

1 **Impact of Organic Amendments on the Development of Phenanthrene**

2 **Catabolism in Soil**

3

4 **Victor T. Omoni, Alfonso J. Lag-Brotons and Kirk T. Semple***

5 **Lancaster Environment Centre, Lancaster University, Lancaster, LA1 4YQ, UK**

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20 * Corresponding Author: Email: k.semple@lancaster.ac.uk

21 **Abstract**

22 This study investigated the impact of spent brewery grains and spent mushroom
23 compost on the development of phenanthrene biodegradation in soil. Two aspects were
24 considered: (i) the influence of increasing waste-to-soil ratios (1:10, 1:5, 1:2, 1:1 & 2:1)
25 and (ii) the impact of soil-PAH contact time (1 – 100 d). Biodegradation was quantified
26 by measuring changes in the lag phase, the fastest rates and extents of mineralization of
27 ¹⁴C-phenanthrene, as well as changes in the number of total heterotrophic and
28 phenanthrene degrading bacteria and fungi. The amendment of smaller amounts of the
29 wastes (1:10 & 1:5) resulted in greatest levels of biodegradation. Microbial numbers
30 increased in all of the amended soils but phenanthrene-degrading numbers in most
31 amended soils did not correlate with the rates and extents of ¹⁴C-phenanthrene
32 mineralization. This investigation highlighted the value of waste organic materials as
33 nutrient sources to stimulate microbial degradation of contaminants in soil.

34

35 **Keywords** Spent brewery grains, spent mushroom compost, phenanthrene,
36 biodegradation, soil

37

38 **1. Introduction**

39 Polycyclic aromatic hydrocarbons (PAHs) are ubiquitous contaminants of major
40 concern in the environment, being potentially harmful to human health due to their
41 carcinogenicity, teratogenicity and mutagenicity potential (European Commission DG
42 Environment, 2013). They are produced primarily through three main processes:
43 biogenic (or diagenetic), petrogenic and pyrogenic (Gennadiev et al., 2015). Both
44 natural and anthropogenic sources can occur through petrogenic and pyrogenic
45 processes.

46 Pyrogenic sources are formed from incomplete combustion of fossil fuels and biomass
47 (petroleum, wood, coal and related products), which are the major routes of PAHs
48 contamination in the environment compared to the natural (petrogenic) sources
49 (Gennadiev et al., 2015). Thus, making these hydrophobic organic contaminants
50 ubiquitous in the environment (Akpor et al., 2007), and recalcitrant, being composed by
51 two or more fused aromatic rings (Ogbonnaya et al., 2017). Physico-chemical properties
52 of PAHs such as molecular size, solid-liquid partition (K_d) and organic carbon-water
53 partition coefficients (K_{oc}) (Cerniglia, 1993), influence their biodegradability,
54 persistence, and recalcitrance to microbial attack in the environment. In terms of
55 mobility in the environment, properties such as hydrophobicity, lipophilicity, and low
56 water solubility are also important (Semple *et al.*, 2003).

57 Soils, sediments and other ubiquitous components such as microplastics can act as sinks
58 for PAHs in the environment through sorption to soil mineral and organic fractions
59 (Xiao *et al.*, 2014; Fries and Zarfl, 2012; Lee *et al.*, 2014). This influences the mobility,
60 bioavailability and biodegradation and, as a result, may influence the persistence of
61 these contaminants (Riding *et al.*, 2013). Biodegradation is a major mechanism for the
62 removal of organic contaminants in soils and is dependent on the interaction between

63 hydrocarbonoclastic microorganisms (hydrocarbon degraders) and their surrounding
64 environment; in particular, properties associated with the contaminants (concentration,
65 toxicity, mobility, bioavailability) and nutrient cycling (availability and degrading
66 enzyme presence) (Leahy and Colwell, 1990; Das and Chandran, 2011). Related to the
67 latter aspect, the efficiency of PAH biodegradation may be influenced by low nutrient
68 and organic carbon concentrations in contaminated soil (Zhang et al., 2012). In general
69 terms, the catabolic potential of microorganisms to detoxify and degrade hydrocarbons
70 depends largely on the amount of nutrients available for microbial metabolism
71 (Azubuike et al., 2016). Consequently, ensuring appropriate nutrient supply for
72 microorganism activity (catabolism) has been a recurrent strategy for the remediation of
73 hydrocarbon-polluted sites.

74 Nutrients provided by waste streams applied to land could offer a sustainable approach
75 to resolving the environmental problems arising from petroleum hydrocarbons
76 contaminated land. The use of organic waste materials (sugarcane bagasse, straw (pea
77 and rice), rice husks, food) have proven to speed up microbial growth and metabolism,
78 thus PAHs biodegradation in contaminated soil (Chiu et al., 2009; García-Delgado et
79 al., 2015). Due to the progressive change in waste streams types and nature throughout
80 time, there is a need to continue exploring their properties, especially those which are
81 relevant for biologically mediated remediation strategies (composition, cost-
82 effectiveness, safety, practicality, sustainability, shorter remediation time).

83 Today, a huge amount of wastes is generated from the food production industry in the
84 UK (post farm-gate waste is 9.5 million tonnes, with commercial and industrial business
85 producing 2.9 million tonnes). In Africa, especially in sub-Saharan Africa, waste
86 generation is estimated to be 62 million tonnes/year; and larger percentage (66-70%) of
87 the total waste generated is organic; however, most countries in Africa currently have

88 no estimated or documented value for these wastes. This has also contributed to massive
89 environmental pollution due to alternative use as well as improper disposal routes such
90 as landfilling, illegal dumping and burning. For example, in Africa soils are
91 vulnerable to degradation through environmental conditions (extremes of wetting and
92 drying, leaching, erosion, loss of organic matter) and anthropogenic impacts (fertiliser
93 and pesticide application, land use, deforestation, dumping of wastes and
94 pollution). However, the maintenance of soil health and fertility is crucial to
95 continued sustainable production of food, welfare of families and communities and
96 local and national economies. Some of these rich non-estimated green wastes include
97 spent mushroom compost (SMC) and spent brewery grains (SBG) which could
98 potentially be used for soil bioremediation (Mussatto, 2014). Focusing on the case of
99 SMC and SBG, about 200,000 tonnes of SMC are generated annually in UK (Finney et
100 al., 2009), while in Nigeria more than 750,000 tonnes of SBG and 3.4 million tonnes in
101 the EU (15% from UK) are produced annually, respectively (Aliyu and Bala, 2011;
102 Olawoye et al., 2017). These organic wastes can potentially improve soil structure,
103 increase soil fertility (directly and indirectly) and stimulate plant growth (Kästner and
104 Miltner, 2016, Sigmund *et al.*, 2018). They also offer rich sources of enzymes,
105 including those involved in lignocellulosic decomposition (Phan and Sabaratnam,
106 2012), and represent a potential microbial inocula for biodegradation of recalcitrant
107 organic compounds (Leahy and Colwell, 1990). In contaminated soils, these effects
108 result in biodegradation, stimulation and stabilization of contaminated soil matrix, thus
109 promoting soil restoration (Kästner and Miltner, 2016).

110 To the best of the authors' knowledge, previous studies have not fully investigated the
111 impact of additions of SBG and SMC on biodegradation of PAHs in soil. In this study,
112 the development of phenanthrene (PHE) biodegradation was investigated in soil, which

113 had been amended with two organic wastes (SBG and SMC). Changes in catabolic
114 activity were quantified by measuring the kinetics of ¹⁴C-phenanthrene mineralization to
115 ¹⁴CO₂ and changes in microbial numbers over time.

116

117 **2. Materials and Methods**

118 *2.1 Soil and organic waste collection*

119 Soil (A horizon; 5–20 cm) was collected from a field belonging to Myerscough
120 Agricultural College (Preston, UK). Soil samples were air-dried, homogenized by
121 sieving through a 2mm mesh to remove plant debris, stones, and larger residue
122 fragments and stored at 4⁰C in the dark until use. General soil properties are described
123 in Table S1 (Couling et al., 2010). Fresh SBG and spent SMC were collected from
124 Lancaster Brewery (Lancaster, UK) and Drinkwater's Mushrooms Ltd (Galgate, UK),
125 respectively. General properties are described in Table S2. SMCs were pasteurized at
126 60⁰C for 10-12 h prior to sampling. The materials used for SMC preparation were
127 casing soil (peat), mushroom spawn, gypsum, water, and manure. Freshly collected
128 organic wastes were homogenized by mixing and then stored in a sterile air-tight high-
129 density polyethylene bags at a temperature of 4⁰C.

130

131 *2.2 Experimental set-up and amendment conditions*

132 Soil (2.1 kg dry weight) was spiked with non-labelled phenanthrene (525 mg kg⁻¹ dry
133 weight) as described by Vázquez-Cuevas and Semple (2017). After blending and
134 venting (to remove acetone), the soils were amended with different amounts of organic
135 wastes (dry weight): 1:10, 1:5, 1:2, 1:1 and 2:1 organic waste-to-soil ratios (in triplicate)

136 and a control soil without amendment. The same water holding (60%) was maintained
137 for all treatments throughout the study (water loss determined gravimetrically). The
138 waste-soil mixtures, including the controls and blanks, were immediately transferred to
139 amber glass bottles (to prevent photo-oxidation) and incubated in the dark at $21 \pm 1^\circ\text{C}$
140 over a period of up to 100 days and sampled at 1, 25, 50, 75 and 100 days soil-PAH
141 contact time.

142

143 *2.3 Mineralization of ^{14}C -phenanthrene in soil-waste mixtures*

144 The impact of organic amendments on the catabolic potential of microbial community
145 on ^{14}C -phenanthrene mineralization to $^{14}\text{CO}_2$ for each sampling time (1, 25, 50, 75 and
146 100 days soil-PAH contact time) on the amended and/or aged soil was measured in
147 triplicate using respirometry, which was carried out using modified 250 ml Schott
148 bottles (Reid et al., 2001; Semple et al., 2006). At each time point, 10 ± 0.2 g (dry
149 weight) of the ^{12}C -phenanthrene spiked soil and 30 ml of deionized water was added to
150 a respirometer. A [^{14}C] phenanthrene standard (100 Bq g^{-1} soil) was then added to the
151 respirometer and placed on a flat-bed orbital shaker at 100 rpm and incubated for 14
152 days at $21 \pm 1^\circ\text{C}$. The $^{14}\text{CO}_2$ was trapped in 1 M NaOH (1 ml) in a vial suspended from
153 the lid of the respirometer and sampled bihourly for 1 d and then every 24 h for 14 days
154 and measured by liquid scintillation analyzer (LSC, Canberra Packard Tri-
155 Carb2250CA) using standard protocols for counting and automatic quench correction
156 (Semple et al., 2006).

157 Pristine soil samples spiked with both ^{12}C and ^{14}C -phenanthrene (without organic
158 amendments), and ^{12}C -phenanthrene (without amendment and ^{14}C -labelled compound)
159 were used as the control and analytical blank, respectively. The catabolic potential of
160 the organic wastes was assessed by measuring the length of the lag phase (the time

161 taken before ¹⁴C- phenanthrene mineralization reached 5%), changes in the maximum
162 rate of ¹⁴CO₂ evolution (fastest rate of mineralization resulting from microbial
163 degradation), and the cumulative extent of mineralization of ¹⁴C- phenanthrene in the
164 soil samples (Macleod and Semple, 2006).

165

166 *2.4 Enumeration of heterotrophic and phenanthrene-degrading microorganisms*

167 Enumeration of total heterotrophic and phenanthrene-degrading microorganisms was
168 determined by dilution and spread plate method (Okere et al., 2012). For each of the
169 different microcosms, soil microbial numbers were determined before and after each
170 mineralization/respirometry assay. At each time point, 1 g (dry weight equivalent) was
171 taken before the start of the experiment (before CO₂ evolution) and 1 ml of soil slurry
172 after mineralization. Plate count (PCA) and Potato Dextrose (PDA) media were used for
173 enumeration of heterotrophic bacteria and fungi, respectively (in triplicate). For the
174 phenanthrene degraders, bacterial colonies were counted using minimal basal salt
175 (MBS) medium enriched with 50 mg l⁻¹ ¹²C- phenanthrene (carbon source) and
176 supplemented with an antifungal (fungizone) (Okere et al., 2012). Similar
177 microbiological culture medium supplemented with antibacterial (penicillin-
178 streptomycin-glutamate) was used for the enumeration of phenanthrene-degrading fungi
179 (Boochan et al., 2000).

180

181 *2.5 Data analysis*

182 Statistical analyses carried out included paired t-tests, ANOVA ($p < 0.05$) and Pearson's
183 correlation coefficient were performed using the Statistical Package for the Social
184 Sciences (IBM SPSS Version 23.0). Tukey's post-hoc and Games-Howell test were used
185 to determine significant differences in means of samples within and across groups

186 following the aging effect on ^{14}C -phenanthrene mineralization, lag phase, maximum rate,
187 cumulative extent and microbial numbers at 95% confidence interval ($p < 0.05$) for
188 organic waste-amended soils. Relationships between phenanthrene-degraders versus total
189 extent and fastest rate of mineralization were analyzed using Pearson's product moment
190 correlations. The Pearson's correlation coefficient (r) was ranked on a scale that range
191 between +1 to -1. The value of r is either a perfect positive (+) or negative (-) correlation,
192 when an increase in one variable led to an increase in the other variable (linear
193 relationship) or an increase in one variable causing a decrease in the other variable,
194 respectively. The strength of the relationship is either strong, weak or moderate between
195 the two variables when the absolute values of their relationship approaches +1 or -1. The
196 p -value shows the degree of association between the two variables. Data were plotted
197 using SigmaPlot 10.0 software (Systat Software Inc., USA).

198

199 **3. Results**

200 The development of phenanthrene catabolism was measured in a soil amended with
201 1:10, 1:5, 1:2, 1:1 and 1:2 SBG:soil and SMC:soil ratios, respectively. Changes in
202 kinetics of ^{14}C -phenanthrene biodegradation were measured for 14 days after 1, 25, 50,
203 75 and 100 days of soil-PAH contact time (Figures 1 and 2). The influence of each
204 organic amendment was assessed by measuring changes in the lag phases, rates and
205 extents of ^{14}C -phenanthrene mineralization to $^{14}\text{CO}_2$ (Tables 1 and 2). Changes in the
206 total heterotrophic and phenanthrene degrading bacteria and fungi were also measured
207 over the course of the incubation.

208

209 *3.1 Influence of spent brewery grains on mineralization of ^{14}C -phenanthrene in soils*

210 The length of the lag phase (days) was measured in the SBG-amended soil incubations.
211 Throughout the investigation, the lag phases were significantly shorter ($p < 0.05$) in the
212 soils amended with lower amounts of SBG (1:10 and 1:5). In particular, the shortest lag
213 phases were observed for 1:5 SBG:soil ratio at 100 d of soil-PAH contact time, while
214 the longest lag phases were observed in soils amended with 2:1 SBG:soil ratio ($p <$
215 0.05), which did not reach 5%. Soil incubations amended with SBG (1:10) were found
216 to have significantly shorter lag phases ($p < 0.05$) than 1:5 SBG:soil incubations after 1
217 d and 25 d aging (Table 1 and Figure 1). There were no significant differences ($p >$
218 0.05) between the control and 1:2 SBG:soil incubations, after 1 d soil-PAH contact time
219 and no measurable lag phases were observed for 1:1 and 2:1 SBG:soil incubations.
220 Noticeably, soil-PAH contact time reduced the lag phases in all of the amended
221 conditions and control incubations except 1:1 and 2:1 SBG:soil ratios; an effect which is
222 reflected especially in the lag phases after 100 days ($p < 0.05$), compared to previous
223 time points. With respect to the amount of SBG added to the soil, lower organic waste
224 additions resulted in shorter lag-phases (1:10>1:5>1:2>1:1 > 2:1), although the SBG:soil
225 ratios (1:2, 1:1 and 2:1) showed significantly reduced lag phases compared with
226 unamended control, at most time points during the incubation period.

227 The influence of increasing amounts of SBG on the fastest rates of ^{14}C -phenanthrene
228 mineralization was also measured at each time point over the 100 d incubation (Table 1
229 and Figure 1). The fastest rates were observed for soils amended with 1:10 and 1:5
230 waste:soil incubations, while the lowest were in the 2:1 SBG:soil incubations. The rates
231 of $^{14}\text{CO}_2$ mineralized in the 1:10 and 1:5 SBG:soil incubations did not significantly
232 differ ($p > 0.05$). After 100 d soil-PAH contact time, 1:1 and 2:1 SBG:soil incubations
233 had no effect on rates of ^{14}C -phenanthrene mineralized when compared to un-amended
234 soil.

235

236 The influence of increasing amounts of SBG on the extents of ^{14}C -phenanthrene
237 mineralization was measured at each time point over the 100 d incubation. As with the
238 changes in lag phase and fastest rate measurements, the soil-PAH contact time and the
239 amount of SBG had an influence on the amount of ^{14}C -phenanthrene mineralized to
240 $^{14}\text{CO}_2$ (Figure 1 and Table 1). At 1 and 25 d soil:PAH contact time, treatments
241 containing organic materials were found with significantly higher ($p < 0.05$) extents of
242 mineralization in the following trend 1:10=1:5>1:2=1:1>2:1. The total extents of $^{14}\text{CO}_2$
243 mineralized were also significantly higher ($p < 0.05$) after 50 d contact time for 1:1 and
244 1:2 SGB to soil emndments compared to 25 d with nearly 120% and 278% increases,
245 respectively, in $^{14}\text{CO}_2$ mineralized in amended soils (Table 1). Furthermore, extents of
246 mineralization peaked at 50 d soil-PAH contact time in most amended soils. This
247 treatment period was found significantly higher ($p < 0.05$) in total extents of
248 mineralization compared to the other time points.

249 The 1:2 SBG:soil amendment showed the highest extent of mineralization (48.7%) after
250 50 d soil incubation, but this extent of mineralization to $^{14}\text{CO}_2$ was not sustained
251 following significant ($p < 0.05$) decreases by 50% and 41% after 75 d and 100 d soil
252 contact time, respectively. However, the lower amounts of SBG amended to soil (1:10
253 and 1:5) after 100 d incubation, showed significantly higher extents of mineralization by
254 nearly 19% and 13%, respectively, as compared to results observed at 75 d of soil-PAH
255 contact time. The $^{14}\text{CO}_2$ produced in 2:1 SBG-amended soil was significantly lower (p
256 < 0.05) than any other treatments and control soil at each sampling point during the
257 study.

258

259 3.2 Enumeration of culturable bacterial and fungal heterotrophs and phenanthrene
260 degraders in SBG-amended soils

261 The colony forming units (CFUs g⁻¹ soil dw) of heterotrophic and phenanthrene
262 degrading bacteria were measured for all treatment conditions and control in SGB
263 amended soils over a 100 d incubation (Table 3). CFUs were also measured at the end
264 of the 14-d respirometric incubations and are presented in supplementary material
265 (Table S3). The total heterotrophs and phenanthrene degraders in amended soils
266 increased significantly ($p < 0.05$) based on the amounts of SBG applied to the soil
267 (Table 3). Compared with the controls, significantly higher numbers ($p < 0.05$) of
268 heterotrophic and phenanthrene-degrading CFUs were observed in the soils amended
269 with SBG. In addition, the smaller amounts of SBG added to the soil (1:10 and 1:5)
270 consistently showed higher CFUs (heterotrophs and phenanthrene-degraders) as
271 compared to other amendment conditions. Furthermore, apart from the heterotrophs,
272 phenanthrene degrading bacteria did not proliferate in the soils containing larger
273 amounts of SBG (2:1); this was also observed in the control soil.

274

275 Phenanthrene-degrading bacterial numbers did not statistically correlate with fastest rate
276 of ¹⁴C-phenanthrene mineralized in all amended soils throughout this study (1 d to 100
277 d) (Figure S1), irrespective of the high numbers of phenanthrene-degraders observed in
278 SBG amended soils. Correlations between phenanthrene degraders and total extents of
279 ¹⁴C-phenanthrene mineralization showed a significantly weak but negative correlation
280 ($r^2 = 0.40$, $p = 0.02$) with bacterial numbers in 1:5 SBG:soil. Also, the extent of ¹⁴C-
281 phenanthrene mineralized for higher dose of SBG added to soils (1:2 and 2:1) showed
282 strong negative and strong positive relationships ($r^2 = 0.50$, $p = 0.003$ and $r^2 = 0.61$, $p =$
283 0.001) with phenanthrene-degrading bacterial numbers in soils, respectively.

284

285 The addition of organic amendment at different ratios resulted in a significant increase
286 ($p < 0.05$) in both heterotrophic and phenanthrene-degrading fungal numbers (Table 3).
287 Overall, both fungal numbers were significantly higher than control before
288 mineralization and after amendment of soils with SBG, although 2:1 SBG application to
289 soil showed a lower heterotrophic fungal number compared to other treatments.
290 Noticeably, 1:2 and 1:1 SBG:soil conditions showed significantly higher fungal
291 numbers (heterotrophs and phenanthrene-degraders) over time (1 d to 100 d) compared
292 to other amendments during the investigation. Similar trends were observed for the 1:5
293 SBG:soil incubations, but did not increase consistently throughout the 100 d incubation.
294 Additionally, all SBG:soil conditions (except 2:1) showed high fungal proliferation
295 from 75 d to 100 d soil-PAH contact time. After 100 d soil-PAH contact time, the 1:5
296 SBG:soil incubations displayed the highest CFUs for heterotrophic fungi; while the
297 highest CFUs for phenanthrene-degrading fungi were observed in the 1:2 and 1:1
298 SBG:soil incubations after 25 d soil-PAH contact time.

299

300 As with bacterial numbers, the phenanthrene-degrading fungal numbers for most
301 SBG:soil treatment ratios have no positive relationships with the rates and extents of
302 ^{14}C -phenanthrene mineralization during the study period (Figure S2), except for 1:5 and
303 1:2 SBG:soil incubations in which the overall extents of mineralization significantly
304 correlated with phenanthrene-degrading fungal numbers. However, weak positive ($r^2 =$
305 0.30 , $p = 0.05$) and strong negative ($r^2 = 0.55$, $p = 0.003$) correlations were found in the
306 1:5 and 1:2 SBG:soil conditions, respectively.

307

308 3.3 Influence of spent mushroom compost on mineralization of ¹⁴C-phenanthrene in
309 soils

310 In soils amended with SMC, the length of lag phases were also measured at each time
311 point over the 100 d incubation. It was observed that the lag phases generally decreased
312 in all of the treatments with increased soil-PAH contact time (Figure 2 and Table 2).
313 After 1 day of soil incubation, the lag phase observed for control soils were generally not
314 significantly different ($p > 0.05$) from any of the SMC:soil conditions. However,
315 significant reductions ($p < 0.05$) in the lag phases, after 25 days soil-PAH contact time,
316 were observed for all SMC:soil conditions as compared to 1 day contact time. In addition,
317 at 25 d soil-PAH contact time, the SMC-amended soils except 2:1 showed significantly
318 shorter lag phases compared with the unamended control condition. These observed
319 reductions were not significantly different from the other contact points onwards (50 to
320 100 days). Data showed that the 2:1 SMC:soil incubation displayed the longest lag phases
321 ($p > 0.05$) compared to the other conditions and control throughout the study period..

322

323 The impact of soil-PAH contact time and the amount of SMC on the fastest rate of ¹⁴C-
324 phenanthrene mineralization in soil were studied over 100 d. For all amendment
325 conditions, increases in soil-PAH contact time resulted in faster rates within each SMC-
326 soil treatment, ranging from 0.40% to a maximum of 2.0%. Similarly, the greatest
327 change was observed from 1 d (0.40 – 0.60%) to 100 d (0.80 – 1.90%) soil-PAH contact
328 time: the 1:5 SMC-soil amendment displayed the fastest rate of ¹⁴CO₂ mineralized
329 (2.37% ¹⁴CO₂ h⁻¹) after 100 d soil-PAH contact time. For control soils, the fastest rates
330 of mineralization were not significantly lower ($p > 0.05$) when compared to all SMC

331 amended soils except for 1:5 SMC:soil condition, which had significantly faster rates at
332 1 and 25 d soil-PAH contact time (both $p < 0.05$).

333

334 The influence of increasing amounts of SMC in soil on the extents of ^{14}C -phenanthrene
335 mineralization was also determined over a 100 d period. From this study, the lower
336 SBG:soil ratios (1:10 and 1:5) exhibited significantly greater ($p < 0.05$) extents of ^{14}C -
337 phenanthrene mineralized (50 and 100 d) compared to all other treatment (Table 2).

338 Following 1 d and 25 d of soil-PAH contact time, there were no significant differences
339 in the overall extents in all SMC-amended soils ($p > 0.05$) when compared to their non-
340 equivalent amendment conditions and control soils. Higher extent of mineralization was
341 observed for all amendment conditions, except for the largest dose rate (2:1) from 50 to
342 100 d soil-PAH contact time. In particular, the lower doses (1:5 and 1:10) displayed
343 higher extents of mineralization (50 to 100 d) in comparison with the other conditions.
344 Furthermore, soils amended with SBG showed the highest extents of mineralization
345 after 75 d but this was not statistically different from 50 d soil-PAH contact time.

346

347 *3.4 Enumeration of culturable bacterial and fungal heterotrophs and phenanthrene* 348 *degraders in SMC-amended soils*

349 Bacterial numbers (both heterotrophs and phenanthrene-degraders) in the SMC
350 amended soils were significantly higher ($p < 0.05$) than control soil before
351 mineralization throughout the course of the study. In comparison to the bacterial
352 numbers after mineralization, most of the amended conditions were not higher than the
353 non-amended soil except for 1d and 50 d for heterotrophic bacteria (Table 4). CFUs
354 after mineralization is presented in the supplementary material (Table S4). The 1:1 and

355 2:1 SMC-soil conditions displayed higher bacterial and fungal numbers (both
356 heterotrophs and phenanthrene-degraders) before mineralization throughout the 100 d
357 incubation ($p < 0.05$). The growth of bacteria in amended soils were significantly
358 influenced depending on the SMC dosage application. After 1 d aging, higher organic
359 materials added to soils resulted in greater increases in the bacterial numbers in the
360 following order: 2:1>1:1>1:2:1:5>1:10). Similarly, heterotrophs and phenanthrene-
361 degraders showed higher CFUs in soil amended with higher dose of SMC in rest of the
362 study periods (25 to 100 d).

363

364 Relationships between rates and extents of ^{14}C -phenanthrene mineralized with
365 phenanthrene-degrading bacterial numbers for all amended soils over the 100 incubation
366 were explored (Table 4 and Figure S3). The 1:1 SMC-soil incubation showed a strong
367 negative relationship for both fastest rates ($r^2 = 0.76$, $p = 0.000$) and overall extents ($r^2 =$
368 0.69 , $p = 0.000$) with phenanthrene-degrading bacteria, whilst a weak but significant
369 positive correlation was found between extent and phenanthrene-degrading numbers in
370 1:10 SMC:soil incubation ($r^2 = 0.30$, $p = 0.04$). In addition, both 1:5 and 2:1 SMC:soil
371 incubations displayed weak positive ($r^2 = 0.30$, $p = 0.05$) and weak negative ($r^2 = 0.31$, p
372 $= 0.03$) correlations between the rate of mineralization and phenanthrene-degraders,
373 respectively.

374

375 Fungal numbers for SMC amended soils did not show significant differences from
376 control, apart from 1:5 and 1:2 amended soils before (Table 4) and after mineralization
377 (Table S6). In most cases, the control soil showed a significant heterotrophic and
378 phenanthrene-degrading numbers ($p < 0.05$) than all treatment soils, especially at 50 d
379 and 25d, respectively. After 1 d incubation, the CFUs (heterotrophic and phenanthrene-

380 degrading fungi) from unamended soil were not significantly different ($p > 0.05$) from
381 the rest of the treatments except for 1:5 SMC amended to soils. In contrast to 75 d
382 aging, all amended soils showed significantly higher fungal numbers ($p < 0.05$)
383 compared to 1 d aging. However, results from this study revealed there were no
384 significant relationships ($r^2 < 0.2$; $p > 0.05$) found between rates and extents of ^{14}C -
385 phenanthrene mineralization with phenanthrene-degrading fungal numbers in virtually
386 all amended soils throughout the study.

387

388 **4. Discussion**

389 *4.1 Organic amendment ratios on ^{14}C -phenanthrene mineralization*

390 The addition of nitrogen-rich nutrients (biostimulation) and potentially viable microbes
391 (bioaugmentation) through organic materials application to soils are two effective
392 approaches for the bioremediation of PAH-contaminated soils (Wang et al., 2016). The
393 results in the present study showed that contact time influenced the development of
394 catabolic activity as defined by decreases in the length of the lag phases and increases in
395 the rates and extents of mineralization of ^{14}C -phenanthrene in amended soils. This
396 agrees with findings reported from previous studies (Abioye et al., 2012; Adam et al.,
397 2015), indicating an organic waste stimulatory effect on the biodegradation of
398 phenanthrene. Generally, the addition of SBG and SMC stimulated phenanthrene
399 catabolism in soils, especially with lower amendment ratios (1:5 and 1:10). Application
400 of higher mix ratios (especially 2:1 organic material to soil) of both amendment types
401 largely reduced the extent of mineralization. Das et al. (2011) also noted that due to the
402 very high content of organic materials, microbes may metabolize the readily degradable
403 substrate as carbon source, rather than the target PAH and this was further reflected in
404 the microbial population after mineralization. The microcosm for the higher amendment

405 (2:1) could have limited oxygen transport for microbial activity, hence a reduced
406 mineralization, due to the nature of water saturated bulky material formed after
407 amendment. In addition, this could be linked to high sorptive capacity of organic
408 materials for PAH and subsequent decrease in bioavailability of PAH for microbial
409 degradation (Rhodes et al., 2008). More so, the degree of contaminant sorption and their
410 rapidly/slowly desorbing fractions in amended soils are important factors that determine
411 the extent of microbial sequestration and transformation (Rhodes et al., 2012). The
412 decrease in the catabolic response by the higher amendment (2:1) agrees with previous
413 studies on organic additives addition to PAHs contaminated soils (Namkoong et al.,
414 2002; Semboung Lang et al., 2016).

415

416 In this study, soils amended with SBG and SMC (1:10 and 1:5) showed significantly
417 shorter lag phases over time, while the lag phase of organic waste-soil mixture (2:1) was
418 immeasurable compared to other amendment conditions. This clearly indicated that
419 appropriate amounts of amendments could significantly influence microbial metabolism
420 of the target contaminant (Schaefer and Juliane, 2007). In this study, the lower organic
421 waste-soil mixtures indicated stimulated microbial action as a result of adaptation and
422 bioavailability of PAH fraction as observed in the lag phase compared to the higher
423 ones. Our results found that after 100 d soil incubation, both SGB and SMC showed a
424 further reduction in lag phases with a substantive extent of $^{14}\text{CO}_2$ mineralized indicating
425 stimulatory effects of the supplements and acclimatization of the degrading microbial
426 populations. Several previous studies have demonstrated that the extent of PAHs-
427 association with soil matrices could potentially facilitate microbial adaptation and
428 subsequently reduce the lag phase for microbial degradation (Oyelami et al., 2015;
429 Okere et al., 2017). In this current study, the fastest rates of mineralization revealed a

430 similar pattern as observed for lag phases with increasing soil-PAH contact period.
431 However, the fastest rates of mineralization remained relatively constant in the SBG-
432 amended soils compared to the SMC-amended soils. Therefore, this may be attributed to
433 the higher available nutrient, and low total organic carbon (TOC) initially present in
434 SMC slurry system. Soil fertility and species richness have been reported as driving
435 force for ¹⁴C-phenanthrene degradation (Oyelami et al., 2012). Okere et al. (2017)
436 suggested, however, that a higher TOC in soils may decrease the bioavailability of ¹⁴C-
437 phenanthrene to PAH-degraders, hence a reduction on the rate of mineralization. Higher
438 rates of ¹⁴C-phenanthrene mineralization in amended soils (1:10 and 1:5) of both SMC
439 and SBG in this study indicated the potential influence of low organic amendments
440 resulting from optimal waste ratios for microbial community uptake and degradation
441 (Namkoong et al., 2002). Abioye et al. (2012) and Sigmund et al. (2018) also
442 demonstrated that the addition of smaller amounts of organic amendments to soil (1:10)
443 largely increased degradation rates, despite the sequestration of the chemicals in the
444 soil.

445

446 The extents of ¹⁴C-phenanthrene mineralization in waste-amended soils depended on the
447 amount of organic material added to the soil. Extents of ¹⁴C-phenanthrene
448 mineralization were greater at most time points for both SBG- and SMC-amended soils
449 as the application rates decreased (2:1 < 1:1 < 1:2 < 1:5 < 1:10). In addition, we also
450 found that the lower mix ratios (1:10 and 1:5) consistently displayed higher extents of
451 mineralization than the other amendment conditions in almost all time points. This may
452 be attributed to the potential of the organic wastes to reduce or speed up the desorption
453 process of phenanthrene and/or the likely effect of aging on the bioavailability of PAHs

454 in soil matrices (Semple et al., 2007). It is important to emphasize that sorption of
455 contaminants to soil is a slow and reversible process (Hatzinger and Alexander, 1995).

456

457 *4.2 Influence of microbial population on ¹⁴C-phenanthrene catabolism in soils*

458 The data from this study showed that the addition of exogenous organic materials to soil
459 increase the microbial populations with soil microbial response (both heterotrophs and
460 degraders). The potential of organic amendments to stimulate microbial numbers in soil
461 have been reported in previous studies (Semple et al., 2001; Agarry and Latinwo, 2015),
462 as well as their catabolic response in PAH-contaminated soil (Zhang et al., 2012;
463 Sigmund et al., 2018). The present study suggested that the rich ingredients provided by
464 both amendment types increased microbial proliferation and activity. However, the
465 numbers of phenanthrene-degraders were generally low compared to their counterparts
466 (heterotrophs) in amended soils and this may have affected mineralization end-points in
467 this study. Thus, organic supplements could stimulate the microbial populations
468 (heterotrophs and PAH-degraders) but the low response of PAHs-degrading
469 microorganisms could reduce PAH catabolism in soil (Carmichael and Pfaender, 1997).
470 The results from ¹⁴C-phenanthrene mineralization (both rates and extents) reported here
471 were not influenced by the number of phenanthrene-degraders, except the mix ratio of
472 1:5 for SBG and SMC-amended soils. Also, the CFUs (phenanthrene-degrading fungi
473 and bacteria) present in the 1:1 and 2:1 waste-soil conditions; however, had an influence
474 on the rates and extents of mineralization. Hydrocarbonoclastic microorganisms are the
475 key bio-actors on the biodegradation of pollutants in the environments, but their
476 synergistic role with non-PAH degraders may play an important role in PAH
477 metabolization in contaminated soils (Leahy, 1990).

478

479 **5. Conclusion**

480 The present study indicates that organic amendment (SBG & SMC) addition to soil can
481 influence the ¹⁴C-mineralization of phenanthrene over time. Mineralization of
482 phenanthrene varies for different amendment ratios to soil as well as the length of soil
483 incubation. We found that the lower mix ratios (1:5 and 1:10) of both amendment types
484 can provide the most optimal conditions and could effectively enhance ¹⁴C-
485 phenanthrene mineralization and microbial numbers over time compared to other mix
486 ratios. Aging the soil significantly reduced the lag phases and increased rates and
487 extents of mineralization in phenanthrene-contaminated soil. These two organic wastes
488 should be considered as nutrient supplements during bioremediation of contaminated
489 soil.

490

491 **Acknowledgments**

492 The authors acknowledge the full financial support of this research from Petroleum
493 Technology Development Fund (PTDF/ED/PHD/835/16), Nigeria. Also, we would like
494 to thank the management and staff of Lancaster Brewery, Lancaster for providing the
495 SBG and Drinkwater Mushroom farm, Galgate for providing the SMC used in this
496 study.

497

498

499 **References**

500 1. Abioye, O., Agamuthu, P., Abdul, R., 2012. Biodegradation of used motor oil in

- 501 soil using organic waste amendments. *Biotechnol. Res. Int.* 8pages.
502 <http://dx.doi.org/10.1155/2012/587041>
- 503 2. Adam, I. K. U., Miltner, A., Kästner, M., 2015. Degradation of ¹³C-labeled pyrene in
504 soil-compost mixtures and fertilized soil. *Appl. Microbiol. Biotechnol.* 99, 9813–
505 9824. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s00253-015-6822-8>
- 506 3. Agarry, S., Latinwo, G. K., 2015. Biodegradation of diesel oil in soil and its
507 enhancement by application of bioventing and amendment with brewery waste
508 effluents as biostimulation-bioaugmentation agents. *J. Ecol. Eng.* 16, 82–91.
509 <https://doi.org/10.12911/22998993/1861>
- 510 4. Akpor, O.B, Igbinsosa, O.E., Igbinsosa, O.O., 2007. Studies on the effect of petroleum
511 hydrocarbon on the microbial and physico-chemicals characterFistics of soil. *Afr. J.*
512 *Biotechnol.* 6, 1939–1943. <http://dx.doi.org/10.5897/AJB2007.000-2295>
- 513 5. Aliyu, S., Bala, M., 2013. Brewer’s spent grain: A review of its potentials and
514 applications. *Afr. J. Biotechnol.* 10, 324–331. <https://doi.org/10.4314/ajb.v10i3>.
- 515 6. Azubuike, C.C., Chikere, C.B., Okpokwasill, G.C., 2016, Bioremediation
516 techniques–classification based on site of application: principles, advantages,
517 limitations and prospects. *World J. Microbiol. Biotechnol.* 32:1–18.
518 <https://doi.org/10.1007/s11274-016-2137-x>
- 519 7. Boonchan, S., Britz, M.L., Stanley, G.A., 2000. Degradation and mineralization of
520 high-molecular-weight polycyclic aromatic hydrocarbons by defined fungal-bacterial
521 cocultures. *Env. Microbiol. Biodegrad.* 66:1007–1019.
522 <https://doi:10.1128/aem.66.3.1007-1019.2000>
- 523 8. Cerniglia, C.E., 1993. Biodegradation of polycyclic aromatic hydrocarbons.
524 *Biodegradation*, 4, 331–338. [https://doi.org/10.1016/0958-1669\(93\)90104-5](https://doi.org/10.1016/0958-1669(93)90104-5)
- 525 9. Chaillan, F., Chaineau, C.H., Point, V., Saliot, A., Oudot, J., 2006. Factors inhibiting

- 526 bioremediation of soil contaminated with weathered oils and drill cuttings. *Environ.*
527 *Pollut.* 144, 255–265. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.envpol.2005.12.016>
- 528 10. Chiu, S.W., Gao, T., Chan, C.S.S., Ho, C.K.M., 2009. Removal of spilled petroleum
529 in industrial soils by spent compost of mushroom *Pleurotus pulmonarius*.
530 *Chemosphere*, 75, 837–842. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.chemosphere.2008.12.044>
- 531 11. Couling, N., Towell, M., Semple, K., 2010. Biodegradation of PAHs in soil:
532 influence of chemical structure, concentration and multiple amendment. *Environ.*
533 *Pollut.* 158, 3411–3420. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.envpol.2010.07.034>
- 534 12. Das, N., Chandran, P., Das, N., Chandran, P., 2011. Microbial Degradation of
535 Petroleum Hydrocarbon Contaminants: An Overview. *Biotechnol. Res. Int.* 2011, 1–
536 13. <https://doi.org/10.4061/2011/941810>
- 537 13. European Commission DG Environment News Alert Service, edited by SCU:
538 Science for Environment Policy, 2013. The University of the West of England,
539 Bristol. DG ENV News Alert Issue 5, September 2013. *Soil Contamination: Impacts*
540 *on Human Health*.
541 http://ec.europa.eu/environment/integration/research/newsalert/pdf/IR5_en.pdf
542 (Retrieved 23th December, 2017).
- 543 14. Finney, K. N., Sharifi, V. N., Swithenbank, J., 2009. Combustion of spent mushroom
544 compost and coal tailing pellets in a fluidised-bed. *Renew. Energ.* 34, 860–868.
545 <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.renene.2008.06.012>
- 546 15. Fries, E., Zarfl, C., 2012. Sorption of polycyclic aromatic hydrocarbons (PAHs) to
547 low and high density polyethylene (PE). *Environ. Sci. Pollut. Res.* 19, 1296–1304.
548 <https://doi.org/10.1007/s11356-011-0655-5>
- 549 16. García-Delgado, C., D’Annibale, A., Pesciaroli, L., Yunta, F., Crognale, S.,
550 Petruccioli, M., Eymar, E., 2015. Implications of polluted soil biostimulation and

- 551 bioaugmentation with spent mushroom substrate (*Agaricus bisporus*) on the
552 microbial community and polycyclic aromatic hydrocarbons biodegradation. *Sci.*
553 *Total Environ.* 508, 20–28. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.scitotenv.2014.11.046>
- 554 17. Gennadiev, A.N., Pikovskii, Y.I., Tsibart, A.S., Smirnova, M.A., 2015.
555 Hydrocarbons in soils: Origin, composition, and behavior (review). *Eurasian Soil*
556 *Sci.* 48, 1076–1089.
- 557 18. Hatzinger, P.B., Alexander, M., 1995. Effect of Aging of Chemicals in Soil on Their
558 Biodegradability and Extractability. *Environ. Sci. Technol.* 29, 2, 537–545.
559 <http://dx.doi.org/10.1021/es00002a033>
- 560 19. Kastner, M., Mahro, B., 1996. Microbial degradation of polycyclic aromatic
561 hydrocarbons in soil affected by the organic matrix of compost, *Appl. Microbiol.*
562 *Biotechnol.* 44, 668–675. <https://doi.org/10.1007/BF00172501>
- 563 20. Kästner, M., Miltner, A., 2016. Application of compost for effective bioremediation
564 of organic contaminants and pollutants in soil. *Appl. Microbiol. Biotechnol.* 100,
565 3433–3449. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s00253-016-7378-y>
- 566 21. Lau, K.L., Tsang, Y.Y., Chiu, S.W., 2003. Use of spent mushroom compost to
567 bioremediate PAH-contaminated samples. *Chemosphere*, 52, 1539–1546.
568 [https://doi.org/10.1016/S0045-6535\(03\)00493-4](https://doi.org/10.1016/S0045-6535(03)00493-4)
- 569 22. Leahy, J.G., Colwell, R.R., 1990. Microbial degradation of hydrocarbons in the
570 environment. *Microbiol. Rev.* 54, 305–315. PMID: 2215423
- 571 23. Lee, H., Shim, W.J., Kwon, J.H., 2014. Sorption capacity of plastic debris for
572 hydrophobic organic chemicals. *Sci. Total Environ.* 470–471, 1545–1552.
573 <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.scitotenv.2013.08.023>
- 574 24. Leys, N.M., Bastiaens, L., Verstraete, W., Springael, D., 2005. Influence of the
575 carbon/nitrogen/phosphorus ratio on polycyclic aromatic hydrocarbon degradation by

576 Mycobacterium and Sphingomonas in soil. *Appl. Microbiol. Biotechnol.* 66, 726–
577 736. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s00253-004-1766-4>

578 25. Li, Y-H., Li, H-B., Xu, X-Y., Xiao, S-Y., Wang, S-Q., 2017. Distributions, sources
579 and ecological risk of polycyclic aromatic hydrocarbons (PAHs) in subsurface water
580 of urban old industrial relocation areas: A case study in Shenyang, China. *J. Environ.*
581 *Sci. Health*, 52, 971–978. <https://doi.org/10.1021/acs.est.6b04366>

582 26. Macleod, C.J.A., Semple, K.T., 2006. The influence of single and multiple
583 applications of pyrene on the evolution of pyrene catabolism in soil. *Environ. Pollut.*
584 139, 455–460. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.envpol.2005.06.014>

585 27. Mussatto, S. I., 2014. Brewer’s spent grain: A valuable feedstock for industrial
586 applications. *J. Sci. Food Agric.* 94, 1264–1275. <https://doi.org/10.1002/jsfa.6486>

587 28. Namkoong, W., Hwang, E.Y., Park, J.S., Choi, J.Y., 2002. Bioremediation of diesel-
588 contaminated soil with composting. *Environ. Pollut.* 119, 23–31.
589 [https://doi.org/10.1016/S0269-7491\(01\)00328-1](https://doi.org/10.1016/S0269-7491(01)00328-1)

590 29. Ogbonnaya, U.O., Oyelami, A.O., Umego, M.O., Okere, U.V., David, O.A., Fasina,
591 S.A., Semple, K.T., 2017. Assessment of PAH contaminated land: Implementing a
592 risk-based approach. *Environ. Technol. Innovation*, 8, 84–95.
593 <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.eti.2017.06.001>

594 30. Olawoye, B., Adeniyi, D. M., Oyekunle, A. O., Kadiri, O., 2017. Economic
595 Evaluation of Cookie made from blend of Brewers Spent Grain (BSG) Flour,
596 Groundnut cake and Sorghum flour. *Open Agric.* 2, 401–410.
597 <https://doi.org/10.1515/opag-2017-0043>

598 31. Okere, U.V., Cabrerizo, A., Dachs, J., Jones, K.C., Semple, K.T., 2012,
599 Biodegradation of phenanthrene by indigenous microorganisms in soils from
600 Livingstone Island, Antarctica *FEMS Microbiol. Lett.* 329, 69–77.

- 601 <https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1574-6968.2012.02501.x>
- 602 32. Okere, U. V., Schuster, J. K., Ogbonnaya, U. O., Jones, K. C., Semple, K. T., 2017.
- 603 Indigenous ¹⁴C-phenanthrene biodegradation in “pristine” woodland and grassland
- 604 soils from Norway and the United Kingdom. *Environ. Sci- Proc. Imp.* 19, 1437–
- 605 1444. <https://doi.org/10.1039/c7em00242d>
- 606 33. Oyelami, A., Elegbede, B., Semple, K., 2014. Impact of different types of activated
- 607 carbon on the bioaccessibility of ¹⁴C-phenanthrene in sterile and non-sterile soils.
- 608 *Environ.* 1, 137–156. <https://doi:10.3390/environments1020137>
- 609 34. Oyelami, A. O., Ogbonnaya, U., Muotoh, C., Semple, K. T., 2015. Impact of
- 610 activated carbon on the catabolism of ¹⁴C-phenanthrene in soil. *Environ. Sci- Proc.*
- 611 *Imp.* 17, 1173–1181. <https://doi.org/10.1039/c5em00133a>
- 612 35. Phan, C.W., Sabaratnam, V., 2012. Potential uses of spent mushroom substrate and
- 613 its associated lignocellulosic enzymes. *Appl. Microbiol. Biotechnol.* 96, 863–873.
- 614 <https://doi.org/10.1007/s00253-012-4446-9>
- 615 36. Reid, B.J., Macleod, C.J.A., Lee, P.H., Morriss, A. W.J., Stokes, J.D., Semple, K.T.,
- 616 2001. C-respirometric method for assessing microbial catabolic potential and
- 617 contaminant bioavailability. *FEMS Microbiol. Lett.* 196, 141–146. PMID:11267770
- 618 37. Rhodes, A.H., Carlin, A., Semple, K.T., 2008. Impact of black carbon in the
- 619 extraction and mineralization of phenanthrene in soil. *Environ. Sci. Technol.* 42,
- 620 740–745. <https://doi.org/10.1021/es071451n>
- 621 38. Riding M.J., Doick K.J., Martin F.L., Jones K.C., Semple K.T., 2013. Chemical
- 622 measures of bioavailability/bioaccessibility of PAHs in soil: Fundamentals to
- 623 application. *J. Hazard. Mater.* 261, 687–700.
- 624 <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jhazmat.2013.03.033>
- 625 39. Schaefer, M., Juliane, F., 2007. The influence of earthworms and organic additives

- 626 on the biodegradation of oil contaminated soil. *Appl. Soil Ecol.* 36, 53–62.
- 627 40. Semboung Lang, F., Tarayre, C., Destain, J., Delvigne, F., Druart, P., Ongena, M.,
628 Thonart, P., 2016. The effect of nutrients on the degradation of hydrocarbons in
629 mangrove ecosystems by microorganisms. *Int. J. Environ. Res.* 10, 583–592.
630 <https://doi.org/10.22059/ijer.2016.59903>
- 631 41. Semple, K.T., Doick, K.J., Wick, L.Y., Harms, H., 2007. Microbial interactions with
632 organic contaminants in soil: Definitions, processes and measurement. *Environ.*
633 *Pollut.* 150, 166–176. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.envpol.2007.07.023>
- 634 42. Semple, K.T., Morriss, W.J., Paton, G.I., 2003. Bioavailability of hydrophobic
635 organic contaminants in soils: fundamental concepts and techniques for analysis.
636 *Eur. J. Soil Sci.* 54, 809–818. <https://doi.org/10.1046/j.1365-2389.2003.00564>.
- 637 43. Semple, K.T., Reid, B.J., Fermor, T.R., 2001. Impact of composting strategies on the
638 treatment of soil contaminated with diesel fuel. *Environ. Pollut.* 112, 269–283.
639 PMID:11234545
- 640 44. Sigmund, G., Poyntner, C., Piñar, G., Kah, M., Hofmann, T., 2018. Influence of
641 compost and biochar on microbial communities and the sorption/degradation of
642 PAHs and NSO-substituted PAHs in contaminated soils. *J. Hazard. Mater.* 345, 107–
643 113. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jhazmat.2017.11.010>
- 644 45. Sikkema, J., de Bont, J.A., Poolman, B., 1995. Mechanisms of membrane toxicity of
645 hydrocarbons. *Microbiol. Rev.* 59, 201–222. PMID: 7603409
- 646 46. Vázquez-Cuevas, G.M., Semple, K.T., 2017. Measurement of hydrocarbon
647 bioavailability in soil. In: McGenity, T.J., Timmis, K.N., Nogales, B. (Eds.),
648 *Hydrocarbon and lipid microbiology protocols – petroleum, hydrocarbon and lipid*
649 *analysis*. Springer-Verlag Berlin Heidelberg, Germany, pp. 231–246.
- 650 47. Wan, C. K., Wong, J. W. C., Fang, M., Ye, D. Y., 2003. Effect of organic waste

651 amendments on degradation of PAHs in soil using thermophilic composting.
652 Environ. Technol. 24, 23–33. <https://doi.org/10.1080/09593330309385532>

653 48. Wang, C., Yu, D., Shi, W., Jiao, K., Wu, B., Xu, H., 2016. Application of spent
654 mushroom (*Lentinula edodes*) substrate and acclimated sewage sludge on the
655 bioremediation of polycyclic aromatic hydrocarbon polluted soil. RSC Adv. 6,
656 37274–37285. <https://doi.org/10.1039/c6ra05457a>

657 49. Wu, G., Kechavarzi, C., Li, X., Sui, H., Pollard, S. J. T., Coulon, F., 2013. Influence
658 of mature compost amendment on total and bioavailable polycyclic aromatic
659 hydrocarbons in contaminated soils. Chemosphere, 90, 2240–2246.
660 <http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.chemosphere.2012.10.003>

661 50. Xiao, Y., Tong, F., Kuang, Y., Chen, B., 2014. Distribution and source
662 apportionment of polycyclic aromatic hydrocarbons (PAHs) in forest soils from
663 urban to rural areas in the Pearl River Delta of southern China. Int. J. Environ. Res.
664 Public Health, 11, 2642–2656. <https://doi.org/10.3390/ijerph110302642>

665 51. Zhang, J., Lin, X., Liu, W., Wang, Y., Zeng, J., Chen, H., 2012. Effect of organic
666 wastes on the plant-microbe remediation for removal of aged PAHs in soils. J.
667 Environ. Sci. (China), 24, 1476–1482. [https://doi.org/10.1016/S1001-](https://doi.org/10.1016/S1001-0742(11)60951-0)
668 [0742\(11\)60951-0](https://doi.org/10.1016/S1001-0742(11)60951-0)

669

670 **Figure legends**

671

672 **Figure 1.** Development of the catabolism of ^{14}C -phenanthrene to $^{14}\text{CO}_2$ in soils
673 amended with spent brewery grains: control (unamended)(□), 1:10 (■), 1:5 (△), 1:2 (▼),
674 1:1 (○) and 2:1 (●) after 1, 25, 50, 75, and 100d soil-phenanthrene contact time.
675 Values of standard error of mean (SEM) are triplicate samples (n = 3).

676

677 **Figure 2.** Development of the catabolism of ^{14}C -phenanthrene to $^{14}\text{CO}_2$ in soils
678 amended with spent mushroom compost: control (unamended)(□), 1:10 (■), 1:5 (△),
679 1:2 (▼), 1:1 (○) and 2:1 (●) after 1, 25, 50, 75, and 100d soil-phenanthrene contact
680 time. Values of standard error of mean (SEM) are triplicate samples (n = 3).

681 Table 1. Catabolic profile of ¹⁴C-labelled phenanthrene in soil amended with different
682 proportions of **spent brewery grains** after 14 days respirometric assay. Values are
683 mean ± standard error (n = 3).

Contact time (days)	Amendment (%)	Lag phase (¹⁴ CO ₂ ≥5%) d ⁻¹	Fastest rate (% ¹⁴ CO ₂ h ⁻¹)	Cumulative Extent (%)
1	0	^{a1} 9.04 ± 0.08	^{a1} 0.20 ± 0.04	^{b1} 11.13 ± 1.06
	1:10	^{c1} 5.06 ± 0.01	^{a1} 0.36 ± 0.03	^{c1} 25.99 ± 1.23
	1:5	^{b1} 6.91 ± 0.17	^{a1} 0.23 ± 0.04	^{c1} 24.54 ± 1.73
	1:2	^{a1} 9.47 ± 0.01	^{a1} 0.25 ± 0.00	^{b1} 14.53 ± 0.61
	1:1	N/L*	^{a1} 0.02 ± 0.00	^{a1} 0.39 ± 0.06
	2:1	N/L*	^{a1} 0.23 ± 0.08	^{a1} 0.76 ± 0.21
25	0	^{b2} 2.34 ± 0.14	^{b1} 0.13 ± 0.00	^{b2} 16.55 ± 0.32
	1:10	^{d3} 0.34 ± 0.00	^{d3} 1.50 ± 0.02	^{c1} 30.18 ± 2.13
	1:5	^{c2} 0.40 ± 0.01	^{d2} 1.34 ± 0.08	^{c1} 28.60 ± 2.42
	1:2	^{a1} 10.16 ± 0.23	^{ac1} 0.27 ± 0.05	^{b1} 12.86 ± 2.22
	1:1	^{a1} 11.05 ± 0.35	^{c2} 0.22 ± 0.00	^{b2} 16.70 ± 2.56
	2:1	N/L*	^{a1} 0.04 ± 0.00	^{a3,4} 0.43 ± 0.02
50	0	^{c4} 0.69 ± 0.01	^{c3} 0.70 ± 0.04	^{b4} 27.74 ± 1.27
	1:10	^{d2} 0.50 ± 0.01	^{cd2} 0.96 ± 0.06	^{c1} 39.84 ± 2.08
	1:5	^{d1,3} 0.48 ± 0.03	^{d2} 1.10 ± 0.02	^{c2} 44.25 ± 3.08
	1:2	^{b3} 2.05 ± 0.02	^{c3} 0.62 ± 0.01	^{c3} 48.66 ± 1.32
	1:1	^{a2} 3.56 ± 0.11	^{b4} 0.35 ± 0.00	^{b3} 36.66 ± 2.26
	2:1	N/L*	^{a1} 0.01 ± 0.00	^{a2,4} 0.28 ± 0.02
75	0	^{c3} 1.16 ± 0.01	^{b2} 0.32 ± 0.01	^{b3} 23.71 ± 0.03
	1:10	^{d2} 0.49 ± 0.02	^{d2} 0.85 ± 0.06	^{bc1} 26.18 ± 0.91
	1:5	^{d2} 0.42 ± 0.00	^{cd3} 2.11 ± 0.04	^{c1} 30.30 ± 0.95
	1:2	^{a2} 4.14 ± 0.03	^{b2} 0.35 ± 0.04	^{b2} 25.31 ± 2.00
	1:1	^{b2} 1.55 ± 0.05	^{b3} 0.27 ± 0.01	^{bc4} 27.28 ± 0.29
	2:1	N/L*	^{a1} 0.01 ± 0.00	^{a1,2,4} 0.10 ± 0.04
100	0	^{a4} 1.01 ± 0.03	^{b2} 0.33 ± 0.01	^{b2} 19.54 ± 0.46
	1:10	^{b3} 0.33 ± 0.03	^{d3} 2.18 ± 0.13	^{c2} 32.26 ± 0.93
	1:5	^{b3} 0.31 ± 0.00	^{d4} 1.79 ± 0.09	^{c1,2} 34.68 ± 2.75
	1:2	^{ab4} 0.69 ± 0.14	^{c3} 0.78 ± 0.05	^{c2} 28.96 ± 1.10
	1:1	^{ab2} 1.78 ± 0.20	^{a3} 0.27 ± 0.01	^{c4} 28.56 ± 0.71
		N/L*	^{a1} 0.02 ± 0.01	^{a1,4} 0.00 ± 0.02

684

685 N/L* No lag phase (Mineralization did not reach or exceed 5%)

686 * Same letters indicate no statistical differences ($p > 0.05$) in amendment levels within
687 each aging time while different letters indicate significant differences ($p < 0.05$) across
688 amendment levels within each aging time

689 * Same numbers indicate no statistical differences ($p < 0.05$) in aged amended soils
690 across the four sampling points while different numbers indicate significant differences
691 in aged amended soils across the four sampling points (1d to 100d).

692

693

694

695 Table 2. Catabolic profile of ¹⁴C-labelled phenanthrene in soil amended with different
696 proportions of **spent mushroom compost** after 14 days respirometric assay. Values are
697 mean ± standard error (n = 3).

Contact time (days)	Amendment (%)	Lag phase (¹⁴ CO ₂ ≥5%) d ⁻¹	Fastest rate (% ¹⁴ CO ₂ h ⁻¹)	Cumulative Extent (%)
1	0	a ¹ 3.71 ± 0.26	a ¹ 0.34 ± 0.00	a ¹ 21.22 ± 2.13
	1:10	a ¹ 3.25 ± 0.06	ab ¹ 0.57 ± 0.00	a ¹ 21.61 ± 1.39
	1:5	a ¹ 3.50 ± 0.35	b ¹ 0.58 ± 0.00	a ¹ 23.97 ± 0.49
	1:2	a ¹ 3.43 ± 0.06	ab ¹ 0.41 ± 0.00	a ¹ 23.48 ± 1.32
	1:1	a ¹ 3.93 ± 0.21	ab ¹ 0.39 ± 0.00	a ¹ 19.54 ± 1.48
	2:1	a ² 4.09 ± 0.05	ab ¹ 0.38 ± 0.00	a ¹ 25.37 ± 4.57
25	0	a ² 0.45 ± 0.02	a ¹ 0.66 ± 0.05	a ¹ 26.46 ± 0.50
	1:10	c ³ 0.23 ± 0.02	b ² 1.94 ± 0.17	a ¹ 26.81 ± 0.91
	1:5	c ^{3,4} 0.24 ± 0.01	b ² 1.72 ± 0.04	a ^{1,2} 25.07 ± 1.31
	1:2	c ² 0.27 ± 0.02	b ² 1.64 ± 0.04	a ¹ 33.08 ± 3.97
	1:1	b ² 0.35 ± 0.01	a ² 1.14 ± 0.11	a ² 25.75 ± 1.52
	2:1	a ⁴ 0.52 ± 0.00	a ² 0.86 ± 0.00	a ¹ 25.66 ± 0.23
50	0	b ³ 0.21 ± 0.01	bc ² 1.75 ± 0.14	ab ¹ 27.44 ± 0.47
	1:10	b ³ 0.22 ± 0.01	c ² 2.02 ± 0.09	c ¹ 31.79 ± 0.47
	1:5	b ⁴ 0.21 ± 0.01	c ³ 2.06 ± 0.10	bc ^{2,3} 28.94 ± 0.83
	1:2	b ² 0.26 ± 0.02	bc ² 1.67 ± 0.18	ab ¹ 27.02 ± 1.37
	1:1	b ^{2,3} 0.30 ± 0.01	b ^{2,3} 1.36 ± 0.03	bc ² 28.69 ± 0.49
	2:1	a ¹ 6.08 ± 0.11	a ¹ 0.36 ± 0.04	a ¹ 24.70 ± 0.37
75	0	a ³ 0.25 ± 0.02	b ² 1.68 ± 0.10	a ¹ 29.36 ± 1.55
	1:10	b ² 0.37 ± 0.02	b ² 1.62 ± 0.05	a ² 34.99 ± 0.29
	1:5	a ² 0.37 ± 0.01	b ² 1.74 ± 0.03	a ³ 33.14 ± 1.26
	1:2	a ² 0.30 ± 0.04	b ² 1.86 ± 0.20	a ¹ 32.87 ± 2.89
	1:1	a ² 0.33 ± 0.00	b ³ 1.61 ± 0.08	a ² 30.55 ± 0.54
	2:1	a ³ 3.41 ± 1.61	a ¹ 0.51 ± 0.12	a ¹ 32.43 ± 5.19
100	0	b ² 0.22 ± 0.01	bc ³ 1.83 ± 0.11	ab ¹ 28.96 ± 0.62
	1:10	b ^{2,3} 0.26 ± 0.01	c ² 2.03 ± 0.14	c ¹ 32.97 ± 0.08
	1:5	b ⁴ 0.23 ± 0.00	b ⁴ 2.37 ± 0.04	bc ³ 31.47 ± 0.57
	1:2	b ² 0.36 ± 0.19	b ² 2.28 ± 0.25	bc ¹ 30.36 ± 1.68
	1:1	b ³ 0.23 ± 0.01	b ⁴ 1.99 ± 0.05	abc ² 29.30 ± 0.53
	2:1	a ³ 1.91 ± 0.02	ac ¹ 0.42 ± 0.00	a ¹ 26.09 ± 0.67

698

699 * N/L indicates no lag phase (mineralization did not reach or exceed 5%)

700 * Same letters indicate no statistical differences ($p > 0.05$) in amendment levels within
701 each aging time while different letters indicate significant differences ($p < 0.05$) across
702 amendment levels within each aging time

703 * Same numbers indicate no statistical differences ($p > 0.05$) in aged amended soils
704 across the four sampling points while different numbers indicate significant differences
705 ($p < 0.05$) in aged amended soils across the four sampling points (1d to 100d).

706

707

708

709 Table 3. Autochthonous heterotrophic and phenanthrene-degrading microorganisms
 710 present before 14 days mineralization of ¹⁴C-phenanthrene in **spent brewery grains**
 711 amended soil. Values are mean ± standard error (n = 3)

Contact time (days)	Amendment (%)	Bacteria CFU x 10 ⁸ g ⁻¹ soil dw		Fungi CFU x 10 ⁶ g ⁻¹ soil dw	
		Heterotrophs	PHE-degraders	Heterotrophs	PHE-degraders
1	0	a ² 11.6 ± 0.49	a ⁴ 2.91 ± 0.03	a ² 0.23 ± 0.00	a ¹ 0.03 ± 0.00
	1:10	cd ⁴ 17.1 ± 0.38	c ³ 15.9 ± 0.34	c ¹ 5.71 ± 0.54	c ² 3.16 ± 0.45
	1:5	b ⁴ 13.8 ± 0.41	c ³ 13.8 ± 0.41	b ¹ 4.44 ± 0.34	d ² 3.72 ± 0.06
	1:2	a ³ 9.37 ± 0.48	c ³ 5.02 ± 0.45	d ^{1,2} 9.52 ± 0.32	e ² 4.52 ± 0.65
	1:1	bc ² 15.9 ± 0.18	ab ³ 2.91 ± 0.29	f ¹ 11.2 ± 0.12	c ² 3.11 ± 0.33
	2:1	de ⁵ 19.0 ± 1.04	ab ³ 2.45 ± 1.23	e ⁵ 10.2 ± 0.20	b ¹ 2.33 ± 0.31
25	0	a ² 0.40 ± 0.03	b ⁵ 4.05 ± 0.20	a ² 0.30 ± 0.01	a ¹ 0.02 ± 0.00
	1:10	f ³ 13.7 ± 0.17	e ³ 14.1 ± 0.34	b ^{2,4} 7.76 ± 0.80	b ² 3.16 ± 0.40
	1:5	e ³ 11.9 ± 0.15	d ³ 12.8 ± 0.26	b ² 8.23 ± 0.84	b ⁵ 5.74 ± 0.90
	1:2	b ⁴ 6.20 ± 0.19	c ³ 6.79 ± 0.17	c ¹ 12.0 ± 0.77	c ³ 9.92 ± 0.70
	1:1	d ¹ 10.4 ± 0.15	f ⁴ 16.0 ± 0.29	c ² 14.0 ± 1.02	c ³ 9.07 ± 0.74
	2:1	c ⁴ 8.40 ± 0.08	a ¹ 0.00 ± 0.00	a ⁴ 2.36 ± 0.10	b ² 5.32 ± 0.34
50	0	a ² 0.05 ± 0.04	a ² 4.18 ± 0.19	a ² 0.05 ± 0.00	a ² 0.05 ± 0.00
	1:10	b ⁵ 19.0 ± 0.76	a ² 0.41 ± 0.08	c ² 7.22 ± 0.77	b ² 0.24 ± 0.01
	1:5	b ⁵ 18.3 ± 0.68	b ² 1.97 ± 0.22	b ¹ 4.09 ± 0.40	c ¹ 0.41 ± 0.02
	1:2	b ⁵ 22.2 ± 1.06	b ² 1.67 ± 0.09	e ^{1,2} 14.0 ± 0.94	c ¹ 0.41 ± 0.05
	1:1	b ² 21.1 ± 4.96	b ² 1.46 ± 0.18	d ¹ 10.2 ± 0.70	d ¹ 0.61 ± 0.03
	2:1	a ^{1,2} 0.14 ± 0.01	a ³ 0.45 ± 0.05	a ³ 0.99 ± 0.08	b ¹ 0.26 ± 0.01
75	0	a ² 0.09 ± 0.03	a ¹ 0.02 ± 0.00	a ⁴ 1.09 ± 0.03	a ² 0.05 ± 0.00
	1:10	b ² 0.92 ± 0.02	b ² 0.36 ± 0.01	b ⁴ 10.6 ± 0.30	a ¹ 0.85 ± 0.04
	1:5	c ² 2.01 ± 0.07	c ² 0.77 ± 0.03	bc ³ 12.1 ± 0.37	bc ³ 4.73 ± 0.48
	1:2	d ⁴ 1.48 ± 0.04	d ⁴ 1.14 ± 0.05	bc ^{1,2} 14.7 ± 0.34	d ³ 7.64 ± 0.70
	1:1	e ² 2.97 ± 0.09	c ² 0.87 ± 0.07	c ² 16.6 ± 0.41	cd ³ 6.37 ± 0.37
	2:1	a ^{2,3} 2.73 ± 0.03	a ² 0.04 ± 0.00	a ² 1.00 ± 0.92	b ² 3.88 ± 0.18
100	0	a ¹ 0.05 ± 0.00	a ³ 0.11 ± 0.00	a ³ 0.49 ± 0.02	a ¹ 0.03 ± 0.00
	1:10	b ^{1,2} 0.92 ± 0.00	a ¹ 0.15 ± 0.00	c ⁵ 10.3 ± 0.59	b ² 3.76 ± 0.18
	1:5	d ¹ 2.01 ± 0.11	b ² 1.32 ± 0.04	f ⁴ 17.9 ± 0.18	c ⁴ 6.24 ± 0.18
	1:2	c ¹ 1.48 ± 0.07	c ^{1,2} 1.45 ± 0.04	e ² 16.5 ± 0.24	c ³ 6.88 ± 0.30
	1:1	e ¹ 2.97 ± 0.16	a ¹ 0.11 ± 0.00	d ² 15.0 ± 0.15	c ¹ 7.34 ± 0.53

2:1	^{e3} 2.73 ± 0.06	^{a2} 0.07 ± 0.00	^{b2} 1.98 ± 0.08	^{a1} 0.21 ± 0.01
-----	---------------------------	---------------------------	---------------------------	---------------------------

712

713

714 * Same letters indicate no statistical differences ($p > 0.05$) in amendment levels within

715 each aging time while different letters indicate significant differences ($p < 0.05$) across

716 amendment levels within each aging time

717 * Same numbers indicate no statistical differences ($p > 0.05$) in aged amended soils

718 across the four sampling points while different numbers indicate significant differences

719 ($p < 0.05$) in aged amended soils across the four sampling points (1d to 100d).

720

721

722

723

724

725

726

727

728

729

730

731

732

733

734

735

736 Table 4. Autochthonous heterotrophic and phenanthrene-degrading microorganisms

737 present before 14 days mineralization of ¹⁴C-phenanthrene in **spent mushroom**

738 **compost** amended soil. Values are mean ± standard error (n = 3)

Contact time (days)	Amendment (%)	Bacteria CFU x 10 ⁸ g ⁻¹ soil dw		Fungi CFU x 10 ⁶ g ⁻¹ soil dw	
		Heterotrophs	PHE-degraders	Heterotrophs	PHE-degraders
1	0	a ² 0.07 ± 0.00	a ³ 0.14 ± 0.01	c ¹ 0.18 ± 0.01	c ² 0.13 ± 0.00
	1:10	b ¹ 0.42 ± 0.02	b ¹ 0.14 ± 0.00	b ¹ 0.16 ± 0.00	d ¹ 0.16 ± 0.00
	1:5	c ¹ 0.67 ± 0.02	c ¹ 0.23 ± 0.04	b ¹ 0.15 ± 0.00	c ² 0.12 ± 0.00
	1:2	d ¹ 0.98 ± 0.01	d ^{1,2} 1.51 ± 0.04	b ¹ 0.15 ± 0.00	b ² 0.10 ± 0.00
	1:1	e ¹ 1.05 ± 0.01	e ² 2.15 ± 0.00	a ¹ 0.06 ± 0.00	c ¹ 0.12 ± 0.00
	2:1	f ¹ 1.46 ± 0.01	f ⁴ 2.60 ± 0.00	b ² 0.51 ± 0.00	a ¹ 0.02 ± 0.00
25	0	a ¹ 0.03 ± 0.00	a ³ 0.16 ± 0.03	a ² 0.32 ± 0.06	a ³ 0.29 ± 0.05
	1:10	a ⁴ 7.02 ± 0.31	b ⁴ 0.74 ± 0.05	c ² 0.92 ± 0.10	b ² 1.59 ± 0.31
	1:5	c ² 14.3 ± 0.35	c ⁵ 1.36 ± 0.04	bc ² 0.69 ± 0.02	b ² 1.67 ± 0.16
	1:2	c ⁴ 13.9 ± 0.80	c ³ 1.42 ± 0.14	ab ³ 0.60 ± 0.08	b ² 2.31 ± 0.40
	1:1	b ² 8.58 ± 0.42	c ² 1.36 ± 0.12	ab ² 0.60 ± 0.08	b ² 1.84 ± 0.14
	2:1	b ³ 7.07 ± 0.73	d ³ 2.37 ± 0.15	a ¹ 0.27 ± 0.02	b ² 1.60 ± 0.02
50	0	a ³ 0.21 ± 0.01	a ¹ 0.01 ± 0.00	c ¹ 0.16 ± 0.00	a ¹ 0.04 ± 0.01
	1:10	a ³ 1.23 ± 0.04	b ² 0.43 ± 0.02	c ¹ 0.15 ± 0.00	a ¹ 0.04 ± 0.00
	1:5	a ¹ 3.24 ± 0.31	b ² 0.44 ± 0.02	bc ¹ 0.14 ± 0.00	a ¹ 0.03 ± 0.00
	1:2	a ³ 4.84 ± 0.44	c ¹ 0.71 ± 0.05	a ¹ 0.09 ± 0.00	b ¹ 0.09 ± 0.00
	1:1	b ³ 18.2 ± 1.23	c ¹ 0.68 ± 0.02	b ² 0.12 ± 0.00	b ¹ 0.08 ± 0.00
	2:1	c ⁴ 36.4 ± 2.24	d ² 0.88 ± 0.04	abc ¹ 0.14 ± 0.00	a ¹ 0.04 ± 0.00
75	0	a ⁴ 0.45 ± 0.08	a ² 0.03 ± 0.00	a ² 0.20 ± 0.00	a ¹ 0.03 ± 0.00
	1:10	bc ³ 1.38 ± 0.21	b ³ 0.76 ± 0.02	a ² 0.42 ± 0.02	ab ¹ 0.14 ± 0.00
	1:5	b ¹ 1.25 ± 0.28	b ³ 0.76 ± 0.02	a ² 0.60 ± 0.76	ab ¹ 0.60 ± 0.76
	1:2	b ² 1.31 ± 0.19	d ¹ 1.34 ± 0.02	a ² 13.2 ± 0.76	ab ¹ 1.35 ± 0.14
	1:1	c ¹ 2.09 ± 0.41	c ¹ 1.00 ± 0.09	a ² 8.14 ± 0.40	ab ¹ 1.29 ± 0.11
	2:1	d ³ 5.60 ± 0.27	de ² 1.17 ± 0.06	b ⁴ 6.71 ± 0.70	c ¹ 2.25 ± 0.14
100	0	a ² 0.07 ± 0.00	a ³ 0.08 ± 0.00	a ¹ 0.00 ± 0.00	a ¹ 0.02 ± 0.00
	1:10	b ^{2,3} 0.71 ± 0.02	b ² 0.40 ± 0.00	b ² 0.24 ± 0.00	a ¹ 0.03 ± 0.00
	1:5	c ¹ 1.01 ± 0.03	d ⁴ 1.93 ± 0.04	b ² 0.31 ± 0.02	b ¹ 0.04 ± 0.00
	1:2	d ^{2,3} 1.82 ± 0.04	e ¹ 1.32 ± 0.09	b ² 0.23 ± 0.02	c ¹ 0.05 ± 0.00
	1:1	d ¹ 1.71 ± 0.05	c ¹ 0.56 ± 0.05	a ¹ 0.08 ± 0.00	c ⁰ 0.03 ± 0.00

	2:1	^{e2} 3.05 ± 0.07	^{bc1} 0.43 ± 0.05	^{e3} 1.09 ± 0.05	^{a1} 0.03 ± 0.00
--	-----	---------------------------	----------------------------	---------------------------	---------------------------

739

740

741 * Same letters indicate no statistical differences ($p > 0.05$) in amendment levels within
 742 each aging time while different letters indicate significant differences ($p < 0.05$) across
 743 amendment levels within each aging time

744 * Same numbers indicate no statistical differences ($p > 0.05$) in aged amended soils
 745 across the four sampling points while different numbers indicate significant differences
 746 ($p < 0.05$) in aged amended soils across the four sampling points (1d to 100d).

747