

FROM ESSENTIALISM TO THE ESSENTIAL: PRAGMATICS AND MEANING OF PUNEÑO SIKURI PERFORMANCE IN LIMA¹

Thomas Turino

In most studies of rural to urban migration in Peru, as in my own earlier work, an Andean-*criollo* dichotomy is a constant motif that is based on an overly static, essentialist conception of culture and identity. Scholars' views of Andean migrants in Lima prior to the 1960s were framed in terms of acculturation: the subordinate rural-based Andean group abandoning "their culture" and adopting *criollo* culture after arriving in the capital². In his 1979 article, "From Homogenization to Heterogenization in Lima, Peru," Richard Schaedel usefully drew attention to a counter trend evident after the 1960s which has been recognized more widely as the "Andeanization of Lima"³. As Schaedel pointed out, the migrants became a major cultural, economic, and political force in Lima due to sheer numbers as well as the growing crisis within the Peruvian state since before the time of Juan Velasco.

At a general level, Schaedel's and others' emphasis on the "continuity of Andean culture" in Lima seems to be supported by the increased and varied presence of regional highland musical styles in the city, especially after the mid-1950s.⁴ The "Andeanization of Lima" view, however, is simply a reversal of the previous acculturation paradigm with the essentialist "*Andino/criollo*" dyad still lurking beneath the surface. In either case, little attention has been granted to the processes of cultural creation through which new forms, practices, identities, and sensibilities are being forged by highlanders in the city.

I. From Essentialism to the Essential

As I use it here, "cultural essentialism" refers to the belief that a person or members of a group will have a certain essence, a certain identity and cosmology, and will maintain certain practices and ideas simply because of where and to whom they were born—as if such things were natural, stable endowments, rather than social constructions. The overly homogeneous "organic whole," or superindividual, model of culture, so prevalent in earlier anthropology and ethnomusicology, is related to this idea, as are common dualistic frameworks involving "culture contact," "westernization," "urbanization," "acculturation," "modernization," and "cultural continuity and change."

Essentialist views of culture ignore individuals' subjectivity and historically specific relations to external conditions—the precise site of intersection where “culture” is dialectically created, recreated, and transformed (Bourdieu 1977; Giddens 1979). Another danger is that essentialism supports the view of subaltern peoples' position as “natural,” unchangeable, and incontestable. An alternative position, often branded as poststructuralist, emphasizes the ambiguous, situationally relative, and socially constructed nature of identity, social practices, and meaning.⁵

I find much in this line of thinking to be intellectually useful and politically important; Orin Starn's stimulating critique of Andeanist ethnography, “Missing the Revolution: Anthropologists and the War in Peru” (1991), is a case in point.⁶ The difficulty is that, in stressing the fluidity and polysemy of identity and social practice, Starn and others writing from this position often go to the other extreme.⁷ Starn seems to almost dismiss the idea that traditions, conventional social meanings, and markers of cultural difference exist for highland Peruvians.⁸ Moreover, he appears to downplay the idea that traditions are often extremely important to, and may not be thought of as the least bit relative for, the people who practice them (see Mayer 1991:480). While I agree that social identities are constructed, they do have real effects in the world and they may not be quite as fluid as poststructuralists claim—witness the difficulty of combating, or escaping, racism in many societies.

From my perspective, it is crucial to distinguish between essentialist ethnographic representations, and the feelings of **essentialness** that people may have about their own traditions, arts, and identity. This paper is an attempt to find a middle ground between fixed, reified conceptions of “culture” and more recent poststructuralist views.

2. Conimeño Regional Associations

The paper is about people from the southern highland state of Puno who are now residents and belong to regional associations in Lima. They were among the tremendous number of highlanders who migrated to the coastal capital city after World War II. As recently as 1940, Lima-Callao had 645,172 inhabitants (Henriquez *et al.* 1985:12) as compared to about six million by 1985. Migration accounts for a large part of this growth as well as for a series of dramatic transformations of the capital city that was once the bastion of European-oriented *criollo* society in Peru.

Because of discrimination, many highlanders have been reluctant to publicly exhibit cultural markers, including music, that would link them with their place of origin and indigenous ethnicity. By the mid-1970s, however, *serranos* from southern Peru had gained organizational sophistication for dealing with the Lima context, and had come to understand the power of their numbers. They created a variety of relatively successful self-help, grassroots political and economic organizations in the face of the state's and the

formal-economic sectors' unwillingness or inability to deal with them (e.g., see de Soto 1989). This, in turn, led to a positive reevaluation of the importance of highland identity and cultural emblems as **social and political resources**—i.e., not as personal essences but as foundations of social unity and action. Greater numbers of migrants did not begin emphasizing Andean identity more openly in the 1970s simply because of where, and to whom, they were born. Rather, the constraints hindering the expression of highland identity were reduced simultaneously with a growing recognition among migrants that there was something to be gained from articulating this identity.

Along with unions for street vendors, organizations for land invasions to establish homes, community kitchens, and other grassroots movements, highlanders created a tremendous number of regional clubs (an estimated 6,000 in 1980) as the hubs for social networks in Lima.⁹ The regional clubs greatly differ in terms of size and the nature of their activities, but many are involved with organizing fiestas and other musical occasions, and the clubs that I worked with from the state of Puno were central to the formation of music and dance ensembles. By 1985, local musical styles from all over the highlands were commonly heard on any Sunday in various parts of the capital. Over sixty panpipe ensembles had been formed within regional clubs from the state of Puno alone.

3. Centro Social Conima

Between 1984 and 1986 I worked most closely with four regional clubs in Lima whose members were from the rural District of Conima in the Aymara-speaking Province of Huancané, Puno, where I conducted comparative research. I will discuss a single club—Centro Social Conima—consisting of around twenty families. The majority of adult members, coming from rural *ayllus* rather than the district capital town, had lived in Lima for about twenty years.

For Conimeños who decided to join one of these clubs—and they are in a minority among all Conimeños who reside in Lima—these institutions have become important self-help community networks in the city. Reasons for belonging to Centro Social Conima are as tangible as child care, help with roofing their houses, an emergency monetary fund, and a community base for important life-cycle events such as weddings, first haircutting ceremonies, and baptisms. The club is also planning a number of future projects including a joint cemetery plot and a communal cottage industry. A site for the furniture making/finishing “factory” had already been obtained in 1988; Centro Social members explained that because of the growing economic crisis in Peru, they felt the need to establish their own economic enterprise to insure the future of their children.

Most of the members of Centro Social Conima took part together in the land invasion that established their *pueblo joven*, Mariano Melgar. The club

was formed in 1970 following the invasion. Centro Social Conima has various offices to which people are elected on a yearly basis. When important issues have to be discussed, a “general assembly” is called by the President. These meetings involve common democratic decision-making processes such as majority voting by secret ballot or a show of hands, rather than the egalitarian consensus method used in highland Conimeño communities. In the meetings, as in all club social gatherings, and even in many homes, only Spanish is spoken. This is striking since the members are native Aymara speakers, but as they themselves admit, after twenty years in Lima, they are forgetting their mother tongue.

In formal club meetings, issues on a written agenda are introduced by the President, and individual members may speak after being recognized in turn. Sometimes the speakers will stand and address the membership in a formal *criollo* style—e.g., “Mr. President and distinguished members”—and some men may argue their points in a formal and forceful speech style. Such formality amazed me at first given the close relationships between the members. The speech style in these meetings certainly contrasted both with their normal ways of interacting and with public speech styles in Conima, which tend to be of a quiet, indirect manner (Turino 1989). Given that only Conimeños were involved in these meetings, it would seem that the migrants had internalized this style of behavior as proper for certain types of occasions.¹⁰

The Shift from Sports to Music

Until 1975 Centro Social Conima’s main public social activity was soccer, and after this they turned to the performance of *sikuris* (a large-ensemble double-row panpipe tradition), *pinkillus* and *tarkas* (end-blown flutes) as their main unifying and emblematic activity. They strictly perform the musical style and repertory from their home region.

The rise of Puneño musical performance in Lima is directly tied to a significant change within the working-class Puneño regional clubs generally. Before the mid-1970s, all but a handful of the regional associations from Huancañé were exclusively dedicated to sports as their central unifying activity. By 1985, hundreds of clubs had become primarily dedicated to the performance of music and dance.¹¹ People from Huancañé explained that by the 1970s, they had reached a critical mass: the large number of *paisanos* lent moral support to musical performances. They also explained that money could be earned for the club with performance activities, whereas they could not really charge for sports matches. This realization came after a vanguard of Puneño institutions (e.g., Asociación Juvenil Puno) had begun to organize performance events in the city. Puneños also frequently commented that many people felt *vergüenza* (shame, embarrassment) about performing highland traditions in Lima before the 1970s; this attitude changed because of

their growing numbers and enhanced social power during and after the era of President Juan Velasco (1968–1975).

Previously, club membership had been based on regional identity, but people felt constrained not to express that identity in public. Soccer was not associated with highland society or any given region, and as such was an unmarked activity around which they could unite.¹² Highland musical styles, however, clearly indicate regional heritage. The change from sports to musical performance, then, indicates the growing positive sentiments that migrants felt regarding the public display of their highland identity, but this change was not reflected in other realms of practice such as language use, public speech styles, and decision-making processes as I indicated earlier. This was not part of a full-blown restitution of highland culture in Lima as much as a strategic and pragmatic selection of an emblematic activity that was efficacious as well as relatively safe for publicly expressing identity. (There were fewer sanctions against framed “folkloric” performances relative to other realms of practice such as coca chewing and indigenous religious practices and languages.)

4. Centro Social: Musical Practice

Playing music in Centro Social’s musical ensemble has become a prerequisite for belonging to the institution, since dedication and constant participation in club events are the main criteria for membership and, after 1975, musical performance became the primary club activity.

Unlike the usual depiction of migrants “bringing their culture with them” to the city, only a small minority of the Conimeños currently involved in the club ensemble had performing experience before leaving the highlands. Most did not learn to play until becoming involved with one of the Conimeño club ensembles after years in Lima, a few as recently as 1980. For these individuals, performing panpipes and the other highland flutes does not represent a continuity in their own lives, where else are we to locate “cultural continuity?”

The residents say that their chief musical goal is to “sound like Conima,” and through dedication and hard work they have been able to successfully imitate the style and repertory of their favorite hometown ensembles—highland Conimeños agree.¹³ Centro Social’s musical values and practices, however, are really quite distinct from the way things are done in the rural *ayllus*. Centro Social members are aware that their success in producing a faithful copy of hometown repertory and style has actually been facilitated by their divergence from various highland musical values and practices, but they also seem conscious that new conditions and problems require new solutions.

For example, given most of the migrants’ relatively recent involvement with musical performance, hierarchical control by the more experienced club ensemble director has been accepted to aid them in reaching their musical

objectives of faithfully imitating the hometown groups. In their almost weekly rehearsals, Centro Social's ensemble director as well as other musicians criticize and correct players that are found wanting, and for important contest performances, less skilled players are asked to blow softly so that their mistakes will not be heard.

By way of contrast, in rural Conima there is no explicit hierarchical (and hence quality) control within musical ensembles, and individual players are not singled out for correction or criticism during rehearsals or performances. Likewise, because of the egalitarian, conflict-avoidance style of social interaction within the rural communities, any man is welcome to play with his community ensemble regardless of the impact he might have on the quality of its performance, and this indicates a dramatic difference in aesthetic and ethical priorities (Turino 1989, 1990).

In Conima, only one or two rehearsals are held before any given fiesta, and the primary activity during rehearsals is the collective composition of new pieces, not the grooming of old ones. Original composition is highly stressed in Conima as a sign of a community ensemble's competence and uniqueness. *Ayllu* ensembles are actually ridiculed for allegedly copying the style and repertory of other local groups (Turino 1989).

In Lima, however, the residents' primary method for learning style and new repertory during their rehearsals is through the attentive imitation of cassette tapes of rural ensembles recorded in the home district. Although Centro Social Conima has composed a number of their own pieces, in important public performance contests in Lima they consistently play the compositions of the better known hometown groups—especially those of Qhantati Ururi. Strikingly, between 1984 and 1986 Centro Social Conima became concerned with composing their own music only once. This was prior to a trip home during which they were to perform for the first time as a group in a fiesta in Conima. The residents were clearly aware that they would be criticized if they returned home without their own original pieces, so they created two new ones in the weeks before the journey.

Under normal circumstances, however, Centro Social Conima is more concerned with faithful imitation than with original composition, and this is understandable given the heterogeneous Lima context and what is required to index Conimeño identity there. Several residents actually expressed the idea that, because one's environment affects artistic creation, if they began forging their own repertory and style in Lima they would no longer "sound like Conima," thus undermining, what is for them, a primary function of musical performance—creating an emblematic link with home.

That Centro Social Conima places primary emphasis on the quality of their sound and less priority on egalitarian relations, as compared to highland ensembles, also makes sense in light of the aesthetic dispositions by which music is judged in the festival contests in the capital. In these competitions, during a performance that spans approximately six to ten minutes, ensembles

are judged on the basis of their sound, choreography and costumes alone. This aesthetic disposition, resembling a certain European orientation, involves the distancing and isolation of the artistic "product." It is certainly distinct from the situation in highland Conima, where an ensemble is judged more by its ability to invite participation, to make a fiesta come alive with volume, spirit, and stamina, and where originality is at least as important as musical and choreographic precision. Because of a different type of aesthetic stance, the Lima context requires a distinct *modus operandi* for achieving success.

These differences in musical values and practices have had a discernible effect at the level of musical sound despite the residents' attempts to precisely imitate cassette tapes of highland groups. Stylistic discrepancies between Centro Social's ensemble and Qhantati Ururi, the hometown group that the residents model themselves on, most prominently involve differences in rhythmic feel, and in the density of simultaneous individual variations.¹⁴ These stylistic differences are analogous to those commonly found between the faithful followers of a canon and the originators of a style. Qhantati members have the luxury of taking a freer, less self-conscious attitude toward the music, whereas the residents' concern with correctness, coupled with fewer years of musical experience, has resulted in a stiffer, more precise parallel polyphony.

In the case of the Conimeño clubs at least, the much celebrated "continuity" of Andean music in Lima takes place mainly at the level of musical sound, and even here there are telling, albeit relatively subtle, differences. The residents' musical practices and values, and their very conception of what music is, however, provide much greater points of contrast with musical life in the *ayllus* of highland Conima.

5. Club Networks and Festivals

Like the other Puneño performance clubs, Centro Social Conima belongs to formalized club networks which are crucial for organizing public festivals. The club networks also enhance the political power of individual clubs. For example, obtaining their own locales is a primary goal for many lower/working-class regional associations, but few are able to attain this. The umbrella organization to which Central Social belongs, Central Folklórica Puno (CFP), however, petitioned and, by 1986, was able to obtain government land for a locale to be shared by the affiliate institutions.

Since its inception in the late 1970s, the leaders of Central Folklórica Puno took care to foster alliances with the Instituto Nacional de Cultura (INC), providing performers when the INC or the government needed Puneño participation. The leaders of Central Folklórica Puno made the case to the central government that their institution could best serve as representative for the Puneños of the "popular" classes. Their success in convincing the gov-

ernment to donate land to working-class residents is a significant example of the increased political power and organizational sophistication of the Puneños by this time, as well as of the state's need to forge alliances with the migrants. It is accomplishments like this that have convinced some highlanders of the value of emphasizing a regional highland identity as a basis for social unity and action.

Within Central Folklorica Puno, each member club has the right to sponsor one "*festival folklórico*" during the year. The sponsoring institution pays the expenses and collects a cover charge from all participants, both performers and spectators, and earns money from selling food and drinks. These festivals are the major way that the clubs attempt to raise money, and they are the primary context for Puneño musical performance in Lima.

Ayni, the term specifically used by the residents, is the basis for the clubs' participation in these performance events. The term refers to a traditional highland system of reciprocal aid in which a specific type and quantity of labor must be returned in kind. In terms of festival organization, the *ayni* system works as follows. Central Folklorica Puno might have forty member clubs in a given year. Each holds a fund-raising festival within the annual cycle with one or two festivals being sponsored by CFP itself. Centro Social Conima may perform at the festivals of twenty member clubs, and these institutions should reciprocate by performing at Centro Social's event. A club ensemble that performs infrequently will find an empty house on the afternoon of their festival.¹⁵

I attended at least thirty of these festivals and the overall structure was identical.¹⁶ Typically, a few guest clubs begin to arrive around mid-afternoon on Sunday and begin to warm up, playing panpipes or brass band music in their own separate circle in casual alternation with the other groups around them. At about five o'clock, the host club's M. C. announces through the scratchy public address system that the formal performance contest is about to begin. The order of participation is established by the host club, which also provides the judges and trophies. The majority of guest clubs arrive just before the contest begins. After the contest, the trophies are awarded to the winners of the different categories—*trajes de luces* (ornate costumed dances), *sikuris* (a rural panpipe style), and *sikumorenos* (a panpipe style often associated with urban mestizo fiestas). With the awards concluded, the clubs begin performing in different corners of the lot or patio and a general social dance takes place with couples and chains of dancers doing the *wayno* in Puneño style.

Club members consider the formal contest, sometimes before a seated audience, to be the most important feature of these festivals, but the playing and dancing that follow it are the most spirited aspect; it is at this point that the club festivals bear some resemblance to highland fiestas.

Yet large public fiestas in highland Conima are fundamentally associated with religious, agricultural, and formal political occasions; they consistently

incorporate *t'inka* rituals involving coca for the local divinities; and frequently they go on for days, allowing for a different type of social interaction and catharsis. These aspects have not been reproduced in Lima. In terms of both form and meaning, the "*festivales folklóricos*" organized by Puneño migrants are not a continuity of highland custom in Lima as much as they represent a new type of musical occasion for Peru that draws on a variety of models to reach specific goals.

Regardless of the type of festival occasion, the Conimeño residents do not take an active interest in the spiritual knowledge and practices of the older people in the *ayllus*. Given the importance highland Conimeños place on maintaining relations with the local divinities in the *ayllus*, and Centro Social members' discourse about preserving highland culture and custom, I found this intriguing. One Centro Social member explained it this way:

In Conima, the people depend on nature [*la naturaleza*] for their livelihoods, for their food. Here, we work for salaries, for money, therefore we no longer need these beliefs. Since they [people in Conima] depend on nature, if one year there is no rain, they carry water up the mountain, and it always rains; or if there is a flood, they do a ceremony to stop the rain. The *t'inka* and the *ch'alla* are like prayers. But we work for salaries and no longer need these things.

This is not an articulation of skepticism regarding these highland beliefs and practices, it is simply a pragmatic statement that such things are no longer relevant in the residents' current circumstances. They explain that they no longer speak Aymara for similar reasons, and many take an equally pragmatic approach to musical performance—a number of friends told me that they play *sikus* primarily because they want to belong to the club.

6. Conclusions

Observers have commonly used festivals in Lima like the ones I have described, and the fact that the migrants are playing rural highland music at all in the capital, as indicators of the "continuity of Andean culture in Lima" and the "Andeanization" of the capital. But how do we analyze the nature of the clubs, club networks, the festivals, and the Conimeños' musical practices in terms of an Andean/*criollo* or Andean/Western dichotomy?¹⁷ The residents use resources and models for action that are generally associated with both highland and *criollo* sources: they play panpipes, dance the *wayno*, and maintain *ayni* relations, on the one hand; they have abandoned Aymara and coca use have adopted *criollo* speech styles in formal settings, and they use democratic organizational structures including secret ballots, on the other.

But the residents' entire repertory of cultural resources can not simply be reduced to Andean or *criollo* sources. For example, models for institutional organization among migrants were also learned through experience with trade unions, not particularly a *criollo* institution. Collecting entrance fees for a musical event evolved as an idea among the migrants in Lima, but that guest performers and their families should pay the fee alongside everyone

else is, as far as I know, a custom specific to these club events. The centerpiece of the festivals—a formally “staged” contest for highland performing arts—was a tradition that gained currency in Peru after the 1920s in the context of the *indigenista* movement, itself a complex conjuncture (Turino 1988, 1991).¹⁸ Finally, the Conimeño residents’ greater emphasis on formal music contests over participatory fiestas, in combination with their desire to link themselves musically with their home region, has generated a distinct set of aesthetics and musical practices that are neither strictly Andean nor *criollo*.

Given that individuals’ internalized dispositions—“cosmology,” “world-view,” “culture”—are shaped by life experience, and many of the Centro Social members have lived over half their lives in Lima, yet in circumstances distinct from coastal-born Limeños, why should we consider them to be essentially Conimeño or Limeño? Why use a single cultural baseline to assess continuity and change? Various reasons why Centro Social members construct themselves as highlanders, the enhancing of their social unity and power not least among them, have already been suggested; but these are fodder for analysis, not the basis of one. In the case of the Conimeño residents, we do not have the continuity of Andean culture with changes derived from their Lima experience, nor do we have the reverse. Both views—premised on an essentialist conception of culture and identity as systems that are somehow autonomous from concrete individuals, in actual places, in real time—are illogical.

It would be equally illogical, however, to argue that the situation among the Conimeño residents is best understood in poststructuralist terms as a rupture of cultural coherence and floating, ambiguous identities. For Centro Social members, the emphasis on highland Conimeño identity, on their created community in Lima, and on the musical emblems for this identity and community are not relative matters for reflection or speculation; they are **essential** cornerstones of their social lives.

Certainly the categories of “Indian,” “*cholo*,” “highlander,” “*criollo*,” “Conimeño” are constructions, but they are also part of a hierarchical social reality that profoundly affects peoples’ lives. One strategy to subvert the hierarchy is to attack the discriminatory categories. The path that Centro Social members and many other migrants have taken, however, is to appropriate the constructions that have been foisted upon them in order to forge social unity as a strategic response to oppression and to Peru’s social and economic crisis. Within this strategy, cultural essentialism—an unquestioned belief in who one is—may be necessary along with a healthy dose of pragmatism.¹⁹

Beyond this, however, the consistency of the residents’ festivals, rehearsals, and decision making meetings that I witnessed indicates that, indeed, highly formalized traditions, institutions, and structured forms of action have been created by these Conimeños in Lima. The degree of homogeneity or heterogeneity of sources for the creation of traditions is relative to a given context (e.g., rural Conima versus Lima), but this does not suggest an analogous con-

tuum between cultural coherence and rupture. Centro Social members' cultural choices and practices are extremely consistent and coherent; their ethics and practices make sense given the residents' experiences, situation, and their specific goals which ultimately involve the quest for some kind of order and livable space. This goal, like the desire for dignity and community, can hardly be thought of as a distinctly Andean or *criollo* trait.

Notes

- 1 Earlier versions of this paper were presented at the University of Chicago in May, 1991, and at the Symposium on "Cosmology and Music in the Andes" in Berlin, Germany, June 1–6, 1992. The fieldwork for this paper was supported by a Fulbright Fellowship, which I gratefully acknowledge.
- 2 E.g., Fried 1959, 1961; Mangin 1959; Valdivia 1970; Wallace 1984.
- 3 E.g., Doughty 1970; Nuñez & Llórens 1981; Matos 1984:77–81; Nuñez 1985; Altamirano 1988.
- 4 Although a professionalized style of highland *wayno* music hit the airwaves beginning in the 1950s in response to the growing migrant market, the public performance of village music in contexts controlled by lower-class migrants themselves was rare until the 1970s.

Commercial recordings can serve as one index of the growing presence of highland music in the city. Although some mestizo highland music was produced on 78s as early as the 1920s in the context of the *indigenista* movement (Turino 1988), Vivanco (1973:128–29) states that 1947 marks the true beginning of the Andean music recording industry. In that year, José María Arguedas, head of the section of folklore of the Ministry of Education, urged Odeon Records to publish several Andean music records by performers that might be described as being of the 'popular' classes. Other companies entered the market based on the success of these records. Arguedas himself observed that by 1953, Odeon alone had expanded its 'folklore' catalogue to include 96 records from the highland state of Junin, 19 from Ancash, 16 from Huancavelica, 14 from Cusco, and 12 from Ayacucho (1975:125). During the 1960s, the number of highland *wayno* records, primarily in professionalized regional-mestizo styles, grew tremendously (Llórens 1983:122, 124). But as Rodrigo Montoya has observed: "If we look at the records and cassettes of music, one can clearly observe that between 1975 and today they began to record the music of Indians. The music that was recorded previously was primarily that of a higher class strata [*senorial*] from all over" (1987:45).

Migrants from the southern state of Puno were relatively uninvolved with the early phase of the *wayno* recording industry. Two of the four regional associations from the district of Conima—the groups I worked with most closely—had produced LPs of their panpipe (*sikuri*) and flute (*pinkillu*, *tarka*) music in the early 1980s. This fits with Montoya's observation and underlines the growing presence of localized village musical styles in the capital by that time.

- 5 Although Kenneth Gourlay's article on the role of the ethnomusicologist (1978) was an early forerunner, it was not until around 1990 that ethnomusicological publications began to emphasize the complex of ideas that, accurately or not, fall under the headings of "postmodernism" and "poststructuralism." In that year in the journal of *Ethnomusicology* alone, Louise Meintjes stressed the polysemy and multiple political uses of a single sign complex, Paul Simon's Graceland album; Christopher Waterman questioned essentialist notions of Yoruba social identity showing how it was a colonial construct; Veit Erlmann drew attention to problems of essentialism in the rural-urban dichotomy that has been so central to ethnomusicological thought; and I discussed the problems of reporting normative, structuralist accounts of musical practice, and of fixed boundaries for defining ethnographic contexts.
- 6 Following Edward Said's concept of "orientalism," Starn coined the term "Andeanism" to refer to "representation that portrays contemporary highland peasants as outside the flow of modern history" (Starn 1991:64). Andeanism is predicated on an essentialist vision of highland peoples with an emphasis on links with an idealized pre-Columbian past and on a series of binary oppositions: "Andeanism/European, indigenous/Western, precapitalist/capitalist, pagan/Christian, traditional/modern" (*ibid.*:85) and, I would add, rural/urban. Starn rightly criticizes the symbolic use of Andean people as a romantic foil to the equally essentialist portrayal of "Western" capitalist values and "Euroamerican" alienation from nature and community. Starn writes, "Fifteen million diverse inhabitants of a 3,000-mile mountain range became unspoiled 'Andean Indians' for the purposes of a vastly oversimplified us/them dichotomy" (*ibid.*:69). As an alternative, he wants to emphasize the "fluid and often ambiguous quality of Andean personal identity" (*ibid.*:70) as it intersects with the complex, conflictive nature of contemporary Peru-

- vian social life, and as it is affected by the multiple historical connections between different types of places and peoples in Peru.
- 7 Reactions among Andeanists to Starn's article have been defensive and at times virulent for a variety of reasons. In part, negative responses have been due to his own strong language and a reading of other people's work that is sometimes unfairly framed to suit his arguments (see Mayer 1991:479–81). Yet, I believe that strong negative reactions also underscore the degree to which we Andeanists are still bound to romantic essentialist visions and structuralist premises. I think that this is particularly true for ethnomusicologists although there are important exceptions (e.g., Romero 1990).
 - 8 Starn puts in a disclaimer that, "Recognizing these intricate ties [between the cities and the countryside] does not mean downplaying the persistence of sharp cultural differences in the Andean nations. It does, however, require seeing difference not as the result of distance and separation but as constructed within a history of continuous and multilayered connections" (1991:85). Nonetheless, throughout the paper he seems to be critical of scholars who discuss aspects that mark a unique Andean presence, or that point to a distinct cultural continuity.
 - 9 A common phenomenon throughout Latin America and Africa (e.g., Ryo 1986; Little 1973), regional migrant institutions already existed in Lima in the 1920s and 1930s. By some estimates, in 1980 there were around 6,000 different regional associations in Lima. These institutions vary greatly in terms of size, activities and functions according to class and region of origin.

As scholars have suggested for the clubs representing other highland departments, sports, religious fiestas, "folklore" performances, social dances, barbecues, and association business meetings are the main types of social activities around which the club members unite (Doughty 1970:37; Galvez 1981; Altamirano 1984; Nuñez 1985). Researchers usually provide rather sketchy descriptions of the musical and dance activities within the regional associations. What emerges, however, is that while the clubs have had an increasingly major role in organizing events where highland music is performed in the city, the club members from many departments are often not actually involved with performing music and dance themselves. It is on this point that the district and *ayllu* level Puneño clubs differ. The vast majority of Puneño musical and dance ensembles in Lima are formed within the context of regional associations whereas this is often not the case for resident musicians of other highland departments.
 - 10 I attended these meetings after becoming an honorary "socio" over the period of a year, hence, I represented a non-Conimeño presence. It seems very doubtful, however, given the length of the time in question and their modes of interaction in my presence in other contexts, that they had constructed this formal meeting style for my benefit.
 - 11 The large number of clubs involved with musical performance can be determined by those mentioned on the "Voz del Altiplano" radio program in Lima, the primary medium through which Puneño sports and musical events are publicized.
 - 12 In addition, the custom of forming soccer associations had already been established in the capital by *criollo* groups, and thus the highlanders were merely fitting themselves into an established custom (Millones 1970).
 - 13 I played cassette tapes of Centro Social's ensemble for friends in Conima who were most impressed with how well Centro Social had "captured" the Conimeño *sikuri* style.
 - 14 These and other stylistic differences between Qhantati Ururi and Centro Social Conima are discussed at greater length in my book "Moving Away from Silence: Music of the Peruvian Altiplano and the Experience of Urban Migration" (Turino 1993).
 - 15 The success of a given festival is gauged by the number of people that attend, and the general public is certainly welcome. But during the 1984–86 period, the festivals were primarily advertised on radio programs specifically directed to the Puneño resident population (e.g., "La Voz del Altiplano" on Radio Agricultural), on flyers, and by word of mouth; the majority of people that came were either members or were attached to other participating Puneño clubs.
 - 16 One major variation in these events is that the clubs that usually perform *sikuris* most of the year play *pinkillus* and *tarkas* during the carnival season. This is based in, and precisely mirrors, highland custom in regard to instrument use.
 - 17 In debates surrounding the regional clubs and the "Andeanization of Lima," some suggest that these institutions represent a continuity of Andean community in the city, while others argue that social clubs of this kind are both urban and Western in nature (see Altamirano 1984:17). Either might be true depending on the specific club. Both views are in a sense true for Centro Social Conima, but this type of thinking does not get to the most important issues.
 - 18 The residents' very use of the term and conception **folklore** to refer to their events and arts likewise was probably influenced by *indigenismo* and, indirectly, by international academic discourse.

19 I do not mean to imply here that the residents are using a kind of "strategic essentialism." For me this concept is a contradiction in terms since, as I understand it, essentialism is based in an unquestioned belief; while a strategic use of essentialism (qua essentialism) requires a reflexive consciousness and distance that belies such a belief.

References

- Altamirano, Teofilo
 1984 *Presencia andina en Lima metropolitana: Un estudio sobre migrantes y clubes de provincianos*. Lima: Pontificia Universidad Católica del Perú.
 1988 *Cultura andina y pobreza urbana: Aymaras en Lima Metropolitana*. Lima: Pontificia Universidad Católica del Perú Fondo Editorial.
- Arguedas, José María
 1975 *Formación de una cultura nacional indoamericana*. Mexico: Siglo Veintiuno Editores, S.A.
- Bourdieu, Pierre
 1977 *Outline of a Theory of Practice*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Degregori, Carlos Ivan
 1981 "El otro ranking: De música 'folklórica' a música nacional." *La Revista* 4:34–9.
 1984 "Huayno, 'chicha': el nuevo rostro de la música peruana." *Cultura Popular* 13/14:187–92.
- Doughty, Paul L.
 1970 "Behind the Back of the City: 'Provincial' Life in Lima, Peru." In *Peasants in Cities*. William Mangin, ed. Boston: Houghton Mifflin Company, 30–45.
- Erlmann, Veit
 1990 "Migration and Performance: Zulu Migrant Workers' *isicathamiya* Performance in South Africa, 1890–1950." *Ethnomusicology* 34(2):199–220.
- Fried, Jacob
 1959 "Acculturation and Mental Health Among Indian Migrants in Peru." In *Culture and Mental Health*. Marvin Opler, ed. New York: Macmillan.
 1961 "The Indian and Mestizaje in Peru." *Human Organization* 10:23–6.
- Galvez, Bertha
 1981? *Etre aymara aujourd'hui: Migration et clubs regionaux*. Ph.D. thesis, Université de Toulouse le Mirail, Centre Interdisciplinaire d'Études Latinoaméricaines.
- Giddens, Anthony
 1979 *Central Problems in Social Theory: Action, Structure and Contradiction in Social Analysis*. Berkeley: University of California Press.
- Gourlay, Kenneth
 1978 "Towards a Reassessment of the Ethnomusicologist's Role in Research." *Ethnomusicology* 24(1):1–35.
- Henriquez, Narda; Ponce, Ana; Vallenas, Sandra; Garcia, José María; Wendorff, Carlos & Victoria Ponce
 1985 *Lima: Población, trabajo y política*. Lima: Pontificia Universidad Católica del Perú.
- Jongkind, Fred
 1974 "A Reappraisal of the Role of the Regional Associations in Lima, Peru." *Comparative Studies in Society and History* 14:471–82.
- Little, Kenneth
 1973 "Urbanization and Regional Associations: Paradoxical Function." In *Urban Anthropology*. Aidan Southall, ed. New York: Oxford University Press.
- Lloréns, José Antonio
 1983 *Música popular en Lima: Criollos y andinos*. Lima: Instituto de Estudios Peruanos.
- Mangin, William
 1959 "The Role of Regional Associations in the Adaptation of Rural Population in Peru." *Sociologus* 9:23–35.
- Martinez, Hector
 1980 *Migraciones internas en el Perú: Aproximación crítica y bibliografía*. Lima: Instituto de Estudios Peruanos.
- Matos, José
 1984 *Desborde popular y crisis del estado*. Lima: Instituto de Estudios Peruanos.

- Mayer, Enrique
1991 "Peru in Deep Trouble: Mario Vargas Llosa's 'Inquest in the Andes' Reexamined." *Cultural Anthropology* 6(4):466-504.
- Meintjes, Louise
1990 "Paul Simon's Graceland, South Africa, and the Mediation of Musical Meaning." *Ethnomusicology* 34:37-73.
- Millones, Luis
1970 "Deporte y alienación en el Perú: El fútbol en los barrios limeños." *Estudios Andinos* 1(2):87-95.
- Montoya, Rodrigo
1987 *La Cultura Quechua Hoy*. Lima: Hueso Humero Ediciones.
- Núñez, Lucy
1985 "La vigencia de la danza de las tijeras en Lima metropolitana." Master's thesis, Pontificia Universidad Católica del Perú.
- Núñez, Lucy & José Antonio Lloréns
1981 "Lima: de la jarana criolla a la fiesta andina." *Quehacer* 9:107-27.
- Romero, Raul
1990 "Musical Change and Cultural Resistance in the Central Andes of Peru." *Latin American Music Review* 11(1):1-35.
- Ryo Hirabayashi, Lane
1986 "The Migrant Village Association in Latin America: A Comparative Analysis." *Latin American Research Review* 21(3):7-29.
- Schaedel, Richard P.
1979 "From Homogenization to Heterogenization in Lima, Peru." *Urban Anthropology* 8(3/4):399-420.
- de Soto, Hernando
1989 *The Other Path: The Invisible Revolution in the Third World*. New York: Harper & Row Publishers.
- Starn, Orin
1991 "Missing the Revolution: Anthropologists and the War in Peru." *Cultural Anthropology* 6(1):63-91.
- Turino, Thomas
1988 "The Music of Andean Migrants in Lima, Peru: Demographics, Social Power and Style." *Latin American Music Review* 9(2):127-150.
1989 "The Coherence of Social Style and Musical Creation Among the Aymara in Southern Peru." *Ethnomusicology* 33(1):1-30.
1990 "Structure, Context, and Strategy in Musical Ethnography." *Ethnomusicology* 34(3).
1991 "The State and Andean Musical Production in Peru." In *Nation-State and Indian in Latin America*. Joel Sherzer and Greg Urban, eds. Austin: The University of Texas Press, 259-85.
1993 *Moving Away From Silence: Music of the Peruvian Altiplano and the Experience of Urban Migration*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press.
- Valdivia, Oscar
1970 *Migración interna a la metropoli: Contraste cultural, conflicto y desadaptación*. Lima: Imprenta de la Universidad Nacional Mayor de San Marcos.
- Vivanco, J. Alejandro
1973 "El migrante de provincias como interprete del folklore andino en Lima." B.A. thesis, Universidad Nacional Mayor de San Marcos, Lima.
- Wallace, James M.
1984 "Urban Anthropology in Lima: An Overview." *Latin American Research Review* 19(3):57-85.
- Waterman, Christopher
1990 "'Our Tradition is a Very Modern Tradition': Popular Music and the Construction of Pan-Yoruba Identity." *Ethnomusicology* 34(3):367-79.