Effective Service Delivery of Nigeria's Public Primary Education: The Role of Non-State Actors

TAYO O. GEORGE   W. K. OLAYIWOLA   M. A. ADEWOLE
and
EVANS S. OSABUOHIEN[1]

ABSTRACT

The study examines and analyses the role of Non-State Actors (NSAs) in public provision of primary education in Nigeria using descriptive and econometric techniques. The analysis demonstrates that the major source of funding of public primary education in Nigeria flows from the Federal Government to the State government and finally to the Local Government Education Authority (LGEA). The study shows that NSAs' activities are mainly the provision of school inputs with little or no role monitoring and management of public primary schools. It was found that the presence of private school inspectors has significant positive effect on pupils' performance. Parents occupation and household qualities especially type of building were found to have positive impact on the pupils' performance. Based on these findings, the study recommends the need for adequate involvement of NSAs in the management of public primary schools and improved inspection of schools as ways of improving the quality of primary education in Nigeria.

INTRODUCTION
BACKGROUND TO THE STUDY AND THE RESEARCH PROBLEM

Education occupies a very unique position in the national development of any nation. It is acknowledged as the bedrock of socio-economic and political advancement of countries (National Bureau of Statistics-NBS, 2009). This is because education empowers people to take advantage of development opportunities. Thus, educated individuals are seen to be crucial catalyst for any economy through driving technological diffusion and utilisation, among others (Becker, 1962; Osabuohien and Efobi, 2012). In this regard, Strauss and Thomas (1998) have observed that educated and healthy people have the abilities to contribute significantly to economic growth. Therefore, education at all levels is pivotal to national development. This was recognised by the Nigerian government, which was evident in the Fourth National Development Plan of 1980. One of the objectives of the Plan was to raise the quality of education at all levels in order to make the products of the nation's school system more relevant to the society.

There is little or no doubt that one of the factors that could determine the performance of students at the secondary and tertiary levels is the foundational knowledge that has been acquired at the primary level. This was reflected in various national and regional polices, especially the Universal Primary Education (UPE) in the Western and Eastern regions in 1953, aimed at making education available to all. The introduction of UPE was characterized by acute shortage of classrooms - overcrowded classrooms, shortage of teachers as well as equipment. Babalola and Adedeji (2009) assert that three decades of exclusive government ownership, control and management of education had been attended by unprecedented failures. It has been characterized by poorly trained teachers, poor teaching, poor technology and under-funding. As public education became increasingly ineffective and inefficient, private provision of education became inevitable. For instance, in Lagos, there are more recognized private primary schools than public schools (Tooley, Dixon and Olaniyan, 2005). There are still many unrecognized private schools delivering higher quality educational services than the public primary schools in Lagos State (Tooley *et al*, 2005).

What seems pretty obvious is that the past and present level of government funding is insufficient to achieve the Millennium Development Goals

(MDGs) for education, let alone the Education for All (EFA) projects (Berman, 2001). The level of public funding is generally low, increasing modestly from 7.16% in 2001 to 7.84% in 2002, 8.09% in 2003, and 11% in 2004. Although, this compares favorably among the other social sectors' expenditure, but it falls below United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization (UNESCO) recommendation of 26%. The best available estimates (Hinchliffe,2002) are that Nigeria spent 14% of total public expenditure (in all three tiers of government) on education in 1998, which comprises 2.3% of Gross Domestic Products (GDP), compared with the averages of 20% and 4.7%, respectively, for 19 countries across Sub-Saharan Africa (SSA). From 1980 to 1997, the percentage of total federal government expenditure on education had remained lower than 9%. The worrisome part of this is that Nigeria, may not achieve both MDGs and EFA, not just because of the low level of government support, but due to underfunding, there have been constant accusations that the Universal Basic Education (UBE) funds are been misappropriated. Thus, not all the released funds reach the intended beneficiaries or sectors.

There are numerous issues and problems involved in the management of primary education system in Nigeria. Since the National Policy on Education handbook was first published in 1977, both the State and the Federal Government have engaged in the implementation of the programme. The programme like any other programme in Nigeria has not achieved the desired results owing to some factors. At a time, State Government took control, later it was handed over to the Local Government and then to a Federal Commission. Durosaro (2004) noted that not until lately that a concrete legislation was passed on primary education in Nigeria – the Universal Basic Education (UBE) bill.

At the core of Nigeria's primary education is the fact that public funding is at lower ebb of 11% in 2007 compared to UNESCO standard of 26%. This low funding is compounded by problems associated with lack of access to service providers, misappropriation, fund leakages and diversions. Consequently, the provision of education materials for effective teaching and learning remains a major challenge of Nigeria's public primary schools. In spite of national initiatives, "Operation Save our School Program" established in 1992 to mobilize and involve civil society in planning, management, monitoring and funding of schools, the state of public education leaves much to be desired. The identified problems are compounded by bureaucratic bottlenecks in the education ministry. Thus, the need for the participation of Non-State Actors (NSAs) to enhance the quality of service delivery in Nigeria's primary education in terms of access becomes important. This is study

is significant because of its focus on the role of NSAs, which earlier work by Tooley *et al* (2005) did not cover. NSAs refer to private involvement in primary education provision. Essentially, NSAs include: private individuals, Community Based Organizations (CBOs), Non-governmental Organizations (NGOs), religious bodies, charity organisations, trade unions, cooperative societies, among others (Ogunyeni *et al*, 2005). Hence, this study examines the inputs of NSAs in public primary schools and how it influence pupils' performance. It also investigates the impact of institutional factors on pupils' performance in public primary schools in Nigeria.

LITERATURE REVIEW

PRIMARY EDUCATION PROVISION AND MANAGEMENT IN NIGERIA

After attaining independence in 1960, Nigerian government made efforts to reshape the education system in line with the yearnings of the time. Sunal and Ose (1994) observed that Nigeria's government after independence favoured a public school system that would promote a national identity over ethnic and religious differences. Successive government used public education to promote national unity, and build human resources for the exploration of the country's natural resources. The Nigerian educational sector at all levels is plagued by a myriad of problems which has now become a going-concern after years of un-arrested deterioration with the primary sub-sector been the worse hit.

The current policy on education in Nigeria has its root in the curriculum conference of 1969, which was sponsored by the Federal Government through the Nigerian Educational Research Council. Adepoju (2007) noted that one of the most important gains of this conference was the birth of the 6-3-3-4 system of education which was defined in the National Policy on Education (NPE) of 1977. In addition, Awoniyi (2007) observed that by 1997, a draft policy on education was discussed by the Federal Government and, in 1981, it was approved for implementation and revised in 1995 and 1998. What attracted the nation to the 6-3-3-4 system of education was the fact that it was rooted in science and technology which are tools for economic and technological growth and development as against the former system of 6-5-4 (Tsadu, 1998; Adepoju, 2007).

The responsibility for the management of primary education involves the Federal, State, and Local Government of the Federation. The Federal Government's role in the implementation of the Universal Basic Education (UBE) is to ensure quality control and maintenance of uniform standards and general co-ordination of programme implementation. The State Governments have constitutional and legislative responsibility to manage the UBE and get a 2% of the Federal Consolidated Revenue as grants in support of UBE (Federal Ministry of Education, 2007). Finance has been a major factor in the Nigerian education system especially at the primary level. The World Bank (2006) has estimated that an additional 251,000 classrooms need to be constructed at a cost of $3billion. In 2006, it was estimated that 4,222 new primary and 2,463 junior secondary classrooms were constructed (Federal Ministry of Education-FME, 2006). This suggests that at the current rates of construction, it will take up to 40 years to make up the deficit.

Lockheed and Verspoor (1991) in a study of developing countries have identified various input and process determinants of educational output. These include orderly school environment, academic emphasis in the form of clearly defined learning outcomes and standards, curriculum, particularly the "implemented curriculum", time for learning, effective use of school time, qualified teachers, and healthy children. The World Education Forum (2000) defined quality of education in terms of recognized and measurable learning outcomes especially in literacy, numeracy and essential life skills. to achieve the desired quality the input and process should also have quality in terms of efficiency, effectiveness, excellence, and social justice. From the ongoing, we can say that Non-State Actors (NSAs) involvement in education provision is paramount in addressing the identified challenges.

In Lagos State, the focus of this study, the major players of primary education include:

- *Universal Basic Education Commission (UBEC)* - a national body with representation in the 36 States of Nigeria including the Federal Capital Territory (FCT) Abuja.

- *Lagos State Ministry of Education* – an arm of the State Government charged with the responsibility of providing quality education.

- *Schools Universal Basic Education Board (SUBEB)*- an offshoot of UBEC at the State level. It is an organ of education under the direct supervision of

the State ministry of education. It is charged with the responsibility of administration, supervision, recruitment, funding, appointment, promotion and discipline.

Among the sub-units of SUBEB in Lagos State include:

a. Schools Services Board (SSB) charged with performing supervisory roles for the public   primary schools across the 20 Local Government Areas (LGAs) of Lagos State. However, only 3 LGAs: Badagry, Kosofe and Surulere the focus of this study, was examined in the subsequent sections

b. In addition to the SSB, SUBEB through a unit-Projects and Evaluation (P&E) executes major projects for both public primary schools and the State-owned secondary schools under its jurisdiction. Building of classrooms, head teachers office, toilet facilities, provision of furniture, bulk purchase of science laboratory and equipment, and text books to mention a few. In some cases, these projects are handled by SUBEB or in conjunction with NSAs.

c. SUBEB has an arm that handles all financial transaction of the body responsible for the disbursement of the running cost of Naira500,000 (naira is the Nigerian currency) to each of the State's LGEAs, in addition to funding seminars, workshops, and training of teachers and non-teaching staff.

NON-STATE ACTORS AND PRIMARY EDUCATION PROVISION

The concept of Non-State Actors (NSAs) was originated from the Cotonou Agreement in 2000 between the European Union (EU) and African Caribbean and Pacific (ACP) countries, signed by 77 ACP countries and 15 EU members (Ogunyeni *et al*, 2005). During the conference, reference was made to the activities of NSAs. Based on the agreement, an applicable definition of the concept 'NSAs' are those private sectors and all social and economic partners, including trade union organizations, and the civil society. They include parties such as CBOs, gender groups, human right associations, NGOs, religious bodies, charity organisations, trade unions, private individuals and cooperative societies. In this study, NSAs comprise organisations, individuals, religious and corporate bodies, etc that provide supports for public primary education.

The Article 4 of the ACP-EC agreement spells out that the NSAs will be involved, *inter alia*, in the process of complementary development activities. These includes co-operation in areas that affects NSAs. The NSAs will also be involved in the implementation of projects and programmes in areas which they have complementary advantage. Therefore, the role of the NSAs can be categorized into two major categories. These categories include their role as partners in dialogue and their roles as service providers. The former role involves their role as advocates in consultation with policy makers on programs in co-operation with public benefit. These include the civil societies, human right activist, trade unions. The later involves the efficient provision of service for social and overall benefits of the populace through finances, expertise and so on.

CONCEPTUAL FRAMEWORK

This study builds on the framework of Reinikka and Smith (2004). The conceptual framework explains the accountability relationship between policymakers and frontline service providers on one hand (called compact), and between final consumers of educational services (students, parents and NSAs) and frontline service providers on the other hand (client power). In addition, the framework also includes the accountability relationship between policymakers and client-citizens (voice). The quality of service delivery is to a large extent dependent on the effectiveness of this accountability framework.

In this framework, policymakers includes the three tiers of government in the country (Federal, State and Local Governments) in addition to politicians or bureaucrats are expected to be accountable to the client i.e. the citizens through adequate resources devoted to providing quality service delivery of primary education. In Nigeria, the federal government, through its agency (Universal Basic Education Board, UBEC) periodically releases financial and educational materials to appropriate authorities at the level of the state (State Universal Basic Education Board, SUBEB). These authorities distribute these educational materials to the Local Government Education Authorities (LGEAs), which in turn distribute these materials to the schools (the frontline service providers). The nature of impact should result in reduced pupil-teacher ratio, smaller class size, greater use in the number of modern teaching aids, more books per pupil and so on.

METHODS OF ANALYSIS

To achieve the objectives of the study, the methodology engaged involves the use of descriptive and econometric analyses. The descriptive aspect

entails the documentation and investigation of the involvement of the NSAs in public primary education provision. The econometric analysis examines the influence of institutions and accountability on pupils' performance.

The first method of analysis, which was aimed at achieving the first objective of the study, details the role of NSAs in the public primary schools in three LGEAs, namely: Badagry, Kosofe and Surulere. This is essential because it provides the roles of NSAs, which was not covered by Tooley *et al* (2005). This was achieved using a mini-questionnaire adapted from Public Expenditure and Tracking Surveys (PETS) technique. PETS consolidates information from frontline Service Providers who can provide useful insight into and the reasons for the disparity in the outcome of public spending, quality and performance of service delivery systems (Reinikka and Smith, 2004; Amin, Jishnu and Goldstein, 2008). Beyond that, the PETS methodology is structured to determine the role played by private persons and organizations in terms of commitment to funding public school system.

To achieve the second objective, the study formulated a model that engaged Tooley *et al* (2005) data on three focused LGAs, namely: Badagry, Kosofe and Surulere. Their dataset was collected from October to December 2003, which is made-up of census of schools and survey of inputs but the report was published in Tooley *et al* (2005). The aim is to estimate how accountability or the lack of it impact on pupils' test score performance in examinations conducted at the school level.

We formulated an econometric model to determine the factors that can influence school outcomes. The school outcomes in this regards are based on pupil's performance (test scores) in two major subjects which are crucial for further education- Mathematics and English. Two other tests scores include: Social Studies and Raven (special test that measures pupils' Intelligence Quotient). We related these indicators of performance to pupil's characteristics, parents, schools as well as indicators of institutions and accountability in the schools using the school codes.

From the above, a functional relationship between indicators of pupils' performance and the explanatory variables is expressed thus:

$$Pefom_i^k = f\ (Pupicha_i,\ Parentcha_i,\ Schcha_i,\ Instcha_i) \qquad (1)$$

where *Pefom^k* denotes iIndicators of performance namely: Mathematics, English Language, Social Studies and Raven test scores. That is, *k*=1-4.

Pupicha is pupils' characteristics; *Parentcha* is parents' characteristics; *Schcha* is schools' characteristics; and *Instch* denotes indicators of institution and accountability.

Given the fact that our main focus was on the school characteristics and measures of institutional factors, we made indicators of parents and pupils to be parsimonious. For pupils' characteristics, we used the pupil's religion, gender, and age. For parents' characteristics, we used occupation of father/guardian and type of buildings of the family. These two factors are crucial because despite the introduction of UBEC, which gave rise to free tuition, other school items such as uniform, sandals, books, etc are not included that parents must provide. The type of building captures the living conditions of the pupil's environment, which is essential for performance. Other parents' characteristics such as income, educational level etc were not captured in the model based on the fact these variables were not adequately defined in the dataset.

For the school characteristics, we used pupils-teachers' ratio. This was computed by dividing total number of pupils in the schools by the total number of teachers. This is crucial as it will help to explain how school characteristics influence pupils' performance. The last measure is an indicator of institutions and accountability, which were derived from Tooley's *et al* (2005), namely: private inspection of schools and external auditing of schools' accounts.

Equation (1) is reformulated by using the variables mentioned above and expressed in econometric form as:

$$Pupefom_i^k = a_0 + a_1 Puprel_i + a_2 age_i + a_3 gender_i + a_4 Pocup_i + a_5 buildtyp_i + a_6 ptrato_i + a_7 inspet_i + a_8 extaudi_i + e \qquad (2)$$

where

Pupefom^k :   Indicators of performance, represented by test scores in Mathematics, English Language, Social Studies and Raven.

Puprel: The religion of the pupils to reflect their perception in life, which can influence their ambition and dispositions.

age: The age of pupils in years.

gender: The gender of the pupils (male or female).

Pocup: Parents' occupation measured as father/guardian main occupation.

buidtyp: Type of building the pupils' household reside, which was categorised as: brick, face to face, wooden, mud and others.

Ptratio: Pupils-teachers ratio computed by dividing total number of pupils by the total number of teachers in the schools.

Inspet: Private inspection of schools measured as the visits of private inspectors to the schools within a session. These private inspectors were not defined in Tooley *et al* (2005). However, from our field visits we observe that private inspectors comprise the School Based Management Committee (SBMC), which is made-up of: representative from the community; religious representative; representative from old boys/girls association; and the head-teacher. This variable will give an indication of institutional control factors on the school.

extaudi: External auditing of schools' accounts, which captures accountability of public schools. This is measured as the frequency of schools' account externally audited grouped into 'never', 'every year at a regular time', and 'occasionally without notice'.

e: The error term**.**

A priori, we expect $a_6 < 0$, while other coefficients are expected to be positive. This is because high pupil–teacher ratio will have negative influence on pupils' performance as a high pupil-teacher ratio will reduce teaching effectiveness given the fact that teachers' attention are directed at many pupils. With respect to other explanatory variables, improvement in them is expected to increase performance, *ceteris paribus*.

THE DATA

The data employed consist of two levels, namely:
The data on the role of NSAs in the public primary schools in three LGAs – Badagry, Kosofe and Surulere was obtained by a mini-questionnaire adapted from Public Expenditure and Tracking Surveys (PETS) technique. The mini-questionnaire for this study contains 30 open and closed ended questions, which was divided into three parts.

Part A covers general information about the public primary schools, pupils' performance in major subjects (English Language, Mathematics and Social

Studies); Part B contains questions relating to facilities in the primary schools sampled, while Part C examines questions on organization and governance of the selected schools[3].   A total of 153 public primary schools across three Local Government Areas (LGAs) were covered. This comprised all the public primary schools in the LGAs: 53 in Badagry, 40 in Kosofe and 60 in Surulere. Thus, the sampled public primary schools will help to analyse how NSAs' involvement in the provision of public primary education.

The second data source aimed at analyzing the determinants of pupils' performance was obtained from Tooley et al (2005) dataset across the same three LGAs covering 160 primary schools: unregistered private primary schools (67); registered private primary schools (53); and Government (public) primary schools (40). These three categories of primary schools distributed across the three LGAs are summarized in Table 3.1.

Table 3.1: Selection of Public Primary Schools

LGA	Public	Registered Private	Unregistered Private	Total
Badagry	10	5	19	34
Kosofe	10	27	29	66
Surulere	20	21	19	60
Total	**40**	**53**	**67**	**160**

Source: Authors' computation using Data from Tooley *et al.*

From Table 3.1, out of the 160 primary schools covered, 40 were public primary schools. Given the fact that our focus is on the public primary schools, we extracted the public schools using the school codes and names in the three LGAs and arrived at 1,100 pupils.

BACKGROUND TO THE STUDY AREAS

The study area covers three Local Government Areas (LGAs), namely: Badagry, Kosofe, and Surulere in Lagos State, Nigeria. The choice of these three LGEAs was informed by the need to complement the study of Tooley *et al* (2005) which focused on these three LGAs one from each of the three Senatorial Districts

---

[3] Details are not provided for space but available from authors on request.

in Lagos State. The major complementary role of our study was the inclusion of NSAs.

Lagos State is the traditional territory of the *Yoruba* and *Egun* speaking groups created in May 1967. The State is situated in the South-Western part of Nigeria with an area covering about 3.577sq kilometres, which 22% of the landmass made up of lagoons, creeks; rivers and swamps. The State is a major manufacturing, commercial and financial nerve center in Nigeria. It is equally the most urbanized linking the coastal region with the interior of the country through major land, water and rail roads. The busy network of Federal and State roads provide access to all parts of Nigeria and the West African sub-region. As one of the largest cities in Black Africa, it was the seat of Federal Government of Nigeria between 1914 and 1990 when the capital was moved to the Federal Capital Territory (FCT), Abuja (UBEC Head Office, Abuja).

The estimated population of Lagos according to the 2006 population census is over 14 million. The population density of Lagos suggests that the State has the highest burden in relation to socio-political and economic life of Nigerians. The State provides educational services to both the indigenes and non-indigenes represented by the multi-ethnic groups. For the purpose of this study, three out of the 20 LGA's namely, Badagry (Rural), Kosofe (Semi-Urban) and Surulere (Urban) in area Lagos State was considered.

Badagry LGA: is a rural setting and a historic town located on the west coast of Lagos State. The history of Badagry dates back to the fifteenth century. Badagry was a major slave trade route in Nigeria and Africa. Slave traders and most European colonial masters used Badagry as a major route to transport Africans sold into slavery to Europe and other parts of the world. The first storey-building in Nigeria is found in Badagry where the colonial masters first settled. As at July 2010 during our field visit, Badagry has a total of 53 public primary schools, 14 Junior Secondary schools, one Administrative Staff College for higher management studies and the Nigerian French Language Village. The 53 public primary schools in Badagry include the schools for the physically challenged two of which are located at Ijara and Muslim Primary School Badagry which also houses the LGEA office.

Kosofe LGA is a semi-urban area of Lagos State comprising of Maryland and Ketu suburbs. It occupies an estimated area of 81 km^2 and a population of 665,393 at the 2006 census. The State Universal Basic Education Board is presently located in Maryland area of Kosofe LGA. It has a total of 40 public primary schools that report to the Education Secretary. The LGEA has monitoring and evaluation team that engages in periodic or routine checks at the schools.

Surulere LGA is a middle income area of Lagos State with low population density. It is divided into: Itire, Coker Aguda and New Lagos. The LGEA has a total of 60 public primary schools among which include 3 special schools for the physically challenged namely: Wesley I & II for pupils with hearing challenge and the Pacelli School for the blind and partially sighted.

PRESENTATION OF RESULTS AND ANALYSES

The findings presented in this section are in two parts. The first examines the involvement of NSAs in the study areas. The second aspect presents the empirical results obtained using Tooley *et al* data.

ANALYSIS OF NSAS' INVOLVEMENT IN PUBLIC PRIMARY SCHOOLS IN LAGOS STATE

In this sub-section, we present the findings on the role of Non-State Actors (NSAs) in public primary education in Lagos State. It is imperative to mention that Lagos State has more than 35% of the total registered NGOs in Nigeria, which is far higher than any other state in the country. The closest to it was FCT and Oyo that had 7.5% and 6.8%, respectively (Ogunyeni *et al*, (2005).

The Lagos State Ministry of Education in its Annual Education Sector Performance Report of 2010 recognized the need for NSAs involvement in public primary education. This was stated under the education sector plan of 2009-2018. Generally, this study found that most of NSAs' involvements center on financial donations to the schools and supporting a given project. The study also observed that most of the donations were made to the schools directly in recent times instead of going through SUBEB and LGEA as previously done. Initially, donations were from top to bottom (through SUBEB and LGEA to the schools) but there were issues of bureaucratic delays and inconveniences. This resulted in a situation in which donations were made to the schools directly by NSAs and the head teachers report such donations to the LGEA in their monthly report known as *My School at a Glance* for documentation in SUBEB office.

Below is the grouping of NSAs in Lagos State based on core activities/roles they perform in public primary education provision. They are in four main groups:

Group A: International Agencies. They are agencies that have made contributions to primary schools and they include: Education Sector Support Program in Nigeria (ESSPIN) funded by Department for International Development (DFID) with operations in five states - Jigawa, Kaduna, Kano, Kwara, and Lagos. Other International Agencies are: United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization United Nations (UNESCO), USAID/COMPASS (Community Participation for Action in the Social Sector), and the World Bank.

Group B: Community Based Organizations (CBOs), Parents' Teachers Association (PTA, now referred as Parents' Forum), Religious Organizations, Identity Groups and Professional Associations.

Group C: Made up of Private Individuals such as alumni and other individual philanthropists who make contributions to the schools.

Group D: Made up of Organized Private Sector/Corporate Bodies, which include contributions from the business community both within the environment where the school is located and outside.

From the above grouping, this study presents the findings from the data derived from authors' mini-survey based on the three selected LGAs. The coverage period was from 2005 to 2010 with a view to examining NSAs' recent involvement in public primary education. The distribution of the four categories of NSAs across the three samples of LGAs are summarized in Table 4.1a.

As shown in Table 4.1a, the percentage distribution of NSAs' categories across the three LGAs reveal that for Group A (International Agencies) category, Badagry LGA has the highest input of 53.13%. Kosofe LGA has the highest contribution from Group B (Religious Bodies) category, which was 47.83%. Individual and Philanthropist category as represented by Group C has its highest presence in Surulere LGA with about 37.14%. In a similar vein, Group D category (corporate bodies) was highest in Surulere LGA representing 22.86%.

Table 4.1a: Distribution of NSAs' Categories the three LGAs

NSA categories	Badagry	Kosofe	Surulere
Group A	17.00	6.00	9.00
%	53.13	26.09	25.71
Group B	2.00	11.00	5.00
%	6.25	47.83	14.29
Group C	7.00	3.00	13.00
%	21.88	13.04	37.14
Group D	6.00	3.00	8.00
%	18.75	13.04	22.86
Total	32.00	23.00	35.00
Total number of Public Primary Schools	53	40	60

Source: Authors' computation from Field Survey, 2010

The above pattern of distribution can be related to two main issues. Firstly, the rural nature of Badagry LGA is likely to attract more international interventions compared to those in the urban center. The second issue can be likened to the fact that Surulere being the most urbanized with the highest presence of corporate bodies explains why it received the highest contribution from Groups C and D.

Furthermore, NSAs' activities in the study area can be categorized into the following: infrastructure, school inputs and other supports. The Infrastructure includes construction of classrooms, administrative blocks, toilets, borehole, roofing of building and related repairs. School inputs comprise provision of chalks, blackboards, dusters, books, and other teaching aids. While other supports include sponsoring of sporting activities, donation of trophies, de-worming exercises for pupils and organizing of workshops/seminars for teachers. This is reported in Table 4.1b.

Table 4.1b shows that NSAs' activities in the three LGAs were found to be more of infrastructural provision. This finding is at variance with the Cotonou Agreement of 2000 where the NSAs were seen to be partners in dialogue with service providers through their involvements as advocates in consultation with policy makers. The highest was in Badagry LGA representing 68.75%, followed by Kosofe LGA with 47.83%. Surulere had the least with 42.86%. The study found that school inputs across the three LGAs were below 40% with the highest in Kosofe LGA.

Table 4.1b: Distribution of NSAs' Activities in the three LGAs

NSA Types of Activities	Badagry	Kosofe	Surulere
Infrastructure	22.00	11.00	15.00
%	68.75	47.83	42.86
School Inputs	10.00	9.00	9.00
%	31.25	39.13	25.71
Other Supports	Nil	3.00	1.00
%	0.00	13.04	2.86

Source: Authors' computation from Field Survey, 2010.

The study further presents a comprehensive list of NSAs' involvement across the three LGEAs. The NSAs that made donations to the public primary schools comprise; International agency (mainly USAID/COMPASS) in Badagry; individuals (alumni and residents), religious organization (churches), Corporate bodies (e.g. West African Gas Pipeline Company) and de-voice Newspaper. It was found that in Surulere LGEA, some substantial donations made went to the schools for the physically challenged especially Wesley Schools I & II for the Hearing Impaired Children. It can be proffered from this finding that some of the NSAs donors/agencies are driven by altruism and disposition to help the less privileged in the society.

DETERMINANTS OF PUPILS' PERFORMANCE IN PUBLIC PRIMARY SCHOOL

In this section, we analyze the impact of institutional factors and other determinants on the performance of pupils in Mathematics, English Language, Social Studies and Raven test. This is with a view to achieving the second objective of this study. This was carried out using regression analysis based on Tooley *et al* (2005) data. The estimation technique used was the Ordinary Least Squares (OLS). We are not unmindful of the challenges with the OLS technique; however, given the data limitations, we relied on the tests of best unbiased least squares

properties (Gujarati and Porter, 2009). As result, test statistics to evaluate the efficiency of the models, which are reported in the lower segment of Table 4.2.

The results from the estimation reported in Table 4.2 shows the determinants of pupils' performance in Mathematics, English Language, Social Studies and Raven test as represented in columns A to D, respectively. The test statistics at the lower rows of Table 4.2 especially the coefficient of determination (R^2), adjusted R^2 and F-statistics were significant at 1 percent indicating that the model is reliable. In addition, the Durbin-Watson (D-W) statistics, which were approximately 2.0, suggest that the assumption of autocorrelation is not violated. Furthermore, correlation test among the explanatory variables was carried out, which revealed the fact that there was no issue of multicollinearity as can be seen in Table A1 in the Appendix. Given the above, we discuss the determinants of pupil's performance.

As can be deduced from Table 4.2, the results show that pupil-teacher ratio (*ptratio*) came out with the expected negative sign, while other explanatory variables had the expected positive sign, except age and gender in some of the columns. With respect to the significance of the independent variables, pupils' religion and gender were not statistically significant at 10 percent. The age of the pupils was only significant in influencing the performance of pupils in English Language. The result suggests that younger pupils tend to perform better in English Language this may due to less distraction compared to older pupils. In effect, the study found from descriptive analysis (not reported) that the mean age of the sampled pupils was 11 years.

Explaining the impact of household characteristics on pupils' performance, occupation of parents was found to be significant except for Raven Test, while type of building was significantly for Mathematics. This implies that what transpires at home (type of building and parents' occupation) has some influence in determining pupils' performance especially in subject like Mathematics. This finding is crucial given the fact that Mathematics has been noted to be a major foundation to scientific and technological advancement in Nigeria with the establishment of National Mathematical Centre (NMC) in 1989 to identify, nurture and mentor the next generation of mathematical scientists that can use their knowledge and talent to contribute in nation building (NMC, 2011).

Furthermore, pupil-teacher had the expected negative sign, which was significant for all the indicators of performance except English Language. This implies that reduction in pupil-teacher ratio will help in improving pupils' performance. This can be achieved by engagement of more qualified teachers. An

examination of institutional indicator, reveal that inspection of schools by private inspectors and external auditing of schools accounts had positive and significant impact on pupils' performance especially in Mathematics, English Language and Raven Tests. By implication, better inspection of schools and more accountability in the schools will significantly improve the quality of primary education.

Table 4.2: Regression Results on Determinants of Pupils' Performance

Dependent Variables ⟹ *Explanatory Variables* ⇓	**Mathematics** **(A)**	**English Lang.** **(B)**	**Social Studies** **(C)**	**Raven** **(D)**
Puprel	0.684	0.620	0.507	1.619
	(0.369)	(0.453)	(0.453)	(0.257)
Age	-0.096	-0.299***	-0.080	0.119
	(0.548)	(0.084)	(0.602)	(0.685)
Gender	0.154	-0.695	-0.028	0.790
	(0.811)	(0.319)	(0.960)	(0.515)
Pocup	0.306***	0.358***	0.405**	0.411
	(0.060)	(0.088)	(0.020)	(0.264)
Buidtyp	1.437*	0.148	0.037	0.034
	(0.001)	(0.255)	(0.322)	(0.466)
Ptratio	-0.129**	-0.027	-0.227*	-0.169***
	(0.012)	(0.328)	(0.000)	(0.074)
Inspct	6.706*	1.606**	0.660	4.101*
	(0.000)	(0.022)	(0.241)	(0.001)
Extaudi	0.885***	0.953***	0.275	1.737***
	(0.097)	(0.100)	(0.553)	(0.080)
Constant	19.338*	15.434*	19.141*	24.124*
	(0.000)	(0.000)	(0.000)	(0.000)
R	0.763	0.404	0.530	0.398
R^2	0.582	0.171	0.281	0.159
Adj. R^2	0.552	0.112	0.226	0.095
F-Stat	19.154*	2.869*	5.172*	2.782**
(P-value)	(0.000)	(0.006)	(0.000)	(0.007)
D-W stat	1.871	2.141	1.891	1.820

Notes: The probability values are in parenthesis. *, **, and *** denote significant at 1, 5, and 10 per cent, respectively. The number of public primary schools in the three LGAs used was 40 covering a total of 1,100 pupils. **Source:** Authors' computation.

SUMMARY OF FINDINGS AND CONCLUSION

The main thrust of this study was on the role of NSAs in the provision of public primary education in Nigeria drawing evidences from Lagos State. From the analyses carried out the major findings of the study are as follows:

1. NSAs activities across the three LGAs sampled were found to be more of infrastructural provisions. Essentially, NSAs' involvements in public primary schools basically entail donation of school inputs and infrastructure with little or no monitoring and supervision of schools. The implication of this finding is that NSAs' involvement in ensuring accountability in pubic primary schools is almost non-existent. Specifically, the study found that the role of NSAs in Surulere LGA compared to other LGAs was least especially in terms of infrastructural provision and school inputs inspite of the visible presence of multinational companies and other corporate organisations. Thus, the fact Surulere LGA comprises mainly middle and high income earners, much of the role of NSAs is expected, yet this is not commensurate with NSAs' contribution in public primary schools in the area.

2. The study found that the major factors influencing pupils' performance in Mathematics include parents' occupation, building type, pupil-teacher ratio, private inspection of schools and external auditing of schools accounts. For English Language, inspection of schools by private inspectors and auditing of schools' accounts, parents' occupation and age of pupils had positive and significant impact on pupils' performance. The major determining factor that influenced pupils' performance in Social Studies was pupil-teacher ratio and occupation of parents. Private inspection of schools, pupil-teacher ratio and external auditing of schools' accounts were the major determinants of pupils' performance in Raven Test Score.

The major implication of the above findings is that pupil-teacher ratio is crucial for pupils' performance due to the fact that the attention of teachers influence pupils' class participation and improved performance. The fact that external auditing of schools' accounts and private inspection of schools

positively influence pupils' performance, it is therefore imperative for public primary schools to be more accountable and institutionally controlled. In addition, given the significant and positive impact of parents' occupation on pupils' performance, rewarding occupations of parents will enhance the performance of pupils in public primary schools. This is because a rewarding occupation will improve the household income, which is essential for better provision of needed school materials for their pupils.

On the basis of findings in this study, we make the following recommendations for policy. First, there is the need to provide the platform for the involvement of NSAs in managing the resources of public primary schools in Nigeria. Beyond the provision of school infrastructures, the NSAs should be more involved in adequate supervision and evaluation of supports in public primary schools. For an effective involvement, participatory process that emphasizes NSAs' participation in regulating public primary schools is very important. To fully maximize this process, the State and NSAs should be willing and able to play their role. This is essential because NSAs' involvement will be more effective when they are both socially and politically committed to the participatory process and are willing to form strategic alliances and build relationship of trust with the public providers. Thus, the role of NSAs in public primary schools will become more impact-oriented.

This study also recommends continuous dialogue between government and NSAs on resources management and policy matters on public primary education in Nigeria. Therefore, the establishment of the School Based Management Committees (SBMCs) by the National Council of Education in 2005 is a welcome development. The SBMCs has the responsibility of fostering community involvement in school management by involving cluster of schools with supports from Education Sector Support Program in Nigeria (ESSPIN). The membership of SBMCs are made up of voluntary representatives from the local community and they are to ensure that available resources are best utilized by participating in school development planning and supporting good management of primary schools. This kind of Committee should be made functional and sustainable in all the local governments of Nigeria.

In addition, there is also a call for reduction in the high level of pupil–teacher ratio through the engagement of more qualified teachers, and improvement in school infrastructures. A regular school inspection by NSAs is highly recommended in addition to their role of donations as this will enhance quality

service delivery in public primary schools. This can be achieved by engagement of more qualified teachers. Finally, the study recommends more regular inspection visits to public primary of schools and external auditing of schools' accounts to ensure improved quality of primary education.

The study is limited to the reliability of the data utilized. Other approaches such as Key Informant Interviews, In-depth Interviews and Focus Group Discussions of major stakeholders would have enriched the findings. There were constraints (resources and bureaucracy associated with obtaining data from public institutions) that hindered such process. However, the authors are confident that these constraints would not hinder conclusions from this study. Further researches can be carried out to complement this aspect.

REFERENCES

Adepoju, O. (2007), "National Policy on Education (NPE): Its Implication for Economic, Social, Political and Technological Development in Nigeria", Nigeria Journal of Gender and Development 7(1), 117-121.

Amin, S., Jishnu, D., and Goldstein, M.(2008), Are You Being Served? New Tools for Measuring Services Delivery, Washington, DC: World Bank.

Awoniyi, S. (2007), "Millennium Development Goals on Education and the Future of the Nigerian Child", Nigerian Journal of Gender and Development 7 (1), 31-39.

Babalola, J. B. and Adedeji, S.O. (2009), "Deregulation of Provision of Education in Nigeria: Truth, Torture and Tactics from American Experience", in: O. M. Afolayan, ed., Multiculturalism in the Age of Mosaic; Essays in Honour of Rudolph G. Wilson (New York: Nova Science Publishers, Inc), 159-170.

Becker, G.S. (1962), "Investment in Human Capital: A Theoretical Perspective", The Journal of Political Economy 70 (5), 9-49.

Berman, S. (2001), Civil Society and Political Institutionalization, in: B.Edwards, M.Foley, and M. Diani, eds., Beyond Tocqueville: Civil Society and the Social Capital Debate in Comparative Perspective (University Press of New England) 32-42.

Central Bank of Nigeria (2001), *Annual Report and Statement of Accounts*, Abuja.

Durosaro, D. O. (2004), Resource Allocation and Utilization for University Education in Nigeria, Trends and Issues, in: E. G. Fagbamiye and D. O. Durosaro, eds., Education and Productivity in Nigeria (NAEAP) 51-67.

Federal Government of Nigeria-FGN (2004), National Policy on Education, Lagos: NERDC.

Federal Government of Nigeria-FGN (2000), Implication Guideline for the Universal Basic Education (UBE) Programme, Abuja: FGN

Federal Ministry of Education-FME (2006), Education Sector Situation Analysis Draft 4, Abuja: FME.

Federal Ministry of Education (2007), "Invitation for Expressions of Interest, Unity Schools: Public-Private partnership Initiative", The Punch (Wednesday January 24), 48.

Gujarati, D.N. and Porter, D.C. (2009) Basic Econometric International Edition, New York: McGraw-Hills Inc.

Hinchliffe, K. (2002), "Public Expenditure on Education: Issues, Estimates and Some Implications", Africa Region Human Development Working Paper Series, August/02.

Lagos State Universal Basic Education Board- SUBEB (Various Issues), Statistics of Public Primary Schools in Lagos State, Maryland: SUBEB.

Lockheed, M.E. and Verspoor. A.M. (1991), "Improving Primary Education in Developing Countries, Oxford: Oxford University Press for the World Bank.

National Bureau of Statistics-NBS (2009), Annual Abstract of Statistics, Abuja: FGN.

National Mathematical Centre (NMC) (2011) National, Pan-African and International Olympiad Programmes, http://www.nmcabuja.org/index.html (accessed 18/08/2011).

Ogunyeni, B., Tella, S., and Venditto, B. (2005), "Non State Actors under the Current ACP-EU Cooperation Agreement: A Sectoral Review of the Nigerian Context", ISSM Working Paper, November.

Osabuohien, E.S. and Efobi, U. (2012), Technological Diffusion and Economic Progress in Africa, in: Ekekwe, N and Islam, N.,eds., Disruptive Technologies, Innovation and Global Redesign: Emerging Implications, (New York: IGI-Global) 425-440.

Reinikka, R. and Smith N. (2004), Public Tracking Surveys in Education, Paris: International Institute for Educational Planning (IIEP).

Strauss, J and Thomas, D (1998). "Nutrition, and Economic Development", Journal of Economic Literature 36(2),766-817.

Sunal, C.S., Sunal, E., Ose, O. (1994), "Nigerian Primary School Teachers Perception of Schooling during the Second Decade of Universal Primary Education", African Studies Review 37 (3), 51-57.

Tooley,J. Dixon,P. and Olaniyan, O. (2005),"Private and Public Schooling in Low-income Areas of Lagos State, Nigeria: A Census and Comparative Survey", International Journal of Educational Research 43, 125–146.

Tsadu, I. (1998), "Implication of Life Long Education for Nigerian Schools Curriculum of 6-3-3-4 System of Education", The Nigeria Teachers Today 6(1), 89-96.

World Bank (2006), School Education in Nigeria: Preparing for Universal Basic Education, Human Development II, African Region, September 1.

World Education Forum (2000), Education for All: Meeting Our Collective Commitments, The Dakar Framework for Action (available at http://www.unesco.org/education/wef/en-conf/dakframeng.shtm, accessed 24/08/2012).

Table A4: Pearson Correlation Test among Explanatory Variables

Variables	Puprel	age	gender	Pocup	buidtyp	Ptratio	Inspet	Extaud
Puprel	1							
age	0.017	1						
gender	0.015	-0.037	1					
Pocup	0.059	-0.061	-0.015	1				
buidtyp	0.008	-0.028	-0.003	-0.010	1			
Ptratio	0.230	0.048	-0.023	-0.006	0.021	1		
Inspet	-0.086	-0.010	0.015	0.009	-0.017	-0.292	1	
Extaudi	-0.125	-0.110	0.023	0.052	-0.092	-0.169	0.264	1

Note: The number observation is 1,100 pupils across 40 public primary schools in the three LGAs

Source: Computed by the authors