

1994

Review of *A Distinctive Industrialization: Cotton in Barcelona, 1728-1832*, by J.K.L. Thomson

Gary W. McDonogh

Bryn Mawr College, gmcdonog@brynmawr.edu

[Let us know how access to this document benefits you.](#)

Follow this and additional works at: http://repository.brynmawr.edu/cities_pubs

 Part of the [Architecture Commons](#), [History of Art, Architecture, and Archaeology Commons](#), and the [Urban Studies and Planning Commons](#)

Custom Citation

McDonogh, Gary W. Review of *A Distinctive Industrialization: Cotton in Barcelona, 1728-1832*, by J.K.L. Thomson. *Journal of Social History* 27 (1994): 864-866.

This paper is posted at Scholarship, Research, and Creative Work at Bryn Mawr College. http://repository.brynmawr.edu/cities_pubs/18

For more information, please contact repository@brynmawr.edu.

other's baptisms and weddings; he finds that witnesses were as likely to reside far away as next door or on the same street. Still, without further comparative work it is difficult to know whether the glass is half empty or half full.

Scherzer's book effectively challenges facile assertions of a transparent relation between where people lived and their affirmative sense of community. He suggests ways to break out of the assumptions of linear development toward class-differentiated neighborhoods and identifies a range of variables that historians should consider in thinking about social loyalties. His discursive footnotes provide a running commentary (sometimes, like the text, unnecessarily defensive and aggressive in tone) on the sociological as well as historiographic literature on cities and neighborhoods. The book is rich in information and makes a persuasive case for the need for greater precision in historians' descriptions of both neighborhood and community ties.

In his conclusion Scherzer observes that while the concept of "aspatial communities" might be considered "overly optimistic . . . it still has validity" because "harsh conditions did not lead to social decay" (211). Used critically, social network theory offers historians fresh ways to conceptualize different modes of social interaction; but it is not clear what it tells us one way or the other about how people experienced "harsh conditions," including their "community" interactions with employers, landlords, shopkeepers, creditors, or police as well as with neighbors and more distant friends and relatives. No less than the theories of Marxist historians or liberal sociologists that Scherzer is at pains to critique, the unbounded community can be viewed as an ideological concept, well tailored to our own era. Whether it inspires optimism remains a political as much as a scholarly question.

Columbia University

Elizabeth Blackmar

A Distinctive Industrialization: Cotton in Barcelona, 1728–1832. By J. K. L. Thomson (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1992. xix plus 347 pp.).

In this clear and well-documented work, Professor Thomson takes as his starting point Pierre Vilar's magisterial *La Catalogne dans L'Espagne Moderne* (1962). He builds on this heritage by following the transformations of the Catalan cotton industry from Early Modern commerce through the critical pre-industrial decades amidst shifting policies of the Spanish state which underpinned the 19th-century industrial triumph of Barcelona and Catalonia. Thomson combines painstaking attention to archival data with strong collegial recognition of the excellent work which has advanced Catalan historiography about this period. The result is a clear and detailed presentation of a critical century, which engages ongoing area studies while raising more general theoretical questions about comparative European industrialization for which he laid the foundations in his *Clermont-de-Lodeve, 1633–1789* (1982).

The book's chapters introduce Catalonia to the non-specialist before pursu-

ing an exhaustive chronicle of industrial organization, technology, and socio-political changes, decade by decade. Thus, detailed study begins with the establishment of calico printing in Barcelona, where Thomson situates early entrepreneurs within the context of markets and imports as well as the Spanish (and comparative) political framework of industrial growth in the early 18th century. This leads to more direct considerations of the rationale behind the movement and impact of mercantile capital in burgeoning industrialization as well as contested questions of the importance of American colonial markets. Thomson maintains a balance between the characteristics of individual founders and the ongoing transformation of their industrial milieu—labor, government, technology, and markets—through the height of this first industrial boom in the 1780s. He skillfully draws together the successes *and* failures of individual firms and figures in order to present a nuanced yet comprehensive vision. He also stands back from time to time to ask more generally about patterns of growth as well as Catalonia's position within wider European changes.

Thomson interrupts this flow in his seventh chapter to explore the history of spinning, which developed extensively only in the 1780s, although it was soon put in a decisive position by a ban on imported yarn in 1802. This provides a kind of counterpoint—technological, organizational and political—to his examination of weaving and printing industries, as well as a bridge to a final examination of the crisis of the factory between 1787 and 1832. While he moves more rapidly in contrasting 1790 and 1823 as industrial conjunctures, he nonetheless teases out local, national and international forces that led to dramatic changes in the nature and future of Catalan growth.

The book ends with a return to a carefully developed specific case—the Bonaplata mill—which is taken to summarize the major themes of the book. Unfortunately, this produces a rather rapid and, on the whole, less than clearly developed conclusion which does not do justice to the careful craftsmanship of the previous chapters or major themes such as pre-industrial foundations and the relation of entrepreneurial and rentier capital.

Other points of criticism might also be raised about the narrow focus of the work. While social and political forces are shown to interlock with industrial organization, Thomson avoids critical questions of cultural transformation—whether in urban values, form or interactions—of the kind whose importance James S. Amelang has so clearly underscored in *Honored Citizens of Barcelona*. In some cases, these lacunae obscure more central features of economic transformation—e.g. the changing values associated with land and titles, or the importance of women and family in the organization of trade as well as the reproduction of capital. Scholars from Vilar and Vicens Vives onward have shown how questions of language, of urban models and urban form and ceremony have been not epiphenomena but central issues in defining the “Catalan-ness” of this industrialization. Avoidance of these considerations detaches Thomson's excellent reconstruction of industrialization per se from the life of the city and polity with which it was so intimately associated.

Nonetheless, Thomson has done many readers a service by both his own rich analytic work and his bridge from vital worlds of contemporary Catalan scholarship to an English-speaking audience. He has placed Catalonia's distinctive

industrialization at the center of studies of the economic, political, social and cultural roots of a "New Europe" whose complex heritage we continue to grapple with today.

Bryn Mawr College

Gary W. McDonogh

Football and Its Fans: Supporters and their Relations with the Game, 1885–1985. By Rogan Taylor (Leicester: Leicester University Press, 1992. viii plus 198 pp.).

Although Taylor's title suggests a somewhat broader study of England's soccer fans, his focus—apart from some rather perfunctory chapters on the early years of the sport—is actually on the National Federation of Football Supporters' Clubs, an organization founded in 1927 on the initiative of Thomas Hodgson, a supporter of Northampton Town Football Club. The members of the NFFSC were all clubs formed to support amateur and professional soccer clubs. At its zenith, the NFFSC may have had as many as 250 member clubs, some of whom had thousands of individual members. In the postwar years, the number of clubs represented at the annual meeting declined from 139 in 1960 to a mere 40 in 1988. After the failure of numerous bids to revitalize the NFFSC by opening it to individual members, dissident fans eager for a less mediated relationship with the Football Association (and with the government) formed a rival organization, the Football Supporters' Association (1985). (Taylor served for four years as the FSA's chairman.)

Even the days of its maximum influence, just before and just after the war, the NFFSC was relatively ineffective. Its motto, "To help and not to hinder," aptly summarized its attitude vis-à-vis the Football Association, which refused officially to recognize the existence of the NFFSC until the Sixties, when representatives of both organizations were invited to participate in the government's many studies of British soccer and its discontents. Although the stadia were uncomfortable and unsafe, Jack Patience, "the truculent Coventry representative" (59), was unable to interest his NFFSC colleagues in any kind of serious remonstrance to the FA or the football clubs. Unthreatened, the FA's attitude towards the obsequious NFFSC was "cynical" (97). Repeated requests for a share of the tickets to the Cup Final were ignored. Four years after parliamentary lobbying by the NFFSC helped pass the Lotteries Act of 1956, the FA changed its rules to permit "official" supporters' clubs, i.e., those set up and strictly controlled by the football clubs, to administer the newly legalized source of income. The NFFSC's independent supporters' clubs were pushed aside.

The directors of most individual football clubs seem to have treated their supporters' clubs with disdain equal to the FA's. It was a rare football club whose directors included a single representative of the supporters who had given them hundreds of thousands of pounds. Worse yet, it was often the case that "supporters found themselves barred from the very facilities they had paid to construct" (115). It has been, in Taylor's view, a sorry story in which powerful and arrogant organizations have manhandled weak and supine ones.