



Letter: faecal microbiota transplantation for irritable bowel syndrome

Journal:	<i>Alimentary Pharmacology & Therapeutics</i>
Manuscript ID	APT-0789-2020.R2
Wiley - Manuscript type:	Letter to the Editors
Date Submitted by the Author:	08-May-2020
Complete List of Authors:	Segal, Jonathan; St Mary's Hospital, Gastroenterology and Hepatology; Imperial College London Mullish, Benjamin; Imperial College London, Division of Digestive Diseases Quraishi, Mohammed Nabil; University Hospital Birmingham NHS Foundation Trust, Iqbal, Tariq; university hospital Birmingham NHS Foundation Trust, Gastroenterology; University of Birmingham, CRUK Institute for Cancer Studies
Keywords:	Irritable bowel syndrome < Disease-based, Outcomes research < Topics, Functional GI diseases < Disease-based, Abdominal pain < Topics, Constipation < Topics, Microbiome < Topics

SCHOLARONE™
Manuscripts

Letter: faecal microbiota transplantation for irritable bowel syndrome

Jonathan P Segal^{1,2}, Benjamin H Mullish^{1,2}, Mohammed Nabil Quraishi^{3,4}, Tariq H Iqbal^{3,4}

1. Departments of Gastroenterology and Hepatology, St Mary's Hospital, Imperial College Healthcare NHS Trust , London, UK
2. Division of Digestive Diseases, Department of Metabolism, Digestion and Reproduction, Faculty of Medicine, Imperial College London, UK
3. University of Birmingham Microbiome Treatment Centre, University of Birmingham, Birmingham, UK
4. Department of Gastroenterology, University Hospitals Birmingham, Birmingham, UK

Authorship

JPS, BHM, MNQ, TI wrote the manuscript; TI provided critical revisions

Acknowledgments

BHM is the recipient of a National Institute of Health Research (NIHR) Academic Clinical Lectureship. The Division of Digestive Diseases at Imperial College London receives financial support from the NIHR Imperial College Biomedical Research Centre (BRC) based at Imperial College London and Imperial College Healthcare NHS Trust.

Conflict of Interest Statement

None to declare

Guarantor of article: Professor Tariq Iqbal

1
2
3 We read with interest the recent paper by Lahtinen *et al* [1] evaluating faecal
4 microbiota transplantation (FMT) in irritable bowel syndrome (IBS); 49 IBS patients
5 were randomised to receive either autologous stool or allogenic FMT *via* colonoscopy.
6
7 The primary endpoint was a 50-point reduction in the IBS severity score at week 12.
8
9 There were no significant differences between autologous stool or allogenic FMT.
10
11
12
13
14
15

16 This study included patients with diarrhoea-predominant IBS (IBS-D), mixed IBS and
17 un-subtyped IBS. Currently, mechanisms underpinning the demonstrated efficacy of
18 FMT for treating *Clostridioides difficile* infection and inflammatory bowel disease are
19 not understood [2,3]. This is despite the clear definition of phenotype in these studies.
20
21 The pathogenesis of IBS is probably multifactorial [4]. From a mechanistic and efficacy
22 perspective, we believe that it is imperative for IBS-FMT interventional studies to
23 rigorously phenotype IBS subtypes to achieve sufficient power. Outcomes, including
24 microbiome composition and functional changes, should be explored separately.
25
26
27
28
29
30
31
32
33
34

35 The importance of phenotyping IBS patients may explain some of the mixed results in
36 the current literature from using FMT for IBS symptoms. Data from FMT trials are also
37 difficult to interpret due to the widely varying methodologies employed. A meta-
38 analysis including all sub-types of IBS concluded that the relative risk of IBS symptoms
39 not improving after FMT was 0.98 (95% CI 0.58-1.66). Furthermore, placebo capsules
40 were superior to capsules containing donor stool in two pooled trials (RR = 1.96; 95%
41 CI 1.19-3.20) [5]. When looking at specific randomised controlled trials, one for IBS-D
42 found that placebo was no better than FMT at inducing symptom relief [6]. Hence, FMT
43 for functional symptoms became a less attractive research proposition. However, this
44 was later challenged with a strongly positive study for FMT in IBS that used a single
45 "super donor". In that study, a 50 point reduction in the IBS severity score was achieved
46 in 23.6%, 76.9% ($p < 0.0001$) and 89.1% ($p < 0.0001$) of the patients who received
47 placebo, 30 g FMT and 60 g FMT, respectively [7], suggesting a dose-dependent
48
49
50
51
52
53
54
55
56
57
58
59
60

1
2
3 response. Furthermore, the "super donor" phenomenon suggests that there are
4 specific constituents within the FMT that are important. Trying to characterise these
5 may be vital to refine and improve FMT efficacy.
6
7
8
9

10
11 We therefore suggest that future FMT-IBS studies have microbiome composition and
12 functional analysis before and after FMT. We commend the authors for reporting both
13 richness and composition changes pre- and post-FMT and would further encourage
14 publication of specific compositional changes in the microbiome that may help our
15 understanding of how FMT works. We further detail some considerations for future
16 FMT-IBS studies in Table 1.
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

26 Despite another negative IBS-FMT study, FMT may have some benefit for highly
27 selected patients with IBS. Future studies should try and understand the mechanisms
28 that underpin this.
29
30
31
32
33
34
35
36
37
38
39
40
41
42
43
44
45
46
47
48
49
50
51
52
53
54
55
56
57
58
59
60

Table 1: Recommendations for consideration in future FMT studies in IBS

Patient characteristics	Selecting patients based on well-defined specific IBS subgroups based on Rome IV criteria along with presence of gut microbial dysbiosis at inclusion. Detailed information on potential confounders such as diet should be collected for covariate analyses.
Donor characteristics	Developing a framework of rational donor selection by understanding mechanisms that dictate donor-recipient compatibility in IBS. There may be a role for exploring strategies around optimising donors possibly through specific dietary modifications prior to the donation process.
FMT characteristics	Heterogeneity in FMT preparation methods, mode of FMT administration and number of treatments/infusions delivered have traditionally made it challenging to establish optimum disease specific FMT protocols.
Study design	As there are currently no valid biochemical manifestations of IBS, clinical outcomes in IBS patients are generally limited to self-reported symptoms. In addition, blinding is often challenging due to difficulties in replicating the smell and appearance of FMT in the placebo. Trial investigators should therefore ensure the blinding process is made as robust as possible in order to minimize bias and maximize the validity of the results.
Study endpoints	Including objective mechanistic endpoints that explore correlation of clinical outcomes with shifts in gut microbial

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28
29
30
31
32
33
34
35
36
37
38
39
40
41
42
43
44
45
46
47
48
49
50
51
52
53
54
55
56
57
58
59
60

	dysbiosis, donor microbiota similarity indices, strain engraftment and metabolomic profiles.
--	--

For Peer Review

References

- 1 Lahtinen, P, Jalanka, J, Hartikainen, A, et al. Randomised clinical trial: faecal microbiota transplantation versus autologous placebo administered via colonoscopy in irritable bowel syndrome. *Aliment Pharmacol Ther.* 2020; 00: 1–11. <https://doi.org/10.1111/apt.15740>
- 2 Allegretti JR, Mullish BH, Kelly C, et al. The evolution of the use of faecal microbiota transplantation and emerging therapeutic indications. *Lancet* 2019;**394**:420–31. doi:10.1016/S0140-6736(19)31266-8
- 3 Yalchin M, Segal JP, Mullish BH, et al. Gaps in knowledge and future directions for the use of faecal microbiota transplant in the treatment of inflammatory bowel disease. *Therap Adv Gastroenterol* 2019;**12**. doi:10.1177/1756284819891038
- 4 Enck P, Aziz Q, Barbara G, et al. Irritable bowel syndrome. *Nat Rev Dis Prim* 2016;**2**:16014. doi:10.1038/nrdp.2016.14
- 5 Ianiro G, Eusebi LH, Black CJ, et al. Systematic review with meta-analysis: efficacy of faecal microbiota transplantation for the treatment of irritable bowel syndrome. *Aliment Pharmacol Ther* 2019;**50**:240–8. doi:10.1111/apt.15330
- 6 Aroniadis OC, Brandt LJ, Oneto C, et al. Faecal microbiota transplantation for diarrhoea-predominant irritable bowel syndrome: a double-blind, randomised, placebo-controlled trial. *Lancet Gastroenterol Hepatol* 2019;**4**:675–85. doi:10.1016/S2468-1253(19)30198-0
- 7 El-Salhy M, Hatlebakk JG, Gilja OH, et al. Efficacy of faecal microbiota transplantation for patients with irritable bowel syndrome in a randomised, double-blind, placebo-controlled study. *Gut* 2020;**69**:859–67. doi:10.1136/gutjnl-2019-319630