

Gender, Immigration and Labour Market Integration: Where We Are and What We Still Need to Know

Evangelia Tastsoglou, Saint Mary's University, researches and teaches in the areas of gender and migration; immigrant women; ethnicity, race and multi-culturalism; migration and development. She leads the "gender, diversity and migration/immigrant women" research domain at the Atlantic Metropolis Centre of Excellence. Valerie Preston, York University, has served on several boards of the Joint Centre of Excellence for Research on Immigration and Settlement in Toronto. Her recent research examines the labour market participation of highly skilled immigrant women and the gendered impact of transnationalism on citizenship practices and identities.

Abstract

This article reviews current literature about the link between gender and immigrants' employment and equity-based economic integration. It concludes with three recommendations for future research.

Résumé

Cet article revoie la littérature courante en ce qui a trait au lien entre les sexes et l'intégration économique des immigrants basée sur l'emploi et l'équité. Il conclut avec trois recommandation pour les recherches futures.

Introduction

A growing literature¹ on immigrants' economic performance focuses on employment status, earnings, and occupational attainments as indicators of labour market integration (Beach & Worswick 1993; Chard, Badets & Howatson-Leo 2000; Reitz & Breton 1994). Relying on census and survey data, this literature uses composite measures of economic performance that take into account education, qualifications, experience, and other work-related characteristics of individuals to account for economic performance (Li 2000). Information from the 2001 census about these measures indicates that immigrant women are less likely to participate in the paid labour force than Canadian-born women, more likely than their Canadian-born counterparts and than Canadian-born and immigrant men to be unemployed, and also segmented into manual occupations. Even among full-time workers, foreign-born women have lower earnings than foreign-born men and Canadian-born workers of both sexes (Table 1).

Faced with this dismal picture of immigrant women's economic integration, research has examined the links among the attributes such as education, qualifications, and experience that are thought to influence productivity in the paid labour market, as well as many other social markers including gender, immigration status, visible minority status, and family composition and various indicators of immigrant women's economic integration (Boyd 1992; Li 2000;

Pendakur 2000; Reitz 1998). Critiquing this recent and growing literature, we advance a conceptual framework of integration and labour market integration from an equity and feminist perspective. Then, we review key recent literature concerning immigrants' employment experiences in Canada, in two sections. The first section of the paper summarises the current understanding of immigrant women's involvement in the paid labour market and the many social, political, and cultural factors that influence immigrant women's paid employment in the Canadian context. Wherever possible, we draw on recently released information from the 2001 census, but where information is still unavailable, we rely on information from the 1996 census. In the second section, we explore directions for future research, outlining the methodological and empirical challenges that remain to be addressed.

Conceptual Framework

The term "immigrant woman" is a bifurcated one as it describes a legal as well as a social status. An immigrant woman is a person born abroad who has acquired permanent residency status or citizenship in Canada. However, the social status associated with being an immigrant woman is different. According to Ng & Estable (1987), the term immigrant woman is socially constructed and rooted in the economic and legal processes of our society that have sexist, racist and class biases. In this paper, the term "immigrant woman" combines technical-legal criteria and social criteria. It refers to foreign-born women who meet the following two requirements: (a) they have permanent resident or citizen status and (b) belong to racialized groups or do not speak English (or French) well or have English (or French) as a second language. The term does not include undocumented foreign-born women.

There are three broad categories of "immigrants" to Canada according to technical-legal

criteria, namely: 1) economic immigrants, including skilled workers and business immigrants; 2) family class immigrants and 3) refugees. The categories correspond to the three major objectives of Canadian immigration programs which have been 1) economic development; 2) facilitating the reunion of families; and 3) fulfilling international legal obligations with respect to refugees and upholding a humanitarian tradition (Horizons 2002). There are significant differences in educational attainments and social class among the three categories. While many economic immigrants are highly educated and/or skilled individuals from middle or upper-middle class backgrounds, family class immigrants, who are more often women than men, and refugees, especially those claiming refugee status in Canada, are less likely to be so. As a result, there are important differences in the labour force experiences of immigrant women. Census and survey data rarely reveal² age at time of immigration; also, this is a factor that affects women's labour force experiences. Women who migrate as children are more likely than those who migrate as adults to have educational attainments and work experience that are valued by Canadian employers (Boyd 2002).

Recent perspectives on immigrant integration emphasize that it is a two-way process that changes the society where immigrants are settling as well as immigrants themselves (Berns McGown 1999). Of the variety of integration theories (Driedger 1996), many still ignore gender, thereby assuming that the problems of integration encountered by male immigrants are universal. Yet significant evidence suggests that integration processes are considerably different for women than for men and that these processes are considerably more challenging for women of colour (Das Gupta 1996; Nyakbwa and Harvey 1990; Miedema and Wachholz 1998). On the other hand, empirical feminist studies that successfully take account of gender do not always examine critically the concept of "integration."

The anti-racism literature better addresses the concept of integration; however, it often lacks a gender dimension (Miedema and Tastsoglou 2000). Small (1994), for example, recognizes the importance of various kinds of integration that he describes as non-segregation, interaction, and harmony. He conceives of integration primarily as "racialized parity"; that is, as a process that equalizes access to and/or ownership of resources among racialized groups.

To integrate feminist and anti-racism perspectives, we theorize integration as "racialized gender parity." Parity is measured relative to the economic experiences of Canadian-born men from European backgrounds that are an ideal yardstick against which to assess the integration of actual immigrant women. We emphasize the processual character of integration that is an ongoing process as long as the ideal is not achieved. This perspective implies that economic integration is a process that aims at equitable distribution of resources for immigrant women. For labour market integration, it implies a process of accessing employment, income and work that is commensurate with one's qualifications, within a time-frame that is equivalent to that of Canadian-born people with similar qualifications. Any assessment of integration processes must also take into consideration current gender, class and visible minority status-related differences among the Canadian-born, since contemporary labour markets exclude people on the basis of these social markers.

As a consequence, we propose re-conceptualizing economic and labour market integration not only as an outcome that refers to access to employment, income, and work commensurate with one's qualifications, but, primarily, as a process involving various challenges that have different relevance for different women. Research needs to assess how processes of economic integration are influenced by the separate and combined effects of gender and race.

Attention should also be paid to the links between home and paid work for immigrant women that are an integral aspect of economic issues.³ Migration often disrupts gender roles and power relations within immigrant households, but the changes are not necessarily emancipatory (Giles 2002). The economic difficulties encountered by many immigrants mean that women are often forced into the paid labour market where they end up in unsatisfying jobs with dangerous working conditions, low wages and few opportunities for advancement while still being responsible for most of the unpaid household labour. We also need to learn about the link between paid work and the feeling of belonging in Canadian society - the more subjective aspects of integration - from the perspectives of immigrant women themselves.

Our analysis raises major methodological and empirical challenges. We suggest that alternative ways of assessing the economic and labour market integration of immigrant women must be devised. Current measures such as family income, individual earnings, employment status and even occupational attainment do not capture many important aspects of economic and labour market integration. Research that compares the integration processes of different categories of immigrant women with those of immigrant men, and Canadian-born women and men, will enable us to identify major challenges facing different immigrant women. Sophisticated analyses are needed to separate the effects of gender from those of racialization on the basis of place of birth, national origin and colour, from immigration class, educational achievement and other human and social capital effects, on earnings, access to employment, and socio-economic status of job attained in the longer term (that is, *ceteris paribus*, or, with all other factors or things remaining the same). Finally, we advocate longitudinal studies that include quantitative and qualitative components, to understand the challenges and strategies that immigrant women deploy

in the process of economic integration. The aim of this critical review is to develop a research agenda that will advance our current theoretical understanding of immigrant women's involvement in paid work. At the same time, the proposed research agenda will foster policy-relevant research that can be used to promote settlement services that will ameliorate immigrant women's employment experiences, fill vital gaps for skilled workers in the Canadian society, and advance equity goals for diverse categories of women and men in Canadian society regardless of their place of birth.

What Do We Know?

Education and Employment: the Elusive Link

We begin by considering labour force participation rates for immigrant women. Compared with Canadian-born women and earlier immigrants, a larger percentage of recent immigrant women, those who arrived in Canada between 1996 and 2001, have undergraduate, graduate, and post-graduate degrees (Statistics Canada 2003c). Among those aged 25 to 44 years of age, 27.7% of recent immigrant women had a bachelor's or first professional degree compared with 20.9% of all immigrant women and 17.3% of Canadian-born women. As well, 15.4% of recent immigrant women held higher level certificates, that is a university certificate beyond the bachelor's degree, a master's degree or earned doctorate, while 9.0% of all immigrant women and 5.2% of Canadian-born women had credentials above the bachelor's level (Statistics Canada 2003c).

Education affects immigrant women's participation in the paid labour market, but it does not always increase participation as we expect. Although a smaller percentage of Canadian-born women than immigrant women have university degrees, the labour force participation rates of Canadian-born women are higher than those of immigrant women. Of Canadian-born women between the ages of 25 and 44

years, 82.4% were in the labour force compared with only 75% of all immigrant women in the same age group. For recent immigrants, only 65% of women were in the labour force (Statistics Canada 2003b). Immigrant women are also less likely to participate in the labour market than immigrant men. There is a growing disparity between the labour force participation rates of immigrant men and women, particularly among those who arrived recently.

Considering differences in education among immigrant women, we find that educated immigrant women, especially those who have post-secondary education in the form of a university degree, are less likely to participate in the paid labour force than equally well-educated women who are Canadian-born. For Canadian-born women, participation rates climb from 36.9% for those with less than high school education to 82.8% for the university educated. In contrast, the participation rate of recent immigrant women with a university degree is just 68.3% (Statistics Canada 2003b). At the other end of the educational spectrum, among women with less than a high school diploma, recently arrived immigrant women are as likely to participate in the labour force as Canadian-born women. In 2001, the participation rate for recent immigrant women with less than a high school education was 37.0% compared with 36.9% for equivalent Canadian-born women (Statistics Canada 2003b). The disparate trends in labour force participation suggest that educated immigrant women withdraw from the labour market in Canada, in stark contrast to the rising labour force participation of educated Canadian-born women. The trends in 2001 are consistent with previous speculation (Chard, Badets, and Howatson-Leo 2000) that educated immigrant women whose households have sufficient income leave the workforce.

Unemployment Rates

Once immigrant women enter the labour force, they often experience difficulty staying employed. Immigrant women are more likely to be unemployed than immigrant men and the differences between the unemployment rates of Canadian-born women and immigrant women are larger than those between their male counterparts (Table 1). For recent immigrants, employment is even more precarious, despite the recent improvement in their unemployment rates. Since 1996, unemployment rates for recent immigrant women have declined to levels not seen since the late 1980s. Nevertheless, in relative terms, recent immigrant women are still more likely than Canadian-born women to be unemployed. In 2001, the unemployment rate for recent immigrant women was 14.4%, more than double the unemployment rate of 6.1% for Canadian-born women (Statistics Canada 2003b). In relative terms, the gap in unemployment rates has grown at the same time as absolute levels of unemployment have declined for Canadian-born and immigrant workers.

Education does not reduce the chances of unemployment for recent immigrant women. As noted for immigrants who arrived between 1986 and 1996 (Badets and Howatson-Leo 1999), the unemployment rates for immigrants who arrived between 1996 and 2000 did not decline significantly with higher education (Statistics Canada 2003c). Unlike the Canadian-born, for whom education is a means of ensuring employment, the unemployment rates of university-educated immigrant women were only slightly better than those of all immigrant women. For example, 14.7% of all recent immigrant women in Toronto were unemployed compared with 14.4% of recently arrived immigrant women with a university degree (Statistics Canada 2003c).

Occupational and Industrial Segmentation

Immigrant and Canadian-born women often

work in different jobs with more immigrant women than Canadian-born women in manual occupations. In 2001, 11.7% of all immigrant women worked in manual occupations compared with just 5.9% of Canadian-born women (Table 1). Conversely, Canadian-born women are much more likely than immigrant women to work in managerial, professional and clerical occupations.

In 1996, there were variations in these occupational patterns related to the period of immigration and education. Recent immigrant women with university degrees were concentrated in administrative, clerical, sales and service occupations when compared to equally well educated Canadian-born women and less educated immigrant women (Chard, Badets & Howatson-Leo 2000). Conversely, highly educated recent immigrant women were less likely than the Canadian-born to work as professionals and managers.

Industrial segmentation by migrant status and gender confirms that immigrant women are not well integrated in the Canadian labour force, although earlier immigrants are better off than recent arrivals (Mojab 1999). In Toronto, a high percentage of working immigrant women were employed in manufacturing, 14.5%, compared with only 7.4% of Canadian-born women (Statistics Canada 2003c). The sector was even more important for recently arrived immigrant women, of whom 17.3% worked in manufacturing. While manufacturing was the most important industry of employment for immigrant women in Toronto, Canadian-born women were more likely to work in retail trade, business services, and education. Such industrial segmentation leaves immigrant women, especially recently arrived immigrant women, vulnerable to unemployment. Recent economic restructuring has maintained and even increased manufacturing output while drastically reducing the number of manufacturing jobs.

Earnings

Foreign-born women earn less than their Canadian-born counterparts (Table 1). The difference in annual earnings between immigrant women and Canadian-born women of \$1,759 has declined slightly since 1995 when the disparity was \$2,016 (Table 1; Chard, Badets and Howatson-Leo 2000). This calculation of average employment income refers only to full-time, full-year workers, the most privileged segment of the workforce.⁴ The average annual earnings of women who are in part-time and temporary jobs are lower - \$17,809 for immigrant women and \$18,736 for the Canadian-born (Statistics Canada 2003d) - so the earnings gap is also smaller.

The persistent gap between immigrant women's employment earnings and those of Canadian-born women has been reported previously (Frenette and Morissette 2003; Li 2000; Preston, Lo and Wang 2003). It is important to emphasize that the effects of place of birth are much smaller than the effects of gender. The relative differences in men's and women's employment earnings from full-time, full-year work are very similar for immigrants and the Canadian-born: immigrant women earn 74.3% of immigrant men's average employment income while Canadian-born women earn 73.6% of Canadian-born men's average employment income. Even for full-time, full-year workers, being a woman has more influence on earnings than being an immigrant.

Foreign-born visible minorities earn less than the foreign-born from non-racialized groups. In 2000, immigrant women who were visible minorities reported median wages and earnings of \$20,024, almost 20% less than the \$24,990 reported by immigrant women who were not visible minorities (Statistics Canada 2003e). The persistent gap in the earnings of foreign-born visible minorities is additional evidence that there may be different employment integration processes for visible and non-visible minorities (Hou and

Balakrishnan 1996; Kunz, Milan & Schetagne 2000). The former tend to have a higher level of education than non-visible minority workers, yet they are more under-represented in high status occupations than non-visible minorities and they have incomes lower than might be expected on the basis of their educational and occupational achievements. The visible minority immigrant earnings deficit in particular grows with the amount of schooling and is most pronounced among those with professional or graduate degrees (Pendakur 2000). Although the employment outcomes suggest differences in the ways visible and non-visible minorities within the immigrant population are integrated into the labour market, the processes themselves remain to be investigated (Pendakur 2000). Increased understanding of the integration processes must also take account of the differences among visible minority groups. The task is complicated by the need to separate the effects of visible minority status from the effects of immigration class that may also influence women's access to appropriate and remunerative employment (Israelite et al. 1999).

Directions for Future Research

Overall, we need to rethink economic and labour market integration as processes that lead to various outcomes for different immigrant women. In addition to evaluating whether or not immigrant men and women are employed, we need to know whether their jobs are commensurate with their qualifications and experience. There is growing concern that immigrant workers of both sexes are underemployed and excluded from well paid secure employment in growing economic sectors (Brouwer 1999).

Research needs to document the challenges that immigrants must overcome to obtain appropriate and remunerative employment in different labour markets. Stories of success that reveal how immigrant men and women overcome challenges in the labour

market are useful for identifying policy initiatives that will promote immigrants' economic success. The identification of labour market barriers and strategies for overcoming them needs to take account of geographical, political and economic variations in Canadian labour markets. Research has documented how immigrant women's chances of being unemployed and the likelihood of working in different industries and occupations vary across Canada's three major metropolitan labour markets (Badets and Howatson-Leo 1999; Hiebert 1999; Preston and Cox 1999), but we know little about the dynamics of the local labour markets that lead to these employment outcomes.

The effects of gender on the processes of economic integration (Piché, Renaud and Gingras 1999, 210), and specifically the links between home and work for immigrant women, also warrant more attention. Gender roles influence all aspects of economic integration. Traditional gender ideologies and gendered-based divisions of labour emphasizing the role of women as homemakers, providing at best a supplementary income, result in immigrant women being unable to take advantage of language training programs, diminishing their prospects for meaningful employment and confining them to poorly paid jobs. Although such ideologies and practices are by no means unique to immigrant communities, immigrant women who are less educated and in need of language training are more vulnerable to their consequences than the Canadian-born. In the Portuguese community, many newly arrived women took care of children or went out to work in the evenings while their husbands attended language classes (Giles 2002). The gender division of labour within the household and gender ideologies that emphasized the man's importance as a breadwinner contributed to unequal access to language training with long term consequences for Portuguese women's paid employment. In many immigrant households where women have most of the responsibility for child care

and housework, women's abilities to participate in language and job training and to take advantage of job opportunities are constrained by the spatial separation of home and workplace (Preston and Man 1999). The time and effort involved in travelling to jobs and training that must be scheduled around the hours of child care and school discourage women from participating in training programs, leaving them qualified only for low-wage jobs. Immigrant women who try to overcome spatial constraints by engaging in paid work at home find that unpaid domestic work often impinges on their paid employment, which is also poorly paid and insecure (Giles and Preston 1996; Ng 1999). But gender roles in the family affect not only immigrant women's employability, employment, and earnings; they are in turn affected by immigrant women's employment. As research in the United States has shown, immigrant women's entry in the labour market often results in more egalitarian gender roles in the family and, in some ethnic groups, joint decision-making between the spouses. However, the results vary significantly by social class and education, ethnicity, and culture (Menjivar 1999; Pessar 1995). Research along similar lines is needed in Canada.

Finally, we need to know about economic and labour market integration processes from the perspectives of immigrant women and men themselves, highlighting their agency in integration processes. Research has emphasized the objective dimensions of integration that may be measured quantitatively; however, the subjective dimensions of integration, particularly those relating to the links between paid employment and the feeling of belonging in Canadian society, are of particular concern. For many immigrants, obtaining remunerative and appropriate paid work commensurate with one's skills is a critical indicator of integration into Canadian society (Neuwirth 1999, 63). In addition to the economic benefits of paid work, case studies have emphasized how paid work contributes to

immigrant women's attachment to Canada (Israelite et al. 1999). How do immigrant women who have withdrawn from the paid labour force develop a sense of belonging in the absence of paid work?

Reconsidering Research Methods

By rethinking economic and labour market integration, we also commit ourselves to reconsidering our research methods. Among the many methodological issues that arise immediately, four stand out. We need to devise better ways of assessing the economic integration of immigrant women. Family income is not always a valid indicator because it often reflects a husband's employment income or income that is not necessarily accessible to the immigrant woman (Miedema and Tastsoglou 2000). Personal income, employment status, and even occupational attainment may not reveal underemployment. Measures of labour market integration must also enable researchers to understand the obstacles that need to be overcome and the effort that went into obtaining remunerative and appropriate employment within a given time frame. Time and again, immigrant women emphasize how they have needed to work doubly hard for their efforts to be recognized and for their careers to be as successful as those of their Canadian peers (Ralston 1998; Tastsoglou and Miedema 2005). If, for example, practising medicine in Canada requires women from certain countries of origin to repeat their medical education in Canada, the outcome, measured at a certain moment in time, may indicate successful labour market integration. From our point of view however, such an approach to labour market integration is problematic and short-sighted, as it overlooks the human effort, the time and the sacrifice (of families and relationships) necessary for immigrant women to achieve such an outcome.

Comparisons with immigrant men, and Canadian-born women and men, are essential. Comparisons should take account of the diverse

experiences of Canadian-born women, particularly those of aboriginal women and women with disabilities (Piché, Renaud and Gingras 1999). Comparisons must also focus on integration processes, rather than just comparing labour market outcomes, as described by labour force participation rates, unemployment rates, and earnings. For example, in the case of migration from China (PRC), Salaff and Greve (2001) uncovered a distinct gender dimension to the employment experiences of Chinese immigrant women in Canada. Professional, immigrant women and men from China (PRC) are disadvantaged by the discounting of their credentials and misunderstanding of their former career ladders by Canadian employers. Women also bear the imprint of gender roles in the workplaces of their homeland. As professionals and managers in state companies and the public sector, Chinese women usually come into little contact with foreign companies in China. As a result, they are less likely than men with equivalent education to acquire work experience valued by Canadian employers (Salaff and Greve 2001). This combination of gender roles in China, and systemic racial, class and gender discrimination in Canada that results in Canadian qualifications being valued more than those of most other nations, and the experiences of female professionals as being less valued than those of men, reduces Chinese professional immigrant women's employability in Canada. The limited availability of support systems for families in Canada - for example, childcare - exacerbates the challenges facing Chinese immigrant women.

Differences in the labour market participation and earnings of immigrant women related to visible minority status and immigration class also warrant more study. Evidence is increasing that discrimination reduces the average wages of visible minorities in Canadian labour markets with larger effects for immigrants than for Canadian-born workers (Pendakur 2000). However, the effects of systemic discrimination are complex (Das

Gupta 1996; Preston & Man 1999). For example, James, Plaza and Jansen (1999) found that education mediated the adverse effects of being a visible minority born in the Caribbean. Among women born in the Caribbean who had postsecondary education, women who were educated in the Caribbean were on average better paid than women who were educated in Canada. Discrimination may also arise from immigration class. Somali and Ghanaian women have found that employers are unwilling to hire them with social insurance numbers that indicate they have temporary work permits rather than permanent residence (Israelite et al. 1999; Wong 2000). Sophisticated analyses are required to evaluate the effects of discrimination and to separate such effects from those of educational attainments, gender, place of birth, and immigration class (*ceteris paribus*).

To understand labour market integration processes requires longitudinal studies that combine quantitative and qualitative analyses. Longitudinal research would indicate how immigrant women's earnings and occupations change over time, demonstrating the extent to which income and occupational disparities between immigrant women and Canadian-born women gradually diminish. By tracing the employment histories of immigrant women over time, longitudinal studies would also provide a description of the processes by which immigrant women are integrated into different local labour markets, the obstacles they have had to surmount, the strategies that have worked best and the time that it has taken for particular obstacles to be overcome. Federal Government initiatives, such as the Longitudinal Survey of Immigrants to Canada (LSIC) are expected to provide valuable information on longer term integration processes (over a four year period after immigration), once the survey is completed in 2005.

Longitudinal research needs to have a strong quantitative component with a special emphasis on the

effects of educational achievement. Current research shows consistently that well-educated immigrants are not benefiting from their educational attainments (Li 2000). Quantitative analyses must control for educational achievement when examining the effects of gender, visible minority status, place of birth and immigration class, among other social characteristics, on immigrant women's earnings, unemployment rates, and labour force participation. We need such measurements over long periods of time as well.

The need for more qualitative assessments of gender, employment and immigrant integration has already been voiced (Abdo 1997; Juteau 1997). Qualitative studies would complement quantitative analyses by exploring immigrant women's experiences of the interacting effects of gender, education, visible minority status, and period of immigration on employment and the views of employers concerning the competencies and skills summarised in requirements for Canadian experience. Qualitative studies would also capture the strategies of immigrant women in overcoming obstacles to obtaining jobs commensurate with their qualifications (Tastsoglou and Miedema 2005), something that longitudinal quantitative studies alone cannot accomplish.

Conclusions

A growing literature underlines the persistent challenges faced by many immigrant women and their diverse experiences in Canadian labour markets. We have proposed an ambitious research agenda that will identify the various challenges facing different women as they strive to achieve employment commensurate with their qualifications and experience. We also advocate an eclectic mix of methodologies drawn from ethnographic studies, longitudinal studies, and studies that combine qualitative and quantitative analyses. The proposed research will enrich our understanding of immigrants' economic and labour market integration with the aim

of explaining and enhancing their economic performance. It will also assist in the design of services that will enable immigrant women to achieve equitable economic and labour market integration.

Although we do not specifically address the impacts of neo-liberalism and economic restructuring on immigrant women, evidence in the literature suggests that the challenges that we have identified may be even further heightened. In addition, neo-liberal influence has shaped the emphasis on highly skilled workers, transferable skills, and education and language provisions for independent class and temporary workers in our current immigration law, the Immigration and Refugee Protection Act (IRPA). Such provisions, in the very least, ensure that the gender, class and racial biases of earlier Canadian immigration policy will be replicated (Abu-Laban and Gabriel 2002, 81). In addition, the increased security provisions of the IRPA may fuel processes of racialization of those deemed terrorist threats, having a direct economic impact on immigrant and ethnic communities, and the men and women from those communities.

Endnotes

1. The present paper fleshes out points raised by the two authors in a more general working document entitled "Policy-Relevant Research on Immigration and Settlement - Relevant for Whom?" by the Strategic Workshop on Immigrant Women: Making Place in Canadian Cities. Montréal: INRS Urbanisation, Culture et Société, Institut national de la recherche scientifique, and Immigration et Métropoles, 2000. (Workshop members: D. Rose (coordinator), J. Bernhard, C. Creese, I. Dyck, L. Goldring, A. McLaren, C. Nolin, V. Preston, B. Ray, E. Tastsoglou). An earlier form of this paper was presented at the 5th National Metropolis Conference, Ottawa, Ontario, October 16-20, 2001. We are grateful for comments from all participants in the Strategic Workshop, especially Damaris Rose, the editors, and two

reviewers. We also appreciate the assistance of Ann Marie Murnaghan and Walter Giesbrecht. The authors gratefully acknowledge financial support from PCERII - Edmonton and CERIS - Toronto.

2. See Hiebert (2002) for one of the rare attempts to take account of immigration category when analysing immigrants' economic integration.

3. From a New Zealand definition of gender analysis: "Gender analysis is based on the standpoint that policy cannot be separated from the social context, and that social issues are an integral part of economic issues (quoted in Abu-Laban and Gabriel, *Selling Diversity*, Broadview Press, 2002, p. 26).

4. The proportions of all working immigrant and Canadian-born women who worked full time, full year in 2001 are very similar.

References

Abdo, N. "Gender is Not a 'Dummy': Research Methods in Immigration and Refugee Studies," Responding to Diversity in the Metropolis: Building an Inclusive Research Agenda. Proceedings of the First Metropolis National Conference on Immigration, B. Abu-Laban & T. Derwing eds. Edmonton: PCERII, 1997, pp. 95-99.

Abu-Laban, Y. and C. Gabriel. *Selling Diversity. Immigration, Multiculturalism, Employment Equity and Globalization*. Peterborough, Ont. Broadview Press, 2002.

Badets, J. and Chui. *Canada's Changing Immigrant Population*. Prentice Hall and Statistics Canada, 1996.

Badets, J. and Howatson-Leo, L. "Recent Immigrants in the Workforce," *Canadian Social Trends*, Spring (1999):16-22.

- Beach, C.M. and C. Worswick. "Is there a Double Negative Effect on the Earnings of Immigrant Women?" *Canadian Public Policy*, 19.1 (1993): 36-53.
- Berns McGown, R. *Muslims in the Diaspora: The Somali Communities of London and Toronto*. Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1999.
- Boyd, M. "Gender, Visible Minority and Immigrant Earnings Inequality: Reassessing an Employment Equity Premise," *Deconstructing a Nation: Immigration, Multiculturalism and Racism in 1990s Canada*, V. Satzewich, ed. Halifax: Fernwood Publishing and University of Saskatchewan, Department of Sociology, Social Science Research Unit, 1992, pp. 279-321.
- _____. "Educational Attainments of Immigrant Offspring: Success or Segmented Assimilation," *International Migration Review*, 36 (2002): 1037-60.
- Brouwer, A. *Immigrants Need Not Apply*. Ottawa: Caledon Institute of Social Policy, 1999.
- Chard, J., J. Badets and L. Howatson-Leo. "Immigrant Women," *Women in Canada, 2000, A Gender-Based Statistical Report*. Ottawa: Statistics Canada, 2000, pp. 189-218.
- Das Gupta, T. *Racism and Paid Work*. Toronto: Garamond Press, 1996.
- Driedger, L. *Multi-Ethnic Canada: Identities and Inequalities*. Toronto: Oxford University Press, 1996.
- Frenette, M. and R. Morissette. *Will They Ever Converge? Earnings of Immigrant and Canadian-born Workers Over the Last Two Decades*. Ottawa: Statistics Canada, 2003.
- Giles, W. *Portuguese Women in Toronto: Gender, Immigration and Nationalism*. Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 2002.
- _____. and V. Preston. "Domestication of Women's Work: A Comparison of Chinese and Portuguese Immigrant Women Homeworkers," *Studies in Political Economy*, 51 (1996): 147-81.
- Hiebert, D. "Local Geographies of Labor Market Segmentation: Montréal, Toronto, and Vancouver, 1991," *Economic Geography*, 74 (1999): 339-69.
- _____. "The Spatial Limits to Entrepreneurship: Immigrant Entrepreneurs in Canada," *Tijdschriften voor Economische en Sociale Geografie*, 93 (2002): 173-90.
- Horizons, "Canada's Immigration System," *Public Works and Government Services Canada*, Vol. 5, No 5 (2002): 27-29.
- Hou, F. and T. R. Balakrishnan. "The Integration of Visible Minorities in Contemporary Canadian Society," *Canadian Journal of Sociology*, 21.3 (1996): 307-26.
- Israelite, N. K., A. Herman, F.A. Alim, H.A. Mohamed, Y. Khan and L. Caruso "Waiting for 'Sharciga': Resettlement and the Roles of Somali Refugee Women," *Canadian Woman Studies/Cahiers de la femme*, 19 (1999): 80-87.
- James, C., D. Plaza and C. Jansen. "Issues of Race in Employment Experiences of Caribbean Women in Toronto," *Canadian Woman Studies/Cahiers de la femme*, 19 (1999): 129-33.
- Juteau, D. "Gendering Immigration/Integration Policy Research: Research gaps," *Responding to Diversity in the Metropolis: Building an Inclusive Research Agenda*. Proceedings of the First Metropolis National Conference

- on Immigration, B. Abu-Laban & T. Derwing, eds. Edmonton: PCERII, 1997, pp. 99-103.
- Kunz, J. L., A. Milan and S. Schetagne. "Unequal Access. A Canadian Profile of Racial Differences in Education, Employment and Income. A Report prepared for Canadian Race Relations Foundation by the Canadian Council on Social Development." Ottawa, 2000.
- Li, P. S. "Earnings Disparities Between Immigrants and Native-Born Canadians," *Canadian Review of Sociology and Anthropology*, 37.3 (2000): 289-311.
- Lo, L., V. Preston, S. Wang, K. Riel, E. Harvey and B. Suin. *Immigrants' Economic Status in Toronto: Rethinking Settlement and Integration Strategies*, CERIS Working Paper #15. Toronto: Joint Centre of Excellence for Research on Immigration and Settlement, 2000.
- Menjivar, C. "The Intersection of Work and Gender: Central American Immigrant Women and Employment in California," *The American Behavioral Scientist*, 42, 4 (1999): 601-27.
- Miedema, B. and S. Wachholz. *A Complex Web: Access to Justice for Abused Immigrant Women In New Brunswick*. Ottawa: Research Directorate Status of Women Canada, 1998.
- Miedema, B. and E. Tastsoglou " 'But Where Are You From, Originally?' Immigrant Women and Integration in the Maritimes," *Atlantis: A Women's Studies Journal*, 24.2 (2000): 82-91.
- Mojab, S. "De-skilling Immigrant Women," *Canadian Woman Studies/Cahiers de la femme*, 19 (1999): 123-28
- Neuwirth, G. "Toward a Theory of Immigrant Integration," *Immigrant Canada. Demographic, Economic, and Social Challenges*. Shiva S. Halli and Leo Driedger, eds. Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1999, pp. 51-69.
- Ng, R. "Homeworking: Dream Realized or Freedom Constrained? The Globalized Reality of Immigrant Garment Workers," *Canadian Woman Studies/Cahiers de la femme*, 19 (1999): 110-14.
- _____ and A. Estable. "Immigrant Women in the Labour Force: An Overview of Present Knowledge and Research Gaps," *Resources for Feminist Research*, 16(1987), 1: 29-33.
- Nyakbwa, K. and C. D.H. Harvey, "Adaptation to Canada: The Case of Black Immigrant Women," *Women and Well-Being*, Vanaja Dhruvarajan, ed. Kingston: McGill-Queen's University Press, 1990, pp. 139-49.
- Pendakur, R. *Immigrants and the Labour Force: Policy, Regulation, and Impact*. Montreal and Kingston: McGill-Queen's University Press, 2000.
- Pessar, P. "On the Homefront and in the Workplace: Integrating Immigrant Women into Feminist Discourse," *Anthropological Quarterly*, 68,1 (1995): 37-47.
- Piché, V., J. Renaud, and L. Gingras. "Comparative Immigrant Economic Integration," *Immigrant Canada. Demographic, Economic, and Social Challenges*, Shiva S. Halli and Leo Driedger, eds. Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1999, pp. 185-211.
- Preston, V. & J.C. Cox. "Immigrants and Employment: a Comparison of Montreal and Toronto Between 1981 and 1996," *Canadian Journal of Regional Science*, XXII.1&2 (1999): 87-111.
- Preston, V. and G. Man. "Employment Experiences of

Chinese Immigrant Women: An Exploration of Diversity," *Canadian Woman Studies/Cahiers de la femme*, 19 (1999): 115-22.

Preston, V., L. Lo and S.Wang. "Immigrants' Economic Status in Toronto: Stories of Triumph and Disappointment," *The World in a City*, Paul Anisef and Michael Lanphier, eds. Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 2003, pp. 192-232.

Ralston, Helen. "'Crossing the Black Water': Alienation and Identity Among South Asian Immigrant Women," *Designs for Alienation: Exploring Diverse Realities*, Devorah Kalekin-Fishman, ed. University of Jyväskylä, Finland: Sophi, 1998, pp. 152-74.

Reitz, J. G. *Warmth of the Welcome: The Social Causes of Economic Success for Immigrants in Different Nations and Cities*. Boulder CO: Westview Press, 1998.

_____ and R. Breton. *The Illusion of Difference: Realities of Ethnicity in Canada and the United States*. Toronto: C.D. Howe Institute, 1994.

Salaff, J. and A. Greve. "Women That Move: International Migration from the PRC to Canada and the Negotiation of Gendered Job Opportunities," paper presented at "Migration and the 'Asian Family' in a Globalizing World, 16-18 April 2001, Singapore. Organized by Asian MetaCentre for Population and Sustainable Development Analysis, Centre for Advanced Studies, National University of Singapore, Singapore. 2001.

Small, S. *Racialized Barriers*. London: Routledge, 1994.

Statistics Canada. *Employment Income Groups (22) in Constant (2000) Dollars, Sex (3), Immigrant Status and Period of Immigration (10D) and Historical Highest Level*

of Schooling (6) for Population 15 Years and Over, for Canada, Provinces and Territories, 1995 and 2000. Ottawa: Statistics Canada, Cat. No. 97F0019XCB01046, 2003a.

_____. *Labour Force Activity (8), Highest Level of Schooling (12), School Attendance (4), Immigrant Status and Period of Immigration (10C), Visible Minority Groups (14), Sex (3) and Age Groups (11A) for Population 15 Years and Over, for Canada, Provinces and Territories, 1991 to 2001 Censuses*. Ottawa: Statistics Canada, Cat. No. 97F0012XCB01041, 2003b.

_____. *Selected Cultural and Labour Force Characteristics (58), Immigrant Status and Place of Birth of Respondent (21B), Age Groups (5A), Sex (3) and Immigrant Status and Period of Immigration (11) for Population 15 Years and Over, for Canada, Provinces, Territories and Census Metropolitan Areas, 2001 Census*. Ottawa: Statistics Canada, Cat. No. 97F0009XCB01042, 2003c.

_____. *Selected Income Characteristics (35), Immigrant Status and Place of Birth of Respondent (21B), Age Groups (6), Sex (3) and Immigrant Status and Period of Immigration (11) for Population, for Canada, Provinces, Territories and Census Metropolitan Areas, 2001 Census*. Ottawa: Statistics Canada, Cat. No. 97F0009XCB01043, 2003d.

_____. *Wage and Salary Groups (22) in Constant (2000) Dollars, Sex (3), Visible Minority Groups (14) and Immigrant Status (3) for Paid Workers 15 Years and Over, for Canada, Provinces, and Territories, 1995 and 2000*. Ottawa: Statistics Canada, Cat. No. 97F0019xCB010157, 2003e.

Tastsoglou, E. and B. Miedema. "'Working Much Harder and Always Having to Prove Yourself': Immigrant

Women's Labour Force Experiences in the Canadian Maritimes," *Advances in Gender Research*, 9 (2005): 201-33.

Wong, M. "Ghanaian Women in Toronto's Labour Market: Negotiating Gendered Roles and Transnational Household Strategies," *Canadian Ethnic Studies*, 32 (2000): 45-74.

Table 1

ECONOMIC INTEGRATION OF IMMIGRANT WOMEN, 2001				
	Women		Men	
	Immigrant	Canadian-Born	Immigrant	Canadian-Born
Labour force participation (%)	75.01	82.4	89.8	92.4
Unemployment rate	8.9	6.1	6.9	6.6
Manual workers (%)	11.7	5.9	13.6	15.3
Average employment income (\$)*	33, 613	35,372	45, 231	48, 063

Source: Statistics Canada, 2003a, 2003b, 2003c, 2003d. * Average employment income is calculated only for full-time employees.