

Aberystwyth University

Population genetic analyses reveal distinct geographical blooms of the jellyfish Rhizostoma octopus (Scyphozoa)

Glynn, Fergal; Houghton, Jonathan D. R.; Provan, Jim

Published in: Biological Journal of the Linnean Society DOI:

10.1111/bij.12614

Publication date: 2015

Citation for published version (APA):

Glynn, F., Houghton, J. D. R., & Provan, J. (2015). Population genetic analyses reveal distinct geographical blooms of the jellyfish Rhizostoma octopus (Scyphozoa). *Biological Journal of the Linnean Society*, *116*(3), 582-592. https://doi.org/10.1111/bij.12614

General rights

Copyright and moral rights for the publications made accessible in the Aberystwyth Research Portal (the Institutional Repository) are retained by the authors and/or other copyright owners and it is a condition of accessing publications that users recognise and abide by the legal requirements associated with these rights.

• Users may download and print one copy of any publication from the Aberystwyth Research Portal for the purpose of private study or • You may not further distribute the material or use it for any profit-making activity or commercial gain
 • You may not further distribute the heat the publication in the Abervstwyth Research Portal

- You may freely distribute the URL identifying the publication in the Aberystwyth Research Porta

Take down policy

If you believe that this document breaches copyright please contact us providing details, and we will remove access to the work immediately and investigate your claim.

tel: +44 1970 62 2400 email: is@aber.ac.uk

Population genetic analyses reveal distinct geographical blooms of the jellyfish *Rhizostoma octopus* (Scyphozoa)

FERGAL GLYNN^{1,2}, JONATHAN D. R. HOUGHTON^{1,2,3} and JIM PROVAN^{1,2*}

¹ School of Biological Sciences, Queen's University Belfast, 97 Lisburn Road, Belfast BT9 7BL

² Institute for Global Food Security, Queen's University Belfast

³ Queen's Marine Laboratory, 12-13 The Strand, Portaferry, BT22 1PF

*Corresponding author: Dr Jim Provan School of Biological Sciences, Queen's University Belfast, 97 Lisburn Road, Belfast BT9 7BL E-mail: J.Provan@qub.ac.uk Tel: +44 (0)28 9097 2280 Fax: +44 (0)28 9097 5588

1 Understanding the spatial integrity and connectivity of jellyfish blooms is important for 2 ecologists and coastal stakeholders alike. Previous studies have shown that the distribution of jellyfish blooms can display a marked consistency in space and time, suggesting that such 3 4 patterns cannot be attributed to passive processes alone. In the present study, we have used a combination of microsatellite markers and mitochondrial COI sequences to investigate 5 genetic structuring of the scyphozoan jellyfish Rhizostoma octopus in the Irish and Celtic 6 Seas. The mitochondrial data indicated far higher levels of population differentiation than the 7 microsatellites ($\Phi_{STIMT1} = 0.300$ vs $\Phi_{STINUC1} = 0.013$). Simulation studies indicated that the 8 9 low levels of nuclear differentiation were not due to limited power as a result of low levels of polymorphism. These findings, supported by palaeodistribution modelling and mismatch 10 distribution analysis, are consistent with expansion of R. octopus from a single, limited 11 12 refugium after the Last Glacial Maximum, followed by subsequent isolation, and that the discrepancy between the mitochondrial and nuclear markers is a result of the nuclear loci 13 taking longer to reach mutation-drift equilibrium following the expansion due to their 14 15 fourfold larger effective population size. The populations studied are most likely not well connected via gene flow, and thus genetically as well as geographically distinct, but our 16 findings also highlight the need to use a combination of organellar and nuclear markers to 17 give a more complete picture of population demography and structure, particularly for 18 19 species with large effective population sizes.

20

21 ADDITIONAL KEYWORDS: Jellyfish, microsatellites, mitochondrial COI,

22 palaeodistribution modelling, population genetics, *Rhizostoma octopus*

INTRODUCTION

24

The application of population genetics approaches has provided many insights into the levels 25 26 and patterns of gene flow in marine organisms. Traditionally, it had been viewed that there were few barriers to population connectivity in the marine realm, particularly for organisms 27 with planktonic or partially planktonic life cycles (Palumbi, 1994; Norris, 2000). Subsequent 28 molecular studies on marine populations utilising mitochondrial DNA (mtDNA), however, 29 indicated that intraspecific genetic structuring does exist (e.g. Chow et al., 1997; Zane et al., 30 31 1998; Keeney et al., 2005; Darling, Kucera & Wade, 2007). More recently, the development of microsatellite markers has offered further opportunities to study genetic structuring, since 32 theoretical studies have suggested that the use of multiple, multi-allelic loci should offer 33 34 greater power than mtDNA to detect population subdivision, particularly at low levels (Larsson et al., 2009), and this has been largely borne out by empirical studies (Iacchei et al., 35 2014; Godhe et al., 2014; but see Provan et al., 2009). It has also been demonstrated, 36 37 however, that population demographic changes such as those associated with the climatic fluctuations of the Pleistocene (ca. 2.58 MYA – 11 KYA) can give rise to apparently 38 contradictory signals of population subdivision across different markers (Lukoschek, Waycott 39 & Keogh, 2008; Larmuseau et al., 2010). Thus, depending on the demographic history of the 40 populations under study, the use of both mtDNA and microsatellites may be required to gain 41 a complete picture of patterns of gene flow. 42

Within this context, there is international interest in the drivers, overall abundance and
connectivity of jellyfish blooms (i.e. Phylum Cnidaria, Class Scyphozoa; Hamner & Dawson
2009; Brotz *et al.*, 2012; Condon *et al.*, 2013). These blooms represent the concentration of
many free swimming medusae in a particular area either through rapid population growth (a
true bloom) or advection from another area (an apparent bloom; Graham, Pag & Hamner,
Page | 3

48 2001; Graham et al., 2003). True blooms are associated typically with species displaying metagenic life-histories comprising free-swimming and sexually reproducing medusae and 49 benthic polyps that reproduce through asexual strobilation (e.g. Graham, Pag & Hamner, 50 51 2001; Richardson et al. 2009; Gibbons & Richardson 2013). In most cases, a given cohort of medusae will persist from spring through to autumn, whilst the asexually reproducing polyps 52 can survive for many years (Thein, Ikeda & Uye, 2012). This inter-annual persistence of an 53 asexually reproducing sessile life stage can lead to the regular re-occurrence of blooms in 54 specific locations(Houghton et al., 2006a,b; Lilley et al., 2008), population structuring (e.g. 55 56 Pitt & Kingsford, 2000) and eventual phylogenetic differentiation. As efforts to incorporate jellyfish more effectively into ecosystem and fisheries models gather momentum (Pauly et al. 57 2008; Brotz et al. 2012; Fleming et al. In Press), such information is important when 58 59 considering the temporal and spatial integrity of seemingly isolated bloom events (Lee et al. 2013). 60

The utility of population genetics to elucidate the connectivity or discreteness of jellyfish 61 62 blooms has been shown, with studies having revealed population structuring (Dawson, 2005a), cryptic speciation (Dawson & Jacobs, 2001; Holland et al., 2004) and even 63 anthropogenic introductions (Dawson, Gupta & England, 2005). Almost all such studies of 64 scyphozoan jellyfish population genetics have employed a limited number of markers (with 65 the exception of Aglieri *et al.* [2014]), with most studies relying mainly on the mitochondrial 66 67 COI gene (eg Holland et al., 2004), although some have additionally employed data from the nuclear ribosomal DNA cistron (e.g. Dawson & Jacobs, 2001; Stopar et al., 2010). The 68 development of microsatellite markers for several jellyfish species (Coughlan, Seymour & 69 Cross 2006; Peplow et al. 2009; Reusch et al. 2010; Bolte et al. 2013; Meek et al. 2013), 70 potentially offers the opportunity to study fine-scale genetic structuring, although to date, 71 there has only been a single published study on scyphozoans (Aglieri et al. 2014). 72 Page | 4

73 In the present study, we used a combination of recently developed microsatellite markers and COI sequences to investigate genetic structuring of *Rhizostoma octopus*, a scyphozoan 74 jellyfish with a generally predictable and temporally stable geographical distribution, 75 76 including regular but apparently discrete blooms of adult jellyfish in bays in the Irish Sea (Doyle et al. 2006; Houghton 2006b). Previous genetic analyses within the genus have 77 provided conflicting results, with Ramšak, Stopar & Malej (2012) finding little partitioning of 78 genetic diversity between blooms of R. pulmo in the Mediterranean Sea, whilst Lee et al. 79 (2013) found notable population structure in *R. octopus* in the Irish Sea and from La 80 81 Rochelle, France, although levels of differentiation were far less pronounced in the nuclear gene studied (calmodulin) compared to the mitochondrial cytochrome oxidase subunit 1 82 (COI) gene. The use of microsatellites, with their potentially increased resolution, should 83 84 allow us to determine whether any fine-scale structure exists in *R. octopus*, even in cases where such levels may be extremely low (Wirth & Bernatchez, 2001), but also whether there 85 are any discrepancies between mtDNA and microsatellites, possibly resulting from 86 87 demographic changes during the Pleistocene.

88	MATERIALS AND METHODS
89	
90	SAMPLING AND DNA EXTRACTION
91	Samples were collected from four locations throughout the Irish and Celtic Seas (Table 1 and
92	Figure 1) in August / September 2011. Genomic DNA was extracted using a modified
93	version of the Porebski, Bailey & Baum (1997) CTAB phenol/chloroform protocol whereby
94	extracted DNA which had been subjected to phenol and chloroform wash was stored in a 1:1
95	supernatant: isopropanol state at -20°C until needed for PCR, then pelleting and the alcohol
96	wash were carried out before elution. Long term storage of eluted DNA resulted in loss of
97	high molecular weight (genomic) DNA and reduced amplification success.
98	
99	MICROSATELLITE GENOTYPING
100	Microsatellites were developed from R. pulmo sequences deposited in GenBank (for
101	accession numbers see Table 2). Forward primers included a 19 bp M13 tail
102	(CACGACGTTGTAAAACGAC) and reverse primers included a 7 bp tail (GTGTCTT).
103	PCR was carried out in a total volume of 10 μ l containing 100 ng genomic DNA, 10 pmol of
104	6-FAM- or HEX-labelled M13 primer, 1 pmol of tailed forward primer, 10 pmol reverse
105	primer, 1x PCR reaction buffer, 200 μM each dNTP, 2.5 mM MgCl_2 and 0.25 U GoTaq Flexi
106	DNA polymerase (Promega). PCR was carried out on a MWG Primus thermal cycler using
107	the following parameters: initial denaturation at 94 °C for 5 min followed by 45 cycles of
108	denaturation at 94 °C for 30 s, annealing at 58 °C for 30 s (55 °C for RpMS-4), extension at
109	72 °C for 30 s and a final extension at 72 °C for 5 min. Genotyping was carried out on an
110	AB3730xl capillary genotyping system (Life Technologies; Carlsbad, California, USA).
111	Allele sizes were scored using LIZ size standards and were checked by comparison with
112	previously sized control samples. Page 6

MTDNA SEQUENCING 113 A 639 bp region of the R. octopus mtDNA COI gene was amplified using the primers Ro-114 COI-F 5'-CAACAAATTCTAAGATATTGGAAC-3' and Ro-COI-R 5'-115 GGGTCGAAGGAAGATGTATTA-3'. PCR was carried out on a MWG Primus thermal 116 cycler using the following parameters: initial denaturation at 94 °C for 3 min followed by 40 117 cycles of denaturation at 94 °C for 30 s, annealing at 58 °C for 30 s, extension at 72 °C for 1 118 min and a final extension at 72 °C for 5 min. PCR was carried out in a total volume of 20 µl 119 containing 200 ng genomic DNA, 10 pmol of each primer, 1x PCR reaction buffer, 200 µM 120 121 each dNTP, 2.5 mM MgCl₂ and 0.5 U GoTaq Flexi DNA polymerase (Promega). 5 µl PCR product were resolved on 1.5% agarose gels and visualised by ethidium bromide staining, and 122 the remaining 15 µl were EXO-SAP purified and sequenced in both directions using the 123 124 BigDye sequencing kit (V3.1; Applied Biosystems) and run on an AB 3730XL DNA analyser (Life Technologies; Carlsbad, California, USA). 125 126 DATA ANALYSIS 127 Tests for linkage disequilibrium between pairs of microsatellite loci in each population were 128 carried out in the program FSTAT (V2.9.3.2; Goudet, [2002]). Levels of polymorphism 129 measured as observed (H_0) and expected (H_E) heterozygosity averaged over loci for nuclear 130 microsatellites, and as haplotype (H) and nucleotide (π) diversity for mtDNA, were calculated 131 using the ARLEQUIN software package (V3.5.1.2; Excoffier & Lischer, [2010]). Inbreeding 132 coefficients (F_{IS}) were estimated using FSTAT. Levels of interpopulation differentiation 133 were estimated from allele (microsatellite) and haplotype (mtDNA) frequencies using Φ -134 statistics, which give an analogue of F-statistics (Weir & Cockerham, 1985) calculated within 135 the analysis of molecular variance (AMOVA) framework (Excoffier, Smouse & Quattro 136 1992), also using the ARLEQUIN software package. Population-pairwise Φ_{ST} values were also 137 Page | 7

138 calculated using ARLEQUIN. Significance of values was tested using 1,000 permutations. A median-joining network showing the relationships between the mtDNA haplotypes was 139 constructed using the NETWORK software package (V4.5.1.6; www.fluxus-engineering.com). 140 In addition, tests for population expansion based on Tajima's D and Fu's F_S and a mismatch 141 distribution analysis, which identifies characteristic "waves" in the shape of the distribution 142 resulting from expansion (Rogers and Harpending, 1992), were carried out in ARLEQUIN. 143 To identify possible spatial patterns of gene flow, the software package BAPS (V5; 144 Corander, Waldmann & Sillanpää, [2003]) was used to identify clusters of genetically similar 145 146 populations using a Bayesian approach. Ten replicates were run for all possible values of the maximum number of clusters (K) up to K = 4, the number of populations sampled in the 147 study, with a burn-in period of 10 000 iterations followed by 50 000 iterations. Multiple 148 149 independent runs always gave the same outcome. To further identify possible spatial patterns of gene flow, a principal coordinate analysis (PCoA) was carried out in GENALEX (V6.1; 150 Peakall & Smouse, 2006). Inter-individual genetic distances were calculated as described in 151 Smouse & Peakall, 1999, and the PCoA was carried out using the standard covariance 152 approach. 153

Because of the genetic homogeneity revealed by the microsatellite loci studied, and to 154 compare the relative power of microsatellites and the mtDNA to detect low levels of 155 population differentiation, simulations were carried out using the POWSIM software package 156 157 (V4.0; Ryman & Palm, 2006). Simulations were carried out for an effective population size of $N_e = 1\ 000$ to yield F_{ST} values of 0.0050, 0.0075, 0.0100, 0.0125, 0.0150, 0.0175 and 158 0.0200. Although R. octopus may have a larger effective population size, this is not relevant 159 to the analysis, since N_e only determines the time necessary to reach the target F_{ST} . Thus, the 160 use of larger values of N_e is unjustified as the difference between, say, $N_e = 1\ 000$ and 10 000 161 (and higher) is not important at values of F_{ST} as small as those tested in the simulation (Nils 162 Page | 8

163 Ryman, personal communication). In all cases, 1 000 replicates were run and the power of 164 the analysis was indicated by the proportion of tests that were significant at P < 0.05 using 165 the observed allele frequencies for both the four microsatellite loci and the single mtDNA 166 COI region studied (for $F_{ST} = 0$ this corresponds to the Type I [α] error). For the mtDNA, 167 sample sizes were adjusted as recommended by Larsson *et al.*, (2009).

- 168
- 169

PALAEODISTRIBUTION MODELLING

Palaeodistribution modelling was carried out to determine the potential suitable range for *R*. 170 171 octopus at the Last Glacial Maximum (LGM; ca. 21 KYA) using the maximum entropy approach implemented in the MAXENT software package (V3.3.3; Phillips, Anderson & 172 Schapire, 2006). Species occurrence data between 1950 and 2000 were downloaded from the 173 174 Global Biodiversity Information Facility data portal (www.gbif.org) and from the Ocean Biogeographic Information System (www.iobis.org), and supplemented with our own 175 population data from the current study (117 spatially unique occurrences in total). Current-176 day bioclimatic data (MARSPEC; Sbrocco & Barber, 2013) were obtained at 5 minute 177 resolution and models were generated using cross-validation of ten replicate runs under the 178 default MAXENT parameters. Model performance was assessed based on the area under the 179 receiver operating characteristic curve (AUC). Models were projected onto reconstructed 180 bioclimatic data for the LGM (ensemble of five models: CNRM, ECBILTCLIO, FGOALS, 181 182 HadCM and MIROC-322; Sbrocco, 2014). To identify potential areas where the model may have extrapolated beyond current climatic conditions, which could lead to unreliable 183 predictions, we carried out a multivariate environmental similarity surfaces (MESS) analysis 184 185 (Elith et al. 2010) in MAXENT.

186	RESULTS
187	
188	POPULATION GENETIC ANALYSES
189	No evidence of linkage disequilibrium was detected between any of the four nuclear
190	microsatellite loci analysed. Between 13 (Rp-MS1) and 25 (Rp-MS5) alleles were detected,
191	with a total of 73 (mean = 18.25 per locus). Within-population levels of observed (H_0) and
192	expected (H_E) heterozygosity ranged from 0.658 (Solway Firth) to 0.777 (Carmarthern Bay;
193	mean = 0.729) and from 0.805 (Tremadoc Bay) to 0.852 (Carmarthen Bay; mean = 0.822)
194	respectively (Table 1). Levels of F_{IS} were significantly different from zero in three of the
195	four populations, and ranged from 0.074 (Tremadoc Bay) to 0.188 (Solway Firth; mean =
196	0.075). Summary statistics by locus are given in Supplementary Table S1.
197	A total of 27 mitochondrial COI haplotypes were identified (Figure 2). Nineteen of these
198	were found in a single individual, and three of the remaining eight, including the two most
199	common haplotypes, were found in more than one population. Within populations, between
200	three (Tremadoc Bay) and 15 (Carmarthen Bay) haplotypes were detected (mean = 8.25).
201	Levels of haplotype (<i>H</i>) and nucleotide (π) diversity ranged from 0.178 (Tremadoc Bay) to
202	0.920 (Carmarthen Bay), and from 0.001 (Tremadoc Bay) to 0.006 (Solway Firth)
203	respectively (Table 1).
204	The analysis of molecular variance (AMOVA) revealed a small but significant overall
205	differentiation based on nuclear microsatellites ($\Phi_{ST[NUC]} = 0.013$; $P < 0.001$), and a much
206	higher level based on the mtDNA COI ($\Phi_{ST[MT]} = 0.300$; $P < 0.001$; Table 3). Population-
207	pairwise Φ_{ST} values ranged from zero (three pairs) to 0.046 (Tremadoc Bay / Celtic Sea) for
208	nuclear microsatellites, and from zero (Carmarthen Bay / Celtic Sea) to 0.579 (Tremadoc Bay
209	/ Celtic Sea) for the mtDNA COI (Table 4). The BAPS analysis indicated that all the

individuals analysed were grouped into a single genetic cluster (100% probability). This wasPage | 10

reflected in the PCoA, which showed no evidence of geographical structuring of individual multilocus genotypes (Figure 3). The values for both Tajima's *D* and Fu's F_S were significantly negative (-1.434 [P = 0.049] and -16.077 [P < 0.0001] respectively), consistent with sudden population expansion. The mismatch distribution analysis (Figure S1), which resulted in a Harpending's raggedness index of 0.045 (P = 0.297), also did not reject the sudden expansion model.

The simulation studies suggested that the nuclear microsatellite data were able to detect F_{ST} values of as low as 0.0100 at least 90% of the time, and 0.0125 at least 98% of the time (Figure 4). The mtDNA COI locus had much lower power, only 9% and 16% for the same two values, and could only detect $F_{ST} = 0.05$ in 88% of the simulations. At the lowest values of F_{ST} (≤ 0.01) used in the simulations, the power of the nuclear microsatellite loci was generally five- to ten-fold that of the mtDNA COI locus.

223

224

PALAEODISTRIBUTION MODELLING

For all models, AUC values were high (mean AUC = 0.995). The modelled current-day distribution was a largely accurate prediction of the current range of *R. octopus*, highlighting coastal areas of northwestern Europe as most suitable (Figure 5a). The palaeodistribution model indicated extensive suitable habitat in the Mediterranean at the LGM, but very little in the northeast Atlantic, with the only suitable habitat being limited to a small area in the Bay of Biscay adjacent to the palaeocoastline (Figure 5b). The MESS analysis did not indicate any areas in the model where extrapolation beyond current climatic conditions had occurred. DISCUSSION

233

Page | 12

232

Although the results from the two sets of markers in the present study revealed differing 234 levels of population structuring, they can be interpreted as being generally consistent with 235 population expansion following the LGM and subsequent divergence, with limited gene flow 236 between the regions studied. Our findings are broadly comparable with those from a previous 237 study on R. octopus (Lee et al. 2013), and highlight an emerging trend from the currently 238 limited number of microsatellite-based population genetic analyses in gelatinous zooplankton 239 240 (Bolte et al., 2013; Aglieri et al., 2014), namely that blooms can readily be traced to relatively isolated, self-sustaining populations. From an ecological perspective such 241 information is insightful given that scyphozoa have often been viewed as transient 242 243 components of marine food webs, with very little spatial integrity or trophic relevance (Doyle et al., 2006; Houghton et al., 2007). The growing body of evidence to show that jellyfish 244 blooms can persist in large numbers in particular locations over time (through processes in 245 addition to advection) promotes the much needed inclusion of such species in ecosystem 246 models (Pauly et al., 2008; Doyle et al., 2014). 247 Discrepancies between the levels of genetic structuring revealed by nuclear and organellar 248

markers have been reported in a wide range of species (reviewed in Karl et al. 2012). These 249 can be the result of a variety of processes, including sex-biased dispersal (Cano, Mäkinen & 250 251 Merilä, 2008), homoplasy at microsatellite loci (Estoup, Jarne & Cornuet, 2002), selection (de Innocentiis et al., 2001), or differences in effective population size (Paulmbi, Cipriano & 252 Hare, 2001). The observed disparity between levels of population differentiation revealed by 253 nuclear and mitochondrial markers in the present study, which differ by more than an order of 254 magnitude ($\Phi_{ST[NUC]} = 0.013$ vs. $\Phi_{ST[MT]} = 0.30$), can be explained most readily by the last of 255 these. For diploid species, such as *R. octopus*, the effective population size of the haploid 256

257 mitochondrial genome is half that of the diploid nuclear genome. In addition to this, in idealized populations of dioecious taxa with even sex ratios, the effective population size of 258 the mitochondrial genome could be assumed to be 0.25 of the effective population size of the 259 nuclear genome, leading to differences in the time required for reciprocal monophyly via 260 lineage sorting (Maynard Smith 1987; Paulmbi, Cipriano & Hare 2001; Hudson & Coyne 261 2002). A lack of resolving power due to insufficient polymorphism in the microsatellites is 262 263 not supported by the simulation analyses, which indicated that the microsatellites had far greater power than mtDNA over a range of simulated F_{ST} values based on the empirical allele 264 265 frequencies.

Differences in F_{ST} and its equivalents between nuclear and mitochondrial markers can be 266 further exaggerated where populations have undergone recent expansion. In such 267 268 circumstances, nuclear loci will take longer to reach mutation-drift equilibrium. This has been suggested previously for other marine species with large effective population sizes 269 (Lukoschek, Waycott & Keogh, 2008; Larmuseau et al., 2010). The results of the 270 palaeodistribution modelling indicate an extremely restricted area of suitable habitat for *R*. 271 octopus in the northeast North Atlantic during the LGM compared to its current distribution. 272 The model did suggest the presence of suitable habitat in the Mediterranean, but whilst this 273 area was not isolated from the Atlantic despite the drop in sea levels during the glacial period, 274 the Strait of Gibraltar represents a major biogeographic barrier to a range of marine species 275 276 (Baus, Darrock & Bruford 2005 and references therein; Paternello, Volckaert & Castilho 2007). Furthermore, climate-induced range shifts and contractions such as those that 277 occurred during the Pleistocene are believed to result from population extirpation, rather than 278 279 migration (Dalén et al. 2007; Bennett & Provan 2008; Provan & Bennett 2008). Our findings, including the significant negative values for both Tajima's D and Fu's F_S and the 280 mismatch distribution analysis, are consistent with expansion of *R. octopus* from a single, 281 Page | 13

282 limited refugium after the LGM, followed by subsequent isolation, as indicated by the mtDNA and the nuclear F_{LS} values, which suggest inbreeding within three of the four 283 populations. Many northern North Atlantic marine species survived the LGM in a range of 284 refugia (reviewed in Provan 2013), and the low levels of nuclear genetic differentiation 285 observed in *R. octopus* are consistent with high historical gene flow, suggesting an extended 286 period of genetic connectivity consistent with LGM survival of populations in the same area. 287 Population isolation following the expansion would give rise to the observed discordance 288 between mtDNA and microsatellites. 289

290 Despite the discrepancies observed between mtDNA and microsatellites, the case for using multiple, unlinked nuclear loci for genetic studies on scyphozoa is strong. As a basic tool, the 291 mitochondrial COI marker allows a great deal of information to be gathered and comparisons 292 293 to be made with many other scyphozoan species for which population data sets exist (e.g. 294 Dawson, 2005; Holland et al., 2004; Prieto, Armani & Marcias, 2013). The additional potential power of microsatellites, as indicated by the simulation studies, could be useful in 295 fine-scale analyses of population structure in other species which appear to have little 296 geographically-based population structuring such as the congener, R. pulmo (Ramšak et al., 297 2012). With the recent publication of a study of *Pelagia noctiluca* genetics employing 298 microsatellite markers (Aglieri et al., 2014) and the present study, we foresee a shift in 299 scyophozoan studies toward including panels of unlinked, high-resolution nuclear markers. 300 301 As in the present study, a combination of organellar and nuclear markers may be necessary to give a more complete picture of population demography and structure, particularly for 302 species with large effective population sizes. 303

304	ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS
305	
306	We are grateful to Melanie Gomes for providing samples and to Gemma Beatty for assistance
307	in the laboratory. Fergal Glynn's PhD was funded by the Department of Agriculture and
308	Rural Development, Northern Ireland (DARDNI).

309 REFERENCES

310

- 311 Aglieri G, Papetti C, Zane L, Milisenda G, Boero F, Piraino S. 2014. First evidence of inbreeding,
- relatedness and chaotic genetic patchiness in the holoplanktonic jellyfish *Pelagia noctiluca* (Scyphozoa,
- **313** Cnidaria). *PLoS One* **9**: e99647.
- Baus E, Darrock J, Bruford MW. 2005. Gene-flow patterns in Atlantic and Mediterranean populations of the
 Lusitanian sea star *Asterina gibbosa*. *Molecular Ecology* 14: 3373-3382.
- **Bennett KD, Provan J. 2008.** What do we mean by 'refugia'? *Quaternary Science Reviews*, **27**: 2449-2455.

Bolte S, Fuentes V, Haslob H, Huwer B, Thibault-Botha D, Angel D, Galil B, Javifpour J, Moss AG,

- 318 **Reusch TBH. 2013.** Population genetics of the invasive ctenophore *Mnemiopsis leidyi* in Europe reveal
- 319 source-sink dynamics and secondary dispersal to the Mediterranean Sea. *Marine Ecology Progress Series*
- **485**: 25-46.
- Brotz L, Cheung WWL, Kleisner K, Pakhomov E, Pauly D. 2012. Increasing jellyfish populations: trends
 in Large Marine Ecosystems. *Hydrobiologia* 690: 3-20.
- 323 Cano JM, Mäkinen HS, Merilä J. 2008. Genetic evidence for male-biased dispersal in the three-spined
 324 stickleback (*Gasterosteus aculeatus*). *Molecular Ecology* 17: 3234-3242.
- 325 Chow S, Okamoto H, Uozumi Y, Takeuchi Y, Takeyama H. 1997. Genetic stock structure of the swordfish
- 326 (*Xiphia gladius*) inferred by PCR-RFLP analysis of the mitochondrial DNA control region. *Marine Biology* 327 127: 359-367.
- 328 Condon RH, Duarte CM, Pitt KA, Robinson KL, Lucas CH, Sutherland KR, Mianzan HW, Bogeberg M,
- 329 Purcell JE, Decker MB, Uye S-I, Madin LP, Brodeur RD, Haddock SHD, Malej A, Parry GD, Eriksen
- 330 E, Quiñones J, Acha M, Harvey M, Arthur JM, Graham WM. 2013. Recurrent jellyfish blooms are a
- 331 consequence of global oscillations. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences USA* **110**: 1000-1005.
- 332 Corander J, Waldmann P, Sillanpää MJ. 2003. Bayesian analysis of genetic differentiation between
- **333** populations. *Genetics* **163**: 367-374.
- 334 Coughlan JP, Seymour J, Cross TF. 2006. Isolation and characterization of seven polymorphic microsatellite
- loci in the box jellyfish (*Chironex fleckeri*, Cubozoa, Cnidaria). *Molecular Ecology Notes* 6: 41-43.

- 336 Dalén L, Nyström V, Valdiosera C, Germonpré M, Sablin M, Turner E, Angerbjörn A, Arsuaga JL,
- **Götherström A. 2007.** Ancient DNA reveals a lack of habitat tracking in the Arctic fox. *Proceedings of*

338 *the National Academy of Sciences USA* **104**: 6276-6279.

- 339 Darling KF, Kucera M, Wade CM. 2007. Global molecular phylogeography reveals persistent Arctic
- 340 circumpolar isolation in a marine planktonic protist. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences USA*
- **341 104**: 5002-5007.
- 342 Dawson MN. 2005. Incipient speciation of Catostylus mosaicus (Scyphozoa, Rhizostomeae, Catostylidae),
- 343 comparative phylogeography and biogeography in south-east Australia. *Journal of Biogeography* 32: 515-
- **344** 533.
- 345 Dawson MN, Jacobs DK. 2001. Molecular evidence for cryptic species of Aurelia aurita (Cnidaria,
- 346 Scyphozoa). *The Biological Bulletin*, **200**: 92-96.
- 347 Dawson MN, Gupta AS, England MH. 2005. Coupled biophysical global ocean model and molecular genetic
- analyses identify multiple introductions of cryptogenic species. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences USA* 102: 11968-11973.
- de Innocentiis S, Sola L, Cataudella S, Bentzen P. 2001. Allozyme and microsatellite loci provide discordant
- estimates of population differentiation in the endangered dusky grouper (*Epinephelus marginatus*) within the
- 352 Mediterranean Sea. *Molecular Ecology* **10**: 2163-2175.
- 353 Doyle TK, Houghton JDR, Buckley SM, Hays GC, Davenport J. 2006. The broad scale distribution of five
- jellyfish species across a temperate coastal environment. *Hydrobiologia* **579**: 29-39.
- 355 Doyle TK, Hays GC, Harrod C, Houghton JDR. 2014. Ecological and societal benefits of jellyfish. In: Pitt
- 356 KA, Lucas CH (eds.) *Jellyfish Blooms*. Springer, Netherlands. pp. 105-127.
- Elith J, Kearney M, Phillips S. 2010. The art of modelling range-shifting species. *Methods in Ecology and Evolution*, 1: 330-342.
- 359 Estoup A, Jarne P, Cornuet JM. 2002. Homoplasy and mutation model at microsatellite loci and their
- 360 consequences for population genetics analysis. *Molecular Ecology* **11**: 1591-1604.
- 361 Excoffier L, Smouse PE, Quattro JM. 1992. Analysis of molecular variance inferred from metric distances
- among DNA haplotypes application to human mitochondrial DNA restriction data. *Genetics* **131**: 479-491.
- 363 Excoffier L, Lischer HEL. 2010. Arlequin suite ver 3.5: a new series of programs to perform population
- 364 genetics analyses under Linux and Windows. *Molecular Ecology Resources* **10**: 564-567.

Page | 17

- Fleming NEC, Harrod C, Newton, J, Houghton JDR. In press. Not all jellyfish are equal: isotopic evidence
 for inter- and intraspecific variation in jellyfish trophic ecology. PeerJ
- Gibbons MJ, Richardson AJ. 2013. Beyond the jellyfish joyride and global oscillations: advancing jellyfish
 research. *Journal of Plankton Research* 35: 928-938.
- 369 Godhe A, Egardt J, Kleinhans D, Sundqvist L, Hordoir R, Jonsson PR. 2014. Seascape analysis reveals
- 370 regional gene flow patterns among populations of a marine planktonic diatom. *Proceedings of the Royal*
- **371** *Society of London Series B* **280**: 301-307.
- Goudet J. 2002. FSTAT, version 2.9.3, A program to estimate and test gene diversities and fixation indices.
 http://www2.unil.ch/popgen/softwares/fstat.htm.
- 374 Graham WM, Pag F, Hamner WM. 2001. A physical context for gelatinous zooplankton aggregations: a
- 375 review. *Hydrobiologia* **451**: 199-212.
- 376 Graham WM, Martin DL, Felder DL, Asper VL, Perry HM. 2003. Ecological and economic implications
- of a tropical jellyfish invader in the Gulf of Mexico. *Biological Invasions* **5**: 53-69.
- Hamner WM, Dawson MN. 2009. A review and synthesis on the systematic and evolution of jellyfish
 blooms: advantageous aggregations and adaptive assemblages. *Hydrobiologia* 616: 161-191.
- 380 Holland BS, Dawson MN, Crow GL, Hofman DK. 2004. Global phylogeography of *Cassiopea* (Scyphozoa:
- 381 Rhizostomae): molecular evidence for cryptic species and multiple invasions of the Hawaiian Islands.
- 382 *Marine Biology* **145**: 1119-1128.
- **Houghton JDR, Doyle TK, Davenport J, Hays GC. 2006a.** Jellyfish aggregations and leatherback turtle
- foraging patterns in a temperate coastal environment. *Ecology* **87**: 1967-1972.
- 385 Houghton JDR, Doyle TK, Davenport J, Hays GC. 2006b. Developing a simple, rapid method for
- identifying and monitoring jellyfish aggregations from the air. *Marine Ecology Progress Series* 314: 159170.
- 388 Houghton JDR, Doyle TK, Davenport J, Lilley MKS, Wilson RP, Hays GC. 2007. Stranding events
- provide indirect insights into the seasonality and persistence of jellyfish medusae. *Hydrobiologia* **589**: 1-13.
- Hudson RR, Coyne JA. 2002. Mathematical consequences of the genealogical species concept. *Evolution* 56:
 1557-1565.
- 392 Iacchei M, Ben-Horin T, Selkoe KA, Bird CE, Garcia-Rodriguez FJ, Toonen RJ. 2014. Combined
- analyses of kinship and FST suggest potential drivers of chaotic genetic patchiness in high gene-flow
- 394 populations. *Molecular Ecology* **22**: 3476-3494.
 - Page | 18

- Karl SA, Toonen RJ, Grant WS, Bowen BW. 2012. Common misconceptions in molecular ecology: echoes
 of the modern synthesis. *Molecular Ecology* 21: 4171-4189.
- Keeney DB, Heupel MR, Hueter RE, Heist EJ. 2005. Microsatellite and mitochondrial DNA analyses of the
 genetic structure of blacktip shark (*Carcharhinus limbatus*) nurseries in the northwestern Atlantic, Gulf of
- 399 Mexico, and Caribbean Sea. *Molecular Ecology* **14**: 1911-1923.
- 400 Larmuseau MHD, Raemaekers JAM, Hellemans B, van Houdt JKJ, Volkaert FAM. 2010. Mito-nuclear
- discordance in the degree of population differentiation in a marine goby. *Heredity* **105**: 532-542.
- 402 Larsson LC, Charlier J, Laikre L, Ryman N. 2009. Statistical power for detecting genetic divergence –
- 403 organelle versus nuclear markers. *Conservation Genetics* **10**: 1255-1264.
- 404 Lee PLM, Dawson MN, Neill SP, Robins PE, Houghton JDR, Doyle TK, Hays GC. 2013. Identification of
- 405 genetically and oceanographically distinct blooms of jellyfish. *Journal of the Royal Society Interface* **10**:
- 406 20120920.
- Lilley MKS, Houghton JDR, Hays GC. 2008. Distribution, extent of inter-annual variability and diet of the
 bloom-forming jellyfish *Rhizostoma* in European waters. *Journal of the Marine Biological Association of the United Kingdom* 89: 39-48.
- 410 Lukoschek V, Waycott M, Keogh S. 2008. Relative information content of polymorphic microsatellites and
- 411 mitochondrial DNA for inferring dispersal and population genetic structure in the olive sea snake, *Aipysurus*412 *laevis. Molecular Ecology* 17, 3062-3077.
- 413 Maynard Smith J. 1987. On the equality of origin and fixation times in genetics. *Journal of Theoretical*414 *Biology* 128: 247-252.
- 415 Meek MH, Wintzer AP, Shepherd N, May B. 2013. Genetic diversity and reproductive mode in two non-
- 416 native hydromedusae, *Maeotias marginata* and *Moerisia* sp., in the upper San Francisco Estuary, California.
 417 *Biological Invasions* 15: 199-212.
- 418 Norris RD. 2000. Pelagic species diversity, biogeography and evolution. *Palaeobiology* 26: 236-258.
- 419 Palumbi SR. 1994. Genetic divergence, reproductive isolation and marine speciation. *Annual Review of*
- 420 *Ecology and Systematics* **25**: 547-572.
- 421 Palumbi SR, Cipriano F, Hare MP. 2001. Predicting nuclear gene coalescence from mitochondrial data: the
- 422 three-times rule. *Evolution* **55**: 859-868.
- 423 Paternello T, Volckaert AMJ, Castilho R. 2007. Pillars of Hercules: Is the Atlantic-Mediterranean transition
- 424 a phylogeographic break? *Molecular Ecology* **16**: 4426-4444. Page | 19

- 425 Pauly D, Graham WM, Libralato S, Morissette L, Deng-Palomares ML. 2008. Jellyfish in ecosystems,
- 426 online databases and ecosystem models. *Hydrobiologia* **616**: 67-85.
- 427 Peakall R, Smouse PE. 2006. GENALEX 6 Genetic analysis in Excel. Population genetic software for research
 428 and teaching. *Molecular Ecology Notes* 6: 288-295.
- 429 Peplow LM, Kingsford MJ, Seymour JE, van Oppen MJH. 2009. Eight microsatellite loci for the Irukandji
- 430 syndrome-causing carybdeid jellyfish, *Carukia barnesi* (Cubozoa, Cnidaria). *Molecular Ecology Resources*431 9: 670-672.
- 432 Phillips SJ, Anderson RP, Schapire RE. 2006. Maximum entropy modeling of species geographic
 433 distributions. *Ecological Modelling* 190: 231-259.
- 434 Pitt KA, Kingsford MJ. 2000. Geographic separation of stocks of the edible jellyfish *Catostylus mosaicus*

435 (Rhizostomae) in New South Wales, Australia. *Marine Ecology Progress Series* 196: 143-155.

- 436 Porebski S, Bailey LG, Baum BR. 1997. Modification of a CTAB DNA extraction protocol for plants
- 437 containing high polysaccharide and polyphenol contents. *Plant Molecular Biology Reporter* **15**: 8-15.
- 438 Prieto L, Armani A, Macías D. 2013. Recent strandings of the giant jellyfish Rhizostoma luteum Quoy and
- Gaimard, 1827 (Cnidaria: Scyphozoa: Rhizostomeae) on the Atlantic and Mediterranean coasts. *Marine Biology*160: 3241-3247.
- 441 Provan J. 2013. The effects of past, present and future climate change on range-wide genetic diversity in
 442 Northern North Atlantic marine species. *Frontiers of Biogeography* 5: 60-66.
- 443 Provan J, Bennett, KD. 2008. Phylogeographic insights into cryptic glacial refugia. *Trends in Ecology and*444 *Evolution*, 23: 564-571.
- 445 Provan J, Beatty GE, Keating SL, Maggs CA, Savidge G. 2009. High dispersal potential has maintained
- long-term population stability in the North Atlantic copepod *Calanus finmarchicus*. *Proceedings of the Royal Society of London Series B* 276: 301-307.
- 448 Ramšak A, Stopar K, Malej A. 2012. Comparative phylogeography of meroplanktonic species, *Aurelia* spp.
- and *Rhizostoma pulmo* (Cnidaria: Scyphozoa) in European Seas. *Hydrobiologia* **690**: 69-80.
- 450 Reusch TBH, Bolte S, Sparwell M, Moss AG, Javidpour J. 2010. Microsatellites reveal origin and genetic
- 451 diversity of European invasions by one of the world's most notorious marine invader, *Mneniopsis leidyi*
- 452 (Ctenophora). *Molecular Ecology* **19**: 2690-2699.
- 453 Richardson AJ, Bakun A, Hays GC, Gibbons MJ. 2009. The jellyfish joyride: causes, consequences and
- 454 management responses to a more gelatinous future. *Trends in Ecology and Evolution* 24: 312-322.Page | 20

- 455 **Rogers AR, Harpending H. 1992.** Population growth makes waves in the distribution of pairwise genetic
- 456 differences. *Molecular Biology and Evolution* **9**: 552-569.
- 457 Ryman N, Palm S. 2006. POWSIM: a computer program for assessing statistical power when testing for
 458 genetic differentiation. *Molecular Ecology Notes* 6: 600-602.
- 459 Sbrocco EJ, Barber PH. 2013. MARSPEC: ocean climate layers for marine spatial ecology. *Ecology* 94:
 460 2013.
- 461 Sbrocco EJ. 2014. Palaeo-MARSPEC: gridded ocean climate layers for the mid-Holocene and Last Glacial
 462 Maximum. *Ecology* 95: 1710.
- 463 Smouse PE, Peakall R. 1999. Spatial autocorrelation analysis of individual multiallele and multilocus genetic
 464 structure. *Heredity* 82: 561-573.
- 465 Stopar K, Ramšak A, Trontelj P, Malej A. 2010. Lack of genetic structure in the jellyfish *Pelagia noctiluca*
- 466 (Cnidaria: Scyphozoa: Semaeostomae) across European seas. *Molecular Phylogenetics and Evolution* 57:
 467 417-428.
- 468 Thein H, Ikeda H, Uye S-I. 2012. The potential role of podocysts in perpetuation of the common jellyfish
- *Aurelia aurita* s.l. (Cnidaria: Scyphozoa) in anthropogenically perturbed coastal waters. *Hydrobiologia* 690:
 157-167.
- Weir BS, Cockerham CC. 1984. Estimating F-statistics for the analysis of population structure. *Evolution* 38: 1358-1370.
- Wirth T, Bernatchez L. 2001. Genetic evidence against panmixia in the European eel. *Nature* 409: 10371040.
- 475 Zane L, Ostellari L, Maccatrozzo L, Bargelloni L, Battaglia B, Patarnello T. 1998. Molecular evidence for
- 476 genetic subdivision of Antarctic krill (Euphausia superba Dana) populations. Proceedings of the Royal
- 477 Society of London Series B 265: 2387-2391.

Dopulation	Latitude	Longitude	Nuclear				Mitochondrial			
ropulation	(N)	(W) -	Ν	H_O	H_E	F _{IS}	N	h	Н	π
Carmarthern Bay	51.745	4.447	24	0.777	0.852	0.090**	24	15	0.920	0.004
Tremadoc Bay	52.728	4.066	23	0.765	0.824	0.074^{NS}	22	3	0.178	0.001
Solway Firth	54.958	3.217	24	0.658	0.805	0.188**	19	10	0.854	0.006
Celtic Sea	51.783	6.650	15	0.717	0.808	0.117*	14	5	0.659	0.003

Table 1. Rhizostoma octopus populations studied and summary diversity statistics

Abbreviations: *N*, number of individuals studied; H_O , observed heterozygosity; H_E , expected heterozygosity; F_{IS} , inbreeding coefficient; *h*, number of haplotypes detected; *H*, gene diversity; π , nucleotide diversity. Significance of F_{IS} - * P < 0.05; ** P < 0.01; NS – non-significant.

 Table 2. Rhizostoma octopus microsatellite primers

Locus	Repeat	Primers (5' – 3')	Size range (bp)	GenBank
Rp-MS1	(GCACGCACACAC) ₇	F: CCCTCATACGTTATGTCATGG	148-205	DQ093644
		R: CAGCAGTTCTGACAAGTATTTATTATTC		
Rp-MS3	(TGX) ₁₄	F: TTTGGTCGTGTCCTGTTTGA	141-212	DQ075948
		R: CGCCAAGAGCAGAATCAATA		
Rp-MS4	(ACTACAC) complex	F: CCAACTAATAGAAACTAATCTAGACTAAAC	398-467	DQ075951
		R: AAAGTATGATTACGTGAAACGA		
Rp-MS5	(TACAC) complex	F: AAAATTTGCTCTTATTTGATTCTCG	237-362	DQ075950
		R: GATGAAAATCGTGGAAGCTG		

Forward tailed with CACGACGTTGTAAAACGAC

Reverse tailed with GTGTCTT

Table 3. Analysis of molecular variance (AMOVA)

		Nuclear				Mitochondrial			
Source of variation	d.f	Sum of squares	Variance	%	d.f	Sum of squares	Variance	%	
Among populations	3	6.666	0.019	1.33***	3	9.153	0.140	30.02***	
Within populations	168	236.979	1.411	98.67	75	24.417	0.326	69.98	

*** *P* < 0.001

Table 4. Population-pairwise ST values. Lower diagonal matrix – nuclear; Upper diagonal matrix – mitochondrial. Values not significantly

 different from zero are shown in italics.

Carmarthen Bay	-	0.437	0.100	0.068
Tremadoc Bay	-0.005	-	0.410	0.579
Solway Firth	-0.011	0.039	-	0.206
Celtic Sea	0.029	0.046	-0.006	-
	Carmarthen Bay	Tremadoc Bay	Solway Firth	Celtic Sea

Figure Legends

Figure 1. Locations of sites sampled in this study: CB – Carmarthen Bay; TB – Tremadoc Bay; SF – Solway Firth; CS – Celtic Sea. Inset map shows western Europe, highlighting the area of the present study.

Figure 2. Median-joining network showing relationships between the 27 haplotypes detected by sequencing the mtDNA COI region. Circle sizes are approximately proportional to haplotype frequency: smallest circle represents a single individual, largest circle represents 24 individuals. Each connection represents a single mutation and small open diamonds represent missing intermediate haplotypes.

Figure 3. Results of the PCA. The first three axes accounted for 23.51%, 21.54% and 17.44% respectively of the total variation (62.49%).

Figure 4. Results of the POWSIM analysis. The Y-axis represents the power of the markers to successfully recover the value of F_{ST} indicated on the X-axis, expressed as the proportion of 1000 simulations (see text for details). For $F_{ST} = 0$, this is the Type I (α) value.

Figure 5. Results of the species distribution modelling: (a) current-day model; (b) palaeodistribution model for the Last Glacial Maximum (LGM *ca.* 21 KYA). Darker blue areas indicate those more suitable for *R. octopus*. Yellow circles in (a) indicate occurrence data used to generate the models.

Figure S1. Results of the mismatch distribution analysis.













Locus		Population						
		Carmarthen Bay	Tremadoc Bay	Solway Firth	Celtic Sea			
		N=24	<i>N</i> = 23	<i>N</i> = 24	<i>N</i> = 15			
Rp-MS1	$H_{\rm O}$	0.565	0.571	0.591	0.733			
	$H_{ m E}$	0.685	0.650	0.629	0.784			
	$F_{\rm IS}$	0.178	0.124	0.062	0.067			
Rp-MS3	$H_{\rm O}$	0.833	0.818	0.750	0.667			
	$H_{ m E}$	0.910	0.886	0.876	0.851			
	$F_{\rm IS}$	0.085	0.078	0.146	0.222			
Rp-MS4	$H_{\rm O}$	0.833	0.905	0.789	0.667			
	$H_{ m E}$	0.861	0.816	0.797	0.641			
	$F_{\rm IS}$	0.033	-0.111	0.009	-0.041			
Rn-MS5	H_{\odot}	0.875	0.765	0.500	0.800			
Rp Mb5	$H_{\rm E}$	0.953	0.945	0.919	0.000			
	F_{10}	0.083	0.195	0.464	0.168			
	1 15	0.005	0.175	0.707	0.100			

Table S1 Summary statistics by locus. Abbreviations: N, number of individuals studied; H_O ,observed heterozygosity; H_E , expected heterozygosity; F_{IS} , inbreeding coefficient.

