

1 2	
3	
4 5	Re-analysing Ebola spread in Sierra Leone: the importance of local level social dynamics
6	Paul Richards ^{1*} , Gelejimah Alfred Mokuwa ² , Ahmed Vandi ³ , Ebola Gbalo research team [^] ,
7	Susannah Harding Mayhew ⁴
8	
9 10	
10	¹ School of Environmental Sciences, Njala University, Mokonde, Sierra Leone
12	² Department of Agriculture and Forestry, Eastern Polytechnic, Kenema, Sierra Leone
13	³ School of Community Health Sciences, Kowama, Bo, Sierra Leone
13 14	⁴ Department of Global Health and Development, London School of Hygiene and Tropical
15	Medicine, London, United Kingdom
16	
17	
18	
19	
20	
21	
22	
23	
24	
25	
26	
27	
28	
29	
30	
31	
32	*Corresponding author
33	E-mail: <u>paul.richards1945@gmail.com</u> (PR)
34	
35	
36	
37	
38	
39	Allowbouchin of the Chele research to an is succided in the Aslandard in the Aslandard
40 41	^Membership of the Ebola Gbalo research team is provided in the Acknowledgements
42	

Re-analysing Ebola spread in Sierra Leone: the importance of local social dynamics

45 46

Abstract

47 Background

- 48 The 2013-15 Ebola epidemic in West Africa was the largest so far recorded, and 49 mainly affected three adjacent countries, Guinea, Liberia and Sierra Leone. The
- 50 worst affected country (in terms of confirmed cases) was Sierra Leone. The present
- 51 paper looks at the epidemic in Sierra Leone. The epidemic in this country was a
- 52 concatenation of local outbreaks. These local outbreaks are not well characterized
- 53 through analysis using standard numerical techniques. In part, this reflects
- 54 difficulties in record collection at the height of the epidemic. This paper offers a
- 55 different approach, based on application of field-based techniques of social
- 56 investigation that provide a richer understanding of the epidemic.

5758 *Methods*

- 59 In a post-epidemic study (2016-18) of two districts (Bo and Moyamba) we use
- 60 ethnographic data to reconstruct local infection pathways from evidence provided by
- 61 affected communities, cross-referenced to records of the epidemic retained by the
- 62 National Ebola Response Commission, now lodged in the Ebola Museum and
- 63 Archive at Njala University. Our study documents and discusses local social and
- 64 contextual factors largely missing from previously published studies.

65 66 **Results**

- 67 Our major finding is that the epidemic in Sierra Leone was a series of local
- 68 outbreaks, some of which were better contained than others. In those that were not
- 69 well contained, a number of contingent factors helps explain loss of control. Several
- 70 numerical studies have drawn attention to the importance of local heterogeneities in
- the Sierra Leone Ebola epidemic. Our qualitative study throws specific light on a
- number of elements that explain these heterogeneities: the role of externalities,
- 73 health system deficiencies, cultural considerations and local coping capacities.
- 74

75 Conclusions

- 76 Social issues and local contingencies explain the spread of Ebola in Sierra Leone 77 and are key to understanding heterogeneities in epidemiological data. Integrating
- and are key to understanding neterogenetiles in epidemiological data. Integrating
 ethnographic research into epidemic-response is critical to properly understand the
- 78 ennographic research into epidernic-response is childra to properly understand the
 79 patterns of spread and the opportunities to intervene. This conclusion has significant
- patterns of spread and the opportunities to intervene. This conclusion has significan
 implications for future interdisciplinary research and interpretation of standard
- 81 numerical data, and consequently for control of epidemic outbreaks.
- 82
- 83 (325 words)
- 84 85

86 Key Words

- 87
- 88 Ebola, West Africa, qualitative research, infection chains, humanitarian crisis
- 89
- 90
- 91
- 92

93 Introduction

94 Ebola Virus Disease (EVD) is a viral hemorrhagic fever largely spread through contact with 95 body fluids of an infected person. From its first identification from an outbreak close to the 96 Ebola river in the Democratic Republic of Congo in the 1970s there have been over 20 97 outbreaks, mainly in isolated communities in the central African forest belt. In 2013 there 98 was an outbreak in south-eastern Guinea, at the western extremity of the humid forested 99 region in West Africa. Infection rapidly spread to the neighboring countries of Liberia and 100 Sierra Leone, largely through inter-personal contact. Carers - whether medical personnel or 101 family members - are especially vulnerable to infection, through nursing the sick or 102 preparing bodies for burial. The disease became established in urban centers, and cases 103 spread to Europe and North America. A major international effort was mounted to contain 104 the West African outbreak. By the end of 2015 this effort was largely successful, though the 105 virus has resurfaced since in two parts of the Democratic Republic of Congo. To date, 106 however, the West African outbreak remains the largest on record with 28 616 confirmed, 107 probable and suspected cases and 11 310 deaths by June 2016 [1].

108

109 As the first large-scale regional outbreak the West African episode has attracted 110 considerable analytic attention. There is recognition that lessons needed to be learned 111 relevant to other potential large-scale episodes, such as the one that occurred in North Kivu 112 (DRC) [2]. Some of the key epidemiological literature on the West African outbreak deploys 113 what we will here term the standard numerical approach (for example [1], [3] and [4]). This 114 makes considerable use of multivariate statistical methods and models. Applied to the West 115 African epidemic of EVD these methods lead to the identification of numerous local-level 116 heterogeneities. Numerical methods are only as reliable as the data on which they feed and 117 collecting reliable data in the heat of an emergency response to an Ebola epidemic is far 118 from straightforward. Whether heterogeneities apparent in numerical data arise from 119 problems of data collection or complexities on the ground is unclear. Our own work, based 120 on fieldwork in two districts in Sierra Leone, the worst affected country in terms of confirmed 121 cases of Ebola, is intended to address this interpretive challenge. Our research strategy 122 seeks to reconstruct local infection chains through evidence provided by communities, using 123 ethnographic and micro-geographical data gathering techniques. Ebola spread from person 124 to person, meaning that it has an inherently social dimension. This social dimension, we will 125 argue, is key, to understanding heterogeneities in the epidemiological data. Our aim, 126 therefore, is to understand the spread of Ebola in two largely rural districts of central Sierra 127 Leone by assessing the social dynamics of infection and the implications of this for control of 128 epidemic outbreaks in many other settings.

130 Limitations of previous numerical studies

131 We examined papers using the standard numerical approach to explore data from standard 132 reporting forms and laboratory records ([1], [3], [4], [5], [6]). These papers exhibit awareness 133 of possible defects in the data set, and exercise care in reaching conclusions. Garske et al. 134 [1] remark that "unfortunately, no information on the mechanisms by which individual cases 135 enter the database was recorded, and it is therefore not possible to assess the impact this 136 has on [case fatality] estimates" (p. 7). After applying editing rules such as the elimination of 137 incomplete records, they reach a conclusion that heterogeneities are real and not just 138 artefacts of noisy data. A picture is presented of Ebola in West Africa not as a single 139 epidemic but as a concatenation of local and at times dissimilar events. We will provide 140 further (qualitative) evidence for supposing that this conclusion is sound. 141

142 The cited papers establish between them a number of broad, descriptive findings about 143 Ebola on an epidemic scale – for example, that risks of cross-infection ran in households 144 and peaked during the final course of the disease and subsequent burials, that the disease 145 affected men and women equally, and that infants and the elderly were especially 146 vulnerable. But on questions with especial significance to protection, such as whether 147 infection was due to local nursing and burial customs or more prosaic practices such as 148 cleaning beds and corpses, or whether the susceptibility of the very young and the elderly 149 was by reason of age, rather than because of body contact between infected mother and 150 child or the exercise of the special responsibilities of the elderly to the sick and dying, the 151 numerical data do not speak.

152

153 It would be good to know whether local disputes, variations in ritual practices, or bad luck 154 modified infection risks. This ambition is clearly articulated in the paper by Fang et al. [3]. 155 They surmise that "the difference in incidence rates among ethnic groups might be due to 156 their geographic locations, economic development, social behaviors, or religious traditions" 157 and propose that "further investigations are needed to elucidate this issue" (p. 4492).

158

Our own paper takes this call as its starting point. Adopting an anthropological approach, we visited a majority of nodes in the main infection chains identified by eye-witnesses and survivors in two districts, Bo and Moyamba. We then traced with these informants how the various infection chains unfolded. We identified chiefdoms and villages that had suffered contrasting outbreaks (large, small, quickly contained, long-lasting outbreaks) and for each we identified the probable index cases then sought to trace the stories of how the infection spread from these cases to infect others. This information was then cross-checked with the

- 166 Njala data base records, and with a document kept by a nurse-volunteer at the Moyamba
- 167 Ebola holding center, that records in careful detail the admission of patients and their test
- 168 results in the first phase of the epidemic. This proved helpful in confirming statements made
- by eyewitnesses but not covered in the national Ebola data base. The result of linking
- 170 quantitative and quantitative information was a richer account of local heterogeneities in
- 171 infection patterns and response that provides the basis for a wider understanding of the
- 172 issues that explain heterogeneities in epidemics.
- 173

174 Methods

- 175 The findings reported in this paper are part of a larger study (*Ebola Gbalo* Ebola Trouble)
- analyzing different levels of response community, district, national and international to
- 177 the Ebola crisis in Sierra Leone 2014-15, and the interactions between these various levels
- 178 [2]. An aim of this larger project was to assess national and local capacities for response to
- the epidemic, and to place these elements, often masked by the more highly visible
- 180 international efforts, into a broader collaborative context. Data were collected principally by
- the second and third authors at various time during 2016 and 2017. Data on the infection
- 182 chain in Niawa Lenga chiefdom were collected in 2018 by a team of three people led by the
- 183 first author (see acknowledgements).
- 184
- To understand epidemic responses, we first needed a more detailed picture of how infection chains were initiated and sustained, and how they were ended more rapidly in some cases than in others. The purpose of the work described in this paper was to establish what combinations of local factors determined the heterogenous responses to Ebola already determined to have occurred via application of the standard numerical approach. We used ethnographic techniques to elucidate the behavioral factors behind the numbers.
- 191

Ethics approval was received from the ethics review boards of the London School of
Hygiene and Tropical Medicine (Approval Reference Number 12016) and Njala University
(Institutional Review Board 2016).

195

Sample strategy and ethnographic fieldwork approach

While not possible to apply an ethnographic approach on a national scale, even in a small country like Sierra Leone, it is nevertheless important to examine how local infection chains were concatenated. How did infection chains start off, and die down, and how were adjacent chains related? This suggested a geographically focused case study might be better than a spread of randomly chosen snapshots from different parts of the country.

A further criterion was to choose a time period after the initial stages (when the epidemic was concentrated in the east of the country), but before the international response was fully ramped up, so that the functioning of local agency would be more readily visible. These criteria led to the selection of two adjacent districts – Bo and Moyamba – in the southern part of the country.

208

The propensity for EVD to move along main roads in Sierra Leone, emphasized in previous studies ([3], [7], [8]), provided the basis for our sampling strategy. We followed infection chains down the main roads crossing Bo and Moyamba Districts in the direction of Freetown, while also taking careful account of side branches connecting interior villages, where infection was blocked or rapidly terminated due to the propensity of rural communities to go into "lock down" mode when threatened by dangers. We describe key interconnected infection chains from both districts.

216

217 Members of our research team are based at Njala University, an institution with campuses at 218 Mokonde in Kori Chiefdom, in Moyamba District, and in Bo. Our group had earlier 219 undertaken fieldwork in Ebola affected communities for the Ebola Response Anthropology 220 Platform (www.ebola-anthropology.net.) in 2014-15, and so knew key localities where 221 enquiries were needed. We began with the earliest cases and traced connections from 222 these known nodes. A number of villages were identified for further investigation. We 223 checked these choices against the numbers of confirmed Ebola cases per chiefdom, and 224 then by village, in the national Ebola data base, a copy of which is archived in Njala, and as 225 a result added some places to the sample of communities where enquiries were required. 226

227 Local authorities were then notified. Community-level informed consent for our enquiries was 228 obtained in meetings held to explain the project attended by local chiefs and elders. Key 229 informants were then identified (e.g. survivors, or members of affected families). Potential 230 interviewees were asked for their individual informed consent. Village-level informants were 231 sometimes keen to supply information, either because they felt the story of their suffering 232 should be heard, or because their motives had been misunderstood. These informants often 233 were willing to give their views in informal focus group settings. Other informants were 234 willing to speak only anonymously and in private. Both kinds of interview were conducted in 235 the Mende language, mainly by a single interviewer. Mende is a strongly oral culture where 236 words are counted and remembered. Recording devices were used in village-level 237 interviews sparingly or not at all. Notes were written-up as soon as possible after the 238 interview.

240 Stories told were complex and multi-faceted. Several visits were made to key sites of

- 241 enquiry, to cross-check material and hear other views. We also followed up events by
- 242 interviewing responders. The Ministry of Health was notified about our study, and medical
- 243 personnel generally granted requests for interviews. We were not able to get the agreement
- of security personnel deployed in quarantine operations at district level. In the accounts that
- follow we link events described to numerical data base sources where appropriate.
- 246

247 Numerical data records

- 248 Numerical data relating to the West African epidemic of EVD derive from two main sources -
- 249 admission data collected via (WHO standard) Ebola Case Investigation Forms, completed
- when a person suspected of having Ebola presented to a care or holding facility, and
- 251 laboratory records of tests for Ebola applied to blood or swab samples.
- 252

253 The version of the standard case investigation form used in Sierra Leone had three pages.

- 254 The first two pages are filled in on first contact or admission. There are sections for names,
- gender, address, occupation, location where the patient became ill, date on which they
- became sick, and symptoms and hospitalization. A second page covers contact with Ebola
- 257 patients, including attendance at funerals, and outcomes (hospitalization and death). The
- third page provides formats for recording the results of laboratory tests.
- 259
- 260 Eye-witness reports confirm that medical personnel coping with the arrival of a patient with261 Ebola symptoms had limited opportunity to fill in or check the numerous details. Some
- 262 patients were too distressed to supply necessary information and questions will often have
- 263 been answered by family members or helpers, not always accurately, either because details
- were not known, or because information was deliberately concealed to avoid incrimination.
- 265 Participation in funerals was declared illegal under Ebola emergency regulations and carried
- the risk of a fine or imprisonment.
- 267

That record keeping was often inconsistent can be illustrated by the case of Bo, the largest town in provincial Sierra Leone. Ebola cases arrived in Bo from Kenema in the early days of the epidemic. A rather large urban outbreak followed, eventually necessitating the opening of a dedicated Ebola Treatment Unit at the outlying village of Bandajuma. The records for Ebola victims in the Bo outbreak were supposed to indicate the district, chiefdom and settlement of origin. Bo town is the headquarters of Bo District and also of Kakua Chiefdom, one of Sierra Leone's 149 chiefdoms (the lowest level of government administration). The

- 275 data base lists 181 laboratory-confirmed cases for Kakua chiefdom. Eight cases were
- wrongly assigned and came from other chiefdoms. Of the remaining 173 cases only 36
- 277 (38%) can be unambiguously assigned to Bo town from information in the data base. In 58
- other cases (62%) a location in Bo town can be inferred only from the name of the street.
- 279 Seemingly, there were 94 confirmed cases of EVD in Bo town, but this cannot be known
- except from fieldwork on the ground, with a street map in hand.
- 281

282 One further source needs to be explained, since it is not available elsewhere. This is a 283 hand-written log of admissions, test results and outcomes maintained (apparently as a 284 personal initiative) by a nurse at the Ebola Holding Centre (EHC) outside Moyamba town. 285 The Moyamba EHC was hastily improvised facility arranged in an empty (school?) building 286 with few affordances operating from July 2014. It handled many of the early cases of EVD in 287 Moyamba District, until internationally staffed and supported Ebola Treatment Units (ETUs) 288 were opened in Bo and Kenema in October 2014, at which point some Ebola+ cases were 289 referred to the new ETUs. The EHC in Moyamba was replaced (in December 2014) by a 290 better-equipped ETU staffed by international (Norwegian) volunteers, to which all remaining 291 cases were transferred. A photocopy of the admissions log of the EHC from June to 292 November 2014 was made available to us after interviewing its compiler and proved useful 293 in confirming details regarding dates and outcomes of cases referred to in village interviews. 294 An anonymized version is included in the online supporting materials.

295

296 Limitations of this study

297 Any study such as this depends on the accuracy of informants' memories and their 298 willingness to be frank. Events described were triangulated from accounts provided by 299 independent witnesses, and discrepancies followed up and resolved. These witnesses were 300 identified by the second author. They were independent in the sense that they were 301 members of the community in question but did not belong to the immediate household of the 302 infected person. In several communities we were also able to make use of base-line data 303 collected by focus group and questionnaire interview for the Ebola Response Anthropology 304 Platform during the epidemic in 2014 (publicly available online at www.ebola-305 anthropology.net). Again, inconsistencies were followed up and resolved. An inherent 306 limitation of the approach is that it cannot infer larger regional trends. If the standard 307 numerical approach had found evidence of larger regional trends this would have cast doubt 308 on the utility of ethnographic analysis to understand heterogeneity through case study 309 approaches like ours. Instead, however, numerical research to date has reported local 310 heterogeneity, justifying the disaggregated case-following approach adopted here.

- 311 Furthermore, we identify categories of elements that explain heterogeneity in this context,
- 312 which are likely to have wider relevance in other contexts and can be tested in other
- 313 settings.
- 314

Results: local Infection chains analysis

- 316 Analyzed from the perspective of the standard numerical approach the various episodes
- 317 making up the 2014-15 Ebola epidemic in Sierra Leone appear highly heterogenous. This
- heterogeneity can be seen in figures for outbreaks by locality (Table 1).
- 319
- 320 Western Urban (Freetown) and Western Rural (Freetown's peri-urban periphery), together
- accounting for about 30 per cent of the national population, had 41 per cent of all Ebola
- 322 cases. Provincial Sierra Leone is divided into three provinces, 12 districts and 149
- 323 chiefdoms (the lowest level of local government), and contained 59 per cent of cases, but
- 324 these were unevenly distributed. According to the national data base, and including only
- laboratory confirmed entries, 39 chiefdoms (26%) had no cases at all. Of 110 chiefdoms with
- 326 cases (74%) as few as 14 chiefdoms accounted for 60% of all chiefdom-level cases (5014327 cases).
- 328

329 Moyamba District infection chains: families begin to keep

330 their distance

331 Village 1A is a typical medium-sized off-road farming settlement on the left bank of the Taia 332 river, in Kori chiefdom, Moyamba District. It is joined to the main Bo-Freetown highway by a 333 7 km track from the right bank of the river. The river must first be crossed by canoe. The 334 track is motorable only in the dry season but can be used by motorcycle taxis (okada) at all 335 times of the year. The people are Mende-speakers, but they live along the provincial boundary with Northern Sierra Leone and are intermarried with Temne-speaking families 336 337 from the other side of the river. The Taia river floods in August and canoe traffic ceases for a period. The settlement is in effect cut off in the middle of the rains. 338

339

Ebola came to Village 1A as a spill-over from the Kenema outbreak. The virus crossed the
border from Guinea in early 2014, and an outbreak in Kailahun District resulted in an Ebola
case being brought to the Government Hospital in Kenema, where there was an isolation
ward for victims of Lassa Fever. Ebola has even more exacting biosafety requirements than
Lassa Fever, and the nursing staff in Kenema were not prepared to deal with Ebola in
advance.

The WHO case definition of Ebola at that stage emphasized bleeding as a key sign. Few
Ebola patients in Sierra Leone showed signs of bleeding, and cases were misdiagnosed as
malaria or Lassa Fever. In addition, the authorities were slow to react to laboratory
information that there was an outbreak of EVD in Sierra Leone and supplies of chlorine and

- 351 personal protective equipment in the hospital were inadequate.
- 352

Kenema Government Hospital became the site of a major outbreak of nosocomial infection
in June-July 2014. EVD appears to have come to Village1A via a diamond miner (AA)
working in Lower Bambara chiefdom, not far from Kenema. One of his sons (BB) fell sick
and was taken to Kenema hospital, where he died. It is not known whether he was already
sick with Ebola or became infected in the hospital.

358

His death was treated as Ebola and AA was denied sight of the son's body. The stunned father was taken ill at the hospital gates. His family had no wish to let him follow his son into Kenema hospital, perceived as the source of Ebola infection. They conceived a plan to seek medical treatment from a sister, who was a renowned herbalist in Village 1A in Moyamba District. AA was familiar with the village since it was his mother's place of birth and he himself came from a village nearby.

365

366 The government had tried to block the further spread of EVD by reinforcing the check point 367 at the western entrance to Kenema, forcing passengers to submit to medical inspection 368 intended to detect anyone with elevated temperature. Local transporters, however, are 369 familiar with a number of by-pass routes opened during the war. One of them was tasked to 370 evade the checks and deliver AA - described as profusely sweating - to a settlement in Kori 371 chiefdom on the main road to Freetown, where a bike taxi was chartered to take the sick 372 man – held fast as a pillion on the back of the bike by one of his sons - to the canoe crossing 373 to Village 1A. There, too weak to climb up to the village, he was carried up the cliff path by a 374 strong young volunteer, who confirmed details of AA's arrival in an interview in 2016. The 375 date was reported as 9th July 2014, six weeks after the government had first announced the 376 presence of the disease in the country.

377

378 People interviewed in village 1A were doubtful whether AA had arrived with Ebola.

Normally, the progression is a 3-day period of headaches and fever followed by a 3-day

380 "wet" period in which vomiting, diarrhoea and bleeding occur, before death or eventual

381 recovery. Unusually, AA survived for two weeks after his arrival as a sick man, alternately

382 sleeping in a family hut and in the mosque, while his sister treated him with various leaf

infusions, before he eventually succumbed, and was buried just outside the village. He wasnot observed to be showing reported signs and symptoms of Ebola.

385

386 AA's sister (CC) then sickened. By mid-July the country was on high alert for Ebola cases. 387 News of the sick woman had reached the Community Health Officer (CHO), head of the 388 Ministry of Health team in Kori chiefdom, based in Taiama, and he arrived with a team on 389 the right bank of the Taia river opposite the village, seeking a blood sample from the sick 390 woman. The CHO phoned across to the chief (DD) explaining that he wanted to send two of 391 his team across the river to collect the blood. The chief responded that this would not be 392 possible as he had had no notification about the visitation, either from the Paramount Chief 393 or the Ministry of Health.

394

The chief later explained, in interview, that he knew sick people were sometimes given blood, but he had never heard of blood being taken from the sick, especially on the point of death. Lack of explanation about blood testing, and the arrival of responders in full PPE, convinced some in the village that this mysterious new disease was a cover for a kind of medical "vampirism" (*bona hinda*).

400

The CHO was forced to withdraw but came back with his team and authorization the next
day. DD required that the CHO cross the river to do the blood sampling in person. The
sample was taken for testing, and proved positive, but the woman died before any follow up
was made.

405

As a *sowei* (an elder of the women's Sande society) CC's burial attracted a group of her peers from surrounding villages. The burial was conducted according to the secret rites of the society. This was before the Ebola burial rules had been promulgated (August 8th 2014) and the CHO later explained in an interview that he did not have any means to prevent the funeral. Interviewees in Village 1A claimed that no further infections occurred among the group of women conducting the burial rites.

412

There were, however, further cases of Ebola both in Village 1A, and in Village 1B, a small
settlement on the left bank of the Taia, about 3 km to the south, and at least two of the
corpses were swabbed on burial. In all, village people report that there were 22 deaths
subsequent to the case of CC in Village 1A (14 female, 8 males) and nine deaths in Village
1B (7 females, 2 males, with six persons coming from one family related to the family of CC
in Village 1A). Several of the people infected in Village 1B had visited CC to express

sympathy with her, and later to take part in her funeral. These visits are an inescapablesocial obligation in tightly intermarried rural communities.

421

The evidence that these deaths were Ebola cases is not conclusive but is supported by the Moyamba records. We were able to cross-reference five persons who were admitted to the facility on 24 September 2014 bearing the same family name as several of the persons who died in Village 1B. They are listed as coming from Taiama, the chiefdom HQ for Kori chiefdom; villages IA and IB are inaccessible places, and Taiama is the nearest settlement of any size. Of this group of five patients, two were diagnosed as positive for Ebola, two died without diagnosis, and one (an old man) was negative, and later interviewed for this study.

430 A youth organizer in Taiama (EE) reported that he had helped to arrange the transport of 431 two suspected Ebola cases from the right bank of the Taia opposite Village 1B. Even if an 432 Ebola ambulance had been available it would not have been able to travel along the track to 433 the riverbank in rainy season conditions, so a commercial motorbike rider had been hired 434 instead. Motorbikes crossed the difficult places on single track bridges improvised by the 435 commercial riders. The incident was vivid in his mind, because the rescue team arranging to 436 collect one of the patients had only a single PPE suit, and the bike rider and the pillion 437 passenger needed to support the patient were both nervous of becoming infected. A 438 nervous rider on a difficulty rainy season track was more likely to have a spill, with serious 439 consequences for the patient and everyone else in the team, so the decision to dress the 440 patient in the PPE, rather than decide which of the two – rider or supporter – should wear 441 the protective suit, made sense. EE told the story self-deprecatingly, remarking 'how little 442 we knew about the disease at the time'. In fact, it suggests that everyone engaged in 443 extracting high-risk patients was beginning to understand about the significance of body 444 contact in spreading the disease.

445

An elderly man interviewed in Village 1B (FF) told us he had been admitted to the Moyamba holding centre along with two other persons from his village, both of whom he knew had tested positive for Ebola and subsequently died. FF was tested Ebola negative and had come back to the village to give notice of the fate of the two persons with whom he had been admitted. Clearly, some of the deaths were confirmed as EVD through laboratory evidence. But still villagers have doubts about whether all admissions had Ebola on entry, or were cross-infected after arrival, due to the notoriously poor conditions at the Moyamba facility.

454 Quarantine was imposed in Village 1A when a small detachment of five police and army 455 personnel arrived on 18th August 2014 and stayed for a month. The recently enacted 456 national emergency regulations authorized military intervention in epidemic response. If the 457 admission of a group of patients "from Taiama" to Moyamba EHC on 24th September 2014 458 corroborates our interviewee's recollection in Village 1B then infections must still have been 459 occurring in Villages 1A and 1B in the second half of September. So why the security forces 460 were withdrawn about that time is unclear. The national data base records dates for onset of symptoms for patients with positive blood tests in Kori chiefdom from 2nd July to 24th 461 462 November 2014, with two outliers in January and February 2015. One person from Village 463 1A and five from Village 1B are listed with positive blood samples.

464

465 What is clear from interviews is that local perceptions were changing very quickly. There 466 was now a distinct awareness the disease was spread by body contact. The name for EVD 467 given in Village 1A was *bondawote* (literally "family turn away"), glossed by an informant as 468 meaning "you are completely abandoned to die". Another interviewee said that "people ran 469 to their farms, [and] most of those who got sick recover[ed] when they stopped touching 470 each other". Youth leaders in a village at the end of a river-bank track leading to Villages 1A 471 and 1B feared that sick relatives in the two afflicted villages would seek help from the health 472 post in their village. They went out and cut down the stick bridge crossing a rainy season 473 flooded ravine, making further contact impossible. This rendered apparent in dramatic terms 474 the rapidly acquired notion that "touching" was deadly. It is likely that this local "turning 475 away" was a significant factor in ending local infection chains.

476

477 Spread of infection to a local market center

Village 1C is a small settlement on the main Bo-Freetown highway in Kori chiefdom at the 478 479 point where the c. 10 km track branches leading to the right bank of the Taia river opposite 480 Village 1A and 1B. This was where AA the sick man from Kenema, transferred from a taxi to 481 a motorbike on his journey to reach his relative, the herbalist, in Village 1A. AA was uncle to 482 GG, a woman living in Village 1C, who joined the CHO's the team on the trip to collect the 483 blood sample in Village 1A. It is reported that she went to Village 1A to warn her relatives 484 there about the dangers from Ebola. How she became infected is not clear. She tested 485 positive for EVD in Taiama and died there on 12th September 2014. Her sick husband 486 sought treatment from a pharmacist based at road junction market (Village 1D) on the 487 highway to Freetown (Fakuniya chiefdom). The pharmacist also sickened and died, 488 presumably from Ebola, but without test data to confirm it. The man was a member of a 489 Catholic sodality [closed association] and his funeral attracted sympathizers from as far as

490 Freetown and Bo. This was followed by a substantial outbreak of EVD in Village 1D, with 491 spread of cases up and down the Freetown and Moyamba roads, perhaps reflecting local 492 networking among traders. The first 12 patients testing positive for Ebola from Village 1D 493 were admitted to Moyamba EHC on 17th September. In all, 36 patients admitted to 494 Moyamba EHC from Village 1D tested positive for Ebola. Village 1D was guarantined by the 495 security forces. The last E+ case admitted to Moyamba EHC is recorded on 8th November 496 2014. The national data base shows 64 E+ cases from Village 1D, and 11 from adjacent 497 villages (some in Kori chiefdom). The dates for onset of symptoms of the first and last cases 498 in Fakuniya chiefdom are 9th September 2014 and 4th November 2014.

499

Bo District infection chains: good response marred by

501 accidents

Village 2A is a village about one km. south of the Kenema-to-Bo highway, some 20 km. east
of Bo city. It is a centre of Islamic instruction. A noted teacher (*kamoh*) from a village on the
border of Bo and Kenema districts was offering instruction in Village 2A, and then fell sick.
Enquiries in his home village suggested he had been in the habit of going to Kenema for
treatment for some longer-term medical complaint. It can be surmised he became infected
with Ebola as a result of the outbreak in Kenema town.

508

509 The *kamoh* died in Village 2A on 13th August and was buried according to Islamic practice.
510 This requires thorough washing of the corpse. The implications of the brand-new Ebola
511 national regulations had yet to be realized in the village, even if they were known. Some of
512 his pupils are said to have used water from the washing of their learned master's body in the
513 hope of inheriting some of his wisdom and charisma.

514

515 The *kamoh* had been seen by medical personnel in a near-by health centre but he had been 516 discharged without any diagnosis of Ebola or instructions about what to do if is condition 517 worsened. Soon after the burial his pregnant wife (HH) began to complain of joint pains and fever. She turned for help to the mother-and-baby unit in near-by Village 2B. The midwife in 518 519 charge examined her and offered some treatment for the fever. She had already received a 520 briefing about Ebola risks, and used gloves in her examination. But HH's symptoms were as 521 yet no different from malaria, so she was discharged and sent home with appropriate 522 medicine for her presumed condition. 523

Two days later HH died, after giving birth to a still-born child. Her other two children
sickened and died two days later. The woman's death was reported to the Paramount Chief

526 for Kakua chiefdom, based in Bo, and the medical authorities immediately intervened.

- 527 Eleven more people fell sick in rapid succession. Samples were taken and inter-village
- 528 movements were stopped. The villagers were told that even the nurses who had treated HH 529 would now have to be quarantined for 21 days, and that burials could only be undertaken by
- 530 a specially equipped burial team.

531 A brother of the *kamoh* died and his body was not buried for 3 days, something that was

532 especially shocking to the villager's Islamic religious sensitivities. The hazard suits of the

burial team alarmed villagers, as did the unexpected arrival of police, military and the DistrictMedical Officer.

- By now a further 13 people had become seriously ill and were taken to Bo Government
 hospital. There were no preparations to deal with Ebola cases, and the sick villagers were
 placed in a kind of holding shed. There was no infection of hospital staff or patients, but the
 episode was disturbing to community members.
- 539 One remarked that "*to my dismay no treatment was given but* [*they were*] *just cluster*[*ed*] *into* 540 *a non-caring room, where five of them immediately died*". They were told that there was no 541 bed for admission at the hospital. The district Ebola task force then decided that the sick 542 villagers should be brought back to the village, to be quarantined in the community school.
- 543 The quarantine was strict. The security forces prevented any movement, even for the
- 544 essentials of daily life. Families suffered heartbreak as they heard their loved ones crying
- out for water and were prevented from helping. Nor was there any satisfactory arrangement
- to feed the patients. Villagers feared the security forces had been ordered to poison them.
- 547 The situation was improved when the local parliamentarian arranged for the delivery of beds,
- 548 and (after 12 days) "9 bags of rice were given to the community with the population of 210,
- 549 *including children*". The district Ebola task force helped to mobilize supplies, even though at
- 550 this stage it lacked a budget and remained reliant on voluntary contributions.
- 551 New cases were still occurring, and the death toll continued to rise. Villagers formed three 552 burial teams, so that they could bury their own loved ones promptly, and the authorities 553 seem to have concurred in this. Thirteen victims were taken to holding centers in Kenema 554 and Kailahun, and only one person is said to have survived.
- 555 The total number of laboratory-confirmed cases of Ebola in Village 2A appears, from the
- national records, to have been 43 (over 20 per cent of the total village population, and 28 per
- 557 cent of our corrected number for all laboratory-confirmed Ebola cases in Kakua chiefdom,
- 558 including Bo city). The villagers reported in interviews that there were 37 deaths. This
- 559 implies either that only six people survived or that the national data base under-estimates

- the total number of infections in Village 2A. In fact, the names of seven certificated survivorswere reported during our enquiries, suggesting the discrepancy may not be large.
- 562 The strict quarantine was not wholly effective. There was at least one escape, when a 563 young man (II) broke bounds to visit a larger settlement, T, a small town about 12 km. south 564 of Bo. II then showed symptoms of EVD. Whether he was infected in Village 2A or on his 565 arrival in T is unclear.
- T is close to Bo city where cases are first recorded in the national data base from mid-June. The national data base records 29 laboratory-confirmed cases in T over the period 23rd July to 13th December. The outbreak here is probably connected to infection in Bo. We have no date for the quarantine breach in Village 2A but it is unlikely to have been earlier than September since quarantine was imposed from the second half of August.
- 571 T was a bridge to a somewhat larger outbreak in the adjacent chiefdom, Bumpeh Ngao,
- 572 where 48 laboratory-confirmed cases are reported in the national data base. The Bumpeh
- 573 outbreak occurred at a later stage in the epidemic, when communities and responders were
- 574 better prepared. The infection chain ran from 3rd October 2014 to 10th January 2015, a
- 575 period of 100 days. The Community Health Officer thought that most cases had some
- 576 connection with a large funeral for a "big person" (Mende: *numu wa*) in T.
- 577 At Village 2C in Bumpeh Ngao chiefdom there is a long-established and well-respected
- 578 mission hospital. The hospital authorities approached the local community and explained
- 579 that the hospital (which lacked a ward capable of handling Ebola cases, until international
- 580 responders built one) would have to close if cases arrived.
- It was agreed with the chiefdom authorities that in order to keep the hospital open during the
 Ebola outbreak all potential patients would pass through a screening and triage process
 located outside the hospital. Any potential patients showing signs and symptoms of Ebola
 would be conveyed to newly opened Ebola case-handling facilities in Bo and Kenema,
- 585 where they would receive specialist treatment. Chiefs and sub-chiefs were responsible for
- 586 conveying a message about why these measures were necessary and the message was
- 587 widely understood.
- 588 Not all families agreed with the implications, however. JJ, the female chief of a satellite
- settlement (Village 2D), attended the "big person's" funeral in Village T, where she appears
- to have contracted Ebola. The nurse in charge of the village health center suspected the
- true cause of her illness and informed the authorities, but JJ's family objected.
- 592 Nevertheless, an ambulance was called, and she was taken to the case-handling facility at
- 593 Bandajuma, where she died. Disagreement over responsibility for JJ's fate led to a

594 breakdown in relations between the family and the nurse so severe that she had to be 595 transferred to another district.

- 596 JJ was not alone in trying to hide her symptoms. Interviews with medical personnel in 597 Village 2C and an adjacent community health post elicited several other stories about the 598 lengths to which other patients went to hide symptoms to avoid being transferred to an Ebola 599 case-handling facility. As yet, there were few survivors from such centers, which were 600 suspected of being "death camps".
- Informants reported that international advisers wondered why Bumpeh Ngao chiefdom was "difficult". The fear of being wrongly diagnosed as an Ebola case and cross-infected in a holding or treatment facility grew as stories about Kenema hospital and poor conditions at the holding centre in Moyamba spread. Local doubts over diagnosis were reinforced by a case in which a blood sample sent by the hospital in Village 2C to a laboratory in Kenema had come back wrongly categorized as negative because it had been confused with a sample from a village with the same name in Kenema District.

608 Null infection chains: A dog that didn't bark?

- 609 Thirty-nine chiefdoms had no cases of Ebola; many were protected from spread of infection 610 by distance or poor roads. Four chiefdoms, however, were situated on or close to the main 611 national road transport network, surrounded by chiefdoms with cases. One of these is 612 Kamajei chiefdom in Moyamba district. Led by their Paramount Chief community activists in 613 Kamajei closed tracks and closely monitored movements of strangers. Interviews and 614 surveys undertaken in this chiefdom during the epidemic (fieldwork in December 2014, 615 www.ebola-anthropology.net) showed widespread acceptance that Ebola was spread by 616 body contact, and not through consumption of bush meat as people had earlier been 617 informed.
- 618

It is also relevant is to ask about communities where cases occurred, but where infection chains were closed down promptly. One such chiefdom is Niawa Lenga in Bo District. This was one of four chiefdoms (in Bo and Moyamba Districts) in which an Ebola infection chain lasted for less than 50 days. The other three chiefdoms in this group (Bagbo, Bagruwa and Jaiama Bongor) had few confirmed cases, but Niawa Lenga had a substantial number (19).

- In general, chiefdoms in Bo and Moyamba districts were among the quickest in the country
- to end infection chains, with an average per chiefdom of 90 days for Bo district, and 95 days
- 627 for Moyamba, compared to figures for chiefdoms in the first and last districts to experience
- the outbreak Kailahun and Port Loko with an average of 133 and 280 days respectively.

630 Why was the outbreak in Niawa Lenga ended promptly? The answer appears to be that by

- 631 mid-October 2014 the Standard Operating Procedures (SOPs) for Ebola control of the Bo
- 632 District Ebola Response team were fully implemented and working successfully, and that
- 633 there was little or no prior opposition to and distrust of local authorities, a factor in a case
- 634 described in detail by Parker et al. [9]. Lessons from Village 2A had been well-learnt.
- 635

636 Fieldwork revealed two distinct infection chains. One involved the chiefdom headquarters,

- 637 Village 3A, and the other a village, Village 3B which is close to the motor road from Bo to
- 638 Yele. Vehicles to Village 3A take the motor road, and branch right just after the town of
- Dambara. There is a shorter route a track leading to Village 3A from the northern outskirtsof Bo.
- 641

A middle-aged female resident of Bo (KK) was heading along this track, possibly seeking local treatment in Village 3C for a long-standing complaint. Village 3C is located on the boundary between Kakua and Niawa Lenga chiefdoms. Here, KK was taken ill with what turned out to be EVD. Her helpers decided to hire some youths to carry her in a hammock to her family. The hammock party left for Village 3A before dawn, without informing the town authorities, a breach of local protocol suggesting they had something to hide.

648

Discharging her hammock carriers at the entrance to Village 3A, and being too weak to walk,

650 KK sent for family helpers to bring her to her house, where she died a day or two later.

Others in the home were infected, including a child who had slept on KK's bed. The

woman's death was promptly reported to the district response team and the death was

- 653 confirmed as Ebola; SOPs were promptly activated.
- 654

The community was quarantined – a process supervised by a doctor from the international
response. At first security forces kept out all visitors, including relief workers, but villagers
complained to the foreign doctor and food and other necessities were quickly supplied.

658

Niawa Lenga is a chiefdom of small-scale rice farmers, and October is the harvest period,

660 when daily life centers around the rice farm. Some people doubtless slipped away down

- 661 unregulated bush tracks and made themselves quietly absent in their farms, while others
- 662 collected daily necessities from the relief agencies. The demand by the chiefdom authorities
- 663 for adherence to Ebola byelaws was respected, and no disputes were reported. Infection in
- 664 Village 3A ceased.
- 665

- 666 Infection in village 3B appears not to be connected with the outbreak in Village 3A. The
- origins of this second outbreak lie in Bo Government Hospital. A nurse contracted Ebola
- 668 (apparently outside the hospital) and patients on her ward took flight. One of the patients,
- LL, headed home to Village 3B. A cluster of cases subsequently occurred in Village 3B, and
- 670 control measures were rapidly implemented by the Bo-based District Ebola Response team,
- 671 which included establishing quarantine barriers. With a local politician's help quarantined
- 672 homes were supplied, enabling people to stay put.
- 673

There was one hiccup. At one of the burials the "safe burial" team attended without a
stretcher and improvised with sticks from a farm. The farmer collecting these sticks after the
burial became another victim of the outbreak.

677

The village location records show 12 cases in Niawa Lenga chiefdom, 4 in Village 3A and 8 in Village 3B. The records of laboratory confirmed cases show 19 cases in Niawa Lenga between 17th October and 21st November 2014. Villagers in Village 3B insist there were more, with 11 deaths in their village alone. Nevertheless, excepting for the mistake over the stretcher, control measures worked as intended. The first confirmed case was recorded on 17th October 2014 and the last on 21st November. The outbreak in the chiefdom was controlled within 36 days.

685

686 **Discussion**

The results reported here help confirm a picture of the Ebola epidemic in Sierra Leone as a concatenation of smaller outbreaks. The heterogeneity of the epidemic thus needs to be explained in terms of local behavioral circumstances and, most especially, social circumstances, for which a standardized top-down numerical analysis or externally driven emergency-response is not necessarily the most effective [11]. This was certainly true for our two study districts, which were affected early in the epidemic and had to cope before a national or international response had been fully mobilized.

694

The local name for Ebola (in the Mende language of the south and east of Sierra Leone) is *bondawote* – "family turn around". This recognizes an essential truth about Ebola infection; it is a disease of social intimacy, with close family members bearing the highest risks of further infection [7]. The risks of infection peak in the final "wet" phase of the disease and immediately after death, when the corpse is prepared by family members for interment. The disease also makes inter-community jumps [8], but our ethnographic data reveal that
these jumps are often the result of family networking. Control, or loss of control, over
infection thus depended a great deal on cooperation of families, and in particular on whether

family care givers were persuaded to collaborate in reducing risks of contact with a sick

705 person or infected body.

706

The disease came under control only when the family "turned around". The heterogeneities of Ebola infection dynamics reflect whether families turned quickly or not, and whether this "turning" was willing or achieved only under pressure. Four different groups of explanatory elements can be discerned in the data presented. As overarching themes emerging from our detailed analysis, they help explain local heterogeneity in ways that need to be considered for other localized outbreaks (either in other parts of Sierra Leone, or in other countries and other epidemics).

714

715 **1. Heterogeneities caused by externalities.**

Whether an epidemic chain was controlled or not sometimes depended on externalities –
events over which there was little or no control. A good instance of this would be the
isolated location of Village 1A, and the seasonal flood of the Taia river, which inhibited
initial response and delayed diagnosis.

720

Diagnostic accidents – the mix up of blood samples from two different villages with the
same name – also help explain why some outbreaks were larger than might have been
expected from the current state of knowledge or preparedness on the part of responders.
The surge in cases in Bumpeh Ngao, quite late in the epidemic's trajectory, when
response modalities were better developed, is a case in point. Misdiagnosis created a
false confidence among family carers that a diagnosis of Ebola was unlikely.

727

728 Panic over nosocomial infection might also be considered a kind of accident, connected 729 to the totally unexpected outbreak of a disease never before seen in the region. The 730 spread of Ebola to patients in the isolation ward at Kenema Hospital, and the notoriously 731 poor conditions in the makeshift Ebola Holding Centre in Moyamba, then led to a sudden 732 and widespread collapse of confidence in medical treatment. Some people became 733 convinced that Ebola was spread deliberately by medical workers, others that Ebola 734 case handling was connected to theft of body parts and blood. Families strategized 735 desperately to prevent patients being consigned to Ebola handling facilities.

Much of the Ebola response was a race against time to put in place proper procedures, in which improvisation was often required. Allocating the single PPE suit to the patient, rather than to rider and pillion helper when extracting patients from Village 1B, might be seen as an inspired solution. The burial team's lack of a stretcher – did they forget to pack it in their haste? - in Village 3B was a mistake with which a village farmer paid with his life.

743

744 2. Heterogeneities resulting from structural or health system 745 deficiencies

Families often struggled to bring sick patients for diagnosis, and many helpers were at
risk of infection during that process. In some instances, little could be done to improve
access to services (Villages 1A and 1B, for example). Later in the epidemic, better
transport equipment (dedicated Ebola ambulances with trained crew, for example),
improved communication (notably, a telephone helpline), and more rapid, mobile
laboratory diagnosis certainly improved capacity to reach and transfer patients over a
large part of the country.

753

754 The availability of Ebola case handling capacity, and the degree to which communities 755 trusted or shunned those facilities [12], varied locally, and negative impacts are clearly 756 seen in our data. A study of the Kenema Ebola Treatment Unit (open from October 757 2014) reports that it only gained wider acceptance after the first survivors returned to 758 their families [13]. The facility at Bandajuma (Bo) also opened in October 2014, and its 759 presence and impact are glimpsed only in our later case studies. The Ebola Holding 760 Centre in Moyamba town was opened as early as June 2014 and left its (negative) mark 761 across the district. It was eventually replaced by a Norwegian-staffed and funded ETU in 762 Moyamba in December 2014, too late for the infection chains reported above.

763

The case-study material relating to Villages 1A and 1B, and 2A illustrate the
disadvantages of not yet having in place a clear set of Ebola response SOPs, and a
proper relief system supply chain to support quarantine. The benefits of having such
organizational procedures are apparent in the speed with which the later Niawa Lenga
outbreak was contained.

769

The original case definition for Ebola imported from central Africa over-emphasized
bleeding as a sign and symptom. The case definition was later changed in line with
actual experience, but families varied in the extent to which they took account of this

earlier misinformation. Arguments about symptoms emerged where precipitate action in
treating a potential case as Ebola was resisted (we documented this in Village 3C, for
example).

777 Other examples of poor messaging, inappropriate in the local context, exist. For 778 example, bush meat, especially eating of monkeys, was widely warned against over 779 radio and on posters as a cause of infection. Villagers who never ate bush meat (often 780 for religious reasons) imagined themselves to be safe from infection. It was only late in 781 the epidemic that this message was replaced by an emphasis on limiting body contact 782 with persons of unknown Ebola status. Village communities varied in the extent to which 783 they worked out for themselves whether or not bush meat or body contact were risks 784 (www.ebola-anthropology.net.).

785

776

3. Heterogeneities linked to cultural considerations.

Older family members are often heavily involved in caring for and treating the sick and advising on steps to be taken in case of serious sickness and death. This explains the quantitative finding that older people were disproportionately at risk of infection from EVD. There was then a knock-on effect – older people in positions of family leadership are more likely to be senior members of the major male and female sodalities. The elaborate funeral rituals of the sodalities played a significant part in local multiplication of infection (e.g. Villages 1A, and 2A).

794

795 It is not the size of the funeral that determines the infection risk, but the distribution of 796 duties in preparing and taking leave of the corpse [7]. These are matters known only to 797 members of the sodalities. The pattern of subsequent infections might then depend on 798 where the key elders came from across a chiefdom or chiefdom section. The 799 conversation between communities and responders about control of infection risks from 800 funerals improved only when sodality members with information on Ebola infection 801 control talked to sodality elders, who then turned this information into safer practical 802 outcomes ([7], [9]).

803

Local government in rural Sierra Leone is dualistic. Chiefdom law is separate from national law. National government intervenes locally only with the collaboration of chiefdom administrations. A slip-up over sending notifications to the local chief through the correct channels hindered the process of establishing that there was EVD in Village 1A, and this delayed implementation of infection control. 810 Belief in the efficacy of traditional herbal medicine is high in rural areas of Sierra Leone, 811 and this trust was intensified by experience of hospital-based nosocomial infection. 812 Traditional practitioners vary in reputation. A renowned practitioner will draw clients from 813 far and wide. The likelihood of a practitioner being infected by a patient is greater where 814 the catchment is wide. Ebola first spread across the border from Guinea through the 815 patients of a well-known herbalist. The index case in Village 1A was also a renowned 816 herbalist. Villages without noted practitioners were less likely to experience infection. 817 The government banned traditional medical practice for the duration of the epidemic. 818 Arguably, a better approach might have been to find a role for herbalists in the epidemic, 819 perhaps as community interlocutors, to explain the infection risk.

820

809

821

4. Heterogeneities as a result of variations in coping options

822 Once communities realized that Ebola infection risks were linked to contact with infected 823 persons, they began to develop ideas for limiting social contacts, especially with 824 strangers. One approach was to impose self-isolation by controlling entrance to and exit 825 from the community, building on experience with civil-defence during the civil war (1991-826 2002). Another approach (again widely practiced during the war) was to retreat into 827 sokoihun ("corners"). Typically, this would mean the household withdrawing to the hut in 828 the family rice farm, where there was both food and shelter. These solutions were less 829 easily applied in some places than others. The greater the dependence on trade rather 830 than the farm for subsistence livelihood the less practical it was to practice self-isolation.

831

832 Community members in Village 1A explicitly mentioned the self-isolation option, more or 833 less reinforced by the cutting of the footpath bridge linking them to Village 1C. 834 Informants connected living in "corners" with cutting down on bodily contact. Village 2A, 835 however, was more dependent on its external links, as a center for both trade and 836 Koranic education, and had no option but to accept externally enforced quarantine, and 837 to apply for relief assistance. More generally it seems clear that the greater difficulty in 838 ending infection chains in districts closer to Freetown (notably Port Loko and Western 839 Rural) relates to the greater involvement of these districts in trade and transportation. 840

- 040
- 841
- 842
- 843

844 **Conclusion**

845 The overall conclusion is that the epidemic of Ebola Virus Disease in Sierra Leone 2014-15 846 is best viewed from a disaggregated perspective, as a series of local, but linked episodes, 847 shaped by a diverse series of factors including bad luck and miscalculation, as well as 848 variation in local cultural imperatives, response strategies and configurations of local 849 livelihood opportunities. Despite local specificity, we have identified four groups of factors 850 that help explain this heterogeneity which are likely to have relevance for other settings. It is 851 critical that epidemic-response rapidly captures the presence of such heterogeneity. To do 852 this implies the continuing need for an ethnographically informed epidemiology: 853 ethnographic research is critical for developing a richer picture of epidemic spread and a 854 better understanding of epidemiological data. Integrating these disciplines in research is 855 challenging, but these are important epistemological considerations that extend well beyond 856 the outbreak of Ebola in West Africa. Critically, understanding this heterogeneity will enable nuanced responses to outbreaks likely to be more effective and better received by the 857 858 population.

859

860 Indeed, given current debates around evidence in the COVID-19 pandemic, we offer 861 important reflections on how, in collaborations between epidemiologists and social sciences, 862 the complementarity in collection, interpretation and use of qualitative and quantitative data, 863 can produce not only more context-appropriate responses but also more accurate efforts to explain and model an epidemic taking into account social dynamics. Our findings raise 864 865 questions about what evidence and whose knowledge "counts" ([14], [15]). A key implication 866 of our analysis is the necessity for local knowledge and inputs to be incorporated in the 867 planning of any future outbreak responses – including in the current Covid-19 outbreak. This 868 would involve working closely with key local figures coming from, or based in, the study 869 communities in order to obtain a full picture of what has happened, why, and how outbreak 870 responses can be made more compatible with local realities. It is also important that local 871 nuance informs subnational and national response planning, with local data aggregated at 872 subnational level to identify geographical patterns of disease. Of immediate relevance, in 873 terms of future preparedness and current Covid-19 response, is the training of local 874 researchers, with detailed knowledge of local cultural contexts, in ethnographic field 875 methods, to join teams carrying out real-time epidemiological analysis and help re-frame 876 research as part of crisis response efforts. 877 878

879

882 Acknowledgements

883

Tommy M. Hanson is thanked for helping to carry out interviews in Bumpeh Ngao chiefdom
in 2017. Foday Mamoud Kamara and Esther Yei Mokuwa are thanked for helping to carry
out interviews in Niawa Lenga chiefdom in 2018. Dina Balabanova, Melissa Parker and two
referees for the journal are thanked for their helpful comments on the manuscript.

888

889 Members of the Ebola Gbalo research team are Lawrence S Babawo, Dina Balabanova,

- 890 Johanna Hanefeld, Tommy M Hanson, Baigeh Johnson, Foday Mahmoud Kamara, Bashiru
- 891 Koroma, Susannah H Mayhew (PI), Alfred Mokuwa, Esther Yei-Mokuwa, Melissa Parker,
- 892 Paul Richards, Ahmed Vandi.
- 893

895 896	References
890 897 898 899 900 901 902	[1] Garske T, Cori A, Ariyarajah A, Blake I, Dorigatti I, Eckmanns T, Fraser C, Hinsley W, Jombart T, Mills H, Nedjati-Gilani G, Newton E, Nouvellet P, Perkins D, Riley S, Schumacher D, Shah A, Van Kerkhove M, Dye C, Donnelly C, Heterogeneities in the case fatality ratio in the West African Ebola outbreak 2013–2016. <i>Philosophical Transactions of the Royal Society B: Biological Sciences</i> 2016, 372 . 20160308. 10.1098/rstb.2016.0308.
902 903 904 905 906	[2] Ebola Gbalo Research Team, Responding to the Ebola virus disease outbreak in DR Congo: when will we learn from Sierra Leone? <i>The Lancet</i> , 2019, 393 , Issue 10191, 2647 – 2650
907 908 909 910 911 912 913 914	[3] Li-Qun Fang, Yang Yang, Jia-Fu Jiang, Hong-Wu Yao, David Kargbo, Xin-Lou Li, Bao- Gui Jiang, Brima Kargbo, Yi-Gang Tong, Ya-Wei Wang, Kun Liu, Abdul Kamara, Foday Dafae, Alex Kanu, Rui-Ruo Jiang, Ye Sun, Ruo-Xi Sun, Wan-Jun Chen, Mai-Juan Ma, Natalie E. Dean, Harold Thomas, Ira M. Longini Jr., M. Elizabeth Halloran, and Wu- Chun Cao (2016) Transmission dynamics of Ebola virus disease and intervention effectiveness in Sierra Leone, <i>PNAS</i> April 19, 2016 113 (16) 4488- 4493; https://doi.org/10.1073/pnas.1518587113
914 915 916 917 918 919	[4] International Ebola Response Team, Agua-Agum J, Ariyarajah A, Aylward B, Bawo L, Bilivogui P, et al., Exposure Patterns Driving Ebola Transmission in West Africa: A Retrospective Observational Study. <i>PLoS Med</i> 2016, 13 (11): e1002170. https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pmed.1002170
919 920 921 922 923	[5] Wong J Y, Zhang W, Kargbo D, Haque U, Hu W, Wu P, Liu C, Assessment of the severity of Ebola virus disease in Sierra Leone in 2014-2015. <i>Epidemiology and infection</i> , 2016, 144 (7), 1473–1481. doi:10.1017/S0950268815003003
923 924 925 926 927	[6] Krauer F, Gsteiger S, Low N, Hansen CH, Althaus CL (2016) Heterogeneity in District- Level Transmission of Ebola Virus Disease during the 2013-2015 epidemic in West Africa. <i>PLoS Negl Trop Dis</i> 10 (7): e0004867. doi:10.1371/journal. pntd.0004867
928 929 930	[7] Richards P, <i>Ebola: how a people's science helped end an epidemic</i> , London: Zed Books, 2016.
931 932 933 934	[8] Richards P, Amara J, Ferme MC, Kamara P, Mokuwa E, Sheriff AI, et al., Social Pathways for Ebola Virus Disease in Rural Sierra Leone, and Some Implications for Containment. <i>PLoS Negl Trop Dis</i> 2015, 9 (4): e0003567. doi:10.1371/ journal.pntd.0003567
935 936 937 938	[9] Parker M, Hanson TM, Vandi A, Babawo LS, & Allen T, Ebola and Public Authority: Saving Loved Ones in Sierra Leone, <i>Medical Anthropology</i> , 2019, 38 :5, 440- 454, DOI: <u>10.1080/01459740.2019.1609472</u>
939 940 941 942	[10] Manguvo A & Mafuvadze B, The impact of traditional and religious practices on the spread of Ebola in West Africa: time for a strategic shift. <i>The Pan African Medical Journal</i> , 22 <i>Suppl 1</i> (Suppl 1), 2015, 9. doi:10.11694/pamj.supp.2015.22.1.6190
942 943 944	[11] Ferguson N, Capturing human behaviour. <i>Nature</i> 2007, 446, 733, doi:10.1038/446733a
944 945 946 947 948	[12] Mokuwa EY, Maat H, Rural populations exposed to Ebola Virus Disease respond positively to localised case handling: Evidence from Sierra Leone. <i>PLoS Negl Trop Dis</i> 2020, 14(1): e0007666. https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pntd.0007666

[13] Richards P, Mokuwa E, Welmers P, Maat H, Beisel U, Trust, and distrust, of Ebola Treatment Centers: A case-study from Sierra Leone. PLoS ONE 2019, 14(12): e0224511. https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0224511 [14] DiGiacomo SM, Can there be a "cultural epidemiology"? Medical Anthropology Quarterly, 2008, https://doi.org/10.1525/mag.1999.13.4.436 [15] Nichter M, Global health: why cultural perceptions, social representations, and biopolitics matter, Tucson AZ: University of Arizona Press, 2008

8 Table 1: Ebola in Sierra Leone by District, date of first case, average length of infection chains at chiefdom level, and

total numbers of laboratory confirmed cases

DISTRICT	DATE OF FIRST CASE onset of symptor	LENGTH OF INFECTION (days) ns	N OF CASES lab confirmed
30	13/06/2014	90	315
BONTHE	10/10/2014	32	6
BOMBALI	06/07/2014	161	1049
KAILAHUN	18/05/2014	133	524
(AMBIA	12/09/2014	259	241
(ENEMA	13/06/2014	120	497
OINADUGU	29/08/2014	198	111
ONO	27/06/2014	132	260
ОҮАМВА	02/07/2014	95	211
ORT LOKO	02/07/2014	280	1202
UJEHUN	28/07/2014	67	31
ONKOLILI	05/08/2014	151	489
estern Rural	20/07/2015	300	1146
estern Urban	25/06/2015	406	2274
LL PROVINCIAL			4936
LL WESTERN A	3420		
OTAL			8356