce adoption and hotel performance," Mediterranean Journal of Social Sciences, 6, 2, pp.61–66 (2015).
- 15. S. Kurnia, C. Jyoti, R. Md Mahbubur and B. Alzougool, "E-commerce technology adoption: A Malaysian grocery SME retail sector study," Journal of Business Research, **68**, 9, pp.1906–1918 (2015).
- M. M. Poorangi, E. W. S. Khin, N. Shohreh and A. Kardevani, "E-commerce adoption in Malaysian small and medium enterprises practitioner firms: A revisit on Rogers' model," An. Acad. Bras. Ciênc., 85, 4, pp.1593– 1604 (2013).
- S. P. John, 2012. How online trust influence B2C e-commerce adoption? An empirical study among Asian online shoppers. In *18th Americas Conference on Information Systems 2012*, (AMCIS, Seattle, USA, 2012) 5, pp. 3699–3710.
- R. Govindaraju, D. R. Chandra and Z. A. Siregar, "Stakeholder role in e-commerce adoption by small and medium enterprises," In *Proceedings of the 2012 IEE 6th International Conference on Management of Innovation and Technology* (IEEE, Bali, Indonesia, 2012), pp.430–435.
- 19. Y. Y. Maryeni, R. Govindaraju, B. Prihartono and I. Sudirman, "Technological and organizational factors influencing the e-commerce adoption by Indonesian SMEs," In 2012 IEEE International Conference on Management of Innovation and Technology (IEEE, Sanur Bali, Indonesia, 2012) pp. 436-441.
- 20. L. Van Huy, F. Rowe and D. Truex, "An empirical study of determinants of E-commerce adoption in SMEs in Vietnam: An economy in transition," Journal of Global Information Management, **20**, 3, pp.23–54 (2012).
- 21. R. J. Karnali and S. Kurnia, "The adoption of B2B E-commerce initiatives by the Indonesian grocery industry," In *The Pacific Asia Conference on Information Systems 2011 Proceedings* (Queensland University of Technology, Brisbane, Australia, 2011).
- 22. L. S. Thi and H. E. Lim, "Estimating the determinants of B2B E-commerce adoption among small and medium enterprises," International Journal of Business and Society, **12**, 1, pp.15–30 (2011).
- J. K. C. Chen, N. A. Windasari and R. Pai, "Exploring E-readiness on E-commerce adoption of SMEs: Case study South-East Asia," In 2013 IEEE International Conference on Industrial Engineering and Engineering Management (IEEE, Bangkok, Thailand, 2013), pp. 1382–1386.
- 24. N. C. Astuti, and R. A. Nasution, "Technology readiness and E-commerce adoption among entrepreneurs of SMEs in Bandung city, Indonesia," Gadjah Mada International Journal of Business, **16**, 1, pp.69–88 (2014).
- 25. H. Nezakati, M. Jofreh, G. W. L. Leong and O. Asgari, "Assessing e-commerce adoption by small and medium enterprises in Malaysia, Singapore and Thailand," World Applied Sciences Journal, **19**, 10, pp.1406–1411 (2012).
- 26. E. Triandini, A. Djunaidy and D. Siahaan, "Determining e-commerce adoption level by SMEs in Indonesia based on customer-oriented benefits," In 2014 The 1st International Conference on Information Technology, Computer, and Electrical Engineering (IEEE, Semarang, Indonesia, 2015) pp. 281–285.
- 27. M. Kartiwi, and T.S. Gunawan, "Assessment of e-commerce adoption benefits by Indonesian women entrepreneurs," In 2013 5th International Conference of Information and Communication Technology for the Muslim World (IEEE, Rabat, Morocco, 2013), pp. 1–4.
- 28. A. I. Al-Alawi and F. M. Al-Ali, "Factors affecting e-commerce adoption in SMEs in the GCC: An empirical study of Kuwait," Research Journal of Information Technology, 7, 1, pp.1–21 (2015).
- 29. S. A. Al-Somali, R. Gholami and B. Clegg, "A stage-oriented model (SOM) for e-commerce adoption: A study of Saudi Arabian organisations," Journal of Manufacturing Technology Management, **26**, 1, pp.2–35 (2015).
- A. A. Al-Bakri, and M. I. Katsioloudes, "The factors affecting e-commerce adoption by Jordanian SMEs," Management Research Review, 38, 7, pp.726–749 (2015).
- 31. N. Hajli, J. Sims and M. Shanmugam, "A practical model for e-commerce adoption in Iran, Journal of Enterprise Information Management," 27, 6, pp.719–730, 2014.
- 32. M. Abou-Shouk, W. M. Lim and P. Megicks, "E-commerce and small tourism businesses in developing countries: Drivers versus boundaries of adoption," *Tourism Planning and Development*, **10**, 3, pp.249–266 (2013).
- 33. M. Abou-Shouk, P. Megicks and W. M. Lim, "Perceived benefits and e-commerce adoption by SME travel agents in developing countries: Evidence from Egypt," Journal of Hospitality and Tourism Research, **37**, 4, pp.490–515 (2013).
- 34. W. Al Rawabdeh, D. Zeglat, and A. Alzawahreh, "The importance of trust and security issues in e-commerce adoption in the Arab World," European Journal of Economics, Finance and Administrative Sciences, **52**, pp.172–178 (2012).

- 35. S. Solaymani, K. Sohaili, and E.A. Yazdinejad, "Adoption and use of e-commerce in SMEs: A case study," Electronic Commerce Research, **12**, 3, pp.249–263 (2012).
- M. Ghobakhloo, D. Arias-Aranda and J. Benitez-Amado, "Adoption of e-commerce applications in SMEs," Industrial Management and Data Systems, 111, 8, pp.1238–1269 (2011).
- S. Alamro, and S. A. Tarawneh, "Factors affecting e-commerce adoption in Jordanian SMEs," Management Research Review, 64, 4, pp.497–506 (2011).
- H. Brdesee, B. Corbitt and S. Pittayachawan, "Technology for business Supporting industries as a main driving force for e-commerce adoption in Saudi Arabia," In International Conference on e-Business 2011, pp. 175–180 (2011).
- 39. R. Awiagah, J. Kang and J. I. Lim, "Factors affecting e-commerce adoption among SMEs in Ghana," Information Development, **32**, 4, pp.815–836 (2016).
- 40. A. P. Shemi, "E-commerce adoption factors in Botswana SMEs: A conceptual framework," In *Proceedings of the 7th IADIS International Conference Information Systems 2014* (IADIS, Madrid, Spain, 2014), pp. 168–175.
- 41. P. Ndayizigamiye and B. McArthur, "Determinants of e-commerce adoption amongst SMMEs in Durban, South Africa," Mediterranean Journal of Social Sciences, **5**, 25, pp.250–256 (2014).
- 42. P. Ndayizigamiye, "The influence of SMMEs internal factors on E-commerce adoption: A South African perspective," Mediterranean Journal of Social Sciences, **5**, 23, pp.246–253 (2014).
- 43. D. O. Faloye, "The adoption of e-commerce in small businesses: An empirical evidence from retail sector in Nigeria," Journal of Business and Retail Management, **8**, 2, pp.54–64 (2014).
- 44. S. Kabanda, "Power dynamics in E-commerce adoption in least developing countries: The case of Dar-es-Salaam SMEs, Tanzania." In *e-Infrastructure and e-Services for Developing Countries*. AFRICOMM 2011, edited by Popescu-Zeletin R., Jonas K., Rai I.A., Glitho R. and Villafiorita A., Lecture notes of the Institute for Computer Sciences, Social Informatics and Telecommunications Engineering, 92, Springer, Berlin, Heidelberg, pp. 218–227.
- S. D. Asare, B. Gopolang and O. Mogotlhwane, "Challenges facing SMEs in the adoption of ICT in B2B and B2C e-commerce: A comparative case study of Botswana and Ghana," International Journal of Commerce and Management, 22, 4, pp.272–285 (2012).
- 46. I. Senarathna, M. Warren, W. Yeoh, and S. Salzman, "An empirical study of the influence of different organisation cultures on e-commerce adoption maturity," In ACIS 2013: Information systems: Transforming the Future: Proceedings of the 24th Australasian Conference on Information Systems (RMIT University, Melbourne, Australia, 2013), edited by Deng, H. and Craig, S., pp. 1-11.
- 47. I. Senarathna, M. Warren, W. Yeoh, and S. Salzman, "The influence of organisation culture on E-commerce adoption," Industrial Management and Data Systems, **114**, 7, pp.1007–1021 (2014).
- 48. Y. C. Hung, Y. L. Yang, H. E. Yang and Y. H. Chuang, "Factors affecting the adoption of e-commerce for the tourism industry in Taiwan," Asia Pacific Journal of Tourism Research, 16, 1, pp.105–119 (2011).
- 49. M. Cui and S. L. Pan, "Developing focal capabilities for e-commerce adoption : A resource orchestration perspective," Information and Management, **52**, 2, pp.200–209 (2015).
- 50. H. L. Tseng, Y. C. Lee and P. Y. Chu, "Improvisational capabilities in e-commerce adoption: A multiyear comparison," Journal of Global Information Technology Management, **18**, 1, pp.48–66 (2015).
- 51. T. Guzzo, F. Ferri and P. Grifoni, "A model of e-commerce adoption (MOCA): Consumer's perceptions and behaviours," Behaviour and Information Technology, **35**, 3, pp.196–209 (2016).
- 52. I. Sila, "Factors affecting the adoption of B2B e-commerce technologies," Electronic Commerce Research, **13**, 2, pp.199–236 (2013).
- 53. L. Li, F. Goethals and B. Baesens, "Predicting e-commerce adoption using data about product search and supplier search behavior," In *The 13th International Conference on Electronic Business 2013* (Singapore, 2013), pp. 111–120.
- 54. A. Herrero and H. San Martín, "Effects of the risk sources and user involvement on e-commerce adoption: Application to tourist services," Journal of Risk Research, **15**, 7, pp.841–855 (2012).
- 55. K. Saffu, J. H. Walker and M. Mazurek, "Perceived strategic value and e-commerce adoption among SMEs in Slovakia," Journal of Internet Commerce, **11**, 1, pp.1–23 (2012).
- 56. J. H. Walker, K. Saffu and M. Mazurek, "An Empirical Study of Factors Influencing E-commerce Adoption/Non-Adoption in Slovakian SMEs," Journal of Internet Commerce, **15**, 3, pp.189–213 (2016).
- 57. J. Chaparro-Peláez, Á. F. Agudo-Peregrina, and F. J. Pascual-Miguel, "Conjoint analysis of drivers and inhibitors of e-commerce adoption," Journal of Business Research, 69, 4, pp.1277–1282 (2016).

- 58. D. E. Campbell, J. D. Wells and J. S. Valacich, "Breaking the ice in B2C relationships: Understanding preadoption e-commerce attraction," Information System Research, 24, 2, pp.219–238 (2013).
- 59. G. Madden, A. Banerjee, P. N. Rappoport and H. Suenaga, "E-commerce transactions, the installed base of credit cards, and the potential mobile E-commerce adoption," Applied Economics, **49**, 1, pp.21–32 (2017).
- 60. R. Gonçalves, J. Martins, J. Pereira, M. Cota and F. Branco, "Promoting e-commerce software platforms adoption as a means to overcome domestic crises: The cases of Portugal and Spain approached from a focus-group perspective," Trends and Applications in Software Engineering, Advances in Intelligent Systems and Computing. In *Proceedings of the 4th International Conference Software Process Improvement* (Springer, Sinaloa, Mexico, 2015), edited by Mejia J., Munoz M., Rocha Á., Calvo-Manzano J., 405, pp. 259–269.
- 61. N. Daries-Ramon, E. Cristóbal-Fransi, E. Martin-Fuentes and E. Marine-Roig, "E-commerce adoption in mountain and snow tourism: Analysis of ski resort web presence through the EMICA model," Cuadernos de Turismo, **37**, pp. 483 487 (2016).
- 62. W. Ibrahim, and K. J. Stevens, "Maturity levels for E-commerce adoption among Australian retailers," In *Proceedings of the 25th Australasian Conference on Information Systems* (ACIS, Auckland, New Zealand, 2014).
- 63. R. D. Lamie, D. L. Barkley and D. M. Markley, "Positive examples and lessons learned from rural small business adoption of e-commerce strategies," Journal of Extension, **49**, 6, pp. 1-8 (2011).
- F. Egbokhare, K. Ukaoha and S. Chiemeke, "E-commerce adoption in Nigeria," Communications in Computer and Information Science. In *Digital Enterprise and* Information Systems International Conference 2011, (Springer, London, United Kingdom, 2011) edited by Ariwa, E. and El-Qawasmeh, E., 194, pp. 78–86.
- 65. P. Freathy, and E. Calderwood, "Coping with Change: The Implications of e-commerce Adoption for Island Consumers," Regional Studies, **50**, 5, pp.894–908 (2016).