

ANNUAL  
YOUNG SCIENTIST  
CONFERENCE 2019

MIGRATION,  
DISPLACEMENT  
AND MOBILITY  
IN AFRICA:  
COMPLEX ISSUES  
IN CURRENT  
TIMES



science & innovation

Department:  
Science and Innovation  
REPUBLIC OF SOUTH AFRICA





© Academy of Science of South Africa

May 2020

ISBN 978-1-928496-26-7

DOI <http://dx.doi.org/10.17159/assaf.2019/0061>

Cite:

Academy of Science of South Africa (ASSAf), (2020). Annual Young Scientist Conference 2019: Migration, Displacement and Mobility in Africa: Complex Issues in Current Times

DOI <http://dx.doi.org/10.17159/assaf.2019/0061>

**Published by:**

Academy of Science of South Africa (ASSAf)

PO Box 72135, Lynnwood Ridge, Pretoria, South Africa, 0040

Tel: +27 12 349 6600 • Fax: +27 86 576 9520

E-mail: [admin@assaf.org.za](mailto:admin@assaf.org.za)

Reproduction is permitted, provided the source and publisher are appropriately acknowledged.

The Academy of Science of South Africa (ASSAf) was inaugurated in May 1996. It was formed in response to the need for an Academy of Science consonant with the dawn of democracy in South Africa: activist in its mission of using science and scholarship for the benefit of society, with a mandate encompassing all scholarly disciplines that use an open-minded and evidence-based approach to build knowledge. ASSAf thus, adopted in its name the term 'science' in the singular as reflecting a common way of enquiring rather than an aggregation of different disciplines. Its Members are elected based on a combination of two principal criteria, academic excellence and significant contributions to society. The Parliament of South Africa passed the Academy of Science of South Africa Act (No 67 of 2001), which came into force on 15 May 2002. This made ASSAf the only academy of science in South Africa officially recognised by government and representing the country in the international community of science academies and elsewhere.

This report reflects the proceedings of Annual Young Scientist Conference 2019: Migration, Displacement and Mobility in Africa: Complex Issues in Current Times held at Future Africa, Pretoria.

Views expressed are those of the individuals and not necessarily those of the Academy nor a consensus view of the Academy based on an in-depth evidence-based study.



# TABLE OF CONTENTS

## ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS 1

## DAY 1 2

### SESSION 1: OPENING 2

**Welcome Remarks** (Prof. Amos Saurombe, University of South Africa (UNISA) and South African Young Academy of Science (SAYAS) Member) 2

**High Level Panel Discussion 2**

**Xenophobia: A Threat to Asylum Regime in Africa** (Dr Jean-Pierre Misago, African Centre for Migration & Society (ACMS), University of the Witwatersrand (Wits) 2

**Refugees in the Context of Movement of People** (Ms Hlengiwe Mtshatsha, Lawyers for Human Rights) 3

**Human Rights Imperatives of Migration** (Mr Deprose Muchena, Amnesty International, Southern Africa) 4

**Root Causes of Migration and Displacement and how they Impact Young Women and Men** (Ms Sibusiswe Nkosi, African Centre for the Constructive Resolution of Disputes (ACCORD)) 5

**Plenary Discussion and Q&A 5**

### SESSION 2: ORAL PRESENTATIONS 8

**SUBTHEMES 1: (1) The Devil is in the Detail: Responding to International Migration 8**  
**(2) Reshaping Humanitarian Aid: The Case for a Shared Responsibility 8**

**Monitoring of Migration Policy Framework, Treaty and Convention Development in Africa** (Mr Adeyemi Badewa, Institute for Social Development, University of the Western Cape (UWC)) 8

**After the Handover: Exploring Médecins Sans Frontières (MSF) Role in the Provision of Health Care to Migrant Farm Workers in Musina, South Africa** (Ms Thea De Gruchy, ACMS, Wits) 9

**Challenges, Complaints and Responses to International Migration by South African Locals: Case Study of Thohoyandou** (Mr Tshedza Sikhwari, University of Venda) 10

**Discussion and Q&A 10**

**SUBTHEME 2: The New Urban Agenda: Migration, Livelihoods, Social Welfare and the Case for Integrated Development Plans 12**

**An Intersectional Approach to Study Urban Mobility Using Poetry-based Methods** (Dr Duduzile Ndlovu, Wits) 12

**Discussion and Q&A 12**

### SESSION 3: WORLD CAFÉ DISCUSSIONS 13

**Report Back and Discussion 13**

**Café 1: When refugees cannot return home, what are the attendant challenges and solutions?** 13

**Café 2: Migration seen in an integrated manner has a lot to do with wider issues of governance and leadership. How do researchers make this linkage much more visible so as to provide lasting solutions?** 14

**Café 3:** In the face of decolonisation and democratising of research in the African context, how do you as researchers on the continent drive, shape and lead the agenda on researching migration? 14

## **SESSION 4: ORAL PRESENTATIONS** 15

**SUBTHEME 2 (continued): The New Urban Agenda: Migration, Livelihoods, Social Welfare and the Case for Integrated Development Plans** 15

**Sustainable, Safe, Inclusive and Resilient Communities: Addressing Informal Settlements through the Lens of the Migrants** (Ms Takudzwa Charisse Taruza, NWU) 15

**A Tale of Static Development with a Dynamic Population** (Ms Gaofenngwe Tlalane Letlhaku, World Merit South Africa (WMSA)) 15

**Discussion and Q&A** 16

## **SESSION 5: SHORT FILM** 18

**The World Academy of Sciences Sub-Saharan Africa Regional Partner (TWAS-SAREP) Secretariat** 18

**Discussion and Q&A** 18

## **DAY 2** 19

**WELCOME AND RECAP OF DAY 1** 19

## **SESSION 6: PANEL DISCUSSION** 20

**Migration and the Media** (Facilitator, Ms Ina Skosana, Health and Medicine Editor, The Conversation) 20

**Discussion and Q&A** 23

## **SESSION 7: ORAL PRESENTATIONS** 24

**SUBTHEME 3: Re-imagining Migration: Big Data and Opportunities for Technological and Scientific Innovation** 24

**Migration, the Socio-Economic and Political Development: The South African Experience** (Mr Andrew Osehi Enaifoghe, University of Zululand) 24

**A Framework for Modelling Conflict-induced Forced Migration According to an Agent-based Approach** (Ms Christa De Kock, Stellenbosch University) 26

**Immigration in the Age of Digital Methodologies** (Mr Phathutshedzo Maxwell Ramukhadi, South African Centre for Digital Language Resources, NWU) 26

**Discussion and Q&A** 27

**SUBTHEME 4: Social Capital, Resilience and Social Networks among Migrant Groups** 28

**Deconstructing the 'Other': A Critical Analysis of West African Diaspora's Modes of Citizenship in Post-Apartheid South Africa** (Ms Ijeoma Opara, UCT) 28

**Illuminating 'threats' and 'enhancers' of Social Cohesion between African Immigrants and South African Nationals in Gauteng Province, South Africa** (Dr Jonathan Oshupeng Maseng, NWU) 28

**Discussion and Q&A** 30

**SUBTHEME 5: Researching Migration: Developing an African Agenda for Africa** 31

<b>Shared Complicities, Decolonisation and Collective Futures of West African Borders</b> (Dr Komlan Agbedahin, University of Free State (UFS))	31
<b>The Decolonisation of Immigration: Immigration that Supports the African Agenda</b> (Ms Michelle Beeslaar, University of Pretoria (UP))	31
<b>The Socio-Economic Effects of Urban Migration within the Context of Africa</b> (Mr Nkululeko Shabalala, University of KwaZulu-Natal (UKZN))	32
<b>Discussion and Q&amp;A</b>	33
<b>SUBTHEME 6: Gender, Health and Migration</b>	34
<b>African Immigrant and Refugee Families' Perceptions on Informational Support and Health Status: A Comparison of African Immigrants living in South Africa and the US</b> (Mr Michael Belebema, UWC)	34
<b>Intersectional Factors Contributing to the Vulnerability of Young Zimbabwean Female Immigrants in Johannesburg</b> (Dr Rachel Chinyakata, University of Venda)	34
<b>Migrant Women's Access to Public Health Care Facilities in Makhado, Limpopo: A Case of Zimbabwean Women</b> (Miss Yolanda Tshililo, UCT)	35
<b>Discussion and Q&amp;A</b>	36
<b>SESSION 8: PARTICIPATORY THEATRE</b>	<b>38</b>
Theme: Performance-as-research	38
<b>CONFERENCE CLOSURE</b>	<b>38</b>
<b>ANNEXURE A: LIST OF ACRONYMS</b>	<b>39</b>
LIST OF PARTICIPANTS	39





# ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

This report reflects the conference proceedings of the tenth Annual Young Scientists' Conference which took place from 28 to 29 October 2019 at Future Africa, University of Pretoria, South Africa. The theme of the conference: 'Migration, Displacement and Mobility in Africa: Complex issues in current times' tied in with the African Union (AU) Year 2019 Theme: The Year of Refugees, Returnees and Internally Displaced Persons: Towards durable solutions to forced displacement in Africa.

The Academy of Science of South Africa (ASSAf) hosts this annual conference in partnership with the Department of Science and Innovation (DSI) and the South African Young Academy of Science (SAYAS).

We wish to acknowledge core funding received by ASSAf from the DSI. Also noted is funding from the Organisation for Women in Science for the Developing World - South Africa National Chapter (OWSD-SANC) in supporting the discussion on the gendered effects of migration and health.

We also thank all the conference participants in their different roles, for enriching the discussions and sharing their experiences.

ASSAf recognises the role of its staff, Ms Edith Shikumo, Young Scientist Liaison Officer and SAYAS Secretariat, in organising this conference.

Appreciation is also given to members of the organising committee who gave of their time and expertise and comprised of: A/Prof Jo Vearey, University of the Witwatersrand (Wits) and SAYAS member; A/Prof Kanshukan Rajaratnam, University of Cape Town and SAYAS member; Prof Amos Saurombe, University of South Africa and SAYAS member; Prof Christof Heyns, University of Pretoria and ASSAf member; Retired Judge Richard Goldstone, ASSAf member; Mr Stanley Maphosa, International Liaison Manager, ASSAf and Ms Edith Shikumo. Key programmatic support was also provided by the African Centre for Migration & Society (ACMS) based at the University of the Witwatersrand (Wits) which helped in shaping the thematic areas discussed.

# DAY ONE

## SESSION 1: OPENING

*Facilitator: Mr Stanley Maphosa, Academy of Science of South Africa (ASSAf)*

### WELCOME REMARKS

*Prof. Amos Saurombe, University of South Africa (UNISA) and South African Young Academy of Science (SAYAS) Member*

Prof Saurombe welcomed everyone, in particular the young scientists, to the conference on behalf of SAYAS.

The last 27 years have seen increases in migration internationally, but primarily across Africa. The African continent is experiencing a coming together of its people, epitomised in the African Union's (AU's) African Continental Free Trade Agreement (AfCFTA), which aims to create a single market for goods and free movement of businesses. Opening up borders, removing barriers and promoting movement have a direct impact on people's lives. The objective of free movement of persons is critical for a future united Africa which is strong enough to take its rightful place in the globalised world. Researchers have a role to play in finding relevance within the current developments on the continent.

The conference serves to bring together the great minds of upcoming researchers from very diverse universities. The presentations will provide insights into their important work that is expected to grow into solid research and provide a foundation for policy-making, as well as contribute to the broader discussions and resolve some of the current problems relating to migration, displacements and mobility in Africa.

### HIGH-LEVEL PANEL DISCUSSION

*Facilitator: A/Prof Jo Vearey, African Centre for Migration and Society (ACMS), University of the Witwatersrand (Wits) and SAYAS Member*

#### Panellists:

**Dr Jean-Pierre Misago**, Researcher, ACMS, Wits

**Ms Hlengiwe Mtshatsha**, Refugee and Migrant Rights Programme, Lawyers for Human Rights

**Mr Deprose Muchena**, Regional Director, Amnesty International, Southern Africa

**Ms Sibuswe Nkosi**, Programme Officer - Peacekeeping Unit, African Centre for the Constructive Resolution of Disputes

### Xenophobia: A Threat to Asylum Regime in Africa

*(Dr Jean-Pierre Misago, ACMS, Wits)*

Despite policies and aspirations about free movement and free trade, the asylum regime in Africa is under threat, partly due to the prevalence of xenophobia through its different manifestations, which is a global phenomenon that affects migrants in countries beyond the African continent. The South African government does not accept that xenophobia is an issue, possibly because it is not regarded as a widespread problem. It is nevertheless a serious social issue that needs to be resolved.

Xenophobia manifests in different ways. In many African countries, the pass system is imposed on refugees and asylum seekers who are forced to stay in camps, face selective law enforcement of the law and are denied basic services. Violent attacks on foreign nationals are not necessarily xenophobic but acts of criminality.

ACMS has been involved in research on xenophobia for some time. There are debates about whether human beings are inherently fearful of strangers as part of their survival strategy, or



whether xenophobia is part of a social construction. Evidence from the South African situation as well as literature from elsewhere indicates the causal factors of xenophobic violence as:

- Underlying causes: Socio-economic and political conditions cannot be used to explain why xenophobic violence happens because complex social issues also exist where no such violence occurs.
- Proximate causes: Factors relating to the violence include the economy, politics, and governance. The absence of trusted conflict resolution mechanisms and social controls contributes to outbursts of violence.
- Triggers: Violence is triggered by mobilisation processes instigated by local groups or political leaders who use xenophobia for their own interests.

Xenophobic violence is a threat to improving livelihoods and integration as well as other aspirations for society, and it has implications for the refugee protection regime in Africa because it causes tension between countries. Communities and their leaders play a crucial role in responding to migration and displacement because they can choose to include or exclude 'the other' regardless of local or regional policies.

Xenophobia is one of the key issues that must be addressed in order to protect the refugee regime and promote free movement on the African continent.

## Refugees in the Context of Movement of People

*(Ms Hlengiwe Mtshatsha, Lawyers for Human Rights (LHR))*

LHR is a non-governmental organisation (NGO) based across South Africa. The Refugee and Migrant Rights Programme (RMRP) is the largest of its programmes and sees about 10 000 to 15 000 refugees and asylum seekers at its various offices around the country. The closure of several Department of Home Affairs' (DHA) Refugee Reception Offices has greatly affected the communities served by RMRP. Sub-programmes within the RMRP include:

- The statelessness project which assists individuals who do not have access to a nationality and are unable to be documented.
- The psycho-social project which assists refugees and asylum seekers by providing access to social services in addition to documentation.
- The detention monitoring unit which assists in cases of unlawful arrest, representing people who have the proper documents but are targeted by law enforcement simply for being foreigners.
- The strategic litigation unit which litigates on specific issues with regard to detention and documentation and is working towards litigation on the current state of the asylum seeker process.

Refugees are those who have fled their countries of origin because of a variety of factors. In order to be classified as a refugee, an individual must present themselves at a DHA Refugee Reception Office and be issued with an asylum seeker permit, which is valid for a short period while their status is being determined. It can take 20 years or more before their refugee status (as defined in a few international legal instruments and in terms of the South African Refugees Act) is officially confirmed by the government of South Africa. LHR has first-hand experience of how people who try to have their status determined face numerous hurdles including institutional xenophobia.

The NGO is concerned with the movement of people because it views refugees as migrants and its mandate requires it to assist refugees and asylum seekers in determining their status and accessing their basic rights. More than 2,000 refugees and asylum seekers presented at the RMRP clinic in Pretoria between January and September 2019. The majority of clients are between the age of 18 to 50 and the issues dealt with relate to accessing Refugee Reception Offices, documentation, services and employment. Economic migrants are neither refugees nor

asylum seekers and therefore do not qualify for the services offered by LHR. There should be a documentation regime for this group as they cannot afford private legal services to be able to access the proper documentation. Other challenges relating to the movement of people relate to:

- Xenophobic attacks and the ripple effects thereof
- Living conditions and the need for social integration
- Xenophobia at all levels of society including institutions
- Perceived competition for resources, which scapegoats' foreign nationals
- Barriers to accessing travel documents
- Policies that are unsympathetic to people who are moving, particularly those from within South Africa who move between provinces and from neighbouring countries.

### **Human Rights Imperatives of Migration**

*(Mr Deprese Muchena, Amnesty International, Southern Africa)*

Amnesty International is a global human rights movement with about nine million members across the world and offices in 10 regions including Southern Africa. As Director of that office, Mr Muchena works with a team of researchers, legal specialists and communication specialists to investigate human rights violations, report on them and engage governments in an attempt to resolve them in order to have a vibrant and tolerant world.

The conversation about migration, displacement and mobility in Africa is important particularly at a time when shifts in the world need to be understood. There is a tendency in South Africa to be too inward looking and assume that no other country struggles with migrants. It is necessary to locate the conversation globally. The world is facing the triple burden of unemployment, poverty and inequality. There is competition for global natural resources and the competition for African land is huge. This means that there will be struggles over land, water and opportunity, which drive migration, displacement and desperation.

A combination of the politics of demonisation, scapegoating and populism is often used by leaders to explain their countries' circumstances, and in a context of poverty, inequality and desperation, people will buy this message, thereby driving the human rights issue in migration. As a result of defunding, there is a huge decline in global leadership on international human rights protection. The absence of a global convergence of human rights norms and standards deepens the crisis for migrants, refugees and asylum seekers. This issue ought to be explored by scholars.

Unlike human beings, capital enjoys freedom and rights, and moves with ease between countries in Africa. It is disappointing to see the collapse of African leadership when it comes to the reality of migration. The legal, policy and institutional frameworks are in place, but there is an absence of leadership that sees Africans as human beings who are in search of opportunities that could benefit both the sending and the receiving countries.

Amnesty International is aware that more and more influence and impact of a European model to manage migration is being imposed across African countries. In Europe, migration is a security phenomenon and not a developmental phenomenon, whereas in some countries in Africa, the amount of remittances mobilised through migration have outstripped foreign direct investment or overseas development assistance. To an extent, migration needs to be seen differently. Scholarship in Africa has failed to dismantle the narrative about migration around the world.

It is important for rights advocates to consider the rights aspect of every incident they deal with. The problem of statelessness affects large numbers of African people. There should be concern about the absence of protection mechanisms for people who find themselves stateless as a result of various policy failures of governments. Almost every country around the world hosts migrants and refugees from other countries. There should be a conversation about the dynamics



of migration and the human rights of migrants as this could be the most unifying alternative to rebuild the leadership that has collapsed as a result of many problems.

## Root Causes of Migration and Displacement and How they Impact Young Women and Men

(Ms Sibusiswe Nkosi, African Centre for the Constructive Resolution of Disputes (ACCORD))

ACCORD is a South African based civil society organisation working throughout Africa to bring creative African solutions to challenges posed by conflict on the continent. Its work involves intervention in conflict situations using negotiation, training, research and conflict analysis and its activities are implemented through a diverse and international staff. The topic of Ms Nkosi's presentation was informed by her work on issues of youth in relation to peace and security across the continent in support of the AU and regional mechanisms.

Migration and displacement are important and rapidly growing phenomena, which for many young people have become an established feature in the contemporary socio-economic landscape. In general, international migration refers to the voluntary movement of people across internationally recognised boundaries. Migrants constitute a diverse group of people whose social, economic and educational backgrounds, means and forms of migration and motivation for migrating influence the scope, scale and type of migration. Youth migrants constitute the larger portion of the overall migration population and have a significant impact on the communities in their countries of origin, transit and destination. Drivers for migration include the search for a better life, economic opportunities, education and the desire to reunite with family members. Internal migrants move from rural to urban areas within a country. In contrast, refugees are those who are forced to migrate due to situations of conflict, violence and human rights violations.

Migration and displacement can have a negative effect on poverty reduction, economic growth, human and social welfare, and environmental sustainability. Integrated development solutions that promote access to land, housing and sustainable livelihoods combined with effective service delivery and accountable, responsive governance are essential to help displaced communities.

Migrant youth are particularly vulnerable and commonly face unemployment, exploitative working conditions, social exclusion, disruption of family, absence of social protection, and barriers to education and training. Young female migrants are at higher risk of abuse, discrimination and gender-based violence (GBV). A negative migration experience can have dire and traumatising consequences for young people in the short and long-term. A positive migration experience can set young migrants on a successful path towards capitalising on their accomplishments and developing economic and social assets for their future.

Young migrants are change agents and a much more positive migratory experience needs to be created for them. They are inventive, dynamic and creative, and integrate into receiving communities faster than older migrants, but this potential is often not harnessed because of discrimination against them. Protecting their rights is fundamental and guaranteeing access to health, education and housing is essential. They ought to also participate in discussions on migrant related policy and governance.

## Plenary Discussion and Q&A

- 1) We understand that xenophobia is a global phenomenon. However, we have to look at xenophobia from multiple perspectives and cannot necessarily blame acts of violence, criminality and tensions within the community on xenophobia. According to the South African Police Services (SAPS) it has dealt with acts of criminality rather than xenophobia over the last few months. The DHA is busy drawing up immigration legislation and policies. Statistics South Africa (Stats SA) claims that there are 4 million foreign nationals in the country, of which 800



are skilled professionals. Internal migration between provinces of South Africa also causes a lot of conflict. There must be a differentiation between conflict that stems from internal migration and conflict that has to do with foreign nationals. The Constitution of the Republic of South Africa guarantees our rights of freedom of movement.

**Response**, Dr Misago: A recent case when all Pakistanis in a community were attacked because of what an individual Pakistani was believed to have done (and this could have been a rumour) is beyond just criminality. People were attacked for who they are and not for what they have done, and the incident was used as an outlet for people's frustrations. Crimes are also committed by South Africans, not only by foreigners. We are all outsiders in some way or another. The problem has to do with the absence of governance and the rule of law. This puts everyone at risk. We should be able to trust our institutions and those who are supposed to address crime in our communities to resolve conflicts. We are all in danger when there is no rule of law and a lack of leadership.

**Response**, Ms Mtshatsha: LHR defends the rights of foreign nationals who are exploited in any way. For example, during the recent xenophobic attacks and the mass arrest of foreign nationals, the state acting against them was unlawful and almost criminal. Such incidents are often based on rumour and the reaction of the SAPS is totally unwarranted.

**Response**, Ms Nkosi: It is interesting that other countries are asking why South Africans are killing foreign nationals and they do not understand why society, instead of the criminal system, is taking charge in this regard.

- 2) I do not believe that South Africans are xenophobic, but people are capable of hating other people, particularly if they believe the other people take their jobs. It is evident that foreign nationals are taking South Africans' jobs, particularly in the informal sector or lower paid jobs.

**Response**, Ms Mtshatsha: From our experience, foreign nationals (undocumented) are targeted for jobs in the informal sector that pay very low wages, which are not in accordance with the National Minimum Wage Act. This is an exploitation of foreign nationals.

- 3) What is the future for the children of foreign nationals in South Africa?

**Response**, Ms Mtshatsha: Basic education for children of foreign nationals is guaranteed in terms of the Constitution. LHR assists them by writing letters to the Department of Basic Education. Access to higher education is more complicated. Foreign nationals must have the right documentation. Asylum seeker privilege is supposed to operate as a study permit but permits have to be valid for the duration of studies and this usually complicates the situation. The DHA needs to rethink some of the amendments to the Refugees Act to focus on enforcing and strengthening socio-economic rights rather than diluting them.

- 4) Is there a relationship between research findings and their dissemination, and measures taken by government to halt xenophobia in South Africa?

**Response**, Dr Misago: This is always a problem. ACMS has been doing research for many years and engaging with stakeholders including government and the South Africa Human Rights Commission to provide solutions and ideas on how these issues can be addressed. Government usually claims there is no xenophobia. This denialism has resulted in inaction. There is no policy at a national level. Every time there is a major outbreak task teams are formed and so on but there is nothing on the ground that prevents xenophobic violence recurring. Our frustration is that the evidence we produce on this and other issues do not make it into policy formulation. Perhaps the young scientists can help us understand how research can make a meaningful impact and lead to policy discussions. We have failed in this regard.

**Response**, Ms Nkosi: There is a major challenge with regard to research informing policy, but some headway is being made and credit should be given where it is due. Many institutions

are working with government to inform and advise on policy. Young scholars need to think about how researchers can do more to inform policymakers.

5) Who is a foreigner? This requires clarification.

**Response**, Ms Mtshatsha: Everyone is a foreigner. It depends where you are.

6) What are your thoughts on the effect of political correctness around xenophobia in South Africa? People in Cabinet give mixed messages about whether or not there is xenophobia.

**Response**; Dr Misago: It is a confusing situation, but we need to understand politicians. At conferences, we are made to believe that we are all for human rights, for example, but then politicians go and do what we do not agree with. There is a dark side to democracy. Politicians have constituencies that they need to please or they will commit political suicide. We need to understand the incentives for policy uptake or our research will never have an impact.

**Response**, Ms Mtshatsha: I am not going into the political rhetoric of denying xenophobia. It is a sore point for us to engage with public officials who do not take the impact of what they say seriously. A recent Tweet provided a spread sheet indicating different nationalities and the crimes they committed in South Africa. This shocked me and I do not know what the effect of this is going to be.

**Response**, Mr Muchena: I would like to redirect people's attention to look critically at statements made by politicians across the continent that paint their nationals as honest, hardworking, crime free and clean living but paint those from other countries as the exact opposite. Scholars must reject this because it is not true. Evidence of research we do all around the continent looking at how States conduct themselves, the protection of rights and the culture of impunity, shows that we have a crisis in every country. After about 20 years of democracy, there is a transition and the countries no longer have democrats and constitutionalism. It is as if crime is a political capital and must be kept going and deployed when and where needed in order to sustain an exhausted narrative about reality. This is destroying our countries. I challenge scholars to ensure that facts and narratives are based on evidence and reject the demonisation philosophy. Countries' problems need to be addressed by working on criminal justice systems. Crimes are not being investigated because many of the African states have become junior partners in this plutocracy, and therefore some level of chaos is allowed to reign in order to sustain decaying nationalist projects. We need to direct the problem where it is occurring instead of fighting among ourselves.

A/Prof Jo Vearey highlighted the following important issues raised in the discussion:

- It is important to look back at history and understand borders as colonial imports. The difference in numbers of non-nationals in South Africa between the 1980s and now is linked to this and is very important. Until 1994, it was incredibly difficult for non-South African nationals to enter this country unless they went through the exploitative labour migration system. It is necessary to recognise the importance of borders being opened and to think about what this means. The same has been seen in terms of movement of South Africans within South Africa.
- Triple-win governance, or governance systems that facilitate the movement of people in ways that benefit the person who moves, the community from which they have travelled and the country to which they travel. Labour exploitation is one of the silent spaces in the governance of migration.
- An excellent report (released towards the end of 2018) looks at the best available data on employment and immigration in South Africa, and shows that South Africans are not being displaced from the labour market by foreign migrants and the presence of foreign migrants has increased the Gross Domestic Product (GDP) by about 3.3% within South Africa. However, the implications of this in terms of who is benefitting from the presence of non-nationals in the country need to be considered.

## SESSION 2: ORAL PRESENTATIONS

### Subthemes 1:

#### (1) The Devil is in the Detail: Responding to International Migration

#### (2) Reshaping Humanitarian Aid: The Case for a Shared Responsibility

*Facilitator: Ms Majory Dzingai, North West University (NWU)*

#### Monitoring of Migration Policy Framework, Treaty and Convention Development in Africa

*(Mr Adeyemi Badewa, Institute for Social Development, University of the Western Cape (UWC))*

The aim of the study is to enhance implementation strategies and the sustainability of the migration policy environment in Africa towards harnessing migration potentials for national and regional development. The objectives were to:

- Evaluate the processes of migration policy development in Africa and its levels of implementation.
- Examine the prospects of bridging the gaps between national and multilateral migration policies toward inclusive development in Africa.
- Highlight the significance of stakeholder engagement in addressing Africa's migration challenges.
- Discuss the linkages between migration and development particularly the implementation of Agenda 2063.

The study is based on the theoretical explanation of policy formulation and implementation derived from the Gates Model of Social Policy Implementation, which is relevant to this study because it interfaces policy environment, planning and management in monitoring implementation towards achieving the goals of adaptability, efficiency, and sustainability. A qualitative research method was used, with secondary data collected from institutional reports, policy frameworks and relevant literature, analysed and interpreted.

Conclusions drawn from the study are:

- Achieving the Pan-African goal of Continental Free Trade Agreement, economic integration and Agenda 2063 is centred on a coherent and well implemented migration regime in Africa, which requires harmony between national and regional priorities, and embraces the following:
  - o Open migration policies for skilled migrants
  - o Provision of basic services support, such as education, favourable labour regulations and special economic zones across the regions to boost entrepreneurship, greater social capital and transborder cooperation
  - o A justice system characterised by immigrant's inclusion, diaspora engagement, and trust and stability between citizens and immigrants reflecting Maunganidze's seven principles.

The work reflected on Maunganidze (2017:111) provide seven moral principles for guiding migration policy frameworks and implementation as significant framework for coherent management and monitoring of migration policy regimes in Africa. The seven principles include:

- (i) upholding humanitarian principles;
- (ii) border management and security;



- (iii) promoting regular and labour migration (according to ILO standards);
  - (iv) integration of migrants;
  - (v) migration and development (in national and regional development policies and programmes);
  - (vi) capacity building (towards achieving institutional objectives and personal fulfilment); and
  - (vii) policy-relevant research (to enhance evidence-based policymaking (EBP)).
- An evaluation of the causality of migration challenges in Africa was needed instead of the push-pull factor narratives.
  - A positive implementation outcome for migration policies in Africa requires political and systematic integration and stakeholder partnerships.
  - Multi-level collaboration on the sustainable implementation of migration policy frameworks, treaties and conventions in Africa is essential for harnessing migration potential for inclusive development.
  - Stakeholder participation in the planning process is key to exploiting the physical and social resources of the people and in a participatory process.

### **After the Handover: Exploring Médecins Sans Frontières (MSF) Role in the Provision of Health Care to Migrant Farm Workers in Musina, South Africa**

*(Ms Thea De Gruchy, ACMS, Wits)*

MSF has traditionally engaged in work that is humanitarian in nature. However, the boundaries between humanitarian and development are increasingly blurring and understanding the longer-term implications of these humanitarian/development interventions is imperative. For example, MSF responded to the massive influx of Zimbabweans to the Musina area of South Africa between 2007 and 2009 by providing emergency health care, but later shifted focus to the access that migrant farm workers living and working in the area have to general and comprehensive health care.

Reflecting global norms, health policy in South Africa fails to account for the realities of migration and recognise it as a determinant of health. Migrants face barriers to health care and including poor treatment at the frontline staff at healthcare facilities. In addition, the Department of Health's (DoH's) decentralised approach to governance and administration adopted in the mid-1990s has proven to be ineffective. Against this background, the research (which forms part of a broader project that looks at the programmatic and policy responses to health in Musina) investigates the changing relationship and dynamics between MSF and the State and the implications of this since MSF's departure from Musina in 2013.

In 2009, MSF identified the need to improve access by migrant farm workers to general and comprehensive health care. The DoH provided some care to these communities by way of a mobile clinic, but did not provide HIV testing, counselling or treatment. MSF established its own mobile clinic programme through which innovation in the form of a model for service provision that was replicable would be demonstrated, with the intention that DoH would take over the programme. MSF's departure from the area was carefully curated, characterised by a process that took more than two years. By all accounts, the DoH was willing and interested to continue with the programme while district and provincial departments were less willing. In the wake of MSF's departure, the programme was able to continue running as it had during MSF's involvement. However, without renewing support and replenishing resources, various parts of the programme started to come undone bringing its longer-term sustainability into question. Frustrations were around the inability of the programme to continue as it once had, and the lack of support offered by the district and provincial offices to sustain it.

The case study raises two important questions:

1. What does it mean to demonstrate an 'innovative' model of care if it does not secure the requisite buy-in from the State to sustain the innovation?

It has been suggested that some organisations should plan for their inevitable departure and rely on local actors (including the State) in their programming. Within this model, the long-term commitment of actors is relied upon, but cannot be assured.

2. What does it mean to continually link the access that migrants have to health care to moments of humanitarian crisis?

While targeted responses to improve access to care for certain populations may be necessary, in the South African context, short-term initiatives would set apart such groups and undermine the State's constitutional commitment to the progressive realisation of access to quality and comprehensive healthcare for all (including migrants). This way of responding to migration and health undermines commitments to and calls for integrated and people-centred health systems, including universal health coverage. As organisations such as MSF move from more traditional aid interventions to developing innovative interventions that are replicable, understanding whether these interventions lend themselves to longer-term structural change and are replicated by the State is important.

Five years after the departure of MSF, remnants of the programme remain and antiretroviral therapy (ART) is more acceptable to farm workers than it was prior to MSF's involvement. But the programme falls significantly short of closing the accessibility gap in health care for remote and migrant populations.

## Challenges, Complaints and Responses to International Migration by South African Locals: Case Study of Thohoyandou

*(Mr Tshedza Sikhwari, University of Venda)*

During the mid-2000s, there was a sudden increase in the number of international migrants entering South Africa due in particular to a series of natural disasters that ravaged neighbouring states and South Africa's attraction as an economically and politically stable state. It is alleged that the growth of the international migration populations resulted in overpopulation and brought with it an upsurge in competition for job opportunities, crime, selling of illegal products and human trafficking, rattling the country's economy. Since 1994, countless outbreaks of xenophobic attacks have occurred in South Africa. The case study of Thohoyandou intends to investigate and understand local South Africans challenges, complaints and responses to international migration, assess South Africa's approach to international migration, and establish amicable solutions that would bring stability and order to the area.

The study will employ a qualitative methodology in order to gain an understanding of the underlying reasons, opinions and motivations regarding the challenges and complains of international migration in Thohoyandou. Participants will be selected from among the local South African population in Thohoyandou and data collection will take place through face-to-face interviews with the participants.

## Discussion and Q&A

- 1) In 2017, a paper was published on the impact of the multiplicity of migration frameworks in Africa that has caused confusion. The author suggested that it would be better to begin to apply some of the frameworks instead of going to conferences and multiplying the number of frameworks without achieving anything. What is your take on this?

**Response**, Mr Badewa: There is a need to track implementation of policies to ensure that they achieve their desired objectives. This requires critical planning, implementation, compilation and dissemination that involve proper engagement with stakeholders. The media and the



academia/research institutes are key to the dissemination of policies in African countries. Migration policies should be reviewed beyond political rhetoric to ensure socio-economic gains especially the Regional Economic Communities (RECs) protocols on free movement of people and investment and the AfCTA.

- 2) There seems to be a lack of a common definition of the terminology and a lack of coherence between hierarchical governance and horizontal governance, and the change that must happen from the bottom up. How do you intend to communicate the findings of your studies so that they reach the people who most need to hear them?

**Response**, Mr Sikhwari: The findings will be communicated widely to whoever is interested by publishing an article on my research.

**Response**, Ms De Gruchy: Many of us have approached government officials requesting their involvement in the research as interviewees, respondents to our research questions and so on, but get no response. We send them policy briefs, follow-up emails and invitations to discussions but get no response. How would you suggest that academics should approach government to be able to share research results? Any thoughts on this would be very helpful.

- 3) There is no use for us to continue producing knowledge unless it can be used to transform society. Research participants often ask what they will get out of the research that is conducted. This speaks to issues of social justice that must be taken into consideration. When it comes to disseminating research findings, we see unethical practices because there is unfairness in the selection of who attends the workshops and how the information is disseminated from there. Too many research reports end up on the shelves gathering dust. I would like to ask Ms Beeslaar (who recently moved from many years in government to academia) about her thoughts on who uses the knowledge produced by researchers and what is government doing with it, and what is the role of the university, especially when government is funding research? How does government perceive research that is produced?

**Response**, Ms Beeslaar: Unconscious bias is part of the problem. We focus on the micro level but need to look at the bigger picture about race, gender and other issues in South Africa. I spent 16 years in government and there is an assumption of how I think and what my views are. Having moved to academia, I have reflected about whether my contributions would have been different if I knew what I know now. I look at things such as the way to approach the silo mentality. Language is a barrier and how academics communicate a message is very important. They produce verbose research reports that government officials are unlikely to read or find useful. The way you approach government officials is also important. It is crucial to be able to communicate in a way that the next person understands. Research needs to be of relevance to the needs of this country and Africa, and it is recommended that researchers partner with government to do this. Even though it is sometimes difficult, it is necessary to build networks and trust.

- 4) Are specific documents required in order to access the services offered by MSF?

**Response**, Ms De Gruchy: The MSF mobile clinics did not have any documentation requirements. In addition, according to South African law, DoH facilities, including their mobile clinics, should provide primary health free of charge to all South African and Southern African Development Community (SADC) nationals.

- 5) Is Mr Sikhwari aiming to interview locals as well as migrants in Thohoyandou? Interviewing migrants would influence the findings of the study, but the ethical challenge of identifying respondents that are immigrants to interview will have to be addressed.

**Response**, Mr Sikhwari: I want to interview only the local people in order to understand why Thohoyandou has experienced very little xenophobic violence compared to other areas of South Africa. To me, this indicates that there is something unique about the local population and I want to find out what this is. It might make the study seem one-sided, but the focus of



the study is on the local people.

- 6) Does the fact that Venda is also spoken in southern Zimbabwe have any bearing on what appears to be good relationships between migrants and locals in Thohoyandou? Mr Sikhwari might want to look at this aspect in his study.
- 7) What could MSF have done better when engaging local structures of government that would help NGOs in future?

**Response**, Ms De Gruchy: My research did not look at the internal justifications for MSF (and other organisations) for getting involved. This study showed that DoH was pleased that MSF and the International Organisation for Migration (IOM) offered to help in the crisis in the Musina region, and agreed to carry on the Musina Model of Care and the handover process. During the handover process, MSF tried at every level of government (given the decentralised DoH) to ensure that MoUs at the provincial and district levels were in place, and then to work with the local sub-district authority in Musina, but this was still not enough. The big question is why, with all this in place, did things go wrong? I think we need to problematise the tendency to lean on humanitarian intervention and external actors only when responding to moments of crisis. We need to ask why, when strategies are employed to sustain programmes implemented by NGOs, these do not work. In terms of strengthening systems versus innovation, the problem with migration and health is that the systems are not migration aware. To strengthen the systems results in the continued exclusion of migrant and mobile populations. ART would not have been provided to migrant farm workers. More innovation was needed, and MSF had to do something different to DoH. I think that this case study speaks to broader trends within humanitarian interventions, noting that South Africa is a unique case study.

## Subtheme 2:

### **The New Urban Agenda: Migration, Livelihoods, Social Welfare and the Case for Integrated Development Plans**

#### **An Intersectional Approach to Study Urban Mobility Using Poetry-based Methods**

*(Dr Duduzile Ndlovu, Wits)*

The study looks at the experiences of Johannesburg as a world-class and inclusive city from the point of view of women. The approach taken was to engage with people's stories beyond the categories without specifically asking for their migrant related experiences and noting that much is lost when referring only to 'migrants' and 'non-migrants' or locals in a binary way. The research asked a question about what 'inclusive' means to women across the spectrum of mobility. Intersectionality theory poses women as the model through which all the power structures are represented within society. This is a useful way to look at how gender intersects and structures people's experiences.

An open invitation was sent to women residing in Johannesburg to participate in a poetry writing workshop on what it means to be a woman in Johannesburg. The study found that the categorised experience of a South African or Zimbabwean woman was not as prominently reflected as was the shared experience of what it means to be a women in Johannesburg, and suggested that asking research questions in a more humanising way, beyond the categories of people to seeing them as humans rather than problems, might make it possible to find a celebration of the diversity that exists among the people of Johannesburg.

#### **Discussion and Q&A**

- 1) The use of poetry to look at people's experience of day-to day living in the city is quite unique. What were the ages and demographics of the participants in the study? What will you do to eliminate stereotypical approaches?

**Response**, Dr Ndlovu: The women were between the age of 23 and the early forties, and their migration status and sexual orientation was not disclosed. The age range allowed for non-hierarchical interaction among the women. We are hoping to create spaces where people could engage honestly and openly in such a way that stereotypes are dismantled.

- 2) What was the impact of this research on the participants and how can your study contribute to the migration issue and the xenophobic crisis in this country?

**Response**, Dr Ndlovu: The women felt they learnt something new and were challenged in how they think.

The poems communicated the salient message that women experience Johannesburg differently in different times and spaces. Their experiences have nothing to do with whether or not they are migrants.

- 3) The conversations tend to happen in silos. For example, Black foreign women are often not at the centre of conversations about GBV in South Africa. How do these conversations intersect within the spaces provided by your research?

- 4) I notice in the photo of the group, how the women were dressed. Were there contestations with gendered identities and the notion of womanhood?

**Response**, Dr Ndlovu: The women dressed as they liked and some happened to wear 'doeks'.

- 5) Poetry is such a powerful tool. Is the message communicated through poetry taken as science or as an art form or entertainment?

**Response**, Dr Ndlovu: As researchers we give the impression that what we write about has a kind of finality. However, the research often leads to more questions. Poetry exposes how we construct what we write, and allows us to represent the emotional side and the complexity of an issue.

## SESSION 3: WORLD CAFÉ DISCUSSIONS

### Report Back and Discussion

#### Café 1: When refugees cannot return home, what are the attendant challenges and solutions?

*(Facilitator, Dr Mphatso Kamndaya, ACMS, Wits)*

The group identified the following challenges faced by the host country:

- A lack of resources to host refugees from other countries. To alleviate this problem, the refugees could contribute their skills by becoming productive, for example by teaching, assisting in health care, and training the workforce. Government could have a system to identify refugees with requisite skills and the areas where they are needed. Refugees could also be retrained in order to become useful to their host country.
- The likelihood of xenophobic attacks on the refugees. To prevent such incidents, both locals and refugees could be educated about how to coexist in communities and about the benefits of coexistence.
- If the circumstances in their home countries improve to the extent that refugees are able to return home, it could be difficult for them (in particular their children) as they may have settled into a new life in South Africa. In such cases, a system needs to be in place for them to be able to choose to remain in this country or they could become stateless.

- The lack of a plan to accommodate the concerns of locals as well as refugees, and ensure coordination of efforts in this regard. Such a plan is of utmost importance to avoid challenges.

**Café 2: Migration seen in an integrated manner has a lot to do with wider issues of governance and leadership. How do researchers make this linkage much more visible so as to provide lasting solutions?**

*(Facilitator, Ms Silindile Mlilo, ACMS, Wits)*

The group raised the following points around researchers' role in finding lasting solutions to issues relating to migration by highlighting the link with governance and leadership. Researchers need to:

- Have a broad understanding of the causal facts about xenophobic violence.
- Ensure that knowledge reaches the people by including communities in the presentation of findings, and give them the opportunity to propose solutions.
- Engage not only national, but also provincial and local government structures.
- Think of creative ways to communicate research findings, avoid using academic jargon and focus on appropriate timing to ensure optimal uptake of published findings.

There are instances where government departments partner with academia and request universities to conduct research in specific areas as required.

**Café 3: In the face of decolonisation and democratising of research in the African context, how do you as researchers on the continent drive, shape and lead the agenda on researching migration?**

*(Facilitator, Dr Duduzile Ndlovu, ACMS, Wits)*

The group discussions centred on:

- The meaning of decolonisation of research.
- Migration policy on the continent -which structures, what is viewed as migration.
- Viewing migration as a human-centred issue and not a race or nationality issue.
- Knowledge that is taught at school level and the changed approach to knowledge taken at university level.
- The quantification of people being used (particularly by politicians) as a tool to instigate violence and not to better their lives.
- The need to take ownership of the African story.
- The choice of topics for research being guided by scientific journals' selection for publication, and journals' tendency to not publish decolonised research.
- The purpose of doing research on migration and its impact, and ownership of the research process.
- Institutions allow very little space for researchers to negotiate concerning the research they do.
- Participants should be the most significant partners within the research process research.
- The concept of hospitality in the context of migration.



## SESSION 4: ORAL PRESENTATIONS

### Subtheme 2 (continued): The New Urban Agenda: Migration, Livelihoods, Social Welfare and the Case for Integrated Development Plans

Facilitator: Dr Tendai Chigware, University of Fort Hare

### Sustainable, Safe, Inclusive and Resilient Communities: Addressing Informal Settlements through the Lens of the Migrants

(Ms Takudzwa Charisse Taruza, NWU)

Informal settlement intervention and migration are central policy issues at the global, regional, national and local level, especially in developing countries. There is a causal relationship between these and issues pertaining to the great proportion of migrants who live in informal settlements which may affect the entire community, yet migrant issues are often ignored in efforts to improve and upgrade informal settlements in line with the Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs), and government's National Development Plan (NDP) and Breaking New Ground policy.

Affordability and inaccessibility to the formal housing markets are some of the reasons why migrants settle in informal settlements. Challenges they experience in these spaces include a lack of basic services, spatial marginalisation and high transport costs, inaccessibility of public health facilities as well as ostracism and incidents of xenophobic violence, crime and GBV, and exclusion from programmes to improve housing and decision-making processes. Migrants who live in informal settlements help develop the informal economy and provide cheap labour. Many among them possess critical skills that should be put to use. The impact of social capital and diversity towards building social resilience in informal settlements cannot be ignored.

In order to create sustainable, safe, inclusive and resilient communities in informal settlements, steps should be taken to integrate migrant issues into informal settlement upgrading programmes, by reforming policy and legislation that pertain to migrants, removing barriers to business development, supporting the informal sector, and making housing and health part of companies' Corporate Social Responsibility. Religious institutions play an important role in addressing developmental issues relating to migrants in informal settlements. Migrant communities need to be educated in and made aware of their rights in accessing health care, employment and housing. Political will to address the challenges faced by migrants and integrate the planning instruments that relate to migrant issues into informal settlement upgrading programmes, and public private partnerships need to be encouraged.

### A Tale of Static Development with a Dynamic Population

(Ms Gaofenngwe Tlalane Lethaku, World Merit South Africa (WMSA))

In 2018, the then Minister of Health, Dr Aaron Motsoaledi, attributed the failure of the health system in Gauteng Province to an influx of foreign nationals, but no statistical evidence was given to substantiate this. The research focussed on the burden on the healthcare sector experienced due to the influx of migrants, particularly to Gauteng Province, and questioned whether this was a reason for South Africa's crippling healthcare system. It also looked at whether government has done enough to meet the demands of a growing population and what can be done to address this issue.

In addition to the influx of migrants to Gauteng, South Africa's population has been growing in recent years. Even though studies show that since 2013, growing numbers of people are making use of the province's public health services, there appears to be a reluctance to develop public health infrastructure to cater for the increasing numbers of people.

Public health infrastructure in Gauteng includes four central hospitals that provide a total of about 7,000 beds. In 2017, almost 50% of child births recorded at one of the hospitals related to migrants. Non-compliance with Occupational Health and Safety regulations is a further issue that contributes to the province's crippling health system.

The research concluded that:

- The province's crippling health system could not be attributed to the influx of migrants, but is due to ageing infrastructure, minimal development and non-compliance of hospitals. Blaming the deteriorating system on migrants is an injustice.
- Although government has made strides towards improving the public health system, the current infrastructure cannot cater for the country's growing population.
- When developing and planning for the health sector, government should take into account the influx of migrants to South Africa and improve their living conditions by allowing them access to housing.
- Population growth should be at the forefront of government's planning for the future.
- Proper and inclusive planning by government can assist with the management of migration.

## Discussion and Q&A

- 1) Can you state upfront whether you are advocating for a bordered South Africa or a borderless Africa? This changes how we view the presentations and the discussions.

**Response**, Ms Lethaku: The idea of one Africa is great, and I think we should advocate for a borderless Africa as long as it is done in the proper way. Colonial borders have affected how we think and do things.

- 2) Is it an issue of poor service to migrants or is the issue that all who live in South Africa are being failed by the health sector?

**Response**, Ms Lethaku: There are many cases of health system failure in the country. The issue is about service delivery to South Africans. Across the board, the government is failing South Africans.

- 3) I would turn around the assertion made. Instead of saying that South Africa should provide better health facilities for the non-nationals crossing the borders into this country, should we not be saying that South Africa should play a better role on the continent to ensure that all countries in Africa have the health facilities necessary to serve their people?

**Response**, Ms Lethaku: South Africa should help ensure that all countries in Africa have requisite health facilities, but not before the problems with health system in this country have been resolved.

- 4) Are your findings participant based or literature related?

**Response**, Ms Taruza: It is participant based and aspects from a literature review were also included.

- 5) South Africans who live in informal settlements experience the same challenges as migrants. The issue of intersectionality has to be taken into account. What do you think should be done if the entire health sector is failing? From a developmental perspective, we cannot have a situation where improvements are intended for certain groups only (such as migrants).

- 6) Is your research conducted throughout South Africa or in a specific informal settlement? What nationalities and gender are these migrants and what are their reasons for them coming to South Africa?

**Response**, Ms Taruza: Research was conducted in a specific informal settlement within the Gauteng urban area where the migrant population comes from all over Africa. Pakistanis mostly run businesses there, but some do live in the informal settlement.

- 7) Migrants are excluded from decision-making and participation. Have you interviewed ward councillors, religious and traditional leaders, and others in the community about how they feel about non-nationals living among them? Is there hope for the migrants' integration and acceptance into the informal settlement community?

**Response**, Ms Taruza: Yes, leaders and others in the community were interviewed. This is a political matter and these people indicated to me that they would want to include migrant issues in planning processes for informal settlements. However, even though this is what they told me for purpose of my research, it was clear to me that their personal views are the opposite.

- 8) What data do you think is missing? What is the data that is needed to help strengthen the arguments and refute common misconceptions? Particularly in relation to access to healthcare, there are a lot of unsubstantiated claims and assumptions about the pressure that non-nationals place on the healthcare system. We need to be careful to recognise where there is data and where there are gaps in the data and what this means in terms of wanting to ensure appropriate planning for healthcare use. Comparing the experiences of different groups of non-nationals in relation to the experiences of South African is important. We also have to be careful about which generalisations we can and cannot make, and make sure to share data in ways that tells the story appropriately. Those involved in cross-sectional, smaller scale, qualitative work, when setting up case studies, should feel confident in owning the study and not to generalise. People doing research in the health sector will always challenge where the data comes from.

**Response**, Ms Letlhaku: In the health sector, there is a lack qualitative data from patients about their experiences as non-nationals.

**Response**, Ms Taruza: From a town planning perspective, there is lack of data that will help plan for migrants and this is a problem. An important set of data that is missing has to do with how many migrants there are in specific areas of South Africa. Migrants are very secretive about their migrant status.

- 9) Ms Taruza makes the recommendation that barriers to the informal business sector should be removed to facilitate migrants' participation in this sector. This recommendation is not valid because there is no barrier. Legislation allows migrants to do business and many businesses already operate in the informal settlements.
- 10) Ms Taruza also recommended that religious institutions should help strengthen social capital. What about the likelihood that religious institutions instigate xenophobia in informal settlements and that they are a threat to social integration?

**Response**, Ms Taruza: Religious leaders are very influential and can help disseminate helpful information to their congregants.

- 11) Given the high rate of incidents of xenophobic violence in Gauteng, do you think it is possible that 47.5% of immigrants stay in the province?

**Response**, Ms Taruza: Even if there is violence, migrants will still settle in Gauteng.



## SESSION 5: SHORT FILM

### The World Academy of Sciences Sub-Saharan Africa Regional Partner (TWAS-SAREP)

*Facilitator: Mr Kholani Mbhiza, TWAS-SAREP Secretariat*

Mr Mbhiza introduced TWAS and TWAS-SAREP. TWAS is a global science academy based in Trieste, Italy, working to advance science and engineering for sustainable prosperity in the developing world. TWAS-SAREP has been hosted by ASSAf since 2015 and is responsible for awarding prizes including the Regional Young Scientist Prize, convening regional meetings and hosting science diplomacy workshops. In order to influence how policies are formulated, young scientists are encouraged to become part of the science diplomacy workshops. Visiting scientists are offered opportunities such as fellowships and scholarships. TWAS Young Affiliates targets researchers under the age of 40 who have published at least ten publications in international journals. Social scientists in particular, are encouraged to respond to the annual call to become a TWAS Young Affiliate.

A documentary produced by TWAS, titled 'Science in Exile', focussing on cases of exiled scientists and scholars-at-risk from Syria, Iran and Iraq was aired. The short documentary focussed on academics in exile or migrant academics and the impact for science and research, and refugee scientists and their value as transnational resources. Participants were invited to reflect on the documentary in the context of Africa.

### Discussion and Q&A

- 1) The documentary provides a perspective of migration from the life of a specific group of refugees - academics and scientists who are well educated - and we see that they experience the same problems as other migrants.
- 2) It is a good thing for an academic refugee or migrant to be useful and make an effort to adapt to the host community, whether or not they are initially welcomed by that community.
- 3) Individuals need to take responsibility and ask what they can do to help when people are in crisis. As academics in a country that hosts refugee scientists, we need to think about how we will cope if we find ourselves on the other side of the border. Intellectual humility is necessary.
- 4) I observed that the situation in Africa is not unique. This is a global problem that needs global solutions. The film makes it clear that even though governments play a part, private organisations and individuals have an important role to play in supporting scientists who are refugees.
- 5) We usually only see the negative effects of migration. The documentary showed us the positive side, particularly the huge economic benefits of hosting migrants. In South Africa we tend to focus on foreigners as Black Africans whereas in fact people from all over the world come to this country and some are legal immigrants.
- 6) Last year TWAS-SAREP hosted a regional conference in Sudan. A few days later, a professor from the Sudan Academy of Sciences who was one of the conference organisers was arrested and detained for three months because, as a scientist, he raised issues about the status quo in that country. Many issues affect scientists on the continent, yet they remain silent about them. Perhaps it is time to make a documentary on xenophobia in South Africa, its impact of science and its effect on scholars-at-risk in research institutions. Young scientists are invited to give input in this regard.

- 7) I agree that documentaries are needed. These can be tools to teach students instead of leaving it up to politicians.
- 8) Currently, there is an element of structural xenophobia in our institutions of higher learning in South Africa which has not been fully explored.
- 9) South Africa's trade policy encourages foreign investment, but xenophobic violence forces big and small businesses run by foreigners to close. This increases unemployment and spreads poverty in society, which cannot be good for the country.
- 10) It is unfortunate that the only time the public hears from academics is when an academic opinion is called on for comment on the TV. Academics must be able to address issues at ground level. They must speak up and make sure that their voices are heard.

## DAY TWO

### WELCOME AND RECAP OF DAY 1

*Facilitator: A/Prof. Jo Vearey, ACMS, Wits and SAYAS Member*

A/Prof. Jo Vearey welcomed everyone to the second day of the conference and gave a brief recap of the previous day's proceedings. Some of the key issues raised were:

- The importance of data and good evidence, and the need for researchers to recognise that it is their responsibility to interrogate the information they hear about and read and to learn how to better engage with data in ways that challenge common assumptions and easy scapegoating of international migrants for failures of the State. ACMS has a range of resources that are challenging some of the assumptions, including responses to certain parts of the media where an increasingly dangerous rhetoric is developing.
- The importance of partnerships both in the research work and in the practice of how the research is translated. Many recognise this and work beyond the academia, recognising how difficult it can be to forge partnerships particularly with government departments. What is the responsibility of researchers, what does it mean when they get frustrated and when they lose faith in the system and in ways to try and engage with others?

A/Prof. Vearey suggested that participants should consider the opportunities that exist around how to embed research translation and engagement with the media, for example, and learning to write for more popular audiences. Useful resources could be collated and shared among participants.

Participants highlighted the following reflections from the previous day's proceedings:

- The conversation about how researchers can take their work into the public space and ensure that it influences policy should continue.
- The importance of interdisciplinary approaches to understanding similar problems and of presenting pragmatic examples of how migration affects people instead of relaying only theoretical assumptions.
- Research practice, what is aimed for in policy work and research translation relies on a functioning State system with structures in place to ensure that the State is listening and engaging with evidence, but this is not always the case as political rhetoric often overtakes and overshadows data.

## SESSION 6: PANEL DISCUSSION

### Migration and the Media

(Facilitator, Ms Ina Skosana, Health and Medicine Editor, The Conversation)

The Conversation works with academics who write articles. Journalists from The Conversation edit the articles and make them understandable for the general public without changing the work or impacting authorship. The researcher approves the edited article for publication by The Conversation under Creative Commons, which means that the (unchanged) articles can be re-published by other media all over the world.

The media is an important source of information for both policymakers and the public. The point of the panel discussion was to help early career researchers to understand the importance of translating research into stories that capture the attention of the general public.

#### Panellists:

**Ms Joan van Dyk**, Health reporter, Bhekisisa Centre for Health Journalism

**Mr Borrie la Grange**, Head of Communications, MSF

**Dr Kudakwashe Vonyoro**, Researcher, ACMS, Wits

1) What are the dominant narratives around healthcare and migrants?

**Response**, Dr Vonyoro: The starting point is recognising that xenophobia is happening in South Africa. As to dominant narratives, I draw mostly on the experiences of migrant users of the healthcare system. Research has eloquently documented the concern with public healthcare providers as actors that practice medical xenophobia, as term used to describe the negative attitudes and practices of healthcare providers towards refugees and migrants. It is within this framing that the debate around migration and health has its point of departure. In this narrative, the key issues focus on attitudes and not healthcare delivery. These technical definitions reflect a generalisation that also exists in public healthcare discourses around healthcare providers and how they are perceived to treat African migrants in South Africa. In this regard, there are other variables to navigate the public health system, such as age, gender, country of origin. Alternative health seeking behaviours are also missed, reflecting an assumption around what health means. A generally struggling healthcare system makes it difficult for locals as well as non-nationals to seek care. This also needs to be addressed within this debate. The result is a nationalistic narrative and not one of solidarity about who should have the right to healthcare. What is missing in such framing is convergent messaging that revolves around health and associate challenges as a common cause and common experience. From the work of colleagues, this suggests that there is what some have termed 'methodological nationalism'. The narrative pulls us towards normalising difference and doing research on 'how to better integrate 'the other' into the healthcare system and ensure that healthcare providers accept this 'other'. The negative impact of this is the normalisation of such behaviour as a social fact, closing doors for solidarity between various interlocutors who are gatekeepers and key to migrants (and locals) accessing healthcare.

**Response**, Ms van Dyk: These are the main narratives I come across:

- Politicians say things that are not true. The stories we see more often in the media are around what the Minister (or another politician) says about migrants and their burden on the health sector. Such reports are likely to come from reporters who do not have time because they have to produce a certain number of articles in a day or who are not specialists on migration and health issues and do not have the knowledge to contextualise statements made by politicians.
- Migrants are placed as either victims or heroes. This polarisation is not helpful.



- Xenophobic violence comes out of nowhere. Such narratives place migrants in the realm of anarchy and often describes them as 'mobs'. No contextualisation of the factors that caused these events is provided.
- The rights of migrants in the health sector. These stories explain that migrants have the right to healthcare.

**Response**, Mr la Grange: MSF provides healthcare to people who do not have access to it because of a disruption of the status quo due to different kinds of conflict or crisis, or in the event of healthcare exclusion or an epidemic. In the discussion about reframing a narrative, MSF is not as interested in what caused a situation as it is in understanding the situation in order to formulate a response.

MSF's migrant, asylum seeker and refugee operations started in the mid-1980s when there was an influx of Mozambican refugees along eastern border regions of the country. MSF's work focused on access to basic primary healthcare and provision of basic water and sanitation in camp settings. In the late 1990s, MSF began working on treating HIV at a time when there was no public health response to the epidemic that addressed the immediate needs. Through this work, MSF became aware of the narrative within the health system and that there was no way for migrants to interact with the healthcare system. MSF's involvement has largely been in terms of responses to acute situations where there are displacements following acts of xenophobic violence. From MSF's experience so far, there has largely been an absence of a State response and local authorities have not seen political gain from responding to these needs. Displaced migrants tend to spend short periods of time on one place making it challenging for organisations to respond to their needs. The closure of refugee centres in several cities across the country led to MSF starting a project in the City of Tshwane that focusses specifically on migrant health.

As a humanitarian organisation, it is important for MSF to do operational research, predominantly when the objective is to alleviate suffering and provide life-saving care, in order to interrogate its own practice. Qualitative and quantitative approaches are used to explore gaps (or lack of response) in access to all levels of health care, the burden of infectious and chronic diseases, aspects of environmental health, and health challenges relating to increased global migration. MSF conducts basic market research activities because it is important to keep track of how sentiment in society shifts over time or between particular groups. One such activity recently found that young South Africans have a significantly more positive perception of supporting migrants and supporting organisations that do such work.

The work of a communication professional within a humanitarian organisation is often focused on advocacy and communication. The approach taken is to make a statement and present the facts supported by evidence, while researchers usually build a case that leads to a conclusion. When researchers interact with the world and want to get messages into the public sphere and influence policymakers, they should consider utilising that approach, provoking thought and adding value through how the argument is unpacked.

Researchers and journalists need not only state the problem but also show potential solutions. Organisations such as MSF need to partner with solution based journalists to find ways to interrogate assumptions, present the facts and generate space for a conversation about potential solutions and offer the practical implications.

## 2) How can creating counter-narratives help change the dominant narratives?

**Response**, Dr Vonyoro: From doing fieldwork in Musina and Johannesburg, I found that frontline providers may be inclusive in counter-intuitive ways and this inclusion may be pronounced in contexts that are known to be typically discriminatory towards certain groups.

Referring to the graph that ranks priorities in terms of causes supported by medical professionals in South Africa in Mr la Grange's presentation, how do we bring the least prioritised causes

into the narrative of universal care such that we move beyond talking about people as migrants, non-nationals or locals, to talking of them as sick humans in need of treatment? Also, how do we create a public healthcare argument?

The idea of therapeutic citizenship came out in my research. This has to do with people meeting and talking with each other in the queue to collect their medication from a facility. This is a way of connecting and engaging that is not necessarily based on nationality. The different sections in a facility tend to provide varying qualities of treatment and levels of discrimination. In Musina, I also found innovation on the frontline, with some healthcare providers making an effort to speak migrants' languages and so on. Acknowledging what is happening on the frontline could help move away from over-dependence on policies and focus concerns of humanitarian organisations towards people on the ground rather than policymakers. It is also about deconstructing the social construction of the State as if it has keys to everything and thinking about how frontline bureaucrats are also able to speak back to policies that do not work or do not sit well with their values.

Lastly, it is important to understand particular spaces and contexts and how these relate to how migrants are treated and who gets access to what, at what time. More ethnographic research in public healthcare systems is needed in order to understand the points of interaction and so on. It is not good enough for a researcher to go to a facility and interview a few migrants and then come back and say you have done a study on public access to healthcare. You also need to adopt observing approaches to see what is really happening on the ground.

**Response,** Ms van Dyk: Context is important in changing the dominant narratives. Unfortunately, a solutions-based article takes a lot of time - about three weeks. What makes such stories powerful is the proper evaluation of the research behind the problem in order to see what causes the problem and what factors influence it. However, many reporters do not have enough time to do this.

Another constraint to changing the narrative is the lack of knowledge about jargon. In a conversation with a journalist, it is useful for a researcher to explain why certain terms and phrases should not be used. For example, 'illegal immigrant' should be avoided and 'undocumented person' used instead. This could start changing the way that journalists write. Some of my work on migration is about what goes on at the Lindela Repatriation Centre. One of the difficult things I found was that whistle blowers are often constrained in providing information. This is a barrier to reporting.

Bhekisisa is consistent in its efforts to look at who reads and how much time people spend reading the stories it publishes, and conducts social media analytics. There appears to be a lack of data available to reporters because many of them reference the 2011 Census when it comes to figures relating to migrants in South Africa. People do not know where to get proper data. Bhekisisa is very serious about the important aspect of being able to explain how the statistics used were derived, the limitations of the statistics and so on.

**Response,** Mr la Grange: I am aware that reporters are not experts and rely on experts who sometimes have their own agendas. It is difficult for reporters to navigate that space and they need to be responsible in this regard, and be aware of the pitfalls of the incredibly fast news agenda. In order to have a thorough conversation that is thought provoking and challenges people and some of the narratives at different levels, it is necessary to disrupt the fast news agenda. It is useful to call up a newsroom and ask about the stories they are doing. There are a lot more generalists nowadays and an overreliance on reporting on political developments rather than on what the socio-economic real-life consequences are for actual human beings. It is a tragedy for the South African society and the public discourse that there are not more institutions like Bhekisisa that thoroughly scrutinise the health beat.

When choosing words to describe a set of people, it is preferable to refer to people as 'human beings' rather than 'population'.



Do we want to reframe the narrative at a national or international level? In MSF's experience, it is better to figure out which level will have the greatest impact and focus on that so that the problem can be broken down into manageable spheres and it does not become overwhelming. It is important to remember who you are speaking to, what they know, what you know about their mindset and who else plays a critical role in terms of informing the way in which you could shape their understanding of a situation, or what other networks you can generate from them that are reliable and trustworthy to further a discussion. This will help avoid resorting to rhetoric.

## Discussion and Q&A

- 1) Identities and representation of migrants is a key element in cancelling dominant narratives, as is research on migrant story-telling practices with institutions and communities about issues of service delivery, its efficiencies and how it affects migrants' lives and livelihoods. There are backlashes to migration from anti-globalisation forces and populist rhetoric. Netnographic research (an online research method originating in ethnography, is understanding social interaction in contemporary digital communications contexts) could be used to assess the public's views.

**Response**, Mr la Grange: Using market research, MSF collected data on the perceptions of 18 to 35 year olds about healthcare issues. To turn this into a communications piece it was decided to do interviews with people on the street. Filming the respondents meant that they were identified and therefore their responses were moderated. The anonymity of social media assists in generating toxic and sometimes venomous discussion with no accountability. Can this be taken as a valid barometer of the public view? What is required is to generate spaces where people can have one-on-one conversations with other human beings instead of conversing through a mediated, performative social media 'show'. It is a very seductive idea to use netnographic research to steer public opinion in a certain direction through data and artificial intelligence but we need to remember to generate spaces where people can have real conversations together and not feel that their view might prejudice them in some way. It is a challenge to do this.

**Response**, Dr Vonyoro: The frustration has to do with how the debate gets reduced to a debate about numbers, the politics of numbers and rights. Several notable papers have been written about this. To some extent, academia and civil society involved in migration issues have had to stoop down to the level of this game that politicians play. The bottom line is about what must be done to ensure that these people get access to healthcare for the public health safety of everyone. The ethical component of big data (and doing that kind of research) needs to be critically engaged with. We need to be aware of the limitations of numbers and categories and the kind of politics that emerges from using these as barometers.

- 2) Although the narratives presented by the panellists relate to South Africa, they do not consider local, academic and government narratives of what the migration issue is all about and how to deal with it. A holistic approach is needed to address the issue of migration.

**Response**, Dr Vonyoro: I agree that there is a need to talk about particular narratives. The panellists presented academic narratives and some of those in the public sphere that attempt to counter xenophobic statements.

- 3) The lack of reliable data, specifically in the African context is a real problem. The existing data has a lot of limitations. The information that is available does not provide sufficient evidence of migration from other African countries into South Africa.
- 4) My main focus is on the media itself and how it portrays its role as a watchdog for society. Journalists cannot be trusted nowadays. Headings of articles contradict the content of the articles. Young people only look at the headlines.



This creates a very bad narrative. What are your organisations doing to reach ordinary citizens?

**Response**, Dr Vonyoro: I view social media with a bit of pessimism mainly because of the re-emergence of similar hierarchies that we are trying to dismantle. It also misrepresents the agency of particular narratives that come from Africa or South Africa. There is a bundling of narratives that legitimise some of the actions African leaders have been doing for years, as if they are European imports. This means that valid opinions get erased and marginalised depending on the number of 'likes' and 're-Tweets'. What the impact of research means in this age of social media is a bigger conversation that is happening in academia. There is a need to go back to having conversations on the ground that bring about change instead of being caught up in the alternative media hype that goes nowhere.

**Response**, Ms van Dyk: It is about approaching the right people and calling different newsrooms to find out what their readership is. Our social media, as with the headlines we use, goes through a lot of editing. The ethical process is very lengthy and focuses on making sure we do not tap into inflammatory narratives on social media.

**Response**, Mr la Grange: The means whereby we share our suspicions have changed massively. Does this threaten the position that journalists and the media have to hold people to account and keep citizens informed? It is important to bring history into contemporary discussions. There is benefit in looking back in time and it is useful to do comparisons. This is missing in the fast pace of journalism.

- 5) Researchers use technical terms when they speak to reporters and sometimes information gets lost in translation. There are ways that researchers can work with reporters to get their message across in an accurate manner. How can researchers engage reliably with the media?

**Response**, Ms van Dyk: If you have given an interview, make sure you see your quotes before they go to print. All publications will not give you the whole article but will allow you to change any misquotes. When interacting with journalists, explain the importance of not using stigmatised words and phrases, and use the opportunity to provide important historical context to your work.

**Response**, Mr la Grange: Researchers need to tell their stories (about their research) as if they are telling them to their mothers. This way they are able to picture telling the story to someone they trust and will break down the issue in a way that it can be understood. Look for a suitable individual when approaching journalists to share your story with.

## SESSION 7: ORAL PRESENTATIONS

### Subtheme 3:

#### **Re-imagining Migration: Big Data and Opportunities for Technological and Scientific Innovation**

*Facilitator: Prof Kanshukan Rajaratnam, University of Cape Town (UCT) and SAYAS Member*

#### **Migration, the Socio-Economic and Political Development: The South African Experience**

*(Mr Andrew Osehi Enaifoghe, University of Zululand)*

Migration has become a global phenomenon, which continues to develop daily. According to the International Organisation for Migration's World Migration Report (2018), there are over 244 million international migrants, which represent about 3.3% of the global population. Though the world has become interconnected economically, South Africa's economy, politics and society

have systematically undergone shaping through its efforts to control or restrict foreigners over recent years. South Africa's various approaches and struggle to control immigration into the country, has not only undermined migration but continue to shape its politics, economy, and the society as well in the global system. Despite the need for improved policy responses to human mobility, reform is hindered by lack of capacity, misinformation, and anti-migrant sentiments within and outside of government. This article summarizes the trends and pressures by providing an overview of the limited demographic and socio-economic data available on migration. Doing so highlights the spatialized aspects of human mobility, trends centred on and around the country's socio-economic benefits. It finds significant potential developments in international migrants' skills and entrepreneurialism. Despite these potential benefits, there are severe impediments to migration. These include a renewed South African populism; the influence of a strong anti-trafficking lobby; promoting stricter border controls; poor implementation capacity; and endemic corruption among police and immigration officials. After two decades of a democratic system of government, the understanding in terms of development and movement of individuals into, out of and within South Africa has been constrained, primarily because of an absence of proficient information. South Africa as a nation, encounter the migration of its people rather to more developed nations outside Africa continent, like the United Kingdom, United State of America, Australia, and so on (World Bank, 2011). Migration can be viewed as an instrument of development, which can possibly encourage economic development and further promote both social and political opportunity; it might likewise, in its procedure, ruin economies, and make social precariousness and disorder. Results of movement for a sending nation, like South Africa include brain drain and loss of skills.

A qualitative method was used for this study and the data was collected from secondary sources and then analysed. Some of the findings of the research were:

- Immigration remained a formidable agent of demographic growth in the United States. Some of the literature shows that accessibility to the workforce means that firms invest in order to expand their productive capacity and build more establishments. Therefore, the productive capacity (capital) per worker grew the US economy at a constant rate during the period from 1960 to 2009, and the capital per worker was higher when immigration was at its peak before the immigration boom began around 2013. Migration helped to stabilise the local economy and decrease the mismatch between demand for and supply of labour and increased the size and number of firms providing investment opportunities.
- The theory of migration and economic growth was applied to put the study in the right perspective. The macroeconomic effects of immigration are complex, and it is unclear whether per capita incomes will increase as a result of immigration, although the literature shows that there is probably a small positive effect on GDP per capita from immigration. It is suggested that the economic contribution of immigrant workers amounts to between 8.9% and 9.1% GDP, which is just below their share in employment (9.2), based on a broad production framework, which subsequently means that migrant workers raise GDP per capita in South Africa (Bodvarsson and van den Berg, 2013). The paper aims to explain the circumstances in which a migrant could increase the level of income per head in a country. The key components of such analysis are the contribution and costs of the migrant's own income, the effects on wider income generation and wider benefits (social and cultural), as well as fiscal costs and benefits.
- Immigrants, particularly those who bring skills, are seen to have contributed to South Africa's economy. The issue of migration requires a national approach involving key players from government as well as business. South Africa should develop a special exchange agreement with neighbouring states where feasible and would be of mutual benefit. Viable approaches and policies relating to border control are necessary.
- It is anticipated that the Global Compact on Migration will lead to global cohesion and encourage the acceptance of migrants and refugees in countries of their destination.



## A Framework for Modelling Conflict-induced Forced Migration According to an Agent-based Approach

(Ms Christa De Kock, Stellenbosch University)

Forced migration has evolved into a complex and diversified global crisis and speaks of over 65 million people being forcibly displaced due to violence, conflict, fear of persecution and human rights violations. The problem is the lack of adequate and complete data in the context of conflict induced forced migration.

The aim of the research was to create a generic framework to aid in developing agent-based models that simulate conflict and localised decision-making, and produce an output that illustrates large-scale migration patterns to help understand the movement of forcibly displaced people and predict anticipated destinations and numbers.

In general, social science theories drives the development of conceptual theoretical models. Privacy and ethically derived data are used as input to create computational models based on the conceptual models in order to perform model analysis and prediction. The model analysis may be validated by social science theories as well as generate new social science theories.

The three main elements of modelling forced migration are the nature and spread of conflict, the population density and distribution, as well as decision-making of people with respect to their movement. The Conflict-Induced Forced Migration Modelling using an Agent-based Approach (CoFMMA) framework can be used by computational modellers to develop a simulation model based on a certain country or region. Its phases of development are:

- *Phase 1 - Formulation:* A particular conflict situation and movement types are selected, and an initial investigation is performed.
- *Phase 2 - Conceptualisation:* Assumptions and limitations of the conflict, the population and its movement decision making are stated as part of conceptual modelling, which goes hand-in-hand with data collection and follows an iterative process. Data with respect to the conflict, the population and factors influencing their movement decision making are collected.
- *Phase 3 - Model development:* An appropriate software environment is selected, the conflict, people and movement decision-making are modelled, and a graphic user interface is developed. As the model is constructed, it is continuously verified and refined.
- *Phase 4 - Model execution:* This phase entails the experimental design, model output analysis and validation of the model developed.
- *Phase 5 - Documentation:* Theories are generated, and recommendations are given to policymakers and other key role-players.

The CoFMMA framework was validated by a model concept demonstrator in the context of Syria.

## Immigration in the Age of Digital Methodologies

(Mr Phathutshedzo Maxwell Ramukhadi, South African Centre for Digital Language Resources, NWU)

The study is based on an ongoing project and aims to showcase the linguistic richness and diversity in the country, explore the use of new digital methodologies (such as Glossopticon Virtual Reality (VR), and help government visualise the patterns of migration based on languages spoken. South Africa is home to 58 million people speaking 11 official languages (and dialects), as well as several foreign languages spoken by migrants.

VR can be used to visualise and contextualise the story of immigration in South Africa. The purpose of VR is to allow a person to experience and manipulate the environment as if it were the real world. Data visualisation assists in providing an overview of problems and is easier to understand



and provides clear ways of communicating research findings. Statistical data is needed to be able to use VR in this sense.

Glossopticon VR, a methodology developed by Australian researchers, has been used to visualise more than 1,500 languages in the Pacific region and can be adapted to a variety of projects. Languages are mapped by location and number of speakers, and there is a mix of recorded voices of many of the languages. It is designed to be viewed on a VR headset, though it can be viewed on desktop or mobile devices. It will be used to map and sonify the different languages spoken in South Africa, including those spoken by immigrants.

The Glossopticon VR project could be a tool for government to manage the situation optimally where focused planning as VR will enable relevant government departments to better visualise the nationalities that have migrated into areas of South Africa and the reasons for the migration. It can also be used to show where immigrants are most concentrated, their level of education and skills and other details.

## Discussion and Q&A

- 1) From the statement made by Mr Enaifoghe, I got the impression that he does not have the background to some of the issues relating to border porosity on South Africa's borders. There are big gaps in the research particularly to do with the contribution of migrants to the various sectors.

**Response**, Mr Enaifoghe: The study did not address border porosity. But due to time constraints, I could not explain all the processes of migration and policies that guide it according to international law and practice. However, more details on the subject area around immigrant and the socio-economic development have been addressed in the paper. To clarify things, my presentation mainly focussed on the contribution of migrants to the economy in South Africa particularly, and of course the US and Canada are big benefactors of foreign migrants. This study does not ignore the fact that migration also comes with some problems, but the potential benefits outweighed the negativity, as seen in my presentation in the case of South Africa.

- 2) The modelling presented by Ms de Kock was interesting and could have extended to other aspects of migration beyond forced migration. What kind of data is brought into the model?

**Response**, Ms de Kock: The framework is developed in such a way that you can decide to focus on any one of the movement types, such as refugees. We use statistical data and census data initially, to determine the demographics of a population. When it comes to what drives a person to migrate, there are no quantitative data based on demographics, so we speak to subject matter experts to derive an equation that guides inclinations. All these factors are brought together to come up with a probability of migrating. In essence, qualitative data are quantified. Simulation modelling and the agent-based approach allow for randomness that fills in for exact data, when it does not exist.

- 3) Ms de Kock's model focusses on what drives people from their home countries but not on the pull factors of migrating?

**Response**, Ms de Kock: Push and pull factors are both important and considered. There is a very broad range of pull factors. It was interesting to note, for example, that internally displaced migrants have different pull factors that carry different weights than those relating to a refugee or undocumented migrant. It is important to capture the factors and associated weights. In the conflict model demonstrating Syria, for example, internally displaced migrants had three main pull factors.

- 4) How does the data that is brought into the VR system differ from what Stats SA produces from a census, for example?

Response, Mr Ramukhadi: The project we are busy with also has a technical part that involves computational linguists which decides on what data needs to be used. We are going to have a digital representation of all language spoken in South Africa, and also have a record of how these languages sound like in different region The role that we language researchers play in the project is to focus on languages.

## **Subtheme 4:**

### **Social Capital, Resilience and Social Networks among Migrant Groups**

*Facilitator: Prof. Kanshukan Rajaratnam, UCT and SAYAS Member*

### **Deconstructing the 'Other': A Critical Analysis of West African Diaspora's Modes of Citizenship in Post-Apartheid South Africa**

*(Ms Ijeoma Opara, UCT)*

The current Master's thesis research addressed the question of how West African migrants' identity interplays with transnational migration in the South African context. The research objectives are to:

- Analyse the intersecting identities of West African migrants in host communities within the South African framework of citizenship
- Re-examine conceptualisations of citizenship through a transnational lens
- Understand the nuances, patterns and behaviours of West African diaspora's integration in South African communities.

The theoretical and conceptual framework addresses transnationalism and identity (political, economic and ethnic/cultural), with the intention of going beyond the idea of migration simply being about people moving across borders to look at migration in terms of movement of labour, capital and social groupings that form outside of rigid definitions, and the interdisciplinary approach to understanding migration. Addressing transnationalism will involve a critique of the role of the State in terms of how it utilises migration as a tool to serve geo-political interests.

A qualitative approach will be used in the research, with data being collected through interviews with 20 participants from West African countries and a literature review on transnational migration in the African context. It is anticipated that analysing the intersecting identities within West African communities and South Africa will shed light into the multiple ways that diasporic mobilities have the potential to inform the understanding of State citizenship and beyond.

### **Illuminating "threats" and "enhancers" of Social Cohesion between African Immigrants and South African Nationals in Gauteng Province, South Africa**

*(Dr Jonathan Oshupeng Maseng, NWU)*

A dominant narrative among migration scholars is the undue on the negative perspectives of migration and the negative outcomes of contact between South Africans and immigrants from other African countries. However, it is not necessarily the case that contact between South Africans and immigrants is consistently prone to have conflict as an outcome.

The study aimed to illuminate the "threats" and/or "enhancers" to social cohesion between immigrants and South African nationals. Gauteng Province was chosen as a case study because of its relatively high proportion of foreign nationals and also due to the fact that it is one of the provinces that experiences the highest number of xenophobic incidents and attacks towards African immigrants in the country.

There is a wide range of literature on positive as well as negative outcomes of migration. When it comes to the migration-conflict nexus, it is well-known that competition over resources and



identity differences are a barrier to coexistence between immigrants as well as nationals in South Africa and other parts of the world. From the literature on the migration-social cohesion nexus, the main indicators against which social cohesion are measured are reciprocity, trustworthiness, tolerance and interethnic relations. As such there is substantial scholarly contribution to the negative impacts of migration on social cohesion between immigrants and nationals, noting that some of these (such as diversity) can be a source of social cohesion between immigrants and nationals, particularly when there is frequent contact between these groups.

The theoretical foundation of the study is based on the theories of contact and of economic competition. Positive contact was used to analyse “enhancers” to social cohesion between South African nationals and African immigrants in the study area. While, negative contact and economic competition were used to analyse “threats” to social cohesion between these groups. A qualitative research method was used, with 50 African immigrants and 35 South Africans interviewed to gain a deeper understanding of what they consider ‘threats’ to and/or ‘enhancers’ of social cohesion between African immigrants and South African nationals. Sunnyside (a suburb of Pretoria) was chosen as the research site. From the narratives of the sampled respondents the following was revealed:

- Relations between the immigrants and nationals are overwhelmingly congenial, partly due to the fact that most small immigrant businesses depend on a predominantly South African clientele.
- These business entities fill crucial gaps in the socio-economic environment South Africans.
- Since African immigrants operate businesses which are supported by South Africans, there is existence of positive service provider-client relations.
- It is these service provider-client relations that serve as ‘enhancers’ of social cohesion in the study area (meaning that positive contact exists between the two groups).
- While on the other hand, the relative dominance of immigrants in the small business sector serves as a ‘threat’ to social cohesion due to the element of economic competition (which suggest that this is negative contact).

From the narratives of respondents, we conclude that contact between immigrants and nationals is not necessarily inherently conflict-inducing, and that the logic of mutual dependence does determine social cohesion. In the context of the study area, service provider-client relations between African immigrants and South Africans is one of the major enhancers to social cohesion between these groups.

Policy recommendations emanating from the study are:

- The NDP should be revised to take into account policy consideration for social cohesion between South Africans and immigrants, particularly African immigrants due to the reason that it is silent in terms of advocating for social cohesion between the two groups sharing similar spaces of existence.
- South African migration policy frameworks should consider the socio-economic and political factors fuelling xenophobia across various host communities. The policy framework should focus on dealing with the causes of xenophobia while also providing policy positions to curb xenophobia.
- Government’s Green Paper on Migration should take into account the integration of all categories of immigrants in order to establish social cohesion between immigrants and South Africans.
- Since there is no clear policy direction in the NDP and the Department of Arts and Culture social cohesion strategy in terms of fostering social cohesion between South Africans and African immigrants, the South African government through its various departments should develop an integrated policy framework dealing with social cohesion between South Africans and immigrants in order to eliminate policy variation.



- Government should implement the resolutions and programmes of action from the World Conference against Racism, Racial Discrimination, Xenophobia and Related Intolerance, held in this country in 2001 (See this link for details of the indicated conference: [https://www.ohchr.org/Documents/Publications/Durban\\_text\\_en.pdf](https://www.ohchr.org/Documents/Publications/Durban_text_en.pdf)).

## Discussion and Q&A

- 1) Dr Maseng should note that immigrants to South Africa are not only from other African countries and indicate the enhancers and threats to coexistence beyond African immigrants within the South African context.

**Response**, Dr Maseng: Xenophobic violence is predominantly focused towards African immigrants hence the focus on relations between African immigrants and South African nationals residing in similar spaces across South African communities. Hence, various scholars refer to this as “Afro-phobia” due to fact that attitudes and physical confrontation is directed to African immigrants mostly. The challenges at socio-economic level that most South Africans experience coupled with the failure of the State to provide for its citizens have led to an environment where African immigrants and most South African nationals living in similar spaces contest for resources and economic opportunities. In addition, migrants of African origin have become scapegoats for all the socio-economic problems faced by citizens of this country.

- 2) Are migrants from other African countries united or do they prefer to associate only with their countrymen?

**Response**, Dr Maseng: It depends. Immigrants are not all the same. Those in different areas of the country are in different social environments. Ethnographic studies will discover that immigrants are not only united among themselves but there are lots of social relations between African immigrants and South Africans. They all mingle. There are instances where Zimbabweans (for example) do not mingle with South Africans. Understanding this is a complex matter which might include even language barriers (which could also serve as a threat to social cohesion). In some cases, language proximity or people of similar languages are able to coexist. For instance, the Swatis from Swaziland do not have challenges of language barrier in South Africa because they are able to communicate fluently with South African Swatis, Zulus or even Xhosas. Language fluency then becomes a social cohesion enhancer.

- 3) Dr Maseng mentioned the Green Paper on Migration, which I have read. It seems that there is going to be a shift from a Eurocentric to an Afrocentric component in the legislation. Do you think that this will solve the problems of social cohesion?

**Response**, Dr Maseng: Government has not committed to an Afrocentric approach to social cohesion. Xenophobic attitudes and attacks are not a new phenomenon in South Africa; however, instead of having government-oriented action to address social cohesion challenges between South Africans and African immigrants, we only see reactions upon instances of these attacks.

## **Subtheme 5:**

### **Researching Migration: Developing an African Agenda for Africa**

*Facilitator: Prof Amos Saurombe, UNISA and SAYAS member*

### **Shared Complicities, Decolonisation and Collective Futures of West African Borders**

*(Dr Komlan Agbedahin, University of Free State (UFS))*

The current border predicaments in Africa, West Africa in particular, originate from the Peace of Westphalia, a series of peace treaties among various European countries dating back to 1648, dealing with the territorial redistribution in Europe. The scramble for Africa began at the Berlin Conference in 1884 - 1885 when European powers projected the division, occupation and colonisation of Africa, creating arbitrary borders and 'dismembering' the continent to bring about European 'enclaves'. Although a more recent scramble for Africa involves various powers from the East and the West and focusses on the sought-after resources the continent has to offer, the initial division of Africa led to numerous challenges related to security, border conflict, illegal cross-border activities, border porosity and regional integration. This study seeks to contribute to the debate germane to these complexities.

The aim of the research is to examine the nexus between complicities, decolonisation and collective futures of West African borders. A qualitative approach is used, and data is collected from document analysis, interviews, personal communication and observation. The legacy of coloniality, observed in excerpts from communication between border users and immigration officers, helped identify channels of complicity and coloniality in relation to the management of West African borders. The preliminary findings suggest the following pathways to the collective futures of borders:

- 'Re-membling' Africa (e.g. Ngugi wa Thiong'o, 1994)
- Decolonisation of borders on micro and macro levels
- Unveiling contemporary mechanisms, architects and conduits of the coloniality of borders in Africa (e.g. Ndlovu-Gatsheni, 2013).
- Identifying and addressing the pervasive border imperialism, internal colonialism, and coloniality of being (individual, institutional and state levels) (e.g. Walia, 2013; Santos, 2014; Afailal & Fernandez, 2018; Buxton & Akkerman, 2018; Ndlovu-Gatsheni, 2018).

### **The Decolonisation of Immigration: Immigration that Supports the African Agenda**

*(Ms Michelle Beeslaar, University of Pretoria (UP))*

The research reflects on whether South Africa's current immigration trajectory is in line with the AU's Agenda 2063 and if not, how South Africa and other African states start to decolonise their institutional governance cultures to create innovative immigration mechanisms that supports the African peace and development agenda. The study uses research methods of qualitative science, including participatory action research, literature review, key informant interviews and focus groups.

Unlike most other African countries that detain asylum seekers and keep refugees in camps, South Africa allows them free movement. This is both a gift and a curse because there are no interim support mechanisms. South Africa needs Africa, its investors, its markets, its tourists and all the potential it has to drive local Small and Medium Enterprises (SMEs), which will transform the South African economy. Politicians and the public are quick to blame the DHA and it is true that the legislation and policies are outdated. The DHA is however exceptionally under-resourced and most of its budget is allocated towards citizens. Immigration is not a priority. This raises the question about how the country's immigration imperatives should be framed within its African commitments.

Decolonisation is about a lot more than simply purge or inclusion, and requires a serious conversation. In 1993, Schutte looked at the philosophical concepts of ontology and epistemology through an African perspective. He emphasised that the Anglo-American approach to political philosophy was clinically scientific and technological. By these very virtues, it reinforced colonial constructs as it did not sufficiently acknowledge local context (indigenous knowledge). In 2007, Torres linked the philosophy to political science reminding us of the theories developed in the 1950s. In 2009, Nobel Peace Prize winner Wangari Maathai, wrote that the leadership challenges in independent Africa could be attributed to amongst other factors colonialism and post-colonial governance structures. Maathai further explained that the Berlin Conference of 1884/5 in which European powers carved up Africa, resulted in the skewed development of Africa to promote European dominance by using Africa's raw materials to drive their industrialisation. In 1959, Frantz Fanon advocated that independence was not a gift from colonisers and that radical transformation had to occur in the hands and minds of Africans themselves.

Over six decades later, there is still no common decolonial theory. It is argued that the immigration system fails, not simply due to corruption or negligence, but because it was never properly deconstructed post-1994. The AU Agenda 2063 states that Africa needs to be united and borderless. South Africa's government has agreed to the Agenda 2063 yet vacillates when these sentiments are echoed by opposition parties.

Better discourse and information on what decolonisation entails, what it means to destigmatise 'being African', and the incorporation of indigenous knowledge into the immigration system are needed. The importance of taking this step, particularly as several relevant White Papers are in the final stages of development, is of utmost importance.

## **The Socio-Economic Effects of Urban Migration within the Context of Africa**

*(Mr Nkululeko Shabalala, University of KwaZulu-Natal (UKZN))*

The objectives of the study were to comprehend push factors of migration, investigate social relations between South African nationals and foreign nationals, survey economic participation and explore policymaking processes within the context of collaborative governance. The City of eThekweni was used as a case study. The quantitative method of research was used to observe how local and regional migration affects individuals and secondary data was sourced mainly from the internet and libraries. The main advantage of this was that it provided quick data collection, and the elimination of bias was ensured by not providing scope for personal comment.

The World Systems Theory provides a macro-analysis relating to socio-economic and political factors and stresses the role of disruption and dislocations in peripheral parts of the world including Africa as a result of colonialism and capitalist expansion. To properly address the micro-analysis, Afrocentric theory sought to fill the gap that has been neglected in global politics - the philosophy of Ubuntu. The urgent need for institutional transformation in Africa to address issues pertaining to migration and mobility is the AU's main focus. A collective approach to principles is essential. The inability of African regional trading blocks to stimulate trade among each other has been a major hindrance in terms of intra-African trade. The movement of goods is impossible without the movement of people. The introduction of African passports by the AU will allow such movement and it is anticipated that this will help deal with social relations between foreign and local nationals within States. In 2015, King Zwelitini stated that it was unacceptable that locals had to compete with foreign nationals for economic opportunities and called for foreign nationals to be deported. Some of his subjects heeded this call and blamed foreign nationals for high levels of crime. Several NGOs that are active in the city of eThekweni have tried to resolve the scourge of xenophobia and criminality through social programmes.

Recommendations:

- A more inclusive approach to foreign and local policymaking through collaborative governance is vital.



- Sport can be viewed as a central element in building social cohesion.
- Young scientists on the continent should ensure that they continue providing scientific based solutions and take full responsibility in the quest for more collaborative governance in policymaking processes and the implementation thereof. They should also ensure that a holistic approach in research on migration takes centre stage.

In conclusion it is argued that:

- Capitalism encourages the movement of people.
- In relation to social cohesion, South African nationals are not necessarily xenophobic, but the government has elements of xenophobia due to the exclusion of foreign nationals in local structures. In some instances, narrow and unguided nationalism tend to prevail among South African nationals.
- Education is devoted to participating in economic activities.
- Inter-departmental capacity and structures have assisted higher education institutions in facilitating training and transfer of skills by foreign nationals.

## Discussion and Q&A

- 1) How will the African passport help realise a borderless Africa where there is freedom of movement?

**Response**, Mr Shabalala: The passport will help reduce the application process for asylum seekers and refugees.

- 2) How do we talk about decolonisation without addressing the challenges of global dependency?

**Response**, Ms Beeslaar: Wangari Maathai talks about this in terms of African collaborators. The colonisers left behind a system of collaborators to assist them to keep the entrenched system of their hierarchical extraction methods. I have difficulty with United Nations (UN) agencies (for example) and who they choose to fund in terms of research institutes and civil society, and motivation behind that. Looking at where the funding goes geographically raises question about whether this reinforces the mentality of Africans keeping other Africans in slavery with pass systems. This conversation, as uncomfortable as it is, is something that researchers need to iteratively reflect on.

**Response**, Dr Agbedahin: This question raises the issue of border externalisation, whereby European powers 'invade' the privacy of African countries and influence the design of policies and migration frameworks. International politics is a rough space, but the issue of dependency syndrome is well calculated and necessitates about the systematic questioning of the authenticity of institutions in Africa. We do not pay attention to the power imbalances. The crux of my presentation is to deal with coloniality. The legacies of colonialism are real. 'Borderlessness' also has to do with the mindset of how we see people who come from other countries, that is, as 'populations' or 'human beings'.

## **Subtheme 6:**

### **Gender, Health and Migration**

*Facilitator: Prof Amos Saurombe, UNISA and SAYAS member*

#### **African Immigrant and Refugee Families' Perceptions on Informational Support and Health Status: A Comparison of African Immigrants living in South Africa and the US**

*(Mr Michael Belebema, UWC)*

The relationship between migration and health is complex, and its impact varies considerably among individuals, across migrant groups, and from country to country. Immigrant communities in the US and South Africa have increased rapidly over the past two decades, yet little is known about the health experiences of this growing population. Research has shown that conditions of migration increase vulnerability to ill health and low-income immigrant families face disproportionate barriers in accessing health care and are at greater risk of living in poverty.

The objective of the study was to examine and compare the perceptions of African refugees and immigrants to South Africa and the US on informational support and its impact on health status (general health perceptions). The Patient-reported Outcomes Measurement Information System (PROMIS), a standard for measuring health outcomes from the patient's perspective was used, as well as a Health Perception Index (HPI) to estimate their health perception and the Information Support Index (ISI) to estimate whether there is a relationship between the information support and the HPI. Data was drawn from migrants living in Cape Town, South Africa and Columbia, Missouri in the US using purposive sampling.

About 128 respondents (62 in the US and 66 in South Africa) were successfully interviewed using a structured survey questionnaire.

Conclusions of the study were:

- The HPI was significantly different between the cities, with migrants in South Africa having a better HPI despite the average HPI of <3.
- The overall ISI was relatively above average which is equivalent to  $\geq 3$  in the scale. However, there was no significant evidence to show differences in ISI between the study areas.
- Immigrants' access to information support is the same for both countries and is higher than the scale average of 3. Thus, immigrants tend to have a higher propensity to information.
- There is a need for multidisciplinary collaboration around theoretical and practical migrant health matters.

#### **Intersectional Factors Contributing to the Vulnerability of Young Zimbabwean Female Immigrants in Johannesburg**

*(Dr Rachel Chinyakata, University of Venda)*

With the advent of the feminisation of migration, large numbers of women are migrating as the main economic providers. Most international migration policies regard the breadwinner as male. Migration literature and theories are patriarchal in nature and there is still a conventional belief that women migrate for marriage. However, migration can never be a gender-neutral phenomenon and should rather be perceived as a gender-specific phenomenon. In order to minimise vulnerability of female immigrants it was important to understand multiple factors that contribute to their vulnerability. The study employed the intersectionality approach which explains the specific experiences of women on the basis of gender, age, race, class, ability, sexual orientation, nationality, religion and how they interact simultaneously and are shaped by one another.

A qualitative research approach was used with data collection through in-depth individual interviews and focus group discussions with young Zimbabwean female immigrants in selected areas of Johannesburg. The findings identified the following factors that contribute to the vulnerability of young, female Zimbabwe immigrants:

- Economic factors: Competition over job opportunities, poverty and desperation, and type of work.
- Lack of protection: Fear to approach institutions, including SAPS, unresponsiveness of organisations to their real needs and lack of implementation of laws.
- Governance factors: Strict requirements of the Immigration Act made it difficult to acquire documentation. The negative attitude of political leaders towards immigrants is adopted and acted upon by their followers.
- Personal factors:
  - Lack of education: The women find employment in the informal sector and lower paid jobs often characterised by abuse and exploitation.
  - Gender: Employment in traditionally feminine occupations exposes the women to abuse.
  - Language: Failure to speak local languages in South Africa makes them easily identifiable and victimisation is a common occurrence.
  - Lack of documentation: Spousal permit holders are denied the opportunity to work and experience abuse by their partners.
  - Nationality: Preference is given to immigrants from economically stable countries over those from poor countries.

It was recommended that

- Gender sensitive policies and interventions to minimise the vulnerability of immigrants be put in place.
- Political leaders take a restrained and diplomatic approach to migration issues in order to limit xenophobia.
- Institutions should be managed properly, and strict measures taken against service providers using their powers and attitude to undermine laws that protect migrants.
- Bilateral cooperative agreements between the Zimbabwean government and the South African government are necessary for the protection of migrant workers.
- The process to acquire the proper documents be facilitated.
- Individual and communal coping strategies be strengthened as a means to minimise vulnerability.
- Stakeholders collaborate at different societal levels to organise awareness campaigns, workshops and support groups for female immigrants.
- Issues of gender, vulnerability and migration be further researched, possibly in a comparative study on different nationalities and in other South African contexts.

### **Migrant Women's Access to Public Health Care Facilities in Makhado, Limpopo: A Case of Zimbabwean Women**

*(Miss Yolanda Tshililo, UCT)*

The bulk of research on migration does not give sufficient attention to women migrants who are particularly vulnerable once they pass through the border into South Africa. With this in mind, Miss Tshililo focused her study on how Zimbabwean migrant women experience access to public healthcare services in Makhado, a small town in Limpopo Province close to the border with Zimbabwe.



From the literature, it was evident that the increase of migration impacts the South African public healthcare services, and that denying a person emergency medical treatment is in violation of the Constitution of the Republic of South Africa, which states that every human being has the right to access health care services, including reproductive healthcare. The theoretical framework of the study was based on Foucault's theory on power and knowledge (1980), which was helpful in explaining the everyday practices on provision of healthcare services and migrants' access to public healthcare, and exposed the abuse of power by healthcare personnel in terms of migrants access to healthcare services, treatment provided and documentation required, and ways of 'disciplining' non-compliant patients by denying them access and discriminating against them. A qualitative research method was adopted using in-depth interviews with 12 migrant patients, focus group discussions as well as field notes.

The study concluded that migrants are faced with challenges such as language barrier and the negative attitudes of healthcare personnel in the two hospitals in Makhado. The South African government should acknowledge that there is a crisis within the public healthcare services (evidenced in staff shortages, corruption and poor leadership/management), which affects both migrants and South African patients. This was more prevalent when the migrant participants indicated that they would rather bribe the healthcare personnel to access medication rather than physically go to the hospital. The findings show that personnel at the two public healthcare facilities discriminate against migrants as well as some South African citizens who utilise the services. Recommendations that came from study participants have to do with the need for:

- Intensive training and education for the healthcare personnel about the rights of migrants and a better working environment for them
- Independent centres to avoid victimisation
- Collaboration with NGOs
- Provision of more mobile clinics.

## Discussion and Q&A

- 1) Were there cases where female immigrants sexually exploiting other female immigrants?

**Response,** Dr Chinyakata: This did not come out in my study but the literature showed that other female immigrants who are more privileged tended to exploit the less-privileged, often using them as cheap labour.

- 2) With regard to service delivery and system efficiencies in the health sector in both countries, what are the narratives between the National Health Insurance (NHI) in the US and South Africa's medical aid system and how these affect immigrants in the two countries?

**Response,** Mr Belebema: Our paper on migration and system efficiency deals with this question (Access: MF Dinbabo, I Ile, W Majee, M Belebema, E Boadu, Evaluating System Efficiencies and Service Delivery of Immigrant Population in South Africa and United States, African Human Mobility Review, 2019). The study I presented did not deal with comparisons between the NHI and medical aids in South Africa at all. In the US, immigrants have difficulty in accessing NHI and usually do not have money to access private health care.

- 3) Do the young female Zimbabweans have strategies to cope with their susceptibility to abuse by the system or the country's laws?

**Response,** Dr Chinyakata: Most immigrants indicated that they had their own coping strategies. One of these was avoidance of vulnerable situations. Some chose to talk less so that the local people do not feel threatened. Another strategy was resorting to unlawful ways to acquire documentation.

- 4) What are the healthcare experiences of Zimbabwean women in the transit areas? Is there any research about this?

**Response**, Ms Tshililo: One participant had visited the hospital in an emergency but did not get attended to because she was identified as a migrant.

- 5) Did you think about framing your studies within decolonial perspectives? This has to do with gender perspectives and is missing from our literature.

**Response**, Dr Chinyakata: The study tried to decolonialise migration by approaching it from the post-colonial feminist perspective, and using the Black Feminist and other theories in order to gain situational knowledge of these migrants. Instead of relying on the theories of migration, which push a certain agenda, we looked at migration from a post-colonial perspective and this is a step towards decolonising migration.

**Response** Ms Tshililo: I believe that the study is a starting point to decolonising the issue of migration. My focus on women and gender already decolonises that notion of migration. The deconstruction of the notion of migration is missing.

- 6) From the presentations about Zimbabwean female immigrants' experiences, most marginalised women in South Africa (women of colour) have the same experiences. Did you talk to non-migrant sex workers and see similarities, or speak to marginalised South African women to look at the same thing?

**Response**, Dr Chinyakata: I did not speak to non-migrant sex workers. This is a gap in my study. Comparative studies on the vulnerability of immigrants, and experiences of female Zimbabwean immigrants compared to those from other countries are needed.

- 7) When it comes to comparative studies, I expect a huge project. What is the size of the project under which this paper was written?

**Response**, Mr Belebema: This is a pilot project between Missouri State University and UWC, to explore this domain within the two countries. We started with a bigger sample but there was attrition. The data collected allowed us draw inferences without generalising. When funding is available, we will be able to do a larger study with a bigger sample at the national level.

- 8) In the process of reviewing your article, can you tell us if you were influenced by the views of some of the reviewers?

**Response**, Mr Belebema: It was a double-blind review. We did not agree with one of the reviewers who did not understand the context of the study and the work was sent to another reviewer.

- 9) It would be helpful to flesh out your finding with regard to discrimination.

**Response**, Dr Chinyakata: Some of the participants indicated that they were discriminated against as a result of their nationality, especially in public spaces such as hospitals. Nurses helping immigrants had strange attitudes towards them. They also experience gender-based discrimination.

- 10) You mentioned that transcripts of interviews with respondents will not be sent to external examiners. This is a concern in terms of institutional issues with regard to the examination of thesis.

**Response**, Ms Tshililo: This is an ethical matter. Participants would not have been willing to participate if the transcripts were shared with anyone. In order to get the transcripts, I had to agree that they would not be shared at all. I have notes from the focus group discussions in case the examiner requests them.

## SESSION 8: PARTICIPATORY THEATRE

*Facilitator: Drama for Life Theatre, Wits School of Arts*

### Theme: Performance-as-research

Actors and musicians from Drama for Life based at Wits embodied young scientists' experiences and stories, giving them dramatic expression in an interactive manner and playing back moments of critical dialogue and engagement with colleagues and peers, and moments of realisation in the work they do with regards to the themes of migration, displacement and mobility in Africa for them to reflect on. Participatory theatre style was utilised which is an approach in which the actors interact with the audience, based on a real problem. Throughout the participatory event, the audience participates to adapt, change or correct a situation, an attitude or a behaviour that is developed during the show. This form of theatre aims to join entertainment with an exploration of attitudes and to share knowledge in order to stimulate positive social changes.

### CONFERENCE CLOSURE

On behalf of ASSAf, Mr Maphosa thanked all the participants, programme facilitators and presenters for their contribution to the conference, and all those who helped organise the conference.



# ANNEXURE A:

## LIST OF ACRONYMS

<b>ACCORD</b>	African Centre for the Constructive Resolution of Disputes
<b>ACMS</b>	African Centre for Migration and Society
<b>AfCFTA</b>	African Continental Free Trade Area
<b>ART</b>	Antiretroviral therapy
<b>ASSAf</b>	Academy of Science of South Africa
<b>AU</b>	African Union
<b>CoFMMA</b>	Conflict-Induced Forced Migration Modelling using an Agent-based Approach
<b>DHA</b>	Department of Home Affairs
<b>DoH</b>	Department of Health
<b>DSI</b>	Department of Science and Innovation
<b>GBV</b>	Gender-based violence
<b>GDP</b>	Gross Domestic Product
<b>HPI</b>	Health Perception Index
<b>ISI</b>	Information Support Index
<b>MSF</b>	Médecins Sans Frontières
<b>NDP</b>	National Development Plan
<b>NGO</b>	non-governmental organisation
<b>NHI</b>	National Health Insurance
<b>NWU</b>	North West University
<b>RMRP</b>	Refugee and Migrant Rights Programme
<b>SADC</b>	Southern African Development Community
<b>SAPS</b>	South African Police Services
<b>SAYAS</b>	South African Young Academy of Science
<b>Stats SA</b>	Statistics South Africa
<b>TWAS-SAREP</b>	The World Academy of Sciences Sub-Saharan Africa Regional Partner
<b>UCT</b>	University of Cape Town
<b>UFS</b>	University of Free State
<b>UNISA</b>	University of South Africa
<b>UP</b>	University of Pretoria
<b>US</b>	United States
<b>UWC</b>	University of the Western Cape
<b>VR</b>	Virtual Reality
<b>Wits</b>	University of the Witwatersrand

## LIST OF PARTICIPANTS

Name	Institution
Mr Adeyemi Badewa	University of the Western Cape
Mr Tshedza Sikhwari	University of Venda
Ms Thea De Gruchy	University of the Witwatersrand
Dr Duduzile Ndlovu	University of the Witwatersrand
Mr James Ansell Makhubeka	University of Venda
Ms Majory Dzingai	North West University
Ms Takudzwa Charisse Taruza	North West University
Mr Andrew Osehi Enaifoghe	University of Zululand
Ms Christa De Kock	Stellenbosch University
Dr Tendai Chigware	University of Fort Hare
Ms Ijeoma Opara	University of Cape Town
Dr Jonathan Oshupeng Maseng	North West University
Dr Komlan Agbedahin	University of Free State
Mrs Michelle Beeslaar	University of Pretoria
Mr Nkululeko Shabalala	University of Kwa-Zulu Natal
Dr Tafadzwa Clementine Maramura	University of Fort Hare
Mrs Deliwe Mankgane	University of Pretoria
Ms Fulufhedzani Ravele	University of the Witwatersrand
Mr Michael Belebema	University of the Western Cape
Ms Nokubonga Mazibuko-Ngidi	Sol Plaatje University
Ms Confidence Phumzile Mabaso	University of Venda
Ms Rachel Chinyakata	University of Venda
Ms Yolanda Tshililo	University of Cape Town
Ms Gaofengwe Tlalane Dorothy Letlhaku	World Merit South Africa
Ms Khethiwe Mosimang	World Merit South Africa
Mr Lebogang Ditsebe	Moral Regeneration Movement
Mr Lenka Malatji	World Merit South Africa
Mr Unoshamisa Chiradza	World Merit South Africa
Ms Edith Shikumo	ASSAf / SAYAS
Mr Stanley Maphosa	ASSAf
Mr Kholani Mbhiza	ASSAf / TWAS
Dr Tebogo Mabothe	ASSAf
A/Prof Jo Vearey	University of the Witwatersrand
Prof Amos Saurombe	University of South Africa
Prof Kanshukan Rajaratnam	University of Cape Town
Dr Jean Pierre Misago	University of the Witwatersrand
Ms Hlengiwe Mtshatsha	Lawyers for Human Rights
Ms Candice Bailey	University of the Witwatersrand
Ms Karabo Kgoleng	University of the Witwatersrand
Ms Silindile Mlilo	University of the Witwatersrand
Ms Tsholofelo Mosala	Azania Research Centre
Mr Deprose Muchena	Amnesty International
Ms Sibusisiwe Nkosi	ACCORD

Name	Institution
Dr Jean Pierre Misago	University of the Witwatersrand
Ms Ina Skosana	The Conversation
Ms Bongwiwe Zwane	ASSAf
Ms Thato Morokong	ASSAf
Mr Phathusedzo Ramukhadi	North West University
Ms Heather Erasmus	Write Connection
Mr Stephen Coan	University World News
Ms Eleni Solaki	University of the Witwatersrand
Ms Mosala Toneqo	Agricultural Research Council
Ms Sibonginkosi Dunjana	University of the Witwatersrand
Ms Tshonana Mokhothu	World Merit South Africa
Ms Joan van Dyke	Bhekisisa Centre for Health Journalism
Mr Borrie la Grange	Médecins Sans Frontières
Dr Kudakwashe Vonyoro	University of the Witwatersrand
Ms Renate Venier	ASSAf











PO Box 72135, Lynnwood Ridge 0040  
Pretoria, South Africa

**Tel:** +27 12 349 6600 | **Fax:** +27 86 576 9520  
**Email:** [admin@assaf.org.za](mailto:admin@assaf.org.za)

*Applying scientific  
thinking in the service  
of society*



2020

# Migration, Displacement and Mobility in Africa: Complex issues in current times

Academy of Science of South Africa (ASSAf)

Academy of Science of South Africa (ASSAf)

---

Academy of Science of South Africa (ASSAf), (2020). Annual Young Scientist Conference 2019:

Migration, Displacement and Mobility in Africa: Complex Issues in Current Times [online] DOI <http://dx.doi.org/10.17159/>

<http://hdl.handle.net/20.500.11911/147>

*Downloaded from ASSAf Research Repository, Academy of Science of South Africa (ASSAf)*