1	Deposition and solubility of airborne metals to four plant species grown
2	at varying distances from two heavily trafficked roads in London
3	
4	Peachey, C.J., Sinnett, D.*, Wilkinson, M., Morgan, G.W., Freer-Smith, P.H., Hutchings, T.R.
5	Forest Research, Land Regeneration and Urban Greenspace Group, Alice Holt Lodge,
6	Farnham, Surrey, GU10 4LH, UK.
7	* Corresponding author. Forest Research, Alice Holt Lodge, Farnham, Surrey, GU10 4LH,
8	UK. Tel: +44 1420 22255 Fax: +44 1420 520180
9	Email addresses: danielle.sinnett@forestry.gsi.gov.uk,
10	matthew.wilkinson@forestry.gsi.gov.uk, geoff.morgan@forestry.gsi.gov.uk, peter.freer-
11	smith@forestry.gsi.gov.uk, tony.hutchings@forestry.gsi.gov.uk
12	
13	Abstract
14	In urban areas, a highly variable mixture of pollutants is deposited as particulate
15	matter. The concentration and bioavailability of individual pollutants within particles need to
16	be characterised to ascertain the risks to ecological receptors. This study, carried out at two
17	urban parks, measured the deposition and water-solubility of metals to four species common
18	to UK urban areas. Foliar Cd, Cr, Cu, Fe, Ni, Pb and Zn concentrations were elevated in at
19	least one species compared with those from a rural control site. Concentrations were,
20	however, only affected by distance to road in nettle and, to a lesser extent, birch leaves.
21	Greater concentrations of metal were observed in these species compared to cypress and
22	maple possibly due to differences in plant morphology and leaf surfaces. Solubility appeared
23	to be linked to the size fraction and, therefore, origin of the metal with those present
24	predominantly in the coarse fraction exhibiting low solubility.
25	Capsule
26	High density traffic resulted in elevated metal concentrations on vegetation, which were
27	related to distance from road and plant species.
28	Keywords
29	Acer campestre; Betula pubescens; Chamaecyparis lawsonia; Greenspace; Urtica dioica

30 1 Introduction

Particulate matter (PM) within the urban environment contains a range of metals that are attributed to a number of both natural and anthropogenic sources (Harrison et al., 2003). The metals Ba, Cd, Cr, Cu, Fe, Ni, Pb and Zn are often associated with high traffic densities; originating from exhaust emission, tyre, brake, vehicle and engine wear, or the re-suspension of road dusts (Allen et al., 2001; Harrison et al., 2003; Monaci et al., 2000; Riga-Karandinos and Saitanis, 2004; Wåhlin et al., 2006).

37 Metals can be deposited onto vegetation growing in urban greenspaces as particles 38 or within rain or fog droplets, often referred to as dry, wet and occult deposition respectively. 39 Deposition of metals can be significant enough to cause short-term variations in foliar metal 40 concentration (Fernández Espinosa and Rossini Oliva, 2006; Kozlov et al., 1995; Monaci et 41 al., 2000; Riga-Karandinos and Saitanis, 2004) and can account for a large proportion of 42 metals recorded in plant leaves (Kozlov et al., 2000a; Riga-Karandinos and Saitanis, 2004). 43 Once deposited on vegetation, metals may be subject to diffusion across the cuticle or 44 stomata or accumulate on the leaf surfaces.

45 The role of urban trees in improving air quality has been given increasing attention in 46 recent years due to their relatively high capturing efficiencies compared with other types of 47 vegetation and land use (Bealey et al., 2006; Beckett et al., 2000a). However, in order to fully 48 assess the effect of urban air pollutants on plants, there is a need to quantify the rate of metal 49 deposition to urban species and the potential for plants to accumulate ecologically significant 50 amounts of metals. Above a certain concentration, most metals result in harm to the 51 vegetation itself (Grantz et al., 2003) and may present a risk to the wider ecosystem if 52 contaminated foliage is consumed and transferred through the food-chain (Notten et al., 2005; 53 Notten et al., 2006).

This study aims to quantify aerial deposition of metals to leaves by growing species commonly planted in UK urban greenspaces in the urban roadside environment. The variation in deposition between distance from road, plant species and metal will be discussed. In addition, the soluble and insoluble fraction of metals within the plant tissue is presented to provide an indication of their bioavailability to primary consumers.

© Crown Copyright 2009

59 2 Materials and methods

60 2.1 Study sites

Park Square Gardens, Central London. National Grid Reference TQ286822, 0° 08.8' W, 51°
31.4' N.

63 This is a city centre park maintained privately for the Crown Estate since the early 64 19th century. The park vegetation cover consists of lawn areas, small trees and shrubs and a 65 small amount of large trees including London plane (Platanus x hispanica Muenchh.) and 66 horse chestnut (Aesculus hippocastanum L.). In a survey carried out in 1988 by the London 67 Natural History Society it was identified as having one of the highest bird populations of small 68 open spaces in inner London (Baker, 1988). Marylebone Road, an often congested section of 69 the inner ring road of London, runs along the southern edge of the park. Marylebone Road is 70 a pollution 'hotspot' where air quality objectives for PM₁₀ are frequently exceeded (Fuller and 71 Green, 2006).

Brompton Square, Central London. National Grid Reference TQ272792. 0° 10.0' W, 51° 29.8'
N.

This garden is privately owned and maintained by the residents of Brompton Square which was developed in the early 19th century. The soil is planted with a lawn, small trees,

shrubs, large ornamental trees and several large London plane and horse chestnut trees.

The garden is long and narrow, with a major arterial road, the A4, at the southern end and

terraced houses and a small road enclosing all other sides of the garden. PM₁₀

79 concentrations recorded at a nearby roadside sampler frequently exceed UK air quality

80 objectives (Fuller and Green, 2006).

Alice Holt Research Station, Farnham, Surrey. National Grid Reference SU803428. 0° 51.1'
W, 51° 10.7' N.

83 Additional plants were kept at a rural site away from major roads or PM₁₀ sources.

84 These plants were used as a control to relate measured metal concentrations to a

85 background range.

86 2.2 Particulate matter and soil metal concentrations

87 The concentration of airborne particulate matter adjacent to roads is substantially 88 higher than background levels (Harrison et al., 2004). Particulate and soil metal

© Crown Copyright 2009

89 concentrations were measured at each site to estimate the length and slope of any pollution 90 gradient. This information was used to determine the optimum positions for the plants to 91 represent the greatest decline in concentrations away from the road. Prior to the 19th century 92 both sites were outside the main city of London and likely to be used for agriculture, forestry 93 or, in the case of Marylebone Road, as royal hunting grounds. It is therefore assumed that a 94 survey of soil metals would be representative of historical air pollution rather than previous 95 land use. The transects were surveyed for total soil metal concentrations using field-portable 96 X-ray Fluorescence (FPXRF), which allows quick and reliable in situ measurements of metals 97 in the soil surface layer (Kilbride et al., 2006). The soil was analysed ten times at five 98 sampling locations (at 1, 5, 10, 25 and 55 m to the north of Marylebone Road and 1, 7, 12, 25, 99 and 50 m to the north of the A4). At each location any litter or grass was removed and the 100 soil compacted to provide a smooth, even surface. A reading was taken from each point by 101 pressing the FPXRF sampling window to the soil surface and depressing the trigger for 120 102 nominal seconds (Kilbride et al., 2006).

103 In order to confirm that soil metal concentrations are a result of contemporary as well 104 as historical deposition, a 12-hour daytime PM₁₀ concentration along the same transect was 105 measured on a day when the prevailing wind direction was from the road. The PM_{10} 106 concentration was sampled at the same five sampling locations as the soil metal levels with 107 three samplers operating at each point. The samplers used were the Sioutas cascade 108 impactor (SKC Ltd, UK), configured to collect PM₁₀ as three fractions (< 1 µm, 1-2.5 µm and 109 2.5-10 µm), with SKC Leyland Legacy sampling pumps. The pumps and filter-loaded impactors were calibrated and set to run at a flow rate of 9 L min⁻¹. Sampling took place 110 111 during the day between 08:00 and 20:00. Gravimetric analysis of filters was carried out by a 112 commercial laboratory (Bureau Veritas, UK) according to the European Standard for 113 determination of the PM₁₀ fraction of suspended particulate matter (Standard Number 114 EN12341, 1999).

The soil and air sampling indicated that concentrations of PM_{10} and metals generally decreased with distance from the road (Table 1). The soil data suggested that the extent to which distance from the road was a factor varied between metal and site, however the decline in metal concentration was generally sharper within 10-12 m of the road and more gradual

between 12 and 50 m. PM_{10} concentrations in the air were augmented within approximately 25 m of the road at both sites. A transect with a length of 12 m was therefore selected for both sites to achieve a range of PM_{10} exposure.

122 2.3 Species selection

123 Plant species used in this study were chosen to represent a large range of potential 124 particulate uptake rates and consideration was made of their prevalence in urban areas. 125 Field maple (Acer campestre L.) is very common in urban environments and its large, smooth 126 leaves result in relatively low particulate capture (Freer-Smith et al., 2005), in addition the 127 thick, waxy cuticle on the leaves is likely to restrict the absorption of soluble metals adhering 128 to leave surfaces. Downy birch (Betula pubescens L.) is commonly found on roadside verges 129 and provides an importance habitat for herbivores; the leaves are small and downy and, therefore, have the potential to be efficient particulate scavengers. Lawson cypress 130 131 (Chamaecyparis lawsonia (A. Murray) Parl.) is very common in urban areas, primarily due to 132 its use as a screen around private gardens. This species has very dense foliage and this, 133 combined with the fact that it is in-leaf throughout the year, results in a very high particulate 134 capturing efficiency (Beckett et al., 2000a; Freer-Smith et al., 2005). Common nettle (Urtica 135 dioica L.) is a common species in disturbed and derelict environments and is important for a 136 large number of invertebrate species, the leaves of which are covered with a great number of 137 fine hairs suggesting a potential for high particulate capture rates.

138 2.4 Particulate deposition to plants

139 Every care was taken to select trees from a relatively unpolluted nursery so that metal 140 concentrations in plants at the beginning of the experiment were representative of 141 background concentrations. Bare-rooted tree standards (1.5 to 1.8 m; age 1+2) were 142 obtained from a rural nursery (Prees Heath Forest Nursery, Shropshire, UK). Trees were 143 transferred to pots containing an uncontaminated peat-perlite mix. Stinging nettles were 144 grown from seed in the peat-perlite mix and were moved to site when their height had 145 reached approximately 20 cm. A transect length of 12 m was selected based on the results of 146 the soil and PM₁₀ data (Table 1), and plants were positioned in a completely randomised 147 design with three replicates of each species at 0, 2, 4, 6 and 12 m to the north of each road.

Plants were removed form their respective positions after 74 days at Brompton Square and114 days at Alice Holt and Park Square Gardens.

150 Plants were harvested prior to leaf senescence. Leaves with petioles intact were 151 stripped from the branches. The leaves of cypress are scale-like and grow around woody 152 parts of the tree, making dissection of leaves from branches very difficult. Therefore, a 153 method to distinguish leaves from branches was used (Freer-Smith et al., 2005). This 154 method treats smooth barky sections as branches and irregularly shaped green sections as 155 leaves. The leaves were oven-dried at 70 °C overnight. The foliage was divided into two 156 sub-samples in order to quantify the total, water-soluble and insoluble metal fractions within 157 the leaves. The total metal concentrations were determined from the oven-dried samples. 158 The water-soluble and insoluble fractions were determined using the method outlined in 159 Kozlov et al. (2000a). The leaves were boiled in deionised water for 15 minutes, which aims 160 to remove approximately 90 % of the soluble metals from the leaf. The leaf material then was 161 oven-dried at 70 °C for 48 hours. The boiled leaves were assumed to contain insoluble metals and a small fraction of soluble metals (< 10 %) not extracted by boiling (Kozlov et al., 162 163 2000a).

Plant samples were dry-ashed at 450 °C for 18 hours and then wet digested 164 165 (Chapman, 1967). Wet digestion was achieved by incubating each sample for 1 hour at 60 °C in 0.75 cm³ concentrated ultra-pure HNO₃, followed by a further 14 hour incubation with 166 2.25 cm³ concentrated HCI and heating for 2 hours at 110 °C. After cooling, 0.15 cm³ of 30 % 167 H₂O₂ was added to each sample followed by heating for 30 minutes at 110 °C. To ensure 168 169 complete oxidation of all organic matter the H₂O₂ treatment was performed twice. The 170 digested samples were analysed for Ba, Cd, Cr Cu, Fe, Ni, Pb and Zn with a Spectro Flame 171 Inductively Coupled Plasma – Optical Emission Spectrometer (ICP-OES; Spectro Analytical 172 Instruments, West Midlands, UK) (Kilbride et al., 2006).

The solution resulting from the leaf boiling was centrifuged at 12 000 rpm for 15 minutes to remove any insoluble metal particles that may have been washed from fused subcuticular waxes (Kozlov et al., 2000a). Organic precipitates in the solution were dissolved by adding 1 ml hydrogen peroxide followed by UV digestion for 60 minutes at 80 °C. Further additions of hydrogen peroxide were added until solutions were clear. Soluble metals were

determined by Spectro Flame Inductively Coupled Plasma – Optical Emission Spectrometer
(ICP-OES; Spectro Analytical Instruments, West Midlands, UK). Concentrations of soluble
metals in the leaf solvent were calculated in relation to dry mass of the leaves boiled.

181 2.5 Statistical analysis

182 Total Pb concentrations in the nettle tissue at the 2 m and 12 m distances from the 183 road at the Brompton Square site were omitted from the analysis due to inconsistencies 184 between the results. The total and soluble metal concentrations in the foliar tissues were 185 subjected to a log transformation to achieve an approximately normal distribution and jointly 186 analysed at the plot level using the REML algorithm in Genstat version 10.1 (Genstat, 2007). 187 The model included a general variance-covariance structure for the metals with independent 188 errors for site, species and distance from the road. Correlated errors for distance from the 189 road were considered, but were found not to be required. The model terms were tested using 190 a Wald test giving an F-statistic with approximate degrees of freedom. Residual plots were 191 examined to confirm model adequacy. Due to the large number of tests carried out a 192 protection level of α/k was used, where α is the chosen significance level (5%) and k is the 193 number of tests being considered.

The mean (across all distances) total and soluble foliar concentrations were compared with the mean concentrations from the rural control site using an approximate t-test with unequal variances and adjusted degrees of freedom (Winer, 1970) in Genstat version 10.1 (Genstat, 2007).

198 3 Results

199 3.1 Total metal concentrations in the plant leaves

The REML analysis found that there was no significant difference between the leaf metal concentrations at the two sites. Unsurprisingly, the metal, plant species, distance from the road and the interactions between them all had a significant affect on the leaf concentrations (all P<0.001). Individual metal concentrations were positively correlated with one another (Table 2), relationships between Cd and Fe and Cr, Cu, Fe and Ni were particularly strong (r^2 >0.87). Considering all metals together, distance from the road had a significant affect on leaf concentrations in birch (P=0.017) and nettle (P=0.004), but the

207 interaction between distance and metal was significant for birch (P<0.001) and maple 208 (P<0.001) leaf concentrations. However, separating the metals in the analysis showed that 209 distance away from the road only had a significant affect on the concentrations of Cu in birch 210 and maple leaves (Table 3; Figure 1), although concentrations of Cr, Fe and Ni in birch leaves 211 were approaching significance. Whereas Cd, Cr, Cu, Fe, Ni and Zn concentrations in nettle 212 leaves were all significantly affected by the distance from the road (Table 3; Figure 1). Metal 213 concentrations in the leaves of Lawson cypress were not significantly related to the distance 214 of the plants from the road.

215 Birch leaves grown at the London Parks had significantly greater concentrations of 216 Cd, Cr, Cu and Fe (all P<0.001) compared with those grown at the rural control site (Table 4; 217 Figure 1). This was only true for Cu and Fe in the needles of Lawson Cypress (both 218 P<0.001). Maple and nettle leaves had significantly greater concentrations of Cr, Fe, Ni, Zn 219 (all P<0.001) and Cu (P=0.003 and P<0.001 respectively) when grown in the urban compared 220 with rural locations. Pb concentrations were not included in the statistical analysis due to all 221 but two of the values at the control site being zero. The maximum value was only 0.40 mg/kg. 222 The Pb concentrations at both Brompton Square and Park Square Gardens were all clearly 223 significantly greater than zero.

224 The ranking between species was consistent between the metals with birch and 225 nettle leaves having the greatest concentrations of all metals compared with both cypress and 226 maple (Table 3). Considering all metals together, there was no significant difference between 227 the concentrations in these two species, although, when taken individually, the Ba 228 concentrations in birch were significantly greater (P=0.024) and the nettle concentrations 229 were significantly greater in the case of Cr (P=0.008), Cu (P=0.018), Fe (P=0.025), Ni 230 (P=0.007). Birch leaves had significantly greater concentrations of all metals compared with 231 cypress (all P<0.001 except Ni where P=0.007). Similarly, nettle concentrations were 232 significantly greater than cypress (all P<0.001 except Pb where P=0.024 and Zn where 233 P=0.025). Birch Ba, Cd and Zn concentrations were significantly greater than those found in 234 maple (P<0.001, P=0.025 and P<0.001 respectively), whereas nettle concentrations were 235 significantly greater for all metals (all P<0.001 except Cd where P=0.004 and Fe where 236 P=0.005), with the exception of Pb. Maple leaves had significantly greater concentrations of

Cd (P=0.002), Cr (P=0.012), Cu (P<0.001), Fe (P<0.001) and Pb (P=0.016) than those found
in cypress needles.

239The ranking between metal concentrations was consistent between species240(P<0.001; Table 3) and in the order Fe>Zn>Ba>Cu>Pb>Cr>Ni>Cd with all differences being

significant (all P<0.001).

242 3.2 Soluble metal concentrations in the plant leaves

Analysis of the data for the soluble metal concentrations in the leaves showed that there was no significant affect of distance (Figure 2). However, there was a significant affect of site (P=0.007), metal, species and their interactions (all P<0.001; Table 5; Figure 2).

Soluble concentrations of Cr, Cu and Pb were significantly greater in birch leaves grown in Brompton Square (all P<0.001) and Park Square Gardens sites (all P<0.001) compared with those from the rural control site (Table 5). Soluble Ni concentrations in birch leaves from Brompton Square were also elevated (P<0.001). There was no significant difference between the soluble metal concentrations in cypress leaves at either Brompton Square or Park Square Gardens compared with the rural control site.

252 Generally, there were no significant differences between the two sites when 253 comparing the mean concentrations for each species, the only exceptions being that the birch 254 trees grown at Brompton Square had significantly greater Cd and Cr concentrations 255 compared with those from Park Square Gardens (Table 5; both P<0.001). The dataset was 256 unbalanced due the missing Cd and Cr values for maple, and therefore the analysis was 257 repeated omitting these results. As with the total metal concentrations, birch had the greatest 258 concentrations of soluble metal concentrations compared with the cypress and maple, although for cypress this was only significant for Ba, Cu, Ni and Zn (all P<0.001) and for Ba 259 260 was only significant for Ba, Fe, Ni, Pb and Zn (all P<0.001). There was generally no 261 significant difference between the soluble metal concentrations in the leaves of Lawson 262 cypress and maple, with the exception of Cu where concentrations in maple were greater 263 than those in cypress (P<0.001).

The ranking between metal concentrations was, again consistent between species (P<0.001; Table 5) and in the order Zn>Fe>Ba>Cu>Pb, Ni>Cr>Cd, with all differences being significant (P<0.001) with the exception of Pb and Ni. The comparison between Cd and Cr

267 applies to birch and cypress only. This order generally follows a similar pattern to that for 268 total metals, except that Zn concentrations are greater than Fe and Ni concentrations are 269 greater than Cr, suggesting a greater portion of Zn and Ni are in soluble forms.

270 4 Discussion

271 4.1 Effect of vehicle emissions on metal concentration in plant leaves

272 Brompton Square and Park Square Gardens were selected for this study as they are 273 close to roads that are recognised particulate 'hotspots' where air quality objectives are often 274 breached due to the high traffic densities (Fuller and Green, 2006). Downy birch, Lawson 275 cypress, field maple and common nettle, all grown in a transect away from these roads, had 276 elevated concentrations of Cd, Cr, Cu, Fe, Ni, Pb and/or Zn in their leaves compared to those 277 grown in the rural control site. All of these metals are associated with particulate pollution 278 originating from roads, suggesting that the high traffic densities are resulting in an increased 279 metal load to nearby vegetation. Other studies have also reported significantly elevated 280 concentrations of Cd, Cu, Fe, Ni, Pb and Zn in trees grown in roadside environments 281 (Fernández Espinosa and Rossini Oliva, 2006; Monaci et al., 2000).

282 The mean concentrations reported here are all within similar ranges to those found in 283 previous studies using different species (Fernández Espinosa and Rossini Oliva, 2006; 284 Monaci et al., 2000; Riga-Karandinos and Saitanis, 2004), although there is some variation. 285 For example, the Ba, Cu, Fe, Ni, and Pb concentrations reported by Fernández Espinosa and 286 Rossini Oliva (2006) on the leaves of oleander and lantana grown in Seville, Spain are often 287 lower than those reported here, which is probably mainly due to the lower traffic densities; 288 23067 vehicles per day compared with the 71200 vehicles per day recorded on Marylebone 289 Road (Department for Transport, 2002). Whereas the Pb concentrations are smaller than 290 those found by Monaci et al. (2000) in the leaves of evergreen oak presumably because their 291 study pre-dated the phasing out of leaded fuel.

Metal deposition has been correlated with tree mortality and injury in rural areas (Gawel et al., 1996) and toxicity at the ecosystem level has been related to soil microbial activity rather than direct effects on the plants (Grantz et al., 2003). The likely physiological effects of airborne metal deposition are difficult to gauge for plants as the majority of toxicity experiments relate toxic effects to root uptake rather than their deposition as particles to leaf

297 surfaces. The concentrations of metals in tree foliage, as a result of root uptake, reported to 298 have a toxicological effect are generally much greater than the concentrations in the present 299 study (Smith and Brennan, 1984; Heale and Omrod, 1982; Carlson and Bazzaz, 1977; Brown 300 and Wilkins, 1985). This suggests that despite the elevated concentrations compared to the 301 control site they are unlikely to result in any direct toxicity to the plant species studied.

302 There were no major differences between leaf metal concentrations at Brompton 303 Square and at Park Square Gardens where plants were exposed for 55% longer. This 304 suggests that adsorption sites on the leaf may be quickly filled with metal particles so that 305 after a short exposure period (<11 weeks) the metal concentrations plateau. This hypothesis 306 is supported by evidence from leaf washing studies which have shown that a portion (more 307 than 65%) of metal is retained permanently on the leaf surface (Kozlov et al., 2000a). 308 Moreover, a previous study of metal burdens over the entire season showed that metal 309 concentrations either remained constant throughout the season or increased during the first 310 half of the growing season and decreased during the latter half (Smith and Staskawicz, 1977). 311 Another explanation for the similarity in foliar metal concentrations between sites is that the 312 average deposition rate was higher at Brompton Square or that there were differences in the 313 dispersion of the particulates over the parks.

Despite these elevated concentrations and the observed decline in PM₁₀ concentrations within 12 m from each road, distance from the road did not have a consistent affect on metal concentrations in the leaf tissue from the three tree species investigated. Only Cu concentrations in birch and maple leaves were significantly related to the distance from the road. The affect of distance was, however, closely related to the total concentrations of Cd, Cr, Cu, Fe, Ni and Zn in the nettle leaves.

320

4.2

Differences in metal concentration between plant species

The difference in metal concentrations between species is likely to be due to differences in their leaf arrangement, morphology and/or surface properties. Species with a large number of small, hairy and sticky leaves have been shown to exhibit high particulate capturing efficiencies (Beckett et al., 2000a; Freer-Smith et al., 2004; Freer-Smith et al., 2005). Nettle and birch leaves exhibit these characteristics explaining the greater concentrations observed in the leaves of these species compared with the cypress and

© Crown Copyright 2009

327 maple. Although only Cu concentrations in birch were significantly affected by distance from 328 the road, Cr, Fe and Ni concentrations did appear to be declining. This, together with the fact 329 that metal concentrations in nettle were often greater than those in birch, suggests that if the 330 exposure period had been extended the differences in concentration in birch along the 331 transect may have become more pronounced. The affect of distance on nettle concentrations 332 may have been a function of the smaller height of this species compared with the trees 333 (Smith, 1976). The tree species used in this study were all standards, with heights of 334 between 1.5 to 1.8 m, whereas the nettle plants were positioned on site when their heights 335 were 0.2 m. The nettles are therefore more likely to be exposed to re-suspended road dusts 336 (Fernández Espinosa and Rossini Oliva, 2006) and spray from roads during wet weather than 337 the taller tree species. This is supported by the dramatic decline between the 0 and 2 m 338 distances observed in the nettle tissue concentrations at Park Square Gardens.

339 The relatively low metal concentration in maple leaves is likely to be due to their 340 comparatively large leaves and waxy cuticles (Pyatt, 1973). Cypress has previously been 341 reported to have a greater particulate capturing efficiency than other tree species due to their 342 dense needle structure (Beckett et al., 2000b), but in this study the needle metal 343 concentrations were smaller compared with the other species. The greater capturing 344 efficiencies are based on the mass of particles deposited on the plant as a whole and, as 345 cypress has a large leaf area index and therefore surface area, the total mass of particulates 346 may be large, despite the concentration per mass of foliage being low. Unlike the other tree 347 species tested, which lose their leaves each year, cypress needles may be retained for 2-10 348 years so the concentrations of metals within them may accumulate to significantly greater 349 levels than those reported here or those found in deciduous species.

350 4.3 Differences in plant leaf concentrations between metals

Leaf concentrations of the eight metals were all positively correlated with each other, suggesting that all metals originate from the same source/s (Monaci et al., 2000). Previous studies have also found that metal concentrations in plant tissues exposed to traffic sources are correlated (Monaci et al., 2000; Riga-Karandinos and Saitanis (2004). Here the correlations between Cd and Fe and Cr, Cu, Fe and Ni were particularly strong and this is likely to represent their particular origins within the overall traffic source. Anthropogenic Fe,

© Crown Copyright 2009

357 Cr and Cu originate primarily from brake wear (Harrison et al., 2003; Monaci et al., 2000; 358 Tasdemir et al., 2005; Wahlin et al., 2006) and other studies have shown strong correlations 359 between the concentrations of these metals on the surfaces of leaves (Monaci et al., 2000; 360 Riga-Karandinos and Saitanis, 2004). Cd is present in the products of tyre wear and exhaust 361 emissions (Allen et al., 2001; Monaci et al., 2000), the strong relationship between this metal 362 and Cu cannot be explained specifically, as, although they are both present in exhaust 363 emissions, this is also true of several other metals for which the correlations are much weaker 364 (Allen et al., 2001). Harrison et al. (2003), however, found that the size distribution of Cd 365 within particles suggested that it originated primarily from wear rather than combustion which 366 may explain its correlation with Cu. Fe is a crustal metal (Monaci et al., 2000; Tasdemir et al., 367 2005) and the greater concentrations of this compared to the anthropogenic metals suggests 368 than soil dusts have been re-suspended by tyre shear (Tasdemir et al., 2005). Leaf metal 369 concentrations followed the order Fe>Zn>Ba>Cu>Pb>Cr>Ni>Cd for total concentrations and 370 Zn>Fe>Ba>Cu>Pb, Ni>Cr>Cd for soluble metals. This ordering is similar to that found in 371 other studies investigating the composition of PM₁₀ (Allen et al., 2001; Tasdemir et al., 2005), 372 suggesting that the particulate pollution in London is representative of a 'typical' composition. 373 Total concentrations of Fe were around 5 times greater than those for Zn, whereas 374 soluble concentrations of Zn were around 1.5 times those of Fe. Similarly, total 375 concentrations of Cr were around double those of Ni, whereas soluble concentrations of Ni 376 were around 4 times those of Cr. Their reversal of positions in the ranking of concentrations 377 suggests that significant proportions of the Zn and Ni are in a soluble form (approximately 378 10% and 13% respectively) compared to a very small proportion of Fe and Cr (approximately 379 1%). Fe and Cr are primarily present within the coarse (PM_{2.5-10}) fraction, whereas Zn and Ni 380 have an even size distribution indicative of a range of sources which may explain why a 381 greater proportion of these metals is in a soluble form (Harrison et al., 2003). Soluble metal 382 fractions were generally lower than fractions measured in the air by other workers. For 383 example, solubility of Cd, Cu, Pb and Zn in atmospheric aerosol has been reported to range 384 from 25-90%, 27-90%, 4-70% and 73-93% respectively (Hoffmann et al. 1997; Fernandez et 385 al. 2002; Voutsa and Samara 2002). It is very difficult to draw conclusions about the relative 386 amount of water-soluble trace metals in particulate matter because it depends on relative

387 contributions of various emission sources to ambient particulate matter and meteorological 388 conditions, both of which vary over time (Tomasevic et al., 2005). Assuming the soluble 389 fraction of metals deposited to trees during the present study were similar to those cited in the 390 literature, then it is evident here that a loss of soluble metal has occurred at some point, most 391 likely through leaf runoff following precipitation which removes water-soluble deposits more 392 rapidly than insoluble deposits (Rodrigo and Avila, 2002). However, the domination of 393 insoluble metals in leaf particulate deposits may also suggest the main components of the 394 particles are derived from road dusts and soil re-suspension (Duan et al., 2005; Manalis et al., 395 2005). In stable atmospheric conditions, coarse particles, such as these, will deposit very 396 quickly (QUARG, 1996). This is supported by the rapid fall of metal levels away from the 397 road, which is characteristic of coarse particle dispersion (QUARG, 1996).

398 5 Conclusion

399 This study provides further evidence that traffic represents a significant source of 400 metal contamination to urban vegetation, particularly that growing in the immediate vicinity of 401 the road. Plant species plays a significant role in the metal concentration in leaf tissue which 402 may be due to differences in leaf arrangement, morphology, surface characteristics and the 403 height of vegetation. Despite this atmospheric deposition of metals to plant surfaces of the 404 species tested here is unlikely to result in a significant immediate risk of direct toxicity to the 405 plant or primary consumers. The results suggest that the risk of creating new pathways for 406 metal contamination from deposition of particulate matter to ecological receptors through 407 greenspace establishment in roadside environments is relatively low.

408 Acknowledgements

The authors thank Chris Bull of the Crown Estate Paving Commission and Sophie Blain of the Brompton Square Garden Committee for allowing access to Park Square Gardens and Brompton Square. We also thank Francois Bochereau and Alberto Morales for carrying out the analytical laboratory work and Steve Coventry for providing practical assistance with the planting and maintenance of the trees and nettles. The EPSRC, who funded this research as part of the PUrE consortium under Grant EP/C532651/1, is gratefully acknowledged.

416

417 6 References

418	Allen, A.G., Nemitz, E., Shi, J.P., Harrison, R.M., Greenwood, J.C., 2001. Size distribution of
419	trace metals in atmospheric aerosols in the United Kingdom. Atmospheric
420	Environment 35, 4581-4591.
421	Baker, H., 1988. Birds of small open places in inner London 1987-1988, in: Earp, M.J. (Ed.),
422	London Bird Report 1988. London Natural History Society, London, p. 126.
423	Bealey, W.J., McDonald, A.G., Nemitz, R., Donovan, R., Dragosits, U., Duffy, T.R., Fowler,
424	D., 2007. Estimating the reduction of urban PM10 concentrations by trees within an
425	environmental information system for planners. Journal of Environmental
426	Management 85(1), 44-58
427	Beckett, K.P., Freer-Smith, P.H., Taylor, G., 2000a. Effective tree species for local air-quality
428	management. Journal of Arboriculture 26(1), 12-19.
429	Beckett, K.P., Freer-Smith, P.H., Taylor, G., 2000b. Particulate pollution capture by urban
430	trees: effect of species and windspeed. Global Change Biology 6(8), 995-1003.
431	Brown, M., Wilkins, D., 1985. Zinc tolerance of mycorrhizal Betula. New Phytologist 99, 101-
432	106.
433	Carlson, R.W., Bazzaz, F.A., 1977. Growth reduction in American sycamore (Platanus
434	occidentalis L.) caused by Pb-Cu interaction. Environmental Pollution 12, 243-253.
435	Chapman, H.D., 1967. Plant analysis values suggestive nutrient status of selected crops, in:
436	Hardy, G.W. (Ed.), Soil testing and plant analysis: Plant analysis part II. Soil Science
437	Society of America, Wisconsin.
438	Department for Transport, 2002. Sources of particulate matter in urban areas: TRAMAQ
439	Project UG 250. Environmental Resources Management, London.
440	Duan, F., He, K., Ma, Y., Jia, Y., Yang, F., Lei, Y., Tanaka, S., Okuta, T., 2005.
441	Characteristics of carbonaceous aerosols in Beijing, China. Chemosphere 60(3), 355-
442	364.
443	Fernández Espinosa, A.J., Rossini Oliva, S., 2006. The composition and relationships
444	between trace element levels in inhalable atmospheric particles (PM_{10}) and in leaves
445	of Nerium oleander L. and Lantana camara L. Chemosphere 62, 1665-1672.

446	Fernandez, J.A., Ternero, M., Barragan, F.J., Jiminez, J.C., 2002. A chemical speciation of
447	trace metals for fine urban particles. Atmospheric Environment 36(5), 773-780.
448	Freer-Smith, P.H., Beckett, K.P., Taylor, G., 2005. Deposition velocities to Sorbus aria, Acer
449	campestre, Populus deltoides X trichocarpa 'Beaupre', Pinus nigra and X
450	Cupressocyparis leylandii for coarse, fine and ultra-fine particles in the urban
451	environment. Environmental Pollution 133(1), 157-167.
452	Freer-Smith, P.H., El-Khatib, A.A., Taylor, G., 2004. Capture of particulate pollution by trees:
453	A comparison of species typical of semi-arid areas (Ficus nitida and Eucalyptus
454	globulus) with European and North American species. Water Air & Soil Pollution
455	155(1-4), 173-187.
456	Fuller, G., Green, D., 2006. Air quality in London 2005 and mid 2006 – briefing. King's
457	College London.
458	http://www.londonair.org.uk/london/reports/AirQualityInLondon2005andmid 2006.pdf.
459	date accessed 10/01/2007
460	Gawel, J.E., Ahner, B.A., Friedland, A.J., Morel, F.M.M., 1996. Role for heavy metals in forest
461	decline indicated by phytochelatin measurements. Nature 381, 64-65.
462	Genstat, 2007. The Guide to GenStat Release 10.1 Part 2: Statistics. [8.1]. Oxford, Lawes
463	Agricultural Trust (Rothamsted Experimental Station) - VSN International.
464	Grantz, D.A., Garner, J.H.B., Johnson, D.W., 2003. Ecological effects of particulate matter.
465	Environment International 29(2-3), 213-239.
466	Harrison, R.M., Jones, A.M., Lawrence, R.G., 2004. Major component composition of PM10
467	and PM2.5 from roadside and urban background sites. Atmospheric Environment
468	38(27), 4531-4538.
469	Harrison, R.M., Tilling, R., Romero, M.S.C., Harrad, S., Jarvis, K., 2003. A study of trace
470	metals and polycyclic aromatic hydrocarbons in the roadside environment.
471	Atmospheric Environment 37(17), 2391-2402.
472	Heale, E.L., Omrod, D.P., 1982. Effects of nickel and copper on Acer rubrum, Cornus
473	stolonifera, Lonicera tatarica, and Pinus resinosa. Canadian Journal of Botany 60,
474	2674-2681.

- 475 Hoffmann, P., Deutsch, F., Sinner, T., Weber, S., Eichler, R., Sterkel, S., Sastri, C.S., Ortner,
 476 H.M., 1997. Solubility of single chemical compounds from an atmospheric aerosol in
- 477 pure water. Atmospheric Environment 31(17), 2777-2785.
- Kilbride, C., Poole, J., Hutchings, T.R., 2006. A comparison of Cu, Pb, As, Cd, Zn, Fe, Ni and
 Mn determined by acid extraction/ICP-OES and ex situ field portable X-ray
- 480 fluorescence analyses. Environmental Pollution 143(1), 16-23.
- Kozlov, M.V., Haukioja, E., Bakhtiarov, A.V., Stroganov, D.N., 1995. Heavy-metals in birch
 leaves around a nickel-copper smelter at Monchegorsk, Northwestern Russia.
 Environmental Pollution 90(3), 291-299.
- Kozlov, M.V., Haukioja, E., Bakhtiarov, A.V., Stroganov, D.N., Zimina, S.N., 2000a. Root
 versus canopy uptake of heavy metals by birch in an industrially polluted area:
- 486 contrasting behaviour of nickel and copper. Environmental Pollution 107(3), 413-420.
- 487 Kozlov, M.V., Haukioja, E., Kovnatsky, E.F., 2000b. Uptake and excretion of nickel and
- 488 copper by leaf-mining larvae of *Eriocrania semipurpurella* (Lepidoptera: Eriocraniidae)
 489 feeding on contaminated birch foliage. Environmental Pollution 108(2), 303-310.
- 490 Manalis, N., Grivas, G., Protonotarios, V., Moutsatsou, A., Samara, C., Chaloulakou, A.,
- 491 2005. Toxic metal content of particulate matter (PM₁₀), within the Greater Area of
 492 Athens. Chemosphere. 60(4), 557-566.
- Monaci, F., Moni, F., Lanciotti, E., Grechi, D., Bargagli, R., 2000. Biomonitoring of airborne
 metals in urban environments: new tracers of vehicle emission, in place of lead.
 Environmental Pollution 107, 321-327.
- 496 Notten, M.J.M., Oosthoek, A.J.P., Rozema, J., Aerts, R., 2005. Heavy metal concentrations in
 497 a soil-plant-snail food chain along a terrestrial soil pollution gradient. Environmental
 498 Pollution 138(1), 178-190.
- Notten, M.J.M., Oosthoek, A.J.P., Rozema, J., Aerts, R., 2006. Heavy metal pollution affects
 consumption and reproduction of the landsnail *Cepaea nemoralis* fed on naturally
 polluted *Urtica dioica* leaves. Ecotoxicology 15(3), 295-304.
- 502 Pyatt, F.B., 1973. Some aspects of plant contamination by airborne particulate pollutants.
 503 International Journal of Environmental Studies 5, 215-220.

- 504 QUARG, 1996. Third Report to the Department of the Environment. Airborne Particulate
- 505 Matter in the United Kingdom. HMSO, London.
- Riga-Karandinos, A.N., Saitanis, C., 2004. Biomonitoring of concentrations of platinum group
 elements and their correlations to other metals. International Journal of
 Environmental Pollution 22(5), 563-579.
- Rodrigo, A., Avila, A., 2002. Dry deposition to the forest canopy and surrogate surfaces in two
 Mediterranean holm oak forests in Montseny (NE Spain). Water, Air, & Soil Pollution
 136(1-4), 269-288.
- 512 Smith, G.C., Brennan, E., 1984. Response of silver maple seedlings to an acute dose of root
 513 applied cadmium. Forest Science 30, 582-586.
- Smith, W.H., 1976. Lead contamination of the roadside environment. Journal of the Air
 Pollution Control Association 26(8), 753-766.
- Smith, W.H., Staskawicz, B.J., 1977. Removal of atmospheric particles by leaves and twigs of
 urban trees: Some preliminary observations and assessment of research needs.
 Environmental Management 1(4), 317-330.
- Tasdemir, Y., Kural, C., Cindoruk, S.S., Vardar, N., 2005. Assessment of trace element
 concentrations and their estimated dry deposition fluxes in an urban atmosphere.
 Atmospheric Research 81(1), 17-35.
- Tomasevic, M., Vukmirovic, Z., Rajsic, S., Tasic, M., Stevanovic, B., 2005. Characterization of
 trace metal particles deposited on some deciduous tree leaves in an urban area.
 Chemosphere 61(6), 753-760.
- Voutsa, D., Samara, C., 2002. Labile and bioaccessible fractions of heavy metals in the
 airborne particulate matter from urban and industrial areas. Atmospheric Environment
 36(22), 3583-3590.
- 528 Wåhlin, P., Berkowicz, R., Palmgren, F., 2006. Characterisation of traffic-generated 529 particulate matter in Copenhagen. Atmospheric Environment 40, 2151-2159.
- 530 Winer, B.J., 1970. Statistical Principles in Experimental Design. MacGraw-Hill, New York.

Fig. 1. Total a) Ba, b) Cd, c) Cr, d) Cu, e) Fe, f) Ni, g) Pb and h) Zn concentrations in the foliar tissue from downy birch, Lawson cypress, field maple and common nettles planted at varying distances from two heavily polluted London roads in Brompton Square (74 days; black squares, dashed lines) and Park Square Gardens (114 days; crosses solid lines) and a rural control site (114 days; open circles).

536

Fig. 2. Soluble a) Ba, b) Cd, c) Cr, d) Cu, e) Fe, f) Ni, g) Pb and h) Zn concentrations in the foliar tissue from downy birch, Lawson cypress and field maples planted at varying distances from two heavily polluted London roads in Brompton Square (74 days; black squares, dashed lines) and Park Square Gardens (114 days; crosses solid lines) and a rural control site (114 days; open circles).

543 Mean soil metal and PM_{10} concentrations (mg/kg and μ g/m³) at Park Square Gardens and Brompton Square.

	n			Distance from roadsid	de (m)	
Brompton Square		1	7	12	25	50
Cu (mg/kg)	50	80.8 (±4.8)	77.1 (±1.3)	78.8(±1.9)	70.0 (±1.8)	54.5 (±1.3)
Fe (mg/kg)	50	1266 (±89.0)	1071 (±23.3)	1198 (±42.0)	996 (±22.2)	783 (±21.2)
Mn (mg/kg)	50	17.9 (± 1.0)	17.9 (±0.7)	20.2 (±1.9)	15.5 (±0.9)	13.8 (±0.6)
Ni (mg/kg)	50	13.7 (± 0.8)	13.8 (±0.8)	14.8 (±0.9)	13.1 (±0.7)	9.4 (±0.6)
Pb (mg/kg)	50	151.9 (±14.4)	96.5 (±6.0)	97.6 (±5.1)	117.5 (±3.2)	66.7 (±4.5)
Zn (mg/kg)	50	117.1 (±19.4)	84.5 (±3.8)	76.3 (±3.1)	67.0 (±1.5)	45.9 (±2.3)
PM ₁₀ (µg/m ³)	11	70.4 (±24.1)	53.8 (±16.1)	58.8 (±19.4)	36.6 (±10.5)	44.0 (±6.9)
Park Square Gardens		1	5	10	25	55
Cu (mg/kg)	43	77.2 (±3.6)	90.0 (±1.8)	80.3 (±2.2)	80.2 (±4.9)	80.2 (±2.0)
Fe (mg/kg)	43	1237 (±104.4)	1613 (±25.5)	1637 (±22.1)	1156 (±81.1)	1299 (±31.8)
Mn (mg/kg)	43	20.2 (±1.5)	21.1 (±0.9)	21.7 (±0.6)	16.1 (±1.0)	17.7 (±1.0)
Ni (mg/kg)	43	12.6 (±1.3)	16.1 (±0.7)	15.9 (±1.4)	15.7 (±1.4)	12.1 (±0.7)
Pb (mg/kg)	43	159.1(±25.2)	162.3 (±9.8)	147.3 (±5.6)	84.0 (±8.0)	106.5 (±6.6)
Zn (mg/kg)	43	99.6 (±9.0)	88.7 (±3.9)	71.2 (±0.7)	96.4 (±9.3)	57.7 (±1.9)
PM ₁₀ (µg/m ³)	10	77.2 (±27.3)	30.7 (±9.0)	21.76 (±9.7)	14.6 (±8.3)	32.5 (±20.6)

544 Quality level for FPXRF data: Ni – qualitative; Cu, Mn, Zn quantitative; Pb, Fe definitive (Kilbride et al., 2006). Values in parenthesis represent the standard error of the mean.

546 Correlation co-efficients between the metal concentrations measured in downy birch, Lawson

- 547 cypress, field maple and common nettle following exposure to particulate pollution from two
- 548 urban roads (n=48).

	Correlation co-efficients between metal concentrations									
Ba	1.00									
Cd	0.74	1.00								
Cr	0.57	0.62	1.00							
Cu	0.69	0.70	0.96	1.00						
Fe	0.67	0.75	0.96	0.96	1.00					
Ni	0.56	0.60	0.93	0.88	0.87	1.00				
Pb	0.51	0.46	0.66	0.60	0.68	0.54	1.00			
Zn	0.60	0.40	0.44	0.45	0.43	0.53	0.60	1.00		
	Ва	Cd	Cr	Cu	Fe	Ni	Pb	Zn		

550 Log metal concentrations in leaves of downy birch, Lawson cypress, field maple and common nettle exposed for up to 114 days to particulate emissions at

551 varying distances (up to 12 m) from two heavily polluted London roads and the associated t-values for the effect of the distance of the plants from the roads.

	Log metal concentrations (mg/kg)								
Metal	Birch (n=15)		Cypress (n=14)		Maple (n=8)		Nettle (n=11)		
	Estimate ^a	t-value	Estimate ^a	t-value	Estimate ^a	t-value	Estimate ^a	t-value	
Ba	-0.0146 (0.0196)	-0.745	-0.0166 (0.0196)	-0.846	-0.0105 (0.0202)	-0.518	-0.0154 (0.0196)	-0.785	
Cd	-0.0040 (0.0159)	-0.254	-0.0086 (0.0159)	-0.543	0.0232 (0.0164)	1.414	-0.0648 (0.0159)	-4.067 ^b	
Cr	-0.0401 (0.0161)	-2.482	-0.0154 (0.0161)	-0.952	-0.0194 (0.0166)	-1.169	-0.0843 (0.0162)	- 5.213⁵	
Cu	-0.0585 (0.0155)	- 3.775 [♭]	-0.0230 (0.0155)	-1.482	-0.0429 (0.0160)	- 2.689 [♭]	-0.0864 (0.0155)	- 5.565⁵	
Fe	-0.0314 (0.0154)	-2.040	-0.0199 (0.0154)	-1.295	-0.0230 (0.0159)	-1.448	-0.0759 (0.0154)	-4.922 ^b	
Ni	-0.0297 (0.0139)	-2.135	-0.0061 (0.0139)	-0.441	-0.0079 (0.0143)	-0.553	-0.0970 (0.0139)	-6.958 ⁵	
Pb	-0.0273 (0.0427)	-0.640	-0.0122 (0.0427)	-0.287	0.0004 (0.0439)	0.008	-0.1109 (0.0470)°	-2.361	
Zn	-0.0025 (0.0217)	-0.115	-0.0118 (0.0217)	-0.543	-0.0089 (0.0223)	-0.400	-0.1092 (0.0217)	-5.026 ^b	

552 ^aEstimated mean from REML analysis, figures in parenthesis are the standard errors of the mean; ^bDenotes significance, where P<0.0015; ^cn=5.

554 Log differences in metal concentrations in leaves of downy birch, Lawson cypress, field maple and common nettle exposed for up to 114 days to particulate

555 emissions from two heavily polluted London roads compared with those from a rural control site and the associated t-values for the effect urban versus rural

556 locations.

	Log differences in metal concentrations compared to the rural control site (mg/kg)								
Metal	Birch (n=15)		Cypress (n=14)		Maple (n=8)		Nettle (n=11)		
	Estimate ^a	t-value	Estimate ^a	t-value	Estimate ^a	t-value	Estimate ^a	t-value	
Ва	0.574 (0.269)	2.14	0.039 (0.158)	0.25	0.566 (0.232)	2.44	-0.257 (0.131)	-1.96	
Cd	0.805 (0.107)	7.53 ^b	0.321 (0.144)	2.23	0.565 (0.417)	1.35	1.187 (0.339)	3.50	
Cr	1.672 (0.170)	9.84 ^b	0.954 (0.178)	5.37	1.421 (0.167)	8.51 ^b	2.160 (0.195)	11.06 ^b	
Cu	2.399 (0.169)	14.19 ^b	0.954 (0.126)	7.54 ^b	1.840 (0.208)	8.85	1.874 (0.126)	14.90 ^b	
Fe	1.898 (0.138)	13.71 ^b	0.958 (0.103)	9.29 ^b	1.408 (0.170)	8.31 ^b	1.993 (0.125)	15.94 ^b	
Ni	0.764 (0.423)	1.81	0.225 (0.131)	1.72	0.909 (0.104)	8.72 ^b	1.378 (0.123)	11.22 ^b	
Zn	0.717 (0.212)	3.39	0.006 (0.143)	0.04	0.826 (0.191)	4.33 ^b	1.216 (0.179)	6.81*	

^aEstimated mean from REML analysis, figures in parenthesis are the standard errors of the mean; ^bDenotes significance, where P<0.002

559 Log soluble metal concentrations in leaves of downy birch, Lawson cypress and field maple exposed to particulate emissions at varying distances (up to 12

560 m) from two heavily polluted London roads at Brompton Square (74 day exposure) and Park Square Gardens (114 day exposure) and the differences

561 between these concentrations compared with those from a rural control site (114 day exposure) and the associated t-values for the effect urban versus rural

562 locations.

Site	Log soluble metal concentrations at the two London sites and the differences between those from the rural control site (mg/kg)										
	Metal		Birch (n=15)		(Cypress (n=14)			Maple (n=8)		
_		Estimate ^a	Difference	t-value	Estimate ^a	Difference	t-value	Estimate ^a	Difference	t-value	
	Ва	1.944 (0.199)	0.36 (0.336)	1.08	0.306 (0.199)	-0.63 (0.213)	-2.98	0.674 (0.257)	0.24 (0.541)	0.44	
e	Cd	-3.355 (0.311)	0.19 (0.363)	0.51	-4.852 (0.343)	-0.15 (0.428)	-0.36				
qua	Cr	-2.381 (0.213)	1.03 (0.225)	4.56 ^b	-3.537 (0.213)	-0.03 (0.221)	-0.12				
Š	Cu	0.467 (0.228)	2.09 (0.252)	8.31 ^b	-1.386 (0.228)	0.59 (0.259)	2.29	0.458 (0.294)	1.38 (0.561)	2.45	
ptoi	Fe	2.080 (0.230)	2.72 (0.692)	3.93	1.585 (0.230)	1.62 (0.433)	3.74	1.276 (0.296)	3.00 (0.392)	7.65 ^b	
ШO	Ni	-1.279 (0.153)	1.08 (0.195)	5.54 ^b	-2.384 (0.153)	-0.28 (0.193)	-1.44	-2.114 (0.198)	0.13 (0.285)	0.46	
В	Pb	-1.512 (0.181)	5.07 (0.339)	14.98 ^b	-2.342 (0.181)	2.27 (0.415)	5.47	-2.298 (0.233)	(0.240)	0.00	
	Zn	2.976 (0.154)	0.30 (0.229)	1.29	1.897 (0.154)	-0.17 (0.214)	-0.78	1.873 (0.199)	0.06 (0.476)	0.12	
(0	Ва	1.485 (0.199)	-0.09 (0.202)	-0.28	0.322 (0.199)	-0.62 (0.202)	-2.91	0.444 (0.199)	0.01 (0.202)	0.01	
lens	Cd	-3.765 (0.656)	-0.33 (0.642)	-0.49	-5.705 (0.391)	-1.06 (0.382)	-2.28				
àarc	Cr	-4.424 (0.229)	-1.02 (0.231)	-4.23 ^b	-3.803 (0.213)	-0.29 (0.214)	-1.32	-1.235 (0.405)	2.13 (0.404)	5.18 ^b	
e.	Cu	0.625 (0.228)	2.25 (0.227)	8.93 ^b	-1.102 (0.228)	0.88 (0.227)	3.38	0.421 (0.228)	1.34 (0.227)	2.53	
quai	Fe	2.433 (0.230)	3.07 (0.230)	4.44	1.876 (0.230)	1.91 (0.230)	4.41	1.524 (0.230)	3.25 (0.230)	9.43 ^b	
SS	Ni	-1.706 (0.153)	0.66 (0.162)	3.35	-2.49 (0.153)	-0.38 (0.162)	-1.99	-2.621 (0.153)	-0.38 (0.162)	-1.49	
ark	Pb	-1.459 (0.181)	5.12 (0.186)	15.13 ^b	-1.922 (0.181)	2.69 (0.186)	6.49	-3.775 (0.196)			
ц	Zn	2.995 (0.154)	0.32 (0.163)	1.38	2.151 (0.154)	0.09 (0.163)	0.41	1.790 (0.154)	-0.02 (0.163)	-0.05	

^aEstimated mean from REML analysis, figures in parenthesis are the standard errors of the mean; ^bDenotes significance, where P<0.001





