Understanding Hidden Forms of Intellectual Participation: A Study of University of Johannesburg Graduates from Kwa Thema Township in Ekurhuleni

by

Zamaswazi Zondo

201308555

Submitted in partial fulfilment of the requirements for the degree

Master of art in Sociology

in the

Department of Sociology

of the

Faculty of Humanities

at the

University of Johannesburg

supervised by

Supervisor: Doctor Siphelo Ngcwangu
Co-supervisor: Professor Malehoko Tshoaedi

31 October 2019

Abstract

There is a particular conception of the social role of higher education; however, it is limited and does not account for other hidden roles of intellectual participation by university graduates. This paper aims to go beyond the perceived conventional and publicly recognisable social role of higher education by focusing on what graduates from an underprivileged community of Kwa Thema Township do with their university education and experience to impact on the community in ways that are hidden. These ways are hidden because they take place within social groups in communities as a way of offering assistance and showing humanity. This dissertation argues that graduates use their university education and experience to advance social change in ways that are hidden and not easily accounted for in literature and in the public sphere. To prove this point, a qualitative approach, including in-depth interviews, was used with eight University of Johannesburg graduates who reside in the township. Results show that indeed graduates are contributing to the community in hidden ways by assisting other young people with tertiary applications, assisting neighbours with useful information and aiding high school learners with difficult subjects. These contributions demonstrate that our understanding of the broader role of higher education in society can be widened beyond the technical and economic functions we are aware of. The paper concludes that some university graduates are not only concerned about getting access to the labour market, however, they also have desires for social justice and aspirations to contribute to their underprivileged communities. The dissertation further concludes that more sociological research is fundamental for understanding unconventional realities that play a significant role in the functioning of our society.

Acknowledgements

I would like to convey my gratitude and thankfulness to the participants who played a significant role in this dissertation's success. Your participation is highly appreciated and will forever mean the world to me. This study would not have been a success without you.

I would like to acknowledge and convey my sincere appreciation to my supervisors, Doctor Siphelo Ngcwangu and Professor Malehoko Tshoaedi. Thank you for working with me throughout this whole process, thank you for your patience, the knowledge you have passed on to me, thank you for your encouragements and your belief in me, thank you for your kindness and your precious time you took to make this dissertation a success. I look up to you both with your humbleness as successful black academics with great minds. You have inspired me to go after my dreams, you have shown me that it is a possibility to be young and great and still be humane. May you continue being the best in what you do and inspire a great generation of young people.

To my best couple, my best friends, my support system, my mother and father, thank you for believing in me, thank you for trusting me, thank you for your everlasting support, your love and care towards me. I went this far with my studies because of you. Thank you for your prayers, your motivations and the courage you gave me. We made it!

To a very good friend of mine, Mabona Machaba, thank you for being there. I am thankful that we shared this journey together, through thick and thin. Thank you for your suggestions towards my dissertation. This journey would have been monotonous without you and I cannot wait to see us grow and be great together. May every good thing in life follow you, I wish you nothing but the best. Congratulations on finishing your masters in due time Master Machaba.

To myself, thanks to me for being me, for being a courageous young black woman, for staying disciplined, for my patience, my humbleness and most importantly, thanks to me for keeping faith in God. Lastly, I would like to thank and sincerely appreciate the supervisor-linked and merit bursary for funding my studies.

Table of Contents

Chapter 1. Introduction

1.1 Study background

For many young graduates who are from underprivileged communities, university education is seen as the highest achievement, a positive development for the community. These graduates become the beacon of hope in their communities where education is perceived as pivotal for social mobility and escaping a life of poverty. This is particularly because few people from underprivileged communities manage to enter universities, and once they have successfully graduated, they become role models of the community. They also come back to those communities and contribute in various ways. Many scholars have focused mainly on the valued and visible ways in which graduates impact on the underprivileged communities they come from. This fact dates back to the 1900s when intellectuals who were graduates, such as Ntsikana, Tiyo Soga, John Tengo Jabavu, Mpilo Walter, Benson Rubusana and Samuel Edward Krune Mqhayi, used their position to make tremendous contributions to their respective communities using the missionary education system which accounted for their education at the time (Ndletyana, 2008). This is to demonstrate that the culture of intellectual participation (of graduates using their education to advance their communities) is not new in the South African context; it has deep historical roots in South African black society.

Furthermore, as time proceeded, those who had access to education in the early 1970s and early 1980s were perceived in the same light and were often expected to play a positive role in their communities. Biographies of prominent anti-apartheid activists such as Mamphela Ramphele (1995), Steve Biko (1978), Es'kia Mphahlele (Mphahlele and Mphahlele, 2002) and Archie Mafeje (Nabudere, 2011), among others, attest to their positive influences in their communities. Often, they also used their position and academic training to impart their university education for the development and empowerment of their communities and address issues of social injustice. For instance, the late Es'kia Mphahlele, who had four qualifications including a Doctorate, made significant contributions to African literature. He was a novelist who wrote about African history with

the aim of exposing African traditions through story telling. As a result, in 1962, he published a book titled *The African Image* that was drawn from his masters' thesis (Jordan, 2011).

Similarly, Mamphela Ramphele was a political activist who went to the University of Natal's medical school. Through her educational training, she founded a primary health care initiative in South Africa called Zanempilo Community Health Centre in King Williams Town. She also strove to persuade people in the Eastern Cape to join community projects for the development of their communities (Ramphele, 2014). Such intellectual contributions indicate an important link between higher education and society, highlighting how a particular educational training through university can place a person in a privileged position to be able to make particular contributions in one's community to bring social change (Collins, 2011).

1.2   Problem statement/rationale

However, the way in which this link (between higher education and society) is studied by many scholars is limited (Collins, 2011; McMahon, 2009; Reddy, 2004; Muller, Cloete, and Van Schalkwyk, 2017; Willetts, 2017; Behrman and Stacy, 1997). It only focuses on the conventional and publicly recognisable forms of intellectual participation and contributions made by intellectuals. This focus overlooks other possible and unconventional ways of participating intellectually that are performed on a daily bases by ordinary graduates who reside in underprivileged black communities. Thus it is important to study and realise that there might be important aspects of other overlooked ways of contributing to communities which are performed by graduates using their university education and experience. This study has come to label this 'The hidden forms of intellectual contributions'.

1.3   Study aims

This study therefore seeks to examine the hidden intellectual contributions made by young graduates from the University of Johannesburg (UJ) in the community of Kwa Thema township. This study aims to understand the various ways in which graduates

contribute to the development of their community through empowering young people within the community. In other words, it seeks to understand how young graduates use their university education and experience to support the youth in their community to, for example, access university education and more. This study does not necessarily categorise graduates as intellectuals. However, it aims to look at how graduates, as individuals who are believed to have acquired a set of skills, knowledge and university socialisation, use this to impact on others in their communities. Thus, this will serve as another way of studying the unconventional role of higher education or graduates for the society.

This study broadly aims to transcend the economistic view of higher education and graduates. Beyond the literature on the role of higher education for the society is the valued economic role played by higher education. Economic motives, compared to social motives, play a dominant role in the existing literature on graduates and higher education. This mean that higher education is often associated with producing workers for the labour market and it is often linked to economic incentives for the graduates (Cloete, Bailey, Pillay, Bunting and Maassen, 2011; Goldsmith, 2013; Comunian and Gilmore, 2016; Cullinan and Flannery, 2017).

Though this is true and vital, it has the tendency to underplay the role of higher education for the development of societies. This is despite the aims of higher education institutions to produce graduates that will be able to contribute to their communities in various ways (Maistry and Thakrar, 2012; Kruss, Haupt and Visser, 2016; DHET, 2018). Other scholars such as Writer (2003) have also argued that receiving higher education gives a person an opportunity to help others in their community. This does not mean that it only takes higher education to be able to give back in one's community. However, the kind of socialisation, education and skills acquired at university can enable a person to contribute in numerous ways in communities. It is for this reason that this study focuses on graduates and also because graduates are put in a privileged position and looked up to in their communities because of the education they possess. This dissertation will argue that some aspects of university education are not easily accounted for in the literature and

that graduates use their educational knowledge to advance social change in ways that are hidden and not easily accounted for in the public sphere.

1.4   Research question and objectives

The research question for this study is: **What are the hidden forms of intellectual participation among University of Johannesburg graduates who graduated within 2013-2018 period who reside in Kwa Thema Township?**

Kwa Thema is a black township located near Springs, in the East Rand (east of Johannesburg) that has seen an increase in forms civic engagement that played (and still plays) a significant role in the community. Some of the examples of such organisations include the Movement for Change, Simunye Football Club, Kutlwano Social Organisation and the Mayoral Committee. This is to say, there has been effort put into developing the community and bringing about social change in the township. Although it is still unclear whether UJ graduates are part of these organisations, this study aims to find out how UJ graduates use their university education and experience on a day-to-day basis to contribute to the community outside of these existing traditional organisations. The objectives of the study are as follows:

- To examine the various forms in which young graduates in Kwa Thema use their university education and experience in their communities.
- To understand how the university experience and social background have influenced young graduates who play a positive role in their communities.
- To examine the specific skills and knowledge that graduates find useful in contributing to their communities.

1.5   Dissertation layout

This report is going to first begin with a literature review chapter (chapter 2) that will conceptualise the role of higher education for society, define intellectual and intellectual participation, look at the common types of intellectuals, and highlight the different ways in which they have used their education and university training to impact on their communities in positive ways. This is going to be done while also challenging the

traditional and publicly recognisable ways of intellectual participation to show that a gap exists concerning the hidden forms and unconventional ways of intellectual participation. A conceptual framework is going to be used to give a sociological analysis and to understand this phenomenon sociologically. The third chapter will lay out the methodology that was undertaken for this research, specifically highlighting the use of a qualitative approach with aspects such as negotiating access and its challenges, entry into the field, the location and language used in conducting in-depth interviews, the description of participants and the use of snowballing and purposive sampling. This chapter is also going to highlight the researcher's positionality by making reference to the experience of interviewing peers, fieldwork challenges during data collection, thematic data analysis, ethical considerations, and trustworthiness.

Next, chapter four will analyse the findings of the study by focusing on themes that emerged from the interview transcripts which potentially answer the research question. This chapter is going to focus on the following sub-themes: graduates from working class backgrounds, the description of participants, transformed graduates through university education and experience, hidden forms of intellectual participation, the influence of the university education and experience, social background and the spirit of sharing, the usefulness of university education and experience, the meaning of the hidden forms of intellectual participation, and conceptual understanding. Chapter five will conclude by showing the theoretical and methodological contributions of the study.

Chapter 2. Literature review

2.1 Introduction

Scholars such as Collins (2011), McMahon (2009), Reddy (2004), Muller, Cloete, and Van Schalkwyk (2017), Willetts (2017), Behrman and Stacy (1997), Swain (2011) and Castells (2009) commonly perceive higher education as fulfilling economic, social and individual goals of participation in an inclusive society and advancing learning and transmission of a common culture and common standards of citizenship. They broadly link higher education to economic change, social change, social justice and liberation. However, the main area of research by many scholars is one sided; it only focuses on the economic side. It centres around the number of graduates produced by universities or colleges (statistics), on how various courses differ when it comes to employment opportunities, on how the university curriculum clashes with what is required in the job market, and most importantly, it focuses on the employability of graduates and how these graduates, when employed, will broadly benefit the economy (Chaita, 2016; Moleke, 2006; Ashwin and Case, 2018; Burke and Christie, 2019;). Likewise, the few works by scholars that focus on the social role of higher education (Behrman and Stacy, 1997, McMahon, 2009, Collins, 2011; Willetts, 2017) is limited. It is often generalised and not specific to what graduates do intentionally with their knowledge to advance society in ways that are hidden and not publicly recognisable.

With this description, this chapter aims to go beyond the aforementioned ways of looking at the role of higher education and graduates by challenging the perceived economic role of higher education, the generalised social role of higher education and most importantly, the traditional and publicly recognisable ways of intellectually participating in communities. This is to say, higher education needs to be expanded and go beyond the graduate's entry into the workplace by incorporating good public values such as concerns for social justice and inequality and poverty reduction in different ways (Walker and Fongwa, 2017). Similarly, Kerr and Luescher (2018) argued that many scholars overlook the question of the connection between student's experiences at university and their

societal engagement towards the public good. While Furedi (2006) criticises the instrumentalist view of educational goals in relation to the economy. This chapter will build on similar arguments by bringing a different dimension to this because there is an overlooked aspect of the role of higher education in society within the broader scope of the role of education for the society. This chapter will continue to argue that some aspects of university education are not easily accounted for in the literature and that graduates use their educational knowledge to advance social change in ways that are hidden and not easily accounted for in the public sphere.

This is primarily going to be done by highlighting the publicly recognisable social role of South African intellectuals (through education) in advancing communities to show that this information is limited and does not account for other hidden social roles of higher education through graduates' participation in their communities. This is particularly important in this rapidly changing society where there are different ways of doing certain things, just as graduates tend to contribute to their communities in many different ways. To do this, this chapter is going to begin with a short background about how higher education and its role in society is conceptualised. This is going to be followed by definitions of intellectuals and the types of intellectuals postulated by Gramsci (1971) and others. A short history of the earliest South African intellectuals (from the 18th to the 19th century) and early intellectuals of the 19th and 20th centuries will be looked at, particularly highlighting how they have formally and visibly used their education for community development. A conceptual framework will follow and last will be a brief conclusion.

2.2 How higher education and society is conceptualised

The role played by higher education in society is widely contested. This role differs for different countries because various countries are challenged by varying social issues and therefore higher education became directed towards certain social issues (Kempner and Tierney, 2018). Even though a vast amount of literature on higher education focuses on economic aspects, there are a number of scholars who have studied the links between higher education and society (Collins, 2011). The social role of higher education is the one that benefits the individual graduate or student and the larger society. In South Africa,

the social role of higher education during the apartheid era at historically black universities was to produce a black elite that would mobilise students, promote political debates and oppose the apartheid system (Reddy, 2004; Muller, Cloete, and Van Schalkwyk, 2017). Higher education institutions were aimed at producing graduates who would have power, which is education and courage to challenge the apartheid system and end segregation. Evidence of this has been seen considering the works and contributions of Nelson Mandela, Steve Biko, Sol Plaatje, Mamphela Ramphele and more. These intellectuals were recognised as black elite because of the privilege of attending higher education institutions. Thus they developed the audacity to fight against the apartheid system and were identified as anti-apartheid activists. This in the apartheid era was the central social role that was played by higher education institutions in the South African context through graduates.

Likewise, we have experienced similar circumstances of higher education in post-apartheid South Africa. The social role of higher education was given significant attention by the student protests of 2015 and 2016 (Walker and Fongwa, 2017). Student activists fought for free higher education and the significant impact of this is witnessed today. These students were influenced by their position as university students and by their university education which socialised them into becoming courageous and empathic beings towards those who could not afford the fees. This indicates another important link between higher education and democracy, and shows that the primary function of universities for the society has been to revolutionise society's conditions so as to generate public good. Some scholars have come to call this relationship 'higher education and the public good' (Ashwin and Case, 2018; Leibowitz, 2012). This is because individuals who benefit from higher education can potentially be advantageous to society in several ways (Leibowitz, 2012).

These assertions illustrate that the role that higher education plays for society is often looked at by looking at the role played by those who received higher education. In other words, it is looked at by looking at how graduates use their university education to positively affect their immediate surroundings and to improve the quality of life that will give people, society and institutions the ability to develop (Muller, Cloete, and Van

Schalkwyk, 2017). Therefore, higher education plays an instrumental social role such as building the capacity to develop public reasoning skills that will enable graduates to contribute to public organisations and to participate in informed and critical decision making about producing social change (Walker and Fongwa, 2017).

Another set of literature that focuses on the role of higher education for society looks at this role by looking at the kind of citizens that graduates become after university. This literature involves the fact that graduates become more likely to live healthier lives, meaning that graduates make less demands on health care facilities. This literature further states that graduates' children become more likely to become educated, that they become more likely to become active citizens such as casting their votes, that they become more likely to be aware of their human rights, that they are often open-minded and often make wiser decisions compared to non-graduates (Behrman and Stacy, 1997; McMahon, 2009; Collins, 2011; Badat, 2009; Willetts, 2017). This set of literature again emphasises the role played by individual graduates in society, showing that their lifestyles changes through university education contribute to society in multiple ways. However, the deficit in this is that this way of looking at the value of higher education for society is hard to validate. For instance, the aforementioned value of higher education for society lacks statistical verification of causality. This means that it does not only take higher education for a person to live more healthily or to have awareness of their rights. Different life experiences, environments and certain socialisations can shape a person in this way too. Therefore, the way in which other scholars have viewed the social role of higher education is too subjective to serve as an objectively defined social role of higher education.

2.3 Defining intellectuals

The term intellectual has always been a contested concept, with many definitions from different geographical locations on the globe. The first definition of intellectual was formulated as a phenomena that involved participation in society, which means that this definition went beyond the narrow scope of the scholastic profession to include any kind of active involvement within the society (Sephiri, 2002), whereas the various definitions of intellectual today are centered around educated people, those who possess a distinct

and highly developed intellect through education. Sephiri (2002) has argued that the definition of intellectual in South Africa has been shaped by race and class, meaning that a person who suits the definition of intellectual is a white educated middle class person. This definition has neglected the possibility that there are also educated black intellectuals from lower class backgrounds and those without formal higher education or training but who have used their experiences as citizens to fight against injustices.

Moreover, the historical western view of intellectuals was often divided amongst scholarly function, social function and cultural function because intellectuals were also believed to be the main producers of culture (Torpey, 1995). They produced this culture because they were considered individuals of ideas, because their main function was to develop ideas that created and shaped culture (Coser, 1956). This shows that these ideas are not meant for personal gain - intellectuals seek to persuade the public and to change the social order (Sephiri, 2002). Therefore Gramsci (1971) had generally defined intellectuals as individuals who fulfil particular functions in society. He meant that everyone who works in any field that is linked either to the production or distribution of knowledge is an intellectual. Thus, teachers, pastors, doctors, lecturers, writers or journalists can all be considered intellectuals because they often perform a visible job of creating and distributing knowledge. Following the same argument, Buhlungu (2004) further defined intellectuals as individuals who are known for playing the crucial role of refining, processing and articulating sensitive or overlooked issues and translating that into powerful strategies and principles to build meaningful ideologies, organisational traditions and practices.

Intellectuals can be seen as individuals with a calling for representing, by means of talking, writing or teaching. This calling is usually publicly recognisable and involves commitment, risk, courage and vulnerability (Said, 1996). Therefore, an intellectual as the representative figure matters, someone who influences, who represents a standpoint and who makes expressive representations of his or her public regardless of obstacles. Intellectuals can also work inside a discipline and also use their expertise in other ways to impact on society (Said, 1996). Additionally, they are seen as individuals who reflect on the society we live in through research, and they often engage in critical thinking

(Creary, 2012). Gramsci (1971) further saw intellectuals as important for the workings of modern society because there has been no major revolution in modern history without intellectuals. An example of this can be drawn from two previous examples about anti-apartheid activists who were intellectuals and fought against segregation in the apartheid era, as well as the student fees must fall protests. These have shown that intellectuals often become the main role players in processes of transformation. They usually have a specific public role in society: to raise embarrassing questions, to confront controversial beliefs and doctrines, and to have the courage to go against the government (Gramsci, 1971). They are usually driven by devotion of their ideas, they use their mental capacities influenced by their education to be critical of and to deal with social issues.

Even though this study does not assume that mere graduates with undergraduate qualifications are intellectuals, these various definitions of intellectuals are intertwined and meant to show that certain mental capacities, often influenced by education (among other influences) drive intellectuals to play particular roles in society.

2.3.1   Intellectual participation

Intellectual participation depends primarily on one's intellect; it is shaped by the mind and soul (Mkandawire, 2005; Posner, 2001). This describes intellectual work as a practice that is influenced by a certain mind set containing a set of knowledge, skills, beliefs, values, ideologies, passion and experiences. Literature suggests that intellectual participation is a process through which people with certain knowledge, skills, experiences and ideas are concerned with the social issues of communities and strive to deal with them (Barney, 1994; Adwan and Wildfeuer, 2011; Bamyeh, 2012). We have experienced a great deal of South African intellectuals who have played a vital role, especially in building and shaping the pan-African concept, particularly by rebuilding the past, interpreting the present and mapping out what the desired future might look like. In other words, we cannot think of pan- Africanism without the intellectuals who conceived it (Mkandawire, 2005). Thus, in relation to this study, intellectual participation is how graduates use their university education and experience to assist others in their community. In other words, it is when they bring the university into the community. Consequently, this study's main focus is the use of university education and experience

11

to uplift communities. This study will address the question of whether university education and experience is unconventionally responsive to some of the social issues through graduates.

Gramsci (1971) asserted that intellectuals participate on the basis of universal principles that all human beings are entitled to expect decent standards of behaviour concerning freedom and social justice from the state and government and that any violations of these standards need to be testified to and dealt with without fear. Thus, the purpose of intellectual activities is to advance human freedom and knowledge; they are not meant to reinforce ego or to celebrate status. In fact, intellectual representations are dependent on a kind of awareness that is sceptical, engaged, constantly dedicated to meaningful investigation and moral judgement. Knowing how to use language well and knowing when to intervene in language are two essential features of intellectual participation (Said, 1996). This mean that intellectuals, as educated people, are more likely to have a better way of approaching social issues and how to deal with them because of their educational training.

However, the way in which intellectual participation is perceived and defined is rigid. Firstly, these definitions shape our thinking and expectations about intellectual participation. These definitions and assertions assume that intellectual participation manifests in a big and traditional manner and involves prominent people such as the president, ministers, mayors, councillors or famous activists who make great and tangible changes in communities such as building schools, houses, clinics or parks. This view neglects other possible ways in which intellectual participation can manifest itself. This study therefore proposes a redefinition of intellectual participation that will also incorporate the idea of hidden intellectualism, that intellectual participation can also take place within social groups in underprivileged communities and be performed by ordinary graduates in unconventional ways that are not documented in literature.

2.3.2   Public intellectuals

One type of intellectual, among others that exist today, is the public intellectual. A public intellectual is a famous, intelligent person whose written works and other social and

cultural contributions are recognised not only by academics or well-read persons but also by ordinary members of society (who did not receive formal higher education) (Hedges, 2001). They are recognised by ordinary people because of their commitments. For instance, Bourdieu was committed to fight against social injustices that affected those who belonged to the subject class; he also challenged government's neoliberal policies which disrupted the lives of the working class. He has had major impact as a public intellectual during the 1995 crisis in France. He brought substantial symbolic capital to the movement by signing a petition that was in support of the strikes (Swartz, 2013). Nelson Mandela can also be seen as a public intellectual because he was also well-known and recognised by all members of South African society because of his commitment to transform the apartheid era into democracy.

Di Leo and Hitchcock (2016) asserted that public intellectuals play a crucial role in the circulation, production and identity of knowledge even though most of them occupy two worlds, academe and the public-private sector (Di Leo and Hitchcock, 2016), while Said (1996) understood public intellectuals as the major advocates of freedom and knowledge. Posner (2001) argued that, to gain power, a public intellectual (an academic) normally must obtain a degree of public fame, because without that it is difficult to stimulate the interest of the public. Essentially, public intellectuals play a public role in society that is often visible and valued by most people. This is illustrative of the idea that there is no vast difference between intellectuals in general, traditional intellectuals and public intellectuals. They are mostly formally educated and part of their education has enabled them to affect change in more conventional ways. Therefore, it is also important to discover how others with this education affect change in their communities in unusual ways.

2.3.3 Gramsci's traditional and organic intellectuals

According to Gramsci (1971), there are two types of people who play the intellectual function. Firstly are those referred to as traditional intellectuals, who have a sense of elitism in society, such as the teachers, lawyers, professors, pastors and administrators who do the same kind of work over and over again through different generations. In other words, these are people who become intellectuals through their university education

which equipped them with a range of knowledge and skills that enable them to make particular contributions in society. They tend to have the jobs that are within social norms and that make a lot of money. Thus, education is seen as an indication of social status and is a goal to many people. Traditional intellectuals share a common language, the refined language of higher culture acquired through formal education. As they are joined by these cultural links, traditional intellectuals tend to see themselves and to be seen by others as disconnected from society, from the current affairs of economic and political life (Gramsci, 1971). They perceive themselves and are perceived by others as an independent social group but they are not, they are part of society and influenced by history and they are constantly absorbed into new social groups (Gramsci, 1971).

The second type of intellectual is the organic intellectual, and these are people that Gramsci (1971) thought of as connected to classes that used intellectuals to organise around their interests to get more control and power. An organic intellectual is someone who attempts to gain approval of potential customers in a democratic society and someone who is actively engaged with society by attempting to change minds and expand markets (Nakamura, 2017). Unlike teachers and pastors who remain in one place doing the same kind of job each year, organic intellectuals are always on the move and making change. In other words, not all organic intellectuals went through formal education (university or college) but they understand the society through their experiences, existing classes and relations and are dedicated to changing lives using what they know and what they have been socialised to in the society. Organic intellectuals are the part of each social group who, regardless of their profession or economic role, create ideas which rationalise and justify the interest of their own social groups. They might also include engineers, managers, bureaucrats, and, within the proletariat, trade union leaders. These intellectuals often perform managerial and administrative tasks (King, 1978).

To better understand how intellectuals emerge, particularly traditional and organic intellectuals in a practical sense, I am going to use Buhlungu's discussion of white intellectuals in black unions during the 90's. White intellectuals became part of black unions because black trade unionists who were experienced at the time, who could have become part of unions, were in jail; some had gone to exile, some were restricted by

banning orders, while others did not have trade union experience and were impatient with the long process of organising unions. Thus white activists became part of black trade unions and were largely influenced by their university experience. They had been exposed to neo-Marxism and their interest in labour was the result of the intellectual engagement and the associated upheaval at white universities (Buhlungu, 2006). Not all white people were considered intellectuals in the 1970's but only those who went to universities and got educated and some who worked at universities as lecturers and researchers. Their education enabled them to acquire administrative skills and analytical skills which they used to theorise about and conceptualise the struggles of black workers. This placed white trade union officials in a privileged position because, while black unionists did mundane duties such as organising and doing clerical work, white unionists performed strategic and intellectual functions. This shows that education gave white officials more power and knowledge to deal with union struggles. One the other hand, Organic intellectuals in unions were described as those who were produced through union struggles and their long experience of being part of the unions, and also through the whole processes of organising unions and training rather than formal education (Buhlungu, 2004). Thus, with this clarity, graduates, the participants of this study resemble aspects of Gramsci's traditional intellectuals because they received formal higher education and they are now equipped with a range of skills and knowledge that are useful to the workings of society.

2.4 The emergence of early South African intellectuals and prominent intellectuals during the 19th and 20th centuries

It is important to locate the role of intellectuals in South Africa within a historical context so as to highlight the role of education in advancing communities. There is a history of African traditional intellectuals who have used education to fight against oppression. Some of the early African intellectuals in South Africa included the likes of Ntsikana, Tiyo Soga, John Tengo Jabavu, Mpilo Walter, Benson Rubusana, Samuel Edward Krune Mqhayi and Sol Plaatje. They all form part of the advancement of some intellectual activity in Africa during the 18th and 19th century. These intellectuals emerged due to the impact of missionary activities and British colonialism on the Cape (Ndletyana, 2008). During this

era, people accessed education through missionaries who also used to spread the Christian religion. This required those who wanted to go to school to also convert to Christianity by reading the bible and learning the ideologies of the Christian religion, and the mission stations became the primary centres of learning during that time. Education among Africans received a colonial boost from 1854 onwards and this meant that prominent schools at the time, such as Lovedale, were developed and new schools were established. Consequently, between 1874 and 1904, 1 502 teachers were trained at various schools and by 1887 more than 2000 pupils had received secondary education at Lovedale, while other graduates became religious ministers, journalists, labour agents, legal assistance and interpreters (Ndletyana, 2008).

This was the beginning of the emergence of early African intellectuals who were Christian converts some of whom later became priests and graduates of missionary schools. These graduates began to improve and advance the communities which they came from in various ways using their education. Some of their significant works, amongst others, involved the incorporation of Xhosa tradition with Christianity, because the missionaries had commanded people to throw away their traditions to convert to Christianity (Ndletyana, 2008). Thus, an inclusive Christian religion was conceptualised and constructed in a way that would liberate, attract and accommodate the various cultural dimensions of the people. As a result, Christian beliefs among the African community advanced and inspired what is known today as black theology (Ndletyana, 2008). These intellectuals were also classified as anti-apartheid activists who fought against colonial expansion and discrimination against black people.

They made tremendous contributions to the development of university education for black people in South Africa, helping to establish Fort Hare University. They used their position to also outline the selection policy at Fort Hare University by insisting that the university also admit women instead of only men, and they also convinced the council to set its entrance qualification in a way that did not exclude many disadvantaged applicants, they intended the university to be as inclusive as possible.

Intellectual traditions and intellectual participation continued to evolve in South Africa after the era of missionaries when modern formal education was introduced which gave rise to a new generation of African intellectuals. Besides the obvious and celebrated contributions of Steve Biko as an anti- apartheid activist and an intellectual (being part of the Black Consciousness Movement and the Black People's Convention and a co-founder of the South African Students' Organisation), there are other black traditional intellectuals who were concerned about the upliftment of their black communities who are not given much recognition (Mangcu, 2014). These traditional intellectuals involved the likes of Es'kia Mphahlele (Mphahlele and Mphahlele, 2002), Archie Mafeje (Nabudere, 2011) and Mamphela Ramphele (Ramphele, 1995), who have made tremendous contributions in South Africa. Es'kia Mphahlele for instance has contributed to the establishment of Bantu education system by challenging its' Western ideas (Grimes, 2008). He has also contributed largely to the building of African Renaissance for Africans to rewrite their African history and renew their African identity and the right of Africans to define their own future (Ajulu, 2001).

Similarly, Archie Mafeje, as an African scholar, intellectual, thinker and academic has influenced change in understanding the discipline of anthropology by interpreting the world of black people, challenging anthropology and changing its perspective. He also understood that whether we like it or not, as people, our social background, class, race and gender influence our position, views and interpretation of the world (Lekaba, 2016). Furthermore, Mamphela Ramphele, with her position as a black female intellectual, is now regarded as an expert in community development because of her significant contributions. Among her other significant contributions, she founded development projects which included a literacy project and a day-care centre; she was also part of the Black Consciousness Movement with Steve Biko. (African Success, 2012). Other prominent intellectuals within the broader African context include the likes of Kwame Nkrumah and Julius Nyerere among others (Jordan, 2011). They impacted change in significant ways by advocating against colonial expansion in African, merely being inspired by their educational training.

These contributions by various intellectuals serve as an indication that intellectual activities in the South African context are not new. Education has always played an important role in developing communities and the society at large through graduates who eventually became intellectuals through their rooted social concerns and constant efforts to minimise them. Their education has enabled them to contribute to the liberation of people, social change and most importantly social justice. Social justice is based on the concept that protect human rights and ensures equality and as the distribution of wealth in society as a matter of justice (Case, 2017). It is the way in which human rights are demonstrated in the everyday lives of people at all levels of the society. The fact that everyone today in a democratic South Africa holds the right to education, regardless of race, is one of the many indications of social justice. This is a right given by the democratic state to every South African citizen. However, it is understood that not everyone can access this right (and other rights) as a consequence of multiple factors, including money and intellectual capacity. Thus, intellectuals with their contributions are in a position to extend many of the human rights in various ways.

2.5   The influence of the university experience and social background

It is apparent that the above description has highlighted how the influence of university training has long played a positive role in communities. The modern day has also witnessed an assertion of the importance of higher education for society, particularly when considering the #RhodesMustFall movement and the #FeesMustFall protest. These protests symbolised how those with university training can be influenced to challenge the state and fight against inequality (Ashwin and Case, 2018; Walker and Fongwa, 2017).

There are also some scholars who have studied the influence of the university experience on graduates to contribute to the 'public good'. They were concerned about studying the impact that university teachings have on how graduates live and act. They were moving away from the general role of university institutions for the society through community engagement programmes and research (Ashwin and Case, 2018; Walker and Fongwa, 2017). However, they have mainly focused on how graduates benefit the economy as part of the public good, and not on how graduates themselves strive to better the society

as a whole. Scholars such as Luescher-Mamashela, Kiiru, Mattes, Mwollo-ntallima, Ng'ethe and Romo (2011) and Bynner, Dolton, Feinstein, Makepeace, Malmberg and Woods (2003) have discovered proof that higher education act as an influence in reinforcing citizenship through some quantitative studies that have indicated a strong association between university education and positive attitudes in relation to democracy and diversity.

Furthermore, Ashwin and Case (2018) also emphasised the influence of higher education on the lives of graduates outside of their work and citizenship. They argued that these factors make life fulfilling and meaningful and also enrich the community for the graduates themselves and others. McMahon (2009) has termed these the 'non-market benefits' which accrue to graduates because of their university experience and education. However, because qualitative research is limited on this topic, particularly on the hidden forms of intellectual participation, there is little literature about how social background influences graduates to participate. Therefore, the results of this study will show how social background plays a role in how graduates contribute in their community.

2.6 The knowledge and skills that graduates find useful in contributing to their communities

Most scholars are concerned about the specific knowledge and skills acquired at university that are useful in the labour market, and how the clash of these skills with those required in the workplace lead to graduates being unemployed (Goldsmith, 2013; Moleke, 2006; Cullinan and Flannery, 2017; Cloete et al. 2011). However, there is gap in the knowledge and skills which university graduates find useful in contributing to their communities or in addressing the question of whether university education is useful in transforming communities. This fact might not need to be studied because the answer might be embedded within the kind of contributions that graduates and intellectuals have always brought to their communities. This is to say, scholars might need to relook at the ways in which graduates and intellectuals use their university education and experience to improve communities to determine the aspects of the university that are useful for graduates to participate intellectually. For instance, it might be said that some aspects of

Mamphela Ramphele's medical qualification enabled her to make specific contributions in her community such as to open health care centres for her community. This might indicate that this knowledge was useful for her to make this kind of contribution. Therefore, this study is also going to determine the knowledge and skills that graduates found to be useful for contributing to their communities through their contributions and their ways of intellectually participating.

The three previous sections outlined above illustrate how intellectuals have used their position to advance society. It is indicated that particular knowledge and skills acquired traditionally through higher education can enable one to make specific contributions to society. However, the way in which these contributions are studied or portrayed by many scholars is rigid and limited. It only covers the conventional and publicly visible ways of intellectually participating and contributing to social change. Therefore this study aims to transcend these assertions by understanding the hidden role of university education and experience in bettering communities through graduates. This study aims to give an account of hidden ways of contributing intellectually to communities that are often unconventional and thus undocumented in literature. Therefore, a sociological analysis is imperative to understand this hiddenness - the ways that are smaller, unrecognisable to the public and less codified.

2.7 Conceptual framework

Thus far it has been understood that this study focuses on graduates who lie more towards the traditional intellectual end of Gramsci's perspective (Gramsci, 1971). These graduates were understood to be giving a kind of participation that is influenced by their university training, involving the skills, knowledge and university experience (Gramsci, 1971). Thus, this study examines how university graduates use their knowledge, skills and university socialisation to impact on their communities in ways that are outside of traditional structures. In this case, the kind of knowledge and skills that graduates possess based on their different qualifications influences the role they play or the kind of assistance they offer in their communities. Thus, I can argue that what graduates possess (skills, knowledge and university experience) functions as their power within societies.

Power is a central organising feature of all social life; therefore, the fact that graduates hold a certain power in societies makes them one of the influencers of social life (Swartz, 2013). Sometimes power comes as a form of capital, and the kind of capital held by university graduates that gives them power in society, according to Bourdieu (1980), is cultural capital. Cultural capital consists of a person's social assets, including education and intellect rewarded by the education system that demonstrates one's cultural competence. Thus, just like power, capital allows one to control one's own fate and the fate of others (Bourdieu, 1980). This will help the study understand how graduates use their cultural capital to empower themselves and others in their community. Power also concentrates in particular arenas of struggle for control of the social order (Swartz, 2013). This illustrates that graduates with their power (cultural capital) can choose, according to their interests and existing gaps, to focus on specific struggles or issues faced by society to bring about change. Thus, this will help the study's findings to indicate different struggles that exist in the community and how graduates chose, according their cultural capital to deal with them.

This power is important for maintaining hegemony within society (Gramsci, 1971). To maintain this hegemony, according to Gramsci (1971), the function of intellectuals is to organise and enforce the authority of the group they represent. In this case, graduates represent their community and what is perceived of their community. This task of enforcement is performed in civil society and political society. Intellectuals influence the public in the civil ground to conform to a certain social orders; they coerce the public to the same end in the political ground. These two main types of intellectual activity (persuasion and coercion) constitute the two main divisions of the superstructure relating to the structure of the dominant social group. Gramsci linked organic intellectuals to civil society and traditional intellectuals to political society (King, 1978). Even though Gramsci made this important link, it does not necessarily mean that traditional intellectuals are associated with political society: they can associate with both, and vice versa.

Thus, this study is going to use Gramsci's assertion the other way around, to look at graduates in relation to civil society – in other words, how graduates impact on the public (their respective underprivileged communities). Additionally, I am going to focus on one

intellectual activity by Gramsci which is persuasion rather than coercion because this study focuses on the positive aspect of intellectual activity to determine how hegemony is achieved through how graduates persuade others in their community. Accordingly, beyond the use of this cultural capital is the power of agency. Agency is the capacity of individuals to act independently and make their own individual choices without anyone's influence (Mayr, 2011). Thus, this conceptual framework will further help the study to unpack the question of how graduates use their agency to impact on communities. This will reveal the hiddenness of how this power is manifested independently by individual graduates to change their communities.

2.8 Conclusion

In conclusion, this chapter served as evidence that there is a strong link between higher education and society and that this fact is not new. There have been always people considered traditional intellectuals as far back as the 1800s (before the birth of the term) who were using what counted as their education at the time to impact on communities. This chapter has also shown that the way in which this link is studied has been limited and has overlooked other ways in which this link can be further investigated by considering the hidden forms of intellectual participation. It was also identified that such intellectual work depends on factors such as power (cultural capital) and agency. Most importantly, it has been presented that the focus is not necessarily on the knowledge, skills or university experience but on the use of these features to bring about social change, liberation and justice.

Chapter 3. Methodology

Now that I have shown secondary data in the literature review and how this study is going to transcend what has been depicted, I will show how this study was undertaken by outlining the research design along with the methodology for this research study. This study's methodology sought to understand the forms of intellectual contributions by UJ graduates who reside in Kwa Thema township - to understand how these graduates use their university education and experience to contribute to the upliftment of Kwa Thema township in hidden ways, to understand the influences of the university education, experience and social background behind these contributions and to investigate the skills and knowledge that graduates found useful in contributing to the community. Thus, a qualitative research approach was useful for this study. This chapter is going to outline all the processes that took place in conducting this research study by specifically looking at the use of a qualitative approach, how access was negotiated, how the field was experienced, where the interviews took place, the language that was used to conduct interviews, a description of the participants, in-depth interviews, positionality when interviewing peers, fieldwork challenges, thematic data analysis, ethics, trustworthiness and concluding remarks. This chapter is going to argue that my positionality as a master's student interviewing university graduates of similar university and township experience and of an age group similar to mine minimised tensions between me and the participants.

Research approach and design

3.1 Qualitative approach

Given (2008) and Babbie (2004) argued that a qualitative approach is ideal for understanding human aspects regarding how human beings perceive and experience the world they live in (Given, 2008; Babbie, 2004). This study sought to undertake a qualitative approach because it was useful in examining in-depth understandings of the various forms of intellectual contributions made by young UJ graduates in Kwa Thema, and for understanding the influence of the university education, experience and social background of graduates so as to understand the human elements attached to these

contributions. Additionally, this approach was useful in determining the specific skills and knowledge that graduates found to be useful in contributing to their community. Given (2008) further asserted that a qualitative approach is ideal for discovering new phenomenon (Given, 2008). Thus, it was also useful for this study in understanding and revealing the hiddenness of the intellectual contributions made by UJ graduates that are overlooked.

3.2 Research design: exploratory research

This study is exploratory as it study's a new phenomenon, the hidden intellectual participation and contributions. Researchers often explore a topic or dilemma when they have no or little knowledge about the topic and are hopeful that something interesting will come out from the study (Stebbins, 2001 and Given, 2008). Therefore, as a researcher, I was also driven by the belief that there are other ways of intellectually participating that are not obvious to notice and that require thorough exploration. Flexibility in searching for relevant information and open-mindedness about where to find relevant data were two essential orientations that I followed in exploring this study (Given, 2008). I relied on different sources to find relevant information. Besides books and journals, I used mostly biographies of prominent intellectuals and historical information to understand the kind of education that intellectuals received and how they used it to empower their communities. I kept an open-mind about where and how to search information because searching this phenomenon as it is "hidden intellectual participation" did not yield any solid and meaningful secondary data. Therefore, I had to use keywords such as; higher education and its societal role, the role of intellectuals in society, educated activists or search prominent intellectuals by their real names to understand their education and the impact they achieved in their communities to find relevant information.

3.3 Population and sample

The study population is the combination of elements from which the sample is selected. It is a group of people who are selected on the basis of inclusion and exclusion to fit the research criteria and in which the sample of the research study will be selected (Babbie, 2004). Thus, the population for this study involved UJ graduates because of their acquired

knowledge, skills and university experience. Eight UJ graduates were then selected from the entire UJ graduates population because they fit the purpose of the study. Particularly because they reside in Kwa Thema Township, the main focused area of location for this study and fit other characteristics which will be shown under the description of participants.

3.4 Negotiating access: challenges during fieldwork

One of the most challenging parts of doing research is to gain or negotiate access, this process can also be time consuming (Johl and Renganathan, 2010). Negotiating access is when a researcher convinces people who fit the purpose of the study to be participants who will provide specific information for the research (Feldman, Bell and Berger, 2003). Access negotiation for this study was equally challenging even though I had known two participants prior to conducting interviews and relied on snowballing and purposive sampling techniques to locate participants. There were cases where graduates could not refer me to other graduates because those that they knew did not reside in Kwa Thema. This created a challenge as I relied more on my participants to locate more participants. I also contacted people I knew, friends and family purposefully to assist me locate more graduates. Few friends assisted and I also used Facebook, I posted a status on seeking help from my Facebook friends. However I could not find any help, this might have been because I am not very active on Facebook, and thus familiarity with Facebook friends might have played a role in this.

However, once I was referred to or got hold of the participants through mostly my social groups, purposive and snowballing techniques, they all agreed to be part of the study without showing any hesitation or concerns. Wasserman and Jeffrey (2007) argued that gaining the trust and acceptance of the participants to conduct research is very important. Thus, the participants of this study might have trusted me and thus accepted me to interview them. This might have been because I introduced myself as a master's student. Being a master's student might have given them the idea that this study was authentic and worthy of being part of. I communicated with most participants through WhatsApp where I would send them the information sheet. The information sheet might have also

contributed to the authenticity of the study which made participants trust and accept me. Furthermore, timing would also interrupt gaining access, as some participants would not be available to meet on particular days and this made the process of collecting data take even longer.

3.5 Entry into the field

After I had gained access to the participants, I entered the field. A researcher usually develops understanding of the phenomena that is being studied as well as the frustrations, relationships and risks that are part of everyday life to understand the reality of the participants after gaining access to the field (Patton, 2002). When I entered the field, I had certain expectations about participants as graduates. I expected them to be accomplished, intelligent and critical individuals with certain ambitions and frustrations. Indeed, during my casual conversations with the participants before the interviews I realised that they were very intelligent and critical of everyday life styles in the township. They were ambitious and eager to do more in life. Others were frustrated because they were educated but still unemployed, while others were frustrated with the jobs they had that were not in line with their qualifications. Participants seemed to be also impressed by the fact that I was a master's student and were interested to know more about how I got to do a master's and wanted to know more about my study and my motives for the study. This might have showed that participants agreed to be part of the study because they were interested and were hoping to be inspired by it.

When I entered the field, I also realised that graduates started communicating with me in English. I assume this might have been because they thought that I would prefer speaking in English since I am a master's student. This supported what Gramsci (1971) argued, as discussed in the literature review chapter, that traditional intellectuals share a common language, the advanced language of higher culture that is acquired through higher formal education. Since graduates share some common qualities with traditional intellectuals, they also shared this aspect with them.

3.6 The location of interviews and interview language

The interviews took place in Kwa Thema Township, usually at a Kentucky Fried Chicken (KFC) outlet in a shopping centre called Kwa Thema Square. This was after my first participant allowed me to choose a place as he did not mind where we did the interview, and I chose Kwa Thema Square because it was close to his house. After the first interview I realised that KFC was the most convenient place to conduct the interviews even though it was going to be up to the participant's comfort to be there or somewhere else where they would feel comfortable. I preferred KFC because it was a public space where participants would feel free that nothing bad could possibly happen to them, as there are people around the area, and where the chances of the feeling of unsafe are less. This was also a good idea in the event that a participant would feel uncomfortable to invite a stranger (me) into their house or be invited in a stranger's house. There are two well-known shopping malls in Kwa Thema, Kwa Thema Square and Ekhaya Shopping Centre, and there are KFC restaurants in both, so either one of them was suitable. Thus, three interviews were conducted at KFC in Kwa Thema Square and one interview at Ekhaya Shopping Centre's KFC. There were two interviews that were conducted at Kwa Thema library and this depended on the comfort of the participants (they chose the place). One participant preferred meeting at Springs Mall at Ocean Basket and the other one preferred being interviewed at his house because he was busy.

Some interviews were conducted in isiZulu because that was the language which most participants felt comfortable using, while others mixed with English. It was comfortable for me as well as a researcher to use isiZulu because it is my mother tongue. Thus, there was no language barrier and this gave me an opportunity to ask further questions comfortably and to be clearer with my questions. This also enabled participants to express themselves freely and confidently. However, there were challenges when I had to transcribe the interviews because I also had to translate the transcripts into English. Some texts would lose meaning while interpreting data because some Zulu words cannot be directly translated into English. Van Nes, Abma, Jonsson and Degg (2010) and Santos, Black, and Sandelowski (2014) also argue that during the translation of non- English

native languages, sometimes meaning gets lost, while the core of qualitative research is the interpretation of the meaning, and language impacts on how meaning is constructed.

3.7 Description of participants: University of Johannesburg graduates from Kwa Thema Township

Name of participant	Age	Gender	Qualification	Year completed	Employment status
Tshepo	24	Male	BA Law Degree	2018	Employed
Thobile	24	Female	Financial Investment Degree	2018	Employed
Mandla	27	Male	Economics and Investment Degree	2016	Employed
Nolwazi	25	Female	Business Management Degree	2018	Unemployed
Amanda	27	Female	Accountancy Diploma	2016	Unemployed
Mamelo	24	Female	Accounting Diploma	2017	Employed
Thami	25	Male	BSc in Physical Science Degree	2018	Unemployed
Sam	27	Male	BA Humanities Degree	2016	Entrepreneur

Table 1: Description of participants

Table 1 serves to indicate that the sample for my study involved black, male and female UJ graduates, irrespective of their employment status, with undergraduate degrees or

diplomas who reside in Kwa Thema, who graduated over the six-year period 2013 to 2018 and were between the ages of 22 and 27. My sample comprised of four women and four men. To select my participants, I looked for these specific characteristics (UJ graduates, who reside in Kwa Thema, who are between the ages of 22 and 27, and who graduated between 2013 and 2018). Therefore, I used snowballing concurrently with purposeful sampling because I selected participants who met with the above description or criteria which had been predetermined by the research as relevant to addressing the research question.

Data collection

3.8   In-depth interviews

To sufficiently investigate a certain phenomenon in qualitative research most often happens through conducting interviews with specific participants, and this study collected data using in-depth interviews. Interviews allow for open-ended questions, which are at the core of qualitative research, to be posed to participants. Open-ended questions involve intensive interviews with participants that seek to capture rich and descriptive data about participants' lived experiences, perspectives and attitudes (Guest, Namey and Mitchell, 2013). Thus, through conducting in-depth interviews I was able to access rich data through open-ended questions, and this enabled participants to give in-depth responses about their intellectual contributions and influences behind these contributions. However, accessing rich data also depended on the personality and on how open and comfortable participants were to share their perspectives, attitudes and influences with me because some were very reserved. This may sometimes have implications for qualitative researchers because participant's personalities or comfort (more reserved personalities or introverts) may make it difficult or hinder researchers from accessing rich data. Therefore, there were a few cases during interviews where I could not access the rich data that I was hoping for because some participants were shy. This also resulted in some interviews taking less than 15 minutes. This might have been because I was a stranger to those particular participants, meeting them for the first time and in a more formal way (doing interviews).

Additionally, the open-ended questions that I asked were open enough to enable participants to further respond to other questions that I had not yet posed and this limited probing. This ensured that I stuck to the way I said I would leave it to the participants of the study to guide the interview. This was beneficial also because participants spoke more and included their feelings, understandings and attitudes about their contributions (Bryman, 2016). Thus, I would not ask the question twice and this saved time.

While conducting interviews hoping to access rich data, I discovered that the questions that I asked required participants to reflect deeply on their past lives at university and how they have used their university education and experience to assist someone else in Kwa Thema. They had to mentally go back to their university years and reflect on what they had gained through the entire experience and how their beliefs, values and ideas were affected by their university experience. Participants had to also reflect deeply on how they use or have used their education and experience to make an impact on others in their community. This might have affected the accuracy of their narratives, particularly for those who graduated more than three years ago. Ellis, Amjad and Deng (2011) asserted that qualitative researchers who are interested in learning about past events of participants are often faced with challenges that include the forgetfulness about past events by participants. This questions and challenges the quality and trust of qualitative research about past events as it is difficult to determine whether participants accurately recall events that happened few years back. This is another potential challenge faced by researchers who conduct qualitative research (Kirkevold and Bergland, 2009) and Alasuutari, Bickman and Brannen, 2008). Thus, Ellis, Amjad and Deng (2011) suggested that researchers conduct pre-interviews that include various activities in line with the topic of the study to help participants recall their past events before the actual interview.

3.9   Positionality: interviewing peers

Positionality refers to the idea that one's social position, based on factors such as race, gender, class, sexual orientation, religion, age, disability or ability, and how these categories intersect, impact on one's perspective of the world and on how one constructs and values knowledge (Given, 2008). My positionality as a young, female, black UJ

masters student who also resides in Kwa Thema Township worked in favour of the research process. I was mostly an insider because I shared similar qualities and experiences with the participants. Being an insider means that the researcher is also part of the population being studied based on shared characteristics, roles and experiences between the researcher and the studied population (Dwyer and Buckle, 2009). Thus, this enabled me to relate to my participants and enabled participants to relate to me as well. We related in terms of the university experience because we shared the same experiences from the same university institution. We also shared similar experiences of staying in the same township and we were also part of the same age group. The casual conversations we would have before and after the interviews were relatable to me and the participants. However, I was also an outsider. Being an outsider is when a researcher does not fully relate to the group being studied or share experiences with the participants (Dwyer and Buckle, 2009). I was an outsider as a master's student in that my participants could not fully relate to me as a master's student, and it might have also led to power dynamics. Furthermore, being a woman made me an outsider when I interviewed four of the male participants of the study. I could not fully relate to them and they could not fully relate to me and this created tensions that will be explored later in the chapter.

Furthermore, interviewing peers was generally beneficial in terms of my comfort as a researcher. I felt more comfortable because I interviewed people who were my age group and I knew exactly how to communicate with them and which conversations were likely to raise their interests. Byrne, Brugha, Clarke, Lavelle and McGarvey (2015) found in their study that interviewing peers is beneficial when it comes to the comfort of the researcher and participants and that it minimised power dynamics between the researcher and the participants. This was also true for this study; conducting interviews with my peers felt like I was having a normal conversation with someone I related to. However, one incident I can refer to that might have indicated power dynamics was when I gave one participant an information sheet and she was very excited to have one; she said, 'Oh wow at least I have something to show that I was part of a master's research study'; she took it as something great that she valued.

My positionality has also played a role as a strategy that I used when I realised that during the interviews, some participants would be a bit uncomfortable with the question and answer order; it might have felt as if they were being interrogated. I then began to also open up a bit about myself and my experiences of being at UJ as these were similar to theirs. As a result, participants began to be more comfortable and thus opened up more when I also engaged with them. My positionality in relation to the research question was that I had assumptions that graduates do participate in hidden ways after reflecting on myself and realising that I also participate in ways that are not codified. Thus, the results of the study also met my expectations as a researcher and these expectations were largely shaped by my positionality.

3.10 Fieldwork challenges: the experience of being a woman interviewing men

Most researchers face various considerable challenges in fieldwork when conducting research (Le-Treweek and Linkogle, 2000). In particular, the most common challenges are faced by women interviewing men as women are constantly sexualised by men, but this challenge is often overlooked (Pante, 2014). There were a few challenges that I came across interviewing male participants. There was a specific case where a participant (a male) asked to meet up with me at a place that was uncomfortable for me and the participant treated our interview meeting as a date. He was uncomfortable with us meeting at KFC so he suggested that we meet at a mall (Springs Mall) at Ocean Basket and he offered to buy the food and drinks and paid for taxi fare as well (he insisted on paying). This process was uncomfortable for me but I had to do it for his comfort as an ethical researcher. Moreover, I faced another challenge when I had to cut off communication with one participant who developed romantic feelings for me. This was a challenge because I also did not want the participant to feel as though I used him to get information for my study. This poses an ethical challenge because ethical guidelines often protect the participants more than the researcher, researchers often sacrifice their own comfort for the comfort of participants.

3.11 Ethics

Ethical considerations are generally about preventing harm to participants by paying careful attention to keeping the participants' personal details safe, private and confidential by using pseudonyms instead of participants' real names or physical addresses (Neuman, 2014). Ethical considerations ensure that participants have a clear picture of the purpose of the study and what the study will require of them. This enables participants to make an informed decision on whether to be part of the study or not (Bless et al. 2013 and Babbie, 2004). Thus, I ensured that I stuck to ethical guidelines in various ways to protect participants. Firstly, I ensured that participants understood the study and what would be required of them before I even met with them physically. I communicated with most of them through WhatsApp and I would call those I could not reach through WhatsApp, and I explained everything thoroughly to them about the purpose of the study. I would send the information sheet as a PDF document to those I communicated with through WhatsApp. Additionally, I would also give them a hard copy of the information sheet together with the informed consent form prior to interviewing, and I would explain the purpose of the study to them again face to face. I would also be open to answering any questions or address concerns they might have had. Thus the participants were not coerced to participate in the study; they participated voluntarily.

To ensure that participants were comfortable, I allowed them to choose a place that would be most comfortable for them to do the interview. However, some participants would allow me to choose as it did not matter for them where we conducted the interview. I also asked for their permission to record the interview using my phone and I would explain to them that the purpose of audio recording was for transcribing. To ensure that participant's identities were safe, I did not use their real names or home address or any information that might identify them in my dissertation; I used pseudonyms instead. I stored the recorded interviews and the field notes safely and kept the interview transcripts in a folder that is protected by a password.

3.12 Thematic data analysis

To analyse the collected data, I relied on secondary data, interview transcripts and field notes. I first transcribed all interviews manually. This process was very time consuming especially for the interviews that were long (more than an hour) (Given, 2008). After transcribing, I familiarised myself with the data collected by reading and rereading the interview transcripts. Even though this process was also time consuming because of the rich data, it was very useful because I was able to have a clear picture of the dynamics that existed within the data as also postulated by Bless et al, (2013). As I was familiarising myself with the data, certain themes started to emerge within the data and I would write those themes down. I also highlighted similar themes with different colours in the original transcript. I used different colours to highlight themes and wrote those themes down alongside the texts. This process assisted me because I was able to identify similar themes quickly for analysis. Furthermore, I broke the transcripts down in another document, taking all the important themes and becoming selective with them while also assigning codes (Bogdan and Biklen 2012). I then used the themes that emerged as the subheadings for my findings chapter.

3.13 Trustworthiness

Trustworthiness ensures that there is accurate presentation of the participant's perspectives, behaviours and experiences through validity and reliability of the study's findings (Marshall and Rossman, 2016). To ensure trustworthiness, I was neutral with the research findings in the sense that I put the narratives of the participants first, than my own interpretations. I have done this by transcribing the interviews verbatim and providing direct quotes from the interview transcripts to validate the perspectives and the interpretations of my participants.

3.14 Conclusion

This chapter sought to outline the research design alongside the methodology of the study. In a nutshell, this section has shown how a qualitative research approach was applied to this research study and how my positionality as a researcher did not always

contradict the research purpose. Instead, it matched with that of participants and eliminated common challenges faced by many qualitative researchers, whose positionality often contradicts that of participants. However, there were also tensions regarding my comfort as a female researcher who also interviewed male participants who were of my age group. The chapter to follow will designate the findings of the study that were found after the application of the aforementioned methodology.

Chapter 4. Findings: hidden forms of intellectual contributions among UJ graduates in Kwa Thema Township

This chapter is going to build from the literature review chapter to close the gap in literature about the hidden forms of intellectual participation. However, because this study is exploring a new phenomenon, there is limited literature on this hiddenness that this chapter can draw from. Thus, reliant on participants' narratives and various aspects of the literature review are going to be used to make sense of the data collected, to potentially give the sociological meaning of this hiddenness. This chapter is going to transcend the literature review, particularly the generalised conceptualisation of the role of higher education for the society and the conventional and publicly recognisable ways of intellectual participation and contributions. This is going to be done by specifically giving an account of the hidden forms of intellectual participation. This chapter will also help understand the various influences behind these hidden forms of intellectual participation. Furthermore, this chapter will continue to argue that some aspects of university education are not easily accounted for in the literature and that graduates use their educational knowledge to advance social change in ways that are hidden and not easily accounted for in the public sphere. This argument will be proven true by the participants' narratives.

This chapter is going to begin by showing that most of the study's participants are from lower class backgrounds, which characterises Kwa Thema Township as an underprivileged community. This is going to be followed by a section describing some resemblances of the participants of the study to aspects of the traditional intellectuals as postulated by Gramsci (1971). Further, it will show how the university experience itself has impacted on graduates themselves before their hidden efforts to contribute in the community. Various narratives from graduates will follow to give an account of the hidden forms of intellectual participation and contributions. A conceptual framework will also be used to give a sociological understanding of these findings. And, lastly, the conclusion

will highlight the methodological and conceptual or theoretical contributions of the study and directions for future research.

4.1 Graduates from working class backgrounds

Difficulty in social background was identified as one of the themes that came through within the collected data. However, because literature on this topic is limited, there is no clarity about the social background of intellectuals and how it influenced their participation that I can draw or build from. Therefore, this section will highlight or give a picture of the social background of graduates in this study and later discover how much it influenced their participation. The social background of graduates is important because it functions as a factor that characterises Kwa Thema as an underprivileged community. It classifies most Kwa Thema citizens, including graduates, as likely to be underprivileged. This also functions as a potential reason why few of those from underprivileged communities make it to university institutions and why graduates are looked up to by the members of their community. Therefore, the interviews showed that indeed six out of eight participants came from lower class backgrounds. They relied mostly on NSFAS and other bursaries financially. This is because some lived with single mothers and had other siblings that needed to be taken care of, while others relied on other family members. For example, Thobile said:

> …O*bviously she was struggling because she is a single parent and I also have another sibling and both of us were in university…. Following year I applied to a company called Ronett and I got a bursary that covered food, accommodation…. everything and it paid for the rest of three years so I can say I was not struggling that much financially because of the bursary… without it I would have definitely struggled* (Thobile, 8 December 2018).

Similarly, Mandla said:

> *When I got to university I used NSFAS because my uncle could not afford anymore….When I was doing my second year I failed four modules because things were so hard for me I even lost a lot of weight because I did not have money for food….* (Mandla, 26 December 2018).

These narratives capture the conditions of most participants of the study causing some of the challenges that they had to endure during their university years. These challenges are triggered by some of the social issues faced by many South Africans and affecting mostly the underprivileged who stay in the townships. Thus, this shows that it could not have been possible for these graduates to go to university if it was not for financial funding schemes such as NSFAS and other bursaries.

4.2 Description of participants: graduates' resemblances to aspects of traditional intellectuals

As mentioned earlier in the paper, this study does not necessarily perceive graduates as fully traditional intellectuals. However, it views these graduates as individuals with resemblances to some aspects of traditional intellectuals derived from Gramsci (1971). This is because they went through formal higher education that equipped them with specific knowledge, skills and experience that they use to assist their community. Furthermore, in literature, Gramsci (1971) argued that traditional intellectuals such as educators, lawyers and professors are cherished, valued and looked up to by society. This is because they tend to have jobs that are within the social norms and that make a lot of money. This was the case as well with the graduate participants of this study. Even though some of them were not employed and some not employed in jobs that were in line with their qualifications, they had studied courses that are within the social norms. And, these courses would eventually put them in elite positions that make money and are favoured by the society.

For instance, they studied courses such as teaching, law, accounting, economics, business management and BSc in physical science. As they are joined by these cultural links, Gramsci (1971) argued, as discussed in literature that traditional intellectuals tend to perceive themselves and to be perceived by others as separated from society and as an independent social group. To support this statement, there were cases in the interviews where two graduates thought they now could not completely relate to the community. This might have been because of their educational status or their individual

transformation through university socialisation. One graduate, Tshepo, was critical of the way people think and behave in the township of Kwa Thema,

> *…but sometimes to people it seems like I use my education too much… because even when I engage in a normal conversation for fun, my thinking and the way I respond is different now…. And now… I don't know… maybe it's me, I no longer get entertained by conversations such as 'oh… I got another chick the other day…' these conversations bore me now. Even now when I am home I no longer hang out with people I used to hang out with…. it's hard for me to hang around with them because there is nothing we talk about that makes sense, that will make us progress. There is only one person that I still talk to and get along with, it's Mbali because I went with her to UJ. So I am able to relate to her, to talk about the future, our goals, because those conversations that involve 'where are we going to drink?' do not entertain me anymore because I have priorities now… where I want to see myself when I reach a certain age, now I am able to set myself goals that I am able to achieve both short term and long term* (Tshepo, 28 November 2018).

Tshepo might have seen himself as a changed person since university compared to the people he used to be friends with before going to university. This may be because he could not relate to them anymore, as he regarded their conversations as tedious for him and thus lost interest in them. Mandla on the other hand was critical of the whole township culture now that he has had university training:

> *…..Township culture is doomed, it is projected for destruction, it is destined for destruction, places such as Bahamas, K1, Chowpozzi* [clubs in Kwa Thema] *you see, there is nothing to celebrate about a township, alcohol was made for celebration but to them it is an activity, it makes me so sad* (Mandla, 26 December 2018).

These two narratives show how much university education and experience can transform graduates into individuals who become critical of their conditions in positive ways, showing concern over township culture that seems to be unprogressive. Furthermore, even though these graduates may seem to have detached themselves from the community's culture that they are a product of - following on Gramsci (1971) – this might

39

not be entirely true. This is because it is important to also realise that it is normal for the circle of people to change due to lifestyle changes. It is also common for individuals to change their circles of friends due to maturity, and this should not be considered a negative change or a detachment from the society. It might simply mean that these graduates have transformed due to their university socialisation. This impacts on their social groups, including who they prefer to be around with and who is likely to stimulate their growth or challenge their thinking. They may be considered an independent social group by others (Gramsci, 1971) because they are now driven by a mindset changed through university; they are more conscious and critical of life and their achievements.

4.3 Graduates transformed through university education and experience: critical and goal driven young graduates

The literature review chapter described intellectuals as critical individuals who persuade, who represent certain ideas and whose participation or work is influenced by a certain mindset. This mindset involves a set of knowledge, skills, beliefs, values, ideologies and passions which enable a critical view of life and critical decision making (Mkandawire, 2005; Posner, 2001). Therefore, this fact came through among the participants of the study. They showed that their thinking, values, beliefs and views have changed in various ways through university and that they are now more goal-driven than before. This is important to understand the kinds of individuals that these young graduates have become, how they have been shaped by their university experience and how their intellectual participation is shaped by their university education. Also, because this study explores a new phenomenon 'hidden intellectual participation' little is known about real cases of how university has impacted on graduates' transformation mentally for their own benefit besides finding a job. Therefore, the following narratives are going to show how university education and experience have impacted differently on the lives of young graduates in terms of their thinking and their perspectives on life. For instance Tshepo stated:

> *I can say I am more confident, assertive… because before, when I was still in high*
> *school I was a kind of person that did not take things serious, things were just the*

same, I did not care, I was not a go getter but now I have changed, I go after what I want. I can say I am very different, even people can tell you (giggles) that I have changed, the way I look at life, I have goals now, I see the importance of goals such as short term goals, long term goals, planning what I want to achieve this month, this year, in the next five years… (Giggles)… (Tshepo, 28 November 2018).

Tshepo showed a clear difference between himself before university and after university. This indicate that indeed the university experience has had a positive impact on his mindset and his view of life, which also shows that the whole university experience besides the curriculum can have a positive impact on graduates. Similarly, Mandla said:

Like I can say, I am no longer someone who believes in things being definite, I always think there is always a potential of things being more than what you see, I learned to believe in myself above everything, I also learned that I cannot just marry anyone, it is only fair to marry someone who makes you better and also…. how do I put it… grows you, like you grow, you benefit health wise from your relationships, it is no longer about 'hey friend, we drink, we smoke' even with my friends, I am different and I have accepted that I am different………..The other day I went to the municipality to acquire some land at Interland [a location in Kwa Thema] *because I wanted to open a development center that would take I think 100 scholars a year, different grades, then I get funding from the government and then I bring prominent people, students for mathematics……. so I went there and they denied me the thing (*the land*)…… I was very passionate about that thing (development center) but they demoralised me, they just broke my spirit, I had planned it, written it, the proposal and everything. I want to leave a legacy, there are two things I would wish to do, a jazz club, like a proper jazz club, like a coffee shop, a nice healthy space for people who have got a taste for life uhm …. and also to say to people … it is not just Bahamas* [a club in Kwa Thema] *in life, there are other things you can do, so even with the development center yoh they would learn how to swim, speak, speeches… so that when they go to university they are already four or five steps ahead, they are used to a computer* (Mandla, 26 December 2018).

Mandla seemed to have been affected by his university experience in a significant way: not only did his university experience impact on his thinking and his view of life, it also sparked interest to do something greater for his community (to open a development center). Something that would positively impact on individuals in the community, particularly young people who are more interested in going to clubs instead of building their lives and the community. Mandla supported Creary's (2012) assertion that intellectuals are perceived as individuals who reflect about the society we live in through research and often engage in critical thinking. This finding gives hope to a better tomorrow through graduates for underprivileged communities. It shows that university can stimulate critical thinking and critical evaluation of particular conditions and inspire graduates to find solutions to these conditions. This may also indicate that even though graduates may not always act in big and conventional ways, their university experience has sparked intellectualism in their minds and they are aware of and concerned about their community's disorders.

Nolwazi also alluded about how her thinking has vastly changed through university:

> *I realised that I have always had a stringent way of thinking, like I would think that if I walk in this bridge this is how I will walk you know? I think me studying, I have met people, I have done things, I have taken somethings for granted that I do not anymore, I value some other things even more you know, because we tend to undervalue somethings but now my way of thinking is… is… uhm.. I don't know how to put it … my way of thinking is much more solid you know, it is very much more solid, the way I do things I … I don't become impractical about life, life is very practical sister … yeah I begin to value life even more I begin to value the experience you know … even my morals you know, uhm… the way I do things it has changed you know… if it was not for me being at UJ, seeing people, experiencing things, the curves and the obstacles I faced, I don't think I would be here or stronger than who I was 4 years ago…* (Nolwazi, 6 January 2019).

Nolwazi has shown a huge impact on her thinking and her view of life after being at UJ; she has also realised important aspects and techniques that one has to follow in life in order to succeed. It is apparent that her thinking and her perspective of life has become

part of her identity and she is now carrying it with her where ever she goes. Another participant experienced similar changes,

> *The experience has taught me budget, hence I said that budget has been the overall thing in my life. So it's all about saving, saving… Varsity is not there for the faint hearted, it is there for people who know, it teaches you budget, it teaches you how to choose friends, it teaches you how to carry yourself, no one is watching you, if you want to come back late it's your own decision, if you do not want to study… I wish everyone could go to varsity for the background and everyone, I wish everyone could go to varsity, varsity washes you……* (Mamelo, 19 January 2019).

Mamelo appeared to have been affected by both her course (accounting) which taught her the importance of budget. She was also impacted by her whole university socialisation which she thought would train a person to know how to live as an adult as she also desired that everyone could go to university. This shows how much she values going to university as it worked for her by making her who she is today. Similarly, Amanda has also shown that her university experience taught her important laws of life.

> *It taught me to be responsible hey, staying alone being given a certain money that has to last you for the whole month you know (laughs) so it taught me to be accountable and responsible shame and to also appreciate hey….. And to also be independent, being independent is not easy….. So it taught me, it taught me, Amanda is not the same person before university* (Amanda, 10 January 2019).

The narratives above have illustrated the tremendous impact of the university experience on graduates' mindset and their life perspective. This experience has shaped graduates' thinking and changed their beliefs about life. It was significant to first understand the mindset of graduates resulting from university before understanding their participation and contributions inspired by this changed mindset and critical thinking.

4.4 Hidden forms of intellectual participation: UJ graduates intellectually participating and contributing in Kwa Thema Township using their university education and experience

As mentioned in the literature review, intellectual participation is a process through which people with certain knowledge are troubled by various social issues and attempt to deal with them using their intellect in various ways (Barney, 1994; Adwan and Wildfeuer, 2011; Bamyeh, 2012). In this section, intellectual participation is going to be looked at according to how UJ graduates use their university education and experience in hidden ways to assist community members in Kwa Thema. Thus this section is going to transcend the conventional and publicly visible forms of intellectual participation and contributions by early South African intellectuals (Ntsikana, Tiyo Soga, John Tengo Jabavu, Mpilo Walter, Benson Rubusana, Sol Plaatje and Samuel Edward Krune Mqhayi) and prominent intellectuals of the 19th and 20th centuries (Steve Biko, Es'kia Mphahlele, Archie Mafeje and Mamphela Ramphele) that were discussed in literature.

The following narratives are going to give an account of hidden forms of intellectual participation and serve as evidence that, even though these hidden forms were overlooked by many scholars, they exist and they play a significant role in communities. They also emphasise the stronger links between higher education and society through graduates. These narratives will indicate that the whole university experience has had a significant impact on individual graduates. It is not only beneficial for them and their private lives but they are able to also use it to support others in the community. For instance, graduate alluded:

> *I do try to convince others and show them the other side of life through the way that I see things now after my experience at UJ, because I have also met people who have bigger dreams than mine and that motivated me. And….also me and my other friends, - one from Omonde near Goldreef City, the other one from Soweto, the other one from Kwa-Zulu Natal and the other one from Swaziland - in 2016 we had decided that in June, after exams we would make donation papers and go to the SRC offices to ask for the UJ stamp so that people trust us when we ask for donations, then since I am from Kwa Thema, I used to take the donation papers*

and go ask for donations in the township and sometimes I would approach another lady and ask her to help me ask for donations so I would go to her and give her the donation forms and she would ask donations in her work place. After the forms were complete, I would take people's details such as identity documents, high school reports and all the documents that were needed and made copies for them using that donation money. After that we would apply for them at different universities, we even applied for NSFAS on their behalf.

This kind of intellectual contribution by Tshepo has produced great and positive results among other young people in the community:

There are four students from Kwa Thema right now who are first years at UJ and they are all studying towards teaching, they even got NSFAS and places to stay, we looked for accommodations especially for girls because they prefer staying at res. We used the donation money to even pay deposits in the residences in which these students were going to stay just to make their beginning of university a bit easier for them, they did not have to take out any money for the first month. And, when a student was admitted at UJ, because I was also still studying, I would avail myself at school so that when they need help I am there to give them directions, especially for orientation since they are not yet familiar with the place, they would just text me where they were so that they do not get lost (Tshepo, 28 November 2018).

On one hand, this narrative is giving reference to how Tshepo used his university experience to assist other young people with university application processes and its positive results. On the other hand, he has also used his university education [BA Law] to assist a neighbour as follows:

Also, last year around December I was able to help a man who is my neighbour and was working for our counsellor in Mzumbe [another section in Kwa Thema] *but was being robbed with his salary because the money he was supposed to earn was stated in his contract but he did not earn that amount, so he kept going to the counsellor to get this fixed but he could not find help; thus with my knowledge I was able to refer him to CCMA and I helped him get his money back and he was*

45

happy (giggles) and I was also happy that I was able to do something to help someone else (Tshepo, 28 November 2018).

The first important point here about Tshepo is that he is intellectually participating in the community regardless of the fact that he is employed (on a job that is in line with his qualification). This supports Gramsci's (1971) assertion that sometimes intellectuals can work inside a discipline and also be able to use their expertise in any other ways. Tshepo's ways of intellectually participating are both inspired by his university experience and university education that he acquired from his BA law degree. He used his university experience of applying for his own course at UJ and residence to assist others with similar applications. He was also able to use his knowledge acquired from his law degree to refer his neighbour who was treated unfairly by his employer to CCMA.

Sephiri (2002) has argued, as discussed in literature that intellectuals are individuals of ideas and these ideas are not meant for personal gains but intellectuals seek to persuade the public and to change the social order (Sephiri, 2002). This was proven true by Tshepo's contributions when he and his other friends developed the idea of seeking donations that would assist other young people to go to university. This gesture has influenced four young people from Kwa Thema and they are now studying towards their teaching degrees. Tshepo's contributions might have contributed to a change of social order in Kwa Thema of building a culture of education. This is showing that there are other ways in which graduates with a passion for helping people, but who are also advancing their personal lives, can assist while also living their lives.

Thobile stated*:*

> *I help people more academically, I always encourage people to study and since I was doing investment, I advise people about their finances on how to manage them without wasting their money anyhow. My knowledge has changed me as well personally because we as people like buying on debts, we like using credit so much so with my knowledge I now calculate the interests that are charged, at this moment I do not buy anything on debt, I have decided that the only thing that I will buy on debt is my car and my house only, not clothes, if you cannot afford something now, rather save up until you can afford it, so I am very conscious of*

how I use my money and even people around me… if they are misusing money I
tell them how they can save up (Thobile, 8 December 2018).

Thobile seemed to have used both her university experience and her university education acquired from her financial investment course. She used her university experience by encouraging others academically and encouraging them to study hard in order to succeed in their studies. She might be doing this because she saw through her own experience of being at university that studying while at university will help one make it and pass. She additionally used her knowledge from her course to offer financial advice to others and to also help herself personally to make better financial decisions.

Nolwazi, similarly, said:

…I told him and I said, 'you know what? invest your money because money like
this comes once, you will never get it again, the money that you did not work for,
the money that you do not even have a certificate for that money only comes once
so what you can do is invest it for it to grow so you can sit while you make money,
eat and be well you know,' and he said yeah you are telling the truth, how can I do
it? This person was venting that he is not working but has money but because of
the course I did at UJ (laughing) because of the course I did at UJ I was able to
gain that…… it's a skill though, it's a mindset because I now know where to start
because I was able to tell him that if he invests this much, this is how much he will
have by a specific time"

Nolwazi has also influenced another school boy to do something beneficial during school holidays:

…and I said to him, why don't you take money, or if you do not have the money
come to me I will give it to you so that you can sell cooltime [fruit juice ice block]
and he was like 'For real?' and I said yes and he did that, he asked me for money
and I gave him and now he was selling cooltime, and even now he told me that he
is saving the money for something else, and even now he is still selling it….. So it
was a breath of fresh air knowing that you have helped someone with what you
have learned….. His mom thanked me because this young guy does not ask her

for money anymore, so he was now telling me that he wants to sell kasi snacks and more (Nolwazi, 6 January 2019).

These narratives show that Nolwazi was able to use her knowledge from her course (business management) to help a guy she met and offered an advice to him about the ways in which he would be able to sustain himself financially. She insisted that she was able to do this because of the course she did at UJ; she gave value to it. In addition to her knowledge, she used her university experience or her changed mind-set to advise and assist a school boy in the location she stays in Kwa Thema. She was able to influence and spark the interest in business to a boy by giving an idea to him and something to do to keep himself busy during school holidays. This was able to significantly help the school boy as he was now able to buy himself things instead of asking for money at home. And, he is now more dedicated to grow this business by selling more and his mother is grateful for this.

Mamelo also emphasises financial skills*:*

> *So I always advise my friends ……I always say, people we need to budget especially for the parents, they pass on and all those things and we do not think about those things when they happen, and then we start fighting for houses and all those things, yeah, so I always pressurise the fact of budget, budget is the most important, … so I always put budget as the most important thing, like you could check the topics that we have with my friends on WhatsApp it is about budget. So varsity has taught me … accounting has taught me to be more vigilant about expenses and my background as well ….. for me I think it would be more nice to work in an environment where I encourage people to budget because I see a lot of people are in debt, especially with black people we take loans, during this time (January) its loans even in December its loans so budget is really important* (Mamelo, 19 January 2019).

Mamelo kept on emphasising budget, and I could also see in the way that she spoke that she was very passionate about budget and teaching people how to budget. Especially seeing that a lot of black people in townships do not have the necessary information about

how to manage their finances. She seemed to have been transferring her accounting knowledge more to her friends in the township.

Thami began tutoring before university:

> *Okay well, I did mention that I tutor, so I was good in mathematics (in high school) and some of the guys did not understand the teacher so because I understood math, I started there to help them, and then I ended up teaching my school mates. Following year I said, okay, because I am going to varsity now and travelling and I still have time on weekends, how about I go and help out in my high school? So I helped matric students with math and science for free, uhm… others would come to me and ask me to take them to UJ so that they can apply… we would organise a transport and go to school to apply, I would fill in the forms…* (Thami, 24 January 2019).

Thami had already begun helping the community even before his university years, which shows how much he is passionate about helping the community. He was already using his mathematics knowledge from high school to help. He continued to use this during his university years and after university for free because he studied BSc in physical science which also incorporated mathematics and physics.

Sam revealed both public and hidden intellectual participations:

> *Okay, we started our business because of like… the eating of unhealthy food by the learners of Theothwala Primary School* [his former high school]…. *when we arrived we conceptualised and we made a product that was kind 'a healthy, in fact it is healthy yeah, trying to fix the problem and then it grew from Theothwala because the focus was on the kids because we had other things that we were busy with on the side, so… the demand grew even here* [in the wider community] *and impacted [on] a lot of people….. Like the preparation of the product, we do not use oil and when we use it we put a small amount of it, we do not freeze our food, like our meat, we prepare the meat today and we use it today, (we do not store our cooked meet in the fridge for too long, we store it for a day or two not like five days in a fridge). Also with careers, like I helped matric learners to choose courses….*

to make them understand their strengths and weaknesses so that they are able to choose the right careers. And the application process, because they all need it, they always come 'please help me apply, please help me apply' and what else? Uhm……mostly its indirect things, if I know something and you come to ask me. Most of the time I help people unconsciously, I don't tell myself that right now I am putting the UJ thinking cap, now I am putting the one from the township… (Sam, 29 January 2019).

Sam is doing something that is publicly recognisable - he is running a business that sells burgers in the township and that can be viewed as a conventional and visible form of intellectual participation. However, the motive behind this form of participation is hidden; some people might look at him as someone who is trying to make a living out of this business just like most people in the townships. However, the motive behind this form of intellectual participation is to assist the community, to help young children eat healthier food in schools.

This section has shown how different university education based on specific qualifications can influence graduates to contribute differently in communities. Also, because graduates had different experiences of being at university, they are using their unique experiences to contribute differently around the community in unconventional ways. It is also vital that the influences behind these hidden ways of intellectual participation are known and understood.

4.5 What influences graduates to participate and contribute in Kwa- Thema Township?

4.5.1   The influence of the university education and experience

Thus far, many of the participants seemed to have been influenced by their university education and experience to contribute in the community. From the literature review chapter, an argument can be made that most intellectuals that were exemplified were influenced by their education to contribute in their communities. For instance, Mamphela Ramphele was influenced by her medical qualification, among other influences, to open health care centers for her community (Ramphele, 2014). Furthermore, scholars such as

Luescher-Mamashela et al. (2011) and Bynner *et al*. (2003) discovered proof that higher education act as an influence in reinforcing citizenship through some quantitative studies that have indicated a strong association between university education and positive attitudes in relation to democracy and diversity. However, because these studies were quantitative, they did not sufficiently describe this kind of influence. Therefore, even though it has been shown already how the university education and experience has influenced graduates to contribute in various ways, this section is going to describe this influence through some of the narratives of graduates.

Sam alluded:

> *Developmental studies taught me social injustices and how you challenge them, how to get out of them, like it has taught me to understand the society as a whole, why are things the way they are, why this person who does not have food does not have food, why the one who has food has it and then ... If you do not have something, how do you move from this point to another? If you have something how do you grow from what you have to the next level?… It taught me to conceptualise, like in my business I use it every day, uhm…. Indirectly and directly, indirectly… in decision making one, two, in conceptualising things like forming a product from scratch and before forming a product you need to understand why you are forming it, so development studies, actually my course as a whole, taught me to see problems so that I can be able to create solutions for those problems. So as an entrepreneur that is what I do* (Sam, 29 January 2019).

This narrative captures the specific influence of the university education (knowledge from developmental studies). Showing that education can transform some individual graduates and raise particular interests and solutions for them to assist in their communities and become change agents for their communities.

Tshepo was similarly influenced*:*

> *I was definitely influenced by my experience of coming to UJ and being at UJ because it was very difficult for me, at home they just gave me money and I had*

to look for the university alone and it was difficult, I did not even know where UJ was... (Tshepo, 28 November 2018).

Tshepo, similar to other participants, voiced that he was influenced by his university experience to assist other young people in the township. Through his difficult experience of going to UJ, he did not want others to go through the struggles that he faced. While other participants wanted others to have this transformative university experience that they also had and was beneficial to them. These narratives indicate the various aspects of the university experience that can be influential on graduates and raise interests to create solutions to particular struggles in the community.

4.5.2 The influence of the social background

Before going into the field, I had assumed that the social background of graduates was going to play a major role as an influencer for graduates to intellectually participate, especially because they are from an underprivileged community. Archie Mafeje also postulated in literature that our social background, class, race and gender influence our position, views and interpretation of the world (Lekaba, 2016). However in this study, the social background of graduates seemed to have little influence on their intellectual participation. It was only one participant who articulated that, among other influences, she was influenced by her social background to intellectually contribute while others were influenced by their university education, experience and the spirit of sharing. Thus, Mamelo asserted that:

I am influenced by my background, my background at home … So experience at home, varsity and experience now (work place) … actually I think my background of budget started at home before varsity because my mom would give us a piggybank so if someone would give you money you would put it inside, then by the end of the year there was this place in Springs, what was it? ... it was a place where the street vendors would buy ice cream, lollypops, so my mom would fill in the stamps on her side and we would also have our own money and then when she goes to buy she would take us with her and then we would choose whatever we wanted for the whole of December, so I really learned about budget at home,

yeah, I learned at home so now it is much more easier, so varsity made it worse because now I had to live on R50 (Mamelo, 19 January 2019).

The other participants might not have been influenced by their social background as much as Mamelo because this might depend on the social background of participants themselves and how it relate to the course studied. For instance, Mamelo might have been influenced by her social background because it related to her accounting diploma. What she learned from her course instilled what she was already socialised to by her household, unlike other participants. An association between a graduates' social background and the course studied might play a role in how much social background can be an influence.

4.5.3   The spirit of sharing as an influencer for graduates to participate

As this topic is under studied, other influences beside university education and experience are unclear in the available literature. Therefore this sub-section introduces the spirit to share as another factor that influenced graduates to intellectually participate in Kwa-Thema. I can also argue that the conventional ways of intellectually participating postulated in literature also symbolise that intellectuals had the devotion to share their knowledge to change people's lives. The results of this study showed similar results. Some graduates participated intellectually because they valued sharing with others and they did not see value in keeping the information to themselves. As Nolwazi said:

it is the heart of sharing you know, what you have is a matter of sharing with someone else because it's, it's a gift or, eish I don't know, you know something that you have, it is much more useful when you share it rather than if I have this pen and it's my pen only [physically illustrating pointing to the pen], *you know, and I think its beneficial, it benefits you as well, your spirit uhm I think it is the heart of giving whatever thing I have is the heart of giving especially if it's going to make you a better person, meaning if I did not tell him he would have never thought of it and he is a better person right now, you know, and it is pleasing if you helped someone else as a person you know, so it is the spirit of giving and not holding information but sharing whatever you have whether its food or information. Imagine*

other people do not have university qualifications but already he is a business person so it is that thing of it's an impact, like you are impacting someone and you also want that person tomorrow to help someone else and it's a triple down effect, you know, so it starts up and goes down and chances are, everyone will be touched by that, you know, so yeah I think that is what motivates me you know, something that inspires me to help someone else, it is the effect it has from this person to the next and to the next yeah you see yeah (Nolwazi, 6 January 2019).

Nolwazi, with others who articulated similar thoughts, did not see value in having all these skills and knowledge from university and not using it in ways to benefit others. She believed it was beneficial for her as well knowing that she has helped someone else. This supports Gramsci's (1971) assertion that the purpose of intellectual activities is to advance human freedom and knowledge; they are not meant to reinforce self-esteem or to celebrate status. Thus some of these graduates truly wanted to assist and were driven by the devotion to help.

4.6 The university education and experience that graduates found useful for contributing in Kwa Thema Township

As in the literature review, to determine aspects of the university education and experience that are useful for the development of communities might require a relook at the contributions made by graduates to determine what aspects of university were used for particular contributions. For instance, drawing from the literature review chapter and considering Mamphela Ramphele's contributions, she used her university education from her medical degree to open two health centers for the poor (Ramphele, 2014). This demonstrates that she might have found her medical degree knowledge to be useful for her to make this kind of contribution for her community. Eskia Mphahlele used his knowledge to make significant contributions to African literature by writing about African history, using his knowledge from writing about the African Image in 1962 that was inspired by his master's thesis (Jordan, 2011). This might also testify that this knowledge has been useful for him to make such contributions to African literature. Similarly, Archie Mafeje might have found his experience as an African scholar useful for him to be able to

contribute to a better understanding of African people, their struggles, success and pursuit of self-understanding (Lekaba, 2016). Additionally, early African intellectuals might have found some aspects of their missionary education useful to be able to make specific changes in their communities such as to translate the English bible into Xhosa (Ndletyana, 2008).

The data collected revealed that this was also the case with UJ graduates. In cases where their university education seemed not applicable to the community's need, they have used their university experience. This experience involved their changed self, including their critical thinking, critical decision making and the process of applying for courses, bursaries and accommodation. Thus, they found these to be useful to assist community members in Kwa Thema. For instance, Tshepo seemed to have used and thus found useful both his university education (law) and his experience. He used his university education by providing helpful information to a man who was not paid fully by his employer as already indicated in a previous section. He also used his university experience of applying at UJ for tuition and accommodation to assist others with the university application processes. This might indicate that some aspects of a law degree can be useful to communities, depending on how graduates use them and also depending on the needs of the community members. Similarly, Thobile and Mamelo have also found their university education - particularly the lesson on budgeting to be useful. They have used their university education (financial investment and accounting) to advise others to make wiser financial decisions; they always stressed the importance of budget to other people in the community, indicating that they have found the lessons on budget useful for them to assist.

Sam found his university education and experience useful for the community; he used his university experience of the application process to assist other young people in the community with applying at universities and helped them choose careers. He additionally used his university education, particularly the knowledge he gained from the developmental studies module- lessons on conceptualisation and understanding social injustices, to manage his business that assists primary school learners in the township by providing healthy food for them. Thus, Sam might have found the knowledge he acquired

from development studies, including his experience of university application, useful to assist in the township.

Similarly, Thami has also found useful and used his university education and experience concurrently: he assisted high school students with mathematics to help them pass and also to inspire them to study further at higher education institutions because of his experience. Thus, he found mathematics skills from his university education useful for him to assist in the township. Another important fact we gather from this is the indication that not all aspects of the university education are equally transferable or usable to individuals' needs in the township. This is because some graduates have found their broader university experience useful and others have found specific aspects of their university education to be useful, while others have found both the university education and experience useful to assist the people of the community. Sometimes, it may not mean that these aspects of the university education and experience are not practical, it may mean that these aspects require greater material resources and funds that may be needed, and graduates as individuals may not be in the position to provide such funds. Sometimes, more education on how some aspects of university can be applied to our underprivileged communities is needed.

4.7 Discussions: The meaning of the hidden forms of intellectual participation and contributions

This overlooked dimension of looking at the role of higher education in society has shown that there are indeed hidden forms of intellectual participation. This is not because these ways are intentionally hidden, but there are few investigations made by scholars about these ways. These hidden ways have revealed other important aspects about the relationship between higher education and society that were overlooked. Firstly, these ways have shown that they are influenced by the transformation of graduates through university training, and this transformation acts as the sole influencer for graduates to contribute to the community. In other words, there are connections between the impact that university has had on graduates and how they contribute in their community. These

ways have additionally shown that graduates are in a position to produce both material and non-material contributions.

However, most of the hidden forms of intellectual contributions in this study were non-material. The literature has made reference to more publicly recognisable ways of intellectual participation that are typically materialistic. This means that these ways have produced tangible outcomes that are seen and valued by all members of the society and that directly impact its members. For instance, the majority of the early African intellectuals such as Ntsikana, Tiyo Soga, John Tengo Jabavu, Mpilo Walter, Benson Rubusana and Samuel Edward Krune Mqhayi have produced tangible contributions. These included the establishment of universities for black people. Most black communities largely benefited from these kinds of contributions. Likewise, from some of the previous narratives, some participants have provided material contributions. For example, Sam opened a business in the community that sold healthy food to primary school learners of his former primary school. This is tangible because it has a physical existence (a business) and is seen and easily valued by members of the community. However, his motivation to open this business was hidden and not understood by many people.

The most important forms of non-material contributions seen in the narratives of this study were information sharing and influence. Most participants shared information regarding university applications, information about how to manage money, information about the law and general advice about making wiser life decisions. Tutoring mathematics to high school learners by Thami can also be identified as information sharing. Furthermore, participants have influenced their peers in various ways; for instance, Nolwazi has influenced a school boy to start a small business of selling 'cooltime' in the township. Therefore, information sharing and influence can be regarded as non-material contributions because they do not have a physical existence. From this, we also understand that information and influence are intertwined because one can give information to influence, or certain information can influence certain individuals. Moreover, even though these are non-tangible contributions, they have the ability to provide tangible rewards in the long run. For instance, when these high school students

pass mathematics because of Thami's assistance and qualify for university admission, they would eventually get their degrees or diplomas and that would be tangible.

These ways have also indicated an important link to social justice. The literature has defined social justice as a concept that protect human rights and ensures equality and as the distribution of wealth in society as a matter of justice (Case, 2017). Thus, I argue that the participants of this study were extending various human rights to Kwa Thema's citizens. For instance, Sam has extended the right to healthy food to the young children at his former primary school. He might have helped to prevent illnesses that might affect the school children through unhealthy eating which might also have affected their school performance and hindered their chances of enjoying their right to education. Thus, I can further argue that Sam has also extended the children's right to education indirectly, and also because he has assisted other young people in the township with university application processes. Furthermore, the right to education has been extended by several participants. Another example would be Tshepo, who has extended this right by assisting high school students with application processes and by collecting money to help them secure accommodation, while others have motivated their peers academically. Thami assisted large numbers of high school students with mathematics, and considering the fact that mathematics has been identified as one of the most difficult subjects, he has extended this right in a significant way. Those who would have failed their matric because of mathematics stand better chances of passing it and making it to higher education institutions and eventually becoming great people. At this point, it is clear that very important aspects of higher education and communities have been misplaced in literature. As much as these hidden ways were overlooked, they have great impact on society when investigated carefully.

4.8 Conceptual understanding

4.8.1   Traditional intellectuals

Even though the participants in this study (UJ graduates) were not merely classified as traditional intellectuals, they resembled some aspects of traditional intellectuals, such as they are university trained and they are able to use their educational status as postulated

by Gramsci (1971) to advance social change in their communities. To further show that these graduates resemble some aspects of traditional intellectuals, Gramsci (1971) argued that traditional intellectuals tend to have the jobs that are within the social norms and that make a lot of money, such as lawyers, teachers, professors and administrators. Therefore, even though most participants of the study may not currently be in certain professions through their university qualifications, they are likely to work in jobs that are within the social norm because of the education they have. The description of the university education that they received involves BA Law, BSc in physical science, accounting (two participants did accounting), financial investment, economics and investment, business management and BA Humanities. Through these courses, they possess what is seen as peculiar in their community and which symbolises their cultural competence and thus they are looked up to by many in their community.

4.8.2   Power and cultural capital

The university education and experience that these graduates possess function as their power or cultural capital that enabled them to make specific changes that are in line with their qualifications and university experience in the lives of those who stay in their community. As already indicated, all participants for this study have been impacted by their university experience mentally, and have used their knowledge power that was specific to their university qualifications and experience to assist others. This has shown that they were able to control their own fate because they used their education to rebuild themselves and to make wiser decisions about their future. However, they were also seen to be positively contributing to the fate of others by using their cultural capital to contribute to others' needs. A good example was shown when four of those who were assisted by Tshepo with university applications made it to university. Tshepo might have controlled their fate in life in a positive way because they might end up living successful lives because of the jobs they will have based on their qualifications. Nolwazi is another great example, when she encouraged a school boy to sell 'Cooltime' during school holidays and this grew into something and still has the ability to grow into something big that could greatly benefit the boy in the long run.

This kind of control is positive for both the graduate and the other (the community member), and maintains hegemony within the community as a form of persuasion. Most of these hidden forms of intellectual participation have emphasised hegemony as a form of sharing information and influencing. In other words, these graduates might be indirectly or unconsciously maintaining their control in a positive way in the community.

4.8.3   Agency

These hidden ways of intellectual participation have additionally emphasised the power of agency. Agency is the capacity of individuals to act independently and make their own individual choices without anyone's influence as indicated in literature (Mayr, 2011). Therefore the hidden forms of intellectual participation demonstrated in the study have been shaped by personal aspirations instead of by certain influences from various institutions and organisations. Graduate participants were able to do all of this through themselves identifying gaps in the community and for some members of the community and they have used their position and power to assist accordingly. This shows that graduates in this study are not ignorant of the social issues faced by community members because some of them wished they could do more to serve the community, such as Mandla who wanted to open a development center for the community. This in a nutshell is demonstrating that university institutions play a crucial role in shaping individual graduates to be the institution in their communities. Furthermore, these institutions maintain their societal role through graduates because these graduates come back to their communities and do what these institutions ought to do. Thus, these institutions extend their dominance or role in society through graduates.

4.9 Conclusion

This chapter has shown and attempted to give a sociological explanation of the hidden forms of intellectual participation and contributions. This has been done by particularly showing that these unique and hidden ways of contributing are linked to the human aspects of graduates especially their spirit to share their university knowledge and experience with others in their community. The chapter to follow will conclude further on

the meaning of this study for sociology and the significance of these hidden forms of intellectual participation and contributions.

Chapter 5. Conclusion

5.1 Theoretical contribution of the study

This study has contributed to our theoretical understanding of the role of Bourdieu's (1980) cultural capital for society. It has first illustrated that graduates possess cultural capital and this capital serves as the power that they possess in their communities. This cultural capital involves their mental abilities influenced by higher educational training and it acts as their power that influences and enables them to make particular contributions in their community. This has also contributed to our understanding of the role of university institutions through graduates, showing that these institutions continue to play a positive role in society through a graduate's cultural capital which these institutions equipped them with. It was also understood that the use of cultural capital takes various forms which range from the conventional ways of participating and contributing to communities (outlined in the literature review chapter) and the unconventional ways which are hidden (shown in findings chapter).

5.2 Methodological contributions of the study

This study has also contributed to our methodological understanding of the positive impact of a researcher's positionality in fieldwork. It has shown that a researcher's positionality does not always interfere with the research process in a manner that opposes or challenges fieldwork. My positionality as a UJ master's student residing in the same township in which my participants reside resulted in me relating to my participants and my participants relating to me. Age was the most important factor in my positionality, because the participants of the study were my peers. We had similar mindsets and shared similar UJ experiences and experiences from our township culture (Kwa Thema Township). We also shared a language, which was also part of my positionality. Being an isiZulu speaker and coming from a township where the predominant language used is isiZulu was a huge benefit in conducting interviews. The similarities in language made it

easier for me and the participants to be more articulate during interviews. All these similarities between me and the participants made the research process more exciting and comfortable. I was able to use my positionality to also share with the participants my experiences of being at UJ and of residing in Kwa Thema in cases where participants would be uncomfortable to open up about their experiences. Thus, this may mean that occasionally, a researcher's positionality that is similar to that of participants in research can limit possible tensions and make the research process less challenging, particularly in field work because this categorises the researcher as an insider.

5.3 What does all of this mean?

This study aimed at transcending the mainstream understanding of the role of higher education for society that largely centres around the generalised social role of higher education and the conventional ways of using higher education for social development. This study sought to understand the overlooked, hidden forms of intellectual participation that contribute to community development. The study aimed to understand this by looking at how UJ graduates who reside in Kwa Thema Township use their position as graduates and as people who have acquired university education and experience to assist particular individuals in the community. This study was broadly inspired by the perceived economic role of graduates and the minimal attention being placed on how graduates benefit the communities they come from. This study wanted to understand these hidden intellectual ways of participation while also understanding how university experience and social background have influenced young graduates in playing a positive role in their communities, and additionally, to examine the specific skills and knowledge that graduates find useful in contributing to their community.

The study's findings revealed that indeed there was more to be known about the hidden forms of intellectual participation, because they do exist. Graduates in this study are doing something to assist individuals in the community of Kwa Thema. These hidden, small and unconventional ways of participation were seen to be playing a significant role in dealing with more personal problems that individuals in the community face, such as workplace problems, lack of information or financial management issues. The study also revealed

that graduates were influenced by their university education, experience and the spirit of sharing more than by their social background (except for Mamelo, whose social background had an influence) to render these forms of participation. Even though these graduates are from Kwa Thema, an underprivileged community, they were not influenced by this but they wanted others to have similar experiences and learn what they learned at university. They did not want others to go through what they went through, and therefore helped them in various ways.

What seemed most useful for graduates to assist in the community was their university experience as a whole, because they used it mostly to help with applications and to influence using a changed mind-set that is more critical and solid. This was also useful for those graduates who had difficulty using their university education because it might have not seemed applicable to them.

This study has also revealed that most of these hidden ways of intellectual participation provided non- material contributions. These non- material contributions have been mainly information sharing and influence. Graduates have provided important information to community members such as information regarding university applications, career, employment, finance, high school tuition and so on. They influenced by giving critical advice to their peers, helping them to make wiser decisions. However, this did not mean that providing material and tangible contributions was impossible, because Sam's contribution was a physical business that sold healthier food to primary school children even though his motives for the business were hidden. This has shown that even though the hidden ways of intellectual participation are more personal and non-material, they are not limited to this because they can also produce tangible rewards in the long run.

These ways have demonstrated a very important link between social justice and higher education. The role of higher education was looked at by looking at its possessors such as the graduates. Thus graduates were extending the right to social justice, including the right to healthy food and the right to education. This has made us understand that even though there are people who cannot access all of their rights, graduates can act as people who work towards extending these rights to those who are underprivileged. For sociology, this means that education can give one power (cultural capital) to make change and

through that power, social justice can be spread to those who cannot enjoy all the given rights because of class, race and intellectual capacity.

5.4   Directions for future research

This study has broadly demonstrated that multiple realities exist, the visible and invisible realities to the public. However, the invisible realities are often neglected and assumed to be nonexistent and this has given room for many generalisations and stereotypes about the unknown. Future sociological research should focus on excavating more neglected realities that exist in the modern day. Particularly those that uplift underprivileged communities.

Reference list

Adwan, S and Wildfeuer, AG. 2011. *Participation and Reconciliation: Precondition of Justice*. California: Barbara Budrich Publishers.

African Success, 2012. *Biography of Mamphela Ramphele*, Accessed 22 March 2019, http://www.africansuccess.org/visuFiche.php?id=406&lang=en.

Ajulu, R. 2001. 'Thabo Mbeki's African Renaissance in a Globalising World Economy: The Struggle for the Soul of the Continent'. *Review of African Political Economy*, 28(87): 27-42.

Alasuutari, P., Bickman, L and Brannen, J. 2008. *The Sage Handbook of Social Research Methods*. London: Sage Publications.

Ashwin, P and Case, J. 2018. *Higher Education Pathways: South African Undergraduate Education and the Public Good*. Cape Town: African Minds.

Babbie, ER. 2004. *The Basics of Social Research*. Belmont CA: Wadsworth.

Badat, S. 2009. *The Role of Higher Education in Society: Valuing Higher Education*. Paper Presented at the HERS-SA Academy 2009, Cape Town.

Bamyeh, MA. 2012. *Intellectuals and Civil Society in the Middle East, Liberalism, Modernity and Political Discourse*. New York: I.B Tauris.

Barney, DD. 1994. 'The Role of Intellectuals in Contemporary Society'. *Insurgent Voices in Education*, 1(1): 89-105.

Behrman, JR and Stacy, N. 1997. *The Social Benefits of Higher Education*. Michigan: University of Michigan Press.

Biko, S. 1978. *I Write What I Like.* Northlands: Picador Africa.

Bless, C, Higson-Smith, C and Sithole, S. L. 2013. *Fundamentals of Social Research Methods: An African Perspective.* Cape Town: Juta.

Bogdan, RC and Biklen, SK. 2012. *Qualitative Research for Education: An Introduction to Theories and Methods.* London: Pearson.

Bourdieu, P. 1980. *The Logic of Practice.* Cambridge: Polity Press.

Bryman, A. 2016. *Social Research Methods.* Oxford: Oxford University Press.

Buhlungu, S. 2004. 'The Building of the Democratic Tradition in South Africa's Trade Unions After 1973'. *Democratisation*, 11(3): 133-158.

Buhlungu, S. 2006. 'Rebels without a Cause of Their Own? The Contradictory Location of White Officials in Black Unions in South Africa, 1973-94'. *Current Sociology*, 54(3): 427-451.

Burke, C and Christie, F. 2019. *Graduates Careers in Context.* New York: Routledge.

Bynner, J, Dolton, P, Feinstein, L, Makepeace, G, Malmberg, L, and Woods, L. 2003. 'Revisiting the Benefits of Higher Education: A Report by the Bedford Group for Lifecourse and Statistical Studies, Institute of Education'. *Higher Education Funding Council for England.* Bristol.

Byrne, E, Brugha, R, Clarke, E, Lavelle, A and McGarvey, A. 2015. 'Peer Interviewing in Medical Education Research: Experiences and Perceptions of Student Interviewers and Interviewees'. *Division of Population and Health Sciences*, 8(518): 1-11.

Case, JM. 2017. *Higher Education and Social Justice: Engaging the Normative with the Analytical.* London. Centre for Global Higher Education.

Castells, M. 2009. The Role of Universities in Development, the Economy and Society. Transcript of a lecture given by Manuel Castells at the University of the Western Cape, August 2009.

Chaita, MV. 2016. *Developing Graduate Employability Skills: Your Pathway to Employment*. Florida: Universal Publishers.

Cloete, N, Bailey, T, Pillay, P, Bunting, I and Maassen, P. 2011. *Universities and Economic Development in Africa*. Semerset West: Center for Higher Education Transformation.

Collins, C. S. 2011. *Higher Education and Global Poverty*. New York: Cambria Press.

Comunian, R and Gilmore, A. 2016. *Higher Education and the Creative Economy: Beyond the Campus*. New York: Routledge.

Coser, LW. 1956. *Men of Ideas: A Sociologist View*. New York: Free Press.

Creary, NM. 2012. *African Intellectuals and Decolonisation*. Ohio: Ohio University Press.

Cullinan, J and Flannery, D. 2017. *Economic Insights on Higher Education Policy in Ireland*. Limerick, Ireland: Palgrave Macmillan.

Department of Higher Education and Training. 2018. Accessed 29 June 2018, http://www.dhet.gov.za/SitePages/CommunityCollege.aspx.

Di Leo, JR and Hitchcock, P. 2016. *The New Public Intellectual: Politics, Theory and the Public Sphere*. New York: Palgrave Macmillan.

Dwyer, SC and Buckle, JL. 2009. 'The Space Between: On Being an Insider-Outsider in Qualitative Research'. *International Journal of Qualitative Methods,* 8(1): 54-63.

Ellis, J, Amjad, A and Deng, J. 2011. 'Interviewing Participants about Past Events: The Helpful Role of Pre-Interview Activities', *In Education*, 17(2).

Feldman, M., Bell, J. & Berger, M. 2003. *Gaining Access: A Practical and Theoretical Guide for Qualitative Researchers*. California: AltaMira Press.

Furedi, F. 2006. *Where have all the Intellectuals Gone?* New York: Continuum.

Given, LM. 2008. *The Sage Encyclopaedia of Qualitative Research Methods*: London: Sage Publications.

Goldsmith, A. 2013. *Higher Education: Economic Benefits and an Examination of Access and Completion Gaps.* London: HarperCollins Publishers.

Gramsci, A. 1971. *The Prison Notebooks*. New York: International Publishers.

Grimes, W. 2008. 'Es'kia Mphahlele, Chronicler of Apartheid, Dies at 88'. *The New York Times,* 31 October: 2008.

Guest, G, Namey, EE and Mitchell, ML. 2013. *Collecting Qualitative Data: A field Manual for Applied Research.* London: Sage Publications.

Hedges, C. 2001. 'Public Lives: Watching Bush's Language, and Television'. *The New York Times,* 13 June: 2001.

Johl, S, K and Renganathan, S. 2010. 'Strategies for Gaining Access in Doing Fieldwork: Reflection of two Researchers', *The Electronic Journal of Business Research Methods,* 8 (1): 42 -50.

Jordan, ZP. 2011. South African History Online: Dr Es'kia Mphahlele. Accessed 03 July 2018, https://www.sahistory.org.za/people/dr-eskia-mphahlele.

Kempner, K and Tierney, WG. 2018. *The Social Role of Higher Education: Comparative Perspectives.* London*:* Routledge.

Kerr, P and Luescher, T. 2018. 'Students' Experiences of University Life Beyond the Curriculum'. In Ashwin, P and Case, J. *Higher Education Pathways: South African Undergraduate Education and the Public Good*. Cape Town: African Minds.

King, ML. 1978. 'The Social Role of Intellectuals: Antonio Gramsci and the Italian Renaissance', *Soundings and Interdisciplinary Journal*, 61(1).

Kirkevold, M and Bergland, A. 2009. 'The Quality of Qualitative Data: Issues to consider when Interviewing Participants who have difficulties providing detailed accounts of their experiences'. *International Journal of Qualitative Studies on Health and Well-being*, 2(2): 68-75.

Kruss, G, Haupt, G and Visser, M. 2016. "Luring the academic soul": Promoting Academic Engagement in South African Universities. '*Higher Education Research and Development',* 35(4): 755-771.

Leibowitz, B. 2012. *Higher Education for the Public Good*. Stellenbosch. Trentham Books.

Lekaba, F. 2016. 'Archie Mafeje: An unforgettable African intellectual giant. Pambazuka News, Voices for Freedom and Justice'. Accessed 25 March 2019, http://www.pambazuka.org./pan-africanism/archie-mafeje-unforgettable-african-intellectual-giant.

Le-Treweek, G and Linkogle, S. 2000. *Danger in Fieldwork*. London. Routledge.

Luescher-Mamashela, TM, Kiiru, S, Mattes, R, Mwollo-ntallima, A, Ng'ethe, N, and Romo, M. 2011. *The university in Africa and democratic citizenship: Hothouse or training ground?* Wynberg: Centre for Higher Education Transformation.

Maistry, M and Thakrar, J. 2012. 'Educating Students for Effective Community Engagement: Students Perspectives on Curriculum Imperative for Universities in South Africa'. *South African Review of Sociology*, 43(2): 58-75.

Mangcu, X. 2014. *Biko: A Life*. London: I. B Tauris & Co. Ltd.

Marshall, C and Rossman, GB. 2016. *Designing Qualitative Research*. Singapore: Sage Publications.

Mayr, E. 2011. *Understanding Human Agency*. New York: Oxford University Press.

McMahon, W. W. 2009. *Higher learning, greater good: The private and social benefits of higher education.* Baltimore: Johns Hopkins Press.

Mkandawire, T. 2005. *African Intellectuals: Rethinking Politics, Language, Gender and Development*. Pretoria: UNISA Press.

Moleke, 2006. *Finding Work: Employment Experiences of South African Graduates*. Cape Town: HSRC Press.

Mphahlele, E and Mphahlele, E. 2002. *Es'kia: Education, African Humanism & Culture, Social Consciousness, Library Appreciation*. California: Kwela Books.

Muller, J, Cloete, N and Van Schalkwyk. 2017. *Castells in Africa: Universities and Development*. Cape Town: African Minds.

Nabudere, DW. 2011. *Achie Mafeje: Scholar, Activist and Thinker*. Pretoria: African Institude of South Africa.

Nakamura, M. 2017. *The Politics of Emancipation: Intellectuals, Everydayness and Philosophy in Gramsci and Tosaka*. Leiden University.

Ndletyana, M. 2008. *African intellectuals in 19th and early 20th century*. Cape Town: HSRC Press.

Neuman, WL. 2014. *Social Research Methods. Qualitative and Quantitative Approaches.* Boston: Allyn and Bacon.

Pante, BLP. 2014. 'Female Researchers in a Masculine Space: Managing Discomforts and Negotiating Positionalities'. *Philippine Sociological Review*, 26, 65-88.

Patton, MQ. 2002. *Qualitative Research and Evaluation Methods*. London: Sage Publications.

Posner, RA. 2001. *Public Intellectuals*. London. Harvard University Press.

Ramphele. M. 1995. *Across Boundaries: The Journey of a South African Woman Leader*. New York: Feminist Press.

Ramphele, M. 2014. *A Passion for Freedom: My Life.* New York: L.B Tauris & Co. Ltd.

Reddy, T. 2004. *Higher Education and Social transformation, South African Case Study*, Cape Town: University of Cape Town.

Said, E. 1978. *Orientalism*. New York: Vintage.

Said, EW. 1996. *Representations of the Intellectual*. New York: A Division of Random House, INC.

Santos, HPO, Black, AM and Sandelowski, M. 2014. 'Timing of Translation in Cross-Language Qualitative Research'. *Qualitative Health Research*, 1-11.

Sephiri, T. 2002. 'The Emergence and Role of Black Intellectuals in the Development of the Development of the Trade Union Movement in South Africa: A Case Study NUMSA'. Unpublished Paper Presented at the 3rd African Regional Congress of the International Industrial Relations Association (IIRA) Employment Relations in a Changing World, Cape Town, South Africa.

Stebbins, RA. 2001. *Exploratory Research in the Social Sciences*. London: Sage Publications.

Swain, H. 2011. 'What are Universities for?' *The Guardian*, 10 October: 2011.

Swartz, DL. 2013. *Symbolic Power, Politics and Intellectuals: The Political Sociology of Pierre Bourdieu*. London: The University of Chicago Press.

Torpey, J. 1995. *Intellectuals, Socialism and Dissent: The East German Opposition and its Legacy*. London: University of Minnesota Press.

Van Nes, F, Abma, T, Jonsson, H and Degg, D. 2010. 'Language Differences in Qualitative Research: Is Meaning Lost in Translation?' *European Journal of Aging*, (7), 313-316.

Walker, M and Fongwa, S. 2017. *Universities, Employability and Human Development*. London. Palgrave McMillan.

Willetts, D. 2017. *A University Education*. New York: Oxford University Press.

Writer, S. 2003. *How your degree can help you get involved in your community.* Accessed 03 April 2003, https://www.cc-sd.edu/blog/how-your-degree-can-help-you-get-involved-in-your-community

Wasserman, J. & Jeffrey, C. 2007 'Accessing Distrustful Populations: Lesson from ethnographic research with street homeless'. Unpublished paper presented at the annual meeting of the American Sociological Association, TBA, New York.

Appendixes

Research Title: **Understanding Hidden Forms of Intellectual Participation: A Study of University of Johannesburg Graduates from Kwa- Thema Township in Ekurhuleni**

Dear prospective participant

My name is Zamaswazi Zondo, a Masters student at the University of Johannesburg, Department of Sociology. I am doing a research study that focuses on understanding hidden forms of intellectual participation among University of Johannesburg Graduates who reside in Kwa- Thema Township, Ekurhuleni. The study aims at finding out the role played by UJ graduates in their respective community using their acquired knowledge, skills and university experience.

You have been identified as one of the suitable participant of this study and your participation will be highly appreciated. Participation in this study is completely voluntary, you are by no means forced to participate. Please feel free to withdraw at any time and do let me know if you are uncomfortable in the whole research process or in responding to a certain question. Please note that no penalty will be held against you if you refuse to participate or any rewards that are going to be given to you by participating in the study.

You will participate in this study by means of an interview that will take approximately 45 minutes to an hour. The interview will be recorded while I also take notes and you are not coerced to be recorded if you are uncomfortable. You can trust that this study will by no means put you in an unsafe situation because the information you will give will be kept safe and your personal details such as your name or address will remain confidential because pseudonyms will be used instead of your real name. The information you will give will be used for my Masters dissertation and the transcripts from the recorded interview will only be accessed by me and my two supervisors, Dr Siphelo Ncwangu and Prof Malehoko Tshoaedi. Should you require any clarity or further information about this study, you can contact me on, 0782425515 or by email, 201308555@student.uj.ac.za or contact one of my supervisors, Dr Siphelo Ncwangu by email on siphelon@uj.ac.za and telephone number: 0115593706 and Prof Malehoko Tshoaedi by email on mtshoaedi@uj.ac.za and telephone number: 0115592884.

Thank you for your participation

Regards
Ms Zamaswazi Zondo

Research Title: **Understanding Hidden Forms of Intellectual Participation: A Study of University of Johannesburg Graduates from Kwa- Thema Township in Ekurhuleni**

I,…………………………………………………………………………… (Participants' full name) hereby agree that I understand what the study is about and happy to participate. I understand that participation in the study is completely voluntary and that no rewards will be offered by participating.

(Please tick in the appropriate box below)
As part of the interview process I agree to be recorded: ☐

I do not agree to be recorded: ☐

Name of participant…………………..…...………

Signature…………………………………………….

Date…………………………………………………..

Interview guide questions

- Please tell me a little bit about yourself, who are you, your social background and when did you graduate?
- Tell me about your whole university experience?
- What would you say you have gained or learned through your university experience?
- How would you say your ideas, values and beliefs have changed through university?
- Through your university experience and what you have gained, how would you say you help or have previously helped others around the community?
- In terms of your degree studied besides your university experience, what knowledge or skills would you say you have gained?
- How have you used that to help someone else in the community?
- What factors influenced your commitment to contribute in the community?

Interview list

The following interview list does not refer to participants real names, pseudonyms were used to protect the identities of participants.

Interviewees

Amanda, female interviewee, 10 January 2019

Mamelo, female interviewee, 19 January 2019

Mandla, male interviewee, 26 December 2018

Nolwazi, female interviewee, 6 January 2019

Sam, male interviewee, 29 January 2019

Thami, male interviewee, 24 January 2019

Thobile, female interviewee, 8 December 2018

Tshepo, male interviewee, 28 November 2018