
Faculty Book Display Case

School of Law

5-2020

Environmental Justice: Law, Policy & Regulation

Clifford Villa

Nadia Ahmad


Rebecca Bratspies

Roger Lin

Clifford Rechtschaffen

See next page for additional authors

Follow this and additional works at: https://digitalrepository.unm.edu/law_facbookdisplay

 Part of the [Energy and Utilities Law Commons](#), [Environmental Law Commons](#), and the [Natural Resources Law Commons](#)

Authors

Clifford Villa, Nadia Ahmad, Rebecca Bratspies, Roger Lin, Clifford Rechtschaffen, Eileen Gauna, and Catherine O'Neill

Environmental Justice

Environmental Justice

Law, Policy & Regulation

THIRD EDITION

Clifford Villa

KELEHER & MCLEOD PROFESSOR OF LAW
UNIVERSITY OF NEW MEXICO SCHOOL OF LAW

Nadia Ahmad

ASSOCIATE PROFESSOR OF LAW
BARRY UNIVERSITY DWAYNE O. ANDREAS SCHOOL OF LAW

Rebecca Bratspies

PROFESSOR OF LAW, CITY UNIVERSITY OF NEW YORK SCHOOL OF LAW

Roger Lin

CLINICAL SUPERVISING ATTORNEY, ENVIRONMENTAL LAW CLINIC
UNIVERSITY OF CALIFORNIA BERKELEY SCHOOL OF LAW

Clifford Rechtschaffen

FORMER PROFESSOR AND CO-FOUNDER, ENVIRONMENTAL LAW &
JUSTICE CLINIC, GOLDEN GATE UNIVERSITY SCHOOL OF LAW

Eileen Gauna

EMERITUS PROFESSOR OF LAW, UNIVERSITY OF NEW MEXICO SCHOOL OF LAW

Catherine O'Neill

FORMER PROFESSOR OF LAW, SEATTLE UNIVERSITY SCHOOL OF LAW



CAROLINA ACADEMIC PRESS
Durham, North Carolina

Copyright © 2020
Carolina Academic Press, LLC
All Rights Reserved.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Names: Villa, Clifford, author. | Ahmad, Nadia Batool, author. | Bratspies, Rebecca M., 1965– author. | Lin, Roger, author. | Rechtschaffen, Clifford, 1957– author. | Gauna, Eileen P., 1953– author. | O’Neill, Catherine A., author.
Title: Environmental justice : law, policy, and regulation / by Clifford Villa, Nadia Ahmad, Rebecca Bratspies, Roger Lin, Clifford Rechtschaffen, Eileen Gauna, Catherine A. O’Neill.
Description: Third edition. | Durham, North Carolina : Carolina Academic Press, LLC, [2020] | Includes bibliographical references and index.
Identifiers: LCCN 2020006023 | ISBN 9781531012380 (paperback) | ISBN 9781531012397 (ebook)
Subjects: LCSH: Environmental law—United States. | LCGFT: Casebooks (Law)
Classification: LCC KF3775 .R385 2020 | DDC 344.7304/6—dc23
LC record available at <https://lcn.loc.gov/2020006023>

CAROLINA ACADEMIC PRESS
700 Kent Street
Durham, North Carolina 27701
Telephone (919) 489-7486
Fax (919) 493-5668
www.cap-press.com

Printed in the United States of America.

*For Olivia and all graduates of 2020: You will continue to inspire as
you take the lead.*

C.V.

*For the young people in New York City (and everywhere) who are speaking
out and stepping up for a just transition.*

R.B.

In memory of Derrick Bell and Federico Cheever.

N.A.

*For the residents of Allensworth, Arvin, East and West Oakland, and Richmond
who continue to further the movement.*

R.L.

Summary of Contents

Preface	xxi
Foreword	xxv
Acknowledgments	xxvii
Chapter 1 • An Introduction to Environmental Justice	3
Chapter 2 • Theories of Causation	39
Chapter 3 • Risk and Health	83
Chapter 4 • Constitutional and Civil Rights Claims	119
Chapter 5 • Standard Setting	171
Chapter 6 • Environmental Permits	207
Chapter 7 • Public Enforcement	249
Chapter 8 • Environmental Justice and Contaminated Sites	279
Chapter 9 • Environmental Justice in Indian Country	323
Chapter 10 • Governmental Initiatives to Promote Environmental Justice	357
Chapter 11 • Land-Use Planning	393
Chapter 12 • Information Disclosure and Environmental Review	407
Chapter 13 • Citizen Enforcement and Common Law Remedies	439
Chapter 14 • Climate Justice	477
Chapter 15 • Disaster Justice	521
Chapter 16 • Food Justice	561
Index	585

Contents

Preface	xxi
Foreword	xxv
Acknowledgments	xxvii
Chapter 1 · An Introduction to Environmental Justice	3
A. History of the Movement	3
Pathfinder on Environmental Justice Generally	7
B. The Meaning of “Environmental Justice”	9
Robert R. Kuehn, <i>A Taxonomy of Environmental Justice</i>	9
Notes and Questions	18
Richard J. Lazarus, <i>Pursuing “Environmental Justice”: The Distributional Effects of Environmental Protection</i>	23
Notes and Questions	25
C. “We Speak for Ourselves”	25
Letter, Circa Earth Day 1990	26
Principles of Environmental Justice, Proceedings, The First National People of Color Environmental Leadership Summit	28
Letter, Circa Earth Day 2001	30
Notes and Questions	32
D. Critiquing the Environmental Justice Movement	35
Christopher H. Foreman, Jr., <i>The Promise and Peril of Environmental Justice</i>	35
Notes and Questions	37
E. Conclusion	38
Chapter 2 · Theories of Causation	39
A. Introduction	39
B. Land-Use Practices	40
Yale Rabin, <i>Expulsive Zoning: The Inequitable Legacy of Euclid</i>	41
Julia Mizutani, <i>In the Backyard of Segregated Neighborhoods: An Environmental Justice Case Study of Louisiana</i>	43
Sarah Schindler, <i>Architectural Exclusion: Discrimination and Segregation through Physical Design of the Built Environment</i>	45
Notes and Questions	47

C. The Market	50
1. Market Forces in Site Selection	51
Robin Saha & Paul Mohai, <i>Explaining Racial and Socioeconomic Disparities in the Location of Locally Unwanted Land Uses: A Conceptual Framework</i>	51
Luke Cole & Sheila Foster, <i>From the Ground Up: Environmental Racism and the Rise of the Environmental Justice Movement</i>	52
Carmen G. Gonzalez, <i>An Environmental Justice Critique of Comparative Advantage: Indigenous Peoples, Trade Policy, and the Mexican Neoliberal Economic Reforms</i>	54
Notes and Questions	55
Brie D. Sherwin, <i>The Upside Down: A New Reality for Science at the EPA and Its Impact on Environmental Justice</i>	58
Notes and Questions	61
2. Post-Siting Changes	62
Vicki Been, <i>Locally Undesirable Land Uses in Minority Neighborhoods: Disproportionate Siting or Market Dynamics?</i>	62
Notes and Questions	65
D. Politics, Social Capital, and the Structure of Environmental Laws	66
Manuel Pastor, Jr., Jim Sadd & John Hipp, <i>Which Came First? Toxic Facilities, Minority Move-In, and Environmental Justice</i>	67
Notes and Questions	68
Jeanne Marie Zokovitch Paben, <i>Green Power & Environmental Justice—Does Green Discriminate?</i>	71
Jedediah Purdy, <i>The Long Environmental Justice Movement</i>	74
Notes and Questions	76
E. Racial Discrimination	77
Charles R. Lawrence III, <i>The Id, the Ego, and Equal Protection: Reckoning with Unconscious Racism</i>	77
Notes and Questions	80
Chapter 3 · Risk and Health	83
A. Introduction	83
Anna Clark, <i>The Poisoned City: Flint's Water and the Urban American Tragedy</i>	84
B. Quantitative Risk Assessment	88
1. An Introductory Note on Quantitative Risk Assessment	88
The Carnegie Commission on Science, Technology, and Government, <i>Risk and the Environment: Improving Regulatory Decision Making</i>	89
Notes and Questions	91
History of Risk at EPA	93
Notes and Questions	94

2. Criticisms of Quantitative Risk Assessment	97
Robert R. Kuehn, <i>The Environmental Justice Implications of Quantitative Risk Assessment</i>	97
Cary Coglianese & Gary E. Marchant, <i>Shifting Sands: The Limits of Science in Setting Risk Standards</i>	100
Notes and Questions	103
National Environmental Justice Advisory Council, <i>EPA's Role in Addressing the Urgent Water Infrastructure Needs of Environmental Justice</i>	104
Notes and Questions	107
3. Risks to Children	110
Philip J. Landrigan, Virginia A. Rauh & Maida P. Galvez, <i>Environmental Justice and the Health of Children</i>	111
Notes and Questions	112
C. Cumulative Risk Assessment	113
National Environmental Justice Advisory Council, <i>Ensuring Risk Reduction in Communities with Multiple Stressors: Environmental Justice and Cumulative Risks/Impacts</i>	114
Notes and Questions	117
Chapter 4 · Constitutional and Civil Rights Claims	119
A. Introduction	119
Pathfinder on Constitutional and Civil Rights Claims for Environmental Justice	119
B. Constitutional and Civil Rights Claims for Environmental Injustice	121
Marianne Engelman Lado, <i>No More Excuses: Building a New Vision of Civil Rights Enforcement in the Context of Environmental Justice</i>	121
Notes and Questions	123
C. Equal Protection Claims	124
<i>Dowdell v. City of Apopka</i>	125
<i>Bean v. Southwestern Waste Management Corporation</i>	128
Notes and Questions	132
<i>R.I.S.E. v. Kay</i>	135
Notes and Questions	137
D. Enforcement of the Civil Rights Act, Title VI	140
1. Introduction	140
2. Administrative Complaints under Title VI Regulations	142
The <i>Select Steel</i> Administrative Decision	143
Notes and Questions	146
EPA letter to Father Phil Schmitter	148
Notes and Questions	152
3. Reform and Modern Practice in Title VI Enforcement	153
Notes and Questions	155

E. Seeking Environmental Justice through § 1983	157
<i>Boler v. Earley</i>	158
Notes and Questions	168
Chapter 5 · Standard Setting	171
A. Introduction	171
1. An Introductory Note on the Taxonomy of Standards	172
2. Legal Sources of Authority	173
Richard J. Lazarus & Stephanie Tai, <i>Integrating Environmental Justice into EPA Permitting Authority</i>	173
Notes and Questions	174
B. The Case of National Ambient Air Quality Standards	175
Rena I. Steinzor, <i>Mother Earth and Uncle Sam: How Pollution and Hollow Government Hurt Our Kids</i>	178
Notes and Questions	180
C. Standards under the Clean Water Act	184
1. An Introductory Note on the Statute's Different Standards	184
2. Water Quality Standards	186
Catherine A. O'Neill, <i>Variable Justice: Environmental Standards, Contaminated Fish, and "Acceptable" Risk to Native Peoples</i>	186
Notes and Questions	187
<i>City of Albuquerque v. Browner</i>	189
Notes and Questions	193
D. Market-Based Approaches	194
1. An Introduction to Market-Based Approaches to Regulation	194
Pathfinder on Economic Incentives	195
Stephen M. Johnson, <i>Economics v. Equity: Do Market-Based Environmental Reforms Exacerbate Environmental Injustice?</i>	194
Notes and Questions	198
2. Emissions Trading	200
Richard Toshiyuki Drury, Michael E. Belliveau, J. Scott Kuhn & Shipra Bansal, <i>Pollution Trading and Environmental Injustice: Los Angeles' Failed Experiment in Air Quality Policy</i>	200
Notes and Questions	202
Chapter 6 · Environmental Permits	207
A. Introduction	207
B. Federal Authorities to Ensure Environmental Justice in Facility Permitting	208
Richard J. Lazarus & Stephanie Tai, <i>Integrating Environmental Justice into EPA Permitting Authority</i>	208
Notes and Questions	210
<i>In re Chemical Waste Management of Indiana, Inc.</i>	213
Notes and Questions	218

<i>In re Shell Gulf of Mexico, Inc. & In re Shell Offshore, Inc.</i> (<i>Frontier Discoverer Drilling Unit</i>)	219
Notes and Questions	222
<i>In re Avenal Power Center, LLC</i>	222
Notes and Questions	224
C. Environmental Justice Claims in State Permit Proceedings	226
NAACP— <i>Flint Chapter v. Engler</i>	226
Notes and Questions	229
<i>Colonias Development Council v. Rhino Environmental Services Inc.</i>	230
Notes and Questions	234
D. Case Study: The Atlantic Coast Pipeline	238
<i>Friends of Buckingham v. Virginia Air Pollution Control Board</i>	238
Notes and Questions	247
Chapter 7 · Public Enforcement	249
A. Introduction	249
B. Historical Critiques	250
Notes and Questions	252
C. Enforcement Purposes	254
Notes and Questions	255
D. Enforcement Authorities to Protect Vulnerable Communities	257
Notes and Questions	260
E. Enforcement Policies to Protect Vulnerable Communities	265
1. Enforcement Targeting	267
Notes and Questions	268
2. Supplemental Environmental Projects	269
Patrice L. Simms, <i>Leveraging Supplemental Environmental Projects: Toward an Integrated Strategy for Empowering Environmental Justice Communities</i>	269
Notes and Questions	274
Chapter 8 · Environmental Justice and Contaminated Sites	279
A. Introduction	279
B. Legal Authorities for Cleaning Up Contaminated Sites	281
1. Jurisdictional Triggers for Cleanup Statutes	281
Notes and Questions	282
2. Funding for Cleanup	284
Josephine M. Balzac, <i>Public Engagement “Reach In, Reach Out”: Pursuing Environmental Justice by Empowering Communities to Meaningfully Participate in the Decision-Making Processes of Brownfields Redevelopment and Superfund Cleanup</i>	286
3. NPL Listing	288
4. Removal Actions	290

5. Remedial Actions	291
Notes and Questions	293
C. Fair Treatment and Meaningful Involvement in Site Cleanup	299
1. Fair Treatment in the Cleanup of Contaminated Sites	300
Notes and Questions	302
2. Required Opportunities for Meaningful Involvement in Site Cleanup	305
Notes and Questions	310
3. Unwritten Opportunities for Meaningful Involvement in Site Cleanup	313
D. Case Study: The Lower Duwamish Waterway Superfund Site	316
Notes and Questions	321
Chapter 9 · Environmental Justice in Indian Country	323
A. Introduction	323
Pathfinder on Environmental Justice in Indian Country	324
B. Special Factors for Environmental Justice in Indian Country	325
Elizabeth Kronk Warner, <i>Environmental Justice: A Necessary Lens to Effectively View Environmental Threats to Indigenous Survival</i>	325
Notes and Questions	330
C. Tribes as Resource Managers	335
Rebecca Tsosie, <i>Tribal Environmental Policy in an Era of Self-Determination: The Role of Ethics, Economics and Traditional Ecological Knowledge</i>	336
Notes and Questions	341
D. Tribes as Environmental Regulators	344
Jeanette Wolfley, <i>Tribal Environmental Programs: Providing Meaningful Involvement and Fair Treatment</i>	347
Notes and Questions	352
Chapter 10 · Governmental Initiatives to Promote Environmental Justice	357
A. Introduction	357
B. Environmental Justice at the International Level	357
C. Federal Initiatives	358
1. The Executive Order on Environmental Justice	359
Executive Order 12898: Federal Actions to Address Environmental Justice in Minority Populations and Low-Income Populations	359
Notes and Questions	361
2. Government Use of Race Classifications	363
<i>Grutter v. Bollinger</i>	363
Notes and Questions	366
3. Recent Federal Strategies for Environmental Justice	369
Rachael E. Salcido, <i>Reviving the Environmental Justice Agenda</i>	369
Notes and Questions	371

D. State Initiatives	372
1. California Initiatives	373
Vien Truong, <i>Addressing Poverty and Pollution: California’s SB 535 Greenhouse Gas Reduction Fund</i>	373
Notes and Questions	375
2. New York Initiatives	378
Rebecca Bratspies, <i>Protecting the Environment in an Era of Federal Retreat: The View from New York City</i>	378
Notes and Questions	380
E. Tribal Initiatives	381
F. Collaborative Approaches	383
Charles Lee, <i>Submission to the National Environmental Policy Commission</i>	384
Notes and Questions	388
Chapter 11 · Land-Use Planning	393
A. Introduction	393
Pathfinder on Environmental Justice and Land-Use Planning	393
B. Planning and Zoning Changes	394
Craig Anthony Arnold, <i>Planning Milagros: Environmental Justice and Land Use Regulation</i>	394
Notes and Questions	396
Letter from California Attorney General, Xavier Becerra, to the Mayor, City Councilmembers, and Planning Commission Members of the City of Arvin Regarding Proposed Ordinance for Regulation of Petroleum Facilities and Operations	398
Notes and Questions	401
Emily Bergeron, <i>Local Justice: How Cities Can Protect and Promote Environmental Justice in a Hostile Environment</i>	402
Notes and Questions	404
Chapter 12 · Information Disclosure and Environmental Review	407
A. Introduction	407
B. The National Environmental Policy Act	409
1. Introduction to NEPA	409
Pathfinder on NEPA	410
Notes and Questions	413
2. Agency Guidance on NEPA and E.O. No. 12898	415
Alan Ramo, <i>Environmental Justice as an Essential Tool in Environmental Review Statutes: A New Look at Federal Policies and Civil Rights Protections and California’s Recent Initiatives</i>	417
Notes and Questions	418
C. EJSCREEN	419

Notes and Questions	422
D. Community Participation in the NEPA Process	422
<i>Atlantic Coast Pipeline</i>	422
Joint Comments by Public Interest Groups on Draft Environmental Impact Statement	424
Notes and Questions	426
E. Judicial Review of NEPA Analyses	426
<i>In the Matter of Louisiana Energy Services, L.P.</i>	427
Notes and Questions	431
F. The Emergency Planning and Community Right-to-Know Act	432
Sarah Lamdan & Rebecca Bratspies, <i>Taking a Page from the FDA's Prescription Medicine Information Rules: Reimagining Environmental Information for Climate Change</i>	433
Notes and Questions	435
G. International Law and the Human Right to Environmental Information	437
Pathfinder on International Right of Access to Environmental Information	438
Chapter 13 · Citizen Enforcement and Common Law Remedies	439
A. The Role of the Lawyer and Litigation	439
1. Environmental Justice Lawyering	440
Francis Calpotura, <i>Why the Law?</i>	440
Notes and Questions	440
Luke W. Cole, <i>Empowerment as the Key to Environmental Protection: The Need for Environmental Poverty Law</i>	441
Notes and Questions	446
Helen H. Kang, <i>Respect for Community Narratives of Environmental Injustice: The Dignity Right to Be Heard and Believed</i>	446
Notes and Questions	450
2. A Note on Environmental Law Clinics	452
Notes and Questions	453
B. Private Enforcement: Citizen Suits	455
1. Legal Requirements for Filing Suit	455
Notes and Questions	459
2. The Practicalities of Private Enforcement	460
Notes and Questions	461
3. Building Community Enforcement Capacity	465
a. Upwardly Adjusting Attorney's Fees	465
b. Technical Assistance to Communities	466
i. Superfund's Technical Assistance Provisions	466

ii. Training and Technology for Communities to Detect Noncompliance	466
mark! Lopez, <i>The Truth Fairy Project and the Exide Fights to Come</i>	467
Notes and Questions	468
C. Common Law Remedies	469
Notes and Questions	469
Richard T. Drury, <i>Moving a Mountain: The Struggle for Environmental Justice in Southeast Los Angeles</i>	471
Notes and Questions	475
Chapter 14 · Climate Justice	477
A. Introduction	477
Pathfinder on Climate Justice	479
B. Background on Climate Change	480
C. The Disproportionate Impacts of Climate Change	484
Maxine Burkett, <i>Rehabilitation: A Proposal for a Climate Compensation Mechanism for Small Island States</i>	487
Notes and Questions	489
Randall S. Abate & Elizabeth Ann Kronk, <i>Commonality among Unique Indigenous Communities: An Introduction to Climate Change and Its Impact on Indigenous Peoples</i>	489
Notes and Questions	491
D. Impacts in the United States	492
Congressional Black Caucus Foundation, <i>African Americans and Climate Change: An Unequal Burden</i>	493
Notes and Questions	494
E. Climate Justice in International Law and Policy	495
The Paris Agreement	496
Notes and Questions	497
M. R. Allen, et al., <i>2018: Framing and Context. In: Global Warming of 1.5°C.</i>	498
Bali Principles of Climate Justice	500
Notes and Questions	504
F. Climate Law and Policy in the Domestic Context	505
Notes and Questions	509
Rebecca Bratspies, <i>Our Climate Moment Is Now! (Or How to Change the Story to Save Our World)</i>	509
Notes and Questions	513
G. Climate Adaptation	513
Daniel A. Farber, <i>Climate Adaptation and Federalism: Mapping the Issues</i>	514

Georgetown Climate Center, Opportunities for Equitable Adaptation in Cities	517
Notes and Questions	518
Chapter 15 · Disaster Justice	521
A. Introduction	521
Mattathias Schwartz, <i>Maria's Bodies</i>	521
B. Vulnerability and Resilience	525
1. Vulnerability	526
Robert R.M. Verchick, <i>Disaster Justice: The Geography of Human Capability</i>	526
Notes and Questions	528
2. Resilience	534
Sidney Shapiro, <i>Preface: An Ounce of Prevention</i>	535
U.S. Dept. of Homeland Security, <i>Draft Interagency Concept for Community Resilience and National-Level Measures</i>	537
Notes and Questions	540
C. Disaster Law Fundamentals	542
1. Disaster Law	542
Notes and Questions	545
2. The Disaster Cycle	550
D. Disaster Justice in Practice	554
Robert D. Bullard & Beverly Wright, <i>The Wrong Complexion for Protection</i>	554
Davida Finger, et al., <i>Engaging the Legal Academy in Disaster Response</i>	558
Notes and Questions	560
Chapter 16 · Food Justice	561
A. Introduction	561
Pathfinder on Food Justice	562
B. Food Deserts	563
Deborah N. Archer & Tamara C. Belinfanti, <i>We Built It and They Did Not Come: Using New Governance Theory in the Fight for Food Justice in Low-Income Communities of Color</i>	563
Notes and Questions	566
C. The Energy-Food-Water Nexus	567
D. Food Security, Biofuels, and Climate Change	567
Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change, Special Report: Climate Change and Land	568
Rebecca M. Bratspies, <i>Hunger and Equity in an Era of Genetic Engineering</i>	570
Notes and Questions	573

E. Food Oppression and Poverty	574
Danielle M. Purifoy, <i>Food Policy Councils: Integrating Food Justice and Environmental Justice</i>	575
Rebecca L. Goldberg, <i>No Such Thing as a Free Lunch: Paternalism, Poverty, and Food Justice</i>	577
Garrett M. Broad, <i>After the White House Garden: Food Justice in the Age of Trump</i>	580
Andrea Freeman, <i>The Unbearable Whiteness of Milk: Food Oppression and the USDA</i>	582
Notes and Questions	583
Index	585

Preface

Environmental justice is one of the most significant and dynamic developments in environmental law since modern environmental legislation emerged in the 1970s. Drawing upon principles from environmental law, civil rights statutes, and broader movements for social and economic justice, the environmental justice movement has focused attention on the disparate environmental harms experienced by low-income communities and communities of color. At the same time, the critical methodologies of environmental justice have drawn attention to other groups who may similarly experience disparate impacts from environmental degradation, including women, children, seniors, immigrants, LGBTQ individuals, and persons requiring special accommodations. While the scope of environmental justice may thus have broadened over time, original concerns remain no less relevant today, particularly as stark examples of racism continue to rise and our national commitment to social welfare continues to erode. Consider the drinking water contamination in Flint, Michigan, for example, or construction of the Dakota Access Pipeline over the massive opposition and protest of indigenous peoples.

This book will provide readers with a comprehensive introduction to environmental justice. Oriented towards legal issues and law students, the book also draws from other disciplines including sociology, geography, and economics. As such, beyond law school, the book may be used in undergraduate or graduate courses. The sixteen chapters of this book provide readings for a single semester of study in environmental justice, or supplemental materials for studies in environmental law, civil rights, and related subjects. To improve readability for a broader audience, we have generally omitted footnotes and legal citations from excerpted materials.

At the same time, this book is intended as a reference guide for practitioners, government officials, and community activists. For lawyers, as promised in the subtitle of the book, we provide an enhanced selection of laws and regulations that may help address specific problems in a given context. For government officials, we provide selections of law and policy to assist their important work in protecting the public health and welfare. For community activists and advocates, we provide examples of how environmental justice concerns have been addressed in circumstances that may be different or perhaps similar to their own.

Community activists remind us that, “We speak for ourselves.” To promote the habit of listening, we have included materials and narratives collected from communities and community advocates from the Yukon Territory to Puerto Rico; from the Yakama Nation to the Navajo Nation; from Los Angeles to Chicago to New York City.

Many of these landscapes and leaders also appear directly in the photographs included, for the first time, in this third edition of the book—reinforcing the understanding that environmental justice is about real people and places.

This book is about understanding the real challenges of environmental justice across the country, but also about how to begin addressing these challenges. Thus, Chapter 3 introduces the concepts of risk assessment and risk management to encourage and empower community advocates to participate in these vital processes for characterizing threats to public health. Chapter 5 provides background on how regulatory agencies set standards for protecting public health. Chapter 6 explains how these standards may be incorporated into permits for industrial facilities and how these permits may be influenced or challenged by community advocates.

Where proper standards and permits fail to prevent disparate environmental impacts, this edition of the book provides an expanded examination of legal tools available to address cases of environmental injustice. Thus, Chapter 4 provides a broader review of constitutional law, civil rights legislation, and implementing regulations, with applications illustrated through cases including the drinking water contamination in Flint, Michigan. Chapter 7 provides a new overview of enforcement authorities available to government agencies under such federal laws as the Clean Air Act, Clean Water Act, and Toxic Substances Control Act. Chapter 8 provides a deep examination of legal authorities for cleaning up contaminated sites, with an extensive review of opportunities for community engagement in cleanup processes. Chapter 10 considers specific governmental initiatives to promote environmental justice; these include Executive Order No. 12898, directing the engagement of federal agencies, plus more recent initiatives from states including California and New York. Chapter 11 considers land-use planning as a tool for pursuing environmental justice. Chapter 12 examines mechanisms for obtaining environmental information, including new GIS tools such as EJSCREEN, as well as legal authorities for compelling environmental information and analysis, such as the National Environmental Policy Act and the Emergency Planning and Community Right-to-Know Act. Chapter 13 focuses on citizen enforcement, to include citizen suits under the various environmental statutes plus remedies that advocates may seek through the common law.

The last three chapters of the book consider the special challenges for environmental justice in emerging contexts including climate change, disaster response, and food systems. As we will see, each of these contexts may affect all people on the planet, but the disparate effects on certain groups of people are important to comprehend and address. A substantially updated chapter on climate justice (Chapter 14), plus new chapters on disaster justice (Chapter 15) and food justice (Chapter 16), will provide substantive starting points for study and practice in these areas. Readers interested in deeper explorations of these and many other related subjects will benefit from pathfinders included throughout the book.

Finally, the authors of this third edition would like to express their gratitude to the many people who contributed to this book in different ways. First and foremost, we would like to thank the original authors of this book, Clifford Rechtschaffen, Eileen

Gauna, and Catherine O'Neill, whose original work truly advanced the study and practice of environmental justice, and who entrusted us with carrying forward this endeavor as environmental justice approaches forty years as a distinct discipline. We would also like to thank all those who reviewed draft chapters of this edition or otherwise inspired our thinking in this book, including Tony Arnold, Michelle Bryan, Robert Bullard, Robin Craig, Dan Farber, Davida Finger, Lisa Grow Sun, Jacquie Hand, Marianne Engelman Lado, Alice Kaswan, Gregg Macey, J.B. Ruhl, Rob Verchick, Elizabeth Kronk Warner, Jeanette Wolfley, and dedicated EPA regional staff in Seattle, Chicago, and Philadelphia. We are particularly grateful for all those who gave of their time for interviews and community tours, including Richard Moore and Sofia Martinez of Los Jardines Institute; Dennis Chestnut of Groundwork Anacostia River D.C.; Naeema Muhammad of the North Carolina Environmental Justice Network; Vernice Miller-Travis; Ryke Longest of the Duke University School of Law; Jessica Grannis and the Georgetown Climate Center; Paulina López, James Rasmussen, BJ Cummings, Daniela Cortez, and the Duwamish River Cleanup Coalition; Lupe Martinez and staff at the Center on Race, Poverty & the Environment; Stefanie Tsosie and indefatigable colleagues at the Earthjustice Seattle office; the Picardi-Perez family of San Juan, Puerto Rico; Charles Lee, Suzi Ruhl, and all at the EPA Office of Environmental Justice; and all dedicated staff at the New Mexico Environment Department.

For superlative writing spaces, Cliff Villa thanks Chris and Lorrie Malins, and Mark and Teru Lundsten. For financial support, Cliff thanks Dean Sergio Pareja of the University of New Mexico School of Law and the law firm of Keleher & McLeod, P.A. For research assistance, thanks go to Melanie McNett (UNMSOL '20) and Ernesto Longa, UNM law librarian. For her keen eye and valued input throughout the book, Cliff thanks the incomparable Mara Yarbrough. For support and inspiration, Cliff thanks his wonderful faculty colleagues, including Reed Benson, Gabe Pacyniak, Josh Kastenber, and Maryam Ahranjani; amazing UNM School of Law students and graduates including participants in the Environmental Justice writing seminars of 2018 and 2020; accounting support from Anna Martinez; and family including his lovely wife Angie, his dear mom, and the ever-fabulous Olivia and Julian.

Rebecca Bratspies thanks the many community activists whose work is documented in these pages. In particular, gratitude goes to Peggy Shepard and Cecil Corbin-Mark at WEACTION, Barbara Brown at the Eastern Queens Alliance, and Evie Hantzopoulos of Global Kids for inspiring an entire generation of young New Yorkers to speak up and step forward for environmental justice, and to New York City Councilmember Costa Constantinides for his unwavering dedication to realizing environmental justice in New York City. Rebecca thanks her husband Allen and daughter Naomi for their support and encouragement, her colleagues Andrea McArdle and Sarah Lamdan for forever being willing to share their insights and expertise, and the entire CUNY Law School for every day spent living our motto "Law in the Service of Human Needs."

For institutional support, Nadia Ahmad thanks Dean Leticia Diaz of Barry University School of Law and Terri Day, Judy Koons, Seema Mohapatra, Cathren Page, Nancy Cantalupo, Rachel Deming, and Margaret Stewart. Thanks to her wonderful

mentors Berta Hernandez-Truyol, Alyson Flournoy, Sharon Rush, Don Smith, Catherine Smith, Ved Nanda, Annecoos Wiersema, K.K. DuVivier, Jason Czarnezki, Nicholas Robinson, Richard Ottinger, Ann Powers, Bridget Crawford, Ann Bartow, Hari Osofsky, and Hannah Wiseman. Thanks to the ABA Environmental Justice Committee of Paula Shapiro, Alli Kielsgard, Kristen Galles, Scott Badenoch, Emily Bergeron, Stephanie Trager, and Jeremy Orr. Special thanks to David Kennedy at the Harvard Institute for Global Law and Policy and Michael Gerrard at the Sabin Center for Climate Change Law for their support. To the students in her environmental justice capstone course for their feedback and comments. Appreciation extended to Barry Law librarians Whitney Curtis, Diana Botluk, and Jason Murray and to the research assistance of Melissa Bryan. Special appreciation to Katherine Lenart, Sammy Zenon, and Owen Gregory. Cheers to her partner and co-pilot, Akmal, for his affirmation and boundless love, and to her children, Senan, Hanan, and Jihan for their unyielding energy through hurricanes, high tides, sick days, and tardy slips. Gratitude to her parents, Shazia, Osman, and Rubina as well as her extended family.

Roger Lin thanks the residents of Allensworth, Arvin, East and West Oakland, Richmond, and other communities who continue to inspire many in their pursuit of environmental justice. For their guidance and significant efforts in the field, Roger thanks Luke Cole, Helen Kang, Alan Ramo, Cliff Rechtschaffen, Greg Karras, Andrés Soto, Richard Drury, Caroline Farrell, Juan Flores, Refugio Valencia, the Pilot Team, and all of the staff, past, present, and future at Communities for a Better Environment, the Center on Race, Poverty & the Environment, and the UC Berkeley Environmental Law Clinic. For their support and patience, Roger thanks his parents, Marcus, Diana, and Camila (born during the drafting of this edition).

All authors of this edition extend our gratitude to the good folks at Carolina Academic Press, who supported this project from the start and made this book possible. We also, of course, thank all readers of this book. Your support and feedback are always welcome as we continue the pursuit of environmental justice together.

Foreword

I remember as a young boy my grandmother sharing with me the words of Ms. Ida B. Wells, who said, “The way to right wrongs, is to turn the light of truth upon them.” The “truth” is, for hundreds of years, vulnerable communities (lower-income, communities of color, and indigenous peoples) have been fighting for justice and equality in voting, housing, transportation, healthcare, and the economy. The “truth” is, for the past 40 years, environmental justice has encompassed all of these areas of inequity.

Unfortunately, fairness for environmental justice communities has often been fleeting at best and replaced with legacy pollution and sacrifice zones. Throughout history, our country’s laws, politicians and decisionmakers have seen Black and Brown communities as the dumping grounds for everything wealthier communities would never accept. In these forgotten areas, we find coal-fired power plants bellowing out mercury and arsenic at alarming rates. Antiquated incinerators releasing dioxins and hazardous ash. Petrochemical facilities in places like Cancer Alley filling the lungs of local residents with nitrogen oxides, sulfur dioxide, and carbon monoxide. In 2020, we still hear the echoes of the Flint water crisis, as millions of children are living in unhealthy housing and attending underfunded schools filled with toxic lead across our country. These impacts will follow our children for a lifetime, with generational effects on the mind, body, and spirits of those who have been exposed.

In our country, over 100,000 people die prematurely annually from air pollution, which is more than those dying from gun violence or automobile accidents. We have 25 million adults and 7 million children living with asthma in the United States. African-American and Latinx children are disproportionately rushed to emergency rooms and the ones most likely to lose their lives due to asthma complications. Recently, the Clean Air Act has been under attack, putting many more lives of color in the crosshairs of pollution. We have an additional 94 environmental rules being rolled back, dismantled and deconstructed, further weakening the environmental and public-health safety net that so many in our country depend on for a basic level of protection.

Even with these increasing challenges facing frontline communities, I continue to see new possibilities and promise. Communities and their partners are working diligently to address past problems and place a spotlight on the impacts happening in their immediate areas. They are gathering information and utilizing community-based participatory research and traditional environmental knowledge to document

the impacts they have been experiencing in their neighborhoods, barrios, and reservations. Vulnerable communities are continuing to build authentic collaborative partnerships with scientific organizations and universities to anchor their experiences and findings in irrefutable science. Frontline organizations are utilizing the power of the law to hold polluters accountable and push agencies like the EPA to fully enforce the statutes on the books. In 2020, frontline communities, scientists, lawyers, and politicians have a unique opportunity to continue building together and ensure that communities of color will never be toxic dumping grounds again, but places filled with culture, opportunity and promise.

This important book and the study of law is so incredibly critical at this time in the history of our country. At a time when science is under attack and policy is being manipulated, the law has become our greatest defense against the erosion of our civil, human and environmental rights. The law is also our greatest weapon to ensure that our most vulnerable are truly protected. We need men and women of good conscience to stand up, but they must be prepared with the tools to fight injustice of both the past and the present. I'm confident that one day—the not so distant future—we will have a society where all communities will be able to breathe clean air and drink clean water, and our children will have clean soil free from toxics to play on. In the words of Ms. Harriet Tubman, “Every great dream begins with a dreamer. Always remember, you have within you the strength, the patience, and the passion to reach for the stars to change the world.” Let the law be the North Star that guides our most vulnerable communities from surviving to thriving.

Mustafa Santiago Ali
March 2020

Acknowledgments

The authors gratefully acknowledge the permissions granted to reproduce in this book images and excerpts of the following works:

- AP, Figure 1-1: Warren County, North Carolina (Sept. 16, 1982).
- Randall S. Abate & Elizabeth Kronk Warner, *Commonality Among Unique Indigenous Communities: An Introduction to Climate Change and Its Impact on Indigenous Peoples*, 26 TULANE ENVTL. L.J. 179 (2013).
- M.R. Allen, et al.: *Framing and Context*. In: *Global Warming of 1.5°C. An IPCC Special Report on the impacts of global warming of 1.5°C above pre-industrial levels and related global greenhouse gas emission pathways, in the context of strengthening the global response to the threat of climate change, sustainable development, and efforts to eradicate poverty* (2018).
- Isela Anchondo, Figure 1-2: Farmworker Ruben Ochoa, Jan. 18, 2020.
- Tony Anderson, Figure 6-1, Chukchi Sea and Beaufort Sea.
- Deborah N. Archer & Tamara C. Belinfanti, *We Built It and They Did Not Come: Using New Governance Theory in the Fight for Food Justice in Low-Income Communities of Color*, 15 SEATTLE J. SOC. JUSTICE 307 (2016).
- Craig Anthony Arnold, *Planning Milagros: Environmental Justice and Land Use Regulation*, 76 DENVER U. L. REV. 1 (1998).
- Josephine M. Balzac, *Public Engagement “Reach In, Reach Out”: Pursuing Environmental Justice by Empowering Communities to Meaningfully Participate in the Decision-Making Processes of Brownfields Redevelopment and Superfund Cleanup*, 9 FLORIDA A&M L. REV. 347 (2014).
- Subhankar Banerjee, Figure 1-4 and Figure 14-1, from ARCTIC VOICES: RESISTANCE AT THE TIPPING POINT (Seven Stories Press, pbk, 2013), by permission.
- Vicki Been, *Locally Undesirable Land Uses in Minority Neighborhoods: Disproportionate Siting or Market Dynamics?*, 103 YALE L.J. 1383 (1994).
- Emily Bergeron, *Local Justice: How Cities Can Protect and Promote Environmental Justice in a Hostile Environment*, 32 NAT. RESOURCES & ENV'T. 8 (2018).
- Rebecca M. Bratspies, *Hunger and Equity in an Era of Genetic Engineering*, 7 UC IRVINE L. REV. 195 (2017).
- Rebecca Bratspies, *Our Climate Moment Is Now! (or How to Change the Story to Save Our World)*, ENVIRONMENTAL LAW DISRUPTED (ELI 2020).
- Rebecca Bratspies, *Protecting the Environment in an Era of Federal Retreat: The View from New York City*, 13 FLORIDA INT'L U. L. REV. 5 (2018).

- Garrett M. Broad, *After the White House Garden: Food Justice in the Age of Trump*, 13 J. FOOD L. & POL'Y 33 (2017).
- ROBERT D. BULLARD & BEVERLY WRIGHT, *THE WRONG COMPLEXION FOR PROTECTION* (NYU Press, 2012). © New York University, by permission.
- Maxine Burkett, *Rehabilitation: A Proposal for a Climate Compensation Mechanism for Small Island States*, 13 SANTA CLARA J. INT'L L. 81 (2015).
- Francis Calpotura, *Why the Law?*, THIRD FORCE (May/June 1994).
- CARNEGIE COMMISSION ON SCIENCE, TECHNOLOGY, AND GOVERNMENT, *RISK AND THE ENVIRONMENT: IMPROVING REGULATORY DECISION MAKING* (1993).
- Anna Clark, *The Poisoned City: Flint's Water and an Urban American Tragedy* (Metropolitan Books, 2018). Excerpts from the "Prologue" with permission from Henry Holt and Company. All rights reserved.
- Cary Coglianese & Gary E. Marchant, *Shifting Sands: The Limits of Science in Setting Risk Standards*, 152 U. PA. L. REV. 1255 (2004).
- Luke W. Cole, *Empowerment as the Key to Environmental Protection: The Need for Environmental Poverty Law*, 19 ECOLOGY L.Q. 619 (1992).
- LUKE COLE & SHEILA FOSTER, *FROM THE GROUND UP: ENVIRONMENTAL RACISM AND THE RISE OF THE ENVIRONMENTAL JUSTICE MOVEMENT* (2000).
- CONGRESSIONAL BLACK CAUCUS FOUNDATION, *AFRICAN AMERICANS AND CLIMATE CHANGE: AN UNEQUAL BURDEN* (2004).
- Lara Cushing, Dan Blaustein-Rejito, Madeline Wander, Manuel Pastor, James Sadd, Allen Zhu & Rachel Morello-Frosch, *Carbon Trading, Co-pollutants, and Environmental Equity: Evidence from California's Cap-and-Trade Program (2001–2015)*, PLoS MED. 15(7) (2018).
- Richard T. Drury, *Moving a Mountain: The Struggle for Environmental Justice in Southeast Los Angeles*, 38 ENVTL. L. REP. NEWS & ANALYSIS 10,338 (2008).
- Richard Toshiyuki Drury, Michael E. Belliveau, J. Scott Kuhn & Shipra Bansal, *Pollution Trading and Environmental Injustice: Los Angeles' Failed Experiment in Air Quality Policy*, 9 DUKE ENVTL. L. & POL'Y FORUM 231 (1999).
- Daniel A. Farber, *Climate Adaptation and Federalism: Mapping the Issues*, 1 SAN DIEGO J. CLIMATE & ENERGY 259 (2009).
- Davida Finger, et al., *Engaging the Legal Academy in Disaster Response*, 10 SEATTLE J. SOC. JUSTICE 211 (2011).
- CHRISTOPHER H. FOREMAN, JR., *THE PROMISE AND PERIL OF ENVIRONMENTAL JUSTICE* (Brookings Institution Press, 1998).
- Andrea Freeman, *The Unbearable Whiteness of Milk: Food Oppression and the USDA*, 3 UC IRVINE L. REV. 1251 (2013).
- Georgetown Climate Center, *Opportunities for Equitable Adaptation in Cities* (2017).
- Rebecca L. Goldberg, *No Such Thing as a Free Lunch: Paternalism, Poverty, and Food Justice*, 24 STANFORD L. & POL'Y REV. 35 (2013).
- Carmen G. Gonzalez, *An Environmental Justice Critique of Comparative Advantage: Indigenous Peoples, Trade Policy, and the Mexican Neoliberal Economic Reforms*, 32 U. PA. J. INT'L L. 723 (2011).
- Jaqueline Hand, Figure 16-2: Detroit hoophouse, March 2014.

- Daniel Hernandez, Figure 2-1: Mariachi Plaza, Los Angeles.
- Stephen M. Johnson, *Economics v. Equity: Do Market-Based Environmental Reforms Exacerbate Environmental Injustice?*, 56 WASH. & LEE L. REV. 111 (1999).
- Helen H. Kang, *Respect for Community Narratives of Environmental Injustice: The Dignity Right to Be Heard and Believed*, 25 WIDENER L. REV. 219 (2019).
- Robert R. Kuehn, *A Taxonomy of Environmental Justice*, 30 ENVTL. L. REP. 10,681 (2000).
- Robert R. Kuehn, *The Environmental Justice Implications of Quantitative Risk Assessment*, 1996 U. ILLINOIS L. REV. 103 (1996).
- Marianne Engelman Lado, *No More Excuses: Building a New Vision of Civil Rights Enforcement in the Context of Environmental Justice*, 22 U. PA. J.L. & SOC. CHANGE 281 (2019).
- Sarah Lamdan & Rebecca Bratspies, *Taking a Page from the FDA's Prescription Medicine Information Rules: Reimagining Environmental Information for Climate Change*, 40 U. ARK. LITTLE ROCK L. REV. 573 (2018).
- Philip J. Landrigan, Virginia A. Rauh & Maida P. Galvez, *Environmental Justice and the Health of Children*, 77 MOUNT SINAI J. MED. 178 (2010).
- Charles R. Lawrence III, *The Id, the Ego, and Equal Protection: Reckoning with Unconscious Racism*, 39 STANFORD L. REV. 317 (1987).
- Richard J. Lazarus, *Pursuing "Environmental Justice": The Distributional Effects of Environmental Protection*, 87 NORTHWESTERN U. L. REV. 787 (1993).
- Richard J. Lazarus & Stephanie Tai, *Integrating Environmental Justice into EPA Permitting Authority*, 26 ECOLOGY L.Q. 617 (1999).
- Charles Lee, Submission to the National Environmental Policy Commission (May 2001).
- Roselynn Loaiza, Figures 13-4(a) and 13-4(b): Raul R. Perez Memorial Park. Huntington, Park, CA. Jan. 17, 2020.
- mark! Lopez, *The Truth Fairy Project and the Exide Fights to Come* (May 2019).
- Julia Mizutani, *In the Backyard of Segregated Neighborhoods: An Environmental Justice Case Study of Louisiana*, 31 GEORGETOWN ENVTL. L. REV. 363 (2019).
- Catherine A. O'Neill, *Variable Justice: Environmental Standards, Contaminated Fish, and "Acceptable" Risk to Native Peoples*, 19 STANFORD ENVTL. L.J. 3 (2000).
- Solmari Perez Oliveras, Figure 14-3. Flooding in Ocean Park neighborhood of San Juan, Puerto Rico. Sept. 20, 2017.
- Jeanne Marie Zokovitch Paben, *Green Power & Environmental Justice—Does Green Discriminate?*, 46 TEXAS TECH L. REV. 1067 (2014).
- Manuel Pastor, Jr., Jim Sadd & John Hipp, *Which Came First? Toxic Facilities, Minority Move-In, and Environmental Justice*, 23 J. URBAN AFF. 1 (2001).
- Jedediah Purdy, *The Long Environmental Justice Movement*, 44 ECOLOGY L.Q. 809 (2018).
- Danielle M. Purifoy, *Food Policy Councils: Integrating Food Justice and Environmental Justice*, 24 DUKE ENVTL. L. & POL'Y FORUM 375 (2014).
- Yale Rabin, *Expulsive Zoning: The Inequitable Legacy of Euclid*, in ZONING AND THE AMERICAN DREAM 101 (Charles M. Haar & Jerold S. Kayden eds., 1989).

- Alan Ramo, *Environmental Justice as an Essential Tool in Environmental Review Statutes: A New Look at Federal Policies and Civil Rights Protections and California's Recent Initiatives*, 19 HASTINGS W.-N.W. J. ENVTL. L. & POL'Y 41 (2013).
- Roselynn Loaiza, Figure 13-4: Raul R. Perez Memorial Park. Huntington Park, CA. Jan. 17, 2020.
- Robin Saha & Paul Mohai, *Explaining Racial and Socioeconomic Disparities in the Location of Locally Unwanted Land Uses: A Conceptual Framework*, presented at the 1997 Annual Meeting of the Rural Sociological Society (Toronto, Aug. 1997).
- Rachael Salcido, *Reviving the Environmental Justice Agenda*, 91 CHICAGO-KENT L. REV. 115 (2016).
- Riccardo Savi, Figure 3-1: "Little Miss Flint," Washington, D.C. April 22, 2017.
- Sarah Schindler, *Architectural Exclusion: Discrimination and Segregation through Physical Design of the Built Environment*, 124 YALE L.J. 1934 (2015).
- Mattathias Schwartz, *Maria's Bodies*, NY MAGAZINE (Dec. 22, 2017).
- SEATTLE TIMES, Figure 15-1: front page, Dec. 20, 2006.
- Sidney Shapiro, *Preface: An Ounce of Prevention*, in *From Surviving to Thriving: Equity in Disaster Planning and Recovery* (Center for Progressive Reform, 2018).
- Brie D. Sherwin, *The Upside Down: A New Reality for Science at the EPA and Its Impacts on Environmental Justice*, 27 NYU ENVTL. L.J. 57 (2019).
- Patrice L. Simms, *Leveraging Supplemental Environmental Projects: Toward an Integrated Strategy for Empowering Environmental Justice Communities*, 47 ENVTL. L. REP. NEWS & ANALYSIS 10,511 (2017).
- Rena I. Steinzor, *Mother Earth and Uncle Sam: How Pollution and Hollow Government Hurt Our Kids* (U. Texas Press, 2008).
- Shirley Trout, Figure 2-3: Walton, Nebraska. Nov. 12, 2019.
- Shirley Trout, Figure 16-3: Cornfield, Walton, Nebraska. Nov. 12, 2019.
- Vien Truong, *Addressing Poverty and Pollution: California's SB 535 Greenhouse Gas Reduction Fund*, 49 HARVARD CIVIL RIGHTS-CIVIL LIBERTIES L. REV. 493 (2014).
- Rebecca Tsosie, *Tribal Environmental Policy in an Era of Self-Determination: The Role of Ethics, Economics and Traditional Ecological Knowledge*, 21 VERMONT L. REV. 225 (1996).
- Robert R.M. Verchick, *Disaster Justice: The Geography of Human Capability*, 23 DUKE ENVTL. L. & POL'Y FORUM 23 (2012).
- Olivia Villa, Figure 8-4: North Railroad Avenue Plume Superfund Site, Española, NM, July 10, 2019; and Figure 8-7: Daniela Cortez, Seattle, WA, March 30, 2019.
- Shirley Trout, Figure 2-3: Walton, Nebraska. Nov. 12, 2019.
- Elizabeth Kronk Warner, *Environmental Justice: A Necessary Lens to Effectively View Environmental Threats to Indigenous Survival*, 26 TRANSNAT'L L. & CONTEMP. PROBS. 343 (2017).
- Jeanette Wolfley, *Tribal Environmental Programs: Providing Meaningful Involvement and Fair Treatment*, 29 J. ENVTL. L. & LITIG. 389 (2014).