CORE
Metadata, citation and similar papers at core.ac.uk
Provided by Explore Bristol Research

Liu, A. G. S. C., Matthews, J., Menon, L., McIlroy, D., & Brasier, M. (2015). The arrangement of possible muscle fibres in the Ediacaran taxon Haootia quadriformis. Proceedings of the Royal Society B - Biological Sciences, 282(1803). 10.1098/rspb.2014.2949

Peer reviewed version

Link to published version (if available):
10.1098/rspb.2014.2949

Link to publication record in Explore Bristol Research
PDF-document

University of Bristol - Explore Bristol Research

General rights

This document is made available in accordance with publisher policies. Please cite only the published version using the reference above. Full terms of use are available:
http://www.bristol.ac.uk/pure/about/ebr-terms.html

Take down policy

Explore Bristol Research is a digital archive and the intention is that deposited content should not be removed. However, if you believe that this version of the work breaches copyright law please contact open-access@bristol.ac.uk and include the following information in your message:

• Your contact details
• Bibliographic details for the item, including a URL
• An outline of the nature of the complaint

On receipt of your message the Open Access Team will immediately investigate your claim, make an initial judgement of the validity of the claim and, where appropriate, withdraw the item in question from public view.

PROCEEDINGS B

The arrangement of possible muscle fibres in the Ediacaran taxon Haootia quadriformis

Journal:	*Proceedings B*
Manuscript ID:	RSPB-2014-2949.R1
Article Type:	Invited Reply
Date Submitted by the Author:	n/a
Complete List of Authors:	Liu, Alexander; University of Bristol, School of Earth Sciences Matthews, Jack; University of Oxford, Department of Earth Sciences Menon, Latha; University of Oxford, Department of Earth Sciences McIlroy, Duncan; Memorial University of Newfoundland, Department of Earth Sciences Brasier, Martin; University of Oxford, Department of Earth Sciences; Memorial University of Newfoundland, Earth Sciences
Subject:	Evolution < BIOLOGY, Developmental biology < BIOLOGY, Palaeontology < BIOLOGY
Keywords:	Ediacaran, Cnidarian, Muscle, Newfoundland
Proceedings B category:	Palaeontology

SCHOLARONE™
Manuscripts

Title: The arrangement of possible muscle fibres in the Ediacaran taxon *Haootia quadriformis*.

Authors: Alexander G. Liu[1, *], Jack J. Matthews[2], Latha R. Menon[2], Duncan McIlroy[3] and Martin D. Brasier[2, 3, §]

[1]*School of Earth Sciences, University of Bristol, Life Sciences Building, 24 Tyndall Avenue, Bristol, BS8 1TQ, U.K.*

[2]*Department of Earth Sciences, University of Oxford, South Parks Road, Oxford, OX1 3AN, U.K.*

[3]*Department of Earth Sciences, Memorial University of Newfoundland, 300 Prince Philip Drive, St. John's, NL, A1B 3X5, Canada*

§ *Deceased*

*Corresponding Author. Email: *alex.liu@bristol.ac.uk*

Keywords: Ediacaran; cnidarian; muscle; Newfoundland

Haootia quadriformis from Newfoundland, Canada, is one of the most unusual impressions of a soft-bodied macro-organism yet described from the late Ediacaran Period. Interpreted as a metazoan of cnidarian grade [1], the body impression of *H. quadriformis* possesses features interpreted as fibrous structures that represent possible evidence for muscular tissue. Evidence both in support of and against a relationship between *H. quadriformis* and the Staurozoa, one of the cnidarian groups to which *Haootia* was compared in Liu et al. [1], is

outlined by Miranda et al. [2]. Our intention in our original paper was to illustrate the staurozoan body plan for comparative purposes, rather than suggest homology or direct ancestry. Nevertheless, fresh insights from workers with expertise in the biology of extant cnidarians are welcomed.

We are pleased that the main points of our paper find support from the biological community: that recently discovered *Haootia quadriformis* likely preserves the impressions of muscle fibres in a macrofossil characterized by tetra-radial symmetry, and that these structures are consistent with a cnidarian body plan [2]. Histological images provided by Miranda et al. [2], plus their accompanying discussion, present a clear picture of muscular arrangements within modern stauromedusae. We concur that *Haootia* shows both similarities and differences with respect to stauromedusans.

Miranda et al. [2] suggest that the organisation of musculature described by us (see [1], fig. 3b) within the body of *Haootia* appears inconsistent with that observed in modern staurozoan taxa. While the argument for the presence of a radial (longitudinal) muscle arrangement is well reasoned (see [2], fig 1s), a revisiting of the type material to determine the orientation of fibrous structures in *Haootia* leads us to conclude that they are essentially as published in our original paper. The paratype specimen (see [1], fig. 1f) has fibres from potential coronal muscles that extend in arcs almost to the base of the calyx, with no clear preservation of radial fibres running perpendicular to these. We would argue that this phenomenon contradicts the suggestion that coronal muscle may have been restricted to the margins of the *Haootia* body [2].

The arrangement of musculature inferred by Liu et al. [1] does not preclude the presence of additional radial muscle bundles within the body of the organism. The holotype of *H. quadriformis* contains evidence for superposition of fibrous structures. We can clearly discern that the body sheet/calyx drapes parallel fibres observed in the stalk/peduncle, and

that subsidiary branches appear to extend beneath the body (Fig. 1). In such cases, the fibres beneath the calyx are not expressed in the fossilised impression, and are inferred to lie beyond the plane of preservation. It is therefore possible that both coronal and radial musculature were present in the calyx of *Haootia* (just as both are present in the arms of modern stauromedusae [2]), but only the outermost set is recorded in the cast of the body tissues so beautifully preserved in the *Haootia* impression.

If one were to adopt a stauromedusan analogue for *Haootia*, the inferred coronal musculature would be in the 'calyx' rather than the radial disc. This proposed muscular arrangement (see [1], fig. 3b) would argue against a free-swimming mode of life, and adds support to a benthic mode of life for *Haootia*. We therefore take great interest in the suggestion that this arrangement of muscles is consistent with an organism capable of producing powerful body contractions, potentially involved in a pulsing feeding strategy [2]. We must keep in mind that some, or maybe most, Ediacaran body plans and feeding strategies may have been specifically adapted to Ediacaran conditions. Possible behavioural ecologies such as surface detritus feeding, which would be feasible for an organism with so flexible a body, still await analysis.

The hypothetical models of muscle fibre arrangement proposed by ourselves [1] and Miranda et al. [2] both require further testing against the fossil material. The remarkably preserved holotype specimen of *Haootia* has now been collected (under permits issued by the Department of Tourism, Culture and Recreation, Government of Newfoundland and Labrador), and is housed at The Rooms Provincial Museum, St. John's, Newfoundland (specimen NFM F-994). While the fidelity of preservation restricts elements of the interpretation of this key fossil, the opportunity to apply controlled lighting conditions to the specimen following its removal from the outcrop offers the potential for further analysis (e.g. Fig. 1). We are confident that well-informed discussion of analogue taxa such as that offered

by Miranda et al. will lead to a more complete understanding of *Haootia,* and its evolutionary significance. Similarly detailed consideration of the physiology of other extant cnidarian clades would be greatly beneficial for palaeontologists working on candidate early cnidarians.

We would like to add in support of our discussion of *Haootia* that strata of similar age in Newfoundland also contain rare fossilized surface locomotion trails that are considered to have formed by contractile activities associated with a cnidarian body plan [3–6]. We have hitherto found no evidence that the basal disc of *Haootia* could contract or move, but having two independent lines of evidence for the presence of organisms with contractile tissues in the Ediacaran makes a more compelling case for the presence of cnidarian-grade organisms [1]. While we recognise the potential importance of a fossil cnidarian ancestor from somewhat well-dated strata for understanding the phylogeny of the Cnidaria, we would caution against the uncritical extension of such interpretations to other Ediacaran taxa. The preservation and morphology of many late Ediacaran macrofossils makes them difficult to interpret, and further work is required before we can be confident in our understanding of these ancient and evolutionarily important organisms.

Acknowledgement

We are grateful to two anonymous reviewers, and to NSERC (to D.M.) and the Natural Environment Research Council (grant no. NE/L011409/1 to A.G.L., and NE/J5000045/1 to J.J.M.) for financial support. The staff of The Rooms Provincial Museum and the Newfoundland and Labrador Department of Tourism, Culture and Recreation are thanked for their role in the successful salvage and curation of the holotype specimen. Additional images can be found here: doi:10.5061/dryad.8m2q8. We dedicate this manuscript to our co-author, mentor and friend Martin Brasier, who contributed so much to this field.

References

1. Liu AG, Matthews JJ, Menon LR, McIlroy D, Brasier MD. 2014 *Haootia quadriformis* n. gen., n. sp., interpreted as a muscular cnidarian impression from the late Ediacaran Period (~560 Ma). *Proc. R. Soc. B* **281**. (doi: 10.1098/rspb.2014.1202).
2. Miranda LS, Collins AG, Marques AC. 2014 Is *Haootia quadriformis* related to extant Staurozoa (Cnidaria)? Evidence from the muscular system reconsidered. *Proc. R. Soc. B*. (**This volume**)
3. Liu AG, McIlroy D. 2015. Horizontal surface traces from the Fermeuse Formation, Ferryland (Newfoundland, Canada), and their place within the late Ediacaran ichnological revolution. In: McIlroy D. (Ed.) ICHNOLOGY: Publications arising from ICHNIA III. *Geological Association of Canada, Miscellaneous Publication* **9,** 141–156.
4. Liu AG, McIlroy D, Brasier MD. 2010 First evidence for locomotion in the Ediacara biota from the 565Ma Mistaken Point Formation, Newfoundland. *Geology* **38**, 123–126. (doi: 10.1130/G30368.1).
5. Liu AG, McIlroy D, Brasier MD, Matthews JJ. 2014 Confirming the metazoan character of a 565 Ma trace-fossil assemblage from Mistaken Point, Newfoundland. *Palaios* **29**, 420–430. (doi: 10.2110/palo.2014.011).
6. Menon LR, McIlroy D, Brasier MD. 2013 Evidence for Cnidaria-like behavior in ca. 560 Ma Ediacaran *Aspidella*. *Geology* **41**, 895–898. (doi:10.1130/G34424.1).

Figure Caption

Figure 1. The disc, stalk and body of the *Haootia quadriformis* holotype. Image taken at The Rooms Provincial Museum, St. John's. Note that although the outline of the stalk/peduncle can be seen beneath the body/calyx, the longitudinal fibres running along its length cannot be

122 easily traced (white arrow). Similarly, fibres radiating from the smallest subsidiary branches
123 are typically not seen to continue beneath the body (e.g. black arrow). It is thus plausible that
124 additional muscle bundles, perhaps in different arrangements to those preserved, were present
125 in the original *Haootia* organism, but do not lie in the plane of preservation. Scale bar = 10
126 mm.

The disc, stalk and body of the Haootia quadriformis holotype. Image taken at The Rooms Provincial Museum, St. John's. Note that although the outline of the stalk/peduncle can be seen beneath the body/calyx, the longitudinal fibres running along its length cannot be easily traced (white arrow). Similarly, fibres radiating from the smallest subsidiary branches are typically not seen to continue beneath the body (e.g. black arrow). It is thus plausible that additional muscle bundles, perhaps in different arrangements to those preserved, were present in the original Haootia organism, but do not lie in the plane of preservation. Scale bar = 10 mm.
133x88mm (600 x 600 DPI)