

VU Research Portal

[Review of: H. Kaelble (1999) Der historische Vergleich: Eine Einführung zum 19. und 20. Jahrhundert]

Lorenz, C.F.G.

published in

International Review of Social History
2001

document version

Publisher's PDF, also known as Version of record

[Link to publication in VU Research Portal](#)

citation for published version (APA)

Lorenz, C. F. G. (2001). [Review of: H. Kaelble (1999) Der historische Vergleich: Eine Einführung zum 19. und 20. Jahrhundert]. *International Review of Social History*, 46, 257-259.

General rights

Copyright and moral rights for the publications made accessible in the public portal are retained by the authors and/or other copyright owners and it is a condition of accessing publications that users recognise and abide by the legal requirements associated with these rights.

- Users may download and print one copy of any publication from the public portal for the purpose of private study or research.
- You may not further distribute the material or use it for any profit-making activity or commercial gain
- You may freely distribute the URL identifying the publication in the public portal ?

Take down policy

If you believe that this document breaches copyright please contact us providing details, and we will remove access to the work immediately and investigate your claim.

E-mail address:

vuresearchportal.ub@vu.nl

The Journal of Ecclesiastical History

<http://journals.cambridge.org/ECH>

Additional services for *The Journal of Ecclesiastical History*:

Email alerts: [Click here](#)

Subscriptions: [Click here](#)

Commercial reprints: [Click here](#)

Terms of use : [Click here](#)



Acta Cusana. Quellen zur Lebensgeschichte des Nikolaus von Kues, I: Lieferung 3a. 1451 Januar–September 5. Edited by Erich Meuthen and Hermann Hallauer. (Heidelberger Akademie der Wissenschaften.) Pp. vii+442 +loose-leaf chart and endpaper. Hamburg: Felix Meiner, 1996. DM 328. 3 7873 1242 0

Lorenz Böningner

The Journal of Ecclesiastical History / Volume 50 / Issue 04 / October 1999, pp 767 - 813
DOI: null, Published online: 08 September 2000

Link to this article: http://journals.cambridge.org/abstract_S0022046999422742

How to cite this article:

Lorenz Böningner (1999). The Journal of Ecclesiastical History, 50, pp 767-813

Request Permissions : [Click here](#)

Reviews

Die Päpste. Von Petrus zu Johannes Paul II. By Horst Fuhrmann. Pp. 307 incl. 191
ills. Munich: C. H. Beck, 1998. DM 48. 3 406 43695 1

Since the illustrations are on the numbered pages, the reader will see that as many pages must be occupied by a picture; the amount of prose text would not by itself make a long book. Hence the history must be by big names – Leo, Gregory, Charlemagne and so on. The book is more of the people than of the institution, though we also learn much about the institution through the people. The pictures, all black-and-white, are unusual and well chosen and helpful in their subdescriptions. The quality of the book is shown in that even the brief descriptions of the few but weighty popes are informative and interesting. In no sense is this a dry textbook. The author is learned, not a Roman Catholic, a medievalist well-known for an introduction to the Middle Ages and for a biographical treatment of the scholars of the last century who made the *Monumenta Germaniae Historica*. The portraits of the institution and its heads are not favourable though virtues are allowed to both. Fuhrmann doubts the Petrine text of the New Testament but thinks that the trophaon under St Peter's is very possibly authentic; argues that Gregory the Great left the papacy in a very bad way; discloses that although in theory a non-cardinal can be elected, the voting paper has printed on it 'I elect Cardinal...'; is fair on pseudo-Isidore and canon law; fascinates about the modern examination of the skeleton of Hildebrand; seems to accept the doubtful opinion that during the Vatican Council of 1870 Pius IX was mentally unbalanced from physical causes; cites the saying of a member of the Curia on the death of Pius X, 'Please God not another saint yet awhile'; is sane about the modernising popes from John XXIII onwards and gives them rather more space; but has the unusual belief that the Vatican City as constituted since 1929 provides no proper basis for an independent papacy. At the end is a pleasant little essay on historians of the papacy with portraits of the famous, from Platina through Flacius and Baronius to Ranke and his Protestant successors, to Pastor and his Catholic successors. Curiously historians are more difficult to place in coherence than the successive heads of an historic institution.

SELWYN COLLEGE,
CAMBRIDGE

OWEN CHADWICK

Creational theology and the history of physical science. The creationist tradition from Basil to Bohr. By Christopher B. Kaiser. (Studies in the History of Christian Thought, 78.) Pp. x+452. Leiden–New York–Cologne: Brill, 1997. Nlg
235. 90 04 10669 3; 0081 8607

Concluding an impressive historical survey, Christopher Kaiser notes that 'due to the secularisation of science and the privatisation of theology, it is no longer

possible to speak of a creationist tradition being shared by scientists as a profession'. The implication is that it once was. For pioneers of modern science, such as Kepler, Descartes and Newton, belief in an ordered and intelligible world was a presupposition of their work. A Judaeo-Christian doctrine of Creation could shape the scientific enterprise in other ways too, as Kaiser showed in his earlier book, *Creation and the history of science* (1991). In this he traced successive manifestations of four theological motifs, which in antiquity had found coherent expression in Basil. These were the comprehensibility of an ordered world, the unity of the cosmos, the relative autonomy of nature and, on a more practical front, the ministry of healing. The history of science had been a series of variations on these themes. This earlier book was an abridged version of the later. *Creational theology and the history of physical science* has an identical structure but is more thoroughly documented. It has sections on the medieval Church and Aristotelian science; on the spiritualist, mechanist and Platonist traditions visible in Leibniz, Boyle and Newton; on the tendency of post-Newtonian natural theology to lead to a naturalism in which nature acquired complete autonomy; and on the 'contribution' of the creationist tradition to twentieth-century physics. Interestingly, Kaiser finds the stamp of creational theology on almost every philosophy of nature, including some that were avowedly anti-Christian, even atheistic. This might invite the sceptical response that if a creational theology was so omnipresent in western science, it could be doing little real work. But this would be to miss the author's purpose, which is to show how a once coherent tradition lost its coherence through scientific diversification. One also detects a higher purpose. When discussing Newton, for example, he tries to assess his 'contribution to our understanding of God and nature from a historic creational perspective'. Here the author's own presuppositions cannot be concealed. Faced with Newton's Arian heresy, which Newton himself grounded in biblical scholarship, Kaiser insists that the resulting deity was 'far from biblical'. Despite an approach to the history of ideas which invests heavily in 'traditions', there is much to savour. We are given many illuminating examples of scientific explanation sought from within a providentialist theology. It is also instructive to see how repeatedly the conclusions of natural philosophers have been susceptible of both theistic and naturalistic interpretation. One lesson is that we should never glibly speak of the 'religious implications of science'. Kaiser himself has other lessons in mind. He is worried by a complete autonomy of nature that 'makes it nearly impossible for us to integrate our spiritual and ethical selves with our science-based view of the world'. His long historical journey finally provides the resources to reconstitute a world in which spiritual restoration has pride of place.

UNIVERSITY OF LANCASTER

JOHN HEDLEY BROOKE

The early Church and its context. Essays in honor of Everett Ferguson. Edited by Abraham J. Malherbe, Frederick W. Norris and James W. Thompson. (Supplements to Novum Testamentum, 90.) Pp. xviii + 366 incl. 4 figs. Leiden–Boston–Cologne: Brill, 1998. 90 04 10832 7; 0167 9732

As a scholar Everett Ferguson has greatly influenced and furthered the study of early Christianity during the last three decades, and in particular in the United

States. The volume of essays written in his honour is designed to reflect his main interests, in the Greco-Roman background to the development of early Christian thought, and towards widening horizons for the study of the Church and its mission. Thus he has included in his *Encyclopaedia of early Christianity* Coptic, Arabic and Ethiopian sources far later in time than the limits normally imposed in encyclopaedias of this nature.

The *Encyclopaedia* was a massive achievement and it has inspired a wide choice of subjects by the essayists. Perhaps too wide, for 'context', the key word in the editors' plan, has led to some loss of unity and the inclusion among the valuable and scholarly of the relatively trivial and the far-fetched. Despite twice attributing Lactantius' *Divine institutes* to the 'early third century' instead of the early fourth century (probably *c.* 311), Rowan Greer has written an invaluable survey of the debt owed by Lactantius to Cicero as a philosopher. For Lactantius, Cicero was 'the greatest author of the Roman language' (*Div. Inst.* 3.13) and a 'consummate philosopher' (*ibid.* 3.14). Though he is sometime patronising, suggesting that Cicero's opinion that true justice transcends civil law 'is not inconsistent with the truth' (*ibid.* 5.12), he accepts and elaborates in a Christian sense Cicero's concept of a universal human society governed by true law and justice, and he uses him to sustain his own arguments in favour of Christianity. It would seem, in fact, that Lactantius' Christianity was an alternative philosophy, fuelling a protest against what he saw as the injustices and parochialism of Roman society under the Tetrarchy. He looked back wistfully to what he believed had once been a Golden Age. As Greer indicates, Lactantius' dualism in conceiving God as the author of evil and maker of Satan foreshadowed Manichaeism in North Africa. He might have added that the hermetic prophetic writings which figure so prominently in the *Divine institutes* also led some intellectuals, such as Faustus of Milevis, to prefer Manichaeism to Donatist or Catholic Christianity.

Ferguson was one of A. D. Nock's last pupils, and apart from Christian philosophy he gained from him an interest in the pagan background to Christianity and conversion to the new religion. The first is represented by Ray Bowen Ward's description of the prominent part played by women in the religious life of Pompeii as public priestesses. The 'considerable power and influence' exercised by women in the Roman empire to which Ferguson draws attention foreshadowed a similar power and influence exercised by Christian women, such as the Gnostic Flora and the Roman *matronae* singled out in the second of Valerian's two edicts of persecution in August 258. The differences between conversion to philosophy and to Christianity prompted by Paul's preaching is discussed by Abraham J. Malherbe. While philosophers such as Epictetus demanded of their disciples a dedication to moral principles implied in growing self-knowledge, the Pauline convert must 'turn from idols', and though afflicted by persecutions could regard himself as destined to salvation from God's wrath designed for unbelievers. The Jewish background is examined in David Balch's discussion of the attitude of Jews towards their Greco-Roman contemporaries shown in 2 Maccabees, Esther, Eupolemus, Aristean and in Luke's Gospel. All illustrated the tension between a Gentile mission and abhorrence to 'mingling' with non-Jews.

Through the second century orthodoxy and Gnosticism vied for supremacy

among the nascent Christian communities. Harold W. Athridge makes an important contribution in his comparison between the range of knowledge, not least scientific knowledge, displayed by Plutarch and his friends, and Gnostics whether orthodox, such as Clement of Alexandria or heterodox such as Basilides. He concludes that 'mystical arithmetic' as taught by the latter was no substitute for the knowledge of natural science and medicine acquired by their pagan contemporaries. For the Christian Gnostic as well as his heterodox opponent knowledge of whence and whither of the soul was all that truly mattered.

On the third century J. T. Fitzgerald's lengthy study of the *Little labyrinth* and its unnamed author adds little to what is already known, except to push the date of this anti-Monarchian tract forward to c. 245–55, in line with Eusebius' attempt (*Historia ecclesiastica* v. 28) to relate it to the refutation of a heresy represented successively by Theodotus the tanner, Artemon and Paul of Samosata.

The growing triumph of the Church in the fourth century following Constantine's conversion opened up new doctrinal issues as well as new attitudes towards society. Charles Kannegiesser comments wisely on the maturity shown by Athanasius in his earliest doctrinal work, the *De incarnatione*, which he dates to 335, just before Athanasius' first exile. Kathleen McVey records some pithy replies based on the New Testament given by some of the Desert Fathers to their often less than wise interlocutors. For the end of the century Pamela Bright shows in a sensitive and scholarly article how much Augustine (as well as his Donatist opponents) owed to Tertullian for his understanding of baptism, as illustrated in the final books of the *Confessions*.

The collection of essays is a worthy tribute to a fine scholar. It illustrates also something of the strength and weakness of current American patristic scholarship. There is a determination to trace out origins, shown in Holliday's essay on the Jewish tract, pseudo-Orpheus, ingenuity in attempts to find new solutions to old problems, a scholarly application to relevant detail, combined with breadth of vision, but progress is confined to written sources. Only Corby Finney's short but valuable discussion of the fragment of a late antique tunic (fifth century?) preserved in the St Louis Art Museum represents the archaeological dimension in the study of early Christianity. This is perhaps inevitable, but it shows the need among other things, for co-operation between the American scholars who at present dominate the four-yearly Oxford patristic conference, and their European colleagues whose researches in the field are so effectively recorded at the International Congresses of Christian Archaeology. The patristic scholar needs the archaeologist at his side.

GONVILLE AND CAIUS COLLEGE,
CAMBRIDGE

W. H. C. FREND

Frühchristliche Baptisterien. By Sebastian Ristow. (Jahrbuch für Antike und Christentum, Ergänzungsband, 27.) Pp. vi + 385 incl. 9 ills and 3 graphs + 37 plates and 3 pull-out maps. Münster: Aschendorff, 1998. DM 148. 3 402 08111 3

The study of baptisteries and baptismal liturgy has been the main theme of the author's research in the present decade. Starting with a study of a baptistery

situated east of Cologne Cathedral, he studied in detail the Rhineland church and baptistery at Boppard. Now, using a dissertation for the University of Bonn as a framework, he has presented a majestic catalogue, preceded by a 100-page discussion, of nearly every identifiable baptistery and font in the Roman empire from the third-century baptistery in the house-church at Dura Europos to eighth-century baptisteries in some Rhineland churches and in Jordan. No less than 788 baptisteries are listed and described from all over the Roman empire, together with another 145 possible and 136 doubtful examples. There is a short, useful discussion of baptismal liturgies.

Baptisteries, whether separate buildings outside the church or forming part of the church were functional. There were those that housed the deep baptismal fonts in north Africa, such as at Tingad and Djemila where the candidate was totally immersed, to signify his death to the world and resurrection to a new Christian life. More generally however, the fonts would be 50–80 cm deep, and the rite would be by aspersion, i.e. the celebrant would pour the water over the candidate standing naked in the font. The form of the font, whether round, square, hexagonal, cruciform or octagonal varied as between different churches. All that can be said after an exhaustive survey of the evidence, is that outside baptisteries were normally set near the west wall of the church, and that hexagonal and square fonts usually preceded the round, cruciform and octagonal forms, though there were numerous exceptions. Byzantine fonts were usually shallower than their fourth–fifth-century predecessors, perhaps as the writer suggests, due to the increase in the numbers of infant baptisms.

This is a massive work, a tribute to the writer's perseverance and industry. Even so, there are some significant omissions. Neither Jurgen Christern's *Das frühchristliche Pilgerheiligtum von Tebessa* (Wiesbaden 1976) nor André Berthier and colleagues' *Les Vestiges du Christianisme antique dans la Numidie centrale* (Algiers 1942) are listed in the voluminous bibliography or discussed in the text. Thus the author repeats the mistake made by earlier writers of calling the pilgrimage centre at Tebessa a monastery, and has not included a number of baptisteries and fonts associated with the many churches and chapels in central Numidia. His map of this area is almost blank. In addition, he has not mentioned the lead baptismal tanks marked with Christian symbols found in Roman Britain. The baptismal scene shown on the Walesby (Lincs) tank clearly indicates their use.

Despite these omissions, however, the value of this study should not be underestimated. Cataloguing can be tedious, but the author's scholarly discussion of all the evidence available to him, marks this off as an exceptional work of reference. The production, not least the plans and illustrations of baptisteries is, as usual in volumes of the *Jahrbuch*, of the highest standard.

GONVILLE AND CAIUS COLLEGE,
CAMBRIDGE

W. H. C. FREND

Lexikon der antiken christlichen Literatur. Edited by Siegmund Döpp and Wilhelm Geerlings. Pp. xvi + 652. Freiburg: Herder, 1998. DM 98. 3 451 23786 5

This fine volume inherits the mantle of Altaner's *Patrologie* with terse articles on Christian writers down to John of Damascus and Isidore of Seville, but arranged

in alphabetical order and with an index. The up-to-date bibliographies, most of which are far from limited to good work in German, make this an indispensable work of reference. Besides particular authors and texts there are some articles on literary themes and genres such as Exegesis, Dialogue (no entry for poetry under *Dichtung*), Cento, Commentary, autobiography, letter, *Schriftstellerkatalog*, *Marienliteratur*. The principal writers receive generous space, for example Augustine (by Geerlings himself) with four columns of bibliography in small print. Canon Law appears (*Kirchenrechtliche Sammlungen*) but not Acts of Councils independently of canons. A few cross references would increase utility. Philocalus is under Dionysius Ph. Under Cyril of Scythopolis, R. M. Price's translation merits mention. The book-list for Gildas omits Michael Winterbottom's edition. The volume will be very successful and gratefully used, not only by beginners acquiring a first introduction.

OXFORD

HENRY CHADWICK

Cassian the monk. By Columba Stewart. (Oxford Studies in Historical Theology.)

Pp. xv + 286 incl. map. New York–Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1998.

£46. 0 19 511366 7

With the publication in 1991 of his historical study of the Massalian movement, '*Working the earth of the heart*', Columba Stewart established himself as an outstandingly able patristic theologian and Church historian. In *Cassian the monk* he more than confirms his reputation, but now in the field of ascetic theology. John Cassian is famous as the theologian who mediated the traditions of the Egyptian desert to the west, to influence St Benedict and, through him, medieval Latin spirituality. Stewart knows his author and, not less importantly, the milieu in which Cassian lived, taught and wrote. Very early in his book he notes that 'the *Institutes* are inescapably a critique of the native [Gallic] monastic tradition associated especially with Martin of Tours', with its emphasis on miraculous powers rather than on simple goodness of life, so that Cassian prefers to concentrate 'on traditional teaching on the amendment of faults and the attainment of perfection, rather than on miraculous stories' (p. 17). At the same time, Cassian's emphasis on the need for human effort in God's service does not, as some have suspected, make him a Pelagian. Cassian, no less than Augustine, believed in divine initiative and the need for grace. 'In terms of the *practice* of the Christian life, Augustine and Cassian may scarcely have differed.' Cassian's concern was that the Augustinian doctrine of predestination 'effectively excluded human responsibility from the process of salvation' (p. 19).

Cassian's theological inspiration stemmed from the Origenistic tradition and especially from Evagrius Ponticus, though Cassian never mentions him by name and is careful to avoid Evagrius' notion of *apatheia* – 'passionlessness' – preferring to use the biblical term 'purity of heart', which he sees as 'the centerpiece of Cassian's monastic theology' (pp. 41–2). To attain to it involves ascetic discipline; love of one's neighbour; and 'the experience of liberation from sin in tranquillity of heart' (pp. 43–4). Stewart emphasises that the attainment of this condition does not, for Cassian, depend upon the unaided power of the monk –

and it is for monks that he is writing. Cassian's theology is profoundly Christocentric, an aspect 'not always immediately apparent to modern readers' (p. 41). It is not, however, the incarnate Christ in the humiliation of His earthly life that is the object of Cassian's devotion but rather the glorified Christ of the Resurrection. Hence Serapion, the anthromorphite monk who, when convinced of his error, was unable to pray, crying out: 'They have taken my God from me, and now I have no one to hold on to and I do not know whom to adore or beseech' (*Conf.* 10.3.5), is spiritually in error. 'From Cassian's perspective, although Serapion may be pathetic, he is certainly wrong. ... Although Serapion was perfect in the *actualis disciplina*, the ascetical life, he had not advanced to contemplating spiritual realities' (pp. 88, 89). 'Cassian wants to move his readers beyond imitation of the earthly life of Jesus to real participation in the glorified Christ' (p. 97). So, in the Lord's Prayer, he understands 'daily bread' spiritually (p. 109). From this follows the notion of unceasing prayer, initiated by monologistic prayer centred upon the name of Jesus, like: 'God come to my assistance, Lord make haste to help me' (Psalm lxix.2 [lxx.1]), found in early monastic circles, out of which came the Sinai tradition of the Jesus Prayer; a western treatise like *The cloud of unknowing*; and, in nineteenth-century Russia, the famous anonymous pilgrim, seeking to understand the command to pray unceasingly. This monologistic devotion may lead, always under God's grace, to that spark-like prayer, in which the monk is taken out of himself *in excessu mentis*, in which he is not aware of himself, or even that he is praying (pp. 85, 114).

Stewart is realistic in his discussion of Cassian's asceticism. In his approach to sexuality Cassian was a man of his own time. For him, virginity was the most perfect form of the Christian life and concupiscence haunts even the 'lawful' sphere of marriage. In this respect, Cassian's ascetic theology comes very close to Augustine's and does not offer an exact programme for Christians today. What he does is 'to encourage those modern Christians willing to undertake the massive challenge of fashioning a theology of sexuality that takes full account of both human experience and grace' (p. 131). Stewart's academic knowledge of his subject is profound, but even more impressive is the judicious sympathy with which he expounds Cassian's teaching. His book is undoubtedly a major contribution to the history of Christian spirituality.

DURHAM

GERALD BONNER

St Augustine, *The city of God against the pagans*. Edited and translated by R. W. Dyson. (Cambridge Texts in the History of Political Thought.) Pp. xxxiii + 1247. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1998. £45 (cloth), £15.95 (paper). 0 521 46475 7; 0 521 46843 4

Considering its importance, both in the Augustinian *corpus* and in the context of wider interests, the *City of God* has not been well served by translations. Its mammoth length has tempted most of its more recent translators and publishers to abridge the text, inevitably in a fashion more or less arbitrary. The older complete versions, whatever their merits, tend to lack either accuracy or readability by modern readers. All this is now remedied by R. W. Dyson's

translations. Wisely resisting the temptation to abridge by leaving out what is likely to be of little interest to students of political thought, he gives a complete version. It reads remarkably well; it is elegant, generally succeeds in reproducing the rhetorical colouring Augustine frequently gives his argument, and, where I have checked it, is remarkably faithful to the text. A short but helpful introduction (marred only by some insignificant slips) provides the necessary information about the context of the work, and summarises the main points of Augustine's political thought. Footnotes are for the most part confined to giving the necessary references. Useful biographical notes include Roman deities, heroes and other persons likely to be unknown to many modern readers. The book is handsome and well-produced; the only disappointment is the omission of the chapter-subdivisions, which will make its use in chasing and giving references unnecessarily awkward.

NOTTINGHAM

R. A. MARKUS

Christian dualist heresies in the Byzantine world c. 650–c. 1450. Translated and annotated by Janet Hamilton and Bernard Hamilton, with Yuri Stoyanov. (Manchester Medieval Sources.) Pp. xvii + 327 incl. 2 maps. Manchester: Manchester University Press, 1998. £45 (cloth), £16.99 (paper).
o 7190 4764 1; o 7190 4765 X

Medieval dualism in western Europe had its origins in the Byzantine world. In this very useful volume the Hamiltons have made available English translations of substantial selections from all the key texts for dualism in the Balkans and Asia Minor, including Peter of Sicily's *History of the Paulicians*, Theophylact Lekapenos's letter to Emperor Peter of Bulgaria, Cosmas the Priest's *Against the Bogomils*, Euthymios of the Periblepton's anti-Bogomil letter, Euthymios Zigabenos's *Dogmatic panoply*, the materials associated with the condemnation of the monk Niphon and the *Synodikon* of Boril. They also translate for the first time the unpublished anti-Bogomil treatise of Manuel I's Pisan advisor, Hugo Eteriano, which sheds most valuable light on the culture of the Komnenian court, and an interesting collection of Latin texts important for dualism in late medieval Bosnia and Bulgaria. In the short introduction the Hamiltons stress that both Paulicians and Bogomils were Christians, with cults largely based on a peculiar reading of familiar Christian texts. For most of the eighth century at least, the Paulicians were not officially regarded as heterodox, and even after that the slowness to persecute puts the culture and organisation of the Byzantine Church in an interesting perspective. It is a pity that the book is not longer. It would have been well worth while finding room for a full translation of Cosmas the Priest's treatise, including his fascinating sections on the shortcomings of the orthodox, and for a fuller commentary. It is also a pity that the volume was not subjected to more rigorous critical scrutiny. The translations from the Greek are not completely reliable, and the references need checking and completing. Several of the editions of Byzantine sources used have been long superseded, in at least one case significantly affecting the sense: for example, p. 165 – *epigambreias* is a verb not a place name. In some cases too a secondary account has been translated

when a more informative primary version exists elsewhere. This is a collection to be warmly welcomed, but it deserves a second edition with the errors ironed out.

ST PETER'S COLLEGE,
OXFORD

MARK WHITTOW

Medieval art. Recent perspectives. A memorial tribute to C. R. Dodwell. Edited by Gale R. Owen-Crocker and Timothy Graham. Pp. xv + 253, incl. frontispiece and 101 figs + 8 colour plates. Manchester–New York: Manchester University Press, 1998. £45. 0 7190 4992 X

Reg Dodwell, who died in 1994, made a fundamental contribution to the internationalising of the study of English medieval art. Best known for his studies of manuscript illumination and painting, Dodwell's work on Canterbury, Reichenau, St Albans, written evidence for the nature of Anglo-Saxon art, Theophilus' well-known text *De diversis artibus*, the Old English illustrated Hexateuch, the Bayeux Tapestry and indeed the entire history of European painting between 800 and 1200, demonstrates a broad and enduring intellectual curiosity. The present volume celebrates aspects of his professional life – Richard Palmer writes on his time as librarian at Lambeth Palace – as well as of those subjects dearest to him. His days in Cambridge are complemented by Timothy Graham's study of Matthew Parker. Peter Lasko and Gale R. Owen-Crocker contribute incisive essays on the Bayeux Tapestry, and his former colleagues at Manchester's Department of History of Art, David O'Connor, Christa Grössinger, Paul Crossley and Jonathan Alexander, present essays on precisely that range of issues whose study has been cultivated by the department he helped to nurture. Crossley and Alexander have contributed essays on important contemporary themes – unity or disunity of planning in late medieval religious art and architecture, and the role of nationalistic presuppositions in the history of art; O'Connor, Grössinger and Zarnecki cover aspects of the media of stone sculpture, stained glass and wood carving; Elizabeth Coatsworth and Jennifer Harris discuss medieval textiles; Sandy Heslop offers an elegant discussion of writing about art in twelfth-century England. No book with an essay by E. H. Gombrich, in this case on Islamic motifs in western art, can easily be neglected. There are rich pickings to be had here.

GONVILLE AND CAIUS COLLEGE,
CAMBRIDGE

PAUL BINSKI

The sacramentary of Echternach. (Paris Bibliothèque Nationale, lat. 9433). Edited by Yitzhak Hen. (Henry Bradshaw Society, 110.) Pp. xii + 560 + 4 plates. Woodbridge: Boydell Press (for the Henry Bradshaw Society), 1997. £35. 1 870252 08 X; 0144 0241

The bulky sacramentary now BN, ms lat. 9433, written at Echternach probably between 895 and 898 and here excellently edited, has figured in several public

exhibitions in the past sixty years, without any informed comment on its anomalous form. Yet it is, in Professor Lapidge's words, 'by any standard one of the most eccentric mass-books of the early Middle Ages'. Its three-book structure, in which the second is the Sanctoral, links it with the 'Old Gelasian' (Vatican BAV. Reg. lat. 316), although as in 'Gregorians' *ordo missae* and Canon are placed at the beginning, and some prayers seem to have the same source; these are, however, heavily outnumbered by ones taken from a supplemented-Gregorian book and from some variety of 'Frankish Gelasian'. The scale of the editorial commentary has been severely constrained by familiar cost-factors; and the Collation Table is strictly limited to the similar prayers in sacramentaries down to the supplemented Hadrianum, except for a few in the late tenth-century Fulda Sacramentary. (This subscriber, for one, would not have objected if the Society had made the edition a two-year one.) Hen draws attention to some of the distinctive features of the prefatory material: no other ninth-century sacramentary has so many *apologiae* (the word is not in fact used here), and indeed only three of them occur in any earlier book, but at least three of the four others will be found in eleventh-century *libelli precum* and no doubt elsewhere; and the following four prayers directed to the Trinity and its Persons which, as he says, do not figure in any early sacramentary are in Carolingian *libelli*, including the earliest of all. For whom was the book intended? Hen implies, without categorically stating, that it was for the Echternach community itself, and there is certainly internal evidence justifying this. Some features, and three distinctive rubrics in particular, may point elsewhere. The first is *Si defunctorum nomina recitanda sunt dicis* to the canon's second *Memento etiam domine famulorum* etc., the only reported comparable one being in the *Paduense* Gregorian where, however, it ends *dicente diacono*; the second is the first rubric of the baptismal *ordo secundum gelasium* [not *secundum Gelasianum*, as in the introduction p. 37] *super electos ad catecumenum faciendum*, which begins 'Primus presbiter in portico ecclesiae stet', where – quite exceptionally – he pronounces a short exorcism over the *infantes* brought to him! and the third is a rubric in the *agenda mortuorum* beginning 'in ecclesia autem requiescit corpus defuncti', perhaps reflecting the efforts by the contemporary Trier archbishop Ratold to get the laity to move their traditional wakes into their church. Could this indicate that the sacramentary was designed for use in a rural church dependent on the community (which in the 890s was probably one of canons rather than of monks)?, raising the possibility that there would once have been several – even many – copies, although doubtless with omissions and other variations. None of this, of course, conflicts with the editor's suggestion, with obviously important consequences, that its 'Old Gelasian' elements lead us back to the liturgy brought to continental Europe by Willibrord.

ST ANDREWS

D. A. BULLOUGH

The Cistercians in medieval art. By James France. Pp. ix + 278 incl. map, 174 black-and-white + 26 colour plates. Stroud: Sutton Publishing, 1998. £30. 0 7509 1583 558

The 900th anniversary of the foundation of Cîteaux seems to have inspired the publication or republication of several lavishly illustrated books on the art of the

order. One thinks of G. Duby's *L'art cistercien* (1976, 1989, 1998), whose illustrations are barely related to the text; of F.-K. Freiherr von Linden's *Die Zisterzienser in Europa* (1997), essentially a picture-book of scenic sites; of G. Desmons's *Mystères et beauté des abbayes cisterciennes* (1996), whose tone and content are admirably reflected in its title. These books, as also the multi-author *Studies in Cistercian Art and Architecture* series published by Cistercian Studies, Kalamazoo, and the superlatively illustrated, two-volume *L'Art cistercien* in the Zodiaque series, are all concerned in one way or another with Cistercian art and architecture *per se*. James France's *The Cistercians in medieval art*, by contrast, explores how Cistercians were actually depicted in the Middle Ages, whether by themselves or by others. As the author explains (pp. vii–viii), he has ‘not been concerned with artistic styles and forms...but with seeing what a historian of monastic life can glean from the images that show the daily lives of monks and nuns, of their communities and leaders, of their spirituality, and of the way the Order developed in the course of the Middle Ages’. Chapters i–v examine the Benedictine background to the Cistercians, the origin and growth of the new order, St Bernard of Clairvaux (the earliest known depiction of whom, incidentally, shows him writing, not blessing as is stated: colour plate 7), and several other luminaries, such as Aelred of Rievaulx and Otto of Freising. In each case a short account of the person or events in question is followed by an examination of the way in which they were depicted. Chapters vi–xii apply the same approach to the themes of ‘the monastic community’, ‘abbots’, ‘lay brothers’, ‘nuns’, ‘*opus dei*’, ‘*labor manuum*’ and ‘*lectio divina*’, with a final chapter on ‘internal temptations’ and ‘external criticism’. The discussion is always informative, and the juxtaposition of artistic and historical evidence is invariably interesting and sometimes very telling: it is shown, for instance, that most representations of lay brothers date from the later Middle Ages when their numbers were declining, and so would seem to represent a conscious evocation of a former ‘golden age’. The author is *au fait* with a broad range of Cistercian foundations, and draws on a correspondingly wide selection of visual sources, extending right across Europe (some of them hitherto obscure and little reproduced). The book is well-illustrated – although it is to be regretted that the designer decided to make some of the plates the size of postage stamps (illustration 135, for instance, reduces an original measuring 3 × 3 ft. to less than 2 × 2 inches, with predictable effect). One pertinent theme that is not addressed directly is whether there was ever a significant distinction between the way the order and its members were depicted in non-Cistercian sources as opposed to Cistercian ones; *ex silentio* the book implies there was not. The arrangement of the material also tends to conceal the enormous differences in the popularity and distribution of the different types of images: depictions of St Bernard, for instance, were fairly ubiquitous, while those of Cistercian lay brothers were definitely not. But these are minor criticisms of a volume which admirably fulfils its stated purpose. And if the iconographic evidence adds little that is startlingly new to our knowledge of the Cistercian order, it is nevertheless a useful reminder of the extent to which visual imagery as opposed to texts promulgated and perpetuated its history and myth. Overall, this is an enjoyable and informative

book, well-produced and modestly priced, which has much to recommend it to historian, art historian and general reader alike.

UNIVERSITY OF KENT,
CANTERBURY

RICHARD GAMESON

Cathedral shrines of medieval England. By Ben Nilson. Pp. x + 276, incl. frontispiece, 16 plates, 10 tables and 17 graphs. Woodbridge: Boydell Press, 1998. £40.
0 85115 540 5

This is a valuable first book on a large and rather neglected subject. The author takes his subject down to the end of the Middle Ages, in order to address a simple but important question for historians of religion and religious practice, as well as of church art and architecture: how popular did the cult of the saints remain in its late period? His answer is that pilgrimage to cathedral shrines remained popular between the pre-Conquest period and the sixteenth century. Within this period shrines underwent periods of greater and lesser popularity, with significant upswings – depending partly on the status of the saint in question – around the time of the Black Death and the later fourteenth century, with a period of relative stability throughout much of the fifteenth century, notwithstanding competition from other religious attractions and the rising cost of the process of canonisation itself. Marian shrines and the few cults centred on parish churches play a lesser role in this account. The author arrives at his conclusions systematically by examining the origins of shrines and the processes of translation, the physical character of shrines within their architectural setting, the role and behaviour of pilgrims and the administration of shrines and their revenues. This last section enables the author to plot shrine revenues, which are here taken to be a measure of shrine popularity, and to produce an eloquent series of graphs of offerings to both major and minor shrines at Canterbury, Ely, Norwich, Lincoln, Hereford, Durham and Westminster. These fascinating figures will captivate any students of late medieval society and art or architecture. Taken at face value they indicate a variety of patterns. In some cases, for example at Canterbury, Ely, Norwich and Lincoln, a marked and sometimes spectacular upswing is apparent in shrine revenues from around 1340, prior to the main outbreak of the plague, followed by a downward curve towards 1400. St Edward at Westminster rose eloquently in favour between the late 1340s and about 1370 before plummeting during the reign of Richard II – the one king of the period who revived his cult. Other shrines were obviously more evanescent. The manner in which the author interprets his findings from an examination of the various accounts for such revenues may provoke some debate; but he is careful to factor demographic change and price inflation into his reckoning. Other areas demand further work. It would be especially profitable to consider in greater detail the matter of access to shrines and how it was gained (is evidence for floor abrasion in the vicinity of high altar screen doorways necessarily evidence for mass pilgrimage access via the sanctuary of cathedral churches, or for regular circumambulation of altars for the purpose of incensing altars as prescribed in the Use of Sarum, for example?) and, on this basis, to assemble evidence for what, aside from making donations, pilgrims actually did at shrines. In general, Nilson's text is carefully considered and

researched, and will provide a basis for understanding this still poorly understood aspect of English religious culture.

GONVILLE AND CAIUS COLLEGE,
CAMBRIDGE

PAUL BINSKI

St Francis of Assisi. The legend and the life. By Michael Robson. Pp. xxvi + 294.
London: Geoffrey Chapman, 1997. £20. 0 225 66736 3

Michael Robson has taken on the arduous task of writing a new biography of the much-loved but highly controversial patron saint of Italy, Francis of Assisi. In a field thronged with accounts, finding an original approach was presumably crucial. Robson's solution is to examine the early fraternity as a whole, framing the main body of the book around studies of the individuals whose careers illuminate the life of Francis. Thus we have chapters on the saint's father, Peter Bernardone, on Bishop Guido of Assisi, on Pope Innocent III, on Lady Poverty (an ingenious choice), on Cardinal Ugolino (later Pope Gregory IX), on Anthony of Padua and on Clare. The closing chapters look at Francis's preaching, his death, burial and posthumous influence. This structure allows for the exploration of central issues through the experience of individuals: the chapter on Anthony includes discussion of mission and theological study in the fraternity, that on Clare, relations with women, on Ugolino the thorny question of relations with the Curia. Robson writes as a friar Conventual, in the venerable spirit of conciliation promoted by Bonaventure, and challenges some of the widely disseminated tradition stemming from Sabatier. Faults are not glossed over, but it is no surprise to find Ugolino's role defended or the great basilica built to house the saint's remains explained. Up-to-date mini-biographies of the main figures in the fraternity include details such as on Lisbon in the twelfth century as part of Anthony's background, which bring the whole to life. This group approach also has the advantage of drawing attention to the network which made the fraternity and indeed, Francis' official sanctity, possible. It might well make an interesting course framework: each figure introduces new issues but allows for recapitulation. In a single volume, however, it produces too much duplication: the necessary explanation of shared ideas, events and ties with each other and Francis overlaps too frequently. Robson wishes to convey something of the medieval Italian context and, like Francis, to establish a vivid visual record for his audience. This leads to some of the best writing, about the martyr-cults, squares and cathedrals of thirteenth-century Umbria. It is unfortunate, however, that contextual illustration is frequently chronologically or geographically wide of the mark: the Pastons are cited to illustrate 'feudal' paternal control, Bede is the source for the key position of Rome. By contrast, biblical images often lack any introductory gloss, an area where the average history undergraduate who may use this book would certainly benefit from guidance. There is an unconvincing mixture of careful primary source analysis with dependence on student textbooks. Widely-acknowledged ideas (such as the growing urbanism of the twelfth century) are inappropriately attributed to a single recent author as though they had been the first to make the point. Other historians' views and revisions are introduced (for example, that Francis was not the initiator of nativity re-enactments), Moorman's

views in particular are subject to analysis, but others are only intermittently discussed and too few details are footnoted. For example, we are told that the monastery where Francis worked has been identified, but not how or by whom (p. 101). It is also a pity that the copy-editor did not do a better job: 'stigamta' [*sic*] does not have quite the right ring, Grundmann is spelt 'Grudundmann' throughout. The Francis loved by generations is here, attempting to have larks protected, convincing great and small to try his way, but not all aspects of the account are successful.

UNIVERSITY OF ST ANDREWS

FRANCES ANDREWS

Guillelmi Duranti Rationale divinatorum officiorum V–VI. Edited by A. Davril OSB and T. M. Thibodeau. (Corpus Christianorum, Continuatio Medievals, 140 A.) Pp. 621 incl. colour frontispiece. Turnhout: Brepols, 1998.
2 503 04403 4; 2 503 04404 2; 2 503 03000 9

This volume continues the critical edition of the major work of William Durandus (c. 1230–96), the first portion of which (bks I–IV) was published in the same series in 1995 (reviewed this JOURNAL XLVIII (1997), 347–48). Without additional introductory remarks, the present volume (covering bks V and VI) begins immediately with the text. Book V concerns the canonical hours, discussing in detail the elements and texts, prayers and responses, of which they are composed. Beginning with the night offices, it runs through lauds, prime, tierce, sext, none, vespers and compline. Book VI, which is far longer, concerns the feast days of the liturgical year, beginning with advent and including both fixed and movable feasts. In the context of Holy Week, chapters on penance, baptism and confirmation are included. This section of Durandus' work will be of particular interest to scholars concerned with the symbolic meaning and practice of the liturgical services of the ecclesiastical year, dominical sermons, and the texts included in these services in the thirteenth to fifteenth centuries. The quality of the edition, with its detailed apparatus to the sources used by Durandus and the canonistic references found in the margin of the manuscripts, matches the high level of critical scholarship established by the first volume.

UNIVERSITY OF WISCONSIN–MADISON

WILLIAM J. COURTENAY

Medicine and religion c. 1300. The case of Arnau de Vilanova. By Joseph Ziegler. (Oxford Historical Monographs.) Pp. x+342. Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1988. £45. 0 19 820726 3

In this dense monograph Joseph Ziegler directs his attention to two *foci*. First, he examines the case of the Catalan physician and lay theologian Arnau de Vilanova (c. 1238–1311), an attendant to several popes whose spiritual works came under repeated scrutiny by inquisitors. Second, he controls the conclusions of this examination by comparing Arnau's work with that of other contemporary physicians who ventured into spiritual matters, in particular, Galvano da Levanto (fl. 1300), and with contemporary preachers who drew on medical learning, in particular the Dominican Giovanni da San Gimignano (d. c. 1300). He calls the results of this research, 'an incomplete and imperfect, provisional

thesis' (p. 276). His thesis is that, contrary to the common perception, there was no marked tension between theology and medicine as disciplines during this period, and that Arnau's conflicts with church authorities cannot be linked to his medical learning *per se*. In particular, he finds that Arnau's medical writing was pretty much isolated from supernatural and theological concerns, while his eschatology, which came under suspicion, was typically Franciscan Reformist and uninfluenced by his medical work. He concludes that 'there is no evidence that Arnau's exposure to natural philosophy and in particular to Aristotelian ideas led him into theological heterodoxy' (p. 270). On the other hand, comparisons of his writing with that of other physicians shows that a shift of concern from matters of bodily health to those of spiritual health was not unnatural, even if Arnau is less overtly moralising in his medicine than Galvano. Such a shift could be justified by the belief that spiritual health played a role in bodily health. Reciprocally, the writings of Giovanni of San Gimignano and other contemporary preachers show that 'high-level medical language' had become common religious discourse, that is to say theological writers and preachers drew on academic medical treatises and encyclopaedia for *exempla*. He notes that these clerical authors use more complex medical language than Arnau does in his own spiritual writing. In short, the increasing disciplinary compartmentalisation, which isolated academic theology and medicine, did not prevent 'reciprocal movements' of ideas and language. This seems especially true outside the university environment. Preachers occasionally criticise physicians, usually for undervaluing spiritual healing, and physicians occasionally criticise clerics for venality, but outside monastic circles there seems little evidence of religious fear or hostility to medicine. Indeed, it was 'normal for physicians and priests to cooperate' (p. 267). He closes by suggesting that future research be directed to testing these hypotheses for theologising physicians outside southern Europe.

UNIVERSITY OF OREGON

AUGUSTINE THOMPSON OP

Nicolaus Minorita, Chronica. Documentation on Pope John XXII, Michael of Cesena and the Poverty of Christ, with summaries in English. A source book. Edited by Gedeon Gál OFM and David Flood OFM. Pp. 30* + 1238. New York: Franciscan Institute, St Bonaventure University, 1996. \$68. 1 57659 118 2

The *Chronicle* of Nicolaus Minorita, identified by the editors of this volume as Nicholas of Freising, *sectator et amicus fidelis* of Michael of Cesena (p. 938), is a treasure store for the historian of the early fourteenth-century papacy, the empire and the Franciscan order. The chronicler provides a brief account of the immensely important controversy about apostolic poverty between the papacy and the minister-general, Michael of Cesena, and his adherents, among them the Emperor Louis IV of Bavaria, Bonagratia of Bergamo and William of Ockham. Nicholas's narrative provides bridge passages between the major documents generated by the struggle – letters, declarations, appeals, papal decretals, imperial constitutions and treatises – from John XXII's *Quia Nonnumquam* (1322) through to Louis of Bavaria's *Fidem catholicam* and *Licet iuris* (1338), concluding with a 'beautiful and useful' ('pulcher et utilis'), but anonymous, tract on papal

power. Gedeon Gál is to be congratulated on the splendid achievement of assembling in one volume and meticulously editing from manuscript all the *Chronicle's* contents, hitherto edited or extracted in scattered publications. He has taken as his basic manuscript Paris, Bibliothèque nationale, ms lat. 5154, but has made substantial use of four others. In particular, he has edited (pp. 624–866) Michael of Cesena's 'prolix' Munich appeal against John xxii's *Quia Vir Reprobus* (26 Mar. 1330) in its entirety for the first time from ms Vat. lat. 4009, a handbook of documents from Michael of Cesena's Munich chancery, probably used by the chronicler: Nicholas himself witnessed the appeal (p. 865). Gál has also identified the majority of the citations in the documents. The volume has indices of manuscripts and of names and authorities, and also provides brief biographical notes on eleven of the main protagonists. David Flood's brief survey on Franciscan poverty, extending from the lifetime of Francis to the opening of the *Chronicle* in 1321, and the summaries of the documents are, as intended, useful for those unwilling or unable to read the Latin. It is therefore regrettable that the standard is less scholarly than that of the edition. They are, in fact, written in colloquial American rather than English, with an intrusive disregard for the use of both prepositions and the definite article. There are also a number of misprints: for example, p. 23* 'of of'; p. 4 'a case... which they thought fit the circumstances'; p. 18 'personnages'; p. 1158 'incompatability'; p. 1160 'Innocent III's *Venerabiles*'. The list could be extended. Sometimes the translation is anachronistic: for example, 'the holy Roman Catholic Church' (p. 615) for 'the holy Roman Church, catholic and apostolic' (p. 626). The chronicler was an unashamed partisan of Michael of Cesena, and this has rubbed off on his English commentator: 'John [xxii] heaps insults on Michael's poor head' (p. 475). Despite these reservations about the volume, it is an important publication and will be an indispensable research tool for many years to come.

UNIVERSITY OF EAST ANGLIA

DIANA WOOD

Studien zum Patriarchatsregister von Konstantinopel II. By Herbert Hunger and Otto Kresten. (Österreichische Akademie der Wissenschaften Philosophisch-Historische Klasse Sitzungsberichte, 647.) Pp. 218. Vienna: Verlag der Österreichischen Akademie der Wissenschaften, 1997. öS 450. 3 7001 2669

7

Those working in earlier periods of Byzantine church history look with envy at the fourteenth-century patriarchal register, but may pause to wonder why it has remained relatively unexploited, despite appearing as long ago as 1860–2 in a reasonably accurate edition. One hopes that the new edition of the register (under the auspices of the Austrian Academy of Sciences) will awaken new interest. The studies under review are intended as a partial accompaniment to the second volume of the new edition which appeared in 1995 and took the text down to 1350. It begins with a magisterial and minute examination of the language of the register by Professor Hunger who has presided over the enterprise. He urges that the apparent carelessness on the part of patriarchal notaries points to the subtlety and plasticity of the Greek. Most of the book is taken up by Otti Kresten's examination of the Tome of 1341 which vindicated

the mystical theology of Gregory Palamas. This is perhaps the most important document published in the second volume. As with virtually all Byzantine theology citing of authorities was the essential. The Tome therefore consists to a very large extent of citations, many of which have not been identified. This is what Kresten sets out to do in a show of impressive erudition, for which many will be grateful. As a postscript there is a new edition and translation of the well-known confession of Paul Tagaris, 'the bogus patriarch'.

UNIVERSITY OF EDINBURGH

MICHAEL ANGOLD

'*First the bow is bent in study*'. *Dominican education before 1350*. By M. Michèle Mulchahey. (Studies and Texts, 132.) Pp. xxi+618. Toronto: Pontifical Institute of Mediaeval Studies, 1998. \$110. 0 88844 132 0; 0082 5328

Medieval Dominican history is easily misinterpreted if excessive attention is paid to exceptional figures like St Albert and Aquinas, and to special situations like the friars' involvement with universities. It is Mulchahey's laudable aim to provide an antidote by examining the order's educational system as a whole, from the humblest convent schools to the *studia generalia*. As she says, this is the context in which Dominican teachers and students worked, and the background from which Dominican preaching came. No such study has previously been undertaken on this scale; '*First the bow is bent*' is an important contribution, not just to Dominican history, but to medieval intellectual history in general. The work is in three parts, of which the second, dealing with the order's various kinds of academic institution, is the most original and the most significant. The author draws on a wide range of sources, but, as she sometimes reminds us, it is often unclear how far their relevance can be generalised; she herself, in much of what she says about provincial *studia*, seems to forget the complete absence of evidence for major provinces like France and England. It is also wrong to say that legislation governing the sending of students to Paris goes back to the general chapter of 1220; from its place in the manuscript, the relevant text was certainly added later, and it is in any case doubtful whether 'ad studium' means 'to the *studium*' or simply 'for the purposes of study'. Nevertheless, Mulchahey makes some valuable points, showing, *inter alia*, that the *fratres communes* probably received a more solid theological formation than has been supposed, and that Dominican education was less dependent on the model of Paris than has generally been believed; she also produces evidence to suggest that the result of the 1259 *ratio studiorum* was merely to incorporate logic, not philosophy as a whole, into the order's syllabus (though here too it is important to remember our lack of information about most provinces). The first part of the book, on the order's formative period, relies heavily on some questionable 'received wisdom' on such subjects as the reasons for the dispersal of the brethren in 1217 and the origin of Dominican provinces; happily this does not generally affect the author's main topic, but she assumes too confidently that innovative legislation about study in the Constitutions goes back to 1216 rather than to 1200 or later. The third part of the book deals with certain kinds of literature produced for the instruction of the brethren, and it is a pity that it is not more closely linked to what has gone before. In particular, Mulchahey is not always attentive to questions of circulation and so does not really address the question of which books were

actually available to the majority of the brethren. Humbert of Romans's *De eruditione praedicatorum*, for instance, to which she devotes some pages (and repeats standard myths about its structure and contents, which I exploded in 1989 in my contribution to T. L. Amos and others, *De ore domini*), appears to have enjoyed little success in the order, and there is manuscript evidence that it had already disintegrated by the end of the thirteenth century, with bits of the *materia praedicabilis* circulating anonymously on their own. She also ignores one important surviving link between Paris and a conventual school, namely the notebook of Erkenfrid, to which Kaeppli drew attention in the *Archivum Fratrum Praedicatorum* xxxix (1969), and one probably significant kind of literature designed precisely to supplement the meagre libraries of smaller convents. It is easy enough to pick holes like this in Mulchahey's book, which is not surprising since it is in many ways an exploration of uncharted territory; but in spite of its flaws it is an impressive work which scholars in the field will ignore at their peril.

ISTITUTO STORICO DOMENICANO,
ROME

SIMON TUGWELL OP

Marriage in Italy 1300–1650. Edited by Trevor Dean and K. J. P. Lowe.
Pp. xi + 304 incl. 10 ills. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1998.
£40. 0 521 55402 0

From sacrament to contract. Marriage, religion, and law in the western tradition. By John Witte, Jr. (The Family, Religion, and Culture.) Pp. xii + 315. Louisville, KY: Westminster John Knox Press, 1997. \$24 (paper). 0 664 25543 4

The editorial team of Trevor Dean and Kate Lowe has produced an important volume of thirteen essays on marriage in late medieval and early modern Italy. Most noteworthy of its contents is David d'Avray's provocative contribution, which should be required reading. D'Avray, while attacking fuzzy thinking by scholars in the field, asks whether a priest's presence was required for a licit marriage after 1215. He concludes that it was not, and that 'lay religion could be unclerical without being anticlerical' (p. 115). This is a welcome corrective to much current writing, which confuses and conflates the two notions. Trevor Dean's essay on marriage laws and marriage disputes in Bologna from 1200 to 1500 is particularly valuable because of its wide chronological sweep, and because it locates Bologna in a larger comparative framework. Stanley Chojnacki's study of Venetian secular marriage legislation from 1420 to 1535 shows the increased involvement of the state in dowries and *corredi*. His dichotomy between 'the state' and the overspending fathers seems to be a false one, however. What Chojnacki describes as an usurpation of paternal power, however, is really more a surrender – a sort of 'stop me before I spend again' impulse – since the men making the laws are the very ones whose authority was being restricted. This is, nevertheless, a fascinating essay. Kate Lowe's piece showing the parallels between ceremonies incorporating young women into convents and secular marriage rituals is superb. Her use of iconographic evidence, as well as the wide chronological and geographical sweep of the essay, makes it particularly appealing. Also of interest are contributions by Patricia Allerston on used and rented wedding finery in Venice, Jacqueline Musacchio on the sudden growth in the fifteenth century of interest in decorative depictions of the story of the Sabine

women, Piet van Boxel on the use of dowries to stimulate Jewish conversions to Christianity, Stephen Kolsky on authorial manipulation of prominent women's biographies to suggest active roles for women, and Giulia Calvi on the priority given to remarried Tuscan widows in caring for children from their prior marriages. As in any volume like this, there are some weak spots. The editors spend almost two-thirds of their introduction trying to make sense of a section of three essays on intermarriage patterns. The effort does not entirely pay off. Finally, Linda Guzzetti's essay on marital breakdown in fourteenth-century Venice suffers from sweeping generalisations based on little evidence and unconvincing conclusions about the 'slight' role of the Church in Venetian marriage cases.

This collection suffers from the lack of coherence that is virtually inevitable when treating such a big topic over such a long period of time (actually even longer than the title indicates) in such a diverse territory. It is not intended to be a comprehensive treatment of the subject. Nevertheless, there are some striking absences. Although half the people who got married were men, this is essentially a volume about women. The history of marriage is not a subset of women's history. If we are to understand the experience of marriage in any place and time, we need to pay more attention to men. These criticisms are not meant to drive away potential readers. This book is easy to recommend for those interested in the field. Specialists, reading selectively, will find many things of interest and value.

If Dean and Lowe's volume is a careful ground-level view of thirteen trees, John Witte's book is an aerial photograph of the forest – or, at least, of a large swath of it. Witte, a professor of law and ethics, has written a synthesis of recent historical scholarship which also succeeds as a highly original and stimulating vision of law and theology in the medieval and early modern periods. Witte observes that Christian marriage has, from its origins, been seen in four different ways. It has been a spiritual or sacramental association subject to the Church's authority, a social estate subject to the laws and values of society, a voluntary association subject to personal and familial desires, and a created institution subject to natural laws expressed in reason, conscience and the Bible. These four perspectives are complementary, but also in some tension because they each 'are linked to competing claims of ultimate authority over ... marriage' (p. 2). In the Middle Ages, it was the sacramental perspective that came to dominate. This does not mean that the other perspectives vanished, but only that they were subordinated and that the Church's claims to authority largely triumphed. The Council of Trent affirmed the Church's medieval vision of marriage, and early modern Catholicism continued to give primacy to the sacramental perspective.

In those areas that rejected Roman authority, Witte sees no consensus on what would replace the sacramental perspective. Rather, he sees three distinct models emerge. The first, which he associates with Lutherans, saw marriage as a social estate rather than a spiritual one. Although created by God, marriage was for human, social ends. As such, it was subject to the State and not the Church. The second model, which Witte associates with Calvinism, saw marriage as a covenant involving God and the entire community. Since marriage was both a sacred and a civil covenant, Church and State shared responsibility for teaching and enforcing marital norms. This model saw marriage as sacred without being sacramental, and as social without being secular. What Witte calls the Anglican

model emphasised a larger vision of marriage: that it was 'a little commonwealth' – that it was all the things described above and more. In England, marriage was seen as created to serve the good of the family, the community, the church and the kingdom. This special emphasis accounts for some of the peculiarities of English marriage law, most notably its refusal to permit divorce. It was in the Enlightenment that the purely contractual model, which stressed the private and voluntary nature of marriage, emerged. This model is more influential in the twentieth century than it was in its own time.

It is impossible, in a brief review, to do justice to the subtlety and depth of Witte's book. In arguing for the dominance of these models in certain places and within certain traditions, Witte never tries to claim too much. Constructing models is a dangerous business, and leaves the author vulnerable to accusations of oversimplifying and ignoring inconvenient evidence. Witte is guilty of neither of these. For those who like their histories of marriage populated with actual wives and husbands, this will not be a satisfying book. Although Witte does include an occasional case study, his book is really about ideas. Those who believe that ideas do matter will find the book stimulating and helpful. With so many specialist studies of marriage in particular places and times now available, it is especially valuable to have such a book to guide us towards a coherent vision of this aspect of our past.

GUSTAVUS ADOLPHUS COLLEGE

ERIC JOSEF CARLSON

The convent and the community in late medieval England. Female monasteries in the diocese of Norwich, 1350–1540. By Marilyn Oliva. (Studies in the History of Medieval Religion, 12.) Pp. xiv + 272 incl. map and 22 tables. Woodbridge: Boydell Press, 1998. £50. 0 85115 576 6; 0955 2480

The constant comparison of medieval female religious with their more visible, wealthy and power-conscious male counterparts has led to a negative image of the former. Starting from this premise, Marilyn Oliva uses the techniques of prosopography to draw conclusions which question this image as well as some commonly-held assumptions about religious life in the later Middle Ages. By making extensive use of wills as well as of the more conventional sources, Oliva is able to identify and determine the social status of 553 nuns who lived in the diocese over a two-century time-span and on this basis to reconstruct a social history of the monasteries to which they belonged. She demonstrates that these nuns, contrary to most modern belief, were drawn mainly from the families of parish gentry who lived close to the monasteries in question. Furthermore they probably chose deliberately to live in relative poverty, isolation and physical degradation as these were integral aspects of female monasticism, piety and spirituality in the later Middle Ages and indeed in keeping with the basic tenets of medieval monasticism. Thus the prevailing view which sees meagre endowment of female monasteries leading to indigence and financial mismanagement is challenged not so much in fact as in interpretation. Other sources look at religious life both within the monastery and in the social community and reveal that these women, many of whom were literate, experienced success as household managers as well as providing for the poor and needy, extended hospitality to visitors and patrons and, of course, carried out their daily offices of

prayer and spiritual exercises. She cites data which lead to the inference that despite the bias in church and society in favour of monks and canons, the nuns in her study had a positive self-image: her study takes her beyond the Dissolution to examine the fate of the nuns who were expelled from their monasteries and she concludes that most of them remained loyal to the Church and to their vocation.

Oliva suggests that in many ways her nuns are representative of the rest of England. This is an area which may need further exploration. She does note elsewhere that the diocese of Norwich was home to many anchoresses. It would be helpful to know if the particular religious climate of the diocese gave rise to any aspects of religious life which were distinctive to the area. One question which remains unanswered is the extent to which the particular religious Rule – Benedictine, Augustinian or the modified Rule of St Clare adopted by the Poor Clares at Bruisyard Abbey – caused any perceptible difference in the religious expression of the nuns in question.

An otherwise masterly work is marred by some imprecisions, and it is especially unfortunate that these relate to the social status of the founders of nunneries in the diocese, a matter which is so central to the main argument of the book. In particular, her statement (p. 209) that ‘most’ of the founders were of middling social status is not corroborated by the earlier discussion (pp. 12ff.), where only four such cases are noted.

While study of female monastic houses is a burgeoning discipline, nevertheless most research has been confined to Ireland and the continent, leaving English nuns, especially those in the later Middle Ages, largely ignored. This book will help to redress that imbalance.

NEW SOUTH WALES,
AUSTRALIA

BERENICE KERR

The boys of the Archangel Raphael. A youth confraternity in Florence, 1411–1785. By Konrad Eisenbichler. Pp. xi + 474 incl. frontispiece + 8 plates. Toronto–Buffalo–London: University of Toronto Press, 1998. £36. 0 8020 4329 1

A large literature now commemorates the thousands of confraternities, predominantly lay associations formed for the purpose of accumulating religious merit by every conceivable means, that flourished in Italy between the thirteenth and the eighteenth centuries. There are a few substantial monographs, such as those of Ronald Weissman and John Henderson on Florence and Nicholas Terpstra on Bologna, which survey the whole range of confraternities in a great city at the close of the Middle Ages; there are innumerable journal articles and conference papers, some of which, hamstrung by lack of evidence, go little further than editing statutes and repeating the bald reports of visiting bishops; there are notable studies, including those of Adriano Prosperi and Vincenzo Paglia, which bring out the characteristics of a particular type of confraternity (for these societies fell into at least a dozen overlapping categories, and often moved, with the passage of time, from one to another). The rich archival material enthusiastically exploited by Konrad Eisenbichler enables him to range through an unusually long stretch of time, tracing the history of Florence’s senior youth company from its foundation to its demise. Once favoured by the Medici, it was dissolved by the house of Habsburg-Lorraine amidst general disillusionment with

confraternities that undermined parishes and failed to concentrate on poor relief. Always concerned with education rather than alms-giving, the company dedicated to the Archangel Raphael was designed to substitute godly for laddish behaviour on the part of young people at the dangerous age between about thirteen and twenty-four. It recruited 'for the militia of the Eternal King', but it did not do so by spoiling its members' fun, and gave them ample opportunity to exercise their talents, not only as amateur preachers on moral topics, but also as actors and musicians in sacred plays and oratorios. This youth club seems to have been closer to a company of *laudesi* than to a penitent brotherhood, although its members wore flagellant gowns. Readers of *Crossing the boundaries*, a collection of essays edited by Eisenbichler a few years ago, will expect vivid descriptions of the performance laid on by adolescent actors, and they will not be disappointed. The author has wisely concentrated on celebrating the creative artistry and ritual performance of the brotherhood and its individual members rather than on exploring in depth the economic history of the organisation. Cast into twenty-one short chapters, with many subheadings in each, the book is well adapted to dipping on the part of those who know what they seek. The method makes for some repetition. But the work is unified by a good sense of historical movement – of the bishops' growing suspicion of independent lay activity, of the increasingly sacerdotal and sacramental character of the company's ceremonies, of the deadening process by which it gradually ceased to be an autonomous youth company when its members no longer graduated from it when they came of age.

UNIVERSITY OF MANCHESTER

BRIAN PULLAN

Acta Cusana. Quellen zur Lebensgeschichte des Nikolaus von Kues, I: Lieferung 3a. 1451 Januar–September 5. Edited by Erich Meuthen and Hermann Hallauer. (Heidelberger Akademie der Wissenschaften.) Pp. vii + 442 + loose-leaf chart and endpaper. Hamburg: Felix Meiner, 1996. DM 328. 3 7873 1242 0

This is the third volume to be published in the authoritative series of *acta* concerning the life of Nicholas of Cusa after the first two volumes covering the years 1401 to 1437 (published in 1976) and 1437 to 1450 (published in 1983). Due to the abundance of documents and information regarding Cusa's famous papal legation to the Germanies (January 1451–March 1452), the third volume has had to be divided into two parts, of which this is the first. Following the general plan of the critical edition, it presents more than 700 entries (nos 963–1,689) in chronological order, with the full-title bibliography promised for the second part. Two maps illustrating the course of Cusa's itinerary and a useful list of the thirteen reform decrees issued during his visit supplement the volume. With impeccable diligence and solicitude the entries have been chosen from the most diverse categories of texts, combining thus well-known public and also private documents (including, for example, communal records of expenditure on wine for the cardinal legate), historiographical extracts and critical considerations regarding these sources. A distinctive quality of the volume is the reluctance to give final verdicts on certain aspects of Cusa's activities, such as, for example, the date of the publication of his decree against Jewish money-lending (p. 742 n. 1021). Although not easy for those not proficient in German, this

volume will be an indispensable working tool for anyone interested in German church life before the Reformation.

FLORENCE

LORENZ BÖNINGER

The missionary factor in Ethiopia. Papers from a symposium on the impact of European missions on Ethiopian society, Lund University, August 1996. Edited by Getatchew Haile, Aasuly Lande and Samuel Rubenson. (Studies in the Intercultural History of Christianity, 110.) Pp. x + 222. Frankfurt am Main: Peter Lang, 1998. £24 (paper). 3 631 33259 9; 0 8204 3588 0; 0170 9240

Considering the attention paid to the impact of Christian missions on other parts of Africa in the last fifty years, Ethiopia has generated little published work. In a response to this comparative neglect, the thirteen papers collected in this valuable book were delivered at a symposium which brought together an interdisciplinary group of scholars (from different religious traditions and almost half of them from Ethiopia itself) to review current research and its future directions. Contributions range widely from the sixteenth century to the present, but are dominated by two principal themes. Introduced by Getatchew Haile, essays by Tadesse Tamrat, Merid Wolde Aregay, Sven Rubenson and Donald Crummey focus essentially on the controversial attempts by western Protestant and Roman Catholic missionaries to convert and to build up churches, and on the consequences of these activities, in a country already possessing its own Orthodox Church and missionary tradition. In very different ways Ezra Gebremedhin, Samuel Rubenson, Tekeste Negash, Ayele Teklehaymanot, Johnny Bakke and Eskil Jonsson examine the persistent interest shown by both Orthodox Ethiopians and converts in new denominations, tapping the offerings of the missions for their own advantage while attempting to set limits to the missionary presence and influence. Aasuly Lande reflects on reasons for the loss of a potential ecumenical opportunity, and Richard Gray suggests that Ethiopia with its long Christian history may be able to make an important contribution to the outcome of the general encounter between post-Enlightenment missions and African religious imagination. Although it will be of specific interest to historians of Africa, those concerned with the general issues of religion and cultural identity, sixteenth- and seventeenth-century Roman Catholic missionary enterprise, and the interplay of missions with modern colonialism, will also wish to consult this collection.

KING'S COLLEGE,
LONDON

ANDREW PORTER

Mässa på svenska. Den reformatoriska mässan i Sverige mot den senmedeltida bakgrunden.

By Christer Pahlmbald (Bibliotheca Theologiae Practicae, 60.) Pp. 267.

Lund: Arcus Förlag, 1998. 91 88553 01 9

Franciscans in Sweden. Medieval remnants of Franciscan activities. By Henrik Roelvink.

(Scripta Franciscana.) Pp. xii + 203 incl. 4 surveys and 42 figs. Assen: Van

Gorcum, 1998. Nlg 50. 90 232 3377 8

Pahlmbald's study focuses upon the structure of the ordinary liturgy in Sweden's cathedrals and parish churches during the first years after the Diet of Västerås in 1527, generally known as the 'Reformation Diet', and the religious talks at

Örebro in 1529. Since Reformation history in Sweden has always been written by the victors and interpreted as an uninterrupted story of evangelical preaching from its beginning in Stockholm in 1529, it has been important to the author to state, basing himself upon an analysis of liturgical books, that the Latin mass as a whole or in essential parts provided the normal Sunday service formulary for most Swedish parish churches throughout the 1530s. Since King Gustav Vasa was not personally interested in church matters, he widely tolerated the Latin as well as a Swedish or Swedified mass and even protected conservative groups from being intruded upon by the Reformers. More properly, the author argues, it is the 1544 Diet that deserves to be called the 'Reformation Diet', as he demonstrates the oscillating meaning of the term 'mass in Swedish' as it was used during the 1530s. Highly interesting perspectives on confession and the influence of the sermon in Swedish with its concluding prayers of intercession upon the form of what was to replace the *Canon missae* make this book a necessary and long-desired corrective to earlier works on the same subject, by, for example, Sven Kjällström, Jacob Jacobsson or Åke Andrén. There is an English summary contained in pp. 239–47.

The need for a condensed account of the medieval history of the Franciscan order in Sweden was strongly felt by Fr Henrik Roelvink OFM during the several decades in which he was engaged in pastoral work in Sweden. Amongst his early contributions was the Swedish translation and edition of the writings of St Francis. A collection of his studies on, for example, Franciscan books and manuscripts, on mural paintings showing the *Life* of St Francis in the former convent church of Arboga, and on contact areas between St Birgitta and Franciscan spirituality, all previously published in Swedish, are now presented to an international audience. These ably take into account, and even critically revise recent scholarly works, as, for example, Anna Nilsén's thesis on Franciscan iconographical programmes of mural paintings in churches around Lake Mälaren (1986). The Danish scholar of Scandinavian Franciscan history, Jørgen Nybo Rasmussen, has written the first chapter, to secure for Sweden its proper place in the Franciscan province of Dacia, which covered the three Nordic countries. Roelvink's conclusions from the fragments of a printed Franciscan missal of 1504 are sober and realistic, and his way of treating St Birgitta's alleged membership of the Third Order of St Francis is convincing. He generally draws with care the dividing line between Franciscan impulses and general European trends in the development of late medieval art in Sweden. This is an important and readable study with wide perspectives, of interest to every scholar of medieval Scandinavian and mendicant history.

UNIVERSITY OF ODENSE

TORE NYBERG

Reformed confessions. Theology from Zurich to Barmen. By Jan Rohls. (Columbia Series in Reformed Theology.) (Trans. by John Hoffmeyer of *Theologie reformierter Bekenntnisschriften*, Göttingen: Vandenhoeck and Ruprecht, 1987, 1997.) Pp. xxiii + 311. Louisville, KY: Westminster John Knox Press, 1998. \$5.00
22078 9

This book is a translation of a work which appeared in German in 1987 and apart from an introduction by Jack L. Stotts, it has not been updated. Basically it is a

comparative study of the classical Reformed confessions which aims to point out both their similarities and differences. The main part of the book consists of a very long chapter divided thematically into sections which deal with subjects like revelation, sin, predestination, the covenant and so on. This type of treatment is very valuable for the way in which it highlights important differences within the Reformed family which might easily be missed otherwise. The two historical chapters, on the other hand, are less satisfactory. The one at the end is a very brief recapitulation of what has happened in the Reformed world since 1700, and is best viewed as an appendix to the work as a whole. The first chapter, which explains the origins of the classical confessions, contains some useful information but will leave British readers bewildered. Dr Rohls believes, for example, that the Lambeth Articles of 1595 were the work of Thomas Whitaker and formed part of the Puritan opposition to Anglicanism, and he singles out the Irish Articles of 1615 as the main fore-runner of the Westminster Confession. He does not quite know what to do with the Thirty-Nine Articles, which he sometimes treats as 'Reformed' and sometimes not. The history is decidedly weak, but the comparative theology is well done and will be useful to students of the period. The introduction by Dr Stotts is mainly concerned with recent developments in the United States and (somewhat surprisingly) in Cuba, and is designed to bring the rest of the book up to date. It will be of interest mainly to those who are involved in or concerned with political developments in the different Presbyterian Churches which are mentioned in it, but does not affect the main body of the work in any way.

SAMFORD UNIVERSITY,
BIRMINGHAM,
ALABAMA

GERALD BRAY

Belief and practice in Reformation England. A tribute to Patrick Collinson from his students.

Edited by Susan Wabuda and Caroline Litzenberger. (St Andrews Studies in Reformation History.) Pp. xiv + 293 incl. frontispiece. Aldershot: Ashgate, 1998. £49.95. 1 85928 430 2

This *Festschrift* in honour of Patrick Collinson covers, in articles of almost uniformly high quality, a range of topics in English Reformation history worthy of the master himself. Social and economic history are represented by Beat Kümin writing on the effects of litigation on the cohesion of English parishes and Patrick Carter describing the effects of royal taxation on the Elizabethan episcopate. Seán Hughes, with lapidary precision, examines English Protestant theology on predestination, showing that it is an oversimplification to label it 'Calvinist'. With equal skill, and a profound knowledge of the didactic and controversial literature of the early English Reformation, Susan Wabuda analyses the controversies over women reading the Bible. She concludes that Protestantism led to an acceptance of women reading Scripture and even instructing their children and servants in it, but that women still remained barred from public ministry. (It is a little surprising, however, that Wabuda seems unaware of the work of Shannon McShaffrey, who has come to rather different conclusions on the importance of female Bible-reading among the Lollards.) David Crankshaw contributes a seminal analysis of the Convocation of 1562–3, which not only demolishes William Haugaard's hitherto influential interpretation

of the genesis of the Elizabethan settlement, but has important ramifications for understanding Matthew Parker's episcopate, the progress of evangelical reform in the Elizabethan Church and the enduring influence of the Edwardian Church. On the basis of annotations which Laurence Chaderton made in his books, Arnold Hunt constructs a persuasive, nuanced re-evaluation of this leading Puritan which is only marred by Hunt's tendency to oversimplify Peter Lake's earlier analysis of Chaderton. Another reinterpretation of a well-known Puritan is provided by Alexandra Walsham, who argues that Philip Stubbes, remembered today largely for his diatribe against contemporary manners, the *Anatomie of abuses*, was not only a moralist but also an author who wrote to suit the tastes of the literary market. But were these aspects of Stubbes's writing contradictory or complementary? Walsham implies the former, but the ties between Stubbes and John Foxe, the martyrologist (which Walsham minimises too readily) demonstrate that Stubbes's work was endorsed by figures of unimpeachable godliness. The calendar of martyrs affixed to certain editions of John Foxe's 'Book of Martyrs' is the subject of an article by Damian Nussbaum which has very interesting things to say about the reception and influence of Foxe's martyrology, although it sidesteps the implications of the fact that Foxe was not the author of the calendar. John Craig's piece on Thomas Rogers supplies insights into the clerical networks in Elizabethan Suffolk and illustrates the potential of Combination Lectures for fostering strife rather than solidarity. From the other end of the kingdom, Caroline Litzenger bases a model of limited confessionalisation in Elizabethan England almost entirely on examples from the anomalous diocese of Gloucester. And in an apposite parallel to Collinson's work on the etymology of the term 'Puritan', Kate Peters describes the origins of both the word 'Quaker' and the genesis of Quaker self-identification.

SHEFFIELD

THOMAS FREEMAN

The rhetoric of the Reformation. By Peter Matheson. Pp. x + 267. Edinburgh: T&T Clark, 1998. £23.95. 0 567 08593 7

Matheson offers a set of thematically linked essays on the rhetoric of early German Reformation pamphlets. After a sage and insightful introduction, he begins with a nuanced chapter on the emergence of a public opinion based on 'mini-media' including polemical pamphlets. Next, Matheson tackles the motives of the pamphlet writers using Karlstadt as a representative example. In chapter iv he explores the popularity of the Reformation dialogues through a careful reading of eight works. Chapter v treats the 'vigorous new language' of the pamphlets drawing on works by Martin Luther, Argula von Grumbach and Thomas Müntzer. In chapter vi Matheson examines 'the dynamic thrust of polemic in galvanising public opinion and propagating reform programmes' (p. 160) through a close exposition of Luther's *Prelude on the Babylonian captivity of the Church* (1520) and Karlstadt's *On the abolition of images* (1522). In chapter vi 'The down-side of polemic', he examines how, after the Peasants' War and the collapse of what Blickle has termed the 'communal reformation', polemic slipped into abuse and polarising propaganda. Luther's *The papacy at Rome, founded by the devil* (1545) is subjected to a stinging critique. In his penultimate chapter, 'Mediation and reconciliation: essays at colloquy', Matheson offers a sympathetic reading of Erasmus' *On restoring the concord of the Church* (1533) within the context

of early sixteenth-century attempts to mediate the divisions between the 'Evangelical' and 'Catholic' parties. He closes with a summary essay on 'Reformation rhetoric'. Throughout he offers reliable summaries of significant Reformation pamphlets and deft commentary on their import.

Tying these essays together are two central assertions: first, that rhetoric is not some ornamental addition to the 'message' of the pamphlets, rather it was rhetoric itself that changed peoples' minds; and, second, that it is a 'category mistake' to characterise the pamphlet literature of the early 1520s as 'propaganda'. Few historians would quarrel with the first point, although some historical theologians proceed as if the theology of the pamphlet literature could be abstracted from its rhetorical expression. Whatever the use of such abstraction for contemporary systematic theology, the attempt to separate 'substance' from its 'rhetorical expression' is doomed to misconstrue the theology as it was actually experienced and vitiate all attempts to understand why the theology so influenced sixteenth-century lives. Matheson makes this case persuasively.

On the second point, most of us who have used the word 'propaganda' to describe the polemical exchange of this period would agree with Matheson that some modern connotations of the term, embracing notions of the cynical and deliberate manipulation of mass public opinion, do not rightly characterise many of the early pamphlets, which are intensely personal, confessional and pastoral, inviting the reader into a search for truth. To be sure, the term 'propaganda' has its origin in the early seventeenth century and refers to Roman Catholic attempts systematically to propagate the faith. The connotations of cynical manipulation and mass audiences accrue with time and in different contexts and are not a necessary entailment of the word. Having said this I, for one, shall henceforth eschew the term 'propaganda' when referring to these earlier polemics.

A great strength of this book is Matheson's ability to make wise and penetrating observations. He has a gift for the telling phrase. He offers not merely a study of rhetoric, but an example of how felicitous rhetoric can change the way in which we view things. I have copied out many of these aphoristic observations for later citation in my own writing!

Less happily, Matheson's argument often assumes matters that need to be demonstrated. For example, he scarcely considers whether the pamphlets or authors that he chooses to explicate are truly representative, yet he draws general conclusions from their example. Why Luther, Müntzer, Karlstadt or von Grumbach and not some others? Why the eight dialogues he chose and not some other dialogues? Matheson does not even give authors' names, publication dates or places of publication of these dialogues and generally ignores questions about the range and influence of the works he considers. Why choose Luther's Latin *De captivitate Babylonica* as a representative example of Reformation polemic rather than one of his German works? Why take Karlstadt's assertion of motive at face value? He could be deceiving himself or others. Further, a whiff of anachronistic moralising hovers about some of Matheson's pronouncements. For example, reading at length of the various ways in which Matheson disapproves of the old Luther's most extreme polemics does not deepen our understanding of the sixteenth century. Similarly, his evident admiration of irenic attempts at mediation may tell us more about Matheson and our late twentieth century than the contentious sixteenth.

Finally, it would be nice to think that some of my books or those by Hans Joachim Köhler, Miriam U. Chrisman and others have silenced the critics who contest the influence – complicated and often indirect, but influence none the less – of the printed word on shaping and spreading the Reformation. It would be pleasant if historians could simply assume the relationship between publications by the tiny literate minority (perhaps 5 per cent of the population) and public opinion. But many historians have not been convinced. Throughout his book Matheson is assuming territory as won when it is still being contested. I would have wished for more help from Matheson in this regard.

Still, this is a fine book for those interested in the role of pamphlets in the early Reformation. It is well-written, perceptive and wide-ranging. While assertion may sometimes substitute for demonstration, I think that most of his assertions would be borne out by further research. His instincts are good.

In his conclusion Matheson observes,

Rhetoric, then, is far more than the ornamentation of thought. It is as we struggle for the ‘right’ words to reach out to others, to teach, delight and move them, that we discover what we ourselves really think. In the end of the day, as every speaker and preacher knows, it is not logic but rhetoric which really shifts thought, including our own. As Perelman and others have argued, figurative discourse is itself argumentative, bringing about a change in perspective, focusing the imagination, creating depth and presence, bringing to birth communion between writer and reader. (p. 244)

Matheson manages with his own rhetoric to ‘reach out to others, to teach, delight and move’ his readers, deepening their understanding of the polemical pamphlets of the early Reformation.

ST OLAF COLLEGE

MARK U. EDWARDS, JR

Visitation articles and injunctions of the early Stuart Church, II. Edited by Kenneth Fincham. (Church of England Record Society, 5.) Pp. xxx+295. Woodbridge: Boydell Press (for the Church of England Record Society), 1998. £40. 0 85115 518 9; 1351 3087

The Anglican canons, 1529–1947. Edited by Gerald Bray. (Church of England Record Society, 6.) Pp. cxii+992. Woodbridge: Boydell Press (for the Church of England Record Society, in association with the Ecclesiastical Law Society), 1998. £95. 0 85115 557 X; 1351 3087

In this second volume of visitation articles and injunctions of the early Stuart Church, Kenneth Fincham turns his attention to the years 1625 to 1642. He maintains the same high standard of careful editing on which the reviewer of the earlier volume commented in this JOURNAL xlvii (1996), 385–6, and contributes an equally valuable introduction. Fincham has assembled a collection of articles, extending across every level of the ecclesiastical hierarchy of both provinces, which he divides into eight groups or ‘families’: a convenient arrangement provided it does not lead researchers to concentrate on the ‘parent’ set of each group to the exclusion of the wide range of churchmanship and minute enquiries contained in each set of articles, and the variation in standards aimed at. Among the concerns addressed are the implementing of the royal instructions of 1629; clerical and lay conduct; inappropriate preaching; minute enquiries into the fabric and furnishings of parish churches; churchmanship and ritual matters

backed by Archbishop Laud and his supporters – the care of, and reverence shown to, the altar – and, especially after 1633, the railing in of the altar; the concerns of the anti-Laudians led by John Williams of Lincoln who enquired whether any clergy had ‘introduced any offensive rites... namely, three courtesies towards the communion table’. Questions are now more sharply defined than hitherto, for example not simply whether clergy used the Prayer Book but whether they were turning the confession and absolution into a prayer. The Church of England has never been a monochrome body, as these fascinating records show. Complementing Fincham’s work is Gerald Bray’s massive volume, on canons between 1527 and 1947, with a substantial thrust forward to 1969, and backward to medieval collections of canons. He has used Cardwell’s *Synodalia* I and II as his main source, supplemented by material from Wilkins IV, Mansi, and other documents (manuscript and printed). He has also included lists of office-holders and exhaustive indices. Despite his declared intention to stop at 1947 there is considerable comment on the English canonical legislation of 1964 and 1969. The Scottish canons of 1634 receive consideration (though the later canons of the Scottish Episcopal Church are relegated to a footnote) as do the Irish canons down to 1872. It is here that a difficulty arises. Bray defines ‘Anglican’ as including ‘those churches in the British Isles which are (or were) episcopalian in polity and which are (or were) established by law’. This definition would serve if his study had been strictly historical but by continuing it well into the present century, it is applied in an era where ‘Anglican’ has a much wider meaning than Bray allows. Bray has put an enormous amount of editorial labour into his work, but in a curious way, partly for the above reason, the result creates an impression that he is not entirely clear where he is going, even though his work is a monument to industry.

MONKFIELD COLLEGE,
LEADENHAM

ROBERT PETERS

The world of Catholic renewal, 1540–1770. By R. Po-Chia Hsia. (New Approaches to European History, 12.) Pp. xi+240 incl. 2 plates, 2 figs and 3 tables. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1998. £35 (cloth), £12.95 (paper). 0 521 44041 6; 0 521 44596 5

In this ambitious and well-executed text, Hsia provides a comprehensive survey of the post-Reformation recovery and expansion of the Roman Catholic Church from the Council of Trent to the eve of its crisis posed by the modern age. After a helpful historiographical introduction to such concepts as ‘Counter-Reformation’ ‘confessionalisation’ and ‘deChristianisation’ Hsia presents his analysis of Catholic renewal in thirteen chapters informed by four themes: the role of the religious elite in reorganising doctrine and the Church; European political and religious interaction; social and cultural manifestations of renewal; and the encounter between Catholic Europe and the non-Christian world. Hsia’s major contribution is to place early modern Catholicism in a world-historical context. Thus along with the usual fare – the mobilisation of the Church through religious orders, papacy and saints – two whole chapters describe and analyse the encounter of Catholicism with the non-European cultures in America and Asia. ‘The Iberian Church and empires’ (ch. xi) and ‘The Catholic missions in Asia’

(ch. xii) provide material that is not readily accessible and rarely, if at all, present in such depth in textbooks. As one expects of Hsia's work, this volume exhibits his erudition and ability to digest and present vast amounts of primary and secondary material. The downside is that at times the reader may be overwhelmed and begin to think this is less a text to be read than a resource to be consulted. This impression is heightened by the extensive multi-lingual 'Bibliographical essay' (pp. 212–26) that does not often include reference to available English translations. There are, to be sure, some literary gems such as the description of the impact of the discovery of the catacombs: 'Like a volcano, the early Church suddenly erupted and shook the Catholic world of 1600; the blood of its martyrs flowed like lava over the parched landscape of Catholic renewal' (p. 130). Hsia's 'concern not to leave society out of the history of religion, but to investigate practices as well as theological norms' (p. ix), is particularly well realised in the chapters on Counter-Reformation saints (ch. viii) and holy women (ch. ix). There is a chapter on art and architecture but the text does not include reference to music and liturgy, surely areas of significance to 'practice'. Nor does the text explore the challenges of early modern science and the early Enlightenment, nor the context and impact of the Thirty Years' War. Nevertheless, this is an important text that warrants inclusion not only in all libraries but also in all courses in early modern history and religion.

BOSTON UNIVERSITY,
BOSTON,
MASS.

CARTER LINDBERG

The identity of Geneva. The Christian commonwealth, 1564–1864. Edited by John B. Roney and Martin I. Klauber, foreword by Robert M. Kingdon. (Contributions to the Study of World History, 59.) Pp. xv + 228. Westport, Conn.—London: Greenwood Press, 1998. £47.95. 0 313 29868 8; 0885 9159

This is a welcome book to every reader interested in Geneva as the city of Calvin and Beza, the birthplace of the Reformed Reformation. It is an ideal source to examine what became of *La Rome protestante* after Calvin's death and, perhaps more importantly, in the period after Beza. As one might expect in a collection of essays there is great diversity in this volume. Some essays (Muller, Beeke, Phillips, Klauber) seem to be focused almost wholly on the theology of a few individuals while the rest of the book examines the wider Genevan society and culture. This is not to imply that these contributions are without interest. Indeed, these vignettes serve as useful counterpoints to the more general articles. The first essay, by Higman, discusses the formalisation of a Genevan identity in the struggles of the Revolution and Reformation during the 1530s by presenting the originals and translation of a number of short and relatively unknown sources. The commentary is brief and allows the sources to speak for themselves. Muller, in an intricate examination, sets Calvin and Beza in a wider theological and hermeneutical context through an examination of various interpretations of Romans xiii.1–7. Beeke's contribution considers the move away from supralapsarianism to infralapsarianism amongst Geneva's theological leaders. One of the more fascinating aspects of this essay is the realisation that this religious elite was very much a 'family affair'. In a number of the essays focusing on a few

theologians one might have hoped that the authors would have made more of these family ties and the impact of generational conflict in changing religious belief. In the next essay, Phillips also stresses theology (specifically, Turretin's vision of *Theologia*) and touches upon the close family connections among the individuals without any real analysis of these personal relationships and their role in the 'dissolution' of Turretin's vision. Antoine Court, and the relationship between Geneva's religious establishment and the Huguenots of the mid eighteenth century, forms the basis for the essay by Selles. The contacts, again, are extremely personal and individual. The essay is perhaps somewhat surprising in making use on only one occasion of the copious minutes of the Council in a period in which political discussions must frequently have turned to the remaining persecuted Protestant minority in France after the Revocation of the Edict of Nantes. Watt's article dramatically shifts the focus of the volume away from the few and the elite to examine suicide as a means of assessing personal piety. He evidences an exceptional and commendable use of primary sources in his essay. The following essay returns to the higher plane of theology with a discussion by Klauber of the decline of Reformed Scholasticism and alterations to views on natural theology. The almost hereditary principle underlying the Genevan theological and intellectual establishment is again apparent but not specifically treated. In her essay, Kirk returns the reader to the socio-cultural level with an examination of the Genevan assumption that their society was increasingly decadent. Kirk examines both the reality behind the assumption and the importance of the belief in shaping the actions of Genevans at the time. Olson then gives a thorough chronological account of the evolution of social welfare from a confessionally orientated mixture of state and private provision to a nationalised system without a religious test. In the antepenultimate essay, Roney shows how Geneva's historians, both Catholic and Protestant, strove to re-define the events of the city's Reformation to fit with 'contemporary' political and confessional concerns. Mützenberg expands upon this (and recalls Higman's opening essay) by treating the collapse of a unified Genevan identity in the nineteenth century. He chronicles the personal bigotry and confessional hatred of many 'opinion-shapers' in the period along with the almost total unwillingness of the state or people to be swayed (or incited) by these voices to religious violence. The volume is brought to an appropriate conclusion by Edgar's essay which highlights the place of modernity and a modern educational approach in transforming the Christian Genevan commonwealth into a modern commonwealth. Taken together, these essays give a multifaceted and multi-layered overview of the social, cultural and, especially, theological history of Geneva in the years after Calvin and Beza until the middle of the nineteenth century.

ABERDEEN

WILLIAM G. NAPHY

Sermons at court. Politics and religion in Elizabethan and Jacobean preaching. By Peter E. McCullough (Cambridge Studies in Early Modern British History.) Pp. xv + 237 incl. 9 figs + disk. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1998. £35. 0 521 59046 9

The remarkable renaissance in Elizabethan and especially Jacobean ecclesiastical and religious history of the last twenty years or so has finally penetrated the royal

inner sanctum which earlier studies have failed to reach, and which has been equally neglected by histories of the court and students of literature. For even this age of supposed 'new historicism' has displayed a profound ahistoricism in its failure to recognise the prime importance of the sermon in Elizabethan and Jacobean culture, not least at court, where not plays, not masques, but sermons were the pre-eminent literary genre. What gave James I the greatest pleasure was not hunting but listening to sermons. There was a sermon at court *every Tuesday*, a weekly commemoration of the mysterious 'Gowrie Conspiracy', and this institution alone accounts for the fact that James heard more sermons in twenty years than his predecessors in 200, or so it was claimed. In the case of Elizabeth, it was not so much a matter of hearing sermons as of processing towards them, a miniature progress on Sundays and holy days which demonstrated both gracious condescension and piety. One of the strengths of Peter McCullough's book is its anchor in the architectural setting of court preaching. Sermons were heard in the 'closet', a kind of royal box which placed the monarch *vis-à-vis* the pulpit, its window a small aperture between the closed world above stairs and the world below and beyond. Open, it was a target for a bold preacher to penetrate, closed, a shield against criticism. In the open-air preaching place at Whitehall both setting and audience were significantly different, and more public, and it is relevant that the sermons which Elizabeth is known to have indecorously interrupted were preached there. James VI of Scotland had occupied a seat *under* the pulpit, and was glad as James I of England to be elevated to the closet. McCullough gives equal attention to the rules governing the choice of preachers, and the accidents of publication, or non-publication, factors which at least partly account for the fame as a preacher of Lancelot Andrewes. This in turn has obscured the intentional inclusivity of the choice of Jacobean court preachers, both Calvinists and proto-Arminians. McCullough's final and most original chapter concerns preaching at the other two courts of Jacobean England: Denmark House, where that notable church papist, James's queen, with apparent dissimulation entertained leading Calvinist preachers; and the Court of St James, where the pulpit which addressed not only Prince Henry but his brother Charles was dominated by Calvinist chaplains. Matthew Wren turns out to have been a kind of cuckoo in the nest, with 'Prince Charles's Puritan Chaplain', John Preston, not an anomaly after all. Those who spend £35 on this book also receive an electronic disk which provides a means to search information about the 1,257 court sermons known to have been preached between 1558 and 1625, only 278 of which were ever printed.

TRINITY COLLEGE,
CAMBRIDGE

PATRICK COLLINSON

Time's alteration. Calendar reform in early modern England. By Robert Poole.

Pp. xix + 243 incl. 3 figs and 2 tables. London: UCL Press, 1998. £40. 1
85728 622 7

The celebrated calendar riots of 1752, through which ignorant countrymen pleaded to be given back their eleven days, never happened. Instead, according

to Robert Poole, England's belated adoption of the sixteenth-century Gregorian calendar reforms passed smoothly, with little political controversy but considerable local confusion. The mythic calendar riots originated in Hogarth's satire on the Oxfordshire election, and passed uncritically into legend. This book traces the history of calendar reform from the time of Elizabeth I to the age of George II and examines the religious, astronomical and administrative arguments that led to a sequence of missed opportunities. It is particularly concerned with Protestant objections to a popish mandate, with rival calculations for the dates of Easter and with the legal, customary and agrarian consequences of tinkering with dates in the year. The association of calendar revision with Counter-Reformation Catholicism was cause enough for many English Protestants to reject it. 'The British Empire is a world of itself, every way independent of the customs of the continent', wrote one eighteenth-century opponent of calendar reform. But, as Robert Poole points out, the politics of the calendar were always more complicated. One valuable chapter examines John Dee's proposals for calendar reform in the 1580s, when England almost came into line with Catholic Europe. Others trace the involvement of later Stuart divines and Royal Society mathematicians in the much-delayed reconciliation. Earlier debates bogged down over epacts, golden numbers and the decisions of the Council of Nicea, as well as the superiority of Catholic or Protestant astronomy, but the final decisions were guided by considerations of practical convenience. A useful tabulation of country fairs shows a preference in the north-west and south-west for the new style, keeping them in line with the official church calendar, while most in the central and eastern region retained old style dates, severing the link between the ecclesiastical and the civic year.

OHIO STATE UNIVERSITY

DAVID CRESSY

American religion. Literary sources and documents, I: From the beginning of European settlement to the effects of political independence; II: Religion in the new nation. Revolution to reconstruction; III: Modern American religion since the late nineteenth century. Edited by David Turley. (The Helm Information Literary Sources & Documents Series.) Pp. xx + 456 incl. frontispiece and 5 ills; ix + 440 incl. frontispiece and 4 ills; x + 586 incl. frontispiece and 6 ills. Mountfield: Helm Information, 1998. £224 (set). 1 873403 21 6

Taking heaven by storm. Methodism and the rise of popular Christianity in America. By John H. Wigger. (Religion in America Series.) Pp. xiii + 269 incl. 18 ills. New York-Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1998. £46. 0 19 510452 8

Fashions in historical inquiry, like other fashions, change with the times. The enormous energy of its practitioners and their conviction that contemporary concerns require the re-examination of fresh areas of the past make this especially true of American historiography. In the face of the intense attention recently paid to race, gender and capitalism as organising principles for the interpretation of American development, religious history has been discounted as at best a secondary matter of concern to specialists. This neglect is triply unfortunate. It implies a reductionist understanding of history, it denies the continuing importance of religion to a majority of Americans, and it misinterprets the

character of American history. Yet, as James Wigger's monograph on Methodism in the first fifty years of independence and David Turley's collection of documents on the broad range of American religious history clearly demonstrate, religion has been central to the shaping of American society from the earliest English settlements to the present day. Religious belief is not solely a private matter; even in the United States it has public consequences. In spite of the separation of Church and State there is almost nothing that religion (whether in theological or ecclesiastical terms) has not touched in one way or another. In particular, both the book and the documents illustrate the fundamental relationship between religious belief on the one hand and recent concerns with race, ethnicity, gender and the market economy on the other. Though very different in character, each helpfully illuminates its subject. Wigger's monograph not only contributes substantially to our understanding of the extraordinarily rapid development of Methodism after the Revolution, but also demonstrates the part religion has played in American social development. Turley's documents cover an extraordinary range of material and offer a rich resource for the study and especially the teaching of religious and social history.

David Turley's three volumes on American religion are one of a series of literary sources and documents intended to offer wide-ranging collections of source material on various aspects of American history and culture. In keeping with the purpose of the series this collection is deliberately bulky but sets out to be representative rather than exhaustive. It is less a research tool in itself, for the material on any particular subject is necessarily limited, than a sequence of signposted entrances into areas for more detailed examination; as such it will also prove a useful source for teaching American cultural history at an advanced level. It also provides useful material for the study of other, more secular, themes such as immigration and the incorporation of different ethnic groups into American society. The collection opens with an extended introductory survey of American religious history followed by bibliographies covering all aspects of its subject. Thereafter the documents extend from Alexander Whitaker's *Good newses from Virginia* of 1613 and Edward Johnson's *Wonder working providence of Sion's saviour* of 1654 to Malcolm X on black revolution in 1971 and Grace Halsell on Jerry Falwell's prophecy of the imminent second coming of Christ after a nuclear Armageddon, in 1987. The immense diversity of American religion is very creditably demonstrated by the choice of documents, though as always with collections it is easy to quibble over the weight assigned to various sects. Thus Native American religion is rather briefly represented, and some critics might argue that black religion could have been treated at greater length. But the balance is ultimately a matter of judgement, and similar criticism could also be made of the treatment of some white sects. Similarly, Mormonism and Christian Science, both home-grown sects, could arguably have been given more attention. However, the under-representation of these sects may be a consequence of the particular character of the entire collection. For this is not a sampling of sectarian theologies, though theology frequently appears in the documents chosen. Rather, it is a collection of documents illuminating the relationship between religion and its social context. Thus Jonathan Edwards is represented by his argument that the millennium would probably dawn in America, not his doctrine of weaned affections. One senses that the heart of the collection lies in the section on the

voluntary principle in operation. It is preceded by documents demonstrating the colonial sense of Americans as a chosen people and illustrating the extent of religious diversity before the Revolution, and more immediately by texts on the separation of Church and State. Thereafter it is followed by an extended treatment of the problems confronting the Roman Catholic Church as it wrestled with the spiritual needs of diverse ethnic groups and came to terms with a cultural environment very different from that to which it was accustomed in Europe. Not that the Americanisation of the Roman Catholic Church ended the problems of organised religion.

What Turley expounds on a grand scale, Wigger explores in detail. Yet in some ways the two authors demonstrate the same points. Above all, Wigger confirms the diversity of American religion implied in Turley's collection and demonstrates that religious development is intertwined with the social context within which it takes place. Class, gender, race and the market economy all feature in the growth of Methodism in the United States. Thus the spectacular expansion of Methodism after the Revolution was in good measure attributable to the commitment of legions of poor men and women to a religion attuned to their own needs, to an organisational structure of itinerant preachers dependent on them for financial support. Both women and African Americans, whether free or enslaved, were prominent among Methodists, though in each case contemporary values ultimately compelled conformity: women were subordinated and blacks were segregated, especially in the south. Also, growing prosperity among many Methodists encouraged a desire for a more affluent lifestyle and grandiose church building. As this admirable study demonstrates, popular religion was a potent force that originated outside the mainstream of American culture but later became incorporated within it. For that reason it has as much claim to be considered as an organising force of nineteenth-century America as does the market economy.

KEELE UNIVERSITY

COLIN BONWICK

Johann Lorenz Mosheim (1693–1755). Theologie im Spannungsfeld von Philosophie, Philologie und Geschichte. [Vorträge, gehalten anlässlich eines Arbeitsgespräches vom 12. bis 15. September 1994 in der Herzog-August-Bibliothek Wolfenbüttel]. Edited by Martin Mulsow, Ralph Häfner, Florian Neumann and Helmut Zedelmaier. (Wolfenbütteler Forschungen, 77.) Pp. 407. Wiesbaden: Harrassowitz, 1997. DM 138. 3 447 03985 X

This collection of essays, most of which are based on papers given at a 1994 colloquium in Wolfenbüttel, was compiled to commemorate the three-hundredth anniversary of the birth of the early Enlightenment Lutheran theologian and historian, Johann Lorenz Mosheim (1693–1755). Taken as a whole, these scholarly papers – all are in German except for one in English – offer a multifaceted intellectual portrait of Mosheim, who is best known as one of the founders of modern church history. Though Mosheim's historical writings are subject to extensive and historiographically up-to-date analysis in many of the contributors' essays, the most significant feature of this volume is its success in illuminating other aspects of Mosheim's published works. The topics covered include his

youthful polemics against the deist John Toland; his highly popular sermons, with their surprisingly strong links to 'old Protestant' devotional literature; his dogmatics, which also reveal a strong connection to seventeenth-century Orthodoxy, especially its irenic, humanistic, Calixtian variety; his translation into Latin of the *magnum opus* of the seventeenth-century English Platonist Ralph Cudworth, which Mosheim sought to present in an updated form to a contemporary audience; his ethical teachings (*Sittenlehre*), which show the more 'modern' side of Mosheim in that they anticipate the typically eighteenth-century 'Christian–natural rights discourse'; and his writings on ecclesiastical law and organisation, which likewise reflect Mosheim's 'progressive' tendencies in that he refuses to view the early Church as the sole authoritative standard in this area, valuing in addition the 'enrichments' which had accrued to the institutional Church over time. As this listing may suggest, moreover, the editors also aspired through this collective portrait to understand, in a much more sophisticated manner than previously, Mosheim's position in the historical development of early modern Lutheranism. In his valuable introduction to this volume, Martin Muslow argues cogently that Mosheim – along with such contemporaries as Johann Franz Buddeus and Christoph Matthäus Pfaff – should be interpreted not just negatively as a 'transitional figure' between 'Orthodoxy' and 'Enlightenment' but positively as an early representative of a German version of the 'conservative Enlightenment', a concept that J. G. A. Pocock has used with respect to a comparable grouping of English clerics and literary figures. Muslow's critique of the 'transitional figure' label has the further merit of helping to account for the virtual absence of major studies on Mosheim since the publication of Heussi's biography in 1906. In the light of the resulting lack of knowledge available on Mosheim, even to specialists in the field, the editors could have included a biographical introduction that would have made it easier for the reader to appreciate these generally high-quality essays. The effort to place Mosheim in historical context, was weakened, moreover, by the absence of an essay discussing Mosheim's relationship to the Pietist movement, which reached its peak during his lifetime. Such omissions notwithstanding, this collection of essays, in conjunction with E. J. Meijering's recent work, constitutes a break-through in restoring Mosheim to his deserved place of importance in the scholarly literature on this period and should give further momentum to the ongoing revival of interest in early eighteenth-century German Lutheranism.

FRANKLIN COLLEGE,
INDIANA

RICHARD L. GAWTHROP

The lustre of our country. The American experience of religious freedom. By John T. Noonan, Jr. Pp. x + 436 incl. 13 ills. Berkeley–Los Angeles–London: University of California Press, 1998. \$35 (paper). 0 520 20997 4

'Free exercise – let us as Americans assert it – is an American invention' (p. 2). This claim sets the tone of the thirteen chapters, organised as three sections, that constitute the book. The result is a remarkable combination of an intensely personal history of the author's Roman Catholic upbringing in Boston, snapshots of history and a number of imaginary dialogues with equally imaginary persons.

The overall theme is the author's belief that the constitutional formulations of James Madison have ultimately informed and fashioned the modern world's practice of religious freedom, and in this belief Noonan focuses on developments in France, Russia, Japan and in formal Roman Catholic teaching. Thus, whatever one thinks of the main title, the subtitle becomes lost in a dense thicket of experience well beyond America. There are historical errors. John Witherspoon is placed as a minister in Edinburgh, rather than Paisley; it is claimed that chattel slavery was established by English law; and Noonan's ordination of William Lloyd Garrison, it may be presumed, would not have been to that anti-clerical gentleman's taste. The most curious omission in this book is any discussion of the roots of religious liberty provided to Americans by their English inheritance. On the other hand, Noonan (described in one of the dust jacket's 'puffs' as 'one of the world's towering intellects') supposes that Madison was deeply influenced by Thomas à Kempis because his schoolmaster owned a copy of the *Imitatio Christi*. *The lustre of our country* lacks internal coherence or chronological development, as it jumps back and forth between 'interviews' with imaginary figures and actual historical developments. Among the latter, there is a useful discussion of the role of the flag in the American consciousness, leading to a further chapter describing the persecution of Jehovah's Witnesses during the Second World War: 'the greatest outbreak of religious intolerance in twentieth-century America' (p. 243). The author could well have more fully developed his interesting depiction in chapter ix of America's role in modern wars as a self-conscious religious crusade – and his equally interesting discussion of the role of internal American moral crusades, 'campaigns to change the laws of the country and thereby the conduct of the people of the country' (p. 250) – although the suggestion that because the Volstead Act permitted the liturgical use of wine the whole Prohibition experiment was doomed is fanciful. The discussion in chapter viii of American tax exemption for religious organisations and the support of military chaplaincies is refreshingly straightforward and useful. But overall the book's evidence and argument is far from straightforward, and Noonan is uncomfortably conscious of the fact that the free exercise of religion, his 'lustre' of the United States, will always in practice be limited when the civil polity perceives itself to be threatened thereby. This book contains no bibliography, the system of citation is awkward and unpredictable and there are a number of pagination errors in the index.

UNIVERSITY OF WALES,
ABERYSTWYTH

BOYD STANLEY SCHLENTHER

Dublin's Merchant-Quaker. Anthony Sharp and the Community of Friends, 1643–1707. By Richard L. Greaves. Pp. xi + 338. Stanford, CA: Stanford University Press, 1998. £35. 0 8047 3452 6

Catholics in a Protestant country. The papist constituency in eighteenth-century Dublin. By Patrick Fagan. Pp. 201. Dublin: Four Courts Press, 1998. £30. 1 85182 417 0

Until recently, religious life in Dublin, the second city in the later Stuart and in the Hanoverian state, has been hidden. The practices of both individuals and groups are brought out of the shadows by these two works. Professor Greaves, having completed a trilogy on radicals after Charles II's restoration, has turned

to Ireland. His study of Sharp may indeed be regarded as a pendant, albeit a weighty one, to his recent analysis of Protestant dissent in later Stuart Ireland, *God's other children*. In contrast, Patrick Fagan brings to his enquiries an enviable familiarity with eighteenth-century Dublin and Irish Catholicism already displayed in a series of monographs and editions over the last ten years.

Of the Quakers who lived in later seventeenth-century Ireland, none left more traces than Anthony Sharp. Having emigrated from Gloucestershire to Dublin in 1669, he quickly became part of the city's mercantile and civic elites. Active in the affairs of the Quakers in and beyond Dublin, he also represented the community in its dealings with the Irish administration. Sharp welcomed the prospect of greater liberty for the Friends held out by James II, and collaborated in running both the Weavers' Company and Dublin corporation as an alderman under the new Jacobite charter. Because some of Sharp's voluminous papers have survived, now in the Friends' Library in Dublin, it is possible to trace his career in unusual detail. Professor Greaves has made extensive use of this archive, long known but hitherto only haphazardly sampled. Yet, even with this ample documentation, much about Sharp remains elusive. Also, of course, what was saved among his papers and what contemporaries recorded of him were designed to promote a particular, hagiographical impression of the patriarch. Necessarily Professor Greaves has to flesh out the sometimes meagre personal account with lengthy asides: for example, on Tetbury and Dublin at the time. Some of these digressions – such as that on the spending of Dublin corporation during the 1680s while Sharp was an alderman – are supererogatory. Others, on the activities of the guilds, the policing of apprenticeship and the internal economy of the Quakers themselves, add substantially to what has been written on these matters. The historical interest of Sharp, other than the happy accident of his papers' survival, lies in his success as a woollen merchant, his place within the mercantile elite of urban Ireland and his relationships with fellow Quakers scattered across the Anglophone world. Greaves deals laboriously with each of these topics. However, the format of a full-scale biography has obliged him to include episodes in which Sharp's role is anonymous or even conjectural. By asserting that gild culture 'was nearly as all encompassing' as the ethos of the Quakers, Greaves justifies his detailed (and helpful) analysis of the mercantile and craft organisations. The result is less an individual's life than the fullest published account of the Irish Quakers in the later seventeenth century. The subjects illuminated range from the reformation of manners, fashions in dress and furnishings through calendar customs to the prevalent business ethics of the day. However, other puzzles posed by Sharp's experiences are hardly addressed. The reasons why he settled permanently in Ireland can only be guessed. Nothing much is made of the ease with which migrants moved between England and Ireland, thereby creating strong links which the Quakers in particular utilised. A stimulating suggestion made by Dr David Dickson, that this thick mesh of contacts contrasted sharply with the situation in which the Huguenots found themselves in Ireland at the same time, is not pursued. In any case, by the start of the eighteenth century the magnetic pull of Dublin for emigrants from Britain had diminished. This opened the way for the scene described by Fagan: an influx into the capital from the Irish provinces, which tilted its confessional balance decisively in the Catholics' favour. Sharp prospered quickly and remarkably, for reasons that are never discussed. If,

as was rumoured, he employed more than 500 workers in Dublin, then he had turned himself within a very short time into one of the leading entrepreneurs there. Professor Greaves's achievement is to show how Sharp then used his wealth and standing. Sharp, without ever claiming to be the leader of the Dublin Friends, guided many of their activities. The growing complexity of the Quakers' institutional life during Sharp's heyday, Greaves would argue, tended to transform the group from a sect into a 'protodenomination'. The survival of the Quakers as a distinctive element within the trading world of the city is attested – in passing – by some of the evidence considered by Fagan. In 1749 eighteen Quakers together with sixty-one other Protestant dissenters were recorded among the 259 freemen of the Weavers' Guild. The Friends' continuing liberty to trade in textiles contrasted with the more awkward position of Catholics who wished to follow this (or any other) calling in Georgian Dublin.

Patrick Fagan's aim is to question whether Catholic Dubliners were, as a contemporary averred, in 'a low way, obnoxious to the laws'. At least in theory Catholics and Quakers were victimised equally by the laws. But the Quakers, too tiny a group to endanger the state, were allowed special routes into civic rights, lucrative offices, trades and professions. Fagan's concern is to see whether a similar latitude moderated the measures against the Catholic majority. He begins with numbers. He reviews the often bald and sometimes contradictory evidence in order to recalculate totals and proportions. He concludes that during the century the Catholics moved from being a minority of 30 per cent to a majority of more than 70 per cent of the city's inhabitants. Parity may even have been reached as early as the 1750s. The implication of this argument is that Catholics predominated numerically earlier than is commonly supposed. In the past there has also been a tendency to contend that, obstacles notwithstanding, Catholics prospered in trade and the professions. However, the conclusions of Fagan's other chapters question this view. As lobbyists against hostile bills, Irish Catholics triumphed only when backed by foreigners (principally the Austrians) and when Britain's other preoccupations made it vulnerable to international pressure. In the legal profession, trade and the crafts, the successes of Dublin Catholics were fewer and less spectacular than Protestant alarmists alleged. Even in medicine and freemasonry, activities into which Catholics were wholeheartedly welcomed, the papists never predominated. Indeed, they tended to herd into particular lodges, so nullifying hopes that freemasonry would break down sectarian barriers. The novelty and value of Fagan's account are to look minutely at some unfamiliar sources. On the question of Dublin's population, not all will accept his new calculations, but his findings about how few reached the higher reaches of the professions and trades are more likely to be endorsed.

Fagan readily concedes that some of the sources which he has located and sampled – for example, the membership lists of the masonic lodges – merit further exploration. Other materials which he has not enlisted might strengthen or modify his arguments. The surviving bill books for the Dublin courts allow one to see how many of those listed as legal practitioners were active. Similarly, through the numerous case papers in family archives more insights might be offered about who, and how many, evaded confessional prohibitions by acting discreetly as chamber counsel. A necessarily close focus, if it yields many dividends, makes him overlook what others have written: the extent of Catholic

practice at the Irish bar under the later Stuarts or David Dickson's re-examination of the exaggerated anxieties of Catholic mercantile wealth could be mentioned. In handling the wider political and cultural contexts of Catholic endeavours, Fagan sometimes betrays naïveté. The shift in manner of living on the part of prospering Dublin Catholics, from frugality to frank enjoyment of their riches, is stated but not demonstrated. In general, attitudes are excluded from his brief. Nevertheless, to an extent which is becoming rare as any Irish historical topic finds a publisher, each of these books adds new and significant detail to what was previously known about those who dwelt in seventeenth- and eighteenth-century Dublin. Both, in consequence, deserve to be much consulted.

HERTFORD COLLEGE,
OXFORD

T. C. BARNARD

Come shouting to Zion. African American Protestantism in the American South and British Caribbean to 1830. By Sylvia R. Frey and Betty Wood. Pp. xiv + 285. Chapel Hill—London: University of North Carolina Press, 1998. \$37.95 (cloth), \$12.95 (paper). 0 8078 2375 9; 0 8078 4681 3

The shift from African to Christian religions was one of the most momentous transitions in the development of American and Caribbean slavery. As a result, argue the authors of this masterful study, 'Protestantism became one of the central frameworks of African American society' (p. 150). Based on a skilful interpretation of such traditional sources as European travellers' accounts, missionary correspondence and church records, Sylvia R. Frey and Betty Wood have reconstructed black religious aspirations and achievements. The authors' thorough familiarity with the historiography of slavery enables them to place religious changes in broader patterns of demographic, economic, social and cultural change and geographic expansion. Always cognizant of diversity, Frey and Wood recognise the dissimilar responses of different African nations to Christian missionaries, the contrast between the American South and the Caribbean, and the important distinctions between denominations.

The agency of slave men and women is a central theme of this book. Instead of passively and fully converting to white Christianity, African Americans and Afro-Caribbeans assimilated those beliefs most compatible with their African religious cosmologies. For example, the people of the Kongo incorporated the Christian cross introduced by Capuchin missionaries into their 'repertory of graphic signs' (p. 19). Slaves on West Indian plantations drew the European celebration of Christmas into their annual yam festivals. In the seventeenth-century Anglo-American colonies, Anglican missionaries were unsuccessful largely because their patronising approach and acquiescence in prevailing notions of hierarchy and racism had little appeal to plantation slaves. In contrast, Moravians and Methodists made greater headway among slaves in the next century since their concept of evangelical conversion struck a resonant chord with the West and West Central African belief that spiritual regeneration could occur spontaneously. Yet there were clearly limits to black autonomy in the religious realm. As slaves filled the growing Baptist and Methodists churches in the early nineteenth-century South, they encountered racial segregation in churches. Frey and Wood also stress the contributions of women to the creation of black

Christianity. Women were often the majority members in Baptist and Methodist churches and sometimes became unlicensed preachers in the revivals of the Second Great Awakening, testifying to the survival of the African tradition of female spiritual leadership.

Frey and Wood's excellent study of slave religion among African Americans and Afro-Caribbeans still leaves questions for future historians. To what extent was black religion shaped by the varying patterns of work on sugar, tobacco, rice and sea island cotton plantations? How can the transformations in religious sensibilities and institutions be related to social and cultural developments among Southern and West Indian whites in the wake of the American and Haitian Revolutions? The authors should none the less be commended for a thoughtful contribution to the ongoing discussion of slave agency in the brutal plantation gulags of the American South and the British Caribbean.

DENISON UNIVERSITY,
GRANVILLE, OHIO

MITCHELL SNAY

Religion and enlightenment in eighteenth-century England. Theological debate from Locke to Burke. By B. W. Young. Pp. xii + 259. Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1998. £35.00 19 826942 0

In this study of eighteenth-century intellectual culture, Brian Young unpacks the notion that the English Enlightenment was religiously conservative by demonstrating the vigour of theological debate within clerical culture, as opposed to debate only between freethinkers and the clergy. One gets a window on the conservative Enlightenment at work in the subscription controversy in the Church of England. Should clergymen and students at the universities be required to assent to a doctrinal standard? There was a significant anti-dogmatic movement of individuals who saw this as a violation of the Protestant principle of 'private judgement'. But while this anti-dogmatism led some younger clergy to unorthodox views of the Trinity in the closing decades of the century, the majority of 'enlightened' divines were orthodox (some even evangelical) and critical of the irreligious *philosophes* across the Channel. Young demonstrates not only how central religion was to enlightenment discourse in England, but also how complex were the alignments of religious, intellectual and political commitments. That the largely forgotten William Warburton, a Right Reverend, was more to be feared than David Hume is an astonishing reversal of expectations. (Historical justice is served: Warburton gets the last full chapter of Young's study.) Likewise, the commonplace of a tidy ideology, Whig in politics and latitudinarian in religion, stemming from a synthetic reading of Isaac Newton and John Locke, dissolves under an analysis of the complexity of views actually held by clergymen on the ground. In fact, Locke's epistemology was sometimes employed in theological debate to counter those elements of Newton's thought about space and time which seemed to imply a deistical conception of God. Moreover, Edmund Law and Daniel Waterland both attacked the Newtonian physico-theology of Samuel Clarke, despite the fact that both were firm Whigs and their own theological views were far apart. Even Counter-Enlightenment cannot be seen as a matter chiefly of political ideology. Theological belief and religious commitment were central to figures as diverse as

William Law, John Wesley, the Hutchinsonian George Horne, Christopher Smart and William Blake. Young concludes that England's true role was not to pave the way for a secular Enlightenment, but to maintain a vigorously religious discourse between Enlightenment and Counter-Enlightenment. This book is a detailed, close reading of a number of neglected writers, and it is demanding reading, but it serves to restore a more whole picture of eighteenth-century intellectual life and to challenge the commonplace caricature of religion as a reactionary or decaying influence in the Age of Reason.

BRIERCREST BIBLICAL SEMINARY,
CARONPORT,
SASKATCHEWAN

BRUCE HINDMARSH

French masters of the organ. Saint-Saëns, Franck, Widor, Vierne, Dupré, Langlais, Messiaen. By Michael Murray. Pp. vii + 245. New Haven–London: Yale University Press, 1998. £30. 0 300 07291 0

The argument about which came first – the chicken or the egg – is one that has no answer, and much the same thing can be said of musicians and their instruments. Generally authors will avoid the question by writing one book on instruments and another on those who play them. Here, the author sensibly combines the two approaches, starting with a review of the life and work of the celebrated French organ-builder, Aristide Cavaillé-Coll, and the influence he, and his instruments, had on the seven chosen organists announced in the title. Beyond that, the chapters on each of the organists are welded together by the influence that each had on the other. Thus what appears at first sight to be a series of chapters on individuals is in fact a coherent whole. Each organist is dealt with in an engaging way, so that by the end of the book the reader feels that he knows each one as a person, as a musician, and as a virtuoso performer. Though seven organists are represented here (and are shown in useful monochrome photographs on the front of the dust jacket, with Cavaillé-Coll on the back) there are plenty of references to other organists whose influence was of importance in the development of the two branches of the nineteenth-century French Romantic School, the one headed by Saint Saëns and Franck, and a later school led by Guilmant and Widor.

Michael Murray (a concert organist himself) has written with loving care and attention on the lives of his subjects. The overall result is scholarly, pleasing and readable. I recommend it thoroughly to all who are interested in French organs and organists.

ST CROSS COLLEGE,
OXFORD

CHARLES MOULD

Lightfoot the historian. The nature and role of history in the life and thought of J. B. Lightfoot (1828–1889) as churchman and scholar. By Geoffrey R. Treloar. (Wissenschaftliche Untersuchungen zum Neuen Testament. 2. Reihe, 103.) Pp. xiii + 470. Tübingen: Mohr Siebeck, 1998. DM 128. 3 16 146866 X
Acton and history. By Owen Chadwick. Pp. xiv + 270. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1998. £30. 0 521 57074 3

It is perhaps only the more or less simultaneous publication of these two volumes

which has prompted the thought that they might profitably be considered together. To some extent, there are indeed similarities. The University of Cambridge is one of them – they were both professors – though it cannot be said to constitute a fundamental bond. Born in 1828, Lightfoot went up to Trinity in 1847 and the university was the centre of his life (though shared latterly with St Paul's) until he accepted the bishopric of Durham in 1879. He died a decade later. Acton, on the other hand, although born only six years after Lightfoot, came to Cambridge as Regius Professor six years after his death and died in 1902. Lightfoot, Liverpool-born, spent all his life at the heart of great academic or ecclesiastical institutions – and they were unambiguously English as was Lightfoot himself: business background, middle-class, solid school, sustained application, Church of England. Acton by contrast, Naples-born, was a half-German outsider: aristocratic, peripatetic, Roman Catholic and European. That he should, for a time, have sat in the House of Commons as the member for an Irish constituency further emphasised his singularity. It was at Munich rather than Oxford or Cambridge that he had studied. Only at the end of his life did he come to a university chair, having been earlier better known as an essayist and controversialist.

The differences which stem from such contrasting backgrounds and the influences to which both men were subjected were not unexpectedly profound. They moved in different circles and probably never met. Certainly, there is no reference to Lightfoot in Chadwick's index and no reference to Acton in Treloar's. Both men in their way can be reckoned to be 'Great Victorians' but we need to remind ourselves that 'Great Victorians' did not hunt in packs.

So, what unites them fundamentally, in their different spheres, is a captivity to history. Their areas of particular scholarship were distinct but they both had a yearning for synthesis and for comprehensiveness within their chosen themes. As is well-known, Acton pursued 'Liberty' with heroic endeavour but failed, in the end, to nail his subject within manageable covers. Lightfoot struggled to put the Christian writings of the first two centuries on what Treloar calls 'an orderly footing'. He took German scholarship seriously and established within the Church of England a critical tradition of New Testament study. Both men brought great linguistic and technical skill to their tasks and had a profound sense of the importance of what they were doing. History mattered and could be 'got right'. However, to do so was not merely a question of professional pride or personal satisfaction. Both men wrestled with its demands because their answers to specific questions had a profound bearing on the vitality of the institutions to which they owed allegiance. Treloar brings out the extent to which Lightfoot knew full well the ramifications and implications of his work for the life of the Church of England and for its place in the life of England itself. History did have its uses and Lightfoot's approach to it is categorised by Treloar as existential. He was not an antiquarian or traditionalist. He did not want to return to some ideal past for its own sake but rather to uncover clues which would point to the future. Treloar proceeds to explore systematically how Lightfoot saw History's purpose in the University and in the Nation. Subsequent chapters uncover the evolution of Lightfoot's scholarly understanding of Jesus, Paul and the Apostolic Fathers. The theme of the intimate relationship between scholarly activity and institutional mission is then brought to a generally convincing conclusion.

Treloar is well aware of the dangers of magnifying Lightfoot's achievements but none the less demonstrates how substantial they were. Yet, in the end, he argues that while Lightfoot was correct in fearing that England was likely to squander its Christian inheritance, his remedies were not likely to prevent it. Although not naively optimistic, Lightfoot fell into the assumption that the 'increasing purpose' of God was relatively easily identifiable in the progress of England. That verdict may be a little harsh. Should a man who died in 1889 really be criticised for failing to anticipate radical change, 'such as the devastating impact of World War I'? Treloar has been assiduous in tracking down material once supposed to be no longer in existence in what is a thorough study. He appears to say in his final paragraph that this present investigation is the prolegomenon to a critical biography.

In his last decade, Lightfoot's *cathedra* was Durham. In replying to the Cardinal Archbishop of Westminster in 1895, Acton worried that the danger of his Cambridge office was that it was almost a platform before the country rather than a *cathedra* with serious students under it. Here was a place in which he had to fuse together the insights derived from a lifetime's concern with public affairs in the widest sense and the specific duties required of a professor in his own university. Chadwick's essays, most of which have been previously published elsewhere in an earlier form, pursue with his customary insight the personalities and influences which played upon their subject. Although the papers consider Acton's life from childhood to death, they do not do so in a systematic fashion and the result is certainly not intended as a critical biography. Rather, individual pieces reflect, illuminatingly, on relationships (Döllinger, Newman and Gladstone) and their personal and intellectual significance for Acton's development at various points in his life. We note that he was not invariably the best of company at dinner. We see Acton the 'man of action' in his somewhat idiosyncratic involvement with the Vatican Council and its aftermath. We see Acton the historian in his encounters with the Vatican archives and in both the assembling and the disposal of his great library. Approaching Acton from these various angles, we grasp the complexity of the interplay of politics, ethics and religion which dominated his thinking but which ultimately could not be resolved. It may sometimes seem puzzling that Acton has exercised such an attraction for a number of his titular successors. These subtly sympathetic essays help us to understand why.

UNIVERSITY OF WALES,
LAMPETER

KEITH ROBBINS

The emancipation of Catholics, Jews and Protestants. Minorities and the nation state in nineteenth-century Europe. Edited by Rainer Liedtke and Stephan Wendehorst.

Pp. x + 223. Manchester: Manchester University Press, 1999. £45. 0 7190

5149 5

This is a highly original and extremely valuable collection of comparative essays on the experience of religious minorities during the nineteenth century in Britain, France, Germany and Italy. Essays by specialist historians survey the experience of Jews in these four countries, as well as Catholics in Britain and Germany and

Protestants in France and Italy. In each of these nations, religious minorities achieved formal emancipation in almost all respects by 1914, although full emancipation and true equality often remained 'deficient' in many areas, for example the exclusion of Jews and Catholics from many official and semi-official positions in Germany. One of the most welcome aspects of this work lies in the fact that it goes beyond a consideration of Jews to include other groups. As the archetypal persecuted minority, Jews have received a full measure of attention from post-Holocaust historians, who are often unaware (as are many others) of the similarity (if not, of course, identity) of their position to many other minority groups. The essays in this work on the Jews in France (by Frances Malino) and Germany (by Christopher Clark) are notable for their general downplaying of the force of antisemitism in these societies, with Clark's essay betraying no hint of the thesis recently made famous by Daniel Goldhagen of pervasive German antisemitism. Ironically, David Cesarani's essay on the Jews in Britain goes to the other extreme, grossly over-estimating the significance of British antisemitism and engaging in Orwellian descriptions (originally voiced by other scholars) of 'the anti-semitism of tolerance'. These are very misleading. For instance, he noted the allegedly antisemitic edge in the Liberal opposition to Disraeli's Turkish policies in the 1870s without pointing out that virtually the entire 'Establishment', including the queen, strongly supported Disraeli's pro-Turkish, anti-Russian programme.

UNIVERSITY OF WALES,
ABERYSTWYTH

W. D. RUBINSTEIN

The failure of Bismarck's Kulturkampf. Catholicism and state power in imperial Germany, 1871-1887. By Ronald J. Ross. Pp. xvi + 221 incl. map and 8 ills. Washington, DC: Catholic University of America Press, 1998. \$66.95. 0 8132 0894 7

Few events in the chancellorship of Otto von Bismarck have so obviously demonstrated the explosiveness of one of his political decisions as Eduard Kullmann's attempt to shoot him on 13 July 1874 while he was on his way to his favourite spa in Kissingen in northern Bavaria. But the young Catholic butcher's apprentice only slightly injured the almost sixty-year-old chancellor, and he paid for the attempted assassination with eighteen years in prison where he died.

Bismarck later declared that he could no longer venture out into public without a bodyguard, for fear that an ultramontane conspiracy would put into practice what it had so far only threatened, namely the murder of Prussian political leaders who were particularly prominent in the *Kulturkampf*. Apart from the chancellor this mainly concerned the *Kultusminister* Adalbert Falk. While Bismarck did not lose his life, he lost the battle that was the background to widespread lawlessness and turbulence in Catholic regions of the *Reich*. In this respect he lost to the Catholics what he had wanted to take away from them when he initiated the *Kulturkampf* in 1871 – control over public opinion in Catholic districts, the *vox populi* which Ronald Ross so splendidly describes in his magisterial account.

The author explains the part played by Catholics in the Bismarckian system of *Reichsfeinde*, a minority, yet an enemy which was regarded as a threat to the

alleged homogeneity of the modern Protestant state which demanded ideological conformity. Socialists, Jews, Danes, citizens of Alsace-Lorraine, Poles and other ethnic minorities were also seen as enemies. The struggle against the Catholics was politically motivated by the fear that they could form an independent authority and mobilise peripheral nationalism among, for example, the Polish population. Bismarck's ideas were supported by the Liberals, who regarded the Catholics as superstitious and backward-looking, and, what was even worse, as blind followers of everything that was decreed in Rome. On the other hand, Bismarck also needed the National Liberal Party to form majorities in the Reichstag. Here was a straightforward pragmatic dimension.

The term *Kulturkampf* was coined by the physician Rudolf Virchow, himself a critic of Bismarck during the Prussian constitutional conflict, and the phenomenon can be traced back to two main points: firstly, in the summer of 1870 the Vatican issued the dogma of papal infallibility ('ex cathedra') following the Catholic Church's general disapproval (1864) of the principles of political, economic and cultural liberalism for which it was strongly criticised by Liberals and Protestants alike; secondly, Bismarck's initiatives to reduce clerical influence on politics and eventually to separate Church and State. The latter were enforced, for example, by the closure of the Catholic section of the Prussian Ministry of Culture in July 1871 and the enactment of the school inspection bill of March 1872. Several more laws were introduced, including the Anti-Jesuit Law of July 1872 and the Congregations Law of May 1875: the latter abolished religious orders in Prussia and ended state subsidies to the Catholic Church. The recently founded Catholic Centre Party was also regarded as an obstacle to the new Prussian *kleindeutsch* empire.

However, despite countless restrictions and many clerics and bishops receiving fines or being sentenced to prison for refusing to obey the law, the Centre Party substantially increased its support. It finally became obvious that Bismarck was facing serious political defeat by an opponent whose power he had greatly underestimated. In strong Catholic areas the Church was able to mobilise enormous numbers of people for demonstrations and passive resistance to state officials, which could often not be met with repression by the administrative apparatus. Ross is at his best when describing the means of political suppression and the limited coercion available to a state in which archiepiscopal as well as episcopal seats were widespread and exercised considerable political and cultural influence.

The failure of Bismarck's *Kulturkampf* was evident when he sought reconciliation with Pope Leo XIII. With the increasing parliamentary influence of the Centre Party, which by the late 1870s was the largest party in the Reichstag, the inadequacy of Bismarck's measures was clear. As a result Falk resigned in 1879, and the chancellor abandoned the Liberals and looked for support from the Catholics in the parliament. One of the consequences of this shift was that Bismarck adopted protectionism in place of the liberal free-trade policies hitherto pursued. The first laws that eased restrictions such as, for example, releasing bishops from taking the oath on Prussian laws, were enacted from 1880. Most anti-Catholic laws were repealed in the following seven years; some however, like the Anti-Jesuit-Law, remained in force until 1917. The reduction of the influence of the Catholic Church in areas such as education was, however, irreversible, and civil marriage remained compulsory.

Yet the damage the *Kulturkampf* inflicted upon political life in the *Kaiserreich* was immense. The alienation of the Catholic population from the German state was deepened by the emergence of a Catholic subculture which defined itself in opposition to Protestant predominance. Protestantism, for its part, was identified with the nationalist, monarchist and conservative ideology which controlled all key institutions such as education, the army, the administration and so on. Ross shows convincingly how the *Kulturkampf* had a lasting impact on the tensions between the different religious and social groups in the German *Kaiserreich*. The author, who has published widely on this subject, and in particular on the limits of state power with regard to the *Kulturkampf* (for example, see his article in this JOURNAL xlvii [1995], 669–88), has produced an impressive study based on extensive archival research. This work, in every respect a very valuable account of one of the most critical events in the history of Bismarck's chancellorship, will be the point of departure for any future investigation.

GERMAN HISTORICAL INSTITUTE,
LONDON

BENEDIKT STUCHTEY

Suomi ja Pyhä Istuin, 1918–1968. Suomen ja Vatikanikaupungin valtion välisten suhteiden kehitys vuodesta 1918 vuoteen 1968. By Pekka Salo. (Suomen Kirkkohistoriallisen Seuran, Toimituksia 176. Finska Kyrkohistoriska Samfundets Handlingar, 176.) Helsinki: Suomen Kirkkohistoriallinen Seura/Societas Historiae Ecclesiasticae Fennica, 1997. Pp. iv + 331 incl. 11 ills. 952 5031 08 X; 0356 0759

This is a study of the development of relations between Finland and the papacy. The pope quickly recognised the independence of Finland after 1918 but not until 1942 (what a year!) did the Finns think of setting up a formal link. There is a 15pp. Italian summary at the end. It was a troubled link; even now the pronuncio lives in Copenhagen.

SELWYN COLLEGE,
CAMBRIDGE

OWEN CHADWICK