

Aberystwyth University

Microbial CaCO3 mineral formation and stability in an experimentally simulated high pressure saline aguifer with supercritical CO2.

Mitchell, Andrew Charles; Phillips, Adrienne J.; Schultz, Logan; Parks, Stacy; Spangler, Lee; Cunningham, Alfred B.; Gerlach, Robin

Published in: International Journal of Greenhouse Gas Control DOI

10.1016/j.ijggc.2013.02.001

Publication date: 2013

Citation for published version (APA):

Mitchell, A. C., Phillips, A. J., Schultz, L., Parks, S., Spangler, L., Cunningham, A. B., & Gerlach, R. (2013). Microbial CaCO3 mineral formation and stability in an experimentally simulated high pressure saline aquifer with supercritical CO2. International Journal of Greenhouse Gas Control, 15, 86-96. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ijggc.2013.02.001

General rights

Copyright and moral rights for the publications made accessible in the Aberystwyth Research Portal (the Institutional Repository) are retained by the authors and/or other copyright owners and it is a condition of accessing publications that users recognise and abide by the legal requirements associated with these rights.

• Users may download and print one copy of any publication from the Aberystwyth Research Portal for the purpose of private study or You may not further distribute the material or use it for any profit-making activity or commercial gain
You may not further distribute the material or use it for any profit-making activity or commercial gain

- You may freely distribute the URL identifying the publication in the Aberystwyth Research Portal

Take down policy

If you believe that this document breaches copyright please contact us providing details, and we will remove access to the work immediately and investigate your claim.

tel: +44 1970 62 2400 email: is@aber.ac.uk

Contents lists available at SciVerse ScienceDirect



International Journal of Greenhouse Gas Control



journal homepage: www.elsevier.com/locate/ijggc

Microbial CaCO₃ mineral formation and stability in an experimentally simulated high pressure saline aquifer with supercritical CO₂

Andrew C. Mitchell^{a,b,*}, Adrienne Phillips^{b,c}, Logan Schultz^{b,c}, Stacy Parks^{b,c}, Lee Spangler^d, Alfred B. Cunningham^b, Robin Gerlach^{b,c}

^a Institute of Geography and Earth Sciences, Aberystwyth University, SY23 3DB, UK

^b Center for Biofilm Engineering, Montana State University, Bozeman, MT 59717, USA

^c Department of Chemical and Biological Engineering, Montana State University, Bozeman, MT 59717, USA

^d Department of Chemistry and Biochemistry, Montana State University, Bozeman, MT 59717, USA

ARTICLE INFO

Article history: Received 27 April 2012 Received in revised form 17 December 2012 Accepted 3 February 2013 Available online 6 March 2013

Keywords: Biofilm Calcium carbonate Ureolysis Supercritical CO₂ CO₂ leakage Permeability

ABSTRACT

The use of microbiologically induced mineralization to plug pore spaces is a novel biotechnology to mitigate the potential leakage of geologically sequestered carbon dioxide from preferential leakage pathways. The bacterial hydrolysis of urea (ureolysis) which can induce calcium carbonate precipitation, via a pH increase and the production of carbonate ions, was investigated under conditions that approximate subsurface storage environments, using a unique high pressure (\sim 7.5 MPa) moderate temperature (32 °C) flow reactor housing a synthetic porous media core. The synthetic core was inoculated with the ureolytic organism Sporosarcina pasteurii and pulse-flow of a urea inclusive saline growth medium was established through the core. The system was gradually pressurized to 7.5 MPa over the first 29 days. Concentrations of NH₄⁺, a by-product of urea hydrolysis, increased in the flow reactor effluent over the first 20 days, and then stabilized at a maximum concentration consistent with the hydrolysis of all the available urea. pH increased over the first 6 days from 7 to 9.1, consistent with buffering by $NH_4^+ \Leftrightarrow NH_3 + H^+$. Ureolytic colony forming units were consistently detected in the reactor effluent, indicating a biofilm developed in the high pressure system and maintained viability at pressures up to 7.5 MPa. All available calcium was precipitated as calcite. Calcite precipitates were exposed to dry supercritical CO₂ (scCO₂), water-saturated scCO₂, scCO₂-saturated brine, and atmospheric pressure brine. Calcite precipitates were resilient to dry scCO₂, but suffered some mass loss in water-saturated scCO₂ (mass loss $17 \pm 3.6\%$ after 48 h, $36 \pm 7.5\%$ after 2 h). Observations in the presence of scCO₂ saturated brine were ambiguous due to an artifact associated with the depressurization of the scCO₂ saturated brine before sampling. The degassing of pressurized brine resulted in significant abrasion of calcite crystals and resulted in a mass loss of approximately $92 \pm 50\%$ after 48 h. However dissolution of calcite crystals in brine at atmospheric pressure, but at the pH of the scCO₂ saturated brine, accounted for only approximately $7.8 \pm 2.2\%$ of the mass loss over the 48 h period. These data suggest that microbially induced mineralization, with the purpose of reducing the permeability of preferential leakage pathways during the operation of GCS, can occur under high pressure scCO₂ injection conditions.

© 2013 Elsevier Ltd. All rights reserved.

1. Introduction

Geologic carbon sequestration (GCS) is one strategy to reduce the emission of greenhouse gases generated through the combustion of fossil fuels. GCS involves the injection of supercritical CO_2 (scCO₂; critical point = 31.1 °C and 7.39 MPa) into underground formations such as depleted oil bearing formations, deep unmineable coal seams, and deep saline aquifers (White et al., 2003; Zakkour

E-mail address: nem@aber.ac.uk (A.C. Mitchell).

and Haines, 2007). The primary concern during the operation of GCS sites is the possibility of leakage through the injection well, other monitoring or abandoned wells and through fractures or faults in the low-permeability cap rock (Pan et al., 2009). Risk of leakage arises because $scCO_2$ is less dense and less viscous than the resident pore fluid, which allows it to migrate upward through the formation (Nicot et al., 2009).

One proposed method to mitigate leakage and enhance CO_2 storage is the use of engineered biofilms to plug porous media (Mitchell et al., 2009). Biofilms are assemblages of microorganisms, attached to surfaces, and embedded in extracellular polymeric substances (EPS). EPS is a hydrated matrix of mostly polysaccharides and proteins (Costerton and Stewart, 2001; Lewandowski

^{*} Corresponding author at: Institute of Geography and Earth Sciences, Aberystwyth University, SY23 3DB, UK. Tel.: +44 1970 622640.

^{1750-5836/\$ –} see front matter @ 2013 Elsevier Ltd. All rights reserved. http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.ijggc.2013.02.001

and Beyenal, 2007). Biofilms can reduce the permeability of porous media and have been engineered to control environmental contaminants and flow in oil reservoirs (Cunningham et al., 2003; Gerlach and Cunningham, 2010). Biofilms are the predominant way of life for most microorganisms in natural systems (Lewandowski and Beyenal, 2007). Previous experiments demonstrated that (1) Bacillus mojavensis biofilms can be grown in Berea sandstone cores under high pressure and scCO₂ injection conditions (8.9 MPa, $32 \circ C$), (2) the biofilm can decrease the permeability of sandstone cores by approximately two orders of magnitude within a few days, (3) biofilms can resist the challenge of scCO₂ exposure and maintain viability with only a slight increase in permeability (Mitchell et al., 2009), and (4) biofilms formed by *B. mojavensis* exhibited only a 1 log reduction in viable cell numbers compared to a 3 log reduction for planktonic (free floating, not attached to a surface) B. mojavensis cells. These data demonstrate biofilm viability under high pressure and scCO₂ conditions relevant to GCS (Mitchell et al., 2008).

It has also been proposed that the biofilm-enhanced formation of minerals, such as calcium carbonate, can plug free pore space in porous media and result in leakage reduction (Cunningham et al., 2009, 2011; Dupraz et al., 2009; Mitchell et al., 2010). Microbially enhanced mineralization has long been recognized in modern and ancient sediments (Van Lith et al., 2003). Biofilms enhance calcium carbonate nucleation by offering negatively charged functional groups for cation adsorption and by metabolically driven changes in solution composition and pH in the biofilm microenvironment and in the bulk solution (Schultze-Lam et al., 1996). Microbially mediated urea hydrolysis is one mechanism which can enhance the formation of calcium carbonate and is being investigated for enhanced GCS (Cunningham et al., 2009, 2011; Dupraz et al., 2009; Mitchell et al., 2010). In this process, bacteria hydrolyze urea, an important nitrogen compound found in natural environments, through a series of reactions which raise the pH and alkalinity of the system through an increase in bicarbonate and carbonate concentrations. In the presence of divalent cations, such as Ca²⁺, this increase in alkalinity can lead to the saturation and precipitation of solid calcium carbonate (CaCO₃).

Urea hydrolysis proceeds through a number of reactions. In the first step, urea $(CO(NH_2)_2)$ is hydrolyzed to ammonia (NH_3) and carbonic acid (H_2CO_3) (Eqs. (1) and (2)) (Burne and Chen, 2000). The ammonia and carbonic acid equilibrate in water to form bicarbonate (HCO_3^-) , ammonium (NH_4^+) , and one hydroxide ion (OH^-) (Eqs. (3) and (4)). The increase in hydroxide ions corresponds to an increase in pH, which shifts the bicarbonate equilibrium to form carbonate ions $(CO_3^{2-})(Eq. (5))$. In the presence of Ca²⁺, CaCO₃ precipitation occurs (Eq. (6)) once saturation is exceeded (Burne and Chen, 2000; Castanier et al., 1999). The overall reaction summarizing the hydrolysis of urea and precipitation of CaCO₃ is described by Eq. (7).

$$CO(NH_2)_2 + H_2O \rightarrow NH_2COOH + NH_3$$
(1)

$$NH_2COOH + H_2O \rightarrow NH_3 + H_2CO_3$$
(2)

$$H_2CO_3 \leftrightarrow HCO_3^- + H^+$$
 (3)

$$2NH_3 + 2H_2O \leftrightarrow 2NH_4^+ + 2OH^- \tag{4}$$

$$HCO_3^- + H^+ + 2OH^- \leftrightarrow CO_3^{2-} + 2H_2O$$
 (5)

$$\mathrm{CO}_3{}^{2-} + \mathrm{Ca}^{2+} \leftrightarrow \mathrm{Ca}\mathrm{CO}_3 \tag{6}$$

 $CO(NH_2)_2 + 2H_2O + Ca^{2+} \leftrightarrow 2NH_4^+ + CaCO_3(Overall, process)$ (7)

Other microbial metabolic processes, such as sulphate, nitrate and iron reduction could also be used to promote $CaCO_3$ formation (Van Lith et al., 2003; Van Paassen et al., 2010a), but these processes usually depend on microbial growth and cannot be controlled as easily as urea hydrolysis, which simply requires the addition of urea as a substrate, without the actual requirement of cell growth. Bacterial urea hydrolysis also does not require light, and can therefore operate in dark subsurface environments. The pH increase generated by urea hydrolysis also dramatically increases the solubility of CO₂(g), thus enhancing the rate of CO₂ solubility trapping (Mitchell et al., 2010). While there is no net mineral precipitation of CO₂ (mineral-trapping) beyond that from the urea, the mineral formed will plug subsurface pore spaces. This is particularly useful for inaccessible subsurface environments, where 'traditional' engineering approaches are not useful. For example, while injection wells may be accessible to traditional sealing approaches, such as cementing, reducing permeability proximal to the well bore or in fracture zones far from the well requires novel approaches due to the high viscosity of such traditional sealing materials. Bacteria can move through extremely small pore throat sizes of 0.4 µm < (Mitchell and Carlos Santamarina, 2004) and where pore throat size is at least twice the cell size (Jenneman et al., 1985). Since pore throat sizes in conventional reservoir rocks range from about 2 to 0.03 µm in sandstones, and from 0.1 to $0.005 \,\mu m$ in shales (Nelson, 2009) this demonstrates that bacteria can effectively be transported through rocks types present in common GCS sites and can likely be manipulated to grow and precipitate minerals on space and time scales by controlled injection of nutrients (Cunningham et al., 2011).

To date, ureolysis-induced CaCO₃ precipitation has been investigated for a number of engineering purposes including wastewater treatment (Hammes et al., 2003), soil stabilization (Harkes et al., 2010; Van Paassen et al., 2010b; Whiffin et al., 2007), immobilization of radionuclides (Mitchell and Ferris, 2005, 2006a,b; Warren et al., 2001), and mineral plugging for enhanced oil recovery and carbon sequestration (Dupraz et al., 2009; Ferris et al., 1996; Mitchell et al., 2010). All of these studies have been made at near atmospheric pressure conditions. However, in order to operate under GCS conditions, ureolytic organisms must be viable and able to hydrolyse urea under high pressure conditions (\sim 7.5 MPa). It is also important to consider the stability of the CaCO₃ minerals under GCS conditions, given the potential for the dissolution of carbonate minerals in CO₂ charged acidic brine, which typically has a pH of 3.5–4 depending on brine chemistry, formation lithology, and temperature (Kaszuba and Janecky, 2009). Low pH can increase CaCO₃ solubility by shifting the bicarbonate equilibrium to enhance H₂CO₃ activity (Stumm and Morgan, 1996).

Here, we investigate whether ureolysis-induced CaCO₃ precipitation can occur under conditions that approximate subsurface storage environments, using a unique high pressure (\sim 7.5 MPa) moderate temperature (32 °C) pulse-flow reactor system housing a synthetic porous media core. We also consider the stability of CaCO₃ minerals in scCO₂, and in likely subsurface fluids, such as brine, in the presence of and equilibrated with scCO₂, in order to assess the stability of biofilm formed minerals in the subsurface.

2. Experimental methods

2.1. High pressure flow reactor setup and synthetic porous media

A high-pressure flow reactor was built to investigate whether ureolysis and CaCO₃ precipitation in porous media could occur under high pressure conditions. The system allowed a differential pressure to be established between an input and an output high pressure accumulator, causing media to pulse-flow through a synthetic porous media core housed in a Hassler-type core holder (Temko, Tulsa, OK). The synthetic core was produced from a 2.54 cm diameter, 5 cm long high density polystyrene rod, with 6×1 mm internal diameter glass capillary tubes running lengthwise through the core (Supplemental Information, Fig. SI1). The capillary tubes allow the aqueous phase to pass through and microscopy to be



Fig. 1. (a) Schematic diagram of high pressure (~7.5 MPa) moderate temperature (32 °C) flow reactor containing synthetic porous media core. Inset pictures show (b) the synthetic porous media core with CaCO₃ precipitates visible on the inside of the glass tubes after an experiment, and (c) the synthetic porous media core inside the Hassler-type core holder.

performed on any biofilm and mineral precipitates formed. The high-pressure system was constructed of ¼" (6.35 mm) stainless steel tubing and Swagelok fittings housed in an incubator to control temperature at 32 ± 0.2 °C. The media reservoirs were water service piston-type accumulators (Parker, Inc.) designed to with-stand pressures of 21 MPa (Fig. 1).

Prior to loading the synthetic core, the input media accumulator and influent tubing were sterilized by exposure to 10% bleach in 6 g L⁻¹ TWEEN 80 solution, followed by 2.25 g L⁻¹ sodium thiosulphate solution, followed by a 70% ethanol solution (Barkley and Richardson, 1994). Next, the synthetic core was loaded into a Buna-N (TEMCO) sleeve and the core holder was reassembled. The core and core sleeve were not sterilized by autoclaving nor chemical treatment. The annulus of the core holder was filled with water and an overburden pressure of about 10.5 MPa was provided by a hydraulic jack pump. The core holder and media accumulators were connected to the high-pressure flow system which was housed in an incubator at 32 ± 0.2 °C (Fig. 1).

2.2. Flow reactor inoculation and operation

Sporosarcina pasteurii (ATCC 11859, gram-positive, sporeforming, urease positive), known to induce CaCO₃ precipitation in the presence of urea and dissolved Ca (Fujita et al., 2008; Mitchell and Ferris, 2005, 2006b) was used for the experiments. *S. pasteurii* was grown to the exponential growth phase, prior to inoculating

the high pressure system containing the synthetic core, in filter sterilized CaCO₃ mineralizing medium (CMM) described by Ferris et al. (1996) which contained 3 g L^{-1} Nutrient Broth, 333 mM Urea, 187 mM NH₄Cl, 25 mM NaHCO₃, and was pH adjusted to 6 with concentrated HCl. The CMM excluded calcium for preparation of the S. pasteurii inoculum and flow reactor inoculation (CMM-) but 25.2 mM CaCl₂•2H₂O was included during the main precipitation experiment (CMM+). To inoculate the core, it was isolated and \sim 40 ml of the exponential growth phase culture of *S. pasteurii* was injected using a 60 ml sterile syringe attached to a Swagelok fitting tightened onto the influent side of the core holder. The inoculum remained in the core for 16 h and then sterile CMM- was pumped through the core at atmospheric pressure using a peristaltic pump at 8.86 ml h^{-1} for 16 days. The use of a rich growth medium and urea allowed S. pasteurii biofilm to develop on the internal surfaces of the core and for ureolysis to occur. On day 17, the media accumulator was filled with 1100 ml of sterile CMMsolution using a peristaltic pump and N₂ gas was used to pressurize the system to 1.43 MPa, with a differential pressure across the core of 0.1 MPa (Fig. 1). After being allowed to acclimatize to the system temperature, sterile CMM- was pulsed into the core, induced by the constant differential pressure across the core. After 24 h, the media in the core was collected in the output media accumulator. Sterile CMM- was then pulsed into the core again from the input media accumulator. For the next 20 days, fresh sterile CMM- was pulsed daily into the core, and medium that had resided



Fig. 2. Pictures of the high pressure vessel (HPV) used to challenge $CaCO_3$ precipitates with $scCO_2$ and brine. HPV was also used to incubate Ca free mineralizing medium (CMM–) described by Ferris et al. (1996) and Ca inclusive CMM (CMM+) abiotically at 7.5 MPa in the absence of $scCO_2$ to demonstrate that no abiotic hydrolysis of urea occurred at the high pressures used in this study. (a) Supercritical CO_2 is pumped by a Teledyne Isco (Lincoln, Nebraska) pump into the (b) view-ported HP(c) the view port image of the HPV shows $scCO_2$ in the headspace and $scCO_2$ saturated brine in the bottom of the HPV during an exposure (see also Video 1).

in the core for 24 h was collected in the effluent. During this 20-day period, system pressure was gradually increased from 1.43 MPa to 7.5 MPa $\pm 0.1\%$ while maintaining a differential pressure across the core between 0.1 and 0.55 MPa \pm 0.1%. On day 39, the input media accumulator was filled with CMM+, and the same daily pulsing procedure was continued, in order to induce CaCO₃ precipitation. Effluent from the flow reactor was collected daily and analyzed for pH, NH₄⁺, Ca²⁺ and ureolytic cell counts, as described in Section 2.3. This procedure was performed in order to elucidate whether S. pasteurii viability could be maintained and ureolysis could occur at pressures at which scCO₂ could be present. During the experiment, CMM- and subsequently CMM+ were sampled from the input media accumulator in order to check for bacterial contamination, as described below. Control experiments were also performed to check ureolysis could not occur abiotically under pressure, by pressurizing CMM- and CMM+ to 7.5 MPa in a separate high pressure vessel (HPV) (Fig. 2) in the absence of S. pasteurii.

2.3. Flow reactor effluent analysis

Effluent that had resided in the core for 24h and had then been pulsed out of the core was collected from the output media accumulator and immediately filter sterilized through $0.2\,\mu m$ polycarbonate membranes and tested for pH using a Fisher Scientific (Fair Lawn, NJ) pH/ion/conductivity meter. The meter was calibrated daily using pH 7 and pH 10 buffer solutions (Fisher Scientific). Ammonium concentrations were determined using the Nessler Assay (Mitchell and Ferris, 2005) by comparing sample results to standards made with NH₄Cl. Ca²⁺ concentrations were determined using an Agilent 7500ce Inductively Coupled Plasma Mass Spectrometer (ICP-MS) in Montana State University's Environmental and Biofilm Mass Spectrometry Facility. Non-filtered effluent was used to determine the number of ureolytic colony forming units (CFUs) as a measure of ureolytic cell viability on a daily basis. Effluent was serially diluted in Phosphate Buffered Saline solution, from 10^{-1} to 10^{-5} and plated onto agar plates, supplemented with 37 g L^{-1} Brain Heart Infusion, and 20 g L^{-1} urea. 30 randomly selected CFUs were individually picked and grown in individual wells containing $250 \,\mu\text{L}$ of BHI+ $20 \,\text{g}\,\text{L}^{-1}$ urea solution in a 96 well plate. Plates were incubated at 30 °C for 24 h, and individual wells were tested for ammonium using the Nessler Assay

to confirm ureolytic activity (Mitchell and Ferris, 2005). CFU's and pH were also measured from the influent CMM– and subsequently CMM+, in order to check for ureolytic bacteria contamination. Further details are given in the Supplemental Information, Section SI1. The glass capillary tubes running lengthwise through the synthetic core were removed and imaged on a Nikon SMZ1500 stereoscope.

2.4. Calcium carbonate brine and supercritical CO₂ challenges

In order to test the stability of ureolysis-induced CaCO₃ precipitates under high pressure scCO₂ conditions relevant to subsurface storage sites, CaCO₃ was challenged with supercritical CO₂ (scCO₂), scCO₂ saturated brine (brine co-equilibrated with scCO₂), brinesaturated scCO₂, and atmospheric pressure brine at two different pH values (pH 7.61 and 4, Table 1). Pyrex bottles containing pre-weighed black polycarbonate coupons and containing 250 ml CMM+ were inoculated with 1 ml of S. pasteurii in the exponential growth phase, and incubated at 30 °C to induce ureolysis and CaCO₃ precipitation onto the coupons. Coupons were also incubated in sterile, uninoculated CMM+ medium to confirm abiotic precipitation was not occurring. Black polycarbonate was used to provide contrast with the precipitated CaCO₃ for light microscopy. After 24-48 h of incubation and precipitation, coupons were removed with sterilized tweezers and dried for more than 24 h at 65 °C until constant weight was achieved. Mineral not firmly attached to the coupon was gently blown off the coupon using compressed air (Falcon Dust Off, Branchburg, NJ). The coupons were weighed again periodically over a period of 24 h to confirm constant weight before they were imaged on a Nikon SMZ 1500 stereoscope (Supplemental Information, Section SI2). Coupons were then challenged with scCO₂, scCO₂ saturated brine, brine saturated scCO₂ and atmospheric pressure brine, as described below.

2.4.1. Atmospheric pressure brine

Synthetic NaCl rich brine of a 162 g L^{-1} TDS (1.5 M strength, used by Kaszuba et al., 2003), containing 683 mM NaCl, 16.4 mM MgSO₄•7H₂O, 5.5 mM CaCl₂•2H₂O, 480 mM MgCl₂•6H₂O, 264 mM KCl, and 1.79 mM KBr, with a resulting pH of 7.61 was prepared and filter sterilized. Mineral-covered coupons were placed in the synthetic brine for 4 h, 24 h, and 168 h (Exposures 1–3, Table 1). After

Table 1

Sι	immary of	f scCO ₂	and/or	brine	exposures o	f CaCO ₃	undertaken	in the	high	pressure v	essel
----	-----------	---------------------	--------	-------	-------------	---------------------	------------	--------	------	------------	-------

Exposure	Pressure	Temperature	Description
1	Ambient	Room	Coupons in brine for 4 h, initial pH 7.61
2	Ambient	Room	Coupons in brine for 24 h, initial pH 7.61
3	Ambient	Room	Coupons in brine for 168 h, initial pH 7.61
4	1300 psi	37 °C	Coupons in scCO ₂ for 2 h
5	1250 psi	37 °C	Coupons in brine-saturated scCO ₂ for 2 h
6	1250 psi	37 °C	Coupons in brine-saturated scCO ₂ for 48 h
7	1250 psi	37 °C	Coupons in scCO ₂ -saturated brine for 2 h
8	1250 psi	37 °C	Coupons in scCO ₂ -saturated brine for 48 h
9	Ambient	Room	Coupons in pH 4 brine for 2 h
10	Ambient	Room	Coupons in pH 4 brine for 48 h
11	Ambient	Room	Sterile control

removal from the brine, coupons were rinsed in DI water to remove residual brine and then dried, weighed, and imaged, as described above.

2.4.2. Supercritical CO₂ (scCO₂)

Coupons were loaded into the HPV system (Fig. 2). The system was pressurized and $scCO_2$ was pumped under constant flow via a Teledyne Isco high pressure pump to the HPV until pressure stabilized at 8.9 MPa. Pressure and temperature were maintained at 8.9 ± 0.4 MPa and 37 ± 0.2 °C, respectively (Exposure 4, Table 1), well above that required for supercritical conditions to account for the accuracy of the pressure and temperature gauges. The system was depressurised after 2 h, and immediately the coupons were removed from the reactor, rinsed, imaged with the stereoscope, dried and weighed, as described above.

2.4.3. ScCO₂ saturated brine and brine saturated scCO₂

350 ml of brine was added under ambient pressure conditions into the HPV. Coupons were placed into the reactor so three coupons were wetted in the brine (bottom portion of reactor) and three were in the headspace of the reactor. The system was pressurized and scCO₂ was pumped into the HPV and bubbled through the brine until pressure in the reactor stabilized at 8.9 ± 0.4 MPa at 37 ± 0.2 °C. The increase in surface area between the CO₂ bubbles and the brine as well as the resulting mixing are assumed to have resulted in sufficient mass transfer to produce scCO₂ saturated brine and brine saturated scCO₂ in the lower and upper portions of the HPV, respectively. Hence, the coupons in the HPV were exposed to brine saturated $scCO_2$ (in the headspace portion) and supercritical CO₂ saturated brine (bottom portion of the reactor) at 8.9 MPa and 37 °C for 2 h and 48 h (exposures 5 and 7, and 6 and 8 respectively, Table 1). Immediately after each exposure, the coupons were removed from the HPV, rinsed in DI water to remove any residual brine, imaged with the stereoscope, dried and weighed, as described above.

Experiments were also performed in order to separately investigate the effect of pH on mineral mass loss by exposing mineralized coupons to pH adjusted brines at atmospheric pressure. Isolating the effect of pH was necessary because during depressurisation and CO₂ degassing of the HPV, extreme physical agitation of the brine occurred which may have accounted for mineral mass loss, and this would not be representative of processes that would occur under GCS field conditions. In order to estimate the pH of the scCO₂ saturated brine used in the current study, pH was measured in scCO₂ saturated brines in a similar high pressure flow system at MSU, equipped with an in-line Barben Analyzer Technology pH probe connected to a Campbell Scientific CR1000 data logger. The observed pH was 3 in a 0.5 g L^{-1} TDS brine and 4 in a 5 g L^{-1} TDS brine (Hansen, 2009), consistent with the decreased solubility of CO₂ in higher salinity solutions (Duan and Sun, 2003; Lagneau et al., 2005). These observations agree with reports by (Kaszuba and Janecky, 2009) who report typical pH values of 3.5-4 for CO₂ charged acidic brines. Therefore the pH of the 162 g L^{-1} TDS brine used in the current study was estimated to have a pH of > 4. Hence, in order to expose the coupons to the most acidic conditions likely, brine was adjusted to pH 4 with HNO₃, and coupons were exposed to this brine for varying lengths of time. Large volume-to-carbonate mineral ratios were used to minimize pH changes due to CaCO₃ dissolution and maintain the pH at 4. Minerals from each of the experiments were examined with XRD to determine the mineralogy of the precipitates before and after exposure (Supplemental Information, Section SI2).

3. Results

3.1. Ureolysis and carbonate mineral formation at ${\sim}7.5\,\text{MPa}$ pulse-flow conditions

The flow reactor was operated at atmospheric pulse-flow conditions with calcium free medium (CMM-), for the first 17 days of the experiment. During this period, NH₄⁺ concentrations increased gradually from \sim 3000 mg L⁻¹, which is the free NH₄⁺ concentration in the CMM– from NH₄Cl, to \sim 11,000 mg L⁻¹, indicating the liberation of NH_4^+ from the hydrolysis of urea (Eqs. (1), (2) and (4)) (Fig. 3). The pH also increased from 7 to 9.1 within the first 5 days (Fig. 3), consistent with buffering by $NH_4^+ = NH_3 + H^+$, the dominant buffer in the system, which has a pK_a value of 9.3 at 30 °C (Mitchell and Ferris, 2005). Viable cells measured in the reactor effluent generally increased during this period, up to a maximum of $5.2 \pm 1.1 \times 10^7$ CFU, and 100% of the tested CFUs were ureolytically active (Fig. 3). Influent media samples during this period exhibited NH_4^+ concentrations of \sim 3000 mg L⁻¹, a pH of \sim 7, and there were no detectable CFUs (Fig. 3), demonstrating that the influent medium had not been contaminated by ureolytic organisms, and that ureolysis was occurring only in or downstream of the synthetic porous media core.

Starting on day 18, pressure was gradually increased from atmospheric to 7.5 MPa as the daily pulse-flow of CMM– continued (Fig. 3). During this period, effluent pH remained at ~9.1. NH₄⁺ concentrations gradually increased over this period to a maximum of 14,600 \pm 1229 mg L⁻¹, consistent with the hydrolysis of all the available urea, as did ureolytic CFUs, on average which increased to 2.1 \times 10⁷ \pm 4.8 \times 10⁶ (Fig. 3). During the period of pressurization ~7.5 MPa, influent media still exhibited NH₄⁺ concentrations of ~3000 mg L⁻¹, pH was ~7, and there were no CFUs, again indicating that the influent medium had not been contaminated by ureolytic organisms, and that ureolysis was occurring in the synthetic porous media core (Fig. 3). Pressurization of the CMM– and the calcium inclusive media, CMM+, in the absence of *S. pasteurii* to 7.5 MPa in the HPV for 24 h (Fig. 2) did not result in any NH₄⁺ production, change in pH or, in the case of the CMM+ experiments,



Fig. 3. Pressure, influent and effluent NH₄⁺, pH, Ca²⁺ and ureolytic colony forming units from the high pressure (\sim 7.5 MPa) moderate temperature (32 °C) flow reactor containing a synthetic porous media core. Ca free CaCO₃ mineralizing medium (CMM–) described by Ferris et al. (1996) was used as the influent media from time 0 to day 38, after which the CMM media included Ca (CMM+).

Table 2

Aqueous chemistry of CaCO₃ mineralizing medium (CMM+) described by Ferris et al. (1996) after exposure to abiotic high pressure conditions (8.9 MPa) in the high pressure vessel. Experiments repeated with CMM excluding calcium (CMM–) demonstrating that urea hydrolysis is not induced abiotically by high pressure conditions. Concentrations in mg L^{-1} .

Sample	рН	$\mathrm{NH_4}^+$	Na ⁺	Mg ²⁺	K^+	Ca ²⁺	Ba ²⁺
CMM– + pressure	7.37	3.22	6.76	0.025	1.15	0.200	0.001
CMM–	7.15	3.45	6.60	0.025	1.12	0.18	0.001
CMM+ + pressure	7.31	2.95	6.48	0.025	1.11	9.71	0.001
CMM+	7.25	2.35	6.49	0.025	1.06	9.20	0.001

decrease in Ca²⁺ concentrations, which confirmed that increased pressure alone did not result in the hydrolysis of urea (Table 2).

After the flow system had been pressurized to 7.5 MPa, the influent was switched to CMM+, containing 1000 mg L^{-1} (25 mM) Ca²⁺. The concentration of Ca²⁺ in the flow reactor effluent was only 12 ± 0.6 mg L⁻¹ after the first 24 h, and remained at this concentration for the remainder of the experiment (Fig. 3). During this period, there were no appreciable changes in effluent pH, NH₄⁺ concentrations, or ureolytic CFUs. After 45 days the system was depressurised and the glass capillaries inside the core were retrieved. Stereoscope (Fig. 4) and XRD analysis (Supplemental Information, Fig. SI2) indicated that calcite had precipitated inside the glass capillaries of the core, demonstrating that ureolysis induced CaCO₃ precipitation occurred under high pressure conditions ~7.5 MPa. Additionally, no precipitates were observed in the effluent accumulator, and the influent CMM+ media exhibited consistent Ca²⁺ concentrations of \sim 1000 mg L⁻¹, indicating that precipitation occurred in the core region under pressure or down the flow path of the core (Fig. 3), and not in the effluent accumulator during depressurisation. A crystal density gradient could be observed, with a greater crystal density in the up flow (influent) end of the core. Crystal size analysis with ImageJ software (Mitchell and Ferris, 2006a,b) of 5 stereoscope images from throughout the core revealed the average, minimum and maximum crystal size was 57 µm, 10 µm and 102 µm respectively, with a standard deviation of 21 µm. This ignored crystals below the stereoscope detection limit of $\sim 5 \,\mu m$ (Schultz et al., 2011).

3.2. Calcium carbonate mineral stability with supercritical CO₂/brine mixtures

In order to examine stability of the microbiologically precipitated CaCO₃ during brine and scCO₂ exposure, CaCO₃ precipitates on polycarbonate coupons were challenged with scCO₂-brine mixtures at high pressure (~8.9 MPa) conditions in the HPV (Fig. 5) and also atmospheric pressure brines. Incubation of CaCO₃ in brine, pH 7.61, at atmospheric pressure for 4 h, 24 h and 1 week, lead to a CaCO₃ mass change of $-7 \pm 0.036\%$, $-10\% \pm 4.7\%$ and $-23\% \pm 2.5\%$ respectively for experiments 1-3. However the difference in mineral mass from before and after exposure was not statistically significant for the three experiments (Fig. 5) and therefore did not suggest that brine exposure at atmospheric conditions led to a statistically significant change in the mass of CaCO₃ on these timescales. Exposure to scCO₂ for 48 h did not lead to an observable mass change $(-0.4 \pm 0.01\%$ variation) demonstrating that dry (i.e. not moisture containing) $scCO_2$ has no effect on the mineral mass. The exposure of CaCO₃ to brine saturated with scCO₂ resulted in a significant mass change of CaCO₃ during both 2h (-84%, $\pm 35\%$ variation) and $48 h (-92\%, \pm 50\%$ variation) of exposure. However, this mass loss is being attributed to an artifact associated with the depressurization process, which resulted in significant turbulence in the brine filled portion of the HPV. Highly intense bubble formation was observed during out-gassing of CO₂ during depressurization, which occurred at a rate of 1.158 MPa min⁻¹ for the 2 h



Fig. 4. Images of CaCO₃ precipitates formed inside the capillary of the synthetic porous media core in the high pressure (\sim 7.5 MPa) moderate temperature (32 °C) flow reactor. (a) CaCO₃ precipitates (in white) inside one of the 5 cm long glass tubes (capillaries) that were inserted in the artificial core. Decreasing crystal density can be seen in the direction of flow (top is influent, bottom effluent). (b–e) Stereoscope images: (b) small CaCO₃ crystals inside the 1 mm internal diameter capillary, (c and d) close-up images of a cluster of CaCO₃ crystals, (e) view into capillary from influent end showing CaCO₃ coating on the inside wall of the capillary. While crystals were clearly visible, no extensive EPS rich biofilm was observed.

exposure and 3.08 MPa min⁻¹ for the 48 h exposure. The resulting turbulence, clearly visible through the sight glass (Video 1), is believed to have mechanically abraded CaCO₃ from the coupons, as evidenced by the discovery of some CaCO₃ crystals in the bottom sump of the HPV. CaCO₃ minerals in the headspace of the HPV, above the scCO₂ saturated brine (i.e. exposed to scCO₂ saturated with brine vapour) exhibited a mass change of $-36 \pm 7.5\%$ during 2 h of exposure, and $-17 \pm 3.6\%$ during 48 h of exposure.

Due to the physical disturbance that the coupons undergo during depressurisation and degassing of the brine, and the effect this could have upon the mineral mass loss, coupons were also exposed to brine at atmospheric pressure, acidified to pH 4, the estimated pH of the 1.5 M scCO₂ saturated brine at 8.9 MPa used in the scCO₂ saturated brine experiments (Allen et al., 2005; Carey et al., 2010; Duan and Sun, 2003; Kaszuba and Janecky, 2009; Kaszuba et al., 2003, 2005; Lagneau et al., 2005), in order to determine mineral dissolution associated with low pH conditions alone. This revealed a small mass change of only $-3.4 \pm 0.67\%$ over 2 h and $-7.8 \pm 2.2\%$ over 48 h (Fig. 5). Stereoscope images of the CaCO₃ precipitates before and after exposure to the $scCO_2$ -brine mixtures exhibited no major morphological changes on the 10–100 μ m scale (Fig. 6). XRD analysis of the precipitates before and after the $scCO_2$ /brine mixtures revealed only calcite, demonstrating that there were no changes in mineralogy due to interaction with $scCO_2$ and brine (Supplemental Information, Section SI2, Fig. SI2).

4. Discussion

4.1. Ureolysis and carbonate mineral formation at \sim 7.5 MPa pulse-flow conditions

The use of a unique high pressure, moderate temperature pulse-flow system has demonstrated that bacterial urea hydrolysis by *S. pasteurii* and associated $CaCO_3$ precipitation can occur under pressure conditions that approximate subsurface CO_2 storage environments. These observations are consistent with previous studies of *S. pasteurii* at atmospheric pressure, demonstrating the organism's ureolytic capability (Ferris et al., 2003; Fujita et al.,



Fig. 5. Change in mass of $CaCO_3$ on coupons (normalized to initial mineral mass) before and after challenges in the high pressure vessel (HPV) (see Table 1) with percentage change of mass listed. Three or more coupons used in each experiment.

2000; Warren et al., 2001). High pressures have previously been reported to significantly affect the metabolic functions and growth of mesophilic organisms, such as *S. pasteurii*, by inhibiting DNA replication and protein synthesis (Abe et al., 1999; Gross et al., 1993; Yayanos and Pollard, 1969). However, ureolytic CFUs up to $5.2 \pm 1.1 \times 10^7$ CFU/mL in the reactor effluent indicate that *S. pasteurii* maintained viability under conditions of approximately 7.5 MPa, demonstrating that elevated pressures did not fatally inhibit cell function.

Ureolytic CFUs in the reactor effluent were, on average, higher during the period of pressurization at 7.5 MPa (day 18 onwards), when NH₄⁺ concentrations were also at their maximum of 14,500 \pm 1200 mg L⁻¹, a concentration which was consistent with the hydrolysis of all the available urea in the influent media. This suggests that ureolytic biomass increased during the course of the experiment and indicates that during the period of pressurization at 7.5 MPa, ureolysis was limited by the mass transport of urea, rather than available ureolytic biomass, under pulse-flow conditions in the synthetic porous media core. In contrast, prior to pressurization, while biomass vas increasing in the core, as indicated by increasing CFUs in this period, ureolysis was likely limited by the available ureolytic biomass rather than reactant supply until approximately 17 days, since NH₄⁺ concentrations were less than could be produced by the available urea, at only ~11,000 mg L⁻¹.

The high pressure flow system was only inoculated once at the beginning of the experiment, yet significant numbers of viable ureolytic cells were observed in the effluent over the course of the experiment. Therefore, it appears a well established surfaceassociated community, or biofilm, developed in the high pressure system. Previous studies at atmospheric pressures have demonstrated that *S. pasteurii* can be effectively distributed and attached to porous media surfaces, including sand beds (Harkes et al., 2010; Van Paassen et al., 2010b), and glass capillaries (Schultz et al., 2011). In these studies, media flow was induced that allowed a surface-associated community to develop after initial inoculation.



Fig. 6. Stereoscope images of coupons exposed brine and scCO₂ before (a and c) and after (b and d) challenge in the high pressure vessel (HPV). Images are at 40× magnification. No major morphological changes to CaCO₃ crystals noticeable on this scale.

Schultz et al. (2011) demonstrated using confocal laser scanning microscopy, that the surface associated S. pasteurii did not form extensive EPS, but rather a discrete cell coverage on the capillary surface and calcite surfaces, which supports observations made in this study where only CaCO₃ crystals but no EPS was observable under high pressure pulse-flow conditions (Fig. 4). The low pH and NH4⁺ concentration in the influent media accumulator demonstrates the biofilm community must have been present only in the synthetic porous media core or downstream of the core. Biofilms are often more resilient to physical chemical, and biological stresses than free floating, or planktonic cells, of the same organism (Costerton and Stewart, 2001; Lewandowski and Beyenal, 2007; Stewart, 2003). Indeed, it was previously demonstrated by us that planktonic *B. mojavensis* cultures exposed to flowing scCO₂ at 136 atm and 35 °C for 19 min lead to a 1000-fold reduction in viable cell numbers, while biofilm cultures only showed a 10-fold reduction in viable cell numbers (Mitchell et al., 2008). These data suggest that the biofilm state of S. pasteurii in the porous media core in the high pressure system may have promoted growth and function under high pressure conditions compared to the planktonic form

The flow system demonstrates ureolysis-induced CaCO₃ precipitation can occur under high pressure conditions. This would be expected under the high pH conditions maintained under pressure by ureolysis, which shifts the bicarbonate equilibrium to form carbonate ions (CO₃²⁻) which, in the presence of Ca²⁺, precipitates out of solution as CaCO₃ if the solubility product for calcite is exceeded (Burne and Chen, 2000; Castanier et al., 1999). Indeed, in the high pressure flow reactor experiments, pH measured in the depressurized effluent fluids (Fig. 3) will represent the in situ pH under high pressure conditions because nitrogen gas and not CO₂ was used for pressurization. If a separate CO₂ phase had been present at elevated pressures, degassing of CO₂ from the reactor effluent would have resulted in a shift of the carbonate speciation in solution, leading to an increase in pH relative to the in situ (high pressure) conditions. This could have resulted in the precipitation of CaCO₃ during depressurization (Murray et al., 1980; Stumm and Morgan, 1996). However, the precipitation of CaCO₃ during depressurization is unlikely to have occurred since N2 was the overburden gas and outgassing of CO₂ was likely not a significant factor. The lack of CaCO₃ precipitates in the effluent accumulator confirms CaCO₃ precipitation occurred in the core region before the accumulator, and must have been caused by ureolysis induced pH and carbonate ion concentration increases. Pressure increases the solubility of CaCO₃, and thus the ion activity product at saturation (Pytkowicz and Conners, 1964). In artificial seawater at 10 MPa, the ion activity product at saturation is 1.093 times greater than at atmospheric pressure (Pytkowicz and Conners, 1964), demonstrating that under fixed Ca concentrations, slightly more urea would be hydrolysed before CaCO₃ saturation is reached than at atmospheric conditions. Saturation index (SI) modeling on PHREE-QCi (Parkhust and Appelo, 1999) with analysis of the media under standard conditions (1 atm and 25 °C) demonstrates that saturation is reached [SI = log ($\{Ca^{2+}\}\{CO_3^{-}\}/K_{sp}\}=0$] when only 1.05 mM urea has been hydrolysed. This suggests at the maximum pressure of 7.5 MPa used the experiments, 1.15 mM of urea was hydrolysed before CaCO₃ precipitation was induced. However, this will be a minimum value, as supersaturation is often required before precipitation is initiated because the nucleation activation (i.e., interfacial) free energy barrier has been surmounted (Stumm and Morgan, 1996). Indeed, in abiotic CaCO₃ precipitation experiments, 2D heterogeneous nucleation on seed particles has been observed at a minimum SI of 0.78 (Teng et al., 2000), and spontaneous 3D homogeneous nucleation in unseeded solutions has been observed at SIs of 1.83-1.99 (Gómez-Morales et al., 1996). In the high pressure flow system, calcite precipitation would be likely be initiated by a combination of 3D homogenous nucleation in solution and 2D heterogeneous nucleation on the capillary walls, nascent crystals, and bacterial cell surfaces (Ferris et al., 2003; Fujita et al., 2000; Mitchell and Ferris, 2005, 2006b). Crystals were observed attached to the capillary walls (Fig. 4b, e and f), as well as agglomerates of loose crystals forming plugs (Fig. 4c and d) suggesting multiple mechanisms of nucleation and growth.

Experimental and modeling studies demonstrate that during ureolysis, the highest pH, concentrations of carbonate ions, and thus saturation, will occur proximal to, and decrease away from cells (Mitchell and Ferris, 2006b; Zhang and Klapper, 2010), suggesting 2D nucleation in the flow system will preferentially occur near cells. However, the decrease in crystal size densities in the capillary along the flow direction of the core (Fig. 4a) suggests that crystal growth was controlled by reactant supply and nuclei grew faster in the inlet region, where reactants, and thus precipitation rates are higher due to the increased SI and availability of higher Ca^{2+} and CO_3^{2-} concentrations (Ferris et al., 2003; Mitchell and Ferris, 2005; Teng et al., 2000). Crystal sizes were much larger $(average = 57 \,\mu m)$ than previously observed for ureolysis induced CaCO₃ precipitation (\sim 1–6 μ m) (Mitchell and Ferris, 2006a,b). This primarily reflects a higher total reactant supply provided by pulseflow operation of the high pressure experiments (20.16 mg Ca²⁺ and 433 mg CO_3^{2-} over the 9 days of CMM+), compared to previous batch experiments $[5.25-17.5 \text{ mg Ca} \text{ and } 79-264 \text{ mg CO}_3^{2-1}]$ (Mitchell and Ferris, 2006a,b)] (Supplemental Information, Section SI3). Nevertheless at the termination of the high pressure pulseflow experiment, plugging had not occurred due to the relatively limited supply of reactants compared to the pore space in the synthetic core, calculated as 0.0185 cm³ CaCO₃ relative to 0.196 cm³ void space in the synthetic porous media core (Supplemental Information, Section SI4). However, permeability reduction and plugging would have occurred given the supply of sufficient reactants, as demonstrated for ureolysis-induced CaCO₃ precipitation in atmospheric pressure constant-flow systems (Cunningham et al., 2011; Schultz et al., 2011).

4.2. Calcium carbonate mineral stability with supercritical CO₂/brine mixtures

The significant mass change observed in the scCO₂ saturated brine challenges over $2h(-84 \pm 35\% \text{ mass loss})$ and $48h(-92 \pm 50\% \text{ mass loss})$ mass loss) appeared to reflect physical dislodging of the CaCO₃ crystals from the coupon surface, particularly during the depressurisation of the HPV which caused violent bubbling when CO₂ was degassing from the brine (Video 1). This was supported by the small mass change of CaCO₃ in atmospheric pressure brine at pH 4, the estimated pH of the scCO₂ saturated brine ($-3.4 \pm 0.67\%$ over 2 h, $-7.8 \pm 2.2\%$ over 48 h). This minor mass change of CaCO₃ demonstrated that acidity-driven dissolution of CaCO₃ was negligible. CaCO₃ dissolution in the scCO₂ saturated brine driven by low pH has been observed in other studies of acidic brine-CaCO₃ interactions (Carey et al., 2010; Gledhill and Morse, 2004, 2006; Sanz et al., 2011) and would be expected under the experimental conditions used here. The apparent lack of this phenomenon could be firstly due to mass transport limitations in the static brine-CaCO₃ mixture in the HPV, where reaction kinetics are reduced by the limited ability of reactants (e.g. H⁺) to reach the mineral surface and products (Ca^{2+} and CO_3^{2-}) to migrate away from the mineral surface by advection. Indeed, at low pH values, the kinetics of calcite dissolution are controlled by mass transport because surface controlled processes (addition of ions to or loss from mineral surface) are so rapid (Marini, 2006). Secondly, this may be due to a protective function of the biofilm where the presence of extracellular polymeric substances protects the CaCO₃ from dissolving. While mass transport limitations might be reduced in flowing systems due to enhanced advection of reactants and products (Wang and Jaffe, 2004), the possible protective function of the biofilm would still reduce the degree of CaCO₃ dissolution. In biofilm-affected systems, the dissolution might be slowed down significantly due to diffusion limitations (Stewart, 2003) and mineral dissolution has been described to be affected by polysaccharides (Banfield et al., 1999). The close association of S. pasteurii biofilms and microbially precipitated CaCO₃ minerals has been demonstrated by us previously (Schultz et al., 2011). These data demonstrate that in high pressure brines, microbially enhanced CaCO₃ precipitates will likely be most stable in the long term in the scCO₂ region and in the scCO₂ saturated brine region where advection is limited. GCS site geology, specifically the abundance of silisiclastic or carbonate bedrock will also have a major control on the in situ pH and the saturation of CaCO₃ minerals both before and after scCO₂ injection which may impact the effectiveness of microbially induced mineralization and pore plugging. Specifically, pH and CaCO₃ saturation will be higher and pH and oversaturation will be maintained in the long-term more readily in pore spaces in carbonate bedrock than silisiclastic bedrock sites, from the dissolution and buffering of the native carbonate minerals (Carey et al., 2010; Kaszuba and Janecky, 2009; Kaszuba et al., 2003, 2005). This will enhance the stability of the microbially produced mineral plugs.

5. Conclusions

Experiments using a novel high pressure (~7.5 MPa) moderate temperature (32 °C) pulse-flow reactor containing a synthetic porous media core allowed microbiologically induced mineralization to be investigated under conditions approximating those in subsurface carbon storage environments. A surface-associated S. pasteurii biofilm became well established in the synthetic porous media core, which was able to hydrolyse all of the urea available in the daily media pulses at pressures of \sim 7.5 MPa. This raised the pH from 7 to 9.1, consistent with buffering by $NH_4^+ = NH_3 + H^+$ which has a pKa value of 9.3 at 30 °C and induced CaCO₃ precipitation. CaCO₃ precipitated as calcite, and a decreasing crystal density gradient with distance into the core suggested crystal growth was limited by the mass transport of Ca²⁺ and urea. Challenges of precipitated CaCO₃ with brine/scCO₂ static mixtures for 2-48 h investigated the potential stability of the precipitates under conditions that approximated a range of pre- and post-CO₂ injection conditions. Brine at atmospheric conditions generated a slight mass loss, due to dissolution of the mineral phase. scCO₂ had a negligible effect on mass, but scCO₂ equilibrated brine generated a significant CaCO3 mass loss. However, control experiments with acidified brine (pH 4, the estimated minimum in situ pH of the scCO₂ equilibrated brine) demonstrated that much of the mass loss in the scCO₂ equilibrated brine experiments was due to the physical agitation of the CaCO3 crystals during depressurisation and degassing at the termination of the experiments. Mass loss was not due to acidic dissolution of the CaCO₃, which appeared to be limited due to the protective effect of the biofilm and the static incubation of the brine + CaCO₃ where reaction kinetics are reduced by the limited ability of reactants and products to migrate to and from the mineral surface by advection. These data suggest that microbially induced mineralization with the purpose of reducing the permeability of preferential leakage pathways during the operation of GCS are applicable in the scCO₂ region and both the scCO₂ saturated brine region and the brine saturated scCO₂ region of the subsurface storage site where subsurface fluids are quasi static.

New and novel tools to control subsurface permeability and CO_2 leakage, as presented here, are required in inaccessible subsurface environments, where 'traditional' engineering approaches cannot be applied. For example, while injection wells may be accessible to traditional sealing approaches, reducing permeability proximal to the well bore or in fracture zones far from the well requires new approaches. While the injection of a base into the subsurface could achieve a pH increase and induce CaCO₃ precipitation similarly to the ureolysis based approach, this would lead to instantaneous CaCO₃ supersaturation and precipitation at the point of injection. However, the controlled injection of urea into the subsurface would allow for transport of urea farther away from the injection point before urea hydrolysis induced pH increase and CaCO₃ precipitation would occur. This is likely to promote a wider spatial distribution of CaCO₃ and avoid uncontrolled plugging at the point of injection (Ferris et al., 2003; Mitchell and Ferris, 2005). The injection of ureolytic organisms could also enhance the precipitation process, particularly since bacterial cells can migrate through pore throat sizes in common GCS site rocks. Recent work has been up-scaled by investigating radial flow and ureolytic CaCO₃ precipitation at atmospheric pressures, within 74 cm diameter, 38 cm thick sandstone cores (Phillips et al., 2012) and ongoing work is focusing on up-scaling under pressures that approximate GCS conditions.

Acknowledgments

Funding was provided from the US Department of Energy (DOE) Zero Emissions Research Technology Center (ZERT), Award No. DE-FC26-04NT42262 and DOE EPSCoR Award No. DE-FG02-08ER46527, NSF Award No. 0934696, as well as a European Union (EU) Marie Curie Reintegration Grant to ACM (277005). Support for the Environmental and Biofilm Mass Spectrometry Facility through DURIP, Contract Number: W911NF0510255 and the MSU Thermal Biology Institute from the NASA Exobiology Program Project NAG5-8807 is acknowledged.

Appendix A. Supplementary data

Supplementary data associated with this article can be found, in the online version, at http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j. ijggc.2013.02.001.

References

- Abe, F., Kato, C., Horikoshi, K., 1999. Pressure-regulated metabolism in microorganisms. Trends in Microbiology 7, 447–453.
- Allen, D.E., Strazisar, B.R., Soong, Y., Hedges, S.W., 2005. Modeling carbon dioxide sequestration in saline aquifers: significance of elevated pressures and salinities. Fuel Processing Technology 86, 1569–1580.
- Banfield, J.F., Barker, W.W., Welch, S.A., Taunton, A., 1999. Biological impact on mineral dissolution: application of the lichen model to understanding mineral weathering in the rhizosphere. Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences 96, 3404–3411.
- Barkley, W., Richardson, J., 1994. Laboratory safety. In: Gerhardt, P., Murray, R., Wood, E., Willis, A., Krieg, N. (Eds.), Manual of Methods for General Bacteriology. American Society of Microbiology, Washington, DC, pp. 715–734.
- Burne, R.A., Chen, Y.-Y.M., 2000. Bacterial ureases in infectious diseases. Microbes and Infection 2, 533–542.
- Carey, W., Svec, R., Grigg, R., Zhang, J., Crow, W., 2010. Experimental investigation of wellbore integrity and CO₂-brine flow along the casing-cement microannulus. International Journal of Greenhouse Gas Control 4, 272–282.
- Castanier, S., Le Métayer-Levrel, G., Perthuisot, J.-P., 1999. Ca-carbonates precipitation and limestone genesis – the microbiogeologist point of view. Sedimentary Geology 126, 9–23.
- Costerton, J.W., Stewart, P.S., 2001. Battling biofilms the war is against bacterial colonies that cause some of the most tenacious infections known. The weapon is knowledge of the enemy's communication system. Scientific American 285, 74–81.
- Cunningham, A., Sharp, R., Hiebert, R., James, G., 2003. Subsurface biofilm barriers for the containment and remediation of contaminated groundwater. Bioremediation Journal 7, 151–164.
- Cunningham, A.B., Gerlach, R., Spangler, L., Mitchell, A.C., 2009. Microbially enhanced geologic containment of sequestered supercritical CO₂. Energy Procedia 1, 3245–3252.

- Cunningham, A.B., Gerlach, R., Spangler, L., Mitchell, A.C., Parks, S., Phillips, A., 2011. Reducing the risk of well bore leakage of CO₂ using engineered biomineralization barriers. Energy Procedia 4, 5178–5185.
- Duan, Z., Sun, R., 2003. An improved model calculating CO₂ solubility in pure water and aqueous NaCl solutions from 273 to 533 K and from 0 to 2000 bar. Chemical Geology 193, 257–271.
- Dupraz, S., Parmentier, M., Ménez, B., Guyot, F., 2009. Experimental and numerical modeling of bacterially induced pH increase and calcite precipitation in saline aquifers. Chemical Geology 265, 44–53.
- Ferris, F.G., Stehmeier, L.G., Kantzas, A., Mourits, F.M., 1996. Bacteriogenic mineral plugging. Journal of Canadian Petroleum Technology 35, 56–61.
- Ferris, F.G., Phoenix, V., Fujita, Y., Smith, R.W., 2003. Kinetics of calcite precipitation induced by ureolytic bacteria at 10 to 20 degrees C in artificial groundwater. Geochimica Et Cosmochimica Acta 68, 1701–1710.
- Fujita, Y., Ferris, F.G., Lawson, R.D., Colwell, F.S., Smith, R.W., 2000. Calcium carbonate precipitation by ureolytic subsurface bacteria. Geomicrobiology Journal 17, 305–318.
- Fujita, Y., Taylor, J.L., Gresham, T.L., Delwiche, M.E., Colwell, F.S., McLing, T., Petzke, L., Smith, R.W., 2008. Stimulation of microbial urea hydrolysis in groundwater to enhance calcite precipitation. Environmental Science & Technology 42, 3025–3032.
- Gerlach, R., Cunningham, A.B., 2010. Influence of biofilms on porous media hydrodynamics. In: Vafai, K. (Ed.), Porous Media: Applications in Biological Systems and Biotechnology. Taylor Francis, Boca Raton London New York, pp. 173–230.
- Gledhill, D.K., Morse, J.W., 2004. Dissolution kinetics of calcite in NaCl-CaCl₂-MgCl₂ brines at 25 degrees C and 1 bar pCO₂. Aquatic Geochemistry 10, 171–190.
- Gledhill, D.K., Morse, J.W., 2006. Calcite dissolution kinetics in Na–Ca–Mg–Cl brines. Geochimica Et Cosmochimica Acta 70, 5802–5813.
- Gómez-Morales, J., Torrent-Burgués, J., Rodríguez-Clemente, R., 1996. Nucleation of calcium carbonate at different initial pH conditions. Journal of Crystal Growth 169, 331–338.
- Gross, M., Lehle, K., Jaenicke, R., Nierhaus, K.H., 1993. Pressure-induced dissociation of ribosomes and elongation cycle intermediates – stabilizing conditions and identification of the most sensitive functional-state. European Journal of Biochemistry 218, 463–468.
- Hammes, F., Seka, A., de Kniff, S., Verstraete, W., 2003. A novel approach to calcium removal from calcium-rich industrial wastewater. Water Research 37, 699–704.
- Hansen, L., 2009. Design and experimental testing of a high pressure, high temperature flow-through rock core reactor using supercritical carbon dioxide. M.S. Thesis, Montana State University.
- Harkes, M.P., van Paassen, L.A., Booster, J.L., Whiffin, V.S., van Loosdrecht, M.C.M., 2010. Fixation and distribution of bacterial activity in sand to induce carbonate precipitation for ground reinforcement. Ecological Engineering 36, 112–117.
- Jenneman, G.E., McInerney, M.J., Knapp, R.M., 1985. Microbial penetration through nutrient-saturated berea sandstone. Applied and Environment Microbiology 50, 383–391.
- Kaszuba, J.P., Janecky, D.R., 2009. Geochemical impacts of sequestering carbon dioxide in brine aquifers. In: McPherson, J.M., Sundquist, E. (Eds.), Carbon Sequestration and its Role in the Global Carbon Cycle, Volume 183. American Geophysical Union Monograph, Washington, DC, pp. 239–247.
 Kaszuba, J.P., Janecky, D.R., Snow, M.G., 2003. Carbon dioxide reaction processes in
- Kaszuba, J.P., Janecky, D.R., Snow, M.G., 2003. Carbon dioxide reaction processes in a model brine aquifer at 200 degrees C and 200 bars: implications for geologic sequestration of carbon. Applied Geochemistry 18, 1065–1080.
- Kaszuba, J.P., Janecky, D.R., Snow, M.G., 2005. Experimental evaluation of mixed fluid reactions between supercritical carbon dioxide and NaCl brine: relevance to the integrity of a geologic carbon repository. Chemical Geology 217, 277–293.
- Lagneau, V., Pipart, A., Catalette, H., 2005. Modélisation couplée chimie-transport du comportement à long terme de la séquestration géologique de CO₂ dans des aquifères salins profonds. Oil & Gas Science and Technology – ReIFP 60, 231–247.
- Lewandowski, Z., Beyenal, H., 2007. Fundamentals of Biofilm Research. CRC Press, London, p. 452.
- Marini, L., 2006. The kinetics of mineral carbonation. In: Marini, L. (Ed.), Developments in Geochemistry, Vol. 11. Elsevier, Chapter 6, pp. 169–317.
- Mitchell, J., Carlos Santamarina, J., 2004. Biological considerations in geotechnical engineering. Journal of Geotechnical & Geoenvironmental Engineering 131, 1222–1233.
- Mitchell, A.C., Ferris, F.G., 2005. The co-precipitation of sr into calcite precipitates induced by bacterial ureolysis in artificial groundwater temperature and kinetic dependence. Geochimica Et Cosmochimica Acta 69, 4199–4210.
- Mitchell, A.C., Ferris, F.G., 2006a. Effect of strontium contaminants upon the size and solubility of calcite crystals precipitated by the bacterial hydrolysis of urea. Environmental Science & Technology 40, 1008–1014.
- Mitchell, A.C., Ferris, F.G., 2006b. The influence of *Bacillus pasteurii* on the nucleation and growth of calcium carbonate. Geomicrobiology Journal 23, 213–226.

- Mitchell, A.C., Phillips, A.J., Hamilton, M.A., Gerlach, R., Hollis, W.K., Kaszuba, J.P., Cunningham, A.B., 2008. Resilience of planktonic and biofilm cultures to supercritical CO₂. Journal of Supercritical Fluids 47, 318–325.
- Mitchell, A.C., Phillips, A., Hiebert, R., Gerlach, R., Spangler, L., Cunningham, A.B., 2009. Biofilm enhanced subsurface sequestration of supercritical CO₂. The International Journal on Greenhouse Gas Control 3, 90–99.
- Mitchell, A.C., Dideriksen, K., Spangler, L.H., Cunningham, A.B., Gerlach, R., 2010. Microbially enhanced carbon capture and storage by mineraltrapping and solubility-trapping. Environmental Science & Technology 44, 5270–5276.
- Murray, J.W., Emerson, S., Jahnke, R., 1980. Carbonate saturation and the effect of pressure on the alkalinity of interstitial waters from the Guatemala Basin. Geochimica Et Cosmochimica Acta 44, 963–972.
- Nelson, P.H., 2009. Pore-throat sizes in sandstones, tight sandstones, and shales. AAPG Bulletin 93, 329-340.
- Nicot, J.-P., Oldenburg, C.M., Bryant, S.L., Hovorka, S.D., 2009. Pressure perturbations from geologic carbon sequestration: area-of-review boundaries and borehole leakage driving forces. Energy Procedia 1, 47–54.
- Pan, L., Oldenburg, C.M., Wu, Y.-S., Pruess, K., 2009. Wellbore flow model for carbon dioxide and brine. Energy Procedia 1, 71–78.
- Parkhust, D., Appelo, C., 1999. User's guide to PHREEQC (Version 2) a computer program for speciation, batch-reaction, one-dimensional transport, and inverse geochemical calculations. U.S. Geological Survey, Water-Resources Investigations Report 99-4259, p. 312.
- Phillips, A.J., Lauchnor, E., Eldring, J., Esposito, R., Mitchell, A.C., Gerlach, R., Cunningham, A.B., Spangler, L.H., 2012. Potential CO₂ leakage reduction through biofilm-induced calcium carbonate precipitation. Environmental Science & Technology 47, 142–149.
- Pytkowicz, R.M., Conners, D.N., 1964. High pressure solubility of calcium carbonate in seawater. Science 144, 840–841.
- Sanz, E., Ayora, C., Carrera, J., 2011. Calcite dissolution by mixing waters: geochemical modeling and flow-through experiments. Geologica Acta 9, 67–77.
- Schultz, L., Pitts, B., Mitchell, A.C., Cunningham, A.B., Gerlach, R., 2011. Imaging biologically-induced mineralization in fully hydrated flow systems. Microscopy Today 2011 (September), 12–15.
- Schultze-Lam, S., Fortin, D., Davis, B.S., Beveridge, T.J., 1996. Mineralization of bacterial surfaces. Chemical Geology 132, 171–181.
- Stewart, P.S., 2003. Diffusion in biofilms. Journal of Bacteriology 185, 1485–1491.
- Stumm, W., Morgan, J.J., 1996. Aquatic Chemistry. John Wiley & Sons, New York, 1040 p.
- Teng, H.H., Dove, P.M., De Yoreo, J.J., 2000. Kinetics of calcite growth: surface processes and relationships to macroscopic rate laws. Geochimica Et Cosmochimica Acta 64, 2255–2266.
- Van Lith, Y., Warthmann, R., Vasconcelos, C., McKenzie, J.A., 2003. Microbial fossilization in carbonate sediments: a result of the bacterial surface involvement in dolomite precipitation. Sedimentology 50, 237–245.
- Van Paassen, L.A., Daza, C.M., Staal, M., Sorokin, D.Y., van der Zon, W., van Loosdrecht, M.C.M., 2010a. Potential soil reinforcement by biological denitrification. Ecological Engineering 36, 168–175.
- Van Paassen, L.A., Ghose, R., Van der Linden, T., Van der Star, W., Van Loosdrecht, M., 2010b. Quantifying biomediated ground improvement by ureolysis: large-scale biogrout experiment. Journal of Geotechnical and Geoenvironmental Engineering 136, 1721–1728.
- Wang, S., Jaffe, P.R., 2004. Dissolution of a mineral phase in potable aquifers due to CO₂ releases from deep formations; effect of dissolution kinetics. Energy Conversion and Management 45, 2833–2848.
- Warren, L.A., Maurice, P.A., Parmar, N., Ferris, F.G., 2001. Microbially mediated calcium carbonate precipitation: implications for interpreting calcite precipitation and for solid-phase capture of inorganic contaminants. Geomicrobiology Journal 18, 93–115.
- Whiffin, V.S., van Paassen, L.A., Harkes, M.P., 2007. Microbial carbonate precipitation as a soil improvement technique. Geomicrobiology Journal 24, 417–423.
- White, C.M., Strazisar, B.R., Granite, E.J., Hoffman, J.S., Pennline, H.W., 2003. Separation and capture of CO₂ from large stationary sources and sequestration in geological formations coalbeds and deep saline aquifers. Journal of the Air & Waste Management Association 53, 645–715.
- Yayanos, A.A., Pollard, E.C., 1969. A study of effects of hydrostatic pressure on macromolecular synthesis in *Escherichia coli*. Biophysical Journal 9, 1464.
- Zakkour, P., Haines, M., 2007. Permitting issues for CO₂ capture, transport and geological storage: a review of Europe USA, Canada and Australia. International Journal of Greenhouse Gas Control 1, 94–100.
- Zhang, T., Klapper, I., 2010. Mathematical model of biofilm induced calcite precipitation. Water Science & Technology 61, 2957–2964.