

## Association for Information Systems AIS Electronic Library (AISeL)

---

Panels

ECIS 2019 Proceedings

---

Summer 6-4-2019

# WHAT MAKES A TOP RANKED JOURNAL: THE JOURNEY TOWARDS GREAT JOURNALS IN IS

Cathy Urquhart

*Manchester Metropolitan University Business School, Manchester Metropolitan University, [c.urquhart@mmu.ac.uk](mailto:c.urquhart@mmu.ac.uk)*

Joe Nandhakumar

*University of Warwick, [joe.nandhakumar@wbs.ac.uk](mailto:joe.nandhakumar@wbs.ac.uk)*

Mari-Klara Stein

*Copenhagen Business School, [ms.digi@cbs.dk](mailto:ms.digi@cbs.dk)*

Robert M. Davison

*City University of Hong Kong, [isrobert@cityu.edu.hk](mailto:isrobert@cityu.edu.hk)*

Catherine Griffiths

*Birkbeck University of London, [c.griffiths@bbk.ac.uk](mailto:c.griffiths@bbk.ac.uk)*

*See next page for additional authors*

Follow this and additional works at: [https://aisel.aisnet.org/ecis2019\\_panels](https://aisel.aisnet.org/ecis2019_panels)

---

### Recommended Citation

Urquhart, Cathy; Nandhakumar, Joe; Stein, Mari-Klara; Davison, Robert M.; Griffiths, Catherine; Tarafdar, Monideepa; and Te'eni, Dov, (2019). "WHAT MAKES A TOP RANKED JOURNAL: THE JOURNEY TOWARDS GREAT JOURNALS IN IS". In Proceedings of the 27th European Conference on Information Systems (ECIS), Stockholm & Uppsala, Sweden, June 8-14, 2019. ISBN 978-1-7336325-0-8 Panels.

[https://aisel.aisnet.org/ecis2019\\_panels/5](https://aisel.aisnet.org/ecis2019_panels/5)

This material is brought to you by the ECIS 2019 Proceedings at AIS Electronic Library (AISeL). It has been accepted for inclusion in Panels by an authorized administrator of AIS Electronic Library (AISeL). For more information, please contact [elibrary@aisnet.org](mailto:elibrary@aisnet.org).

---

**Authors**

Cathy Urquhart, Joe Nandhakumar, Mari-Klara Stein, Robert M. Davison, Catherine Griffiths, Monideepa Tarafdar, and Dov Te'eni

# WHAT MAKES A TOP RANKED JOURNAL: THE JOURNEY TOWARDS GREAT JOURNALS IN IS

*Panel*

Cathy Urquhart, Manchester Metropolitan University, [c.urquhart@mmu.ac.uk](mailto:c.urquhart@mmu.ac.uk)

Joe Nandhakumar, Warwick Business School, University of Warwick,  
[joe.nandhakumar@wbs.ac.uk](mailto:joe.nandhakumar@wbs.ac.uk)

Mari-Klara Stein, Department of Digitalization, Copenhagen Business School,  
[ms.digi@cbs.dk](mailto:ms.digi@cbs.dk)

Robert Davison, Department of Information Systems, City University of Hong Kong,  
[isrobert@cityu.edu.hk](mailto:isrobert@cityu.edu.hk)

Catherine Griffiths, School of Business, Economics and Informatics, Birkbeck University of  
London, [c.griffiths@bbk.ac.uk](mailto:c.griffiths@bbk.ac.uk)

Monideepa Tarafdar, Department: Management Science, Lancaster University,  
[m.tarafdar@lancaster.ac.uk](mailto:m.tarafdar@lancaster.ac.uk)

Dov Te'eni, Coller School of Management, Tel Aviv University, [teeni@post.tau.ac.il](mailto:teeni@post.tau.ac.il)

## 1 Introduction

Journal rankings increasingly drive recruitment, promotion and tenure in the information systems field. This trend can be seen in most if not all universities. Journal ranking lists play a significant role in the evaluation exercises (such as REF in the UK) by influencing the process of selection of staff and research outputs for submission to such exercises (Mingers & Willmott, 2013). The AJG (Association of Business School - ABS) is one of the journal rankings guide for a range of journals in which business and management academics publish their research. AJG journal rankings are being reconsidered. We have the option to put forward two journals of the basket of eight for a 4 ranking in the list. In this panel, all four EICs of these journals will talk about the criteria for a great journal.

## 2 Issues

Citation rankings are quantitative measures, often seen as more “objective” reflection of the value of the articles published in a journal. There are many metrics that can provide a useful perspective on journal rankings. For example, JCR (Journal Citation Reports) indicates the number of times the articles in the journal were cited. SJR (SCImago Journal Rank) accounts for both the number of citations received by a journal and the importance of the journals where such citations come from. IPP (Impact per Publication) measures the ratio of citations per article published in the journal. SNIP (Source normalized impact per paper) measures contextual citation impact by weighting citations based on the total number of citations in a subject field.

In addition to citation metrics, there are other qualitative aspects to consider in evaluating journal quality. For example, Curries et al. (2014) summarize a list of qualitative indicators that could also be considered such as acceptance rate, access (open or not in various flavors), average standings across many surveys (e.g. AIS journal surveys), diversity of topics/ methods, editorial board, longevity, number of readers use in practice/ teaching and so on. Opinion-based rankings (such as AJG, AIS Senior Scholars Basket of 8, Financial Times Top 50, Nordic List and Australian Business Deans Council (ABDC) Journal Ranking List) often consider such indicators in evaluating journal quality. However, such opinion-based lists are often shaped by citation data (Mingers and Willmott, 2013). So, what does make a good quality journal?

The panel will cover controversial questions such as:

How does qualitative reputation of a journal drive the metrics journey of a journal?

How far should quantitative metrics determine the position of a journal? How can we ‘measure’ more qualitative factors?

In what way are quantitative metrics self-reinforcing of a top position?

How does community sentiment about a journal foreshadow its rise or fall in the rankings?

What role do decision makers in the community play in shaping rankings in the community and beyond?

## 3 Panel Structure

The panel will be designed to maximize interaction among participants and with the audience.

First, each EIC or journal representative will be given just 5 minutes to say how metrics and community esteem have shaped the journal. This is followed by viewpoint from Marie-Klara Stein and Joe Nandhakumar on the ABS/ AJG view. (35 mins in all). Cathy Urquhart will moderate the discussion.

This will be followed by an open discussion/ open up to audience. The panellists will make closing comments for the remaining 5 to 10 minutes.

## **4 Panellists**

**Robert Davison** is a Professor in the Department of Information Systems, City University of Hong Kong. Robert serves as the Editor-in-Chief of both the Information Systems Journal and the Electronic Journal of Information Systems in Developing Countries. He is also the Chair of the IFIP WG 9.4 (Social Implications of Computers in Developing Countries). His current research focuses on Knowledge Seeking and Sharing activities in Chinese SMEs. Robert is Programme Leader of the MSc in Electronic Business and Knowledge Management and Assistant Dean for the Assurance of Learning.

**Catherine Griffiths** is a Senior Editor for the [Journal of Information Technology](#) and its sister journal for teaching cases, [JITTC](#) . She is also a Trustee of the Association of Information Technology Trust. She has a career in establishing and expanding research centres that span multiple disciplines at Imperial College and LSE as well as Birkbeck London University. Holding both academic posts and post graduate supervisor roles, she also has experience of teaching and shaping leading edge research in areas as diverse as technology, railways, management strategy and data analytics. Catherine represents Birkbeck's involvement in the newly founded Institute of Coding <https://instituteofcoding.org>

**Joe Nandhakumar** is Professor of Information Systems at Warwick Business School, University of Warwick. Joe serves as a member of the CABS AJG (Chartered Association of Business School - Academic Journal Guide) Scientific Committee. His primary research interest focuses on the digital innovation and its transformative potential; creativity and interdisciplinary collaboration; and design and use of information systems. He is an Associate Editor for Information Systems Research, and a former Senior Editor of Journal of the Association for Information Systems and an Associate Editor for European Journal of Information Systems.

**Mari-Klara Stein** is an associate professor at the Department of Digitalization, Copenhagen Business School. Mari-Klara's research interests include the use and non-use of information systems in workplace settings, with a particular emphasis on work practices as well as the social, emotional and identity-related aspects of user experiences. Mari is also the recipient of the Association for Information Systems (AIS) Early Career Award.

**Monideepa Tarafdar** is Professor of Information Systems at Lancaster University, an Affiliated Researcher at MIT Sloan CISR, and a Visiting Professor at Indian Institute of Management Calcutta. Her research broadly focuses on how IT and systems impact individuals and collectives, with emphasis on digital innovation, healthcare operations, IT adoption-related maladaptive phenomenon, supply chain management, and algorithm-enabled business processes. She is a Senior Editor at Information Systems Journal and an Associate Editor at Information Systems Research. She serves on the Editorial Review Boards of the Journal of MIS, Journal of the Association for Information Systems and Journal of Strategic Information Systems

**Dov Te'eni** is the Associate Dean for Research, and holds the Mexico Chair for Information Systems, at Collier School of Management, Tel Aviv University. Dov studies visualization and feedback, knowledge sharing for innovation, combining cognitive and data analytic research methods, and design of systems that support decision making and creativity. Dov is Editor of the European Journal of IS (EJIS) and is/has been on the boards of MISQ, JAIS, AIS THCI, Information & Organizations,

Internet Research. Dov sits on the university wide P&T committees of Tel Aviv University and Zefat college. He has served as President of the world-wide Association of Information Systems. He was awarded AIS Fellowship in 2008, Vision award in 2011, Danish Velux Fellowship in 2015 and the AIS LEO award in 2015.

**Cathy Urquhart** is a Professor of Digital Enterprise at the Manchester Metropolitan University Business School. Cathy serves as a member of the CABS AJG (Chartered Association of Business School - Academic Journal Guide) Scientific Committee. She is a Senior Editor for the European Journal of Information Systems, an Editorial Board member for the Information Systems Journal, and an Associate Editor for Information Technology and Development. She is currently an Associate Editor for the MIS Quarterly special issue on Next Generation Theories. She is a member of the AIS Special Interest Groups for Global Development (SIGGLOBDEV), Grounded Theory Method (SIGGTM) and of the IFIP 9.4 Working Group on the Social Implications of Computers in Developing Countries and IFIP 8.2 Working Group on Information Systems and Organizations.

## References

- Academic Journal, Guide (2018) Chartered Association of Business Schools, <https://charteredabs.org/academic-journal-guide-2018/>
- Curries, W. L., Dennis, A. R., Nickerson, R., Niederman, F. and Vogel, D. 2014, Interim Report of Senior Scholar Basket Review, *Thirty Fifth International Conference on Information Systems*, Auckland 2014
- Dennis, A.R. Valacich, J.S. Fuller, M.A. and Schneider, C. 2006. Research Standards for Promotion and Tenure in Information Systems, *MIS Quarterly*, (30:1), pp. 1-12
- Mingers, J., and Willmott, H. 2013. "Taylorizing Business School Research: On the 'One Best Way' Performative Effects of Journal Ranking Lists," *Human Relations* (66:8), pp. 1051-1073