



Mythopoeic Society

mythLORE

A Journal of J.R.R. Tolkien, C.S. Lewis,  
Charles Williams, and Mythopoeic Literature

---

Volume 1  
Issue 4

Article 1

---

January 1974

## The Decline and Fall of the Osgiliathian Empire

James D. Allan

Follow this and additional works at: <https://dc.swosu.edu/mythpro>



Part of the [English Language and Literature Commons](#)

---

### Recommended Citation

Allan, James D. (1974) "The Decline and Fall of the Osgiliathian Empire," *Mythcon Proceedings*: Vol. 1 : Iss. 4 , Article 1.

Available at: <https://dc.swosu.edu/mythpro/vol1/iss4/1>

This Article is brought to you for free and open access by the Mythopoeic Society at SWOSU Digital Commons. It has been accepted for inclusion in Mythcon Proceedings by an authorized editor of SWOSU Digital Commons. An ADA compliant document is available upon request. For more information, please contact [phillip.fitzsimmons@swosu.edu](mailto:phillip.fitzsimmons@swosu.edu).

SWOSU<sup>TM</sup>

---

## Mythcon 51: The Mythic, the Fantastic, and the Alien

Albuquerque, New Mexico • Postponed to: July 30 – August 2, 2021



### Abstract

Taking Tolkien's statement that hobbits lingered in "the North-West of the Old World" as its basis, this paper examines the fauna, organization of human culture, development of armor and so on in Middle-earth to place it in the "heroic age" of Europe and to identify Gondor with Rome. The author further identifies the function of the Elves and their protected kingdoms with the monasteries that preserved cultural memories through the Dark Ages. Consideration is given to the nonmedieval culture of the Shire, the fact that Aragorn does not map precisely onto any particular ruler of this period, and what these anomalies mean.

### Keywords

Tolkien, J.R.R.—Characters—Elves; Tolkien, J.R.R.—Settings—Middle-earth—Geography; Tolkien, J.R.R.—Settings—Middle-earth—Sources;

# THE DECLINE AND FALL OF THE OSGILIATHIAN EMPIRE

by

James D. Allan

A question often arising in the minds of Tolkien's readers is that of the location of Middle-earth, both in time and in space. One valid answer is that Middle-earth exists nowhere in no-time, except as an imaginative construct in the minds of Tolkien and his readers. But this can be said of all fiction, and evades the intent of the question.

So, I rephrase it in this fashion: When and where are the events related in the books supposed to have happened? To this Tolkien does give an answer, where he says, "Those days, the Third Age of Middle-earth, are long past, and the shape of all lands has been changed; but the regions in which Hobbits then lived were doubtless the same as those in which they still linger: the North-West of the Old World, east of the Sea." (I:11/21) That is to say, the story is set in Europe, as it is imagined to have been in some remote prehistoric era. This kind of answer has been most fully developed by Margaret M. Howes in her superb article: "The Elder Ages and the Later Glaciations of the Pleistocene Epoch" in *Tolkien Journal* #8. She identifies the rule of Morgoth with the short pre-Wurm glaciation, placing his overthrow 95,000 years before the present at the sudden end of this "little ice age." Thus the War of the Ring is dated 88,538 years before the present. The article includes maps showing the probable appearances of Europe before, during, and after the four ages spoken of in *The Lord of the Rings*.

However, there is yet a third answer to the posed question, arrived at by considering the zoological and cultural features of Tolkien's world. First the zoological: there is not a single mention of the formerly common, and now extinct, fauna which roamed Europe during the Pleistocene. There are no sabre-tooth tigers, no wild aurochs (unless perhaps the kine of Araw are such), and no mammoths (though the *mûmak* of Harad is said to be larger than the present-day elephant (II:269/341)). Instead we find the foxes, rabbits, otters, and badgers of our modern European countryside along with the wolves and bears which were common in a slightly older Europe, and horses large and sturdy enough to be used extensively as a riding animal. This same modern picture is seen when human culture is surveyed. Except for small isolated groups like the Woses of Druadan Forest and the Lossoth of the far north we find not a primitive hunting and gathering society with Stone Age technology, but rather an agricultural Iron Age culture, and a very advanced one at that.

In the poem "The Hoard" (T. B:53) Tolkien traces the decline of the Elves to the appearance of iron in the lines:

But their doom fell and their song waned,  
by iron hewn and by steel chained.  
Greed that sang not, nor with mouth smiled,  
in dark holes their wealth piled,  
graven silver and carven gold:  
over Elvenhome the shadow rolled.

We are informed that this poem reflects "the heroic days at the end of the First Age" (T. B:8), and I suspect the passage quoted refers to the stealing of Elvish treasure by Morgoth, whose close connection with iron is evidenced

by his Iron Crown in which were set the stolen Silmarils, and by Angband, a land or fortress in the territory ruled by Morgoth whose name contains the Elvish root ANG meaning "iron". (I:206/260; II:321/408) The point of this digression is that iron had been known and used for at least 6,462 years before the War of the Ring, by which time bronze weapons and tools seem to have disappeared almost completely. At least Tolkien never mentions them. Therefore, it can be stated that the War of the Ring occurred during the Iron Age at a time by which the use of iron had been universal for ages.

The era can be further pinned down by a consideration of the types of armor worn. With few exceptions armored men are equipped with a mail coat and helm and bear a round shield. This is the standard garb of the Rohirrim. The Dwarves of the Iron Hills also wore on their legs "hose of a fine and flexible metal mesh, the secret of whose making was possessed by Dain's people." (H:289/263) The use of plate seems to have been very limited. The sole clear reference to it occurs when we are told that prince Imrahil, when he comes upon the body of Eowyn, "held up the bright-burnished vembrace that was upon his arm before her cold lips". (III:121/147) His followers, the knights of Dol Amroth, are said to be "in full harness" which also suggests some sort of plate in addition to mail. (III:43/50)

Now mail, real chain mail, though it appeared here and there throughout the Roman period, only began to become the most popular type of armament in Europe around the fourth century, and was almost the only type of armor used in Europe from about the seventh to the eleventh century: the great Age of Mail. It is this period, often called the Dark Ages, which provides the closest parallels with the end of the Third Age of Middle-earth.

Besides armor there are many other common features shared by the historical Dark Age and the fabulous Third Age of Middle-earth. For instance, it is common knowledge that the magical background and supernatural apparatus for *The Lord of the Rings* is drawn chiefly from Teutonic myth and legend with some intermingling of Celtic material. One example: in the Icelandic Eddas there are three "divine" races: the *Æsir*, the *Vanir*, and the *Elves*. This threefold division approximates the Tolkien hierarchy of Valar, Eldar, and East Elves. Also in the Eddas we find not only the divine race of Light Elves, but also a race of subterranean Dark Elves differentiated from the Dwarfs who are sometimes called Black Elves.<sup>2</sup> Tolkien's Orcs appear to correspond to these Dark Elves, since they live beneath the ground like the Dwarves, yet were believed to have been made in the Great Darkness by the Enemy in mockery of Elves. (II:89/113) The trolls also derive from Teutonic myth. The name *Eärendil* in various forms was a Teutonic star name.<sup>3</sup> *Beorn* in *The Hobbit* resembles both the genuine werewolf of Norse legend and the wild "berserkr" fighters of both legend and true history.

Again it is no secret that the names of the Rohirrim are no more nor less than authentic Anglo-Saxon.<sup>4</sup> It is true that Tolkien claims to have substituted the Anglo-Saxon names for other real names (III:414/517), but this is an obvious piece of rationalizing to make credible his pretense

that all is occurring before the dawn of history. The Dwarfish names are similarly of Old Norse, Frisian, and Low German origin, most of them drawn directly from the *Eddas*, and the rest composed on the same pattern.<sup>5</sup>

What bearing do these names have on the question of dating the War of the Ring? Well, most of the extant Icelandic and Germanic mythological and legendary tales which do not occur in a vague mythological "dream time" concern people and events from a very narrow period, that between late fourth and early seventh centuries.

The Siegfried story, which formed a center for other originally independent tales, is a prime example. The slaughter of the Burgundian kings by Etzel/Atli the Hun is in part based on the historical destruction of Worms by the Huns in 437. Sigebert, King of Austrasia, who took to wife a Visigothic princess named Brunhilda, and whose career had other parallels to that of the legendary Siegfried, died in 575. Late versions introduce into the story a certain Dietrich von Berne, a legendary development of the historic Roman Emperor Theodoric the Goth who reigned from 493 to 526, and who was the centre of his own legend cycle. Ermanaric, a king of the Ostrogoths, who took his own life about 374, appears in the Dietrich legends as Dietrich's wicked uncle who usurped the imperial throne, and in the northern versions of the Siegfried legend as Jormunrek who married Siegfried's daughter Swanhild.<sup>6</sup> The Beowulf story and numerous other lesser known tales also fall within this period.

Even the Celtic element in Tolkien's creation is to some extent connected with this time period. Except for saint legends Welsh and Irish traditions and stories were almost completely unknown to the rest of Europe in their pure forms, until the last century. However some stories in distorted form and a large body of Celtic themes did enter the general European consciousness through the extraordinarily popular Arthurian tales. Though almost immediately taken over and remodeled, indeed recreated, by the French romancers to their own taste, these tales of knight-hood and courtly love still retained in bleached and garbled forms motifs closely identified with Celtic legend and myth -- motifs such as that of the fairy mistress, the journey to the other world castle, the battle at the ford, and the hunting of the fabulous beast.

And Arthur himself of course belongs to the period in question. The *Annales Cambriae* place the Battle of Badon in 516 and that of Camlann where Arthur and Medraud fell in 537.<sup>7</sup> Geoffrey of Monmouth dates this latter battle to 542.<sup>8</sup> *La Quête du Saint Graal* dates the beginning of the quest for the Holy Grail to 454 years after the crucifixion,<sup>9</sup> that is 487 according to standard medieval chronology.

But enough of dates. I believe the point has by now been made that there was an historical "heroic age" in Europe about which many of the traditions used by Tolkien had crystallized. Thus, Tolkien's Middle-earth reflects the political, cultural, and technological features of this era, partly as seen through the eyes of the medieval poets and romancers through whose works material based on this period have been preserved, and partly as it actually was as seen through the eyes of more contemporary chroniclers and modern historians. For Tolkien has not only followed the legends set in this time, but has also turned to authentic history.

I do not mean to suggest that he purposely followed history in a sort of allegory, but rather that when writing of cultures and races paralleling those of both the legendary and historical European Dark Age he was led, in part unconsciously perhaps, to parallel also the history of that period.

First, I think there can be no argument that Gondor is to be identified with Rome, especially when Rome is understood to mean not only the physical city of Rome but also the symbolic Rome, the eternal city whether Rome itself or Constantinople, the Biblical "Babylon".<sup>10</sup>

Rome was founded, according to the generally accepted tradition, by descendants of Aeneas and his followers who fled by ship from the fallen city of Troy. Gondor and Arnor were founded by fugitives from the fundered island of Númenor. In the republican period Rome's greatest and most dangerous adversary was the city of Carthage, which Virgil presents as founded before Rome by Dido the Phoenician. After Gondor had defeated Sauron at the end of the Second Age its main adversary was Umbar, a sea power founded by the Numenoreans before their homeland was destroyed.

Gondor was weakened by three evils: the Kin-strife, the deadly plague of 1636, and the invasion of the Wainriders from the east. Rome fell through a combination of internal strife among contenders for the purple, various plagues and famines, and attacks of barbarians from the north and east.

In Gondor the use of Northmen--with Gothic names<sup>11</sup> --as allies against the Easterlings led to close friendship between the two peoples, and eventually to the marriage of the heir to the throne of Gondor to a daughter of one of the Rhovanion chieftains. (III:326/405) In Rome emperors more and more often were of non-Italic ancestry, often sprung from families of Gothic origin.

For administrative reasons the originally unified Roman empire was split into two sections, an eastern one centered on Constantinople and a western one centered on Rome. Later the two sections became independent of one another. Similarly the two realms founded by Elendil, Arnor and Gondor, were originally united under one government, and the Dúnedain of Gondor chose wrongly when, the throne of Gondor falling vacant, they picked as their king Eärnil the Captain of the Army instead of Arvedui lord of Arnor and rightful heir to the united realm. (III:330/410)

After the disappearance of the Roman Emperors of the West, the Popes, often thought of as Stewards of Christ, assumed certain of the attributes of the emperors, pretending to authority over other kings and chieftains who professed the Christian faith, and serving as a living symbol of Classical culture. The supreme authority of the Pope was to last only until Christ himself, the true King, returned. In Gondor the lack of an acceptable king led to government by a line of Ruling Stewards "to hold rod and rule in the name of the king, until he shall return." (III:333/414)

Rome increasingly used barbarians to do her fighting for her, granting them lands in return, sometimes after the barbarians had already achieved *de facto* possession of those lands. Similarly the Steward of Gondor gave Calenardhon to the Eothéod, a northern people, who subsequently subjugated or drove out the earlier Dunlendish inhabitants whose speech Tolkien represents by Celtic roots. (III:407/508 ff., 413/516 f.) Thereafter the Eothéod, now known as the Rohirrim, remained firm allies to Gondor.

The destruction of Constantinople by the Turks left only the weakened "Germanic" Roman Empire as a successor to the authority of the Caesars. But by then most of the cultural heritage had been lost. In Gondor, after the destruction of Osgiliath by the Nazgûl, the Dúnedain of Minas Tirith, though continuing to fight against their enemies, fell in their level of culture more closely to that of their Northman allies, esteeming a warrior above men of other crafts. (II:287/364)

Probably more parallels can be found, but the above are sufficient to demonstrate the correspondence of Rome and Gondor. Arnor, for the most part, is a fainter duplicate of Gondor, and the histories of the two follow like courses. The main difference is that by the end of the Third Age the decline and fall of Arnor is in the far past while Gondor remains a viable force. The reason for this will be considered later. In some instances Arnor appears to play Rome to Gondor's Constantinople: Arnor being originally the more important kingdom, but Gondor gaining ascendancy and outlasting its sister.

To summarize: Gondor, and to a lesser degree Arnor, correspond to Rome. The various tribes of the Easterlings

are the Germanic barbarians. The Rohirrim are the barbarians in their role as Roman allies. The Dunlanders and related peoples, such as the Breemen, represent the Celtic peoples, overrun first by the Romans and then by the Goths.

As for the other races, the Southrons are the Arabs, the Orcs are the most destructive of the barbarians, and the Dwarves have no relations with Gondor and therefore have no counterparts in real history.

But what of the Elves? To some extent they are just elves, the supernatural beings who were believed to dwell in the wilder regions of Europe, and who were considered with mixed worship and fear. But they are not just that. When their role in the traditions of Gondor is considered, and the part played by them in the War of the Rings is taken into account, a surprising and somewhat incongruous identification can be made. The Elves, at least the High Elves, are Monks!

Consider! Both are separated from the everyday life of normal men. Both dwell in small isolated communities dealing with the outside world only so much as is necessary for preservation. It was in the monasteries that the languages and traditions of a vanished past were in part preserved, and in Tolkien's world it is the Elves who pile up lore and living memories of the past, spending much of their time in reliving it in their songs and their waking dreams. Also, like monks, the High Elves appear as advisors of men, famed for their wisdom, but they do not, with few exceptions, take an active part in the actual fighting during the War of the Ring.

The largest community of High Elves appears to be that of the Grey Havens, beyond the Blue Mountains far to the north-west of Gondor, by the Sea. It was similar in Dark Age Europe where the strongest and most vital continuation of classical scholarship and learning occurred in the small hermitages and monasteries of remote Ireland. There the monks could work and study in comparative peace away from the turmoil and slaughter convulsing the European mainland.

Having demonstrated the cultural parallelism between Tolkien's invented world and the real world of the Dark Age, I will now consider possible historical parallels. Is there any event in real history which can be identified with the War of the Ring? If this war can be taken as the telescoping of a series of conflicts which resulted in the overthrow of an ancient enemy and the restoration of a long gone old order, then the answer is yes.

From a political point of view the story in The Lord of the Rings concerns the overthrow of Sauron, the old enemy of Gondor, and the elevation of Aragorn to a throne which has been vacant for almost a thousand years. Aragorn is certainly the key figure, and if a parallel figure can be discovered in real history, then the historical base for the War of the Ring will have been found. Actually Aragorn has close resemblances to two such personages.

First there is Theodoric the Goth, leader of a people of northern origin, who became emperor of the West, inaugurating a period of peace after generations of war and conflict. Theodoric was developed by poets and romancers into the fabulous Dietrich von Berne, and one of the stories told of him parallels Aragorn's courtship of Arwen. Dietrich falls in love with Virginia, the elvish Snow Queen. She bestows a red jewel on him, but refuses to marry him, because to do so would mean sacrificing her immortality. Yet in some tales Dietrich, upon reaching old age, voluntarily leaves his kingdom and returns to the realm of the Snow Queen never to be heard of again.<sup>12</sup> Certainly there is at least a vague correspondence here to Aragorn, Arwen, and the green stone.

But the position of Aragorn as the restorer of a lost kingship, as Envinyatar the Renewer, suggests that he can be more profitably likened to another figure: the Emperor Carolus Magnus, the legendary Charlemagne. Both rulers restore a great empire of the west, assuming each a title which has been unused for generations. Both inaugurate a

period of peace and prosperity. Both achieve their victories by triumphing over barbarians from the east. And Aragorn's victories over the Haradrim of Umbar match the legendary Charlemagne's continual wars with the Saracens.

As Charlemagne's empire was not in reality the old Roman Empire revived, but rather the beginning of a new era, the age of feudal kingdoms and a new medieval culture, so Aragorn's reign for all its glory, is marked by as much loss of the old as by the old regained. The majority of the remaining High Elves depart forever to the Undying Lands as the Elven rings lose their virtue. With them goes much of the past. For example, Tolkien notes that the deeds of the Rangers of the North were mostly forgotten after Elrond departed. (III:323/401)

It may be objected that Aragorn's kingdoms are not to be compared to Charlemagne's ramshackle empire. However Tolkien has been recorded as saying that the apparent promise of continued peace and prosperity for the men of Middle-earth was illusory. Tolkien had planned and had begun work on a sequel to The Lord of the Rings called The New Shadow in which, about a hundred years after the War boredom with nothing but peace and prosperity led to "every kind of madness".<sup>13</sup> Apparently the stability of Aragorn's empire was illusory.

But enough of documenting similarities between the European Dark Age and the end of Tolkien's Third Age. Rather let us note the differences, and discuss their implications.

One striking difference is that while Rome was ruled by various forms of government at different times, and while its emperors were of varied origins and often gained power by slaying their predecessors, Gondor and Arnor were each ruled by a single line of hereditary kings or chieftains. Each was the lawful heir and most often the son of his predecessor. And when in Gondor the line was interrupted after the death of Eärnur, an equally unchallenged line of stewards ruled, passing the rod of office from father to son.

The historic fact that later emperors were often of non-Italic lineage was, as already mentioned above, sublimated by Tolkien in the story of Eldacar whose elevation to the throne was opposed by his cousin Castamir on the grounds that Eldacar's mother was the daughter of a barbarian. Eldacar finally manages to drive out Castamir, and so the descendants of barbarians attain the kingship of Gondor without disturbing the royal line of descent. (III:327/406)

Tolkien's world is a moral one in a way that ours is not, at least in so obvious a fashion. Gondor has, by a sort of divine right, the authority over other peoples and nations that was historically claimed by Rome. Hence when Isildur curses the hill people for refusing to come to Gondor's aid his curse is extraordinarily effective. (III: 55/64) The unbroken line of the kings is a symbol of Gondor's authority, and those who oppose it are in the wrong. Accordingly the rebellion of Castamir is evil, and so he loses, is banished, and his descendants sink to the level of mere Southron princes. The refusal of the Council of Gondor to acknowledge that Arvedui of the northern realm of Arnor is the rightful heir to the throne dooms the Dúnedain to "much sorrow and many lives of men" until they can once again arise in full strength as a united people. (III:330/410) The real history of Rome in which emperors who inherited the throne were often either weak or cruel, in which usurping emperors were often good rulers, and in which acquisition of power, not right by inheritance, was what made an emperor--this history has implications very different than that which Tolkien presents.

In Tolkien the ruling authorities are not perfect. They may make errors or fall into evil ways. Yet always they appear as the betters of those who would seize their power from them. The revolutionaries are never in the right, and in the end always meet defeat.

This principle necessitates a revision of the Gothic invasions in Tolkien's history. In the primary world the

Goths came down, slaughtered or drove out or subdued the local peasantry, and took their lands as their own. Later, when these barbarians became allied to Rome, Rome recognized their right to the land. In The Lord of the Rings the Rohirrim come down as allies of Gondor only after Gondor's own army is on the point of defeat. Therefore Gondor grants the region of Calenardhon to them for a new home, since the 'people of that region had become few since the Plague, and most of those that remained had been slaughtered by the savage Easterlings.' So Tolkien justifies this land grant by minimizing the opposition of the former inhabitants. (III:345/430) Yet Tolkien does not go so far as to completely justify the Rohirrim. There is that one pathetic reminder of the other side when Ghân-buri-Ghân, leader of the Woses of Druadan Forest, asks as his price for the help of his people only that the Rohirrim "leave Wild Men alone in the woods and do not hunt them like beasts any more." (III:107/131)

So far I have been concentrating on the identity of Gondor and Rome. But of course Gondor is more, and less, than that. If it most closely parallels Rome it also parallels to a lesser extent other earlier imperial cultures. Speaking of the kings of Gondor Faramir says, "Death was ever present, because the Númenoreans still . . . hungered after endless life unchanging. Kings made tombs more splendid than houses of the living." (II:286/363) This, to most readers, calls to mind connotations of the Egyptian Pharaohs. And is there not also an Egyptian feel about the Argonath: the two colossal statues of Isildur and Anárion on either side of the river Anduin, reminiscent of the colossi of Raameses by the bank of the Nile.

Also certain of the names have an eastern feel. Lebennin is similar to the Palestinian Lebanon, and Erech where Aragorn binds the spirits of the dead is the form assumed by Uruk, an ancient city of Mesopotamia, in the Bible.<sup>14</sup>

Finally, the inspiration for Tolkien's seven walled city of Minas Tirith may come from a passage in Herodotus. Describing the Median capital of Hagmatan or Agbatana, the modern Hamadan, Herodotus writes: "the walls . . . are of great size and strength, rising in circles one within the other. The plan of the place is, that each of the walls should out-top the one beyond it by the battlements. The nature of the ground, which is a gentle hill, favours this arrangement in some degree, but it was mainly effected by art. The number of the circles is seven, the royal palace and the treasuries standing within the last. The circuit of the outer wall is very nearly the same with that of Athens."<sup>15</sup>

Up to this point I have avoided dealing with the Shire. For it alone of the places depicted in The Lord of the Rings lacks the Dark Age feel. Rather it belongs to what one might call idealized provincial Victorian England. The Hobbit begins by introducing the reader to a tribe of furry little creatures living in well furnished holes, like the animals in Kenneth Grahame's The Wind in the Willows. Like these animals they possess all the material and cultural paraphernalia of a provincial Victorian English society, and like them they dwell in a relatively comfortable and easy part of a world which is, on the whole, hard and dangerous.

Like these riverbank animals and like the real peasantry of a small English village the Hobbits are for the most part content to pass their lives away in quiet ignorance of the outside world. Of the few who are lured away for one reason or another, most never come back.

For this idealized rural England Tolkien provides an idealized foundation legend. The foundation legend of the historical England is that a small group of Saxons, whose leaders were Hengest and his brother Horsa, landed in Britain, and after gradually increasing their numbers through immigration, they drove out the Celtic possessors of the land and took it for their own. The names Hengest and Hor-

sa are both words meaning "horse". Now according to Tolkien the Shire settlement was effected by the two Fallohide brothers, Marcho and Blanco. (I:13/23) Marcho is a Celtic word meaning "horse", and blanco is an Anglo-Saxon word also meaning "horse".<sup>16</sup> Thus Tolkien represents the Saxon and Celtic strains which are usually considered the base stock of the modern British population as not in any kind of opposition, but as united from the first in the task of settling the conveniently vacant land that later became the Shire.

The only hint of the conflict between Saxon and Celt is the fact that the office of Thain was originally held by the Oldbucks, a family with names of Celtic style, but later passed to the Took family who are distinguished by Gothic names. In the same year Gorhendad Oldbuck, the head of the Oldbuck family, crossed the Brandywine, and began to excavate Brandy Hall. The area around became known as Buckland, and the name Oldbuck was changed to Brandybuck. (I:18/30, 108/141; III:368/459) All this hints at the historical transfer of sovereign power from the Celts to the Anglo-Saxons, and the flight of the Celtic Britons to Wales and Armorica which they renamed Little Britain or Brittany.

By the end of the Third Age the office of Thain has become devoid of almost all real power comparable to the loss of power by the English monarchs. (I:19/30)

When all this is taken into account, one of the reasons for the existence of Arnor appears. If Gondor is the Roman Empire as a still viable entity, then Arnor is that same empire after it has been long dead, the Roman Empire as seen today from the viewpoint of a modern Englishman. Many details of Shire culture and law are derived from that empire which died very soon after the Shire was first settled, just as the Roman Empire was going through its last gasps as the Saxons were working their way through more and more of Britain.

But why does Tolkien tell the tale of a return from this almost modern culture of an idealized rural provincial Victorian England to the archaic past? In part it may be to give us viewpoint characters with which we can more easily identify. But it should also be noted that when a Victorian Englishman went abroad to India, Russia, China, Japan, or Turkey, he did, after a fashion return to the past, since the cultures he found in those places were of a sort that had disappeared from most of Europe generations earlier. They were feudal cultures in which gunpowder was a new innovation still, and where most fighting was still carried out by more primitive weapons such as sword, spear, and arrow. It is in this context that a certain remark of the dwarves finds its interpretation. As they approach the Edge of the Wild Thorin and his company epitomize the dangerous nature of the natives of these lands by the words, "They have seldom even heard of the king round here." (H:42/45) This is just the sort of thing that a guide would say in one of the wilder parts of an English possession.

Bilbo Baggins might be compared to a rather conservative country landlord who, in a moment of unusual spirit, joined up with the army or with the British Foreign Office and spent several years abroad, perhaps in India. When he returned home he had gained a broader and more tolerant outlook, as well as a fund of somewhat shocking and disturbing stories which his contemporaries tried to ignore and which their children begged to hear.

As to why Tolkien returns his heroes to the more primitive type of world from which our society developed, the answer is that the pitting of modern man against more primitive conditions is the essence of many adventure stories, and also of many tales of self discovery. In Gondor, Morдор and the wild country about them the Hobbits can use themselves, and in so doing discover themselves and grow into themselves, not just the sleepy potentialities which they would have become in the Shire. And for this purpose the mythical heroic age of Europe is a perfect background. For the medieval poets and romancers superimposed on the

57 Williams, The Greater Trumps, p. 238.  
 58 Ibid., 59 Ibid., 60 Ibid., 61 Ibid., p. 264.  
 62 Ibid., 63 Ibid., p. 29 64 Ibid., p. 116.  
 65 Ibid., p. 63. 66 Ibid., p. 103.  
 67 Ibid., p. 8. Lothair thinks of Nancy as a "gipsy name"; (p. 8.) Williams attributes Lothair's and Sibyl's names to their godmother's liking for Disraeli. Perhaps Williams is suggesting that Nancy is the bearer of a Gypsy (Egyptian) name: Horus. In Memories, Dreams, Reflections, Jung describes the African sunrise, in which the first brilliant irradiation of the darkness is the moment of God's presence, the epiphany of Horus. This image of enlightenment may be related to the concept of Grace, which is what Nancy's name (it is a diminutive of Anne) literally means.  
 68 Charles Williams, The Greater Trumps, p. 242.  
 69 Ibid., p. 136. 70 Ibid., p. 262. 71 Ibid., p. 29.  
 72 Ibid., p. 90. 73 Ibid., p. 26. 74 Ibid., p. 99.  
 75 Ibid., p. 164: See Song of Solomon, 8:6 -- "Love is stronger as death."  
 76 Ibid., p. 110. 77 Ibid., p. 29. 78 Ibid., p. 90.  
 79 Ibid., p. 178. 80 Ibid., p. 212. 81 Ibid., p. 193.  
 82 Ibid., p. 178. 83 Ibid., p. 29. 84 Ibid., p. 116.  
 85 Ibid., p. 3. 86 Ibid., 87 Ibid., p. 139.  
 88 Ibid., p. 29. 89 Ibid., 90 Ibid., p. 226.  
 91 Ibid., p. 29. 92 Ibid., p. 17. 93 Ibid., p. 262.  
 94 Ibid., p. 265. 95 Ibid., pp. 265-266.  
 96 Ibid., p. 110. 97 Ibid., p. 29. 98 Ibid., p. 112.  
 99 Ibid., p. 116. 100 Ibid., pp. 226-227.  
 101 Ibid., 102 Ibid., p. 29. 103 Ibid., p. 112.  
 104 Ibid., p. 262. 105 Ibid., p. 226.  
 106 Ibid., p. 227. 107 Ibid., pp. 18-19.  
 108 Ibid., p. 82. 109 Ibid., p. 83.  
 110 Ibid., pp. 232-233.  
 111 T.S. Eliot, "Gerontion," The Waste Land and Other Poems, Harvest Books, Harcourt, Brace, and Co. (New York: 1934), p. 19.  
 112 Charles Williams, The Greater Trumps, p. 227.  
 113 Ibid., p. 112. 114 Ibid., pp. 29-30  
 115 Ibid., p. 111. 116 Ibid., p. 266  
 117 Ibid., pp. 145-146. 118 Ibid., pp. 155-156.  
 119 Ibid., p. 161.  
 120 C.G. Jung, Memories, Dreams, Reflections, Vintage Books (New York: 1963), p. 338.  
 121 Gerardus van derLeeuw, Sacred and Profane Beauty: The Holy in Art, Holt, Rinehart and Winston (New York: 1963), p. 29.  
 122 Ibid..  
 123 Sam Keene, "Manifesto for a Dionysian Theology," New Theology No. 7: The Recovery of Transcendence, ed., Martin E. Marty and Dean G. Peerman, Collier-Macmillan Ltd. (Toronto: 1970), p. 94.  
 124 E.M.W. Tillyard, The Elizabethan World Picture, Chatto and Windus (London: 1967), p. 97.  
 125 Williams, The Greater Trumps, p. 123.  
 126 Ibid., pp. 116-117.  
 127 Ibid., pp. 119-120.  
 128 Dante Alighieri, The New Life, William Anderson, trans., Penguin (Harmondsworth: 1964), p. 64.  
 129 Ibid., p. 40.

VII. The Sovereign Fool

1 Willeford, op. cit., p. 3, also p.239, n. 1.  
 2 Andreas Lommel, Shamanism: The Beginnings of Art, McGraw-Hill (Toronto: 1967), pp. 128-129.  
 3 Willeford, op. cit., p. 11, quoted from Thelma Niklaus, Harlequin, Brazillier (New York: 1956), p. 18.  
 4 Willeford, op. cit., p. 240, n. 6.  
 5 Ibid..  
 6 Ibid., p. 12.  
 7 Ibid., p. 251, n. 16. 8 Ibid., p. 16.  
 9 Ibid., p. 10. 10 Ibid., p. 16.  
 11 Lommel, op. cit., p. 112. 12 Ibid..  
 13 Willeford, op. cit., p. 242, quoted from E.W. Ives, "Tom Skelton--a Seventeenth Century Jester," Shakespeare Survey 13, Cambridge University Press (Cambridge: 1960), p. 103.  
 14 Willeford, op. cit., p. 23.  
 15 Euripides, "The Bacchae," William Arrowsmith, trans., The Complete Greek Tragedies, Vol. IV, Euripides, ed. David Greene and Richard Lattimore, p. 548.  
 16 Ibid., p. 552.  
 17 Willeford, op. cit., pp. 28-29. The noise and silence are typical of mushroom cult behaviour but obviously the drug effects of the mushroom are desired because they cause these certain signs of possession.  
 18 Ibid., p. 29. 19 Ibid..  
 20 Eric Welsford, The Fool: His Social and Literary History, Faber and Faber (London: 1968), p. 55.  
 21 Willeford, op. cit., pp. 37-38.  
 22 Ibid., pp. 41-42.  
 23 Ibid., p. 54, quoted from M. Willson Disher, Clowns and Pantomimes, Constable (London: 1923), pp. 28-29.  
 24 Willeford, op. cit., p. 65. 25 Ibid., p. 113.

26 Ibid., p. 117.  
 27 Ibid., p. 120, quoted from C.G. Jung, Aion, R.F.C. Hull, trans., Collected Works, Vol. IX, Part II (Boilingen Series XX), Pantheon (New York: 1959), p. 198, par. 310.  
 28 Willeford, op. cit., p. 112. 29 Ibid..  
 30 Ibid., p. 114. 31 Ibid., p. 79. 32 Ibid., p. 109.  
 33 Ibid., p. 112. 34 Ibid., p. 121. 35 Ibid., p. 124.  
 36 Ibid., p. 131. 37 Ibid., 38 Ibid., p. 133.  
 39 Ibid., p. 134. 40 Ibid., p. 135.  
 41 Williams, The Greater Trumps, p. 210.  
 42 Ibid., 43 Ibid., p. 219. 44 Ibid., p. 220.  
 45 Ibid., p. 221. 46 Ibid., pp. 221-222.  
 47 Willeford, op. cit., p. 143. 48 Ibid., pp. 143-144.  
 49 Ibid., p. 14. 50 Ibid., p. 151. 51 Ibid..  
 52 Ibid., p. 153. 53 Ibid., p. 161.  
 54 Ibid., p. 162. 55 Ibid., 56 Ibid., p. 167.  
 57 Ibid., p. 168. 58 Ibid., p. 170. 59 Ibid..  
 60 Ibid., p. 172. 61 Ibid., 62 Ibid., p. 173.  
 63 Ibid., 64 Ibid., p. 212. 65 Ibid., p. 217.  
 66 Ibid., pp. 265-266.  
 67 Otto, op. cit., p. 29.  
 68 Williams, The Greater Trumps, p. 123.

NOTE: Heartfelt thanks are due to Mrs. Stephanie Walker, Prof. J.R. Christopher of Tarleton State College, and Prof. Robert Ellwood of UCLA, for their meticulous reading and correction of the final version of this paper.

Addenda

I. The Greater Trumps

add to Footnote #4:

The courtesy of Dr. Daniel Luzon Morris who sent me my first exoteric deck, the Marseille Tarot, and of Gracia-Fay Ellwood who sent me my first esoteric deck, the Waite-Smith Tarot, are hereby acknowledged and thanked as well.

II. Occult and Unconscious

footnote #4

4. Ibid., Yeats himself left the Isis-Urania temple and "followed Dr. Felkin, who founded the order of the Stella Matutina," (Ibid., pp. XXIII-XXIV) Waite himself adds, "I put an end to the Isis-Urania or Mother Temple...Of the new Rite which arose...there...is no story to tell...May that most sacred centre give up no outward form." (Quoted from A.E. Waite, Shadows of Life and Thought, Selwyn and Blount, p. 229, Ibid., p. XXIV). This is the "new Rite," or "later unnamed order" to which Anne Ridler refers.

V. The Traditional Tarot

footnote 54 between line 6 and 7

(Robert Graves, "Mushroom," Man, Myth, and Magic, pp. 1905-1910)

Continued from page 6

actual crude, bloody, absurd European Dark Age a sort of archetypal grid. They created, in the words of another modern writer of romance "a land... wherein human nature kept its first dignity and strength; and wherein human passions were never in a poor way to find expression with adequate speech and action."<sup>17</sup> This world of brutality and poetry, and of wildness and bombast, all covering bottomless deeps, this Jungian world of the subconscious provides an author with the means of showing forth man's potentialities in a way that fiction of the mundane cannot do. For Tolkien the world of Middle-earth is a stage on which is played the never ending battle of resistance to evil. Supported by their vision of this the Hobbits can rise above their physical heritage and themselves become heroes.

Continued on page 36

The night wind whispered around him  
with scent of brook and rue.  
Both moons rose high above him  
and hills aflash with dew.  
The dance weaves under the firethorn.

And dreaming of that woman  
who waited in the sun,  
he stopped, amazed by starlight,  
and so he was undone.  
The dance weaves under the firethorn.

For there beneath a barrow  
that bulked athwart a moon,  
the Outling folk were dancing  
in glass and golden shoon.  
The dance weaves under the firethorn.

The Outling folk were dancing  
like water, wind, and fire  
to frosty-ringing harpstrings,  
and never did they tire.  
The dance weaves under the firethorn.

To Arvid came she striding  
from where she watched the dance,  
the Queen of Air and Darkness,  
with starlight in her glance.  
The dance weaves under the firethorn.

With starlight, love, and terror  
in her immortal eye,  
the Queen of Air and Darkness...  
cried softly under sky:

'Light down, you ranger Arvid,  
and join the Outling folk.  
You need no more be human,  
which is a heavy yoke.'

He dared to give her answer:  
'I may do naught but run.  
A maiden waits me, dreaming  
in lands beneath the sun.'

'And likewise wait me comrades  
and tasks I would not shirk,  
for what is ranger Arvid  
if he lays down his work?

'So wreak your spells, you Outling,  
and cast your wrath on me.  
Though maybe you can slay me,  
you'll not make me unfree.'

The Queen of Air and Darkness  
stood wrapped about with fear  
and northlight-flares and beauty  
he dared not look too near.

Until she laughed like harp-song  
and said to him in scorn:  
'I do not need a magic  
to make you always mourn.'

'I send you home with nothing  
except your memory  
of moonlight, Outling music,  
night breezes, dew, and me.'

'And that will run behind you,  
a shadow on the sun,  
and that will lie beside you  
when every day is done.'

'In work and play and friendship  
your grief will strike you dumb  
for thinking what you are - and -  
what you might have become.'

'Your dull and foolish woman  
treat kindly as you can.  
Go home now, ranger Arvid,  
set free to be a man!'

In flickering and laughter  
the Outling folk were gone.  
He stood alone by moonlight  
and wept until the dawn.  
The dance weaves under the firethorn.

(Continued from page 32)

Notes for Osgiliath paper by James D. Allan

1. For all page references H signifies The Hobbit; I, II and III respectively represent the three volumes of The Lord of the Rings; and T. B stands for The Adventures of Tom Bombadil. Page references are first to the hardback and Methuen paperback editions and then, following a slash, to the Ballantine paperback edition.
2. Teutonic Mythology Vol. II by Jacob Grimm, trans. James Steven Stallfrass, Dover, N. Y. 1966 p. 443 ff.
3. Tolkien: A Look Behind "The Lord of the Rings" by Lin Carter, Ballantine, N. Y. 1969 p. 170 ff.
4. "Old English in Rohan" by John Tinkler, Tolkien and the Critics ed. N. D. Isaacs & Rose A. Zimbaro, Notre Dame, 1968, p. 164 ff.  
"Anglo-Saxon and the Language of Rohan" by John Sadoski, Carandaith 4, Oct. 1969, ed. Alpajpuri, pp. 24-25.
5. "The Novels of J. R. R. Tolkien and the Ethnology of Medieval Christendom" by E. L. Epstein, Philological Quarterly XLVIII, 4, Oct. 1969, p. 518
6. "Introduction" by Robert W. Gutman to Volsunga Saga trans. William Morris, Collier, N. Y., 1962, pp. 29 ff.
7. "Annales Cambriae" in Arthur King of Britain ed. Richard L. Brengle, Appleton, Century-Crofts, N. Y., 1964, p. 7
8. The History of the Kings of Britain by Geoffrey of Monmouth, Box xi, chap. 2.
9. The Quest of the Holy Grail trans. P. M. Matarass, Penguin, London, 1969, p. 33  
Morte d'Arthur by Sir Thomas Malory, Book XIII, chap. 2
10. I Peter 5:13; Revelation 13:8
11. "Beth-Luis-Nion" by Paula Marmor, Parma Eldalam-beron 1, Autumn 1971, The Mythopoeic Society, p. 2
12. The most complete rendering of this story in English, of which I am aware, is in Dietrich of Berne and the Dwarf King Laurin by Ruth Sawyer and Emmy Mollès, Viking Press, N. Y., 1963
13. "An Interview with Tolkien" by Henry Resnick, Niekas 18, late Spring, 1967, ed. Ed Meškys & Felice Rolfe, p. 42
14. Genesis 10:10
15. The Greek Historians ed. Francis R. B. Godolphin, N. Y., 1942, "The Persian Wars" Book 1, chap. 98
16. "An Etymological Excursion Among the Shire Folk" by Paula Marmor, Mythlore 7, Winter 1971, p. 4
17. The Cream of the Jest by James Branch Cabell, Ballantine, N. Y., 1971, p. 32