



UNIVERSITÀ DEGLI STUDI DI TORINO

This is an author version of the contribution published on:

Jaouani I; Abbassi MS; Alessandria V; Bouraoui J; Ben Salem R; Kilani H;  
Mansouri R; Messadi L; Cocolin L

High inhibition of *Paenibacillus* larvae and *Listeria monocytogenes* by  
*Enterococcus* isolated from different sources in Tunisia and identification of  
their bacteriocin genes

LETTERS IN APPLIED MICROBIOLOGY (2014) 59

**High inhibition of *Paenibacillus larvae* and *Listeria monocytogenes* by *Enterococcus* isolated from different sources in Tunisia and identification of their bacteriocin genes**

Imen Jaouani<sup>a</sup>, Mohamed Salah Abbassi<sup>a\*</sup>, Valentina Alessandria<sup>b</sup>, Jihen Bouraoui<sup>a</sup>, Rakia Ben Salem<sup>a</sup>, Hajer Kilani<sup>a</sup>, Riadh Mansouri<sup>a</sup>, Lilia Messadi<sup>c</sup>, Luca Cocolin<sup>b</sup>

<sup>a</sup>Laboratory of bacteriological research, Institute of Veterinary Research of Tunisia, 20 Street of Jebel Lakhdhar, Bab Saadoun, Tunis 1006, Tunisia

<sup>b</sup>Università di Torino, Dipartimento di Scienze Agrarie, Forestali e Alimentari, Via Leonardo da Vinci 44, Grugliasco, 10095 Turin, Italy

<sup>c</sup> National school of veterinary medicine, Department of microbiology and immunology, La Manouba University, Sidi Thabet, Tunisia

**Running head:** Inhibition of *P. larvae* and *L.monocytogenes* by *Enterococcus*

**\*Corresponding author:**

Abbassi Mohamed Salah

Institute of Veterinary Research of Tunisia, 20 Street Jebel Lakhdhar, Bab Saadoun, Tunis 1006, Tunisia

Tel: 00216 71 561 070

Fax: 00216 71 569 692

E. mail : salahtoumi\_mohamed@yahoo.com

**Significance and Impact of Study:** Enterococci possess interesting properties not only for the food industry, but also for animal and human health. The antimicrobial potential of these bacteria includes principally bacteriocin-like molecules. With the aim of identifying bacteriocinogenic strains, a collection of 300 enterococci isolated from different origins were screened and their spectrum of action, as well as the gene encoding the bacteriocin, were determined. Fifty nine bacteriocin-producing *Enterococcus* showed high activity against *Listeria monocytogenes* and *Paenibacillus larvae*, the causative agent of American Foulbrood. Enterocin A, P and L50A/B were found in various combinations. The most important finding of this study is the growth inhibition of *P. larvae* due to bacteriocin-producing *Enterococcus*, which opens up the possibility to use these strains to control the disease in honeybees.

### **Abstract**

A total of 300 isolates of *Enterococcus*, from different sources including feces of poultry, cow and sheep, raw milk, ricotta cheese, and water, in Tunisia, were screened for their antibacterial activity. Amongst them, 59 bacteriocin-producing strains were detected and identified by molecular methods. Genes encoding for *entA*, *entP*, *entB*, *entL50A/B*, AS-48, *bac31* bacteriocins were targeted by PCR. The bacteriocin-producing strains were assigned to the species *Enterococcus faecium*, *Ent. faecalis*, *Ent. hirae*, *Ent. mundtii* and *Ent. durans*, respectively 34, 19, 3, 2 and 1 isolates. Antimicrobial activity was specifically observed against different spoilage and pathogenic microorganisms, such as *Listeria monocytogenes*, *L. innocua*, *L. ivanovii*, *Escherichia coli*, *Ent. faecalis*, *Staphylococcus aureus*, *Salmonella enterica* serovar Enteritidis and *Paenibacillus larvae*. The inhibitory activity was totally lost after proteinase K treatment, thereby revealing the proteinaceous nature of the antimicrobial compound. Only three bacteriocin genes, namely *entP*, *entA*, and *entL50A/B* were detected in the isolates included in this study. Enterocin A and P were the most frequent genes and they were found in 55 (93.2%) and 39 isolates (66.1%), respectively, followed by enterocin

L50A/B present in 27 isolates (45.7%). These newly identified bacteriocin-producing enterococci have the potential to be used in bio-preservation of food as well as biological control of foulbrood disease.

**Keywords:** *Enterococcus*; bacteriocin; *Paenibacillus larvae*; *Listeria monocytogenes*; Tunisia

## Introduction

*Enterococcus* are Gram-positive, facultative anaerobic bacteria, belonging to the Lactic Acid Bacteria (LAB) group and they can be isolated from different ecosystems such as humans, animals, water, soil, plants, food, waste and poultry (Byappanahalli *et al.* 2012). The bacteria of the genus *Enterococcus* have the ability to produce several antimicrobial substances, including bacteriocins, specifically enterocins, which have the potential to be used in bio-preservation (Khan *et al.* 2010). According to Franz *et al.* (2007), enterocins can be divided into four classes: class I of lantibiotic enterocins, class II of small and non-lantibiotic peptides, class III of cyclic enterocins and class IV of large proteins. Bacteriocin-producing enterococci are widespread in nature. They have been isolated from numerous sources, such as dairy products (Foulquié *et al.* 2006), fermented sausages (Cocolin *et al.* 2007), fish (Bourouni *et al.* 2012), vegetables (Bennik *et al.* 1998; Zendo *et al.* 2005) and mammalian gastrointestinal tract (Carina Audisio *et al.* 2000; Brandão *et al.* 2010).

To date, the following enterocins from genus *Enterococcus* have been characterized: enterocin A (Aymerich *et al.* 1996), enterocin B (Casaus *et al.* 1997), enterocin P (Cintas *et al.* 1997), enterocins L50A and L50B (Cintas *et al.* 1998), enterocin I (identical to enterocin L50A, Floriano *et al.* 1998), enterocin Q (Cintas *et al.* 2000), enterocin M (a new variant of enterocin P, Mareková and Lauková 2002), enterocin CRL35 (Farías *et al.* 1996), bacteriocin 31 (Tomita *et al.* 1996), and mundticin (Bennik *et al.* 1998). In general, most enterocins belong to the group of class IIa bacteriocins, which are thermostable and pediocin-like bacteriocins. These are of considerable interest as biopreservatives, because of their high antilisterial activity (Galvez *et al.* 2007).

American Foulbrood (AFB) is a severe disease, affecting larvae of the honeybee *Apis mellifera*, caused by the spore-forming bacteria *P. larvae*. AFB is worldwide distributed and

significantly affects honeybee populations and production (Genersch 2010). Besides having a strong impact on beekeeping industry, pollination, productivity of agricultural systems and conservation of natural ecosystems may be also affected by AFB. Antibiotic treatments appear as an alternative to the burning of diseased bee colonies. Currently, the only antibiotic approved for prevention and control of AFB is oxytetracycline; however, there is evidence of oxytetracycline-resistant isolates of *P. larvae* in certain endemic areas. Moreover, several alternative treatments being used for control of this disease are plants extracts (Boligon *et al.* 2013), essential oils of various plants (Flesar *et al.* 2010; González *et al.* 2010) or propolis (Antunez *et al.* 2008; Bastos *et al.* 2008) and antagonistic bacteria such as *Bacillus thuringiensis* (Cherif *et al.* 2008), *Bacillus subtilis* (Sabaté *et al.* 2009), lactic acid bacteria isolated from fermented materials (Yoshiyama *et al.* 2013), and *Lactobacillus johnsonii* strains isolated from the gut of worker *Apis mellifera* L. bees (Carina Audisso *et al.* 2011).

The aim of this study was to screen for the production of antimicrobial compounds, as well as the identification of bacteriocin genes, a large collection of enterococcus isolates obtained from different sources, such as feces (from poultry, cow and sheep), water, ricotta cheese, and raw milk in Tunisia.

## **Results and Discussion**

The interest on enterococci was raised in the last decades and most of the *in vitro* studies dealt with the ability of enterococci to produce bacteriocins, determining the spectrum of inhibitory activity, their physicochemical properties, and their application in food products.

In this study we investigated a collection of 300 enterococci isolated from different sources for their ability to produce bacteriocins. By using the agar well diffusion assay (AWDA), 59 (19.6%) enterococci isolates showed antibacterial activities (Table 1) against a large number of indicator microorganisms investigated. This result is similar to other reports studying bacteriocinogenic *Enterococcus* from animals, humans, and vegetables sources (Ozdemir *et*

al. 2011; Klibi *et al.* 2012; Birri *et al.* 2013), underlining the possibility that this trait is involved in the increase of the competitiveness of some *Enterococcus* isolates in specific ecological niches. After identification of the bacteriocinogenic isolates it was determined that 34 belonged to *Ent. faecium*, 19 to *Ent. faecalis*, 3 to *Ent. hirae*, 2 to *Ent. mundtii* and 1 to *Ent. durans*. The literature is rich of studies reporting antibacterial activities by these species as well as others (i.e. *Ent. columbae* and *Ent. casseliflavus*), not identified in our study (Butaye *et al.* 2002; Sabia *et al.* 2004; Poeta *et al.* 2007). Among the 59 strains, 21 *Ent. faecium*, 14 *Ent. faecalis*, 2 *Ent. hirae*, 1 *Ent. mundtii*, and 1 *Ent. durans* showed anti-*L. monocytogenes* activity. It is worth underlining that 13 isolates showed a large inhibition zone (>15mm). *L. ivanovii* and *L. innocua* were also inhibited by the majority of these isolates. The ability to inhibit the growth of *Listeria spp.* is common to most *Enterococcus* bacteriocins (Cocolin *et al.* 2007; Pinto *et al.* 2009; Rivas *et al.* 2012), this ability being related to the close phylogenetic relationship of enterococci and listeriae. *Enterococcus* strains which show antilisterial activity, due to bacteriocin production, are of great importance in food and dairy industries (Rodríguez *et al.* 2000; De Vuyst *et al.* 2003). Twenty-nine isolates showed an activity against *E. faecalis*, with a large inhibition zone exhibited by 18 enterococci isolates. Concerning *S. aureus*, 10 isolates exhibited an inhibition effect. These two species have been previously reported to be susceptible to enterococcal bacteriocins (Rivas *et al.* 2012). It is generally recognized that the inhibitory activity of enterococcal bacteriocin encompasses Gram-positive bacteria, including *L. monocytogenes*, but shows limited or no activity against Gram-negatives (Banwo *et al.* 2012), due to their outer membrane. However, we found that *S. enteritidis* and *E. coli* were inhibited by 7 and 16 *Enterococcus* isolates, respectively. Moreover, three *Enterococcus* isolates were able to inhibit simultaneously the both species, although the *in vitro* inhibition was not as remarkable as for other Gram-positive indicators. This finding has been rarely reported in bacteriocinogenic *Enterococcus* isolates (Todorov *et al.* 2010; Theppangna *et al.* 2007) and would have important perspectives in *Salmonella* control in animal production (Szabó *et al.* 2009) as well as food protection against pathogenic pathogens of *E. coli* (Sparo *et al.* 2013).

In our study, 36 isolates were able to inhibit *P. larvae*, however only for 25 of them it was possible to link this activity to the production of a bacteriocin by the AWDA. To the best of our knowledge, this is the second report on *P. larvae* growth inhibition due to bacteriocin-

producing *Enterococcus* strains (Yoshiyama *et al.* 2013), but the first report of *P. larvae* inhibition by *Enterococcus* strains isolated from non fermented feeds and foods, and other than *Ent. thailandicus*. It is of great interest to focus on the possible biotechnological application of this finding, especially when considering that *Enterococcus* genus is part of the microbiota of honeybee digestive tract (Carina Audisso *et al.* 2011). While it seems that through *in vitro* experiments the bacteriocin acts directly on *P. larvae* inducing the killing, during *in vivo* experiment attempting to use a bacteriocinogenic strains as probiotics for honeybees (Yoshiyama *et al.* 2013) another biological trait has been observed. Indeed, those authors reported that after oral administration of bacteriocin-producing isolates, including one *Ent. thailandicus*, to larvae and adults, the transcription levels of antimicrobial peptide genes, such as abaecin, defensin and hymenoptaecin, were found to increase significantly. It was suggested that bacteriocin-producing isolates stimulate the innate immune response in honeybees, which may be useful for preventing bacterial diseases in honeybees. The effects of bacteriocin-producing *Enterococcus* isolates on AFB infection *in vivo* should be further investigated to understand its full applicability to protect honeybees from this disease.

In our study, the antimicrobial activity exhibited by 59 *Enterococcus* isolates, was lost after proteinase K treatment, thereby revealing the proteinaceous nature of the substance responsible for the inhibition (Dal Bello *et al.* 2010). Some bacteriocins are produced on solid growth media, but not in liquid cultures (Qi *et al.* 2001). Indeed, the difference of inhibition activity detection in solid and liquid medium is explained by several reasons, firstly, adsorption of bacteriocin to the surface of bacteriocin producing strains. Secondly, necessity of physical contact between the producing strain and indicator strain in order to induce the production of bacteriocin. This control system allows energy savings in the bacterial cell (Riley 1998).



Three bacteriocin genes *entP*, *entA*, *entL50A/B* were detected in this study. The structural genes of Enterocin A and P were shown to be the most frequent, being found in 55 (93.2%) and 39 isolates (66.1%), respectively. Lastly, enterocin L50A/B was found in 27 isolates (45.7%). Enterocin AS-48, *entB* and *bac31* genes were not found in any of the examined enterococci. For one isolate no amplification product was obtained by using the set of primers targeting the bacteriocin genes described in this study. Different combinations of bacteriocin-encoding genes were observed in 41 isolates: *entA+entP+entL50A/B* (22 isolates), *entA+entP* (15 isolates), *entA+entL50A/B* (4 isolates). Enterocins A and P are grouped in the class II.1 bacteriocins of the pediocin family, which are apparently very effective in preventing the growth of *Listeria* (Eijsink *et al.* 1998, Banwo *et al.* 2012). The high prevalence of enterocins A and P have been reported previously, as well as enterocin B (Simonova *et al.* 2007; Rivas *et al.* 2012). In contrast to our findings, *entA* and *entB* were mainly reported to specifically occur concomitantly in *Ent. faecium* isolates (De Vuyst *et al.* 2003; Cocolin *et al.* 2007; Ozdemir *et al.* 2011). Combination of two, or more bacteriocin-encoding genes, have been reported previously (Sanchez *et al.* 2007; Strompfova *et al.* 2008) and this was also the case of our collection in which 41 strains contained 2 or 3 gene combinations (Table 1). The presence of three enterocin genes in 22 strains in our study indicates the potential of some strains to produce various bacteriocins. However, the occurrence of several enterocin structural genes in *Enterococcus* isolates does not always correlate with a higher bacteriocin activity in their supernatants, and not all enterocin genes are expressed at the same time (Casaus *et al.* 1997). It is worthy to note that no relationship could be established between the presence of enterocin structural genes and the activity spectra of these bacteriocinogenic isolates. Regarding the isolate for which no amplification was obtained using the bacteriocin primers selected in this study, it should be underlined that this indeed is not an efficient

producer of bacteriocins as it was only able to inhibit *L. innocua* and *P. larvae* by agar spot test and lost its activity after neutralization of the supernatant, supporting the fact that most probably the inhibition was caused by the production of acid compounds.

In conclusion, the most important finding of this study is the ability of bacteriocin-producing *Enterococcus* isolates to inhibit the growth of *P. larvae*. This outcome is very promising and might open a large horizon for the scientific community working on the control of AFB in honeybees. Certainly, *in vivo* experiments are needed to better understand how to exploit this finding.

## **Materials and Methods**

### **Bacterial Strains**

A collection of 300 *Enterococcus* isolates were obtained from different sources including feces of poultry, cow and sheep, water, ricotta cheese, and raw bovine milk. The enterococci were isolated on Slanetz Bartley agar (BioKar diagnostics, Allonne, France) and incubated at 37°C for 24-48h. Colonies with typical aspect of *Enterococcus* were isolated and incubated overnight at 37°C. Gram staining, catalase and oxidase tests were carried out to confirm the appurtenance of isolates to *Enterococcus* genera. The following bacteria were used as indicator strains: *Listeria (L) monocytogenes* ATCC 43256, *L. innocua* (our collection), *L. ivanovii* (our collection), *Escherichia (E) coli* ATCC 25922, *Enterococcus (Ent) faecalis* ATCC 29212, *Staphylococcus (S) aureus* ATCC 6538, *Salmonella enterica serovar* Enteritidis (*S. enteritidis*) (our collection), and *P. larvae* (kindly provided by Pr. Cherif Ameur).

### **Bacteriocin production assay**

Bacteriocin activity was tested by the agar spot test (De Vuyst *et al.* 1996). Briefly, 50 µl of an overnight culture of the indicator strain was added to 5 ml Brain Heart Infusion (BHI)

broth (Oxoid, Italy) supplemented with 0.7% agar, mixed, and poured onto a BHI agar plate. A single colony of the isolate to be tested for antimicrobial activity was transferred with a sterile toothpick to the agar plate seeded with the indicator bacteria. Plates were incubated for 24 h at 37°C in aerobic conditions. The antimicrobial activity was visually detected by clear inhibition zones around the tested strain. A test of the agar well diffusion assay (AWDA) was also realized as following: 150 µl of the indicator culture was inoculated into 15 ml of BHI agar and poured into plates. Wells were punched in the agar and filled with cell-free supernatant extracts of tested *Enterococcus* isolates (100 µl), sterilized by filtration using 0.22 µm filters. The presence or absence of inhibition zones around the wells was determined after incubation for 24 h at 37 °C.

In order to confirm the proteinaceous nature of the antimicrobial compounds, cultures of the positive isolates were centrifuged at 8000 x g for 10 min at 4°C and supernatants were collected and adjusted to pH 7 with 1 mol l<sup>-1</sup> NaOH to eliminate the effect due to organic acids and 100 µl were treated with 4 µl of proteinase K (25 mg ml<sup>-1</sup>, Sigma). Both the neutralized and proteinase K treated supernatants (100 µl) were placed into a well in BHI agar plate containing 1% inoculum of an overnight culture of each of the indicator strains considered. The plates were then incubated at optimum growth temperature of the indicator strains and examined after 24 h for inhibition zone. The presence of inhibition zones around the well containing the neutralized culture broth and the absence of the halo around the well containing the proteinase K, confirmed the production of bacteriocins or bacteriocin-like compounds by the tested strains (Dal Bello *et al.* 2010).

### **Molecular identification of the bacteriocin-producing isolates**

Strains showing antimicrobial activity were identified at the species level as described by Cocolin *et al.* (2004). First, the strains were subjected to a PCR reaction by using the primers

P1V1GC (5'-CGC CCG CCG CGC CCC GCG CCCGTC CCG CCG CCC CCG CCC GGC GGCGTG CCTAATACA TGC-3') and P2V1 (5'-TTC CCC ACG CGT TAC TCA CC-3'), and subsequently grouped by Denaturing Gradient Gel Electrophoresis (DGGE). Representatives of strains showing the same migration pattern were subjected to amplification of the V1-V3 regions of the 16S rRNA gene by using the primers P1V1 (5'- GCG GCG TGC CTA ATA CAT GC-3') and P4V3 (5'-ATC TAC GCA TTT CAC CGC TAC-3') as reported elsewhere (Cocolin *et al.* 2004). PCR products were purified by QIAquick<sup>®</sup> PCR purification kit (QIAGEN, Milan, Italy) and sent for sequencing to MWG Biotech (Ebersberg, Germany). The retrieved sequences were aligned in Gene Bank by using the Blast program (<http://blast.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov>).

#### **Targeting the bacteriocin encoding gene by PCR amplification**

Genes encoding for the enterocins (A, P, B, L50A, L50B, AS-48, 31) were targeted by PCR using the primers and conditions as reported by De Vuyst *et al.* (2003). The reaction was performed in a final volume of 25  $\mu$ l containing 1X PCR buffer, 1.5 mmol l<sup>-1</sup> MgCl<sub>2</sub>, 0.2 mmol l<sup>-1</sup> dNTP, 0.2 mmol l<sup>-1</sup> of each bacteriocin primer and 1 U of Taq polymerase (Applied Biosystem, Milan, Italy). The cycles used were 95°C for 5 min as initial step, 95°C for 1 min, 56°C (for the primers AS-48, *entA*, *entP*, *entB*, L50A, L50B) or 52°C (for enterocin 31) for 1 min, and 72°C for 1 min for the next 30 cycles, 72°C for 5 min concluded the amplification. Fragments were visualized on 2% agarose gels added of ethidium bromide using a 100 bp ladder (Sigma, Italy) as molecular weight ladder. For each PCR, positive control strains from the Università di Torino, Dipartimento di Scienze Agrarie, Forestali e Alimentari were used.

#### **Acknowledgements**

Imen Jaouani has a fellowship from the Tunisian Ministry of Higher Education and Scientific Research. The authors wish to thank Pr. Cherif Ameer, Higher Institute for Biotechnology, Biotechpole Sidi Thabet, for providing us with *Paenibacillus larvae* isolates.

**Conflict of interest:** no conflict of interest declared

## References

- Antunez, K., Harriet, J., Gende, L., Maggi, M., Eguaras, M., Zunino, P. (2008) Efficacy of natural propolis extract in the control of American Foulbrood. *Vet Microbiol* **131**, 324-331.
- Aymerich, T., Holo, H., Havarstein, L.S., Hugas, M., Garriga, M., Nes, I.F. (1996) Biochemical and genetic characterization of enterocin A from *Enterococcus faecium*, a new antilisterial bacteriocin in the pediocin family of bacteriocins. *Appl Environ Microbiol* **62**, 1676-1682.
- Banwo, K., Sanni, A., Tan, H. (2012) Technological properties and probiotic potential of *Enterococcus faecium* strains isolated from cow milk. *J Appl Microbiol* **114**, 229-241.
- Bastos, E.M., Simone, M., Jorge, D.M., Soares, A.E., Spivak, M. (2008) In vitro study of the antimicrobial activity of Brazilian propolis against *Paenibacillus larvae*. *J Invertebr Pathol* **97**, 273-281.
- Bennik, M.H., Vanloo, B., Brasseur, R., Gorris, L.G., Smid, E.J. (1998) A novel bacteriocin with a YGNGV motif from vegetable-associated *Enterococcus mundtii*: full characterisation and interaction with target organisms. *Biochim Biophysica Acta* **1373**, 47-58.
- Birri, D.J., Brede, D.A., Tessema, G.T., Nes, I.F. (2013) Bacteriocin production, antibiotic susceptibility and prevalence of haemolytic and gelatinase activity in faecal lactic acid bacteria isolated from healthy Ethiopian infants. *Microb Ecol* **65**, 504-516.
- Boligon, A.A., Brum, T.F., Zadra, M., Piana, M., Alves, C.F.S., Fausto, V.P., Júnior, V.S.B., Vaucher, R.A., Santos, R.C.V., Athayde, M.L. (2013) Antimicrobial activity of *Scutia buxifolia* against the honeybee pathogen *Paenibacillus larvae*. *J Invertebr Pathol* **112**, 105-107.
- Bourouni Chahad, O., El Bour, M., Calo-Mata, P., Boudabous, A., Barros-Velazquez, J. (2012) Discovery of novel biopreservation agents with inhibitory effects on growth of food-borne pathogens and their application to seafood products. *Res Microbiol* **163**, 44-54.
- Brandão, A., Almeida, T., Muñoz-Atienza, E., Torres, C., Igrejas, G., Hernández, P.E., Cintas, L.M., Poeta, P., Herranz, C. (2010) Antimicrobial activity and occurrence of bacteriocin structural genes in *Enterococcus* spp. of human and animal origin isolated in Portugal. *Arch Microbiol* **192**, 927-936.

- Butaye, P., Baele, M., Devriese, L.A., Haesebrouck, F. (2002) Comparison of susceptibility to antimicrobials of the enterococcal species isolated from pigeons (*Columba livia*). *Microb Drug Resist* **8**, 215-218.
- Byappanahalli, M.N., Nevers, M.B., Korajkic, A., Staley, Z.R., Harwood, V.J. (2012) Enterococci in the Environment. *Microbiol Mol Biol Rev* **76**, 685-706.
- Carina Audisio, M., Oliver, G., Apella, M.C. (2000) Protective effect of *Enterococcus faecium* J96, a potential probiotic strain, on chicks infected with *Salmonella pullorum*. *J Food Protect* **10**, 1333-1337.
- Carina Audisio, M., Torres, M.J., Sabaté, D.C., Iburguren, C., Apella, M.C. (2011) Properties of different lactic acid bacteria isolated from *Apis mellifera* L. bee-gut. *Microbiol Res* **166**, 1-13.
- Casaus, P., Nilsen, T., Cintas, L.M., Nes, I.F., Hernández, P.E., Holo, H. (1997) Enterocin B, a new bacteriocin from *Enterococcus faecium* T136 which can act synergistically with enterocin A. *Microbiology* **143**, 2287-2294.
- Cherif, A., Rezgui, W., Raddadi, N., Daffonchio, D., Boudabous, A. (2008) Characterization and partial purification of entomocin 110, a newly identified bacteriocin from *Bacillus thuringiensis subsp. Entomocidus* HD 110. *Microbiol Res* **163**, 684-692.
- Cintas, L.M., Casaus, P., Havarstein, L.S., Hernández, P.E., Nes, I.F. (1997) Biochemical and genetic characterization of enterocin P, a novel sec-dependent bacteriocin from *Enterococcus faecium* with a broad antimicrobial spectrum. *Appl Environ Microbiol* **63**, 4321-4330.
- Cintas, L.M., Casaus, P., Holo, H., Hernández, P.E., Nes, I.F., Havarstein, L.S. (1998) Enterocins L50 A and L50 B, two novel bacteriocins from *Enterococcus faecium* L50, are related to staphylococcal hemolysins. *J Bacteriol* **180**, 1988-1994.
- Cintas, L.M., Casaus, P., Herranz, L.S., Havarstein, L.S., Holo, H., Hernandez, P.E., Nes, I.F. (2000) Biochemical and genetic evidence that *Enterococcus faecium* L50 produces enterocins L50A and L50B, the sec-dependent enterocin P, and a novel bacteriocin secreted without an N-terminal extension termed enterocin Q. *J Bacteriol* **182**, 6806-6814.
- Cocolin, L., Rantsiou, K., Iacumin, L., Urso, R., Cantoni, C., Comi, G. (2004) Study of the ecology of fresh sausages and characterization of populations of lactic acid bacteria by molecular methods. *Appl Environ Microbiol* **70**, 1883-1894.

- Cocolin, L., Foschino, R., Comi, G., Fortina, M.G. (2007) Description of the bacteriocins produced by two strains of *Enterococcus faecium* isolated from Italian goat milk. *Food Microbiol* **24**, 752-758.
- Dal Bello, B., Rantsiou, K., Bellio, A., Zeppa, G., Ambrosoli, R., Civera, T., Cocolin, L. (2010) Microbial ecology of artisanal products from North West of Italy and antimicrobial activity of the autochthonous populations. *LWT – Food Sci Tech* **43**, 1151-1159.
- De Vuyst, L., Callevart, R., Crabbe, K. (1996) Primary metabolite kinetics of bacteriocin biosynthesis by *Lactobacillus amylovorus* and evidence for stimulation of bacteriocin production under unfavourable growth conditions. *Microbiology* **142**, 817-827.
- De Vuyst, L., Foulquie Moreno, M.R., Revets, H. (2003) Screening for enterocins and detection of hemolysin and vancomycin resistance in enterococci of different origins. *Int J Food Microbiol* **84**, 299-318.
- Eijsink, V.G., Skeie, M., Middelhoven, P.H., Brurberg, M.B., Nes, I.F. (1998) Comparative studies of class IIa bacteriocins of lactic acid bacteria. *Appl Environ Microbiol* **64**, 3275-3281.
- Fariás, M.E., Fariás, R.N., Holgado, A.P.R., Sesma, F. (1996) Purification and N-terminal amino acid sequence of enterocin CRL 35, a 'pediocin-like' bacteriocin produced by *Enterococcus faecium* CRL 35. *Lett Appl Microbiol* **22**, 417-419.
- Flesar, J., Havlik, J., Kloucek, P., Rada, V., Titera, D., Bednar, M., Stropnický, M., Kokoska, L. (2010) In vitro growth-inhibitory effect of plant-derived extracts and compounds against *Paenibacillus larvae* and their acute oral toxicity to adult honey bees. *Vet Microbiol* **145**, 129-133.
- Floriano, B., Ruiz-Barbra, J.L., Jiménez-Díaz, R. (1998) Purification and genetic characterization of enterocin I from *Enterococcus faecium* 6T1a, a novel antilisterial plasmid-encoded bacteriocin which does not belong to the pediocin family of bacteriocins. *Appl Environ Microbiol* **64**, 4883-4890.
- Foulquié Moreno, M.R., Sarantinopoulos, P., Tsakalidou, E., De Vuyst, L. (2006) The role and application of enterococci in food and health. *Int J Food Microbiol* **106**, 1-24.
- Franz, C.M., Belkum, M.J.V., Holzapfel, W.H., Abriouel, H., Galvez, A. (2007) Diversity of enterococcal bacteriocins and their grouping in a new classification scheme. *FEMS Microbiol Rev* **31**, 293-310.



- Gálvez, A., Abriouel, H., López, R.L., Ben Omar, N. (2007) Bacteriocin-based strategies for food biopreservation. *Int J Food Microbiol* **120**,51-70.
- Genersch, E. (2010). American Foulbrood in honeybees and its causative agent, *Paenibacillus larvae*. *J Invertebr Pathol* **103**, 10-19.
- Gonzalez-Toledo, S.Y., Dominguez-Dominguez, J., Garcia-Almendarez, B.E., Prado-Barragan, L.A., Regalado-Gonzalez, C. (2010) Optimization of nisin production by *Lactococcus lactis* UQ2 using supplemented whey as alternative culture medium. *J Food Sci* **75**, 347-353.
- Khan, H., Flint, S., Yu, P.L. (2010) Enterocins in food preservation. *Int J Food Microbiol* **141**,1-10.
- Klibi, N., Ben Slimen, N., Fhoula, I., Lopez, M., Ben Slama, K., Daffonchio, D., Boudabous, A., Torres, C., Ouzari, H. (2012) Genotypic diversity, antibiotic resistance and bacteriocin production of enterococci isolated from rhizospheres. *Microbes Environ* **27**, 533-537.
- Mareková, M., Lauková, A. (2002) Enterocin M- a new bacteriocin produced by *Enterococcus faecium* AL41 and its potential use. *Proceedings of "XX Days of Animal Physiology"* **20**, 10-23.
- Ozdemir, G.B., Oryasin, E., Bıyık, H.H., Ozteber, M., Bozdoğan, B. (2011) Phenotypic and genotypic characterization of bacteriocins in enterococcal isolates of different sources. *Indian J Microbiol* **51**,182-187.
- Pinto, A.L., Fernandes, M., Pinto, C., Albano, H., Castilho, F., Teixeira, P. (2009) Characterization of anti-*Listeria* bacteriocins isolated from shellfish: potential antimicrobials to control non-fermented seafood. *Int J Food Microbiol* **129**, 50-58.
- Poeta, P., Costa, D., Rojo-Bezares, B., Zarazaga, M., Klibi, N., Rodrigues, J., Torres, C. (2007) Detection of antimicrobial activities and bacteriocin structural genes in faecal enterococci of wild animals. *Microbiol Res* **162**, 257-263.
- Qi, F., Chen, P., Caufield, P.W. (2001) The group I strain of *Streptococcus mutans*, UA140, produces both the lantibiotic mutacin I and a nonlantibiotic bacteriocin, mutacin IV. *Appl Environ Microbiol* **67**, 15-21.
- Riley, M.A. (1998) Molecular mechanisms of bacteriocin evolution. *Ann Rev Genet* **32**, 255-278.

- Rivas, P.F., Castro, M.P., Vallejo, M., Marguet, M., Campos, C.A. (2012) Antibacterial potential of *Enterococcus faecium* strains isolated from ewes' milk and cheese. *LWT - Food Sc Technol* **46**, 428- 436.
- Rodríguez, E., González, B., Gaya, P., Nuñez, M., Medina, M. (2000) Diversity of bacteriocins produced by lactic acid bacteria isolated from raw milk. *Int Dairy J* **10**, 7-15.
- Sabaté, D.C., Carrillo, L., Audisio, M.C. (2009) Inhibition of *Paenibacillus larvae* and *Ascosphaera apis* by *Bacillus subtilis* isolated from honeybee gut and honey samples. *Res Microbiol* **160**, 163-169.
- Sabia, C., Messi, P., Niederhausern, S., Manicardi, G., Bondi, M. (2004) Study of two bacteriocins produced by *Enterococcus casseliflavus* and *Ent. faecalis*. *Lett Appl Microbiol* **38**, 99-105.
- Sánchez, J., Basanta, A., Gomez-Sala, B., Herranz, C., Cintas, L.M., Hernández, P.E. (2007) Antimicrobial and safety aspects and biotechnological potential of bacteriocinogenic enterococci isolated from mallard ducks (*Anas platyrhynchos*). *Int J Food Microbiol* **117**, 295-305.
- Simonová, M., Lauková, A. (2007) Bacteriocin activity of enterococci from rabbits. *Vet Res Commun* **31**, 143-152.
- Sparo, M.D., Confalonieri, A., Urbizu, L., Ceci, M., Bruni, S.F. (2013) Bio-preservation of ground beef meat by *Enterococcus faecalis* CECT7121. *Braz J Microbiol* **44**, 43-49
- Strompfová, V., Lauková, A., Simonová, M., Marcinaková, M. (2008) Occurrence of the structural enterocin A, P, B, L50B genes in enterococci of different origin. *Vet Microbiol* **132**, 293-301.
- Szabó, I., Wieler, L.H., Tedin, K., Scharek-Tedin, L., Taras, D., Hensel, A., Appel, B., Nöckler, K. (2009) Influence of a probiotic strain of *Enterococcus faecium* on *Salmonella enterica* Serovar Typhimurium DT104 infection in a porcine animal infection model. *Appl Environ Microbiol* **75**, 2621-2628.
- Theppangna, W., Murase, T., Tokumaru, N., Chikumi, H., Shimizu, E., Otsuki, K. (2007) Screening of the enterocin genes and antimicrobial activity against pathogenic bacteria in *Enterococcus* strains obtained from different origins. *J Vet Med Sci* **69**, 1235-1239.

- Todorov, S.D., Wachsmann, M., Tomé, E., Dousset, X., Destro, M.T., Disks, L.M.T., Franco, B.D.G.M., Vaz-Velho, M., Drider, D. (2010) Characterisation of an antiviral pediocin-like bacteriocin produced by *Enterococcus faecium*. *Food Microbiol* **27**, 869-879.
- Tomita, H., Fujimoto, S., Tanimoto, K., Ike, Y. (1996) Cloning and genetic sequence analysis of the bacteriocin 31 determinant encoded on the *Enterococcus faecalis* pheromone-responsive conjugative plasmid pPD1. *J Bacteriol* **179**, 7843-7855.
- Yoshiyama, M., Wu, M., Sugimura, Y., Takaya, N., Kimoto-Nira, H. Suzuki, C. (2013) Inhibition of *Paenibacillus larvae* by lactic acid bacteria isolated from fermented materials. *J Inverteb Pathol* **12**, 62-67.
- Zendo, T., Eungruttanagorn, N., Fujioka, S., Tashiro, Y., Nomura, K., Sera, Y., Kobayashi, G., Nakayama, J., Ishizaki, A., Sonomoto, K. (2005) Identification and production of a bacteriocin from *Enterococcus mundtii* QU 2 isolated from soybean. *J Appl Microbiol* **99**, 1181-1190.

**Table 1** Sources of isolation, harbored enterocin genes and inhibitory spectrum of the enterococcal isolates used in this study.

| Isolates | Origin        | Identification      | Enterocin genes | Spectrum of inhibition  |                   |                    |                      |                |                  |                       |                  |
|----------|---------------|---------------------|-----------------|-------------------------|-------------------|--------------------|----------------------|----------------|------------------|-----------------------|------------------|
|          |               |                     |                 | <i>L. monocytogenes</i> | <i>L. innocua</i> | <i>L. ivanovii</i> | <i>Ent. faecalis</i> | <i>E. coli</i> | <i>S. aureus</i> | <i>S. enteritidis</i> | <i>P. larvae</i> |
| Ent B11  | Feces of cows | <i>Ent. faecium</i> | A, P, L50A/B    | ++++ <sup>a</sup>       | +++               | +++                | ++++                 | -              | +++              | -                     | -                |
| Ent B10  |               |                     | A, P            | -                       | +                 | ++                 | -                    | -              | -                | +                     | -                |
| Ent KA18 |               |                     | A, P, L50A/B    | -                       | +                 | -                  | -                    | +              | -                | -                     | -                |
| Ent K1   |               |                     | A, P            | -                       | +++               | -                  | ++                   | +              | -                | -                     | -                |
| Ent KA1  |               |                     | A, P            | +                       | +++               | ++                 | -                    | +              | -                | -                     | +                |
| Ent KA15 |               |                     | A, P            | ++                      | -                 | ++                 | -                    | +              | -                | -                     | ++               |
| Ent S9   |               |                     | A               | -                       | -                 | ++                 | -                    | ++             | ++               | -                     | ++               |
| Ent SB8  |               |                     | A, P            | ++++                    | ++++              | ++                 | -                    | -              | -                | -                     | ++               |
| Ent CH4  |               |                     | A, P, L50A/B    | +++                     | -                 | +                  | -                    | -              | -                | -                     | ++               |
| Ent Bi28 |               |                     | P               | +++                     | ++++              | ++                 | ++++                 | -              | +++              | -                     | ++               |
| Ent VF   |               |                     | A, P, L50A/B    | -                       | +                 | +                  | -                    | -              | -                | -                     | -                |
| Ent KA22 |               |                     | A, P            | +++                     | +++               | +++                | +                    | +              | -                | +                     | -                |
| Ent 102  |               |                     | A, P            | +                       | +++               | -                  | +++                  | -              | -                | -                     | +++              |
| Ent KA24 |               |                     | Feces of sheep  | A, P                    | -                 | ++                 | +                    | -              | +                | -                     | -                |
| Ent M7   | A, P, L50A/B  | -                   |                 | -                       | +                 | -                  | -                    | -              | +                |                       |                  |
| Ent Bi5  | A, P, L50A/B  | ++                  |                 | +++                     | -                 | +++                | -                    | ++             | -                | +                     |                  |
| Ent C2   | Feces of      | A, P, L50A/B        | +++             | +++                     | ++                | ++                 | ++                   | -              | -                | -                     |                  |

|          |                            |                 |      |     |      |     |      |    |      |     |      |
|----------|----------------------------|-----------------|------|-----|------|-----|------|----|------|-----|------|
| Ent P4   | poultry                    | A, P,<br>L50A/B | +    |     | ++   | +   | ++   | -  | -    | -   | -    |
| Ent 97   |                            | A, P            | -    |     | +++  | +   | +++  | -  | -    | -   | ++   |
| Ent P10  |                            | A, P,<br>L50A/B | +    |     | ++   | -   | ++   | -  | +    | -   | +    |
| Ent 6    |                            | A,<br>L50A/B    | -    |     | +++  | -   | -    | -  | -    | -   | +++  |
| Ent 11   |                            | A,<br>L50A/B    | -    |     | +++  | +   | -    | -  | -    | -   | -    |
| Ent 12   |                            | A               | +    |     | +++  | +   | +++  | -  | -    | -   | +++  |
| Ent 23   |                            | A, P,<br>L50A/B | +    |     | +++  | +   | +++  | -  | -    | -   | -    |
| Ent 75   |                            | A               | -    |     | +    | -   | -    | -  | -    | -   | +++  |
| Ent 76   |                            | A               | +    |     | +    | +   | -    | -  | -    | -   | +++  |
| Ent 13   |                            | A               | -    |     | +++  | +++ | +++  | -  | -    | -   | +++  |
| Ent 14   |                            | A               | +    |     | +++  | +   | +++  | -  | -    | -   | +++  |
| Ent 59   | A,<br>L50A/B               | +++             |      | +++ | +++  | +++ | -    | -  |      | +++ |      |
| Ent OR42 | Feces<br>of bird           | A, P,<br>L50A/B | ++   |     | ++   | ++  | -    | ++ | +    | -   | +    |
| Ent 112  | Swab<br>from<br>cat ear    | A               | +++  |     | +++  | +++ | ++++ | -  | -    | -   | ++++ |
| Ent 111  | Swab<br>from<br>dog<br>ear | A               | ++   |     | +++  | ++  | ++++ | -  | -    | -   | +++  |
| Ent L5   | Raw<br>milk                | A, P,<br>L50A/B | ++++ |     | ++++ | -   | ++++ | -  | ++++ | -   | +++  |

|          |                  |                      |              |     |     |     |     |    |     |     |      |
|----------|------------------|----------------------|--------------|-----|-----|-----|-----|----|-----|-----|------|
| Ent R1.2 | Ricotta cheese   |                      | A, P, L50A/B | -   | +   | -   | -   | -  | -   | -   | -    |
| Ent K4   | Feces of cows    | <i>Ent. faecalis</i> | A            | ++  | +   | +   | -   | -  | -   | -   | -    |
| Ent S2   |                  |                      | A, P, L50A/B | -   | ++  | ++  | -   | +  | -   | +   | +    |
| Ent KA20 |                  |                      | A, P         | +   | ++  | +   | +   | -  | +   | -   | ++++ |
| Ent KA16 |                  |                      | A, P         | ++  | ++  | -   | ++  | -  | -   | -   | +++  |
| Ent KA8  |                  |                      | A, P, L50A/B | ++  | ++  | ++  | -   | ++ | -   | -   | ++   |
| Ent K3   |                  |                      | A, P, L50A/B | -   | +   | +   | -   | -  | -   | -   | -    |
| Ent KAA  | Feces of donkey  |                      | A, P, L50A/B | -   | +   | -   | -   | +  | -   | +   | -    |
| Ent M11  | Feces of sheep   |                      | A, P, L50A/B | +   | -   | ++  | ++  | -  | -   | -   | ++   |
| Ent KA26 |                  | A                    | +++          | -   | -   | -   | +   | -  | -   | -   |      |
| Ent C3   | Feces of poultry |                      | A, P, L50A/B | +++ | +++ | +++ | +++ | ++ | -   | -   | -    |
| Ent P2   |                  | A, L50A/B            | +            | +++ | ++  | -   | +++ | -  | -   | -   |      |
| Ent P8   |                  | A, P, L50A/B         | -            | +   | +   | -   | +   | -  | -   | +++ |      |
| Ent 20   |                  | ND <sup>b</sup>      | -            | +   | -   | -   | -   | -  | -   | +++ |      |
| Ent 7    |                  | A                    | +            | ++  | -   | -   | -   | -  | -   | +++ |      |
| Ent 8    |                  | A                    | +            | +++ | -   | +++ | -   | -  | -   | +++ |      |
| Ent 98   |                  | L50A/B               | ++           | +++ | -   | +++ | -   | -  | -   | +++ |      |
| EntOR30  | Feces            |                      | A, P,        | +++ | +++ | ++  | +++ | -  | +++ | -   | +++  |

|          |                |                     |              |     |      |      |     |   |    |    |     |
|----------|----------------|---------------------|--------------|-----|------|------|-----|---|----|----|-----|
|          | of bird        |                     | L50A/B       |     |      |      |     |   |    |    |     |
| Ent SP12 | Water          |                     | A            | +   | +    | +    | -   | - | ++ | ++ | -   |
| Ent L4   | Raw milk       |                     | A, P         | +++ | ++++ | ++++ | +++ | - | -  | -  | -   |
| Ent B3   | Feces of cows  | <i>Ent. hirae</i>   | A, P         | +   | ++   | +++  | +   | - | -  | ++ | -   |
| Ent S7   |                |                     | A, P         | -   | ++   | +++  | +   | - | -  | ++ | ++  |
| Ent SP13 | Water          |                     | P            | +   | -    | ++   | -   | - | -  | -  | +++ |
| Ent K2   | Feces of cow   | <i>Ent. mundtii</i> | A, P, L50A/B | +   | +    | +    | -   | - | -  | -  | -   |
| Ent KA23 | Feces of sheep |                     | A            | -   | +    | +    | -   | - | -  | -  | -   |
| Ent SB3  | Feces of cow   | <i>Ent. durans</i>  | A, P         | ++  | ++   | ++   | ++  | - | -  | -  | ++  |

<sup>a</sup> scores were assigned based on the diameter of the inhibition halo: ++++= clear zone >15mm, +++ = clear zone 10-15 mm, ++:5-9.9 mm, + = clear zone 1-4.99 mm, - = no zone.

<sup>b</sup>ND, not detected: no amplification signal was obtained by using the bacteriocin primers used in this study.