

Open Research Online

The Open University's repository of research publications and other research outputs

THE USES OF MUSIC AND THEIR EXTENSIONS IN THE NOVELS OF E.M. FORSTER

Thesis

How to cite:

Colebourne, Alan Stanford (1976). THE USES OF MUSIC AND THEIR EXTENSIONS IN THE NOVELS OF E.M. FORSTER. The Open University.

For guidance on citations see [FAQs](#).

© 1976 The Author

Version: Version of Record

Copyright and Moral Rights for the articles on this site are retained by the individual authors and/or other copyright owners. For more information on Open Research Online's data [policy](#) on reuse of materials please consult the policies page.

oro.open.ac.uk

ALAN STANFORD COLEBOURNE

B.A. (Hons), A.R.C.M., L.R.A.M., L.T.C.L.

THE USES OF MUSIC

AND THEIR EXTENSIONS IN THE NOVELS OF

E. M. FORSTER

DISSERTATION

PRESENTED FOR THE DEGREE OF BACHELOR OF PHILOSOPHY

IN THE FACULTY OF ARTS

of the

OPEN UNIVERSITY

MARCH,

1976.

Submitted 23.3.76
Awarded 18.10.76

ProQuest Number: 27919391

All rights reserved

INFORMATION TO ALL USERS

The quality of this reproduction is dependent on the quality of the copy submitted.

In the unlikely event that the author did not send a complete manuscript and there are missing pages, these will be noted. Also, if material had to be removed, a note will indicate the deletion.



ProQuest 27919391

Published by ProQuest LLC (2020). Copyright of the Dissertation is held by the Author.

All Rights Reserved.

This work is protected against unauthorized copying under Title 17, United States Code
Microform Edition © ProQuest LLC.

ProQuest LLC
789 East Eisenhower Parkway
P.O. Box 1346
Ann Arbor, MI 48106 - 1346

A B S T R A C T

E. M. FORSTER was a novelist with a passionate interest in music. Throughout his life playing the piano, visiting the opera, and attending concerts of orchestral and chamber music constituted his principal forms of pleasure and relaxation; wherever he travelled - in Europe, in Egypt, or in India - the music of the country he visited attracted his keenest attention.

But, more than this, music was for him "the deepest of the arts and deep beneath the arts", and it provided a vital stimulus and source of inspiration in the writing of his novels. Although other English novelists before him had shared his interest and had used music in various ways in their novels, Forster develops these uses - in delineation of character, the creation of atmosphere, the underlining of structure, for example - far beyond the limits of his predecessors, and extends them into the realms of the fundamental imagery, the overall structure, indeed the whole resonance of a novel in a way unparalleled even among his contemporaries.

While all Forster's novels have in common a certain number of musical techniques, they reveal not so much a steady chronological development of such techniques as a close relating of specific musical material to the particular task in hand. But when, ultimately, such material becomes inadequate for the task, Forster expands it to encompass the whole sphere of sound and silence.

This study surveys the extent of Forster's musical knowledge and ability, indicating the principal influences on him in that area, examines in detail the special musical techniques employed in each novel, illustrates the enormous widening of scope between the first and last, and estimates the importance of his contribution to the development in the uses to which English novelists have put music in their work.

C O N T E N T S

	<u>Page</u>
Chapter 1 : <u>INTRODUCTION</u>	6
Chapter 2 : <u>A ROOM WITH A VIEW</u>	71
Chapter 3 : <u>WHERE ANGELS FEAR TO TREAD</u>	95
Chapter 4 : <u>THE LONGEST JOURNEY</u>	109
Chapter 5 : <u>HOWARDS END</u>	133
Chapter 6 : <u>MAURICE</u>	159
Chapter 7 : <u>A PASSAGE TO INDIA</u>	176
Chapter 8 : <u>CONCLUSION</u>	226
<u>BIBLIOGRAPHY</u>	267

ABBREVIATIONS

The following abbreviations are used in the Notes to individual chapters:

<u>RWV</u>	<u>A Room with a View</u>
<u>WAFV</u>	<u>Where Angels Fear to Tread</u>
<u>LJ</u>	<u>The Longest Journey</u>
<u>HE</u>	<u>Howards End</u>
<u>M</u>	<u>Maurice</u>
<u>PI</u>	<u>A Passage to India</u>
<u>CSS</u>	<u>Collected Short Stories</u>
<u>AN</u>	<u>Aspects of the Novel</u>
<u>GLD</u>	<u>Goldsworthy Lowes Dickinson</u>
<u>AH</u>	<u>Abinger Harvest</u>
<u>TC</u>	<u>Two Cheers for Democracy</u>
<u>HD</u>	<u>The Hill of Devi</u>
<u>MT</u>	<u>Marianne Thornton</u>

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

Even with a work of the extent which follows, it would be impossible to pay tribute to all the individuals who have, knowingly or unknowingly, contributed to its composition. To any I may unintentionally have omitted I offer my sincere thanks and apologies; to those who follow I acknowledge profound debts as indicated.

To Professor A. Kettle, of the Open University, who has supervised the writing of this dissertation, for his many helpful suggestions and for his infinite patience.

To Mr. P.N. Furbank, Forster's official biographer, who has given most generously of his time to discuss the topic with me, and to read, and to comment most valuably upon, each chapter.

To Mr. George Hurren, a remark of whom first gave me the idea of writing on Music in the Novel, and who has given me the benefit of his vast knowledge of Nineteenth Century Literature.

To Mrs. Penelope Bulloch, of the Library, King's College, Cambridge, who directed, with Mr. Furbank, my attention to invaluable original material and made it available to me.

To the Staff of the University of London Library at Senate House, particularly Miss M. Oswald and Dr. M.A. Baird, for their unfailing help and friendliness.

To Mr. Joseph Scott and his Staff of University College, London, Library for their efforts in trying to trace articles.

To the Staff of the British Library, both in the British Museum Reading Room, and at Colindale, where Miss Murray and Mr. Martin respectively were especially kind, for locating otherwise unavailable material.

To the Staff of the Central Music Library, Westminster, for their constant help and patience, even when retrieving material from the vaults.

To Mr. Alan Maher, formerly of the Westminster Reference Library, for directing my attention to Forster's letters addressed to K. Natwar-Singh.

To Dr. R.M. Ogilvie, Headmaster of Tonbridge School, for writing most fully to me about music at Tonbridge in Forster's time.

To Mr. Benjamin Britten for replying to a query despite serious illness.

To Mrs. Eade of Edward Arnold's, Forster's publishers, for providing me with texts at short notice, and with information about publications.

To Mr. B. Garth, of Southgate Technical College, for giving me the benefit of his knowledge on opera.

And to Mr. Kenneth Haines who has given much time in assisting me with the minutiae of research and in painstakingly recording those minutiae in centres as far apart as Cambridge and Colindale.

A debt of a different kind is acknowledged to the Principal of Southgate Technical College, Mr. W.A.G. Easton, and to the London Borough of Enfield, in granting me a year's leave of absence, when the bulk of this work was completed, as well as earlier relief from contact teaching, when its foundations were laid.

The final debt of gratitude must be to Miss Eileen Sullivan who has typed and retyped my manuscripts with unending patience.

The whole is dedicated to my mother without whom none of this would have been possible.

CHAPTER 1 : INTRODUCTION

"There is no doubt that E.M. Forster is our most musical novelist. And I don't mean that he just likes music or likes going to concerts and operas, or plays the piano neatly and efficiently (all of which he does), but that he really understands music and uses music in his novels, and fairly frequently."

So wrote Benjamin Britten at the beginning of his contribution (1) to a volume, published to mark Forster's ninetieth birthday (2), which was for its editor and contributors alike "a work of love and of gratitude." (3)

It will be the principal object of this study to establish exactly what are the uses to which Forster puts music in his novels, to examine what may have been his aims in using it to the degree he does, and to see how far he advances its uses in the novel; but in order to see those uses and aims in better perspective, it will be as well first briefly to survey the general musical climate in which Forster was raised, and evolved as a writer, and to indicate fairly fully the nature and extent of his sympathies, interests, and abilities in music.

Forster's life (1879-1970) covers a period which can lay strong claim to containing the most fundamental and far-ranging developments, both from the point of view of composition and of performance, of any in musical history. The latter part of the nineteenth century is dominated by the culmination,

carrying within it the seeds of disintegration, of Romanticism, that movement characterized in part by a growing interest in the mystic, the supernatural, the chivalric past, and the "innocence" of the savage, peasant, and child, but marked most strongly by

"an extraordinary development of imaginative sensibility"

(4), "a desire to find the infinite within the finite"

(5), and "a liberation of the less conscious levels of the mind" (6),

together with a concentration on emotion rather than reason (7), trends which find their expression through such means as the development of programme music, the increasing use of chromatic harmony, the introduction of nationalist elements, the vast expansion of the orchestra, and the phenomenal advance in (particularly piano) virtuosity. It is the composers who, to a greater or less extent, exhibit these characteristics of Late Romanticism - Brahms, Tschaikowsky, Wolf, Franck, Mahler, R. Strauss, and especially Wagner - whose names tower above those of contemporaries following, like, say, Debussy, other paths. Of especial importance in England are the growth of the new Renaissance under, amongst others, Parry, Stanford, Sullivan, Mackenzie, and Elgar, and certain developments in the social aspects of music, a number of which relate directly both to events in Forster's novels and to his own musical habits. Among these are the "Music for the People" campaign initiated

by the Early Closing Association; the use made of musical gatherings by middle-class people settling in large cities to make friends in the neighbourhood; the growth of cheap concerts such as those promoted by J.M. Dent at Toynbee Hall; the increase in amateur music-making; the formation of brass bands, orchestras, and opera companies; the continuing importance of foreign musicians both as performers and teachers; an intensification of patriotism exhibited in the many songs extolling national pride; the patenting of the pianola (1897); the foundation of the English Gramophone Company (1898); the formation of the English Wagner Society, with its journal, "The Meister" (1872); and Edward VII's fondness for French operas and operettas which resulted in six performances of Faust and two of Carmen in the 1906 summer season alone at Covent Garden. (8)

The twentieth century exhibits an unparalleled diversity of trends in compositional styles: the Neo-romanticism of Mahler, Bruckner and R. Strauss; the Impressionism of Debussy and Ravel; the Expressionism of Schönberg, Webern and Berg; the Neo-classicism of Busoni, Les Six, middle-period Stravinsky, and Hindemith; and the enormous growth of Jazz and Pop music. This diversity is matched by a search for new modes of expression, to be seen in Microtonality, Polytonality, Atonality, together with new scalar and harmonic systems, and even Tone Clusters; and by corresponding experiments in the

field of new media, epitomized in those developments which are usually designated "musique concrète" and "tapesichord" music. Every one of these trends can be exemplified in English composers, but, of course, the vital social impact, from a musical point of view, of the cinema, the gramophone, the radio, and ease of travel has meant an enormous increase in the extent of general musical knowledge of every kind and of every country.

It is appropriate now to examine the degree to which Forster reveals an awareness of, and an interest in these (and other) developments, and to assess the contribution which his own technical expertise makes in their direction. Until Mr. Furbank's official biography of Forster appears, the prime sources of information on this subject must at present lie in Forster's own miscellaneous articles and reminiscences (though much may be deduced from the novels, and, to a lesser extent, from the short stories), and in those works of a biographical or autobiographical nature. It is indeed fortunate that, together, these cover practically the whole of Forster's career.

Two early memories reveal what were to prove Forster's prime musical passions throughout his life. The first recalls a happy moment, when he was only five, while staying at Holmleigh, "a tall sun-drenched house balanced high above Salisbury":

"I can see my mother and Maimie rattling at the Erard - it is Spohr's String Quartet (9) as a piano duet - and when they start the slow movement too fast, as they

always did, I can hear the old man's sonorous magisterial voice (Mr. Aylward's) saying 'Adagio, madame, Mary, adagio'." (10)

The second concerns his first visit, at the age of fourteen or fifteen, to his first opera, in the company of "an able and extrovert doctor called Herringham". He it was who persuaded Forster's aunt that it was time Forster saw one, though he made him pay Covent Garden's considerable sum of 7s.6d. for his ticket. They sat in about the sixth row of the amphitheatre and Forster "liked the performance a great deal." With characteristic impishness Forster does not specify the name of the opera, but provides the reader with certain clues:

"The curtain rose upon a boat, which was uninterruptedly dominated by a foreign singer called Ternina. She was certainly very good though I wished she would end off her tunes more definitely. In the second act she waved a scarf with magnificence, and came in at the end of the third with a song for which my ears had been inadequately trained. She had a man to sing with her, possibly called Burrian, though at an interval of nearly 70 years I cannot be sure, and they had a conductor to conduct them, though his name was probably not on the programme - conductors cut very little ice in those days. There was not much acting; at the end of the opening act some women came up through the deck carrying parcels and causing Dr. Herringham to mutter: 'Maids sea-sick as usual'." (11)

If the music presided over by Herbert Pembroke at Sawston is anything to go by (12), Forster's experiences in

this direction at Tonbridge must have been on a par with his others at this hated school, and it is not until he blossoms in the atmosphere of Cambridge that further really deep, pervading influences are exerted on his musical taste. The chief source of these influences was in all probability Goldsworthy Lowes Dickinson who, though seventeen years older than Forster, and already a Fellow of King's when Forster entered that college in 1897, and never his formal tutor, eventually became a very close friend. Dickinson had, too, in turn derived much from Oscar Browning. One of Dickinson's earliest memories is of "lying in bed in the dusk, listening to the Moonlight Sonata played below" (13), the sonata Forster describes as that "where sorrow is transformed into grace." (14) Dickinson's sisters recall his performances of Handel on the piano as a child (15), John Munro those of Mozart and Beethoven at Charterhouse, as well as his playing of the violin in the school orchestra (16). When Dickinson moved to All Souls' Place he recalls performances of Messiah, Elijah (better still), and "a queer new thing", The Ring ("of which he could make nothing.") (17) But as with Forster, it was at Cambridge that his musical ability and taste really grew. At Oscar Browning's "at homes" he heard "some really good music" (18) and played duets with him (including the slow movement of Beethoven's 7th Symphony, with tempo adapted to suit Browning's failing technique (19)), and with a far superior pianist, Adolph Behrens (20). "All agree,"

says Forster, "that, for an amateur, (Dickinson's) performance was remarkable" (21), and it is a great pity that loss of muscular control followed by rheumatism caused him to give up the piano before Forster knew him well. However, Forster points out that

"there is no doubt that, though he lost the power to play, the fact that he had once had it allowed him to enter more deeply into music, both technically and passionately, and to pass beyond the ante-chamber of 'appreciation' where most of us have to stop." (22)

Indeed, Forster goes farther:

"His feeling for music went far beyond the sensitiveness of the ordinary man, and had his specific gift been adequate he might here have achieved the ideal which he vainly pursued through poetry." (23)

It is evident from these comments that Forster felt deeply about this particular aspect of Dickinson's make-up and it is instructive to see how far his tastes coincided with those of his friend. The "main pillars" of Dickinson's taste were Mozart and Wagner, together with Glück, Bach, Beethoven and Schubert (24), and Forster points out how Dickinson paid tribute to Wagner in his Poems of 1896 (25), and to Mozart in his novel The Magic Flute in which

"he tries to express all he owes to Mozart" (26), and whose opera

"inspires two profound and profoundly moving episodes that

he has introduced into the Mozartian story: the episode of the Hermitage of Jesus and the episode of the Lotus Lake of Buddha." (27)

Another composition of Mozart too that Dickinson much admired was the Requiem which he describes as

"different to anything else of his. Great as Beethoven, I think." (28)

Dickinson's attitude to Wagner was ambiguous, an ambiguity revealed in two letters to Sir Dennis Proctor. In anticipation of a performance of The Ring at Munich in 1930 he writes:

"Wonder if I shall still be an enthusiast. I think I shall. The enchanter always corners me, though I rebel the next day." (29)

Nearly eighteen months later, à propos a broadcast of the 3rd Act of Siegfried heard at King's College, Cambridge, occurs the comment:

"I listened subconscious of the long windedness and superficiality of Wagner, but nevertheless in a kind of ecstasy." (30)

Schubert's Quartet Der Tod und das Mädchen provided him with an experience "very schwärmerisch and romantic" (31), but "unless it be the Mass (32) of Bach" Beethoven's Choral Symphony, in which the choral movement embodies the enthronement of Peace by Passion (33), is "the greatest music in existence." (34)

Forster by no means shared Dickinson's adoration of Mozart (35). Benjamin Britten has heard him describe some Mozart as "tinkling" (36), just as Lucy Honeychurch tinkles at a Mozart Sonata in A Room with a View, and Beethoven's Op.2, No.1 goes "Mozarting ahead" till the last movement (37). Nor does Forster feel that Mozart goes as far as Beethoven in the use of a particular key for a particular mood (38). Wagner, however, as will be seen, remained one of his great enthusiasms, even though he shared with Dickinson certain, though not so extensive, reservations about him, while Beethoven (still with reservations) was probably his idol.

After Forster left King's in 1901 to travel to Italy and Greece, it was probably E.J. Dent's musical influence that was most strong (39). At the age of 78 he could still pay tribute to this influence in these terms:

"What he did for me in my early visits to Italy is still vivid in my mind." (40)

It was at this time too that he saw Tetrizzini as Lucia in Florence (41) and whose performance is put to such hilarious use in Where Angels Fear to Tread, and his interest in opera was further stimulated by his first visit to The Ring at Dresden in 1905, where he was impressed both by the emphasis on realism in the production, and the glorious singing of Wittich as Brünnhilde and Burrian as Siegfried (42).

The years 1905-1914, when Forster was principally living with his mother in Surrey, were largely taken up with the writing of the first five novels, the musical significances of which are to be examined later, but it is worth recording in passing that two of Forster's short stories of the period, "The Celestial Omnibus" (1908) and "Co-ordination" (1912), again reflect respectively his interest in opera and in the piano. In the first the boy reaches a scene redolent of one in Wagner's Rheingold; flames of a rainbow lick the wheels of the omnibus, the sun strikes down into an everlasting river, and he sees three maidens

"rise to the surface of the pool, singing, and playing with something that glistened like a ring" (43).

In the second, as Britten says,

"Forster certainly remembers his own piano-duet playing, and those painful collisions which skin the little fingers." (44)

Interminable pairs of schoolgirls thump out an arrangement of the Eroica Symphony, while a deaf Beethoven tots up the number of performances and decrees a reward of "a perfect performance of my A minor quartette." (45) Fortunate for them that they receive instead a performance from "the most spiffing band" (46). It all looks like a formidable indictment of inept teaching on earth and dishonesty in heaven. But Raphael defeats the Devil,

"For these people have co-ordinated, Mephistopheles. They

have co-ordinated through the central sources of Melody and Victory." (47)

Forster's sojourn in Surrey was interrupted in 1912 by his first visit to India, undertaken, in the company of Dickinson and R.C. Trevelyan, for primarily touristic reasons, and thus he made his first direct contact with Indian music of which he was eventually to make such use in A Passage to India. The letters of 1912-1913, recorded in The Hill of Devi, do not contain the musical detail of those of 1921, but one or two significant items appear. There is the importance of bands in general, particularly those of the two Dewas States

"each of which play different tunes at the same hour every evening" (48),

but also of the one which accompanies

"our dancing in our grand clothes (49), and of the one which "is an important part of the national forces" (50) and which plays "Oft in danger, oft in woe." (51)

It is especially the element of incongruity here which Forster notices, as he does with the two National Anthems of Dewas (52). Also of significance are the little drums beaten in the temples (53), the singing of the nautch girls (54), and "the little song" sung "in praise of some god" (55) all of which eventually find their way into the novel.

From the end of 1915 till the beginning of 1919 Forster was in Egypt with the International Red Cross. During

this time he contributed three articles on music to The Egyptian Mail: "Sunday Music" (56), "A Musician in Egypt" (57), and "Handel in Egypt" (58). Of these perhaps the most important is the first, since it contains a description of a concert at San Stephano (which also appears in Alexandria, A History and Guide) where the behaviour of the audience is almost an echo of that in Where Angels Fear to Tread. Looking back to his days in Egypt, Forster saw that he had been "comfortable" yet wondered how he could have come through without "lamps for my gloom", and among those artists (primarily authors) - Arnold, Browning, Blake, Morris, T.S. Eliot, Huysmans, Yeats - who were some of those lamps, he singles out for special mention two composers, Beethoven and César Franck (59).

On his return to England Forster again busied himself with journalism, and 1919 saw the publication in The Athenaeum of two articles which provide an added dimension to and further insight into Forster's musical knowledge. The first, "A Concert of Old Instruments" (60), is a review of a recital given by Mrs. Gordon Woodhouse at Queen Anne's Gate on the harpsichord, virginals, and clavichord - an event far rarer than it would be today - and Forster is at pains to show that old instruments do not "tinkle" and that

"the harpsichord is as versatile as the piano, though
in another way"

(a very progressive viewpoint for that time). He speaks of the way

"it could roar and ring, and buzz and sing, and could at the same time bring out, in an intelligible way, the structure of the music."

He praises the performer's magnificent Bach and, interestingly, a Pavane by the sixteenth century composer Tisdall. The virginals he finds to have a more limited, rather "archaeological" appeal, but the clavichord is "refined"; unfortunately its sound gets lost in a large room (a problem solved, not always ideally, nowadays by amplification). Above all Forster appreciates the inherent differences in the instruments, the clavichord responding to touch, the harpsichord to pedals and stops (an over-simplification, but with an essential basis of truth) and he regards the disappearance of the latter (happily no longer the case) as a tragedy. He also takes the opportunity of expressing an aesthetic opinion which recurs, from time to time in various forms, throughout his writings on music:

"Music, like all the arts, (makes a) double appeal to emotion and thought, and great music so makes it that it seems, while we listen, that the same two sides of our nature have been involved."

The second, "Music in Edinburgh: The Reid Concerts" (61), pays genial tribute to their founder, General Reid, and indicates Reid's aim in these annual birthday concerts which were

"to consist of his own works, and to be performed 'by a select Band in order to show the taste of Music about the middle of the last (i.e. eighteenth) century, when

they were by me composed, and with a view also to keep my memory in remembrance'."

Forster regards them as far more instructive and amusing than those at the Usher Hall under Landon Ronald, a situation arising from the guiding genius of Tovey who

"interprets the spirit as well as the letter of the general's bequest, and tries by well-chosen programmes and careful analytical notes to bring the 'taste' of past ages into our mouths, and to show us not only that music is alive, but that musicians once lived."

Tovey, (even if, in playing works other than those of General Reid, he broke the letter in achieving the spirit of the bequest) Forster shows us, did in fact what we nowadays associate more with William Glock and the Proms, namely illuminated works like Saint-Saëns' "Phaeton" and Dittersdorf's "Second Ovidian Symphony", or Beethoven's "Eroica" Symphony and "Prometheus" Variations, by thoughtful juxtaposition. However, in the midst of this light-hearted article, Forster expresses an opinion which seems a trifle odd in view of his comments on music's double appeal to both emotion and thought:

"At an ordinary concert (its) only aim is, or ought to be, sensuous pleasure."

As Howards End shows, this is not the only occasion when Forster seems inclined to undervalue the importance of the intellect in music.

In 1921 Forster returned to India for six months, as private secretary to the Maharajah of the State of Dewas Senior, and as has been indicated, the series of letters this second visit produced is of far greater importance musically than the first. The incongruities are still there in abundance: the palace contains

"two pianos (one a grand), a harmonium, and a dulciphone, all new and all unplayable, their notes sticking together and their frames cracked by dryness" (62);

a eunuch, "a tall scraggy man with a moustache dressed in a pink sari" (63), sings in the course of the festival of Holi; and "God Save the King" is "excruciatingly rendered" on the occasion of the King Emperor's birthday (64). But Forster becomes more aware of the serious side of Indian music, particularly singing, as when it accompanies acting (65), where the variety of its subject matter is revealed (66), where it takes the form of Marathi hymns (67), or where geographical differences become apparent (68). Overshadowing all are the descriptions of the "Birth of a Baby" (69) and the festival of Gokul Ashtami (70), the music of which Forster uses to such effect in A Passage to India and which is examined in the chapter on that novel (71).

Again music figures prominently in certain sections of Aspects of the Novel (1927) but since that work casts "hind-light" on the novels themselves, discussion of this is reserved until later (72). For "sidelight" we must turn again to

Abinger Harvest and an article that has already been quoted from in passing - "A Note on the Way" (1934) (73). Here Forster returns to his favourite composer, Beethoven, not, however, to discuss or reflect upon any specific work, but in support of the thesis that

"The arts are not drugs. They are not guaranteed to act when taken." (74)

He selects Beethoven precisely because he is his favourite composer and in the given circumstances most likely to act as a drug; but on two vital occasions - once when Forster was going to hear the Busch Quartet at the Wigmore Hall, but had perforce to hear a story of misfortune beforehand, and once when he received notice that he would be wanted to give evidence in The Well of Loneliness case -

"Beethoven failed to do his job." (75) "Art, love and thought can all do something" (76)

but not everything.

1934 also saw Forster's musical development taking a new and prophetic turn in the form of his first collaboration with a composer of the first rank, in this case Ralph Vaughan Williams. It occurred in connection with the delightful Abinger Pageant created in aid of the Abinger Church Preservation Fund (77). In the course of Forster's text there occurs triumphant music for the Normans, a Latin Hymn to the Virgin

Mary, a Latin Chant in Plain-song, the Surrey-Sussex Smiths' folk-song "Twanky-dillo", a country-dance "Gathering Peascods", the old metric version of the 68th Psalm, "Here's a Health unto his Majesty", two more country dances - "The Triumph" and "Haste to the Wedding", - "I'm Seventeen come Sunday", yet more Morris and country dances, the Surrey folk-song "The Sweet Nightingale", a psalm of dedication, some verses from the 84th Psalm, and the hymn "O God our help in ages past" "concludes the active part of the pageant." (78)

This collaboration must have made Forster deeply aware of that great movement in English music (owing a debt both to folk-song and dance, and to England's own composers of the Renaissance) at the head of which Vaughan Williams stands, but within which Moeran and Butterworth, amongst others, should not be forgotten. And it was a collaboration renewed in England's Pleasant Land, a pageant play produced in 1938 at Milton Court, Westcott, Surrey, and published in 1940.

"Word-making and Sound-taking" (1935) is the second article in Abinger Harvest wherein music can be said to play an important part (79). Of secondary interest is the fact that it contains a brief discussion of William de Morgan's use of a Beethoven tune in one of his novels, and recalls Proust's use of the Vinteuil sonata which figures so prominently in Aspects of the Novel. But what is of prime importance is that it reveals Forster's increasing involvement with problems of musical

aesthetics, in this case whether the labelling of tunes with words is justifiable. Many have had Mendelssohn's Hebrides Overture ruined by exhortations to supply "How lovely the sea is!" to the first subject. Forster succumbs to the temptation with the march-like movement of Schumann's Piano Quintet:

"Ah nò, ah nò,
The world will yet be saved, be saved,
Ah nò, ah nò,
The world will yet be saved,
Bé sáved." (80)

He is, however, honest enough to admit that, when he does succumb,

"Schumann is nowhere" and that "if this habit of mine was constant, music would disappear and be replaced by a series of remarks" (81).

He basically feels that wherever words are introduced - he cites the Absence and Farewell Sonata, and the posthumous F major Quartet -

"Beethoven turns coarse" and that "the Ninth Symphony itself may be regarded as an essay in coarseness." (82)

The choral Finale, with its attendant paraphernalia seen through Forster's mischievous eye,

"is all vaguely disquieting after three great movements of music, where nothing seemed tethered to the earth. And yet without it there could be no Ninth Symphony. This rickety bridge has to be crossed before the army can enter heaven:

No, no, no, you're quite mistaken,
No, no, no, I'm sure your wrong

if you deny to Beethoven or even to his auditors the
right to stick on an occasional label, 'Liberty',
'Joy', 'Peace'." (83)

Yet even though Forster comes to this conclusion, he
is clearly uneasy about it, and many, unlike Dickinson, have
felt that the Finale with its banalities and vulgarities does
not succeed.

Forster is much more at ease in illustrating the
intellectual jokes that can be perpetrated by adding words to
fugal subjects, such as the one at the end of the Brahms-Handel
Variations:

There was a bee
Upon a wall,
And it said buzz and that was all;
And it said buzz and that was all.

Or one by Bach:

O Ebenezer Prout,
You're a very funny man,
You have set Bach's tunes
To a lot of silly words. (84)

He does not, however, go into the reason why there was a vogue
in the nineteenth century for adding words at all - namely as an
aid to the interpretation of mood, or, more especially, phrasing.
Nor does he pay tribute to Prout's indefatigable energy in
producing what were, in their time, innumerable useful text-
books. He is more concerned with his own mental pictures

conjured up by various pieces, particularly by the slow movement of Beethoven's 4th Piano Concerto. But this concern is momentary. As well as "the release of one's own fancy" Forster admits there is the composer's intention, the sounds themselves, and he praises music "because it gives access to two worlds."
(85)

Forster returns to this theme of mental wool-gathering in "Not Listening to Music" (1939) (86) where he begins by examining the various elements that can distract the average listener. For him only

"professional critics can listen to a piece as consistently and as steadily as if they were reading a novel." (87)

The inherent idea, that concentrated listening requires training and that even then few will succeed completely, is justifiable. But the simile reveals the man: how many can read a novel without similar wanderings? His second point concerns a two-fold division of music, not the dual appeal to emotion and intellect already seen, but one into

"Music that reminds me of something" and "music itself" .

And he remarks on a development within himself from an early preference for the former kind, epitomized in Wagner, to one for the latter, commenting on the loss that learning Wagner's programme for the Coriolanus Overture occasioned him. The

deduction follows that music

"untainted by reference is obviously the best sort to listen to; we get nearer the centre of reality." (88)

Despite this

"the Goldberg Variations, the last Beethoven Sonata, the Franck Quartet, the Schumann Piano Quintet and the Fourth Symphonies of Tchaikovsky and of Brahms certainly have a message." (89)

What this message is is difficult for Forster to define, but, as he says,

"There's an insistence in music - expressed largely through rhythm: there's a sense that it is trying to push across at us something which is neither aesthetic pattern nor a sermon. That's what I listen for especially." (90)

This, surely, is part, though only part, of the quality which Forster saw in certain novels, and which he chose, in Aspects of the Novel, to express by "Rhythm" .

The final section of Forster's article concerns his

"own performances on the piano" which "grow worse yearly" (91)

but which he will never give up, for during them attention is compulsory, construction becomes clearer, and key relations are apparent. Especially does he play Beethoven and thereby gets to know his special qualities better - Forster's selection of

these is sensitive, though the statement that Beethoven was averse to the key of B major is slightly suspect, as witness the slow movement of the Emperor Concerto, and the Allegretto section of the Fantasia in G Minor, Op. 77.

This love of Beethoven found further expression in a series of notes on the 32 Piano Sonatas which Forster undertook, also in 1939, at the suggestion of his friend Charles Mauron (92). Sadly the task was never completed, only nine being treated; and, indeed, of these nine not every movement is covered, nor are all those movements which are discussed analysed in equal detail (93). However, a number of significant points emerge: sometimes the comments are purely descriptive, interspersed with words of a more personal nature (for example "teasing" and "bobbing-up" in Op. 101); tribute is paid to brilliancy (Op. 7, i.), to gigantic gestures (Op. 90, i.), to loveliness (Op. 101, iii); movements are seen in visual terms (a fish swims against the stream in Op. 31 No.2, iii) or even sexual ones (Op. 22, iv, and Op. 57); and adverse criticism is far from eschewed (Op. 22, i, is "dull", Op. 90, ii, "boring"). There are, too, indications of the limitations of Forster's technique (in the March of Op. 101) and of his appreciation (particularly with regard to Beethoven's more lyrical aspects in the last movement of Op. 90, and, more seriously, in the first movement of Op. 110). Brief as they are, these notes deserve publication for the special light they throw on Forster's

approach to music and his own playing.

Beethoven also figures prominently in "The C Minor of that Life" (1941) (94) where Forster examines the problem as to whether there is

"any absolute difference between keys" (95)

as opposed to mere highness or lowness, and, if so, whether they have special, nameable qualities. Forster feels that they have, yet amusingly points out that he and Beethoven differ over B minor and A flat, but agree, with Wagner, over C sharp. In particular he illustrates fully and persuasively the importance of C minor to Beethoven. His final conclusions, however, deserve critical consideration. His first is that

"there may be nothing in key" (96);

but there is. Certainly ever since tempering was introduced each scale, and with it each chord in that scale, has been slightly different from every other, and thus the use of an individual key produces a different physical sensation from that of any other, and with it a different emotional response. His second is that

"there can be nothing in key unless we have a sense of pitch." (97)

Of course, a great deal depends here on whether Forster is referring to absolute or relative pitch; if the first - the ability to recognize the exact frequency of a note's fundamental - then his conclusion has some validity in so far as

the hearer will at once realize what key a piece is in, and automatically register certain emotional associations dependent upon his previous experience of works in that key; if the second - the ability to perceive the exact distances between notes, without, necessarily, the ability to recognize their precise level - then the conclusion has slightly less validity in that the hearer will not immediately register those associations, though it is probable that, as a work progresses, the relationship between the notes will eventually arouse them. His third is that Beethoven, far more than Mozart, thought that keys, especially C minor, reflected a particular mood.

There seems little doubt that certain keys, and particularly C minor - as witness the 3rd Piano Concerto, the 5th Symphony, and the Piano Sonatas Op. 10 No. 1, Op. 13, and Op. 111, amongst other works, are associated in Beethoven's mind with special qualities, and here Forster's claim seems amply justified, but it does less than justice to Mozart (for whom Forster cites a partiality for D major) who did wonderful things in G minor.

The years 1939-1944 saw Forster as a regular attender at the National Gallery Concerts, and reference has only to be made to the enormous variety of music played by Myra Hess herself (98), not to mention the complete list of pieces performed (99), to see the breadth of his musical sympathies. Indeed, so regular was he in his visits that, together with

Myra Hess, Sir Kenneth Clark, and Howard Ferguson, he was invited to contribute to a booklet celebrating the Fifth Anniversary of the concerts (100). His article, "From the Audience", deals not with specific music (that is not his province) but with certain themes that tend to recur in his writings on music - the differences of individual response, the audience's wandering attention, and the lingering effect of a concert which ultimately "provides an enlargement of the spirit," an effect which Forster feels to be, perhaps, the most vital. Nevertheless he acknowledges the importance of

"the immediate physical delight in sound",

of scholarship, and, interestingly, of

"the architectural emotion, when a composition extending through time is suddenly apprehended as a whole",

a view which surely relates to the second type of rhythm he looks for in a novel. Enjoyment, it seems to Forster, is the one common denominator which has brought such differing individuals to the concerts for five years, but for him, with his thoughts of Raphael, it is the feelings of "the indestructability of the arts", of the "continuity", and of the "aspect of the eternal" that remain to outweigh all others.

Forster's voracious appetite for concerts is further exemplified in his report for The Sunday Times on the Edinburgh Festival of 1947 (101). In its opening five days, in

addition to seeing two Shakespeare plays, attending a poetry reading, and visiting an exhibition of modern stained glass, the National Gallery, the Castle, and St. Mary's Cathedral, he heard a concert by the Colonne Orchestra, two by the Jacques Orchestra, another by Schnabel's Chamber Group, and Verdi's Macbeth. He had intentions, too, of going to three other concerts, by Schnabel, the Hallé, and a singer of Gaelic songs, quite apart from "doing" Richard II, the "Enterprise Scotland" exhibition, and the opening of the Film Festival. Lack of time only prevented his attendance at concerts given by the Vienna Philharmonic, the Liverpool Philharmonic, the Orpheus Choir, and the Czech Nonet, and at Robert McLennan's Laird o' Torwatletie.

His comments on the Colonne Orchestra's concert are not devoid of acerbity:

"M. Paul Paray coquetted with the sound of Haydn" (the Surprise), "pranced martially when the Schumann (No. 4) allowed it", and "gave a surprisingly unseraphic rendering of the Franck" (the D minor).

But what is perhaps noticeable in a man of 68 is his remark that

"The contents of his programme could be criticized. An opening performance should pay some tribute to the twentieth century, and indeed the Festival errs on the side of conservatism."

Forster's perennial youthfulness is discernible in his delight that the "smartiboots" atmosphere of Glyndebourne is

absent in Edinburgh, and he can revel, as he did forty-two years before at Dresden, in the marvellous décor, though his matured taste can long for the later Verdi of Otello as opposed to the "tum-tummy" type of the early Macbeth, despite the effectively terrifying impact of the sleep-walking scene. His mind is ever open to new musical impressions, such as those imparted by "some lovely things I had never heard" played by the Jacques Orchestra and which included a Byrd Fantasia. But his greatest enjoyment came with the chamber music concert given by Schnabel, Szigeti, Primrose, and Fournier, playing Brahms' Trio Op. 101, Schubert's Trio Op. 100, and Brahms' A major Piano Quartet -

"the one that has the passionate outburst by the piano in the slow movement, the most violent outburst, the most complete give-away, that Brahms has ever permitted himself. It is absurd for an outsider to talk about music, and about such music. He can only proclaim enjoyment and gratitude.

What a mercy that such music and such interpreters exist! They are a light in the world's darkness, raised high above hatred and poverty. Despite their greatness and our smallness, they have the power of making us feel great. Half an hour later we feel small again, but the extension has been made."

No greater tribute to the power of music and to the artistry of performers could be found, nor a clearer indication of the breadth of Forster's sympathies and depth of feeling that music aroused in him.

The high esteem in which Forster's knowledge and appreciation of music was held had been illustrated by his having, earlier in the same year (1947), been invited to address the Symposium on Music Criticism at Harvard University. He chose as his subject "the Raison d'Être of Criticism in the Arts" (102) and he begins by asserting his belief

"that music is the deepest of the arts and deep beneath the arts" (103).

Reluctantly he agrees that love for music, and indeed for all the arts, is not enough; training is necessary, since without it, there is a

"tendency to lead to the appreciation of no one but oneself" (104), but "the danger (is) that training may sterilize the sensitiveness that is being trained". (105)

Criticism can help in giving a sense of form, educate through precision, and stimulate. At this point Forster digresses on his favourite theme of picture-building with music, citing Whitman, and, repeating much of what he had said in Aspects of the Novel, Proust. But as in "Not Listening to Music",

"these visual wanderings are not entirely to (his) taste"

now, and he particularly appreciates, returning to his theme, the early criticism of Shaw who can "interpret as well as stimulate" (106), quoting Shaw's comments on Haydn and remarking on how well they reflect Forster's own feelings about the opening of the C major Symphony "Op. 97" (107). Stimulation

too can be achieved through jokes, as in Beachcomber's "Wagner is the Puccini of music", or Forster's uncle's "They tell me music's like a gun; it hurts less when you let it off yourself." (108)

But Forster's main contention is that

"there is a basic difference between the critical and creative states of mind" (109). "Think before you speak is criticism's motto; speak before you think is creation's." (110)

And criticism has two aims; one, the more important, aesthetic, the second, subsidiary, dealing with "problems of less relevance" (111), and in the course of which Monteverdi's Vespers, the Great Mosque at Delhi, and the Frogs of Aristophanes tend to get lost sight of. The last comment is interesting, not only because it throws light on yet another aspect of Forster's musical taste, but also because it reveals a tendency, seen in the novels, to think triadically.

For Forster a work of art is "infectious" - a feeling (as occurs in him with Brahms' 4th Symphony, though not identical to the composer's in the act of creation) passes across, and it is in this area that criticism cannot help. Nor can it with the problem of freshness; Forster is, I think, over-optimistic in asserting that it is possible ever to recreate the sensation one receives on hearing a work for the first time - he cites the opening of the Choral Symphony in this connection (a

point which Britten seems to miss almost completely in his criticism of the article (112)) and Tschaiikowsky's B flat minor Piano Concerto. The combination of "experience with innocence" (113) is an unattainable ideal, yet Forster feels that

"we are most likely to perform that miracle in the case of music." (114)

Music, for him (and this is a view that again goes back to his ideas on War and Peace in Aspects of the Novel)

"more than the other arts, postulates a double existence. It exists in time, and also exists outside time, instantaneously I can conceive myself hearing a piece as it goes by and also when it has finished. In the latter case I should hear it as an entity, as a piece of sound-architecture, not as a sound-sequence, not as something divisible into bars." (115)

This is certainly possible and by experience this new sensation may be attained, though that of freshness is forever lost.

In two minor ways Forster feels that criticism can aid the artist - including the musician: by ensuring that he keeps only first-rate company (though "to be alone may be best - to be alone was that Fate reserved for Beethoven" (116)), and by helping over "niggling details, minutiae of style." (117) His final conclusion on criticism is unfavourable;

"the only activity which can establish a raison d'être is love" (118).

Mention has already been made of Forster's

collaboration with a composer of the first rank, Ralph Vaughan Williams; but perhaps no greater musical influence was exerted on Forster, certainly in the latter part of his life, than by his collaboration with another of equal rank, Benjamin Britten. Although Britten had long had "the deepest admiration for Forster's writing" (119), the first direct connection appears to have occurred in the summer of 1941 when Britten

"came across a second-hand copy of George Crabbe's poems in a Los Angeles bookshop and at the same time read an article by E.M. Forster in the B.B.C's 'The Listener' about Crabbe and Suffolk." (120)

This resulted in Britten's telling Koussevitsky about his idea for an opera on the subject of Peter Grimes which had originated from his reading of The Borough. The financial problem that writing such an opera posed was solved by a donation of 1,000 dollars from the Koussevitsky Foundation. Britten made up his mind to return to England (though it took him six months to get a passage), and Albert Herring (1947) was eventually dedicated to Forster "in admiration" and, no doubt, in recognition of the initial inspiration for Peter Grimes (121).

In the event Britten was not ready to start composing Peter Grimes till January, 1944, but the opera received its première (and, indeed, celebrated the return "home" of the company) at Sadler's Wells on 7th June, 1945, and a special booklet, in which Forster's inspirational article was included,

was produced (122). But of far greater interest with regard to Forster's connection with this opera is the lecture, "George Crabbe and Peter Grimes", that he gave in 1948 at the Aldeburgh Festival (123) of which he became a devoted friend. The earlier part of the lecture is masterly both in its evocation of the atmosphere of Aldeburgh and the surrounding countryside, and of the Peter Grimes of Crabbe's poem. When it comes to the opera itself it is characteristic of Forster's modesty that he makes no mention of his original article, just as it is of Britten's, when he describes Forster as having reacted "sympathetically to some of my own pieces" (124); for Forster in fact speaks of Peter Grimes as

" a work for which I myself have deep affection", while "that music of the workaday sea always brings tears into my eyes, it is so lovely" (125).

Having agreed that

"it has been accepted as a great work" and that "it has become a national possession and been performed all over the world" (126),

Forster proceeds fascinatingly to examine the fundamental divergences between the Crabbe and the Britten/Slater versions. His conclusion is that, just as from Verdi in Otello, through Bizet in Carmen, to Donizetti in Lucia di Lammermoor, composers have, in varying degrees, made alterations in their sources;

"they had every right to make (the change). A composer is under no obligation to stick to his original: his duty is to be original himself." (127)

Initially Forster had difficulty in adjusting to them, but

"at the second hearing I accepted the opera as an independent masterpiece, with a life of its own." (128)

Equally fascinating are Forster's speculations on what the opera would have been like had he written it, for his conception is "romantic" almost to the extent of Catherine Morland's of Northanger Abbey. Murdered apprentices, ghosts, blood and fire, and hell opening are still envisaged as essential ingredients, while the final curtain is to be lowered "on a mixture of Don Juan and the Freischütz"(129); in fact, as Forster points out, the very antithesis of all that Britten has actually used.

This lecture was the first public contribution that Forster made to the Aldeburgh Festival; he was subsequently invited by the B.B.C. to "prepare a retrospective talk of a general character" (130) on it, and this he did (131). After some witty jibes at certain kinds of festivals, especially those that are just excuses to make money, those "that remain at the flower-show level, the amateur-theatrical level", and those where "my old enemy, the Morris Dance, once more comes forth and foots it defeatedly on the tussocks of the village green", he assures the listener that Aldeburgh is not like any of those, moves on to a description of Crabbe and his birth-place, and comes eventually to an account of the choral and orchestral concert in the Parish Church with which the Festival had opened on June 5th, 1948.

"The chief item in the first concert was Benjamin Britten's new cantata 'St. Nicholas', which he conducted. This has been written for Lancing College, and it was only performed at Aldeburgh by its courtesy."

Poor Forster was duly slated by Scott Goddard for the three errors, of varying degrees of seriousness, here committed: Leslie Woodgate conducted, "Nicholas" should read "Nicolas", and Lancing actually commissioned the work. But Forster's subsequent apology (132) (his excuse is that he was "led away by (his) admiration for the music") in the face of what was a somewhat vitriolic attack, contains a delicious piece of wit, since he begins with reference to Mr. Scott Goddard and ascends through the letter to the angel whose name he had misspelt. The implication about the former is obvious.

For special praise at the concert Forster singles out three wonderful moments when

"a single little boy piped out"; when contrast was made "between elaborate singing and the rough breathy voices of three kids from the local 'co-op'" and caused "one (to) swallow in the throat and water from the eyes. (It was one of those triumphs which only the great artist can achieve)";

and when Britten

"(threw about) a tune from the main choir in the church to the girls' choir up in the gallery under the tower. The church seemed alive, and at the end the whole congregation was drawn into a hymn"

He is also appreciative of Martin Shaw's Cantata God's Grandeur and Noel Mewton-Wood's piano recital containing Schumann's Dauidsbtünderlertänze and "a sonata with jazz tendencies by Constant Lambert." The main event for him, however, was the performance of Albert Herring given by the full company of the English Opera Group and its orchestra from London, with Peter Pears in the title role. Despite problems of space, especially with the harp and percussion, Forster preferred this production to the one he had seen at Covent Garden, praising Joan Cross who seemed "inspired to every sort of drollery" and (with another jibe against Glyndebourne) conveying the feeling that "here we are happy".

Forster speculates on whether the Festival will recur and whether it could occur elsewhere. Of course it meant to (and did), but Forster objects to any centralization in London, for if that happens, he says,

"You amuse the provinces from the metropolis. Whereas the provinces ought to amuse themselves."

The height of the collaboration between Forster and Britten was reached in the late 1940s when the latter "suggested our doing an opera together" and the former "agreed happily" (133). Britten's memories of this collaboration are couched in the warmest terms:

"At the start he was characteristically timid about it, worried by his lack of experience. But when Eric Crozier

agreed to collaborate, with his considerable operatic background, he felt more confident - if we could find a mutually acceptable subject. We each suggested subjects, nearly settling on the Suffolk story "Margaret Catchpole", but not quite. Who brought up the idea of "Billy Budd" no one can quite remember; it was probably telepathic and simultaneous. I think the writing of the libretto gave him great pleasure. Certainly the summer of 1950, when we stayed for a long time at Aldeburgh, when the sun seemed to shine continuously and we would go out for relaxation in a boat with a fisherman friend (curiously resembling the Billy we were writing about), was my own happiest operatic collaboration. Naturally there were problems. He was worried that his writing in prose would inhibit my music; on the contrary, I found his terse, vivid sentences, with their strong rhythms, melodically inspiring. There was one passage that actually came out in blank verse (Claggart at the beginning of Act III); but when we did our revision after the first performances, condensing the work from four into two Acts, and removing Vere's sermon to the crew (neither of us was comfortable about this), Forster asked to be allowed to rewrite this passage in prose. We had problems over the nautical terms and tactics, but Crozier did endless research over these, and a naval friend carefully checked everything. I am sure the rehearsals and problems of production interested him, and I know he had a great thrill when the perfect Billy Budd arrived from the U.S.A (the casting of this part had been a great headache). The pleasure which I derived from this collaboration I shall never forget: Morgan's deep perception, quick wit, tireless energy (though he was just recovering from an operation), and, in spite of his doubts ('I'm not creative any longer') his consistent inspiration." (134)

Eric Crozier too has looked back to the collaboration with the happiest of memories and has fascinatingly described the interplay of personalities and ideas (135). Among the five manuscripts which lead from the start of the collaboration in 1948 to the drafting of the final two-Act version of the opera of 1960, it is the first he treasures most

"because it is the sole record of the original meeting between Benjamin Britten, E.M.Forster, and myself when we first considered Melville's story."

And he endorses Britten's sentiments above when he says that

"I do not think there could be a happier or more generous collaboration than between Britten and Forster." (136)

He also reveals (though without specifying which) that

"some scenes were wholly mine; many more were wholly (Forster's) - but whoever wrote a particular scene was expressing joint ideas." (137)

Of special interest in relation to Forster's desire to rewrite the Claggart passage in prose instead of blank verse is Crozier's statement that

"a libretto in verse is half-way towards the condition of music" (138),

for Britten aimed to break away from the dominance in English writing for the voice of

"strict subservience to logical speech rhythms" because "accentuation according to sense often contradicts the accentuation demanded by emotional content." (139)

More light is shed on Forster's own particular

attitude to the task involved in tackling the libretto in a "letter" which he wrote from Cambridge in September, 1951 (140). He indicates first why Melville's story should be so suitable for dramatisation:

"(It) has the quality of a Greek myth; it is so basic and so fertile that it can be retold or dramatised in various ways."

Forster further reveals his knowledge of two other dramatisations, the "excellent play" by Louis Coxe and Robert Chapman which "creates a wonderful scene in which Billy 'antitempts' Claggart and nearly seduces him into goodness", and Quasimodo's libretto for Ghedini's opera which "is short and elegiac but (which) too has a happy innovation: the apparition of Bristol Molly 'che dansa sul ponte', while the homesick sailors lie dreaming."

He then goes on to consider his, and Crozier's, special problem in making the adaptation:

"Ours has been how to make Billy, rather than Vere, the hero. Melville must have intended this; he called the story Billy Budd, and unless there is strong evidence to the contrary one may assume that an author calls his story after the chief character. It is what I assume here, as in another disputable case: that of the Princess Casamassima. But I also think that Melville got muddled and that, particularly in the trial scene, his respect for authority and discipline deflected him. How odiously Vere comes out in the trial scene! At first he stands in

the witness box, as he should, then he constitutes himself both counsel for the prosecution and judge, and never stops lecturing the court until the boy is sentenced to death. 'Struck by an angel of God: and I must make sure that the angel hangs.' It comes to that. 'I take him to be of that generous nature that he would even feel for us.' It comes to that too and in those words. His unseemly harangue arises, I think, from Melville's wavering attitude towards an impeccable commander, a superior philosopher, and a British aristocrat. Every now and then he doused Billy's light and felt that Vere, being well-educated and just, must shine like a star.

Or (for one must avoid that cold word 'felt') he may have created, as Shakespeare did, at various levels. We, who want to quarry a play out of him, must settle which level is relevant.

Billy's primacy granted, he must not be pathetic, and he must not be emasculated. Here again we have to hunt for the right hint. Some critics, while accepting him as hero, have noted his almost feminine beauty and the suggestion of his gentle birth. (The Indomitable is riddled with gentle births - even Claggart has one.) And this has persuaded them that Melville intends him as a priest-like saviour, a blameless fool. They can make out a case. But the hints of masculinity are stronger. 'Belted Billy' belongs to adolescent roughness, to the watches of Queequeg and Jack Chase and John Marr.)

Tattooings, earrings, love-locks curled;
Barbarians of man's simpler nature,
Unworldly servers of the world,

whom the world can easily trap and destroy, but who are, in the precise meaning of the word, men.

Claggart is less of a problem. Melville's hint of

'natural depravity' has to be followed. Claggart gets no kick out of evil as Iago did, and he is not an arch-devil, though Vere and Billy may mistake him for one, and if he utters a credo it must be on different lines from Iago's in 'Othello'. He seems almost to be the 'Man of Sorrows'. However, it does not do to go deeply into matters merely because they are deep, and neither Claggart nor Melville's conception of Fate repays lucid analysis. Melville believed in Fate, but kept seeing out of the corner of his eye a white sail beating up against the storm. Doom was fixed, the trap clicked, the body splashed, the fish nibbled. But he kept seeing the obstinate white sail."

In his view of Melville's story Forster is in particular agreement with William Plomer (whom he cites) because Plomer's criticism of it "by-passes all that is ponderous and facetious in Melville. It avoids such equations as 'Vere = Law'. It centres on the central warmth and on the bonfire in the heart and on the Milk of Paradise." "Possessed of these," says Forster, "we can flourish and endure and understand. Not all is lost. All cannot be lost. The hero hangs dead from the yardarm, dead irredeemably, and not in any heaven, dead as a doornail, dead as Antigone, and he has given us life."

His final conclusions on the problems involved are couched in the following terms:

"Thus far can a libretto lead. We (Eric Crozier and myself) have plumped for Billy as hero and for Claggart as naturally depraved, and we have ventured to tidy up

Vere. Adapters have to tidy. Creators needn't and sometimes shouldn't. Billy's stammer we hadn't to consider. It belongs to the world of sound and one day you may hear how it sounds."

All this is fascinating in so far as it shows Forster's attitude to adaptation in general and to Melville's story in particular, but it does little to reveal, except perhaps for the merest hint contained in the last two sentences, how far his experience as a novelist, and especially a novelist, who, as will be seen, displays such an awareness of sound, helped his task, or how far it confirmed or modified his views on the relationships between words and music. It was not until after the first version of the opera had finally been produced at Covent Garden on 1st December, 1951, (cost having defeated the original idea of a Sadler's Wells mounting at the Edinburgh Festival), and revision had continued over a further nine years that Forster, Crozier, and Britten, provided, in a broadcast conversation (141) rather more insight into these aspects of the problems involved.

In view of Forster's skill in handling comic scenes in his novels, and the wit that he shows in his other writings, it is interesting to learn from this conversation that, when the subject of an opera was first broached, Forster felt unable to manage a "comedy opera" because

"if it were to be modern it would have to be satirical,

and if it were to be about the past it would inevitably be nostalgic." (142)

Perhaps the qualities in the story of Billy Budd, which made Forster see it as

"a remote unearthly episode, but a song not without words" in which Melville "reaches straight back into the universal, to a blackness and sadness so transcending our own that they are undistinguishable from glory" (143),

led to its ultimate selection when subjects of a serious nature were considered. Certainly they are qualities which Crozier too, though expressing them in somewhat different terms, felt the story to possess and which made it appear to him ideal for operatic treatment:

"It seems to be the kind of pregnant description of a subject that would attract a composer by the fact that it describes quality of extension from the story. That you start with - with real characters, human characters, which are then extended onto other planes of significance. Something that is obviously stimulating when it comes to thinking of writing music." (144)

At this point in the discussion Forster modestly disclaims having any knowledge on that topic and asks Britten whether this "kind of thing would appeal to a person who saw the universe through music." (145) Britten, likewise modestly, confesses to being slightly out of his depth, but explains that he always starts with the characters, hoping that "what you

have been talking about, Morgan and Eric, comes in accidentally." He feels that "if I'm any good as a composer it will - the music will show a greater depth than perhaps I'm intending." (146)

It is perhaps indicative of the thoughts which were paramount in Forster's mind when writing the libretto that he returns, after Crozier has reintroduced and elaborated his theme of the quality of extension in the story, with the ship being, in a sense, an image of the world, to a consideration of the relative importance of the characters:

"I don't think Billy the central figure. He names the opera, and I think I consider the things from his point of view. And incidentally, this question of goodness, and of making goodness interesting, is one that does hold me very much. Because I think if only writers were able enough, as Dostoevsky was able enough, that you could make goodness very interesting. And I was very anxious to do that over Billy as far as I could, helped to no small extent by Melville. But I quite see the position of Vere. It's very easy to place him in the centre of the opera, because he has much more apprehension than poor Billy, who's often muddling about in an instinctive way. Vere is on much more to what's going on. He really understands it, when he gets the facts he understands everything. And Billy is always a little bewildered. Billy's not complete intelligence, though he is complete goodness." (147)

Fortunately, however, Britten helps to bring the discussion round again to the respective advantages of music

and literature:

"Perhaps I can help a little here in this argument dramatist versus novelist. Music has one great advantage in that it is an artificial medium: in the opera people sing all the time, and on board ship - but of course one only sings when one is singing shanties, one talks the rest of the time. But since one is in this artificial medium of music one can break into an aria which can be a statement about goodness or evil and not seem to break the medium." (148)

It is this statement, aided by a provoking interjection from Crozier, that induces Forster to make one of his most important pronouncements on the subject:

"I think that a novelist can show so much more variety, there's so much more possibility of simply describing without directly showing the reactions of the good character. But if you simply have to show the man or woman in action there's nothing that that particular good person can do but be good, and this leads to a danger which is that - that it tends to make one over villainise the villain as it were After all, when the composer wants to show a good character, he can give you good music." (149)

Forster's last comment refers, of course, as Britten points out, to music "which depicts goodness itself", so that here, in a nutshell, we have a clear picture of what Forster considered to be the advantages the novelist and composer have over the dramatist, and, by implication, the advantage the novelist has over the composer. However, the weakness inherent

in the latter part of Forster's argument is ably demonstrated by Britten:

"Music is an inexplicit art, and what one person thinks is good doesn't necessarily seem music of goodness to someone else - the same with evil. One can think of lots of examples of that. For instance, you yourself, Morgan, have said to me in the past that you have felt the Mozart G minor Symphony to be elegance personified, whereas I feel that it is one of the most tragic and tense pieces which has ever been written." (150)

Of course, similar divergences of opinion can exist about works of literature, but because the ideas therein are expressed in words, which are capable of more precise definition than music, the room for such divergences is correspondingly less wide. Which, however, is not to say that music is less capable of conveying to, or evoking in, the hearer powerful, and perhaps even more powerful, emotions.

As the discussion proceeds, it indicates rather more specifically than do Britten's and Crozier's comments above (151) the division of labour on the libretto between Crozier and Forster. The "technical things" and, in the main, the dialogues were the former's, while any "big slab of narrative" was the latter's (152). But of far greater interest is Forster's description of his attitude to, and method of, work while writing his share:

"I wrote in as far as I can remember, you see, a great

deal of emotion. I knew the music was somehow or other to be attached to my words. And whether this somehow got into the words and put them in the right order, I don't know. In writing my part of the libretto, and in the collaboration, I felt quite differently to what I have felt while writing other things, completely different. I was on a kind of voyage." (153)

Crozier then underlines not only Forster's emotional involvement in what he was doing, but also his intuitive understanding of what is required in a libretto:

"(You were) so much on fire with the whole idea that you wanted to be up and doing and it was at that point that you actually wrote the very opening speech of the opera - the prologue which wasn't altered at all, and which Ben set exactly as you first wrote it and which has such a musical feeling to it. And here immediately you showed your grasp, I think, of what was wanted." (154)

Britten, too, testifies to the excellence of Forster's work:

"It was going to be quite clearly magnificent set to words set to music." (155)

Forster, however, continues to disclaim any great ability as a writer of libretti, and, characteristically, moves the discussion away from his personal share in the collaboration to a consideration of "a particular idea that has interested me" :

"I remember starting it quite early, but in my writing I don't think I have ever tried very hard - things just come

in little rushes. The agonies of composition are unknown to me." (156) "I don't think as librettist I had any idea what would be made of the music. The music is, I think, on the whole rather solemn and sombre, and I've sometimes wondered - this is only a theoretical idea - to what extent the fact that the libretto was mostly written in prose and not in poetry may have influenced the music. It's an idea that has occurred to me but not to you, I think, Eric, has it? The prose libretto is rather unusual, and it had to be in prose because I can't write poetry though you can. So we had to plump (?) on to prose. And I've often wondered whether this prose style has influenced the music." (157)

Britten agrees that, naturally, he was influenced by the prose style, since "one is always influenced by the words one is setting." (158) But he emphasizes the fact that

"your and Eric's prose is not ordinary prose: on all occasions when I wanted it to be heightened, your prose came up to this height; and I was at no point worried by the fact that I was dealing with a prose libretto and not a poetic one." (159)

Forster admits that both he and Crozier had attempted to heighten the prose, Crozier citing in particular Claggart's aria "Oh handsomeness, oh beauty" (160), in the writing of which Forster had had in mind "a bit of the (Iago monologue) in Verdi's Otello" (the "Credo") (161).

From this examination of the influence that the heightened prose libretto may have had on the writing of the

music, the discussion, as it draws to a close, turns on whether Forster, in writing "this piece", had felt that "the meaning behind the action" had been "part of (his) intention" or whether it had "come in casually." (162) Forster's reply is again both interesting and typical:

"I had the general feeling of salvation, of course. But I don't think we put in anything there in that region which Melville did not give us. We imagined ourselves, anyhow, to be following his symbolism."

It is only in passing, within this consideration of the symbolism, that Forster returns to the problem of presenting a concept by means of music, and, by implication, the advantage the writer has over the composer. He feels that

"it would be difficult to do musically the idea of God's visiting card in the evil of Claggart." (163)

Perhaps herein lies the suggestion that, even had Forster's musical abilities matched his literary ones, he would still, in the end, have chosen to be a writer, the suggestion that the advantages to be obtained from the precision of words outweighed those of the more general appeal of music.

This discussion contains what are, despite their tantalizing brevity, Forster's most significant utterances on the relative qualities inherent in words and music. Benjamin Britten has very recently intimated that some day he may "talk or write a little about E.M. Forster's attitude to opera" but

that, because of his current illness, "it cannot be at the present moment." (164) Until that day arrives, these brief utterances must constitute the final comment on Billy Budd.

Forster continued to be a prominent figure at the Aldeburgh Festival, a special appearance at which occurred in June, 1951, when he read and commented on excerpts from his unfinished novel "Arctic Summer" (165). The same year, however, also saw the publication of a talk on the "Fifth Anniversary of the Third Programme" (166), a programme he sees as rightly being concerned with things that

"are not immediately useful - with art, literature, and music, with philosophic speculation and non-practical religion and unapplied science" (167), with things "educational" and which "require us to make an effort." (168)

For Forster the Third Programme cannot be justified on a quantitative basis since the reaction of the majority is expressed in the words of the middle-aged East Anglian fisherman he met:

"I can sum music up for you in one word: No good." (169) Quality is what matters, and the listeners to the Third do not use it "as background music for the vacuum cleaner." That is why Forster is in part disturbed by "certain signs of popularisation" exhibited in "some concerts of light music" (170), and particularly by professional carpers such as the critic who said that

"the only items in the Third which were of interest to the

ordinary man were the talks and the operas, and then held up for special censure an evening which included a complete performance of the 'Meistersinger'."

As Forster pointedly remarks,

"By the time he concluded his attack he had forgotten how it started." (171)

Another talk, also given on the Third, "Revolution at Bayreuth" (1954) (172) Britten describes as "Forster at his musical best." (173) Forster conveys his evident enjoyment of the season there where he saw The Ring, Parsifal, and Lohengrin (though he missed Tannhäuser), characterizing Hans Hotter's performance of Wotan and Amfortas as "superb", though finding Martha Mödl "a little too elegant" for Brünnhilde. He reserves special comment for Wieland and Wolfgang Wagner's respect for their grandfather's libretto and music, but is disturbed at their neglect of his stage directions, particularly with regard to lighting. The presentation of Act III of Parsifal is amusingly castigated, and the dresses he finds "vexatious", but he singles out for special praise the opening scene of Rheingold, the forging of the sword in Siegfried, and, above all, the close of Götterdämmerung. He dwells on the difficulties inherent in the delineation of Siegfried's character, and experiences too an enormous sense of the Wagnerian tradition at Bayreuth where the manuscript parts bear the signatures of all the players who have performed from them.

But his most important comments relate to Wagner's continued popularity:

"I understand why," he says, "young creative musicians should detest him. They are trying to produce something different - something clean and crackly upon a rigid superstructure - and they cannot stand the thick orchestration (174), the woolliness, the emotionalism, the slow motion, the heavy nineteenth-century furniture, and the occasional vulgarity of the Master. Others, who are not doing creative work, follow their lead. In purist circles Wagner is taboo, and when I said I was going to Bayreuth I encountered such remarks as 'I am afraid I am for Mozart', a slight pause being made between the Mo and the zart which had the subtle effect of a reprimand. Why an outsider like myself and why other outsiders should not be both for Wagner and Mozart I do not know. We are not composers. We have no creative obligations. And I believe that the coming generation, when left to itself, does like them both, and that consequently Wagner will endure. If he does not the human race loses."

Here speaks the man for whom Wagner was second only to Beethoven and for whom opera was one of the main sources, if not the main source, of musical pleasure to him (175). As he confessed in 1955,

"I am not a balletomane. Madness leads me more in the direction of opera. I know nothing about dancing, forget to watch the performers' feet, look too much at the décor, listen too much to the music, and if the human voice is introduced I am disproportionately delighted." (176)

Only at the London Diaghilev Exhibition did his previous moments, when he had apprehended greatness, coalesce, and he is only too aware of how ballet "more readily than do the other serious arts" attract abundant folly, gossip, tittering, bikinis and martinis. Nevertheless, he recognizes that behind ballet, as behind all art, lies the rigorous training, the hard work, that is "the inevitable prelude to achievement", and in his tribute to the excellence of the exhibition's organization he recognizes also the use of "not too much music" and the parallels with the typically French entertainment of "Son et Lumière".

It is not surprising that, as Forster entered his late seventies, his writings on music, as on other subjects, should have become less frequent and less extensive; but in 1956 we find him urging the view that, because "literature and the other creative arts cannot blackmail" by striking, writers (and presumably, by implication, musicians too) should refuse to give their services gratis (177); and in 1957 perceptively reviewing an English version of the libretto of The Magic Flute by W.H.Auden and Chester Kallman, drawing attention to the different interpretations and emphases that had been placed on the opera by Dent and Dickinson (178). 1964 saw him choosing as one of his three books of the year Benjamin Britten's On Receiving the First Aspen Award, which he describes as

"A confession of faith from a great musician which should awake a response in the hearts of the rest of us, whether

we are musicians or not, and whether we are great or small." (179)

Very recently K. Natwar-Singh has released some letters to The New Statesman (180) which testify to Forster's continued interest in Indian music:

"The Indian I see most of is a Maratha, who is apprenticed to Pye's, and knows a lot about music." (181)

"We are in the full swing of May Week activities - balls, concerts, parties, informal drinks - of young people sitting on the grass. I attend a suitable proportion of these. The best item is however over - a recital last Thursday of Vilayet Khan in the Union. I thought him marvellous. He went on, with one small break, for two and three-quarter hours and had us all entranced. For the first section he used the Yamani Raga. How I wish I understood the damn stuff better. I never shall. I am merely convinced it is great." (182)

A later letter reveals an amusing disregard for the modern craze for hi-fi:

"I still sit about quietly, still have no telephone and though I have a gramophone it does not revolve as quickly as it should; it probably needs cleaning." (183)

This survey of Forster's interests in music, ranging as it does through problems of listening, performing, and aesthetics, has taken us a long way, but not all the way. Britten states that Forster

"prefers the Romantic to the Classical" - logically, since

he was brought up musically at the end of the nineteenth century." (184)

However, as he points out "Forster is interested in new music"; his interest in Britten's own music has already been seen, and Britten has also

"heard him react sympathetically to Stravinsky (and) to Michael Tippett." (185)

This list should be extended: in his letter following upon The Times' obituary of E.J. Dent, Forster calls attention to Dent's book on Busoni (186); he admired Menotti's operas The Medium and The Telephone and told him so (187); he was delighted by the virtuosity of Grigoraş Dinicu's gipsy band in Rumania - so famous that Heifetz adopted Dinicu's "Ciocarlia" as an encore, while violinists of similar eminence often went to listen (198): and, after initial incomprehension, Forster was ultimately enchanted by Ethel Merman in Annie Get Your Gun (189).

But despite these wide interests, Britten was essentially right about Forster's musical taste, and this is brought out particularly clearly by the choice of music that Forster was allowed to make (subject to the availability of talent) for the concert on 1st March, 1959, given at one of the King's College Sunday evening concerts, at which Forster was such a constant attender, in honour of his eightieth birthday.

The programme was as follows:

Overture:	Coriolan	Beethoven
Variations Symphoniques for piano and orchestra		Franck
Lieder:		
(a)	Dämmerung senkte sich von Oben	Brahms
(b)	Anakreons Grab	Wolf
(c)	Zueignung	R. Strauss
(d)	Allerseelen	R. Strauss
Trumpet Concerto in E flat		Haydn
		(190)

Perhaps the availability of talent prevented the inclusion of Wagner, and perhaps the Haydn is there both as contrast and a happy send-off: but the programme reveals, in the main, where Forster's real sympathies lay. It now remains to be seen how these sympathies, interests and concerns are reflected in the novels.

*** *** ***

NOTES to CHAPTER 1

- 1) "Some Notes on Forster and Music", pp. 81-92.
- 2) Aspects of E.M. Forster, ed. Oliver Stallybrass, Edward Arnold, Ltd., 1969.
- 3) Stallybrass in his Preface to the above.
- 4) C.H. Herford in The Age of Wordsworth (1897).
- 5) Hoxie N. Fairchild in The Romantic Quest (1931).
- 6) F.L. Lucas in The Decline and Fall of the Romantic Ideal (1936).
- 7) George Sand. These definitions ((4)-(7)) are taken from: E. Bernbaum: A Guide through the Romantic Movement, New York, 1949, pp. 301-2, and are repeated in: Lilian R. Furst; Romanticism, No. 2 of The Critical Idiom, Methuen and Co., Ltd., London, 1969.
- 8) For the mainly musical aspect of this period in England, see Ernest Walker: A History of Music in England, Oxford University Press, London, 1966, Chapters 11 and 12. For the social aspects, see E.D. Mackerness: A Social History of English Music, Routledge and Kegan Paul, London, 1966, Chapter 6, pp. 199-234.
- 9) Louis Spohr (1784-1859), of course, wrote many String Quartets. He enjoyed a great reputation in his time, but fell into neglect especially this century. There has, however, been a considerable revival of interest recently with the publication of a new biography, the formation of a Spohr Society, and the recording of several pieces especially of the Violin and Clarinet Concertos, and certain chamber works. The Victorian practice here of playing a piano arrangement shows how the knowledge of chamber and orchestral works was often disseminated in the period.
- 10) MT, Chapter 4, pp. 279-280.
- 11) See; "My First Opera", Opera, June, 1963, Vol. 14, pp. 373-4.
- 12) See Chapter 4 below. The present headmaster of Tonbridge School, Dr. R.M. Ogilvie, has been kind enough to

supply me with the following information and comments regarding music at Tonbridge during Forster's time there:

"During Forster's time there were two Directors of Music, Brewer, later Sir Herbert Brewer, organist at Gloucester Cathedral, and H.C. Stewart. The situation was that music at Tonbridge, as at many schools, was a very dull and unfashionable activity before 1890, and it was only a few schools, in particular Clifton, Rugby and Tonbridge, which tried to make it part of the cultural experience of a school boy. I well remember my father, Sir Frederick Ogilvie and my uncle, Joyce Cary, who were contemporaries at Clifton, telling me of the enormous effect that the appointment of an enthusiastic and professional Director of Music had on their own lives, so that I think Forster's remarks have got to be seen against the background of trying to instil life into school music which these days we take for granted. I don't think that Forster's criticisms, particularly if you have read Maurice, should be taken out of context. He was a deeply introverted and morbidly sensitive man, as I knew when I had the good fortune to enjoy his company for three years when he was a Fellow of King's during the 1950s. Alas, no tapes or records survive of the kind of music which was actually being performed at this school during the period that interests you."

Letter dated 27th January, 1975.

- 13) GLD, Chapter 1, p. 8.
- 14) GLD, Chapter 5, p. 18.
- 15) GLD, Chapter 9, p. 69.
- 16) GLD, Chapter 5, p. 20.
- 17) Ibid.
- 18) GLD, Chapter 6, p. 25.
- 19) Ibid.
- 20) GLD, Chapter 9, p. 69.
- 21) Ibid.
- 22) Ibid.

- 23) Ibid.
- 24) Ibid.
- 25) Ibid., p. 67 and p. 69.
- 26) Ibid., Chapter 12, p. 147.
- 27) Ibid., Appendix B, p. 208.
- 28) Ibid., Chapter 10, p. 78.
- 29) GLD, Chapter 14, p. 186. The letter is dated 7 August 1930.
- 30) Ibid., p. 189. This letter is dated 21 January 1932.
- 31) Ibid., p. 185.
- 32) Presumably the B minor.
- 33) GLD, Chapter 12, p. 149.
- 34) GLD, Chapter 14, p. 188.
- 35) It seems to me that Martial Rose (Chapter 7, p. 107) is in error.
- 36) Benjamin Britten, op. cit., p. 85.
- 37) TC, "The C Minor of that Life", p. 132.
- 38) Ibid., p. 133.
- 39) Dent forms the basis for the character of Philip Herriton in WAFI. See Chapter 2 below.
- 40) Letter to The Times, 26th August, 1957.
- 41) See, "My First Opera", op. cit., p. 374.
- 42) See both the above, and "Revolution at Bayreuth", The Listener, 4th January, 1954.
- 43) CSS, pp. 49-50.
- 44) Britten, op. cit., p. 82.
- 45) CSS, p. 173.

- 46) Ibid., p. 174.
- 47) Ibid., p. 178. Here indeed are echoes of Lucy Honeychurch and Margaret Schlegel.
- 48) HD, p. 19.
- 49) Ibid., p. 24.
- 50) Ibid., p. 38.
- 51) Ibid., p. 46.
- 52) Ibid., p. 37.
- 53) Ibid., p. 20.
- 54) Ibid., p. 24.
- 55) Ibid.
- 56) 2nd September, 1917, signed "Pharos".
- 57) 21st October, 1917, signed "Pharos".
- 58) 6th January, 1918.
- 59) See "A Note on the Way" (1934), in AH, p. 88.
- 60) The Athenaeum, 11th July, 1919, p. 597.
- 61) The Athenaeum, 26th December, 1919, p. 1406.
- 62) HD, p. 60.
- 63) Ibid., p. 65.
- 64) Ibid., p. 91.
- 65) Ibid., p. 59.
- 66) Ibid., p. 64.
- 67) Ibid., p. 71.
- 68) Ibid., p. 88.
- 69) Ibid., p. 78 onwards.
- 70) Ibid., p. 100 onwards.

- 71) See Chapter 7 below.
- 72) See Conclusion below.
- 73) AH, pp. 85-89.
- 74) Ibid., p. 86.
- 75) Ibid.
- 76) Ibid., p. 87.
- 77) See AH, pp. 369-384.
- 78) AH, p. 384.
- 79) See AH, pp. 115-119.
- 80) Ibid., p. 116.
- 81) Ibid., p. 117.
- 82) Ibid.
- 83) Ibid., p. 117.
- 84) Ibid., p. 118.
- 85) Ibid., p. 119.
- 86) TC, pp. 133-136.
- 87) Ibid., p. 133.
- 88) Ibid., p. 135.
- 89) Ibid., p. 136.
- 90) Ibid.
- 91) Ibid.
- 92) See the manuscript in the Library of King's College, Cambridge.
- 93) Op. 101, movements 1, 2, 3; Op. 7, movement 1; Op. 31 No. 3, Scherzo; Op. 110, movement 1; Op. 10 No. 2, movement 1; Op. 22, movements 1 and 4; Op. 90, movements 1 and 2; Op. 109, movement 1; Op. 31 No. 2, movement 3. Others - the Moonlight, the Appassionata, and Op. 31 No. 1 - are mentioned in passing.

- 94) TC, pp. 130-133.
- 95) Ibid., p. 130.
- 96) Ibid., p. 133.
- 97) Ibid.
- 98) See Myra Hess by Her Friends, compiled by Denise Lassimonne, Hamish Hamilton, London, 1966, pp. 109-111.
- 99) Music performed at the National Gallery Concerts, 10th October, 1939, to 10th April 1946, Privately Printed, London, MCMXLVIII.
- 100) National Gallery Concerts, In aid of the Musicians' Benevolent Fund, 10th October, 1944, Printed for the Trustees, London, 1944. Forster's article appears on pp. 6-7.
- 101) The Sunday Times, 31st August, 1947, p. 4.
- 102) See TC, pp. 114-129.
- 103) Ibid., p. 114.
- 104) Ibid., p. 115.
- 105) Ibid.
- 106) Ibid., p. 119.
- 107) Ibid., p. 119. Forster presumably means No. 97, not Op. 97. His views on Haydn, as with his views on Mozart, do less than justice to the composer. Moreover, he misspells his name "Hayden" in the MS. on the Beethoven Sonatas.
- 108) TC, p. 120. Like the first of these perceptive witticisms, the words to the Brahms-Handel Variations' Fugue, cited above, pass silent but trenchant comment on the fact that the last two phrases of the subject are identical; the second surely bears on Lucy Honeychurch's and Forster's own playing.
- 109) Ibid., p. 121.
- 110) Ibid., p. 123.
- 111) Ibid.

- 112) Britten, op. cit., p. 84.
- 113) TC, p. 126.
- 114) Ibid.
- 115) Ibid. This statement is obviously related to the common dictum of nineteenth century German critics that "Architecture is frozen music" and its converse that "Music is moving architecture". See: Calvin S. Brown: Music and Literature: A Comparison of the Arts, University of Georgia Press, Athens, Georgia, 1948, Chapter 2, p. 9.
- 116) TC, p. 128.
- 117) Ibid., p. 129.
- 118) Ibid.
- 119) Britten, op. cit., p. 85.
- 120) Alan Kendall, Benjamin Britten, Macmillan, London, Ltd., 1973, Chapter 1, p. 20. The article in question, "George Crabbe: The Poet and the Man" is reprinted in: Aldeburgh Anthology, edited by Ronald Blythe, Snape Maltings Foundation in association with Faber Music, Aldeburgh, Suffolk, 1972, pp. 3-7. See also note (122) below.
- 121) Peter Grimes could not have been dedicated to Forster since the dedication was already, by the terms of the donation, committed to the memory of Natalie Koussevitsky, the deceased wife of the conductor.
- 122) Sadler's Wells Opera Books, 1945, No. 3. Benjamin Britten: Peter Grimes - Essays. See pp. 9-14. Forster's article is the same as that mentioned in note (120) above, but there are minor differences of wording.
- 123) See TC, pp. 176-191.
- 124) Britten, op. cit., p. 85.
- 125) TC, p. 188 and p. 189 respectively.
- 126) Ibid., p. 188.
- 127) Ibid., p. 189.

- 128) Ibid., p. 191.
- 129) Ibid., p. 190.
- 130) See Forster's letter to The Listener, 8th July, 1948, p. 61.
- 131) See "Looking Back on the Aldeburgh Festival", The Listener, 24th June, 1948, p. 1011 and p. 1013.
- 132) See his letter to The Listener, note (130) above.
- 133) Britten, op. cit., p. 85.
- 134) Britten, op. cit., pp. 85-86. The "perfect Billy Budd" referred to was Theodor Uppman.
- 135) See Eric Crozier: "Writing an Opera", Adam International Review, March/May, 1952, pp. 17-19.
- 136) Both ibid., p. 18.
- 137) Ibid.
- 138) Ibid., p. 19.
- 139) See Benjamin Britten: "Peter Grimes", Sadler's Wells Opera Books, No. 3, p. 8, cited above.
- 140) The photocopy of the typescript of this "letter", beginning "My Dear America", is item 9 in Box 14 of the E.M. Forster collection at King's College Cambridge, and forms part of a donation from Eric Crozier.
- 141) Transcript (dated 22nd November 1960) of a discussion on Billy Budd between Benjamin Britten, E.M. Forster, and Eric Crozier, broadcast on the B.B.C. Third Programme, 12th November, 1960 and contained in E.M. Forster: Broadcast Talks, 1944-60, Volume 23 (pp. 491-512) of the King's College Collection. King's College also possess a tape-recording of this discussion (Tape No. 15). The original transcript is contained in the B.B.C. Written Archives Centre at Caversham.
- 142) Ibid., p. 493.
- 143) AN, Chapter 7, pp. 145-6. Forster reads the paragraph from which these quotations are taken in the discussion.

- 144) Transcript (see 141) above), p. 496. The quality of "extension" which Crozier considers of such importance to an opera composer is also emphasized in: Writing an Opera, a talk given by him on the Third Programme on 1st December 1951. See the photocopy of the transcript of this talk, item 11 in Box 14 of the King's College collection.
- 145) Ibid., p. 496.
- 146) Ibid.
- 147) Ibid., p. 498.
- 148) Ibid., p. 499.
- 149) Ibid.
- 150) Ibid., p. 500.
- 151) See (134) and (139).
- 152) Transcript, p. 502.
- 153) Ibid., p. 503.
- 154) Ibid.
- 155) Ibid.
- 156) Ibid., p. 504.
- 157) Ibid., p. 507.
- 158) Ibid.
- 159) Ibid.
- 160) Ibid., p. 508.
- 161) Ibid.
- 162) Ibid.
- 163) Ibid., p. 509.
- 164) Letter to myself, dated 4th February, 1975.
- 165) See the reprint in: Tribute to Benjamin Britten on his Fiftieth Birthday, edited by Anthony Gishford, Faber and Faber, London, 1963, pp. 46-55.

- 166) The Listener, 4th October, 1951, pp. 539-541.
- 167) Ibid., p. 539.
- 168) Ibid.
- 169) Ibid., p. 540.
- 170) Ibid.
- 171) Ibid.
- 172) The Listener, 4th January, 1954, pp. 755-757.
- 173) Britten, op. cit., p. 84.
- 174) Britten, op. cit., p. 84, quarrels with this.
- 175) J.R. Ackerley (E.M. Forster: A Portrait, McKelvie, London, 1970) refers to his listening to opera standing or sitting "with averted face". (p. 5.)
- 176) "A Shrine for Diaghilev", The Observer, 25th December, 1955, p. 4.
- 177) Letter to The Times Literary Supplement, 17th August, 1956, p. 487.
- 178) The Listener, 21st November, 1957, p. 850 and p. 853.
- 179) The Observer, 20th December, 1964, p. 7.
- 180) The New Statesman, 14th June, 1974.
- 181) Letter dated 2nd May, 1957.
- 182) Letter dated 8th January, 1958.
- 183) Letter dated 6th June, 1961.
- 184) Britten, op. cit., p. 85.
- 185) Ibid.
- 186) Letter to The Times, 26th August, 1957, p. 10.
- 187) See "Forster in America" by William Roerick in Aspects of E.M. Forster, cited above, p. 64.
- 188) See "Forster in Rumania" by Alec Randall in the above, p. 54.
- 189) Roerick, op. cit., p. 64.
- 190) See "Forster and King's" by Patrick Wilkinson also in the above, p. 26.

CHAPTER 2 : A ROOM WITH A VIEW

A ROOM WITH A VIEW, the first of Forster's novels to be embarked upon, but the third to be published (1908) (1), contains what is, in some ways, Forster's most extensive, if not most subtle, use of music in his novels. By far the best analysis of this use is by Beer (2), though it is also touched on by, amongst others, Stone (3), Wilde (4), Trilling (5) and Brander (6).

The opening chapter of the novel presents Lucy Honeychurch as a young girl who shows every sign of having reached a crucial point in her life where she subconsciously feels the need to break out from the restrictions imposed upon her by her background, her upbringing, and the repressions of Miss Bartlett. She secretly sympathizes with the social outcasts of the Pension Bertolini, the Emersons; has

"an odd feeling that whenever these ill-bred tourists spoke the contest widened and deepened till it dealt, not with rooms and views, but with - well, with something quite different, whose existence she had not realized before" (7);

is "in a state of spiritual starvation" (8); goes so far as to turn back to give "the two outsiders a nervous little bow" (9); and is secretly delighted at the triumph of the young Mr. Emerson (10). Up to this point in her life Lucy has been an unremarkable girl, unremarkable that is except for the one aspect

of her character which makes Mr. Beebe remember her from among the many females he has perforce to encounter - her piano-playing (11).

The occasion on which Mr. Beebe first heard Lucy play was at Tunbridge Wells "at one of those entertainments where the upper classes entertain the lower." (12) He had expected "Adelaida" (sic) or the march from "The Ruins of Athens" (13). Instead

"his composure was disturbed by the opening bars of Op. 111" (14).

Now, as has been seen, however great was Forster's devotion to Wagner, however fond he may have been of R. Strauss, Wolf and Franck, his musical idol, if any, was Beethoven. Britten's testimony to the quality of Forster's own piano-playing (15) (even though it did not approach that of Gide's (16)), and the particular love that he had for the Beethoven Sonatas, have too been noticed. It is sad that Op. 111 is omitted from the notes on those Sonatas (17); but it is clear from Forster's comments on the others, and elsewhere, that the qualities he especially valued in Beethoven are the drama, the power and the rhythmic drive.

Technically, with the exception of the Hammerklavier, Op. 111 is the most difficult of the Sonatas, and the black appearance alone of the second movement is enough to daunt most amateurs. It is thus doubly surprising that Miss Honeychurch

should essay it, and her choice marks her at once as having singular courage, determination, and a streak of rebellion, even if she does play only the first movement. Emotionally, too, encompassing as it does the sublimest heights and profoundest depths of human feeling, equalled only in the late Quartets, Op. 111 speaks of matters which Miss Honeychurch can as yet have only inklings of, matters which she will encounter more as she develops through the novel. It seems to symbolize her aspiration towards sensations so far unrealized. Characteristically, because she is young, and although (like Forster, who could not manage the March of Op. 101 up to speed) she is no "dazzling exécutante" (18), she plays "on the side of Victory." (19)

So too, then, does her choice suggest that she has the potential for considerable emotional development. Already, whenever she opens her piano, she becomes a different person, neither "deferential or patronizing" (20). Already the seeds of rebellion against the society in which she has been brought up are showing signs of growth, that society epitomized in the vicar who did "not consider her choice of piece happy" (21), and who thought that Beethoven

"is so usually simple and direct in his appeal that it is sheer perversity to choose a thing like that, which, if anything, disturbs" (22),

a society narrow in outlook, emotionally barren, and odiously complacent. No wonder if the reader feels with Mr. Beebe:

"If Miss Honeychurch ever takes to live as she plays, it will be very exciting - both for us and for her" (23).

A similar response to the vicar's is shared by Mrs. Honeychurch who, without positively disliking it, feels that Lucy gets too excited about her music and becomes silly over it. Here we see music relating to one of the book's most important themes, the idea that in the acceptance of emotion lies one aspect of truth, an aspect that is in part denied by Mrs. Honeychurch. Yet music relates too to the idea that emotion must be complemented by the intellect, the intellect that will help resolve the "muddle" which old Mr. Emerson finds in Lucy. And as early as Chapter 4 we learn that

"Lucy never knew her desires so clearly as after music."
(24)

The "too much Beethoven" (25) of which Mr. Beebe complains produces a desire in her to seek an adventure on the platform of an electric tram; instead she finds a stabbing and the saving arms of George Emerson. Her music has not only helped to establish an important element in her character; it has also sent her off on the path of self-knowledge.

It would be as well at this point to consider whether Forster has used any of the other Arts to strengthen the reader's initial impression of Lucy. With painting and sculpture she does not display the same assuredness as she does with music. Deserted by Miss Lavish, alone in Santa Croce without her

Baedeker, she cannot trust her own judgment, or allow her natural appreciation to work. She feels that she must be educated in Giotto's "tactile virtues" and have Ruskin tell her what "Sepulchral slab is really beautiful". True, her exploration of the church leads to an encounter with George and Mr. Emerson, but this meeting is not fraught with the emotional overtones of the one following the stabbing and which culminates in George's throwing away of the bloodstained photographs, an action which warns Lucy of unknown dangers. It is surely significant that the latter episode is rounded off by Forster with a musical metaphor:

"Leaning her elbows on the parapet, she contemplated the River Arno, whose roar was suggesting some unexpected melody to her ears." (26)

Until her range of emotional experience begins to be broadened by her encounter with George Emerson, music has provided Lucy with her one great emotional outlet. Following the security-shattering episode of the trip to the slopes near Fiesole and the receipt of her first kiss among the violets (27), she feels the need for another outlet, that of self-exposure to the brown Miss Bartlett. When Miss Alan asks her to play, she refuses vehemently:

"Music seemed to her the employment of a child." (28)

Her response marks a crucial point in her development: not only does music no longer serve her emotional needs; its effects pale

into insignificance beside those of the experiences she is undergoing for the first time.

In the event Lucy's desire for emotional self-exposure is thwarted by the unexpected attack of Miss Bartlett about what is to be done, and the unexpectedness of it prevents Lucy from achieving the victory and liberation that she might otherwise have won. Forster, as with the stage reached after the stabbing, marks this temporary defeat by a musical metaphor:

"She could not modulate out of the key of self-abasement in which she had started." (29)

Hitherto, when she had played the piano, she had played on the side of victory. She has not yet learned to play on the side of victory in her emotional life.

When the scene changes to Windy Corner, Lucy's piano appears as an item, but by no means, apparently, a significant item, in the furnishings of the drawing-room. It acts as a convenient repository for Freddy's bone. Perhaps this juxtaposition symbolizes the stages Freddy and Lucy had reached in their respective developments and attitudes - Freddy the somewhat callow youth with scientific leanings, Lucy the, apart from her music, unremarkable girl - prior to her Italian trip, though it is more likely to indicate the happy and cosy, if to some extent superficial, relationships that exist within the Honeychurch household. But Freddy in his own individual way, like Lucy, is reaching a stage in his development when he

is becoming, if only intuitively, aware of issues wider than his home has ever provided. He senses that, because of a fundamental flaw in Cecil's character - expressed in his feeling that Cecil was the kind of fellow who would never wear another fellow's cap, Cecil is wrong for Lucy, and when Mrs. Honeychurch praises Cecil for all the qualities that Freddy knows to be irrelevant - his goodness, his cleverness, his wealth, his good connections - he kicks the piano. Of course, this may simply be convenience - his bone is on the piano and the piano may be the nearest thing to kick - though it might, as with Anne, have been the door or the chair-legs. But its being the piano tends to remind the reader of Lucy's specialness and her potential for the development already begun - not however by Cecil Vyse but by George Emerson.

Like Mr. Beebe, Cecil has known Lucy as

"a commonplace girl who happened to be musical" (30), and this reiteration of an idea soon after the opening of the second part of the novel functions almost in the way that the repetition of the first subject in a different key at the beginning of the middle section of a Sonata-form movement does: it reminds the reader of important material, acts as a signal that new light is to be shed on what has gone before, and suggests possibly unsuspected developments.

The change that has taken place in Lucy in Italy is,

however, not indicated by Forster in terms of music, but in terms of painting:

"She was like a woman of Leonardo da Vinci's, whom we love not so much for herself as for the things she will not tell us." (31)

Nevertheless, when Mr. Beebe, oblivious of the engagement between Cecil and Lucy, is discussing her potential for expansion and improvement, it is again music that is used:

"Does it seem reasonable that she should play so wonderfully, and live so quietly? I suspect that one day she will be wonderful in both. The water-tight compartments in her will break down, and music and life will be single. Then we shall have her heroically good, heroically bad - too heroic, perhaps, to be good or bad." (32)

Here again is a restatement of the main theme originally given out by Mr. Beebe. (33) And the unpredictability of the direction Lucy's development is to take is also expressed in musical terms (34) though augmented by the cartoon-like simile of Miss Honeychurch as the kite with Miss Bartlett holding the string.

In the chapters which follow, Freddy's intuitive feeling, despite his acceptance of the engagement once it was effected, that the relationship of Cecil and Lucy is not going to work, is shown to be amply justified. Cecil despises the society of Summer Street; Lucy's outburst over Mr. Eager shows how unstable are her emotions beneath the surface; Lucy

confesses that she sees Cecil only in a drawing-room without a view; Cecil's first kiss to Lucy shows how apt is his nickname of "the Fiasco"; and Cecil seals his own fate by arranging for the Emersons to be installed in Cissie Villa in place of the Miss Alans.

Lucy's anger over the latter action is seen once again in terms of painting rather than of music. The woman who had been "like a woman of Leonardo da Vinci's" (35) when Cecil first meets her in Italy, and who had "reminded him of a Leonardo more than ever" (36) on his second proposal in the Alps, now for him "had failed to be Leonardesque." (37) But when Lucy is temporarily sheltered from the Emersons by being at Mrs. Vyse's London flat when they move into Cissie Villa, and can even seem to find security in Cecil's arms, a crisis is reached, the nature of which Forster explores deeply and subtly with the aid of music. At Mrs. Vyse's dinner party "the grandchildren of famous people" with their wittily weary talk, perpetual ennui, and continually collapsing enthusiasms ask Lucy to play the piano. She plays Schumann (38):

" 'Now some Beethoven,' called Cecil, when the querulous beauty of the music had died. She shook her head and played Schumann again. The melody rose, unprofitably magical. It broke; it was resumed broken, not marching once from the cradle to the grave. The sadness of the incomplete - the sadness that is often Life, but should never be Art - throbbled in its dejected phrases, and

made the nerves of the audience throb. Not thus had she played on the little draped piano at the Bertolini, and 'Too much Schumann' was not the remark that Mr. Beebe had passed to himself when she returned." (39)

Beer sees that

"in so doing she passes a subconscious judgment on the atmosphere in which they have surrounded themselves" (40)

and certainly Forster's description suggests the boredom and lack of direction inherent in the Vyse society. But there is more to the passage than that. The choice reflects Lucy's inner state, her subconscious dissatisfaction not only with that society, but also with her own unfulfilled emotions. The word "querulous" relates to the peevishness which Beer notices frequently occurs in Lucy, as well as in others. The music itself, while having a transitory beauty, is "unprofitably magical"; it leads nowhere and Lucy is likewise at sea. Her playing matches the music. In Beethoven she had played on the side of victory; no such confidence is exuded here. Her drive has been replaced by indecision and the recollection of Mr. Beebe's comment of "Too much Beethoven" on the change actually wrought by Italy and George Emerson, in the phrase "Too much Schumann" indicates the further change occasioned in Lucy by her engagement to Cecil.

It is ironic that her playing rouses him to an ecstasy of enthusiasm:

" 'But her music!' he exclaimed. 'The style of her!'
How she kept to Schumann when, like an idiot I wanted
Beethoven. Schumann was right for this evening.
Schumann was the thing.'" (41)

He can only appreciate the sensitiveness of her choice; he does not sense the conflicting emotions underlying that choice which erupt in her nightmare at the end of the chapter.

Forster soon underlines this unsatisfactoriness in the relationship between Lucy and Cecil with music of a very different kind. By Chapter 13 even the equable Mrs. Honeychurch is becoming incensed with Cecil's attitude to Summer Street society, and she sharply criticizes to Lucy his behaviour when Freddy had sung his comic song (42). Lucy's faltering excuse is that

"You can't expect a really musical person to enjoy comic songs as we do." (43)

This is doubly ironic, because the excuse contains two inherent condemnations. It raises the whole question as to whether a "really musical person" should be able to enjoy every kind of music and suggests once again that Cecil is incomplete as a person. And, of course, Lucy does enjoy the song, thereby strengthening the impression that she is capable of becoming more fully rounded than he will ever be.

The episode marks yet another stage in the removal of

the scales from Lucy's eyes; Cecil, measured against the Summer Street society, rather than the London one, is found wanting.

It is rounded off by a passage, which, in its suggestion of issues far greater than the problems inherent in Lucy's relationship with Cecil, reminds the reader of Lucy's initial encounter with the Emersons (44).

"The two civilizations had clashed - Cecil had hinted that they might - and she was dazzled and bewildered, as though the radiance that lies behind all civilization had blinded her eyes. Good taste and bad taste were only catchwords, garments of diverse cut; and music itself dissolved to a whisper through the pine-trees, where the song is not distinguishable from the comic song." (45)

Beyond individual civilizations, beyond individual tastes, lies an ultimate unity, a wholeness of which we can catch only an occasional vision. The last image looks forward to the moment when Lucy will no longer find in music her prime emotional fulfilment; and music's dissolution among the pine-trees suggests its final subservience to even more vital matters, for the trees evoke associations with the most important train of symbolism in the book - rooms with views, nature, vitality, George Emerson.

As Lucy's opinion of Cecil progressively worsens, her opinion of George correspondingly improves. After the Sunday church-going, when Lucy realizes that he has kept from his father the secret of the Italian episode, her joy, the cause of which she does not correctly attribute, is again significantly

expressed in musical terms:

"All the way home the horse's hoofs sang a tune to her:
'He has not told, he has not told.' Her brain expanded
the melody: 'He has not told his father - to whom he
tells all things'." (46)

This prepares the way for the great symbolic use of music which closely follows, when, after Cecil has been irritatingly patronizing and off-hand over the Emersons, and lunch has passed unusually cheerfully, Lucy is asked to play (47).

"She had seen Gluck's 'Armide' that year, and played from memory the music of the enchanted garden (48), the music to which Renaud approaches, beneath the light of an eternal dawn, the music that never gains, never wanes, but ripples for ever like the tideless seas of fairyland. Such music is not for the piano, and her audience began to get restive, and Cecil, sharing the discontent, called out: 'Now play us the other garden - the one in 'Parsifal'.'" (49)

Ostensibly, then, the reason for her choice is her having seen the opera that year, but the symbolism underlying her choice is clear. The music of Gluck's enchanted garden does not just have a soothing effect upon Lucy's nerves; it evokes for her an atmosphere of timelessness and unchangingness which relates to the feeling of permanence that, however transient in reality, she senses resides at Windy Corner (50). Cecil, whose attributes are essentially, in Forster's view, those of the Middle Ages, characteristically asks for the garden music from Parsifal.

But it is also just possible that Forster derived a private satisfaction, in keeping with his liking for "having secrets from the reader" (51), from a symbolism arising out of the ramification of the plots of the respective operas. Armide is the story of an enchantress whose charms captivate all men except the very one she wants - Renaud. Moreover, the section that Lucy plays (the opening of Act II scene iii) occurs just before he succumbs to the magic of the garden, thereby exposing himself to the dagger she is incapable of using. The initial parallel - what she can have and does not want, and what she feels she cannot have and does want - with Cecil and George is obvious. Further, Armide's inability to kill Renaud suggests Lucy's deep-seated reluctance to forget George. Perhaps too the fact that, in the end, Armide loses Renaud to valour implies that Lucy anticipates a similar fate resulting from George's better feelings.

A modicum of support for this view, that Forster was deriving a somewhat personal enjoyment from this additional symbolism, is supplied by an examination of Cecil's request. Parsifal, "the Guileless Fool", renounces passion for the sake of eternal life, unlike Tristan who renounces life for the sake of passion. Cecil has no real passion; he is more at home with things than people, his first kiss has been a failure, he sees Lucy continually as a work of Art. George among the violets, shows he has.

The Garden music of Parsifal (the opening of Act II) contains, amongst other "motive", those of Klingsor, the sorcerer, and Kundry, the witch-maiden. It manifests a sense of foreboding completely absent from the Glück and preludes Cecil's self-destruction at the end of the following chapter brought about, finally, by his refusal to make a fourth at tennis. Kundry, like Armide, fails to get her man, but is released from a life of suffering by Parsifal just as Lucy is saved both by Cecil's action and George's perseverance. Obviously there can be no complete identification of personages and the symbolism does not fully work out, but the parallels are distinctly suggestive.

Lucy, at first, will not play Cecil's request. Not only is her natural good taste better than Cecil's (52); her rebellion is increasing. Miss Bartlett thinks, perhaps, that Lucy's change of mind is occasioned by George's appearance. But Lucy plays, not for George, but to counteract feelings of guilt aroused by her refusal to Cecil. Her indecision, her inability to play well, reflect the turmoil of her mind. No wonder that tennis now seems superior to music:

"How much better to run about in comfortable clothes than to sit at the piano and feel girt under the arms. Once more music seemed to her the employment of a child." (53)

The escape is more than an immediate removal from

discomfort. Music had before with her taken on a lesser significance at a point of crisis in her life, after George had kissed her among the violets (54). Now, in an even more momentous crisis, at a place in the novel which is structurally and, indeed, almost geometrically (55), in a position directly parallel to the first episode, the change in Lucy's scale of values reveals the progress of her emotional development towards the moment when music will no longer be the prime outlet for her feelings. And once again, coupled with the musical symbolism, is the wider image of nature representing George's vitality. Yet, despite Lucy's temporary progression beyond music Forster uses a musical metaphor, as he had done at the end of the Fiesole episode, to indicate Lucy's subsequent mood towards Cecil:

"She had dwelt amongst melody and movement, and her nerves refused to answer to the clang of his." (56)

After the second kiss, Lucy's feigned attack on George, his declaration of love, and the breaking off of the engagement, Forster returns to the symbolism of Lucy's progress beyond music. Initially, in the confrontation of Lucy and Cecil, it is the imagery of painting he draws upon:

Cecil "looked at her, instead of through her, for the first time since they were engaged. From a Leonardo she has become a living woman, with mysteries and forces of her own, with qualities that even eluded art." (57)

But, at the climax of Lucy's outburst, music is linked with painting and literature in her new manifesto for living, (couched, ironically, in a vocabulary learned from George) reducing the importance of all Art, which Cecil symbolizes, in favour of people:

" you wrap yourself up in art and books and music, and would try to wrap up me. I won't be stifled, not by the most glorious music, for people are more glorious, and you hide them from me." (58)

Mr. Beebe, bicycling to Windy Corner to share his amusement and pleasure at his receipt of Miss Catharine Alan's letter, is happily oblivious of this momentous change. And just as Forster had signalled the "development" section of the novel with a musical echo (59), he now recapitulates the idea given out at the beginning before showing the very real change that has taken place in that development:

" - she must see some beauty in life, or she could not play the piano as she did. He had a theory that musicians are incredibly complex, and know far less than other artists what they want and what they are; that they puzzle themselves as well as their friends; that their psychology is a modern development, and has not yet been understood." (60)

That change is indicated when Mr. Beebe hears Lucy in the drawing-room "tinkling at a Mozart Sonata." (61) The first significance lies in the word "tinkling". Lucy is no longer playing on the side of victory as she did in Beethoven;

her confidence has melted away with her state of indecision. Secondly, Forster had no high regard for the Mozart Piano Sonatas, an opinion shared by many musicians, and, with certain exceptions, notably K. 310 in A minor and K. 457 in C minor, they are inferior emotionally both to other groups of Mozart's work, like, say, the concertos, and to the Beethoven Piano Sonatas. Lucy has moved on; her music can no longer fulfil her spiritual needs. When Mr. Beebe eventually enters the drawing-room she is playing "attentively" (62), a word which suggests she is playing to avoid her innermost feelings rather than for self-expression (despite Miss Bartlett's later caustic comment that "Lucy can always play" (63)). And after some desultory chords Lucy passes into Schumann. The process of recapitulation is continuing, for we are reminded of her playing at the Vyses' (64) which evoked a feeling of dissatisfaction (here matched by a sense of despondency arising from the fact that, despite the removal of Cecil, its real cause remains) both with London society and her relationship with Cecil. The possible salvation inherent in the projected trip to Greece with the Miss Alans is marked by a return from Schumann to Mozart (65), which suggests a removal from Cecil and subsequent state of comparative equanimity. The recapitulation is not just a recollection of what has gone before; it involves a moving beyond. And sometimes that moving may be in a direction which misleads in order that a surprise, or at least a return to what was originally anticipated, may be effected in the

Coda. So it is in A Room with a View. When, through the efforts of Mr. Beebe, supported by Miss Bartlett, Mrs. Honeychurch has agreed to the trip, Lucy is discovered accompanying herself in a song (66). The words come from Chapter 3 of Scott's The Bride of Lammermoor where the like-named heroine is accompanying herself on the lute. Forster's method here is similar to his private usage of the Glück and Wagner references (67), except that the quotation of the actual words in this instance makes the symbolism more overt. Lucy Ashton, like Armide and Kundry (68), is a woman who ultimately loses her true love, and, in particular, through the intervention of others, and the words suggest that she will join the armies of the celibate, so approved of by Mr. Beebe. But the "soaring accompaniment" (69) is at odds with the words, anticipating the real rather than the suggested end (70).

This scene is the last in the novel where Forster employs music extensively, but its use persists till the end. In the midst of his attempt to extricate Lucy from her "muddle", old Mr. Emerson quotes from Samuel Butler:

" 'Life,' wrote a friend of mine, ' is a public performance on the violin, in which you learn the instrument as you go along.' " (71)

Lucy may be a pianist, but she has still much to learn on this new instrument, even though she has by now taken some hard lessons on it. As music has marked stages in her

development, so this new image suggests that the development will never be complete. And the stage that it has reached by the end of the novel is rounded off by a passage which has echoes right across the novel:

"Youth enwrapped them; the song of Phaethon announced passion requited, love attained. But they were conscious of a love more mysterious than this. The song died away, they heard the river, bearing down the snows of winter into the Mediterranean." (72)

It had been Phaethon who had driven Lucy on the fateful trip near Fiesole, Phaethon who had led her to George among the violets. His song symbolizes all that Lucy had once unconsciously felt was lacking in her life and sums up the major themes of the novel. Lucy has discovered something more essential to life than Art, represented both by her music and Cecil; she has discovered the joy and zest for living with its promise of Persephone's fertility, epitomized by Nature with George in the foreground. Summer Street has been invigorated by Italy and the view is thereby the more complete.

*** *** ***

NOTES to CHAPTER 2

- 1) Probably begun c. 1903. See, e.g., Trilling, p. 85.
- 2) J.B. Beer, The Achievement of E.M. Forster, Chatto and Windus, London, 1968.
- 3) Wilfred Stone, The Cave and the Mountain, A Study of E.M. Forster, Stanford University Press, California/Oxford University Press, London, 1969.
- 4) Alan Wilde, Art and Order, a Study of E.M. Forster, New York University/Peter Owen Ltd., London, 1965.
- 5) Lionel Trilling, E.M. Forster, The Hogarth Press, London, 1969.
- 6) Laurence Brander, E.M. Forster, A Critical Study, Rupert Davis, London, 1968.
- 7) RWV, Chapter 1, p. 9.
- 8) Ibid., p. 10.
- 9) Ibid., p. 11.
- 10) Ibid., p. 17.
- 11) Ibid., p. 11.
- 12) RWV, Chapter 3, p. 35.
- 13) This is both interesting and odd. "Adelaide" is, of course, a song. Was Mr. Beebe expecting her to accompany herself even though she was announced as "Piano", did he expect an arrangement (there is, for example, one by Liszt - item 442 in Alan Walker's catalogue), was he ignorant or forgetful, or is he, as Kettle suggests, representative of an age that, perhaps, distinguished less clearly than does the present, between an original and an arrangement? The March from "The Ruins of Athens" was very popular in piano transcriptions in Victorian and Edwardian drawing-rooms (witness the "Star Folios") but is none too easy. Why isn't, say, Für Elise", the Andante Favori, or one of the Rondos or other Bagatelles, which would be more in line with what might be more "suitable" for a young lady, used?
- 14) RWV, Chapter 3, p. 35.
- 15) See: "Some Notes on Forster and Music" in Aspects of E.M. Forster, Edward Arnold, London, 1969, p. 81.

- 16) See: K.W. Gransden, E.M. Forster, Writers and Critics Series, Oliver and Boyd, Edinburgh, 1970, Chapter 1, p. 2.
- 17) See Chapter 1 above.
- 18) RWV, Chapter 3, p. 34.
- 19) Ibid.
- 20) Ibid.
- 21) Ibid., p. 35.
- 22) Ibid.
- 23) Ibid., p. 36.
- 24) RWV, Chapter 4, p. 45.
- 25) RWV, Chapter 3, p. 44.
- 26) RWV, Chapter 4, p. 51.
- 27) RWV, Chapter 6.
- 28) RWV, Chapter 7, p. 80.
- 29) Ibid., pp. 82-3.
- 30) RWV, Chapter 8, p. 94.
- 31) Ibid., p. 95.
- 32) Ibid., p. 99.
- 33) See (23) above.
- 34) RWV, Chapter 8, p. 99.
- 35) Ibid., p. 95.
- 36) Ibid.
- 37) RWV, Chapter 10, p. 125.
- 38) Why does not Forster indicate which pieces she plays as he does with Beethoven? Is it that no single pieces sufficiently convey the emotions here expressed and that he therefore leaves the reader to supply whatever pieces fit, for him, the bill?

- 39) RWV, Chapter 11, p. 129. The Pocket Edition has "disjected" for "dejected" phrases.
- 40) See (2) above, Chapter 3, p. 60.
- 41) RWV, Chapter 11, p. 130.
- 42) RWV, Chapter 13, p. 144.
- 43) Ibid.
- 44) See note (7) above.
- 45) RWV, Chapter 13, p. 144.
- 46) RWV, Chapter 15, p. 163.
- 47) In his discussion of this passage, Beer is slightly inaccurate in that he states that at this point she "plays again for the Vyses" (Chapter 3, p. 60). In fact Cecil is the only Vyse present, the incident taking place at Windy Corner, the others being Mrs. Honeychurch, Freddy and Miss Bartlett. Nor is the full significance of choice revealed.
- 48) Are we asked to believe that Lucy played this music from memory after a single hearing? Probably not. It would take a first-rate musician to achieve such a feat, and Lucy is no Josef Hofmann.
- 49) RWV, Chapter 15, p. 165.
- 50) Ibid., p. 164.
- 51) See the interview with Furbank and Haskell reprinted in: E.M. Forster: A Passage to India, A Casebook, edited by Malcolm Bradbury, Macmillan & Co Ltd., London, 1970, p. 30.
- 52) From a pianistic point of view, Cecil's suggestion is even less suitable than the Gluck, which doesn't say much for his artistic sensibilities. Both pieces depend, to a large extent, for their effect on the orchestration.
- 53) RWV, Chapter 15, p. 166.
- 54) RWV, Chapter 7, p. 80. See (28) above.
- 55) The first episode occurs on p. 80, the second on p. 166.
- 56) RWV Chapter 15, p. 168.

- 57) RWV, Chapter 17, p. 183.
- 58) Ibid., p. 184.
- 59) See (3) above.
- 60) RWV, Chapter 18, p. 188. Of course, Mr. Beebe's theory about the psychology is no more tenable than it would be if it were applied to any other kind of practising artist, but it serves to underline the continuing turmoil in Lucy's mind.
- 61) RWV, Chapter 18, p. 190.
- 62) Ibid., p. 192.
- 63) Ibid., p. 195.
- 64) See (39) above.
- 65) RWV, Chapter 18, p. 195.
- 66) Ibid., p. 200. Beer lumps this episode together with her playing of Mozart and Schumann, thereby missing the significance of the individual parts.
- 67) See (47) et seq. above.
- 68) And, of course, like Lucia in Donizetti's Lucia di Lammermoor, the opera Forster uses for very different purposes in WAFI.
- 69) RWV, Chapter 18, p. 202.
- 70) The scene, also, once again, links music with painting for Lucy, Mrs. Honeychurch and Freddy are seen by Mr. Beebe as constituting a "Santa Conversazione", a thought which recalls the quality of emotional stability and sense of security in the Honeychurch family, that Cecil, in his dislike of the Summer Street society, had failed to recognize.
- 71) RWV, Chapter 19, p. 215.
- 72) RWV, Chapter 20, p. 223.

CHAPTER 3 : WHERE ANGELS FEAR TO TREAD

While the composition of WHERE ANGELS FEAR TO TREAD post-dates the Italian section of A Room with a View its publication (1905) ante-dates the complete version of that novel by some three years; and the use to which music is put in it, no doubt because a more extensive one would not suit Forster's plan here, largely only adumbrates techniques which were to be fully exploited in the later novel. This view receives immediate support from the fact that the principal commentators on Forster (1) ignore all the musical usages (as they do not with A Room with a View) with the exception of the Lucia di Lammermoor scene.

Yet, despite their comparative paucity and the lack of a consciously worked out musical symbolism, the usages are important in that they do indicate certain paths Forster was to follow, and, indeed, in that one instance not to follow again, at least to the same extent.

It has been seen how, in A Room with a View, Forster gave an unremarkable girl a remarkable ability that was to reappear throughout the novel and fluctuate in relation to certain stages in her development. No such outstanding ability is given to Lilia Theobald, whose main attributes appear to be her prettiness, her blowsy high spirits, her knack of being absurd in public, and - recurring theme that it is throughout the

novel - her vulgarity:

"Lilia had no resources. She did not like music, or reading or work." (2)

Had she possessed Lucy Honeychurch's ability she might have been in a better position to resist the descent into the depths occasioned by her marriage and its attendant circumstances. Yet she can play the piano, albeit very badly, and the one instance when she does play occurs in a scene whose structural positioning anticipates similar placings in A Room with a View.

The scene in question is the brief visit of Spiridione Tesi to the Carellas' house. (3) Its initial significance is in the light it throws on the characters involved. Lilia, who flourishes best in company, displays her hitherto unsuspected ability, and momentarily regains the enthusiasm of her earlier days, thus reminding the reader of the change that her marriage has wrought in her, and underlining the pathos of her current situation. Spiridione typifies qualities which throughout the novel appear as essentially Italian: ostentatiously (by English standards) good manners; extravagance (which would not appear so in the original language) of feeling and of expression; and a greater natural musicality. Gino shares the last gift, playing the guitar (4) on this one occasion, and singing (as he does on another crucial one). But the gathering is not as agreeable as it seems. It is significant that Gino remains apart from the other two - on the loggia (where Forster

often places him) - and the consequences of the scene are final. The prelude and postlude to it emphasize the Latin facility for that type of male companionship which excludes woman, even when she is (which Lilia is not) "simpatica". No real communication exists between this particular husband and wife. The scene itself, however, awakens in Gino the equally Latin distrust of other men with regard to their intentions towards women in general and wives in particular. Malice and satire may be lacking in his voice when he speaks to Spiridione, but Gino behaves with ruthless thoroughness as a result. There are no further visits.

Thus the scene's most important function is structural. The first section of the novel culminates in the death of Lilia at the end of Chapter 4, a chapter which contains the events of that final slide into death - Lilia's pathetic joining of Santa Deodato's, the desertion of her friends, the first frightening row, the infidelity of her husband, her solitary walk, the second row, her letters home, and her attempt to give Gino the son he so desired. The musical gathering, coming as it does at the end of Chapter 3, marks a momentary raising of the reader's hopes for Lilia, after her gradual but inevitable descent in Chapters 2 and 3, prior to their utter crushing in what follows. Without their subtlety of implication, in its special positioning the scene looks forward to, for instance, that at the Vyses' (5) and that at Windy Corner (6).

Of far greater importance is the scene involving the performance of Lucia di Lammermoor, with again, its prelude and postlude. (7) As Trilling says,

"The scene is a great one and carries the novel to the heights of comic bravura." (8)

Perhaps some of the scene's gusto springs from its being based on an actual performance given by Tetrizzini at San Gimignano at the beginning of the century (9). Certainly, both in stature and in dramatic technique (or lack of it), the "hot lady of the Apennines" resembles that famous lady. Be that as it may, a significant part of the humour arises from the performers off stage, in particular Harriet. In the course of the scene Harriet manages to exhibit almost every odious characteristic with which she eventually becomes associated throughout the novel, and to do so at an incredible speed. Philip's broaching the subject of the possible visit provokes:

" 'Mother wouldn't like it. It would be most unsuitable - almost irreverent. Besides all that, foreign theatres are notorious. Don't you remember those letters in the "Church Family Newspaper" ?' " (10)

Each utterance condemns; the first her subservience to the formidable Mrs. Herriton; the second her Sawstonian respect for what is superficially proper; the third her insular prejudice against what is foreign and therefore, probably, immoral. Further, when it is pointed out that the performance

is of an opera and based on classical Sir Walter Scott,

"Harriet's face grew resigned. 'Certainly one has so few opportunities of hearing music. It is sure to be very bad. But it might be better than sitting idle all the evening. We have no book, and I lost my crochet at Florence.' " (11)

Thus, in fewer than fifty words, are added her hypocrisy (for we learn later that "she did not care for music" (12)); her incurable pessimism; and her typically Victorian dislike of not doing something - presumably on the assumption that the Devil finds evil employment for idle hands. She caps this with an exhibition of snobbishness provided by her contemplation of having to sit with "the most awful people" (13).

All this before she even arrives, discomfited by guilt, at the opera. When she does arrive she excels herself. She shishes when the audience respond physically to the music (14) and exudes smug satisfaction when they comply (though, ironically, not for the reason she supposes) (15). When her success proves ephemeral, she resorts to carping comment. Her zenith is reached when she, of all people, is struck in the chest by a billet-doux-bearing bouquet:

" 'Call this classical?' she cried, rising from her seat. 'It's not even respectable! Philip! take me out at once.' " (16)

The performance provides a yardstick against which the protagonists' development can be measured and judged.

Throughout Harriet remains almost entirely intractable, inflexible, adamant. Not so Miss Abbott. It is she, in her new-found grace and lightness, who suggests the visit. Those qualities initially struggle against her Sawstonian conscience when Philip unthinkingly reminds her that the purpose of the journey is "to rescue a child" (17), but gradually those qualities win. Unlike Harriet, on their arrival she is pleasant and praises everything; she shows an unaccustomed concern for her appearance; she feels it is not their place to interfere with the Italians; and eventually, like them, is "swaying oddly" (18). The evening has a tremendous effect on her. Only once before has she felt so happy -

"a night in March, the night Gino and Lilia had told her of their love - the night whose evil she had come now to undo." (19)

This degree of happiness brings on feelings of guilt. The moment is one of epiphany for her and Forster marks it, as he does very rarely in this novel, by an extended musical usage:

"But the tunes would not go out of her head, and all night long she was troubled by torrents of music, and by applause and laughter, and angry young men who shouted the distich out of Baedeker:

'Poggibonizzi, fatti in là,
Che Monteriano si fa città!'

Poggibonzi was revealed to her as they sang - a joyless straggling place, full of people who pretended. When she woke up she knew that it had been Sawston." (20)

The echoes are intensified, for the Italian distich recalls the moment earlier in the chapter when Philip had been taken to Gino's house by the little girl in a state in which the real Italy had not yet fully claimed him, while the specific metaphor

"she was troubled by torrents of music"

suggests the only other moment where Forster uses such a metaphor in the novel - again a moment of epiphany - when Miss Abbott confesses her love for Gino to Philip, the love which may have begun

"when you took us to the theatre, and I saw him mixed up with music and light." (21)

It is Wilde who most fully points out the significance of the scene in Philip's development (22). He is clearly right when he says that Philip's early absorption of the various facets of Italy into "one aesthetic whole" (23) is partially disrupted first by his contemplation of having an Italian as a relative and second, and more painfully, by his learning that that relative is the son of a dentist. The scene, for Wilde, takes Philip as far as he can go in the transition from "viewer to doer" (24). Again this is valid. Philip displays a new-found tactful strength in his treatment of Harriet before the opera (25), and senses a new feeling in himself at the prospect of going (26). He recognizes and sympathizes with changes taking place in Miss Abbott, and opposes the attempts of

Harriet to turn the evening's entertainment into a prayer meeting (27). He ignores her request to "take (her) out at once" (28) and is "drunk with excitement" (29). The climax both of the scene and of Philip's transformation comes when he is hauled by Gino, up among his friends, into the box.

Forster's motto to Howards End - "Only connect . . ." - is perhaps what the scene is really about. Once Philip is inside the box he establishes contact, both spiritual and physical (the latter of a kind similar to that between Spiridione and Gino). Miss Abbott too has been touched. Harriet alone remains impervious. For Wilde again, the opera house is a place

"where people can relate to one another" (30), and, of course, it symbolizes the Italy beyond with its emphasis on life, on participation rather than observation, on having a thing bad rather than not having it at all, on vulgarity - epitomized in the hideous décor - when it represents genuine feeling rather than cold calculation. Indeed, it symbolizes opposition to all that is worst in Anglo-Saxon (31) upper middle class attitudes.

Important as it is, Philip's metamorphosis is incomplete for he remains one of those people who "are born not to do things" (32), even though "the access of joy that had come to him in the theatre promised to be permanent." (33) His suffering at Gino's hands and the ministrations of Miss Abbott bring him to love itself, but he lacks the animal qualities of

Gino which might have given him his heart's desire.

Philip, Forster has said, was modelled on E.J. Dent, Fellow of King's College, and later Professor of Music at Cambridge, who "knew this, and took an interest in his own progress." (34) But the resemblance seems to lie in facets of character rather than behaviour, for certainly his reorganization of the B.Mus. Degree at Cambridge, his research, his books, his Opera translations, his musical activities on the Continent, and his innumerable articles, reveal him to have been a "doer" rather than a "viewer". However, Philip also has much of Forster in him, as, on his own admission, do Rickie and Cecil (35), and it would be wrong to see him primarily as a picture of Dent.

It has been noted how, in A Room with a View images and symbols drawn from music and painting often go hand in hand. Just as there are fewer important musical usages in Where Angels Fear to Tread so similarly are there fewer drawn from Art. The most significant of these is, perhaps, the association of Philip with Santa Deodata whose unbelievable passivity and inactivity extend (suggestively) to ignoring her prostrated mother. A second is Philip's seeing Miss Abbott, the baby and Gino as "the Virgin and Child, with Donor." (36) But, with the images drawn from Classical Mythology and even (probably the most extensive category in the novel) those concerned with views, they do not achieve the importance of the Lucia di Lammermoor scene, whose implications are not yet exhausted.

The placing of Spiridione's visit was vital; that of the opera performance is even more so. Everything in the second section of the novel (from the opening of Chapter 5) has slowly, but acceleratingly, been building up to the occasion when the baby finally is to be obtained. At the very moment when Philip seems on the point of getting it, he finds Gino out, and the anticipated confrontation is temporarily delayed. Instead comes the opera. The effect is bathetic in one way, climactic in another. It is the comic peak matched later, as Trilling points out (37), by the stark horror of Gino's torturing Philip after the death of the baby. It finally changes Philip's mood and directly leads to Miss Abbott forestalling him. Thence her change of attitude, Harriet's intervention and the crowning tragedy. The connection between these scenes of ultimate joy and horror is pointed by Forster by having, as Philip waits helplessly in the rain-darkened hotel for news of Harriet,

"the scraps of Donizetti (floating) tunelessly out of the wineshops" (38)

to prelude the diaster.

Why does Forster choose particularly Lucia di Lammermoor for this vital scene and not some other opera? There is undoubtedly more than superficial significance in his choice of Glück's Armide and Wagner's Parsifal in A Room with a View. Here it may be no more than that Lucia was what Tetrizzini sang and he kept to it. There is, however, a parallel

between the melodramatic qualities of Donizett's opera and certain elements in Where Angels Fear to Tread. Moreover, the fact that it is a story of the north transmuted in a southern clime also makes it appropriate.

One final instance of Forster's musical usage in this novel remains to be considered (39). It occurs in the scene where Miss Abbott first watches Gino and the baby unseen, and then helps in the bathing. As she waits,

"The voice of her adversary was heard at last, singing fearlessly from his expanded lungs, like a professional. Herein he differed from Englishmen, who always have a little feeling against music, and sing only from the throat, apologetically." (40)

The observation is in itself a remarkably perceptive one, but its first function is obviously an intensification of the antitheses propounded throughout. It emphasizes Gino's animality, zest for life, masculinity, and positiveness, as opposed to, say, Philip's aestheticism, indolence, suppressed homosexuality, and passivity. By extension it symbolizes the clash of the two civilizations, Italian and English. However, the singing takes on deeper shades of meaning when Gino states:

"No one may sing to (the baby) but I." (41)

It relates then to what has been called the "continuance theme" in Forster (42). Gino's desire for a son is the overwhelming passion in his life to which, by comparison, sex and marriage are

naught. The bond of father to son is intimate and unbelievably strong; the singing underlines this bond and indicates how futile are the efforts of Mrs. Herriton and her myrmidons to destroy it. Death alone can succeed, and succeed it does.

A case has been tentatively made out for the total structure of A Room with a View bearing some resemblance to Sonata-form. Since, in other ways, Where Angels Fear to Tread anticipates, in its musical usages, the final version of that novel, it is worth considering whether there may be any similar structural fore-shadowings. The paucity of usages precludes any scheme as detailed and elaborate. Nevertheless it is interesting that Where Angels Fear to Tread has in common with its fellow the "double-bar line" (the death of Lilia) marking the end of the exposition (Chapter 1 England, Chapters=2-4 Italy), with a return to England (Chapter 5) thereafter before the development and coda in Italy (Chapters 6-10) - a section which is, as one would expect in the classical period, relatively longer. However, Where Angels Fear to Tread has no final scene in England, as would be necessary to make the novel tripartite like Sonata-form (though it could be argued that the final scene on the train, relating as it does to the first, rounds the novel off in a similar way). If any musical parallel is to be drawn (and it cannot be emphasized too strongly that such a parallel is somewhat tenuous) it is with eighteenth century binary form rather than with Sonata-form. And any such suggestion can gain credence only from Forster's known interest in musical procedures.

NOTES to CHAPTER 3

- 1) Beer, Stone, Wilde, Trilling, Brander.
- 2) WAFT, Chapter 4, p. 52.
- 3) Ibid., Chapter 3, pp. 48-9.
- 4) Piano and guitar seem, too, to be instruments which typify the two opposing societies.
- 5) RWV, Chapter 11.
- 6) RWV, Chapter 15 and, again, Chapter 18.
- 7) WAFT, Chapter 6, pp. 99-108.
- 8) Op. cit., Chapter 4, p. 60.
- 9) See Stone, op. cit., Chapter 7, p. 171 (footnote). See also: "My First Opera", Opera, June 1963, Vol. 14, p. 374.
- 10) WAFT, Chapter 6, p. 101.
- 11) Ibid. Forster remarks on the divergencies of the plots of Donizetti's opera and Scott's novel in "George Crabbe and Peter Grimes", TC, p. 189.
- 12) Ibid., p. 103.
- 13) Ibid., p. 102.
- 14) This looks forward to the characters' varied responses to Beethoven's Fifth Symphony in HE (Chapter 5).
- 15) WAFT, Chapter 6, pp. 103-4.
- 16) Ibid., p. 105.
- 17) Ibid., p. 99.
- 18) Ibid., p. 105.
- 19) Ibid., p. 108.
- 20) Ibid.
- 21) Ibid., Chapter 10, p. 159.

- 22) Op. cit., Chapter 2, pp. 22-3.
- 23) WAFT, Chapter 5, p. 61.
- 24) Op. cit., Chapter 2, p. 22.
- 25) WAFT, Chapter 6, p. 101.
- 26) Ibid., p. 102.
- 27) Ibid., p. 104.
- 28) Ibid., p. 105.
- 29) Ibid., p. 106.
- 30) Op. cit., Chapter 2, p. 22.
- 31) Nor does the Germanic escape.
- 32) WAFT, Chapter 8, p. 131.
- 33) Ibid., p. 126.
- 34) See: P.N. Furbank and F.J. Haskell in "E.M.Forster", Writers at Work, ed. Malcolm Cowley, The Viking Press, New York, 1958, p. 37.
- 35) See: Forster in the same interview, Stone, p. 176 onwards and Wilde, p. 24.
- 36) WAFT, Chapter 7, p. 122.
- 37) Op. cit., Chapter 4, p. 64.
- 38) WAFT, Chapter 8, p. 137.
- 39) Passing reference is made to it in the comments on Spiridione's visit. It is possible too that the coon song (Chapter 7, p. 109) lying on the piano is a pathetic relic and reminder of that visit.
- 40) WAFT, Chapter 7, p. 110.
- 41) Ibid., p. 118.
- 42) See, for example, I.A. Richards "A Passage to E.M. Forster: Reflections on a Novelist", Forum, LXXVIII, December, 1927, pp. 914-20, to which Wilde draws attention.

CHAPTER 4 : THE LONGEST JOURNEY

THE LONGEST JOURNEY (1907) is, by general consent, the least successful of Forster's novels as a whole, yet it was for him "the one I am most glad to have written." (1) The second of the novels to be published, but, in the main, the third in its conception and execution, it marks a considerable advance on, and in certain respects, a departure from what Forster had so far attempted, and there are, interestingly, corresponding developments in the uses to which music is put.

When these uses are compared to those in the earlier novels, two significant factors immediately emerge. There is no example of a single, sustained musical symbol, as occurs with Lucy Honeychurch's piano-playing in A Room with a View; and there is no scene based wholly on a musical event such as that involving the performance of Lucia di Lammermoor in Where Angels Fear to Tread. The musical uses in The Longest Journey are less immediately striking, yet, on close examination, clearly more numerous, more varied, and more subtly pervasive than those in the two "Italian" novels. They tend, moreover, to fall into certain well-defined groups, but, as one would expect with a novelist of Forster's complexity, the individual groups do not possess strictly individualised functions.

Like Jane Austen before him, Forster, in both A Room

with a View and Where Angels Fear to Tread, uses response or attitude to music as a yardstick against which characters can (as far as he allows such a black-and-white distinction) be measured as sheep or goats. Thus Gerald Dawes, when told by Rickie that A.P. Carruthers is secretary to the college musical society in addition to being a soccer blue seems "offended" and changes the subject (2). Obviously to him music is for milk-sops, and the view that a man can enjoy both music and football quite untenable. Agnes, who, despite Angus Wilson's sympathy for her (3), is clearly a goat, only gets as far as mentioning the anthem she heard in Salisbury Cathedral (4) and, presumably, she tolerates, not to say enjoys, the musical travesties (of which more later) perpetrated via Herbert at Dunwood House. Mr. Failing, however, we are told "loved poetry and music" (5), while Rickie sings (6) (albeit, probably, in the English rather than the Italian style, so nicely differentiated in Where Angels Fear to Tread), loves music (7), and uses this love to try to establish contact with the unfortunate Varden (8). Ansell, perhaps because to confess a love of music would be to admit to too much heart amongst head, apparently despises music, though he is obviously well enough informed to be able to make fun of Rickie's enthusiasm for it (9).

Significantly, too, music, though of a very different kind, has an integral part in the character of Stephen Wonham. The farthest he goes towards admitting a liking for it is to

confess, in reply to Mrs. Failing's attempts to clothe him in the romance of the Pastoral, that "Chaps sing to themselves at times" (10), but sing he does (usually in the privacy of his own room in the pediment of Cadover) (11), and on one particular occasion, according to Mrs. Failing, entertains her continuously from eight to eleven with "Father's boots will not fit Willie" (12). It is an attribute he shares with Gino, as is his playing (though Stephen's instrument is the typically English ocharoon (13) rather than Gino's typically Latin guitar) and, as with Gino, it is one which underlines his essential connection with the soil whence spring fertility and continuance. There is surely something symbolic, therefore, in Rickie's refusal to get "thundering tight" with him and "then sing." (14) In addition, two songs, in which Stephen does not participate, reveal a further complexity. The soldier's "Sorcy Mr. and Mrs. Tackleton" (15) forms part of the process which his individual version of "Sally in Our Alley" continues, of establishing that Stephen "is not to be distinguished from a hero" (16).

That Forster insists on Stephen's heroic qualities (17) reminds the reader that he at one time envisaged calling him Siegfried (18). Here, therefore, is a far more direct equation than that involved in the Glück and Wagner references in A Room with a View. But, though more fully developed, the parallels are again neither exhaustively carried through nor,

indeed, always present. Certain resemblances between Stephen and his Wagnerian forebear are at once apparent. He is the outcome of an illicit (though not incestuous) relationship; he is the foster-child of one with whom he feels little sympathy (though Mrs. Failing is hardly Mime); he is close to nature (as Siegfried is after drinking Fafner's blood). But it is as a figure in whom hope for a solution to an insoluble problem (as Siegfried is for Wotan), and for the future of the almost helpless Rickie, is invested that Stephen most resembles Siegfried. Despite the great importance in general of Ansell's relationship to Rickie and in particular of his crucial denunciation at Dunwood House, Forster is at pains to point out that "He was not a hero" (19), while Rickie achieves only temporary heroic status in his dealing with Stephen after the latter's drunken assault on Dunwood House, a status lost immediately Stephen perceives the true motive behind Rickie's actions and tears up their mother's photograph (20). It is Stephen alone who has the strength of mind and body to remove Rickie from his stultifying environment and bring him where his creativity can again flourish. Yet Stephen possesses characteristics which seem scarcely heroic - his quarrelsomeness, his obduracy, his stealing, his lack of concern for the feelings of others - and which appear at least to suit him more to Mrs. Failing's definition of a hero than Agnes' (21); and his image as a hero seems finally to be shattered when he breaks his promise to Rickie and gets drunk (22). But all his weaknesses are over-

shadowed by his intrinsic incorruptibility, his strength, and above all his virility which awakens Agnes' sexuality and wrath (23) and ensures the continuation of his line while Rickie's dies out (24). In this Stephen has more success than Siegfried, in whose death the fate of the gods is sealed, for he perpetuates life in his child and Rickie's memory in the published stories, while the curse of the Elliots lies buried for ever.

The Stephen-Siegfried equation is the most important in a short series of Wagnerian references, of both a musical and literary nature, throughout the book, which extend even to Mrs. Lewin's parrot being called Parsival. The first in the series occurs in the opening chapter when Anderson

"had crawled to the piano and was timidly trying the Prelude to Rheingold with his knee upon the soft pedal." (25)

Initially this contributes (26), with the tobacco, tea, and buttered buns, to the creation of the pleasant atmosphere in Rickie's Cambridge room, the unchanging E flat harmony (27) providing a sense of continuance and stability redolent of that suggested by the music from Armide in A Room with a View. Later, when Rickie goes to Ansell's room to upbraid him for his behaviour towards the Pembrokes, he specifically mentions (in association with the, for him, beautiful earlier entry of Agnes) the moment when

the Rhinemaidens sing "Rheingold! Rheingold!".

It looks as if he is going to suggest that the special change in the harmony (the momentary modulation into C minor) occurred at a most appropriate juncture to show Agnes' specialness. Here is irony indeed, for this harmony is associated with the curse that falls upon the gold and the implication would be that Agnes is the curse that is eventually to fall upon Rickie - though neither Wagner's nor Forster's audience would be aware of this at so early a stage. In the event the modulation is not mentioned, for Rickie's

"the music, which up to then has so often been in E flat -" is interrupted by Ansell's "Goes into D sharp." (28)

As such a modulation, if it existed, would constitute only an enharmonic change (and the suggested key is, anyway, an outrageous one), Ansell's statement at first seems to be a reply in kind to Rickie's earlier ones accompanied by his slamming Ansell on the head with a sofa-cushion. But it takes on a subtler significance in the light of Ansell's comments towards the end of the chapter: for him Agnes is one of those phenomena

"which are the subjective product of a diseased imagination and which, to our destruction, we invest with the semblance of reality" (29).

Agnes is illusory; thus so is the modulation.

The next two Wagnerian references again involve Rickie, Agnes and Ansell. They occur in the second and third of the "seven letters written in June" (30) after Rickie's announce-

ment that he is going to marry Agnes, and Ansell's following reaction, expressed to Tilliard, that he can

"foresee the most appalling catastrophe." (31)

In the first of the seven Ansell gives most cogent reasons why Rickie should not marry. Rickie replies that he is in love and that Ansell should try to

"understand Beatrice, and Clara Middleton, and Brunhilde in the first scene of Götterdämmerung." (32)

As with the Rheingold reference, irony is present. Rickie chooses Brunnhilde (33) as one of the symbols of womanly devotion - which indeed she is. But in the scene which he cites, Brunnhilde urges Siegfried to go forth and perform the great deeds which will be his fulfilment; though Rickie believes that Agnes wants him to have

"Friends, and work, and spiritual freedom" (34),

these are just the things which she denies him.

In reply Ansell asks if he should recommend Rickie to

"understand Xanthippe and Mrs. Bennet, and Elsa in the question scene of Lohengrin"

(a suggestion Ansell discards as he intends not to be literary on this occasion). The reference to Elsa is, of course, intended as an antithesis to the Brunnhilde one, for Elsa (though it is because she is worked upon by the sorceress, Ortrud) does not possess Brunnhilde's complete trust in her lover, and by her

questioning destroys their relationship. Even this has its irony, for Elsa is intrinsically good - far more so than Agnes, though it is true that Agnes' behaviour is to some extent conditioned by external circumstances.

The last (35) of these allusions appears almost at the end of the Cambridge section of the novel where, after the shattering experience of learning, and mistakenly interpreting, his relationship with Stephen, Rickie discusses with Agnes his stories and his failure to get them published. She advises him to "Try an out-and-out love story" (36).

"My notion just now,' he replied, 'is to leave the passions on the fringe.' She nodded, and tapped for the waiter: they had met in a London restaurant. 'I can't soar; I can only indicate. That's where the musicians have the pull, for music has wings, and when she says 'Tristan' and he says 'Isolde', you are on the heights at once. What do people mean when they call love music artificial?'

'I know what they mean, though I can't exactly explain. Or couldn't you make your stories more obvious? I don't see any harm in that. Uncle Willie floundered hopelessly. He doesn't read much, and he got muddled. I had to explain and then he was delighted. Of course, to write down to the public would be quite another thing and horrible. You can have certain ideas, and you must express them. But couldn't you express them more clearly?'

'You see -' He got no further than 'you see.'

'The soul and the body. The soul's what matters,' said Agnes and tapped for the waiter again." (37)

That a Wagner reference should occur at this point tends to remind the reader of the exchange of letters just recorded, where Agnes' essential unfitness for Rickie is insisted upon. Here comes a most significant proof, placed as it is before Rickie's final descent in Sawston. Her reply to Rickie's question, "What do people mean when they call love music artificial?" shows not her inability to explain, but her complete incomprehension of the issues involved. And as with the Brunnhilde and Elsa allusions irony is present, for no relationship is more passionate than Tristan and Isolde's and none less so than Rickie and Agnes'. Agnes has had her moment of passion with Gerald, and perhaps Rickie is incapable of feeling passion, at least for a woman. Certainly his greatest moments of emotion come with Ansell and Stephen. Perhaps too this is in part why he, like Forster, "can only indicate" and not "soar". But the passage raises too the almost insuperable problem of expressing emotions in words, which tend to constrict, a problem which for many, including Forster, music, because it seems capable of expanding limitlessly, is able to surmount.

An interesting development in The Longest Journey is Forster's use of music as a weapon of satire. It is natural that any public school worthy of the name and of hate should have its own school anthem. Sawston is no exception and boasts one "recently composed by the organist." (38) Forster, in a delightful phrase, reveals that "Words and tune were

still a matter for taste" (39), and anyone with the least experience of teaching boys to sing can imagine the simultaneous variants in both, intentional and unintentional. Moreover, there is a suggestion that "taste" has a wider significance, especially as the anthem contains the fatuous and grammatically tortuous words,

"Perish each laggard! Let it not be said
That Sawston such within her walls hath bred."

and ends with "harmonies in the style of Richard Strauss" (40). The episode involving its singing reveals (as do many more incidents of a non-musical nature), the pettiness of the school and most of its staff (the boys are not allowed an edition with music and, of course, anyone, like Lloyd, who does not learn the anthem is an outsider (41)) and the hypocrisy of Herbert who can deny setting "one section of the school against another" (42) yet likens Dunwood House's performance to that of day-boys. Rickie sees it all, yet tolerates it, and the rot begins to set in.

The satire on Sawston's music assumes an extra dimension when Ansell arrives to "assure himself of his friend's grave" (43). As he reads the Essays of Anthony Eustace Failing in the garden of Dunwood House

"the sound of a manly hymn, taken very fast, floated
over the road from the school chapel." (44)

The manliness and speed of the hymn, of course, continue to typify

the idiocies of Sawston, but juxtaposed as they are against both Ansell and the Essays they become a symbol of what Ansell must fight against. A hymn "swings off" with the usual false line division (45) (probably occasioned by over-emphasized musical stress, breathlessness, and thoughtlessness) after Ansell's encounter with Stephen and the lobelias; its end marking the speed with which "their intimacy (had) grown" (46), and imparting to the reader a sense of urgency that these two should join forces against such philistinism. A similar sense of urgency is felt by Ansell when he hears the organist "prancing through the voluntary" (47), and it drives him at once to learn more of his new companion, the knowledge of whose history leads to the glorious denunciation which provides the climax to the Sawston section of the novel. And that denunciation is delivered by Ansell standing next to the harmonium over which the Union Jack is spread and to which the evening hymns are sung. Again the juxtaposition of symbols is important, but so is the echo (as is, somewhat similarly, Freddy's kicking of Lucy's piano in A Room with a View), for the moment recalls Rickie's angry retort to Mrs. Failing that

"organized religion will not be wrecked by a harmonium and a dull sermon." (48)

At Sawston religion has been trivialised and debased by what the harmonium and Herbert's harangues stand for, and Rickie has undergone a parallel degradation.

A similar but less significant instance of Forster using an instrument as a prompt to recall occurs with the harp which hangs in Ansell's bedroom at home. With its luminous paint and exhortation to "Watch and pray" it symbolizes for Rickie on his first visit, as do the new shop sign and innumerable crayons, the "complete absence of taste" (49) which binds Ansell to his family in a way that Rickie is not bound to the Silts. The harp reappears during Maud Ansell's conversation with Rickie and Agnes at the Army and Navy Stores -

" 'the second spare room, which we call the "harp room" on account of a harp that hangs on the wall, is always reserved for Stewart's friends' " (50) -

to point the separation that Agnes has tried to effect between Rickie and all he really desires, at a moment when non-communication between husband and wife is growing fast. Agnes' letters from Cadover have "told him nothing" (51) and in particular Rickie wishes to conceal "the feeling of pleasure" (52) that his talk to Widdrington has given him. Amidst the veiled hostility it comes as a reminder of happier days and happier relationships before Rickie is further disgusted by Agnes' inquiry into how the drapery departments compare.

An instrument also extends into the imagery of the novel. When Agnes appears to Rickie to take him seriously over his short story writing and advises him to "plunge",

"it thrilled him like a trumpet-blast" (53),

and he is led directly to his encounter with her in the dell. The image in itself is not particularly original yet manages to convey vividly the sharpness and suddenness of his feeling. "No flourish of trumpets" (54), however, will, in the view of Mr. Failing, accompany the approach of Swinburne's Beloved Republic, for it "will not be brought about by love alone" and the use of the same instrument at this point perhaps invites a comparison between the relationships of Agnes and Rickie, which seems to begin so well, but decays, and that of Mrs. Elliot and Robert which is so much more real, but which dies suddenly, so that she is forced to compromise.

More important is Forster's use of the church bell, superficially petty and ludicrous, which "pangs" ominously in fact in the background as Rickie, Agnes and Mrs. Failing explore the Rings (55); for it underlines the unease in the situation following Rickie's quarrel with Mrs. Failing and Agnes' attempts to patch it up, and it precludes Mrs. Failing's partial disclosure regarding Stephen. Moreover,

"her fancy compared Rickie to the cracked church bell sending forth its message of 'Pang! pang!' to the countryside, and Stephen to the young pagans who were said to lie under this field guarding their pagan gold." (56)

This image is echoed in the penultimate chapter of the novel when she writes to Mrs. Lewin of how she and Agnes buried him

"to the sound of our cracked bell" (57);

it is an image singularly fitting in its sense of sadness and finality.

Of a like sadness is an image which in its more frequent occurrence anticipates Forster's use of the "goblins" of Beethoven's 5th Symphony in Howards End. This is the image of "beating time." It appears first at Sawston in a moment of blinding realization for Rickie that "there isn't any future" (58). Agnes' legacy-hunting, Varden, the lie over Stephen all weigh unbearably upon him. Everything seems futile, but Agnes, knowing

"that her marriage was a failure" and prevented by "spiritual apathy" from ever leaving Rickie, can continue her life "cheerfully beating time" (59).

Mrs. Elliot hopes to do it till she dies after Robert's death induces her to return to her husband, but she discovers that

"there is no such thing" and "as the years passed she realized her terrible mistake." (60)

Again an image invites a comparison of relationships. Ansell and Stephen - and of course Forster - believe that "our earth (is) not a place to beat time on" (61), which is why they try to rescue him from his spiritual imprisonment. Mrs. Failing, like Agnes, would have him continue therein.

In lighter vein is the image Forster uses to mock the exhortations to the scholars of Dunwood House

"to be patriotic, athletic, learned, and religious, that flowed like a four-part fugue from Mr. Pembroke's mouth." (62)

Even Herbert with his oratorical skill would have been incapable of saying four things at once, but the simile admirably suggests the way in which the themes must have entered, returned, re-appeared in different forms, and combined in the course of the speech. And a parallel, though simpler, image occurs when Stephen, endeavouring to borrow the trap from the boy at Salisbury, has his words echoed "in canon" by the country-bumpkin bystander (63). However, Forster uses the fugal image to serious effect for, as Rickie, ceasing to allow himself to throb

"to the music of Virgil" (64), finds it difficult to "speak in a deeper key" (65)

to Agnes, it returns with Rickie after the holidays to mark his continued and mounting deterioration:

"The music of the four-part fugue entered into him more deeply, and he began to hum its little phrases." (66)

Again in lighter vein but with serious intent is Mrs. Failing's likening of her farm to

"a Gilbert and Sullivan opera, with a chorus of agitated employers." (67)

The picture is an amusing one and the wit in keeping with that lady's character. But it underlines her superficiality and triviality, her lack of Ansell's essential formula for people:

"They must be serious, they must be truthful." (68)

It is probable that the metaphorical use, serious or otherwise, of "harmony" had already in Forster's time entered the "dead" category later so impugned by Orwell. (69) Yet in his hands it seems to take on a new life. When

"metaphysics, commerce, social aspirations" all live together in "harmony" (70),

more when Mrs. Failing feels that a revival of the scandal would

"disturb the harmony of Cadover" (71)

and most of all when Agnes "wrote like the Sibyl" and

"her sorrowful face moved over the stars and shattered their harmonies" (72)

the reader senses that Forster is using the image with full cognisance of its implications and ramifications.

However, the most famous, not to say notorious, example of musical imagery in The Longest Journey occurs at the moment when Rickie, returning for his sandwiches, inadvertently witnesses the embrace of Gerald and Agnes:

"He thought, 'Do such things actually happen?' and he seemed to be looking down coloured valleys. Brighter they glowed, till gods of pure flame were born in them, and then he was looking at pinnacles of virgin snow. While Mr. Pembroke talked, the riot of fair images increased. They invaded his being and lit lamps at unsuspected shrines. Their orchestra commenced in that

suburban house, where he had to stand aside for the maid to carry in the luncheon. Music flowed past him like a river. He stood at the springs of creation and heard the primeval monotony. Then an obscure instrument gave out a little phrase. The river continued unheeding. The phrase was repeated, and a listener might know it was a fragment of the Tune of tunes. Nobler instruments accepted it, the clarinet protected, the brass encouraged, and it rose to the surface to the whisper of violins. In full unison was Love born, flame of the flame, flushing the dark river beneath him and the virgin snows above. His wings were infinite, his youth eternal; the sun was a jewel on his finger as he passed it in benediction over the world. Creation, no longer monotonous, acclaimed him, in widening melody, in brighter radiances. Was Love a column of fire? Was he a torrent of song? Was he greater than either - the touch of a man on a woman?

It was the merest accident that Rickie had not been disgusted. But this he could not know." (73)

This is a passage of considerable complexity which has attracted some very perceptive comment, notably from Harvey (74), Beer (75), and Stone (76). Its style is certainly somewhat disconcerting, suggesting to Harvey a purple passage more appropriate to a woman's weekly magazine, and providing for Stone

"a riot of color and music, which mounts to an orchestral triumph almost embarrassing in its excess",

though Beer finds in it

"a certain Wagnerian magnificence".

What strikes the reader first is the way that the

strictly musical images are mingled with others drawn from a scenic vision possessed of an almost apocalyptic grandeur (77), and which include allusions to water, flame, and the heavens so important elsewhere in the novel (78); then, perhaps, the way in which the vision is counterpointed by the intrusions of reality. Most impressive is the gradual overwhelming expansion of both vision and sound, the growth of "little phrases" to "widening melody" suggesting Sibelius' symphonic technique, and recalling to the reader Forster's own later comments on Proust's use of the "'little phrase' in the music of Vinteuil" for what he calls "rhythm" (79).

The moment is obviously one of supreme importance to Rickie. For the first time he recognizes the transfiguring power of physical love, but his attitude to the scene is sexually ambiguous as Forster's brief final comment clearly shows. Though Rickie hates Gerald as a person, he admires his physicality, and his subsequent exhortations to Agnes to "mind" his death looks at times suspiciously like identification with her. Stone sees in the passage

"Rickie's creator (recognizing) this explosion of fair images to be the defensive show of one in panic fear about his own potency"

and indeed the birth of Rickie's daughter is one of the more unlikely episodes in the novel. Yet Rickie is apparently able to transfigure by his own imagination a girl who herself has

little or none -

"He found her in poetry and music and in the sunset
But one night he dreamt that she lay in his arms. This
displeased him" (80) -

but it is the transfiguration rather than the reality that he
loves.

It can thus be seen that the use of music in The Longest Journey presents not so much a continuation and expansion of techniques that Forster had already used (though these can certainly be seen in, for instance, the measurement of character by response to, and in satire based on taste in, music) as a tentative development along new lines, particularly in the nature and pervasiveness of the Wagnerian references, and the extension of musical imagery in an attempt to express the inexpressible (though here again the symbols of the cow and its attendant square and circle, and, especially, Orion are even more important in this respect.) Above all The Longest Journey marks a return to the basically triadic structure of A Room with a View, but now the sections are clearly designated. In Aspects of the Novel Forster eventually envisages a second kind of rhythm in the novel akin in effect to that of "the Fifth Symphony as a whole" (81) and both he (82) and Dickinson (83) saw this work as being in three, and not four, movements. This makes it quite probable that Forster was striving, as Beer suggests (84) to achieve a similar effect in his own writing.

The plan does not, however, succeed to the extent it does when he returns to its use in A Passage to India. For his next novel his musical scheme is quite different.

*** *** ***

NOTES to CHAPTER 4

- 1) "Aspects of a Novel", The Bookseller (September 10th, 1960), p. 1230, and Forster's own Introduction to the World's Classics edition of the novel, opening sentence. Maurice, both because of its later appearance (1971) and unusual subject-matter is often omitted from critical consideration.
- 2) LJ, Chapter 3, p. 41.
- 3) Encounter, November, 1957, p. 56.
- 4) LJ, Chapter 24, p. 198.
- 5) LJ, Chapter 19, p. 177.
- 6) LJ, Chapter 1, p. 21.
- 7) Ibid., p. 22, for instance.
- 8) LJ, Chapter 22, p. 190.
- 9) LJ, Chapter 1, p. 22.
- 10) LJ, Chapter 10, p. 93.
- 11) LJ, Chapter 12, p. 124.
- 12) LJ, Chapter 11, p. 109.
- 13) LJ, Chapter 12, p. 124.
- 14) LJ, Chapter 33, p. 263.
- 15) LJ, Chapter 12, p. 120.
- 16) Ibid., p. 121.
- 17) See, for instance, LJ, pp. 108, 122, 253, 255, 280.
- 18) See, for instance, Stone, op. cit., Chapter 8, p. 210, and Wilde, op. cit., Chapter 2, p. 44.
- 19) LJ, Chapter 20, p. 180. Of special significance in this respect is his inability to cope with the announcement of Agnes' pregnancy.
- 20) LJ, Chapter 31, p. 255. Rickie's saving of Stephen's life is couched too in the most unheroic terms.

- 21) LJ, Chapter 11, pp. 108-9.
- 22) LJ, Chapter 34.
- 23) LJ, Chapter 31, p. 255.
- 24) Ibid., p. 250.
- 25) LJ, Chapter 1, p. 9.
- 26) As do "the costly hymn-tune", "the note of St. Mary", and "the familiar mistakes (Forster himself?) in a Beethoven Sonata". (LJ, Chapter 6, p. 63.)
- 27) 136 bars of it.
- 28) LJ, Chapter 1, p. 22.
- 29) Ibid.
- 30) LJ, Chapter 9, p. 86.
- 31) LJ, Chapter 8, p. 82, and p. 86 respectively.
- 32) LJ, Chapter 9, p. 87.
- 33) Forster uses the spelling "Brunhilde", which is odd, seeing that he writes "Götterdämmerung".
- 34) LJ, Chapter 9, p. 87.
- 35) It is possible that there is a Wagnerian allusion in the mention of Erda (LJ, Chapter 13, p. 135), in Rickie's conversation with Mrs. Failing at the Rings, who, he suggests, may have been the deity worshipped there. Far more usual forms of the name are "Nerthus" and "Hertha". "Erda" is the form used in The Ring of the Nibelungs. And at the end of Chapter 16 (p. 157) Rickie is spoken of as hoping that "his eyes (would) recapture the Holy Grail."
- 36) LJ, Chapter 15, p. 147.
- 37) Ibid.
- 38) LJ, Chapter 17, p. 162.
- 39) Ibid.
- 40) Ibid.

- 41) Ibid., p. 172.
- 42) Ibid., p. 163.
- 43) LJ, Chapter 26, p. 210.
- 44) Ibid.
- 45) "Fight the good. Fight with. All thy. Might." LJ, Chapter 26, p. 214.
- 46) Ibid., p. 216
- 47) Ibid.
- 48) LJ, Chapter 13, p. 130.
- 49) LJ, Chapter 3, p. 36.
- 50) LJ, Chapter 24, pp. 199-200.
- 51) Ibid., p. 198.
- 52) Ibid., p. 199.
- 53) LJ, Chapter 7, p. 78.
- 54) LJ, Chapter 29, p. 238.
- 55) LJ, Chapter 13, pp. 134-5.
- 56) Ibid., p. 134.
- 57) LJ, Chapter 35, p. 281.
- 58) LJ, Chapter 23, p. 194.
- 59) LJ, Chapter 24, p. 202.
- 60) LJ, Chapter 29, p. 239.
- 61) LJ, Chapter 33, p. 266.
- 62) LJ, Chapter 17, p. 161.
- 63) LJ, Chapter 33, p. 268.
- 64) LJ, Chapter 17, p. 169.
- 65) LJ, Chapter 18, p. 171.
- 66) LJ, Chapter 19, p. 180.
- 67) LJ, Chapter 10, p. 92.

- 68) LJ, Chapter 33, p. 266.
- 69) "Politics and the English Language", in Inside the Whale and other Essays, Penguin Books Limited, 1957, pp.145-6.
- 70) LJ, Chapter 33, p. 261.
- 71) LJ, Chapter 14, p. 140.
- 72) LJ, Chapter 6, p. 64.
- 73) LJ, Chapter 3, p. 45.
- 74) W.J. Harvey, "Imagination and Moral Theme in E.M. Forster's 'The Longest Journey'", Essays in Criticism, 1956, VI, p. 431.
- 75) Op. cit., Chapter 4, pp. 86-8.
- 76) Op. cit., Chapter 8, pp. 200-203.
- 77) No wonder Beer is reminded of Blake.
- 78) As, for instance, Stephen's burning of the paper flower on the stream (LJ, Chapter 33, pp. 271-2), and the numerous references to Orion.
- 79) AN, Chapter 8, p. 166.
- 80) LJ, Chapter 7, p. 71.
- 81) AN, Chapter 8, p. 166.
- 82) Ibid., p. 169.
- 83) Goldsworthy Lowes Dickinson: "Noise that you pay for", The Independent Review, August 1904, pp. 377-390.
- 84) Beer, op. cit., Chapter 8, p. 202.

CHAPTER 5 : HOWARDS END

Of all Forster's novels HOWARDS END (1910) has attracted the most divergent critical opinions. For *Kettle* it is "the least satisfactory of the five novels" (1), while for *Trilling* it "is undoubtedly Forster's masterpiece." (2) For most readers, however, it is probably the first novel to spring to mind when the subject of music is raised, since it contains what Britten has called "the musical locus classicus" (3) - the performance of Beethoven's 5th Symphony at the Queen's Hall and the singularly varied reactions to it (4).

The reasons why this should be so are many: it is the most extended of all such allusions in Forster; the symphony (at least in part - the first four notes) is perhaps the best known of all classical works; the individual reactions to it are such as most concert-goers will have witnessed or sensed; and the æsthetic problem raised by those reactions is one of the most commonly debated. Yet it is worth recording that musical allusions of the variety and type of those in The Longest Journey, presumably because they would not serve Forster's purpose, tend not to occur. What replaces them is an unparalleled concentration on this scene and its almost unending reverberations and ramifications.

While the scene does not take place at the very

opening, Forster places it sufficiently early to enable him to establish certain vital aspects of the characters involved which are to be developed as the story progresses, though it also draws into its implications ideas suggested in the first four chapters. Beer has aptly commented on how the tone of light comedy of the opening, redolent of Pride and Prejudice, belies the seriousness of much of the content (5), and this dichotomy is nowhere more apparent than in Forster's treatment of the participants. One may as well begin with Mrs. Munt. She it is who taps "surreptitiously when the tunes come." (6) In this she typifies the kind of English middle-class female who responds physically to the more easily recognisable elements in music but who feels, as her Italian counterpart at Lucia di Lammermoor would not, that it is inherently infra dig. to do such a thing. She does it "of course, so as (not) to disturb the others" (7) (a concern that one would like to regard as typically English also), but she is not averse to talking between movements, especially as her companions do the same. Her attitude to the music is distinctly uncerebral (she can no more remember what instrument the transitional passage is on than what the name of Mrs. Wilcox's house is), and is expressed in such phrases as "I do not go in for being musical", "I only care for music", and "I do know when I like a thing and when I don't." And what she, being English to the backbone and particularly patriotic, likes is "Pomp and Circumstance". It is an attitude Forster

strongly deprecates (8), and is a reflection of the general distrust of intellectuality she early evinces in relation to the Schlegels. The same defect which makes her unable to concentrate on the music's detail can be seen in her inattention to scenery (on the way to Hilton) as opposed to her attention to physical comfort, and in her inability, comparable to Henry Wilcox's, to notice slight, but significant looks. The woman who lacks any clearly defined impression of Beethoven's 5th Symphony can also allow her memories of what really happened between her and the Wilcoxes to become distorted. That she should experience no overwhelming feeling, as does Helen, recalls her general suspicion of sudden emotion. She is, too, very concerned that the Wilcoxes should "care about Literature and Art" (9), but the genuineness of her own appreciation is in doubt, the more so as she shares with them certain other qualities - "esprit de classe", a belief in money, a regard for social status, and a "vein of coarseness". (10) She is not, however, aware of any deficiency in her appreciation, a complacency paralleled by her confidence in really having helped the Schlegel sisters. Nor is her attention undivided. She finds time to enquire, after the first movement "Who is Margaret talking to?" (11), thereby evincing further unresponsiveness to the music, and a curiosity similar to that which provides her with information about Mrs. Matheson and the Wilcoxes unknown to the uninquisitive sisters (12). Of course, not all Mrs. Munt's characteristics are present: in particular

the very genuine and deep concern she has for her nieces is only hinted at. But the interrelations are of sufficient number to indicate the importance of the scene in emphasizing her qualities and what she stands for. Moreover, she occupies one extreme of the spectrum of attitudes which it is obviously Forster's intention to bring out.

Tibby occupies the opposite extreme. Apart from the calculating way in which he avoids missing Brahms' Four Serious Songs ("Tibby only cares for cultured females singing Brahms" (13)), the emphasis is on his technical knowledge.

He is

"profoundly versed in counterpoint" (14), "holds the full score open on his knee" (15), and "(implores) the company generally to look out for the transitional passage on the drum." (16)

Britten feels that Forster is over-critical of Tibby, "is determined to paint (him) black or dark grey" (17), and uses Tibby's approach to do just that. It is true that Forster was only too aware of the dangers to which an over-intellectual attitude to music could lead; training could "sterilize the sensitiveness that is being trained", education "lead to knowledge instead of wisdom", "spontaneous enjoyment be checked." (18) But perhaps Britten is over-critical of Forster. Tibby's approach has been conditioned by the intellectual environment in which he has been raised, and by the fact that "he had never been interested in human beings" (19), resulting from the

feminine, if not effeminate, over-concentration on personal relationships with which he had been surrounded since childhood. It is from the same source that his preoccupation with his hay-fever and fine tea, his inability to make friends or to deal with Charles Wilcox, spring. Yet he has genuine concern for Helen in her plight and there is a suggestion that his love for music has an emotional core, and is not just coldly cerebral:

"These tears touched him as something unusual. They were nearer the things that did concern him, such as music." (20)

With Fräulein Mosebach and her young man, Herr Liesecke, we are in the realms of pure comedy. She, being so absolutely Teutonic, cannot possibly respond to Helen's smile, because she is "listening to Classical Music" (21). Heaven forbid that such a serious art-form should allow for levity. He, one feels, with his lined forehead, parted lips, be-pince-nezed nose and thick white hands is one of those who contribute to "the extreme physical ugliness" (22) which Forster observed in a classical audience. No doubt too his future conduct, as his present, will be governed by her.

With Helen, however amusing may be her wool-gathering, in the manner of Forster himself (23), over audience, organ, or Cupidic architecture, the underlying implications are serious in the extreme. Her approach to music is essentially visual and literary, and indeed she can reverse the process whereby music

suggests images and can produce instead a tonal scheme for a view:

"The course of the Oder is to be like music. It's obliged to remind her of a symphonic poem. The part by the landing stage is in B minor, if I remember rightly, but lower down things get extremely mixed. There is a slodgy theme in several keys at once, meaning mud-banks, and another for the navigable canal, and the exit into the Baltic is in C sharp major, pianissimo." (24)

The aesthetic problem as to whether music does, or even should, evoke pictures is treated in an article with which Forster must have been familiar (25), and, as has been seen, considered too by Forster himself (26). He does not find "visual wanderings entirely to (his) taste" (27) but is guilty of them, as when, for instance, he sees a fish swimming against the stream in the Allegretto of Beethoven's Op. 31 No. 2 (28), a tapestry of hunting scenes in the opening of his 7th Symphony, or Gluck's Orpheus and the Furies in the slow movement of the 4th Piano Concerto (29). That Helen has such visions is to mark her from the first as slightly inferior to Margaret. But both for her and for the symbolism of the novel it is essential that she does. She

"can see heroes and shipwrecks in the music's flood" (30) in the first movement, goblins and a trio of elephants dancing in the Scherzo, and "gusts of splendour, gods and demi-gods contending with vast swords, colour and fragrance broadcast on the field of battle, magnificent victory, magnificent death" (31) in the Finale.

This response provides the key to the character of a girl who can fall in and out of love in a day, descend with the Basts on Evie's wedding, give herself to Leonard in a mad symbolic gesture, and be prepared to sacrifice almost half her fortune. Within this response, however, it is the goblins and their associations who emerge as having the most significance:

"They were not aggressive creatures; it was that that made them so terrible to Helen. They merely observed in passing that there was no such thing as splendour or heroism in the world. After the interlude of elephants dancing, they returned and made the observation for the second time. Helen could not contradict them, for, once at all events, she had felt the same, and had seen the reliable walls of youth collapse. Panic and emptiness ! Panic and emptiness ! The goblins were right." (32)

The word "once" recalls the moment when the phrase "panic and emptiness" is first heard - in Helen's account to Margaret of Paul's terror the morning after his evening's kiss and declaration of love (33). The goblins, the panic and emptiness, together with other words and phrases drawn in around them, resemble threads that become part of the extremely complex fabric which is the imagery of Howards End. It is a part particularly associated with the menace of the Basts and the emotional hollowness in the Wilcoxes. The first thread reappears when, after the concert, Leonard has retrieved his umbrella, and fled from the offer of tea, a refusal that distresses Helen:

"For that little incident had impressed the three women more than might be supposed. It remained as a goblin footfall, as a hint that all is not for the best in the best of all possible worlds, and that beneath these superstructures of wealth and art there wanders an ill-fed boy, who has recovered his umbrella indeed, but who has left no address behind him, and no name." (34)

Thus are the first seeds of destruction sown in Helen's mind and the means of transition provided between the freedom from financial worry, the happiness and genuine culture of the Schlegels' household in Chapter 5, and the penny-pinching, depression, and pseudo-culture of the Basts' in Chapter 6.

The second thread recurs after the sudden (35) and tragic death of Mrs. Wilcox, when Charles and Evie, with their father genuinely grief-stricken upstairs, talk Chalkley and elms rather than discuss their loss. This is not, Forster tells us, because they were callous, but partly because, like all the Wilcoxes,

"they avoided the personal note in life It did not seem to them of supreme importance. Or it may be, as Helen supposed, they realized its importance, but were afraid of it. Panic and emptiness, could one glance behind." (36)

This disregard of the inner life and the reluctance to face it is a failing of criminal dimensions in Helen's eyes and it colours her whole attitude to Margaret's relations with Henry and strongly influences her attitude to Leonard Bast. Thus

after Jacky's unfruitful visit to Wickham Place in search of her husband, Helen's

"thoughts were poisoned. Mrs. Lanoline had risen out of the abyss, like a faint smell, a goblin footfall, telling of a life where love and hatred had both decayed." (37)

Here the two initial threads in the imagery can be seen to interrelate and, further, to become intertwined with two new ones - "smell" (which later manifests itself as "odours") and "abyss" (38). What was an image arising from Beethoven's 5th Symphony has now become almost inseparable from other elements, and even when the latter occur on their own, the associations with that work are still present.

Margaret too can become distressed by "odours from the abyss" (39) when Leonard calls at Wickham Place to explain his wife's visit, but the odours arise primarily because Helen will not allow him to get away with an explanation that is obviously a lie. The Helen who sees heroes and shipwrecks is at work again.

The Helen who sees goblins returns when she receives the, for her, shattering news of Henry's proposal to Margaret:

" 'Don't, don't do such a thing ! I tell you not to - don't!
I know -- don't !'
'What do you know?'
'Panic and emptiness,' sobbed Helen. 'Don't!' " (40)

The memory of Paul, and the emotional inadequacy of the Wilcoxes comes flooding back to her. Obviously she has no hope that the goblins will be dispelled by the gusts of splendour, but of course Margaret has no such view of life. The slight change in her is measured by "a cessation of the winds and odours of life." (41)

The cessation is, however, only temporary. Leonard, hauled up to Oniton, is "near the abyss" (42) and is uncharacteristically direct with the sisters. Margaret, in shaking hands with Jacky

"remembered the motive of her call at Wickham Place, and smelt again odours from the abyss" (43).

Not only does this constitute an echo of the goblin menace, but also provides a premonition of the approach to the precipice of her relationship in Helen's central discussion with Leonard over the division of people into those who do and those who do not say "I". Nietzsche and Napoleon, Bluebeard and Botticelli, Pierpoint Morgan and Henry Wilcox do not;

"If you could pierce through (them) you would find panic and emptiness in the middle." (44)

Leonard and Helen (and, of course, Margaret) do - and as his realization of this dawns he is drawn to her.

But Margaret's precipice is, for the time being, avoided because "she chose her words carefully and so saved Henry from panic." (45)

Helen and Leonard have already, she in one sense he in another, fallen over theirs, even though she feels that her gift of £5,000 will "raise one person from the abyss" (46), for he refuses the gift and reaps the consequences, while she passes "into chaos" (47). Leonard to her has really been only an outgrowth from Paul:

"Both times it was loneliness, and the night, and panic afterwards." (48)

For him there remains a nagging remorse, a compelling need for expiation:

"Again and again must the drums tap, the goblins stalk over the universe before joy can be purged of the superficial." (49)

Stone has perceptively remarked on how the phrase "panic and emptiness" is gradually fragmented and its effect diminished, until, in what he designates the coda of the book, a transition is effected to the motif of "death" (50). It marks for him a movement towards "prophecy"; certainly "the idea of death", as opposed to death itself which destroys (51) can save a man, but it has come too late to save Leonard, and could never save Charles Wilcox.

Helen, with Margaret - and perhaps even Henry, crosses "the black abyss of the past." (52) Once, the music of Beethoven's 5th Symphony "had summed up to her all that had happened or could happen in her career" (53), but her goblins

have hardly been swept away "amid vast roaring of superhuman joy" (54). The allegory is incomplete: it is a very much sadder, wiser, and withdrawn Helen who remains. Whatever heroism she once possessed now resides, transmuted, in Margaret. (55)

One particular thread in this fabric of musical imagery has been seen to connect Helen with Leonard Bast, but the implications of the associations of music with him are by no means exhausted. The concert itself has important ramifications. It forms, of course, part of Leonard's general striving after culture exemplified elsewhere in his voracious but uncritical reading of the literature of the open road, and his penchant for Ruskin and Watts. The pieces played constitute the basis of his conversation with Margaret, and, more significantly, help in removing his suspicion occasioned by the loss of his umbrella because they enable him to "slack off" (56). Not that he can completely. During the walk to Wickham Place after the concert he gets no response from Margaret to his "attending" the gallery at Covent Garden, and he is anxious about the pronunciation of Tannhäuser. Moreover, his liking for Faust and Tosca suggests that his taste in opera, as is to be expected, falls short of the highest standards. He is bowled over by Margaret's dissertation on music and painting, and beneath it all "the umbrella persisted, with the steady beat of a drum." (57) The umbrella too, then, becomes connected to the symphony and recurs on two crucial occasions - on his visit to Wickham Place two years later

when he mistakenly hopes that the concert, so special to him and so undistinguishable to the Schlegels, will remind them who he is: Helen "Steals umbrellas oftener than (she hears) Beethoven" (58); and in his fateful discussion with Helen at Oniton when

"as the lost umbrella had spoilt the concert at the Queen's Hall, so the lost situation was obscuring the diviner harmonies now." (59)

It is the concert which provides the occasion for his meeting with the sisters, the concert which supplies the visiting card that results in Jacky's visit, the concert which leads to his final destruction.

Behind Leonard Bast's concert-going lies his own music-making. As with Lucy Honeychurch's home at Windy Corner, a piano forms part of the furniture in his Camelia Road "flat", but its symbolic function is entirely different. With the draped mantelpiece bristling with Cupids, the bookcase, and the Maude Goodman, it contributes to

"that shallow makeshift note that is so often heard in the modern dwelling-place" (60),

thus forming a minute part of that sequence of imagery which marks the opposition of permanence and flux epitomized in Howards End and London. On this piano, badly and vulgarly, he "jingled out a little Grieg." (61) Again, as with Lucy's playing at the Vyses, Forster does not specify the piece Leonard attempts, but the choice of composer is significant. Charming though many of

the Lyric Pieces and other miniatures are, no one would claim Grieg to be a composer of the first rank. Moreover, the word "jingled", like Lucy's "tinkling" of Mozart, has faintly pejorative overtones. In combination, composer and performance constitute a reflection on Leonard's veneer of culture, which, through lack of time and money, remains so pitifully thin.

His performance is "not without its effect" (62) on Jacky. While she remains completely indifferent to his attempts to discuss the concert with her, and only just manages to rouse herself sufficiently to opine that "Hark, my soul it is the Lord" is "a lovely tune" (it gives him the hump) (63), the Grieg sends her off to bed. No more in music than in any other aspect of living is there any connection between husband and "wife" (64). Perhaps it is not just coincidence that when Forster is describing Leonard's mingling of "true imagination and false", he should do so thus:

"What he said wasn't wrong, but it wasn't right, and a false note jarred. One little twist, they felt, and the instrument might be in tune. One little strain, and it might be silent for ever" (65);

for, as well as having his own personal area of musical symbolism in addition to that which connects him with Helen, this last discordant element will be seen ultimately to contrast him with Margaret.

Gransden has called Margaret Forster's "most striking

and completely realized character" (66) and, as with Helen, a vital part of this realization comes with her response to music. She alone, of all the party attending the concert, "can only see the music" (67), an ability Forster elsewhere allows only to the professional critic (68), and music is for her, at least early in the novel, a very serious business. Her taste is of the highest; she likes Beethoven, but not Mendelssohn, Elgar, or Brahms, although concern alone for the theft of Leonard's umbrella diverts her attention from the last's Four Serious Songs. She strongly attacks Helen's idea of interchangeability in the Arts:

" 'Oh, it's all rubbish, radically false. If Monet's really Debussy, and Debussy's really Monet, neither gentleman is worth his salt - that's my opinion' " (69);

puts the blame for it fairly and squarely on Wagner (70), and dismisses the comparison of the Oder to music as "affectation" (71); and because she gives music such unremitting attention it tires her. (72) This attitude marks her as superior to the others, if, as well, making her seem a trifle uncompromising.

(73) It also opposes her diametrically to the male Wilcoxes - to Henry who fears the decline of Ducie Street because "the house opposite has been taken by operatic people" (74), who can comment on Helen as "Musical, literary, artistic, but I should say normal" (75), who has no music at his wedding with Margaret (76), but who provides "the rubbish of a pretentious band" (77) at Evie's - and to Charles who fears that they will "all be

dancing to a very different music" when the Schlegels with their "artistic beastliness" have taken over his father (78). But it is an attitude that suffers modification, especially through Margaret's contact with Mrs. Wilcox. After their exchange of notes about Helen and Paul, Margaret impulsively dashes across to Wickham Mansions to find her in bed. She is scandalized that Mrs. Wilcox can find "nothing to get up for" in London "when there are all the autumn exhibitions, and Ysaye playing in the afternoon" (79), but as she listens to her voice she feels the suggestion that

"pictures, concerts, and people are all of small and equal value." (80)

Again, towards the end of the disastrous luncheon party that Margaret gives for Mrs. Wilcox, she tries to delay her departure with:

" 'Oh, but come upstairs for a little. Miss Quested plays. Do you like MacDowell? Do you mind him only having two noises?' " (81)

Mrs. Wilcox's gentle reply makes Margaret experience a sudden revulsion against "the lives of gibbering monkeys" that they lead, and assert that they have at bottom "something quiet and stable" (82).

The change is slow and subtle, but inevitable. Although Margaret "would have preferred to spend the afternoon at a concert" (83), she regrets her lack of intuition in refusing

Mrs. Wilcox's invitation to Howards End and goes to King's Cross. The concerts which "(sweep) past them" (84) become the concerts which waste her time (85), though music always remains one of the comforts (86) in her life. This change is part of the larger process by which Margaret comes to see everything in "proportion" and "whole" (87). It is surely suggestive that, at the moment she feels Henry's proposal is coming (88), she holds on to the piano; it is almost as if she is clinging to something which symbolizes her past values and which she will now inevitably have to relinquish. Connecting may involve letting go.

Just as Mrs. Wilcox, both in flesh and in spirit, exercises a calming influence throughout the novel, so Margaret, who becomes a new Mrs. Wilcox, gradually develops into the novel's main harmonizing force. It is she who hopes to help Henry

"to the building of the rainbow bridge (89) that should connect the prose in us with the passion" without which "we are meaningless fragments, half monks, half beasts, unconnected arches that have never joined into a man" (90);

she who, though not knowing "to what ultimate harmony we tend", can sense that

"there seemed a great chance that a child would be born into the world, to take the great chances of beauty and adventure that the world offers." (91)

Often this "tone" (92) of Margaret's character is expressed not

in specifically musical terms, but conveyed as a pervasive feeling:

"No, there was nothing more to be done. They had tried not to go over the precipice, but perhaps the fall was inevitable: cause and effect would go jangling forward to some goal doubtless, but to none that she could imagine. At such moments the soul retires within, to float upon the bosom of a deeper stream, and has communion with the dead, and sees the world's glory not diminished, but different in kind to what she had supposed. She alters her focus until trivial things are blurred. Margaret had been tending this way all the winter." (93)

Here we are once again reminded how, often in Forster, music is intimately related to natural scenery (94), and, in Howards End, to water in particular. It is a connection which extends even into the tumult of the city and early on provides Margaret with a sense of peace:

"She broke off, and listened to the sounds of a London morning. Their house was in Wickham Place, and fairly quiet, for a lofty promontory of buildings separated it from the main thoroughfare. One had the sense of a back-water, or rather of an estuary, whose waters flowed in from the invisible sea, and ebbed into a profound silence while the waves without were still beating." (95)

Later, when the tumult is Henry's affair with Jacky, Margaret, with everything in proportion, falls asleep, "lulled by the murmurs of the river that descended all the night from Wales." (96) Most importantly, when Margaret and Helen pass their

evening together at Howards End,

"The present flowed past them like a stream. The tree rustled. It had made music before they were born, and would continue after their deaths, but its song was of the moment. The moment had passed. The tree rustled again. Their senses were sharpened, and they seemed to apprehend life. Life passed. The tree rustled again. 'Sleep now,' said Margaret.

The peace of the country was entering into her." (97)

Not only does Margaret exercise a harmonizing influence on those around her; nature also, epitomized in its most vital symbol, the wych-elm, soothes her.

How long such beauty will endure to soothe is a question about which Margaret, with Helen and Forster himself, has sad doubts:

"Howards End, Oniton, the Purbeck Downs, the Oderberge, were all survivals, and the melting-pot was being prepared for them. Logically, they had no right to be alive. One's hope was in the weakness of logic. Were they possibly the earth beating time?" (98)

Yet, in her hardly won peace, she can "very early in the morning in the garden feel that our house is the future as well as the past." (99)

It is indeed remarkable how what at first glance might have seemed a scene of pure comedy emerges as providing not only a key to the way that characters eventually behave but also, to

change the earlier metaphors, an explosion of a chain reaction which spreads to all the other symbols in the novel. It cannot, of course, be claimed that music in itself provides the chief symbol; Howards End and its wych-elm must do that. But it certainly affords a prime activating force and an allegory of much that is to follow.

*** *** ***

NOTES to CHAPTER 5

- 1) Arnold Kettle, An Introduction to the English Novel, Volume 2, Chapter 6, p. 137. Hutchinson and Co., Ltd., 1972. Maurice is omitted in this judgment, and Professor Kettle has since somewhat revised his opinions.
- 2) Op. cit., Chapter 7, p. 99.
- 3) Op. cit., p. 81. Britten also praises Forster's perceptive observations on Beethoven as "profound enough to help explain why his music has kept its hold on the public's affection all these years". Forster's comments on the Andante (which Britten ignores) too are valid and especially happy is the thought of its final cadence saying "Heigh-ho". What, however, has happened to the Trio of the Scherzo in the suggested programme?
- 4) HE, Chapter 5.
- 5) Op. cit., Chapter 5, pp. 120-121.
- 6) HE, Chapter 5, p. 31.
- 7) Ibid.
- 8) See: "The Raison d'Être of Criticism in the Arts" in TC, p. 115.
- 9) HE, Chapter 2, p. 10.
- 10) HE, Chapter 3, p. 21.
- 11) HE, Chapter 5, p. 31.
- 12) HE, Chapter 7.
- 13) HE, Chapter 5, p. 42.
- 14) Ibid., p. 31.
- 15) Ibid.
- 16) Ibid., p. 32.
- 17) Op. cit., p. 84.
- 18) TC, p. 115.

- 19) HE, Chapter 30, p. 237.
- 20) Ibid., p. 235.
- 21) HE, Chapter 5, p. 32.
- 22) "Not Listening to Music", TC, p. 133.
- 23) See (22) *passim*.
- 24) HE, Chapter 9, p. 71. The passage raises the problem, which fascinated Forster, as to whether, apart from association, keys have particular qualities.
See: "The C minor of that Life", TC, pp. 130-133, discussed in Chapter 1.
- 25) See: G. Lowes Dickinson: "Noise that you pay for", The Independent Review, August 1904, pp. 377-390. It is odd that G.L.D. should regard the Symphony as having only three movements, as did Forster.
- 26) See: "The Raison d'Être of Criticism in the Arts", TC, pp. 117-9.
- 27) Ibid., p. 119.
- 28) See the MS. of Notes on the Piano Sonatas, in the Library of King's College, Cambridge.
- 29) "Not Listening to Music", TC, p. 134. Liszt saw Orpheus taming the wild beasts in this last.
- 30) HE, Chapter 5, p. 31.
- 31) Ibid., p. 33.
- 32) Ibid., pp. 32-33.
- 33) HE, Chapter 4, p. 26.
- 34) HE, Chapter 5, p. 44.
- 35) Though not so unprepared as other deaths in Forster.
- 36) HE, Chapter 11, p. 88.
- 37) HE, Chapter 13, p. 108.
- 38) "Abyss" first occurs in the description of Leonard Bast where it establishes his exact social position:
"He was not in the abyss, but he could see it", and

"he was obliged to assert gentility, lest he slipped into the abyss where nothing counts". (HE, Chapter 6, p. 44.) Brander (op. cit., p. 127) regards it as a typically Edwardian middle-class word. Stone (op. cit., p. 249 (footnote)) sees it as evidence connecting Bast with St. Sebastian. P.N.Furbank in a note to me suggests that C.F. Masterman's From the Abyss lay at the back of Forster's mind.

- 39) HE, Chapter 14, p. 111.
- 40) HE, Chapter 19, p. 161.
- 41) Ibid., p. 164.
- 42) HE, Chapter 26, p. 212.
- 43) Ibid., p. 216.
- 44) HE, Chapter 27, p. 219.
- 45) HE, Chapter 29, p. 230.
- 46) HE, Chapter 30, p. 237.
- 47) HE, Chapter 34, p. 261.
- 48) HE, Chapter 40, p. 292.
- 49) HE, Chapter 41, pp. 301-2.
- 50) Op. cit., Chapter 10, pp. 269-70.
- 51) HE, Chapter 27, p. 223.
- 52) HE, Chapter 44, p. 313.
- 53) HE, Chapter 5, p. 34.
- 54) Ibid., p. 33.
- 55) See, for example, Helen's "you're a heroine" to Margaret (HE, Chapter 23, p. 181) on the latter's decision to marry Henry, and her "Can't it strike you - even for a moment - that your life has been heroic?" (HE, Chapter 44, p. 315) in the final summing-up. Here lies support for Stone's view that Helen is an extension of Rickie, and Margaret of Stephen - the Siegfried hero of LJ.
- 56) HE, Chapter 5, p. 36.
- 57) Ibid., p. 39.

- 58) HE, Chapter 14, p. 110.
- 59) HE, Chapter 27, p. 223.
- 60) HE, Chapter 6, p. 47.
- 61) Ibid., p. 53.
- 62) Ibid.
- 63) Ibid., p. 52.
- 64) Apart from the quoted hymn, Jacky's musical taste is exemplified in the song: "On the shelf, / On the shelf, / Boys, boys, I'm on the shelf." (HE, Chapter 6, p. 50.)
- 65) HE, Chapter 14, p. 115.
- 66) K.W. Gransden, E.M. Forster, Writers and Critics Series, Oliver and Boyd, 1970, Chapter 5, p. 54.
- 67) HE, Chapter 5, p. 31.
- 68) See: "Not Listening to Music", TC, p. 133.
- 69) HE, Chapter 5, p. 38.
- 70) Ibid.
- 71) HE, Chapter 9, p. 72.
- 72) HE, Chapter 5, p. 37.
- 73) Ibid. She refuses, too, to "make things go" with Leonard.
- 74) HE, Chapter 20, p. 171.
- 75) HE, Chapter 35, p. 269.
- 76) HE, Chapter 31, p. 240.
- 77) HE, Chapter 41, p. 295.
- 78) HE, Chapter 21, p. 173.
- 79) HE, Chapter 8, p. 66.
- 80) Ibid., p. 67.

- 81) HE, Chapter 9, p. 74. Forster is really very unkind to MacDowell here. Perhaps he only knew him as the composer of "To a Wild Rose" and "Shadow Dance". But his 2nd Piano Concerto, his Piano Sonatas, and his Sea Pictures deserve him a place next to his model, Grieg. And can this Miss Quested be the one who figures in A Passage to India?
- 82) Ibid.
- 83) HE, Chapter 10, p. 82.
- 84) HE, Chapter 13, p. 102.
- 85) HE, Chapter 17, p. 141.
- 86) HE, Chapter 18, p. 152.
- 87) See, for example, HE, pp. 97, 181, 227, 250.
- 88) HE, Chapter 18, p. 154.
- 89) Gransden (p. 56) states that, in using this phrase, Forster had Wagner particularly in mind.
- 90) HE, Chapter 22, p. 174.
- 91) HE, Chapter 43, p. 307.
- 92) The word is Beer's.
- 93) HE, Chapter 43, p. 309.
- 94) And it extends, in HE to places: Hilton Station "like the scenery, like Helen's letters, struck an indeterminate note" (Chapter 3, p. 16.); "The lamps and the plane trees, following the line of the embankment, (near Battersea Bridge Station) struck a note of dignity that is rare in English cities" (Chapter 15, p. 121.); "The city behind them seemed to be a vast theatre, an opera-house in which some endless trilogy was performing (Chapter 15, p. 122.); St. Paul's has its "inaudible songs" (Chapter 34, p. 262.) And, indeed, to mythology: "Our folklore has never advanced beyond daintiness, and the greater melodies about our country-side have all issued through the pipes of Greece". (Chapter 33, p. 249.)
- 95) HE, Chapter 2, p. 9. The "waves" are taken up later in the equation of the roaring thoroughfare with "a tide that could never be quiet". (HE, Chapter 5, p. 43.)

- 96) HE, Chapter 28, p. 227.
- 97) HE, Chapter 40, p. 293.
- 98) HE, Chapter 44, p. 316, Perhaps the earth can afford to beat time in a way that Mrs. Elliot in LJ cannot.
- 99) HE, Chapter 44, p. 316.

CHAPTER 6 : MAURICE

MAURICE occupies a unique position in Forster's output. Begun in 1913, and completed in 1914, it was not published until 1971 (1), and between completion and publication the final section of the manuscript was subjected to several revisions. The bulk of the novel, however, belongs to a period of three months' intensive work done towards the end of 1913, and thus the work is, in the main, the immediate successor to Howards End. (2)

Since Beethoven's 5th Symphony plays such a seminal role in the earlier novel, it will be as well first to examine whether Tschaiikowsky's 6th assumes a similar importance here. No Helen is present when it is first played (3) to provide it with vivid visual symbolism - neither Maurice nor Durham is of a type to indulge in such fantasies - but, as Maurice later discovers (4), the symphony was written with the composer's own allegory very much in mind:

"During my travels I had an idea for another symphony, this time a programme-symphony, but with a programme which shall remain a mystery for every one - let them guess away, but the symphony will be called merely "A Programme Symphony" (No. 6). The programme itself is subjective to the core. While I was composing it I frequently cried."
(5)

The allegory is thus not only spelt out in full, but

in addition a number of significant clues, both external and internal, exist. The symphony is dedicated to Vladimir Lvovitch Davidov - Bobyk, whom Forster calls "the wonderful nephew to whom Tchaikovsky turns after his breakdown" (6). Certainly Bobyk's importance to Tschaikowsky in general and with regard to the symphony in particular would be difficult to overestimate. The three-week holiday especially that he spent with him at Vichy in 1892 did much to alleviate the nervous depression brought on by the rupture in 1890 with Nadezhda von Meck, the death of his sister in 1891, and general overwork, while the symphony, the dedication of which Bobyk knew was to be his, formed a frequent topic in Tschaikowsky's letters to him thereafter. He was present at his death-bed, and received in his will the royalties from the symphony. The title "Pathétique" was provided by Modest (7), the homosexual of Tschaikowsky's younger twin brothers, who with Bobyk, after the composer's death, eventually bought the house at Klin which they converted into the Tschaikowsky museum. It was a title to which Tschaikowsky gave his whole-hearted approval.

Earlier sketches for a 6th Symphony had included a theme headed "Why? Why? For what?" and a four-movement scheme based on "Life", depicting "passion, assurance, thirst for activity"; "love"; "disillusionment"; "death - result of final collapse". (8) Although there is no sure evidence that this scheme was carried into the B minor Symphony, it reveals the

general direction in which Tschaikowsky was moving at the time. And there are two more significant pointers: the first movement (bars 201-5) contains the funeral theme "Resting with the Saints" from the Orthodox Requiem, while two letters written to the Grand Duke Constantine, declining to set Apukhtin's poem "Requiem" to music, give the reason that

"My last symphony (and especially the Finale) only just written is saturated with a mood very near to that with which "Requiem" is filled. I am afraid of repeating myself in undertaking a composition related in spirit and character to its predecessor." (9)

Beyond this there is only the music itself, and it would be wrong to try to impose too detailed an interpretation on it. Forster goes no farther than describing Maurice enjoying "the piercing and the tearing and the soothing" (10) which is a fair indication of the music's effect, though one might venture a little farther without offending too many personal views. The descending scale of the introduction, which recurs in various guises throughout the work, is probably a death motto theme; some kind of emotional struggle is apparent in the subsequent Allegro which conflicts with the yearning love-theme of the second subject; respite and charm reside in the Valse, though its trio recalls despair; Tschaikowsky himself described the March as being in "triumphant, jubilant vein" (11); and the Finale constitutes the Requiem wherein the return of the second subject in the minor, which in its original form had afforded a momentary

ray of light, creates a moment of almost unbearable poignance and tragedy. No wonder that Havelock Ellis should see the symphony as "The Homosexual Tragedy". (12)

It is thus singularly appropriate that it should be the Pathétique that Clive Durham is sorting out when Maurice, in search of Risley, comes across him in the latter's room. (13) Although they have met before, this meeting marks their first meaningful encounter, and the symphony provides an indication of the direction their relationship is to take. The scene, too, contains a number of significant details which might easily be overlooked. Why, for instance, should it be the March that Durham cannot find? It is perhaps not too much to suggest that it is because Durham is in search of happiness, and the March is the one section of the symphony where such a feeling exists. And indeed Durham forgoes finding the record and accompanies Maurice instead, thereby anticipating his eventual desertion of his books and music for his lover. In the course of the conversation, too, Maurice declares that "(the work) means nothing to me" (14), a statement which assumes an ironic tinge in the light of his subsequent discoveries about it. For him "a good waltz is more in my style" (15) and the fact that Durham meets his eye as he makes the reply "Mine too" seems undoubtedly to indicate that Durham is searching in Maurice's comment for a homosexual interpretation of the word "waltz" as a synonym for a particular kind of walk. At all events, it is the 5/4 that Durham insists on playing

because "it's nearer waltzes" (16), thus providing the second indication of Maurice's dawning importance to him. Beginnings of change in Maurice are apparent too, for although he is not "in the aesthetic push" he "listens carefully to the music" and "rather like(s) it." (17) The foundations of the relationship are being laid. We see Maurice asserting his masculinity by insisting on carrying the records, Durham sitting at the pianola with Maurice kneeling at his side (relative positions which are later more usually reversed), and Durham refusing to play the Valse again because

"A movement isn't like a separate piece - you can't repeat it" (18).

Here speaks the Durham of Cambridge to whom intellectual integrity still means something; and he might well have added in parenthesis, "Nor can you repeat an experience." He rightly feels that one can only move onwards, and so he plays what Forster calls the "Largo" (19). His so doing provides a premonition of the eventual death of the relationship.

No overt reference to the work occurs until Maurice takes advantage of the concert ticket sent by Miss Tonks to Kitty, and by one of Forster's coincidences, hears again

"the symphony of Tchaikovsky Clive had taught him to like." (20)

By this time much water has flowed under the bridge: the relationship has burgeoned idyllically, and then been blighted by Durham's

somewhat unlikely transformation in illness; the problems of Ada and Dickie have raised their heads and Durham has become engaged. Dr. Barry's reaction of "Rubbish ! rubbish !" to Maurice's confession of his problem drives him in the direction of Miss Tonks. Ironically Forster records that "Unfortunately, after the concert he met Risley." (21) In fact it is fortunate in the extreme: only by reading a life of Tschaikowsky as a result does Maurice avoid being dragged into a marriage which would have been as disastrous as the composer's. He is led instead to undergo hypnosis, a course which, in the event, proves unproductive (by "normal" standards) but which at least is not so fraught with danger.

But while this episode contains the only further overt reference to the symphony, it is often present by implication. Because Forster's aim in Maurice is essentially different from that in Howards End, the method of narrative is much simpler and the fabric of imagery correspondingly far less complex. Nevertheless, there is a substantial group of images which is clearly an off-shoot of those related to the "goblin footfalls" of the earlier novel and which utilizes a similar and, on occasions, identical vocabulary. And there is both a general and a specific connection between Beethoven's 5th Symphony and Tschaikowsky's 6th: the nineteenth century widely accepted Beethoven's opening notes as signifying Fate knocking at the door, thereby inviting a programmatic interpretation of the whole work

similar in kind to that of the Tschaikowsky; while in Tschaikowsky's third movement the entry of the death motto theme in upper woodwind and strings against the original scherzo-like material in the lower strings is accompanied by Beethoven's Fate motif on the brass (22). The conclusion is inescapable: images which irrefutably connect with the Beethoven relate too to the Tschaikowsky.

This view is fully corroborated by the nature of the words and images themselves. The first of these is "abyss". It has been seen how in Howards End this word is especially associated with Leonard Bast. Now it occurs at certain crucial points in relation to Maurice's development. As he becomes drawn towards Durham as a direct result of the encounter over the symphony, he does not search his inner self to discover what is really happening but allows

"Each day with its contradictions (to slip) into the abyss" (23).

The crisis following Durham's declaration of love causes Maurice to become a man though

"there was still much to learn, and years passed before he explored certain abysses in his being - horrible enough they were." (24)

When love has been accepted Durham has to lead Maurice

"up a narrow and beautiful path high above either abyss" (passion and temperance) (25).

But when Durham changes and Maurice sees Ada as the cause, he

"returned in a few hours to the abyss where he had wandered as a boy." (26)

The handsome young Frenchman who chaffs Maurice after the episode with Dickie also causes "odours from the abyss" (27) to arise. Here we have the identical phrase that Forster uses in Howards End at the moment when Margaret is distressed during Leonard's call at Wickham Place (28), and it illustrates once again how involved the fabric of imagery in Forster's novels can become. "Odours", for instance, ascend from the primroses just before Maurice's encounter with Scudder in the shrubbery, but it is rain that helps release them and at once the connection with a new thread appears. Rain falls on the piano at Penge (29) to point Maurice's broken relationship, and outside the British Museum (30) as a background to the danger of Scudder's blackmail attempt, in contrast to the afternoon's breaking into glory (31) when his love for Maurice becomes apparent. The odours from the abyss return in transmuted form at the very end of the novel when Durham, appalled at Maurice's disclosure of his union with Scudder at Penge and his attitude to the Cambridge relationship, sees the whole business as "a cesspool" from which "one breath at the election would ruin him." (32)

Again related to the abyss is the thought of darkness. It appears as a synonym for death, the only possible end to the

"beautiful path" cited above. (33) Maurice confesses to his grandfather that

"Since Cambridge I believe in nothing - except in a sort of darkness" (34), and when "the volume of their past" has finally to be "restored to its shelf" it is "amid darkness and perishing flowers." (35)

And, of course, darkness suggests hell, the hell that Maurice experiences on earth (36), or the hell which may continue beyond the grave (37).

In Howards End the phrase "panic and emptiness" too was closely associated with "abyss", particularly in relation to the goblins of the Beethoven symphony. In Maurice it seems to be replaced by "pain and loneliness", or some form of the latter word on its own, though there is an interesting moment, when Maurice and Scudder unite in London, where Forster sees physical love as being "panic in essence" (38). The phrase occurs in full during Maurice's agonizing meeting with Durham after the vacation at home, which has temporarily destroyed his ability to connect, when he still does not fully understand what he is searching for (39). He has, however, felt "beaten and lonely" for a while when Durham insists on remaining in Risley's room to find the March (40). After Durham's change the words "lonely" and "loneliness" toll like the strokes of a death knell in his tortured brain:

"the heart of his agony would be loneliness", "the loneliness

remained", "loneliness was poisoning him" (41), "he was unbearably lonely" (42).

Even when his grandfather's death has at least prevented his suicide,

"He lived on increasingly lonely. One cannot write these words too often: Maurice's loneliness: it increased." (43)

And there is a final echo when it seems that Scudder will inevitably emigrate:

"Nothing had changed in his life. Nothing remained in it. He was back with his loneliness as it had been before Clive, as it was after Clive, and would now be forever." (44)

Enough has been said to show how pervasive is this group of images related in mood to the symphony which

"dies away and ends in the darkness from which it had originally emerged." (45)

At least, unlike the symphony, the novel ends on a note of happiness, though the feeling remains that Lytton Strachey was right when he declared that "the relationship rested upon curiosity and lust and would only last six weeks." (46)

And it is Lytton Strachey who provides a final, but rather more light-hearted, comment on the symphony. His character supplied Forster with the basis for Risley's (47). Strachey himself apparently possessed little technical knowledge of music, but had a great love for it, which he probably inherited from

his mother (48). He could enjoy a concert by Paderewski (49), be moved to tears by memories evoked by a Schubert Quartet (50), sense the "exquisiteness" of Mozart (51), whose Don Giovanni caused him to declare to be "the greatest artist who ever lived" (52), and write appreciatively of a book by Stanford (53). It is thus appropriate that "his" room should contain "a castle of pianola records" (54) (one of the details too that Forster feels gives the novel a somewhat dated flavour) (55), and, in view of his notorious homosexual activities (which reflect more than a little of Maurice's own loneliness), doubly appropriate that he should possess the "Pathétique" and attend a concert which includes it (56). It is, however, Strachey's wickedly delicious wit and sense of the ironic that surfaces in Risley's remarks afterwards:

" 'Symphonie Pathique', said Risley gaily.
 'Symphony Pathetic,' corrected the Philistine.
 'Symphonie Incestueuse et Pathique I come to see all respectable London flock. Isn't it supreme!' "
 (57)

In addition to the sequence of images and associations relating to the symphony, there remains a small number of references which, either directly or indirectly, have music as their basis. "Some men singing" (58) form part of the Cambridge atmosphere which warms Maurice after the experiences of his Prep. and Public Schools, just as the "costly hymn-tune", the bell of St. Mary's and "the familiar mistakes in a Beethoven sonata" had

soothed Rickie (59), while the group going into dinner at Penge form an "absurd octet" (60) redolent of Mrs. Failing's comic opera view of her farm. More important is the piano which, recalling the pianola and its memories of Cambridge, Durham has at Penge (61). Comment has already been made in passing on how the rain which falls on it, not to mention the futile attempts to dry its inside with blotting paper (62), symbolizes the blight which has fallen on his relationship with Maurice; further, the move the rain necessitates provides one of the incidents whereby Maurice becomes aware of "the croucher beside the piano" (63), and is one that Scudder himself reminds Maurice of (64).

Less obvious is a further connection with Howards End and The Longest Journey. It has been seen how Stephen possesses certain heroic attributes derived from Wagner's Siegfried, attributes which are to some extent continued in Margaret. Something of the same quality resides in Maurice. It is hinted at when he is "in the heroics" (65) over Mr. Cornwallis, but particularly manifests itself towards the end of the novel in his attitude to Scudder who is "not a hero" (66), and who must finally "bring out the hero in him." (67)

It has been remarked elsewhere how in Forster an apparently dead metaphor can assume a new life (68) and this continues to apply in Maurice. "In unison" has a nice precision when used to describe Mrs. Durham and Mrs. Hall visiting the Royal Academy (69), where it conveys a remarkable coincidence of

viewpoint and an almost military exactness of movement, while "their unison" (70) (used of Scudder and Maurice at the British Museum) well suggests not only a like identity of movement but also an unexpected oneness of spirit as against the superficial antagonism of mind.

The diversity of situation in which Forster employs some variant of a metaphor dependent on "harmony" might, however, seem to contradict this view, yet in almost every case he appears to be alert to specific suggestions in its use. Thus, when everything goes well at Maurice's send-off from Sunnington,

"Everyone and everything had suddenly harmonized" (71),

and the feeling conveyed by the key-word is one of blending, complementing, and completeness such as harmony, as opposed to discord, does produce. When Maurice's "dull talk" and "unimportant meeting" with Scudder "harmonized with the darkness" (72) the emphasis is on the likeness of impression rather than comprehensiveness, as is the case with the "virility" which harmonizes Maurice's body and face (73). The idea of completeness is perhaps more apparent in the "harmony" that succeeds Durham's "asceticism" (74) and relates importantly to the quality that resides in Margaret. It is when this quality transcends the individual and overflows to engulf another that the metaphor takes on its fullest meaning. Love, for Durham, sure at last that he is loved in return, becomes "harmonious, immense" (75) and he

achieves with Maurice a Platonic

"harmony of body and soul that women (may not) have even guessed." (76)

In many ways then Maurice, from a musical point of view, continues, though in modified form, techniques Forster had employed in Howards End. The uniqueness of the material, however, has provided him with opportunities for suggestion through music unparalleled elsewhere in his output.

*** *** ***

NOTES to CHAPTER 6

- 1) Edward Arnold Ltd., London, with Introduction by P.N.Furbank, and a Terminal Note by Forster.
- 2) The abortive Arctic Summer of 1912-13 was never completed.
- 3) M, Chapter 6, p. 39.
- 4) M, Chapter 32.
- 5) Letter from Tschaikowsky to Bobyk, 11th/23rd February 1893, widely quoted in biographies. The translation here, except for the last sentence, is taken from: Edward Garden, Tchaikowsky, J.M.Dent and Sons, Ltd., London, 1973, Chapter 12, p. 139. The last sentence from: Herbert Weinstock, Tchaikowsky, Cassell and Co., Ltd., London, 1946, Chapter 18, p. 340.
- 6) M, Chapter 32, p. 141.
- 7) His first suggestion of "Tragic" was rejected by Tschaikowsky.
- 8) See Edwin Evans, Tchaikowsky, J.M. Dent and Sons Ltd., London, revised edition, 1966, Chapter 9, p. 121.
- 9) Ibid., p. 122. See also Garden, op. cit., p. 145.
- 10) M, Chapter 32, p. 141.
- 11) Evans, op. cit., p. 122.
- 12) See Weinstock, op. cit., Chapter 19, p. 350.
- 13) M, Chapter 6, p. 37.
- 14) Ibid., p. 38.
- 15) Ibid.
- 16) Ibid., p. 39.
- 17) Ibid., pp. 38-39.
- 18) Ibid., p. 39.
- 19) There is in fact no such direction in the whole of the symphony; presumably he means the Adagio Lamentoso which carries the marking "largamente" for the strings.
- 20) M, Chapter 32, p. 141.
- 21) Ibid.
- 22) Philharmonia Minature Score, pp. 133-5.

- 23) M, Chapter 6, p. 41.
- 24) M, Chapter 11, p. 60.
- 25) M, Chapter 18, p. 91.
- 26) M, Chapter 26, p. 120.
- 27) M, Chapter 30, p. 132.
- 28) HE, Chapter 14, p. 111.
- 29) M, Chapter 34, p. 149.
- 30) M, Chapter 43, p. 192.
- 31) M, Chapter 45, p. 208.
- 32) M, Chapter 46, p. 214.
- 33) See (25).
- 34) M, Chapter 27, p. 123.
- 35) M, Chapter 46, p. 213.
- 36) As, for instance, over Ada (M, Chapter 26, p. 119.)
- 37) In Durham's metaphysical speculations (M, Chapter 21, p. 101.)
- 38) M, Chapter 43, p. 198.
- 39) M, Chapter 9, p. 56.
- 40) M, Chapter 6, p. 38.
- 41) M, Chapter 26, p. 120.
- 42) Ibid., p. 121.
- 43) M, Chapter 28, p. 125.
- 44) M, Chapter 44, p. 204.
- 45) Garden, op. cit., Chapter 12, p. 149.
- 46) Forster's Terminal Note, p. 219.
- 47) Ibid.
- 48) See Michael Holroyd: Lytton Strachey by Himself, a Self-Portrait, Heinemann, London, 1971, p. 14.
- 49) C.R. Sanders, Lytton Strachey, His Mind and His Art, Yale University Press, 1957, Chapter 1, p. 15.
- 50) Ibid., p. 36, footnote 25.
- 51) Ibid., Chapter 7, p. 181.

- 52) Michael Holroyd: Lytton Strachey: A Biography, Heinemann, London, 1971, Chapter 11, p. 559.
- 53) "Music and Men", Spectator, 101 (December 19th, 1908), pp. 1059-60.
- 54) M, Chapter 6, p. 37.
- 55) See Forster's Terminal Note, p. 221. It might, however, be preferable to describe the detail as giving a "period" rather than a "dated" flavour, since it is feelings, attitudes, beliefs which "date", not objects.
- 56) M, Chapter 32, p. 141. P.N.Furbank assures me in a note that though, as I have suggested, Strachey would have taken a wicked delight in seeing "all respectable London flock" to a performance of the Pathétique, he would have thought the work itself "dreadfully sentimental."
- 57) Ibid. The effect of Risley's comments has already been noted.
- 58) M, Chapter 5, p. 32.
- 59) LJ, Chapter 6, p. 63.
- 60) M, Chapter 16, p. 83.
- 61) Ibid.
- 62) M, Chapter 34, p. 149.
- 63) Forster's Terminal Note, p. 220.
- 64) M, Chapter 38, p. 174.
- 65) M, Chapter 14, p. 75.
- 66) M, Chapter 45, p. 205.
- 67) Ibid., p. 208.
- 68) See Chapter 4 above.
- 69) M, Chapter 19, p. 92.
- 70) M, Chapter 43, p. 195.
- 71) M, Chapter 4, p. 29.
- 72) M, Chapter 37, p. 166.
- 73) M, Chapter 21, p. 103.
- 74) M, Chapter 12, p. 68.
- 75) Ibid., p. 70.
- 76) M, Chapter 16, p. 84.

CHAPTER 7 : A PASSAGE TO INDIA

A PASSAGE TO INDIA (1924) is undoubtedly Forster's best known novel, and, in the main, the one that has received the greatest critical acclaim. For Kettle it is his "most successful novel" (1), Stone sees it as "perhaps the greatest English novel of this century as an aesthetic accomplishment" (2), while Burra considers it "one of the most aesthetically compact books ever written." (3) Yet the acclaim has been far from undiluted. It has already been seen that for Trilling Howards End is Forster's masterpiece (4), whereas A Passage to India is "the most comfortable and even the most conventional of Forster's novels" not to mention "the least surprising." (5) Priestley finds that "a certain curious evocative power present in Howards End has not been entirely recaptured" (6), while Rose Macaulay makes "the serious charge" that the novel is defective in "its drawing of people" (7), and more important than all Forster himself has said that he felt as he finished the novel "this is a failure." (8) Some of the slight feelings of dissatisfaction are, no doubt, due in part to the history of its composition, Forster having begun the novel in 1912, been interrupted by the war, and then found continuation impossible until he could stand back and observe from afar the experiences of his second visit to India. (9) Yet, despite its flaws, it is certainly "the most inclusive and ranging" of the

novels and although containing clear developments along earlier lines of Forster's thought "is considerably different from any of (his) earlier works"; "and as it is adventurous in matter, so it is in technique." (10)

Nowhere else in the novels is this adventurousness of technique more apparent than in Forster's use of music, yet it may be as well to consider first certain aspects of its use which are adumbrated in its predecessors in order that the great advances along new lines may be the more clearly seen.

All the racial groups in A Passage to India come under the lash, albeit tempered, of Forster's satire, but it is probably the "Anglo-Indians" who suffer most. Although that community contribute "an amateur orchestra" (11) to the club, the Arts in general are "bad form", and those that do appear are represented by single annual performances of such masterpieces as Cousin Kate, Quality Street and The Yeomen of the Guard, literature being left severely alone (12). Ronny has to repress his mother "when she enquired after his viola" for

"a viola was almost a demerit, and certainly not the sort of instrument one mentioned in public." (13)

Such incidents mark the half-hearted gestures that the group make towards a culture for which they have no real feeling, their lack of any real taste, and the insidious effect that an insularity (for which Forster allows a partial justification) has on their relationships with the other communities. Miss

Derek goes so far as to regard "the entire peninsula as a comic opera" (14), much in the same way as Mrs. Failing did her farm, and, it must be confessed, as Forster a little did Dewas on his first visit (15).

Nowhere is Anglo-Indian insularity, superiority and intractability more apparent than on the various occasions when the National Anthem occurs. After the performance of Cousin Kate is ended

"conversation and billiards stopped, faces stiffened. It was the Anthem of the Army of Occupation. It reminded every member of the club that he or she was British and in exile. It produced a little sentiment and a useful accession of will-power. The meagre tune (16), the curt series of demands on Jehovah, fused into a prayer unknown in England, and though they perceived neither Royalty nor Deity they did perceive something, they were strengthened to resist another day. Then they poured out, offering one another drinks." (17)

One wonders whether such emphasis on the importance of a National Anthem in the establishment of morale had any effect on the production of the two separate Anthems for the two Dewas States (18). Certainly it is the exhortations of the National Anthem that alone will make Ronny approve of religion, and object to it when "it attempted to influence his life" (19). No wonder that Fielding realizes that

" 'white' has no more to do with colour than 'God Save the King' with a god" (20),

nor equally that Adela's hope that

"God who saves the King will surely support the police"
(21)

proves abortive if the police are the Heaslops and McBrydes of this world.

This use of music, perhaps better described as belonging to farce rather than satire, finds extension in the harmonium (and two dogs) which by her own "little mistake" accompanies Miss Derek in the car which she has gleefully purloined from the Maharajah of Mudkul (22), and behind which the Nawab Bahadur (whose good breeding insists he ignore such a suspicion) fears the City Magistrate may be fondling either maiden (23). But it is rare for Forster to use music purely for comic effect as, to cite only one earlier instance, the Queen's Hall concert in Howards End shows. As early as Where Angels Fear to Tread, he had used attitude to music to differentiate racial characteristics of English and Italians, and just as here the National Anthem and Gilbert and Sullivan typify certain qualities of the English which cut them off from Moham- medan and Hindu, so too does music separate the latter groups (24). Early on Aziz realizes that some drumming is Hindu and not Moslem

"because the rhythm was uncongenial to him" (25);

the "song" that he recites voicing loneliness is "less explicit than the call to Krishna" (26); he feels that if the Emperor

Babur had

"only one musical instrument, he would compel it to play a beautiful tune" (27);

and when, after being flattered to "sing" again, he envisages a

"song of the future" that "must transcend creed" (28),

the "song" never gets written, yet he can remark, in reply to

Fielding's idea that Hindus have perhaps found something in

religion that may be worth recording in poetry,

"Hindus are unable to sing." (29)

And it is with the introduction of the Hindu element into the novel that Forster's most fascinating and complex use of music begins to manifest itself. Adela, infuriated by the "Bridge Party" which does nothing to enable her to see "the real India" (30), is overjoyed when Fielding suggests the possibility of her hearing "an old professor down at the College, who sang" (31). The whole interpretation of the function of Professor Godbole's singing in A Passage to India hinges on the view one takes of this enigmatic character, and the views of him are as varied as those of the novel as a whole. At one end of the scale lies David Shusterman who feels that

"far from being an influence for good, his is an influence which is non-beneficial and, if not primarily and consciously evil, is at least in the direction of evil"

and who develops a strong, if provocative, case for establishing that

"the groundwork for almost all the evil that is established in the novel is laid by Godbole's reluctance, whether

deliberate or not, to say anything that matters about the Marabar Caves." (32)

A slightly less condemnatory position is taken up by Nirad Chaudhuri who asserts that

"to those of us who are familiar with the teachings of the Hindu reformers of the nineteenth century, Godbole is not an exponent of Hinduism, he is a clown" (33).

For Stone (of whom more later) he is a "mild and mystical absent-minded Professor" (34), while it must never be forgotten that Forster was far from being a whole-hearted admirer of Hinduism, and preferred Islam (35). Yet Godbole was apparently modelled on a friend (36), and if Stone's identification is correct, a remarkable one at that, a fact which would tend to militate against Shusterman's view of him. The question is thus so fraught with difficulties that it must be approached with extreme caution and attention to detail.

Until Professor Godbole's arrival at Fielding's tea party, Aziz has been the centre of attention, and even then he is only "quieted somewhat" (37). The Brahman remains polite, encouraging, yet slightly detached, and takes his food as if encountering it by accident (38). It is his appearance, however, that is the most suggestive:

"He wore a turban that looked like pale purple macaroni, coat, waistcoat, dhoti, socks with clocks. The clocks matched the turban, and his whole appearance suggested harmony - as if he had reconciled the products of East

and West, mental as well as physical, and could never be discomposed." (39)

Perhaps, indeed, Professor Godbole had achieved such a harmony, but the physical description as a whole has a somewhat ludicrous tinge, and the word "suggested" conveys a faint impression that the implied harmony may in fact be illusory.

After Adela's unthinking bombshell (to her "in key" with the rest of the conversation) that she cannot settle in India (40), it is Aziz's attempt to offer her something typically India to detain her, equivalent to Professor Godbole's sweets, that provokes his invitation to the Marabar Caves. When it appears that Aziz has in fact never visited them, Adela asks Professor Godbole (who regards this task as "a great honour") (41) to describe them, yet as "he drew up his chair an expression of tension came over his face" (42). The sum total of the information supplied by Godbole, despite helpful promptings from Aziz, is that the caves are not large, they have entrances through rock, there are no sculptures, they are not holy, not ornamented, have no stalactites, and yet their fame is not quite an "empty brag" (43). Almost every statement is, in effect, a statement of what the caves are not. Unbeknown to Adela

"the comparatively simple mind of the Mohammedan was encountering Ancient Night" (44)

and the more Aziz tries the further he gets from discovering what is "extraordinary" (a key word in the novel) about the Marabar

Caves.

Into the gathering drops Ronny to destroy "the secure and intimate note" (45) of the last hour, so that Aziz becomes increasingly provocative and "everything he said had an impertinent flavour or jarred" (46). Fielding sees the four - Ronny, Aziz, Adela, Godbole - as a "strange quartet" (47) from a play (though the phrase also obviously has operatic overtones, each character giving out simultaneously an individual "theme"), and realizes that "everyone was cross or wretched" (48).

"There seemed no reserve of tranquillity to draw upon in India. Either none, or else tranquillity swallowed up everything, as it appeared to do for Professor Godbole" (49).

It is at this point of leave-taking, in a scene which Kettle sees important enough to quote from at length (50), that the revelation of a new dimension in Forster's use of music appears (51) and it is vital that the scene should be examined both in the light of the comments of Kettle and other illuminating critics, and from additional points of view that may have been ignored or insufficiently emphasized:

"Inspired by the devil to a final effort, he added, 'What a shame you leave India so soon! Oh! do reconsider your decision, do stay.'

'Good-bye, Professor Godbole,' she continued, suddenly agitated. 'It's a shame we never heard you sing.'

'I may sing now,' he replied, and did.

His thin voice rose, and gave out one sound after another. At times there seemed rhythm, at times there was the illusion of a Western melody. But the ear, baffled repeatedly, soon lost any clue, and wandered in a maze of noises, none harsh or unpleasant, none intelligible. It was the song of an unknown bird.

Only the servants understood it. They began to whisper to one another. The man who was gathering water chestnut came naked out of the tank, his lips parted with delight, disclosing his scarlet tongue. The sounds continued and ceased after a few moments as casually as they had begun - apparently half through a bar, and upon the sub-dominant.

'Thanks so much; what was that?' asked Fielding.

'I will explain in detail. It was a religious song. I placed myself in the position of a milkmaiden. I say to Shri Krishna, "Come! come to me only." The god refuses to come. I grow humble and say: "Do not come to me only. Multiply yourself into a hundred Krishnas, and let one go to each of my hundred companions, but one, O Lord of the Universe, come to me." He refuses to come. This is repeated several times. The song is composed in a raga appropriate to the present hour, which is the evening.'

'But he comes in some other song, I hope?' said Mrs. Moore gently.

'Oh no, he refuses to come,' repeated Godbole, perhaps not understanding her question. 'I say to him,

'Come, come, come, come, come, come. He neglects to come.'

Ronny's steps had died away, and there was a moment of absolute silence. No ripple disturbed the water, no leaf stirred." (52)

On what may be described as the more immediately appreciable level, Kettle praises the superb manner, characterised by extreme economy, and careful selection of significant detail, with which Forster conveys that mysterious impression which is, if only in part, India. He remarks on "the strangeness to Western people" (and indeed to the Moslems, one should add) of the song. The nature of the strangeness needs elaborating. It lies first in the quality of the voice, which Forster calls "thin", and it is true, as far as any such generalisation can be, that Indian voices, partly from the point of view of pronunciation and partly from that of intonation, are unsympathetic to Western ears in a way that those of many other nationalities are not. Next there are the characteristics of Indian, as opposed to European, music itself. Similarities both of rhythm and melody may be present but the ear is "baffled repeatedly", and the raga ceases "casually apparently half through a bar and upon the sub-dominant" (53). By its very nature the raga suggests the possibilities, as well as the difficulties, of connection between East and West, and produces the thought that no Indian music could possess the finality and completeness that, for a European, say, Beethoven's 5th Symphony does, just as nothing and no one can finally sum up India.

"Only the servants understood it", says Forster, yet this too is surely true only on a certain level. The song is a "religious song" and each will interpret it according to

his caste and sect. But the song has a reverberation far beyond what the original raga may have intended, for as it is religious, so, in a sense, is the novel; it raises the whole question of the real values of Christianity, Islam and Hinduism, and presents a Sphinx-like enigma in the form of the Caves. Godbole places himself in the position of a milkmaid. It is interesting that he decides (and decision is not the first quality one thinks of in connection with Godbole) to sing not only to convey to Adela a sense of a wider India than she has experienced hitherto, but also, perhaps because of what Stone calls his "limitless compassion" (54), to cover her sudden agitation at the exposure of the decision she has not yet communicated to Ronny. If the prime association with Krishna is that he "makes the world whole by love" (55), then there are certainly specific suggestions implicit in the song for Adela. She must, like the milkmaid, pray for love - her main quality being, surely, a likeable, frank, intellectuality, though somewhat lacking in warmth. Yet she must be humble, not expect that love will manifest itself in the form she expects nor, indeed, that it will come to her at all - as it does not. Mrs. Moore, her Christianity as yet unshattered by the Caves, asks if, perhaps, like Christ he comes in some other song. Godbole "perhaps" does not understand the question. Again one is up against the problem of Godbole's real nature. Perhaps he has just never considered a philosophy other than his own where everything, good and evil alike, is part of creation, and he,

the Brahman, too can be "separated from his god" (56). But there lurks the suspicion that Godbole's mythology is not quite so self-sufficient as Kettle might have us believe. (57) The tension on his face when asked to describe the caves has already been remarked on, and Beer feels that the old Hindu tradition of love which Godbole represents and which by extension may even express

"the earth's yearning for the heavens," (58) (and which finds voice in his song) "cannot cope with the intractability of the Caves," (59)

while Brower goes so far as to put forward the idea that the song "suggests the baffling Caves and their echoes." (60)

Indeed, this relationship between song and echo undoubtedly forms part of what may be seen as one of Forster's principal objectives in planning the overall structure of the novel, namely, the reverberations between the individual "movements" such as he envisaged occurring in Beethoven's 5th Symphony.

Of course, the scene is, in another sense, structurally very important. It comes at a satisfyingly appropriate point to complete, with its Hindu element, Forster's initial picture of India. Ronny's "failure to listen to the song" (61) makes Adela realize "how gross he has been" (62), and the scene "marks a turning point in (the) feelings" (63) both of Adela and Mrs. Moore. But Kettle is right to pin-point what is perhaps the most important element in the scene:

"The song itself winds its way into the texture of the novel. 'I say to him, Come, come, come, come, come, come. He neglects to come'.

He neglects to come throughout the novel." (64)

And especially, as Gertrude White says, does Krishna's refusal to come pose the problem for the second section, "Caves" (65).

Yet before passing on to examine the problems of these windings, one last word must be said about this memorable description. It ends with a moment of absolute silence - the kind of silence that Mozart regarded as greater than the sound which had preceded it. This is a final exquisite detail which demonstrates incomparably Forster's power for what Burra calls his use of images "to suggest, by association, more than they themselves signify." (66)

As, then, with Beethoven's 5th Symphony in Howards End and, to a lesser extent, Tschaikowsky's "Pathétique" in Maurice, Professor Godbole's song produces, though in a very much more intricate manner, endless echoes and reverberations throughout the novel. Indeed on occasion care must be taken not always to ascribe such echoes to conscious, intellectual effort (though often they do obviously arise from it) and one is reminded of Forster's own warning that "People will not realize how little conscious one is of these things (i.e. technical clevernesses); how one flounders about" (67), and of Sibelius' apparent surprise when it was pointed out to him that the glorious

theme which provides the culmination of his 5th Symphony is, with the difference of one note, adumbrated in the double bass part of the preceding movement. (68)

It is in this spirit, and perhaps with half an eye on Frederick Crews's "The Pooh Perplex" (69), that "come" must be approached. Stone, in a fascinating section on the novel (70), draws attention to the way that eye-flies rather than electricity had "come" to Aziz's bungalow (71). On one level this shadows the way that Indian creatures (epitomized in the wasp) have no "sense of an interior," (72) but on a pathetically deeper, and bitterly ironic one, it travesties the god who does not. Bitingly satiric is Hamidullah's exclamation of "He comes, he comes, he comes, I cringe, I tremble" (73) at the approach of Ronny Heaslop in his guise of City Magistrate, rather than lover, to Adela. Stone does not have space to elaborate on the word's ramifications at this point, but the page and its sequels positively bristle with them. Thus the slightly less biting comment of the barrister on Heaslop's approach:

" 'Here comes the City Magistrate. He comes in a third-class Band-ghari for the purpose of disguise, he comes unattended, but here comes the City Magistrate'." (74)

Hamidullah's air is one of almost amused contempt for Ronny: for Adela, in what he regards as her lack of consideration for Fielding and of proper pride, it is more hostile.

When Fielding reports that Ronny "prefers not to come in" and Adela asks, "Does he tell me to come out to him?" Hamidullah retorts:

"Whether he tells you or not, you will go, I think." (75)

Adela feels that, after Fielding's kindness, "It was insulting of (Ronny) not to come in", but Fielding, seeing his side of the case after the incident at the club, and especially, the recent news of Mrs. Moore's death, perceives that "Heaslop doesn't come out badly." (76)

However, the news of Mrs. Moore's death causes Adela to beg Fielding to allow her to remain at the College and "come and see Ronny again." (77)

" 'I think he should come in this time', said Fielding, feeling that this much was due to his own dignity. 'Do ask him to come.' " (78)

Come he does, but only for the while, for the love, which Ronny and Adela had hoped existed has finally been shown to have been an illusion, and the mind goes back to their drive along the Marabar, rather than the Gangavati Road, where the inferiority of the items in the scenery had in vain called out to them " 'Come, come.' There was not enough god to go round." (79)

Stone does, however, include the way in which the word "enters the idiom of the British" (80), citing Fielding's

"Come along, Aziz, old man" (81), (though here, perhaps, one feels a slight over-stating of a case) and the Inspector's "Ah, thank God, he comes" (82)(which seems more appropriate because of the nature of the phraseology) (83). Such "pathetic or comic variants", to use Stone's phrase, pale into insignificance when India who

"knows of the whole world's trouble, to its uttermost depth" also calls " 'come' through her hundred mouths, through objects ridiculous and august. But come to what? She has never defined. She is not a promise, only an appeal." (84)

Perhaps Professor Godbole does, in the end, come closest to one aspect of what her "appeal" is really about. With his belief that

"absence implies presence, absence is not non-existence
..... we are entitled to repeat, 'Come, come,
come, come'"(85),

and as Fielding asks Aziz if "the old fellow is still saying 'Come, come,'" (86), so at the end of his great moment he is (87). But as that moment is inextricably bound up with the festival of Gokul Ashtami and its attendant music, it will be better to reserve final judgment on this point till the full significance of that festival is examined.

Nevertheless, confronted, and perhaps overcome, as he is by the multitudinous appearances of the word, it is necessary for the reader to step back to see what, exactly, from

a musical point of view, its function is. Stone's phrase "pathetic and comic variants" supplies a clue. The word is not so much a leitmotif in a Wagnerian sense; that is, it is not associated with one particular person or idea, even though it originates primarily in Professor Godbole's song. It is rather like a theme which, as often in Liszt (the Second Piano Concerto is a wonderful example), is metamorphosed and in the process undergoes complete transformations of character. Of course, a single word like "come", unlike a theme, cannot be metamorphosed; what changes is the context, and it is the context which produces the metamorphosis. The effects in Liszt are a cohesion of material, a sense of growth, and an eventual unification of the whole, and it is the same goals towards which Forster is striving.

Meanwhile, as has been said, no such word with the importance that "come" (88) has in the novel functions in isolation (as is also true with a Liszt main theme), and before one can see Professor Godbole's visionary moment in perspective, it is necessary to examine the implications of another associated word, again fraught with implications of sound. That word is "echo". It is a word inseparable from the Marabar Caves, and, as with Professor Godbole, considerable problems exist as to the symbolic function they fulfil. Forster, in his Notes to the Everyman Edition (89) has said that "Mosque", "Caves", and "Temple"

"also represent the three seasons of the Cold Weather, the Hot Weather, and the Rains, which divide the Indian year".

"Also" has given critics ample room for further speculation. Obviously "Mosque" and "Temple" have Moslem and Hindu connotations with all that association by comparison and contrast, both within and without the respective sections, can evoke. There is thus a certain logic in linking "Caves" with the Anglo-Indians and their associated characteristics, (among which, as has been seen, is their negative attitude to music) as Allen has done (90), though as Stone has pointed out (91) no so completely restrictive an interpretation can be imposed upon them.

Forster himself describes them as

"an area in which concentration can take place. A cavity. They were something to focus everything up; they were to engender an event like an egg." (92)

And this they indeed do, but from a musical point of view certain phrases of critics are more evocative. Trilling, for instance, speaks of their "negating mass" (93), Stone their "unspeakable nothingness" (94), Beer their "nightmarish nullity" (95). What is to prove vital is the transformation that Professor Godbole's song and all that it implies will undergo (as does everything else) in the Caves.

The terrifying and shattering effect that they are to have, particularly on the two women, is prepared for in part by the fact that

"It so happened that Mrs. Moore and Miss Quested had felt nothing acutely for a fortnight. Ever since Professor

Godbole had sung his queer little song, they had lived more or less inside cocoons, and the difference between them was that the elderly lady accepted her own apathy, while the younger resented hers." (96)

Moreover, this statement establishes at once a similarity in kind, though not, of course, in degree, between the women's individual experiences during that song, and those at the Caves. But the echo they are to hear at Marabar is anticipated too by Adela when, confronted by friendly Indians at the "Bridge Party",

"she tried to make them talk, but she failed, she strove in vain against the echoing walls of their civility" (97);

and by Mrs. Moore, with her growing need in old age for God, when Forster, in one of those remarkable images suggesting limitless expansions of space and time, describes her as realizing that

"Outside the arch there seemed always an arch, beyond the remotest echo a silence." (98)

Echoes also of "Krishna the earth, Krishna the stars replied" (99) comment sardonically on Ronny's mock anger with his peon who had failed to bring up files of little importance.

The first of the anticipations again strengthens the link between the echo of the Caves and that almost indefinable, enigmatic quality presented to the Anglo-Indians by the Indians, and epitomized in the song; the second provides an early example of the technique Forster employs to such effect at its end, namely the use of silence. It is generally accepted that one of the

tyro's commonest faults in elementary composition is his inattention to the necessity for rests, and it is almost as if, in this novel, Forster is becoming increasingly aware of the need for strengthening the impact of his uses of music by the addition of silences. The reiteration of "Krishna", of course, provides yet another ramification of the song which contributes to the functions that "come" has been seen to have, but it also foreshadows later, more important uses of word-repetition which can, at times, resemble the insistence in music on a particular figure (as occurs, for instance, in the first movement of Beethoven's "Pastoral").

Just as there are pre-echoes in "Mosque" of what is to happen in "Caves", so the approach to the caves themselves contains hints of their

"archetypal emptiness preceding existence itself." (100)

The impending dawn over the hills which promises so much turns into "a profound disappointment".

"Why, when the chamber was prepared, did the bridegroom not enter with trumpets and shawns, as humanity expects?" (101)

As the party moves closer to the hills

"a new quality occurred, a spiritual silence which invaded more senses than the ear. Life went on as usual, but had no consequences, that is to say, sounds did not echo or thoughts develop. Everything seemed cut off at its root, and therefore infected with illusion." (102)

No wonder that Aziz despite his "gay, confident talk" (103) is, like the Anglo-Indians, lost without Professor Godbole. Here, then, is further evidence of Forster's increasing use of silence (and, indeed, at this point near-silence also) in a quasi-musical way, since the general subduing of sound in certain of these phrases coupled with the suggestion of its ultimate elimination in the others provides a hushed prelude against which the explosion in the cave can achieve its maximum effect.

When the caves are actually entered it is Mrs. Moore who has the first shatteringly undermining experience, an experience which Wilde sees as "the climax of the novel" (104). It begins with the claustrophobic effect of her being crammed against villagers and servants, and smelling their attendant stench. She gets lost, is touched by unknown people, cannot breathe and is struck in the face by "some vile naked thing" that "settled on her mouth like a pad." (105) But not even all this, coupled with her difficulty in getting out, and her hitting her head really causes her momentary panic. It is the "terrifying echo", the echo which, perhaps because it had never impressed him, or perhaps because he realized what an impact it might have, Professor Godbole had omitted to mention. This echo is not one of the "exquisite" echoes of India.

"It is entirely devoid of distinction. Whatever is said, the same monotonous noise replies, and quivers up and down the walls until it is absorbed into the roof.

'Boum' is the sound as far as the human alphabet can

express it, or 'bou-oum', or 'ou-boum', - utterly dull. Hope, politeness, the blowing of a nose, the squeak of a boot, all produce 'boum'. Even the striking of a match starts a little worm coiling, which is too small to complete a circle, but is eternally watchful. And if several people talk at once, an overlapping howling noise begins, echoes generate echoes, and the cave is stuffed with a snake composed of small snakes, which writhe independently." (106)

Her experience is thus nothing less than complete undermining of "her hold on life". She feels now that "Everything exists, nothing has value"; all that she had once considered worthwhile seems meaningless, and she realizes that the divine words " 'Let there be light' to 'It is finished' " of "poor little talkative Christianity" only amounts to "boum." (107) In Wilde's words

"her desire to communicate disappears, and she sinks into a profound state of cynical indifference, able only barely to keep herself from complete engulfment." (108)

Now, if any word provides the key to the heart of Christianity it is "love", and it has already been seen that Krishna is primarily associated with that concept. The reduction by the echo of Christianity to "boum" therefore implies a similar reduction of Hinduism to a like meaninglessness, and as the "love" element in Hinduism has been expressed in Professor Godbole's song, the echo itself can be seen as a distortion of the original song and its associations, indeed

almost, one might say, a retrograde version of its "theme" in the sense that its conclusion is the very reverse of what the original proposed.

An immediate result of Mrs. Moore's experience is that Adela goes on with only Aziz and a guide, in the course of which tour "they lit a match, admired its reflection in the polish, tested the echo and came out again." (109) Among her thoughts are not only "tiresome wedding bells" (110) but also an echo of a different kind; the echo of a vision of the "pattern traced in the dust by the wheel of the Nawab Bahadur's car" in "the rock nicked by a double row of footholds." (111) It is this echo (112) which makes her realize that she and Ronny do not love each other, a fact which, followed as it is, by thoughts of Aziz's wives, children and good looks, precipitates her own experience in the cave. To shout for her in the caves when she is lost, both physically and spiritually, is useless for

"a Marabar cave can hear no sound but its own" (113), and again present here is a sense of the Caves exerting a negating effect on the yearning for love expressed in Professor Godbole's song.

The echo which is taken up in the discussion between Fielding and McBryde over Aziz's guilt (114) thus has a duality; it is the echo of the cave and of an unconscious feeling

brought to the level of consciousness by external associations, and it is these significances that Fielding expects that he "presently would know." (115) Adela, as yet, does not fully realize them. In reply to solicitous enquiries, she describes how

" 'I remember scratching the wall with my finger-nail, to start the usual echo, and then, as I was saying, there was this shadow (116), or sort of shadow, down the entrance tunnel, bottling me up'." (117)

Her tears, her breakdowns, all signal her inner confusion, and while her logic will win for a while

"she would hear the echo again, weep, declare she was unworthy of Ronny, and hope her assailant would get the maximum penalty." (118)

And because she cannot consult Mrs. Moore, the echo with its association of evil, intensified by the sound of her falling field-glasses "spouting" after her, flourishes. Indeed, when Adela and Mrs. Moore do eventually meet, it is only the mention of the echo which eventually arouses that decaying lady's attention. She knows perfectly well what the implications of the echo for Adela are, yet she expects her to realize them herself, and irritably, even bitterly, refuses to help her. (119) But her outbursts over young people asking questions and expecting answers and "all this rubbish about love, love in a church, love in a cave" (120) cause Adela to utter Aziz's name, rather than the hitherto customary Anglo-Indian circumlocutions and

"the sound of it now rang out like the first note of a new symphony." (121)

And the appropriateness of the simile is irrefutable, for the whole course of the plot is henceforth to be switched. Adela's echo is better, and once it is, the possibility at least of the love implicit in Professor Godbole's song returns.

For the bodily Mrs. Moore, however, the feeling of the echo "ending everything," (122) remains, she has had "the twilight of the double vision" (123), and "the undying worm" aroused by the Marabar gong has reduced all to "Boum" (124). Yet as she sails away the coconut palms laugh

" 'So you thought an echo was India; you took the Marabar Caves as final?' " (125)

Of course they are not, and the spirit of Mrs. Moore remains to prove it. The agony and uncertainty attendant upon the severe return of Adela's echo on the day of the trial (126) begins to be dispelled as the chant (with its repetitions redolent of "come" and "Krishna") of Mrs. Moore's name, metamorphosed into the Hindu goddess "Esmis Esmoor", rises, her mind clears, and she withdraws the charge.

In her characteristically frank explanation of what has happened to Fielding, Adela confesses that her "echo has gone" (127), but what is more interesting is that she realizes that her being "unwell" antedates the episode in the caves and

originated at his tea-party:

" 'I enjoyed the singing but just about then a sort of sadness began that I couldn't detect at the time' " (128).

This irrefutably establishes that Professor Godbole's song and the Marabar echo are vitally connected links in the same long chain.

For Fielding, as he is re-accepted into the club at the insistence of the Lieutenant-Governor, thoughts about Anglo-India, about life in general, are bitter:

" 'Everything echoes now; there's no stopping the echo. The original sound may be harmless, but the echo is always evil.' This reflection about an echo lay at the verge of Fielding's mind. He could never develop it. It belonged to the universe that he had missed or rejected." (129)

It is a statement that expresses dissatisfaction not only with the people he lives among, the people he would be friends with were it possible, the recent events, even India (and the world as a whole that by extension it represents), but also some indefinable lack that he as an Anglo-Indian, albeit an unusual one, senses within his own character, a something that perhaps in different ways, the Mrs. Moore and Professor Godbole of the final section possess, however much the sense of incompleteness present in the latter's original song may be related to this feeling. For with "Caves" the specific echoes vanish, and with "Temple"

comes some little hope.

Now it may be argued that the echo of the Marabar Caves is not in itself music, and, of course, in a restrictive sense it is not. However, enough has been said to show that not only is the echo intimately bound up with Professor Godbole's song, but that it is also, in a wider sense, a transformation of it. This transformation forms part, but only part, of the adventurousness in technique, referred to earlier, which Bradbury noted in the novel, and which finds extension and development in the coupling of music with other forms of sound, particularly in its final section.

As has been seen, Forster's sectional titles suggest a predominance, though by no means an overwhelming one, of a particular aspect, with its attendant ramifications, of India and what India symbolizes. The predominance of the Hindu element in "Temple" is emphasized by the placing of the celebration of the festival of Gokul Ashtami, and Professor Godbole's vital participation in it, at its very opening. Forster saw this long description as

"architecturally necessary. I needed a lump - or a Hindu temple if you like - a mountain standing up. It is well placed; and it gathers up some strings. But there ought to be more after it. The lump sticks out a little too much." (130)

The "architectural necessity" of this "lump" is

apparent only to readers who see the novel as a whole, and not merely in terms of its dramatization which ends with the trial and the parting, on the note of hope that one day things will be different, of Aziz and Fielding (131). The trial and its outcome form perhaps, in a dramatic sense, the climax of the novel, but do not provide the final comment on the themes that pervade it. The "lump" supplies an opportunity for transition to a different mood, a different world, a different attitude, and, in that it occupies such a large part of "Temple", it contributes considerably, as does the relationship between the song in "Mosque" and the echo in "Caves", to the reverberations between the three "movements". It owes much to Forster's description of the festival in The Hill of Devi (132), as well as more than a little to that concerning the "Birth of a Baby" (133), which shares something of the same atmosphere. In all three music is of supreme importance, but it is the use to which Forster puts music in this section of the novel that again shows how refined his technique has become.

The music first takes the form of Professor Godbole's chant to Krishna. (134) It is characteristic of the man that the address itself is oblique, for "Tukaram" is not Krishna himself but a mystic who stressed the importance of man's union with God through love, a belief which finds its full expression in the ceremonies associated with Gokul Ashtami. The nature of the chant is important too, for the words are repeated to such an

extent that they cease almost to have any specific meaning, and become more a means of inducing a hypnotic, trance-like state. Again, it forms part of Forster's gathering up of strings. The very repetition itself recalls the manifold "Come" of Godbole's first song, and the crowd's reiteration of "Esmiss Esmoor" at the trial. His appearance as he sings, accompanied by his choir, his cymbals, drums and portable harmonium (135), with his gold pince-nez, caught in a jasmine garland lying sideways down his nose, is ludicrous in the extreme. So, from a European point of view, is the rest of the music emanating from a variety of sources, and consisting of

"braying, banging (and) crooning" that "melted into a single mass which trailed round the palace before joining the thunder." (136)

It is all of a piece with everything else that goes on at this

"muddle" which constitutes "this approaching triumph of India,"

and is for Forster "a frustration of reason and form" (137), an apparent negation of the "Mediterranean harmony" (138) of which Venice forms such an important part.

The confusion of the music grows in intensity. The rhythm of the hymn is destroyed by the engine that works the hundreds of electric lights (139), its universal message is travestied by the slip in the English translation, "God si Love", (140) and it has to compete with "Nights of Gladness" played by

a Europeanized band (141). As if this were not enough, Professor Godbole cannot choose a new hymn till he has disentangled his pince-nez, yet clashes his one cymbal against the air, while singing into the grey moustache of a comrade. When he finally does choose, the new rhythm on the drum is "more exciting" and "the inner images it (evokes) more definite", but the result is to make the singers' expressions "fatuous and languid" (142). Yet amidst all this apparent fatuity in the ceremony comes the reality of the participants' religious experience, the ability to love all men and all things. It is epitomized in Godbole when he remembers Mrs. Moore and the wasp (143) with their innumerable echoes reaching as far as the discussion of the missionaries at Chandrapore. Even Godbole finds he must exclude the stone from his all-embracing love, but the moment has been crucial. Contact and understanding has been possible, a similarity of psychical comprehension established between Godbole and Mrs. Moore and with it the idea of "completeness". In the end perhaps Stone is right when he says that

"it is the Godbole vision we must understand if we are to understand the book." (144)

It is characteristic of Forster that such a point of revelation for the reader should occur within what is apparently such ludicrous confusion, and characteristic too that the moment passes as suddenly as it comes, drowned in an ever-growing deluge of sound that comprises not only Godbole and his clashing

cymbals and the Europeanized band, but also the noise of the wind, thunder and shouts of the crowd (145). Yet that epiphany is inherent in the ultimate climax of sound which coincides with the moment when

"Infinite Love (takes) upon itself the form of SHRI KRISHNA" when "the clock struck midnight, and simultaneously the rending note of the conch broke forth, followed by the trumpeting of elephants" (146).

Music by no means contributes all to the festival of Gokul Ashtami; papier-maché cobra, child-symbol napkin, butter games, war games all follow in quick and detailed succession. But the fact remains that it is during, and in part as a result of, the music that Godbole has his visionary moment and it is to this vision that Forster returns at the end of the chapter:

"Professor Godbole had once more developed the life of his spirit. He had, with increasing vividness, again seen Mrs. Moore, and round her faintly clinging forms of trouble. He was a Brahman, she Christian, but it made no difference, it made no difference whether she was a trick of his memory or a telepathic appeal. It was his duty, as it was his desire, to place himself in the position of God and to love her, and to place himself in her position and to say to the God, 'Come, come, come, come, come,' This was all he could do. How inadequate! But each according to his own capacities, and he knew that his own were small. 'One old English-woman and one little, little wasp,' he thought, as he stepped out of the temple into the grey of a pouring wet morning. 'It does not seem much, still it is more than I am myself.' " (147)

The circle begun in the song of the milkmaid is nearing completion. Chapters 34 and 35 are dominated by Aziz, but it is Godbole who, in a very physical sense, has caused Aziz to "come to Mau" (148), provided him with the atmosphere in which he can write his poems which, however illogical, strike "a true note" (149), and who too surely, by passing on Fielding's letter hopes that the two friends will come together once again. And the spirit of Mrs. Moore, whose psychical links with Godbole have been established both in the resemblance of the repetition of her metamorphosed name to elements in his songs and in his apperception of her during his vision, returns not only further to complete the circle when her name first straight, then transformed, stirs memories in Aziz - "Esmis Esmoor as though she was coming to help him" (150), but also begins a new one in the person of her son Ralph.

Meanwhile the noise of the Hindu festival continues as a background to events involving Moslem and Anglo-Indian, coming to the fore when

"all culminated in the dance of the milkmaidens before Krishna, and in the still greater dance of Krishna before the milkmaidens, when the music and the musicians swirled through the dark blue robes of the actors into their tinsel crowns, and all became one." (151)

Again is emphasized the strange mixture that Forster finds in Hinduism, yet always with the realization that "religion is a

living force to the Hindus" (152), a realization conveyed with a particular poignancy when, in the midst of a festival where multifarious cacophony has been the norm,

"all other music (is) silent" for the Sweepers' Band who represent the "Despised and Rejected" (153).

The sounds of the festival again retreat into the background (154) during Aziz's reading of the two letters at the European Guest House to give way to a sudden new one. Aziz "in a spurt of temper hit the piano, and since the notes had swollen and stuck together in groups of threes, he produced a remarkable noise." (155) (The reader is perhaps reminded of Freddy's kicking Lucy's piano in A Room with a View.) Not only is the noise remarkable; so too is the concentration of suggestion Forster evokes. The piano becomes a symbol for "the strength of England" (156) against which Aziz feels the need to react so violently. Its state of neglect, prefigured in The Hill of Devi (157), reflects Indian muddledom in general and the almost hostile disregard the forces of nature in India have for anything man-made, Anglo-Indian, Moslem or Hindu. And the sound summons Ralph Moore to his first meeting with Aziz.

At the very moment when Aziz admits his identity to Ralph and bitterly recalls Miss Quested and Marabar, his last words are drowned by all the guns of the State going off. "The prisoner had been released, and was kissing the feet of the singers." (158) The timing of this sound is obviously symbolic

also, for Aziz too, in a sense, is about to be released by his new-found relationship with Ralph from the bitterness that, however deep down, has haunted him since the episode in the caves. To underline this the sounds of the festival begin to grow again, culminating in a song that

"became audible through much repetition; the choir was repeating and inverting the name of deities.

'Radhakrishna Radhakrishna,
 Radhakrishna Radhakrishna,
 Krishnaradha Radhakrishna,
 Radhakrishna Radhakrishna.' " (159)

Again the connection with the repetition of "come" in Professor Godbole's first song and the transformation to, and evocation of, Mrs. Moore's name as "Esmis Esmoor" is inescapable, and with them the philosophy they, in their different ways, represent. The first circle is complete when Aziz, on Ralph's assertion that he can always tell when a stranger is his friend, declares, "Then you are an Oriental" (160), echoing the words he had spoken to Mrs. Moore in the Mosque. Its completion and the beginning of the new one is movingly pointed, as Aziz rows Ralph on the lake, by the recurrence of the Radhakrishna chant changed, suddenly as it seems to him, to

"the syllables of salvation that had sounded during his trial at Chandrapore." (161)

As with Professor Godbole's, Aziz's visionary moment dissolves in noise, but of a different kind, for the music of the

singers who sound "every note but terror" (162) is mingled with gusts of wind, collisions of boats, howls of worshippers, the firing of artillery, the beating of drums, the trumpeting of elephants, rising in a gigantic crescendo which culminates in

"an immense peal of thunder" which "cracked like a mallet on the dome." (163)

As far as the ceremony goes this constitutes "the climax, as far as India admits of one." (164) Thereafter it degenerates, the singing getting less, though seeming to go on almost interminably, asserting that "God is love" (165); its "emotional centre" remains forever elusive. Symbolically the personal relationships that the confusion mirrors are scarcely more satisfactory. Aziz will not communicate with Stella or Ralph, Fielding's marriage to Stella is not quite perfect, Fielding and Aziz have come together again only to part finally. From the religious point of view the close of the novel is overcast by the inner spiritual lack Fielding feels, and which expresses itself outwardly in his questioning of Aziz about Gokul Ashtami and Godbole, and his unease at his wife and brother's liking for Hinduism "though they take no interest in its forms" (166), the importance of music to all which has been amply demonstrated. It is fitting, therefore, that it is "not a sight, but a sound" (167) which flits past Aziz to remind him to add to his letter to Adela that he will

"henceforth connect (her) with the name that is very sacred in my mind, namely, Mrs. Moore." (168)

Thereafter Krishna is deliberately forgotten till the horses and they swerve apart with the message of "No, not yet."

There is no doubt that Forster's use of music and sound in "Temple" has the most impelling and shattering effect of any in the whole of the novel. Yet the volume and extent of its impact must not be allowed to obscure other smaller but none-the-less important uses. It has already been noted how Forster indicates racial division by Aziz's reaction to Hindu drumming in "Mosque" (169). Moslem drumming makes a significant contribution to the creation of atmosphere and the building up of tension after the accusation in "Caves"; in her anxiety not to be attacked by the "niggers", Mrs. Blakiston, Ceres-like in appearance, newly a mother, with her husband far away, because she symbolizes more than poor Adela what the Anglo-Indians are fighting for, attracts the reassurances of the men:

" 'Don't worry, Mrs. Blakiston, those drums are only Mohurram.' " (170)

And when Turton announces that everything is absolutely normal in the city, his wife comments:

" 'I had gathered as much. Those drums are merely Mohurram, of course.' " (171)

The words "only" and "merely" clearly indicate the typical and continuing condescension of the Anglo-Indians. What is not appreciated is the ominousness of the drums, for they signify not only the celebration of the festival, but also the

beginning of the eventual eruption of Moslem feeling. Again as "Mohurram was working up, the city beat a good many drums" but to Fielding they "seemed good-tempered" (172). The key word here is "seemed", for like so many aspects of this novel, the initial effect is illusory or ambiguous. Even the seriousness of the conference, which seems based on logic and common sense, among the Moslems and Fielding over the conduct of the case is undermined by the superstition of the Nawab Bahadur (a characteristic he officially decries) in vetoing the dismissal of

"a group of itinerant musicians" because they "had walked many miles" and "might bring good luck" (173).

Forster underlines the irony implicit in the Anglo-Indian attitude by having Ronny "drumming on the brass Benares bowls" (174) when confronted by Adela's persistent weeping.

Forster achieves rather similar effects to these by his use of bells. Different bells with different intent distinguish the Anglo-Indians' attitude from that of the missionaries (175), but despite the genuineness of the latter, it is no more, perhaps even in the long run less, effectual than the former. Converts are made only during famine, while Ronny may do some good administering justice. But in the face of the problems India presents all the bells can do is "twitter" (176). A bell, however, can mock Indian behaviour too; one is rung with enthusiasm by a junior official (a delightful cameo this) precipitating virtual panic among the servants at the start of the

Marabar expedition (177). More darkly ironic is the "sudden rackety-dacket on a temple bell" which comes as if in answer to McBryde's prayer of "Lord help us all" (178). Little does McBryde know how much His help will be needed; the same bell continues to "jangle harshly" (179) against the decision to brief Amritrao for the defence, producing almost a kind of coarse laughter in the face of the feebleness of the Britishers to stand against India. Yet it is significant too that it is a temple bell, with its Hindu rather than Moslem implications, that rings, thereby emphasizing that even the Moslems are foreigners in India and perhaps suggesting that the closest approach to whatever the real India is, is through Hinduism.

Caroline Spurgeon once made out a strong case for Shakespeare's The Tempest being "an absolute symphony of sound" (180). A similarly strong one could be made out for A Passage to India, though the symphony might not have the close of "serene harmony" which she sees, perhaps over simply, that play to have. For the novel contains, in addition to the multitudinous examples of man-made music and sounds, the manifold noises of Nature herself. Her presence is suggested by the use above of the word "twitter" in relation to the bells, but very early on the night has an "uneasiness" contributed to by Mrs. Moore's voice and jackals baying "their desires" mingled with the percussion of drums" (181). The squeals that a squirrel emits are "in tune with the infinite" but "not attractive

except to other squirrels" (182) and suggest once again the vastness, unfathomability, and hostility to man of Nature in India. A similar unfathomability appears in the unidentifiable green bird (183) the sound of whose dive can be sensed rather than palpably heard, and in the hyena (a word, it seems to me, incapable of separation from the sound the animal makes) which is suggested as the object collided with by the Nawab Bahadur's car, and which wrings from him a loud cry (184).

This coupling of music with other forms of sound in A Passage to India appears to constitute one of the most significant advances beyond the uses to which Forster had previously put music in his novels. As has been seen, Forster's tastes in music were a little conservative, but he was far from being unsympathetic towards modern trends, even if, to his ear, some contemporary music

"has a good many sudden deaths in it; the phrases expire as rapidly as the characters in my novel, the chords cut each others throats, the arpeggio has a heart attack, the fugue gets into a nose-dive." (185)

The fact, too, that he lived during a period when composers were becoming increasingly dissatisfied with conventional media, and accordingly turned to the many techniques outlined in Chapter 1 has been noted, and although A Passage to India was written too early to have been influenced by the more extreme forms of sound production and distortion that the twentieth century has witnessed, there nevertheless seems to be a case for claiming that Forster also

found the use of "pure" music inadequate for his purposes and therefore expanded it to include these other manifold noises originating with both man and Nature.

Opposed to the noises of Nature, which find their supreme expression in the echoes of the caves, just as there is "beyond the remotest echo a silence" (186), so are there words evocative of soundlessness, a fact which yet again strengthens the view that Forster was increasingly concerned with the need for silences to counterbalance his sounds. Of these perhaps the most important is "nothing" (a word so redolent of King Lear) which recurs particularly in relation to the Caves (187) and to India (188).

"Darkness" (a word, as has been seen, of some significance in Maurice) too (despite the night's "uneasiness" above) tends to have similar association, as when the unknown speaker passes "with his friendly word through red-brick pillars into the darkness" (189); when darkness begins "entirely covering the field each side of (Ronny and Adela) before it brimmed over the road" (190); when Mrs. Moore's mind "seemed to move towards them from a great distance and out of darkness" (191); and when Adela returns in her mind to the Marabar Hills and "spoke from them across a sort of darkness to Mr. McBryde" (192).

This enormously complex opposition of sound and silence in A Passage to India goes, both in intent and execution, far beyond anything Forster had attempted and achieved even in

Howards End. It becomes an integral part of what Trilling has called the story as opposed to the plot (193), of the whole meaning of a work to which Brown would apply the adjective "great" (194) and which Stone would raise to the level of "myth" (195). It is fitting, however, that Trilling because of the terms in which his comment is couched, should have the last word:

"However we may interpret Forster's intention in this web of reverberation, it gives his book a cohesion and intricacy usually only found in music." (196)

*** *** ***

NOTES to CHAPTER 7

- 1) Kettle, op. cit., Chapter 6, p. 137.
- 2) Stone, op. cit., Chapter 12, p. 345.
- 3) Burra, Introduction to Everyman edition, p. xviii.
- 4) See Chapter 5 above.
- 5) Trilling, op. cit., Chapter 8, pp. 113-114.
- 6) J.B. Priestley, Review in The London Mercury, LVII, July 1924.
- 7) Rose Macaulay, The Writings of E.M. Forster, Hogarth Press, London, 1938.
- 8) Virginia Woolf in A Writer's Diary, ed. Leonard Woolf, 1953, cited in Casebook, p. 43.
- 9) In these connections see Forster's statements in The Hill of Devi and to Furbank and Haskell.
- 10) Malcolm Bradbury, Introduction to E.M. Forster: A Passage to India, Casebook Series, Macmillan & Co. Ltd., 1970, pp. 11, 14, 11.
- 11) PI, Chapter 2, p. 20.
- 12) PI, Chapter 5, p. 40.
- 13) Ibid.
- 14) PI, Chapter 5, p. 48.
- 15) HD, p. 19. Letter of 26th December.
- 16) Forster is rightly disparaging about the Anthem's musical value.
- 17) PI, Chapter 3, pp. 26-27.
- 18) HD, p. 37.
- 19) PI, Chapter 5, p. 51.
- 20) PI, Chapter 7, p. 62.
- 21) PI, Chapter 24, p. 206.

- 22) PI, Chapter 8, pp. 88-9.
- 23) Ibid., p. 91. A harmonium appears in the New Palace at Dewas Senior (HD, p. 60). See too its appearance in the festival of Gokul Ashtami. (HD, pp. 105 and 110).
- 24) It has often been remarked that Forster grossly oversimplifies the racial and religious divisions in A Passage to India which exist on the sub-continent.
- 25) PI, Chapter 2, p. 20.
- 26) PI, Chapter 9, p. 103.
- 27) PI, Chapter 13, p. 142 - as compared to the cacophony the Hindus can produce.
- 28) PI, Chapter 30, p. 261.
- 29) PI, Chapter 31, p. 270.
- 30) PI, Chapter 3, p. 27.
- 31) PI, Chapter 5, p. 46.
- 32) "The Curious Case of Professor Godbole: A Passage to India re-examined." PMLA LXXVI (1961), pp. 428 and 429.
- 33) Nirad C. Chaudhuri: "Passage To and From India", Encounter 2 (June 1954), p. 21.
- 34) Stone, op. cit., Chapter 12, p. 317.
- 35) See, for instance, HD, p. 87 and p. 154.
- 36) See Stone, Chapter 12, p. 319 (footnote) where the Maharajah of Chhatarpur is suggested.
- 37) PI, Chapter 7, p. 71.
- 38) Ibid.
- 39) Ibid.
- 40) Ibid., p. 72.
- 41) Ibid., p. 74.
- 42) Ibid.
- 43) Ibid.

- 44) Ibid.
- 45) Ibid., p. 75.
- 46) Ibid., pp. 75-6.
- 47) Ibid., p. 76.
- 48) Ibid., p. 77.
- 49) Ibid.
- 50) Kettle, op. cit., Chapter 6, pp. 139-140.
- 51) The merest hint of the origin for this scene occurs in HD, p. 24.
- 52) PI, Chapter 7, pp. 77-78.
- 53) Forster's technical knowledge makes its appearance again here.
- 54) Stone, op. cit., Chapter 12, p. 336.
- 55) Frank Kermode: Puzzles and Epiphanies; Essays and Reviews, (1962), cited in Casebook, p. 218.
- 56) Stone, op. cit., Chapter 12, p. 319.
- 57) Kettle, op. cit., Chapter 6, p. 140.
- 58) Beer, op. cit., Chapter 6, p. 145.
- 59) Ibid., p. 146.
- 60) Reuben A. Brower: The Fields of Light (1951), cited in Casebook, p. 123.
- 61) Kettle, op. cit., Chapter 6, p. 140.
- 62) PI, Chapter 8, p. 79.
- 63) Wilde, op. cit., Chapter 4, p. 130.
- 64) Kettle, op. cit., Chapter 6, p. 140.
- 65) See Gertrude M. White, "A Passage to India; Analysis and Revaluation", PMLA LXVIII (September 1953).
- 66) Peter Burra, The Novels of E.M. Forster, cited in Casebook, p. 62.
- 67) Furbank and Haskell, op. cit., cited in Casebook, p. 30.

- 68) See: Simon Parmet, The Symphonies of Sibelius, translated Kingsley Hart, Cassell, London, 1959, p. 81.
- 69) Frederick C. Crews, The Pooh Perplex, A Freshman Casebook, E.P. Dutton & Co. Ltd., New York, 1965.
- 70) Stone, op. cit., Chapter 12, especially p. 341 onwards.
- 71) Ibid., p. 343, PI, Chapter 9, p. 99.
- 72) PI, Chapter 3, p. 35.
- 73) PI, Chapter 26, p. 239. Varied forms of trinities are innumerable throughout the novel.
- 74) Ibid.
- 75) Ibid.
- 76) Ibid.
- 77) Ibid., p. 241.
- 78) Ibid.
- 79) PI, Chapter 8, p. 85.
- 80) Stone, op. cit., Chapter 12, p. 343.
- 81) PI, Chapter 16, p. 159.
- 82) Ibid.
- 83) Stone omits Mr. Haq's "Dr. Aziz, will you kindly come?" (Ibid.)
- 84) PI, Chapter 14, p. 135.
- 85) PI, Chapter 19, p. 175.
- 86) PI, Chapter 37, p. 315.
- 87) PI, Chapter 33, p. 286.
- 88) Even Aziz asks Fielding "to come" if he is ever in trouble, PI, Chapter 11, p. 118.
- 89) p. xxix.
- 90) See: Glen O. Allen, "Structure Symbol and Theme in E.M. Forster's A Passage to India", PMLA LXX (1955).

- 91) Stone, op. cit., Chapter 12, p. 311.
- 92) Interview with Furbank and Haskell, cited in Casebook, p. 28.
- 93) Trilling, op. cit., Chapter 8, p. 135.
- 94) Stone, op. cit., Chapter 12, p. 304.
- 95) Beer, op. cit., Chapter 6, p. 145.
- 96) PI, Chapter 14, p. 132.
- 97) PI, Chapter 5, p. 43.
- 98) Ibid., pp. 51-2.
- 99) PI, Chapter 8, p. 94.
- 100) Stone, op. cit., Chapter 12, p. 335.
- 101) PI, Chapter 14, p. 136.
- 102) Ibid., p. 139.
- 103) Ibid., p. 140.
- 104) Wilde, op. cit., Chapter 4, p. 139. Of course the conclusion is debatable, but the case (pp. 137-140) well argued.
- 105) PI, Chapter 14, p. 145.
- 106) Ibid.
- 107) Ibid., pp. 147-148. Allen, op. cit., pp. 942-943, writes interestingly on the relationship between Forster's "Boum" and the pronunciation of, and meditation upon, the syllable 'Om' (equals A - Brahma, the creator; U - Vishnu, the preserver; M - Siva, the destroyer) which plays "a very important part of the discipline of those seeking Brahman."
- 108) Wilde, op. cit., Chapter 4, p. 139.
- 109) PI, Chapter 15, p. 149.
- 110) Ibid.
- 111) Ibid., p. 150.
- 112) And, of course, there are many echoes of this type in the novel.

- 113) PI, Chapter 16, p. 152.
- 114) PI, Chapter 18, p. 165.
- 115) PI, Chapter 20, p. 187.
- 116) Stone perceptively sees "echo" as "shadow as sound",
op. cit., Chapter 12, p. 337.
- 117) PI, Chapter 22, p. 189.
- 118) Ibid., p. 190.
- 119) Ibid., p. 195.
- 120) Ibid., pp. 196-7.
- 121) Ibid., p. 200.
- 122) Ibid.
- 123) PI, Chapter 23, p. 202.
- 124) Ibid., p. 203.
- 125) Ibid., p. 205.
- 126) PI, Chapter 24, p. 208.
- 127) PI, Chapter 26, p. 232.
- 128) Ibid., p. 233.
- 129) PI, Chapter 31, p. 269.
- 130) Interview with Furbank and Haskell, cited in Casebook, p. 28.
- 131) A Passage to India, a play by Santha Rama Rau, from the
Novel by E.M. Forster; Samuel French, London,
copyright as an unpublished work, 1960, by E.M. Forster
and Vasanthi Rama Rau Bowers.
- 132) See HD, p. 100 onwards.
- 133) HD, p. 78 onwards.
- 134) PI, Chapter 33, p. 279.
- 135) Cf. HD, p. 105.
- 136) PI, Chapter 33, p. 280.

- 137) Ibid.
- 138) PI, Chapter 32, p. 275.
- 139) PI, Chapter 33, p. 280.
- 140) Ibid., p. 281.
- 141) Ibid. Cf. HD, p. 109.
- 142) Ibid.
- 143) The full significance of the wasp is admirably dealt with in E.K. Brown, Rhythm in the Novel, University of Toronto Press, 1950, Section 4, pp. 93-97.
- 144) Stone, op. cit., Chapter 12, p. 334.
- 145) PI, Chapter 33, p. 282.
- 146) Ibid., p. 283.
- 147) Ibid., pp. 285-6.
- 148) PI, Chapter 34, p. 287.
- 149) Ibid., p. 289.
- 150) PI, Chapter 35, pp. 297-8.
- 151) PI, Chapter 36, p. 299.
- 152) Ibid.
- 153) Ibid., p. 301.
- 154) Ibid., p. 303.
- 155) Ibid.
- 156) Ibid.
- 157) HD, p. 60.
- 158) PI, Chapter 36, p. 305.
- 159) Ibid., p. 306.
- 160) Ibid.
- 161) Ibid., p. 308.

- 162) Ibid., p. 309.
- 163) Ibid., p. 310.
- 164) Ibid.
- 165) Ibid., p. 311.
- 166) PI, Chapter 37, p. 315.
- 167) Ibid.
- 168) Ibid.
- 169) PI, Chapter 2, p. 20. Hindu drumming is mentioned in HD, p. 20.
- 170) PI, Chapter 20, p. 178.
- 171) Ibid.
- 172) PI, Chapter 21, p. 188.
- 173) Ibid.
- 174) PI, Chapter 22, p. 192.
- 175) PI, Chapter 9, p. 98.
- 176) Ibid., p. 99.
- 177) PI, Chapter 13, p. 128.
- 178) PI, Chapter 18, p. 169.
- 179) PI, Chapter 19, p. 171.
- 180) Caroline Spurgeon, Shakespeare's Imagery and What It Tells Us, Cambridge University Press, 1965, Chapter 14, p. 300.
- 181) PI, Chapter 3, p. 35.
- 182) PI, Chapter 10, p. 11. A squirrel sits inside the piano in the state drawing room of The New Palace, Dewas Senior, HD, p. 61.
- 183) PI, Chapter 8, p. 83.
- 184) Ibid.
- 185) "The Raison d'Être of Criticism in the Arts", TC, p. 128. The novel referred to is probably LJ.

- 186) PI, Chapter 5, pp. 51-2.
- 187) See especially PI, Chapter 12, pp. 124-5.
- 188) PI, Chapter 14, p. 143.
- 189) PI, Chapter 3, p. 24.
- 190) PI, Chapter 8, p. 85.
- 191) PI, Chapter 22, p. 200.
- 192) PI, Chapter 24, p. 221.
- 193) Trilling, op. cit., Chapter 8, p. 126.
- 194) E.K. Brown, Rhythm in the Novel, University of Toronto Press, 1950.
- 195) Stone, op. cit., Chapter 12, p. 346.
- 196) Trilling, op. cit., Chapter 8, p. 134. À propos this comment, Allen (op.cit., p. 938) calls attention, as I do independently above with RWV, to the novel's formal relationship to Sonata form.

CHAPTER 8 : CONCLUSION

Trilling's comments on A Passage to India reveal a notable tendency in critics of Forster's novels, namely that of discussing certain of their aspects in terms of music. Like Forster's own uses of music, these comments can relate to ideas which range from the comparatively simple to the exceedingly complex, from the general statement to the close parallel. Some, indeed, may be of a casual or incidental nature, as, for instance, when McConkey speaks of there being

"a harmony between (Mrs. Moore's) spirit and the earth" (1),

or when Gertrude White describes "Mosque" as

"not only a symphony of differences but of attempts at oneness" (2);

yet it is clear that in some areas, because of certain special qualities in Forster's way of writing, the use of musical expression or analogy is vital in their attempts to convey as nearly as is possible the essence of those qualities.

The use appears initially in relation to the style of certain specific passages in the novels. Burra, writing of Stephen's "first appearance, a third of the way through (The Longest Journey)", feels that

"the writing is lifted up like music to herald his approach" (3).

While Burra does not comment in any detail, an examination of the passage (4), a description of a rain-drenched landscape with primaeval overtones, will reveal what he means. For though the writing does not aspire to the "Wagnerian magnificence" of the description of Rickie's beholding the embrace of Gerald and Agnes (5), it has a sound which seems to evoke the very soul of the earth with which Stephen is irrevocably associated, a sound quite unlike what has gone before.

Hoggart, considering the opening paragraph of A Passage to India, is more explicit. After pointing out that "it establishes the setting of the novel" and that "it also begins to establish the tones within which the novel will be conducted", he comments:

"It is an extremely assured passage, sure of its own stance before its material, sure of the responses it will draw from its audience. It's undramatic; the movement of its feelings, the way it approaches the experiences with which it is dealing, its obliqueness and quietness, all this is like subtle piano-playing rather than large orchestration." (6)

The simile is both singularly appropriate, and precise in its implication; it exactly suggests the discriminating restraint, the fine timbre, more redolent of a Faure than a Mahler, so characteristic of Forster.

An extension of this use of musical analogy in relation to specific passages is encountered in general remarks on what is

usually referred to as "the Forsterian voice". Rose Macaulay, commenting on "Notes on the Way" and similar articles, writes:

"In all of them he speaks with the voice of cultured, sensitive and democratic liberalism rather than with his own peculiar note, or rather, he is speaking with that part of his voice which sings in the choir with cultured, sensitive and democratic liberalism." (7)

Here one feels that while the image has no special vividness, it is interesting in that it illustrates how sharp is the alertness of critics to the unique Forsterian sound.

Heer (the critic who, in the main, responds most sensitively to Forster's use of music, and who, appropriately, most often uses music to convey his ideas) moves beyond hearing a special note in the speech of certain characters within the novels, and discovers it even in their actions, nominating such characters

" 'tonal' characters which help provide (the novels) with vision and music" (8)

- a highly discerning judgment which will be considered in more detail later. Moreover, contrasted with such characters he sees others, like Leonard Bast, identified with "the absence of music" (9).

Musical analogies appear with the greatest frequency, however, in relation to elements which go to make up the structures of Forster's novels, particularly Pattern and Rhythm.

Such analogies are well represented by Stone who assures us that

"To read this novel (Howards End) as Forster would have us read it, we must conceive of it as a kind of musical score in which leitmotifs associated with certain characters and situations are of special importance." (10)

Here, as with the penultimate illustration, the analogy is of such significance that a fuller discussion of its implications will be reserved till later, but enough has been said to draw attention to what is a widespread and important tendency in approaches to Forster.

Of course, Forster himself had established a precedent for such approaches in Aspects of the Novel (1927), and indeed the book is dedicated to Charles Mauron, the man who, as has been seen, later inspired the Notes on the Beethoven Sonatas. The range of Forster's musical analogies is as wide, if not so comprehensive in detail, as that of his critics. On the simple level the second speaker on the novel (whom Forster detests and fears) is characterised by the remark:

"You can take your art, you can take your literature, you can take your music, but give me a good story." (11)

The style of Wells and Dickens is stigmatized by the comment:

"Sometimes the lively surface of their prose scratches like a cheap gramophone record" (12).

In the discussion of "round" and "flat" characters the reader is warned that "at any moment we may look at Mr. Pickwick

edgeways and find him no thicker than a gramophone record", though the fact that this last comment has little special musical significance is emphasized by Forster's, on the same page, describing almost "all Wells's characters" as being "as flat as a photograph" (13). A slightly deeper level is reached, because the statement relates to a subtler problem in novel-writing, when, in his discussion of the mixed ingredients the novelist has to handle, Forster sees characters as

"creations inside a creation, and often inharmonious towards it" (14).

Indeed, as might be expected from the behaviour of his critics, Forster's musical analogies increase in proportion to the complexities of the problems his subject involves. Forster is forever wistfully wishing that the novel's highest common factor should be something different from the story, for instance "melody, or perception of the truth" (15), and this comment provides an early indication of how continually and profoundly aware he is of the "sound" a novel has.

Beyond "melody or cadence" (the type of sounds that

"the eye, backed by a mind that transmutes" can appreciate "can even telescope up so that we get them quicker than we should do if they were recited, just as some people can look through a musical score quicker than it can be rapped out on a piano" (16))

lies voice, a quality appreciable only when prose is read aloud.

And it is in terms of "tone of voice" that Forster describes the highest peak a novelist can attain - "Prophecy". Prophecy for him is not concerned with

"the narrow sense of foretelling the future" but "is an accent in the novelist's voice, an accent for which the flutes and saxophones of fantasy may have prepared us. His theme is the universe, or something universal, but he is not necessarily going to 'say' anything about the universe; he proposes to sing, and the strangeness of song arising in the halls of fiction is bound to give a shock. How will song combine with the furniture of common sense? we shall ask ourselves, and shall have to answer 'not too well': the singer does not always have room for his gestures, the table and chairs get broken, and the novel through which the bardic influence has passed often has a wrecked air, like a drawing-room after an earthquake or children's party." (17)

"To any one who has an ear for song" (18) Dostoyevsky has this prophetic quality, as do Melville, D.H. Lawrence, and Emily Brontë, whereas Hardy (his novels "do not give out sounds") and Conrad (Marlow's voice "is too full of experience to sing") (19) do not. It is an exacting and personal judgment and not every reader will subscribe to his exclusions.

To this prophetic quality contribute those elements in the novel which Forster nominates Pattern, which he conceives in primarily visual terms, and Rhythm, which he derives from music. The latter he subdivides into a "quite easy" one which manifests itself in his description of it principally as a

leitmotif which contributes beauty (who if she "does not look surprised reminds us too much of a prima donna" (20)) and which is

"not to be there all the time like a pattern, but by its lovely waxing and waning to fill us with surprise and freshness and hope" (21),

but which at the same time can perform a kind of stitching together of material and thereby provide a unifying factor; and into a "difficult" one

"comparable to the effect of the Fifth Symphony as a whole, where, when the orchestra stops, we hear something that has never actually been played" (22).

This second kind of rhythm he sees as having been achieved

"mainly (though not entirely) by the relation between the three big blocks of sound which the orchestra has been playing" (23),

and as finding, perhaps, its sole parallel in the novel in War and Peace, one quality of which "after one has read (it) for a bit" is that it is akin to "great chords (beginning) to sound" which arise from "the immense area of Russia" (24).

Again the judgement is exacting and personal. Rose Macaulay is right to point out that

"it is possible to find precisely this quality in other novels; some find it in Conrad, some in Hardy" (pace Forster's own comments) "some in Meredith; I have known those who found it in George Eliot. The rhythm of a symphony or of a literary work are alike only audible to the individual ear and brain." (25)

But it is worth considering at this point whether, in his choice of certain of these quasi-musical terms, Forster is speaking purely metaphorically or intending something more literal. The term "melody" here obviously relates to the rise and fall of the writing, and involves, as it would in music, its phrasing, pitch, and speed. The phrase "tone of voice" seems to add the element of colour and timbre, as is further suggested by Forster's "orchestration" of "fantasy". With the first type of rhythm the ground is more uncertain, since in Forster's usage it seems to have, from a basic musical point of view, more a melodic than a rhythmic implication. But the fact that Forster is not thinking here in the simpler kind of musical sense is evidenced by his attempted definition of the second type which involves, as it were, an apprehension, in a moment in time, of the resonance of a complete work. It is precisely the chief factors that the novel and the symphony have in common - their length and their complexity - which makes the hearing of their vast undulations, as Rose Macaulay says, such an individual affair, for

"as quickly as we read (the novel) melts and shifts in the memory; even at the moment when the last page is turned, a great part of the book, its fine detail, is already vague and doubtful." (26)

Yet, however inadequate words appear in defining what lies at the back of Forster's mind, it seems clear that he intends more than a purely metaphorical interpretation of the terms; the

arts of writing and composition are for him closely linked, and he sees music as offering

"in its final expression a type of beauty which fiction might achieve in its own way. Expansion. That is the idea a novelist must cling to. Not completion. Not rounding off but opening out. When the symphony is over we feel that the notes and tunes composing it have been liberated, they have found in the rhythm of the whole their individual freedom." (27)

It betrays, perhaps, a somewhat idealistic attitude towards what music can achieve, an attitude to be found also in his comment à propos his own work on Goldsworthy Lowes Dickinson:

"A biography of him, if it succeeded, would resemble him; it would achieve the unattainable, express the inexpressible, turn the passing into the everlasting Perhaps it could only be done through music." (28)

Again Rose Macaulay calls attention to the extremity of this viewpoint:

"It might: but there is a danger of attributing to music more power than any one art can have. Music can express what is inexpressible in words, words can express what is inexpressible in music." (29)

It therefore seems appropriate now to examine exactly what it was that Forster was aiming to express through his use of music, to judge how far he succeeded in those aims, and to assess to what extent he advanced its use in the novel. Perhaps, too, it will not be unfair to view his work in part

from some of the standpoints he himself proposes, and, since he assigns such an unimportant part to "The Story", to begin with "People".

The use of music as an aid to the delineation of character was far from new in Forster's time. It can be seen, for instance, in the kind of music which Squire Western, deep in his bottle, gets Sophia to play for him on the harpsichord in Tom Jones (30), the seductive song which Becky Sharp sings to the gullible Jos in Vanity Fair (31), or the passionately sensitive response to music exhibited by Maggie Tulliver in The Mill on the Floss (32). Most especially can it be seen, as has been remarked in passing (33), in one of those authors Forster claimed to have particularly influenced him - Jane Austen. Marianne Dashwood, Anne Elliot, Emma Woodhouse, Catherine Morland, Elizabeth and Mary Bennet, to mention only a few, all by their individual responses to music either intensify for the reader characteristics they have already been seen to possess, or to have an extra dimension added to them. Degree of response to music as a yardstick (though by no means an infallible one - Elinor Dashwood is not musical) against which characters can be measured is present, and satire, exemplified primarily in the treatment of Lady Middleton, Mr. Collins, Lady Catherine de Bourgh, and, especially, Mrs. Elton, abounds.

In these respects Forster's treatment of, say, Lilia, Gerald, Herbert, Agnes, or even Mrs. Munt is hardly original; but

in other respects Forster has moved far beyond his predecessors. There is nothing quite like Lucy Honeychurch and her relationship to Beethoven. Not only does his music provide an outlet for the great feelings burgeoning within her; it also comes near to expressing for her the inexpressible in emotion, and the extra dimension which this adds to her character is far wider than anything achieved by Jane Austen, for it includes that element so essential in a symbol - a mystery.

Even a writer of Forster's own time, whose knowledge of music was probably far greater, in a novel dealing with a girl who is specifically intended for the career of pianist, does not match Forster's subtlety. The character of Stella Fane in Compton Mackenzie's Sinister Street (1913) is finely delineated, a delineation which is particularly aided by her response and attitude to music. Nice details such as her shuddering at hearing the treble of a piano duet without the bass and her spontaneous composing of songs about everyday events as a child, her later concern with what her audience is saying while she is playing, her apparent lack of concern about her father's death when her mind is fixed on her forthcoming concert, all contribute to a rounded portrait. But the farthest that her response to individual composers goes is only to underline a certain superficiality in her make-up:

"I think of you (Michael) meeting Lily when I play Schumann, and when I play Chopin I think of you walking about underneath her window, and when I play Beethoven I think of you kissing her." (34)

Something of the mysterious quality which imbues Lucy Honeychurch pervades Helen Schlegel's attitude, though, of course, in Howards End Beethoven's 5th Symphony and its associations achieve a life independent of any single character. It has already been remarked too how Forster excels in the creation of what Beer calls "tonal" characters, characters which "help to provide (his novels) with vision and music" (35). Among these he numbers (in addition to Lucy Honeychurch) Caroline Abbott, Rickie Elliot, Margaret Schlegel, and Mrs. Moore. Of course, the degree to which these characters contribute vision and music to their individual novels varies considerably; the contribution of the last two is undoubtedly far greater than the preceding two. And there also appears to be an unaccountable omission from the list, Mrs. Wilcox, whose "tonal" quality pervades Howards End to an extent even greater than that to which Mrs. Moore's does A Passage to India and who, in the suggestion which surrounds her, as opposed to the more positive realization of characters like Aziz and Margaret Schlegel, may be regarded as Forster's supreme achievement in this particular area.

When it comes to "Plot", to which Forster requires the reader to bring the qualifications of intelligence and memory, one need again look no further than Jane Austen for a precedent wherein music, in some form, plays an important part. In Sense and Sensibility it is Colonel Brandon's sincere appreciation of Marianne's first performance at Barton Park, as

opposed to the idiotic adulations of Sir John and Lady Middleton, that lays the foundation of her regard for him (36); but because Willoughby's response to music and dancing is as ecstatic as her own, it is he who captures her affection (37). Marianne and Willoughby's mutual enjoyment of music contributes considerably to the growth of their friendship (38), and of particular structural interest is the way that Marianne's playing over of every song she had played to Willoughby, as well as every duet they had sung together, and her gazing "on every line of music that he had written out for her", when he makes his sudden departure (39), is echoed on her return to Barton Park. There, lying on the piano, is the score of an opera Willoughby had obtained for her, containing those very duets; the moment is crucial, for Marianne, though not able to bring herself to play properly, recovers and thereafter mends (40).

Jane Austen's use of the technique is obviously not very advanced. A similar instance of greater subtlety occurs in Middlemarch where George Eliot uses a mutual interest in music to establish a relationship between Rosamond Vincy and Lydgate (41) but also to continue it (42) and then complicate it. When Dorothea Casaubon visits Rosamond she finds her playing to Will Ladislaw (43); despite, or perhaps because of, Ladislaw's very different treatment of Rosamond from Lydgate's in other fields, in music they become companions (44), and it is Lydgate's discovery of their making music together that increases his

his irritation from other causes (45). The malicious gossip of Mrs. Cadwallader concerning Ladislav's "warblings" with Rosamond stirs Dorothea's remembrance of how she had once found them (46), while, towards the end of the novel, a certain irony underlies Ladislav's hope, expressed in his letter to Lydgate, that there will be "a great deal of music in store for him" (47).

But even in George Eliot's more advanced technique there is nothing to match the subtlety with which Forster, in A Room with a View, marks out the form of his novel by Lucy's playing of Beethoven, Schumann, and Mozart and uses the scenes containing their music (as he does, as Benjamin Britten has remarked (48), in a simpler way, the Lucia di Lammermoor scene in Where Angels Fear to Tread) "to push on the action".

Again, the generation of atmosphere, which is one product of these scenes, is not new. A feeling of feverish melancholy is clearly evoked in Marianne's playing over of songs in the scene from Sense and Sensibility mentioned above. A more resigned kind of melancholy is aroused during Anne Elliot's performance at Uppercross (49), while against the background of Caroline Bingley's performance at Netherfield Darcy's ardour towards Elizabeth Bennet ironically burns brighter (50). And Jane Austen is only one of several nineteenth century authors who to some extent employ the technique. In Scott it is often song which contributes to a scene its particular air. A sense of delight fills Sir William Ashton, and the reader, as he listens

to the sound of his daughter's unseen lute and the ancient air she sings (51); one of foreboding, mingled with a feeling of being in the presence of praeternatural powers, is more likely to fill the bosom of Guy Mannering as he listens to Meg Merrilies' "Twist ye, twine ye!" (52) The sound of the Reverend Septimus Harding's cello is inseparable from Trollope's Warden, and a moment of great poignancy is reached when, temporarily bereft of his instrument and brow-beaten by the Archdeacon, he makes tiny passes with an imaginary bow over imaginary strings (53). Rather less of pathos and more of humour derives from Thackeray's "little old man", Mr. Bows, whose performance upon "the battered piano (which had injured its constitution woefully by sitting up so many nights, and spoke with a voice, as it were, at once hoarse and faint)" draws Pendennis's attention to the very man he had been seeking (54), while the whole of Hardy's Under the Greenwood Tree is permeated with the rustic charm imparted to it by the Mellstock Quire.

But with certain exceptions (particularly Jane Austen, George Eliot, and, to some extent, Hardy) the use of music in the nineteenth century novel tends to be confined to isolated, specific situations. With Forster, in scenes like, in their very different ways, those involving the performance of Lucia di Lammermoor, Lucy's playing at the Vyses', the Queen's Hall concert, and, especially, Professor Godbole's song, the effect achieved is individual and unforgettable, not only because an atmosphere is

created, but also because the ramifications of those scenes pervade the respective novels.

Forster's section headings in Aspects of the Novel, though fascinating in part, do not, however, cover a wide enough area to admit consideration of all the functions which music performs in his own novels, and temporary leave must therefore be taken of them to survey first the uses which Forster has been seen to have made of particular composers.

It is worth remarking that Jane Austen, the first English author to use music with any degree of consistency of purpose, never specifies the composers, and very rarely, indeed, the titles of the music which is performed, and the only composer to be so much as mentioned in the course of the six major novels is Cramer. George Eliot mentions composers with some frequency, but can be equally vague about what music is being performed on any particular occasion. Samuel Butler's obsession with Händel is well known and that composer's works find fairly frequent mention in The Way of All Flesh; but Forster's way with his composers is far different from even this second of English authors who he claimed had influenced him most.

Forster is essentially an economical writer and rarely does a detail appear without special significance. Thus even the apparently casual appearances of Grieg and Macdowell in Howards End (55) have been seen to have their special

implications as do those of Mendelssohn, Brahms, and Elgar in the same novel. With the appearance of Glück in A Room with a View the level of implication, relating as it does both to the music and, possibly, to the plot of Armide, is deeper, while with that of Mozart and Schumann, despite the absence of the specification of particular pieces, considerable complexity arises. Most profound, of course, are the uses to which Forster puts Wagner and Beethoven, and it would be difficult to decide which has the more predominant effect in the novels. The extent to which the former's influence pervades The Longest Journey, encompassing as it does the whole Stephen-Siegfried equation, and the implications of the Rheingold, Götterdämmerung, Lohengrin, and Tristan und Isolde references, has been shown to be far wider than is immediately apparent (56). The Parsifal influence in A Room with a View is, too, undeniably strong, and, indeed, John Lucas, in an interesting if not wholly convincing article, goes far beyond what has been suggested here (57), and would equate in certain respects George Emerson with Amfortas, Mr. Emerson with both Titirel and Parsifal, Miss Bartlett and Mr. Beebe with Klingsor, and Lucy with Kundry (58), giving strength to his case by calling attention to the way in which Forster uses The Ring as an allegory for the 1939 situation in "What I believe" (59).

But it is probably, in the end, the uses of Beethoven which are the more significant. The playing of Op. 111 alone is

important enough in its suggestions about Lucy, but in its wider Beethovenian implications of living, as well as playing, on the side of Victory it is vital to the whole meaning of A Room with a View. To an even greater degree Beethoven's 5th Symphony becomes for Helen Schlegel an allegory for living (60), and a further idea of its vast importance to Howards End can be obtained by a comparison with Compton Mackenzie's use of a performance of it which completes the second book (61) of Sinister Street. Here Michael Fane's thoughts are removed from his anxiety about Stella's concerto performance and stray to the audience, an audience composed of people of "unimaginable variety", ranging from lovers to old men, each of whom is moved in a particular way. Michael Fane too, in the manner of Forster, wool-gathers, the bassoons reminding him of Mr. Neech, one of his former schoolmasters, who had taught him "The Ancient Mariner".

Mackenzie's scene has both a vital presence and some feeling of resonances beyond; what it lacks is both the allegorical significance of Forster's and a further exploitation of those resonances. And Mackenzie is writing three years later.

Forster's admiration for Beethoven is supported by the concensus of opinion of the musical world. Forster would not have accorded to Tschaikowsky a similar status, and posterity has not either. Yet Tschaikowsky obviously has a very special, personal meaning for Forster, and while the association of images

with the 6th Symphony does not reach the complexity of those associated with Beethoven's 5th, the poignancy of that association is one of the most memorable in his works. With Donizetti, although he brings back at a crucial point in Where Angels Fear to Tread scraps of the opera (62), Forster is less concerned with the music than with the effect of the performance of Lucia di Lammermoor as a whole. Again, the use of an opera performance in this way seems to be original to Forster, though it clearly has its roots in such a scene as Partridge's witnessing of the performance of Hamlet in Tom Jones (63).

It can thus be seen that Forster brings to his composers and to individual works a highly personal response, and while their range is not enormously wide, the use to which he puts them certainly is, being quite unparalleled in any earlier English author.

The same cannot be said of Forster's uses of the musical metaphor or simile, that is in a restricted, isolated sense. By and large these tend to be of the "harmony"/"unison" type, though it has been remarked that when he does resort to such apparent clichés, Forster often gives the impression of having thought anew about them (64). Even where the image seems more original, as with Herbert Pembroke's four-part fugue, the idea is not wholly new. "Life is like a fugue, everything must grow out of the subject", writes Samuel Butler (65), and Forster does not quite achieve the delights of that same author's "the

lower parts of his back emphasized themselves demonstratively as though about to fly off in different directions like the two extreme notes in the chord of the augmented sixth" (66). Where Forster does seem to have added something new is in his placing of musical images at certain crucial points in a narrative, the technique he uses to such effect in A Room with a View (67).

A chronological survey of Forster's six novels reveals not so much a steady development and increase in his use of music as an adapting of such material to the needs of the particular work in hand. But one development is clear, and that is Forster's increasing awareness and use of sound of all kinds, which is an extension of his use of music and which reaches its climax in A Passage to India. This is not to say that in the earlier novels Forster is not conscious of other than musical sounds. It is true that he does not seem to share George Eliot's particular sensitivity to the timbre of voices, but this deficiency, if it be one, may in any case be more apparent than real, since, while she may add the descriptive phrase or simile to distinguish a voice (Dorothea Casaubon's, for instance, is like that "of a soul that had once lived in an Aeolian harp" (68), while Rosamond Vincy speaks in one "that fell and trickled like cold water drops" (69)), he tends to convey his awareness simply by the words themselves. There is no need to specify a tone for Miss Bartlett when it comes through the writing as clearly as this:

"My own wishes, dearest Lucy, are unimportant in comparison

with yours. It would be hard indeed if I stopped you doing as you liked at Florence, when I am only here through your kindness. If you wish me to turn the gentlemen out of their rooms, I will do it. Would you then, Mr. Beebe, kindly tell Mr. Emerson that I accept his kind offer, and then conduct him to me, in order that I may thank him personally?' " (70)

In addition to this early evidence of Forster's keen ear for the melodies of speech, A Room with a View provides examples of the sounds of a river gushing (71), a fair wind blowing (72), an explosion caused by an electric storm (73), the tinkle of church bells (74), and people emerging from cold water (75); Where Angels Fear to Tread supplies the blowing of the children's bladder whistles at the Bologna festa (76), the ringing of the bell which salutes Harriet every quarter of an hour (77), the songs of the girl about Poggibonsi (78) and of Gino, and the latter's piercing cry of woe (79). In The Longest Journey sounds are still present, but more muted. A bird calls out of the dell (80), flowers rustle in vases (81), a train whistles faintly (82), and, as from Gino, a cry breaks from Rickie (83). Howards End too offers the song of birds - a thrush sings its two syllables, and then has its song augmented by that of the cuckoo and the "nonsense" of other birds (84), the rustle - of leaves (85), and the sound - in this case a roar - of trains (86). But Howards End is a much more complex work than its predecessors and it possesses special sounds which relate to its

major themes - the sound of "the language of hurry clipped words, formless sentences, potted expressions" (87), the sound of the heart of the house "beating, faintly at first, then loudly, martially" (88), and, in particular, the sound of water manifested in the whisperings and murmurings of the little river (89), the fall of rain (90), and the movement of the sea (91). In comparison Maurice lacks the variety of sound of Howards End - the "sounds of the May term" (92) and "the sounds of spring" (93) are unspecified, though this fact to some extent contributes to the effect of the concentration on the sound of water already noted (94) which is clearly a development from Howards End. And in any case the circumstances surrounding the composition of Maurice (95) are not conducive to its fitting easily into a Forster chronology.

Howards End, then, can be regarded in terms of supra-musical sound as a more immediate predecessor to A Passage to India than Maurice. Yet an examination of predecessor and successor proves beyond any shadow of doubt the vast development and massive achievement in the use of sound which is a major feature of the latter. Its sheer variety and complexity which has been demonstrated at length (96) put it in a class of its own.

A second claim which has been made for A Passage to India is that it demonstrates Forster's increased awareness of the necessity to counterbalance his sounds with silences, and it is apposite, if ironic in view of Forster's attitudes to the

composers involved, to note what Huxley has to say about Beethoven, Mozart and Wagner:

"Silence is an integral part of all good music. Compared with Beethoven's or Mozart's, the ceaseless torrent of Wagner's music is very poor in silence. Perhaps that is one of the reasons why it seems so much less significant than theirs. It 'says' less because it is always speaking." (97)

As with supra-musical sounds, Forster's earlier novels are not lacking in silences. Two significant instances occur in A Room with a View, the first when, in Santa Croce, George, though "healthy and muscular", gives Lucy a

"feeling of greyness, of tragedy that might only find solution in the night", a feeling "born of silence and of unknown emotion" (98);

the second when Mr. Beebe ("who could be silent, but who could not bear silence") endeavours to enliven George, as, in the company of Freddy, they go to take their bathe, with his "History of Coincidence" (99). His efforts are met with a double silence. If anything, the use of silence in Where Angels Fear to Tread is more developed. Silences punctuate the conversation of Gino and Spiridione about Lilia, particularly at the moment when the question of her being "simpatica" is raised (100), and Gino praises Caroline Abbott for the fact that she speaks "very little" (101). Again, silences, in the form of Miss Abbott's non-reply to Mrs. Herriton, and Mrs. Herriton's to

... of

... ..

... ..

... ..

... ..

... ..

... ..

(11)

... ..

... ..

... ..

... ..

... ..

... ..

(12)

... ..

... ..

... ..

... ..

... ..

... ..

... ..

... ..

... ..

... ..

... ..

Philip, heighten the sense of conflict in the argument over the baby (102). Philip, becoming more attracted as he does so, watches Miss Abbott, as she stands by the window, in silence (103), just as Miss Abbott does Gino, whose smoke rings exert an almost hypnotic influence over her (104). Most significant is the omen contained in the baby's crying silently (105).

In The Longest Journey silence seems to be restricted in the main to Stephen Wonham ("a long interval of silence" follows Mrs. Failing's announcement to Agnes that "he is a hero" (106), he and Rickie proceed "for a long time in silence" (107) and silence returns to him at the end of the novel (108)), and also to Ansell ("a silence akin to poetry" invades him after his encounter with Stephen (109), and "a profound silence" succeeds the storm which he occasions at Sawston (110)); while in Howards End it seems to be reserved for moments charged with special significance, as with the "silence absolute" which follows the departure of the last of the mourners, the young woodcutter, from the cemetery where Mrs. Wilcox lies buried (111), the silence which underlines Miss Avery's agreement to admit Margaret but no one else to Howards End (112), or the "general silence" which succeeds the family's comments on Henry's decision to leave the house to Margaret (113). The same appears to be the case with Maurice, since "an immense silence as of death" encircles Maurice as the realization of what the loss of Durham ultimately means sinks in (114), a

"silence absolute" fills the Russet room after his union with Scudder (115), and "silence and the advancing night" threaten when it appears that he has miscalculated about Scudder (116), though it should also be remarked that there is an emphasis on the significance of silence in conversation (117).

It would be an exaggeration to claim that Forster's use of silence and words associated with silence in A Passage to India exceeds that in his earlier novels to the extent which his use of sound does (indeed the use of "darkness" in Maurice is probably greater), but that it is wider in its ramifications, particularly with regard to the landscape of India and its implications, cannot be doubted.

Return can now be made to the section headings which Forster employs in Aspects of the Novel, and two remain - "Rhythm" and "Prophecy".

"Rhythm", it has been seen, is a term Forster borrowed deliberately from music, and that borrowing is regarded by Brown as part of a general resorting to music as a source of critical vocabulary (exemplified in Huxley's Point Counter Point, Gide's Symphonie Pastorale, and Rumer Godden's A Fugue in Time) in the period, constituting a sequel to, if not a reaction against, that epitomized in Henry James, drawn from painting (118).

Brown is here allowing himself a certain latitude in his use of the word "period" since the respective dates of these

novels are 1928, 1919, and 1945, but the general point is valid, though it must be emphasized that their titles embody not merely a search for a new critical vocabulary but, indeed, certainly in the cases of the first and last, vital experiments in fictional form. Huxley, in a famous passage from the novel (119), ponders on the "musicalization of fiction", seeking inspiration from Beethoven to achieve the abrupt transitions, and the "more interesting" modulations and variations on a theme. For the first he sees "sufficiency of characters and parallel, "contrapuntal plots" as enough; for the second a "reduplicating (of) situations and characters" is required. He also envisages another possibility of the novelist, "god-like", "(electing) to consider the events of the story in their different aspects." Elsewhere, however, he acknowledges the difficulty, indeed the impossibility, despite the title of his book, of achieving true counterpoint in writing. The effect is only apparent momentarily in a good metaphor, and "when a writer tries to render" the "co-existence of incompatibles" which "is a commonplace of everyday life" he "is forced, by the very nature of language, to adopt a strategy, not of chords or of counterpoint, but of melodic modulation." (120)

Huxley's method of "musicalization" in Point Counter Point, which resembles most his first description above, is not Forster's, nor is it quite Rumer Godden's, the fugal structure of whose exquisite miniature hinges upon the concept of what is, what

was, what will be, and what might have been. Gide's, in its way, equally beautiful work seems not to exhibit such radical attempts at a "musical" structure, although the priest tries to awaken Gertrude's awareness of what colours mean by analogy with the orchestration of Beethoven's Pastoral Symphony, while the whole story, despite its infinitely sad ending, seems imbued with the same idyllic quality as that symphony. Certainly it does not aim at the "something like the art of fugue writing" which Gide apparently was attempting in Les Faux Monnayeurs (121).

Forster's musicalization of fiction, then, is based on what he chose to call "Rhythm". He was not completely happy with either of his definitions of this term but felt that "the more the arts develop the more they depend on each other for definition." (122) For the first "leitmotif" is often substituted, while Brown suggests the phrase "expanding symbol" (123), though neither carries quite the implication of vital organic unity which rhythm imposes on music and which was certainly part of the meaning Forster wanted to convey.

The device qua device again is not original to Forster: he pays tribute to its use in À la recherche du temps perdu (124) and was one of the first critics, though not the first, to do so (125), but he seems, in Howards End (not to mention its predecessors) to have anticipated Proust. (126) However, he acknowledges that the device, of a sort, is present in Meredith, though he calls it "a banner" (127), an epithet which Brown, with some

justification, regards as particularly unjust, and more applicable to the bridge in The Bridge of San Luis Rey. (128)

Certainly in Wilder's book the bridge is not an expanding symbol, representing as it does only the source of a fitting end for those whose lives had lost their meanings, and varying only in so far as those meanings were different. It was Zola who saw the kinship of his own use of repetition to the motifs of Wagner (129) and it is the influence of the latter that Brown guesses to be common to both Forster and Proust (130), a judgement, certainly in Forster's case, with a strong likelihood of accuracy in view of his love of Wagner's music and his use of the Operas in other ways in the novels.

What matters to Forster is that the device should not just "reappear" but be capable of developing, of waxing and waning. (131) The general symbols in A Room with a View, with the exception of water, Brown finds to be "recurrent rather than expanding", which is a fair judgement, and he goes on to praise the "great beauty and power" of those in The Longest Journey (132); which the latter are he does not specify, but he may particularly have had in mind those of the square and circle, and Orion, both of which certainly have more of the element of "expansion" in them, as does the "hay" element in Howards End, which he subjects to a perceptive analysis (133).

But the fact that Forster draws his terminology from music is, perhaps, insufficient reason for regarding any of these

symbols as having a specially musical significance. It is really only for those which can be shown to have irrefutable connections with music itself that the claim can be made with absolute confidence. Thus in Howards End, while the hay, not to mention the house and the wych-elm, is of great importance, the symbols which carry the weight of real musical implication are, as has been seen, those relating to the 5th Symphony - panic and emptiness, goblin footfalls, abyss and so on; and these seem to be of just the "special use" to the novelist which such symbols, as Brown suggests, should be: they enable him to render what "is subtle or otherwise elusive" (134).

Again, the symbols in Maurice - abyss, odours, loneliness, even rain - can, with some justification, be claimed to have a similar type of musical basis, and though they do not possess the same degree of subtlety of suggestion, and the power of unification as those of Howards End, yet both qualities are to some extent present. What they certainly lack is any hint of the "prophetic", and with Forster's term "prophecy" we approach what is undoubtedly the most difficult problem in the nomenclature of Aspects of the Novel.

The problem lies in the fact that Forster is using the word in a highly personal manner, and his insistence, in his approaches to defining it, on the metaphor of song and singer (135) does not always make for clarity of communication. Perhaps a clearer idea of what he intends by "prophecy" is contained in

his summing up of what, in his view, makes Dostoyevsky a prophet but George Eliot only a preacher:

"In Dostoyevsky the characters and situations always stand for more than themselves; infinity attends them, though they remain individuals they expand to embrace it and summon it to embrace them Every sentence he writes implies this extension, and the implication is the dominant aspect of his work." (136)

Now, if Forster himself anywhere approaches the peak of the "prophetic" it is in A Passage to India. Of all his novels, this last is the only one with an aura of vastness, a vastness which lies both in India and in the nameless something beyond; and a vital contribution (quite apart from any other to atmosphere, unification, or sense of mystery) to this impression is made by those symbols, deriving in part from Professor Godbole's song, from the echoes of the Caves, and from the festival of Gokul Ashtami, all of which have a certain musical basis. There are, however, others, such as those relating to landscape, sun and moon, earth and sky, for instance, for which an equal claim to importance in this contribution can be made, and these might only be claimed to have such a basis in so far as they relate to Forster's first kind of Rhythm. Yet because so many of these symbols in A Passage to India, as well as those in Howards End and Maurice, do have this basis, and because those that do not nevertheless perform a function which he saw as analogous to rhythms in music, Forster's contribution to the novel in this

field must be seen, from a musical point of view, as one of his most important.

What is also significant in the relationship between the overall "musical" effect of A Passage to India and its possibly "prophetic" quality is Forster's comment about Wuthering Heights:

"(It) is filled with sound - storm and rushing wind - a sound more important than words or thoughts." (137)

A strong case has been made out for A Passage to India's being "A Symphony of Sound" (138), and there can be no doubt that Forster's achievement in creating his own spectacular sound world in his final novel, contributing so vitally as it does to what he regards as the highest peak attainable in fiction writing, is another of his greatest in the musical area.

If, however, Forster's finest musical achievement lies in this sound world and in the first kind of rhythm, then that in the second kind of rhythm is only a little less fine. Burra has expressed the view that The Longest Journey and A Passage to India are "planned like symphonies in three movements" (139), and Beer goes further:

"If Forster finds no strict analogy to (his) second type of rhythm, the fact that both (novels) exist in three large, designated blocks suggests that he may have been trying for some such effect in his own writing." (140)

This is a suggestion having a strong possibility of likelihood,

both in view of what has been said above about the Sonata-form structure evidenced in A Room with a View (141), and what Forster himself has to say about Virginia Woolf's To the Lighthouse:

"(It) is in three movements. It has been called a novel in sonata form, and certainly the slow central section, conveying the passing of time, does demand a musical analogy." (142)

Beer goes on:

"In the last novel (A Passage to India) particularly, large themes expand in each section These themes are undoubtedly effective, though it is doubtful whether they quite resound against each other in a symphonic manner. They are perceived intellectually rather than harmonically."

It is a just judgement: in A Passage to India Forster achieves his greatest large-scale musical effect, but to go as far as Brown who, from a slightly different viewpoint sees it as

"a prophetic novel, a singing in the halls of fiction" (143) is to go a little too far. Great chords resound, but not the greatest.

Fater's dictum, anticipated in Schopenhauer's "Wie die Musik zu werden, ist das Ziel jeder Kunst" (144), that "all art constantly strives towards the condition of music" (145), is well known; thus it is not surprising to find a writer, with

such a demonstrable interest in music, and so extensive an integration of music into his works as Forster exhibits, having his novels described by a critic as

"(aspiring) to the condition of music and (being) governed by that end in every part." (146)

"In every part" is an exaggeration, if a pardonable one, and certainly "aspire" is all they can do, for Forster was up against at least one problem put succinctly by Kermode: that if the novelist

"declares for music as a criterion for formal purity" (and Forster's various comments on music seem to suggest that he might so declare) the trouble is that "in the novel, the matter which seeks pure form is itself impure." (147)

Why then did Forster, in the face of what is an unattainable goal, still turn to music? Burra calls him

"a musician who chose the novel because he had ideas to utter which needed a more distinct articulation than music could make" (148)

and Rose Macaulay expresses a similar sentiment when she says that

"even had he been a musician, he could not have said all he wanted in music. It had to be expressed in words, which trace the pattern of an imagination richly charged with the perceptions of more than words can actually say." (149)

It is ironic that Forster's musical idol, Beethoven, should, in his Choral Symphony, also have turned to words to give

full expression to the magnitude of his thoughts, but perhaps this action helps to provide the final answer to our question: it is precisely because Forster's imagination conjured up visions that were ultimately ineffable (150) that, although he inevitably chose words as his medium, he, moving in the opposite direction to Beethoven, resorted to music to give as fully as was humanly possible some sort of expression to those elements in his visions which were inexpressible in any other way.

"Our most musical novelist" is a title which he well deserves.

*** *** ***

*** *** ***

None of the foregoing text has appeared in published form.

NOTES to CHAPTER 8

- 1) McConkey, op. cit., Chapter 3, p. 82.
- 2) White, op. cit., cited in Casebook, p. 136.
- 3) Burra, op. cit., p. xxiii.
- 4) LJ, Chapter 10, p. 90.
- 5) LJ, Chapter 3, p. 45. See Chapter 4 above for the discussion of this passage.
- 6) Richard Hoggart: "A Question of Tone", Speaking to Each Other: Vol. 2 About Literature, Chatto & Windus, London, 1970, pp. 194-5 and 196-7.
- 7) Rose Macaulay, op. cit., Chapter 15, p. 255.
- 8) Beer, op. cit., Chapter 8, p. 207. See also p. 203.
- 9) Ibid., Chapter 5, p. 129.
- 10) Stone, op. cit., Chapter 10, p. 268.
- 11) AN, Chapter 2, p. 33.
- 12) Ibid., Chapter 1, p. 24.
- 13) Ibid., Chapter 4, p. 79.
- 14) Ibid., p. 74.
- 15) Ibid., Chapter 2, p. 34.
- 16) Ibid., p. 47.
- 17) Ibid., Chapter 7, p. 129.
- 18) Ibid., p. 131.
- 19) Ibid., p. 140.
- 20) Ibid., Chapter 5, p. 96.
- 21) Ibid., Chapter 8, p. 168.
- 22) Ibid., p. 169.
- 23) Ibid.

- 24) Ibid., Chapter 2, p. 46.
- 25) Rose Macaulay, op. cit., Chapter 14, p. 244.
- 26) Percy Lubbock, The Craft of Fiction, Chapter 1, p. 1.
- 27) AN, Chapter 8, p. 170.
- 28) Cited by Rose Macaulay, op. cit., Chapter 16, pp. 258-9.
- 29) Rose Macaulay, ibid.
- 30) Henry Fielding, Tom Jones, Book 4, Chapter 5.
- 31) William Thackeray, Vanity Fair, Chapter 4.
- 32) George Eliot, The Mill on the Floss. See, for instance,
Book 2, Chapter 2, Book 4, Chapter 3,
Book 5, Chapters 1 and 3.
- 33) See Chapter 4 above.
- 34) Compton Mackenzie, Sinister Street, Book 2, Chapter 17.
- 35) Beer, op. cit., Chapter 8, p. 207.
- 36) Jane Austen, Sense and Sensibility, Chapter 7.
- 37) Ibid., Chapter 10.
- 38) Ibid.
- 39) Ibid., Chapter 16.
- 40) Ibid., Chapter 46. A strong case can also be made out for
the structural importance of Jane Fairfax's musical
ability, and the piano that Frank Churchill buys her on
account of it.
- 41) George Eliot, Middlemarch, Chapter 16.
- 42) Ibid., Chapter 27.
- 43) Ibid., Chapter 43.
- 44) Ibid., Chapter 46.
- 45) Ibid., Chapter 58.
- 46) Ibid., Chapter 62.

- 47) Ibid., Chapter 75.
- 48) Britten, op. cit., p. 83.
- 49) Jane Austen, Persuasion, Chapter 6.
- 50) Jane Austen, Pride and Prejudice, Chapter 10.
- 51) Sir Walter Scott, The Bride of Lammermoor, Chapter 3.
- 52) Sir Walter Scott, Guy Mannering, Chapter 4.
- 53) Anthony Trollope, The Warden, Chapter 5.
- 54) William Thackeray, Pendennis, Chapter 31.
- 55) See Chapter 5 above.
- 56) See Chapter 4 above.
- 57) See Chapter 2 above.
- 58) John Lucas, "Wagner and Forster: Parsifal and A Room with a View", English Literary History, March, 1966, pp. 92-117.
- 59) TC, pp. 75-84. See, especially, pp.78-9.
- 60) See, in addition to what has been said in Chapter 5 above, Barry R. Westburg, "Forster's Fifth Symphony: Another Aspect of Howards End", Modern Fiction Studies (Winter, 1964-65), pp. 359-365.
- 61) Compton Mackenzie, Sinister Street, Book 2, Chapter 20.
- 62) See Chapter 3 above.
- 63) Henry Fielding, Tom Jones, Book 16, Chapter 5.
- 64) See, for instance, Chapters 4 and 6 above.
- 65) Samuel Butler, The Way of All Flesh, Chapter 46.
- 66) Ibid., Chapter 49.
- 67) See Chapter 2 above.
- 68) George Eliot, Middlemarch, Chapter 9.
- 69) Ibid., Chapter 64.

- 70) RWV, Chapter 1, p. 16.
- 71) RWV, Chapter 4, p. 51.
- 72) RWV, Chapter 12, p. 136.
- 73) RWV, Chapter 7, p. 78.
- 74) RWV, Chapter 15, p. 158.
- 75) RWV, Chapter 12, p. 138.
- 76) WAFI, Chapter 6, p. 83.
- 77) Ibid.
- 78) Ibid., p. 92.
- 79) WAFI, Chapter 9, p. 150.
- 80) LJ, Chapter 7, p. 97.
- 81) LJ, Chapter 10, p. 101.
- 82) LJ, Chapter 33, p. 288.
- 83) LJ, Chapter 13, p. 137.
- 84) HE, Chapter 33, pp. 250-1.
- 85) Ibid., p. 251.
- 86) HE, Chapter 6, p. 45.
- 87) HE, Chapter 13, p. 103.
- 88) HE, Chapter 23, p. 188.
- 89) HE, Chapter 25, pp. 201-2, Chapter 27, p. 224,
Chapter 28, p. 227, Chapter 41, p. 295.
- 90) HE, Chapter 23, p. 188, Chapter 34, p. 261.
- 91) HE, Chapter 12, p. 97, Chapter 44, p. 313.
- 92) M, Chapter 9, p. 54.
- 93) Ibid., p. 56.

- 94) See Chapter 6 above.
- 95) See also Chapter 6 above.
- 96) See Chapter 7 above.
- 97) Aldous Huxley, On Art and Artists, "The Rest is Silence", p. 318.
- 98) RWV, Chapter 2, p. 30.
- 99) RWV, Chapter 12, pp. 136-7.
- 100) WAFI, Chapter 3, p. 45.
- 101) Ibid., p. 46.
- 102) WAFI, Chapter 5, pp. 75-6.
- 103) WAFI, Chapter 6, p. 98.
- 104) WAFI, Chapter 7, pp. 111-112.
- 105) WAFI, Chapter 8, p. 140.
- 106) LJ, Chapter 11, p. 108.
- 107) LJ, Chapter 12, p. 114.
- 108) LJ, Chapter 35, p. 288.
- 109) LJ, Chapter 26, p. 217.
- 110) LJ, Chapter 27, p. 230.
- 111) HE, Chapter 11, p. 84.
- 112) HE, Chapter 33, p. 252.
- 113) HE, Chapter 44, p. 317.
- 114) M, Chapter 26, p. 121.
- 115) M, Chapter 38, p. 173.
- 116) M, Chapter 45, p. 209.
- 117) M, see, for instance, Chapter 7, p. 46, Chapter 13, p. 74, Chapter 20, p. 97, Chapter 40, p. 180, Chapter 43, p. 195.

- 118) Brown, op. cit., Section 2, pp. 34-5.
- 119) Aldous Huxley, Point Counter Point, Chapter 22, pp.297-8.
- 120) Aldous Huxley, Preface to On Art and Artists.
- 121) André Gide, Les Faux Monnayeurs, Part II, Chapter 3,
translated by Dorothy Bussy (Penguin).
- 122) AN, Chapter 8, p. 151.
- 123) Brown, op. cit., Section 2, p. 35.
- 124) AN, Chapter 8, pp. 166-8.
- 125) See Brown, op.cit., Section 2, p. 41.
- 126) Ibid., p. 46.
- 127) AN, Chapter 8, p. 168.
- 128) Brown, op. cit., Section 2, p. 41.
- 129) See Brown, op. cit., Section 1, p. 28.
- 130) Brown, op. cit., Section 2, p. 54.
- 131) AN, Chapter 8, p. 168.
- 132) Brown, op. cit., Section 2, p. 53.
- 133) Ibid., pp. 46-51.
- 134) Ibid., p. 55.
- 135) See this Chapter above, Note 17, and throughout
Chapter 7 of AN.
- 136) AN, Chapter 7, p. 136.
- 137) Ibid., p. 148.
- 138) See Chapter 7 above.
- 139) Burra, op. cit., p. xix. It is again the Goldsworthy
Lowes Dickinson/Forster three-movement view of the
5th Symphony, and not the usual four-movement one,
we see here.

- 140) Beer, op. cit., Chapter 8, p. 202. It must not be forgotten that Allen (op. cit., p. 938) saw a single Sonata-form movement.
- 141) See Chapter 2.
- 142) Virginia Woolf, TC, p. 254.
- 143) Brown, op. cit., Section 4, p. 115.
- 144) Schriften "über Musik, p. 159.
- 145) "The School of Giorgione" in The Renaissance. In relation to both these see: Calvin S. Brown, Music and Literature: A Comparison of the Arts, University of Georgia Press, Athens, Georgia, 1948.
- 146) Beer, op. cit., Chapter 8, p. 195.
- 147) Kermode, op. cit., cited in Casebook, p. 217.
- 148) Burra, op. cit., p. xix.
- 149) Rose Macaulay, op. cit., Chapter 17, p. 274.
- 150) This is the word that Wilde uses to describe, amongst other feelings, Lucy's when she plays the piano. (Wilde, op. cit., Chapter 5, p. 163).

SELECT BIBLIOGRAPHY

A : WORKS by E. M. FORSTER

(1) NOVELS

Quotations from Forster's novels are taken from the most conveniently available edition, the Penguin, as follows:

- | | |
|------------------------------------|---|
| <u>A Room with a View,</u> | Penguin Books Ltd., Harmondsworth,
Middlesex, England, 1971. |
| <u>Where Angels Fear to Tread,</u> | Penguin Books Ltd., Harmondsworth,
Middlesex, England, 1970. |
| <u>The Longest Journey,</u> | Penguin Books Ltd., Harmondsworth,
Middlesex, England, 1971. |
| <u>Howards End,</u> | Penguin Books Ltd., Harmondsworth,
Middlesex, England, 1971. |
| <u>Maurice,</u> | Penguin Books Ltd., Harmondsworth,
Middlesex, England, 1975. |
| <u>A Passage to India,</u> | Penguin Books Ltd., Harmondsworth,
Middlesex, England, 1971. |

Reference is also made to the following editions:-

- | | |
|----------------------------|---|
| <u>A Room with a View,</u> | Pocket Edition, Edward Arnold & Co.,
London, 1962. |
| <u>Maurice,</u> | Edward Arnold, London, 1971. |
| <u>A Passage to India,</u> | Everyman's Library, No. 972,
J.M. Dent & Sons Ltd., London,
1968. |

The Abinger edition, published by Arnold, which will ultimately become the standard one, has also been consulted, but only Howards End (1973), of the novels, has as yet been published; Where Angels Fear to Tread is scheduled for October, 1975. An excerpt from the unfinished Arctic Summer is printed in:

Gishford, Anthony (ed.), Tribute to Benjamin Britten on his Fiftieth Birthday, Faber and Faber, London, 1963, pp. 46-55.

(2) SHORT STORIES

Collected Short Stories, Penguin Books Ltd., Harmondsworth, Middlesex, England, 1970.

The Life to Come and Other Stories, edited by Oliver Stallybrass, Penguin Books Ltd., Harmondsworth, Middlesex, England, 1975.

(3) OTHER BOOKS

Abinger Harvest, Penguin Books Ltd., Harmondsworth, Middlesex, England, 1974.

Alexandria, A History and a Guide, Anchor Books, Doubleday and Co., Inc., Garden City, New York, 1961.

Aspects of the Novel, Penguin Books Ltd., Harmondsworth, Middlesex, England, 1971.

England's Pleasant Land : A Pageant Play, The Hogarth Press, London, 1940.

Goldsworthy Lowes Dickinson, Abinger Edition, Edward Arnold (Publishers) Ltd., London, 1973.

The Hill of Devi, Pocket Edition, Edward Arnold & Co., London, 1967.

Pharos and Pharillon, The Hogarth Press, London, 1972.

Marianne Thornton, Edward Arnold (Publishers) Ltd., London, 1956.

Two Cheers for Democracy, Penguin Books Ltd., Harmondsworth, Middlesex, England, 1972.

(4) ARTICLES

"Aldeburgh", Adam International Review, March/May, 1952, Year 20, pp. 12-13.

"Aspects of a Novel", The Bookseller, 10th September, 1960 p. 1230.

- "A Concert of Old Instruments", The Athenaeum, 11th July, 1919, p. 597.
- "The Edinburgh Festival", The Sunday Times, 31st August, 1947, p. 4.
- "The Fifth Anniversary of the Third Programme", The Listener, 4th October, 1951, pp. 539-541.
- "From the Audience", National Gallery Concerts, In Aid of the Musicians Benevolent Fund, 10th October, 1944, Printed for the Trustees, London, 1944, pp. 6-7.
- "George Crabbe, The Poet and the Man", Benjamin Britten: Peter Grimes - Essays, Sadler's Wells Opera Books, 1945, No. 3, pp. 9-14.
- "George Crabbe, The Poet and the Man", Aldeburgh Anthology, edited by Ronald Blythe, Snape Maltings Foundation in association with Faber Music, Aldeburgh, Suffolk, 1972, pp. 3-7.
- "Handel in Egypt", The Egyptian Mail, 6th January, 1918.
- "Looking Back on the Aldeburgh Festival", The Listener, 24th June, 1948, p. 1011 and p. 1013.
- "Music in Edinburgh: The Reid Concerts", The Athenaeum, 26th December, 1919, p. 1406.
- "A Musician in Egypt", The Egyptian Mail, 21st October, 1917.
- "The Magic Flute: English Version of the Libretto" by W.H. Auden and Chester Kallman, (Review), The Listener, 21st November, 1957, p. 850 and p. 853.
- "My First Opera", Opera, June, 1963, Vol. 14, pp. 373-4.
- "On Receiving the First Aspen Award", (Benjamin Britten), The Observer, 20th December, 1964, p. 7.
- "Revolution at Bayreuth", The Listener, 4th January, 1954, pp. 755-57.
- "A Shrine for Diaghilev", The Observer, 25th December, 1955, p. 4.
- "Sunday Music", The Egyptian Mail, 2nd September, 1917.

(5) LETTERS

- To The Listener, 8th July, 1948, p. 61, on the Aldeburgh Festival.
- To K. Natwar-Singh, dated 2nd May, 1957, 8th January, 1958, and 6th June, 1961, The New Statesman, 14th June, 1974, pp. 841-2.
- To The Times, 26th August, 1957, p. 10, a personal tribute on the death of Professor E.J. Dent.
- To The Times Literary Supplement, 17th August, 1956, p. 487, on Money for the Arts.

(6) MANUSCRIPTS, TYPESCRIPTS, and TRANSCRIPTS

Manuscript of Notes on the Beethoven Sonatas, The Library, King's College, Cambridge.

Typescript of a "Letter", dated September, 1951, sent from Cambridge, England, and beginning "My dear America", Item 9, Box 14, Eric Crozier Donation, The Library, King's College, Cambridge.

Transcript (22nd November, 1960) of the discussion on Billy Budd between Benjamin Britten, E.M. Forster, and Eric Crozier, broadcast on the B.B.C. Third Programme on 12th November, 1960, in Broadcast Talks, Volume 23, pp. 491-512, The Library, King's College, Cambridge.

B : WORKS on E. M. FORSTER

(1) BIBLIOGRAPHY

- Borrello, Alfred : E.M. Forster : An Annotated Bibliography of Secondary Materials, The Scarecrow Author Bibliographies, The Scarecrow Press, Inc., Metuchen, N.J., 1973.
- Gerber, Helmut E. : "E.M. Forster : An Annotated Checklist of Writings About Him", English Fiction in Transition, II, Spring, 1959, pp. 4-27.

Kirkpatrick, Brownlee Jean : A Bibliography of E.M. Forster,
2nd (Revised) Impression, Rupert Hart-Davis, London,
1968.

McDowell, Frederick P.W. : English Literature in Transition
1880-1920, XIII, (E.M. Forster Memorial Volume)
University of Arizona, 1970.

(2) BOOKS on E. M. FORSTER

Ackerley, J.R. : E.M. Forster : A Portrait, Published by
Ian McKelvie at 65, Lakenheath, London, N.14. 1970.

Beer, John B. : The Achievement of E.M. Forster,
Chatto and Windus, London, 1968.

Bradbury, Malcolm (ed.) : E.M. Forster : "A Passage to
India", A Casebook, Macmillan and Co., Ltd.,
London, 1970.

Bradbury, Malcolm (ed.) : Forster : A Collection of
Critical Essays, Twentieth Century Views Series,
Prentice-Hall, Inc., Englewood Cliffs, N.J., 1966.

Brander, Laurence : E.M. Forster : A Critical Study,
Rupert Hart-Davis, London, 1968.

Brower, Reuben A. : The Fields of Light, Oxford University
Press, London, 1951.

Crews, Frederick C. : E.M. Forster : The Perils of
Humanism, Princeton University Press, Princeton,
New Jersey; Oxford University Press, London, 1962.

Gransden, K.W. : E.M. Forster, Writers and Critics Series,
Oliver and Boyd, Edinburgh, 1970.

Macaulay, Rose : The Writings of E.M. Forster, Second
Impression, The Hogarth Press, London, 1970.

McConkey, James : The Novels of E.M. Forster, Cornell
University Press, Ithaca, New York, 1957.

McDowell, F.P.W. : E.M. Forster, Twayne English Authors
Series No. 89, Twayne Publishers, New York, 1969.

Rose, Martial : E.M. Forster, Literature in Perspective
Series, Evans Brothers, Ltd., London, 1970.

- Stallybrass, Oliver (ed.) : Aspects of E.M. Forster,
Edward Arnold, Ltd., London, 1969.
- Stone, Wilfred : The Cave and the Mountain : A Study of
E.M. Forster, Stanford University Press, California;
Oxford University Press, London, 1969.
- Trilling, Lionel : E.M. Forster, revised edition with New
Preface, The Hogarth Press, London, 1969.
- Wilde, Alan : Art and Order : A Study of E.M. Forster,
Peter Owen, London, 1965.

(3) ARTICLES on aspects of E.M. Forster's Works

- Allen, Glen O. : "Structure, Symbol and Theme in E.M. Forster's
A Passage to India", PMLA, LXX (1955), pp. 934-54.
- Bayliss, Stanley A. : "E.M. Forster and Music", The
Chesterian, Volume XVIII, No. 131, January-February,
1937, pp. 61-65.
- Britten, Benjamin : "Some Notes on Forster and Music",
Aspects of E.M. Forster, edited by Oliver Stallybrass,
Edward Arnold, Ltd., London, 1969, pp. 81-86.
- Burra, Peter : "The Novels of E.M. Forster", The Nineteenth
Century and After, November, 1934, reprinted as the
Introduction to the Everyman Edition of A Passage to
India, pp. xi - xxviii.
- Chaudhuri, Nirad C. : "Passage To and From India",
Encounter II, June, 1954, pp. 19-24.
- Furbank, P.N. and Haskell, F.J.H. : "E.M. Forster", Writers
at Work, ed. Malcolm Cowley, The Viking Press, New York,
1958, and reprinted in Bradbury, Malcolm : E.M. Forster:
"A Passage to India", A Casebook, Macmillan and Co., Ltd.,
London, 1970, pp. 27-31.
- Harvey, W.J. : "Imagination and Moral Theme in E.M. Forster's
The Longest Journey", Essays in Criticism, VI, 1956,
reprinted in Forster : A Collection of Critical Essays,
Twentieth Century Views Series, Prentice-Hall, Inc.,
Eaglewood Cliffs, N.J., 1966, pp. 117-127.
- Lucas, John : "Wagner and Forster : Parsifal and A Room
with a View", English Literary History, March, 1966,
pp. 92-117.

- Priestley, J.B. : Review of A Passage to India, The London Mercury, LVII, July, 1924, reprinted in Bradbury, Malcolm : E.M. Forster : "A Passage to India", A Casebook, Macmillan and Co., Ltd., London, 1970, pp. 55-59.
- Randall, Alec : "Forster in Rumania", Aspects of E.M. Forster, edited by Oliver Stallybrass, Edward Arnold, Ltd., London, 1969, pp. 51-60.
- Richards, I.A. : "A Passage to E.M. Forster : Reflections on a Novelist", Forum, LXXVIII, December, 1927, pp. 914-20.
- Roerick, William : "Forster and America", Aspects of E.M. Forster, edited by Oliver Stallybrass, Edward Arnold, Ltd., London, 1969, pp. 61-72.
- Shusterman, David : "The Curious Case of Professor Godbole : A Passage to India re-examined", PMLA, LXXVI, 1961, pp. 426-35.
- Werry, Richard R. : "Rhythm in Forster's A Passage to India", Studies in Honor of John Wilcox, edited by A. Dayle Wallace and Woodburn O. Ross, Wayne State University Press, Detroit, 1958, pp. 227-237.
- Westburg, Barry R. : "Forster's Fifth Symphony : Another Aspect of Howards End", Modern Fiction Studies, X, Winter, 1964-65, pp. 359-365.
- White, Gertrude M. : "A Passage to India : Analysis and Revaluation", PMLA, LXVIII, September, 1953, pp. 641-657.
- Wilkinson, Patrick : "Forster and King's", Aspects of E.M. Forster, edited by Oliver Stallybrass, Edward Arnold, Ltd., London, 1969, pp. 13-28.
- Wilson, Angus : "A Conversation with E.M. Forster", Encounter, IX, November, 1957, pp. 52-7.

(4) GENERAL BOOKS relating to E.M. Forster's work

- Ackerley, J.R. : Hindoo Holiday, An Indian Journal, Chatto and Windus, London, 1932.
- Anonymous : Music performed at the National Gallery Concerts, 10th October, 1939, to 10th April, 1946, Privately Printed, London, MCMXLVIII.

- Bernbaum, Ernest : A Guide through the Romantic Movement,
2nd edition, The Ronald Press Co., New York, 1949.
- Blythe, Ronald (ed.) : Aldeburgh Anthology, Snape Maltings
Foundation in association with Faber Music, Aldeburgh,
Suffolk, 1972.
- Bowen, Catherine Drinker and von Meck, Barbara: Beloved Friend:
The Story of Tchaikovsky and Nadejda von Meck,
Random House, New York, 1937.
- Britten, Benjamin : Peter Grimes : Essays by Benjamin Britten,
E.M. Forster, Montagu Slater, and Edward Sackville-
West, John Lane, The Bodley Head, London, 1946.
- Brown, Calvin S. : Music and Literature : A Comparison
of the Arts, University of Georgia Press, Athens,
Georgia, 1948.
- Brown, E.K. : Rhythm in the Novel, University of Toronto
Press, Geoffrey Cumberledge, Oxford University Press,
1950.
- Crews, Frederick C. : The Pooh Perplex : A Freshman
Casebook, E.P. Dutton and Co., Inc., New York, 1963.
- Dickinson, Goldsworthy Lowes : The Magic Flute : A Fantasia,
George Allen and Unwin, Ltd., London, 1943.
- Evans, Edwin : Tchaikovsky, J.M. Dent and Sons, Ltd.,
London, 1966.
- Furst, Lilian : Romanticism, No. 2 of The Critical Idiom
Series, Methuen and Co., Ltd., London, 1969.
- Garden, Edward : Tchaikovsky, J.M. Dent and Sons, Ltd.,
London, 1973.
- Gishford, Anthony (ed.) : Tribute to Benjamin Britten on his
Fiftieth Birthday, Faber and Faber, London, 1963.
- Holroyd, Michael : Lytton Strachey: A Biography,
Heinemann, London, 1971.
- Holroyd, Michael (edited and introduced by) : Lytton Strachey
by Himself, a Self-Portrait, Heinemann, London,
1971.
- Howard, Patricia : The Operas of Benjamin Britten :
An Introduction, Barrie and Rockliff, The Crescent
Press, London, 1969.

- Hoggart, Richard : Speaking to Each Other, Volume 2 About Literature, Chatto & Windus, London, 1970.
- Huxley, Aldous : On Art and Artists, edited and introduced by Morris Philipson, Chatto and Windus, London, 1960.
- Jacobs, Arthur, and Sadie, Stanley : Opera, A Modern Guide, David and Charles, Newton Abbot, Devon, 1971.
- Jacobs, Robert : Wagner, J.M. Dent and Sons, Ltd., London, 1947.
- Kendall, Alan : Benjamin Britten, Macmillan Ltd., London, 1973.
- Kermode, Frank : Puzzles and Epiphanies : Essays and Reviews 1958 - 1961, Routledge and Kegan Paul, Ltd., London, 1962.
- Kettle, Arnold : An Introduction to the English Novel, Volume 2, Hutchinson and Co., Ltd., London, 1972.
- Lassimonne, Denise, and Ferguson, Howard : Myra Hess By Her Friends, Hamish Hamilton, London, 1966.
- Lightwood, James T. : Music and Literature, The Epworth Press, J. Alfred Sharp, London, 1931.
- Lubbock, Percy: The Craft of Fiction, second impression, Jonathan Cape, London, 1921.
- Mackerness, E.D. : A Social History of English Music, Routledge & Kegan Paul, London, 1966.
- Matthews, Denis : In Pursuit of Music, Victor Gollancz Ltd., London, 1966.
- Morley, Sir Alexander : The Harrap Opera Guide, George Harrap and Co., Ltd., London, 1970.
- Newman, Ernest : Gluck and the Opera, A Study in Musical History, Victor Gollancz, Ltd., London, 1964.
- Parment, Simon : The Symphonies of Sibelius, translated by Kingsley A. Hart, Cassell, London, 1959.
- Rau, Santha Rama : A Passage to India, a play from the novel by E.M. Forster, Samuel French, London, 1960.

- Sanders, Charles Richard : Lytton Strachey : His Mind and Art, Yale University Press, New Haven, Oxford University Press, London, 1950.
- Scott, Marion : Beethoven, J.M. Dent and Sons, Ltd., London, 1947.
- Spurgeon, Caroline : Shakespeare's Imagery and What It Tells Us, Cambridge University Press, 1965.
- Walker, Ernest : A History of Music in England, 3rd edition, revised and enlarged by J.A. Westrup, Oxford University Press, London, 1966.
- Weinstock, Herbert : Tchaikovsky, Cassell and Co., Ltd., London, 1946.
- Woolf, Virginia : A Writer's Diary, edited by Leonard Woolf, The Hogarth Press, London, 1953.

(5) GENERAL ARTICLES relating to E.M. Forster's work

- Britten, Benjamin : Peter Grimes, Sadler's Wells Opera Books, 1945, No. 3, pp. 7 - 8.
- Crozier, Eric : "Writing an Opera", Adam International Review, March/May, 1952, pp. 17 - 19.
- Dickinson, Goldsworthy Lowes : "Noise that you pay for", The Independent Review, August, 1904, pp. 377-390.
- Orwell, George : "Politics and the English Language", Inside the Whale and other Essays, Penguin Books, Ltd., Harmondsworth, Middlesex, 1957.
- Strachey, Lytton : "Music and Men", The Spectator, 101, 19th December, 1908, pp. 1059 - 1060.

(6) GENERAL TRANSCRIPT

- Crozier, Eric : Writing an Opera, Transcript (photocopy) of a talk given on the B.B.C. Third Programme on 1st December, 1951. Item 11, Box 14, of the Forster collection, The Library, King's College, Cambridge.

(7) SCORES

- Beethoven, Ludwig van : Sonata No. 32 in C minor, Op. 111, Klaviersonaten, Band II (urtext), edited by B.A. Wallner, G. Henle-Verlag, München - Duisburg, no date, pp. 309 - 329.
- Beethoven, Ludwig van : Symphony No. 5 in C minor, Op. 67, Eulenberg Miniature Score, Leipzig, no date.
- Britten, Benjamin : Albert Herring, (dedicated to E.M. Forster), Vocal Score, Hawkes and Son, London, 1948.
- Britten, Benjamin : Billy Budd, An Opera in four Acts, Libretto by E.M. Forster and Eric Crozier, Vocal Score by Erwin Stein, Hawkes and Son (London) Ltd., 1952.
- Britten, Benjamin : Peter Grimes, Vocal Score, Boosey and Hawkes Ltd., London, 1945.
- Donizetti, Gaetano : Lucia di Lammermoor, Vocal Score, Boosey and Hawkes, London, no date.
- Glück, Christoph : Armide, Vocal Score, Choudens, Paris, no date.
- Tschaikowsky, Peter : Symphony No. 6 in B minor, Philharmonia Miniature Score No. 64, Universal Edition, Vienna & London, 1960.
- Wagner, Richard : "Götterdämmerung", Vocal Score, B. Schott's Söhne, Mainz, no date.
- Wagner, Richard : Lohengrin, Full Score, C.F. Peters, Leipzig, no date.
- Wagner, Richard : Die Meistersinger von Nürnberg, Vocal Score, Bei B. Schott's Söhne, Mainz, no date.
- Wagner, Richard : Parsifal, Vocal Score, C.F. Peters, Leipzig, no date.
- Wagner, Richard : Das Rheingold, Vocal Score, Breitkopf & Härtel, London, 1910.
- Wagner, Richard : Siegfried, Vollständiger Klavierauszug mit Text, Breitkopf & Härtel, Leipzig, no date.

Wagner, Richard : Tannhäuser, Full Score, C.F. Peters,
Leipzig, no date.

Wagner, Richard : Tristan and Isolde, Vocal Score,
Kalmus, New York, no date.

*** *** ***