American University in Cairo

AUC Knowledge Fountain

Theses and Dissertations

6-1-2017

The implementation of the United Nations security council resolutions on Libya

Mostafa Ahmed Mostafa Safwat

Follow this and additional works at: https://fount.aucegypt.edu/etds

Recommended Citation

APA Citation

Safwat, M. (2017). The implementation of the United Nations security council resolutions on Libya [Master's thesis, the American University in Cairo]. AUC Knowledge Fountain. https://fount.aucegypt.edu/etds/686

MLA Citation

Safwat, Mostafa Ahmed Mostafa. *The implementation of the United Nations security council resolutions on Libya*. 2017. American University in Cairo, Master's thesis. *AUC Knowledge Fountain*. https://fount.aucegypt.edu/etds/686

This Thesis is brought to you for free and open access by AUC Knowledge Fountain. It has been accepted for inclusion in Theses and Dissertations by an authorized administrator of AUC Knowledge Fountain. For more information, please contact mark.muehlhaeusler@aucegypt.edu.

The American University in Cairo

School of Global Affairs and Public Policy

The Implementation of the United Nations Security Council Resolutions on Libya

A Masters Project Submitted in partial fulfillment of the requirements for Global Affairs

By

Mostafa Ahmed Mostafa Safwat

Spring2017

Table of Contents
Project element: Critical Case Study (Option 2: M.G.A Guidelines).
Project title: The implementation of the United Nations Security Council resolutions on Libya

I- Introduction/ Project objective:	Page 3 – p. 7
a) The Situation in Libya	Page 3 – p. 6
b) Objective of research	Page 6 – p. 7
II- Research Question:	Page 7 – p. 8
III- Client Description:	Page 8 – p. 8
IV- Argument/Preview of Findings and Recommendations:	Page 8 – p. 9
a) Hypothesis	Page 8 – p. 9
V- Background:	P. 9 – p. 19
a) The United Nations Security Council	P. 9 – p. 12
b) Countries and International Organizations' reactions to the situation in Libya.	P. 12 – p. 15
c) The League of Arab States' role in the Libyan conflict/Resolution 7360 (2011).	P. 15 – p. 17
d) Countries and International Organizations' reactions to the adoption of UNSC Resolutions 1970 and 1973 on Libya.	P. 17 – p. 19
VI- Literature review:	P. 19 – p. 35
a) The United Nations Security Council resolution 1970 (2011).	P. 19 – p. 20
b) The United Nations Security Council resolution 1973 (2011).	P. 20 – p. 22
c) The implementation of the UNSC resolutions 1970 and 1973 (NFZ).	P. 22 – p. 26
d) The Responsibility to protect principle (R2P).	P. 27 – p. 30
e) Going beyond the "Arms Embargo"/Support/Arming of Rebels.	P. 30 – p. 32
f) Boots on the ground.	P. 32 – p. 33
g) Protection of civilians.	P. 33 – p. 35
VII- Methodology, including discussion of alternative methodologies:	P. 35 – p. 36
VIII- Case or Data selection:	P. 36 – p. 37
IX- Analysis of the data or case(s):	P. 37 – p. 50
Interviews.Consequences/results of military intervention in LibyaImplications for Syrian Conflict.	P. 49 – p. 50
X-Conclusion:	P. 50 – p. 51
List of Interviews	P. 52
Bibliography	P. 53 – p. 56
Annexes	P. 57

I- Introduction/ Project objective:

a) The Situation in Libya:

The Libyan Revolution of February 11th 2011 quickly degenerated into a bloody civil war between the Libyan rebels revolting against former President Colonel Muammar El Qaddafi's forces. Qaddafi received international condemnation as soon as the Libyan Revolution erupted and was accused of killing civilians who were calling for him to step down from power. The deteriorating situation in the country led to the United Nations Security Council's (UNSC) response in convening and adopting a number of resolutions to both condemn the Libyan regime as well as to take action against it. The SC considered the situation in Libya a threat to international peace and security, which resulted in the Council's adoption of resolutions 1970 and 1973 under chapter VII of the UN Charter to take action by intervening in the conflict, by imposing sanctions, a No-Fly Zone (NFZ) as well as other measures to halt Qaddafi from killing civilians, which in turn paved the way for military intervention in Libya. According to Sara Lea, Human Rights Watch (HRW)'s executive director for the Middle East and North Africa at the time "there was a humanitarian disaster taking place in Libya, with protestors' resistance to gunshots and death, and HRW called for the trial of the authorities responsible for the civilian deaths in Libya, including Qaddafi himself and to bring them in for questioning" (Meaddi, 2011- Informal translation). Arab countries, the African Union, the European Union and other governments with links to Libya were called upon by HRW to call on Qaddafi to put an end to 'illegal use of violence against peaceful protestors' (Meaddi, 2011). Qaddafi as well as his security authorities had been mainly accused by a number of countries including but not limited to the United States of America (USA), United Kingdom (UK), and France of using force against protestors - which they viewed as "peaceful" - calling for the downfall of his regime. The accusation was that Qaddafi's armed forces were shooting at unarmed civilians who were peacefully demonstrating against Qaddafi and calling for him to step down from power which escalated into a violent turn of events. The rapidly deteriorating situation on the ground in Libya paved the way for various regional and international actors to intervene in the Libyan crisis. This caused a number of reactions by The League of Arab States (LAS), as well as the UNSC and the North Atlantic Treaty Organization (NATO), alongside many countries. Amnesty International (AI) condemned Qaddafi for the acts of violence committed against protestors by his security forces. "AI published an official statement on its website calling for the SC and LAS to immediately send an envoy to Libya to

investigate events that led to the death of hundreds of protestors" (Meaddi 2011) Oaddafi was also

List of Interviews

- 1- Interview 1. Namira Negm. Interview with Ambassador Dr. Namira Negm, Egyptian Ambassador to Rwanda, Former Deputy Assistant Minister for Legal Affairs, Egyptian Ministry of Foreign Affairs, Date of Interview: 15/10/2016.
- 2- Interview 2. Egyptian Ambassador. (Who asked not to be named). Interview with an Egyptian Ambassador, Egyptian Ministry of Foreign Affairs, who asked not to be named. 27/10/2016.
- 3- Interview 3. Nabil El Gawahergy. Interview with Nabil El Gawahergy. Third Secretary, Embassy of Egypt in Algeria. Former Diplomat Department of Libya, Egyptian Ministry of Foreign Affairs, Date of Interview: 16/11/2016.
- 4- Interview 4. Libyan diplomat (Who chose not to be named for his safety). Embassy of Libya in an African country. Date of interview: 1/1/2017.
- 5- Interview 5. EU diplomat. (Who chose not to be named for her safety). Date of interview: 3/01/2017.

Bibliography:

- 1- Allain, Jean. The true challenge to the United Nations system of the use of force: the failures of Kosovo and Iraq and the emergence of the African Union. 2004. Max Planck UNYB 8 (2004). http://www.mpil.de/files/pdf1/mpunyb_allain_8.pdf. Accessed 8/10/2016
- 2- Bellamy, Alex J and Williams, Paul D. The new politics of protection? Côte d'Ivoire, Libya and the responsibility to protect. 2011. The Royal Institute of International Affairs. http://journalistsresource.org/wp-content/uploads/2011/10/full-study1.pdf. Accessed: 8/8/2016.
- 3- Blanchard, Christopher M. (2011). Libya: Unrest and U.S. Policy. Congressional research Service (prepared for members of congress). Retrieved from http://fpc.state.gov/documents/organization/159788.pdf
- 4- Chesterman, Simon, "Leading from Behind': The Responsibility to Protect, the Obama Doctrine, and Humanitarian Intervention After Libya" (2011). New York University Public Law and Legal Theory Working Papers. Paper 282. http://lsr.nellco.org/nyu_plltwp/282
- 5- Christiansen, HF. (2011). The implementation of the United Nations Security Council Resolution 1973 on Libya. Oslo University. Retrieved from https://www.duo.uio.no/bitstream/handle/10852/22701/144655.pdf?sequence=1.
- 6- Constantinides, Aristotle. An Overview of Legal Restraints on Security Council Chapter VII Action with a Focus on Post-Conflict Iraq. Institute of Public International Law and International Relations of Thessaloniki http://www.esil-sedi.eu/sites/default/files/Constantinides_0.PDF. Accessed: 10/8/2016.
- 7- Dembinski, Matthias, and Reinold, Theresa. (2011). Libya and the Future of the Responsibility to Protect –African and European Perspectives. Peace Research institute Frankfurt.

 Retrieved from: http://www.google.com.eg/url?sa=t&rct=j&q=un%20resolution%201973%20libya%20pdf &source=web&cd=40&cad=rja&ved=0CF4QFjAJOB4&url=http%3A%2F%2Fkms1.isn.e https://www.google.com.eg/url?sa=t&rct=j&q=un%20resolution%201973%20libya%20pdf &source=web&cd=40&cad=rja&ved=0CF4QFjAJOB4%2Fipublicationdocument_singled ocument%2F2c8b87f1-
 - 49b24891ab163ed3f6c36fc5%2Fen%2Fprif107.pdf&ei=HFAeUtX7M6Ku7Aaql4DADw&usg=AFQjCNGjT0R7DI3hTIMnbAiJS6f2Sx9peQ&bvm=bv.51156542,d.ZGU
- 8- Deplano, Rossana. The Use of International Law by the United Nations Security Council: An Empirical Framework for Analysis. http://law.emory.edu/eilr/recentdevelopments/volume29/essays/international-law-united-nations-council.html. Accessed 8/10/2016.
- 9- Einsiedel, Malone and Ugarte. Sebastian Von Einsiedel, David M. Malone, and Bruno Stagno Ugarte. The UN Security Council in the 21st Century. 2015. Lynne Rienner Publishers https://www.rienner.com/uploads/55f1a23ac18a6.pdf. Accessed 8/10/2016.
- 10- Ekwealor, Chinedu Thomas and Uzodike, Nwabufo Okeke. (2012). The United Nations Security Council and Human Insecurity in Libya: The Intricacies of Resolution 1973. School of Social Sciences, University of KwaZulu-Natal, South Africa. Retrieved from http://www.ipedr.com/vol51/022-ICHSC2012-B10004.pdf

- 11- Garlasco, Marc. NATO's lost lessons from Libya. June 11, 2012. The Washington Post.https://www.washingtonpost.com/opinions/natos-lost-lessons-fromlibya/2012/06/11/gJQAhkAoVV_story.html
- 12- Glazerbrook, Dan. The Lessons of Libya. November 12, 2014. Counterpunch.org. http://www.counterpunch.org/2014/11/12/the-lessons-of-libya/
- 13- Globalr2p.org. 2016. The Responsibility to Protect. http://www.globalr2p.org/about_r2p. Accessed 8/8/2016.
- 14- Hilsum, Lindsey. (2012). Sandstorm Libya in the Time of Revolution. Faber and Faber Ltd. London.
- 15- سيد إمام. (2012). الثورة الليبية سلسلة ثورات مصرية وعربية دار أقلام للنشر. القاهرة. (Imam, 2012)-15
- 16- Jacoiste, Eugenia Lopez. The UN Collective security System and its Relationship with Economic Sanctions and Human Rights. 2010. A. Von Bigdandy and R. Wolfrum, (eds), Max Planck Yearbook of United Nations Law, Volume 14, 2010, 2010. Koninklike Brill N.V. Printed in The Netherlands.
- 17- Karns& Mingst. Margaret P.Karns and Karen A. Mingst. International Organizations: The Politics and Processes of Global Governance. 2004. Lynne Rienner Publishers. www.rienner.com
- 18- Karns, Margret P. and Karen A. Mingst, International Organizations. The Poliitcs and Processes of Global Governance. Boulder, London, Lynne Rienner Publishers, 2010.
- 19- Kinacioglu, Muge. The Principle of Non-Intervention at the United Nations: The Charter Framework and the Legal Debate. 2005. Centre for international studies, London School of Economics and Political Science
- http://sam.gov.tr/wp-content/uploads/2012/01/Muge-Kinacioglu.pdf. Accessed 8/10/2016.
- 20- Köchler, Hans. (2011). Memorandum by the President of the International Progress Organization on Security Council resolution 1973 (2011) and its implementation by a "coalition of the willing" under the leadership of the United States and the North Atlantic Treaty Organization. International Progress Organization (Vienna). Retrieved from http://i-p-o.org/IPO-Memorandum-UN-Libya-26Mar11.pdf
- 21- LAS Res. No.: 7360. (2011). The outcome of the Council of the League of Arab States meeting at the Ministerial level in its extraordinary session On The implications of the current events in Libya and the Arab position Cairo, March 12, 2011. Retrieved from www.securitycouncilreport.org/atf/cf/...6D27.../Libya%207360.pdf
- 22- Manji, Firoze & Ekine, Sokari. (2011). African Awakening The Emerging Revolutions. Pambazuka Press. The UK. Published in 2012.
- 23- Mueller, Karl P. Precision and Purpose: Airpower in the Libyan Civil War/ Karl P. Mueller (and thirteen others). 2015. Published by the RAND Corporation. www.rand.org
- 24- Naime, Monica. (2012). Libya and Resolution 1973: The Law of Politics. Journal of Strategic Security. Retrieved from: <a href="http://scholarcommons.usf.edu/cgi/viewcontent.cgi?article=1158&context=jss&seiredir=1&referer=http%3A%2F%2Fwww.google.com.eg%2Furl%3Fsa%3Dt%26rct%3Dj%26q%3Dun%2520resolution%25201973%2520libya%2520pdf%26source%3Dweb%26cd%3D32%26cad%3Drja%26ved%3D0CC0QFjABOB4%26url%3Dhttp%253A%252F%252Fscholarcommons.usf.edu%252Fcgi%252Fviewcontent.cgi%253Farticle%253D1158%2526context%253Djss%26ei%3DHFAeUtX7M6Ku7Aaql4DADw%26usg%3DAFQjCNFLfr

- pHvekACe lgPE1ahHlbZWEg%26bvm%3Dbv.51156542%2Cd.ZGU#search=%22un%20resolution%201973%20libya%20pdf%22.
- 25- Nolte and Randelzhofer. Georg Nolte, Albrecht Randelzhofer. Ch.VII Action with Respect to Threats to the Peace, Breaches of the Peace, and Acts of Aggression, Article 51. From: <u>The Charter of the United Nations: A Commentary, Volume II (3rd Edition)</u>. Edited By: Bruno Simma, Daniel-Erasmus Khan, Georg Nolte, Andreas Paulus, Nikolai Wessendorf (Assistant Editor). 22 November 2012. Oxford Scholarly Authorities on International Law.
 - http://opil.ouplaw.com/view/10.1093/law/9780199639779.001.0001/law-9780199639779-chapter-66. Accessed 8/10/2016
- 26- Pargeter, Alison. (2012) LIBYA THE RISE AND FALL OF QADDAFI. YALE UNIVERSITY PRESS. NEW HAVEN AND LONDON.
- 27- Payandeh, Mehrdad. (2012). The United Nations, Military Intervention, and Regime Change in Libya. The Virginia Journal of International Law Association. 2012. Retrieved from http://www.vjil.org/assets/pdfs/vol52/issue2/Payandeh Post Production.pdf
- 28- Popovski, Vesselin. The Concepts of Responsibility to Protect and Protection of Civilians: 'Sisters, but not Twins'. The Institute for Sustainability and Peace, United Nations University in Tokyo. Security Challenges Vol.7 N.4 (Summer 2011). http://www.regionalsecurity.org.au/Resources/Files/vol7no4Popovski.pdf. Accessed: 8/8/2016.
- 29- Postema, Saskia. The Responsibility to protect and Libya: Uncovering the Achilles' heel of R2p-based intervention. Rijksuniversiteit Groningen journals.library.tudelft.nl/index.php/sure/article/view/1078. Accessed: 8/8/2016.
- 30- Remshardt, Katharina. Under what Conditions has the UN been able to use its Chapter VII Powers? NOV 13 2010. University of Birmingham. http://www.e-ir.info/2010/11/13/under-what-conditions-has-the-un-been-able-to-use-its-chapter-vii-powers/. Accessed: 8/10/2016.
- 31- Responsibility to protect.org. 2016. An Introduction to the Responsibility to Protect. http://www.responsibilitytoprotect.org/index.php/about-rtop. Accessed: 8/8/2016.
- 32- Ronda, Hauben. (2011). The Role of the UN Security Council in Unleashing an Illegal War against Libya. Global research. Retrieved from http://www.globalresearch.ca/the-role-of-the-un-security-council-in-unleashing-an-illegal-war-against-libya/25715
- 33- Schott, Jared. Chapter VII as Exception: Security Council Action and the Regulative Ideal of Emergency, Volume 6 Northwestern Journal of International Human Rights. (2008). http://scholarlycommons.law.northwestern.edu/njihr/vol6/iss1/2. Accessed: 8/10/2016.
- 34- Sloggett, Dave. (2012). The RAF's AIR WAR IN LIBYA. Published by Pen & Sword Aviation. Great Britain.
- 35- Spain, Anna. The U.N. Security Council's Duty to Decide. 2013. Harvard National Security Journal. http://harvardnsj.org/wp-content/uploads/2013/05/Vol.4-Spain Final-Revised3.pdf. Accessed 8/10/2016.
- 36- UN.org. UN Charter. http://www.un.org/en/sections/un-charter/chapter-vii/. Accessed: 8/8/2016.

- 37- UN.org. 17 March 2011. Security Council Approves 'No-Fly Zone' over Libya, Authorizing 'All Necessary Measures' to Protect Civilians, by Vote of 10 in Favor with 5 Abstentions. http://www.un.org/press/en/2011/sc10200.doc.htm. Accessed: 8/8/2016.
- 38- UNSC Res. No. 1970. (2011). Resolution 1970 (2011) adopted by the United Nations Security Council at its 6491st meeting, on 26 February 2011. Retrieved from http://www.icc-cpi.int/NR/rdonlyres/081A9013-B03D-4859-9D61-5D0B0F2F5EFA/0/1970Eng.pdf
- 39- UNSC Res. No. 1973. (2011). Resolution 1973 (2011) adopted by the Security Council at its 6498th meeting, on 17 March 2011. Retrieved from http://daccess-dds-ny.un.org/doc/UNDOC/GEN/N11/268/39/PDF/N1126839.pdf?OpenElement
- 40- UNSC Res. No. 2009. (2011). Resolution 2009 (2011) adopted by the Security Council at its 6620th meeting, on 16 September 2011. Retrieved from http://daccess-dds-ny.un.org/doc/UNDOC/GEN/N11/502/44/PDF/N1150244.pdf?OpenElement
- 41- UNSC Res. No. 2016. (2011). Resolution 2016 (2011) adopted by the Security Council at its 6640th meeting, on 27 October 2011. Retrieved from http://daccess-ddsny.un.org/doc/UNDOC/GEN/N11/567/10/PDF/N1156710.pdf?OpenElement
- 42- UNSC Res. No. 2017. (2011). Resolution 2017 (2011) adopted by the Security Council at its 6644th meeting, on 31 October 2011. Retrieved from http://daccess-dds-ny.un.org/doc/UNDOC/GEN/N11/573/33/PDF/N1157333.pdf?OpenElement
- 43- UNSC Res. No. 2022. (2011). Resolution 2022 (2011) adopted by the Security Council at its 6673rd meeting, on 2 December 2011. Retrieved from http://daccess-dds-ny.un.org/doc/UNDOC/GEN/N11/620/28/PDF/N1162028.pdf?OpenElement
- 44- Vradenburgh, Anna M. The Chapter VII Powers of the United Nations Charter: Do They Trump Human Rights Law, 14 Loy. L.A. Int'l & Comp. L. Rev. 175 (1991). http://digitalcommons.lmu.edu/cgi/viewcontent.cgi?article=1242&context=ilr. Accessed 8/10/2016.
- 45- Williams, Paul R., & Popken, Colleen. (2012). SECURITY COUNCIL RESOLUTION 1973 ON LIBYA: A MOMENT OF LEGAL & MORAL CLARITY. Case Western Reserve University School of Law. Retrieved from http://law.case.edu/journals/JIL/Documents/(11)%20Williams_Darby.pdf
- 46- Xing, Qu. The UN Charter, the Responsibility to Protect, and the Syria Issue. Apr 16, 2012. China Institute of International Studies. China International Studies (March/April 2012). http://www.ciis.org.cn/english/2012-04/16/content_4943041.htm. Accessed 8/10/2016.

-47 د. الحسيني الحسيني معدي. (2011).القذافي نيروز الشرق. دار الخلود للنشر و التوزيع. (2011). 48 ياسر حماية. (2011). معمر الطاسة – القذافي سابقاً – القائد الأعلى للكوميديا في العالم. كنوز للنشر والتوزيع. (Hemaya, 2011).

ANNEXE

- 1. United Nations Security Council Resolution 1970 (2011)
- 2. United Nations Security Council Resolution 1973 (2011)
 - **3.** League of Arab States 7360 (2011).

Abstract

The situation in Libya in February 2011 turned into a violent civil war between what was viewed at the time as peaceful protestors calling for the Qaddafi regime to step down and the Qaddafi regime forces. This resulted in international condemnation and action by many countries and international organizations such as the League of Arab States, the United Nations and the North Atlantic Treaty Organization. The United Nations Security Council adopted resolutions 1970 and 1973 in 2011 to protect the civilian population in Libya from Qaddafi's forces. These resolutions paved the way for an international military intervention in Libya. This project looks into the extent to which the UN mandate was exceeded during the implementation of the resolutions - if at all. The resolutions mandate was the protection of civilians and not regime change, yet the military intervention that took place over Libya through Operation Odyssey Dawn and which later shifted to the NATO-led Operation Unified Protector resulted in regime change in Libya. Countries who participated in the military intervention in Libya, such as USA, UK and France, among many others – and later on NATO, as well as non-NATO countries – exceeded the UNSC resolutions' mandate because of their resort to direct military intervention, and went to war against Qaddafi's forces as opposed to adhering to an imposition of a NFZ to protect civilians as the resolution stated. The mandate had been stretched beyond neutralizing Gadhafi's aerial capacities. Countries that directly and openly armed the Libyan rebels to fight against the Qaddafi regime also went beyond the letter of the UNSC resolutions.

Dedication

I dedicate this project to my dear parents who have been very supportive and insistent that I enroll in a Master's program, and finish writing my project. Also, I dedicate this project to my dear supervisor Dr. Ibrahim Awad, who has not only been patient with me but inspiring and motivational as well for which I truly thank him. I would also like to dedicate this study to Dr. Magda Shahin and Dr. Reda Shehata whom have also been motivational to me in finalizing this project. I would also like to thank my beloved family and friends who have stood by me throughout the past five years until I completed my Master's. Finally, I dedicate this project to any Academic who is interested in researching Libya especially the case study found in this project which tackles the early phases of the military intervention in the country in 2011 which constituted the basis of this research.