



1988

The effects of word processing and two common instructional methods on the essay revisions of twelfth grade students

Jon Louis Walther
University of the Pacific

Follow this and additional works at: https://scholarlycommons.pacific.edu/uop_etds

 Part of the [Education Commons](#)

Recommended Citation

Walther, Jon Louis. (1988). *The effects of word processing and two common instructional methods on the essay revisions of twelfth grade students*. University of the Pacific, Dissertation. https://scholarlycommons.pacific.edu/uop_etds/3477

This Dissertation is brought to you for free and open access by the Graduate School at Scholarly Commons. It has been accepted for inclusion in University of the Pacific Theses and Dissertations by an authorized administrator of Scholarly Commons. For more information, please contact mgibney@pacific.edu.

The Effects of Word Processing
and Two Common Instructional Methods
on the Essay Revisions of Twelfth-grade Students

by

Jon Walther

B.A., University of California at Berkeley
M.A., San Francisco State University

A Dissertation Submitted to the Graduate School
of the University of the Pacific in Partial Fulfillment
of the Requirements for the Degree of
Doctor of Education

Stockton, California

1988

The Effects of Word Processing
and Two Common Instructional Methods
on the Essay Revisions
of Twelfth-grade Students

Abstract of the Dissertation

Statement of the Problem:

The purpose of this study was to investigate the interaction between two common instructional methods--the use of editing questions and the use of models--and word processing in the revisions of twelfth-grade students. This study addressed the following questions: Will students' revisions of analytical essays be significantly affected by the use of word processing? Will students' revisions be significantly affected by the use of editing questions or writing models? And will there be a significant interaction between instructional method and computer use?

Methods:

A sample of 33 twelfth-grade students wrote four essays under four different conditions: word processing with model essays, word processing with editing questions, non-word processing with model essays, and non-word processing with editing questions. The resulting rough and final drafts were scored holistically, according to idea/example count, and according to error count. A statistical analysis of the differences between rough draft scores and final drafts scores was then conducted using ANOVA and t-scores.

Results:

Holistic scores and idea/example counts for the final drafts were significantly greater than those for corresponding rough drafts, but there was no significant decrease in error/example counts. The study did not demonstrate a significant difference in changes in the three scores between rough and final drafts among the four conditions. The study did demonstrate a significantly higher idea/example count and error count for the final drafts of essays written with word processing.

Conclusions:

The study indicates that the use of word processing does affect the student's composition process but will not necessarily improve the quality of the student's writing or the quality of student revisions.

Table of Contents

	Page
List of Tables	v
Chapter	
1. Introduction	1
The Problem	6
The Purpose	7
Hypotheses	8
Definition of Terms	9
Limitations	10
Assumptions	11
Organiation of the Study	12
2. Literature Review	13
Word Processing Justifications:	
Physical and Psychological	13
Research on Student Writing	
With Word Processing	17
Positive Results	17
Negative Results	20
Conclusion	25
3. Procedures	29
Subjects	29
Materials	35

(Table of Contents continued)	Page
Method of Data Collection	38
Statistics	45
Summary	46
4. Results	48
Hypothesis One	48
Hypothesis Two	51
Hypothesis Three	52
Hypothesis Four	53
Hypothesis Five	55
Hypothesis Six	56
Summary	57
5. Summary, Discussion and Conclusions, Recommendations . . .	58
Summary	58
Conclusion	69
Implications	70
Recommendations	74
Recommended Areas for Future Research	77
References	81
Appendices	85
A. Materials for Assignment 1	85
B. Materials for Assignment 2	102

(Table of Contents continued)

	Page
C. Materials for Assignment 3	118
D. Materials for Assignment 4	138
E. Materials for Readers	159
F. Student Survey	163
G. Competency Test Summary	166

List of Tables

Table	Page
1. Results of Survey of Student Opinion on Computers and the Writing Process . . .	33
2. Summary of Techniques Found in Nine Secondary Writing Texts for Stimulating and Guiding Student Revisions	37
3. Reader Correction Sheet for Error Counts and Idea/Example Counts	44
4. Descriptive Statistics for Holistic Scores, Idea/Example Counts, and Error Counts on Rough and Final Drafts of Student Essays Grouped According to Student Use of Word Processing	49
5. Descriptive Statistics for Holistic Scores, Idea/Example Counts, and Error Counts on Rough and Final Drafts of Student Essays Grouped According to Student Use of Editing Questions or Writing Models	50
6. Comparison of the Holistic Scores of First Draft Essays to the Holistic Scores of Final Draft Essays	51
7. Analysis of Variance Comparing Gains in Holistic Scores of Essays Written with the Computer to Those Written without the Computer and Essays Written with Editing Questions to Those Written with Writing Models	52
8. Comparison of the Idea/Example Counts of First Draft Essays to the Idea/Example Counts of Final Draft Essays . .	53

(List of Tables continued)

Page

9. Analysis of Variance Comparing Gains in
Idea/Example Counts of Essays Written
with the Computer to Those Written without
the Computer and Essays Written with
Editing Questions to Those Written with
Writing Models 54
10. Comparison of the Error Counts of
First Draft Essays to the Error
Counts of Final Draft Essays 55
11. Analysis of Variance Comparing Error
Counts of Essays Written with the
Computer to Those Written without
the Computer and Essays Written with
Editing Questions to those Written
with Writing Models 56

Chapter 1

INTRODUCTION

Claims about the value of word processing form an important part of the justification for introducing such an expensive innovation as the computer into the English classroom. Advocates of word processing claim that unlike drill-and-practice software, which often could be duplicated much less expensively with a workbook, word processing has unique educational value. Word processing, according to the argument of its advocates, dramatically reduces the drudgery of rewriting and, thus, encourages the student to revise his or her work. Such ease of revision is seen as particularly important because of the current emphasis on teaching writing as a multi-step process in which the student works his or her way through numerous drafts before creating a final product. Word processing, therefore, seems to be a tool perfectly designed to meet a real educational need.

There is general recognition of the power of this tool. For instance, the latest edition of California's

English-Language Arts Curriculum Framework (1986) states, "Possibly more than any other invention in history, word processing simplifies the physical act of writing" (p. 19). And testimonials such as the following one by Judith Newman (1984) are common:

With the help of computers we can take any piece of text completely apart, restructure sentences, search for key words and phrases, rephrase thoughts, rearrange passages effortlessly. This use of computers is rapidly becoming adopted by adults wherever they write for a living. (p. 494)

There is little doubt that experienced, adult writers find word processing valuable, and it is natural to assume that a mechanism of such value to the experienced writer will be of similar benefit to the student writer. This assumption, however, is not necessarily correct. Adult writers such as Newman are obviously impressed with the ease with which revisions can be made on a computer. Students may not be so impressed. In this regard, Nash and Schwartz (1985) tell a suggestive anecdote. They established an elaborately equipped computer laboratory in a college basic composition course. When the computers first arrived, they were surprised that the students were not as delighted as they were over the computer's

potential for reducing the drudgery of revision, but the two teachers soon guessed at the truth. Their guess was confirmed when then they asked the students in one class how many times in the past they had rewritten a paper and found that only one student had ever done so (p. 21). As Nash and Schwartz's story indicates, a student may not see word processing as a labor saving device since the student may never have intended to do any extensive rewriting in the first place.

The point of the Nash and Schwartz (1985) story goes beyond merely being a comment on student laziness. Attitudes toward revision are basic to the writing process. An awareness of the importance of revision may itself be an important distinction between the experienced and inexperienced writer. "Inexperienced writers," according to Wheeler (1985), "view composition as a solitary, one-step activity" but experienced writers "recognize that writing is a multistage, recursive process"(p. 54). Authorities have also argued that the manner and extent of the revision done by a writer is closely related to that writer's understanding of the writing process and of what is an acceptable finished product. Purves and Purves (1986), for example, suggest that concepts of when a text is completed may depend on

culturally determined models. They state,

...one might expect that there would be differences between cultures not only as to the shape of the model, a particular text structure, but also as to the point at which the activity ceases. It appears that in some cultures a single draft is sufficient; in others that redrafting and polishing are required.

(p. 185)

In addition, as Purves and Purves indirectly remind us, the current instructional emphasis on revision is itself a culturally imposed requirement and is no more natural than the "one-shot" approach favored by Nash and Schwartz's students.

Given the complexity of the issues surrounding the revision process, we should not be surprised that the contribution of word processing to this process is far from clear. Certainly many potential benefits can be suggested. Newman (1984), for example, sketches some of the positive effects of the speed of revision possible with word processing:

. . . it is much easier to sustain the images one is trying to create from draft to draft. Not only can you sustain an idea you want to explore better, you are also encouraged to take risks you might not

otherwise consider. The computer's capacity for storing and manipulating text makes it easier to consider alternative frameworks while you're writing. Writing becomes much more of a comparison process: do I want to say this in this way or in that, do I want to structure my argument this way or that? (p. 495)

Such effects would obviously be of great help to the student writer. Such effects, however, may not necessarily result from word processing. Nash and Schwartz (1985) caution that revision is a skill that must be taught; otherwise the ease with which "surface prettiness" is achieved with a computer may actually reduce the process of revision. Similarly, Wheeler (1985) states,

. . . without proper teaching, inexperienced writers do not improve their writing by using a word processor. In fact, these writers are sometimes fooled by the illusion of the professional-looking copy. They tend to compose longer documents and revise more frequently. But their revisions focus on making changes at the word level, which don't necessarily add to the quality of the text. (p. 54)

As these authors indicate, word processing for all of its

obvious potential will not necessarily automatically improve student revisions.

The Problem

The real focus of the problem is, of course, not the word processor but the student. As has been the case in the past, the difficulty is finding instructional methods which will both motivate the student to revise and assist him or her in making revisions which allow him or her to communicate with more clarity and force. Furthermore to be useful in our public schools those methods must be practical under the prevailing conditions in those schools. High school English teachers, for instance, are commonly advised to use individual conferences to coach the student through multiple drafts of each writing assignment, but though such a process might be effective, it is often rendered impractical by large class sizes, discipline problems, and time schedules.

Although the potential power of word processing in the revision process is clear, how this potential can be realized in the classroom is still an open question. There is a need to investigate the interaction between instructional methods and word processing; particularly, there is a need to investigate methods which can be implemented in currently prevailing classroom conditions.

This study attempts to contribute to such an investigation by trying to answer the following questions: Will students' revisions of analytical essays be significantly affected by the use of word processing? Will students' revisions be significantly affected by the use of editing questions or writing models? And will there be a significant interaction between instructional method (the use of editing questions or the use of writing models) and the means of writing (the use or non-use of word processing)?

The Purpose

The purpose of this study was to investigate the interaction between word processing and two common instructional methods. This study compared rough and final drafts for four analytical essays written by thirty-three twelfth grade students. At the beginning of the study the students were randomly divided into four groups, and during the study these groups were cycled through four conditions: word processing with editing questions, word processing with writing models, non-word processing with editing questions, and non-word processing with writing models.

Hypotheses

The following are the null hypotheses posited as the basis for investigation in this study. They were tested for significance at the .05 level of significance.

Hypothesis 1: For each of the two treatments the mean of the final draft holistic scores for both the word processing and non-word processing conditions will not differ significantly from the mean of the first draft holistic scores.

Hypothesis 2: For each of the two treatments the increase in the mean of the holistic scores for the word processing condition will not differ significantly from the increase in the mean of the holistic scores for the non-word processing condition.

Hypothesis 3: For each of the two treatments the mean of the final draft idea/example counts for both the word processing and non-word processing conditions will not differ significantly from the mean of the first draft idea/example counts.

Hypothesis 4: For each of the two treatments the increase in the mean of the idea/example counts for the word processing conditions will not differ significantly from the increase in the mean of the idea/example counts for the non-word processing condition.

Hypothesis 5: For each of the two treatments both conditions will not show a significant decrease in the mean error count between the first and final drafts.

Hypothesis 6: For each of the two treatments the mean decrease in error count for the word processing condition will not differ significantly from that for the non-word processing condition.

Definition of Terms

For the purposes of this study the terms listed below will have the following meanings:

Holistic scoring: a norm-referenced, impressionistic rating of compositions for overall quality. Readers will use a 1-9 point scale with "1" being lowest and "9" being highest.

Analytical essay: a composition in which the writer develops a main idea by explaining and illustrating its component parts; typically, the writer presents a thesis and then offers a series of supporting ideas, developing each with reasoning and examples.

Writing prompt: a written statement given to the student in order to initiate the writing process. In addition to a writing topic, it will include indications of the composition's purpose, probable audience, and special requirements.

Word processor: a computer program designed to record, manipulate, and store text.

Process writing instruction: a method of instruction which emphasizes the steps by which the student arrives at his or her final composition and the strategies employed rather than emphasizing writing sub-skills and the final product.

Idea/example count: the total produced by tabulating the ideas and examples identified in each composition by a reader.

Error count: the total produced by tabulating the errors identified in each composition by a reader. (Readers were provided a list of common errors--spelling, punctuation, and sentence structure. This list appears in Appendix E.)

Limitations

In interpreting the results of this study, certain limitations have to be considered:

1. The results are valid and reliable only to the extent that the scoring procedures are valid and reliable.
2. The results are generalizable only to the extent that the characteristics of the intact group utilized as a

sample are shared by any other group or individual.

3. The results are generalizable only to the extent that the characteristics of the word processor utilized in this study, Open Access, are shared by any other word processor.

4. The results must be interpreted in the context of the instructional methods and teaching style of the instructor as these may influence the effectiveness of a particular instructional method or writing mode.

5. Since the researcher is also the instructor for the intact group used in the study, results must be interpreted in the context of a possible unintentional instructor bias which could influence the students' preferences for instructional method or writing mode.

Assumptions

The design of this study rested on the following assumptions:

1. The students would be able to complete the writing process within the time given to them. (Originally the time was three fifty-minute class periods, but this time was extended to four fifty-minute class periods.)

2. The students would complete an entire rough draft of the essays before beginning the revision process.

3. The study's results would not be significantly affected by differences in keyboarding and computer skills possessed by the students.

Organization of the Study

The remaining chapters in this study are organized as follows: Chapter Two is a review of the literature related to the student use of word processors and the student revision process. In Chapter Three a description of the sample, the materials, procedures for data collection, and the methods of analyzing the data are presented. Chapter Four contains the results of the analyses. Included in Chapter Five is a summary of the findings, discussion, and recommendations for further research.

Chapter 2

LITERATURE REVIEW

One author rejects the comparison of the introduction of the word processor to the invention of the printing press, suggesting somewhat slightly that the innovation is perhaps more closely analogous to the change from the quill pen to the metal nib (Wilkinson, 1986, p. 100). Another states that the word processor is "not some magical implement" (Pufahl, 1984, p. 93). The kind of hyperbole--"Possibly more than any other invention in history, word processing..."--and inflated claims that these authors are rejecting suggests one problem with existing research on the effects of word processing on student revision of composition: Expectations may be too high. This technological advance may not have the educational effects expected by its advocates.

Word Processing Justifications: Physical and Psychological

These expectations grow naturally from a recognition of the word processor's tremendous potential. For experienced writers word processing is close to magical. Tapping a few keys can replace hours of retyping. Microchips quietly absorb correction after correction and

on demand send perfectly clean type to screen or printer, never producing the kind of smudged mess created by hand corrections. Such a wondrous mechanism should have wondrous effects on student writing. Particularly, word processing should revolutionize the student's process of revision, and the literature contains a number of persuasive justifications for this expectation.

One of the more complex and influential of these is presented by Colette Dauite (1983). She argues that word processing can help young writers overcome both physical and psychological constraints. Physically, word processing frees the student from the work of recopying and the aesthetically unappealing appearance of a revised draft. Psychologically, word processing provides three benefits:

(1) Relief from the burden on short term memory-- Dauite suggests that student writers overburden their short-term memories by trying to carry on the entire writing process at once unlike experienced writers who have well-learned strategies for producing structures which they can call up "automatically from long-term memory." Word processing allows the less experienced writer to lessen the problem by "focusing on different steps in the writing process one by one" (p. 139).

(2) A psuedo-audience--As an audience the word

processor is "subtly interactive." According to Dauite (1983), "The writer knows that the computer is not really an audience, but the machine's responsiveness alerts the writer to the concerns of the potential audience" (p. 141).

(3) Encouragement for the student to control his or her cognitive processes--Dauite (1983) claims supplemental programs such as spell checkers can teach the student self-monitoring and that the students' "interaction with the computer also helps writers learn to monitor their own writing process and evaluate the product" (p. 142).

A similar rationale for the value of word processing for student writers is provided by Richard M. Collier (1983). Listing major reasons to explain why inexperienced writers do not adopt "more complex, holistic, and mature tactics" (p. 149), he explains how word processing would be likely to resolve most of the problems. Like Dauite (1983) he points to the demands on the short term memory and conceptualizing power of the student and suggests that the computer's memory could supplement that of the student. He speculates,

Revising might even become an attractive activity:
because of its novel capabilities, a word processor
might encourage the student writer to play and

experiment with language, thus helping to produce surprise, innovation, even serendipitous learning, all of which are the ingredients of productive heuristics. (p. 150)

Revision on a computer might then be intrinsically motivating, a form of play, but a form of play that fosters learning about writing.

A common thread in the ideas of those supporting the student writer's use of word processing is that the ease of electronically manipulating text will free the student writer to take chances and experiment. Newman (1984), for example says,

Writing with a word processor has many advantages. It allows writers to become more willing to take risks, to be tentative about meaning for longer, to consider organization and word choices more freely than ever before. What this means is that children (and adults, too) can learn a great deal about language and the writing process each time they engage in writing.

(p. 495)

Nash and Schwartz (1985) agree, claiming that word processors encourage more rewriting because they "permit infinite reshaping of a text without the need for endless recopying" (p. 19). The authors of Hand in Hand: The

Writing Process and The Microcomputer (1986) say that word processing "reinforces and enhances the dynamic, interactive, social nature of writing " and thus becomes more like talking (p. 27).

Research on Student Writing with Word Processing

A number of writers, then, have concluded that the benefits of word processing should induce the student to revise both more extensively and more effectively. Although the existing research shows some positive results, by and large, results have not met expectations. Partially the lack of positive results may reflect the limitations of the research. Writing in 1983, Collier (1983) comments that his study of computer-based text editors "is an attempt to begin mapping this largely unexplored territory" (p. 149) and, although there have been a number of studies since Collier's, the area that they cover is still tiny in proportion to the territory involved. The research, though, does seem to indicate that simply having access to word processing will not necessarily increase or improve the student's revisions.

Positive results

Almost without exception researchers report that their subjects showed a positive attitude toward word

processing. In a University of Minnesota study of graduate students with only one exception even the "Beethovians," who reported feeling frustrated by having to scroll back and forth, purchased microcomputers for themselves soon after the study (Rodrigues and Rodrigues, 1986, p. 8). After working for a semester in a computer laboratory with twelve remedial college students, Rodrigues (1985) reports that using word processing markedly improved her students' attitude toward writing, and she concludes,

Even though the quality of their finished products was not significantly higher than that of previous years' students, I believe that these students' experiences helped them to internalize the writing process and so gain confidence as writers. (p. 339)

Similarly, Jones, Meis, and Bolchazy conclude that enthusiasm for word processing among a group of secondary students justified using word processors even though the research results were negative (Rodrigues and Rodrigues, 1986, p. 9).

In addition, a few studies have found that word processing produced improved results as well as positive attitudes. Two studies using small samples and a case study approach report positive results: Bean (1983) worked

with four college freshmen as well as twelve instructors at Montana State University; two of the students reported that using the computer increased the number of revisions that they made in their essays (p. 147-148). Another small study was conducted by Pearson and Wilkinson (1986) in an Essex comprehensive school. After observing the use of word processors by fifteen students, they conclude, the word processor was not found to be an essential prerequisite to such revision, but appeared in these cases to act as a facilitating device which increased the motivation to revise by making it so simple. The contention that word processors may only encourage children to tinker with surface features (primarily word selection and punctuation) of their writing is not borne out by the evidence of these case studies (p. 187). Both Bean and Pearson and Wilkinson conclude that there were grounds for further study into the benefits of word processing for student writers.

Three more extensive studies also showed positive results. Using process-oriented writing instruction, Sommers (1985) compared the revisions of forty-four college students who did not use word processors to those of thirty-five college students who did use word processing. On a twelve point holistic scale, the word

processor users improved 1.26 points while the non-word processor users improved only .46 points; although small, the difference in improvement was statistically significant. Kurth and Stromberg (1984) divided eighteen fifth, sixth, and seventh grade remedial students into two groups of nine with one group using word processors. Their analysis of twelve essay assignments showed that, although there was little difference in the lengths of the essays produced by the two groups, the word processing group produced more rough drafts and made a higher percentage of their revisions at the sentence and paragraph level. Like Sommers, Kurth and Stromberg focused instruction on the process of writing. In a study of eighty seventh grade students Dalton (1986) found that after a year of instruction low ability students who had used word processing scored significantly better on a standardized writing test than low achieving students who had had conventional instruction; he did not find, however, that word processing was effective for the high ability students.

Negative results

Six studies, on the other hand, report either negative or non-significant results for word processing.

The earliest is that of Collier (1983) who tested the following hypothesis:

. . . that the use of computer-based text editors would significantly expand the number and the complexity of the operations used by inexperienced writers when revising and would increase the range of domains upon which these operations were performed, thus improving overall effectiveness of their revising strategies. (p. 150)

As was mentioned above, Collier based his hypothesis on an extensive rationale, but his actual study involved only four subjects, ranging in age from nineteen to thirty-two. After obtaining sample student essays which were produced and revised by hand, Collier had his subjects produce handwritten essays weekly for six weeks, submit them on Tuesdays, and revise them using the terminals on the following Fridays. Twice he asked the students to provide a "thinking aloud protocol" which was tape-recorded, and during the final session he video taped the screens of the word processors. He concluded that his hypothesis was not confirmed. On the positive side, he found that his students made more changes in smaller units of meaning, experimented more, and wrote slightly longer essays. Also, contrary to Dalton's findings, he found that the word

processor was more of an advantage for the superior student. On the negative side, he found that the student made more "serious and elaborate additions" when working by hand, recognized and corrected fewer errors while using the text editor, and did not produce higher quality products with the text editor. Finally, Collier found no evidence that students employed different strategies when using the text editor (pp. 151-155).

Working with college freshmen, three researchers obtained results similar to Collier's. Hawisher (1986) had twenty advanced college freshmen alternately write four essays on and off the computer, producing two with word processing and two with pen and typewriter. She found that the computer did not lead to increased revision, different kinds of revisions, nor higher quality papers. She found no positive relationship between extensive revision and the quality ratings given by trained raters using an analytic scale. Hult (1985), also working with college freshmen, also found no difference in correctness in papers produced with and without a word processor. Cross and Curey (1984) divided three sections of freshman English into two halves randomly and compared eight essays written in a computer laboratory by one group to those produced conventionally by the other. They compared the

essays according to both process and content measures but found no consistent differences.

Again with college freshmen, Harris (1985) used a case study approach with six honors English students. Each student revised two expository essays without a word processor and two with a word processor. According to Harris's analysis, the revisions made with the word processors did not contain more meaning changes nor did the students with more computer experience revise more. Harris (1985) made the following observations:

(1) Most students were unable to revise on the computer, requiring printouts on which to work.

(2) Students liked clean copy.

(3) The spell checker was an important benefit.

(4) There was no evidence that students were more likely to experiment and take risks on a computer.

(5) There was an unanswered question on recursiveness--significant because the computer limits the ability of the writer to check the overall flow of an essay by skimming back through previous pages.

(6) Students liked to use word processing.

She concludes,

. . . word processing does not, in and of itself, encourage student writers to revise more extensively,

especially the macrostructure of a text. In fact, for whatever reason, using a word processor seems to discourage revision. Inexperienced writers, those who do not typically revise, seem even less inclined to make major changes in the content and organization of their texts when they use word processing. (pp. 328-330)

The most negative results were those obtained by Jones, Meis, and Bolchazy (Rodrigues and Rodrigues, 1986) with secondary students working on the Bank Street Writer word processing program. The students worked for a month on one major assignment, an extended memoir. Those students using the word processor made fewer revisions than those working with paper and pen:

. . . those who worked with paper and pen included three times as much specific detail as those who worked on the word processor and made almost three times as many mechanical revisions as those who worked on the word processor. (p. 8)

Thus in this case the word processor seems to have worked to the students' detriment, but Jones, Meis, and Bolchazy speculate that since their students had not used word processing previously, the students in the word processing group may have been at a disadvantage because they had to

learn to use the word processor at the same time as they were doing the writing task.

Conclusion

As was stated at the outset, these studies are too few and the territory too large for conclusive results. In addition, the studies suffer from a number of other limitations. In four of the studies--those by Collier (1983), Harris (1985), Bean (1983), and Pearson and Wilkinson (1986)--the researchers specifically acknowledge that the sample is too small to form a basis for generalization.

The significance of equipment also raises difficulties. Both hardware and software can have significant effects on the outcomes. Collier (1983), for instance, points to deficiencies in the word processing program used by his students (p. 154) as do Jones, Meis, and Bolchazy (Rodrigues and Rodrigues, 1986, p. 9). Other, less obvious effects of equipment are also possible. For example, since some writers work best with hardcopy, the availability of printers could significantly affect the outcome of a study. The equipment used in these studies was--understandably--neither consistent nor fully reported.

The degree to which the student is experienced with

the equipment used in the study could also be a significant variable. In their review of the research Rodriques and Rodrigues (1986) stress the importance of this variable:

As we read the current research about writing on the computer, we must continue to ask ourselves what the results will be like once the students are comfortable with word processing and are experienced with it. (p. 8)

And, of course, not only is the student's general experience with word processing important but also his or her experience with the particular program and equipment used in the study.

Perhaps the most important variable, and the least consistent, is the degree to which the teacher intervenes in the writing process. In response to a criticism of his methodology, Collier (1984) writes,

Undoubtedly, then, a combination of the computer and good teaching yields more extensive language learning than does the computer alone, and investigation of this interrelationship is a direction future research should pursue. But just as the social scientist might wish to determine what effect a change from drab to bright colors in a classroom could have on learning,

so, too, was I curious to discover if the word processor, which can eliminate much of the drudgery in composition, might by itself bring about some valuable changes in writing behavior. (p. 94)

Pearson and Wilkinson (1986) too emphasize that they did not intervene directly in the writing process (although, of course, Collier and Pearson and Wilkinson structured the conditions under which the subjects of their studies wrote), but all the other researchers did combine their individual concepts of "good teaching" with their studies of the effects of word processing. In this regard, it may be significant that the three of the researchers who obtained positive results stressed their emphasis on the student's writing process; in other words, there may be a link between successfully using word processing and focusing instruction on strategies for prewriting, writing, and revising.

To a large extent, of course, the very inconsistency of the results answers the initial question--the one that intrigued Collier. Word processing by itself clearly does not automatically improve the student's ability to revise effectively. Certain conditions must be met in order for the student to make use of the magical implement; therefore, the emphasis in research should be to find

those conditions.

Chapter 3

PROCEDURES

Described in this chapter are the procedures used in the selection of a sample of subjects, the materials, the method of data collection, and the statistical techniques used in the data analysis.

Subjects

The subjects of this study were members of an intact group drawn from a California public high school. The high school was one of four comprehensive high schools in a district with a total district enrollment of 9,621. The high school's enrollment was drawn primarily from a single central California city. The 1980 US Census listed the city's population as 106,602 and indicated that population included 2,187 Blacks, 1,164 American Indians, 2,333 Asian/Pacific Islanders, and 11,180 people of Spanish origin. (The total population had increased to an estimated 138,500 in 1987.) The 1985 per capita income was 10,526, and 10,727 people were in poverty. The 1980 US Census divided the city's 52,214 person labor force as follows: 10,692 managers and professions; 15,431

technicians, sales, and administrative support; 6,207 service occupations; 994 farming, fishing, and forestry; 6265 precision production, craft, and repair; 6,906 operators, fabricators, and laborers; and 3,029 self employed persons (Hornor, 1988, p. 240).

According to the California Basic Educational Data System (CBEDS) report to the California State Department of Education, the high school from which the sample was drawn had a total enrollment of 2,415 during the 1986-1987 school year. Of this total 20% were Hispanic and 6% were Asian; none of the other sub-groups were over 1%.

According to a district report to the California State Department of Education, as of October of 1986, 320 students at this high school qualified for "free and reduced lunches" and 370 came from families which qualified for "aid to families with dependent children." The district's Annual Test Report 1986-87 includes the following information about the academic performance of the twelfth-grade class from which the sample was drawn: The CAP scores of this class were within the comparison bands in math and language and above in reading; 12.0% of those taking the SAT had a verbal aptitude score above 450; and 13.0% had a math aptitude score above 500.

The senior English class which participated in the

study was composed of 18 girls and 15 boys. Three members of the class were Hispanic and one was Asian. The class was intended for students who expected to go to college. As is shown in Appendix G, all the students had passed the district's mastery tests in "Reading/Literature" and "English/Writing." Two students, however, had not received mastery-level scores on the written composition portion of the English/Writing test.

All students in this group were familiar with the word processing program and computers used in this study. During the semester before the one in which the study was conducted they had all periodically used the computer laboratory for English composition assignments. In addition to this experience, students either had been required to meet a district computer literacy requirement by taking one of a list of designated courses or had had the requirement waived. The requirement was waived if a student had received a grade of B or better in a seventh or eighth grade computer literacy course. As is shown in Appendix G, of the students in the study 13 had had the requirement waived and 25 had passed at least one class which the district accepted as meeting the computer literacy requirement. (Six of the students who had had the requirement waived also passed classes which met the

requirement.)

To form some basis for determining whether the students' opinions on word processing and the writing process affected the outcomes of the study a ten question, written survey was administered by the researcher during the first week of the experiment. This survey was intended to provide base line information for a frame of reference for results that might evolve from the study. A copy of this survey is included in Appendix F, and a summary of its results is presented in Table 1.

The first group, Questions 1 through 4, were asked to help determine the students' attitudes toward computers and word processing. The responses to Question 1 show slight home use of computers for school assignments. Only one-fourth of the class had access to a computer at home, and of those eight two indicated that they never used a computer for writing school assignments. (Three students marked 3; two marked 4; and one marked 5--indicating that this student always used a computer for writing assignments.)

Table 1
Results of Survey of Student Opinion
On Computers and the Writing Process
(n=32)

QUESTIONS	MEAN	SD
1. Do you have access to a computer at home? (Eight responded yes.) If so, do you use it for writing school assignments? never 1 2 3 4 5 frequently	1.25	.44
2. How would you rate your mastery of the Open Access word processing program? poor 1 2 3 4 5 excellent	3.65	.93
3. Given a choice do you prefer to write on a computer? never 1 2 3 4 5 always	3.82	1.37
4. Do you do a better job of writing when you use a computer? never 1 2 3 4 5 always	3.76	1.33
5. How would you rate your skill as a writer? poor 1 2 3 4 5 excellent	3.50	1.10
6. If you have a choice, do you write more than one draft of an essay before turning it in to an English class? never 1 2 3 4 5 always	3.78	1.28
7. When you rewrite an essay, do you concentrate mostly on correcting errors? never 1 2 3 4 5 always	4.03	.96
8. When you rewrite an essay, do you add new examples? never 1 2 3 4 5 always	4.07	.94
9. How important do you consider the neatness of the final draft of an essay to be? slightly 1 2 4 5 highly	4.78	.60
10. When you rewrite an essay, do you change the order in which the sentences appear? never 1 2 3 4 5 always	3.35	.82

Responses to Questions 2 through 4 show that the students had predominantly positive attitudes toward word processing. In Question 2 students rated their mastery of the Open Access word processing program on a five step scale ranging from "poor" to "excellent." (Open Access was the program used during the experiment and was also used the in school's computer literacy classes.) The students rated themselves above the median with the mean response being 3.656. On the third and fourth questions, given a one to five range from "never" to "always," the students also averaged above the median for both, showing a preference for using a computer for writing and a belief that they did better work on a computer.

The focus shifted to the writing process with Question 5. On a scale from "poor" to "excellent" the students placed themselves slightly above the midpoint with an average of 3.4961. They also placed themselves above the midpoint on a scale from "never" to "always" on Question 7 about writing more than one draft of an essay. Questions 7 through 10 show the students gave similar importance to the different aspects of revision and editing, but the fact that they gave the highest average rating to neatness and the lowest to changing the order in which sentences appear could indicate that they gave more

importance to appearance than to organization.

In general, the students showed a positive attitude toward word processing and toward revision. They rated themselves slightly above the median on mastery of Open Access, on preferring writing on a computer, and on doing a better job of writing when using a computer. In regard to writing, the students indicated a willingness to revise, but showed no strong prioritization of the different aspects of revision. The survey did not reveal any student opinions or feelings which would hamper the students' performance during the experiment.

Materials

In this study two instructional techniques were utilized, the use of editing questions and the use of writing models. The basis for the selection of these two techniques was a review of textbooks offered by the nine publishers that are listed in Table 2. These texts had been solicited by the local school district as part of a textbook selection process, and they were all recently issued. The oldest bore a 1980 copyright; four were copyrighted in 1985; two in 1986; and two in 1987. All of these texts discuss the writing process and divide this process into steps or stages, offering the student advice and activities for each stage. A survey of these nine

writing texts revealed some variety in the techniques used to help the student revise: Four texts suggest some form of peer editing; one explains and gives examples of trying out "focuses" (primarily, selecting details and organizing them to fit different dominant ideas); another demonstrates a process of "unwriting" which shows the student how to use a paraphrase, precis, or outline to analyze a composition; and each text intermingles instruction on revision with instruction on specific writing skills. Two techniques, however, obviously predominate: the use of writing models and the use of editing questions.

All the texts present the students with writing models. Some of these models are presented as good examples of particular types of compositions. Others are flawed examples which the student is asked to analyze. And still others are what the Macmillan English writers call "evolving models;" these are before and after samples of writing used to demonstrate possible kinds of revision. All texts also make profuse use of various kinds of editing questions. In some cases these are general open-ended questions such as "Does this composition fullfill your purpose?" But more frequently the questions are checklists to help the student evaluate

Table 2
Summary of Techniques Found
in Nine Secondary Writing Texts
for Stimulating and Guiding Student Revision

Publisher (Copyright)	Models	Editing Questions	Peer Edit	Focusing	Unwriting
Laidlaw Brothers (1985)	X	X	X		
Educational Design (1985)	X	X		X	
Scholastic (1987)	X	X			
Glencoe (1985)	X	X			
Addison-Wesley (1987)	X	X	X		X
Scribner/Macmillan/ Collier Macmillan (1986)	X	X	X		
Houghton-Mifflin (1986)	X	X			
Prentice-Hall (1985)	X	X			
Stack The Deck (1980)	X	X	X		

his or her composition by checking for certain characteristics.

For this study the researcher chose the two dominant methods and prepared editing questions and models similar to those found in the texts reviewed. (Both the questions and models for each assignment appear in Appendixes A, B, and C.) The editing questions were not taken entirely from any one source but are a composite of typical editing questions for an analytical essay. Rather than focusing on a particular skill, these questions direct the student's attention to major aspects of the organization and development of an essay. For the writing models, the researcher chose to present "good" models instead of flawed models and to follow each with a short series of questions to focus the student's attention on the model's major characteristics. Three models were prepared for each assignment: a sample introduction, a sample developmental paragraph, and a sample essay. The first set was written for the study. The other three sets were adapted from analytical essays that appeared in textbooks.

Method of Data Collection

For this study students were assigned to four groups of eight students each: Group A, Group B, Group C, and

Group D. All students wrote four essays. The conditions under which each group wrote changed for each assignment so that by the end of the fourth assignment all groups rotated through all four conditions: (1) word processing using models, (2) word processing using editing questions, (3) non-word processing using models, (4) non-word processing using editing questions.

Each of the four assignments required the interpretive analysis of a work of literature. The four-day writing cycles were preceeded by classroom activities related to the literature. Before each writing assignment all students were given a set of prewriting questions to discuss in small groups and to answer in writing. During each four-day cycle, after being given a writing prompt, the students were instructed to finish a first draft by the end of the second day and a final draft by the end of the fourth day. (Originally this was to be a three-day cycle with the first draft to be completed at the end of the first day, but the students had so much difficulty completing a first draft that, starting with the first essay, they were given an additional day.) Students were given four class periods of fifty minutes each to work on their essays. To control time as a variable the students were not allowed to take their work home. Students who

finished early were given a reading assignment. Although the teacher answered student questions, during the three days he did not initiate lessons or activities other than the writing assignment and related activities described below.

Writing Models

For each assignment two groups--one word processing and one non-word processing-- were given a model at the beginning of each writing session except the second. At the beginning of the first session, this was a model of an introduction for the type of writing in which they were engaged. At the beginning of the second session, the model was of a developmental paragraph of the kind which could be used in the body of their essays. And the model for the fourth day incorporated the first two into a complete essay of the type which the students were writing. The students were required to turn in answers to questions about each of the models. (See Appendixes A, B, C for examples of the models.)

Editing Questions

Instead of models, the other two groups were given lists of editing questions. These questions were designed to focus the students' attention on major elements of

their essays. (See Appendixes A, B, and C for examples of the editing questions.) The students were required to turn in written answers to the editing questions with each draft of their papers.

Word Processing and Non-word Processing

For each assignment one half of the class used word processors and the other half used paper, pens, and pencils. All students were provided packets of lined paper and asked to use it for all writing except that done on the computer. Students worked in a computer laboratory with which they were familiar under the supervision of their regular English teacher. They had dictionaries and extra copies of the text containing the literature available in the laboratory.

The computer laboratory contained eighteen Apricot computers equipped with Open Access word processing programs. Two dot matrix printers were available. The laboratory also contained sufficient desks to seat the class.

For each of the four assignments the students' papers were collected at the end of each class period, and students were only allowed to write their compositions during class. The composition submitted at the end of the second

day was photocopied. That copy was considered the "rough draft." The composition submitted at the end of the fourth day was also be photocopied. That copy was considered the "final draft."

Evaluation of Essays

The student papers were given three scores: a holistic score, an error count, and an idea example count. The scoring was done by three individuals who were experienced "readers" and who had received training in holistic grading. All three had bachelor of arts degrees--two in English and one in communications. All three had been employed by the local school district to annotate and score student compositions for English classes and also to score papers holistically as part of the district's minimum competency program. One had worked as a reader for ten years for one school district and eight for another. The second had read for the local district for two years. And the third had read for the local school district for seventeen years.

All first and final draft student papers--which were identified only by number--from the four assignments were mixed together and randomly distributed among the readers. First the papers were holistically scored as follows: The readers were given the instructions included

in Appendix E and guided through several practice rounds during which they scored sample papers and compared the results. Then each paper was independently given a score of one to nine by two readers. If the two scores for a particular paper were more than two points apart a third reader scored the paper and the two closest scores were used. Second the papers were redistributed randomly among the readers. This time, using the form shown in Table 3, the readers counted the number of separate ideas and examples found in each paper and counted the number of specified errors found in each paper. At the end of the process each paper had three scores.

To assess reliability for the holistic scoring, Pearson's r was determined for the three combinations of readers and for the two closest scores that formed the total holistic scores. The correlations for the three combinations of readers were as follows:

Reader 1 to Reader 2, $r=.66$ ($n=74$)

Reader 1 to Reader 3, $r=.71$ ($n=76$)

Reader 2 to Reader 3, $r=.67$ ($n=108$)

These moderate correlations indicate an acceptable level of agreement among the three readers' scores. When the third readings were taken into account and the two closest scores were compared, then $r=.80$ ($n=256$).

To determine the reliability of the errors counts and idea/example counts, forty papers were selected randomly

Table 3

Reader Correction Sheet for Error Counts
and Idea/Example Counts

ERROR COUNT

Student Code____ Assignment Number____ Reader_____

____ 1. Sentence Structure____
(run-on sentences, fragments, misplaced or dangling
modifiers, or faulty parallelism)

____ 2. Punctuation____
(omitting or incorrectly using one of the following:
comma, end mark, quotation mark, underlining, dash,
semicolon, or colon)

____ 3. Pronoun____
(lacks clear antecedent, doesn't agree with
antecedent, shifts person unnecessarily)

____ 4. Subject-verb Agreement_____

____ 5. Spelling_____
(including apostrophe errors)

____ 6. Double Negative_____

____ 7. Word Selection_____

____ Total Number of Errors

____ Idea/Example Count_____

and given a second reading using the same form as is shown in Table 3. When the first and second readings for the forty papers were compared, the error counts had a correlation of $r=.92$ and the idea/example counts had a correlation of $r=.76$.

Statistics

A two-way analysis of variance was used to examine each of the six hypotheses with a .05 level of significance being considered sufficient to reject the null hypothesis. Hypothesis 1, 3, and 5 were framed to investigate the differences between first draft and final draft scores according to holistic scoring, idea/example count, and error counts for both handwritten and word processed compositions. Gain scores were computed by subtracting the first draft scores from the final draft scores. A t -test for each set of gain scores was used to determine whether or not the expected significant improvements according to the three measures did indeed take place.

Hypotheses 2, 4, and 6 were posited in order to compare the differences between word processed and handwritten compositions on the same three measures under the same three instructional conditions. The two-way analysis of variance of gain scores served the purpose of

holding constant the possible differences in initial abilities in writing as reflected on the first drafts of each composition, so that the results obtained on the final draft could be investigated without these potentially contaminating effects. Thus the analysis allowed the researcher to determine if the writing skills as measured by holistic, idea/example, and error count scores were significantly different due not only to treatment, but also to the mode (word processed or handwritten) used for the composition of the material.

Summary

The purpose of this study was to investigate the effect on student essay revisions of the use of word processing and of two common instructional methods. The instructional methods, selected after a review of nine high school writing texts, were the use of writing models and the use of editing questions.

The sample for the study was composed of thirty-three high school seniors, 18 girls and 15 boys. All subjects were members of a single college-preparatory English class in a central California public high school. Three members of the class were Hispanic and one was Asian. All subjects were familiar with word processing.

The procedure was to randomly divide the class into four groups and to rotate the groups through four different conditions: (1) word processing using models, (2) word processing using editing questions, (3) non-word processing using models, (4) non-word processing using editing questions. Under each condition each student in the group wrote an analytical essay. First and final drafts of these essays were compared to determine changes in holistic scores, idea/example counts, and error counts. The resulting scores and counts were analyzed using a two-way analysis of variance and, for three hypotheses, t-tests to determine if the null hypotheses could be rejected.

Chapter 4

RESULTS

This chapter contains the results of the analyses related to the six hypotheses. In Table 4 and Table 5 it also includes the means and standard deviations for holistic scores, idea/example counts, and error counts grouped according to the students' use of word processing and according to the students' use of editing questions or writing models.

Hypothesis One

Hypothesis One stated that for each of the two treatments the mean of the final draft holistic scores for both the word processing and non-word processing conditions would not be significantly greater than the mean of the first draft holistic scores. The means were calculated and a t test was applied to determine significance. As shown in Table 6, out of a possible 18 the mean holistic score for the first draft was 8.37, and the mean holistic score for the final draft was 11.58.

Table 4

Descriptive Statistics for Holistic Scores,
 Idea/Example Counts, and Error Counts
 on Rough and Final Drafts of Student Essays
 Grouped According to Student Use of Word Processing

	<u>n</u>	Mean	Standard Deviation
Holistic Scores			
Word Processing			
Rough	64	8.672	4.000
Final	63	11.270	3.028
Non-word Processing			
Rough	62	8.145	3.561
Final	63	11.778	3.599
Idea/Example Count			
Word Processing			
Rough	63	5.683	3.374
Final	63	7.730	4.132
Non-word Processing			
Rough	62	4.597	1.894
Final	64	6.313	2.281
Error Count			
Word Processing			
Rough	63	10.683	7.502
Final	63	12.206	8.215
Non-word Processing			
Rough	62	9.807	6.618
Final	64	9.516	5.489

Table 5

Descriptive Statistics for Holistic Scores,
Idea/Example Counts, and Error Counts
on Rough and Final Drafts of Student Essays
Grouped According to Student Use
of Editing Questions or Writing Models

	<u>n</u>	Mean	Standard Deviation
Holistic Scores			
Editing Questions			
Rough	63	8.222	3.558
Final	63	11.444	3.068
Writing Model			
Rough	63	8.603	4.018
Final	63	11.603	3.581
Idea/Example Count			
Editing Questions			
Rough	63	5.000	2.597
Final	64	7.000	3.846
Writing model			
Rough	62	5.290	2.977
Final	63	7.032	2.890
Error Count			
Editing Questions			
Rough	63	10.698	7.747
Final	64	10.719	6.786
Writing Model			
Rough	62	9.790	6.322
Final	63	10.984	7.415

Hypothesis One was rejected ($p < .001$). Thus it appears that the holistic scores for the final drafts were significantly greater than those for the corresponding first drafts regardless of treatment.

Table 6
Comparison of the Holistic Scores
of First Draft Essays to the Holistic Scores of
Final Draft Essays

Variable	<u>n</u>	Mean	Standard Deviation	Standard Error
First Draft	125	8.37	3.77	0.34
Final Draft	125	11.58	3.27	0.29
<u>t</u> -ratio = 8.62; $p < .001$				

Hypothesis Two

Hypothesis Two stated that the increase in the mean of the holistic scores in the word processing condition would not be significantly greater than the increase in the mean of the holistic scores in the non-word processing condition. This hypothesis was tested by computing the differences between first and final drafts for each composition and then using a two-way ANOVA to check for significant differences in the degree of improvement under

the word processing and non-word processing conditions. As is shown in Table 7, at $F = 2.08$ the results were nonsignificant. Hypothesis Two was not rejected. Thus this study did not demonstrate that the use of word processing changed the increase in holistic scores between first and final drafts of student essays.

Table 7

Analysis of Variance Comparing Gains in Holistic Scores Of Essays Written With the Computer to Those Written Without the Computer and Essays Written with Editing Questions to Those Written with Writing Models

Source of Variation	<u>F</u>	Mean Square	<u>F</u>	<u>p</u>
Main Effects	2	18.12	1.03	0.36
Computer	1	36.24	2.08	0.15
Edit/Model	1	0.10	0.01	0.94
2-Way Interactions	1	1.66	0.10	0.76
Computer Edit	1	1.66	0.10	0.76
Explained	3	12.64	0.72	0.54

Hypothesis Three

Hypothesis Three stated that the mean of the final draft idea/example counts for both word processing and non-word processing conditions would not be significantly

greater than the mean of the first draft idea/example counts. The means were calculated and a t-test was applied to determine significance. As is shown in Table 8, the mean idea count for the first draft was 5.14, and the mean for the final draft was 7.08. Hypothesis Three was rejected ($p < .001$). Thus it appears that the idea/example counts were significantly higher for the final drafts than for the corresponding first drafts.

Table 8

Comparison of the Idea/Example Counts
of First Draft Essays to the Idea/Example Counts of
Final Draft Essays

Variable	<u>n</u>	Mean	Standard Deviation	Standard Error of the Mean
First Draft	124	5.14	2.80	0.25
Final Draft	124	7.08	3.39	0.31
<u>t</u> -ratio = 6.45; $p < .001$				

Hypothesis Four

Hypothesis Four stated that for each of the two treatments the increase in the mean of the idea/example counts for the word processing conditions would not be significantly greater than the increase in the mean of the

idea/example counts for the non-word processing condition. This hypothesis was tested by computing the differences between first and final draft idea/example counts for each composition and then using a two-way ANOVA to check for significant differences in the degree of improvement under the word processing and non-word processing conditions. As is shown in Table 9, at $F = .30$ the results were nonsignificant. Hypothesis Four was not rejected. Thus this study did not demonstrate that word processing changed the increase in idea/example counts between the first and final drafts.

Table 9

Analysis of Variance Comparing Gains in Idea/Example Counts of Essays Written With the Computer to Those Written Without the Computer and Essays Written with Editing Questions to Those Written with Writing Models

Source of Variation	<u>DF</u>	Mean Square	<u>F</u>	<u>p</u>
Main Effects	2	1.93	0.17	0.85
Computer	1	3.45	0.30	0.58
Edit/Model	1	0.30	0.03	0.87
2-Way Interactions	1	14.96	1.31	0.25
Computer Edit	1	14.96	1.31	0.25
Explained	3	6.27	0.55	0.65

Hypothesis Five

Hypothesis Five stated that for each of the two treatments both conditions would not show a significant decrease in the mean error count between the first and final drafts. The means were calculated and a t-test was applied to determine significance. As is shown in Table 10, the mean error count for the first draft was 10.19, and the mean for the final draft was 10.61. The difference between the two was not significant. Hypothesis Five was not rejected. Thus this study did not demonstrate that the number of errors decreased between the first and final drafts of the student essays.

Table 10

Comparison of the Error Counts
of First Draft Essays to the Error Counts of
Final Draft Essays

Variable	<u>n</u>	Mean	Standard Deviation	Standard Error of the Mean
First Draft	124	10.19	7.06	0.63
Final Draft	124	10.61	6.95	0.62
<u>t</u> -ratio = 0.68; <u>p</u> > .50				

Hypothesis Six

Hypothesis Six stated that for each of the two treatments the mean decrease in error count for the word processing condition would not be significantly greater than that for the non-word processing condition. This hypothesis was tested by computing the differences between first and final draft error counts for each composition and then using a two-way ANOVA to check for significant differences in the decreases under the word processing and non-word processing conditions. As is shown in Table 11,

Table 11

Analysis of Variance Comparing Error
Counts of Essays Written With the Computer to Those Written
Without the Computer and Essays Written with Editing
Questions to Those Written with Writing Models

Source of Variation	<u>DF</u>	Mean Square	<u>F</u>	<u>p</u>
Main Effects	2	85.86	1.78	0.17
Computer	1	144.71	2.99	0.09
Edit/Model	1	33.32	0.69	0.41
2-Way Interactions	1	18.46	0.38	0.54
Computer Edit	1	18.46	0.38	0.54
Explained	3	63.39	1.31	0.27

at $F = 2.99$ the results were nonsignificant. Hypothesis Six was not rejected. Thus this study did not demonstrate that using word processing changed the decrease in the first and final draft error counts.

Summary

Chapter Four presented the results of the study. Analysis of the data revealed that, although there were significant increases in holistic scores and idea/example counts between the first and final drafts, there was not a significant decrease in the error count. The use of word processing was not found to significantly affect the differences between first and final draft scores for any of the three measures used, nor were the results significantly affected by whether or not the students were given editing questions or writing models.

Chapter 5

SUMMARY, DISCUSSION AND CONCLUSIONS, RECOMMENDATIONS

Summary

The study is an investigation of the effects of the use of word processing and of editing questions and writing models on the revision of student essays. The purpose of this study was to investigate the results on student revisions of combining two common instructional methods with word processing.

A review of relevant research indicated that the effect of word processing on students' revisions of essays was still undetermined by research. Although there was a commonly expressed belief (Dauite, 1983; Newman, 1984) that word processing was potentially of great value to the student, research results were inconsistent. Five studies reported positive results: Working with small samples, Bean (1983) and Pearson and Wilkinson (1986) concluded that word processing increased the number of revisions made by student writers; Sommers (1985) found that the gain in holistic scores between rough and final drafts of

thirty-five college students who did use word processing were slightly higher than the gains of forty-four college students who did not use word processing; Kurth and Stromberge (1984) found that fifth, sixth, and seventh grade remedial students who used word processing wrote more rough drafts and made more sentence and paragraph changes than those students who did not use word processing; and Dalton (1986) found that after a year of instruction with word processing low ability seventh graders scored significantly higher on a standardized writing test than low ability seventh graders who had received conventional instruction. (Dalton did not find similar results for high ability students.)

Six researchers, however, did not obtain positive results. Collier (1983), working with only four students, found that students made more extensive revision when working by hand than they did working with word processors. Hawisher (1986) found that twenty college freshmen did not revise more extensively when working on computers. Hult (1985) and Cross and Curey (1984) found no statistically significant differences between essays that college freshmen produced on computers and those produced by hand. Using a case study approach, Harris (1985) did not find that six college freshman revised more

extensively on the computers than they did by hand.

Jones, Meis, and Bolchazy (Rodrigues and Rodrigues, 1986) found that secondary students who worked by hand included three times as much detail in extended memoirs as students who used Bank Street Writer.

The inconsistent results of existing research suggested that, although word processing would not automatically improve students' revisions, it could have a positive effect under certain conditions. Those conditions, however, are not clearly delineated by existing research. The present study attempted to contribute to an exploration of these conditions by investigating the interaction of two common instructional methods with the use or non-use of word processing. These instructional methods were selected after a review of nine secondary composition texts. In these texts the two most common methods for encouraging and guiding student revisions were the use of editing questions and the use of writing models. Therefore, these two methods were selected for the current study.

The materials used in this study were prepared by the researcher. The editing questions and writing models were modeled on those presented in the nine texts. The prewriting activities and writing prompts conformed to the

course of study for the class used as a sample.

The subjects for this study, members of a single twelfth-grade English class, each wrote four analytical essays. The thirty-three students were randomly divided into four subgroups, and, as they wrote their essays, were rotated through four different situations: (1) using a computer and editing questions, (2) using a computer and writing models, (3) writing without a computer and using editing questions, and (4) writing without a computer and using writing models.

A comparison of first and final drafts of all essays, regardless of condition, showed that students improved their essays by rewriting, significantly increasing their holistic scores. That this improvement reflected more than merely proofreading is suggested by the increase in idea counts and, surprisingly, the lack of a significant decrease in error counts. Students, also, seem to have changed their pattern of writing during the experiment: With the third essay, although holistic final draft scores did not change significantly, mean gain scores increased from 2.00 to 4.44 ($F = 3.03$, $\text{sig.} = 0.03$). This change suggests that for the last two assignments students redistributed the writing task, doing more of it during the time allocated for revision and thus spreading the

work more evenly over the four days whereas for the first two assignments the students had finished more of the task by the time they turned in their first drafts at the end of the first two days.

The findings provided an indication that the use of word processing had an effect on the writing process. The use of a word processor did seem to lead students to write more, producing higher idea/example counts for both first and final drafts: a first draft mean of 5.68 for the word processing group as opposed to 4.60 for the non-word processing group ($p = .029$) and a final draft mean of 7.730 for the word processing group as opposed to 6.313 for the non-word processing group ($p = .019$). This finding is contrary to that of Kurth and Stromberg (1984) who found no increase in essay length for fifth, sixth, and seventh grade students who used a word processor.

The computer users also had higher final draft error counts: the word processing group with a mean count of 12.21 as opposed to 9.52 for the non-word processing group ($p = .032$). The higher error count for the word processing group is consistent with the findings of Collier (1983) who found his students corrected fewer errors while using a word processor (p. 151), and it may result from the fact that in order to get a neat appearing

essay students working by hand usually recopy their completed essays and thus slowly reread their entire essays at least once. This final step is not forced upon those students who are using a word processor.

Though this study showed that word processing affected the idea/example count and error count, this study revealed no statistically significant effect of word processing on the students' revisions. For none of the three measures used to evaluate student papers was the change between first and final draft for papers written on computers significantly different from that for those written by hand. Although these results are consistent with several earlier studies (Collier, 1983; Hawisher, 1986; Hult, 1985; Cross and Curey, 1984), they are surprising on a number of counts. They are inconsistent with the findings of Sommers (1985) who reports that college students' scores on a twelve point holistic scale improved 1.26 points between rough and final draft for those working on a word processor but only .46 for those working by hand. They are also inconsistent with the speculations of writers such as Dauite (1983) and Newman (1984) who forcefully argue that word processing should lead to greater revisions. The results of this study did not meet such expectations; instead, these results indicate that

students using a word processor write more, but neither the extent of their revisions nor the quality of the final product is greater for those using a word processor and the number of errors may actually be more. These results were obtained even though the students all had been trained in the use of Open Access, the word processing program used in the study, and, according to their survey responses (see Table 1), students preferred using word processing. Furthermore, the two aids to revision which are most commonly offered by secondary composition texts--the use of models and the use of editing questions--had no statistically significant effect on student revisions nor did they interact significantly with the use of word processing.

Three factors may help explain the study's limited results. First, during the experiment the distinction between a first and final draft was often blurred. The researcher expected the student to produce a rapidly written draft of the entire essay and then to revise this completed draft. In practice, however, many of the students did not follow this pattern. According to the researcher's observations and student comments, the working unit for many students was the sentence or the paragraph rather than the entire composition; these

students wrote and rewrote the shorter units until satisfied but seldom returned to a completed portion of the essay. Thus the first drafts turned in by these students were actually partly completed final drafts; the difference between the two drafts was the addition of new paragraphs. Neither the editing questions nor the models seemed to induce the students to revise their completed essays. Regardless of earlier lessons on revision, many students treated both the model essays and editing questions as separate assignments which were irrelevant to the writing process. The word processor offers a highly convenient means for altering existing text, but much of this advantage is lost if, as was true of many of the students in the study, the writer does not work recursively but instead completes sentences and paragraphs as she or he proceeds. The process suggested by Dauite (1983) in which the computer helped students focus on "different steps in the writing process one by one" (p. 139) did not take place since most students treated writing as a one-step process.

A second, closely related problem was the difficulty the students had in producing a draft at all. Originally the researcher had expected students to produce a rough draft by the end of the first class period, but students

had so much difficulty producing a first draft that the researcher added a day to the cycle so that they would have two class periods instead of one to produce the first draft. Even with the additional day many students obviously had trouble producing a first draft.

One cause of the time problem was that those students who proceeded on a sentence by sentence or paragraph by paragraph basis were actually attempting to produce a completed essay during the time allotted to produce a first draft. In addition, the essay topics, although similar to ones typically assigned to second-semester seniors, were difficult for the students. They required analysis of complex works and, despite previous classwork, many of the students had trouble understanding the literature. In general, the students seemed to have tremendous difficulty generating ideas, and this struggle to find something to say pre-empted the rest of the writing process. Possibly because the writing subjects caused such difficulty, there was no indication that the students were engaging in the kind of experimentation with language in which the computer allows the writer "to take risks" and to be "tentative about meaning" which Newman (1984, p. 495) suggests the computer encourages.

The time limits and the requirement to work in the

classroom may have caused further difficulty. Aside from essay tests and short personal responses, writing assignments in this class are normally done as homework. The unusual conditions disrupted some students' writing rituals. This problem may, for instance, explain the small but significant negative correlation between gain scores and those students who indicated on the survey that they preferred writing more than one draft ($r = -.217$, $p = .017$). They may simply have not had enough time to follow their preferred writing pattern. An additional example was provided by one girl, who spent the first period staring at blank paper and insisted she could not write without listening to music; when she was allowed to bring a Walkman the next day, she quickly produced a rough draft with seeming ease. Also, students distracted each other: Writing requires prolonged, sometimes painful concentration; in a room full of active teenagers, there are too many attractive alternatives.

Third, there were a large number of factors outside the experiment which affected the students. The class was a large, socially involved group of seniors in their final quarter before graduation. They were frequently pulled out of class for school activities and a great deal was going on in their lives. Such distractions are not unusual for

a high school class, but they do illustrate the difficulty of isolating the effects of particular conditions on the student's writing.

Finally, the results reflect weaknesses of the teaching techniques used during the experiment. In an attempt to minimize the effects of a possible teacher bias, the teacher/researcher relied on printed materials, editing questions and model essays, to stimulate and guide student revisions. Although the student could ask the teacher questions, he or she was otherwise expected to work independently. So, even though the student was required to work in a full classroom, he or she received neither coaching from the teacher nor ideas and feedback from classmates as would have been the case with, for example, a group editing process in which students would have provided suggestions and an audience for each other. Thus the social situation did not help the student complete the writing tasks, but, on the contrary, was often a source of distraction. It is probable that the instructional techniques reduced the degree of improvement between the students' first and final drafts, and, therefore, reduced the opportunity for the study to show significant results.

Conclusion

Even with its limitations, this experiment suggests some general conclusions. Whatever effect word processing may have on the student's writing process can be overwhelmed by other factors. In this case the use of word processing may have increased productivity but did not increase quality. The students produced more ideas and examples when using the word processor but did not improve their holistic scores or decrease their errors to a greater degree. Even though word processing offers a means for rewriting with much less effort than by hand, it did not lead students to revise more extensively or more effectively. Nor, according to both statistical analysis and the researcher's observations, did the use of two common methods for inducing revision significantly affect student writing.

This study also highlighted the problem with treating the writing process as one in which the writer produces a series of complete drafts of his or her work. According to the researcher's observations, many students did not follow this multi-draft pattern. Even though the students involved in this study were specifically instructed to write a "first draft" and a "final draft" and time was allocated for the writing of each, many students did not

complete more than one draft; instead these students wrote on a sentence by sentence or paragraph by paragraph basis. They devoted considerable time to revising each sentence or paragraph but, once they moved on to the next sentence or paragraph, seldom returned to an earlier portion of the essay. Even prodded by editing questions and models, these students did not revise their completed essays although in the case of handwritten essays, most did recopy for the sake of neatness. Even if more than one copy of an essay was turned in to meet the requirements of the assignment, to consider the work of one of these students as a series of drafts is misleading; a more accurate model would be one in which the student's essay is considered a single draft which grows section by section with recursion largely limited to the sentence or the paragraph.

Implications

The school administrator or anyone else who must decide on the use of word processing as a classroom writing tool faces a complex problem. To resolve it he or she must balance cost, instructional efficacy, and student needs.

Cost

Even though the introduction of the microcomputer has greatly reduced the cost of computer use, still the cost of providing word processing equipment to public school students is not negligible. Shifting prices and the multiplicity of options make estimates difficult, but one indication was provided by Nash and Schwartz. In 1983 they spent \$60,000 creating a 15 station college computer laboratory; this \$4,000 per station cost--which included hardware (with a printer for each station), furniture, software, supplies, and security--would not be out of line for a comparable laboratory today (1985, p. 9). Although it could be argued that the price of equipment has continued to drop since 1983, the tendency has been for companies such as Apple to merchandise more powerful computers to the schools instead of dropping the price. This tendency is reinforced by the requirements of recently designed software. For example, Nash and Schwartz's students ran what were then two of the most advanced word processing programs, WordStar and Word Plus, on 128K DEC Rainbow 100s with two floppy disk drives; today the more sophisticated word processing programs, such as the latest version of Word Perfect, require 512K and need a hard disk for convenient use.

The \$4,000 per station spent by Nash and Schwartz

could obviously be reduced by reducing the quality or extent of the equipment, but a reasonable estimate of cost could hardly fall below \$2,000. A 1988 "Apple Educator Buy Program" offered systems from \$620 for an Apple IIc to \$2,410 for a Macintosh SE (both without printers), and a similar "IBM Educator buy" offered an IBM Model 30 system for \$2255 and a IBM Model 60 for \$4658 (both with printers). The significance of such costs is indicated by the fact that the per student income of the high school district in which this study was conducted was \$3202.13 in 1987-1988. Even if the cost of the equipment were spread over a five year period and a \$2,000 estimate were used, the yearly cost would be \$400 per student or 13% of the 1987-1988 income.

Instructional Efficacy

What value will the student receive for this significant expenditure? The current study and previous research both indicate that benefits will not be automatic. There is no doubt that the use of word processing affects student writing; in the current study one effect was the increased idea/example count when students used a word processor. There is also no doubt that the effect is not always positive; again in the current study the students made significantly more errors

when they used the word processor. Furthermore, the lack of effect of two very common instructional methods--the use of editing questions and the use of models--suggests that traditional methods may not best take advantage of the particular properties of word processing. New strategies need to be devised to take advantage of the obvious power of word processing. Word processing is a tool. The most effective use of that tool has not yet been discovered.

The development of such strategies is complicated by the rapid evolution of word processing. As the programs become more sophisticated, the possibilities for instruction expand and change. In fact, the actual process of composition may be changed by technological advances. For example, several of the latest generation of word processing programs now allow the writer to use windowing to work with two or more text files almost simultaneously, mixing material from one into another. A writer could use this feature to practice modes of composition that would have been prohibitively laborious before. The innovative writer could, for example, "prewrite" a series of files--one for quotes, one for an outline, one for keywords, etc--and then merge appropriate bits and pieces of each into a common draft. And the

example can be extended to an instructional method in which the writing task is shared with some files given to the student and others written by the student.

Student Needs

Even though the research on the efficacy of word processing in the instructional process is far from conclusive, the schools have little choice about whether or not to introduce word processing into the writing program. As writers such as Newman (1984, p. 494) have noted, word processing is rapidly becoming the preferred writing mode in the work place and on the college campus. As the student who does not master word processing becomes increasingly at a disadvantage in the modern world, the effective use of word processing itself becomes an instructional objective. Therefore, even if the writing strategies learned for word processing did not transfer to other modes of writing, the modern student would still need to learn those strategies.

Recommendations

Further research is needed to determine how to help students best use word processing to improve their writing. The rapid expansion of the use of microcomputers both in the work place and in the home strongly suggests that graduates of our schools will be writing with word

processors. Both past studies and the current one suggest that even students who are familiar with the mechanics of word processing will not automatically use it productively to revise their writing. Two related areas for research are suggested. First, before teachers can help students use word processing, the teachers must know what writing strategies best take advantage of word processing. One approach might be to follow the lead of those researchers who have examined the writing process. Over the past two decades a number of studies of successful writers have been conducted in order to discover what writing strategies are successful, and, similarly, studies such as Cynthia Selfe's (1985) interviews with "screen-and-keyboard writers," college students who successfully used word processing, suggest how strategies for using word processing might be discovered (p. 59-63). In addition, as Bridwell and Duin (1985) point out, "...computers make it possible to study writers at work in their new medium in ways that weren't feasible before" (p. 115). A word processing program can, for example, be written so that it monitors and records selected characteristics of the writing process. This area of study should prove to be increasingly fruitful as more and more expert writers hone their ability to use word processing, and the

monitoring programs become more and more sophisticated.

Second, classroom management methods for using microcomputers in the teaching of writing need to be developed. One problem is providing students with enough time at the computer. If students work in a computer laboratory, writing must be done at school during class or the laboratory must be open to the students at other times. In-class writing assignments are time consuming. In the current study, for example, four periods of class time were barely sufficient for the students to complete an essay assignment. Keeping a laboratory open outside of class hours, however, is expensive and may cause transportation problems for some students. Other alternatives would be to have students do only parts of their writing assignments on school computers or to send computers home with the students, but these alternatives also have obvious drawbacks. For instance, the student who does only part of the writing process on a computer may be getting only part of the potential benefit of word processing, and sending computers home may be prohibitively expensive. Studies are needed to determine the optimum use of time and money in applying computer technology to the classroom.

Another class management problem is that of how best

to group students. According to the researcher's observations of both high school students and adults, placing students in front of computer terminals tends to fragment the class making large group instruction difficult. One alternative is to individualize instruction by giving the student materials that lead him or her step by step through a process with little other instruction. The current study attempted to follow this individualized pattern. As was discussed above, however, a class places a student in a social situation, and if interaction among students is not included in the instructional pattern it will likely occur anyway and disrupt the pattern. A number of patterns suggest themselves. One possibility would be to physically isolate the students. Another would be to group students so that they can work collaboratively. A third might be to use a LAN (Local Area Network) so that the entire class could contribute electronically to the same product. Each of these patterns suggests a possible area of study.

Recommended Areas for Future Research

The current study suggests that in order to further our understanding of the uses of word processing in composition instruction, studies need to be designed to

fulfill the following purposes:

(1) To determine through observation, interview, electronic monitoring, or other means the writing strategies employed by those writers who successfully use word processing in the composing process. Hypotheses might include the following: (a) The successful user of word processing will employ different writing strategies when using word processing than when writing by hand. (b) Successful users of word processing will employ different strategies from unsuccessful users. (c) The writing strategies employed by successful users of word processing will change according to the writing task.

(2) To determine if instruction in the strategies employed by successful users of word processing will improve the writing of students. Hypotheses might include the following: (a) Students who have received instruction in strategies employed by successful users of word processing will alter their own use of word processing in the writing process. (b) The written compositions of students who have received instruction in strategies employed by successful users of word processing will receive significantly higher scores than the compositions of those who have not received such instruction.

(3) To determine if the amount of time during which the

student has access to a word processor significantly affects the student's writing process and the quality of the product. Hypotheses might include the following: (a) Students who have unlimited access to a word processor will develop different writing strategies from those students who have limited access. (b) The compositions of those students who have unlimited access to word processing will receive higher scores than the compositions of those students who have limited access to word processing.

(4) To determine the effects of various kinds and degrees of social interaction on the student's use of word processing during the writing process. Hypotheses might include the following: (a) Students who use word processing cooperatively in small groups will develop different writing strategies from those who use word processing in isolation. (b) Students who receive individual coaching from the teacher on the use of word processing during the writing process will use writing strategies different from the writing strategies of students who do not receive coaching. (c) Students who observe successful word processing writing strategies modeled by a teacher or a peer will be more likely to adopt those strategies than students who do not observe

such modeling. (d) Students who receive peer reactions to a draft of a composition written on a word processor will revise their compositions more extensively than students who do not receive such reactions.

References

- Ackley, Elizabeth, Collins-Kimbell, Sylvia, Ranta, Robert, Calabrese, Paula A., Pohlman, Sonya, Willis, Marjory Carter, Cavender, Sandra A., Purvis, Judi, and Witt, Gail. (1986). Macmillan English. New York: Scribner Educational Publishers, Macmillan Publishing Company, Collier Macmillan Canada.
- Bean, John C. (1983). Computerized Word-Processing as an Aid to Revision. College Composition and Communication, 34, 146-148.
- Bridwell, Lillian, and Duin, Ann. (1985). Looking in depth at writers: computers as writing medium and research tool. In James L. Collins and Elizabeth A. Sommers (Eds.), Writing On-Line Using Computers in the Teaching of Writing (pp. 115-121). Upper Montclair, New Jersey: Boynton/Cook Publishers, Inc.
- Brown, Ann Cole, Nilson, Jeffery, Shaw, Fran Weber, Weldon, Richard A. (1986). Grammar and Composition Fifth Course. Boston: Houghton Mifflin Company.
- Burns, Marjorie L. (Ed.). (1987). Scope English Writing and Language Skills Level Two. New York: Scholastic Inc.
- Cahill, Robert B., and Hrebic, Herbert J. (1980). Fan the Deck an Advanced Composition Book. Chicago, Illinois: Stack the Deck, Inc.
- Collier, Richard M. (1983). The Word Processor and Revision Strategies. College Composition and Communication, 34, 149-155.
- Collier, Richard M. (1984). Reply by Richard M. Collier. College Composition and Communication, 35, 94-95.
- Cross, John A., and Curey, Bob J. The Effect of Word Processing on Writing. A paper presented at the Mid-Year Meeting of the American Society for Information Science, Bloomington, Indiana, May, 1984, (ERIC Document Reproduction No. ED 247921).

- Crowell, Sheila C., and Kolba, Ellen D. (1986). Practicing the Writing Process 2 the Essay. New York: Educational Design, Inc.
- Daiute, Colette A. (1983). The Computer as Stylus and Audience. College Composition and Communication, 34 ,134-145.
- Dalton, David W. Word Processing and the Writing Process: Enhancement or Distraction. Paper presented at the Annual Convention of the Association for Educational Communications and Technology, Las Vegas, Nevada, January 16-21, 1986, (ERIC Document Reproduction No. ED 267763).
- English-Language Arts Curriculum Framework and Criteria Committee. (1986). English-Language Arts Framework for California Public Schools Kindergarten Through Grade Twelve. Sacramento: California State Department of Education.
- Farmer, Marjorie, Yesner, Seymour, Zemelman, Steven, and Boone, Beth. (1985). Composition and Grammar 12 Steps in the Writing Process. River Forest, Illinois: Laidlaw Brothers, Publishers.
- Forlini, Gary. (1985). Grammar and Composition Level 6. Englewood Cliffs, New Jersey: Prentice-Hall, Inc.
- Harris, Jeanette (1985). Student Writers and Word Processing: A Preliminary Evaluation. College Composition and Communication, 36 ,323-330.
- Hawisher, Gail. The Effects of Word Processing on the Revision Strategies of College Students. Paper presented at the Annual Meeting of the American Educational Research Association, San Francisco, California, April 16-20, 1986, (ERIC Document Reproduction No. ED 268546).
- Horner, Edith R. (Ed.). (1988). California Cities, Towns, and Counties Basic Data Profiles for all Municipalities and Counties. Palo Alto: Hornwood Press.
- Hughes, Donna M., Lowry, Louise K., Clark, Richard W. (1985). Glencoe English 12. Encino, California:

Glencoe Publishing Company.

Hult, Christine. A Study of the Effects of Word Processing on the Correctness of Student Writing. A paper presented at the Annual Meeting of the Conference on College Composition and Communication, Minneapolis, Michigan, March 21-23, 1985, (ERIC Document Reproduction No. ED 260425).

Kurth, Ruth, and Linda Stromberg. Using Word Processing in Composition Instruction. A paper presented at the Annual Meeting of the American Reading Forum, Sarasota, Florida, December 8-10, 1984, (ERIC Document Reproduction No. ED 251850).

Nash, James and Lawrence Schwartz (May 1985). Making Computers Work in the Writing Class. Educational Technology, 19-26.

Newman, Judith M. (1984). Language Learning and Computers. Language Arts, 61, 494-497.

Parker, John F. (1987). Writing: Process to Product. Menlo Park, California: Addison-Wesley Publishing Company.

Parson, Gail. (1986). Hand in Hand: The Writing Process And The Microcomputer Two Revolutions in the Teaching of Writing. Juneau-Douglas Borough School District: Alaska Department of Education.

Pearson, Howard and Andrew Wilkinson (1986). The Use of the Word Processor in Assisting Children's Writing Development. Educational Review, 38, 169-187.

Pufahl, John (1984). Response to Richard M. Collier, "The Word Processor and Revision Strategies". College Composition and Communication, 35, 91-93.

Purves, Alan C., and William C. Purves (1986). Viewpoints: Cultures, Text Models, and the Activity of Writing. Research in the Teaching of English, 20, 174-195.

Rodrigues, Dawn (October 1985). Computers and Basic Writers. College Composition and Communication, Vol. 36, No. 3, 336-339.

Rodrigues, Dawn, and Raymond J. Rodrigues. Teaching Writing with a Word Processor, Grades 7-13. Urbana, Illinois: ERIC Clearinghouse on Reading and Communication Skills and the National Council of Teachers of English, 1986.

Selfe, Cynthia L. (1985). The electronic pen: computers and the composing process. In James L. Collins and Elizabeth A. Sommers (Eds.), Writing On-Line Using Computers in the Teaching of Writing (pp. 55-66). Upper Montclair, New Jersey: Boynton/Cook Publishers, Inc.

Sommers, Elizabeth. The Effects of Word Processing and Writing Instruction on the Writing Processes and Products of College Writers. (ERIC Document Reproduction Service No. Ed 269762), 1985.

Wheeler, Fay (March, 1985). Can Word Processing Help the Writing Process. Learning, 54-62.

Wilkinson, Andrew M. (1986). Introduction: Myths About Composition. Educational Review, 38 ,99-101.

APPENDIX A
MATERIALS FOR ASSIGNMENT 1

HAMLET PREWRITING

Hamlet's insanity has puzzled critics for hundreds of years. Although, as he tells Rosencrantz and Guildenstern, he seems to know "a hawk from a handsaw" much of the time, several times in the play he acts strangely for little apparent reason. Is Hamlet's insanity feigned or real? You are going to be asked to write an essay on this question, and whichever side you take there are experts who would agree with you (and others who would disagree. Your answer, however, should be based on your own interpretation of Hamlet's behavior. Before arriving at that interpretation, you should consider the following related questions.

A. What benefit does Hamlet gain or expect to gain from feigning insanity?

When Hamlet returns from talking to the ghost, he warns his friends, "I perchance hereafter shall think meet to put an antic disposition on." In other words, he tells them that he may decide to pretend to be crazy. Why? What reason could he have for putting on such an act? Are the actual results of his crazy behavior to his benefit?

Answer:

B. Why does Hamlet treat Ophelia so cruelly?

Ophelia seems to be a particular target of Hamlet's insane behavior. She is the first character in the play to report Hamlet's strange behavior, and Hamlet insults her in two separate scenes: first, while Polonius and the King are hidden nearby and, second, before the play-within-the-play begins. Is there a rational explanation for Hamlet's treatment of Ophelia?

Answer:

C. Why is Hamlet so unconcerned about killing Polonius?

Polonius too is a target of Hamlet's insane behavior. Hamlet not only repeatedly teases the foolish old man, but, when Hamlet discovers that he has accidentally killed Polonius, he coldly comments,
Thou wretched, rash, intruding fool, farewell!

I took thee for thy better. Take thy fortune.
Thou find'st to be too busy is some danger.
Then after finishing the scene with his mother Hamlet plays
a game of hide and seek with Polonius's body.
How do you think Shakespeare wanted us to interpret
Hamlet's treatment of Polonius? Is justified it or is it
evidence of insanity?

Answer:

D. Does the ghost of Hamlet Senior actually appear in
Gertrude's chamber?

In Act I, although Hamlet is the only character to
talk to the ghost, four other characters see the ghost, but
in Act III only Hamlet sees the ghost. His mother says,
"Alas, he's mad!" She then asks her son why he is talking
to the air and, when he tries to point out the ghost to
her, she answers, "This is the very coinage of your brain."
Why is Gertrude unable to see the ghost? If you were
staging this scene, would you have the ghost appear to the
audience? Or do you agree with Gertrude that the ghost
appears only in Hamlet's brain?

Answer:

E. Why does Hamlet act so strangely at Ophelia's funeral?

Hamlet leaps into Ophelia's grave beside Laertes. He
then challenges Laertes to a contest to show who feels the
most grief for Ophelia, proposing a series of ridiculous
feats including eating a crocodile. Both the King and the
Queen try to excuse Hamlet's behavior to Laertes by saying
Hamlet is mad.

Are the King and Queen correct or is there some reason
for Hamlet's behavior?

Answer:

Assignment 1: Hamlet Essay
Group 1

Topic

In a well-organized essay answer the following question: Is Hamlet's insanity feigned or real?

Purpose

Your purpose is to convince the reader that your answer to the question is both plausible and significant. To be plausible it should be supported with logic and specific evidence. To be significant it should extend the reader's understanding of Hamlet.

Audience

You should assume that your audience is composed of intelligent readers who are generally familiar with Hamlet but who may not recall specific passages without your help.

Requirements

1. Your essay must be entirely composed during the three class periods provided.
2. At the end of the first period you must have completed the first draft of your essay and have saved it on your disk.
3. At the end of the third period you must have completed the final draft of your essay and have saved it on your disk.
4. During each period you will be given parts of a model essay. These are intended to provide guidance for your own essay. Please read the parts of the model and respond to the questions on each. Your answers will be collected at the end of each period.
5. No set length is required for your essay but it must have an introduction, body, and conclusion. The introduction should include a thesis statement.
6. Please proofread your essay carefully.
7. All writing for the assignment should be done either on

the computer or on the paper provided. Both your disk and your paper will be collected at the end of each period.

Assignment 1: Hamlet Essay
Group 2

Topic

In a well-organized essay answer the following question: Is Hamlet's insanity feigned or real?

Purpose

Your purpose is to convince the reader that your answer to the question is both plausible and significant. To be plausible it should be supported with logic and specific evidence. To be significant it should extend the reader's understanding of Hamlet.

Audience

You should assume that your audience is composed of intelligent readers who are generally familiar with Hamlet but who may not recall specific passages without your help.

Requirements

1. Your essay must be entirely composed during the three class periods provided.
2. At the end of the first period you must have completed the first draft of your essay.
3. At the end of the third period you must have completed the final draft of your essay.
4. During each period you will be given parts of a model essay. These are intended to provide guidance for your own essay. Please read the parts of the model and respond to the questions on each. Your answers will be collected at the end of each period.
5. No set length is required for your essay but it must have an introduction, body, and conclusion. The introduction should include a thesis statement.
6. Please proofread your essay carefully.
7. All writing for the assignment should be done on the paper provided. Your paper will be collected at the end of each period.

Assignment 1: Hamlet Essay

Group 3

Topic

In a well-organized essay answer the following question: Is Hamlet's insanity feigned or real?

Purpose

Your purpose is to convince the reader that your answer to the question is both plausible and significant. To be plausible it should be supported with logic and specific evidence. To be significant it should extend the reader's understanding of Hamlet.

Audience

You should assume that your audience is composed of intelligent readers who are generally familiar with Hamlet but who may not recall specific passages without your help.

Requirements

1. Your essay must be entirely composed during the three class periods provided.
2. At the end of the first period you must have completed the first draft of your essay and have saved it on your disk.
3. At the end of the third period you must have completed the final draft of your essay and have saved it on your disk.
4. At the beginning of the second period will be given a list of editing questions. Please answer those questions about your first draft. Turn in your answers to these questions before continuing work on your essay. A few minutes before the end of the third period or when you complete your final draft, you will be given a second set of questions. Please answer these about your final draft. These questions are intended to call your attention to possible improvements or corrections which you could make in your essay, so of course you are allowed to make changes in your final draft after you have completed the editing questions.
5. No set length is required for your essay but it must

have an introduction, body, and conclusion. The introduction should include a thesis statement.

6. Please proofread your essay carefully.

7. All writing for the assignment should be done on the computer or on the paper provided. Your paper and disk will be collected at the end of each period.

Assignment 1: Hamlet Essay
Group 4

Topic

In a well-organized essay answer the following question: Is Hamlet's insanity feigned or real?

Purpose

Your purpose is to convince the reader that your answer to the question is both plausible and significant. To be plausible it should be supported with logic and specific evidence. To be significant it should extend the reader's understanding of Hamlet.

Audience

You should assume that your audience is composed of intelligent readers who are generally familiar with Hamlet but who may not recall specific passages without your help.

Requirements

1. Your essay must be entirely composed during the three class periods provided.
2. At the end of the first period you must have completed the first draft of your essay.
3. At the end of the third period you must have completed the final draft of your essay.
4. At the beginning of the second period will be given a list of editing questions. Please answer those questions about your first draft. Turn in your answers to these questions before continuing work on your essay. A few minutes before the end of the third period or when you complete your final draft, you will be given a second set of questions. Please answer these about your final draft. These questions are intended to call your attention to possible improvements or corrections which you could make in your essay, so of course you are allowed to make changes in your final draft after you have completed the editing questions.
5. No set length is required for your essay but it must have an introduction, body, and conclusion. The

introduction should include a thesis statement.

6. Please proofread your essay carefully.

7. All writing for the assignment should be done on the on the paper provided. Your paper will be collected at the end of each period.

Editing Questions

Use the following questions as a guide in revising your essay.

CONTENT

- _____ Does the introduction identify the question or problem which the essay will address?
- _____ Does the introductory paragraph end in a clear thesis statement?
- _____ Does the thesis present a single idea?
- _____ Does the thesis have an argumentative edge?
- _____ Do all the paragraphs in the body of the essay support and develop the thesis statement?
- _____ Does the final paragraph restate the controlling idea and bring the essay to a clear conclusion.

SUPPORT

- _____ Are there sufficient examples to develop the thesis clearly and convincingly?
- _____ Are all the supporting ideas directly related to the thesis?
- _____ Are supporting ideas backed up with specific facts or quotations (either direct or indirect)?
- _____ Is there any unnecessary plot summary?
- _____ Are quotations introduced and explained?

ORGANIZATION

- _____ Is the essay clearly developed in three parts: introduction, body, and conclusion?
- _____ Are transitional words and phrases used where appropriate?

SENTENCES

- _____ Are sentences as economical as possible?

_____ Have related sentences been combined to clarify the logic of your essay?

_____ Have excessively long sentences been divided to make the essay clear?

Model 1

Sample Introduction

Even-handed Justice

Macbeth is certainly one of William Shakespeare's most villainous heroes. He stabs a saintly king and orders the deaths of the noble Banquo and of Macduff's innocent family; yet, although his guilt is great, his punishment is even greater. His life proves the truth of his own statement that "in these cases we still have judgment here." His crimes deprive his life of those elements that would have otherwise given it value.

Questions

1. What is the subject of the sample essay?
2. What question will the essay attempt to answer?
3. What sentence in the introduction provides a one-sentence answer to that question? (Copy the sentence.)

Model 2

Sample Developmental Paragraph

(The following is a sample of a paragraph that would appear in the body of an essay.)

Far from bringing satisfaction, Macbeth's crimes destroy his peace of mind. His guilt robs him of sleep, shaking him with "terrible dreams" from the time that, as he leaves Duncan's chamber, he hears a voice telling him that he will sleep no more. He is further tormented by insecurity as he agonizes over the witches' prophecy about Banquo's line. Before the murder of Banquo he cries his pain to his wife, "O, full of scorpions is my mind." Later, after hearing that Fleance escaped, he exclaims that he is still "bound in to saucy doubts and fears." These fears will plague him until the end.

Questions

1. What is the topic sentence of this paragraph? (Please copy it.)
2. List three supporting examples given in this paragraph.
3. How many direct quotes are used in this paragraph?

Model 3

Sample Essay

Even-handed Justice

Macbeth is certainly one of William Shakespeare's most villainous heroes. He stabs a saintly king and orders the deaths of the noble Banquo and of Macduff's innocent family; yet, although his guilt is great, his punishment is even greater. His life proves the truth of his own statement that "in these cases we still have judgment here." His crimes deprive his life of those elements that would have otherwise given it value.

Far from bringing satisfaction, Macbeth's crimes destroy his peace of mind. His guilt robs him of sleep, shaking him with "terrible dreams" from the time that, as he leaves Duncan's chamber, he hears a voice telling him that he will sleep no more. He is further tormented by insecurity as he agonizes over the witches' prophecy about Banquo's line. Before the murder of Banquo he cries his pain to his wife, "O, full of scorpions is my mind." Later, after hearing that Fleance escaped, he exclaims that he is still "bound in to saucy doubts and fears." These fears will plague him until the end.

In addition, his crimes destroy the respect he normally could have expected. During the course of the play we watch as he is reduced from a hero to a despised individual who can accurately compare himself to a baited bear, alone and attacked

by all. By Act V he realizes what he has lost:

And that which should accompany old age,
As honor, love, obedience, troops of friends,
I must not look to have; but in their stead,
Curses, not loud but deep, mouth honor, breath,
Which the poor heart would fain deny, and dare not.

Minutes later even Lady Macbeth will desert him by committing suicide. In the end Malcolm contemptuously provides his epitaph by dismissing him as "this dead butcher."

Perhaps the most appalling consequence of Macbeth's crimes is his own destruction. Macbeth is potentially a great man. In the first act we hear from the Sergeant of Macbeth's greatness as a warrior and in his soliloquies we witness his intelligence and sensitivity. His crimes destroy all three qualities. The fearless warrior is so unnerved by killing Duncan that he is afraid to return to the chamber with the bloody daggers, and his wife must do it for him. After learning that Macduff has escaped to England, Macbeth chooses to circumvent his own intelligence and act only on impulse:

The very firstlings of my heart shall be
The firstlings of my hand.

And he carries out this policy with the senseless killing of Macduff's family. By Act V even his emotional responses are destroyed, and he is unable to mourn his wife's death.

Macbeth's punishment fits or possibly even exceeds his crimes. Unable to profit from his crimes, he instead loses his peace of mind, respect, and dignity. By the end he has been

reduced to the point that all existence is "a tale told by an idiot."

Questions

1. What two words provide a transition between the second and third paragraphs?
2. Which paragraph contains the longest direct quote?
3. According to this essay, what are the three main things that Macbeth loses because of his crime?

APPENDIX B
MATERIALS FOR ASSIGNMENT 2

Prewriting Activities for Interpretation of Hamlet

Act III, Scene 4

You are going to be asked to write an interpretation of Hamlet, Act III, Scene 4. Please answer the following questions to gather material and ideas for that interpretation.

1. Try to summarize the entire scene in two sentences.
2. Where is the scene's climax?
3. Did the scene raise any questions in your mind? If so, what were they?
4. Do you think Hamlet is fair to his mother? Explain.
5. How did the scene affect your feelings about each of the following characters? (Try to answer with a brief phrase such as "Made me feel sorry for him." If the scene did not affect your feelings about the character, write "No change.")

Claudius:

Polonius:

Gertrude:

Hamlet:

6. How does the killing of Polonius contribute to each of the

following?

Plot development:

Characterization of Hamlet:

Theme(s):

7. Paraphrase each of the following:

a. "Take thy fortune./Thou find'st to be too busy is some danger."

(32-33)

b. "You cannot call it love, for at your age / The heyday in
the blood is tame, it's humble,/ And waits upon the judgment."

(69-70)

c. "Mother, for love of grace,/ Lay not that flattering
unction to your soul,/ That not your trespass but my madness
speaks." (144-145)

d. "Assume a virtue if you have it not." (160)

e. "They must sweep my way/ And marshal me to knavery."

(204)

f. "I'll lug the guts into the neighbor room." (212)

Assignment 2: Interpretation of a Scene
Group 1 (Non-word Processor, Editing)

Topic

In a well-organized essay interpret Act III, Scene 4 of Hamlet. Explain the scene's importance by examining how it contributes to the play as a whole. Try to analyze not only how the scene contributes to the plot but also how it contributes to the audience's understanding of the play's theme(s) and major characters.

Purpose

Your purpose is to convince the reader that your interpretation is both plausible and significant. To be plausible it should be supported with logic and specific evidence. To be significant it should extend the reader's understanding of Hamlet.

Audience

You should assume that your audience is composed of intelligent readers who are generally familiar with Hamlet but who may not recall specific passages without your help.

Requirements

1. Your essay must be entirely composed during the four class periods provided.
2. At the end of the first two periods, you must have completed the first draft of your essay.
3. At the end of the fourth period, you must have completed the final draft of your essay.
4. At the beginning of the third period, you will be given a list of editing questions. Please answer these questions ("yes" or "no") about your first draft. Turn in your answers to these questions before continuing work on your essay. A few minutes before the end of the third period or when you have finished your final draft, you will be given a second set of questions. Please answer these about your final draft. These questions are intended to call your attention to possible improvements or corrections which you could make in your essay, so of course you are allowed to make changes in your final draft after you have completed the editing questions.

5. No set length is required for your essay but it must have an introduction, body, and conclusion. The introduction should include a thesis statement.

6. Please proofread your essay carefully.

7. All writing for the assignment should be done on the paper provided. Your paper will be collected at the end of each period.

Assignment 2: Interpretation of a Scene

Group 2 (Word Processing, Editing)

Topic

In a well-organized essay interpret Act III, Scene 4 of Hamlet. Explain the scene's importance by examining how it contributes to the play as a whole. Try to analyze not only how the scene contributes to the plot but also how it contributes to the audience's understanding of the play's theme(s) and major characters.

Purpose

Your purpose is to convince the reader that your interpretation is both plausible and significant. To be plausible it should be supported with logic and specific evidence. To be significant it should extend the reader's understanding of Hamlet.

Audience

You should assume that your audience is composed of intelligent readers who are generally familiar with Hamlet but who may not recall specific passages without your help.

Requirements

1. Your essay must be entirely composed during the four class periods provided.
2. At the end of the first two periods, you must have completed the first draft of your essay and have saved it on your disk.
3. At the end of the fourth period, you must have completed the final draft of your essay and have saved it on your disk.
4. At the beginning of the third period, you will be given a list of editing questions. Please answer these questions ("yes" or "no") about your first draft. Turn in your answers to these questions before continuing work on your essay. A few minutes before the end of the third period or when you have finished your final draft, you will be given a second set of questions. Please answer these about your final draft. These questions are intended to call your attention to possible improvements or corrections which you could make in your essay, so of course you are allowed to make changes in your final draft after you have completed the editing questions.
5. No set length is required for your essay but it must have an

introduction, body, and conclusion. The introduction should include a thesis statement.

6. Please proofread your essay carefully.

7. All writing for the assignment should be done either on the computer or on the paper provided. Both your paper and disk will be collected at the end of each period.

Assignment 2: Interpretation of a Scene
Group 3 (Non-word processing, Model)

Topic

In a well-organized essay interpret Act III, Scene 4 of Hamlet. Explain the scene's importance by examining how it contributes to the play as a whole. Try to analyze not only how the scene contributes to the plot but also how it contributes to the audience's understanding of the play's theme(s) and major characters.

Purpose

Your purpose is to convince the reader that your interpretation is both plausible and significant. To be plausible it should be supported with logic and specific evidence. To be significant it should extend the reader's understanding of Hamlet.

Audience

You should assume that your audience is composed of intelligent readers who are generally familiar with Hamlet but who may not recall specific passages without your help.

Requirements

1. Your essay must be entirely composed during the four class periods provided.
2. At the end of the first two periods, you must have completed the first draft of your essay.
3. At the end of the fourth period, you must have completed the final draft of your essay.
4. During the first, third, and fourth periods, you will be given parts of a model essay. These are intended to provide guidance for your own essay. Please read the parts of the model and respond to the questions on each. Your answers will be collected at the end of each period.
5. No set length is required for your essay but it must have an introduction, body, and conclusion. The introduction should include a thesis statement.
6. Please proofread your essay carefully.
7. All writing for the assignment should be done on the paper provided. Your paper will be collected at the end of each period.

Assignment 2: Interpretation of a Scene
Group 4 (Word processor, Model)

Topic

In a well-organized essay interpret Act III, Scene 4 of Hamlet. Explain the scene's importance by examining how it contributes to the play as a whole. Try to analyze not only how the scene contributes to the plot but also how it contributes to the audience's understanding of the play's theme(s) and major characters.

Purpose

Your purpose is to convince the reader that your interpretation is both plausible and significant. To be plausible it should be supported with logic and specific evidence. To be significant it should extend the reader's understanding of Hamlet.

Audience

You should assume that your audience is composed of intelligent readers who are generally familiar with Hamlet but who may not recall specific passages without your help.

Requirements

1. Your essay must be entirely composed during the four class periods provided.
2. At the end of the first two periods, you must have completed the first draft of your essay and have saved it on your disk.
3. At the end of the fourth period, you must have completed the final draft of your essay and have saved it on your disk.
4. During the first, third, and fourth period, you will be given parts of a model essay. These are intended to provide guidance for your own essay. Please read the part of the model and respond to the questions on each. Your answers will be collected at the end of each period.
5. No set length is required for your essay but it must have an introduction, body, and conclusion. The introduction should include a thesis statement.
6. Please proofread your essay carefully.
7. All writing for the assignment should be done either on the computer or on the paper provided. Both your disk and your paper will be collected at the end of each period.

Editing Questions (Assignment 2)

Use the following questions as a guide in revising your essay.

CONTENT

- _____ Does the introduction identify both the play and scene which the essay will interpret?
- _____ Does the introductory paragraph end in a clear thesis statement?
- _____ Does the thesis tell why the scene is significant?
- _____ Does the thesis have an argumentative edge?
- _____ Do all the paragraphs in the body of the essay support and develop the thesis statement?
- _____ Does the final paragraph restate the controlling idea and bring the essay to a clear conclusion.

SUPPORT

- _____ Are there sufficient examples to develop the thesis clearly and convincingly?
- _____ Are all the supporting ideas directly related to the thesis?
- _____ Are supporting ideas backed up with specific facts or quotations (either direct or indirect)?
- _____ Is there any unnecessary plot summary?
- _____ Are quotations introduced and explained?

ORGANIZATION

- _____ Is the essay clearly developed in three parts: introduction, body, and conclusion?
- _____ Are transitional words and phrases used where appropriate?

SENTENCES

_____ Are sentences as economical as possible?

_____ Have related sentences been combined to clarify the logic of your essay?

_____ Have excessively long sentences been divided to make the essay clear?

Model 1 (Assignment 2)

Sample Introduction

Macbeth, Act II, Scene 2

Shakespeare's Macbeth chronicles the downfall of a Scottish thane, Macbeth, whose desire to be king, fed by his wife's passionate encouragement, leads him to murder Duncan, the king. The play examines the consequences of ambition that overshadows reason. Act II, Scene 2 illuminates the characters of Macbeth and Lady Macbeth and ironically foreshadows her descent into guilt and madness.

Questions

1. This introduction both names the play and identifies the scene. What is the play? _____ What is the scene? _____

2. According to this introduction, the scene is important for two main reasons. What are they? _____

Model 2 (Assignment 2)

Sample Developmental Paragraph

(The following is a sample of a paragraph that would appear in the body of an essay.)

When Macbeth enters the dark courtyard where Lady Macbeth waits, he is already awash in remorse and guilt, although his concern is not for the murdered Duncan but for himself. "I had most need of blessing, and 'amen' / Stuck in my throat," he laments. "Methought I heard a voice cry 'Sleep no more!'" Lady Macbeth tells him briskly not to think of such things--ironically, as it turns out, because it is her sleep Macbeth has "murdered," and she will later relive this scene as she sleepwalks. Here, however, she is remorseless and resolute. "A little water clears us of this deed," she says. "How easy is it then!" She will learn that the horror of regicide cannot be so easily washed away.

Questions

1. This paragraph does not have a topic sentence. Write a possible topic sentence for it.

2. This paragraph contains a direct quote that is only one word long. What is it? _____
3. Does this paragraph focus primarily on plot or on

characterization? _____

Model 3 (Assignment 2)

Sample Essay

Macbeth, Act II, Scene 2

Shakespeare's Macbeth chronicles the downfall of a Scottish thane, Macbeth, whose desire to be king, fed by his wife's passionate encouragement, leads him to murder Duncan, the king. The play examines the consequences of ambition that overshadows reason. Act II, Scene 2 illuminates the characters of Macbeth and Lady Macbeth and ironically foreshadows her descent into guilt and madness.

In this scene Macbeth nervously rejoins his wife after he has murdered Duncan. Lady Macbeth tells him to put his guilty imaginings away and to get on with business: Get water, wash his hands, take back the daggers, smear the grooms with Duncan's blood. When he refuses to return to the murder scene, she coolly goes herself, returning to chide him, "My hands are of your color, but I shame/ To wear a heart so white." A knocking at the castle gate interrupts them, and Lady Macbeth urges Macbeth to put on his nightclothes so that no one will know they have been awake.

When Macbeth enters the dark courtyard where Lady Macbeth waits, he is already awash in remorse and guilt, although his concern is not for the murdered Duncan but for himself. "I had most need of blessing, and 'amen'/ Stuck in my throat," he

laments. "Methought I heard a voice cry 'Sleep no more!'" Lady Macbeth tells him briskly not to think of such things--ironically, as it turns out, because it is her sleep Macbeth has "murdered," and she will later relive this scene as she sleepwalks. Here, however, she is remorseless and resolute. "A little water clears us of this deed," she says. "How easy is it then!" She will learn that the horror of regicide cannot be so easily washed away.

In this scene the pair demonstrate the qualities that will ultimately bring about their end. Macbeth has allowed himself to be persuaded to an action of which he is uncertain. He is weak, and at the same time he is cruel: He says nothing about Duncan, his victim--only himself. Lady Macbeth makes light of Macbeth's distress, with self-interested ambition as her guide. Later in the play ambition will come to haunt her.

Questions

1. Which paragraph most clearly explains the author's ideas?

2. What is the purpose of the second paragraph?

3. In the second paragraph we are told Macbeth acts "nervously." What adverb is used to contrast Lady Macbeth's behavior to that of her husband?

APPENDIX C
MATERIALS FOR ASSIGNMENT 3

Gulliver's Travels Prewriting Questions

You will be asked to write an essay in which you examine the most important lesson that Swift teaches in Gulliver's Travels. Swift teaches through satire, through poking fun at what he does not like. He believed that, if he could get people to laugh at foolish behavior, then they would avoid the behavior to avoid looking foolish. So to understand the lessons which he is teaching you must examine how and why he makes his characters appear ridiculous. In order to gather material for your essay, please answer the following questions:

1. In Lilliput how are candidates selected for high office in the government? How could this same idea be applied to a modern political campaign?

2. Gulliver seems quite impressed with the Lilliputian army. He praises a calvaryman for making the "prodigious leap" over Gulliver's shoe. He describes the mock battles the army conducted on his handkerchief in glowing terms, and tells us how impressive the Lilliputian army was when it marched between his legs. What reaction does Swift expect the reader to have to these scenes?

3. Gulliver's description of the process by which he is given his freedom contains several absurdities. He is required to swear

...in the method prescribed by their laws; which was to hold my right foot in my left hand, and to place the middle finger of my right hand on the crown of my head, and my thumb on the tip of my right ear.

He translates the official title of the tiny king of the Lilliputians as,

...most mighty Emperor of Lilliput, delight and terror of the universe, whose dominions extend five thousand blustrugs (about twelve miles in circumference) to the extremities of the globe; monarch of all monarchs, taller than sons of men; whose feet press down to the center, and whose head strikes against the sun...

And he avoids telling us the words of praise given to him by the king "to avoid the censure of vanity."

What effect do these incidents have on the reader? Why? What human characteristic is being satirized?

4. When the king of Brobdingnag questions Gulliver about English society, a number of weaknesses are exposed including the following: the king asks if a "stranger with a strong purse" might not win an election over a more qualified man and he questions Gulliver's arithmetic because the English government seems to be spending twice as much money as its tax revenues. (page 329) What would the modern equivalent of each of these weaknesses be?

5. How does the king of Brobdingnag react when Gulliver offers to tell him the secret of gunpowder? How does Gulliver interpret the king's reaction? How does Swift expect the reader to react?

6. With what other ideas of the Brobdingnagian king does Gulliver disagree? How did Swift expect the reader to react?

7. What do you think is the major target of Swift's satire in Gulliver's Travels? List examples to support your answer.

Assignment 3: Gulliver's Travels
Group 1 (Non-word processing, Model)

Topic

Eighteenth Century neoclassical writers saw literature as primarily a means of teaching. Satire in particular was intended to change behavior by showing the reader the absurdity of immoral or irrational actions. In Gulliver's Travels, one of the greatest Eighteenth Century satires, Jonathan Swift sets out to teach mankind a lesson or, perhaps, several lessons.

In a well-organized essay answer the following question: What is the most important lesson taught in Gulliver's Travels? Please base your analysis on and draw your examples from the selection from Gulliver's Travels in your text (pages 313-318, 327-332).

Purpose

Your purpose is to convince the reader that your answer is both plausible and significant. To be plausible it should be supported with logic and specific evidence. To be significant it should extend the reader's understanding of Gulliver's Travels.

Audience

You should assume that your audience is composed of intelligent readers who are generally familiar with Gulliver's Travels but who may not recall specific passages without your help.

Requirements

1. Your essay must be entirely composed during the four class periods provided.
2. At the end of the first two periods, you must have completed the first draft of your essay.
3. At the end of the fourth period, you must have completed the final draft of your essay.
4. During the first, third, and fourth periods, you will be given parts of a model essay. These are intended to provide guidance for your own essay. Please read the parts of the model and respond to the questions on each. Your answers will be collected at the end of each period.
5. No set length is required for your essay but it must have an

introduction, body, and conclusion. The introduction should include a thesis statement.

6. Please proofread your essay carefully.

7. All writing for the assignment should be done on the paper provided. Your paper will be collected at the end of each period.

Assignment 3: Gulliver's Travels
Group 2 (Word processor, Model)

Topic

Eighteenth Century neoclassical writers saw literature as primarily a means of teaching. Satire in particular was intended to change behavior by showing the reader the absurdity of immoral or irrational actions. In Gulliver's Travels, one of the greatest Eighteenth Century satires, Jonathan Swift sets out to teach mankind a lesson or, perhaps, several lessons.

In a well-organized essay answer the following question: What is the most important lesson taught in Gulliver's Travels? Please base your analysis on and draw your examples from the selection from Gulliver's Travels in your text (pages 313-318, 327-332).

Purpose

Your purpose is to convince the reader that your answer is both plausible and significant. To be plausible it should be supported with logic and specific evidence. To be significant it should extend the reader's understanding of Gulliver's Travels.

Audience

You should assume that your audience is composed of intelligent readers who are generally familiar with Gulliver's Travels but who may not recall specific passages without your help.

Requirements

1. Your essay must be entirely composed during the four class periods provided.
2. At the end of the first two periods, you must have completed the first draft of your essay and have saved it on your disk.
3. At the end of the fourth period, you must have completed the final draft of your essay and have saved it on your disk.
4. During the first, third, and fourth period, you will be given parts of a model essay. These are intended to provide guidance for your own essay. Please read the part of the model and respond to the questions on each. Your answers will be collected at the end of each period.
5. No set length is required for your essay but it must have an introduction, body, and conclusion. The introduction should

include a thesis statement.

6. Please proofread your essay carefully.

7. All writing for the assignment should be done either on the computer or on the paper provided. Both your disk and your paper will be collected at the end of each period.

Assignment 3: Gulliver's Travels
Group 3 (Non-word Processor, Editing)

Topic

Eighteenth Century neoclassical writers saw literature as primarily a means of teaching. Satire in particular was intended to change behavior by showing the reader the absurdity of immoral or irrational actions. In Gulliver's Travels, one of the greatest Eighteenth Century satires, Jonathan Swift sets out to teach mankind a lesson or, perhaps, several lessons.

In a well-organized essay answer the following question: What is the most important lesson taught in Gulliver's Travels? Please base your analysis on and draw your examples from the selection from Gulliver's Travels in your text (pages 313-318, 327-332).

Purpose

Your purpose is to convince the reader that your answer is both plausible and significant. To be plausible it should be supported with logic and specific evidence. To be significant it should extend the reader's understanding of Gulliver's Travels.

Audience

You should assume that your audience is composed of intelligent readers who are generally familiar with Gulliver's Travels but who may not recall specific passages without your help.

Requirements

1. Your essay must be entirely composed during the four class periods provided.
2. At the end of the first two periods, you must have completed the first draft of your essay.
3. At the end of the fourth period, you must have completed the final draft of your essay.
4. At the beginning of the third period, you will be given a list of editing questions. Please answer these questions ("yes" or "no") about your first draft. Turn in your answers to these questions before continuing work on your essay. A few minutes before the end of the third period or when you have finished your final draft, you will be given a second set of questions. Please answer these about your final draft. These questions are intended to call your attention to possible improvements or corrections which you could make in your essay, so of course you are allowed to make changes in your final draft after you have completed the editing questions.

5. No set length is required for your essay but it must have an introduction, body, and conclusion. The introduction should include a thesis statement.
6. Please proofread your essay carefully.
7. All writing for the assignment should be done on the paper provided. Your paper will be collected at the end of each period.

Assignment 3: Gulliver's Travels
Group 4 (Word Processing, Editing)

Topic

Eighteenth Century neoclassical writers saw literature as primarily a means of teaching. Satire in particular was intended to change behavior by showing the reader the absurdity of immoral or irrational actions. In Gulliver's Travels, one of the greatest Eighteenth Century satires, Jonathan Swift sets out to teach mankind a lesson or, perhaps, several lessons.

In a well-organized essay answer the following question: What is the most important lesson taught in Gulliver's Travels? Please base your analysis on and draw your examples from the selection from Gulliver's Travels in your text (pages 313-318, 327-332).

Purpose

Your purpose is to convince the reader that your answer is both plausible and significant. To be plausible it should be supported with logic and specific evidence. To be significant it should extend the reader's understanding of Gulliver's Travels.

Audience

You should assume that your audience is composed of intelligent readers who are generally familiar with Gulliver's Travels but who may not recall specific passages without your help.

Requirements

1. Your essay must be entirely composed during the four class periods provided.
2. At the end of the first two periods, you must have completed the first draft of your essay and have saved it on your disk.
3. At the end of the fourth period, you must have completed the final draft of your essay and have saved it on your disk.
4. At the beginning of the third period, you will be given a list of editing questions. Please answer these questions ("yes" or "no") about your first draft. Turn in your answers to these questions before continuing work on your essay. A few minutes before the end of the third period or when you have finished your final draft, you will be given a second set of questions. Please answer these about your final draft. These questions are intended to call your attention to possible improvements or corrections which you could make in your essay, so of course you are allowed to make changes in your final draft after you have completed the editing questions.

5. No set length is required for your essay but it must have an introduction, body, and conclusion. The introduction should include a thesis statement.
6. Please proofread your essay carefully.
7. All writing for the assignment should be done either on the computer or on the paper provided. Both your paper and disk will be collected at the end of each period.

Editing Questions (Assignment 3)

Use the following questions as a guide in revising your essay.

CONTENT

- _____ Does the introduction identify both the work which you are analyzing and the question which you are answering?
- _____ Does the introductory paragraph end in a clear thesis statement?
- _____ Does the thesis answer the question?
- _____ Does the thesis have an argumentative edge?
- _____ Do all the paragraphs in the body of the essay support and develop the thesis statement?
- _____ Does the final paragraph restate the controlling idea and bring the essay to a clear conclusion.

SUPPORT

- _____ Are there sufficient examples to develop the thesis clearly and convincingly?
- _____ Are all the supporting ideas directly related to the thesis?
- _____ Are supporting ideas backed up with specific facts or quotations (either direct or indirect)?
- _____ Is there any unnecessary plot summary?
- _____ Are quotations introduced and explained?

ORGANIZATION

- _____ Is the essay clearly developed in three parts: introduction, body, and conclusion?
- _____ Are transitional words and phrases used where appropriate?

SENTENCES

- _____ Are sentences as economical as possible?

_____ Have related sentences been combined to clarify the logic of your essay?

_____ Have excessively long sentences been divided to make the essay clear?

Model 1 (Assignment 3)

Sample Introduction

A Comic Masterpiece

Gulliver's Travels is a complex book. It is, of course, a satire on four aspects of man: the physical, the political, the intellectual, and the moral. It is also a brilliant parody of travel literature; and it is at once science fiction and a witty parody of science fiction. It expresses savage indignation at the follies, vices, and stupidities of men, and everywhere implicit in the book as a whole is an awareness of man's tragic insufficiency. But at the same time it is a great comic masterpiece, a fact that solemn and too-sensitive readers often miss.

Questions

1. According to this introduction, what four aspects of man are satirized in Gulliver's Travels?
2. What will this essay attempt to prove?

Model 2 (Assignment 3)

Sample Developmental Paragraph

(The following is a sample of a paragraph that would appear in the body of an essay.)

We laugh and were meant to laugh at the toy kingdom of the Lilliputians; at the acrobatic skill of the politicians and courtiers; at the absurd jealousy of the diminutive minister who suspects an adulterous relationship between his wife and the giant Gulliver. We laugh at the plight of Gulliver in Brobdingnag: one of the lords of creation, frightened by a puppy, rendered ludicrous by the tricks of a mischievous monkey, in awe of a dwarf; embarrassed by the lascivious antics of the maids of honor; and at last content to be treated like a baby by his girl-nurse. We laugh at the abstractness of the philosophers of Laputa, at the mad experimenters of Balnibarbi. And I am sure that we are right in at least smiling at the preposterous horses, the Houyhnhnms, so limited and so positive in their knowledge and opinions, so skilled in such improbable tasks as threading needles or carrying trays, so complacent in their assurance that they are "the perfection of Nature."

Questions

1. This paragraph does not have a topic sentence. Write a possible topic sentence for it.
2. This paragraph contains only one quote. What kind of evidence does the author use to develop his idea?

3. Could this paragraph be easily understood by a reader who had not read Gulliver's Travels?

Model 3 (Assignment 3)

Sample Essay

A Comic Masterpiece

Gulliver's Travels is a complex book. It is, of course, a satire on four aspects of man: the physical, the political, the intellectual, and the moral. It is also a brilliant parody of travel literature; and it is at once science fiction and a witty parody of science fiction. It expresses savage indignation at the follies, vices, and stupidities of men, and everywhere implicit in the book as a whole is an awareness of man's tragic insufficiency. But at the same time it is a great comic masterpiece, a fact that solemn and too-sensitive readers often miss.

A friend once wrote me of having shocked an associate by remarking that he had laughed often on rereading Gulliver's Travels. "What should I have done?" he asked me. "Blown out my brains?" I am sure that Swift would have approved my friend's laughter. To conclude that Gulliver's Travels expresses despair is radically to misread the book. All of Swift's satire was written in anger, contempt, or disgust, but it was written to promote self-knowledge in the faith that self-knowledge will lead to right action. Nothing would have bewildered him more than to learn that he had led a reader to the desperate remedy of blowing out his brains. But the book is so often called morbid, so

frequently have readers concluded that it is the work of an incipient madman, that I think it worth while to emphasize the gayety and comedy of the voyages as an indication of their author's essential intellectual and spiritual health. True, seventeen years after finishing Gulliver's Travels, Swift was officially declared non compos mentis. But his masterpiece was written at the height of his powers, and the comic animation of the book as a whole rules out the suspicion of morbidity and mental illness.

We laugh and were meant to laugh at the toy kingdom of the Lilliputians; at the acrobatic skill of the politicians and courtiers; at the absurd jealousy of the diminutive minister who suspects an adulterous relationship between his wife and the giant Gulliver. We laugh at the plight of Gulliver in Brobdingnag: one of the lords of creation, frightened by a puppy, rendered ludicrous by the tricks of a mischievous monkey, in awe of a dwarf; embarrassed by the lascivious antics of the maids of honor; and at last content to be treated like a baby by his girl-nurse. We laugh at the abstractness of the philosophers of Laputa, at the mad experimenters of Balnibarbi. And I am sure that we are right in at least smiling at the preposterous horses, the Houyhnhnms, so limited and so positive in their knowledge and opinions, so skilled in such improbable tasks as threading needles or carrying trays, so complacent in their assurance that

they are "the perfection of Nature."

Much of the delight that we take in Gulliver's Travels is due to this gay, comic, fanciful inventiveness. Swift did not wish us to blow out our brains: he did wish us to laugh.

(This essay is adapted from "The Pride of Lemuel Gulliver" by Samuel Holt Monk.)

Questions

1. Which paragraph most clearly explains the author's ideas?
2. What is the purpose of the second paragraph?
3. What idea about Gulliver's Travels does this essay attempt to disprove?

APPENDIX D
MATERIALS FOR ASSIGNMENT 4

Prewriting Questions for Essay

on "The Rime of the Ancient Mariner"

You are going to be asked to write an essay in which you discuss the theme of "The Rime of the Ancient Mariner." In his long ballad Coleridge presented one of the basic beliefs of the English Romantics. He presents this idea allegorically through the adventure of the Ancient Mariner. In this adventure the setting and creatures--particularly the albatross--have symbolic significance. Through these symbols and through the example of the Mariner, Coleridge attempts to lead us to his theme (but in case we missed it, he restates the theme at the end of the poem.) The following questions are intended to help you recognize this theme and gather material for your essay. Before attempting to answer each of the four major questions, answer the related questions that follow each one.

1. What does the albatross symbolize?

a. Where is the ship trapped when the albatross first appears?

b. What is missing from this place?

c. How do the sailors react to the albatross when it first appears?

d. What happens immediately after the appearance of the albatross?

e. What is the result of the albatross's death?

2. What is the significance of the Mariner's crime?

a. What does he do?

b. What are the results of his action?

c. What are the main elements of his punishment?

d. What is the name of the supernatural creature that wins the Mariner in a game of dice with Death?

3. What shows the Mariner's true repentance for his crime?

a. Consider the following two quotes:

Quote 1 (lines 123-126)

"The very deep did rot; O Christ!
That ever this should be!
Yea, slimy things did crawl with legs
Upon the slimy sea.

Quote 2 (lines 273-281)

I watched the water snakes.
They moved in tracks of shining white,

And when they reared, the elfish light
Fell off in hoary flakes.

"Within the shadow of the ship
I watched their rich attire;
Blue, glossy green, and velvet black,
They coiled and swam, and every track
Was a flash of golden fire.

The Mariner is describing essentially the same scene in both quotes but in very different terms. Why? How has he changed between the time of the first quote and that of the second?

b. Following the second quote above, while looking at the water snakes, the Mariner says,

"Oh happy living things! no tongue
Their beauty might declare.
A spring of love gushed from my heart,
And I blessed them unaware;
Sure my kind saint took pity on me,
And I blessed them unaware.

The albatross then drops from his neck. Why? How has he made up for at least part of his guilt?

4. What is the theme of the poem?

Before answering restate in your own words the following lines from near the end of the poem.

He prayeth well, who loveth well
Both man and bird and beast.

"He prayeth best, who loveth best
All things both great and small;
For the dear God who loveth us,
He made and loveth all."

Assignment 4: "Rime of the Ancient Mariner"
Group 1 (Word processing, Editing)

Topic

In "The Rime of the Ancient Mariner" Samuel Coleridge presents one of the basic beliefs of the English romantic writers. To present his idea he uses allegory and symbolism as well as direct exposition.

In a well-organized essay answer the following question: What is the most important lesson taught in "The Rime of the Ancient Mariner"? Support your answer by discussing how Coleridge presents this lesson.

Purpose

Your purpose is to convince the reader that your answer is both plausible and significant. To be plausible it should be supported with logic and specific evidence. To be significant it should extend the reader's understanding of "The Rime of the Ancient Mariner."

Audience

You should assume that your audience is composed of intelligent readers who are generally familiar with "The Rime of the Ancient Mariner" but who may not recall specific passages without your help.

Requirements

1. Your essay must be entirely composed during the four class periods provided.
2. At the end of the first two periods, you must have completed the first draft of your essay and have saved it on your disk.
3. At the end of the fourth period, you must have completed the final draft of your essay and have saved it on your disk.
4. At the beginning of the third period, you will be given a list of editing questions. Please answer these questions ("yes" or "no") about your first draft. Turn in your answers to these questions before continuing work on your essay. A few minutes before the end of the third period or when you have finished your final draft, you will be given a second set of questions. Please answer these about your final draft. These questions are intended to call your attention to possible improvements or corrections which you could make in your essay, so of course you are allowed to make changes in your final draft after you have completed the editing questions.
5. No set length is required for your essay but it must have an introduction, body, and conclusion. The introduction should include a thesis statement.
6. Please proofread your essay carefully.

7. All writing for the assignment should be done either on the computer or on the paper provided. Both your paper and disk will be collected at the end of each period.

Assignment 4: "The Rime of the Ancient Mariner"
Group 2 (Non-word Processor, Editing)

Topic

In "The Rime of the Ancient Mariner" Samuel Coleridge presents one of the basic beliefs of the English romantic writers. To present his idea he uses allegory and symbolism as well as direct exposition.

In a well-organized essay answer the following question: What is the most important lesson taught in "The Rime of the Ancient Mariner"? Support your answer by discussing how Coleridge presents this lesson.

Purpose

Your purpose is to convince the reader that your answer is both plausible and significant. To be plausible it should be supported with logic and specific evidence. To be significant it should extend the reader's understanding of "The Rime of the Ancient Mariner."

Audience

You should assume that your audience is composed of intelligent readers who are generally familiar with "The Rime of the Ancient Mariner" but who may not recall specific passages without your help.

Requirements

1. Your essay must be entirely composed during the four class periods provided.
2. At the end of the first two periods, you must have completed the first draft of your essay.
3. At the end of the fourth period, you must have completed the final draft of your essay.
4. At the beginning of the third period, you will be given a list of editing questions. Please answer these questions ("yes" or "no") about your first draft. Turn in your answers to these questions before continuing work on your essay. A few minutes before the end of the third period or when you have finished your final draft, you will be given a second set of questions. Please answer these about your final draft. These questions are intended to call your attention to possible improvements or corrections which you could make in your essay, so of course you are allowed to make changes in your final draft after you have completed the editing questions.
5. No set length is required for your essay but it must have an introduction, body, and conclusion. The introduction should include a thesis statement.
6. Please proofread your essay carefully.

7. All writing for the assignment should be done on the paper provided. Your paper will be collected at the end of each period.

Assignment 4: "Rime of the Ancient Mariner"
Group 3 (Word processor, Model)

Topic

In "The Rime of the Ancient Mariner" Samuel Coleridge presents one of the basic beliefs of the English romantic writers. To present his idea he uses allegory and symbolism as well as direct exposition.

In a well-organized essay answer the following question: What is the most important lesson taught in "The Rime of the Ancient Mariner"? Support your answer by discussing how Coleridge presents this lesson.

Purpose

Your purpose is to convince the reader that your answer is both plausible and significant. To be plausible it should be supported with logic and specific evidence. To be significant it should extend the reader's understanding of "The Rime of the Ancient Mariner."

Audience

You should assume that your audience is composed of intelligent readers who are generally familiar with "The Rime of the Ancient Mariner" but who may not recall specific passages without your help.

Requirements

1. Your essay must be entirely composed during the four class periods provided.
2. At the end of the first two periods, you must have completed the first draft of your essay and have saved it on your disk.
3. At the end of the fourth period, you must have completed the final draft of your essay and have saved it on your disk.
4. During the first, third, and fourth period, you will be given parts of a model essay. These are intended to provide guidance for your own essay. Please read the part of the model and respond to the questions on each. Your answers will be collected at the end of each period.
5. No set length is required for your essay but it must have an introduction, body, and conclusion. The introduction should include a thesis statement.
6. Please proofread your essay carefully.

7. All writing for the assignment should be done either on the computer or on the paper provided. Both your disk and your paper will be collected at the end of each period.

Assignment 4: "The Rime of the Ancient Mariner"
Group 4 (Non-word processing, Model)

Topic

In "The Rime of the Ancient Mariner" Samuel Coleridge presents one of the basic beliefs of the English romantic writers. To present his idea he uses allegory and symbolism as well as direct exposition.

In a well-organized essay answer the following question: What is the most important lesson taught in "The Rime of the Ancient Mariner"? Support your answer by discussing how Coleridge presents this lesson.

Purpose

Your purpose is to convince the reader that your answer is both plausible and significant. To be plausible it should be supported with logic and specific evidence. To be significant it should extend the reader's understanding of "The Rime of the Ancient Mariner."

Audience

You should assume that your audience is composed of intelligent readers who are generally familiar with "The Rime of the Ancient Mariner" but who may not recall specific passages without your help.

Requirements

1. Your essay must be entirely composed during the four class periods provided.
2. At the end of the first two periods, you must have completed the first draft of your essay.
3. At the end of the fourth period, you must have completed the final draft of your essay.
4. During the first, third, and fourth periods, you will be given parts of a model essay. These are intended to provide guidance for your own essay. Please read the parts of the model and respond to the questions on each. Your answers will be collected at the end of each period.
5. No set length is required for your essay but it must have an introduction, body, and conclusion. The introduction should include a thesis statement.
6. Please proofread your essay carefully.

7. All writing for the assignment should be done on the paper provided. Your paper will be collected at the end of each period.

Editing Questions (Assignment 4)

Use the following questions as a guide in revising your essay.

CONTENT

- _____ Does the introduction identify both the work which you are analyzing and the question which you are answering?
- _____ Does the introductory paragraph end in a clear thesis statement?
- _____ Does the thesis answer the question?
- _____ Does the thesis have an argumentative edge?
- _____ Do all the paragraphs in the body of the essay support and develop the thesis statement?
- _____ Does the final paragraph restate the controlling idea and bring the essay to a clear conclusion.

SUPPORT

- _____ Are there sufficient examples to develop the thesis clearly and convincingly?
- _____ Are all the supporting ideas directly related to the thesis?
- _____ Are supporting ideas backed up with specific facts or quotations (either direct or indirect)?
- _____ Is there any unnecessary plot summary?
- _____ Are quotations introduced and explained?

ORGANIZATION

- _____ Is the essay clearly developed in three parts: introduction, body, and conclusion?
- _____ Are transitional words and phrases used where appropriate?

SENTENCES

- _____ Are sentences as economical as possible?

_____ Have related sentences been combined to clarify the logic of your essay?

_____ Have excessively long sentences been divided to make the essay clear?

Model 1 (Assignment 4)

Sample Introduction

The Idea in D. H. Lawrence's "The Horse Dealer's Daughter"
that Human Destiny is to Love

There are many ideas in D. H. Lawrence's "The Horse Dealer's Daughter" about the love between men and women. Some of these are that love is a part of the uncontrollable side of human life--the emotions; that love cannot exist without a physical basis; that love transforms life into something new; that love gives security; that only love gives meaning to life; that love is not only something to live for but something to be feared. The one idea that takes in all these is that loving is an essential part of human nature--that it is human destiny to love.

Questions

1. According to this introduction what is the main subject of Lawrence's story?
2. What one generalization sums up the different ideas which Lawrence presents about this subject?

Model 2 (Assignment 4)

Sample Developmental Paragraph

(The following is a sample of a paragraph that would appear in the body of an essay.)

In the first part of the story, Lawrence illustrates characters who have no love, and whose lives are therefore negative, incomplete, and without a destiny. According to this idea, he shows that human beings without love are frustrated, sullen, argumentative, and even cruel. Their lives are similar to those of the great draft horses, which Lawrence describes as moving with "a massive, slumbrous strength, and a stupidity which held them in subjection." Time, Lawrence implies, is running out on people in this condition, and unless they find love they are doomed to misery. And it must be real love, for according to the main idea, anything short of real love is an evasion and will surely hasten this doom. Thus Joe, the eldest of the Pervin brothers, has arranged for an apparently loveless marriage to achieve economic security. With deliberate finality, Lawrence disposes of Joe, who thereby becomes an example of the main idea: "He would marry and go into harness. His life was over, he would be a subject animal."

Questions

1. This paragraph suggests a parallel between loveless people and draft horses. How are they similar?

2. What is the topic sentence of the paragraph? (State it in your own words.)

3. What is is one example which is used to support the topic sentence?

Model 3 (Assignment 4)

Sample Essay

The Idea in D. H. Lawrence's "The Horse Dealer's Daughter"
that Human Destiny is to Love

There are many ideas in D. H. Lawrence's "The Horse Dealer's Daughter" this story about the love between men and women. Some of these are that love is a part of the uncontrollable side of human life--the emotions; that love cannot exist without a physical basis; that love transforms life into something new; that love gives security; that only love gives meaning to life; that love is not only something to live for but something to be feared. The one idea that takes in all these is that loving is an essential part of human nature--that it is human destiny to love.

In the first part of the story, Lawrence illustrates characters who have no love, and whose lives are therefore negative, incomplete, and without a destiny. According to this idea, he shows that human beings without love are frustrated, sullen, argumentative, and even cruel. Their lives are similar to those of the great draft horses, which Lawrence describes as moving with "a massive, slumbrous strength, and a stupidity which held them in subjection." Time, Lawrence implies, is running out on people in this condition, and unless they find love they are doomed to misery. And it must be real love, for according to the main idea, anything short of real love is an evasion and will

surely hasten this doom. Thus Joe, the eldest of the Pervin brothers, has arranged for an apparently loveless marriage to achieve economic security. With deliberate finality, Lawrence disposes of Joe, who thereby becomes an example of the main idea: "He would marry and go into harness. His life was over, he would be a subject animal."

The thought that life is impossible without love is finally brought bear on Mabel, Joe's sister. She is the lone woman in the Pervin family, and also the figure for whom the story is named. Just as the death of her father is causing the family to separate, the breakup is about to produce a drastic action on her part. Here the operation of Lawrence's idea is brought out clearly: since it is human destiny to love, and since life without love is a kind of death, and since Mabel loves no living person but has only the love for her dead mother to remember, she chooses real death with dead love, which she prefers to earthly life without any love at all. In this sense her attempted suicide is a positive act. She walks "toward the centre of the pond, very slowly, gradually moving deeper into the motionless water, and still moving forward as the water got up to her breast."

Rather than ending Mabel's life, however, the pond really begins it, for her attempted suicide is the occasion of her love with Dr. Jack Fergusson, and therefore it also is the positive means by which she moves toward her destiny. Dr. Fergusson, who

rescues her, has previously been introduced as a person leading a life of quiet desperation. Perhaps his common cold, mentioned when he first appears at the Pervin home, may be interpreted as suggestive of the sickness of the soul without love. Therefore his need to be well, like Mabel's need to be rescued from the pond, may be seen as support for Lawrence's basic idea. Whether this interpretation is right or not, however, it is clear that Dr. Fergusson's rescue of Mabel is therapeutic not only for Mabel, but also for himself. The rescue thus suggests that once love is attained, it restores life.

Clearly, Lawrence suggests, men and women without love, like those at the beginning of the story, have never reached fulfillment and consequently they face problems that, though certainly severe and immediate, are really peripheral to life as it should be lived. The entire story of Mabel and Jack is an extensive example of Lawrence's dominating idea that it is the destiny of men and women to love.

Questions

1. Briefly list three ideas which are presented in this essay to support its thesis.

2. List one specific example which is used to illustrate a supporting idea.

3. Was the author of this essay sure about his or her interpretation of the meaning of Dr. Jack Fergusson's cold?

APPENDIX E
MATERIALS FOR READERS

Instructions to the Reader

Please give each essay a score of from one to nine with one being the lowest and nine being the highest. In general, your score should reflect your overall impression of the essay. That impression will naturally include your response to both the student's ideas and writing skill. The following descriptions may help you establish a range for your scoring, but they are not intended to provide a basis for a point by point analysis.

High (7-9)

The essay forcefully develops an original, significant idea. The argument is clearly organized and convincing. Supporting ideas are developed with quotes and specific facts. The writing is lively and economical with few errors.

Middle (4-6)

The essay responds to the assignment by presenting an answer to the question. It is organized into an introduction, body, and conclusion. Its logic is understandable and supported by some relevant examples. The errors do not obscure the meaning.

Low (1-3)

The essay does not meet the minimum requirements of the assignment. It may either not respond to the assigned question or wander away from it. It may not have an introduction, body, and conclusion. The logic may be difficult to follow and ideas may lack specific development. Errors may obscure meaning.

First Reading

Student Code____ Assignment Number____ Reader_____

- ____ 1. Sentence Structure____
(run-on sentences, fragments, misplaced or dangling
modifiers, or faulty parallelism)
- ____ 2. Punctuation____
(omitting or incorrectly using one of the following: comma,
end mark, quotation mark, underlining, dash, semicolon, or colon)
- ____ 3. Pronoun____
(lacks clear antecedent, doesn't agree with antecedent,
shifts person unnecessarily)
- ____ 4. Subject-verb Agreement____
- ____ 5. Spelling____
(including apostrophe errors)
- ____ 6. Double Negative____
- ____ 7. Word Selection____
- ____ Total Number of Errors
- ____ Idea/Example Count_____

ERROR COUNT

Second Reading

Student Code____ Assignment Number____ Reader_____

- ____ 1. Sentence Structure____
(run-on sentences, fragments, misplaced or dangling
modifiers, or faulty parallelism)
- ____ 2. Punctuation____
(omitting or incorrectly using one of the following: comma,
end mark, quotation mark, underlining, dash, semicolon, or colon)
- ____ 3. Pronoun____
(lacks clear antecedent, doesn't agree with antecedent,
shifts person unnecessarily)
- ____ 4. Subject-verb Agreement____
- ____ 5. Spelling____
(including apostrophe errors)
- ____ 6. Double Negative____
- ____ 7. Word Selection____

_____ Total Number of Errors

_____ Idea/Example Count _____

APPENDIX F
STUDENT SURVEY

Computer Survey

1. Do you have access to a computer at home? _____

If so, do you use it for writing school assignments?

never 1 2 3 4 5 frequently (Circle one.)

2. How would you rate your mastery of the Open Access word processing program?

poor 1 2 3 4 5 excellent (Circle one.)

3. Given a choice do you prefer to write on a computer?

never 1 2 3 4 5 always (Circle one.)

4. Do you do a better job of writing when you use a computer?

never 1 2 3 4 5 always (Circle one.)

5. How would you rate your skill as a writer?

poor 1 2 3 4 5 excellent (Circle one.)

6. If you have a choice, do you write more than one draft of an essay before turning it in to an English class?

never 1 2 3 4 5 always (Circle one.)

7. When you rewrite an essay, do you concentrate mostly on correcting errors?

never 1 2 3 4 5 always (Circle one.)

8. When you rewrite an essay, do you add new examples?

never 1 2 3 4 5 always (Circle one.)

9. How important do you consider the neatness of the final draft of an essay to be?

slightly 1 2 3 4 5 highly (Circle one.)

10. When you rewrite an essay, do you change the order in which the sentences appear?

never 1 2 3 4 5 always (Circle one.)

Please enter words per minute you typed in the keyboarding test ____.

APPENDIX G
COMPETENCY TEST SUMMARY

Table 1 lists both the manner in which the students in the study had met the computer literacy requirement and the scores which they had received on those district mastery tests which were related to language arts. The scores included are as follows:

- A--Reading/Literature Mastery Test (Forty points were possible; twenty-four points were required for mastery.)
- B--Written Composition (136 points were possible; 74 points were required for mastery. This score is a subscore of the English/Writing score.)
- C--English/Writing (162 points were possible; 89 points were required for mastery.)

Table 1 also lists the name of the class or classes which each student took that met the district's computer literacy requirement. The letter in parentheses following each course name is the grade the student received. A "W" indicates that the computer literacy requirement was waived, but in some cases, even though the requirement was waived the student took classes which would have met the requirement, and, in these cases, the courses are still listed. "NR" indicates that the student's record did not show how the computer literacy requirement was met.

Table 1

DISTRICT MASTERY TEST SCORES AND COMPUTER LITERACY REQUIREMENT

	(A)	(B)	(C)	Computer Literacy Requirement
1.	36	50	99	Computer Keyboarding/Typing (B)
2.	36	83	103	NR
3.	39	94	120	W, Computer Keyboarding/Typing (B)
4.	38	79	94	Intermediate Computer Literacy (A)
5.	38	60	116	W, Data Processing I and II (D,C)
6.	35	111	137	W
7.	37	101	117	W
8.	38	100	121	Computer Keyboarding/Typing (B)
9.	39	114	140	W
10.	32	106	122	Computer Keyboarding/Typing (D)
11.	32	74	113	NR
12.	37	104	124	W
13.	39	93	114	W, Computer Keyboarding/Typing (B)
14.	35	104	119	W, Data Processing I and II (A,C)
15.	36	87	108	W, Data Processing I and II (C,D)
16.	35	98	119	Beginning Computer (A)
17.	36	90	110	Beginning Typing/Keyboarding (B)

18.	36	78	84	Computer Keyboarding/Typing (A), Beginning Computer (A)
19.	38	89	105	W, Data Processing I and II (C,B)
20.	39	100	123	Computer Keyboarding/Typing (C), Data Processing I and II (B,B)
21.	39	94	115	NR
22.	33	100	125	Basic Computers (B)
23.	39	93	119	Beginning Typing/Keyboarding (D)
24.	35	99	119	Beginning Computer (B), Advanced Computer (B)
25.	38	101	122	W, Beginning Typing/Keyboarding (A)
26.	35	105	126	Beginning Computer Literacy (B)
27.	40	105	120	W
28.	33	86	102	Beginning Computer Literacy (C), Beginning Typing/Keyboarding (C)
29.	36	88	109	Beginning Computer Literacy (A)
30.	34	104	119	Computer Keyboarding/Typing I and II (C,C)
31.	36	98	110	W, Beginning Typing/Keyboarding (A)
32.	38	103	124	Beginning Typing/Keyboarding (A)
33.	30	85	106	Computer Literacy (B)