Relating growth potential and biofilm formation of Shigatoxigenic *Escherichia coli* to *in planta* colonisation and the metabolome of ready- to-eat crops

Running title: STEC growth characteristics in plants

Authors:

Bernhard Merget [a,b], Ken J. Forbes [c], Fiona Brennan [d], Sean McAteer [e], Tom Shepherd [a], Norval J.C. Strachan [b], Nicola J. Holden [a#]

Affiliations:

a: Cell and Molecular Sciences, The James Hutton Institute, Dundee, DD2 5DA, UK

b: School of Biological Sciences, The University of Aberdeen, Cruickshank Building. St Machar Drive, Aberdeen, AB24 3UU, UK

c: School of Medicine and Dentistry, The University of Aberdeen, Foresterhill, Aberdeen, AB25 2ZD, UK

d: Teagasc, Dept. of Environment, Soils and Land-Use, Johnstown Castle, Wexford, Republic of Ireland

e: Roslin Institute & R(D)SVS, The University of Edinburgh, Easter Bush, EH25 9RG, UK

for correspondence: nicola.holden@hutton.ac.uk

Word Count: 5891 / 6000 (ex. Methods, Refs, Fig Legs, Tables)

Keywords: spinach; lettuce; alfalfa; fenugreek; *E. coli* O157:H7; EHEC

1 Abstract (247 / 250 words)

2 Contamination of fresh produce with pathogenic *Escherichia coli,* including Shigatoxigenic *E.*

3 *coli* (STEC), represents a serious risk to human health. Colonisation is governed by multiple

4 bacterial and plant factors that can impact on the probability and suitability of bacterial growth.

5 Thus, we aimed to determine whether the growth potential of STEC for plants associated with

6 foodborne outbreaks (two leafy vegetables and two sprouted seed species), is predictive for

7 colonisation of living plants as assessed from growth kinetics and biofilm formation in plant

8 extracts. Fitness of STEC was compared to environmental *E. coli*, at temperatures relevant to

9 plant growth. Growth kinetics in plant extracts varied in a plant-dependent and isolate-

10 dependent manner for all isolates, with spinach leaf lysates supporting the fastest rates of

11 growth. Spinach extracts also supported the highest levels of biofilm formation. Saccharides

12 were identified as the major driver of bacterial growth, although no single metabolite could be

13 correlated with growth kinetics. The highest level of *in planta* colonisation occurred on alfalfa

14 sprouts, though internalisation was 10-times more prevalent in the leafy vegetables than in

15 sprouted seeds. Marked differences in *in planta* growth meant that growth potential could only

16 be inferred for STEC for sprouted seeds. In contrast, biofilm formation in extracts related to

17 spinach colonisation. Overall, the capacity of *E. coli* to colonise, grow and internalise within

18 plants or plant-derived matrices were influenced by the isolate type, plant species, plant tissue

19 type and temperature, complicating any straight-forward relationship between *in vitro* and *in*

20 *planta* behaviours.

21 ## Importance (149 / 150 word)

22 Fresh produce is an important vehicle for STEC transmission and experimental evidence

23 shows that STEC can colonise plants as secondary hosts, but differences in the capacity to

24 colonise occur between different plant species and tissues. Therefore, an understanding of the

25 impact of these plant factors have on the ability of STEC to grow and establish is required for

26 food safety considerations and risk assessment. Here, we determined whether growth and the

27 ability of STEC to form biofilms in plants extracts could be related to specific plant metabolites

28 or could predict the ability of the bacteria to colonise living plants. Growth rates for sprouted

29 seeds (alfalfa and fenugreek) exhibited a positive relationship between plant extracts and living

30 plants, but not for leafy vegetables (lettuce and spinach). Therefore, the detailed variations at

31 the level of the bacterial isolate, plant species and tissue type all need to be considered in risk

32 assessment.

33

Introduction

Contamination of fresh produce from Shigatoxigenic *Escherichia coli* (STEC) presents a serious hazard as a cause of food-borne illnesses, diarrhoea and enterohemorrhagic disease. Fresh produce is a major vehicle of transmission of STEC, with foods of plant origin accounting for the majority of *E. coli* and *Shigella* outbreaks in the USA (50). Fresh produce is often eaten raw or minimally processed and contamination of the produce can occur at any point along the food chain from farm to fork, with major outbreaks e.g. spinach (30) and sprouted seeds (6). STEC has been shown to interact with plants and can use them as secondary hosts (16, 25), which has implications for pre-harvest contamination, as well as persisting on post-harvest produce (29, 31, 32, 34, 52).

Colonisation of host plants by *E. coli* is governed by a range of environmental, bacterial and plant factors. Initial contact and attachment of bacteria on plant tissue is defined by motility, adherence factors and plant cell wall components (33, 64, 65), while establishment is influenced by a range of plant biotic (44, 67, 68) and abiotic factors (15, 62). The ability of bacteria to grow in the presence of plant material is a key factor in assessing risk, and although proliferation is well known to be influenced by physio-chemico factors (5, 23, 57, 58), risk assessments for STEC on fresh produce tend to consider plants as a homogenous whole (12, 21, 51).

STEC preferentially colonise the roots and rhizosphere of fresh produce plants over leafy tissue and have been shown to internalise into plant tissue, where they can persist in the apoplastic space as endophytes (13, 72). The apoplast contains metabolites, such as solutes, sugars, proteins and cell wall components (54) and as such provides a rich environment for

4

many bacterial species, both commensal bacteria and human pathogens (20, 28). The rate of STEC internalisation is dependent on multiple factors including the plant species and tissue (73) and how plants are propagated (17-19). Specificity in the response of STEC to different plant species and tissue types has been demonstrated at the transcriptional level (9, 38). Therefore, there is a need to take into account specificity of the STEC-plant interactions that could impact risk.

Determination of the growth potential of a bacterial population takes into account the probability of growth together with the suitability of the growing population for a particular environment (22). It is used as a measure in risk assessment, e.g. for growth of STEC in water (70). In plant hosts, bacterial growth potential is governed by several factors, including bacterial growth rates, initial adherence and colony establishment, which is often in biofilms, as well as plant-dependent factors including metabolite availability and the ability to withstand plant defence responses (26). Therefore, the aim here was to determine if *in vitro* growth kinetics and biofilm formation of STEC in plant extracts, together with plant metabolite analysis, could be related to colonisation of plants that are associated with food-borne outbreaks, and hence inform on growth potential of STEC *in planta*. Use of genetically distinct *E. coli* isolates (two STEC, two environmental and one laboratory isolate) enabled assessment of phenotypic variation within plants or plant-derived matrices to be compared. Growth kinetics and biofilm formation were quantified in different tissue extracts of two leafy vegetables, lettuce and spinach, and two sprouted seeds, fenugreek and alfalfa sprouts. Growth kinetics was related to metabolomics of the extracts. Quantification of *in planta* colonisation and internalisation allowed a correlation analysis the for two STEC isolates.

Results

Growth rate parameterisation

To relate growth potential to colonisation of STEC in fresh produce plants, *in vitro* growth rates were first measured in plant extracts. Representative edible species associated with food-borne outbreaks were used: two leafy greens (lettuce, spinach) and two sprouted seeds (fenugreek, alfalfa). Plant tissues used were to represent edible, non-edible and internalised tissues of the leafy greens from total lysates of leaves or roots, and apoplastic washing recovered from leaves, respectively, while total sprout lysates were used to represent edible sprouts. A panel of five *E. coli* was assessed (Table 1) to allow relative fitness of two STEC O157:H7 Stx- isolates derived from fresh produce-associated outbreaks to be compared to two environmental isolates from plant roots and soil. A K-12 faecal-derived and laboratory-adapted isolate was included for reference. Growth was assessed at three temperatures (18, 20 and 25 °C) to represent relevant growth temperatures of leafy greens and sprouted seeds. Growth kinetics were measured from optical densities derived from a plate reader (as described by others (22).

E. coli growth rates in plant extracts

Primary modelling of *in vitro* growth data in plant extracts successfully fitted 86.7 % (117 of 135) growth curves with a non-linear Baranyi model (SM1). Mis-fits were improved by manually truncating the growth curves to before the observed decrease in cell density that occurred in stationary phase, resulting in R^2_{adj} = 0.996 (Fig. S1, Table S1). Comparison of the maximum growth rates (μ) showed highest growth rates in spinach extracts, with fastest growth in leaf lysates at 18 °C or apoplast at 25 °C (Fig. 1A), while in lettuce the fastest growth occurred in

6

101 apoplastic extract at all temperatures tested (Fig. 1B). All isolates grew consistently faster in

102 fenugreek sprout extracts than in alfalfa, and either sprout extract supported faster growth than

103 defined medium (RDMG) (Fig. 1C). The *E. coli* O157:H7 isolates showed differential

104 responses in the different extracts and their growth rates were as fast or faster than the

105 environmental isolates in almost all extracts. The lowest growth rates occurred for the

106 laboratory-adapted isolate MG1655. The plant extract tissue-type as well as the bacterial

107 isolate significantly impacted μ, from a two-way ANOVA at 18 °C ($F_{(4, 7363)}$ = 76.3; p <

108 0.0001 and $F_{(8, 7363)}$ = 436.4; p < 0.0001, for bacterial isolate and extract type, respectively)

109 and at 20 °C ($F_{(4, 8387)}$ = 160.3; p < 0.0001 and $F_{(8, 8387)}$ = 416.1; p < 0.0001, for bacterial

110 isolate and extract type, respectively).

111 Growth was almost always highest at 25 °C, although with exceptions, e.g. for *E. coli* O157:H7

112 isolate ZAP1589 in lettuce extracts. Growth characteristics were similar at both 18 and 20 °C,

113 but μ were in general lower at 20 °C than at 18 °C. This counterintuitive result was

114 reproducible and occurred in all growth experiments. It meant that secondary modelling for

115 temperature was not possible. It was possible, however, for temperature-effects of growth in

116 the defined medium without plant extracts, which produced a linear distribution for temperature

117 for all five *E. coli* isolates (R^2 = 0.996 to 1) (SM2), indicating the effect was due to the plant

118 extracts and not a systemic error.

119 Metabolite analysis of fresh produce plant extracts

120 To establish the impacts of different plant components on the growth of the *E. coli* isolates,

121 metabolite analysis was determined for the extracts. Detection of absolute levels of mono- and

122 disaccharides (sucrose, fructose, glucose, arabinose) showed the highest abundance in

123   fenugreek sprout extracts, followed by lettuce apoplast and lettuce leaf lysates (Table 2).

124   Sucrose was the most abundant sugar in all species and cultivars, except for alfalfa, which had

125   high levels of fructose and glucose. Arabinose was only detected in the apolastic fluid of

126   spinach and lettuce, accounting for 0.36 % and 0.23 % of all sugars, respectively. A two-way

127   ANOVA found significant differences for tissue types ($F_{(7, 60)}$ = 16.5; $p < 0.0001$).

128   The levels of amino acids and other metabolites were determined from identification of 116

129   polar metabolites, of which 60 were assigned and mapped onto a simplified polar metabolite

130   pathway for plants to visualise metabolite availability for the bacteria (Fig. S2). The abundance

131   ratio of each compound against the internal standard ribitol, generated a response ratio (RR)

132   to allow semi-quantitative comparison (Table S2). Differences occurred between species and

133   tissue types in a similar pattern to the mono- and disaccharides (Table 2), and for 12

134   metabolites including fructose, glucose and sucrose, there were significantly different RR (two-

135   way ANOVA and Tukey multiple comparison, $F_{(7, 854)}$ = 37.2, $p < 0.0001$). Small amounts of

136   arabinose could be found in all tissues with no significant differences between host species or

137   tissue types. Grouping metabolites by structure (Fig. 2A) for monosaccharides,

138   polysaccharides, amino acids, organic acids and other metabolites, showed that the highest

139   total saccharides were present in fenugreek sprouts, while alfalfa was higher in

140   monosaccharides and amino acids. The organic acids in spinach apoplast consisted mainly of

141   oxalic acid, which was almost double the amount in spinach leaf lysates. The percentage

142   composition showed that the majority of metabolites in all lettuce extracts are polysaccharides,

143   compared to mainly of organic acids in all spinach extracts.

144   Significant variation of the metabolite content occurred between plant tissues, as well as for

145   and individual metabolites (two-way ANOVA from assuming a parametric distribution, $F_{(420,}$

854) = 43.15; p < 0.001). A principal components analysis (PCA) showed that the first five

components accounted for ~ 85 % of variance, and 50 % of the variance for all detectable

polar metabolites (n=116) was attributed to PC1 and 2 (Fig. 2B). This was supported by

significant positive correlation for leaf lysates and apoplast extracts of lettuce and spinach (R^2

> 0.97), a weak correlation for the root lysates based on species (R^2 0.542 – 0.757), with no

significant correlation between any species for the tissues.

The influence of plant extract metabolites on *E. coli* growth

To relate any specific plant metabolites to bacterial growth, a correlation analysis was carried

out between the plant extracts growth rates for two *E. coli* O157:H7 isolates (Sakai and

ZAP1589) and the assigned metabolites. Several organic acids positively associated with

maximal growth rates (μ), although there was a temperature-dependent effect. Metabolites

associate with growth at 18 °C for isolate Sakai were galactosyl glycerol, threonic acid, and

oxoproline (p ~ 0.04); at 20 °C, malic acid, fumaric acid and quinic acid (p = 0.014 – 0.048);

and at 25 °C oxalic acid (p = 0.009), aspartic acid (p = 0.038), glutamic acid (p = 0.046),

coumaric acid (p = 0.011) and uridine (p = 0.011). Chlorogenic acid (*trans*-5-O-caffeoyl-D-

quinate) was consistently associated with growth for all temperatures (p 0.04 at 18 ^{o}C, p 0.004

at 20 ^{o}C, and p 0.04 at 25 ^{o}C). *E. coli* isolate ZAP1589 gave similar results, although there was

also a bacterial isolate effect as there were no significant associations at 20 °C. Therefore, no

single metabolite was identified as the major factor influencing *E. coli* growth rate, with a

significant impact from growth temperature.

The main metabolite groups were then investigated as groups that could influence bacterial

growth, by generating defined 'artificial' growth media comprising the main plant extract

9

168   metabolites. The six most abundant metabolites were selected from lettuce apoplast or sprout

169   extracts to represent contrasting metabolite profiles (Table 3). Each of the major groups of

170   saccharides (SA), organic acids (OA) or amino acids (AA) were assessed independently by

171   dilution, to restrict their effect, and at temperatures relevant to lettuce (18 °C) and sprouts (25

172   °C). Maximal growth rates were similar in the sprout and lettuce extract artificial medium (Fig.

173   3), although reduced compared to the 'complete', natural extracts (Fig. 1). Growth rates were

174   significantly reduced when the concentration of the saccharide group (SA) was reduced for

175   both artificial media (all $p < 0.0049$), while restriction of the amino acids (AA) or organic acids

176   (OA) had no impact (Fig. 3). The SA-dependent effect occurred for all *E. coli* isolates, although

177   there were also significant isolate dependencies (two-way ANOVA, $F_{(16, 28637)} = 39.5$; $p <$

178   0.0001 at 25 °C; two-way ANOVA, $F_{(4, 9544)} = 401.3$; $p < 0.0001$ at 18 °C).

179   The influence of plant extracts on *E. coli* biofilm formation

180   On host tissue *in planta*, bacterial colonies are more likely to be present in biofilms rather than

181   as single cells. Therefore, the influence of the plant extracts of the leafy vegetables was tested

182   for *E. coli* biofilm ability in isolation, i.e. on polystyrene surfaces. Spinach leaf lysates and root

183   lysates were the only extracts that induced biofilm for all isolates, albeit minimal for isolate

184   MG1655 ($p < 0.0011$, compared to isolate MG1655) (Table 4). The remaining extracts were

185   not as conducive for biofilm formation, with the exception of one of the environmental isolates

186   (JHI5025). This was not explained by different growth rates since this isolate did not exhibit the

187   fastest growth rates in the extracts compared to the others (Fig. 1) and must therefore reflect

188   increased adherence in the presence of the plant extracts. A qualitative risk ranking was

189   determined for implementation of biofilm formation as a risk factor for the *E. coli* O157:H7

190   isolates (Sakai and ZAP1589) that identified spinach roots as the highest risk (from highest to

10

191   lowest): spinach roots > spinach leaves > lettuce roots > lettuce leaves > spinach apoplast >

192   lettuce apoplast.

193   *E. coli* O157:H7 colonisation and internalisation *in planta*

194   *E. coli* O157:H7 colonisation of leafy vegetables and sprouts was quantified to determine

195   whether growth kinetics and biofilm formation in the extracts were predictive of *in planta*

196   colonisation. Colonisation of the *E. coli* O157:H7 isolate (ZAP1589) was quantified on spinach

197   and lettuce, and for both isolates (ZAP1589 and Sakai) on sprouted seeds. Our previous *in*

198   *planta* data for lettuce and spinach plants showed that the highest levels of *E. coli* isolate Sakai

199   occurred on spinach roots (73). Inoculation of spinach and lettuce with the high dose (10^7 cfu

200   ml^{-1}) of *E. coli* isolate ZAP1589 also resulted in higher levels of bacteria on the roots compared

201   to leaves, with similar levels on spinach and lettuce roots, e.g. 2.53 ± 0.97 and 2.69 ± 0.88 log

202   (cfu g^{-1}) at day 14, respectively (Fig. 4A, B). *In planta* colonisation of sprouted seeds by the

203   two *E. coli* O157:H7 reference isolates was quantified for plants grown under conditions that

204   mimic industry settings (hydroponics at 25 °C, three days) (Fig. 4C-F). A low inoculation dose

205   of 10^3 cfu ml^{-1} was used and total viable counts on day 0 were estimated by MPN since they

206   fell below the direct plating detection threshold. Total counts of isolate Sakai increased by 4.5

207   log (cfu g^{-1}) on alfalfa sprouts and 3 log (cfu g^{-1}) on fenugreek sprouts, between 0 and 2 dpi.

208   Viable counts for isolate ZAP1589 were generally lower on both sprouted seeds compared to

209   isolate Sakai, but still reached 6.00 ± 0.253 log (cfu g^{-1}) on alfalfa 2 dpi.

210   Internalisation was also assessed since endophytic behaviour is a feature of *E. coli* O157:H7

211   colonisation of fresh produce plants and growth potential could be reflected by growth in the

212   apoplast washings. Internalisation of isolate ZAP1589 occurred to higher levels in spinach

11

213   roots compared to lettuce roots (Fig. 4A, B), although the prevalence was similar in both plant

214   species (60 % and 58.3 % of plants contained endophytic bacteria). In contrast, internalisation

215   in sprouts only occurred on three occasions in all the experiments: isolate Sakai in alfalfa (1.07

216   log (cfu g^{-1})) and fenugreek (1.53 log (cfu g^{-1})) on day 1, and isolate ZAP1589 in alfalfa (1.87

217   log (cfu g^{-1})) on day 2. The prevalence was 7.1 % (1/14 samples positive), although the viable

218   counts were close to the limit of detection by direct plating. Therefore, internalisation of *E. coli*

219   O157:H7 isolates Sakai and ZAP1589 appeared to be a rare event on sprouted seeds,

220   although they colonised the external sprout tissue to higher levels than on lettuce or spinach.

221   Correlating *in planta* colonisation with plant extract growth rate kinetics

222   To relate growth kinetics in extracts with *in planta* growth, growth rates were estimated for *in*

223   *planta* growth. This was possible for sprouted seeds since colonisation levels increased over

224   time (Fig. 4). Alfalfa plants supported significantly faster growth rates for both *E. coli* O157:H7

225   isolates compared to fenugreek, at 2.23 ± 0.213 log cfu g^{-1} per day (R^2 = 0.720) and 1.50 ±

226   0.0913 log cfu g^{-1} (R^2 = 0.863) for Sakai on alfalfa and fenugreek sprouts, respectively, and for

227   isolate ZAP1589, rates of 2.24 ± 0.159 log cfu g^{-1} (R^2 = 0.822) and 0.710 ± 0.116 log cfu g^{-1} (R^2

228   = 0.464) per day on alfalfa and fenugreek sprouts, respectively. The difference in growth rate

229   between the isolates on fenugreek sprouts was significant (p < 0.0001). Although *in planta*

230   growth rates for *E. coli* isolates Sakai were estimated on spinach tissues (leaves, roots or

231   internalised in leaf apoplast) or lettuce (leaves, roots) from low inoculation dose (10^3 cfu ml^{-1})

232   (73) these were non-significant since growth over the 10 day period was minimal or completely

233   constrained, with a high degree of plant-to-plant variation. Growth rate estimates were not

234   made when a high starting inoculum was used since the colonisation levels decreased over

235   time (Fig. 4).

236   Comparison of the *in planta* and extract growth rate estimates were made for both *E. coli*

237   O157:H7 isolates on sprouted seeds (at 25 °C) or in spinach and lettuce (at 18 °C) (Fig. 5). A

238   positive correlation occurred for growth rate estimates in the sprouted seeds (R^2 = 0.516),

239   although this was not significant. Since *in planta* growth in spinach or lettuce tissues was

240   minimal, there was no correlation with growth rates in corresponding extracts. Therefore, the

241   restrictions in bacterial growth that occurred with living plants meant that growth rates in

242   extracts could not be extrapolated to *in planta* growth potential for leafy vegetables, but did

243   bear a positive relationship for sprouted seeds.

244

Discussion

The potential for food-borne bacteria to grow in fresh produce food commodities is a key consideration in quantitative risk assessment. Factors that influence bacterial growth are the plant species and tissue, the bacterial species or isolate, and the surrounding environment. The growth potential of a bacterial population consists of proportion of the growing sub-population and the suitability of the environment for growth, and it provides a quantitative description of probability of growth (22). Therefore, the factors that influence growth potential of STEC in edible plants include plant-dependent and physio-chemico factors, as well as bacterial isolate-specific responses. Metabolically active components of plants can be extrapolated from plant extracts for bacterial growth dynamic measurements coupled with metabolite analysis. They also represent a bacterial growth substrate in their own right that could arise during the post-harvest production process e.g. from cut surfaces. A number of studies show growth of food-borne bacteria on plant extracts during the production process (35, 55, 56) and growth potential for *E. coli* O157:H7 has been evaluated in water (70). Here, maximum growth rates in plant extracts were strongly influenced by the plant tissue type and species, as well as the *E. coli* isolate tested and overlaid by temperature-dependent effects. *In planta* growth rates, however, was markedly different between the sprouted seeds and leafy vegetables, with a growth restriction evident in the leafy vegetables. The plant-dependent factors that could account for this difference include plant age, defence response, growth conditions and associated microbiomes. As such growth rates in the extracts could not be used to infer *in planta* growth potential for spinach or lettuce. In contrast, proliferation on sprouted seeds did bear a positive relationship to growth rates in extracts, although it was also dependent on the plant species and on bacterial isolate tested.

14

268 Saccharides were shown to be the major driving force for *E. coli* growth, which is unsurprising

269 given their role in central metabolism (41). Although the levels of the most abundant sugars,

270 glucose, fructose and sucrose (the disaccharide of glucose and fructose) could explain the

271 high growth rates in sprout extracts, similarly rapid growth did not occur in lettuce leaf lysate

272 extract, despite an abundance of sugars, indicating that plant species-specific inhibitory

273 compounds exist. This is supported by the occurrence of more rapid growth rates in spinach

274 leaf extracts compared to lettuce. Plant-dependent factors that could influence bacterial growth

275 potential include the innate defence response (33), antimicrobial activity of plant secondary

276 metabolites (71) and plant development stage (74).

277 Bacterial growth rates were not significantly impacted by manipulation of the major amino or

278 organic acids from the extracts, although the phenolic acid, chlorogenate (*trans*-5-O-caffeoyl-

279 D-quinate) was positively associated with growth. This contrasts to reports of its ability to

280 inhibit fatty acid synthesis in *E. coli* isolate MG1655 (37) and prevent *E. coli* growth (75), but

281 may be explained by differences in concentration between the extracts and exogenous

282 application. Oxalate levels were relatively high in spinach, in keeping with previous reports that

283 show an average as high as ~ 1000 mg / 100 g fresh weight (47) and correlated with growth for

284 isolate Sakai at 25 °C. Amino acids levels were substantially higher in sprouted seed extracts

285 compared to the leafy vegetables, which is likely a reflection of different developmental stages

286 of the plants (4). It was notable that the artificial media did not support equivalent growth rates

287 to the 'complete', natural extract media, indicating that other, minor nutrients in the extracts

288 were utilised for maximal bacterial growth and also need to be accounted for in growth

289 dynamics.

290 Bacteria including STEC, tend to form biofilms in association with plant tissue (11, 73, 74).

291 Here, a risk ranking could be inferred from biofilm formation in the extracts, with spinach roots

292 ranked highest. Curli is an important biofilm component for STEC associated with plants (7),

293 but other biofilm components are likely to be responsible for the biofilm formation in extracts,

294 since isolate Sakai did not form biofilms in spinach apoplast extract *in vitro* but does produce

295 curli during endophytic colonisation and biofilm formation in leaves (73). This indicates that

296 specific *in planta* cues induce different biofilm components. Alternative biofilm components that

297 may be involved include Type 1 fimbriae, which was shown to be expressed by the

298 environmental isolates JHI5025 and JIH5039 at 20 °C and promoted binding to spinach roots

299 (40).

300 Internalisation of STEC into apoplastic spaces in plants presents a hazard as pathogens

301 cannot be removed by conventional sanitation methods. However, growth potential for

302 internalised *E. coli* O157:H7 could not be inferred from growth in apoplast extracts since

303 endophytic proliferation was prevented or reduced in the apoplast (73). As the apoplast is a

304 habitat for plant-associated endophytes (66) and phytopathogens (63), it appears that for *E.*

305 *coli* additional factors such as the plant defence response need to be considered. The

306 increased likelihood of internalisation into tissues of leafy vegetables compared to sprouted

307 seeds for the *E. coli* O157:H7 isolates could be due to multiple factors including plant age, the

308 competing microbiota and access to nutrients. Plant dependent factors have also been shown

309 to impact colonisation of lettuce cultivars by STEC (Quilliam, et al. (59).

310 *In planta* colonisation of *E. coli* O157:H7 isolate Sakai was significantly higher than isolate

311 ZAP1589, in both leafy tissue types and on both sprouted seed species (73). In contrast,

312 growth rates in the plant extracts and in artificial media overlapped, albeit with specific extract-

16

313   specific differences. Since isolate ZAP1589 was found to be flagellate but non-motile, this may

314   reflect a role for flagella in plant colonisation (65). ZAP1589 growth rates on sprouted seeds

315   were similar to the rates reported for other *E. coli* O157:H7 isolates on 2-day old alfalfa sprouts

316   (8). Growth rates of both *E. coli* O157:H7 isolates in the extracts was, in general, as high as

317   the environmental isolates, and almost always higher than the K-12 isolate, indicating

318   similarities in fitness levels for STEC and environmental *E. coli*.

319   The ability of *E. coli* isolates to metabolise different carbon sources varies and could contribute

320   to the isolate-dependent variations in growth rates. Although less than 50 % of *E. coli* isolates

321   can metabolise sucrose (41), *E. coli* O157:H7 isolate Sakai encodes the sucrose transport

322   genes (1) and sucrose degradation genes were expressed by this isolate on exposure to

323   spinach extracts (9). The sucrose translocator from *S. enterica* serovar Typhimurium was

324   expressed by a related epiphyte *in planta* (46). In contrast, fructose and glucose are sufficient

325   sole carbon source-metabolites for *E. coli* and their role in bacterial metabolism is well

326   characterised (41). An *E. coli* fructose metabolism gene has also been expressed in a related

327   epiphyte *in planta* (36).

328   Growth rates normally positively correlate with temperature (60), as was observed for growth

329   rates in the defined medium without plant extracts, which exhibited a linear distribution from 18

330   °C to 25 °C. However, maximal growth rates in the extracts were influenced in a non-linear

331   manner by temperature. Similarly, a non-linear effect was reported in a meta-study on growth

332   of STEC on lettuce (42). This could be due to *E. coli* adaption to the plant environment and

333   resulting metabolic responses (9), and reflects the different organic acid correlations that

334   occurred for different temperatures seen here. The implications are that a linear approximation,

335 e.g. such as a Ratkowsky model, is not sufficient to describe *E. coli* growth in plant extracts,

336 although it has been used to model growth on plants (43, 60, 61).

337 In conclusion, growth potential *in planta* was described in part, by growth rates in plant

338 extracts, but only for sprouted seeds. On the other hand, biofilm formation in plant extracts

339 showed some relation to *in planta* colonisation in leafy vegetables. Plant species- and tissue-

340 type dependent differences in metabolites meant that no single metabolite could be correlated

341 with growth, and the only positive association was with the combined group of saccharides.

342 The marked differences in *in planta* colonisation between the sprouted seeds and leafy

343 vegetables reinforces the higher risk associated with very young plants, grown under

344 conditions conducive for bacterial growth (72). Therefore, although this data can inform hazard

345 identification and risk analyses, it is evident that important specificities within each plant-

346 microbe system need to be considered, and it is not possible to take a generalised view of

347 STEC-plant colonisation.

348

Materials and Methods

Bacteria and media

The bacterial isolates panel comprised five isolates: two *E. coli* O157:H7 isolates, two environmental *E. coli* isolates and an *E. coli* K-12 isolate (Table 1). *E. coli* ZAP1589 is a Stx negative derivative, generated from isolate H110320350 (Methods SM3). Motility of isolate ZAP1589 and isolate H110320350 was tested on motility agar (0.7 %), and presence of the H7 flagella was confirmed by agglutination with the monoclonal H7 antibody.

Bacteria were cultured overnight in Lysogeny-broth medium (LB) at 37 °C (2, 3), with shaking at 200 rpm. Prior to experimentation an aliquot of the overnight culture was inoculated 1:100 in rich defined 3-(N-morpholino)propanesulfonic acid (MOPS) medium (48) with 0.2 % glycerol and essential and non-essential amino acids, termed 'rich defined MOPS glycerol' (RDMG), for 24 h at 18 °C and 200 rpm. Bacteria were collected by centrifugation, washed in phosphate buffered saline (PBS) and adjusted to the required starting optical density (OD) 600 nm. Media was supplemented with 30 µg ml^{-1} kanamycin, if required. Defined artificial 'lettuce apoplast' or 'sprout extract' media was generated by adding each group of constituents (Table 3) to a base minimal MOPs medium (MMM) lacking a carbon source and amino acids. Each component group was added at the defined concentration to represent the concentrations and composition present in lettuce apoplast or sprout extracts and by dilution of one major group at a time at: 1:50 saccharides (SA), 1:10 amino acids (AA) or 1:20 organic acids (OA), while the other groups were at 1:1. The pH of the sprout defined medium was 7.2 and lettuce apoplast defined medium 7.05. Viable counts were determined from 10-fold dilutions plated on MacConkey

370   (MAC) agar, incubated overnight at 37 °C and counted manually the next day. All experiments

371   were conducted in triplicate. Viable counts and OD_{600} nm were plotted in Excel 2010.

Plant extracts and metabolite analysis

373   Lettuce (*Lactuca sativa*) var. All Year Round and spinach (*Spinacia oleracea*) var. Amazon

374   were grown individually in 9 cm^3 pots in compost for microbiological assays, or in vermiculite

375   for metabolite analysis, in a glasshouse for three weeks. Fenugreek (*Trigonella foenum-*

376   *graecum*) and alfalfa (*Medicago sativa*) seeds were soaked in sterile distilled water (SDW) for

377   3 h at room temperature (RT), surface sterilized with 3 % calcium hypochlorite (20,000 ppm ml[-

378   1] active chlorite) for 15 min, washed five times with SDW and soaked for 2 h in SDW at RT.

379   Sprouts were transferred aseptically on distilled water agar (DWA) (0.5 % agar) and sprouted

380   for two (alfalfa) or five (fenugreek) days at 25 °C in darkness. Leaf apoplastic washings were

381   collected as described previously (Methods SM4), optimised for spinach and lettuce to

382   minimize cytoplasmic contamination (39). All tissue extracts were made as described

383   previously (9). In brief, vermiculite was gently washed off the roots with tap water and rinsed

384   with SDW. Leaves and roots were separated with a sterile scalpel, macerated in liquid nitrogen

385   with a pestle in a mortar and stored at -20 °C until use and pre-processed for sample

386   clarification by mixing 1 g with 20 ml SDW, soaked on a shaker for 4 h, centrifuged at 5000 rcf

387   for 15 min, and the supernatant heated to 50 °C for 30 min. The extract was centrifuged at

388   5000 rcf for 15 min and filter sterilised through a 0.45 µm filter for root tissue or 0.1 µm filter for

389   leaf tissue. Sprouts were macerated in liquid nitrogen, processed as described above without a

390   washing step to remove vermiculite, and filter sterilised through a 0.22 µm filter. Apoplast

391   extracts were filtered sterilised through a 0.1 µm filter (Durapore, Merck, Germany). Extracts

392   were made from ~ 5 plants per sample for leaves and roots and up to 24 plants for apolastic

20

393 washings or for sprouts. 10 ml plant extract samples were used for GC-MS analysis as

394 described in Methods SM5. Lysates were prepared for HPLC described previously by

395 Shepherd, et al. (69).

Bacterial growth rates

397 Bacterial growth rates were determined using a pre-warmed plate reader Bioscreen C plate

398 reader (Oy Growth Curves Ab Ltd, Finland), set to different temperatures. The *E. coli* isolates

399 were grown as described above, adjusted to an OD_{600} of 0.05 in PBS (~ 2.1 x 107 cfu ml^{-1}) and

400 inoculated at a 1:10 dilution in plant extracts (at 1:20 w/v in dH_2O) or defined media (Table 3),

401 in 200 µl total volume, in multi-well plates. Growth for the *E. coli* isolates was measured at 18,

402 20 and 25 °C in 100-microwell plates (Honeycomb, Thermo Fisher, USA). Wells were

403 randomised in duplicate on the plate with negatives included. All growth curves in extracts

404 were repeated three times with four replicates on plates. Measurements were recorded every

405 15 min for 48 hours and multi-well plates were shaken for 60 seconds pre- and post-

406 measurement. Results were exported from plate reader proprietary software as tab-delimited

407 files. For model fitting, 12 replicates of each isolate and medium type were averaged and

408 converted to viable counts log (cfu h^{-1}) (Methods SM6). A conversion factor of 4.2 x 10^8 cfu ml^{-}

409 ^{1} was applied so that all growth curves could be modelled using DM-Fit (Methods SM1).

410 Secondary modelling was applied for different temperature as described (Methods SM2).

Biofilms

412 Bacterial biofilms were measured as described previously by Merritt, et al. (45). Bacteria were

413 grown aerobically in LB at 37 °C for 12 h, sub-cultured (1:1000 v/v) in RDMG for 18 h at 18 °C,

414 diluted in PBS to OD_{600} of 0.05 and inoculated into plant extracts as per the growth rates

415   determination in a 96 well polystyrene plate and incubated statically for 48 h at 18 °C. The

416   washed wells were stained with 0.1 % crystal violet solution and solubilised with 95 % ethanol.

417   The solution was transferred into a fresh plate and absorbance measured at 590 nm with a

418   plate reader (Multiskan Go, Thermo Scientific, USA). Results were exported with the software

419   SkanIt[TM] (Thermo Scientific, USA) to Microsoft Excel 2010 for analysis.

Plant colonisation assay

421   Lettuce and spinach plants (~ 3 weeks old) were transferred to a growth chamber (Snijders) at

422   21 °C; 75 % humidity and 16 h light – 8 h dark cycle (400 µE/m2.s (30.000 lux)) three days

423   prior to inoculation and were not watered for ~ 18 h prior to inoculation. Roots were inoculated

424   by placing pots in a plastic box containing a 1 litre suspension of *E. coli* Sakai or ZAP1589,

425   diluted to OD_{600} of 0.02 (equivalent to 10^7 cfu ml^{-1}) in SDW, which partially submerged pots.

426   After 1 h inoculation, the pots were transferred to the growth chamber until sampling. Sprouts

427   were inoculated with 10^3 cfu ml^{-1} bacteria in 0.5 l SDW for 1 h, rinsed with 0.5 x Murashige and

428   Skoog (MS) basal medium (no sucrose), and transferred to petri dishes containing distilled

429   water agar (DWA) (0.8 % agar) and incubated for up to three days at 25 °C. Negative controls

430   were incubated with SDW without bacteria.

431   Lettuce and spinach roots were sampled at 0, 5, 10 and 14 days post infection (dpi),

432   aseptically removed from aerial tissue with a sterile scalpel, the compost removed by washing

433   with SDW, and the roots were transferred into 50 ml tubes, washed with PBS and the fresh

434   weight determined. Sprouts were sampled at 0, 1, 2 dpi, where half were used to enumerate

435   the total viable counts of *E. coli* and stored in PBS until further use (~ 30 min), and surface-

436   associated bacteria were removed from the other half of the samples by surface sterilization

22

437 with 200 ppm $Ca(ClO)_2$ for lettuce/spinach roots or 20,000 ppm $Ca(ClO)_2$ for sprouts, for 15

438 min. Surface decontamination of sprout tissue required at least 15,000 ppm of $Ca(ClO)_2$ to

439 eradicate external *E. coli*, but endophytes appeared to be protected from the active chlorite

440 since endemic internalised bacteria occurred on recovery media after surface decontamination

441 with 20,000 ppm $Ca(ClO)_2$. The root/sprouts were washed five times with PBS to ensure

442 removal of all loosely adherent bacterial cells and residual chlorine. Surface sterilisation was

443 validated as described (73). Any samples containing surface-associated bacterial colonies

444 were removed from subsequent analysis. Roots/sprouts were macerated using mortar and

445 pestle in 2 ml PBS and ~ 50 mg sterile sand. The supernatant was diluted once for spinach

446 and lettuce (1:1), three times for fenugreek (1:3) or four times for alfalfa (1:4) with PBS and

447 100 µl plated on MAC plates using a spiral plater (WASP, Don Whitley Scientific, UK) and

448 incubated for 24 h at 37 °C. Plates were counted using a counting grid (WASP, Don Whitley

449 Scientific, UK), multiplied by the dilution factor and converted to cfu ml^{-1}. The experiment was

450 repeated three times with five replicate samples per time point, and sprout samples comprised

451 multiple (> 15) sprouts. The limit of detection from direct plating was 20 cfu ml^{-1}, below which

452 values were manually levelled to < 1 log (cfu ml^{-1}) for lettuce and spinach root data. Since the

453 level of inoculation of sprouts for day 0 was below the detection limit, the numbers were semi-

454 quantified by most probable number (MPN) method for 3 tube assay as described by Oblinger

455 and Koburger (49). Samples were diluted 6-fold in buffered peptone water (BPW) and

456 incubated overnight at 37 °C, and positive samples confirmed by plating triplicate 100 µl

457 samples on MAC agar and incubating overnight at 37 °C.

458

459

Acknowledgments

Conflict of interest disclosure

467 The authors declare no conflicts of interest.

468

References

1. **Baumler, D. J., R. G. Peplinski, J. L. Reed, J. D. Glasner, and N. T. Perna.** 2011. The evolution of metabolic networks of *E. coli*. BMC Syst. Biol. **5:**21.

2. **Bertani, G.** 2004. Lysogeny at Mid-Twentieth Century: P1, P2, and Other Experimental Systems. J Bacteriol **186:**595-600.

3. **Bertani, G.** 1951. Studies on lysogenesis. The mode of phage liberation by lysogenic *Escherichia coli*. J. Bacteriol. **62:**293-300.

4. **Bewley, J. D., and M. Black.** 1978. Physiology and Biochemistry of Seeds in Relation to Germination: 1 Development, Germination, and Growth. Springer-Verlag Berlin Heidelberg.

5. **Buchanan, R. L., and L. A. Klawitter.** 1992. The effect of incubation temperature, initial pH, and sodium chloride on the growth kinetics of *Escherichia coli* O157:H7. Food Microbiol **9:**185-196.

6. **Buchholz, U., H. Bernard, D. Werber, M. M. Bohmer, C. Remschmidt, H. Wilking, Y. Delere, M. an der Heiden, C. Adlhoch, J. Dreesman, J. Ehlers, S. Ethelberg, M. Faber, C. Frank, G. Fricke, M. Greiner, M. Hohle, S. Ivarsson, U. Jark, M. Kirchner, J. Koch, G. Krause, P. Luber, B. Rosner, K. Stark, and M. Kuhne.** 2011. German outbreak of *Escherichia coli* O104:H4 associated with sprouts. N Engl J Med **365:**1763-70.

7. **Carter, M. Q., J. W. Louie, D. Feng, W. Zhong, and M. T. Brandl.** 2016. Curli fimbriae are conditionally required in *Escherichia coli* O157:H7 for initial attachment and biofilm formation. Food Microbiol **57:**81-89.

8. **Charkowski, A. O., J. D. Barak, C. Z. Sarreal, and R. E. Mandrell.** 2002. Differences in growth of *Salmonella enterica* and *Escherichia coli* O157 : H7 on alfalfa sprouts. Appl Environ Microbiol **68:**3114-3120.

9. **Crozier, L., P. Hedley, J. Morris, C. Wagstaff, S. C. Andrews, I. Toth, R. W. Jackson, and N. Holden.** 2016. Whole-transcriptome analysis of verocytotoxigenic *Escherichia coli* O157:H7

494   (Sakai) suggests plant-species-specific metabolic responses on exposure to spinach and lettuce

495   extracts. Front Microbiol **7:**1088.

496 10. **Dahan, S., S. Knutton, R. K. Shaw, V. F. Crepin, G. Dougan, and G. Frankel.** 2004.

497   Transcriptome of enterohemorrhagic *Escherichia coli* O157 adhering to eukaryotic plasma

498   membranes. Infect Immun **72:**5452-9.

499 11. **Danhorn, T., and C. Fuqua.** 2007. Biofilm formation by plant-associated bacteria. Annu Rev

500   Microbiol **61:**401-22.

501 12. **Danyluk, M. D., and D. W. Schaffner.** 2011. Quantitative assessment of the microbial risk of

502   leafy greens from farm to consumption: preliminary framework, data, and risk estimates. J Food

503   Prot **74:**700-708.

504 13. **Deering, A. J., L. J. Mauer, and R. E. Pruitt.** 2012. Internalization of *E. coli* O157:H7 and

505   *Salmonella* spp. in plants: A review. Food Res Int **45:**567–575.

506 14. **Dobson, G., T. Shepherd, R. Marshall, S. R. Verrall, S. Conner, D. W. Griffiths, J. W.**

507   **McNicol, D. Stewart, and H. V. Davies.** 2007. Dordrecht.

508 15. **Elhadidy, M., and A. Álvarez-Ordóñez.** 2016. Diversity of survival patterns among *Escherichia*

509   *coli* O157:H7 genotypes subjected to food-related stress conditions. Front Microbiol **7**.

510 16. **Erickson, M. C., J. Liao, A. S. Payton, C. C. Webb, L. Ma, G. D. Zhang, I. Flitcroft, M. P.**

511   **Doyle, and L. R. Beuchat.** 2013. Fate of *Escherichia coli* O157:H7 and *Salmonella* in soil and

512   lettuce roots as affected by potential home gardening practices. J Sci Food Agri **93:**3841-3849.

513 17. **Erickson, M. C., C. C. Webb, L. E. Davey, A. S. Payton, I. D. Flitcroft, and M. P. Doyle.**

514   2014. Biotic and abiotic variables affecting internalization and fate of *Escherichia coli* O157:H7

515   isolates in leafy green roots. J Food Prot **77:**872-9.

516 18. **Erickson, M. C., C. C. Webb, J. C. Diaz-Perez, L. E. Davey, A. S. Payton, I. D. Flitcroft, S. C.**

517   **Phatak, and M. P. Doyle.** 2013. Internalization of *Escherichia coli* O157:H7 following spraying

518   of cut shoots when leafy greens are regrown for a second crop. J Food Prot **76:**2052-2056.

519 19. **Erickson, M. C., C. C. Webb, J. C. Diaz-Perez, S. C. Phatak, J. J. Silvoy, L. Davey, A. S.**

520   **Payton, J. Liao, L. Ma, and M. P. Doyle.** 2010. Infrequent internalization of *Escherichia coli*

521   O157:H7 into field-grown leafy greens. J Food Prot **73:**500-506.

522 20. **Erlacher, A., M. Cardinale, M. Grube, and G. Berg.** 2015. Biotic stress shifted structure and

523   abundance of *Enterobacteriaceae* in the lettuce microbiome. PLoS One **10**.

524 21. **Franz, E., S. O. Tromp, H. Rijgersberg, and H. J. van der Fels-Klerx.** 2010. Quantitative

525   microbial risk assessment for *Escherichia coli* O157:H7, *Salmonella*, and Listeria

526   monocytogenes in leafy green vegetables consumed at salad bars. J Food Prot **73:**274-285.

527 22. **George, S. M., A. Métris, and J. Baranyi.** 2015. Integrated kinetic and probabilistic modeling of

528   the growth potential of bacterial populations. Appl Environ Microbiol **81:**3228-3234.

529 23. **Gibson, A. M., N. Bratchell, and T. A. Roberts.** 1988. Predicting microbial growth: growth

530   responses of *salmonellae* in a laboratory medium as affected by pH, sodium chloride and

531   storage temperature. Int J Food Microbiol **6:**155-78.

532 24. **Hayashi, K., N. Morooka, Y. Yamamoto, K. Fujita, K. Isono, S. Choi, E. Ohtsubo, T. Baba,**

533   **B. L. Wanner, H. Mori, and T. Horiuchi.** 2006. Highly accurate genome sequences of

534   *Escherichia coli* K-12 strains MG1655 and W3110. Molecular Systems Biology **2:**2006.0007.

535 25. **Holden, N., R. W. Jackson, and A. Schikora.** 2015. Plants as alternative hosts for human and

536   animal pathogens. Front Microbiol **6**.

537 26. **Holden, N., L. Pritchard, and I. Toth.** 2009. Colonization outwith the colon: plants as an

538   alternative environmental reservoir for human pathogenic enterobacteria. FEMS Microbiol Rev

539   **33:**689-703.

540 27. **Holden, N. J., F. Wright, K. MacKenzie, J. Marshall, S. Mitchell, A. Mahajan, R. Wheatley,**

541   **and T. J. Daniell.** 2013. Prevalence and diversity of *Escherichia coli* isolated from a barley trial

542   supplemented with bulky organic soil amendments: green compost and bovine slurry. Lett Appl

543   Microbiol **58:**205–212.

544   28.   **Hou, Z., R. C. Fink, C. Radtke, M. J. Sadowsky, and F. Diez-Gonzalez.** 2013. Incidence of

545   naturally internalized bacteria in lettuce leaves. Int J Food Microbiol **162:**260-265.

546   29.   **Huang, L.** 2012. Mathematical modeling and numerical analysis of the growth of non-O157

547   Shiga toxin-producing *Escherichia coli* in spinach leaves. Int J Food Microbiol **160:**32-41.

548   30.   **Jay, M. T., M. B. Cooley, D. Carychao, G. W. Wiscomb, R. A. Sweitzer, L. Crawford-Miksza,**

549   **J. A. Farrar, D. K. Lau, J. O'Connell, A. Millington, R. V. Asmundson, E. R. Atwill, and R. E.**

550   **Mandrell.** 2007. *Escherichia coli* O157:H7 in feral swine near spinach fields and cattle, central

551   California coast. Emerg Infect Dis **13:**1908-11.

552   31.   **Jensen, D. A., L. M. Friedrich, L. J. Harris, M. D. Danyluk, and D. W. Schaffner.** 2015. Cross

553   contamination of *Escherichia coli* O157:H7 between lettuce and wash water during home-scale

554   washing. Food Microbiol **46:**428-33.

555   32.   **Jensen, D. A., L. M. Friedrich, L. J. Harris, M. D. Danyluk, and D. W. Schaffner.** 2013.

556   Quantifying transfer rates of *Salmonella* and *Escherichia coli* O157:H7 between fresh-cut

557   produce and common kitchen surfaces. J Food Prot **76:**1530-8.

558   33.   **Klerks, M. M., E. Franz, M. van Gent-Pelzer, C. Zijlstra, and A. H. van Bruggen.** 2007.

559   Differential interaction of *Salmonella enterica* serovars with lettuce cultivars and plant-microbe

560   factors influencing the colonization efficiency. ISME J **1:**620-31.

561   34.   **Koseki, S., and S. Isobe.** 2005. Prediction of pathogen growth on iceberg lettuce under real

562   temperature history during distribution from farm to table. Int J Food Microbiol **104:**239-248.

563   35.   **Koukkidis, G., R. Haigh, N. Allcock, S. Jordan, and P. Freestone.** 2017. Salad leaf juices

564   enhance *Salmonella* growth, colonization of fresh produce, and virulence. Appl Environ

565   Microbiol **83**.

566   36.   **Leveau, J. H. J., and S. E. Lindow.** 2001. Appetite of an epiphyte: Quantitative monitoring of

567   bacterial sugar consumption in the phyllosphere. Proc Natl Acad Sci USA **98:**3446-3453.

568   37.   **Li, B.-H., X.-F. Ma, X.-D. Wu, and W.-X. Tian.** 2006. Inhibitory activity of chlorogenic acid on

569   enzymes involved in the fatty acid synthesis in animals and bacteria. IUBMB life **58:**39-46.

570   38.   **Linden, I. V. d., B. Cottyn, M. Uyttendaele, G. Vlaemynck, M. Heyndrickx, M. Maes, and N.**

571   **Holden.** 2016. Microarray-based screening of differentially expressed genes of *E. coli* O157:H7

572   Sakai during preharvest survival on butterhead lettuce. Agriculture **6:**6.

573   39.   **Lohaus, G., K. Pennewiss, B. Sattelmacher, M. Hussmann, and K. Hermann Muehling.**

574   2001. Is the infiltration-centrifugation technique appropriate for the isolation of apoplastic fluid?

575   A critical evaluation with different plant species. Physiologia Plantarum **111:**457-465.

576   40.   **Marshall, J., Y. Rossez, G. Mainda, D. L. Gally, T. Daniell, and N. Holden.** 2016. Alternate

577   thermoregulation and functional binding of *Escherichia coli* Type 1 fimbriae in environmental

578   and animal isolates. FEMS Microbiol Lett **DOI: 10.1093/femsle/fnw251**.

579   41.   **Mayer, C., and W. Boos.** 2005. Hexose/pentose and hexitol/pentitol metabolism. EcoSal Plus.

580   42.   **McKellar, R. C., and P. Delaquis.** 2011. Development of a dynamic growth-death model for

581   *Escherichia coli* O157:H7 in minimally processed leafy green vegetables. Int. J. Food Microbiol.

582   **151:**7-14.

583   43.   **McKellar, R. C., and X. Lu.** 2004. Modeling microbial responses in food. CRC Press LLC,

584   Florida, USA.

585   44.   **Melotto, M., S. Panchal, and D. Roy.** 2014. Plant innate immunity against human bacterial

586   pathogens. Front Microbiol **5:**411.

587   45.   **Merritt, J. H., D. E. Kadouri, and G. A. O'Toole.** 2005. Growing and analyzing static biofilms,

588   p. 1B.1.1-1B.1.17, Curr Prot Microbiol.

589   46.   **Miller, W. G., M. T. Brandl, B. Quiñones, and S. E. Lindow.** 2001. Biological sensor for

590   sucrose availability: relative sensitivities of various reporter genes. Appl Environ Microbiol

591   **67:**1308-1317.

592   47.   **Mou, B.** 2008. Evaluation of oxalate concentration in the U.S. spinach germplasm collection.

593   HortScience **43:**1690-1693.

594   48.   **Neidhardt, F. C., P. L. Bloch, and D. F. Smith.** 1974. Culture medium for enterobacteria. J

595   Bacteriol **119:**736-47.

596   49.   **Oblinger, J. L., and J. A. Koburger.** 1975. Understanding and teaching the most probable

597   number technique. J Milk Food Technol **38:**540-545.

598   50.   **Painter, J. A., R. M. Hoekstra, T. Ayers, R. V. Tauxe, C. R. Braden, F. J. Angulo, and P. M.**

599   **Griffin.** 2013. Attribution of foodborne illnesses, hospitalizations, and deaths to food

600   commodities by using outbreak data, United States, 1998-2008. Emerg Infect Dis **19:**407-15.

601   51.   **Pang, H., E. Lambertini, R. L. Buchanan, D. W. Schaffner, and A. K. Pradhan.** 2017.

602   Quantitative microbial risk assessment for *Escherichia coli* O157:H7 in fresh-cut lettuce. J Food

603   Prot **80:**302-311.

604   52.   **Perez-Rodriguez, F., M. J. Saiz-Abajo, R. M. Garcia-Gimeno, A. Moreno, D. Gonzalez, and**

605   **A. I. Vitas.** 2014. Quantitative assessment of the *Salmonella* distribution on fresh-cut leafy

606   vegetables due to cross-contamination occurred in an industrial process simulated at laboratory

607   scale. Int J Food Microbiol **184:**86-91.

608   53.   **Perry, N., T. Cheasty, T. Dallman, N. Launders, and G. Willshaw.** 2013. Application of multi-

609   locus variable number tandem repeat analysis to monitor Verocytotoxin-producing *Escherichia*

610   *coli* O157 phage type 8 in England and Wales: emergence of a profile associated with a national

611   outbreak. J Appl Microbiol **115:**1052–1058.

612   54.   **Pignocchi, C., and C. H. Foyer.** 2003. Apoplastic ascorbate metabolism and its role in the

613   regulation of cell signalling. Curr. Opin. Plant Biol. **6:**379-89.

614   55.   **Posada-Izquierdo, G., S. Del Rosal, A. Valero, G. Zurera, A. S. Sant'Ana, V. O. Alvarenga,**

615   **and F. Perez-Rodriguez.** 2016. Assessing the growth of *Escherichia coli* O157:H7 and

616   Salmonella in spinach, lettuce, parsley and chard extracts at different storage temperatures. J

617   Appl Microbiol **120:**1701-1710.

618   56.   **Posada-Izquierdo, G. D., F. Perez-Rodriguez, F. Lopez-Galvez, A. Allende, M. I. Gil, and G.**

619   **Zurera.** 2014. Modeling growth of *Escherichia coli* O157:H7 in fresh-cut lettuce treated with

620   neutral electrolyzed water and under modified atmosphere packaging. Int J Food Microbiol

621   **177:**1-8.

622   57.   **Presser, K. A., D. A. Ratkowsky, and T. Ross.** 1997. Modelling the growth rate of *Escherichia*

623   *coli* as a function of pH and lactic acid concentration. Appl Environ Microbiol **63:**2355-2360.

624   58.   **Presser, K. A., T. Ross, and D. A. Ratkowsky.** 1998. Modelling the growth limits (growth/no

625   growth interface) of *Escherichia coli* as a function of temperature, pH, lactic acid concentration,

626   and water activity. Appl Environ Microbiol **64:**1773-1779.

627   59.   **Quilliam, R. S., A. P. Williams, and D. L. Jones.** 2012. Lettuce cultivar mediates both

628   phyllosphere and rhizosphere activity of *Escherichia coli* O157:H7. PLoS ONE **7:**e33842.

629   60.   **Ratkowsky, D. A., R. K. Lowry, T. A. McMeekin, A. N. Stokes, and R. E. Chandler.** 1983.

630   Model for bacterial culture growth rate throughout the entire biokinetic temperature range. J

631   Bacteriol **154:**1222-1226.

632   61.   **Ratkowsky, D. A., J. Olley, T. A. McMeekin, and A. Ball.** 1982. Relationship between

633   temperature and growth rate of bacterial cultures. J Bacteriol **149:**1-5.

634   62.   **Record Jr, M. T., E. S. Courtenay, D. S. Cayley, and H. J. Guttman.** 1998. Responses of *E.*

635   *coli* to osmotic stress: large changes in amounts of cytoplasmic solutes and water. Trends in

636   Biochemical Sciences **23:**143-148.

637   63.   **Rico, A., and G. M. Preston.** 2008. *Pseudomonas syringae* pv. *tomato* DC3000 uses

638   constitutive and apoplast-induced nutrient assimilation pathways to catabolize nutrients that are

639   abundant in the tomato apoplast. Mol Plant Microbe Interact **21:**269-282.

640   64.   **Rossez, Y., A. Holmes, H. Lodberg-Pedersen, L. Birse, J. Marshall, W. G. T. Willats, I. K.**

641   **Toth, and N. J. Holden.** 2014. *Escherichia coli* common pilus (ECP) targets arabinosyl residues

642   in plant cell walls to mediate adhesion to fresh produce plants. J Biol Chem **289:**34349-34365.

643   65.   **Rossez, Y., A. Holmes, E. B. Wolfson, D. L. Gally, A. Mahajan, H. L. Pedersen, W. G. T.**

644   **Willats, I. K. Toth, and N. J. Holden.** 2014. Flagella interact with ionic plant lipids to mediate

645   adherence of pathogenic *Escherichia coli* to fresh produce plants. Environ Microbiol **16:**2181–

646   2195.

647   66.   **Sattelmacher, B.** 2001. The apoplast and its significance for plant mineral nutrition. New Phytol

648   **149:**167-192.

649   67.   **Seo, S., and K. R. Matthews.** 2014. Exposure of *Escherichia coli* O157:H7 to soil, manure, or

650   water influences its survival on plants and initiation of plant defense response. Food Microbiol

651   **38:**87-92.

652   68.   **Seo, S., and K. R. Matthews.** 2012. Influence of the plant defense response to *Escherichia coli*

653   O157:H7 cell surface structures on survival of that enteric pathogen on plant surfaces. Appl

654   Environ Microbiol **78:**5882-5889.

655   69.   **Shepherd, L. V., J. W. McNicol, R. Razzo, M. A. Taylor, and H. V. Davies.** 2006. Assessing

656   the potential for unintended effects in genetically modified potatoes perturbed in metabolic and

657   developmental processes. Targeted analysis of key nutrients and anti-nutrients. Transgenic

658   research **15:**409-25.

659   70.   **Vital, M., D. Stucki, T. Egli, and F. Hammes.** 2010. Evaluating the growth potential of

660   pathogenic bacteria in water. Appl Environ Microbiol **76:**6477-6484.

661   71.   **Wallace, R. J.** 2004. Antimicrobial properties of plant secondary metabolites. The Proceedings

662   of the Nutrition Society **63:**621-9.

663   72.   **Wright, K. M., S. Chapman, K. McGeachy, S. Humphris, E. Campbell, I. K. Toth, and N. J.**

664   **Holden.** 2013. The endophytic lifestyle of *Escherichia coli* O157:H7: quantification and internal

665   localization in roots. Phytopathol **103:**333-340.

666   73.   **Wright, K. M., L. Crozier, J. Marshall, B. Merget, A. Holmes, and N. J. Holden.** 2017.

667   Differences in internalization and growth of *Escherichia coli* O157:H7 within the apoplast of

668   edible plants, spinach and lettuce, compared with the model species *Nicotiana benthamiana*.

669   Microb Biotechnol **10:**555–569

670   74.   **Wright, K. M., and N. J. Holden.** 2018. Quantification and colonisation dynamics of *Escherichia*

671   *coli* O157:H7 inoculation of microgreens species and plant growth substrates. Int J Food

672   Microbiol **273:**1-10.

673   75.   **Zheng, Y., J. Liu, M. L. Cao, J. M. Deng, and J. Kou.** 2016. Extrication process of chlorogenic

674   acid in Crofton weed and antibacterial mechanism of chlorogenic acid on *Escherichia coli*.

675   J.Environ.Biol. **37:**1049-1055.

676

677

678 Tables and Figures

679 Tables

680 **Table 1**   Bacterial isolates used in this study

681 ST = sequence type, Stx = Shiga toxin presence, nd = not determined, n/a = not applicable.

682 Isolate Sakai used here is the *stx*-inactivated derivative (10). * Isolate ZAP1589, derived from

683 H110320350 (Perry et al., 2013) has both *stx*-encoding regions removed, and is H7 positive

684 but non-motile.

Isolate Name	Serotype	ST	Stx	Source	Reference
MG1655	OR:H48	98	n/a	faecal/lab	(24)
JHI5025	nd	2055	n/a	soil	(27)
JHI5039	nd	2303	n/a	root	(27)
Sakai	O157:H7	11	negative	sprout /	(10)
ZAP1589	O157:H7	11	negative	leek / clinical	(53)*

685

686 **Table 2**   Quantification of saccharides from plant extracts

687 Concentrations of mono- and disaccharides determined by HPLC (μg mg^{-1}). ND – not

688 detected.

	glucose	fructose	sucrose	arabinose
fenugreek	24.5 ± 3.1	24.9 ± 3.7	75.6 ± 6.3	ND

alfafla	35.4 ± 0.8	35.8 ± 18.6	3.5 ± 0.3	ND
lettuce apoplast	19.4 ± 1.8	23.4 ± 2.8	53.4 ± 20.7	0.226 ± 0.001
lettuce leaf lysates	10.7 ± 0.3	14.6 ± 0.4	50.1 ± 3.1	ND
lettuce root lysates	9.9 ± 0.1	20.0 ± 0.9	22.5 ± 0.4	ND
spinach apoplast	11.8 ± 2.0	8.0 ± 1.7	38.3 ± 7.0	0.211 ± 0.049
spinach leaf	21.9 ± 2.9	6.1 ± 0.8	32.8 ± 2.6	ND
spinach root	17.4 ± 1.2	9.00 ± 0.9	29.4 ± 1.5	ND

689

690 **Table 3** Composition of defined artificial media supplements

691 Concentration ($\mu g\ ml^{-1}$) as determined by HPLC and GC-MS for the major six components in

692 sprout extracts (alfalfa and fenugreek combined), lettuce apoplast, used to generate defined

693 'artificial' media.

Metabolite	Sprouts	Lettuce apoplast
Saccharides (SA)		
Sucrose	3021.4	2116.2
Fructose	1443.4	926.5
Glucose	1425.0	769.8

Amino acids (AA)		
Asparagine	814.3	n/a
Alanine	766.1	n/a
Serine	327.4	n/a
Oxoproline	n/a	63.4
Organic acids (OA)		
Malic acid	n/a	194.0
2,3-dihydroxy-propanoic acid	n/a	143.5

694

695 **Table 4**   Biofilm formation for reference *E. coli* isolates in plant tissue extracts. Biofilms

696 were formed on polystyrene multiwall plates following incubation in spinach (Sp.) and lettuce

697 (Lt.) extracts (apoplast; leaf; root) and rich defined MOPS medium with glycerol (RDMG) at 18

698 °C, for 48 hrs in static conditions. The average (± variance) density of crystal violet at $OD_{590\ nm}$

699 is presented.

Treatment / Isolate	Sakai	ZAP1589	JHI5025	JHI5039	MG1655
Sp. apoplast	0.002 ± 0.001	0.011 ± 0.001	0.372 ± 0.007	0.013 ± 0.000	0.001 ± 0.002

Sp. leaf	0.071 ± 0.000	0.128 ± 0.001	0.218 ± 0.034	0.113 ± 0.001	0.000 ± 0.000
Sp. root	0.173 ± 0.000	0.148 ± 0.017	0.179 ± 0.015	0.126 ± 0.000	0.013 ± 0.000
Lt. apoplast	0.000 ± 0.002	0.005 ± 0.000	0.125 ± 0.005	0.001 ± 0.000	0.000 ± 0.000
Lt. leaf	0.000 ± 0.000	0.018 ± 0.001	0.151 ± 0.002	0.007 ± 0.000	0.001 ± 0.000
Lt. root	0.008 ± 0.000	0.029 ± 0.001	0.066 ± 0.001	0.025 ± 0.000	0.000 ± 0.000
RDMG	0.000 ± 0.000	0.000 ± 0.000	0.013 ± 0.000	0.000 ± 0.000	0.000 ± 0.000

700

701

702 ## Figure Legends

703 **Figure 1** Maximum growth rates (μ) of reference *E. coli* isolates in plant extracts.

704 Maximum growth rates (μ) were calculated using the Baranyi model for the reference *E. coli*

705 isolates in spinach **(A)** or lettuce **(B)** aploplast (circles), leaf lysates (triangles) and root lysates

706 (diamonds) extracts, or in alfalfa (circles) or fenugreek (triangles) sprouts lysate extracts **(C)**

707 with RDMG (diamonds) as no-plant extract control, at 18, 20 or 25 °C. Each point is the

708 average rate (n = 12), with standard errors indicated by bars.

709 **Figure 2** Plant extract metabolomics and grouping

710 The 60 assigned metabolites from all species and tissues are separated into amino acids,

711 organic acids, mono- and polysaccharides and others **(A)** by their mean total response ratio

712 (with SD indicated by bars). (**B**) Score plot of principal component 1 (31 % variance) and

713 component 2 (19 %) for all 116 polar metabolites, for alfalfa (ALF) in red, fenugreek (FEN) in

714 blue, spinach (SAP, SLL, SRL) green and lettuce (LAP, LLL, LRL) black.

715 **Figure 3** Maximum growth rates (μ) in artificial media mimicking plant extracts.

716 Maximum growths rates (μ) calculated using the Baranyi model for the *E. coli* isolates at 18 °C

717 and 25 °C in media mimicking (**A**) lettuce apoplast or (**B**) sprout lysates (a mixture of alfalfa

718 and fenugreek sprout metabolites) with specified dilutions. The base minimal MOPS medium

719 (MMM) was supplemented with saccharides (SA), organic acids (OA) or amino acids (AA) at

720 the dilution specified. Each point is the average rate with standard errors indicated by bars.

721 **Figure 4** Total and internalised counts for *E. coli* O157:H7 *in planta*.

722   The number of *E. coli* isolate ZAP1589 recovered from inoculation (10^7 cfu ml^{-1}) of (**A**) spinach

723   (var. Amazon) or (**B**) lettuce (var. All Year Round) roots at 0, 5, 10 and 14 dpi.. The number of

724   *E. coli* isolate ZAP1589 recovered from alfalfa (**C**) or fenugreek (**D**), and *E. coli* isolate Sakai

725   recovered from alfalfa (**E**) or fenugreek sprouts (**F**), from inoculation at 10^3 cfu ml^{-1}, sampled at

726   0, 1 and 2 dpi.. Averages (lines) and individual samples counts are shown for the total (black)

727   or internalised population (red) (n = 15: ~ 1.5 g per sample for sprouts, individual plants for

728   spinach & lettuce). Sprout d0 data was assessed by MPN (level of detection = 0), otherwise

729   minimum counts were manually levelled to the direct plating detection limit of 10 cfu g^{-1} on d1.

730   **Figure 5**   Comparison of *in planta* and extract growth rates for *E. coli* isolates Sakai and

731   ZAP1589

732   Growth rates for *in planta* estimates were plotted against estimates for plant extract extracts,

733   on a Log$_{10}$ cfu day^{-1} basis for *E. coli* isolates Sakai and ZAP1589, normalised per g fresh

734   weight for plant tissues or per ml for plant extracts. Estimates for sprouted seeds (alfalfa – Alf;

735   fenugreek – Fen) were obtained for growth at 25 °C, and at 18 °C for spinach (Sp.) or lettuce

736   (Lt.) tissues (apoplast – A; leaves – L; roots – R).

737   **Supplemental Figure 1**   Manual correction of growth rate misfits in DMFIT.

738   Example of a correction with *E. coli* isolate JHI5039 grown in lettuce leaf lysate, 18 °C. **A)**

739   DMFIT could not fit a non-linear curve on data (n = 193) with a decrease in the stationary

740   phase (R^2_{adj} = 0.001). **B)** Data was cut off manually (n = 49) to achieve better fits (R^2_{adj} =

741   0.996). A complete list of fits including data points are in Supplemental Table 3.

742   **Supplemental Figure 2**   Simplified polar metabolic pathways in plants

743   Interaction between major polar pathways (colour coded) in green leafy plants. Metabolism of

744   carbohydrates degradation (green) is linked to amino acid degradation (dark blue and purple),

745   which feed into the TCA cycle (red). The arrows pointing outside are entries into the non-polar

746   fatty acid pathway. The glutamate group (orange) leads into the urea cycle. The light blue

747   cycle described the acyl chain synthesis. Modified from the metabolomic pathway in *Solanum*,

748   based on Dobson, et al. (14).

749

750

A

B