



Cedarville University  
**DigitalCommons@Cedarville**

---

Pharmacy and Nursing Student Research and Evidence-Based Medicine Poster Session

---

11-2012

# The Therapeutical Benefits of Using Music Therapy Rather Than Cognitive Therapy in Depressed Older Adults in a Healthcare Setting

Brittnie Jarrett

*Cedarville University*, [brittniejarrett@cedarville.edu](mailto:brittniejarrett@cedarville.edu)

Elizabeth Hansel

*Cedarville University*, [ehansel@cedarville.edu](mailto:ehansel@cedarville.edu)

Follow this and additional works at: [http://digitalcommons.cedarville.edu/pharmacy\\_nursing\\_poster\\_session](http://digitalcommons.cedarville.edu/pharmacy_nursing_poster_session)

 Part of the [Geriatrics Commons](#), [Mental and Social Health Commons](#), [Music Commons](#), and the [Psychiatry and Psychology Commons](#)

---

## Recommended Citation

Jarrett, Brittnie and Hansel, Elizabeth, "The Therapeutical Benefits of Using Music Therapy Rather Than Cognitive Therapy in Depressed Older Adults in a Healthcare Setting" (2012). *Pharmacy and Nursing Student Research and Evidence-Based Medicine Poster Session*. 20.

[http://digitalcommons.cedarville.edu/pharmacy\\_nursing\\_poster\\_session/20](http://digitalcommons.cedarville.edu/pharmacy_nursing_poster_session/20)

This Poster Session is brought to you for free and open access by DigitalCommons@Cedarville, a service of the Centennial Library. It has been accepted for inclusion in Pharmacy and Nursing Student Research and Evidence-Based Medicine Poster Session by an authorized administrator of DigitalCommons@Cedarville. For more information, please contact [digitalcommons@cedarville.edu](mailto:digitalcommons@cedarville.edu).



# The Therapeutical Benefits of using Music Therapy rather than Cognitive Therapy in Depressed Older Adults in a Healthcare Setting

Brittnie Jarrett  
Elizabeth Hansel  
Cedarville University School of Nursing

## PATIENT CARE ISSUE

- Limited research has been conducted concerning the effects of music therapy in depressed individuals with dementia <sup>1,2,3,4,5</sup>
- Music therapy is a simple, non-invasive, and inexpensive treatment <sup>3</sup> in relation to pharmaceutical interventions and possibly even some forms of cognitive therapies
- Depression is a disabling disease that can cause a reduction in quality of life and loss of general functioning <sup>5</sup>
- Depression affects more than 6.5 million of the 35 million Americans aged 65 years or older <sup>9</sup>
- 74% of older adults remain depressed one year after general treatment with pharmaceutical agents <sup>2</sup>

## EVIDENCE-BASED PRACTICE QUESTION

**Question:** Is music therapy more physically, clinically, and cost effectively beneficial than cognitive behavioral therapy?

**P-**Depressed older adults in the health care setting

**I-**Music therapy

**C-** Cognitive Behavioral therapy

**O-**Lower levels of depression in older adults

## REGISTERED NURSE INTERVIEW

- Good Samaritan Hospital does not have a standardized music therapy program but does have several programs for behavioral therapy.
- Alternate behavioral therapies used include:
  - Life Well is an intensive outpatient services for patients in need of significant assistance with coping skills and support.
  - Dialectical Behavioral Therapy is an evidence based psychotherapy that is the treatment of choice for a wide range of mental health problems.
- The hospital does provide private rooms with emotion stimulating music, pictures, and animations.

## REFERENCES

- Chan, M. F., Wong, Z. Y., Onishi, H., & Thayala, N. V. (2012). *Effects of music on depression in older people: a randomized controlled trial*. Retrieved from <http://onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/10.1111/j.1365-2702.2011.03954.x/full>
- Chan, M. F., Wong, Z. Y., & Thayala, N. V. (2011, December). *The effectiveness of music listening in reducing depressive symptoms in adults: A systematic review*. Retrieved from <http://www.sciencedirect.com/science/article/pii/S0965229911001099>
- Chan, M. F., Chan, E. A., & Mok, E. (2010). *Effects of music on depression and sleep quality in elderly people: a randomized controlled trial*. Retrieved from <http://www.sciencedirect.com/science/article/pii/S0965229910000233>
- Chan, M. F. (2009, July 2). *Effect of music on depression levels and physiological responses in community-based older adults*. Retrieved from <http://onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/10.1111/j.1447-0349.2009.00614.x/full>
- Erkkilä, J. N., Gold, C. F., Punkanen, M., Fachner, J., Ala-Ruona, E., Pöntiö, I., Teraniemi, M., & Vanhala, M. (2011, April 7). *Individual music therapy for depression: randomized controlled trial*. Retrieved from <http://bjp.rcpsych.org/content/199/2/132.long>
- Esther de Graaf, L., Gerhards, S., Evers, S., Arntz, A., Riper, H., Severens, J. L., Widdershoven, G., & Metsemakers, J. (2008). *Clinical and cost-effectiveness of computerized cognitive behavioral therapy for depression in primary care: Design of a randomized trial*. Retrieved from <http://www.biomedcentral.com/1471-2458/8/224>
- Holman, A. J., Serfaty, M. A., Leurent, B. E., & King, M. B. (2011, February 11). *Cost-effectiveness of cognitive behaviour therapy versus talking and usual care for depressed older people in primary care*. Retrieved from <http://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pmc/articles/PMC3046916/>
- Serfaty, M. A., Haworth, D., Blanchard, M., Buszewicz, M., & Murad, S. (2009). *Clinical effectiveness of individual cognitive behavioral therapy for depressed older people in primary care*. (Vol. 66, p. 12). Retrieved from <http://archpsyc.jamanetwork.com/article.aspx?articleid=210468>
- Willis, S. L., Tennstedt, S. L., Marsiske, M., Ball, K., Elias, J., Koepke, K. M., Morris, J. N., & Wright, E. (2010, July 27). *Long-term effects of cognitive training on everyday functional outcomes in older adults*. Retrieved from <http://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pmc/articles/PMC2910591/>

## RESULTS AND SYNTHESIS OF EVIDENCE

- There is more evidence to support Cognitive therapy over Music therapy in the treatment of depression at this time.
- Cognitive and Music therapy have been known to help with:
 

|  |                            |             |                    |
|--|----------------------------|-------------|--------------------|
| elevation of mood  | emotions                   | lowering BP | slowing heart rate |
| regulation of stress hormones  | enhancing immune functions | digestion   | endurance          |
| an overall sense of safety and well-being <sup>(1,2,3,4,5,6,7,8,9)</sup> |                            |             |                    |

| STATUS SCALE | Beck Depression Inventory                                      | Geriatric Depression Scale         | Hospital Anxiety and Depression Scale | Global Assessment of Functioning | Montgomery-Asberg Depression Rating Scale |
|--------------|--|------------------------------------|---------------------------------------|----------------------------------|---|
| ARTICLE(S)   | Esther de Graaf, 2008; Serfaty, 2009; Holman, 2011; Chan, 2012 | Chan, 2011; Chan, 2010; Chan, 2009 | Erkkilä, 2011; Chan, 2012             | Erkkilä, 2011; Chan, 2012        | Erkkilä, 2011; Chan 2012                  |

## EVIDENCE-BASED PRACTICE RECOMMENDATIONS

Additional higher level studies need to be done when it comes to:

- Music therapy and its affects on depression in older adults
- Music therapy as opposed to cognitive therapy

Music therapy should be used more frequently at Good Samaritan Hospital with the addition of several music therapy programs; not simply music interventions

## LIMITATIONS

- More research needs to be conducted on music therapy using bigger sample sizes
- No direct correlational studies between music therapy and cognitive therapy
- Studies were gender biased, involving more females
- Most of the studies conducted in Asian culture
- Lack of high level research on the topic
- No consistent scale of depression

## METHODS

•Key Words: "music", "music therapy", "older adults", "cognitive therapy", "depression"

•Based off of the IOWA Model

•Inclusion Criteria:

- Participants had to be of age ≥ 55 (although studies that included younger populations were also eligible if it was possible to extract data of participants ≥ 55)
- From credible sources who had dealt with research and either older adults or depression prior to the study
- Article had to be finished within the last six years

•Exclusion Criteria:

- Qualitative studies
- Older than six year
- Surgery and dementia

| Type of Intervention | CINAHL | PubMed | Articles used for review |
|----------------------|--------|--------|--------------------------|
| Music Therapy        | 48     | 18     | 5                        |
| Cognitive Therapy    | 11     | 167    | 4                        |