

Exploring Materiality *and* Connectivity in Anthropology *and Beyond*

Edited by
Philipp Schorch
Martin Saxer
Marlen Elders



Exploring Materiality and Connectivity in Anthropology and Beyond

Exploring Materiality and Connectivity in Anthropology and Beyond

Edited by Philipp Schorch, Martin Saxer
and Marlen Elders

 **UCL**PRESS

First published in 2020 by
UCL Press
University College London
Gower Street
London WC1E 6BT

Available to download free: www.uclpress.co.uk

Text © Contributors, 2020
Images © Contributors, 2020

The authors have asserted their rights under the Copyright, Designs and Patents Act 1988 to be identified as the authors of this work.

A CIP catalogue record for this book is available from The British Library.

This book is published under a Creative Commons 4.0 International license (CC BY 4.0). This license allows you to share, copy, distribute and transmit the work; to adapt the work and to make commercial use of the work providing attribution is made to the authors (but not in any way that suggests that they endorse you or your use of the work). Attribution should include the following information:

Schorch, P., Saxer, M. and Elders, M. (eds). 2020. *Exploring Materiality and Connectivity in Anthropology and Beyond*. London: UCL Press. DOI: <https://doi.org/10.14324/111.9781787357488>

Further details about Creative Commons licenses are available at <http://creativecommons.org/licenses/>

Any third-party material in this book is published under the book's Creative Commons license unless indicated otherwise in the credit line to the material. If you would like to reuse any third-party material not covered by the book's Creative Commons license, you will need to obtain permission directly from the copyright holder.

ISBN: 978-1-78735-750-1 (Hbk.)
ISBN: 978-1-78735-749-5 (Pbk.)
ISBN: 978-1-78735-748-8 (PDF)
ISBN: 978-1-78735-751-8 (epub)
ISBN: 978-1-78735-752-5 (mobi)
DOI: <https://doi.org/10.14324/111.9781787357488>

Contents

<i>List of figures</i>	vii
<i>Notes on contributors</i>	xii
<i>Acknowledgements</i>	xvii
Introduction: Materiality and Connectivity <i>Martin Saxer and Philipp Schorch</i>	1
Part I: Conceptual Grounds	15
1. In the gathering shadows of material things <i>Tim Ingold</i>	17
2. Doing/changing things/us <i>Philipp W. Stockhammer</i>	36
Part II: Movement and Growth	51
3. Becoming imperial: the politicisation of the gift in Atlantic Africa <i>Julia T. S. Binter</i>	53
4. How pilgrimage souvenirs turn into religious remittances and powerful medicine <i>Catrien Notermans and Jean Kommers</i>	72
Intervention	
5. Invoking the gods, or the apotheosis of the Barbie doll <i>Natalie Göltenboth</i>	91
6. Stallions of the Indian Ocean <i>Srinivas Reddy</i>	98

7. Labelling, packaging, scanning: paths and diversions of mobile phones in the Andes	116
<i>Juliane Müller</i>	
Intervention	
8. Establishing intimacy through mobile phone connections	135
<i>Anna-Maria Walter</i>	
Part III: Dissolution and Traces	143
9. Smoky relations: beyond dichotomies of substance on the Tibetan Plateau	145
<i>Gillian G. Tan</i>	
Intervention	
10. What remains: the things that fall to the side of everyday life	163
<i>Marc Higgin</i>	
11. Apocalyptic sublimes and the recalibration of distance: doing art-anthropology in post-disaster Japan	172
<i>Jennifer Clarke</i>	
12. Towards a fragmented ethnography? Walking along debris in Armero, Colombia	191
<i>Lorenzo Granada</i>	
Intervention	
13. Remembering and non-remembering among the Yanomami	207
<i>Gabriele Herzog-Schröder</i>	
14. The matter of erasure: making room for utopia at Nonoalco-Tlatelolco, Mexico City	214
<i>Adam Kaasa</i>	
15. Refugee life jackets thrown off but not away: connecting materialities in upcycling initiatives	228
<i>Elia Petridou</i>	
Intervention	
16. <i>Tamga tash</i> : a tale of stones, stories and travelling immobiles	249
<i>Lisa Francesca Rail</i>	
<i>Index</i>	259

Introduction: Materiality and Connectivity

Martin Saxer and Philipp Schorch

Things that move and thereby connect or, conversely, connections made through things have long been central to anthropology's concerns. From the Kula Ring (Malinowski 1922) and the role of the gift (Mauss 1923–4) to questions of dowry (Goody 1976), the theme of material circulation and exchange has featured prominently in anthropological understandings of the worlds in which we live. In recent decades, too, a renewed interest in things has informed a variety of scholarly endeavours. Arjun Appadurai's volume on *The Social Life of Things* (1986) inspired a substantial body of work on material culture in motion (Thomas 1991; Marcus and Myers 1995; Clifford 1997; Harrison, Byrne and Clarke 2013; Bell and Hasinoff 2015; Joyce 2015; Bennett, Cameron, Dias et al. 2016; Basu 2017). 'Things' continue to be rethought (Henare, Holbraad and Wastell 2007; Bennett 2009; Miller 2010; Bogost 2012; Shaviro 2014; Atzmon and Boradkar 2017), while a recent strand of anthropological work has shifted the focus from the 'social life of things' to the 'social life of materials' (Drazin and Kuchler 2015; see also Ingold 2007, 2012).

At the same time, in the field of science studies, Bruno Latour's reflections on the parliament of things (1993) and his outline of Actor-Network-Theory (2005) problematised the notion of agency as something not exclusively human, inspiring new approaches to the study of science, technology and medicine. Interdisciplinary takes on infrastructure highlight both the stubbornness and the fragility of material interventions (Björkman 2015; Harvey and Knox 2015), and studies on transnational commodity flows provide us with a deeper understanding of global connections (Steiner 1994; Bestor 2001; Tsing 2015). New schools of thought are emerging around concepts such as perspectivism (Viveiros de Castro 2004, 2012), multispecies ethnography (Kirksey 2014), new materialism (Barad 2007; Bennett 2009; Dolphijn and van der Tuin 2012) and

object-oriented ontology and speculative realism (Bogost 2012; Harman 2010; Bryant, Srnicek and Harman 2011; Shaviro 2014), working across the big divides between human and non-human, nature and culture and subject and object, that once seemed to be taken for granted.

All of these approaches and themes – from the classics of anthropology to the bleeding edge of theory production – share a fundamental concern with things in motion and their role in forging connections. This volume – the outcome of two workshops and a symposium – aims to provide a new look at the old anthropological concern with materiality and connectivity. We do not understand materiality as a defined property of some-thing; nor do we take connectivity as merely a relation between discrete entities. Somewhat akin to Heisenberg’s uncertainty principle (1927), we rather see materiality and connectivity as two interrelated modes in which an entity is, or, more precisely, is becoming, in the world. Just as things tend to become the things they are through the connections in which they are engaged, connections are often imbued with material qualities. The question, thus, is how these two modes of becoming relate and fold into each other to produce the realities we attempt to understand.

In order to find answers, we explore the forces and potentialities that underlie, constitute and mobilise these entities from ethnographic, historical, methodological and theoretical angles. More specifically, we follow the narrative journeys of things and the emergent ties through which what is commonly called ‘material culture’ comes into existence, bringing into focus the dynamic courses of material change, dissolution and decay. Thus, we do not see the value of this volume as emerging from a juxtaposition of two well-researched themes – materiality and connectivity – but rather from their deep and often surprising entanglements. Throughout the four-year research process that led to this book, we approached these issues not just from a theoretical perspective; taking the suggestion of ‘thinking through things’ (Henare, Holbraad and Wastell 2007) literally, and methodologically seriously, we dedicated our first two workshops to practical, hands-on exercises working with things. From these workshops a series of installations emerged, straddling the boundaries of art and academia (cf. Schneider and Wright 2006, 2010). These installations served as artistic-academic interventions during the final two-day symposium and are featured alongside the other, academic contributions to this volume. We will now begin by outlining this process of exploration, with all its pitfalls and outcomes, bringing it into conversation with the chapters and main themes of the book.

Thinking-by-doing

The aim of the first workshop in 2015 was to take stock of experiences with, stories of and reflections on things that move and thereby connect or, the other way round, connections made through things. The method employed was decisively simple: each participant brought three or four things to the workshop and prepared brief interventions – anecdotes about experiences, conceptual insights, questions, puzzles. These ‘storied things’ were then *put on the table* – metaphorically as well as physically – in order to create an arrangement of materials, field experiences, concepts, theories and histories. This simple exercise of thinking-by-doing¹ turned out to be highly productive, leading to a wealth of ideas that have since found purchase within our own work.² However, we also realised that, at least initially, putting things on a table led us down a well-trodden path that went counter to our original proposition of materiality and connectivity as two intertwined modes of becoming. The storied things on the table made us look for connections between them, which we quickly started to visualise with a red woollen thread, naming them with labels. Once more, we found ourselves in precisely the kind of universe of discrete things and their connections that we sought to transcend.

For the second workshop, in 2016, a different setup was attempted: instead of putting things on the table, we decided to *hang them from the ceiling* in order to create a three-dimensional playground. We rented an industrial space in Munich, Germany, and built a simple wooden frame covered by a fishing net. This setup, designed to further our thinking-by-doing, allowed us to hang and reposition things and walk the emerging landscape of thought, changing perspectives, identifying angles and observing parallax.³ We invited participants to bring not just a handful of ‘storied things’ to the workshop but rather a ‘thing-story’ consisting of several items. While, again, productive and providing the seeds from which four of the five installations for the final symposium emerged, the setup posed new problems. First, the industrial space we had rented stubbornly invaded the evolving landscape, adding things like green exit signs to the fragile thing-stories we tried to put in context with each other. Second, many of the items brought to the workshop (a t-shirt, postcards, photographs) had clear front and back sides. Hung on the fishing net, they tended to turn round and, literally as well as metaphorically, turn their backs on us. And third, even more than with the things on the table, we ended up with something reminiscent of a model of the universe with stars, planets and asteroids – discrete material

entities held together by the connecting force of gravitation. In hindsight, we now see that, while the themes of co-emergence, transformation and dissolution were clearly present in several of the thing-stories brought to the workshop, the upside-down think-piece hanging from the fishing net still glossed over these qualities.

What our temporary playgrounds of things were missing was the dimension of time and its forces of growth, dissolution and decay. Rather than a model of a universe of things, we were after something more dynamic. To capture our initial proposition of materiality and connectivity as intertwined modes of becoming, we needed a different metaphor. Consider then, for a moment, a forest or *thicket*, where vines, roots, bushes and trees grow with and into each other. Their material form as well as their relations are inseparable from each other in the process of growth and decay. In a thicket, things are mostly also ties and ties are things. Rather than discrete entities (things) with relations between them (ties), there are *thing~ties*. We solicit the help of a tilde as a connecting grapheme between these terms that are usually taken as separate. Originally used as a mark of suspension, denoting the omission of one or several letters, the tilde later acquired a variety of meanings. It stands for approximation, a degree of equivalence or a possibly significant degree of error; as a diacritic, it indicates a shift in pronunciation and a number of languages deal with the limitations of the Latin script. The tilde implies movement and gesture where other graphemes suggest a more stable relation. While *thing-tie* may conjure up a hybrid, *thing/tie* might hint at the two sides of a coin and *thingtie* possibly suggests a new discrete entity, a *thing~tie* maintains the idiosyncrasies, uncertainties, movements and pragmatic decisions present in the history of its typographic use.

Meanwhile, we had issued a call for papers for our final symposium. Reviewing the almost 50 proposals received, we found that many of the most intriguing and convincing ones were concerned with the dimension of time and the forces of dissolution. We thus invited not only scholars working on things that become the things they are through movement and connections, but also archaeologists and historians looking at material traces and what they tell us about connectivity. We approached Tim Ingold, who had been a source of inspiration for our thinking from the outset. Regardless of his own scepticism about the term materiality (2007), he joined us for a short fellowship at the Center for Advanced Studies (CAS) at Ludwig-Maximilians-Universität Munich around the time of the final symposium, which took place in 2017. We invaded a neatly renovated villa in the posh Munich neighbourhood in which CAS

is housed. For the two and a half days of the symposium, five installations, or artistic-academic interventions, as we call them, provided the background for our conversations surrounding the papers presented.⁴

Two main themes emerged from this encounter of research-based papers and installations grounded in the practical thinking of the two earlier workshops: the manifold ways in which mobilising things and materialising connections fold into each other and grow together, and the connectivity afforded by ruination and dissolution. These two themes structure Part II, 'Movement and Growth', and Part III, 'Dissolution and Traces', respectively, of the present volume. Part I, 'Conceptual Grounds', consists of two chapters offering conceptual takes on things and ties – one from anthropology and one from archaeology.

Book outline

Part I: Conceptual Grounds

What we choose here to call *thing~ties* directly resonate with Tim Ingold's chapter, 'In the gathering shadows of material things'. Ingold traces the career of the term *assemblage* in the work of Gilles Deleuze and Félix Guattari (1987). The English term *assemblage*, Ingold argues, is a translation of the original French word *agencement* – despite the fact that *assemblage* also exists in the French language. In current debates, an assemblage is normally a group of heterogeneous elements whose relations are exterior (DeLanda 2006) – reminiscent of the planetary metaphor alluded to above in highlighting the limits of our intellectual playgrounds. The original term *agencement*, Ingold notes, has additional connotations that were somewhat lost in translation. In a world of becoming, he shows, 'the focus shifts to the processes of material formation themselves and to how they go along together' (p. 18). While articulation is what produces an assemblage, Ingold suggests the term *correspondence* for this process of material co-becoming. The nexus formed in this process he calls a *gathering* (p. 18). Ingold's objective is not to replace *assemblage* with *gathering* as a better alternative; his goal is rather to point to the many contexts in which relations are not exterior to material entities but constitutive in their material genesis and decay.

The metaphor of a growing *thicket of thing~ties* as opposed to the image of a moving yet relatively stable planetary constellation directs our attention also to time and history. In [Chapter 2](#), Philipp Stockhammer tackles the problem of understanding human–thing entanglements in

archaeology by suggesting three kinds of changes that things undergo over time. The first concerns changes in perception, which are closely linked to the routes along which a certain thing travels; the second relates to the process of wear and tear, of decay; and the third involves changes in the practices associated with a thing. In all three kinds of change, materiality and connectivity are tightly interwoven. Here, too, it makes little sense to see the shifting connectivities as external to the less than stable materiality in the course of a thing's history. The human–thing entanglements with which Stockhammer is concerned grow from the same variety of seed as Ingold's observations; things and ties, and their underlying materiality and connectivity, are integral rather than external to each other. Stockhammer argues that the work things do (their 'effectancy', he calls it) is closely related to their movement – their 'itinerancy' – which, of course, is central to the methodological underpinnings of archaeology. Itinerancy, as a less anthropomorphising alternative to biography, highlights movement and directly leads back to the old anthropological concerns about material circulation and exchange, and thus to the movement and mobilisation of materials.

Part II: Movement and Growth

Itinerancy is obvious in the theme of the gift, which frames the two opening chapters of Part II of this volume. In [Chapter 3](#), Julia Binter examines the politics of the gift in the colonisation of British Nigeria. Gifts, 'shot through with claims to political, economic and cultural power' (p. 59), played a key role in struggles to maintain sovereignty and impose dependence. In nineteenth-century Atlantic Africa, against the background of the end of the slave trade and the rise of the palm oil economy, new trade agreements and protection treaties were forged with local elites. In this context, African rulers hosted European merchants in elaborate rituals that took place on extravagant war canoes in the Niger Delta. European merchants presented gold-laced hats, silver-headed canes, silk and embroidered coats to their African counterparts as a means to 'break trade' and start or maintain commercial relations. These gifts were used by African rulers to display their wealth and standing, and to facilitate their inland journeys to acquire palm oil. Blurring distinctions between gift and commodity, and imbued with the power of relations, these *thing~ties* were at the heart of commercial activity in a fragile political environment. Binter shows how the British efforts to replace them with stable treaties signed on paper were only partially successful. The 'material processes of becoming imperial were far from

teleological', Binter argues, and gift exchange remained 'invested with the potential to impose power as much as to forge alliances and generate resistance' (p. 67).

Catrien Notermans and Jean Kommers (Chapter 4) follow women from West and Central Africa living in Europe on their journeys to Catholic pilgrimage sites. Shopping for religious souvenirs and sending them home has become a central activity in the lives of these migrant women. The souvenirs, purchased in large quantities on expensive trips throughout Europe, are more than simple gifts for individual friends and family. They are distributed widely through the networks of churches back home and have become a form of 'religious remittance', the authors argue. Here, as in Julia Binter's case, gifts are a form of commodity that assumes a crucial role in the maintenance of transnational relations between Europe and Africa. Imbued with religious power, they are used to heal illnesses, protect against the dangers of witchcraft and strengthen the migrant women's social standing in their home countries.

In both cases, more than a century apart, the things in motion are more than mere symbols or tokens of ties. They *are* the ties – ties that directly stem from their itinerancy. Bought, sent, distributed, and used to heal and protect, things and ties constitute each other as entwined modes of becoming.

The ties in these *thing~ties*, however, are not necessarily singular or exclusive, and may indeed prove multivalent. Exploring the cultural and religious links between Cuba, Africa and the USA, Natalie Göltenboth's intervention (Chapter 5) provides an example of multiple connections layered in a *thing~tie*. Göltenboth tells the story of Barbie dolls brought from Miami to Havana and their elevation to become sacred figurines of West African deities called *orichas* – 'saints' – through rituals of consecration. The act of consecration, here, can be seen as a form of transformation of one set of ties – imaginaries of a luxury life outside Cuba imbued with transnational family relations – into another, systems of belief and religious power flowing from Yorubaland to everyday lives in contemporary Havana. These connections are layered and additive rather than exclusive: while becoming deities through consecration, they continue to speak of the dream-world of Ken and Barbie. In the Barbie dolls, then, a diverse set of beliefs, values, aesthetics and family ties are entwined. As *thing~ties*, they hold in view the many itinerancies in play.

The notion of itinerancy deserves further scrutiny in cases where things do not take the paths foreseen for them, where it requires effort to keep them on track or, in other words, where the ties in *thing~ties* are at risk of being abducted or re-forged into something new. Srinivas Reddy's

contribution (Chapter 6) on the trade of war horses between Europe, Africa, the Middle East and India in the early sixteenth century reveals one dimension of the efforts required to keep goods mobile. While South Indian empires flourished, Portuguese colonial enterprises attempted to seize control of maritime trade across the Indian Ocean. One of the most important commodities flowing into India at that time was stallions to equip the cavalries of rival empires. The war horses were crucial in these struggles of power. For the Portuguese merchants, this tremendously profitable trade came along with the inherent risk that rival empires could begin breeding their own war horses. One of the strategies employed to prevent this was a ban on the sale of mares, withholding the stallions from entering into reproductive ties on site and thereby keeping them as commodities. Reddy argues that the system established a type of membrane to keep a profitable dependence in place. Managing ties through this membrane can be seen as a strategy against the risk of abduction by keeping the reproductive ties between mares and stallions separate from the ties of exchange at the heart of the trade system.

Another example of this kind of risk, on a different continent and in the present, is the topic of Juliane Müller's contribution (Chapter 7). Müller traces mobile phones produced in Asia and imported into Bolivia via the special economic zone of Iquique in Chile by a network of informal traders. In this supply chain, large corporations like Samsung struggle to keep track of their products. Frequently, and for a variety of reasons, Samsung finds shipments destined for one Latin American market ending up in another, much to the dismay of the national branches of the company, which are looking to boost their performance indicators. To keep phones on track requires effort. Samsung has developed a system that not only establishes the authenticity of phones, distinguishing originals from fakes, but also tries to prevent parallel imports – diversions from the predestined path of distribution. To this end, the company introduced the new category of 'Samsung Plus Original!', marked by a silver hologram on the packaging as the certificate of a particular itinerancy. This form of 'branding' (in the original sense of the term) changes the value of the phones regardless of the fact that the product is exactly the same. While Samsung employees are trying to track down phones on the markets of La Paz and re-enter them into their database, traders engage in repackaging and relabelling in order to keep the possibilities of trade open and plural: between them they pursue an ongoing quarrel over things and ties between traders and a transnational corporation.

Things and ties in relation to mobile phones also form the topic of Anna-Maria Walter's intervention (Chapter 8), which explores intimacy

in northern Pakistan. Walter's work teases out how material qualities of life as well as intimate chats and phone calls between lovers and young married couples intersect and constitute each other in a context in which gender segregation structures and regulates everyday life. In other words, the phone as private and mobile item carried close to the body is more than just a thing and more than just a tool to facilitate telecommunication – it is a *thing~tie* at the heart of personal identity, relationship-making and social subversion. The phone as thing and the intimate ties it affords allow young couples to test the boundaries of social norms and reinterpret – or abduct – cultural concepts. Virtual connections might be invisible, but they certainly have a tangible efficacy.

As the chapters and interventions outlined above attest, Part II is concerned with cases in which ties are clearly more fluid than things. When a *thing~tie* undergoes change, this change originates first and foremost in the transformation of the ties in which a thing is suspended. This is not always the case, however. Part III looks at instances in which it is rather the things that dissolve; their solid form evaporates while the ties remain strong and even gain in presence and relevance.

Part III: Dissolution and Traces

How connections may be forged through dissolution is brought into focus by Gillian Tan's contribution (Chapter 9), which explores a smoke-purification ritual in Tibet. Tan suggests that smoke both requires and enables us to think about materiality and connectivity in new ways. In smoke-purification rituals, burned juniper incense gains its potency for forging relations in the process of leaving its material form behind. Tan describes the ritual complex of smoke-purification as vital to the making and maintaining of relationships between ritual practitioners, pastoralists, 'worldly' local deities and the environment in eastern Tibet. It is through the ritual enactment of these relationships, Tan argues, that worldly deities come into being; they are not only fortified by smoky relations but also depend on them for their very existence. Burning incense – the dissolution of juniper into smoke – affects human practitioners and worldly deities in a mutual process of becoming and un-becoming (p. 149). In these smoky relations, it becomes clear that materiality and connectivity, underpinning things and ties, do not exist on their own but rather come into being through mutual constitution.

Marc Higgin comes to a similar conclusion in his reflections on his intervention (Chapter 10). Higgin collected water in the puddles of a busy road leading to the harbour in Aberdeen. He brought this water to

the symposium at CAS and put it into a humidifier. The vapour of King Street invisibly filling the fancy premises of the symposium highlights the ‘surrounding vital quality’ of things that are no longer things, Higgin suggests. Vapour invites us to reflect on modes of connectivity and materiality that usually remain unaccounted for, yet are intrinsic to human ways of becoming in the world. Similarly to the ‘smoky relations’ that Tan explores in the Tibetan context, it is the very transformation of the water from a puddle into humidified air that constitutes relational force.

Even less palpable than smoke or vapour is radiation, perhaps the ultimate un-thing overflowing with pervasive ties that shape the material world in the most profound and lasting ways. In [Chapter 11](#), ‘Apocalyptic sublimes and the recalibration of distance’, Jennifer Clarke explores the aftermath of the 2011 earthquake, tsunami and nuclear meltdown in Japan. Between the plethora of strangely sublime post-disaster images and the national emphasis on the necessity to endure suffering (*gaman suru*), Clarke responds with a form of anthropology that seeks to generate knowledge not through retrospective analysis and writing but through the practice of art.

Materials left behind by processes of dissolution may re-emerge as *thing~ties* of a different kind. Like Clarke’s account, Lorenzo Granada’s contribution ([Chapter 12](#)) begins with an apocalyptic event – the 1985 avalanche that buried the city of Armero in Colombia. Granada seeks to understand the ways in which the radically changed landscape and the rubble left behind affect those who live in the Magdalena Valley today. While some of the things buried have become treasures unearthed and sold, others have the potency to haunt and bewitch. Some things emerging from the mud acquire different lives and become new *thing~ties* through the very process of ruination, burial and excavation; other items, such as a skull a friend of the author stumbles upon, retain their old ties, which, too strong to be cut, become dangerous. Granada responds to the negativity of this landscape and the surprising possibilities of debris with what he calls a fragmented ethnography, articulating the constellations of broken things that inhabit this unstable terrain.

Memories ingrained in things can loom large, and sometimes the only way to move on is to rid oneself of things. The Yanomami community that Gabriele Herzog-Schröder addresses in her intervention ([Chapter 13](#)) puts a tremendous effort into cutting all ties to a deceased person. After death, a person’s body and all his or her belongings that could provoke remembrance are eliminated in an elaborate ritual process to rid the community of memory and whatever could linger and enchant. The body of a deceased person is transformed into ashes and finally eliminated by

consumption. Here, materiality needs to be obliterated in order to untie connections.

Tabula rasa, the blank slate, the empty wax tablet ready to be inscribed again, material erasure as requirement to reshape relations from the ground – this is also the idea that pushed modernist urban planners like the famous Mexican architect Mario Pani, whose work is the topic of Adam Kaasa’s contribution in this volume (Chapter 14). Kaasa shows how the quest to make room for Utopia, for example by clearing slums in Mexico City, goes hand in hand with materials of another kind – the architectural journals, drawings, plans and visualisations that undergird urban planning and rewrap *tabula rasa* urbanism as technical necessity rather than political or aesthetic choice. The matter of erasure, Kaasa argues, is thus ‘not only the rubble of demolition, but the matter of documents, bodies, photographs and architectural journals that legitimate demolition. These are, after all, materials of circulation and connectivity’ (p. 216).

Chapter 15 adds yet another angle to the afterlife of things and the struggles that may arise around their narrative ties. Elia Petridou follows the afterlife of debris left behind by refugees on Lesvos (Lesbos), Greece. At the peak of the refugee crisis in 2015, life jackets and abandoned rubber dinghies piled up along the shores of the island. While artists like Ai Weiwei started using them for installations across Europe to highlight the plight of refugees, Lesvos saw itself confronted with a waste problem. Petridou traces several upcycling initiatives transforming the waste into designer bags with a story and providing refugees with opportunities for generating income. These artistic and social projects intervene in the nexus of things and ties, transforming piles of polluting waste into a resource, and the traumatic memories of crossing the sea into political statements or items of everyday use. The design and sewing workshops appear as places where people work not just on materials but on the remodelling of erstwhile connections.

In the final intervention, Lisa Rail’s story of *tamga tash* (Chapter 16) deals with yet another kind of historical trace. *Tamga tash* is a stone in northern Kyrgyzstan inscribed with the Tibetan mantra *om mani padme hum*, hinting at a distant past of ancient inter-Asian connections. The stone itself is immobile, but the stories and materials (from travel blogs to books and prayer flags) emerging in conjunction with it travel far. At the symposium, Rail’s installation was formed around a replica of the stone to highlight the multiplicity and inseparability of things and ties, and the ways in which they are re-presented or made present. A replica still staying conjunct with its original is, Rail infers, a co-constitutive

process of mediation in which both stone and stories are taking shape and leave traces in unexpected ways. After the symposium, the Center for Advanced Studies asked us to remove the stone from its garden. It now lies silently at the bottom of a tree in a nearby park – a trace not just of the story of *tamga tash* but also of our exercise of rethinking things and ties.

Conclusion

We began this introduction, and the research project that led to this book, with a proposition to explore the nexus between materiality and connectivity and the aim of offering a new perspective on an old anthropological concern.

Taking the notion of ‘thinking through things’ both literally, and methodologically seriously, we enacted it in practice, approaching our question through thinking-by-doing: putting things on the table, hanging them from the ceiling and curating academic arguments *in situ*. Our ultimate goal was not to formulate a coherent new theory. As seen, for example, in the much-debated conceptual trajectory from objects to things and materials, there is no shortage of theoretical reflections in this burgeoning academic field – theoretical reflections that inspired our curiosity and informed this volume’s authors in their individual chapters and interventions in different ways. Rather than testing theories, however, we set out to experiment methodologically and trigger complications at the intersection of materiality and connectivity.

At times, we veered off course and almost lost touch with our initial intention of understanding materiality and connectivity not as defined properties of a thing but as two interrelated modes of becoming. In the process of editing this volume, joining and juxtaposing the chapters and installations presented at the symposium, there emerged the two lines of inquiry that now structure this book. It took two workshops, one symposium and ongoing discussions to arrive at the insight that things and ties appear as evolving *thing~ties* suspended in processes of growth and dissolution. As interrelated modes of becoming, materiality and connectivity make it necessary to coalesce things and ties into *thing~ties* – an insight towards which the chapters and interventions came from different sides, and one in which our initial proposition still shines through. Throughout the pages of this volume, we invite the reader to travel beyond imaginaries of a universe of separate planets united by connections, and to venture with us instead into the thicket of *thing~ties* in which we live.

Notes

1. See video: <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=vLJnw267CFs&feature=youtu.be> (accessed 29 August 2019).
2. For example, the notion of curation emerged as an enlightening lens – not as the expertise of individual curators, but closer to the original meaning of *curare* – to heal – although in a broadened yet specific sense of attending to, or taking care of, material environments (Schorch et al. forthcoming 2020; Saxer 2016).
3. Some impressions can be found here: <https://www.flickr.com/photos/146280257@N06/sets/72157671668717391/>.
4. The recordings of the symposium can be found at <https://cast.itunes.uni-muenchen.de/vod/playlists/h0khPlzmx.html>.

References

- Appadurai, Arjun. 1986. *The Social Life of Things: Commodities in Cultural Perspective*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Atzmon, Leslie and Prasad Boradkar. 2017. *Encountering Things: Design and Theories of Things*. London and New York: Bloomsbury Academic.
- Barad, Karen. 2007. *Meeting the Universe Halfway: Quantum Physics and the Entanglement of Matter and Meaning*. Durham, NC: Duke University Press.
- Basu, Paul. 2017. *The Inbetweenness of Things: Materializing Mediation and Movement between Worlds*. New York and London: Bloomsbury Academic.
- Bell, Joshua Alexander and Erin L. Hasinoff. 2015. *The Anthropology of Expeditions: Travel, Visualities, Afterlives*. New York: Bard Graduate Center.
- Bennett, Jane. 2009. *Vibrant Matter: A Political Ecology of Things*. Durham, NC: Duke University Press.
- Bennett, Tony, Fiona Cameron, Nélia Dias, Ben Dibley, Rodney Harrison, Ira Jacknis and Conal McCarthy. 2016. *Collecting, Ordering, Governing: Anthropology, Museums and Liberal Government*. Durham, NC: Duke University Press.
- Bestor, Theodore. 2001. 'Supply-side sushi: commodity, market, and the global city.' *American Anthropologist* 103 (1): 76–95.
- Björkman, Lisa. 2015. *Pipe Politics, Contested Waters: Embedded Infrastructures of Millennial Mumbai*. Durham, NC: Duke University Press.
- Bogost, Ian. 2012. *Alien Phenomenology, or What It's Like to Be a Thing*. Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press.
- Bryant, Levi, Nick Srnicek and Graham Harman (eds). 2011. *The Speculative Turn: Continental Materialism and Realism*. Melbourne, Vic: re.press.
- Clifford, James. 1997. *Routes: Travel and Translation in the Late Twentieth Century*. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press.
- DeLanda, Manuel. 2006. *A New Philosophy of Society: Assemblage Theory and Social Complexity*. London: Continuum.
- Deleuze, Gilles and Félix Guattari. 1987. *A Thousand Plateaus: Capitalism and Schizophrenia*. Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press.
- Dolphijn, Rick and Iris van der Tuin. 2012. *New Materialism: Interviews & Cartographies*. London: Open Humanities Press.
- Drazin, Adam and Susanne Küchler. 2015. *The Social Life of Materials: Studies in Materials and Society*. London: Bloomsbury Academic.
- Goody, Jack. 1976. *Production and Reproduction: A Comparative Study of the Domestic Domain*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Harman, Graham. 2010. *Towards Speculative Realism: Essays and Lectures*. Winchester: Zero Books.
- Harrison, Rodney, Sarah Byrne and Anne Clarke (eds). 2013. *Reassembling the Collection: Ethnographic Museums and Indigenous Agency*. Santa Fe, NM: School for Advanced Research Press.
- Harvey, Penny and Hannah Knox. 2015. *On Roads: An Anthropology of Infrastructure and Expertise*. Ithaca, NY, and London: Cornell University Press.

- Heisenberg, Werner. 1927. 'Über den anschaulichen Inhalt der quantentheoretischen Kinematik und Mechanik.' *Zeitschrift für Physik* 43 (3–4): 172–98.
- Henare, Amiria, Martin Holbraad and Sari Wastell. 2007. *Thinking through Things: Theorising Artefacts Ethnographically*. London and New York: Routledge.
- Ingold, Tim. 2007. 'Materials against materiality.' *Archaeological Dialogues* 14 (1): 1–16.
- Ingold, Tim. 2012. 'Toward an ecology of materials.' *Annual Review of Anthropology* 41: 427–42.
- Joyce, Rosemary and Susan D. Gillespie (eds). 2015. *Things in Motion: Object Itineraries in Anthropological Practice*. Santa Fe, NM: School for Advanced Research Press.
- Kirksey, Eben. 2014. *The Multispecies Salon*. Durham, NC: Duke University Press.
- Latour, Bruno. 1993. *We Have Never Been Modern*, trans. Catherine Porter. New York: Harvester Wheatsheaf.
- Latour, Bruno. 2005. *Reassembling the Social: An Introduction to Actor-Network-Theory*. New York: Oxford University Press.
- Malinowski, Bronislaw. 1922. *Argonauts of the Western Pacific: An Account of Native Enterprise and Adventure in the Archipelagoes of Melanesian New Guinea*. London: George Routledge & Sons.
- Marcus, George E. and Fred R. Myers. 1995. *The Traffic in Culture: Refiguring Art and Anthropology*. Berkeley and Los Angeles: University of California Press.
- Mauss, Marcel. 1923–4. 'Essai sur le don: forme et raison de l'échange dans les sociétés archaïques.' *L'Année Sociologique*, NS 1: 30–186.
- Miller, Daniel. 2010. *Stuff*. Cambridge: Polity.
- Saxer, Martin. 2016. 'A spectacle of maps: cartographic hopes and anxieties in the Pamirs.' *Cross-Currents: East Asian History and Culture Review* 21 (December): 111–36. <https://cross-currents.berkeley.edu/e-journal/issue-21/saxer>.
- Schneider, Arnd and Christopher Wright. 2006. *Contemporary Art and Anthropology*. Oxford: Berg.
- Schneider, Arnd and Christopher Wright (eds). 2010. *Between Art and Anthropology: Contemporary Ethnographic Practice*. Oxford: Berg.
- Schorch, Philipp with Noelle M. K. Y. Kahanu, Sean Mallon, Cristián Moreno Pakarati, Mara Mulrooney, Nina Tonga and Ty P. Kāwika Tengan. (forthcoming 2020). *Refocussing Ethnographic Museums through Oceanic Lenses*. Honolulu: University of Hawai'i Press.
- Shaviro, Steven. 2014. *The Universe of Things: On Speculative Realism*. Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press.
- Steiner, Christopher B. 1994. *African Art in Transit*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Thomas, Nicholas. 1991. *Entangled Objects: Exchange, Material Culture, and Colonialism in the Pacific*. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press.
- Tsing, Anna Lowenhaupt. 2015. *The Mushroom at the End of the World: On the Possibility of Life in Capitalist Ruins*. Princeton, NJ, and Woodstock: Princeton University Press.
- Viveiros de Castro, E. 2004. 'Exchanging perspectives: the transformation of objects into subjects in Amerindian ontologies.' *Common Knowledge* 10 (3): 463–84.
- Viveiros de Castro, E. 2012. 'Cosmologies: perspectivism', lecture 1 in *Cosmological Perspectivism in Amazonia and Elsewhere* (HAU Masterclass Series, 1), 45–168.