Strategies for Fighting Back:

Globalization and the City

By

Karl Eckert

Senior Project

City and Regional Planning Department

California Polytechnic State University

San Luis Obispo

June 2010

| 1. INTRODUCTION | 3 |
|---|----|
| | |
| 2. LITERATURE REVIEW | 4 |
| | |
| 2.1 EMERGENCE OF GLOBALIZATION: COMMUNICATION AND MOBILITY IMPROVEMENTS | 4 |
| 2.2 RESTRUCTURING OF THE URBAN REALM: HOMOGENIZATION OR DIVERGENCE? | 10 |
| 2.2.1 DIVERGENCE | 10 |
| 2.2.2 HOMOGENIZATION | 12 |
| 2.3 PLACE: AN INTRODUCTION | 19 |
| 2.4 PERSONAL EXPERIENCE | 20 |
| 2.4.1 GLOBALIZATION AND PERSONAL EXPERIENCE | 23 |
| 2.5 COLLECTIVE IDENTITY | 25 |
| 2.5.1 GLOBALIZATION AND IDENTITY | 28 |
| 2.6 URBAN DESIGN | 29 |
| 2.6.1 GLOBALIZATION AND DESIGN | 31 |
| 2.7 CONCLUSIONS ON A SENSE OF PLACE | 32 |
| 3. CASE STUDIES | 33 |
| 3.1 How to Fight Back | 33 |
| 3.1.1 REDEVELOPMENT | 34 |
| 3.1.2 TOURISM | 37 |
| 3.1.3 ROOTEDNESS | 38 |
| 3.1.4 IDENTITY | 41 |
| 3.1.5 CITY IMAGE | 49 |
| 4. CONCLUSION | 49 |

1. Introduction

This paper will look into the influence of globalization upon the local places of cities. First, the issue of globalization will be addressed. The influence of global trends upon local decisions has recently become an important issue for consideration because of developments in technology that facilitate the mobility of capital. The mobility of capital has caused a restructuring of the capitalist economic system. Cities have responded to this change in economic system through new policies that stresses decentralization and privatization of the urban realm in order to attract new investment. This is because businesses are now more able to establish in areas that before were not reachable but are now open due to improved methods of information and capital exchange. Thus deregulations by governments to support neo-liberal policies have been pursued to allow for their cities to attract global capital as a form of new investment. Also the economic liberalization of previously unreachable markets (from collapsed communist regimes to the developing cities of the world) has opened up entirely new urban structures to the forces of the new global market. It is the argument of this paper that this new valuation of the urban realm, as a place concentrated upon economic gains rather than cultural or societal issues, has caused for unique places around the world to lose their established identity and distinctiveness as they now reinvent themselves with the infrastructure required by globalization in order to attract global investment.

To understand the impact of urban restructuring upon individual cities, there needs to be an understanding of what makes place distinct in the first place. This paper also looks to identify how the identified global influences have changed the experience of place by examining the elements that make places distinct and how they have been affected by global capital. With this understanding, it becomes clear that places are converging in structure. Identifying the essential

elements of distinct places is useful as to extract these and see how they can be incorporated into future ideas and designs as to attack globalization.

Theories on the influence of global capital have both contended that places are both becoming more homogenous while also becoming more distinct. No discussion on the issue would be complete without addressing both sides. However, globalization has harmed places of unique character through an overall homogenizing effect on the elements of place.

To combat this, the third major section of this paper presents case studies and theories that aim to challenge globalization on various scales. There is no single way to address the issues presented in this paper and thus multiple ways are presented as to provide a comprehensive outlook on how to address globalization. But globalization should be defined for the purposes of this paper and identify how it affects cities.

2. Literature Review

2.1 Emergence of Globalization: Communication and Mobility Improvements

Globalization is the historical interaction and exchange between separate societies and is not a new phenomenon. Logan recognizes that "what is happening now is but the latest of a series of globalizing waves that began with the spread of the great religions and the establishment of colonial empires and quasi-colonial spheres of influence, both ancient and modern" (Logan, 2002, p.xii). To talk about globalization only in terms of recent events ignores the process that globalization has undertaken to come to the pivotal point we find ourselves at now. What distinguishes the present from past trends in globalization is that globalization has now entered a new stage of development enabled by the emergence of new technologies that facilitate faster communication and mobility.

Garcia, in her essay titled The Architecture of Global Networking Technologies (2002) explains the development of communication technologies. According to Garcia, communication has been improved in five main ways. First, the reach of communication networks has greatly expanded. Garcia's main example here is the new use of satellites to provide communication needs to more and more areas of the globe. Secondly, networks are now able to handle a larger density of information than before through the use of high-fiber optic cables as well as the digitalization of data. A third element of improved communication is the increase in accessibility to the existing networks. Garcia attributes this to the switch to wireless communication. Wireless systems allow for areas of access to be set up without the construction of on site infrastructure and, thus, allow for the speedy set up of the network. Fourthly, communication is further improved through flexibility in the allowed types of communication through a medium. For example, the internet is a flexible mode of communication because it is adaptable to many types of communication which increases the effectiveness of the communication. Finally, Garcia sees an improvement in the functionality of communication networks in that they are able to take in various sets of data and integrate together to generate new data. These communication improvements have allowed for an increase in the amount as well as quality of information transferable instantly to remote locations (Garcia, 2002). Garcia mentions that "given today's technology advances, networks can be both locally based as well as globally extended" (Garcia, 2002, p.53). This allows for the dissemination of information and decisions to greater areas of the globe.

The mobility of populations has been influenced in various ways. For example, the development of freeway systems in multiple cities (particularly after World War II in the U.S.) of the globe has facilitated mobility through automobile usage (Hall, 2002). The use of

commercial air travel to reach remote areas was also an important development that opened much of the world to every day people. Air travel first became accessible to a large commercial base with the creation of the 747 by Boeing in 1970 (Time, 2006). Increased mobility has facilitated a higher volume of migration between cities, states, and nations.

The improvements made in communication networks as well as transportation have made the developed society enter into a new stage of cultural exchange. This exchange is more effective than ever before in disseminating decisions and resources from remote locations. Thus global trends are beginning to have a heightened relevancy for decisions that used to be made locally.

Improved exchange has caused a restructuring to occur within the capitalist system of production. Capital has now also become mobile in that investments can now transcend distance and be accumulated in remote localities, being made possible through the exchange of information and people (Garcia, 2002; Cresswell, 2004). This has provided cities an added source of investment to help boost their city's tax base and employment (Sideras, 1998). Cities can gain from opening up their cities through supportive legislation to have multinational corporations set up within their boundaries (Ciccolella and Mignaqui, 2002). Also, the increase in population mobility has allowed for the tourist population to travel across the world to experience new places, increasing the importance of tourism as a source for new investment as well (Logan, 2002; Bull, Boontharm, Parin, Radovic, & Tapie, 2007).

Taken in balance with other values the economic rationality of globalization is a beneficial asset. Cities can stand to gain from allowing such investments to enter their city. This can help raise the living standard for developing countries for which this may be a top priority (Logan, 2002; Ciccolella and Mignaqui, 2002). As long as the focus upon attracting global

capital is not the main priority for a city, the forces of global structures and decision making will not affect cities in a detrimental way. However, cities and governments of the last few decades have shifted their political priorities towards opening regional economies to the influences of global capital beyond a good balance. This can be seen in the liberalization of markets and the adoption of market oriented policies all around the globe (Sideras, 1998; Logan, 2002; Ciccolella and Mignaqui, 2003).

Cities have been prone to adopting neo-liberal and market oriented policies of urban development in order to attract more remote investment in an era of limited returns from conventional methods. In the US, Loukaitou-Sideris and Banerjee (1998) note that the focus of urban planning changed in the 1970's and 80's. This came due to new legislation that cut the tax base of state and federal governments. For example, in California, Proposition 13 cut the revenue the state could collect from revenue tax. The authors state that the loss of revenue between 1978 and 1979 in the State of California from Proposition 13 was estimated around \$51 billion (Loukaitou-Sideris & Banerjee, 1998, p.74). This proposition was also a model for many other states. In 1979 a New York Times study found that 37 states had tax cuts or spending limits enacted in 1979 (Loukaitou-Sideris & Banerjee, 1998, p.74). Such legislation pressured local and state governments to look for investment in new areas of the economy because their traditional source, taxes, were deeply cut. To make up the difference, cities began to look towards the private sector. Government began working with the private sector in mutual benefit agreements to attract developers to cities for the increase in tax revenue such projects would bring. A new valuation of business and corporations in the urban realm ensued (Sideras, 1998). This fiscalization of land use planning has caused for a restructuring of the urban layout of many US cities (Fulton, 2005).

The developing world also began to rely upon global capital in order to receive new investment. As noted by Ciccolella and Mignaqui (2003), Brazil has been keen on developing market oriented policy to increase investment and, subsequently, raise the standard of living. In their essay titled *Buenos Aires: Sociospatial Impacts of the Development of Global City Functions*, the authors recognize the transformational changes that the city has under gone through the adoption of new market oriented policies. They state that "these transformations and changes in land use are accompanied and allowed by the multiple changes in the institutional frameworks and regulations" (Ciccolella and Mignaqui, 2002, p.317). The regulations they cite include privatization, decentralization of governmental functions, the Convertibility Law, Law of Economic Emergency, among others (Ciccolella and Mignaqui, 2002, p.324). All of these regulations are aimed at attracting global capital.

Logan notes the same tendencies in Asia in that:

a new international hierarchy of cities is forming, and government development strategies are increasingly designed to ensure the highest possible position for their own cities...in this new hierarchy. Major projects and big events are encouraged as a key way of implementing such strategies, often with little regard for the resulting social impact. (Logan, 2002, p.xiv)

Despite the increase in democratization of Asian cities there still "remains the fact that large business organizations, be they privately or state owned, have stronger voices and are often aided and abetted by government officers who espouse neo-liberal economic policies or are connected to the business organizations in pecuniary ways" (Logan, 2002, p.xx). A new global market has appeared and planning methods have been utilized to extract investment from this new realm through an economic rationality of urban space.

Another profound example of the new valuation of space can be seen in collapsed communist regimes of Eastern Europe. Sykora (1994) in his essay titled *Local Urban*

Restructuring as a Mirror of Globalisation Processes: Prague in the 1990's details out how the collapse of the previous communist regime and the subsequent rise of the capitalist system has affected Prague. Skyora arugues that "Prague is rapidly becoming a standard Western city considerably shaped by forces of contemporary global capitalism" (Sykora, 1994). This is because of the "system transformations, such as public management deregulation, privatization processes, and liberalization of prices, have already set 'new rules of the game', have relocated resources and power" (Sykora, 1994). Such new rules have lead to the restructuring of the city towards new ends, that of the capitalist model (Sykora, 1994).

The model of economic rationality for urban vitality is being used by cities all across the world in varying nations and contexts. This new valuation of the urban realm has taken place due to the mobility of capital. Such a new valuation of the urban realm has had detrimental effects upon the specific and unique places of cities that express values other than that of the economy. Cultural aspects become less important because they do not provide for maximum quantifiable gains. Thus this new approach for planning can be seen as a new "technique" that causes a restructuring of the city to occur as put by Relph (1976) in his book On Place and Placelessness. This technique is defined by its "overriding concern with efficiency as an end in itself. In technique places can be as the interchangeable, replaceable locations of things, as indeed they are by multinational corporations, powerful central governments, and uninvolved planners" (Relph, 1976, p.143). Such a planning attitude is brought on by this new technique because what is important to the planner has changed. No longer are societal problems the largest concern but instead the focus becomes attracting the most investment into the area. Thus, such a technique is subservient to the capitalist model in trying to maximize efficiency and profits. This common denominator of many city governments today has lead to the homogenization of place.

2.2 Restructuring of the Urban Realm: Homogenization or Divergence?

The restructuring of the urban environment brought on by globalization has caused for two arguments of its effect on place to emerge. On one side, scholars argue that localities are converging in structure and are losing their distinctive qualities. Other scholars state that places are actually diverging in structure because of globalization. In presenting both of these arguments, it becomes clear that the homogenizing effects of globalization should not be trivialized and need to be addressed.

2.2.1 Divergence

A full discussion of globalization can not be attained without exposing the idea shared by some intellectuals that globalization is causing for places to diverge in structure. This argument supposes that the market changes brought on by globalization make objective place less important since space can be transcended by the available technological innovations (Cresswell, 2004). Thus the quality of place becomes more important in a business or residents choice for settlement, causing cities to compete with one another as to attract these external investments through the making of a distinctive city (Cresswell, 2004).

Similarly, Cresswell (2004) explains the diverging theory held by David Harvey who recognized that the irrelevance of place due to the mobility of capital has caused for an anxiety to develop within people of a community. They fear "about their security of their particular place in the world" (Cresswell, 2004, p.58). They begin to fear that their local identity is vulnerable to global influences and thus seek to define themselves more than before as to provide security from the imposition of global trends upon their specific place (Cresswell, 2004). They act in an

antithesis manner to the perceived forces of globalization and in doing so, define their place more profoundly. Even Logan recognizes this trend in that "globalization seems to be provoking a strong localist reaction – a reaction that is reflected in growing interest in local history, traditions, and cultural identity" (Logan, 2002, p.xvii).

Flusty (2004) alternatively recognizes that in terms of the city landscape, "what in close-up appears to be a fragmented and polycultured landscape is, from a wider perspective, a collage of elements selected from a limited menu of monocultures" (Flusty, 2004, p.50). This can be interpreted to mean that the urban forms a global city takes on are easily distinguishable and perhaps the same as employed in other global cities. He then states that:

in turn, these built monocultures are widely strewn among adaptive and persistent local variations that have proven similarly adept at dislocating themselves to propagate globally, thus creating the geographically diffuse polycentric hub that is the metapolis. The implications of the metapolis is therefore not that of a homogenized and harmoniously operating urban monolith. Each city node in the global urban field is made of a different selection of ingredients, and each rises and falls in relation to every other. (Flusty, 2004, p.50)

The variations of different places and how they use the limited amount of urban structures create innumerous amounts of variation. Thus places are not to become homogenized but still have plenty of breathing room to create distinct places.

Although the divergence argument is correct in its own context, globalization still poses a considerable threat in the devaluation of the cultural aspects of cities; the imposition of the rationale of the global marketplace has a homogenizing effect which should not be trivialized. While certain places are diverging, these are only places with considerable bargaining positions (Savitch and Kantor, 2002). These cities have enough economical clout to guide development in a manner they see appropriate for their localities be it for localist reactions to globalism or to increase their cities competitiveness. Such cities have an advantage in gaining investment in that

they are not dependent upon attracting investment but instead have investment waiting in line.

This is not true for cities of a lesser status which bend to the rationale of the global marketplace, sacrificing with it their local identity, to bring in investment.

2.2.2 Homogenization

Places have become more homogenous through the affect of global market influences upon local cultures. The features that have made local areas distinct have been penetrated and impeded by the imposing global capital superstructure. This is because "common standards of measurement, universal criteria, interchangeable parts, and identical symbols are essential for globalization" (Savitch and Kantor, 2002, p.13). The authors go further to say that:

almost by definition globalization standardizes commodities and, ultimately, governments and political behavior. The same products, films, and newscasts are consumed in all parts of the global village. 'Best Practices' are often adopted across cultures and policy can be transferred across governments. The sheer dynamics of globalization leads us to believe that everything is becoming homogenized. (Savitch and Kantor, 2002, p.269)

This trend is opposed to the cultivation of local trends that have developed in relative isolation to specific cultures and ways of life. The urban structures of cities have been caught in this myriad of standardization and have thus lost a sense of local identity; instead places are becoming interchangeable parts of the global.

Because of the mobility of capital, cities have made new infrastructure to accommodate for land uses that support global investment. It is this accommodation of the new economic structure that has caused, according to some, a homogenization of place. According to Cresswell (2004):

the permanence of place and the mobility of capital are always in tension and places are having to adapt to conditions beyond their boundaries...it is this mobility of capital that many see as the prime force of globalization and the main reason for the perceived homogenization of places around the world. As capital becomes more mobile and mass

communication more ubiquitous, the argument goes, places become less important. (Cresswell, 2004, p.58)

The mobility of capital influences urbanism by allowing companies to become multi-national; they de-locate from areas that they were once dependent upon and can extend further around the globe. The ability of businesses to de-locate enhances the ability of cities to attract this foot-loose investment into areas unreachable before. Now-a-days, a corporate headquarters does not have to be located near their constituency, but instead can be built in a remote area, their communication needs facilitated by improved mobility and telecommunications. Also, the advent of new communication infrastructure opens up entirely new countries and remote areas into which businesses can extend their market. A business primarily focused on the East Coast can easily transcend the distance barrier and set up on the West side of the nation or on a larger scale, US businesses can now establish rather seamlessly in other countries.

Restructuring of the city is done in order to attract investment and growth to cities that might otherwise be stagnant or in decline. In order to attract new investment, cities recognize the need:

to replace an exhausted physical environment with one that is more suited for postindustrial services...This has created a vast conversion of the built environment to accommodate the hoped-for influx of office workers, tourist, and professional services. Pushing the conversion is an international market place that caters to investors, architects, and developers. (Savitch and Kantor, 2002, p.268)

The restructuring of the city to attract capital has two ways of attainment. One is through the use of redevelopment schemes to rid areas of blight and replace them with new structures that are more oriented towards global investment. A second way cities are looking to attract mobile capital is through the creation of tourist attractions to bring in foreign investment. These two schemes look to take advantage of the ability of businesses to locate into new areas (mobility of capital) and of the general population (mobility of the population). These two will be discussed

separately, identifying the ways in which they are attainable and why they have a homogenizing influence upon place. Then the influence of global media and its effects upon urbanization will be discussed in that it undermines an existing demand for unique places to be built.

One way that the efforts in changing the physical make up of the city have manifested themselves is through the redevelopment efforts of cities. Redevelopment looks towards the identification and improvement of areas of low investment through the attraction of new investment. This has been pursued through the adoption of neo-liberal and market oriented policies mentioned before (Brazil, Asia, Prague) to attract global investment.

For example, through the institutional changes mentioned by Ciccolella and Mignaqui (2002), Brazil has had an expansion of foreign investment into the city. In a table compiled by the authors, the amount of foreign private investment is estimated for the period between 1990 and 1998. New shopping centers, industrial plants, and international hotels, have a foreign private investment estimated around 75% of the total (Ciccolella and Mignaqui, 2002).

Through the institutional changes wrought in Prague, Sykora (1994) notes the emergence of US style shopping centers that have sprung up and run counter to the traditional types of consumer landscapes known in the area. Also, "many shops and restaurants in central Prague belong to a network of internationalized places rather than to a locality. Their customers are almost exclusively foreigners and their products are imported rather than locally manufactured" (Sykora, 1994). Such restructuring of the city is brought on by redevelopment efforts to increase consumerism and foreign investments.

These foreign investments have a homogenizing effect upon the city structure because they impose foreign types of developments within the city and destroy the previously existing places. It is from this that the homogenization of place becomes apparent. It is also through

reinvestment that local populations become removed from an area. Through this process of gentrification, the culture that these people previously brought to an area is removed.

Tourism also brings investment to localities from far reaches of the globe. The realization of this has caused for many Asian cities to restructure their urban environments as to attract foreign visitors (Logan, 2002. Bull, et. al., 2007). The creation of tourist infrastructure, such as kitsch stores and areas of tourist consumption, establish homogenizing structures. In the words of Relph, "tourism is a homogenizing influence...[through] the destruction of the local and regional landscape that very often initiated the tourism, and its replacement by conventional tourist architecture and synthetic landscapes and pseudo-places" (Relph, 1976, p.93). The replacement structures that accompany tourist developments hinder the distinct sense of place that these places originally had.

Tournier (2007), in the essay *Urban Development and Context: the Traditional*Landscape and Globalization in Marrakeck details out the harmful effects of tourism upon local landscapes. The urban form of Marrakeck was influenced by French colonial powers during their colonial reign in the early 20th century. French planners and architects set up guidelines for development in the city that created a distinct blend of design, incorporating both French and Moorish ideals. This design approach used European models incorporated with native Moorish plants and garden structures. This created a new school of landscape architecture known as neo-Moorish (Tournier, 2007).

However, in order to attract more tourists, Tournier states that "to give the city a modern image, public spaces are now being developed using global garden standards and forms with large lawns and Eurpoean-style flowering plants" (Tournier, 2007, p.53). This is in opposition to the gardening standards that were set up by the town planners of the early 20th century. Instead of

furthering local traditions of the past, developments are now catering to more standardized forms.

Another example is George Town, Malaysia where Nasution and Jenkins (2002) identify acts by local governing bodies that seek to support tourist activity while not accommodating for the local heritage of the town. The authors draw specific example from the Khoo Kongsi precinct. This area of George Town is distinct because it housed immigrants from China's Hokkien province and thus has architectural features that establish this Chinese decent. The city, in pursuit of promoting tourism, created a Chinatown festival to take place in the courtyard and create a spectacle for tourist consumption. Renovations were made to the precinct's square so that it could accommodate this festival, which had unintended consequences. Fire insurance rose because of the new improvements made to the square. Because of this, the Chinatown festival eventually took place of the local Hungry Ghost Festival because fire insurance became a prohibitive cost. In this manner, the state created a new pseudo tradition packaged towards tourist and in effect pushed out the local tradition that made the area special (Nasution and Jenkins, 2002).

Through the restructuring of the urban environment to cater towards tourist, cities sometimes do not consider the elements that make their city worth visiting. Instead, in the pursuit of tourist investment, cities will often initiate policies that are harmful to the cultural elements that make the city distinct in the first place.

Homogenization of place has also been brought on by another force of globalization, namely the extension of mass media. In the book *Southern California and the World*, Pizarro (2002) looks into the creation of suburban developments in Latin America that closely modeled the type of suburban development found in America. Pizarro identifies the typical culprits that

are linked to suburban developments in Latin America. These include the "lower land values in the periphery, increase of car ownership among a rising middle and upper class, and the expansion of freeways" (Pizarro, 2002, p.179). These factors only explain the creation of suburban communities. However, there are other factors involved that made the developments take on similar attributes to American suburbs.

Pizarro looks into the factor of mass media in creating demand for these similar types of developments. It is argued that the extension of American television shows into Latin America created demand for the suburban types of development shown in these shows. This is because:

film narratives have fabricated an idealized suburban landscape characterized by a peaceful, healthy, and pleasurable environment, an urban utopia embedded in a small-town atmosphere. On the other hand, the same narratives have constructed an unhealthy, dangerous, dark urban landscape, an urban dystopia represented in the 'city'. (Pizarro, 2002, p.180)

The images of the suburb as a pleasurable place for families to live were enforced by shows such as "My Three Sons, Father Knows Best, The Brady Bunch, Leave it to Beaver, and Life with Riley" (Pizarro, 2002, p.187). Pizarro states that the effectiveness of these images of urban character are further enforced in the Latin American population because the media representation of the city runs parallel to the actual conception residents have of the Latin American city as a place ridden with crime, insecurity, and dirtiness (Pizarro, 2002).

Pizarro then takes the example of suburban development from the city of Bogotá, Colombia where "alien cultural practices have swept through [Latin America] (sic.). Its cities have naturally taken on a similar look, not only to one another, but also to the principle source of new technology, investment, and culture: North America" (Pizarro, 2002, p.183). These types of developments found in Bogotá closely follow American renditions.

So not only are city structures influenced by the mobility of capital, but here Pizarro tries to identify how the mobility of ideals, as through cinematic images, also influence and homogenize places around the world. Had the population of Bogotá not been exposed to the images of the American suburb they would have been allowed to develop their own models. This would have allowed for distinct suburbs to develop as opposed to the same models in both nations. Instead, the dissemination of mass media standardized the type of market demand of suburban development which caused for similar developments to be built.

The main force of globalization is the extension of a standardized market force into more and more remote areas of the globe where they did not penetrate before. This extension, fueled by the creation of new technologies that enable long distance travel and communication, has caused for a restructuring of cities to occur. Since they all bend to the same economic rationality, one sees similar development springing up in these various areas of the globe. The extension of multinational corporations into villages of Eastern Europe, the replacement of local festivals by pseudo-festivals, and the manipulation of market demand for standard urban structures has affected the world over. The new attributes of the global market creates new forces that call for a standardized restructuring of the urban realm in order to attract maximum investment.

It is the argument of this paper that this restructuring of the urban environment causes for places to lose an already established sense of place. But what is a sense of place? How is it identified? The second part of this paper looks to identify "sense of place" and expose some key aspects. With these aspects identified, a deeper look into the effects of globalization upon these elements can be made.

Three areas for the analysis of place will be discussed in the next section. These include how personal experience, collective experience, and the design of the city contribute to a sense

of place. With each of these sections, the effects of globalization upon these separate elements will be discussed. It becomes clear that globalization has profound effects upon the personal experience people have with local environments through the dislocation of culture, the breaking of temporal ties between residents and place, and a loss of sense of rootedness. Secondly, collective experience of place is hampered through the creation of new areas of investment which impose new and foreign cultures to local environments with an already established culture. Finally, urban design is hampered by developments centered to global capital because they alter the imagability of a city by remaking its elements.

2.3 Place: an Introduction

Place is important because of the various experiences it can offer us. As noted by Logan, "while no culture is static and immune to outside influences, and nor would we want it to be, it would be regrettable if ultimately a bland world culture replaced the vibrant variety of local cultures that now exist" (Logan, p. xv). It is a known fact that there are special, unique places in this world. These places are defined by the urban infrastructure in which they find themselves. Specialized ways of life compiled with unique contextual circumstances have allowed for places to develop in divergent ways over the years. The urban fabric of Bangkok, for example, differs greatly from that of New York City because of the underlying historical influences that have expressed themselves on the built environment. These cities have become distinct through the emergence of distinct cultures, the impact of historical and societal changes, and the use of different technologies to influence ways of life.

But what are the elements that make places distinct? Through looking at the theoretical work done on what constitutes a sense of place and what makes places distinct, it is hoped that

we can better understand the forces at hand in contemporary society that are causing for places to become similar. Places are experienced both on a personal and collective level. Then the influence of the urban designer upon place will be examined.

2.4 Personal Experience

The theoretical insights into the elements of the personal experience are multidimensioned, having various explanations. Relph (1976) in his book *Place and Placelessness* details out nine elements of personal experience that contribute to the experience of place. Of these, three are especially pertinent to our discussion. These include how experience is affected by location, time, and a sense of rootedness. These are important conclusions that Relph makes that help expand the understanding of how individuals experience a sense of place.

For example place has a spatial connotation but is not invariably tied down to a single location. Relph makes the observation that a traveling circus can be considered a place in that it constitutes a special kind of culture and way of life within multiple locations since it is always on the move. This means that place is not just about a static location but also concerns itself with the cultural and activity of the users. For a place to be distinct it must offer an unique experience contained within a spatial realm that differs from neighboring areas (Relph, 1976).

One manifestation of this is the presence of a distinct culture in the area. An example given by Mazumdar et. al. (2000) is of Little Saigon in Los Angeles. In this area one of the residents notes that "what makes Little Saigon so distinctive are the people. They speak Vietnamese…the people dress Vietnamese style. The men do not wear pants and ties but wear loose shirt[s],...white shirt[s] and trouser[s]" (Mazumdar, 2000, p.324). The establishment of stores and restaurants that offer a distinct set of goods create a distinct environment. In the case

of Little Saigon, the residents enjoy the service of specialty Vietnamese coffee shops and grocery stores that offer specific goods not available elsewhere in Los Angeles (Mazumdar, 2000).

In addition to the offering of a distinct experience, Relph notes the influence that time has in the creation of a sense of place. Increasing the amount of time that an individual spends in a location makes them more prone towards building a sense of belonging to the environment. This becomes important for residents in an area. Though a common and vernacular building may seem bland to the outsider, a resident who has been present in the area over the years may have established some sort of bond with that structure because it was present in his/her everyday life. Through prolonged interaction, bonds between people and place are created (Relph, 1976).

Along the same lines, Milligan (1998) talks about the conception of "interactional past" in the creation of a sense of place. Through the interaction people have with a particular place over time, they develop a continuity of memory that is tied to that location. The emotions and experiences had at one location create a strand of memories that establish the place as distinct for the individual. Milligan uses the example of a university coffee shop to outline the type of bond that is developed between place and interactional past. The coffee shop had an identifiable sense of place as described by the workers because the coffee shop was known as a more alternative scene for university students. When the shop was to move a few hundred feet to a new location in the same development, the workers of the coffee shop became distraught about the move. Even though the shop would only be located a few hundred feet away and still house the same activities, the move presented a break with the current location. This signifies a loss of the continuity of experience with the old location, and through moving a new strand would ensue. Thus the coffee shop loss its old sense of place through the breaking of the continuity; the

interactions that happened there to be remembered as a separate era by the workers (Milligan, 1998).

There is also a collective connotation to how time affects place. The shared past traditions of a community affect how people personally experience the area. Relph notes that "ritual and custom and myth has the incidental if not deliberate effect of strengthening attachment to place be reaffirming not only the sanctity and unchanging significance of it, but also the enduring relationships between a people and their place" (Relph, 1976, p.33). Time is not only dependent upon the personal experience, but also the knowledge of a shared past (Relph, 1976).

Place can also exhibit a sense of rootedness in the individual. Rootedness, an identification of the self with a particular place, is "to have a secure point from which to look out on the world, a firm grasp of one's own position in the order of things, and a significant spiritual and psychological attachment to somewhere in particular" (Relph, 1976, p.38). It provides a foundation for basic understanding of the self within a complex world.

If the area supports the activities of a person, they are likely to see the place as part of their identity. This makes them more prone towards defending the area from change that would undermine their established sense of identity. Place in this manner becomes itself a physical manifestation, a part of the person. Thus, the self-interest of the person would have them preserve the environment to preserve their identity too (Relph, 1976). For example, avid hikers that live in an area with trails are going too be opposed to the development of these natural areas in which they hike because it destroys the facilities that they use to establish their activity and sequentially their identity.

2.4.1 Globalization and personal experience

Places are determined as distinct because of the way in which they are experienced.

Location affects the boundaries where people feel submerged in a new context, the amount of time spent in a place helps establish bonds between people and place, and a sense of rootedness makes a place more important to the individual because it becomes a part of their identity. All of these have been influenced by globalization in some manner.

Location has been transcended through globalization trends. Cultures can cross traditional boundaries of nations and even continents and set up in major cities of the world. No longer does one have to travel to China for authentic Chinese food. Instead, one can find this service almost anywhere in the major cities of the world. This has also been shown in the presence of ethnic enclaves in multiple cities that cater to the same ethnicity. For example, the Little Saigon of Los Angeles becomes less distinct in the face of multiple Vietnamese enclaves springing up in other cities of the US such as San Francisco or Sacramento. Location, a distinct factor in the creation of a sense of place, has been eliminated because now culture can establish itself anywhere.

This runs counter to the discussion previously mentioned that scholars such as Flusty (2004) offer in that places are always distinct because their context differs. The same elements are used but they differ in relation to one another because of their respective context. Thus the Little Saigon's of the U.S. are all still different and unique because the cities they find themselves in differ as well. However, the same elements are still being used in various remote areas of the nation. True distinct places would not copy each other in various cities but instead would become distinct by catering to different values as the other. Thus the emergence of Little Saigon's in multiple destinations is a homogenization of place.

Relph talked about how a shared past increases a sense of place. When elaborating about the perception of a shared past, Relph says that:

when the rituals and myths lose their significance and the people cease to participate in them the places themselves become changeable and ephemeral. In cultures such as our own, where significant tradition counts for little, places may virtually be without time, except perhaps in terms of direct and personal experiences. (Relph, 1976, p.33)

The lack of a shared tradition hinders a person's ability to establish a bond with place. Instead they become dependant upon their personal direct relation to the place. But even personal temporal relations are limited with the increase in the mobility of the population. In the U.S. alone, around 12.4% of the population moved residencies in 2009 alone (U.S. Census Bureau, 2010). Our inability to stay in one area disrupts our personal experience-building potential and, thus, place becomes ephemeral.

Also, the rise of the tourism industry supports the creation of urban infrastructure that is to be experienced in the short term (Relph, 1976). So even where people want to settle into a place for a long time, the types of land uses that surround them, such as kitsch stores, along with a large population of visitors, leave the resident with little to build a bond with. These urban functions are not conductive to the needs of a permanent population. People are hampered when it comes to cultivating personal bonds with place.

Finally, rootedness, the force that compels people to care and nurture places they identify with is also hampered by globalization. This is through the creation and imposition of inauthentic types of developments that do not support the shared identity of the individual. Being interpersonal and thus hard to effectively plan for, rootedness is hard to directly address on a city level. However, for rootedness to develop, places have to be allowed to vary in character as to appeal to people of multiple interests. Globalization and the standardization of space does not

cultivate rootedness because it does not accommodate people who are looking for a distinctive environment to live in.

Relph argues that the promotion of rootedness for residents is the most ignored attribute of society. The creation of standardized places that support homogeneity instead of cultivating the interest of separate individuals hampers rootedness to develop. Without these identification bonds between people and place, places are prone more to disinterest and deterioration.

Before a discussion on how to address these effects upon the experience of place, there are still two other aspects to consider. Next, the collective understanding of place also influences our conception of place.

2.5 Collective Identity

Besides the personal elements that dictate our experience of the city there are cultural interpretations of place that influence how people experience them. These cultural interpretations are built off of "the unity of 'place, person, and act' and stress the links rather than the division between specific and general features of place" (Relph, 1976, p.44). From these links a broader conception of place that "is based on the recognition that while places and landscapes may be unique in terms of their content they are nevertheless products of common cultural and symbolic elements and processes" (Relph, 1976, p.44). The built environment, in turn, can support and create a sense of cohesion among residents through a unifying identity.

Relph notes that the three aspects that dictate the identity of places are the physical environment, activity of the people in the site, and the construction of meaning (Relph, 1976, p.44). The physical environment comprised of architectural features and public spaces that concerns themselves with the expression. For example, the explicit choice of Spanish style

architecture in Santa Barbara (that is the only allowed architecture in the downtown area) is a direct manipulation of the physical realm to create identity.

The activity of the users of the site defines what is socially acceptable in how others are to interact and experience a place (Relph, 1976). If the main form of activity includes walking up and down a main boulevard, other people will tend to follow in the same manner. If there are many people who are sitting and eating, the place may be known as a popular place to eat lunch. Thus, in the creation of a sense of place, the activity of the site has to be considered. People can be encouraged to engage in certain activities only if there exists infrastructure supporting these activities. If the place is to be distinct, steps can be taken to encourage alternative activities that are not always pursued in the rest of the city. For example, certain parks or plazas can be used for the creation of art by individuals through the inclusion of supporting infrastructure.

The third aspect, the creation of meaning, is a formed opinion of the area in question. Though dependent on the afore mentioned aspects of the physical realm and activity, the creation of meaning for a place is a separate entity that can be independently analyzed. Through the creation of meaning, an area can become known as dangerous, relaxing, stimulating, and so forth. The creation of meaning is open to self interpretation in that an individual can come to view a public space as relaxing while another person can view it as an area of discomfort. This attribute influences the experience of the user in that area (Relph, 1976).

The creation of meaning for places is an element ready for manipulation by city planners to enforce positive meaning or rid the area of commonly held stigmas. For example, the Los Angeles area of South Central Los Angeles was renamed South Los Angeles to try and rid the conception some had of South Central and how dangerous the area was perceived to be. This simple change did not arguably achieve its goal but the intentions highlight the significance for

the manipulation of the meaning of a place through a change in name. By providing different cues, different meanings for places can be established.

The study of the identity of places can be best described by looking at modern ethnic/cultural enclaves. These areas of cities actively support a unifying culture or values that are present in all of the three elements of the physical space, activity of users and the creation of meaning. For example, Abrahamson (1996) looks at the Chinatown District of San Francisco in his book *Urban Enclaves: Identity and Place in America*. The district includes many signs in Chinese as well as Chinese architecture that enforces the Chinese identity of the area. In addition, the activities upon the streetscape create a differing atmosphere from the rest of the city. Chinatown is one of the only areas where vendors set up on the street to sell Chinese goods. Finally, the creation of meaning is developed in Chinatown through the relation of people to the area. Since immigrants of Chinese decent are attracted to the area, the district can be seen as a supportive entity that helped them gain footing in their new country. In the eyes of tourist, Chinatown can be seen as an area of cultural emersion that differs from the larger context of the city (Abrahamson, 1996).

Through the manipulation of these three aspects, a distinct identity can be created. It becomes the goal of the place oriented planner to see how the urban realm can be changed as to allow for varying modes of activity, a physical representation in stark contrast to its surrounds, or the creation of meaning that enforce positive values for the users of the site. The differing of the expressions of these elements will help boost the individuality of the area and help make a distinct sense of place. When done correctly, the identity sought after should follow the values of the residents. Their values and ways of life should be supported through the buildings and landscapes that they constantly interact with. When inappropriately applied, the attempt becomes

superficial and even contradictory to the wishes of the residents by not supporting their life style. The creation of such an inauthentic urban realm will create an atmosphere of alienation that will not be conductive towards place making efforts. Thus the manipulation of these elements must coincide with the values of the local population and not just be an enforced ideal that is thought up by political leaders who act in no connection to the needs of the public (Relph, 1976).

2.5.1 Globalization and identity

The effect of globalization upon individual cultures and place identities has been the imposition of foreign trends that introduce inauthentic values and thus disrupt local culture. The disruption of local cultures is known as gentrification. Gentrification is a side effect of global involvement through the removal of the local population and the introduction of a new population with new values. For example, Ciccolella and Mignaqui (2002) detail out the restructuring of the urban environment to accommodate global capital through the creation of "new urban objects" (Ciccolella and Mignaqui, 2002, p.311). The authors recognize that:

these 'new urban objects' that underlie the spatial fragmentation are characterized by additive, heterogeneous, ephemeral, and excluding architectures, responding to specialized processes embedded in the new urban culture. They alter the urban morphology, fabric, and landscape, as well as the land uses and functions, the predominant economic activities, and the labor market of each urban segment...in many cases jeopardizing its identity. (Ciccolella and Mignaqui, 2002, p. 311)

Global development can cause for an imposition of ideals that are foreign to the area being developed. For example, business practices can be brought into an area through the creation of new and prominent office buildings. This will change the physical make up of the area as buildings that were once there are replaced by these structures. The activity found on site will cater more towards the business crowd who use the office buildings.

Thus a more business oriented activity will establish in the area, pushing out what was once there. The previous identity of a place is lost and a new one is established.

Logan details out a pertinent example of how in Asian cities:

only now being drawn into the global economy, the changing pace and widening scope of change is obvious to both people and to external commentators: work practices and leisure possibilities, the composition of education curricula, the choice of available consumer goods, aesthetic taste – are all being dramatically affected. (Logan, 2002, p.xv)

Such new values have an alienating effect upon the population that used to identify with the previous use of the space. No longer is their culture validated by the urban realm and they must either redefine their values or relocate to another area that does support their traditions.

Finally, places are made distinct through the design of the city. Design that actively seeks to make places distinct is successful through the utilization of the elements that make the cityscape "legible" to the everyday user as proposed by Lynch (1960).

2.6 Urban Design

Lynch (1960) in his book *The Image of the City* details out elements of design that can add to the "imagability" of the city (Lynch, 1960, p.9). This image, when properly developed would "seem well formed, distinct, remarkable; it would invite the eye and the ear to greater attention and participation" (Lynch, 1960, p.10). His conception looks to consider the need for identity and structure within an ever changing urban environment. Lynch's concept of the image of the city is essentially the properties of a sense of place established in this paper, differing only in that the image's primary use is for user orientation. Thus an effective city image creates a sense of place in the city because the visitor knows and feels that they are in a distinguishable

place from the rest of the city. The need for a sense of place helps guide people on their journeys and creates a stimulating environment (Lynch, 1960).

Lynch details out five interrelated elements that define the image of a city. When modified appropriately, these five elements can help establish a clear and cohesive urban image. These elements include paths, edges, districts, nodes, and landmarks (Lynch, 1960).

Paths are the ways that people travel through their urban environments. These mainly coincide with the street system of cities but can also include pedestrian or bicycle paths. It is along these paths that many of the urban residents spend most of their time and become the way that they learn about the city. In his study, Lynch found that newer residents of cites were more familiar with major districts and landmarks. Older residents, however, had a stronger correlation to paths, having used them for their transportation needs and thus identifying with them (Lynch, 1960).

Edges are elements of the city that distinguish a beginning or end of a certain realm for the individual. Edges can consist of tree lines, railroad tracks, water features, and so forth. that cause a break in experience. Also, building facades that distinguish themselves from others in the area present a definable barrier that can be experienced as edges. Edges help people break up the city into organizable features of space for legibility and orientation (Lynch, 1960).

Districts are a larger classification of the urban sphere into two dimensional realms.

Districts exhibit a sense of being inside and outside of them through the experience that a person has with them. Being in or outside of these districts is dictated by visual cues or activities that are unique to these areas (Lynch, 1960).

Nodes exhibit high amounts of activity within confined spaces and because of this activity are distinguishable from the rest of the city. Public plazas with performers and high

through traffic are examples of nodes within the city. Also, junctions within the city are nodes because of the multiple users that visit the site through their travels (Lynch, 1960).

Landmarks are built or natural features that are unique and provide a contrast to its surroundings. These elements are usually highly visible and thus are important for orientation purposes. Landmarks can be city wide such as a large tower structure, but can also be experienced on a smaller scale. All that is required is that they stick out enough to be recognizable (Lynch, 1960).

Through the proper design of these elements in a cohesive sense, a city with high imagability can be achieved in that residents and visitors alike will feel as being in distinct place of the city at any given moment. Pathways can be enhanced by defining edges and including nodes along the way to provide a sense of place distinct from other pathways. Districts can be transected by paths and allow for a user of the path to experience the entry and exit of special places. All of this can be overshadowed by a large landmark, further enhancing the imagability of the area. Through the use of these design elements, a stimulating environment can be produced that engages the user of urban space into feeling that they are in a distinct setting.

2.6.1 Globalization and design

The key features that define cities are becoming more and more similar. The landmarks that are used for legibility are denoted as the typical skyscrapers that dominate every major city. Paths are dominated by the same type of technology, the automobile, and lose their distinctiveness in that the streets have similar qualities in remote areas to accommodate this type of transportation. Districts which sponsor a distinct culture, as noted before in the location section, are able to set up most cities. Yet most importantly, the changes brought upon the urban

environment from the economic restructuring can detrimentally affect the observer. Lynch recognizes that:

in Los Angeles there is an impression that the fluidity of the environment and the absence of physical elements which anchor to the past are exciting and disturbing. Many descriptions of the scene by established residents, young or old, were accompanied by the ghost of what used to be there. Changes, such as those wrought by the freeway system, have left scars on the mental image. (Lynch, 1960, p.45)

Because of this, "the observer must also adjust his image to secular shifts in the physical reality around him. Los Angeles illustrated the practical and emotional strains induced as the image is confronted with constant physical changes" (Lynch, 1960, p.86). The mental image then must adjust itself to new conceptions of the city as it is redefined. Residents cannot enjoy past activities or places which cause a constant redefinition of the city and how the users understand as well as navigate it. The established sense of place is lost.

2.7 Conclusions on a Sense of Place

A sense of place is created through the way that individuals experience a place, the cultural interpretations of the area, as well as intentional layout and design of the city.

Experience is influenced by the location, the time spent of the observer in, and the sense of rootedness that the person has with an area. The culture of an area is supported by physical features, activity on-site, and meaning of an area. Finally, city imagability sets out to create a legible map of the city to allow for a coherent way of distinguishing areas of the city from one another. This is achieved through the strategic planning of pathways, edges, districts, nodes, and landmarks. All of these are distinguishable elements of what makes a place distinct and unique.

It becomes clear that globalization has caused for the experience of the place to be altered. The forces of economic rationality and tourism have a detrimental effect upon the distinctiveness of cities. No longer are temporal ties or rootedness a key feature of cities today. Unbounded cultural exchange has allowed for specialized cultures to establish into local places across the world that run counter to that of the traditional culture. Globalization has also brought with it a decrease in the legibility of the urban realm through impeding new structures that disrupt the establishment of cognitive maps of the city. The next step required is to identify how to mend the ill effects of globalization through a case study analysis of various methods and approaches.

3. Case Studies

3.1 How to Fight Back

The focus of this paper now moves to how best to fight the effects of globalization. Having identified the aspects of globalization as well as the aspects of local place and what makes them distinct, a synthesis of these two will be made. As put by Bull, Radovic and Parin (2007), decision makers must be able to "think globally and locally, and act globally and locally, effecting real change" (Bull, Radovic, & Parin, 2007, p.230). Shunning external investment opportunities for cities offered by globalization, though addressing the problem of homogenization of place, can have a detrimental effect upon the living standard exhibited within the city. Instead approaches to coordinate between the local and global will be presented and expanded upon.

These examples on how to fight back the forces of globalization are to be examined in terms of the elements of globalization as well as place identified already in this paper. Firstly,

since economic rationality is the main force of globalization, examples on how to deal with this force will be given. For example, the city bargaining model proposed by Savitch and Kantor (2002) defines how cities are to negotiate effectively as to attract and mold foreign investment to cater to the other specific needs of the city such as culture and identity. Secondly, Sunakorn and Pinijvarasin (2007) present methods on how to maintain authentic culture in the face of the homogenizing forces of tourism. Third, a look at influencing the aspect of personal experience will be explored through an investigation into the work done by Low, Taplin, Scheld, and Fisher, (2002) on Independence National Historic Park. The case study shows how a sense of rootedness can be established among ethnicities and place through cultural representation. Fourthly, examples of how to maintain the identity of place will be explored. A case study done by Askew (2002) of Bangkok's Ban Khura district will be given where popular urbanism was able to define the local identity and mobilize populations in order to preserve it. Two alternatives are presented to establish identity in a place should it already not be defined. Also, the aspects of Frampton's (1983) outline for critical regionalism which stresses the mending of global and local influences through architecture will be discussed. Finally, the imagability of the city should be maintained if not strengthened by allowing for important urban features to maintain their existence within the city as to not disrupt the established cognitive maps of citizens.

3.1.1 Redevelopment

Redevelopment of urban space to cater towards an economic optimization has been detrimental to established sense of place. In order to effectively deal with the forces of global capital, Savitch and Kantor (2002) stress the importance bargaining has to make the city not fully dependent upon the market for investment. Instead the city is to use its own unique attributes to attract the type of growth seen as favorable for the area. As noted by the authors:

Our approach is somewhat different. Rather than subordinating cities to market pressures, we underline how cities might strengthen themselves vis-à-vis business and cope with market strings. We focus on how cities can maximize their bargaining resources in the international market place and, most crucially, how they might expand choice. Cites may be compelled to bargain with private benefactors, but they need not magnify their weakness. Instead they can leverage their strength. (Savitch and Kantor, 2002, p.314)

In this manner, cities can become selective of the types of developments that spring up in their communities by increasing their ability to negotiate with the forces of global capital.

Coupled with a desire for cultural preservation, the identity of the place in question can be a top priority for the bargaining process.

One way to do this noted by Savitch and Kantor is that communities create Community Development Partnerships (CDPs) that help guide development in a socially responsible way. The authors argue that these CDPs increase the amount of "social capital" in the city. Social capital is the "process that supports a network of relationships that can facilitate access to resources" (Savtick, Kantor, 2002, p.322). The increase in social capital leads an increase in "civic capacity" which is the "building of social capital at territorial levels beyond the neighborhood, enabling urban communities to bridge group differences and support broader interactions" (Savitch and Kantor, 2002, p.323). The CDP looks to create an organization empowered by social capital to develop broad goals for a community to address the effects of the market upon their individual place. Such broader interactions can lead to a heightened concern for cultural preservation in a city faced with globalization (savitch and Kantor, 2002).

Such CDPs make use of a grassroots effort coupled with a building of relations with the major players of development such as government or businesses to pursue development that addresses the needs of both parties. The contents of CDPs differ widely in organization and overall function. An example given by Savitch and Kantor is of an organization in South Bronx of New York. This organization helped facilitate "sweat equity" programs to help the renovation

of their community (Savitch and Kantor, 2002, p.324). Along the same lines, CDPs catered towards cultural heritage will allow for a mending of the global forces by creating political pressure to make developments more sensitive to local conditions.

Another approach offered by the authors is the creation of regional governmental bodies. Such regionalism can allow for governments to spread their financial foundation which "enables local governments to more easily substitute public-sector investments for private sector-investments, and it allows cities the opportunity to shift the cost of providing services to governments with a larger and more leastic revenue base" (Savitch and Kantor, 2002, p.330)

They further state that "fiscal regionalism ultimately could encourage local governments to undertake longer-term perspectives in fashioning urban development strategies – in turn, giving greater attention to social priorities rather than just going after every last tax dollar to cover tight local budgets" (Savitch and Kantor, 2002, p.330). With a wider financial base, cities will be less dependent upon incremental revenue offered by global development. Also, a regional approach to government can limit the amount of self-destructive competition that cities exhibit to attract global capital (Savitch and Kantor, 2002). A business that must stay in the general area but wants to delocate to the outside periphery will still be included in the laws and taxes charged by the regional government (Savitch and Kantor, 2002).

Such approaches could be helpful in the mending of the impeding global trends mentioned in Brazil, Prague, and the US. CDPs can increase the citizen's ability to define for city officials the local values worth preserving. Regional government can expand financial clout as well as make it impossible for a business to fully dislocate from a city's taxes.

3.1.2 Tourism

The homogenizing influences of tourism and the inauthentic types of developments it causes can also be dealt with in an effective manner. Sunakorn and Pinijvarasin (2007) detail out in their essay *Sustainable Tourism for Local Identity* the aspects of a sustainable tourist plan for rural villages in the northern part of the Chaing Mai providence, Thailand. The government wanted to open up rural communities to the tourism because of the rise in the cultural tourism industry. However, to do so effectively, the effects of tourist activity had to be mitigated as to prevent harmful effects to occur upon the remote mountain villages that the tourists were to visit. A collaboration between the Faculties of Forestry, Department of Home Economics, and the Economics and Architecture at Kasetsart University was established to create a plan for sustainable tourism (Sunakorn and Pinijvarasin, 2007).

Their plan first identified the appropriate programs for tourist to enjoy based upon the assets and abilities of the separate rural communities involved. This ensured that the cultural heritage was being presented in an authentic manner to the tourists since the activities cater to the specific attributes of the rural community. Having identified these, the next step taken was to improve or create new facilities that support this type of activity. These new or improved facilities are to be in the same style of the village as to support their existing architectural features. For example, new landscaping to be done in the area in support of tourist activity should not only have the local species used by the village but also be maintained by locals with knowledge of the appropriate gardening practices. Also, transportation that the tourists use has to support the type of transportation acceptable in the area. This may preclude the use of automobiles or other mechanical devices that are not characteristic or used by the residents of the area. The final aspect detailed by the sustainable tourism plan is that the negative effects of

tourism in the area had to be mitigated through a plan. Through the initial letting of only a small amount of tourist through in the beginning, the unanticipated detrimental effects can be identified and addressed. Once effectively addressed, larger tourist number can be allowed to visit. Such mitigation will allow for a sustainable tourism approach to develop because the harmful effects will not accumulate but instead be minimized through such an operating program (Pinijvarasin, Sunakorn, 2007).

Tourism in this manner becomes beneficial to the region because of the increase in capital it has brought to the area while also being supportive of the local culture and identity. Though slightly higher of a cost to maintain, the overall benefits of such a program include that the local culture will be maintained making the tourism industry in the area a sustainable asset to be profitable for a considerable amount of time. The example of the destruction of the neo-Moorish landscape of Marrakech can take this program as a good example on how to preserve its uniqueness. To draft such a plan the involvement of experts as well as community members should be sought after to ensure that both have a say in the plan.

3.1.3 Rootedness

Cross cultural design can be used to mold global trends into more localized and specific designs that cater to local populations. Such design can use the elements of personal experience of place to optimize them. This includes making areas more prone for a sense of rootedness to develop and flourish.

Low et al. (2002) looked into the aspect of cultural design and the sense of rootedness exhibited by residents. In the essay *Recapturing Erased Histories*, Low et al. looked into the design of Independence National Historic Park and how certain cultures where expressed in the park. Residents of the area were asked as to their attitudes about the park. This study is

interesting because it was done in a multicultural area, where there is more than just one single cultural heritage to represent. Thus, representing the culture effectively is a complex issue since many cultural elements had to be balanced in some manner as to appeal to the maximum amount of people.

Ethnicities which saw a lack in the connection between their ethnic values and histories shared a more negative view of the park. For example, the park has no elements which note the role of African-Americans in the neighborhood or even the establishment of the park. Because of this they do not feel like the park is intended for them and decide to go to other parks (Low, et al., 2002).

An ethnicity that had a more positive view of the park was the Jewish community. This is attributed to the responses from the interviewee's who pointed out the fact that the liberty bell, one of the most prominent features in the park, has a Jewish motto engraved in it. They also stated that the conception of liberty was a Jewish gift to America. Because of this they felt more ambient towards the park than other cultures, seeing a connection between their cultural values and that expressed by the park (Low, et al., 2002).

In addition, Vietnamese residents felt that the conception of liberty expressed in the Independence National Historic Park fit well with their country's struggle from constant oppression by the French, Americans, and so forth. This helped them see the park in a good light. It should be noted that most all of the interviewee's of Low's study stated that they support the inclusion of more cultures in the park equally. Though some preferred theirs as higher priority they did not wish to exclude others (Low, et al., 2002).

So when considering how to represent local culture in design, the values of the specific cultures in the area should be used in the design. This will create a more welcoming environment

for these cultures. Jewish-Americans directly felt that the park and the conception of justice was a direct expression of Jewish values and Vietnamese residents felt that the ideas proposed by the park fit well with the history of their county's struggle (Low, et al., 2002). African-Americans, however, felt a lack of identification with the park because nothing was shown concerning the slavery their ancestors had to endure, the African-American community displaced to create the park, nor elements of how they helped create the park (Low, et al., 2002). To increase the effectiveness and welcoming atmosphere of the Independence National Historic Park, more elements that support the African-American community should be established.

Bull, Radovic, and Parin (2007) offer an analysis on how to best achieve rootedness through cultural design. In their concluding chapter to *Cross Cultural Urbanism*, theoretical aspects of cross cultural design are discussed and a framework for reaching this end in our globalized society is given. The authors state three propositions to enhance the effectiveness of cross cultural design. The first of these is that there needs to be multiple formats for communication between stakeholders. This includes the formation of symposiums, workshops, studios and research that look to enhance the effectiveness of cross-cultural design practice. It is the lack of communication and understanding that causes for standardization of practices (Bull, Radovic, and Parin, 2007). Had the African American community around the Independence National Historic Park been engaged with through dialog, the park could have initially catered to the cultural and historical elements of this population.

In addition, the authors recognize the needs for conceptual open-mindedness and cross-cultural inclusively to be included in the design process. This allows for the designers and decision makers to depart from standard models to look for creative solutions to the developments they are creating (Bull, Radovic, and Parin, 2007).

Finally, the authors stress the need to set up culturally responsive methodology in the design process. Such processes include the participation of local communities since they "can articulate the value of their historical places and practices as tangible manifestations of local culture" (Bull, Radovic, and Parin, 2007, p.224). This runs parallel to popular urbanism but differs in that in cultural design, the community is engaged with and encouraged to help make future design decisions for the developments planned in their area. Being responsive to the local residents will allow for an altering in the standard methods employed by international developers.

Culturally oriented design has to take into the values of the resident of the area and support their needs to be truly effective and not have a homogenizing effect upon the urban realm. The representation of personal and collective values is the goal to be achieved by good cultural design.

3.1.4 Identity

Cultures and identity have to be allowed to flourish to preserve existing sense of place. An approach defined by Askew (2002) in his analysis of Bangkok Thailand, notes that there must be a demand for distinct places in the population for there to be an organized response against the forces of homogenization. Through such "popular urbanism", communities can unite and pool together resources to protect what they find valuable (Askew, 2002, p.239). In order to stimulate this demand, local culture has to be allowed to be defined and expressed. With a clear conception, organizations that use the local values as a basis to their purpose and action can effectively enact change in the urban realm to continue the existence of this identity.

Such political organization to support urban identity can be seen in the pertinent example of Bangkok's Ban Khura district. Ban Kuhra is a district of mainly Muslim inhabitants. The

Expressway and Rapid Transit Authority of the federal government sought to build a freeway through the district in order to improve mobility within the city and improve investment through new infrastructure. The decision is in the favor of global capital because it facilitates the improvement of mobility of goods and services that are required by inner-city businesses (Askew, 2002).

To combat this procedure, the community organized to create an organization in the interest of preserving the district and fighting off governmental pressure to redevelop it. The community leaders were able to negotiate with the prime minister on the basis of historical rights, but this was temporary, lasting only until a regime change occurred (Askew, 2002).

Community leaders then sought to establish solidarity within the neighborhood based upon the Muslim identity prevalent in the district. One of the community leaders used the mosque as a basis for building support. Askew notes that:

the chairman of the community's defense committee argued that the mosque was not like a Thai spirit house, which could be moved; in contrast, the mosque was the heart of the community's identity at Ban Khrua. He maintained that the state's proposal to remove four hundred homes and relocate residents would threaten the life of the mosque, and was tantamount to attack on the religion and the viability of the community. (Askew, 2002, p.238)

Such rhetoric improved cohesion in the community to work together to preserve the district.

Most importantly, the community used local media to distribute and garner support for their struggle on a city scale rather than just focusing in on the neighborhood. This opened up the conflict to the general public and allowed for the involvement of middle class experts and academics. Through their involvement, government statistics that supported the project and gave it political approval were exposed to be exaggerated realities of the actual effects the new highway would have upon traffic congestion. Without these supporting statistics, the rational for the development was lost and the highway did not get built as planned (Askew, 2002).

Instead, the government came back with a new proposal on the table. This proposal was retrofitted to fix the problems of the previous project, as well as looked to appease the community members more actively. Instead of leveling 400 households, the new proposal leveled 200. While not ideal, the effects of the community organization can be seen. Without the organization and collective effort of the citizens, the initial project proposal would have been approved and built, displacing more residents while also being a faulty project. In the negotiated project, fewer families were displaced, the mosque was maintained, and the project was addressed to solve its short comings. The case study showed that:

against the claims of the state that the infrastructure needs of the metropolis were supreme, the Ban Khrua protest articulated an alternative valuation of urban space, a popular urbanism which asserted that culture, religion, and popular memory underpinned the quality of urban life for ordinary people in the city. (Askew, 2002, p.239)

Forces in favor of improving global capital flows were challenged and local values prevailed.

The Ban Khura protest changed the focus of planning efforts from capital enhancement to the preservation of the established place and culture. With such efforts, a focus upon cultural identity in the city can be maintained.

Mballa (2007) in his essay *The Communal Project and the Reinforcement of Values* recognizes that the urban:

project reveals itself as a space of cultural expression, mobilizing many stakeholders and interested parties based on...their respective capacities to access capital. Thus, the way a project values the historical or contemporary, the monumental or banal, the public or private, the conservation practices of the state (Amougou, 2001), the development sector, the community or individuals, reveals the relative power of each and its position in the complex web of contemporary social relationships. (Mballa, 2007, p.46)

With the emergence of new organizations that concern themselves with popular urbanism, the types of projects pursued can shift in favor of local urban heritage instead of being dominated by the global market. This will help maintain the sense of place already established in the area by

incorporating local values as identified by these new heritage organizations and not allow for imposing foreign models and standards to be applied to an area.

It should be noted that the case studies looked at so far in this report have all concerned areas that have an identifiable monoculture to rally around be it Little Saigon or the Ban Kuhra district. However, without a clear conception of a shared identity, a community will not know what to preserve. In this atmosphere political efforts to create an urban heritage foundation will falter without an ability to value what is currently present. There are two ways that an identity can be fostered for a community, allowing for the community to better guide development according to these newly found values. One way is through the creation of local events that bring residents together to educate and express communal values in a highly visible manner. The second is through designating/creating *mutable space*, space where culture and values can be openly expressed in the urban environment for the public to experience and participate.

Community events can be effective in exploring the common values of an area and help establish identity. An example of developing popular demand for cultural aspects in America can be exemplified by the *Boyle Heights: the Power of Place* community event that was held in 2003. Boyle Heights is a community of Los Angeles that was primarily inhabited by Japanese Americans in the past but has currently under gone demographic shifts that has changed the makeup of the community. In order to share and educate the community about its shared past and its multicultural present, the National Japanese American Museum, in collaboration with other organizations, held a large community event. This event included museum exhibitions that detailed the history and culture of the area, artistic performances, among other exhibits. Through this event, the community was able to come together to share their common values. Such an

effort can make communities come together to celebrate their common values and define new values (Boyle Heights Project, n.d.).

A second way to develop identity is through the creation of *mutable space*. An example of this is the McCormick Campus Center built at the Illinois Institute of Technology. It is the argument of Whitford (2007) that this development represents the aspects of a "disintegrated" subject, being without orthodox form itself and without distinct identity (Whitford, 2007, p.40). The development tries to be "pre-ego, pre-individual, pre-identity: and epigenetic soup full of potential" by not conforming to preconceived designs or cultures (Whitford, 2007, p.40). In doing so, the building becomes full of potential because it does not have ties to past traditions or rationalities. Instead, this type of space can be free from preconceptions of how to use the space (Whitford, 2007).

The McCormick building is economical and simple in its construction as to maximize the potential for user expression. It is such architecture that can be libratory and be "an architecture of becoming" (Whitford, 2007, p.41) by allow for new ideas and values to cultivate and come to being. By allowing for such a space to be mutable by the public, communal values can be accumulated in the space.

The exhibits done in the library of California Polytechnic State University San Luis

Obispo (Cal Poly) can be seen to be in close conjunction with this concept. Student groups,

operating under a pre-determined theme, create projects to be shown on the second floor that

stimulate the students. The most recent project was that of creating kinetic structures that library

patrons play and interact with as they pass by. The idea proposed here is to expand the concept

found in the Cal Poly library. A broader audience of the general public should be involved so

that they may have a space where they can create or exhibit their work.

Such design would help express the antithesis to global trends because such a space becomes an area for local expression, independent from architectural cues. The residents could change the space and in changing it express their values and interests. Being created and defined by residents of the area, such a space would not impose an external culture onto the space. An example of this can be seen in Berlin's Kunsthaus Tacheles located near the city's center. This development consists of an abandoned building that has been taken over by local and international artist. The residents of the development have reinvented the area through art installations. The public is free to enter and exit the facility to see what has been created there. Such areas in multiple cities can allow for residents to engage themselves and create modes of local expression.

Community events or mutable space can help establish local values where they may be currently hidden. With such a guiding theme established, popular urbanism can be attained. Popular urbanism is important in the context of a global society because it maintains a demand for local, unique culture and history. As detailed by Pizarro (2002), the influence of global media upon the developing communities of Latin America created demand for these standardizing types of developments. Without a demand for the preservation of the distinctiveness of place, no effort to do so will rightfully exist. Popular urbanism maintains that such a demand will exist and be curtailed to the needs of the local citizens.

Globalism can also be attacked at the scale of individual buildings through critical regionalism. Critical regionalism is a movement in architecture that stresses the mixing of the global and the local elements within the design of individual buildings. Frampton (1983) details out six aspects of Critical Regionalism in his essay *Towards a Critical Regionalism: Six Points* for an Architecture of Resistance. In this publication, Frampton draws upon the ideal of Ricoeur

on how to "become modern and return to the sources; how to revive an old dormant civilization and take part in universal civilization" (Frampton, 1983, p.16).

Frampton recognizes the homogenization of place brought on by globalization in the realm of architecture. He states that "modern building is now so universally conditioned by optimizing technology that the possibility of creating significant urban form has become extremely limited...Today the practice of architecture seems to be increasingly polarized between, on the one hand, a so-called "high tech" approach predicted exclusively upon production and, on the other, the provision of a "compensatory façade" to cover up the harsh realities of this universal system" (Frampton, 1983, p.17). Frampton recognizes the importance that capital has in determining the design of developments and how this has hindered the possibilities that can emerge because architects are forced by market logic to look solely at economically optimizing features. These types of developments (typical of the "new urban objects" as mentioned by Ciccolella and Mignaqui, 2002, p.311) contribute to the homogenization of place.

In order to combat this, Frampton explains how to best adapt architecture to the local particularities of place. Such a commitment leads to the establishment of distinct place by creating buildings that cater to their respective cultural and landscape context. For example, the importance of local topography, climate, and light should be considered in the creation of these buildings. This is usually hampered by the building of air conditioning dependent structures that have un-openable windows that do not allow the building inhabitants to experience the local climate (Frampton, 1983).

Also, buildings that form to the existing topography and do not perform a bulldozing of the land represent the locality well. Frampton recognizes that: the bulldozing of an irregular topography into a flat site is clearly a technocratic gesture which aspires to a condition of absolute *placelessness*, whereas the terracing of the same site to receive the steeped form of a building is an engagement in the act of 'cultivating' the site. (Frampton, 1983, p.26)

Using the existing topography in the form of the building, though not economically favorable, will allow for the existing and perhaps distinguishing feature of the area in question to exist despite the imposition of a new development. Through the use of these elements, the sense of place can be maintained despite new facilities because these new facilities cater to the place's existing characteristics (Frampton, 1983).

One example of a critical regionalism project would be the Jean-Marie Tijbaou Cultural Center located in Noumea, New Calendonia. This development is a cultural center that was created in memory of the assassinated political leader Jean-Marie Tijabou (Lefairve and Tzonis, 2003). The project is an interesting conception of incorporating local trends with the use of modern technology and standards. The project exhibits ten hut-like buildings that mimic the hut structure of the indigenous Kanak people of the area (Renzo Piano Building Workshop, 2010). Incorporated into this form is modern technology and building practices. The engineering of the structures allows for them to catch and slow the tropical winds that blow through the area. The structure interacts with the natural elements of the area through the use of two exterior layers which optimizes wind circulation for the building as well as through the curvature of the huts which allows for the users of the building to be sheltered from direct sunlight (Lefairve and Tzonis, 2003).

According to the Renzo Piano Building Workshop, the local culture has a special relationship to nature, and for this reason the development is intermixed with vegetation of the area to allow for that bond to be expressed on the site (Renzo Piano Building Workshop, 2010).

The design of the Jean-Marie Tijbaou Cultural Center allows for local values to continue their existence through directly supporting them in the design of the structure.

3.1.5 City image

In order to maintain the cognitive maps created by the citizens of a city, an analysis of the city or area in question should be done. Lynch did such studies to illustrate the points of his book. Such analyses involve asking residents to map their neighborhood or city at large on a piece of paper (Lynch, 1960). In the process, the participants detail out the area according to the elements defined by Lynch, be it paths, nodes, districts, landmarks or edges (Lynch, 1960). When complete, these maps can be analyzed by city planners.

Such maps can help the planner understand the key elements of the area that citizens use to navigate. The common themes found in multiple maps can then be identified as important for individual cognitive maps on a community level. These elements should be taken into consideration when future development is being pursued. In this manner, planners can know what elements to look towards preserving in order to maintain such cognitive maps and maintain the imagability of the city for its residents. This provides an opportunity for the city to remain legible during the restructuring process by maintaining the elements that are most commonly used.

4. Conclusion

Recent trends in the restructuring of the capitalist system through new inventions that facilitate communication and mobility improvements have had impacts upon areas of uniqueness. Places are now becoming more similar because of imposing developments that cater to the attraction of global capital. Urban spaces deemed as unique because of the shared culture

and identity of residents has been devalued. Cities, especially in developing countries, instead have put more of an importance upon the accumulation of international investments. These investment opportunities require a restructuring of the urban environment, a restructuring process that is destructive to distinct sense of place.

However, the forces of globalization are not overwhelming and are combatable. Instead, it becomes imperative for cities and local jurisdictions with the ability to recognize distinct places to take action in preserving and enhancing these assets. Through planning coordination such efforts can be done effectively. Through the use of community development partnerships, the stimulation of a demand for unique places, the incorporation of cultural design and critical regionalism, increasing the effectiveness of city bargaining opportunities, and maintaining the imagability of the city, places can be allowed to flourish as distinctive areas despite the effects of globalization. These multiple approaches to mending the effect of globalization upon local communities are all varying in their effectiveness and are to be used where the context is most appropriate for their use.

Since globalization brings along with it an economic rationalization of space, the priorities of planning in contemporary society should reflect a higher priority of local cultural values in order to combat globalization. If one ignores all but the values upon which a money value can be put upon, one looses a lot of the aspects that make a city worth experiencing. A devaluation of the economic gains made from development allows of the other aspects of city development to flourish. Such a paradigm shift is not immediate and will require work to fully develop. However, a realization of the benefits associated with socially and culturally oriented development will hopefully help shift the globalization paradigm to be more favorable to localities and their unique attributes.

References

- Abrahamson, M. (1996). *Urban enclaves: Identity and place in America*. New York: NY. Worth Publishers.
- Askew, M. (2002). The challenge of co-existence: The meaning of urban heritage in contemporary Bangkok. In W. S. Logan. (Ed.) *The 'disappearing' Asian city: Protecting Asia's urban heritage in a globalizing world.* (pp.229-244). New York: NY. Oxford Press.
- Banerjee, T. & Loukaitou-Sideris, A. (1998). *Urban design downtown: Poetics and politics of form.* Berkeley: CA. University of California Press.
- Boyle Heights Project (n.d.) *Exhibition overview*. Retrieved from Japanese American National Museum at: http://www.janm.org/exhibits/bh/exhibition/exhibition.htm
- Bull, C., Boontharm, D., Parin, C., Radvoic, D., Tapie, G. (2007). *Cross Cultural Urban Design: Global or Local Practice?* Abingdon: UK. Routledge.
- Bull, Radovic, & Parin. (2007). Conclusion: Urban design for a cross-cultural future. In Bull et al. (Eds.) *Cross cultural urban design: Global or local practice?* (pp.208-232). Abingdon: UK. Routledge.
- Ciccolella, P. & Mignaqui, I. (2002). Buenos Aires: Sociospatial impacts of the development of global city functions. In S. Sassen. (Ed.) *Global Networks Linked Cities*. (pp. 309-325). New York: NY. Routledge.
 - Cresswell, T. (2004). Place: A short introduction. Malden: MA. Blackwell Publishing.
- Flusty, S. (2004). *De-coca-colonization: Making the globe from the inside out*. London: UK. Routledge.
- Frampton, K. (1983). Towards a critical regionalism: Six points for an architecture of resistance. In Foster, H. (Ed.) *Postmodern culture*. London: UK. Pluto Press.
- Garcia, L. D. (2002). The Architecture of Global Networking Technologies. In S. Sassen (Ed.), *Global Networks Linked Cities*. (pp. 39-71). New York, NY: Routledge.
- Hall, P. (2002). *Cities of tomorrow: An intellectual history of urban planning and design in the twentieth century.* (3rd ed.). Oxford, UK: Blackwell Publishing.
- Lefaivre, L. and Tzonis, A. (2003). *Critical regionalism: Architecture and identity in a globalized world*. Munich: Germany. Prestel.

- Logan, W. (2002) Introduction: Globalization, cultural identity, and heritage. In W. S. Logan (Ed.) *The Disappearing "Asian" City: Protecting Asia's Urban Heritage in a Globalizing World.* (pp.xii-xxi) New York: NY. Oxford University Press
- Low, S. M., Taplin, D., Scheld, S., Fisher, T. (2002). Recapturing erased histories: Ethnicity, design, and cultural representation a case study of Independence National Historical Park. *Journal of Architectural and Planning Research*. V.19 No. 4 (pp.282-299).
 - Lynch, K. (1960). The image of the city. Cambridge, MA: MIT Press.
- Mazumdar, S., Mazumdar, S., Docuyanan, F., McLaughlin, C. M. (2000). Creating a sense of place: The Vietnamese-Americas and Little Saigon. *Journal of Environmental Psychology*, 20, (pp.319-333).
- Mballa, E. A. (2007). The communal project and the reinforcement of values. In C. Bull et. al. (Eds.) *Cross Cultural Urban Design: Global or Local Practice?* (pp.46-49). Abingdon: UK. Routledge.
- Milligan, M. J. Interactional past and potential: The social construction of place attachment. *Symbolic Interaction*. V.21 is. 1. (pp.1-33).
- Nasution, K. S. & Jenkins, G. (2002). The challenge of co-existence: The meaning of urban heritage in contemporary Bangkok. In W. S. Logan. (Ed.) *The 'disappearing' Asian city: Protecting Asia's urban heritage in a globalizing world.* (pp.229-244). New York: NY. Oxford Press.
- Pinijvarasin, W. & Sunakorn, P. (2007) Sustainable tourism for local identity: The hill-tribe of northern Thailand. In C. Bull et. al. (Eds.) *Cross Cultural Urban Design: Global or Local Practice?* (pp.119-124). Abingdon: UK. Routledge.
- Pizarro, R. (2002). Exporting the dream: Hollywood cinema and Latin American suburbia. In Heikkila, E. J. & Pizarro, R. (Eds.). *Southern California and the world.* (pp.179-194). Westport: CT. Praeger Publishers.
 - Relph, E. (1976). Place and placelessness. London: UK. Pion Limited.
- Renzo Piano Building Workshop. (2010). Jean-Marie Tjibaou cultural center. Retrieved from Renzo Piano Building Workshop website at: http://rpbw.r.ui-pro.com/
 - Sassen, S. (ed) (2002). Global Networks Linked Cities. New York, NY: Routledge.
- Savitch, H. V., Kantor, P. (2002) *Cities in the International Marketplace: The Political Economy of Urban Development in North America and Western Europe.* Princeton: NJ. Princeton University Press.

- Sykora, L. (1994). Local urban restructuring as a mirror of globalization processes: Prague in the 1990s. *Urban Studies*. V.31, is.7. Retrieved from Academic Search Elite.
- Time. (2006). *A brief history of globalization*. Retrieved from Time Magazine website at: http://www.time.com/time/magazine/article/0,9171,1174759,00.html
- Tournier, J. (2007). Urban development and context: the traditional landscape and globalization in Marrakech. In C. Bull et al. (Ed.) *Cross Cultural Urban Design: Global or Local Practice?* (pp.49-57). Abingdon: UK. Routledge.
- U.S. Census Bureau. (2009). Geographical Mobility: 2008 to 2009 detailed tables. Retrieved from U.S. Census website at: http://www.census.gov/population/www/socdemo/migrate/cps 2009.html
- Whitford, S. (2007) Dissolved identity and disintegrated globalization. In C. Bull et al. (Ed.) *Cross Cultural Urban Design: Global or Local Practice?* (pp.39-46). Abingdon: UK. Routledge.
- Fulton, W. & Shigley, P. (2005). *Guide to California planning*. (3rd ed). Point Arena: CA. Solano Press Books.