

A Note on However and Sentence Adverbs: The Preferable Word Order and Co-occurrence Frequency

著者	OTA Yuko
journal or publication title	Journal of International Cultural Studies
volume	26
page range	69-87
year	2020-03-31
URL	http://hdl.handle.net/10097/00127389

A Note on *However* and Sentence Adverbs:

The Preferable Word Order and Co-occurrence Frequency

OTA, Yuko

Abstract

Fraser (1999) mentions that there is a case where the level of acceptability changes due to the word order. Fraser states that “Frankly, however, ...” is less acceptable than “However, frankly....” The exact opposite is claimed by Petersen (1988) and Strunk & White (1999). This paper examines which word order is more preferable; whether *however* comes before sentence adverbs or vice versa. To find it out, Google searches are conducted on combinations of some other sentence adverbs and *however*. The results contradict Fraser. Moreover, the lower acceptability of *frankly* and the other pragmatic markers are confirmed. The number of hits is much smaller than in other pairs. I hypothesize that the reason is redundancy.

[Keywords: acceptability / word order / Co-occurrence / discourse connectives / Sentence Adverbials]

1. Introduction

Fraser (1999) mentions that some examples of discourse markers (hereafter, DMs) are expressions in bold in the following sequences.

- (1) a. A: I like him. B: **So**, you think you'll ask him out then,
b. John can't go. **And** Mary can't go either.
c. Will you go? **Furthermore**, will you represent the class there?
d. Sue left very late. **But** she arrived on time.
e. I think it will fly. **After all**, we built it right. (Fraser 1999, p. 931)

After reviewing previous theoretical research on DMs, Fraser tries to answer what DMs are. To answer the question, four sub-questions are posed. Those questions are:

1. What do DMs relate?
2. What are not DMs?

3. What is the grammatical status of DMs?

4. What are the main classes of DMs?

(Fraser 1999, p. 937)

On the status of DMs, Fraser concludes as follows:

DMs, except for a few idiomatic cases, are expressions drawn from the syntactic classes of conjunctions, adverbials, or prepositional phrases, have the syntactic properties associated with their class membership, have a procedural meaning and have co-occurrence restrictions which are in complementary distribution with their conceptual counterparts.

(*ibid.*, p. 946)

Fraser says, “syntactically, DMs do not constitute a separate syntactic category (p. 943).” For example, “coordinate conjunctions *and*, *but* and *or* function primarily though not exclusively as DMs (p. 943).” Moreover, “subordinate conjunctions such as *so*, *since*, *because* and *while* also function as DMs, although they function in other ways as well (*ibid.*).” See (2).

(2) a. **Since** Christmas, we have had snow every day.

b. The book was **so** good that I read it a second time.

c. You should read **while** doing it.

(*ibid.*, p. 943)

Adverbials as in (3a-b) are used uniquely as a DM, while those as in (3c-f) ambiguously.

(3) a. She won't eat. **Consequently**, she will lose weight.

b. Bill likes to walk. **Conversely**, Sam likes to ride.

c. I believe in fairness. **Equally**, I believe in practicality.

(*ibid.*, p. 943)

d. I treat everyone **equally**.

e. A: I can't see the buoy. B: **Then** don't leave.

f. Will he be able to leave **then**?

(*ibid.*, p. 944)

Fraser continues, “there are prepositional phrases which function uniquely as DMs (p. 944),” as in (4a-b), “and those which are ambiguous (*ibid.*),” as in (4c-f).

(4) a. Harry shut his eyes. **As a consequence**, he missed the bird.

b. You shouldn't do that. **In particular**, you shouldn't touch that brown wire.

c. We should have ice cream for dessert. **After all**, it's my birthday.

- d. He didn't do **after all**.
- e. He didn't want to go. **On the other hand**, he didn't want to stay.
- f. One hand was unadorned. He had a colourful tattoo **on the other hand**.

(ibid., p. 944)

Based on the above examples (2) to (4), Fraser adds that the environments for their different functions are in complementary distribution. In other words, the syntactic environments where an expression functions as a DM are different from those environments where it occurs (p. 944).

Fraser argues that “semantically, there are several aspects to the meaning of an expression when it functions as a DM (p. 944).” According to Fraser, DMs have a core meaning, which is procedural, not conceptual (p. 931), and “an expression with a procedural meaning specifies how the segment it introduces is to be interpreted relative to the prior (p. 944).”

Fraser gives the following example to illustrate that every individual DM has a specific, core meaning (p. 945).

- (5) a. She's good looking. **But** he's ugly as sin.
- b. He's good looking. **But** that isn't going to get him a job in this market.
- c. A: He's late. B: **But** he's not late at all.
- d. You say that Mary is coming. **But** we weren't talking about Mary at all.
- e. A: James is not in his office. B: **But** I just saw him there.

(ibid., p. 945)

Fraser alleges that “the core meaning of simple contrast coupled with the context will render the notion of *but* plus whatever additional Interaction is present (p. 945).” That is, “on one hand, the DM forces a relationship between the segments S2 and S1 by virtue of the DM meaning, while on the other hand, the context, both linguistic and non-linguistic, elaborates and enriches the relationship based on the details present (pp. 945-956).”

Fraser states that, although there are certain exceptions, they signal a relationship between the interpretation of the segment they introduce, S2, and the prior segment, S1 (p. 931). Fraser argues that there are two main classes of DMs below:

- (6) Discourse Markers which relate messages
 - a. Contrastive markers
 - b. Collateral markers
 - c. Inferential markers

d.

(7) Discourse Markers which relate topics

(Ibid., p. 946)

DMs which relate messages in (6) are “those that relate the explicit interpretation conveyed by S2 with some aspect associated with the segment, S1, and DMs which relate topics in (7) are those that relate the topic of S2 to that of S1 (p. 931).”

Here is an example of a topic relating DMs which involves an aspect of discourse management.

(8) This dinner looks delicious. **Incidentally**, where do you shop? (Ibid., p. 949)

Fraser mentions that “*incidentally* signals that S2 is to be interacted as a digression from the topic of S1 (p. 949).”

2. The Purpose of Research

In the conclusion section, Fraser adds, “Even given this progress, there is much we don’t understand.” Then, some questions are raised. One of them is how DMs interact with other pragmatic markers, which constitute an entire, separate message.

As such an example, Fraser shows that there is a case where the level of acceptability can be different due to the order of *however*, which is a DM, and *frankly*, which is one of the pragmatic markers. See (9).

(9) a. **However**, frankly, you didn’t do very well.

b. ? Frankly, **however**, you didn’t do very well. [emphasis added]

(Fraser, 1999, p. 950)

Fraser says that the example (9a) seems acceptable, but that (9b) seems much worse. As one of the questions to be answered in the future, Fraser brings up a question: “Is such co-occurrence a rule-governed, principle-governed, or an idiosyncratic matter? (p. 950)”

Interestingly, however, Petersen’s (1988) and Strunk & White’s (1999) remarks are opposite to Fraser’s. Petersen claims that sentence connectors such as *however* should not be placed at the beginning of the sentence because that makes it sound pretentious or argumentative. Concerning how to use *however*, Strunk & White says, “Avoid starting a sentence with *however* when the meaning is ‘nevertheless.’ The word usually serves better when not in the first position (p. 51),” showing the following examples:

- (10) a. The roads were almost impassable. **However**, we at last succeeded in reaching camp.
b. The roads were almost impassable. At last, **however**, we succeeded in reaching camp.

(Strunk & White, 1999, p. 51)

Strunk & White state that “when *however* comes first, it means ‘in whatever way’ or ‘to whatever extent’ (p. 51)” as shown in the examples (11).

- (11) a. **However** you advise him, he will probably do as he thinks best.
b. **However** discouraging the prospect, they never lost heart. (ibid.)

The problem is that it is not clear whether their observations are based on the objective data or just their intuitions. Therefore, it is necessary to check whether the difference in the acceptability between them can be seen through Google searches¹. This paper examines whether a specific word order is required when *however* and sentence adverbials appear in a sentence and whether it is unique to *frankly* and the same type of ones.

3. Methods

With an aim to find out the answer to the questions that are raised in the previous section, the number of hits for the strings, “*However, frankly*,” and “*Frankly, however*” is counted respectively in both American and British English. The reason is that there can be a difference between American and British English and that Fraser belongs to an American university and Petersen (1988) and Strunk & White (1999) are from the United Kingdom.

For this research, Google is used as a search engine. It is necessary to see whether “*Frankly, however*” is smaller than that for the search string “*However, frankly*.” If so, it can be said that Fraser’s (1999) observation is plausible. If not, however, there is a possibility that Fraser might not be correct.

Concerning the effect of frequency, studies show that participants rated sentences as more acceptable if they had read them earlier and that speakers’ previous experience with the sentences can improve the level of acceptability of similar types of sentences (Luka & Barsalou, 2005; Dąbrowska, 2010 as cited in Hsu & Hsieh, 2013, pp. 93-94). If the number of hits for words or phrases is large, people are more likely to be exposed to the expressions and then the level of acceptability will be higher.

It is predicted that the words which are classified into the same group have the same tendency to some degree. For the sake of the research on whether the same difference in the

level of acceptability as (11) can be observed in pairs of *however* and other sentence adverbs, the same method is adopted. The words which are chosen as sentence adverbs are *honestly*, *regretfully*, *certainly*, *apparently*, and *fortunately* for the purpose of comparing one from the same group as *frankly* with some in the group different from it. Although they are classified as one group of commentary pragmatic markers by Fraser², Swan (1988) argues that they can be divided into three groups. Swan classifies *frankly* and *honestly* as speech-act adverbs (p. 64), *apparently* and *clearly* as evidential modal adverbs (p. 451), and (*Un*) *fortunately* as an evaluative adverb (p. 464). Although *regretfully* is not taken up in Swan's list, it will fall under evaluative adverbs.

4. Results

To see if Fraser's (1999) observation can be verified, I counted the number of hits for the search strings, "*However, frankly*," and "*Frankly, however*." The example (12) was found as one of "*Frankly, however*." The example (13) is one example of "*However, frankly*." (Henceforth, in all the examples found through Google searches, the emphasis is added by the author.)

- (12) There's more holding back IoT. Berg analyst Kurkinen said smart devices would be more useful to consumers if they got along better. Such interoperability would mean that as you "leave your home and lock your front door, your door lock could tell your thermostat to switch to 'away mode' and turn off the lights," he noted. "**Quite frankly, however**, there are very many standards and initiatives related to interoperability and.... ("The Internet of Things: Convenience at a Price," 2015, March, 30, "Not Easy, and Not Cheap," para. 3)
- (13) This professor may have told the student that she wasn't good at math, and may perhaps even have displayed some subtly discriminatory attitudes in the classroom. **However, frankly**, the chances are nil that anyone with the mental equipment to obtain a professorship at Stanford University would, in the late 1980s in as politicized an atmosphere as an elite university, blithely tell a black student that black people cannot do math. (McWhorter, n.d., "Stories of Victimology," para. 2)

As can be seen from Tables 1 and 2, which are the results of Google searches, the number of hits is small but surely both strings are used. It is confirmed that there are some cases where "*Frankly, however*" is used. What is more, the ratio of hits for it in each country is larger than that of "*However, frankly*."

Table 1: The Number of Hits for the String “*Frankly, however*”

America		Britain	
Harvard University	7	Oxford University	1
New York Times	4	The Guardian	3
Washington Post	0	The Independent	2
USA Today	0	The Telegraph	6
edu	81	ac.uk	17
gov.	32	gov.	26
Total	124	Total	55

Table 2: The Number of Hits for the String “*However, frankly*”

America		Britain	
Harvard University	0	Oxford University	0
New York Times	1	The Guardian	1
Washington Post	0	The Independent	0
USA Today	0	The Telegraph	1
edu	20	ac.uk	14
gov.	13	gov.	9
Total	34	Total	25

These results contradict Fraser’s observation in both American and British English.

The second question is whether the same difference in the acceptability as (11) can be seen in other combinations of *however* and sentence adverbs or not. The first one is the combination of *however* and *honestly*, whose examples are shown below:

- (14) In the aftermath of the 2010 earthquake in Haiti, many Haitians have looked not toward the U.S., France, and Canada as history might suggest, but within the Latin American region, attracted by the economic stability of countries like Chile and Brazil in the Southern Cone. **Honestly, however**, the pressure to produce a 40-page paper (in Spanish) on this topic by the end of the semester has been quite demanding.

(Randolph, 2015, May 12, para. 1)

- (15) Interviewer: Which channels do you watch? Rasheed’s father: In general we watch Arabic most of the time. **However, honestly**, we watch certain channels because we like their

ethics. We want the channel to teach the culture and the habits of the community to our children. (Mechanic, 2015, p. 153)

Tables 3 and 4 show the results of hits for the combination of *however* and *honestly*. The total number of hits for the combination is much smaller than that of “*Frankly, however*” and “*However, frankly*.”

Table 3 : The Number of Hits for the String “*Honestly, however*”

America		Britain	
Harvard University	0	Oxford University	2
USA Today	1	The Guardian	2
The Washington Times	0	The Telegraph	0
edu	21	ac.uk	8
gov.	4	gov.	0
Total	26	Total	12

Table 4 : The Number of Hits for the String “*However, honestly*”

America		Britain	
Harvard University	1	Oxford University	0
USA Today	0	The Guardian	1
The Washington Times	0	The Telegraph	0
edu	12	ac.uk	11
gov.	6	gov.	0
Total	19	Total	12

In American English, the number of hits for “*Honestly, however*” is larger than that of the reversed word order. In British English, on the other hand, the number of hits for both cases is the same. These results also contradict Fraser.

The next tables indicate the results of the search strings “*Regretfully, however*” and “*However, regretfully*.” The examples (16) and (17) are samples from Google searches.

- (16) The group said: “At the end of a very difficult year, Alton Towers Resort has confirmed a proposed restructure of the business to be completed in time for the opening of the new season in March 2016. **Regretfully however**, it may result in the loss of up to 190 salaried jobs across the resort. (Hellebore, 2015, para. 4)

- (17) **However, regretfully**, we were unable to complete the call as County staff recommended directly sending the review. (Boswell, 2009, para. 1)

Tables 5 and 6 show the number of search results. The total number of hits for “*Regretfully, however*” and “*However, regretfully*” is also much smaller than those of the combinations of *however* and *frankly*.

Table 5 : The Number of Hits for the String “*Regretfully, however*”

America		Britain	
Harvard University	1	Oxford University	0
USA Today	0	The Guardian	2
The Washington Times	0	The Telegraph	0
edu	45	ac.uk	36
gov.	15	gov.	5
Total	61	Total	43

Table 6 : The Number of Hits for the String “*However, regretfully*”

America		Britain	
Harvard University	1	Oxford University	0
USA Today	0	The Guardian	1
The Washington Times	0	The Telegraph	0
edu	9	ac.uk	12
gov.	5	gov.	10
Total	15	Total	23

In the number of hits, “*Regretfully, however*” exceeds “*However, regretfully*” in both American and British English. This is also contradictory to Fraser’s observation.

Next, here are the results of the search strings, “*Certainly, however*” and “*However, certainly*.” Samples from Google searches are as follows:

- (18) **Certainly, however**, there was politics: political ideology, pumped in particular from the Centre for Policy Studies, which said that markets were a good thing; and there was Ken Baker’s political agenda. (“Political Coup Bred Educational Disaster,” 1999, “Struggling schools,” para. 1)
- (19) Clerk-Treasurer Rhodes said not in the way our accounts are structured. **However**,

certainly, the persons who are involved in these transactions are being charged substantially by the bank. (“City of West Lafayette Common Council Pre-Council Minutes,” 2005, “Ordinance No. 33-05”)

Tables 7 and 8 show the number of hits for the search strings “*Certainly, however*” and “*However, certainly*.” Compared with the results of the other three combinations which we have seen above, the number of hits for them is much larger. It is clear that something is different from the other three combinations of *however* and *frankly*, *honestly*, or *regretfully*. The total number of hits for “*Certainly, however*.” and “*However, certainly*” is much larger than those of the combinations of *however* and *frankly*.

Table 7 : The Number of Hits for the String “*Certainly, however*”

America		Britain	
Harvard University	17	Oxford University	5
USA Today	0	The Guardian	7
The Washington Times	1	The Telegraph	3
edu	148	ac.uk	243
gov.	80	gov.	72
Total	246	Total	330

Table 8 : The Number of Hits for the String “*However, certainly*”

America		Britain	
Harvard University	7	Oxford University	5
USA Today	0	The Guardian	9
The Washington Times	0	The Telegraph	3
edu	24	ac.uk	62
gov.	33	gov.	100
Total	64	Total	179

As for the difference because of the word order, in both American and British English, far more cases of *however* coming after *certainly* were found than that of *however* coming before *certainly*.

The examples of the combination of *apparently* and *however* which I found through Google searches are shown below.

- (20) That, at any rate, is the impression given by military payroll records released by the Bush administration on Tuesday. **Apparently, however**, Lt Bush’s superiors at Ellington didn’t see it that way. (Goldenberg & Burkeman, 2004, para. 1)
- (21) Because the environment around Io has very high radiation, this mode was implemented to provide additional protection against corruption of the images due to radiation-induced noise. **However, apparently** due to accumulated radiation damage to the camera electronics, this readout mode did not function properly during the flyby. (“Original Caption Released with Image,” n.d., para. 2)

Results for the search strings “*Apparently, however*,” and “*However, apparently*” are shown in Tables 9 and 10.

Table 9 : The Number of Hits for the String “*Apparently, however*”

America		Britain	
Harvard University	21	Oxford University	9
USA Today	3	The Guardian	17
The Washington Times	9	The Telegraph	7
edu	130	ac.uk	310
gov.	99	gov.	16
Total	262	Total	359

Table 10: The Number of Hits for the String “*However, apparently*”

America		Britain	
Harvard University	13	Oxford University	6
USA Today	1	The Guardian	7
The Washington Times	3	The Telegraph	5
edu	49	ac.uk	91
gov.	33	gov.	33
Total	99	Total	142

The tables show that the number of hits for them is much larger than those of the other three sentence adverbs, *frankly*, *honestly*, and *regretfully* just as the previous one, *certainly*.

The tendency for *however* to follow sentence adverbs is also confirmed in both a American and British English.

The next search strings are “*Fortunately, however*” and “*However, fortunately*.” Examples of

each case through Google searches are shown in (22) and (23).

(22) This is Don Juan at the end of his tether, an exhausted husk of a man with nothing to draw on. **Fortunately, however**, the film is visually elegant and constantly droll.

(French, 2005, para. 10)

(23) One has to rely on the few sporadic small-scale surveys and studies from individual states. **However, fortunately**, the National University of Educational Planning and Administration (NUEPA) carried out a two year study of government school teachers across nine Indian states in 2014-15, ...

(Kingdon, 2017, p. 23)

Tables 11 and 12 show the number of hits. The tables show that the number of hits for them is also much larger than those of the first three sentence adverbs, *frankly*, *honestly*, and *regretfully* just as *certainly*.

Table 11: The Number of Hits for the String “*Fortunately, however*”

America		Britain	
Harvard University	97	Oxford University	80
USA Today	4	The Guardian	38
The Washington Times	12	The Telegraph	39
edu	233	ac.uk	329
gov.	107	gov.	175
Total	453	Total	661

Table 12: The Number of Hits for the String “*However, fortunately*”

America		Britain	
Harvard University	14	Oxford University	8
USA Today	0	The Guardian	6
The Washington Times	1	The Telegraph	3
edu	81	ac.uk	214
gov.	39	gov.	1
Total	135	Total	232

Concerning the difference depending on the word order, the same pattern as most of the other cases is seen. There is no difference in the pattern between American and British English.

To sum up, it is noticeable that all the cases of *however* following the sentence adverbs

outnumber those of the reversed word order. On top of this, it is important to note that there are a smaller number of hits for the combinations of *however* and *frankly*, *honestly*, or *regretfully*.

5. Discussion

As shown in the previous section, in all the pairs, the ratios of hits for the search strings where the sentence adverbs precede *however* are larger than those of the reversed word order. The results verify Petersen's (1988) observation, but not Fraser (1999). Furthermore, there is no big difference between American and British English in the tendency for *however* to be placed after sentence adverbs.

Then, another question to be discussed here is in what context each word order is preferable. As mentioned in section 2, Petersen claims that sentence connectors such as *however* should be placed at the beginning of the sentence in a logical argument or an argumentative context. Documents by governments or in educational institutions are supposed to be formal and logic must be clear. If Petersen is right, in such contexts, *however* in the sentence-initial position should be preferable, but in reality, it is not. The number of hits is indeed larger in websites of governments or educational institutions than in the newspapers and magazines, but the number of hits for the strings where *however* occurs after sentence adverbs is larger than that of the reversed word order.

Concerning the case where sentence adverbs occur in the initial position of the sentence, Csüry (2013, p. 102) states as follows:

In order to avoid misleading local connections between neighboring text units, writers (or probably speakers) put a thematic marker or a framing adverbial in the sentence-initial position and relegate the connective to specific adverbial positions inside or at the end of the sentence. (Csüry, 2013, p. 102)

With regard to sentence adverbs placed at the end of the sentence, Yasui (1982) mentions that they are added there as an afterthought or to be emphasized in order to show that they are emphasized.

(24) a. *To be sure*, he is satisfied.

b. He is satisfied, *to be sure*.

(Yasui, 1992, p. 288)

Judging from the results, it seems to be more preferable that sentence adverbs come after

however. As predicted, the results show that the words which are classified into the same group have the same tendency, but it contradicts Fraser's indication.

The next topic which I would like to discuss is about the results that clearly show a smaller number of hits for the combinations of *however* and *frankly*, *honestly*, or *regretfully*. It can be hypothesized that the cause of the results must be the redundancy.

The lower level of acceptability because of redundancy is observed not only by Quirk et al. (1985), who argue that it is undesirable for *but* to be used with *however* at the same time in a sentence but also by Araki et al. (1985, p. 543), who also state that the co-occurrence of *but* and *however* as shown in (25) is verbose in literary style and should be avoided.

(25) *But* these plans, *however*, cannot be carried out without money.

(Araki et al. 1985:543)

Morris ed. (1969, p. 261) remarks that too much contrast can ruin a sentence and that the contrastive conjunction *but* is redundant when used with *however*. Morris ed. also observes that it is hard to justify the sentence illustrated below (ibid.).

(26) ***But*** the army, ***however***, went on with its plans.

(Morris ed., 1969, p. 261)

In a colloquial style, *however* sometimes follows just after *but*. Quirk et al. (1985, p. 643) indicate that emphatic endorsement by conjunct co-occurrence of the same class is more characteristic of loose informal talk rather than formal writings.

Seemingly, *honestly* and *regretfully* appear in a context similar to *frankly*, where they seem to be used to connect two contradictory statements. *The Collins English Dictionary* says that "You use *frankly* when you are expressing an opinion or feeling to emphasize that you mean what you are saying, especially when the person you are speaking to may not like it." See the examples in (27), which are given in the dictionary.

(27) a. 'You don't give a damn about my feelings, do you.'-- 'Quite *frankly*, I don't.'

b. *Frankly*, Thomas, this question of your loan is beginning to worry me.

c. I was *frankly* astonished at the singer's interpretation of the song.

[italics added]

As you know, the sentence connector *however* also signals the reader or listener to find a contradiction. That is why the co-occurrence is undesirable.

On the other hand, the sentence adverbs *certainly*, *apparently*, and *fortunately* occur in both contexts where the proceeding statement is contradictory to the preceding statement and where it is not. Take *certainly* as an example. *The Collins English Dictionary's* definition of it is that "You use *certainly* to emphasize what you are saying when you are making a statement." See (28) and (29).

- (28) September brings a change in seasons and a chance to remember. A dozen years have passed since the day the twin towers fell, but we never look at a bright-blue, clear September sky quite the same way, **and** *certainly* each September 11 anniversary gives us pause. [emphasis and italics added] (Sonenshine, 2013, para. 1)
- (29) Don't forget to create some of your own rocks to hide. Should you decide to do so, on the back, write in permanent pen or paint, "Take picture and post on Facebook in 'Onslow Rocks' group. Rehide." **But**, *certainly*, if you do find a painted rock that you can't seem to part with, keep it. [emphasis and italics added] (Didonato, 2017, para. 5)

The Collins English Dictionary defines a sentence adverb *apparently* as "it appears that; as far as one knows; seemingly."

- (30) Then Trump rashly accepted the idea of a face-to-face meeting on June 12, without adequate preparations **and** *apparently* based on the delusion that North Korea would simply hand over its nuclear weapons [emphasis and italics added]. (Kristof, 2018, para 14)
- (31) Don't skip drinking during exercise in hot weather, a new study reminds us. This advice might seem obvious. **But** *apparently* some athletes, especially in team sports, have begun to eschew fluids during hot weather workouts, in hopes that the privation might somehow make them stronger [emphasis and italics added]. (Reynolds, 2018, para 1-2)

The Collins English Dictionary says that *fortunately* is used to introduce or make a statement about an event or situation that is good.

- (32) From Germany we flew to England just before the start of World War II **and**, *fortunately*, after some months in Britain, the family arrived safely by boat in New York Harbor. We debarked on Jan. 3, 1940, at Ellis Island [emphasis and italics added]. (Gutstein, 1985, November 24, para 2)

- (33) They hid the affair, of course, **but** *fortunately* for them Schwob's divorced father married Suzanne's widowed mother in 1917, making them stepsisters [emphasis and italics added]. (D'Erasmus, 2018, para 1)

Examples (28), (30) and (32) have a coordinating conjunction *and*. In the context, no contradiction can be confirmed between the segments which it connects. Examples (29), (31) and (33) have a coordinating conjunction *but*, which is used to introduce a contradiction. Note that *certainly*, *apparently*, and *fortunately* do not contain the meaning of "contrary to expectations," judging from those definitions. Therefore, there is no redundancy in the co-concurrence of the sentence adverb and *however*. It will be true of the rest of the said sentence adverbs.

6. Conclusion

Fraser (1999) mentions that the level of acceptability can differ because of the order of the sentence connector *however* and the sentence adverb *frankly*. In this research, however, Fraser's observation was not verified by the findings through Google searches. As for six combinations in total, as predicted, the same tendency was confirmed: the cases of *however* following the sentence adverbs were found more often than those of the reversed word order in both formal and less formal writings.

The results of Google searches showed that the number of hits for the combinations of some pragmatic markers and *however* is smaller than those of the others. My conclusion is that the reason is the redundancy in meaning. Both *however* and sentence adverbs are used in the contradictory context. Generally speaking, therefore, their co-occurrence should be avoided. The rest of the pragmatic markers do not have such a constraint on the context. That is why their co-concurrence is more acceptable.

Notes

1. The reason for using Google searches is that there are no hits at all in Corpus of Contemporary American English and Time Magazine Corpus.
2. Fraser's definition of commentary pragmatic markers is as follows:

Frankly, *obviously*, and *stupidly* do not signal a two-placed relationship between the adjacent discourse segments, but rather signal a comment, a separate message, that relates to the following segment. These are commentary pragmatic makers. (p. 942)

References

- Application Form for Admission Doctor of Liberal Studies Program. (n.d.). Southern Methodist University. Retrieved January 28, 2020, from <https://www.smu.edu/-/media/Site/Simmons/MLS/PDF/DLSApplicationApril2015.pdf?la=en>
- Brigety Reuben Robinson Lecture. (2017, February). Retrieved from http://www.gspia.pitt.edu/Portals/0/General_PDF/Brigety%20Reuben%20Robinson%20Lecture%20Feb%202017.pdf?ver=2017-02-15-152927-520
- City of West Lafayette Common Council Pre-Council Minutes. (2005, December 1). Retrieved from <https://www.westlafayette.in.gov/government/minutes/cc120105.htm>
- Close, R.A. (1975). *A Reference Grammar for Students of English*. London: Longman
- Csűry, I. (2013). Connectives and Discourse Markers: Describing Structural and Pragmatical Markers in the Framework of Textology. *Officina Textologica 18: Fifteen Years of Research in Text Linguistics, the Officina Textologica Project*, 83-106. Debreceni Egyetemi Kiadó–Debrecen University Press, Debrecen.
- Dąbrowska, Ewa (2010). Naive v. expert intuitions: An empirical study of acceptability judgments. *The Linguistic Review 27*, 1-23.
- D'Erasmus, S. (2018, August 17). Stepsisters, Lovers and Gender-Bending Artists, Now Celebrated in a Novel. *The New York Times*. Retrieved from <https://www.nytimes.com/2018/08/17/books/review/rupert-thomson-never-anyone-but-you.html>
- Didonato, T. (2017, June 17). Katie Dodge Rocks Onslow County with Hidden Surprises. *The Washington Times*. Retrieved from <https://www.washingtontimes.com/news/2017/jun/17/katie-dodge-rocks-onslow-county-with-hidden-surpri/>
- Fraser, B. (1999). What are discourse markers? *Journal of Pragmatics 31*, 931-952.
- French, P. (2005, October 23). Son and Lovers. *The Guardian*. Retrieved from <https://www.theguardian.com/theobserver/2005/oct/23/features.review27>
- Goldenberg, S. & Burkeman, O. (2004, February 12). George's War. *The Guardian*. Retrieved from <https://www.theguardian.com/world/2004/feb/12/uselections2004.usa2>
- Gutstein, D.W. (1985, November 24). Long Island opinion; Tasting Turkey and Freedom. *The New York Times*. Retrieved from <https://www.nytimes.com/1985/11/24/nyregion/long-island-opinion-tasting-turkey-and-free>
- Hellebore, D. (2015, November 9). Alton Towers to Make up to 190 Staff Redundant. *The Guardian*. Retrieved from <https://www.theguardian.com/business/2015/nov/09/alton-towers-to-make-up-to-190-staff-redundant>
- Hsu, C. & Hsieh, S. C. (2013). The Effects of Syntactic Knowledge and Extra-Grammatical Factors on Sentence Acceptability Judgement: An Empirical Study on Chinese Topic Constructions. *Taiwan Journal of Linguistics* Vol. 11.1, 91-124.
- In The Court of Appeals of Iowa. (2007, May 23). Retrieved from https://www.iowacourts.gov/media/documents/7345_3FDE13C181AF5.pdf
- Kingdon, G. G. (2017). The private schooling phenomenon in India: A review. Retrieved September 23, 2018, from <https://www.csae.ox.ac.uk/materials/papers/csae-wps-2017-04.pdf>

- James, S. (2013, December 27). Ole Gunnar Solskjaer the Target after Cardiff City Sack Malky Mackay. Retrieved from <https://www.theguardian.com/football/2013/dec/27/malky-mackay-sacked-cardiff>
- Jefferson, T. (1792, November 6). From Thomas Jefferson to the Mayor and Municipality of Marseilles. Retrieved from <https://founders.archives.gov/documents/Jefferson/01-24-02-0551>
- Luka, Barbara J., and Lawrence W. Barsalou. (2005). Structural facilitation: Mere exposure effects for grammatical acceptability as evidence for syntactic priming in comprehension. *Journal of Memory and Language* 52, 436-459.
- Matsui, C. (2002). *Eigogaku Gairon*. (2nd ed.). Tokyo: Asahishuppansha.
- McWhorter, J. H. (n.d.). Losing the Race: Self-Sabotage in Black America. *The New York Times*. Retrieved September 24, 2018, from <http://www.nytimes.com/books/first/m/mcwhorter-race.html>
- Mechanic, S. (2015). A Study of Language Use, Language Attitudes and Identities in Two Arabic Speaking Communities in the UK. Retrieved January 28, 2020, from <http://etheses.whiterose.ac.uk/10502/1/Sanaa%20Bichani%20thesis%202015.pdf>
- Memorandum of Conversation, (1946, May 9). *Foreign Relations of the United States, 1950, Western Europe, Volume III*. Retrieved September 23, 2018, from <https://history.state.gov/historicaldocuments/frus1946v08/d782>
- Original Caption Released with Image. (n.d.). Retrieved September 23, 2018, from <https://photojournal.jpl.nasa.gov/catalog/PIA02517>
- Petersen, M. (1988). *Nihonjin no Eigo*. Tokyo: Iwanamishoten.
- Political Coup Bred Educational Disaster. (1999, September 16). *The Guardian*. Retrieved from <https://www.theguardian.com/uk/1999/sep/16/nickdavies>
- Randolph, M. (2015, May 12). Traveling within Chile: Northern Deserts and Southern Lakes. Retrieved from <https://amherstglobaleducationblog.sites.amherst.edu/2015/traveling-within-chile-northern-deserts-and-southern-lakes/>
- Report of the National Commission on Technology, Automation, and Economic Progress. (1966, February). Retrieved September 23, 2018, from <https://files.eric.ed.gov/fulltext/ED023803.pdf>
- Scrivener, S. (n.d.). The Art Object does not Embody a Form of Knowledge. Coventry University. UK. Retrieved September 24, 2018, from https://www.herts.ac.uk/_data/assets/pdf_file/0008/12311/WPIAAD_vol2_scrivener.pdf
- Sentence Connectors (n.d.). *Collins Free Online English Dictionary*. Harper Collins Publishers. Retrieved September 23, 2018, from <https://www.collinsdictionary.com/dictionary/english/sentence-connector>
- Sonenshine, T. D. (2013, September 11). Sonenshine: Personifying America outside the Perimeter: Diplomats Gamble with their Lives to Win Friends. *The Washington Times*. Retrieved from <https://www.washingtontimes.com/news/2013/sep/11/sonenshine-personifying-america-outside-the-perime/>
- Strunk, W. Jr. & White, E. B. (1999). *The Elements of Style*. (4th ed.). Longman.
- Swan, T. (1988). *Sentence adverbials in English: A synchronic and diachronic investigation*. Oslo: Novus.
- The Internet of Things: Convenience at a Price. (2015, March, 30). *The Guardian*.

Retrieved from

<https://www.theguardian.com/technology/2015/mar/30/internet-of-things-convenience-price-privacy-security>

The Players Cannot Help Counsel; They'll Tell All. (n.d.).

Retrieved January 28, 2020, from <http://ota.ox.ac.uk/text/5224.html>

The Secretary of State to Certain Diplomatic Offices. (1950). *Foreign Relations of the United States, 1950, Western Europe, Volume III*. Retrieved January 28, 2020, from <https://history.state.gov/historicaldocuments/frus1950v03/d92>

Uchida, S. (2007). Bun wo Koeta Bumpo. *A New Introduction to English Linguistics*. Tokyo: Eihosha.

Yasui, M. (1992). *A Better Guide to English Grammar*. (2nd ed.). Tokyo: Kaitakusha.

(太田裕子 東北大学大学院国際文化研究科言語コミュニケーション論講座 修了生)