

## **Significance and Impact of Study**

 Acute Oak Decline (AOD) is an increasing threat to Britain's native oak population. Two novel bacterial species both belonging to the family *Enterobacteriaceae*, *Gibbsiella quercinecans* and *Brenneria goodwinii*, are thought to play an important role in symptom development. Here we describe a rapid identification technique using high resolution melt (HRM) analysis of the *atpD* gene able to assign isolates to either *G. quercinecans* or *B. goodwinii* in a single assay, greatly reducing the time taken to identify if either or both of these species are present in symptomatic oak.

## **Abstract**

 Two Gram-negative *Enterobacteriaceae*, *Gibbsiella quercinecans* and *Brenneria goodwinii*, are frequently isolated from oak suffering from Acute Oak Decline. These two species are difficult to identify based on colony morphology, carbohydrate utilisation or 16S rRNA gene sequence, and identification using *gyrB* gene sequencing is time-consuming and laborious. A rapid identification technique, based on high resolution melt (HRM) analysis of the *atpD* gene, was designed to efficiently process numerous isolates from an increasing number of affected woodlands and parks. Principal component analysis of the resulting melt curves from strains of *G. quercinecans*, *B. goodwinii* and their close phylogenetic relatives allowed differentiation into distinct clusters based on species or subspecies identity. 

**Keywords**

 *Gibbsiella quercinecans*, *Brenneria goodwinii*, Acute Oak Decline, high resolution melt, HRM 

**Introduction:**

 Acute Oak Decline (AOD) is an increasingly serious problem in Britain, affecting the native oak species *Quercus robur* and *Q. petraea* throughout the Midlands and south east of the country. Symptoms appear on mature oaks and include weeping patches, cracks in the outer bark, necrosis of the underlying tissue and larval galleries of the bark boring buprestid *Agrilus biguttatus* (Denman *et al*., 2014). Investigations into the cause of AOD started in 2008/2009 and in the years following, numerous bacteria have been isolated from symptomatic tissue and fluid exudates. A large proportion of these bacteria were found to belong to the family *Enterobacteriaceae* and several were proposed as novel genera, species or subspecies within this family (Brady *et al*., 2010, Brady *et al*., 2012, Denman *et al*., 2012, Brady *et al*., 2014a, Brady *et al*., 2014b). It appears that the two most frequently isolated species, *Gibbsiella quercinecans* and *Brenneria goodwinii*, play an important role in causing symptoms of the decline (Denman *et al*., 2014). Other species belonging to the genera *Brenneria*, *Lonsdalea*, *Rahnella*, *Erwinia* and *Ewingella* are often isolated in lower numbers along with *G. quercinecans* and *B. goodwinii*, and could possibly contribute to lesion formation and decay of the inner tissues.

 Members of the *Enterobacteriaceae* are typically difficult to identify owing to a high degree of similarity in both phenotype and 16S rRNA gene sequence. Sequencing and phylogenetic analysis of protein-encoding genes such as *gyrB*, *rpoB* and *dnaJ* have greatly improved identification and classification of enterobacteria (Dauga *et al*., 2002, Delmas *et al*., 2006, Mollet *et al*., 1997, Pham *et al*., 2007). The majority of the novel species associated with AOD were described using a multilocus sequence analysis (MLSA) scheme based on four

 protein-encoding genes (*gyrB*, *rpoB*, *infB* and *atpD*), but routine identification of bacteria associated with AOD has been typically based on amplification and sequencing of the *gyrB* gene of cultured isolates. This approach, although time-consuming due to the large number of epi- and endophytes present in oak, has allowed researchers to gain insight into the composition of the culturable bacterial population of symptomatic native oak. However, with an increasing number of woodlands and parklands affected by AOD, new isolations from infected tissue are performed on a regular basis, highlighting the need for rapid methods of accurate identification and detection of both *G. quercinecans* and *B. goodwinii*. 

 High resolution melt (HRM) analysis is a real-time PCR-based molecular technique, whereby single nucleotide polymorphisms (SNPs) can be identified in amplification products without sequencing. A short stretch of the target gene is amplified in the presence of an intercalating dye that only fluoresces when bound to double-stranded DNA. Following amplification, samples are subjected to a melting step where the temperature increases 86 with each cycle until 95  $\degree$ C is reached. The loss of fluorescence is measured as the double- stranded amplification product denatures and a melt curve is generated. The rate of lost fluorescence correlates with the G+C content and sequence length of the amplification 89 product. Therefore, samples differing by a single base pair can generate different melting curves. Genotyping by high-resolution melting has been in use for over 10 years (Gundry *et al*., 2003, Wittwer *et al*., 2003) and improvements in the chemistry of the saturating dyes and the system technology have made this an attractive alternative to standard techniques for SNP detection, mutant detection and methylation (Vossen *et al*., 2009). Typically HRM analysis is applied to identification of clinical bacteria (Pietska *et al*., 2009, Talmi-Frank *et al*., 2010, Sangal *et al*., 2013) and detection of mutations in cancer samples and markers (Boyd

 *et al*., 2011, Takano *et al*., 2008). However, this technique is gaining popularity for SNP detection of plant and insect species (Mackay *et al*., 2008, Swisher *et al*., 2012, Wetten *et al*., 2015). Here we describe the application of HRM analysis of the *atpD* gene as a rapid identification technique for bacteria, particularly *G. quercinecans* and *B. goodwinii*, associated with AOD in Britain. **Results and discussion:** Bacterial strains, isolated from native oak species in the UK, previously identified as either *G. quercinecans* or *B. goodwinii* were selected for this study. Additionally, strains belonging to the close phylogenetic relatives of *G. quercinecans* (*G. greigii*, isolated from oak in the USA, and *G. dentisursi*, not isolated from oak) and subspecies of both *B. roseae* and *L. quercina* (*B*. *roseae* ssp. *roseae*, *B. roseae* ssp. *americana*, *L. quercina* ssp. *quercina*, *L. quercina* ssp. *britannica* and *L. quercina*. ssp. *iberica*; all isolated from symptomatic oak in the UK, USA and Spain) were also included (Suppl. table 1). Sequence alignments of four housekeeping genes (*gyrB*, *rpoB*, *infB* and *atpD*), routinely used in a MLSA scheme to classify novel

*Enterobacteriaceae* (Brady *et al*., 2008) were examined for regions of heterogeneity

between species of *Gibbsiella*, *Brenneria* and *Lonsdalea*. The *atpD* gene (encoding the β

subunit of ATP synthase) was found to be a good candidate target gene as several regions

contain SNPs which could potentially differentiate between strains of *G. quercinecans* and *B.* 

*goodwinii*. Several different primer pairs targeting short sequences of the *atpD* gene were

designed and tested against strains of *G. quercinecans*, *B. goodwinii*, their close

phylogenetic relatives and species of *Rahnella* (often isolated from symptomatic oak in

 lower numbers). The optimal primer pair should be able to amplify all strains tested and reveal enough diversity in the target gene for differentiation of species.

 The *atpD* primer pair designed and selected for this study (Gq6bF and Gq6bR) could amplify all species tested belonging to the genera *Gibbsiella*, *Brenneria* and *Lonsdalea* (Suppl. table 1). A unique melting curve was generated for each bacterial species examined in the HRM analysis indicating the presence of SNPs. While the melting curve generated per strain was specific for that species, it was still difficult to definitively distinguish several strains of *Gibbsiella quercinecans* and *Brenneria goodwinii* based solely on the shape of the melt curve. This could possibly be due to a high degree of intraspecies relatedness within each of these species and the short gene region examined. To counteract this, each individual PCR product was combined ('spiked') with an *atpD* PCR probe of the *G. quercinecans* reference 131 strain (FRB 97<sup>T</sup>), prior to the melting step. The *atpD* gene of the *G. quercinecans* reference strain was amplified separately on a large scale to create the PCR probe. This maximised the differentiation between each species by forcing amplification products to create heteroduplexes on which the melting analysis was performed. Ideally, strains which are less related to the *G. quercinecans* reference strain will form a less stable heteroduplex, dissociate and lose fluorescence more easily than strains which are closely related to *G. quercinecans* and form stable heteroduplexes.

 Fig. 1 shows the distinct melt curves of four species frequently associated with AOD in Britain (*Gibbsiella quercinecans*, *Brenneria goodwinii*, *Brenneria roseae* ssp. *roseae* and *Lonsdalea quercina* ssp. *britannica*), based on the mean of 9-10 strains of *G. quercinecans* and *B*. *goodwinii*, and 2-5 strains for *B. roseae* ssp. *roseae* and *L. quercina* ssp. *britannica* (all

 HRM PCRs performed in duplicate). Principal component analysis performed on the data generated by HRM in ScreenClust (Qiagen), reveals that strains belonging to each of these four species are easily separated into four distinct species specific clusters, each containing the relevant type strain (Fig. 2). Each dot represents a single HRM reaction, with all strains performed in duplicate. Strains identified as *G. quercinecans* form a densely populated cluster, suggesting little sequence variation in the 119 bp *atpD* region among these isolates. When the *atpD* sequence alignment for these strains is examined, only one SNP (at position 92) is observed for two strains of *G. quercinecans* compared to the reference strain (FRB 151 97<sup>T</sup>) (Table 1). Slightly more variation is evident within *B. goodwinii*, with six out of nine 152 strains exhibiting a SNP (at position 81) compared to the reference strain (FRB 141<sup>T</sup>) (Suppl. Fig. 1). This is reflected in the scatter plot where *B. goodwinii* strains are more dispersed within their cluster. Both *B. roseae* ssp. *roseae* and *L. quercina* ssp. *britannica* strains are contained in discrete clusters easily distinguishable from the two most frequently isolated species associated with AOD (Fig. 2).

 HRM analysis allows not only the differentiation between species belonging to different genera, but also between closely related species belonging to the same genus and even between different subspecies. A scatter plot, focussed only on *Gibbsiella*, demonstrates that 161 the three species belonging to this genus can be easily separated based on SNPs revealed by their melt curve, despite their close phylogenetic relationship (Fig. 3a). *G. greigii* has, so far, only been isolated from California black oak in the USA and *G. dentisursi* has been isolated from the oral cavity of a bear in Japan and the intestinal tract of a butterfly in Korea. To date, neither of these *Gibbsiella* species have been isolated from symptomatic oak in Britain. However as these three species are so closely related (Suppl. Fig. 2), it was

 necessary to ensure that the rapid identification technique could distinguish strains belonging to all *Gibbsiella* species in the event of a host jump. The resolution which HRM analysis can provide below the species level is evident within *B. roseae* and *L. quercina*. Although strains belonging to both subspecies of *B. roseae* differ by a single SNP, they form two distinct clusters in a scatter plot following principal component analysis, whereas subspecies of *L. quercina* are more diverse with a range of SNPs amongst them and form three specific clusters corresponding to *L. quercina* ssp. *quercina*, *L. quercina* ssp. *britannica* and *L. quercina* ssp. *iberica* (Fig. 3b). In Britain, *B. goodwinii* is one of the most frequently isolated bacteria from symptomatic oak, followed by *B. roseae* ssp. *roseae* and *L. quercina* ssp. *britannica*. To our knowledge, *B. roseae* ssp. *americana* and *L. quercina* ssp. *quercina* have been isolated from symptomatic oak only in the USA, and *L. quercina* ssp. *iberica* from symptomatic oak only in Spain. Despite more diversity existing between species of *Brenneria* and *Lonsdalea* (Fig. 2), it is crucial that strains belonging to any of these species found on symptomatic oak can be distinguished from each other in the rapid identification assay.

 To test whether the HRM assay is sensitive enough to detect lower quantities or 183 concentrations of *G. quercinecans*, the reference strain FRB 97<sup>T</sup> was serially diluted from 10<sup>0</sup> 184 to 10<sup>-10</sup>. Each dilution was subjected to HRM analysis using the same primers and conditions with an undiluted sample (a single colony in 750 µl sterile water) as a positive control. The melt curve for each diluted sample was visually compared to the undiluted control and the 187 shape of the curves remain consistent up to  $10^{-4}$  (4.4 x  $10^{6}$  CFU ml<sup>-1</sup>) (data not shown). With HRM analysis able to detect *G. quercinecans* in a 10 000 fold dilution, it's possible that with some modifications, the assay could be applied to future samples swabbed directly from infected oak tissue broadening the application of this identification technique.

 AOD is an increasing threat to the native oak population in Britain and as such, a large number of samples from symptomatic tissue are processed on a regular basis. The aim of this study was to create a single rapid identification technique for both *G. quercinecans* and *B. goodwinii*, the two species most frequently isolated from symptomatic oak. HRM analysis of a short region of the *atpD* gene has achieved this and also shows great future promise for identification of non-cultured samples. Including a reference strain of *G. quercinecans* and *B. goodwinii* in each run of the assay allows for comparison of isolates to both species, greatly reducing the time taken to identify bacteria isolated from oak tissue.

## **Materials and methods:**

 Published sequences of the *atpD* gene (ATP synthase β subunit) from *Enterobacteriaceae* isolated from symptomatic oak were aligned and examined for a region containing heterogeneity between species. Primers were designed to amplify a short stretch (119 bp) of the *atpD* gene demonstrating sufficient sequence divergence between species of *Gibbsiella*, *Brenneria* and *Lonsdalea* (Gq6bF: 5'GGC AAC CCA TCG ACA TGA A 3'; Gq6bR: 5' CTT GAT ACC GGT TTC CAG CAG 3') (Suppl. Tables 1 and 2). For all bacterial strains, a single 208 colony was re-suspended in 750 µl sterile distilled water and 2 µl was used in a 20 µl PCR mixture containing 2x SensiFAST HRM mix (Bioline) and 10 pmol of each primer. HRM analysis was performed on 2 – 10 strains of each of the following species in duplicate: *G. quercinecans*, *G. greigii*, *G. dentisursi*, *B. goodwinii*, *B. roseae* ssp. *roseae* and ssp. *americana*, *Lonsdalea quercina* ssp. *quercina*, ssp. *britannica* and ssp. *iberica* (Suppl. Table 1) 213 in a Rotor-Gene Q cycler (Qiagen). Following initial denaturation for 10 min at 95 °C and 45 214 amplification cycles of 5 sec denaturation at 95 °C and 30 sec annealing at 58 °C, each PCR

 reaction was 'spiked' with 20 µl of the *G. quercinecans* probe (the *atpD* amplification 216 product of reference strain FRB  $97<sup>T</sup>$  which was amplified separately using the primers and conditions listed above). The melting step was then performed with 2 min denaturation at 218 95 °C, 2 min hold at 55 °C and melting from 55 to 90 °C where the temperature was 219 increased by 0.1  $\degree$ C each cycle. The fluorescence was measured at the end of each cycle and a melt curve was generated by the Rotor-Gene software (Qiagen).

 To assess the statistical differences between each of the species tested, melting curves 223 (normalised between 80-81 and 87-88 °C) were converted to residual plots in ScreenClust v 1.10.1.2 (Qiagen). A preliminary analysis was run with the number of possible clusters fixed to the number of expected species (supervised mode) and then compared to an analysis with the optimal number of clusters generated automatically by the software (unsupervised mode). Screenclust allocates strains to the most appropriate cluster, indicating which SNPs generate significantly different melt curves.

 Amplification and sequencing of the *atpD* gene for each strain examined by HRM analysis was performed as previously described (Brady *et al*., 2008). *atpD* sequences were aligned and trimmed in BioEdit v 7.2.5 (Hall, 1999) to reflect the 119 bp fragment amplified used in the HRM analysis. A maximum likelihood tree was constructed in MEGA v 6 (Tamura *et al*., 2006) using the general time reversible model with proportion of invariable sites and gamma distribution and with 1000 bootstrap replicates.







 Brady, C.L., Cleenwerck, I., Denman, S., Venter, S.N., Rodríguez-Palenzuela, P., Coutinho, T.A. and De Vos, P. (2012) Proposal to reclassify *Brenneria quercina* (Hildebrand & Schroth 1967) Hauben *et al*. 1999 into a novel genus, *Lonsdalea* gen. nov., as *Lonsdalea quercina* comb. nov., descriptions of *Lonsdalea quercina* subsp. *quercina* comb. nov., *Lonsdalea quercina* subsp. *iberica* subsp. nov. and *Lonsdalea quercina* subsp. *britannica* subsp. nov., emendation of the description of the genus *Brenneria*, reclassification of *Dickeya dieffenbachiae* as *Dickeya dadantii* subsp. *dieffenbachiae* comb. nov., and emendation of the description of *Dickeya dadantii*. *Int J Syst Evol Microbiol* **62**, 1592-1602.

 Brady, C., Hunter, G., Kirk, S., Arnold, D. and Denman, S. (2014a) Description of *Brenneria roseae* sp. nov. and two subspecies, *Brenneria roseae* subspecies *roseae* ssp. nov and *Brenneria roseae* subspecies *americana* ssp. nov. isolated from symptomatic oak. *Syst Appl Microbiol* **37**, 396-401.

 Brady, C., Hunter, G., Kirk, S., Arnold, D. and Denman, S. (2014b) *Rahnella victoriana* sp. nov., *Rahnella bruchi* sp. nov., *Rahnella woolbedingensis* sp. nov., classification of *Rahnella* genomospecies 2 and 3 as *Rahnella variigena* sp. nov. and *Rahnella inusitata* sp. nov., respectively and emended description of the genus *Rahnella. Syst Appl Microbiol* **37**, 545-552. 

- Dauga, C. (2002) Evolution of the *gyrB* gene and the molecular phylogeny of *Enterobacteriaceae*: a model molecule for molecular systematic studies. *Int J Syst Evol Microbiol* **52**, 531-547.
- 
- Delmas, J., Breysse, F., Devulder, G., Flandrois, J-P. and Chomarat, M. (2006) Rapid identification of *Enterobacteriaceae* by sequencing DNA gyrase subunit B enconding gene. *Diagn Micr Infec Dis* **55**, 263-268.

 Denman, S., Brady, C., Kirk, S., Cleenwerck, I., Venter, S., Coutinho, T., De Vos, P. (2012) *Brenneria goodwinii* sp. nov., associated with acute oak decline in the UK. *Int J Syst Evol Microbiol* **62**, 2451-2456.

 Denman, S., Brown, N., Kirk, S., Jeger, M. and Webber, J.F. (2014) A description of the symptoms of Acute Oak Decline in Britain and a comparative review on causes of similar disorders on oak in Europe. *Forestry* **87**, 535-551.

 Gundry, C.N., Vandersteen, J.G., Reed, G.H., Pryor, R.J., Chen, J. and Wittwer, C.T. (2003) Amplicon melting analysis with labelled primers: a closed-tube method for differentiating homozygotes and heterozygotes. *Clin Chem* **49**, 396-406.

 Hall, T.A. (1999) BioEdit: a user-friendly biological sequence alignment editor and analysis program for Windows 95/98/NT. *Nucl Acids Symp Ser* **41**, 95-98.





Table 1: Sequence variation within the partial *atpD* gene (119 bp) of *Gibbsiella quercinecans*, *Brenneria goodwinii*, *Brenneria roseae* subsp. *roseae* and *Lonsdalea quercina* subsp. *britannica* associated with Acute Oak Decline in Britain. Single nucleotide polymorphisms are indicated as compared against the *Gibbsiella quercinecans* FRB 97<sup>T</sup> reference sequence.





*Gq* = *Gibbsiella quercinecans*, *Bg* = *Brenneria goodwinii*, *Brr* = *Brenneria roseae* ssp. *roseae*, *Lqb* = *Lonsdalea quercina* ssp. b*ritannica*

= nucleotide identical to the *Gq* reference sequence at that nucleotide position

Figure 1: HRM curves generated for species associated with Acute Oak Decline (AOD) in Britain by amplification of partial *atpD* genes, followed by 'spiking' with the FRB 97<sup>T</sup> probe and a high resolution melting step. The assay was performed on each strain in duplicate. *Gibbsiella quercinecans* n = 10 (-), *Brenneria goodwinii* n = 9 (-), *Brenneria roseae* subsp. *roseae* n = 5 (-) and *Lonsdalea quercina* subsp. *britannica* n = 2 (-).



Figure 2: Scatter plot generated by ScreenClust v 1.10.1.2 (Qiagen) from HRM curve data. Each dot represents a single strain (in duplicate) of species associated with Acute Oak Decline (AOD) in Britain: *Gibbsiella quercinecans* n = 10 (•), *Brenneria goodwinii* n = 9 (•), *Brenneria roseae* subsp. *roseae*  $n = 5$  ( $\bullet$ ) and *Lonsdalea quercina* subsp. *britannica*  $n = 2$  ( $\bullet$ ). Cluster plot was produced from principal components 1 and 2 in an unsupervised mode.



Figure 3a: Scatter plot generated by ScreenClust v 1.10.1.2 (Qiagen) from HRM curve data. Each dot represents a single strain (in duplicate) of *Gibbsiella quercinecans*  $n = 10$  ( $\bullet$ ) and close phylogenetic relatives *Gibbsiella greigii* n = 5 () and *Gibbsiella dentisursi* n = 2 (). Cluster plot was produced from principal components 1 and 2 in an unsupervised mode.

Figure 3b: Scatter plot generated by ScreenClust v 1.10.1.2 (Qiagen) from HRM curve data. Each dot represents a single strain (in duplicate) of *Brenneria goodwinii* n = 9 ( $\bullet$ ) and close phylogenetic relatives *Brenneria roseae* subsp*. roseae* n = 5 ()*, Brenneria roseae* subsp*. americana* n = 3 ()*, Lonsdalea quercina* subsp*. quercina* n = 3 ()*, Lonsdalea quercina* subsp*. britannica*  $n = 2$  ( $\bullet$ ) and *Lonsdalea quercina* subsp. *iberica*  $n = 1$  ( $\bullet$ ). Cluster plot was produced from principal components 1 and 2 in an unsupervised mode.



## **Supporting information:**

Supplementary table 1: Strains of *Gibbsiella quercinecans*, *Gibbsiella greigii*, *Gibbsiella dentisursi*, *Brenneria goodwinii*, *Brenneria roseae* and

*Lonsdalea quercina* used in this study







Single nucleotide polymorphism position

phylogenetic relatives. Single nucleotide polymorphisms are indicated as compared against the *Gibbsiella quercinecans* reference sequence.

Supplementary table 2: Sequence variation within the *atpD* gene of species associated with Acute Oak Decline in Britain and their close

Gq = Gibbsiella quercinecans n = 10, Gd = Gibbsiella dentisursi n = 2, Gq = Gibbsiella greigii n = 5, Bq = Brenneria goodwinii n = 9, Brr = Brenneria roseae ssp. roseae n = 5, Bra = Brenneria roseae ssp. americana n = 3, Lgg = Lonsdalea quercina ssp. quercina n = 3, Lgb = Lonsdalea quercina ssp. britannica n = 2, Lonsdalea quercina ssp. iberica n  $= 1$ 

= nucleotide identical to the *Gq* reference sequence at that nucleotide position

Supplementary figure 1: Sequence variation within the *atpD* gene of species associated with Acute Oak Decline in Britain and their close phylogenetic relatives. Single nucleotide polymorphisms are indicated as compared against the *Gibbsiella quercinecans* (FRB 97<sup>T</sup> ) and *Brenneria goodwinii* (FRB 141<sup>T</sup> ) reference sequences. *Gq* = *Gibbsiella quercinecans* n = 10, *Gd* = *Gibbsiella denstisursi* n = 2, *Gg* = *Gibbsiella greigii* n = 5, *Bg* = *Brenneria goodwinii* n = 9, *Brr* = *Brenneria roseae* subsp. *roseae* n = 5, *Bra* = *Brenneria roseae* subsp. *americana* n = 3*, Lqq* = *Lonsdalea quercina* subsp. *quercina* n = 3, *Lqb* = *Lonsdalea quercina* subsp. *britannica* n = 2, *Lqi* = *Lonsdalea quercina* subsp. *iberica* n = 1



Supplementary figure 2: Maximum likelihood tree based on partial *atpD* gene sequences of species of *Gibbsiella*, *Brenneria* and *Lonsdalea*. Bootstrap values after 1000 replicates are expressed as percentages. *Cronobacter sakazakii* is included as an outgroup, gene sequence were obtained from the genome sequencing database (http://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov). The scale bar indicates the fraction of substitutions per site.

