

**sinergie**  
italian journal of management



Società Italiana di  
**MANAGEMENT**

**SINERGIE-SIMA 2018 CONFERENCE**

**Transformative business strategies  
and new patterns for value creation**

**Extender Abstract**

*Ca' Foscari University, Venice  
Department of Management - San Giobbe, Cannaregio 873*

**14-15 June 2018**

**Convegno Sinergie - Sima 2018**

**Transformative business strategies  
and new patterns for value creation**

**14-15 June 2018**

***Referred Electronic  
Conference Proceeding***

**Extender Abstact**

a cura di

*Claudio Baccarani, Marco Frey, Gaetano M. Golinelli,  
Alberto Pastore e Tiziano Vescovi*

# INDICE

## TRACK - STRATEGY BETWEEN THEORY AND PRACTICE

|   |   |    |
|---|---|----|
| <i>Merging strategic and behavioural perspectives on corporate responses to climate change. An empirical analysis of institutional and individual drivers of climate action in the Italian manufacturing industry</i> | “ | 3  |
| NICCOLÒ MARIA TODARO, FRANCESCO TESTA, TIBERIO DADDI, FABIO IRALDO  |   |    |
| <i>Technology-driven store format: from impact on practice to impact on theory</i>  | “ | 9  |
| VIRGINIA VANNUCCI, GAETANO AIELLO   |   |    |
| <i>Cresciute in fretta. Organizzazioni a rapida crescita: verso la creazione di un approccio analitico “ad hoc”</i>   | “ | 13 |
| LEONARDO POMPA, FULVIO FORTEZZA, GIOVANNI MASINO  |   |    |
| <i>La logica esperienziale applicata alle strategie del comparto fieristico: una review della letteratura</i>   | “ | 17 |
| TONINO PENCARELLI, MARCO CIOPII, ILARIA CURINA, FABIO FORLANI   |   |    |

## TRACK - STRATEGIA TRA TEORIA E PRATICA

|  |   |    |
|--|---|----|
| <i>Il rightshoring e le strategie di localizzazione delle attività delle imprese. Alcuni casi a confronto</i>    | “ | 27 |
| ALESSANDRO BARONCELLI, VALERIA BELVEDERE, LUIGI SERIO  |   |    |
| <i>Effetti competitivi della sharing economy nei servizi ricettivi</i>   | “ | 33 |
| AURELIO G. MAURI, ROBERTA MINAZZI, RUGGERO SAINAGHI  |   |    |
| <i>Ambidexterity e performance management. Un’evidenza empirica di implementazione della strategia aziendale</i> | “ | 39 |
| DANIELE BINCI, CORRADO CERRUTI, STEFANO ANTONIO DONNARUMMA, PIERLUIGI PALMIGIANI                                 |   |    |
| <i>L’influenza della componente enogastronomica sul comportamento di viaggio degli italiani</i>                  | “ | 47 |
| ROBERTA GARIBALDI, ANDREA POZZI  |   |    |

## TRACK - RETHINKING STRATEGY: STRATEGIC ENGAGEMENT FOR VALUE CREATION

|  |   |    |
|--|---|----|
| <i>Transformative strategies for employee engagement: managers and employees confronted</i>                          | “ | 53 |
| ALESSANDRA MAZZEI, LUCA QUARATINO, ALFONSA BUTERA, CHIARA FISICHELLA   |   |    |
| <i>Unpacking the good soldier syndrome: the role of authentic leadership and organizational citizenship behavior</i> | “ | 57 |
| RICCARDO RIALTI, GIACOMO FABIETTI, LAMBERTO ZOLLO, CRISTIANO CIAPPEI   |   |    |

## TRACK - BUSINESS MODELS EVOLUTION: TECHNOLOGY AND BEYOND

|   |   |    |
|---|---|----|
| <i>The financial attractiveness of business models: an analysis of sharing economy companies</i>          | “ | 63 |
| LAURA MICHELINI, CECILIA GRIECO, GENNARO IASEVOLI   |   |    |
| <i>When open innovation drives business models evolution: the case of business to business markets</i>    | “ | 69 |
| TINDARA ABBATE, ANNA CODINI, BARBARA AQUILANI   |   |    |
| <i>On the way to business blockchainization: An empirical analysis of successful ICOs</i>                 | “ | 73 |
| DANIELA ANDREINI, GIUSEPPE PEDELIENTO, MARA BERGAMASCHI   |   |    |
| <i>Business model innovation in complex servitized systems: the case of OBC in capital equipment SMEs</i> | “ | 77 |
| MARCO PAIOLA  |   |    |
| <i>Smart tourism destinations and its integration into territorial certifications</i>                     | “ | 83 |
| TINDARA ABBATE, ELVIRA TIZIANA LA ROCCA, ALFONSO VARGAS-SANCHEZ   |   |    |

## TRACK - L'EVOLUZIONE DEI MODELLI DI BUSINESS TRA BIG DATA E TECNOLOGIA

|  |      |     |
|--|------|-----|
| <i>Big data governance e PMI: evidenze dal distretto aerospaziale campano</i><br>FILOMENA IZZO, DOMENICO GRAZIANO, MARIO MUSTILLI  | PAG. | 91  |
| <i>Collusione, processi decisionali ed intelligenza artificiale</i><br>FABRIZIO IANNONI, ALBERTO PASTORE   | “    | 97  |
| <i>L'innovazione digitale per le strategie di tailor made delle imprese del Made in Italy nei mercati internazionali</i><br>GAETANO MACARIO, SAVINO SANTOVITO, SERGIO SALOMONE, RAFFAELE SILVESTRI | “    | 103 |
| <i>Il management del trasferimento tecnologico nell'ambito delle Strategie Regionali di Specializzazione Intelligente (S3)</i><br>MARIACARMELA PASSARELLI, FRANCESCO RICOTTA, ALFIO CARIOLA        | “    | 107 |
| <i>Competences and performance in metal waste supply chain: lessons from Italy</i><br>MARIACARMELA PASSARELLI, FRANCESCO RICOTTA, PINO VECELLIO  | “    | 113 |
| <i>I teatri lirici italiani: efficienza, efficacia e ruolo della tecnologia</i><br>CLEMENTINA BRUNO, FABRIZIO ERBETTA, GIOVANNI FRAQUELLI, ANNA MENOZZI  | “    | 119 |

## TRACK - MARKETING STRATEGIES TO CREATE CUSTOMER VALUE

|  |   |     |
|--|---|-----|
| <i>Niche marketing: an exploration from the perspective of tourism businesses</i><br>ALBERTO MATTIACCI, ATTILIO BRUNI, FRANCESCA MAGNO, FABIO CASSIA                             | “ | 127 |
| <i>From traditional customer segmentation to buyer personas: new strategies to create customer value</i><br>GIORGIA SEPE, AUDUR HERMANNSDOTTIR, BIRGIT HAGEN, ANTONELLA CARCAGNÌ | “ | 133 |

## TRACK - BUSINESS STRATEGIES FOR A BETTER WORLD

|   |   |     |
|---|---|-----|
| <i>Resources slack for social entrepreneurship: the genesis of social and strategic growth options</i><br>BEATRICE ORLANDO, ANTONIO RENZI, GIANLUCA VAGNANI, CRAIG WATTERS  | “ | 139 |
| <i>CSR and organizational culture: the competitive advantage of organizations</i><br>MARCELA LEPORE   | “ | 153 |
| <i>CSR strategy in the Internet era</i><br>PAOLO POPOLI   | “ | 159 |
| <i>Enhancing entrepreneurship for social change in the Euro-Mediterranean Region: Evidence from the UNIDO e4SC program</i><br>MICHAEL SHERIFF, MORENO MUFFATTO  | “ | 165 |
| <i>Ethics perceived in IMIs socially responsible investments (SRIs): some findings and perspectives on UK and Italian Asset Management companies</i><br>MAURO SCIARELLI, MARIO TANI, CATELLO GIOVANNI LANDI, LORENZO TURRIZIANI | “ | 171 |

## TRACK - COMPETITION AND COLLABORATION IN BUSINESS

|   |   |     |
|---|---|-----|
| <i>Knowledge technology improvement in manufacturing systems. Case analysis of 'open strategy business model'</i><br>GIAN LUCA GREGORI, MARIA ROSARIA MARCONE                       | “ | 181 |
| <i>Advertising in extreme vs traditional sports. Is there a difference?</i><br>MICHELA C. MASON, ANDREA MORETTI, DANIELE SCARPI, FRANCESCO RAGGIOTTO                                | “ | 187 |
| <i>Who tells the story? Defining visual storytelling as a new territory in digital innovation narrative</i><br>REBECCA PERA   | “ | 191 |
| <i>Le dinamiche cooperative nell'ambito delle imprese multibusiness: un caso studio esplicativo</i><br>ROSANNA AMATA, GIOVANNI BATTISTA DAGNINO, ANNA MINÀ, PASQUALE MASSIMO PICONE | “ | 197 |
| <i>Il contributo della comunicazione al successo della strategia cooperativa</i><br>SONIA C. GIACCONE, GIOVANNI BATTISTA DAGNINO, ALESSANDRA MAZZEI                                 | “ | 201 |

## TRACK - LA PROSPETTIVA DEL CONSUMATORE AL VALORE

|   |          |
|---|----------|
| <i>Exploring creative brands' digital storytelling impact on successful "self-portraits":<br/>A case study in Italian furniture brands</i><br>YUHONG ZHOU, JIE ZHANG, ROMANA ANDÒ                             | PAG. 209 |
| <i>La segmentazione della marca del distributore "premium": la valutazione dei consumatori<br/>in relazione ai fattori di scelta</i><br>GUIDO CRISTINI, CRISTINA ZERBINI                                      | " 217    |
| <i>Discovering mobile instant messaging in the business: technology acceptance model<br/>and customer perceived value on satisfaction and CRM performance</i><br>VITTORIA MARINO, LETIZIA LO PRESTI           | " 223    |
| <i>ViviSmart. Analisi dell'efficacia di una campagna educativa sul comportamento<br/>di consumo alimentare e lo stile di vita dei bambini</i><br>COSTANZA NOSI, ANTONELLA D'AGOSTINO, CARLO ALBERTO PRATESI   | " 227    |
| <i>Exploring the critical incident technique as a method for the analysis of online customer reviews</i><br>EDWARD BOON, LAURA BOUGARY, ALESSANDRO BIGI, MICHELLE BONERA                                      | " 231    |
| <i>Narrare il patrimonio storico e culturale dell'impresa per creare valore.<br/>Una proposta di definizione dell'heritage marketing-mix</i><br>MARIA ROSARIA NAPOLITANO, ANGELO RIVIEZZO, ANTONELLA GAROFANO | " 237    |
| <i>How to involve customers in the service creation process through the web.<br/>An investigation on some telecommunication firms</i><br>VALENTINA DELLA CORTE, GIOVANNA DEL GAUDIO, FABIANA SEPE             | " 241    |

## TRACK - DECISION SUPPORT SYSTEMS, NETWORKS AND STRATEGY

|  |       |
|--|-------|
| <i>The dark side of big data: a new framework to understand and manage risks</i><br>SINEAD RODEN, FENG LI, ALBERTO NUCCIARELLI   | " 253 |
| <i>3D printing and the impact on global value chains re-configurations</i><br>STEFANO DENICOLAI, GIOVANNA MAGNANI, ANTONELLA ZUCHELLA  | " 257 |
| <i>Il lato "Humane" dell'entrepreneurship: un nuovo modello per una nuova prospettiva</i><br>ROBERTO PARENTE, ROSANGELA FEOLA, VALENTINA CUCINO, MASSIMILIANO VESCI,<br>CHIARA CRUDELE, ANTONIO BOTTI, VALTER RASSEGA                                    | " 265 |
| <i>Network inter-impresa ed opportunità imprenditoriali: il ruolo dei legami deboli<br/>e forti nella formazione e nello sfruttamento delle opportunità imprenditoriali</i><br>GIOVANNI BATTISTA DAGNINO, GABRIELLA LEVANTI, ARABELLA MOCCIARO LI DESTRI | " 271 |
| <i>L'orientamento strategico delle Università. Verso una accountability "integrata"</i><br>STEFANIA DI CARLO   | " 277 |

## TRACK - STRUMENTI MANAGERIALI PER LO SVILUPPO DI NETWORK E TERRITORI

|   |       |
|---|-------|
| <i>Strategic vision, sustainability, and self-organization control in the Ferrari's city of Maranello</i><br>ANGELO RIVA, LUCIANO PILOTTI                                     | " 285 |
| <i>Il rapporto tra marche locali e territorio di riferimento. Risultati di un'indagine esplorativa</i><br>GABRIELE QUALIZZA   | " 293 |
| <i>"Turnà a 'ndomà": un'analisi sulla destinazione d'uso dell'Ex Padiglione Expo<br/>del Kuwait da parte del comune di Brembilla (BG)</i><br>MAURO CAVALLONE                  | " 299 |
| <i>Managing ICT platforms in service ecosystems: a strategic approach to value co-creation</i><br>PIERPAOLO SINGER, CARLO ALESSANDRO SIRIANNI, ANTONELLA MONDA, MARA GRIMALDI | " 305 |



## TRACK - CROWDFUNDING AS A NEW BUSINESS MODEL

*Equity crowdfunding: investigating the role of entrepreneurial quality in affecting the success of the campaigns*

CIRO TROISE, ELENA CANDELO, MARIO SORRENTINO

PAG. 315

*Linguistic style of crowdfunding pitches: How does displayed narcissism influence crowdfunding success?*

SIMONA LEONELLI, FRANCESCA DI PIETRO, FRANCESCA MASCIARELLI

“ 321

*Il crowdfunding e le variabili predittive di successo: il caso Kickstarter*

FRANCESCO CAPPÀ, RICCARDO MAIOLINI, MARIA ISABELLA LEONE, MICHELE PINELLI, LORENZO RABBIA

“ 325

*L'influenza del linguaggio in una campagna di finanziamento di crowdfunding*

RICCARDO MAIOLINI, FRANCESCO CAPPÀ, MARIA ISABELLA LEONE, MICHELE PINELLI, GIULIA BEDI

“ 329

*The private equity model of value creation through innovation financing*

ANNA GERVASONI, ALESSIA MUZIO, ANDREA ODILLE BOSIO, MARIA TERESA DI GRADO

“ 335

## OFF THE TRACK - CONTAMINAZIONI AL PENSIERO MANAGERIALE

*Ri-ri-ri-nascimento: guardare al passato e farlo diventare “altro da sé”, una strategia identitaria per le imprese italiane*

DANIELA CAVALLO

“ 345

## TRACK - STRATEGIC MANAGEMENT & CORPORATE GOVERNANCE

*Le euristiche nei processi decisionali delle nuove imprese*

GIANNI LORENZONI

“ 351

*Anticorruption, risk management and governance. Features of a triple relationship*

IRENE BUZZI, CLAUDIO NASSISI

“ 361

*New models of football governance: fan-ownership in UK and Italy*

DANIEL TORCHIA, ANNA CLAUDIA PELLICELLI

“ 367

*Academic spin-offs' team composition: a hypothesis of non-linear relationship between team heterogeneity and growth performance*

GIULIA TAGLIAZUCCHI, GIANLUCA MARCHI, BERNARDO BALBONI

“ 371

*The parent university influence over academic spin-offs: the case of four universities in Milan*

ALESSANDRO BARONCELLI, MATTEO LANDONI

“ 375

*Una reinterpretazione della corporate governance alla luce della tecnologia blockchain: nuove prospettive*

SALVATORE ESPOSITO DE FALCO, NICOLA CUCARI

“ 379

## TRACK - INNOVATION AND TECHNOLOGY MANAGEMENT

*Strategic management and industry 4.0. An exploratory study through a manufacturing case study*

ANDREA CHIARINI, VALERIA BELVEDERE

“ 387

*Internal and external perspectives on user innovation: what was left behind?*

KHATEREH GHASEMZADEH, GUIDO BORTOLUZZI

“ 393

*Know who e know how: il ruolo degli intermediari per lo sviluppo di nuovi prodotti*

GIUSEPPE CAPPIELLO

“ 399

## TRACK - ENTREPRENEURSHIP

|  |          |
|--|----------|
| <i>The role of the entrepreneurial university in fostering women entrepreneurship: a cross-cultural study</i><br>MARIA CARMEN LAUDANO, LAMBERTO ZOLLO, CRISTIANO CIAPPEI, VINCENZO ZAMPI     | PAG. 405 |
| <i>Entrepreneurship across cultures. A BR approach</i><br>CHIARA CANNAVALE, IMAN ZOHOORIAN NADALI  | “ 413    |
| <i>Antecedents and consequences of work-family conflicts: Italian women entrepreneurs' experiences</i><br>SARA POGGESI, MICHELA MARI, LUISA DE VITA  | “ 417    |
| <i>Entrepreneurial ecosystems: a qualitative comparative analysis (QCA) of their similarities and differences around the world</i><br>MARIA CRISTINA CINICI, ANTONIO CRUPI, DANIELA BAGLIERI | “ 423    |
| <i>The impact of market orientation on research-based spin off performance: emerging issues from an exploratory study</i><br>NICOLETTA BURATTI, LUCA PERSICO, GIORGIA PROFUMO                | “ 427    |
| <i>Il ruolo coesivo della passione imprenditoriale: nuove prospettive teoriche e risultati emergenti da un'analisi esplorativa</i><br>ANDREA RUNFOLA, SILVIA RANFAGNI                        | “ 431    |

## TRACK - INTERNATIONAL BUSINESS

|   |       |
|---|-------|
| <i>A study on the causal-effect relationship linking the financial crisis, international trade and the failures rate in the Italian iron kitchenware industry</i><br>MARIA GARBELLI   | “ 437 |
| <i>Le determinanti del “made in Sicily”: prime evidenze di un'indagine empirica internazionale</i><br>SONIA C. GIACCONE, ROSARIO FARACI, GRAZIANA MICALIZZI   | “ 449 |
| <i>Fattori di competitività per le imprese distrettuali nell'economia globalizzata</i><br>FABIO MUSSO, BARBARA FRANCONI   | “ 455 |
| <i>Il modello della Tripla Elica e le determinanti delle intenzioni imprenditoriali nei giovani ricercatori: un confronto internazionale</i><br>ROBERTO PARENTE, ROSANGELA FEOLA, VALENTINA CUCINO, MASSIMILIANO VESCI, CHIARA CRUDELE, ANTONIO BOTTI, VALTER RASSEGA | “ 463 |

## TRACK - TOURISM AND CULTURE MANAGEMENT

|  |       |
|--|-------|
| <i>Digitalization of value creation and value appropriation: the travel &amp; tourism industry case</i><br>CHIARA ACCIARINI, PAOLO BOCCARDELLI   | “ 471 |
| <i>Chinese tourism in Europe: the determinants of destination competitiveness</i><br>ANTONIO USAI, FRANCISCO MONTES, DANIELE PORCHEDDU, MANLIO DEL GIUDICE   | “ 477 |
| <i>Masters of branding in Italian museums: not only a matter of masterpieces</i><br>ANNAMARIA ESPOSITO, ANGELA BESANA  | “ 485 |
| <i>Intercultural sensitivity in tourism and hospitality - strategies for value creation</i><br>ANNA IRIMIÁS, MARIANGELA FRANCH   | “ 489 |
| <i>Dinamiche co-evolutive nel turismo: Il Caso “Convenzione delle Alpi”</i><br>LUNA LEONI, MATTEO CRISTOFARO, SILVIA BAIOTTO   | “ 495 |
| <i>Tutela e valorizzazione del patrimonio culturale. Il caso Forum Sempronii</i><br>EMANUELA CONTI, LAURA BARATIN, TONINO PENCARELLI   | “ 501 |
| <i>Responsabilità sociale d'impresa e performance aziendali nel settore turistico: un'analisi longitudinale nell'industria dell'ospitalità</i><br>STEFANO FRANCO, MATTEO GIULIANO CAROLI, FRANCESCO CAPPA, GIACOMO DEL CHIAPPA | “ 509 |

## TRACK - SUSTAINABILITY

|  |          |
|--|----------|
| <i>Restaurant sustainability: an exploratory study on client's food waste composition, motivation, habits and doggy bag adoption</i><br>LUDOVICA PRINCIPATO, LUCA SECONDI                                  | PAG. 517 |
| <i>Sustainable business models in services: multiple case study in yacht tourism</i><br>CINZIA BATTISTELLA, MARIA ROSITA CAGNINA, LUCIA CICERO, NADIA PREGHENELLA  | “ 521    |
| <i>L'economia circolare come opportunità di business? Un'indagine esplorativa sulle imprese italiane</i><br>ANGELO DI GREGORIO, MARCO FREY, FRANCESCA CERUTI, LAURA GAVINELLI                              | “ 527    |
| <i>Stakeholder engagement nelle pratiche di sostenibilità aziendale. Un'indagine empirica condotta attraverso i corporate website</i><br>FRANCESCA CONTE, AGOSTINO VOLLERO, ALFONSO SIANO, CLAUDIA COVUCCI | “ 535    |

## TRACK - SMALL AND FAMILY BUSINESS

|   |       |
|---|-------|
| <i>A social enterprise in Gomorrah-land: a tale of radical cultural entrepreneurship and social innovation management</i><br>LILIA GIUGNI, NEIL STOTT, ROBERTO VONA | “ 543 |
|---|-------|

## TRACK - RETAILING AND SERVICE MANAGEMENT

|   |       |
|---|-------|
| <i>Effective service recovery after privacy failure</i><br>FRANCESCA NEGRI, MARCO IEVA  | “ 551 |
| <i>The strategic evolution of fashion flagship stores</i><br>EDOARDO SABBADIN, SIMONE AIOLFI  | “ 557 |
| <i>Retail channels evolution in the car industry: early findings from the Volvo car 'Studio' experience</i><br>LUCIA PIZZICHINI                         | “ 563 |
| <i>Multichannel integration, physical distance and consumers' online purchase intention</i><br>MICHELA MATARAZZO, RICCARDO RESCINITI, FEDERICA DE VANNA | “ 569 |
| <i>Comparing business models in the grocery retailing industry: a conceptual framework proposal</i><br>LUIGI CANTONE, VINCENZO BASILE, PIERPAOLO TESTA  | “ 575 |
| <i>Consumers' privacy concern, trust and the trap of willingness to share information</i><br>SANDRO CASTALDO, MONICA GROSSO                             | “ 581 |

## TRACK - OPERATIONS E SUPPLY CHAIN MANAGEMENT

|   |       |
|---|-------|
| <i>L'adozione della tecnologia blockchain nel management della supply chain: nuove prospettive di ricerca</i><br>ROBERTO VONA, NADIA DI PAOLA                                   | “ 587 |
| <i>Evaluating brands in online communities: it's not just a matter of engagement</i><br>SILVIA RANFAGNI, MONICA FARAONI, CLAUDIO BECAGLI  | “ 591 |
| <i>L'innovazione digitale attraverso il networking nel settore agroalimentare</i><br>RAFFAELE SILVESTRI, FRANCESCO PETRUCCI, SAVINO SANTOVITO                                   | “ 597 |
| <i>Performance d'impresa e nuovi strumenti per una gestione sistemica del rischio</i><br>SERGIO SALOMONE, SAVINO SANTOVITO, MARIO SCICUTELLA                                    | “ 601 |
| <i>Dalla catena alla costellazione del valore: il collective impact e la sfida della riduzione della povertà</i><br>GIACOMO BÜCHI, ANNA CUGNO, MONICA CUGNO, REBECCA CASTAGNOLI | “ 609 |
| <i>Blockchain e criptovalute: strumento di democratizzazione imprenditoriale o bolla speculativa?</i><br>GIOVANNA DOSSENA, FRANCESCA MAGNO, PASQUALE MASSIMO PICONE             | “ 615 |



## TRACK - MARKETING & COMMUNICATION

|   |          |
|---|----------|
| <i>Opportunità e limiti nell'utilizzo del sito web in chiave esperienziale nel contesto dei centri commerciali</i><br>MARCO CIOPPI, ILARIA CURINA, TONINO PENCARELLI, ELISABETTA SAVELLI                                  | PAG. 621 |
| <i>Ad ogni navigante il suo porto: la segmentazione nei marina</i><br>CLARA BENEVOLO, RICCARDO SPINELLI   | “ 627    |
| <i>Misurare la creazione di valore attraverso i social network digitali</i><br>STEFANIA ROMENTI, GRAZIA MURTARELLI  | “ 633    |
| <i>Content marketing e brand journalism: un'analisi esplorativa sull'uso di contenuti editoriali per sviluppare la corporate reputation</i><br>CARLO ALBERTO PRATESI, LUDOVICA PRINCIPATO, DIOMIRA CENNAMO, GERMANA RUSSO | “ 637    |
| <i>I millennials italiani e le nuove in-store technologies. Un'indagine esplorativa nel fast fashion</i><br>MARCO VALERIO ROSSI, MARIA VERNUCCIO, ALBERTO PASTORE   | “ 641    |
| <i>I fattori di scelta dei servizi professionali: il punto di vista delle imprese e delle società di consulenza</i><br>TONINO PENCARELLI, LINDA GABBIANELLI   | “ 651    |

# New models of football governance: fan-ownership in UK and Italy

DANIEL TORCHIA\* ANNA CLAUDIA PELLICELLI\*

**Objectives.** *The paper presents an ongoing study of fan-ownership as a new alternative method of football governance, in both Italy and the UK, and it aims to assess its limits and possibilities, in a competitive and capitalistic sector like senior football. Football is witnessing important changes in recent years, as newer ways of organising are questioning the established models of ownership and management, typical of leagues such as the English Premier League or the Italian Serie A. Alternative ways are offered by the recent but growing phenomenon of fan-ownership, aimed at promoting a more democratic governance of football clubs. Those recent developments find their roots in the process of hyper-commodification of football (Walsh and Giulianotti, 2001), deemed by the scholars to contain pathological circumstances and elements, where the corporatization of football clubs constitutes the main one. Because of the hyper-commodification of the football industry, football clubs in the last thirty years have become rapidly and steadily trans-national companies, welcoming the idea of the ‘customer’ and ‘football flaneur’ as a replacement for the traditional ‘football fan’ (Giulianotti, 2002). The fan-ownership model constitutes an existing and growing trend in the UK, where about thirty football clubs currently exists, albeit with some differences in their governance model, but all sharing a sense of discontent with the commodification of the game. In Italy, the discussion about fan-ownership is at a much earlier stage, and fan-associations ToroMio and MyRoma have just recently drafted a law proposal to introduce a new governance model for football clubs. As Hognestad (2012) argues, football fans, for their loyalty and attachment to the club, constitute a fundamental stakeholder, so fan-ownership implies a shift for football fans from emotional to actual stakeholders, agents of change and custodians of the football club. A strong duty of care towards the surrounding communities is often at the heart of those (utopian) projects, in the attempt to reaffirm football fundamentally as a grassroots activity and exploit its potential for social development.*

*This paper looks at fan-ownership in two countries: the first one is an ethnographic study of one the most radical examples of fan-ownership in the UK, namely Football Club United of Manchester (hereafter FC United), a semi-professional club set up in 2005 by disenchanted Manchester United fans, who saw the acquisition of the club by the Glazer family, after borrowing the incredible amount of £500 million, as the ‘last straw’ (Poulton, 2009) of twenty years of deep changes in the nature of football. FC United was created as a 100% fan-owned club, according to the one member-one vote principles reminiscing of co-operatives: in just ten years of history it has achieved four promotions and has managed to build its own stadium, thanks to huge donations from members and fans and through several partnerships with the public sector. The club has now over five-thousand members from all over the world. FC United also strives to affirm the aggregative power of football, to reconnect with surrounding communities, both geographical and of fans, as a means to fight the incessant individualisation of society (Bauman, 2000; 2001). The second Country of this analysis is Italy but, given the novelty of the argument in this Country, the ongoing fieldwork study will strive to provide a preliminary account of how tangible and feasible the introduction of the fan-owned football club would be, giving voice to the proponents of fan-ownership and to football fans on how this initiative could challenge the status quo in football management. As fieldwork in Italy is just starting, findings will be mostly related to the ethnographic research of FC United.*

*The paper seeks therefore to explore and analyse challenges and opportunities for ‘making a difference’ as alternative (and utopian) organisations in a highly competitive environment like senior football, questioning whether fan-ownership models can constitute a viable and credible alternative to management, as it is presented in mainstream business education.*

**Methodology.** *The research methodology is inevitably affected by the different nature of the two cases of the UK and Italy, and it deploys the research methods that are considerate more appropriate to investigate fan-ownership in different settings. The research is, first and foremost, guided by the key principle of reflexivity: for Hammersley and Atkinson (2007), this means that regardless of the epistemological and ontological stance of our research, we are part of the social world that we study, so the findings will be shaped as much by the researcher as by the people or phenomenon studied.*

*The research in the UK has been carried out ethnographically, and the researcher has offered voluntary work in exchange for access to the organisation. Ethnography was chosen for this phase of the research for its ability to produce thick descriptions (Geertz, 1973), hence to understand and interpret the systems of meanings that produce a*

---

\* Research Scholarship Holder of Management - University of Turin  
e-mail: danieltorchia85@googlemail.com

• Associate Professor of Management - University of Turin  
e-mail: annaclusdia.pellicelli@unito.it

culture. The ethnographic fieldwork lasted for a year and a half and data were collected through daily notes arising from participant observations, countless conversations in the field, twenty semi-structured 'reflexive interviews' Hammersley (1992, p. 117), all complemented by internet fora, fanzines, Facebook groups and other literature on the club, which provided a great additional tool, especially to understand and analyse the club's past, in order to make sense of the here and now.

Conversely, the research in Italy is quali-quantitative, will feature semi-structured interviews with the actors behind the proposal of the introduction of fan-ownership, and followed by a large-scale questionnaire among football fans, aimed at understanding how fan-ownership is perceived, and to what extent fans themselves would be willing to invest time and money into the club they support.

**Findings.** The long study of FC United as an alternative football club, with a novel model of governance, helped analyzing challenges and opportunities for making a difference, and its credibility as a counterforce to mainstream business models. FC United can be considered as an experiment in cooperativism applied to football. Operating in senior competitive football, the club is clearly part of a different field from many worker co-operatives. Nevertheless, at its core, FC United follows principles of openness, democracy, community participation, autonomy and education. Despite setting a great example for other organisations operating in football, the principle of openness and the attempt to assert democracy on a wide scale across the club, proves to be also one of the biggest challenges the club must face, especially after a significant expansion. To prove and sustain its status of alternative organisation, FC United must attend to the principles of democracy and collective participation that the constitution promotes. For the club this means finding ways to actively engage with the wider membership in decision-making and in the operations and reconciling different positions has proven to be difficult. The work of Webb and Cheney (2014) helps to reflect on two aspects: what would be the optimal size for a member-owned organisation, and what would be a good turnout at general meetings, as a sign of member's engagement with the club. FC United is a rather large organisation nowadays, having reached over five thousand members in the season 2015-2016, but it can be seen just as a potential challenge, because the nature of FC United is such that not all the membership, or even better a rather small percentage, can be considered as active: many people join FC United as an act of sympathy and allegiance to the values it represents. The way FC United is set up as an organisation, leaves members the freedom to identify with what they prefer, whether is the football, the community or the politics, therefore not making the growing size an insurmountable problem. On the second matter, only about three-hundred members, almost all living locally, are active and regularly attend general meetings to vote. To date the club lacks an online system to stream and vote for fans who cannot be physically in Manchester. This is certainly a problem that needs addressing in the attempt of exercising the type of participative democracy that FC United promotes, and to become more and more a 'glocal' (Giulianotti and Robertson, 2007) organization.

The other great challenge is financial: despite the undoubtedly great achievements in keeping competitive the football club, building a brand-new stadium and constantly expanding range and scope of the community work, the ethnographic insights coming from the several members' meetings, pictured a situation where fans were continuously invited to make donations. The utopian side of the FC United project has often clashed with the reality of numbers and finances and, whereas for some of the staff the economic side was not an issue for other people, like some players or some community coaches, being part of something different (and quite in the spotlight, especially for the players) became secondary if the money earned was much less than what they could have earned somewhere else. It can be concluded that the economic challenges are even greater than the organisational matters in terms of democracy and representation. The club fights capitalism from within, directly challenging it, but cannot escape from the system of competitive football leagues it is in. To be able to compete on the same level as the other teams, the club must go to great lengths, and most of all keeping the members interested, engaged and happy to sacrifice their time (mostly for free) and their money for the well-being of the club. The cost of the stadium, which was finished in May 2015, has represented an unprecedented expense that had a duplex effect: on one side it revamped the flame of hope and utopian dreams; on the other side it highlighted one of the main limits of this organisational model, that in a very competitive environment like senior football, the more you try keeping up with the other teams and grow as a club, the harder it gets to financially sustain a model that excludes the presence of wealthy investors.

In terms of the opportunities for making a difference, FC United is an organisation with an immense potential, which has been able to gather worldwide attention of the media and football fans. The club shows that it is important to stay loyal to some basic principles, as much as it is to show openness and adaptability: in many ways, it became glocalised, respecting its Mancunian roots, but growing into a global entity that is taken as example of good practice by many people and other clubs from Europe and overseas. Moreover, the unwillingness to compromise and remain consistent over time, despite the promotions and the achievements, enhanced the club's profile and attracted new fans and members. To assess whether the FC United's model represents a viable alternative to mainstream models of management, for football clubs and beyond, it is important to look at the process of growth of the club, rather than just at the here and now. FC United had a steady evolution, following the motto often pronounced by the General Manager that 'this club can only go as far as members want it to go'. If we look at the process and development of the club, it encompassed all the elements of Alvesson and Willmott's (1992, 2014) emancipation diagram: it started with a questioning phase aimed at challenging the dominant socio-economical arrangements with modern football and especially Manchester United, which led to the decision to start a new club with different principles; a utopian phase, before the formation and during the very early days served to create a broader vision of the club and its potential goals;

finally over the years utopian elements have been alternated with incremental undertakings, as part of the wider utopian vision of the club. FC United can be better understood as an organisation that started with a grand vision of a football where ordinary fans could actively participate and not feeling just as customers. To getting close to achieve the grand vision, the club has embarked in a series of micro-emancipatory projects aimed at giving voice to fans and helping local communities. What is the real potential of the model though? If we look at the goals reached in its first ten years of history, it would be sensible to say that the participatory model of fan-ownership proposed by FC United can be developed into a widespread working alternative to mainstream management models of football clubs that could work in other contexts, such as the Italian one. It is also sensible to say that the model proposed by FC United takes fan-ownership to its most extreme heights and it is yet to be tested at higher levels. If fan ownership was to be introduced in Italy in some forms, it would probably strive to resemble more the German Fußball-Liga model of ownership, where members own most of the voting rights, following the '50+1 rule (BBC, 2013) that prevents football clubs to become fully privately owned. According to Massimiliano Romiti, president of the ToroMio association, commercialisation and privatization in football cannot be escaped in toto, especially in top-flight club but, with a cultural change that allows fans to get closer again to the teams they support, it is possible to shape football governance in a way that pleases both parties. The rest of the research among Italian fans will say more on this matter.

**Research limits.** Due to time constraints, in the UK only one club was studied in depth. The research would have certainly benefited from a multi-sited ethnography in the UK, to explore how other fan-owned clubs deal with issues of representation, decision-making and community, for instance; AFC Wimbledon and AFC Telford United would have been good examples. The research in Italy is just beginning, so it is difficult to foresee what the boundaries will be: one thing for sure is that fan-ownership project is still in its embryonal phase, as the draft law has just been presented and it is just trying to gain momentum, therefore many of the implications have yet to be seen.

**Practical implications.** The primary objectives of this research are to highlight the challenges and opportunities for alternative organizations in senior football to make a difference in a very established model of governance and to tease out the wider implication of the fan-ownership model for business and management education. Fan-ownership is an emerging phenomenon in football: understanding its potential in Italy will facilitate its introduction and eventually generate alternatives to the orthodox model of ownership and governance in this Country. Conversely, in the UK, the study highlights that fan-ownership, especially in the radical way proposed by FC United, can be hindered by advancement in the leagues, as money pressure arises. This highlights the challenges for football politicians to help sustaining and making viable these organizational forms at all levels of football.

**Originality of the study.** This is the first ever study that analyses fan-ownership in football from a business and management point of view, and as an alternative approach to more established models of management and governance in senior football. Previous research on FC United provided a political-economic framework to understand fans' motivation for joining FC United, and how fans and club interact (Poulton, 2013), and has assessed instead how notions of (fans) authenticity are articulated within English football, using Manchester and FC United as examples, focusing especially on the journey towards the formation of FC United (Porter 2011). Such studies have therefore looked at fan-owned football clubs from sociological, cultural and political perspectives, without stressing the challenges of establishing themselves as viable organizational alternatives alternatives.

**Key words:** football; alternative; critical management; fan-ownership; governance; community-value

## References

- ALVESSON M., WILLMOTT H. (1992), "On the idea of emancipation in management and organization studies", *Academy of Management Review*, vol. 17, n. 3, pp. 432-464.
- ALVESSON M., WILLMOTT H. (2014), *Making Sense of Management: a Critical Introduction*, 2nd edn, Sage, London.
- BAUMAN Z. (2000), *Liquid Modernity*, Polity Press, Cambridge.
- BAUMAN Z. (2001), *The Individualized Society*, Polity Press, Oxford.
- GEERTZ C. (1973), *The Interpretation of Cultures*, Basic, New York.
- GIULIANOTTI R. (2002), "Supporters, Followers, Fans, and Flaneurs: A Taxonomy of Spectator Identities in Football", *Journal of Sport & Social Issues*, vol. 26, n. 1, pp. 25-46.
- GIULIANOTTI R., ROBERTSON R. (2007), "Recovering the social: globalization, football and transnationalism", *Global Networks*, vol. 7, n. 2, pp. 144-186.
- HAMMERSLEY M. (1992), *What's Wrong with Ethnography? Methodological Explorations*, Routledge, London.
- HAMMERSLEY M., ATKINSON P. (2007), *Ethnography: Principles in Practice*, 3<sup>rd</sup> edn, Routledge, Oxon.
- HOGNESTEAD H.K. (2012), "Split loyalties: football is a community business", *Soccer & Society*, vol. 13, n. 3, pp. 377-391.
- PORTER C. (2011), "Cultures of Resistance and Compliance: Football Fandom and Political Engagement in Manchester", PhD thesis, Manchester Metropolitan University.
- POULTON G. (2013), "FC United of Manchester: Community and Politics amongst English Football Fans", PhD thesis, The University of Manchester.
- WALSH A.J., GIULIANOTTI R. (2001), "This sporting mammon: a normative critique of the commodification of sport", *Journal of the Philosophy of Sport*, vol. 28, n. 1, pp. 53-77.

WEBB T., CHENEY G. (2014), "Worker-owned and governed co-operatives and the wider cooperative movement: challenges and opportunities within and beyond the global economic crisis", in Parker M., Cheney G., Fournier V., Land C. (eds.) *The Routledge Companion to Alternative Organization* (pp. 64-88), Routledge, Oxon.

**Websites**

<http://www.bbc.com/news/business-22625160>