The University of Southern Mississippi The Aquila Digital Community

**Dissertations** 

Fall 12-2017

# Alabama Classroom Teachers Who Participated in Arts Integration Workshops and Their Implementation of Music into the Core Curriculum

Laurie Martin University of Southern Mississippi

Follow this and additional works at: https://aquila.usm.edu/dissertations

### **Recommended Citation**

Martin, Laurie, "Alabama Classroom Teachers Who Participated in Arts Integration Workshops and Their Implementation of Music into the Core Curriculum" (2017). *Dissertations*. 1455. https://aquila.usm.edu/dissertations/1455

This Dissertation is brought to you for free and open access by The Aquila Digital Community. It has been accepted for inclusion in Dissertations by an authorized administrator of The Aquila Digital Community. For more information, please contact Joshua.Cromwell@usm.edu.

# ALABAMA CLASSROOM TEACHERS WHO PARTICIPATED IN ARTS INTEGRATION WORKSHOPS AND THEIR IMPLEMENTATION OF MUSIC INTO

## THE CORE CURRICULUM

by

Laura Jane Martin

A Dissertation Submitted to the Graduate School and the Department of Educational Research and Administration at The University of Southern Mississippi in Partial Fulfillment of the Requirements for the Degree of Doctor of Philosophy

Approved:

Dr. Lilian H. Hill, Committee Chair Professor, Educational Research and Administration

Dr. Ann Blankenship, Committee Member Assistant Professor, Educational Research and Administration

Dr. Myron Labat, Committee Member Assistant Professor, Educational Research and Administration

Dr. Gregory A. Fuller, Committee Member Professor, Music

Dr. Karen S. Coats Dean of the Graduate School

December2017

COPYRIGHT BY

Laura Jane Martin

2017

Published by the Graduate School



#### ABSTRACT

# ALABAMA CLASSROOM TEACHERS WHO PARTICIPATED IN ARTS INTEGRATION WORKSHOPS AND THEIR IMPLEMENTATION OF MUSIC INTO THE CORE CURRICULUM

by Laura Jane Martin

#### December2017

With the growing emphasis on academic achievement, it has become increasingly more challenging to justify the integration of arts into the curriculum. Effective teachers employ instructional strategies that enhance student engagement and can positively affect student learning. This qualitative study investigated the instructional practices and experiences of classroom teachers who implement music into the academic lesson to increase student engagement and enhance learning. Specifically, the research questions explored how teachers use music to enhance their curriculum, the level of preparedness after attending arts integration professional development, and where they located resources for music activities. Effective teachers realize that all students learn differently as proven through Gardner's Multiple Intelligences which served as the conceptual framework for this general qualitative inquiry study. Fifteen classroom teachers volunteered to interview for this qualitative study. In these face-to-face semi-structured interviews, data was collected from participants who discussed practices and experiences of the implementation of music in their classroom lessons. This data was transcribed and analyzed to reveal the extent to which the participants utilized music as an instructional tool in the classroom. The data showed sufficient evidence to support the fact that participants find using music in their classroom to be effective not only fort student

achievement but for classroom behavior, to reinforce memorization skills, and engage students in the lesson. In addition, data showed that the majority of teachers who participated in this study felt more prepared to implement music into their lesson once they completed the Arts in Education professional development through the University of South Alabama. The findings in this study imply there is a need for more collegiate level classes offered in the area of music integration within the course of study.

#### ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

I would like to acknowledge several people who made this dissertation possible. I would like to express my deepest gratitude to Dr. Lilian Hill and my USM committee members who patiently helped me wrap up and complete this paper. I am most grateful to Dr. Leslie Locke who faithfully worked with me from the beginning until she relocated to The University of Iowa, and my faithful sister in Christ and dear friend Dr. Karen Dennis, University of Mobile, for her unselfish love and devotion with unwavering encouragement. I am forever indebted to my family Judy Martin Bobo, Leslie Martin Nettles, and my precious daughter Sarah Jane Shearer who on many evenings ate cereal for dinner. I love you all and am more than grateful for your love and support though this tremendous endeavor. Finally yet importantly, I acknowledge my four legged fur baby Lula who is always happy to see me when I walk in the door. It is great to be loved unconditionally.

## DEDICATION

This dissertation is lovingly dedicated to my parents Judith Martin Bobo and the late James Richard Martin who have always believed I was number one and made me feel like I was "the winner and still champion". Their constant devotion and Godly example have inspired me to be determined and successful. Thank you for giving me every tool needed to pursue my passion for vocal music. I love you and will forever be indebted.

ABSTRACTii
ACKNOWLEDGMENTS iv
DEDICATIONv
LIST OF TABLES
LIST OF ILLUSTRATIONS xiv
LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS xv
CHAPTER I – INTRODUCTION 1
Overview1
Statement of the Problem
Purpose of the Study
Research Questions
Assumptions
Limitations
Justification5
Conceptual Framework
Definition of Terms7
Summary
CHAPTER II – LITERATURE REVIEW 11
History and Early Research in Music Education 11

Early	Influences on Music Education	12
Early	Music Conventions	15
Th	e Yale Seminar	16
Th	e Manhattanville Music Curriculum Project	18
Th	e Tanglewood Sympsium	19
Natio	onal Association for Music Educators	20
Musi	c Education Curriculum	22
Politi	ics in Music Education	24
No C	hild Left Behind	27
ESSA	A	29
Musi	c and the Brain	30
Lister	ning to Music	36
Fund	ing in Music Education	38
Bu	dgets in Music Education	39
Arts	Integration	40
Using	g Music in the Classroom	44
Sum	nary	51
СНАРТ	TER III - METHODOLOGY	53
Intro	duction	53
Purpo	ose of the Study	54

Resear	rch Questions	54
Method	odology and Design of the Study	54
Partici	ipant Selection	55
Intervie	iews	57
Positio	onality	
Data A	Analysis	59
Trustw	vorthiness	60
Summa	1ary	61
CHAPTE	ER IV	
Introduct	tion	62
APPEND	DIX A - Placeholder Appendix Title	101



#### INSTITUTIONAL REVIEW BOARD STANDARD INFORMED CONSENT

	SI	ANDARD INFORME	D CONSENT PROC	EDURES	
The     Prir	Project Information cipal Investigator be	be signed by each con and Research Descrip fore submitting this fo g form consent should	otion sections of this form for IRB approval.	form should b	e completed by the Last Edited March 13 <sup>th</sup> , 2017

 Today's date:4-19-2017

 PROJECT INFORMATION

 Project Title: ALABAMA CLASSROOM TEACHERS WHO PARTICIPATED IN ARTS INTEGRATION WORKSHOPS AND THEIR IMPLEMENTATION OF MUSIC INTO THE CORE CURRICULUM

 Principal Investigator: Laurie Martin Shearer
 Phone: 251-599-0313
 Email: laura.shearer@eagles.usm.edu

 College: Education
 Department: Education Research and Administration

 RESEARCH DESCRIPTION

#### 1. Purpose:

This study is being performed to gain undertanding of the opinions and perspectives of general classroon teachers who have been participants in arts integration workshops and used music as a tool to help students gain knowledge and increase retention in the lessons of core subjects. The results of this study can be used for future research as well as provide administrators with more tools to apply in decision making regarding music education in school systems. [Describe purpose of the investigation, why it is being performed and what use may be made of the results.]

#### 2. Description of Study:

Teachers who have participated in arts in education workshops will volunteer to participate in 1 hour interviews to contribute to literature in the area of implementing music into the curriculum of core subjects. Data will be collected from the interviews with the intention of understanding the perceptions and experiences of classroom teachers who implement music into the core subject lessons. [Describe the experimental procedure(s), including duration, amount of time required of the participants, number of participants, restrictions on normal activities, invasive techniques etc.]

#### 3. Benefits:

Participants may not benefit directly in this study but will contribute to the literature for knowledge and future research.[Describe any benefits that may occur to the participant or to others as a result of participation in the study, including all benefits or payments. If the potential for medical injury exists, identify treatment procedures or the absence thereof]

#### 4. Risks:

This study will present minimal risks such as confidentiality and inconvenience of time, therefore anonymity will be provided and no penalty for cancelation or if participants decline to answer a question. Possible risks might include minimal social and psychological risks which might cause discontinuation of interview.

APPENDIX C	
APPENDIX D	
APPENDIX E –	



BOARD OF SCHOOL COMMISSIONERS Reginald A. Crenshaw, Ph.D., President - District 3 William C. Foster, Ed.D., Vice President - District 9 L. Douglas Harwell, Jr. - District 1 Don Stringfellow - District 2 Robert E. Battles, Sr. - District 4 SUPERINTENDENT Martha L. Peek

May 11, 2017

Ms. Laura Martin Shearer 5415 River Landing Drive Mobile, AL

RE: Permission to conduct research

Dear Ms. Shearer,

The Mobile County Public School System grants permission and approval for your research proposal, Alabama Classroom Teachers who Participated in Arts Integration Workshops and their Implementation of Music into the Core Curriculum. A copy of this letter should be presented to the principals and participants involved in order to assure them your research has been approved by the district. Approval is given, however, with the following stipulations:

- 1. Involvement by the principals and teachers is to be on a voluntary basis. You must advise your participants that they are not obligated to participate in your study.
- 2. You must comply with the Family Education Rights and Privacy Act.
- 3. Confidentiality must be guaranteed for all participants.
- 4. Approval for the above referenced study is granted for one year from the date of this letter.

Upon conclusion of the research, one completed copy of your study should be submitted to the MCPSS Division of Research, Assessment, Grants, and Accountability.

Best wishes to you as you continue your research efforts.

Sincerely,

Susan Hinton

Susan Hinton, PhD Executive Director Research, Assessment, Grants & Accountability

The mission of Mobile County Public Schools is to graduate prepared and productive citizens.

## LIST OF TABLES

Table A1. Appendix Ta	able Title Example	(be concise)	
-----------------------	--------------------	--------------	--

# LIST OF ILLUSTRATIONS

<i>Figure 1</i> . Example figure title	Error! Bookmark not defined.
Figure A1. Example figure title.	

# LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

USM	The University of Southern Mississippi
WCU	William Carey University

#### CHAPTER I – INTRODUCTION

#### Overview

In 2001 the No Child Left Behind Act (NCLB) mandated that all students must perform at grade-level proficiency, which is to be assessed and determined through scores on state mandated tests. Duncombe, Lukemeyer, and Yinger (2006) noted that the result of these scores determine funding availability for schools; therefore, more emphasis is given by educational leaders to the subject areas that are tested, such as math and reading, rather than the arts (US Department of Education, 2010). Because music courses are considered a non-tested core subject by NCLB, testing is not required. Consequently, educational leaders do not value music on an equal level as they do other core subjects (Gerrity, 2009). In December 2015 President Barack Obama's administration worked to execute the Every Student Succeeds Act (ESSA). This law replaced its predecessor, the No Child left behind Act. ESSA allows more power at the state level to implement an accountability structure within its public school systems (Peet & Vercelletto, 2016). According to Levy (2008), all school districts have created standards for graduation, which students must achieve to fulfill the requirements of the federal government. Many educators feel there is insufficient funding and time for music education to be included as a class in and of itself (Conrad, 2006). If these scores fail to demonstrate an increase in student achievement, teachers could lose their positions and schools could be penalized financially by not receiving certain federal funds (Gerrity, 2009).

Many of these extra supplies needed for remediation such as technology, textbooks, and computer programs can be costly. Instruments for the music classroom can be expensive as well, but because some educational administrators do not value the subject of music, many music teachers are using old classroom instruments and other supplies, which may not be working properly (Spohn, 2008). The newest and latest program is many times made available for students in math or reading, but not for the students in music class (Spohn, 2008).

To raise awareness for the importance of music in the classroom, music educators have developed a plan of embedding music into the regular classroom lessons to enhance learning (Spohn, 2008). This plan is known as 'Arts Integration' whereby music and the other art forms are included in the lesson plans of classroom curriculum for learning enhancement (Fischer, 2002). Arts integration involves linking the educational arts such as dance, music, and visual art into a written curriculum for each subject area (Parsad & Spiegelman, 2012). Learning math and reading through music makes learning fun, and often increases student achievement (Randall, 2012). For example, Courey, Balogh, Siken and Paik (2012) studied the implementation of music into a third-grade math lesson on fractions, which is considered by many as the most difficult mathematical concept in the 3<sup>rd</sup> grade elementary curriculum. Results showed music to be effective for students who are coming to instruction with a lower than average understanding of fractions. The students were shown to be more engaged and at ease with the instruction. In addition to having fun learning fractions, the students demonstrated deeper knowledge of the content (Courey et al. 2012).

#### Statement of the Problem

Since the reconstruction of public elementary and secondary education during the post-Sputnik era, student access to a high quality music education has been drastically

reduced (Walker 1998). Past education reform policies such No Child Left Behind Act (NCLB) established through the Bush administration limited students' access to quality music education. Gerrity (2009) said, "Although NCLB refers to music and the other arts as core subjects, the legislation along with school principals, do not encourage achievement in the core subjects with equal fortitude" (p. 80). While it may be true that educators believe music is beneficial for students' course of study, principals and administrators are often reluctant to relinquish class time for music education (Rentner, Scott, Kober, Chudwsky, Joftus, & Zabala, 2006). Although the current education law, the lingering accountability systems of NCLB do not encourage using instructional time for arts instruction or even integration.

Moreover, with funding based on academic achievement, and the considerable amount of emphasis geared toward the tested core subjects, teachers are expected to devote instructional time to tested subjects such as reading and math during school hours as well as during after-school hours (Hemmel & Gerrity, 2012).

Research from the National Center for Education Statistics (2012) showed the value of music as a tool for instruction that stimulates knowledge retention. Delivering lessons with engaging techniques has long been a goal of classroom teachers. Howard Gardner's theory of multiple intelligences has been the justification for teaching in a variety of techniques. While many teachers believe in the value of arts integration in our schools, they feel pressured to spend class time teaching and remediating core subjects. In addition, many teachers felt ill-prepared to effectively integrate the arts with academic subjects (Vitulli, Santoli, & Fresne, 2013). However, by attending professional

3

development workshops and conferences, teachers discovered ways to integrate music to enhance, rather than distract, from learning academic subjects. However, it is not known how attendance and participation in arts integration professional development classes influenced teacher's use of music as an instructional tool.

#### Purpose of the Study

The purpose of this general qualitative study was to describe the perspectives of classroom teachers who have participated in professional development regarding the integration of music into academic core subjects. Specifically, this study explored how teachers use music to enhance their curriculum, how they use knowledge gained through attendance in Art in Education workshops to integrate music, and where they find music resources. Data was collected through interviews and provided a description of the participants' experiences with using music in their daily routines. This study outlined the journey of music in the education system and how it has become an integral part of the elementary classroom as an instructional tool.

#### **Research Questions**

Jenson (2002) proposed that integrating music into the classroom will enhance knowledge retention as a key to a child's success in school. To that end, the integration of music into the general education classroom as a means of engaging students and raising the level of retention of core academic concepts were explored in this study. Three questions served as guideposts for the research. These questions are: R1: What are the experiences and perspectives of classroom teachers who have incorporated music into their general classroom curriculum? R2: How do general education teachers perceive their preparedness for integrating music into their curriculum after attending Arts in Education professional development?R3: What resources do teachers use when searching for and implementing musical activities in their curriculum?

#### Assumptions

The assumptions of the study are as follows:

- 1. The teachers who participate in this study will be truthful, credible, and honest when responding to questions in the interview.
- 2. The teachers who participate are knowledgeable and consist of those who incorporate music into their classroom curriculum.

#### Limitations

This research was subject to the following limitations.

- 1. Face-to-face interviews will be conducted in the preferred location of the participant. Only individual interviews will be used in this study.
- Only teachers who use music in their classrooms and general lesson plans who work in schools in the Mobile, Alabama area will be invited to participate in this study.

### Justification

It is believed that this research added to the scholarship of music in education as well as provided educational leaders and administrators with information explaining the benefit and value of arts integration. It is the desire of the researcher for administration and educational leaders to gain understanding in the contribution music can provide when included in the general classroom lesson plans. Teachers can be provided with professional development that will encourage the implementation of music into their lessons, as well as professional development in vocal training for matching pitch resulting in more confidence in classroom performance.

Because little research has been conducted in the area of arts integration, it is my desire to contribute to the field what I believe will increase the value of music in the eyes of educational leaders for student achievement. Principals and other administrators need to be made aware of the benefits, such as knowledge retention resulting in higher test scores when teachers integrate the arts in instruction. Teachers also need to be encouraged through professional development to use music in their lessons. Therefore, this research enhanced knowledge and understanding for educational leaders concerning the implementation of the arts into the curricula of their school or school district. Effective teachers are always seeking ways to influence learning.

#### Conceptual Framework

Howard Gardner's Theory of Multiple Intelligences served as the conceptual framework for this study. Introduced in 1983, Gardner's Theory of Multiple intelligences categorizes human intelligence by the various ways humans process information. Gardner has identified nine different kinds of intelligences: these are verbal-linguistic, logical- mathematical, visual-spatial, musical, naturalistic, bodily-kinesthetic, interpersonal, intrapersonal, and existential (Gardner, 2013). All people possess all nine intelligences in varying amounts. When instruction addresses a variety of intelligences, the reception of instruction is enhanced. Gardner's Theory of Multiple Intelligences concurs with the most current brain research on how teachers teach and how students learn (Zadina, 2014).

Understanding that musical intelligence is prevalent in school-age children is an important factor in designing and implementing effective instructional practices (Colwell, 2008). Jenson (2002) reports that music can be used to both relax and excite children and has also been shown to have an effect on memory. One of the earliest talents to emerge in children is musical intelligence (Jenson, 2002). Teachers of young children have long employed the practice of using singing to help students recall information such as the sequence of the alphabet or the order of the months of the year (Bredekamp, 2014). A common thread among educational theorists' beliefs is that children learn best when content is delivered in a variety of ways. Multimodal instruction requires the teacher to have a detailed knowledge of students' specific areas of strength and weakness, as well as research-based methods of addressing those areas (Hattie, 2011). Often teachers are faced with the challenge of finding an innovative method of lesson delivery that will reach even the most reluctant student (Tomlinson, 2014). Set within the framework, this study is designed to recount participants' efforts to utilize music as both an instructional tool and as an engagement strategy.

## **Definition of Terms**

The following terms will be used throughout this study:

*Arts implementation.* This term refers to the professional development provided to teachers for education regarding how to implement arts into the classroom curriculum of language arts, math, science, and social studies by using dance, music, theater, and visual arts (Vitulli, Santoni, & Fresne, 2013).

*Arts integration*. An instructional strategy that brings the arts into the core of the school day and connects the arts across the curriculum (Rabkin & Remond, 2006).

*Emotional aesthetics*. For the purposes of this study, this term refers to the sensory feeling experienced when listening to music, (Saarikallio & Erkkilä, 2007).

*Kinesthetic intelligence*. Knowledge gained through action or actively doing (Mixon, 2004).

*Mental intelligence*. This term refers to the health of an individual's ability to enjoy life, procure a balance between life activities, and efforts to achieve psychological resilience (Paramita & Das, 2011).

*Music education curriculum*. Course of study or standards set by the National Association for Music Educators for music grades K-12 (Walker, 1998).

*Musical emotion*. Referring to regulation of mood that can be attributed to listening to music (Saarikallio & Erkkilä, 2007).

*Music program.* Department in a school includes music participation for grades K-12. Classes consist of band, chorus, and lessons for elementary students (Grimmett, Rickard, Gill, & Murphy, 2012).

*Multiple intelligences.* Individuals gifted in the areas of math, spatiality, musicality, and verbal expression (Henshon, 2006).

*Musical advocacy*. Support through community or corporate organization for the sake of music education (Hobby, 2004).

*Non-tested core subjects.* Those subjects considered to be a core component of the elementary and secondary curriculum, but are not tested on required standardized assessments. Examples of non-tested core subjects include foreign language and fine arts such as music and art (NCLB, 2002).

*Professional development*. For the purposes of this study, the meeting of teachers and faculty from elementary, secondary, and higher education institutions to collaborate and study the implementation of arts into the content areas of classroom curriculum (Vitulli, et al. 2013).

*Second delivery of instruction.* Describes the process of additional strategies used for students with different types of learning styles (Vitulli, et al., 2013).

*Traditional modes of learning*. Customary method of gaining knowledge through auditory, visual, and tactile/kinesthetic learners (Mixon, 2004).

*Tested Core subjects.* Academic subjects reading, math, science and social studies (Colwell, 2008).

#### Summary

Effective teachers employ instructional strategies that enhance student engagement and can positively affect student learning. The integration of music into the curriculum as a means of increasing motivation and participation is one such strategy. With a growing emphasis on academic achievement, it has become increasingly more challenging to justify the integration of arts into the curriculum. Little research has been done to describe the perceptions of classroom teachers who have integrated music into the curriculum. This study provided a glimpse of how music can be used to enhance student learning.

Chapter 1 began with an introduction to the study. Also included were the problem statement, the purpose of the study, and the research questions that guided the study. The conceptual framework for this study was discussed and definitions of terms relevant to this study were given. Chapter 2 consists of a review of the problem

statement and purpose of this study, followed by a comprehensive review of the literature regarding music in education. Chapter 3 describes the methodology for this study, as well as the design and plan for implementation. Chapter 4 details the analysis of the data collected, providing an in-depth description of the results of the study. Finally, chapter 5 provides a summary of the study, its findings, and implications.

#### CHAPTER II – LITERATURE REVIEW

The purpose of this study is to describe classroom teachers' experiences who have attended an arts integration workshop with integrating music into the classroom curriculum. The aim of this study is to gain in-depth knowledge regarding the implementation of music into the classroom curriculum and determine how teachers perceive the effectiveness of professional development participation in music integration.

A review of the literature reveals that in the early 1900s, music educators in the United States felt the need for a more organized form for teaching music (Walker, 1998). Through collaboration and meetings, organizations were formed and curriculum was designed so that students would receive high quality musical instruction (Mark & Gray, 2007). After many years of research, scientific tests were developed that provide valid evidence of the importance of music in the development of the brain (Strickland, 2011). Because music is a factor in the foundation of our early development, music programs are provided in our schools as an opportunity for students to work together and recall knowledge (Abril & Gault, 2006).

#### History and Early Research in Music Education

Music education in schools today provides opportunities for students to develop creativity as well as show the value and results of their determination and hard work (Mark & Gary, 2007). Prior to the 1950s, music education was an unorganized subject in the elementary, secondary, and high school curricula. Although music played a large part in the entertainment of society, the education of music was taught as a function of religious ceremonies or worship (Mark & Gray 2007). At this time, children were delivered music instruction by memorization, which most often consisted of music from church liturgy (Keene, 1982). Mid-century musicians began to see the need for music training beyond performance; therefore, musicians of early years began to organize and develop a format for music education (Keene, 1982). Leaders of this early era of music education consisted of contributors with a vision to establish a framework of design for music instruction. These early musicians included Lowell Mason, Charles Aiken, and Luther Whiting Mason. These musicians provided significant influence in the area of music for education (Walker, 1998).

### Early Influences on Music Education

Lowell Mason was a student at the Singing School in Massachusetts, led by Amos Albee, where he played organ, piano, flute, clarinet, and other instruments (Mark & Gray, 2007). Mason began his music career in 1815 in Savannah, Georgia where he was the choirmaster and organist of the Independent Presbyterian Church. While there, he composed hymns and other music used in worship (Mark & Gray, 2007). In 1821, Mason visited Boston where he found publishers for his music, J. H. Wilkins and R. B. Carter (Keene, 1982). His writing of *The Boston Handel and Haydn Society* became so successful Mason moved to Boston (Keene, 1982). Mason began teaching music classes, without pay, in the Boston elementary schools in 1837 (Walker, 1998). Although adversely antagonistic to accepting the position, Mason was the first teacher of the Singing School for Children in Boston, and in 1838 was appointed the first supervisor of vocal music for the Boston School District with an annual budget of \$130 for each school he supervised (Keene, 1982). He continued this work until 1845 when he began writing, lecturing, and teaching at the Boston Academy of Music (Walker, 1998). Lowell Mason believed music was a large part of life's fulfillment. He said:

The musical talent should not be cultivated merely because it is one of the many human faculties, but because the development of the musical faculty contributes to the development of the "whole man" [sic] through assisting in the growth of certain elements or aspects of the complete personality, such as the physical, the intellectual, the emotional, the aesthetic, the social, the character, and the integrated individual. (Rich, 1946, p. 62-63)

Mason incorporated Heinrich Pestalozzi's idea, Pestalozzianism, into his educational practices, which is the belief that children learn intellectually as well as through natural expression when in a comfortable environment (Keene, 1982). Through Pestalozzianism, Mason worked to find ways to best suit the needs of the children by improving music education. The Pestalozzianism idea suggested students be grouped according to ability instead of age, encouraged individual differences, and promoted activities such as drawing, writing, singing, and model making. Because of his work he was recognized by the community as an outstanding proponent of music education with accomplishments in the areas of revising instructional music material, organizing and instructing educational conventions, and originating the study of the rudiments of music in U.S. public schools (Walker, 1998). He was also known as the "father of singing among the children" and did so initially without pay (Mark & Gray, 2007, p. 129).

Like Mason, others such as Charles Aiken taught for many years without pay. In 1842, Charles Aiken was the first to teach music to primary grades in the city of Cincinnati (Mark & Gray, 2007). Aiken began his career working with students in the basement of the Sixth Street Presbyterian Church in Cincinnati, developing a singing school. According to Mark and Gray (2007) he enjoyed being located in the church due

to the large music collection in the basement library. In 1871 Aiken, introduced music in the elementary grades, assisted in the writing of several texts, and edited *The High School* Choralist of 1866 and The Choralist's Companion of 1872 (Walker, 1998). These publications included four-part choral music from composers such as Handel, Haydn, Mozart, Beethoven, Mendelssohn, and Rossini. Aiken continued writing and composing music for many years until he accepted a position as superintendent of music for the Cincinnati School District (Walker, 1998). Aiken retired in 1879 and his son, Walter H. Aiken who was considered by his colleagues to be a brilliant choral director, was then appointed the superintendent of music in Cincinnati in 1900. This father and son combination gave 86 continuous years to music students in Cincinnati (Walker, 1998). Charles Aiken wrote to his son while teaching in Hamilton, Ohio, "If you find that the Hamiltonians don't appreciate that class [classical genre] of music, don't give any more concerts, 'Cast not your pearls before the swine' is a good doctrine" (Mark & Gray, 2007, p. 174). Charles Aiken seemed to think that his son was wasting his talent on an audience who did not appreciate his efforts and ability (Mark & Gray, 2007).

Like Aiken, Luther Whiting Mason served the Cincinnati schools in 1857 and translated a set of Lowell Mason's songbooks for young voices (Walker, 1998). Luther Mason (no relation to Lowell Mason) is most noted for developing a rote-note approach to music instruction, which incorporated flash cards to learn music notation through memorization (Walker, 1998). In 1864, Mason found his start in Boston to organize and teach music in elementary schools. During this time, he created the first elementary music organized curriculum known as the *National Music Course* (Walker, 1998). As a result, he was recognized as the formulator of instructional materials for early grades and gained prominence as the founder and creator of music methodology curriculum (Walker, 1998). The *National Music Course* was the first arranged approach for teaching music and was adopted by the Japanese government (Walker, 1998). However, in the United States, there was still no organized form of music education in school settings. This began to change in the early 1900s, when music education became one of the focal points of early music conventions (Mark & Gray, 2007).

#### Early Music Conventions

Throughout early periods of music education development, music leaders began meeting together to further discuss the ideas and objectives in every area of music instruction (Mark & Gray, 2007). The first recorded convention for music performers took place in Concord, New Hampshire, in 1829, and focused on the role of church choir directors, singing schoolmasters, and interested singers in the area of performance (Mark & Gary, 2007). Convention goers participated in choir competitions, and sang in choir musical works, which were too large for one choir to sing (Mark & Gary, 2007). Limited recorded meeting dates include 1830 in Pembroke, New Hampshire and 1831 in Goffstown, New Hampshire (Mark & Gray, 2007).

The conferences became very popular, because they provided music instruction for music educators, who in turn returned to their schools encouraged and motivated to teach these new lessons (Walker, 1998). In 1910, in Cincinnati, a new group of music leaders formed as the Music Supervisors National Conference. The membership of this organization consisted of public school educators who were also part of the National Education Association (NEA) (Walker, 1998). By 1920 membership had grown from 1,000 to 3,000 with Chicago headquarter offices established in 1930 (Walker, 1998). In 1934 the organization went through a name change to Music Educators National Conference or MENC. For many years this organization promoted music education throughout the U.S. Finally, in September of 2011, the organization settled on a name and changed it to the National Association for Music Educators (NAfME) with its current membership of approximately 60,000 (Nierman, 2014). NAfME is the governing force for the advocacy of music education in schools within the U.S. It has fought for and provided support for music education to remain in schools with continuous advancment for better musical instruction for K-12 grade levels and higher education in a time of budget and time deficit (Mark & Gray, 2007). The NAfME mission statement states:

Music allows us to celebrate and preserve our cultural heritages, and also to explore the realms of expression, imagination, and creation resulting in new knowledge. Therefore, every individual should be guaranteed the opportunity to learn music and to share in musical experiences. The mission of the National Association for Music Education is to advance music education by encouraging the study and making of music by all. (Mission Preamble, para. 1).

Throughout the years, musicians met for different conventions; however, there were a pivotal few in history such as The Yale Seminar, The Manhattanville Project, and the Tanglewood Symposium. These meetings are recognized for creating the early beginnings of a formal music curriculum for music education within the schools. Music educators gathered to collaborate and brainstorm ideas for creating a comprehensive music program of study (Mark, 2008).

### The Yale Seminar

The Yale Seminar took place in June of 1963. Thirty-one music teachers met on

the campus at Yale University to examine music materials and musical performances, and to make suggestions for improvement in both performance and curriculum resources of music (Mark & Gray, 2007). The purpose of the seminar was to discuss problems in K-12 music education and create solutions for a flourishing music education program (Mark & Gary, 2007). During this meeting, educators speculated if students were rehearsing music to simply perform music or to determine if they were really learning musical concepts (Walker, 1998). Seminar members were critical of the art of music being used only for "showmanship while the aesthetic influence of great music" was missed (Mark & Gray, 2007, p. 400). They determined new materials for music classrooms and levels of performance ability had not changed during the course of thirty years (Walker, 1998). The Yale Seminar suggested the following as goals for music education:

The basic goals of the K-12 education curriculum should be to develop musicality through performance, movement, creativity, and listening. The music education repertory should be broadened to include jazz, folk and contemporary popular music. A sequence of guided listening [sic] to worthwhile music should be developed. Performance activities should include large ensembles for which authentic and varied repertory would exist; small-ensemble participation by student musicians should be of particular importance. Advanced theory and literature courses should be available to students who could most benefit from them. Performing musicians, composers and scholars should be brought into school to provide students with insights as to how professionals think and work.

17

Music programs in the public schools need to take greater advantage of community and national human material resources. Audiovisual aids and individualized instruction programs need to be developed and used in music classrooms. A plan must be developed to train and retrain teachers as to enable curriculum revision to be successfully implemented. (Walker, 1998, p. 317)

#### The Manhattanville Music Curriculum Project

Another conference of importance to music education was the Manhattanville Music Curriculum Project, many times referred to as the Manhattanville Project or MMCP. This meeting was held at Manhattanville College in Purchase, New York in 1965 (Walker, 1998). Development of music education curriculum for grades K-12 was of the utmost concern at this meeting, as well as developing an instrument for assessment of music education (Walker, 1998). This group was interested in the music curriculums being used in the present music programs of that day; therefore, 92 schools were selected to participate in a pilot study and provide research information for future music educators. Areas of research included student-learning potential, curriculum reform, and creating classroom procedures. During this pilot study, neither the administrators nor the parents saw the need to establish a music education program other than the existing music classes based on performance. Therefore, this endeavor did not continue, and the result of the Manhattanville Project did not prove successful (Walker, 1998).

## The Tanglewood Sympsium

In 1967, another meeting of great significance was held. Music educators convened at the Tanglewood Symposium in Tanglewood, Massachusetts (Walker, 1998). This group consisted of professionals in society such as scientists, sociologists, labor leaders, and educators, as well as government leaders. This symposium was given the nickname "Music in American Society" (Choate, Brown, Fowler, & Wersen, 1967, p. 73). This symposium provided a framework for music education to determine the type of characteristics and desirable ideologies that were needed for an emerging postindustrial society, as well as the values of music and other arts for individuals and communities in society. Due to the success of the symposium, the group of professionals had to conclude what must be done to obtain this information (Walker, 1998).

At the Tanglewood Symposium, discussions were held on the topic of music and its role in American society (Choate et al. 1967). This group believed that elementary music education curriculum should stress more understanding regarding types of music through listening and performance, studying music by singing, playing and movement, and arranging and composing music, as well as using musical notation (Walker, 1998). Attendees believed junior high students should be required to take one general music class, while high school students should take one arts course as well as instrumental performance (Walker, 1998).

Through their discussions, members of the Tanglewood Symposium agreed that the integrity of music as an art must continue through education. The members agreed that music curriculum must include musical periods, styles, forms, and cultures of other countries so that a comprehensive approach would be taught (Choate et al, 1967). They also thought that time should be allotted in schools and colleges so that adequate music programs might be developed. Members created stipulations that would require adequate university programs for music specialists who would train and educate individuals who in turn would develop qualified musicians (Choate et al, 1967).

## National Association for Music Educators

The National Association for Music Educators was established to be an advocate for music education. This professional organization originated during the Tanglewood Symposium and was originally known as the Music Educators National Conference (MENC). The collaboration that took place at the Tanglewood Symposium allowed decisions to be made by music educators to immediately address the inadequacies of the school music programs. The members of this organization worked together to create and organize standards not just for music education for accountability, but so that the value and respect for music education could be developed in society as well (Walker, 1998).

Through the Tanglewood Symposium, the organization once known as Music Educators National Conference (MENC), which is today's NAfME, became larger in number and more powerful. This organization has been the national music educators association for professionals for many years that meets annually for the purpose of "advancement of music knowledge and education" (Mark & Gary, 2007, p. 237).

NAfME continues to be an advocate for promoting music education in our schools (NAfME, 2013). It is because of the MENC that our standards of music for grades K-12 have been developed (Walker, 1998). The standards are:

- singing, alone and with others, a varied repertoire of music;
- performing on instruments, alone and with others, a varied repertoire of music;

- improvising melodies, variations and accompaniments;
- composing and arranging music within specified guidelines;
- reading and notating music;
- listening to, analyzing, and describing music;
- evaluating music and music performances;
- understanding relationships between music, and other arts; and disciplines outside the arts;
- understanding music in relation to history and culture (MENC, 2013).

Along with these standards for music the MENC organization has created a role of music education in the K-12 curriculum. (Walker, 1998, p. 317) These music standards are an example of the curriculum that is to be covered in the music classroom (Walker, 1998). Along with these objectives, the educators should evoke the students' emotional aesthetics or feeling response, which are experienced within the student through the music experience (Foran, 2009). Fresne & Vitulli (2013) describe the ideal music classroom as a classroom with multi levels of learning to meet the needs of all students at their individual levels. Music classrooms will be recognized as the one where laughter and music can be heard.

Walker (1998) described the expectations of music education for schools as follows:

The music education program in the curriculum of today's schools should provide every student with the opportunity to develop intellectual, technical aesthetic, and social goals. These goals represent a basic minimum for performers and nonperformers alike. The school should attempt to achieve as much depth and understanding in these skills as the resources of the school and community will permit. (p. 318)

Yick-Ming (2005) describes the complete, well-rounded student as one who has lived life and experienced enjoyment, creativity, participation, and enthusiasm. Only through public performance and demonstration of creativity can a child develop a holistic, well-rounded personality. Part of the completion of a mature individual is the encouragement and nurturing of creativity and the opportunity to show development (Yick-Ming, 2005). Children are natural musicians with innate capacities to become excited, release tension, and become motivated when exposed to musical activities (Campbell, 1998). The development of the comprehensive student goes beyond textbooks and tests; therefore, the development of an effective music education curriculum is imperative (Campbell, 1998). Conrad (2006) expresses that a child's education goes beyond knowledge but encompasses the process of experiencing achievement and success.

# Music Education Curriculum

In the early 1900s, Will Earhart worked to create a music curriculum for high schools that included not only choral music but classes for harmony, music appreciation, musical form, instrumental lessons, and the formation of orchestra and band (Walker, 1998). These classes became models for future music classes. This type of format for music education continued well into the 1940s. In 1957, when the Soviet Union launched the first man-made satellite, education as a whole went through pandemonium, with a sharp increased focus on math, science and foreign languages, leaving little time for music education, (Johanningmeier, 2010). This shocked the U.S. and created a political

crisis. Inventions such as the light bulb, sewing machine, cotton gin, electricity, and the telephone had all been created first in the U.S. and Americans did not expect to be second in anything (Bernhardt, Burns, Lombard, & Steeves, 2009).

Americans considered the U.S. to be the most advanced country in the world, but they had a rude awakening when Sputnik was launched. Americans felt threatened because Russia was now seemingly more advanced than the U.S. (Walker, 1998). Emotions were high with anxiety and urgency for reform in every aspect of education, business, and politics in the U.S. (Steele, 1988). Americans believed that our security as a nation had been breached (Steele, 1988). Americans believed the government was to blame for the advancements of Russia's space endeavors and denounced the school systems for lacking high expectations for their students. Because of society's pressure for change, the federal government, for the first time in history, created educational reform and schools began a restructuring process that forever changed education in American schools. School systems across America developed curriculum with increased rigor in science and math in an effort to compete with the Soviet Union's advancements (Johanningmeier, 2010). President Dwight D. Eisenhower enacted the National Defense Education Act (NDEA), which provided funding that allowed school systems to meet the new rigorous academic demands. This restructuring caused changes in music education as well as an exigent desire to develop a better education for our future society (Walker, 1998). As public education in the U.S. became a focal point due to the overwhelming desire to regain world prominence, it was determined by educational and political leaders that all academic studies including music education should become a priority in schools in hopes of providing American students, the future of our country, with knowledge

which they in turn would contribute back to the U.S. and place the U.S. ahead in the world once again.

In an effort to regain recognition and achievement in the world, American composers were placed in the school systems throughout the country to teach and write music between the years of 1959 and 1962 (Walker, 1998). This became known as the Young Composers Project (Walker, 1998). Composers involved in this endeavor were Conrad Susa of New York, who was placed in the Nashville, Tennessee School System; Nelson Keyes of Los Angeles, CA, who served in the Louisville, Kentucky School District; and Phillip Glass of New York, who was assigned to the Pittsburg, Pennsylvania School District (Green, 1961).

Funded by the Ford Foundation-National Music Council, a foundation for advancing human prosperity, the Young Composers project increased the awareness for music education in the public schools, created a foundation for the music professional, nurtured educators and students in the quality of music used in schools, and created talent in the students (Mark and Gray, 2007). It was during the time of the Young Composers Project that the participating musicians became aware that an organized curriculum for music was needed and that many political figures were willing to give support.

## Politics in Music Education

Historically, political figures have wavered on their support for the arts. In the Puritan era of the colonial U.S., the arts were viewed as highly "suspect and sinful" (Barresi, 1981, p. 246). Although this view created a mindset of insignificance for the arts for early Americans as well as the many politicians who were politically influenced, there still remained those who valued the arts. President George Washington was a supporter of the arts, and in 1791 requested that Pierre L'Enfant, the designer of the city of Washington, D.C., develop an arts center when planning the nation's new capital city (Barresi, 1981). President John Adams believed the arts to be important, although he regarded them as a low priority in his plan of progress. Adams was more concerned with political stability, material wealth, and westward expansion (Barresi, 1981).

During the Great Depression of the 1930s, government funding in many areas was limited, with 71% of the nation's musicians unemployed (Barresi, 1981). Within this time period, the government made use of the jobless artists and educators as performers and teachers by initiating massive programs for performance in schools (Parker, 2008). Musicians encouraged national unity through music and diminished fear of times to come (Parker, 2008). They were paid to perform music of past and present times in the U.S., to encourage and honor American composers, and perform music of American heritage (Parker, 2008).

However, towards the end of World War II, federal subsidies for the arts were unplanned and irregular (Barresi, 1981). Support for the arts narrowed and was limited to cultural exchanges sponsored by the State Department, with indirect financial support in the form of income tax deductions for art contributions and supplementary services (Barresi, 1981). During this time, President Harry S. Truman requested that the existing Commission on Fine Arts investigate ways in which the arts could be aided by the federal government. Then in the late 1950s President Dwight D. Eisenhower was persuaded to sponsor legislation creating the National Council on the Arts (Barresi, 1981). The National Endowment for the Arts was created in 1968 with a \$15.5 million dollar National Cultural Center, which was developed in Washington D.C. (Barresi, 1981). Political figures continued to promote the arts throughout Americans history. Politicians such as Truman and Eisenhower endorsed the arts, but very little solid information or research was available to support their desire to promote the arts (Gerrity, 2009). Although these individuals were supportive of the advancement of the arts, research was needed for educational leaders for additional knowledge and understanding of the necessity of music education for K-12 students.

Attitudes of educational administrators have fluctuated during the years regarding the importance of music classes offered to school-age children (Gerrity, 2009). In a study of the Ohio school system, Clay (1972) found that 100% of the administrators believed music classes were considered an important element in U.S. schools, and 45% of administrators believed that music classes for all K-8<sup>th</sup> grade students should be required. In 1994, Monroe revised the Ohio study of Jones and Clay which was conducted in 1994 and found that 84% of principals, considered music important, but believed that it should be offered as an elective (Gerrity, 2009). Only 21% of these school principals valued music education in and of itself (Gerrity, 2009).

In 1983, the National Commission of Excellence in Education released a report titled *A Nation at Risk*, which led to a close examination in the field of education (Conrad, 2006). This report explained such problems in U.S. schools as less days spent in school compared to other countries and the idea of more focus given to subjects such as language arts, math, and science (Conrad, 2006). With these studies, educators became curious as to what should be taught and how much time should be allotted to each subject area (Conrad, 2006). Through the next 20 years, music educators stayed somewhat quiet until legislators passed the 2001 No Child Left Behind and implemented it into the K-12 schools.

# No Child Left Behind

Due to federal regulation, education reform policies have affected our students' access to a high quality music education. In order to close the achievement gap existing between various groups of students in core subjects such as reading and math, federal lawmakers created the NCLB Act of 2001. Spohn (2008) noted, "NCLB was created to establish equitable educational opportunities for all students and close the gap for student achievement, but because of testing in reading and math, learning opportunities in the arts have reduced" (p. 3). This policy was established early in the presidency of George W. Bush and continues today in the Obama administration. Gerrity (2009) noted, "Although No Child Left Behind refers to music and the other arts as core subjects, the legislation does not encourage achievement in the core subjects with equal fortitude" (p. 80).

While many students benefit from reading and mathematics in NCLB, for others in elective subject areas, it is a detriment. Music programs have been diminished due to the funding cuts implemented by the federal government (Lichtenberg, 2007). With the focus given to math and reading for NCLB, arts programs throughout schools in the U.S. have gradually become less robust (Lichtenberg, 2007). For example, in the Evansville-Vanderburgh School Corporation in Indiana, music programs have been eliminated along with nine teaching positions of music specialists (Lichtenberg, 2007).

Furthermore, increased emphasis on achievement is geared toward the core subjects while funding is based on increased test scores (Major, 2013). As a result, music teachers are often expected to devote instructional time to other subjects such as reading and math (Hemmel & Gerrity, 2012). According to Retner, Scott, Kober, Chudwsky, Shudowsky, Joftus & Zabala (2006), 46% of school districts have reduced instructional time for art and music to allow more time for remediation in reading and math. Thus, principals and other administrators are showing decreased interest in the importance of music education (Retner, et al., 2006).

In a 2006-2007 study of principals in the Ohio schools, results showed 26 principals of Ohio school districts, consistently ranked music as the least important subject in the general education of students when compared to the other core disciplines tested through NCLB such as mathematics, reading, science, social studies, and writing (Gerrity, 2009). Schuler (2012) discusses the issue of the situation created by federal education legislation in the guidelines of grants and waivers, which have created an atmosphere where school officials feel obligated to give up music and other educational programs, which are not tested, so that instructional time can be increased for tested subjects.

On April 2, 2012, the U.S. Department of Education released a report of a study of art education in public elementary and secondary schools in 2009. In this report Shuler (2012) showed that 91% of America's schools provide music education taught by a licensed music teacher and some 57% of high schools require their students to fulfill arts requirements for graduation. Shuler (2012) found that there was an unfortunate loss for students in the lowest socioeconomic quartile of 25% who are far less likely to receive a music education . These are the very students who would benefit most from the study of music and other arts.

Because music had not been incorporated as a subject of tested accountability at this point in time, unfortunately, every year education administrators are pressured by board members or other education officials to reduce class time allotted to music in order to allow more minutes for instruction in tested core subjects (Conrad, 2006). For example, if math scores do not improve; music class time will decrease even more (Spohn, 2008). According to Spohn (2008), limiting music and art instruction in the education of a child can be likened to limiting a food group in her or his diet that would lead to deficiencies and disease in children and limit their growth into hearty individuals (Spohn, 2008).

Spohn (2008) discussed the affects of high stakes testing as a production of "educationally and developmentally famished citizens" (p. 11). NCLB was implemented so that education would be delivered with equity for all students but due to the stress of achievement given in the subjects of math and reading educational leaders neglected student creativity that could be fostered by the arts. Testing does not assess creativity; instead, solving problems requires higher order thinking abilities needed to generate an efficacious life. Not everything in life can be learned from a textbook.

# Conrad (2006) said,

Fine arts education, including music education, is fundamental for the social, intellectual, cognitive and emotional development of students. Policy makers and music educators must decide whether to emphasize performance training and music understanding or exclude a large segment of learners, which limits the influence that music education can have. (p. 33).

### ESSA

In December 2015, the Obama administration created the Every Student Succeeds Act (ESSA) as a replacement for No Child Left Behind Act. This new education law allows schools to use federal funds to provide a well-rounded education. Building on the belief that all students should be taught to high academic standards and be prepared to succeed in college and careers, ESSA implements an accountability factor that ties each schools' funding to its academic performance (Dennis, 2017). ESSA defines a well-rounded education as follows.

The term "well-rounded education" means courses, activities, and programming in subjects such as English, reading or language arts, writing, science, technology, engineering, mathematics, foreign languages, civics and government, economics, arts, history, geography, computer science, music, career and technical education, health, physical education, and any other subject, as determined by the State or local educational agency, with the purpose of providing all students access to an enriched curriculum and educational experience (U.S. Department of Education, 2015).

## Music and the Brain

In order to determine how music and musical activities can affect the brain, the brain development process needs to be understood (Burriss & Strickland, 2001). The relationship between the brain and music, although complex, is most interesting (Cole, 2011). According to neuroscientists from Harvard, Stanford, and the University of Oregon, policymakers should think twice before cutting arts programs in schools, as there are many correlations between the arts and student learning (Cole, 2011). In 2004, the Dana Arts and Cognition Consortium gathered research from neuroscientists from seven different universities across the U.S. The Dana Foundation is a private philanthropic organization which provides grants for research in brain science, immunology, and education with a special interest in the arts (DANA, 2013). One of these seven

neuroscientists, Michael Posner of the University of Oregon, showed results of researchbased interventions which proved useful in improving the ability of children to adjust to the school setting and to acquire skills like literacy and numeracy (Posner & Rothbart, 2005). Cole (2011) commented that "sustained motivation can be developed through the arts and provide the cognitive benefit of strengthening the attention networks in the brain such that are found in the midline and lateral frontal areas" (p. 26).

Furthermore, Huttenlocher's 1994 study supported this theory, emphasizing the importance of early stimulation provided by the exposure to music at an early age. Huttenlocher found that synaptic density in the human visual cortex in preschool children and maximum synaptic growth occurs in the visual cortex at approximately four months of age, and in the prefrontal cortex at approximately one year of age. The auditory cortex is generally about 80% developed by the age of one year (Burriss & Strickland, 2001). Although these synapses prepare the brain to learn quickly from environmental experiences, a lack of experience results in the elimination of these synapses (Burriss & Strickland, 2001). Burriss and Strickland (2001) reported, "After the rapid growth period, the synapses that are not used are gradually lost; this process continues through early adolescence" (p. 100).

In the study of Posne and Rothbart (2005) research showed the arts to be helpful in increasing attention duration of students in school. The results of the study revealed that this was due to structural brain changes created when the students were engaged in practicing their art form. Cole (2011) said, "When students pick up an instrument and practice a tricky passage in their solo, they are developing a high level of concentration that will aid them when working on the next algebra problem" (p. 27). In addition, Cole (2011) found increased concentration when students are taught lessons in music. Likewise, spatial sensitivity is strengthened in the musician's brain while practicing on string instruments, using mental and kinesthetic intelligence to divide the strings at just the exact point to obtain the right notes every time they play (Cole, 2011). This brain interaction can actually be seen through sophisticated imaging technology.

New brain imaging technology called Diffusion Tensor Imaging (DTI), identifies locations among brain regions involved in the development of skills used in reading (Shachar, et al., 2011). Wandell (2008) used this new brain imaging technology to show the relationship between reading fluency and the amount of music training a child has experienced. Wandell (2008) discovered regions in the child's brain which were utilized in the development of musical skills as being the same cognitive skills which allow students to become fluent readers. Brain imaging data demonstrates the primary auditory cortex in the left hemisphere of musically trained subjects is larger than individuals untrained in music (Cole, 2011). Motor-sequencing tasks of musicians, along with rhythm melodic tasks, were more developed as well (Cole, 2011). Furthermore, attention strategies are keener in musicians due to the long rehearsals, which improve the cerebrum where long-term memory is developed in the brain (Cole, 2011). This can be seen through brain imaging technology available for research. DTI technology is invaluable when providing evidence for leaders who determine the necessity for music education. As Burriss and Strickland (2001) noted, "These recent sophisticated techniques for measuring brain activity allow us to study brain development to a degree never before possible" (p. 100). With these scientific findings educational leaders can see proof of the necessity of music for children in schools and the positive effects that can be gained

#### (Burriss & Strickland, 2001).

# The Mozart Effect.

In the early 1990s the development of the "Mozart Effect" became well known and popular (Caulfield, 1999). This term originated from two men, Francis Rauscher and Gordon Shaw from the University of California at Irvine who studied college students who listened to *Mozart's Sonata for Two Pianos in D Major* before academic testing. Other types of music selections were used but when tested on standard IQ tests these individuals showed improvement in their spatial reasoning skills for those listening to the Mozart piece of music (Rauscher, Shaw, & Ky, 1993). Contrary to the common belief that Mozart's music is only beneficial to infants, this study showed beneficial results as well with college students (Caulfield, 1999).

A follow-up study by Rauscher and Shaw (1993) with a larger sample, showed the previous results to be significant (Caulfield, 1999). The Mozart Effect created a buzz of announcements from the press proclaiming "Mozart makes you smarter" (Caulfield, 1999, p. 119). In 1998, the Governor of Georgia embraced this idea and was the first state governor to provide newborn babies in Georgia with a CD of Mozart's music (Caulfield, 1999). Caulfield (1999) told the story of an extremely premature half-pound infant who was on life support in a neo-natal unit that played Mozart's music. The doctors had no hope that the baby would live but the mother gave Mozart's music the credit for the baby girl's survival (Caulfield, 1999). This child showed many delays in the first few years of her life. She could not sit up until the age of one year and could not walk until two years of age, but by the time she was three, she tested far ahead of her years in abstract reasoning (Caulfield, 1999). Newman, Rosenbach, Burns, Latimer, Matocha, and Vogt remain skeptical of this study and feel circumstance had more to do with the study than Mozart's music (Newman et al., 1995). In his closing remarks, Caulfield (1999) states,

Music does appear to stimulate the neural circuitry of the brain in ways that are becoming better understood each day with connections between neurons, which are being formed at an explosive rate during early infancy and childhood. Therefore, when children are exposed to music at an early age, neurons start hard wiring connections to the auditory cortex. If they are continually used, they become fully integrated with other neurons; therefore, music is important. (p. 120)

At the same time, questions began to surface in the Mozart Effect research and the effect of older students. Jones and Estell (2007) examined whether the Mozart Effect existed in high school students because the population had not been previously studied. They sampled 86 high school students to determine if there was a relationship between listening to Mozart and performance on spatial IQ tests. The research of Jones and Estell (2007) of the Mozart Effect showed mixed results. Thompson, Schellenberg, and Hussain (2001) concluded that spatial performance and listening to Mozart are related, but Mozart does not increase arousal levels for high school students. However, regardless of the musical conditions, students with higher arousal levels showed better spatial task performance than students who were less aroused (Raucher & Hinton, 2006). Brouchard, Dufour, and Després (2004) suggest, "learning to play a musical instrument and/or read musical scores involves the development of specific perceptual, cognitive, and motor skills which are likely to transfer to other behaviors" (p. 103).

Music training that begins at an early age affects the organization of the musical brain (Hodges, 2000). In Hodges' (2000) study, babies responded to music in the womb during the last three months before birth. After birth there was strong evidence for the existence of neural mechanisms in the brain used to process musical information. Hodges (2000) said, "For the musically trained, the arrangement of the auditory cortex is much like a piano keyboard, with equal distance between octaves" (p. 19).

Hodges (2000) stated,

The area of the motor cortex controlling the fingers increased in response to piano exercises, both actual and imagined. The auditory cortex, which responds to piano tones, was 25 percent larger among experienced musicians; the effect was greater for those who started studying music at an early age. Finally, compared to nonplayers, string players have greater neuronal activity and a larger area in the area of the right motor cortex that controls the fingers of the left hand. Again, these effects were greater for those who started playing at a young age. (p. 19)

These findings display great value in showing how music aids in brain development and the importance of the introduction to music at an early age. The scientific information of the brain and how it relates to music could be used to advocate for music education (Peterson, 2011). Peterson (2011) said, "As musicians and music educators, we know the value of music, but evidence from recent research could further strengthen our convictions" (p. 206).

# Listening to Music.

When studying the effect on the brain while listening to music, researchers have used a new approach called "cumulative variation amplitude analysis" for analyzing spontaneous EEGs or electroencephalograms (Bhattacharya, Petsche & Pereda, 2001). The EEG is a computerized tool used to image or scan the brain while performing a cognitive activity. This information can be recorded during several cognitive tasks such as listening to music (Bhattacharya et al., 2001). These test results can be used when working with music as therapy, which originally was used for rehabilitation settings (Foran, 2009). Music therapy has proven to be helpful in individuals who have experienced psychological trauma, yet it is not known at the present time exactly why it is helpful (Sacks, 2007). Many times children and adolescents who have experienced trauma have difficulties in emotional regulation, behavior problems, poor concentration, and deficits in verbal memory (Stein & Kendall, 2004). Although teachers are seldom music therapists, and few are trained musicians, they can still add music to their day in many ways such as starting the day with five minutes of classical music as a soothing and attention-focusing tool (Foran, 2009). By listening to music, people experience beneficial physiological effects such as less tension, a lower heart rate and blood pressure, and a reduction in anxiety levels (Foran, 2009). Classical music such as that of Mozart, Haydn, Vivaldi, Bach, or Handel can help students concentrate (Foran, 2009). Popular music and jazz are also helpful in aiding the brain's attention, emotional regulation, and memory functions (Foran, 2009).

Using music for relaxation and mood regulations may prepare the student to maintain a state of well being (Barcewicz, 2011). In a study by Saarikallio and Erkkila

(2007) in Finland, the role of music in adolescents' mood regulation was examined using group interviews and theory-based methods. Saarikallio and Erkkila (2007) discovered seven strategies adolescents implemented to use music to satisfy a desired calming mood. These strategies include entertainment, revival, strong sensation, diversion, discharge, mental work, and solace. Saarikallio and Erkkila (2007) concluded that each of these strategies was utilized by listening to music as well as other musical activities such as singing or writing songs and each strategy was associated with an ultimate change in mood ranging from relaxing and feeling understood and comforted to experiencing thrills and getting energy.

One Saarikallio and Erkkila (2007) study shows that music has the ability to encourage emotional self-regulation for adolescents, but this study also suggests applications using music not only in therapy sessions, but also as a resource to be used in maintaining emotional levels outside of therapy. It has been discovered that happinesselations and nostalgia-longing were more commonly reported during episodes with musical emotions whereas anger-irritation, boredom-indifference, and anxiety-fear were more common in episodes with nonmusical emotions (Juslin, 2008).

Not only is listening to music beneficial to memory learning and other aspects of brain development, but learning to play musical instruments is beneficial as well (Davenport, 2010). Participation in instrumental music and the effect on academic achievement researched and studied by McLelland (2005) showed a statistically significant difference in reading and math achievement among the fifth-grade music participants and those who did not participate. Data collected from standardized testing of 356 fifth-grade students in the Delaware School District from 2001-2002 and 20032004 school years indicated a positive difference in the performance achievement of students who were involved in playing an instrument compared to those who did not.

In 2001, Babo completed research in The Union Township Public School District of New Jersey with 548 students. Babo divided these students into two groups and collected data from California Achievement Test scores along with the New Jersey Grade Eight Proficiency Assessment results in reading and mathematics (Davenport, 2010). Due to brain development that was supported through music experience, such as instrumental lessons, it was determined that those students with instrumental instruction experienced a strong benefit in reading and language arts achievement (Davenport, 2010). Another study issued by the Siemens Foundation 2004 showed the value of playing a musical instrument through the correlation of student achievement and those who played an instrument. This report showed almost 100% of the past winners of the Siemens Westinghouse Competition in Math, Science, and Technology played a musical instrument (Goff, 2017). The Siemens Westinghouse Corporation (2004) gathered winners of the Math, Science, and Technology Competition at Carnegie Hall in New York City and performed a concert (The Midland Chemist, 2005). These students excelled in important areas of academics.

#### Funding in Music Education

Despite the substantial benefits of music education for student performance, whether through cultural awareness or emotional response of others, schools have reduced funding for music and arts programs during the last 10 years (Hobby, 2004). In the 1990s when the federal government cut the national education budget by 40%, many music educators became concerned that music would become a privilege reserved for the rich who could afford hour-long, private lessons (Hobby, 2004). Fischer (2002) said, "Due to the back to the basics approach to education, school officials are now investing more resources on reading, writing and arithmetic, rather than music classes" (p. 22). Many states within the U.S. have experienced loss of funding in music budgets, so that more monies could be appropriated for core subjects such as reading and math. This has caused a drop in the number of students who are involved in music education (Hobby, 2004). In 2003, California suffered enormous cuts in the arts with music student numbers dropping from 124,000 to 64,000 (Hobby, 2004).

In 2015, college students began veering away from music degrees because a music degree is viewed as an unwise decision due to the low number of job opportunities. This has resulted in universities eliminating music degrees which have been offered in the past (Klingenstein, 2011). Furthermore, with the states cutting back funding in our K-12 schools, local taxpayers are expected to pick up the slack through tax increases. Bulkeley (1991) said, "These tax increases have created anger among many in society" (p. A1). Those in the musical arena of society will endorse and support political nominations that value the arts with their vote in elections (Hobby, 2004). These politicians are continually looking for money to enable the arts and prevent the termination of music programs (Gewertz, 2001).

*Budgets in Music Education*. Many public school board members are not supportive of the promotion of music education (Gewertz, 2001). Unfortunately, when faced with reduction in revenues and tight budgets, state legislatures and school districts wrestle with which programs within the school must go and what can stay (Duncombe, Lukemeyer & Yinger, 2006). When the idea of a program cut arises, complaints from the music program supporters are definitely the most vocal (Battling Music, 2004). Faced with cries of how music makes kids smarter from parents, communities, and political leaders, the pressure for finding the funding for music is relentless (Winner and Hetland, 2008).

Funding cuts are not just an issue for music education, but for all public and private institutions at all levels including K-12, community college, and university (Hobby, 2004). However, educators and administrators are beginning to realize that arts programs do not take away from basic subjects, but instead enhance the academic achievement of most students (Longley, 1999). Nevertheless, some political and educational leaders continue to believe that "despite the advocating and reform efforts, music teachers and music education is on the brink of extinction" (Hobby, 2004, p. 44).

Hobby (2004) stated,

Music education is usually one of the first programs to be cut when states fall into a funding crisis. Many music educators ascertain that legislators suggest cutting music programs to illicit [sic] an outcry from the most taxpaying people because music educators typically serve more students than academic teachers. Because of the reality that not all school systems' music programs are considered to be an essential component in student's educational experiences, music advocacy is a vital part of the fight for these special programs. (p. 45)

# Arts Integration

Because of these budget cuts in school systems nationwide, music educators have worked to develop music lessons to incorporate into tested core curriculum subjects (Zdzinski et al., 2007). This has become known as arts integration (Zdzinski et al., 2007). Research has found that integrating music instruction into a whole-language classroom results in equal achievement, yet with a more enthusiastic student response, as well as, provides a deeper understanding in tested academic areas (Zdzinski et al., 2007). DeMoss and Morris (2001) studied results of arts integration in education and found students became more independent, were motivated to learn, gained more knowledge through understanding, were more challenged by building character, and gained a deeper interest in future learning opportunities.

Underwood (2000) said:

Music is an academic discipline, which involves a challenge to the mind like science, foreign language, computer science, and mathematics. However, it appears to touch students at a more basic level, requires less of a prerequisite skill-set, and offers a broader opportunity for enrichment. The beauty of music is that, while it can challenge and enrich the capabilities of outstanding students, less-capable students can enjoy these same benefits as well. (p. 3)

Gardner (1993) acknowledged the theory of multiple intelligences, and how individuals use these intelligences to learn and solve problems. This was done through logical and mathematical analysis, verbal and linguistic skills, musical thinking and spatial representation, bodily and kinesthetic movement, and an understanding of self and of others (Gardner, 1993). Gardner (1993) states that through multiple intelligences middle and high school students are given the opportunity to study and learn academic curriculum in an environment favorable for learning. Knowledge and skills from these multiple intelligences can be associated with characteristics of arts education. Musical thinking is a skill that may be associated with music education; however, verbal and linguistic skills may be associated with theater education. Bodily and kinesthetic movement skills correspond with skills needed for dance education; in the same way spatial representation skills correspond with skills needed for visual arts education (Lee-Holmes, 2008).

The integration of music into the classroom has been in progress for many years (Lee-Holmes, 2008). Implementation supports the theory of multiple intelligence, complements current brain research and learning, and helps to maintain the existence of music in the schools (Lee-Holmes, 2008). The intent of the arts in education is to enhance student learning through the arts. Teachers are not asked to teach dance, music, theater, or visual arts, but to teach reading, math, writing, science, social studies, and other subjects through the vehicle of the arts (Fresne & Vitulli, 2013). Learning or teaching through the arts often reaches students who struggle with the more traditional modes of learning and it supports creativity in the classroom setting (Lee-Holmes, 2008).

The idea of effective integration of the arts was developed by Catterall and Waldorf (1999) and introduced to The Chicago Arts Partnership in Education. This organization helped develop guidelines for effective and smooth merging of objectives in core and art subjects.

These guidelines suggest:

Students should see connections across disciplines and walk away with a bigger picture, students must take their work seriously, the expressions and activities in the arts should genuinely speak to important areas of the

42

academic curriculum, lesson content and academic lesson should be of equal importance, the experience should have a planned assessment with rubrics and scoring guides, and the lesson plans should grow from state curriculum standards in both content areas and the arts. (Lee-Holmes 2008, p. 25)

Due to the federal mandates in education through NCLB, music educators have discovered that incorporating music into the regular classroom curriculum can become a fun way to learn as well as specifically work as a second delivery of instruction (Randall, 2012). The Beverley Taylor Sorenson Arts Learning Program, (BTSALP) a program developed to promote this very idea, is being implemented in Utah with traditional classroom teachers collaborating with music educators (Randall, 2012). BTSALP has been active, and is now in its fifth year with arts specialists working together with teachers to plan lessons and brainstorm activities (Randall, 2012). This program is administered by the state with the help of philanthropist endowment (Randall, 2012).

The BTSALP works as follows: Every week an arts specialist teaches a given elementary class in collaboration with the classroom teacher. Like the students, the classroom teacher learns the art form so that he or she can eventually help the student practice the art skills outside of the designated class and use the art form to reinforce learning across the curriculum. In addition, both teachers are involved in joint curriculum planning throughout the year. (Randall, 2012, p. 1)

Professional development is provided for all teachers who then use BTSALP as a supplementary curriculum, which is to be merged into the core classroom lessons. This

professional development is provided through the University of Utah and is currently led by the Dean of Arts Education and Associate Professor of Music Education, Dr. Joelle Lien (Randall, 2012).

An increase in academic achievement has been noted in the schools where BTSALP has been implemented. However, music educators are concerned that this idea of merging the arts into the classroom will become the dominant instruction in which arts instruction is used so the arts will be used only to support instruction of the curriculum and lose its value as a tested core subject (Randall, 2012). The program director over professional development for the BTSALP at the University of Utah, Kelby McIntyre, assures all educators who work with this program that "collaborative planning between teachers always includes careful attention to goals and outcomes in specific arts disciplines such as dance, visual art, theatre, music, and other academic core subjects" (Randall, 2012, p. 2).

#### Using Music in the Classroom

There are many ways to use music in the classroom. Press (2006) offered suggestions for incorporating music in the classroom setting. Music can be a great source for transitioning from one activity to the next (Press, 2006). Whether played on the classroom CD player or a simple song sung, songs can grab the attentions of students and indicate the time to start an activity, while another song can be used to indicate the ending of an activity, as well as indicate the time to move to the next activity (Press, 2006).

Another form of using music in the classroom is to create songs that can be used to help children learn, and practice and internalize concepts (Press, 2006). For example, using educational items such as "School House Rock" (Kinderart, 1995), students can learn valuable information and facts concerning the historical creation of the Constitution of the United States, the make-up and organization of our government, and history lessons. Included in "School House Rock" are catchy tunes, which correlate with grammar and are designed to aid in the proper placement of the parts of speech (Kinderart, 1995). Rice (2009) showed that being a rock star is not a necessity when creating songs for students. Using objective terms and catchy tunes will enable memorized concepts and higher test grades (Rice, 2009).

Learning through music helps children develop mental and physical concepts in a fun way (Gardner, 1993). Younger children enjoy learning through songs such as the "Hokey Pokey" (LaPrise, 1950). If a child is having difficulty differentiating between their left and right, the "Hokey Pokey" can be used to teach and reinforce this objective in a fun way where mistakes are ignored (LaPrise, 1950). Similarly, a second grade teacher used movement and music to teach her students the water cycle. Students listen to Tchaikovsky's *Waltz of the Snowflake* from *The Nutcracker*. The students pretended to be a snowflakes flying through the air until they landed on an object of their choice, such as a rabbit, and then begin to melt and become water (Jacobs, Victoria, Goldberg, Merryl, & Bennett 1999).

Making up simple movements to go along with songs is another helpful way to learn using music (Press, 2006). Children love to be creative, and applying this practice may increase and improve gross motor and coordination skills. Creating a dance would be a helpful art to implement in the development of coordination (Press, 2006). Students can create finger play songs to improve fine motor skills (Press, 2006). This can be accomplished by using his or her fingers to create a play or story (Press, 2006). Books that are written in a lyrical, sing-song style have also been shown to increase engagement of beginning readers. The repetitive nature of books that allow student to sing while reading enhances vocabulary skills while teaching reading and listening comprehension.

Another effective use of music as an effective tool occurs when children are given the opportunity to create a play with a storyline, which they can act out while creating a song to go along with a story, developing a musical. Students can gain development in oral language and pronunciation with song lyrics that incorporate rhyme (Press, 2006). Students of all ages love to take the tune of their favorite song and create new lyrics (Press, 2006). This could include current pop music as well (Press, 2006). Playing music to create the classroom mood will develop a learning environment, which encourages relaxation and enjoyment (Press, 2006). It can also be played in the classroom for students who are working independently (Press, 2006). Relaxed and happy children are ready to learn (Greenlist, 2003). In addition to listening to music, students who are involved in more formal music instruction, such as playing an instrument, have added benefits (Press, 2006).

In a study by Press (2006), children who play their own instrument follow directions more efficiently and have better developed fine motor skills. Press encourages singing songs or tunes when giving directions. Press gives the example of the song tune "This is the way we wash our hands" and changes the words to "This is the way we get our coat" (Press, 2006, p. 2). This makes listening for instructions interesting and fun (Press, 2006). Garner (2004) discusses "MusicCan," a CD and songbook, that provides encouraging music for skill achievement. Songs such as "Tidy Up the Kitchen" are offered which inspire students to develop listening skills (Garner, 2004). Press encourages teachers to invite instrumentalists to the class to give performances and allow the students to see what the instruments are in an orchestra. Press (2006) also suggests taking class field tips to various types of musical performances and involving students in the planning of the trip.

Macklis (1989) created a rap activity for her language arts class. In this activity, once the teacher delivers the lesson the students are divided into groups. Each group is given a certain number of English terms and is asked to create a rap with the terms. Once each group is finished they put their raps together to form one rap which covers all the terms for the unit lesson.

Press (2006) provided suggestions for combining music with science and reading instruction. For example, Press suggested a science lesson to science teachers on the voice, using questions such as how does the voice make sounds and how does the voice make music? What must a person do to change pitch using their voice? How do various instruments make sounds and why do all instruments sound different? (Press, 2006). Furthermore, reading can be correlated to music by using sing along videos with the bouncing ball that shows the lyrics being sung (Press, 2006). The cumulative and repetitive nature of songs teaches sight vocabulary in a meaningful and fun way (Press, 2006). Pearman and Friedman (2009) said, "Integration makes content come alive in a way that helps students make connections between their own lives and experiences and other texts they have read" (p. 12). Most students will not remember dates or places of specific social studies events, but will remember what is meaningful and relevant in their lives, and music can help with this (Waller & Edgington, 2001).

Music also uses several math concepts. When learning the value of notes and configuring the beats for each measure, the concept of fractions is used. In the study of Dudley and Pecka (1994), a third grade class introduced the concept of the value of dotted music notes and time signature meters. A correlation to fractions was used along with pie charts, which researchers hoped could be understood with much more ease. Dudley and Pecka (1994) determined how many beats a dotted note received as the time meter was changed. Therefore, if a dotted half note gets 3 beats out of 4 in the measure, the pie would have 3 pieces gone and 1 piece left (Dudley and Pecka, 1994).

Nolan (2009) has authored a book Musi-*Matics* which combines a curriculum of music and math lessons. *Musi-Matics* includes 18 creative lessons with over 20 hours of instruction complete with lesson plans, visuals, and worksheets (Nolan, 2009). Pictures are available as well in the book for a better visualization for the reader, which attract student attention and engage them in learning (Nolan, 2009). According to Nolan (2009) all children learn in different ways. Therefore, arts integration offers more options for reinforcement of instruction and retention of knowledge.

According to Nolan (2009):

Arts integration allows teachers to engage many modes of learning simultaneously, includes all students in a creative and safe environment, and — for a few moments — has students forget they are learning and just be in the moment of the activities. The arts in their own realm bring beauty and expression to life. This book, *Musi-Matics* was designed to bring some of that beauty and creativity into elementary classrooms. Each creative lesson reinforces one key math concept, such as patterns,

48

estimation, addition, and skip counting. Teachers can address both math and musical concepts through enjoyable techniques designed to enhance student mastery. (p. 20)

Another program implemented in various North Carolina school's curriculum for academic improvement is titled The A+ School Program (Thomas & Arnold, 2011). This program was implemented in 1995 through the North Carolina Arts Council which holds that "integration of the arts strengthens learning and creates a positive instructional environment" (Thomas & Arnold, 2011, p. 96). The A+ School Program was created by the Thomas Kenan Institute for the Arts in Winston-Salem, North Carolina, and encouraged integration of the arts within the curriculum (Noblit, Corbett, Wilson, & McKinney, 2009). Pepin (1998) discussed the design of A+ Schools. Schools that encompass the A+ School Program do so in a number of ways. The curriculum is infused with the arts such as visual art, music, dance and drama. In addition, A+ schools support teachers and administrators, being sure to include them in the process of school improvement. The A+ program strives to expand the way teachers view children to include their unique abilities and intelligences, and widen their concept of schools to include the communities in which they are situated.

The A+ School Program provided the support for a holistic approach to teaching with the arts. This was a school-wide implementation of using arts in lesson plans. Teachers were provided professional development along with materials needed to combine arts with the curriculum (Noblit, Corbett, Wilson & McKinney, 2009). The A+ School idea concluded that the implementation of arts should include arts for arts sake, as well as the improvement of learning achievements. Noblit et al. (2009) discussed the effectiveness of the A+ Schools program at Ashley River Creative Arts School in Charleston, South Carolina. By implementing this program, students at Ashley River have increased their attendance rate to 99.5% while at the same time finding that they had one of the highest academic ratings in their school system (Thomas & Arnold, 2011).

The A+ School Program observed in Oklahoma showed student achievement through curriculum planning, community building, arts specialists within the faculty, and leadership support (Barry, Gunzenhauser & Montgomery 2003). Noblit et al. (2009) describes the A+ idea as more a philosophy of instructional change rather than a weaving of arts into the curriculum. Increased achievement continued through the efforts of the A+ School Program thus by 1997, the A+ Schools Program was being used by 44 public schools within the U.S. and serving in 21 public schools in North Carolina (Thomas & Arnold, 2011). Records in North Carolina's Department of Public Instruction indicated that participating schools in North Carolina showed an increase in student attendance, reduced discipline referrals, increased parental involvement, and gained active student teacher engagement in the classroom (Thomas & Arnold, 2011).

Academic growth for students using the A+ School Program showed growth of 92% improvement as compared to the state average of those who did not implement the A+ School program, who only showed an average 83.9% improvement (Thomas & Arnold, 2011). These findings confirmed the theory of Thomas and Arnold (2011) who revealed that changing the instructional method in the classroom could engage the students and refocus their attention, giving students practice in multiple processes. For example, visual learning and deductive reasoning will invigorate their mental energies (Willingham, 2009). Student involvement in dance, theater, and music leads to

50

improvements in emotional intelligence, reflection of themselves as well as others, and respect for diversity (Jensen, 2002). The integration of arts in general create higher SAT scores as well as lower dropout rates, show higher school attendance, and increase cultural awareness (Jensen, 2002).

Although there are many positive factors seen by the implementation of the A+ School Program, there are still negative factors that arise (Thomas & Arnold, 2011). In teacher collaboration, discussions of the allotted funding for each A+ School caused concern and distress for school district leaders and teachers (Noblit et al. 2009). There are some school districts that are able to provide their schools with more funding and supplies while other districts are fortunate not to see classes cut due to lack of funding regardless of their commitment to the program (Thomas & Arnold, 2011). Even with the negative aspect, the A+ School Program has expanded in Arkansas, providing students the opportunity of experiencing the arts and continued dedication and commitment to their core subjects with little or no decline in student attendance, healthier attitudes and improved behavior (Overland, 2013).

### Summary

Beginning in the mid 1800's music education slowly made its way into the public education system. By the 1950s it was commonplace for American students to be involved in music and art classes either during the school day or as an extracurricular activity. However, with the perceived threat of the Soviet Union with the launching of Sputnik, American legislators enacted the Elementary and Secondary Education Act (ESEA), which regulated a more stringent curriculum in core academic subjects (United States Department of Education (2010). Music education was eliminated from many school programs to allow more time to be devoted to math and science instruction (Gerrity, 2009). The reauthorization of ESEA in the 1999, known as the No Child Left Behind Act (NCLB), brought about even more strictures and limitations for music education. However, teachers realized the benefit of music as an educational tool. Years of research provides valid evidence of the importance of music in the development of the brain (Burriss & Strickland, 2011). The most recent enactment of education legislation, ESSA, or Every Child Succeeds, touts a belief in a 'well-rounded education' that includes music and art activities. The emphasis, however, is on arts integration rather than formal music programs. Effective teachers understand the benefit music integration.

The results of this literature study show that while teachers' beliefs in the importance of arts inclusion are significant, the absence of professional development is a detriment for teachers who do not have musical experiences in their background.

# CHAPTER III - METHODOLOGY

## Introduction

This study utilized a general qualitative inquiry approach. The participants were elementary school teachers who have chosen to embed music into their core curriculum. The teachers selected had participated in an arts integration workshop, known as Arts in Education. This is a professional development opportunity for classroom teachers from area schools who are interested in implementing the arts into their lesson plans (Fresne & Vitulli, 2013). The Alabama Commision on Higher Education understood the need for such programs in light of the limited amount of time and funding allotted to schools for non-academic activities, and offered funding in the form of a grant. The University of South Alabama was awarded a ten-year grant in 2004. Dr. Jeanette Fresne coordinated the creation of the Arts in Education program open to certified teachers in the southern region of Alabama (Fresne & Vitulli, 2013). She organizes this event and selects clinicians for instructional sessions. Teachers received 56 hours of hands-on training, and 6 hours of additional mentoring as they implemented concepts and activities learned in the training.

This general qualitative study explored the experiences of classroom teachers to better understand the influence of integrating music into the core academic curriculum. Particular attention was paid to the level of student engagement in such activities as memorization of facts and key concepts in various content areas. This chapter explains the research process that was employed to conduct the study, which includes the purpose of the study, research questions, process for participant selection, and the methods for collection and analysis of the data.

### Purpose of the Study

The purpose of this study is to understand the experiences of classroom teachers who participated in the Arts in Education workshop and are implementing music into their classroom lessons. Specifically, participants were asked to share their experiences with integrating music into their classroom routines and how they find resources to do so. Adding to the body of knowledge concerning music in education may provide administrators with the ability to make informed decisions about music integration in school systems within Alabama and perhaps other areas throughout the U.S.

# **Research Questions**

The aim of this study is to describe elementary classroom teachers' experiences with embedding music into the core academic curriculum. To that end, three research questions will guide the inquiry. They are:

R1: What are the experiences of classroom teachers who have incorporated music into their general classroom curriculum?

R2: How do general education teachers perceive their preparedness for integrating music into their curriculum after attending Arts in Education professional development?R3: What resources do teachers use when searching for musical activities to include in their curriculum?

# Methodology and Design of the Study

This study utilized a qualitative approach. This approach was chosen because of its ability to tell a story of the participants involved in the study. The intention of this study was not to measure and quantify, but to explore and explain (Merriam & Tisdell, 2016). Therefore, a qualitative methodology was appropriate to study the experiences of teachers who integrate music. The design for this study is that of a general qualitative inquiry. With this design, an in-depth understanding of participants' perspectives can be realized. The general qualitative design also allows for a description to be made without attempting to determine a causal relationship (Merriam & Tisdell, 2016). Specifically, the general inquiry nature of this study lent itself to an interpretive design. Denzin (2005) described interpretive design as a set of perspectives and opinions as to how the world should be examined and understood. Merriam and Tisdell (2016) described interpretive research as an interpretation of multiple realities of a single event or the relevance of collective situations to a certain situation. Denzin (2001) posited that it is through understanding and precise interpretation of opinions, perceptions, and experiences of a person working towards a specific agenda that will create solid and effective programs. Therefore, the interpretive method was used for this study to understand the perspectives and experiences of teachers who implement the use of music in their classroom lessons.

Creswell (2013) stated that interpretive research focuses on the stories that are told in the interview. Denzin and Lincoln (1998) explained the interviewing process as a way of capturing the individual's point of view and gaining their perspectives while examining the constraints of everyday life.

#### Participant Selection

Once approval was received from the Institutional Review Board (IRB) at the University of Southern Mississippi, participants were solicited and chosen. Purposeful sampling was used to choose participants. Merriam (2016) suggests that purposive or purposeful sampling is the most appropriate method of selecting a sampling when the investigator wants to discover, understand and gain insight about the specific research problem. In order to be a part of this study participants must have attended the Arts in Education workshop and had experience with integrating music in to their classroom routine. To that end, a list of workshop participants and their email addresses was provided by the Arts in Education instructors. An email was distributed to all members on the list in which they were asked to affirm their use of music in the classroom lessons and their willingness to participate in this study. Each teacher who responded positively to the email was sent a second email which described the purpose and explained their responsibility as a participant. Fifteen teachers agreed to contribute to this study. It was believed that the fifteen participants gave sufficient coverage to understand the experiences with music integration. Permission to conduct research was given by local school systems. Letters of informed consent were provided for each participant at the initial interview. In addition, each participant was provided the purpose and description of the study via email.

Although the sample size was small, this study yielded data that illuminates the ways in which integrating music into the core curriculum can influence student learning. Face-to face, semi-structured interviews served as the primary means of collecting data, with questions relating to their perspectives and experiences of the advantages and disadvantages of incorporating music into the general curriculum. These in-depth interviews were conducted in participant's classrooms to obtain understanding of how they find resources to assist in their lessons.

•

## Interviews

Data for this study was collected via face-to-face, semi-structured interviews. The interview protocol was designed as semi-structured, which Merriam and Tisdell (2016) described as a flexible list of questions, which are not verbalized with exact wording when asked in each of the interviews; neither are the questions asked in exact order each time. This style of interview was best suited for this study because it provided a more comfortable and relaxing setting for both the interviewer and participant.

For each face-to-face, semi-structured interview, participants were contacted via email to arrange meeting times and interviews. Because location can be of significance for a successful interview, interviews were scheduled at the convenience of the participants and were conducted in their classrooms. Denzin and Lincoln (1998) concluded that being in the natural surroundings of the participant would allow the interviewer to become more connected with the perspectives of the participant. Therefore, locations were chosen that created an environment that was quiet, free from distractions, and comfortable as well as convenient, for participants.

The interviews consisted of approximately one-hour sessions with each participant. Before each interview, the purpose of the study was explained and the intentions of the research were discussed with the participant. Interview questions were designed to gather information to address the research questions. The interviews were recorded and transcribed verbatim. Member checking was implemented as participants were given the opportunity to review their transcripts and to modify their responses or correct any errors that may exist.

# Positionality

I believe I began singing before I could talk. As a child, my mother taught me every nursery rhyme and folk song she knew. In 5<sup>th</sup> grade my teacher announced that our class would be performing a musical called "The Missing Parts of Speech" (Barlow & Hutchinson, 1962). She explained that a musical was a play which included singing and solo parts. Songs from the play consisted of lyrics, which describe grammatical terms. For example, "You can recognize an adverb, if you really try, it will help you if you notice, that it often ends in L-Y." I can still remember these songs I learned at 11 years old. The lyrics to this song and others in this musical I learned as an elementary student helped me throughout my high school years. I could diagram any sentence given to me based on these lyrics I learned and still can today. Because of music, I can also name the 47 presidents in order! I learned early on that I could remember almost any list if a song was created to recite the list.

Music as well as education was valued in our home. Therefore, immediately after high school graduation I enrolled in classes to complete a bachelor's degree in music with voice concentration. I completed the Bachelor in Music and eventually obtained a master's degree in music education. I taught elementary music for eight years traveling to different schools within the district, sometimes serving seven or eight schools in a school year. Because of serving several schools at one time I would have between 2,000-2,500 students each year. During my time as an elementary music teacher I taught my students music theory and urged them to sing with self-assurance, while at the same time encouraged them, hoping to build confidence and self-esteem so that they would not be afraid or timid to sing in front of others. My students performed at large Christmas shows along with patriotic and other thematic programs. My passion has always been to see my students learn music from our U.S. heritage such as folk songs as well as learn songs which would help them retain information that would show better test scores. I now serve as choral director at Burns Middle School in Mobile, AL, but my love and interest is in the mystery of how students retain knowledge when implementing music in their classroom lessons.

Given the history of the influence music has had on my education I want to learn more about how classroom teachers are using music in their general classroom lessons to enhance student retention of knowledge. I want to know when music is used in the lesson as well as where they find songs and activities to engage the students.

# Data Analysis

Qualitative data can become voluminous and working to make sense of it can be overwhelming (Creswell, 2013). Merriam and Tisdell (2016) stated that data should be collected and examined at the same time. So much is learned from one participant to the next, and data analysis can become more intensive as the study progresses (Merriam & Tisdell, 2016). Therefore, information gathered from each participant was immediately reviewed and transcribed after the interview. During the review process, possible reoccurring themes and key phrases of the participant's experiences and perceptions were noted. Once the review was complete, the transcripts were organized so that data from each interview could be evaluated using the constant comparative method as a method of coding (Merriam & Tisdale, 2016). Merriam and Tisdale (2016) described the constant comparative method as "comparing one segment of data with another to determine similarities and differences" (p. 30). Through careful scrutiny of data, line by line, information was revealed and categorized to align with the research questions. The data analysis was categorized according to identified patterns, themes and common relationships. From the identified themes, a rich description was written to address each research question.

## Trustworthiness

Validity and reliability are the conglomerate factors of trustworthiness. Validation in qualitative research is the attempt to evaluate and assess the accuracy of the data collected by the researcher and participant while reliability refers to the constancy of participant responses in the codes in data (Creswell, 2013). Denzin and Lincoln (1998) noted, "objective reality can never be captured" (p. 4). Therefore, it is important for the researcher to maintain unbiased opinions and remain neutral in the data collection process. To protect the privacy and confidentiality of the participants, each participant was identified by an assigned number throughout the study. In addition, member checking was implemented where all participants were given the opportunity to review their transcripts of the interview for revisions. This study was completed using techniques designed to create a non-judgmental and non-threatening environment which safeguarded interpretation and representation of the research participants during the data collection process.

In addition, peer review or debriefing was done, along with member checking as additional precautions regarding data for reliability and consistency. Members of my dissertation committee, with the intent of clarifying researcher bias, assisted me in completing this process of peer debriefing.

#### Summary

In summary, this general qualitative study strove to understand the experiences of teachers who attempt to utilize knowledge gained and ideas learned while attending the Arts in Education workshop. Teachers who adhere to the Theory of Multiple Intelligences posited by Howard Gardner understand that music can be used to enhance instruction and keep students engaged in classroom activities. There were three research questions that served as guideposts for this study. They are:

R1: What are the experiences of classroom teachers who have incorporated music into their general classroom curriculum?

R2: How do general education teachers perceive their preparedness for integrating music into their curriculum after attending Arts in Education professional development?R3: What resources do teachers use when searching for musical activities to include in their curriculum?

Teachers who attended the Arts in Education workshop and have used music to augment lessons were the target population. Participants were chosen purposefully to ensure that this screening criteria was met. Using a qualitative approach, data was collected via face-to-face, semi-structured interviews. Confidentiality was maintained by protecting the participants' identities. The interviews were transcribed and each participant was given the opportunity to review and revised the transcripts. The data was analyzed and interpreted to reveal the extent to which the participants utilized music as an instructional tool in the classroom. Chapter IV will review the data analysis procedure and outline the results of the analysis.

#### CHAPTER IV

## Introduction

The purpose of this general qualitative study was to describe the perspectives of general classroom teachers who have participated in professional development regarding the integration of music into the tested core academic curriculum subject. Accordingly, the research questions focused on the experiences and perspectives of teachers who have incorporated music into their general classroom curriculum (RQ1), preparedness of teachers who attending Arts in Education professional development (RQ2), and resources used for music activities in the lesson (RQ3).

Although past research has focused on the benefits of classical music and brainbased learning, few researchers have explored arts integration as a means to enhance learning in the elementary curriculum. This study addressed the gap in the literature and enhanced the knowledge and understanding of music integration into the classroom curriculum. Chapter 4 outlines the results of this study. This chapter is organized into sections that provide a descriptive analysis of the experience and background of participants, the data analysis procedure utilized in this study, and a detailed report of the analysis.

# **Descriptive Data**

Qualitative data were collected through face-to-face, semi-structured interviews which resulted in an interpretive view of how teachers integrate music to enhance learning (Merriam & Tisdell, 2016). Participants for this general qualitative study were chosen using a purposeful sampling technique (Merriam & Tisdell, 2016). These participants were classroom teachers who had completed the Arts in Education

professional development program (Fresne & Vitulli, 2013). The researcher contacted superintendents and principals of participating school districts to obtain permission to interview teachers who met this criteria. After IRB permission was granted by the University of Southern Mississippi, teachers were contacted via telephone and invited to participate. Written consent was obtained from each of the fifteen teachers who agreed to be interviewed. Table 4.1 illustrates a summary of participant experiences and backgrounds. In order to maintain confidentiality participants remained anonymous and were assigned an identifying number (i.e. Interview Teacher 1, Interview Teacher 2, etc.).

Table 4.1

_	Study participant	Gender	Degree	Years of teaching experience	Grade levels taught
-	Teacher 1	Female	Ed.S.	42	Kindergarden-5 <sup>th</sup> grade
	Teacher 2	Female	Master's	10	2 <sup>nd</sup> , 3 <sup>rd</sup> , 4 <sup>th</sup>
	Teacher 3	Female	Master's	49	Pre-Kindergarten -6 <sup>th</sup> grade
	Teacher 4	Female	Master's	39	3 <sup>rd</sup> , 4 <sup>th</sup> ,5 <sup>th</sup>
	Teacher 5	Female	Master's	7	Pre-Kindergarten
	Teacher 6	Female	Master's	3	Pre-Kindergarten
	Teacher 7	Female	Master's	9	3 <sup>rd</sup> grade
	Teacher 8	Female	Bachelor's	9	3 <sup>rd</sup> and 4 <sup>th</sup> grade
	Teacher 9	Female	Bachelor's	9	2 <sup>nd</sup> , 3 <sup>rd</sup> , 4 <sup>th</sup> , 5 <sup>th</sup> , 6 <sup>th</sup> grade
	Teacher 10	Female	Master's	33	3 <sup>rd</sup> and 5 <sup>th</sup> grade
	Teacher 11	Female	Master's	34	Pre-Kindergarten
	Teacher 12	Female	Bachelor's	17	Kindergarten -6 <sup>th</sup> grade
	Teacher 13	Male	Master's	15	4 <sup>th</sup> and 5 <sup>th</sup> grade
	Teacher 14	Male	Master's	7	4 <sup>th</sup> and 5 <sup>th</sup> grade
	Teacher 15	Female	Ph.D.	25	Pre-Kindergarten -2 <sup>nd</sup> grade

# Demographic Data for Participants

## **The Research Participants**

In total, there were 15 participants in the study. The years of experience in the classroom ranged from three to 43 years. Each participant brought to the study a philosophy of teaching about integrating music into the curriculum as varied as the participants themselves. The backgrounds and life experiences of the participants played a part in forming their ability and inclination to use music for various purposes in their daily teaching routines.

Teacher 1 has 31 years teaching experience with a master's degree in elementary education, a certification in school counseling, and an Education Specialist degree in administration. While in college, she took one general music class but most of her musical experience came from her family. Her family were church going gospel singers. She and her sisters were dedicated choir members, while her mother was a piano accompanist. Her father played guitar with Hank Williams on the radio in Montgomery, AL before Williams became so well known. When there was a get-together, family members would bring their guitars, harmonicas, and washtubs made into a bass instrument for entertainment. Teacher 1 came from a family who valued education but neither parent completed college. While in elementary school, Teacher 1 was taught piano at school but there was no structured music class available.

With 10 years teaching experience and a master's degree in elementary education, Teacher 2 has definitely found a niche for music in her classroom. She grew up with parents who valued a college education but did not have one themselves. Although her parents enjoyed music, they were not performers like Teacher 2 and her sister who were very involved with church choir. She is teaching in the area where she grew up. She stated, "I am still in the same community that I graduated from which is pretty awesome that I get to teach a lot of the kids of parents that I went to school with." At this time, she teaches 2<sup>nd</sup> grade where she feels she has the greatest ability to incorporate music. While teaching the upper grades this task became more difficult due to testing which caused time restraints. She took three music classes in her college experience but attributes her creativity of using music in her lessons to the Arts in Education workshop she attended.

From administration to teaching English language learners (ELL) to serving in an elementary classroom, Teacher 3 has 49 years of experience in education and attended college in Miami, Porto Rico and at the University of Alabama in Birmingham, AL. After several years of teaching, she was encouraged by her principal to return to school to study for a master's degree in English as a Second Language (ESL), which was funded through a grant written by her administrator. She came from a Porto Rican family who loved music and dancing which was a large part of the Porto Rican culture. Although her family valued education, neither parent had a college degree. Her mom completed secretarial school, which she says was equivalent to a college degree at that time. She believed the music classes she took in her master's program as well as the Arts in Education workshop were much more applicable than the classes she completed in her undergraduate degree.

A strong musical background led Teacher 4 to incorporate music as often as she can. She has taught for 39 years and has a master's degree in elementary education. Teacher 4 is currently teaching 4<sup>th</sup> grade in a small community school in a prestigious neighborhood. As a young person, she remembers participating in church choir and playing the piano for worship service. Since her dad was the church choir director and

her brothers played the guitar, violin and mandolin, she considers her family to be very musical. They enjoyed providing entertainment at church functions. She clearly remembers sitting on the porch and singing while they all played. She remembers as a child having music classes at school with a music teacher who taught them songs such as The Star Spangled Banner and other patriotic songs. Although she did complete a college music class as part of her college requirement, she feels that she gained most knowledge of how to use music in teaching from the Arts in Education workshop she attended.

Teacher 5 stated, "Incorporating music makes the learner more diversified and makes their brain handle more information." She began her teaching preparation earning her associates degree in elementary education in Alabama. She then moved to Florida where she earned a bachelor's degree in elementary education and a master's degree in reading. She is in her 7th year of teaching at the largest elementary school in the state of Alabama. Her school is located in a rural community and has a very diverse population. Teacher 5 attributes her value for music through her college classes where she learned the importance of music and its connection to students making better grades. Because she had heard that students who learn to play an instrument progress to larger careers and better positions in life, she encouraged her boys to play instruments in the band. She was very much an active band parent attending fieldtrips and parades. Her two sons earned music scholarships for college and both successfully graduated. Her parents did not have college degrees but they valued education.

In her 3<sup>rd</sup> year of teaching, Teacher 6 holds both a bachelor's and master's degree in elementary education. Her first exposure as using music as a teaching tool came in her college music class and she could not wait to use it in her own classroom. She teaches kindergarten at a small suburban school. She grew up with parents who valued education and both completed college degrees. She remembers having music once a week during her elementary years of school but does not remember using music in her core classroom lessons.

Currently teaching 3<sup>rd</sup> grade, Teacher 7 is completing her 9<sup>th</sup> year of teaching in a small school in a rural farming community. She has a bachelor's degree in elementary education with a master's in reading instruction, from the University of Mobile. She does not claim to come from a musical family although her mother enjoyed music very much. She recalls dancing around with her mom as they listened to rock-n-roll music from an old jukebox in their living room. Teacher 7 remembers elementary music class where she played the flutophone in her 4<sup>th</sup> grade school year. She remembers fondly the "group sounded like cats fighting but it was loads of fun." She took a required college music class but feels her knowledge of implementing music has come through her years of experience

After graduating from Purdue University, Teacher 8 taught 2<sup>nd</sup> grade for several years before moving to Alabama. She has taught 2<sup>nd</sup> through 6<sup>th</sup> grades over the last several years and is currently teaching 3<sup>rd</sup> grade in a small rural community. Growing up in a family where music was valued, Teacher 8 and her siblings were in the high school band and chorus. They later played with a band in clubs in their hometown of Nashville, TN. Her parents saw to it that they had opportunities to attend operas and other musical performances. They valued education and were both college graduates. Although Teacher 8 did not have structured music during her elementary years, she had one music

class in college where she learned the basics of piano and musical transposition. Music in her elementary school was taught by the classroom teacher; however, they sang all the time. She clearly remembers learning the 50 states through a song along with a song that lists the presidents in order.

Teacher 9 taught several years in a school overseas, and when she moved back to Alabama, she wanted to teach at the small, private school she attended as a student. She happily teaches 3<sup>rd</sup> grade there and is grateful to be able to teach at a Christian school. She has a bachelor's degree in elementary education. Because she was a missionary's child, her childhood was spent moving from place to place. Her parents valued education but neither completed college. However, her mom started college courses in elementary education, but did not finish once she got married. Teacher 8 was influenced to become a teacher by her maternal grandmother who was an elementary school teacher. Her family enjoyed music in church and during the holidays. Teacher 9 remembers one elementary school where she was taught music by a certified music teacher and played instruments. She completed one music appreciation class in college but most of her music creativity comes from her experience during her younger school years.

Coming from a non-musical background, a love of music is the driving force behind Teacher 10's desire to infuse music into daily lessons. She has 33 years of experience in teaching elementary education. She graduated with a bachelor's and master's degree from the University of South Alabama. She has taught all levels of elementary school in a large public school and is now teaching K4 students in a much smaller, private school. Although she completed a music class in college, she considered it to be a brief overview of music appreciation. Her experience showed her that any time

she involved her students in a musical activity they seemed to remember what they were learning more effectively. Now she says she "couldn't make it through a morning, much less an entire day, without music in her daily routine." She came from a family who loved music but "could not carry a tune in a bucket." Education was valued by her family but neither parent completed college.

Music was an integral part of the home life of Teacher 11. She naturally brought music to her students as a way of capturing and maintaining interest and attention. She holds a master's degree and 27 years of experience in teaching elementary education. Her educational journey was not smooth, and she often questioned whether or not she really should become a teacher, but now cannot imagine doing anything else. Now at a rural community school, she loves to "flavor" her lessons with all genres of music, including opera. Her parents were "opera people" so they would sit as a family and listen to opera recordings throughout her childhood. Education was of great value to the family and her mom and dad both graduated with college degrees. Her father worked a very stressful job with NASA and listening to opera was his stress relief. Teacher 11 carries that same idea into her classroom, and often uses music to calm the students in the afternoons.

Teacher 12 has a bachelor's degree in elementary education with 21 years of teaching experience. She has taught upper elementary age students for most of her career. She was born into a family who valued education and a mom and dad who both had college degrees. Her parents enjoyed music and were very supportive when she performed during elementary school. Teacher 12 finds using music to introduce new subject matter very helpful for student understanding and retention. Her first experience with integrating music and learning was when she attended a Kindermusic class with her daughter. These "mommy-child" classes are geared toward preschool-age children and gives them the opportunity to learn new songs and play percussion instruments, such as triangles, tambourines, and shakers. From then on, Teacher 12 knew she wanted to add music to her teaching routine.

As one of only two male participants, Teacher 13 provided a unique viewpoint as he shared ways to enhance learning mundane facts through music. He has a bachelor's and master's degree in elementary education with 16 years of teaching experience. He feels the college music class he took did not help him at all prepare to use music in his elementary class but he clearly remembers learning to play the flutophone in 4<sup>th</sup> grade. He has considered implementing the flutophone in his own 4<sup>th</sup> grade class, but feels it is not possible due to time limitations. His family enjoyed music when he was growing up. He has two uncles who are band directors and a dad who played in the band during school years. His parents valued education, but only his mom completed a college degree.

Teacher 14 is the second male interviewed for this study. He has a bachelor's and master's degree in elementary education where he completed two music courses but feels his background contributes more to his ability to use music in the classroom. His family valued education and many were educators themselves. His mother and grandmother were teachers and his two uncles were principals. He remembers very well being involved in music during elementary school. He was part of the school choir and performed African American spirituals while learning about the cultures of the regions they were singing about. He enjoys bringing the flavor of the inner-city community to his 5<sup>th</sup> graders as a way of connecting with them and making learning fun. He says, "When I can tell my students need a break, we dance, like really dance. You know, we do the Stanky Leg or Dab, just to do it, you know."

While earning her doctoral degree in cognition and instruction, Teacher 15 realized the silly musical activities she had always done in her classroom were actually research-based practices that have been proven to enhance a student's ability to learn. She holds a bachelor's, degree in early childhood education and a master's degree in elementary education. She has 25 years of experience, during which she taught PreK, 1st, and 2<sup>nd</sup> grade. Most of her teaching career was spent at a large, inner-city school. She came from a family who enjoyed singing. Her mother would sing silly songs to encourage her to get things done around the house. Both parents valued education but her father was a college graduate while her mom was a stay-at-home mom. She remembers clearly singing with her classroom teachers while in elementary school. Her kindergarten teacher played the guitar and taught her and her classmates songs to sing along. She also remembers having a music class in early elementary school, where they sang songs to match rhyming words.

# Major Themes Related to the Research Questions

The data were collected and analyzed using analysis strategies suggested by Creswell (2013), which included multiple reads of transcripts, as well as a reduction of data according to emerging themes. Three major themes were identified for research question 1, which asks what the experiences and perspectives are of teachers who have incorporated music into their general classroom curriculum. These themes included: 1) Using music for engagement, 2) Using music to reinforce and memorize skills, and 3) Using music as a behavior management tool.

Theme 1: Using music to engage students. Teachers find using music engages students and keeps them interested and involved. When students are attentive they develop a passion and motivation to learn. Teacher 1 feels that the best way her students learn is through having fun and forgetting they are learning. Teacher 3 feels that when students are having fun they believe they can achieve more. She stated, "Besides building their academic levels, it builds self-esteem helps achieve things they did not think they could achieve, and raises them all around as a whole person." Teacher 7 stated, "I am not one who likes to get up and sing and dance with my kids personally just myself but I have learned that they will learn a lot better with movement and music so I work music into our lessons." Likewise, Teacher 13 feels that the best way to reach students today is to "make learning fun." He remembers his elementary teachers using music in his classroom growing up, but did not learn music from a music teacher. He finds his students' favorite activity to be any activity which requires movement and something in their hand such as a shaker or triangle. Teacher 14 shared a chant he uses to praise and encourage students. He stated:

We do the Good Job chant after we do an assessment or after we do some type of task in the classroom and it goes like this...."good job, good job, clap clap. Good job, good job, clap clap. G-O-D-J-O-B good job good job. And then we do another one if they did something really great we do this chant "Hey so and so you're a real cool cat! You got a lot of this and a lot of that. Shake your tail feather!" and they wiggle around and feel special.

Teacher 11 remembers going to music class while in elementary school and sitting on the floor playing instruments to "capture the beat." She uses music in her classroom for brain breaks or word associations. During those moments when she feels she is losing the students' attention, she will reel them in with a catchy tune she creates. Teacher 11 says,

I think it energizes them, I think it helps them regroup, I think they buy into you more because you are trying to help them. I think they see you as a human not as a teacher that can't be approached and these days that is very important.

Teacher 15 also believes that using music in her lessons creates excitement in her students and encourages engagement. Her experiences showed her that "students learn so much more readily when they are having fun." Teacher 12 believes that music engages her students and says, "If you don't like math but you are singing the math songs then you are paying attention and learning and able to recall information, and guess what? You are learning math anyway!" Teacher 9 also believes that music plays an integral role in keeping students engaged and on task. She stated:

To keep students on task while at their seat, I try to play more instrumental music while they are working. I have some CDs that I got from Arts in Education which is music from other countries that I play because here in Mobile sometimes we are so self-centered that we aren't aware that there are other places in the world that are different, so I try to open their eyes to other cultures.

Using music in the classroom is an everyday occurrence with Teacher 10. She emphatically stated, "Actually my kids love music and if I put anything with music they are going to enjoy the activity and stay engaged. They are eager to start the next objective so they can sing the next new song."

*Theme 2: Using music to reinforce memorization skills*. Using music can be a great help to reinforce items that need to be recalled or memorized, such as multiplication facts and parts of speech. Several of the participants expressed that they themselves can recite lists or items that were put to song many years ago during their elementary school years. For example, teacher 15 recalls learning to tell time by singing a teacher-made song she called the "tick-tock song". She shared this memory:

My kindergarten teacher, Mr. Kasulus, taught us to tell time with a rhythm and movement song. I don't remember the song now, but I clearly remember him telling me I was the best tick-tocker, so I wanted to learn all the times to please him." Teacher 14 stated, "When students are having fun they forget they are learning." He also believed that using music creates an atmosphere of joy and happiness, which produces students who love to learn with great retention. Similarly, Teacher 13 stated:

It helps them retain information more because if I just get up there and say it they are not going to retain. They can't retain information these days with all the computer screens, so moving and snapping helps them relate to information for test.

Teacher 4 finds that her students' favorite musical activity are the CDs she uses in math such as *Multiplication Rock, Multiplication Rap* and *Multiplication Rhythm and Blues* created by Rock-N-Learn. Teacher 4 said, "We incorporate a lot of music into PreK because it makes it easier for them to learn and it doesn't seem like learning because it's fun." She believes these activities create more diversified learners and makes their brain handle more information. They can take in so much more because it is in a song." Likewise, Teacher 2 has discovered that by using songs and chants she finds on line, she can engage her students and their parents. She stated:

You know, in second grade there is not enough time to teach and practice all the phonics they need to know. I have to review 1<sup>st</sup> grade phonics before I get to 2<sup>nd</sup> grade patterns. I was so thrilled when I found some phonics chants on YouTube that allows my students to practice the phonics patterns at home and in centers in my classroom. That quadruples the amount of time they spend practicing phonics and that is amazing to me.

Teacher 9 uses every possible learning style to teach her students and with the incorporation of music in the core curriculum she feels music helps students focus. She uses the *School House Rock* Preamble song to help her students memorize the introduction of the Constitution for the United States of America and has created a preposition song to the tune of Row, Row, Row, Your Boat. She uses music to create songs for easy memorization and recall. Teacher 10 feels the best way to reach her students is to know the needs of each individual student. She uses music for brain breaks. She stated:

By pausing the skill and drill routine, I can allow my students a moment to sing and be silly, but then refocus on what we are working on. I also use music to practice phonics skills and review math concepts. It works because they can use the whole body in all activities.

Teacher 10 went on to say, "I can't think of an area where I don't use music. It more or less drives my instruction." She feels the implementation of music helps with students' memorization along with retelling and comprehension. She says, "With music, their academic skills as a whole are better as well as their language skills." Teacher 6 uses music in her kindergarten class to teach sight words, give students a brain break and create an easy transition for forming a line, cleaning up and grabbing their attention. She finds the implementation of music keeps the students engaged, which causes them to forget they are learning. She also credits Arts in Education for providing wonderful classroom items such as books, CDs, and puppets but also allowing the opportunity to visit and learn from other teachers. Teacher 8 enjoys playing Disney Classics while her students are working quietly. She also considers herself to be a "bust-out" teacher because she will bust out in song that she creates "just out of her head" to give students a brain break. This brief interruption of instruction allows students to get up out of their seat, take a break and move around. Teacher 14 uses music any time he can tie it to a new concept being introduced. His excitement filled the room as he shared his first experience with tying music and academic skills together. He stated:

I remember when I was doing my blocks at The University of South Alabama we had a cell rap and we had kids come from different elementary schools and we had like 30 minutes to present and we did a little skit. And we dressed up like we were inmates and we created cells or jails out of boxes, refrigerator boxes we cut up into a cell. We started rapping the song and after we finished rapping the song we turned that song into an activity because they use different words inside of the song and the different parts made the actual cell out of a plant cell so that was one way and it was exciting it was 30 minutes but very intense. They were all engaged. Oh my, that was my first time to ever use music inside an activity and it was the first time I discovered I have to use this! It was exciting. At least once a week I'm going to have to do something and incorporate music or use music inside of my lesson. Because it gets them going. They love to get out of their seats and music is a way to get you out of your seat.

*Theme 3: Using music as a behavior management tool.* Effective classroom management is the act of maintaining order in a classroom setting, which is vital for student achievement and academic success. Results of this study indicated that the participants found that techniques learned in the Arts in Education workshop assisted in establishing a safe and orderly environment conducive to learning. Teacher 14 believes the best part of participating in Arts in Education is the help he received in how to incorporate music in his classroom yet maintain classroom control. He states, "It is great to have a good time but bringing students back to focus is tricky." Teacher 3 feels that project-based learning is the best instructional approach which allows students to "put learning into action." At the same time, she feels frustrated that administration and other educational leaders regulate what teachers should teach leaving no time or freedom to prepare or incorporate music in their lessons. Teacher 9 stated:

I'll play music in my classroom when they are doing a test or when they are having free work time or reading time. When I have them write an adventure story I use the upbeat music. Or if they are writing something calm I play calm music.

Several participants use music to establish daily routines for activities in their morning whole group instruction. For instance, Teacher 5 stated, "We use it throughout the whole day. We begin the morning calendar and we sing the days of the week along with a good morning song." Likewise, Teacher 6 uses the chant "Criss-cross apple sauce, hands in lap, ginger snap" when gathering students on the carpet each morning. She also uses chants and silly songs to ensure a smooth transition from one activity to another. She stated:

For transition, I would sing this song. 1-2 buckle my shoe 3-4 shut the door 5-6 pick up sticks and when I get to 10 they have to be where they are supposed to be. I have a tidy up song that I sing, too. Tidy up, tidy up put your things away. I have a chant for them to come to the carpet as well. Come to the carpet, use your walking feet; Come to the carpet, careful not to shout and when you sit, don't forget to have a quiet mouth shhhhh.

Similarly, Teacher 10 said that she uses jingle songs "for something as simple as lining up. Something like....Eyes on the door, feet on the floor, say no more....different things like that." Teacher 11 also uses singing to recapture student's attention. She stated:

If I'm trying to grab a student's attention and I see in my peripheral vision them looking away, I might come up with some sort of tune I think they might know and put my own words to it. Like, "Do you remember what I just said?" to a tune or rap rather than me saying or fussing..... "so and so", pay attention.

Using songs for daily routines is not limited to younger grades levels. Teacher 13, a 5<sup>th</sup> grade teacher, grinned wickedly as he recalled:

Sometimes as a joke I start to sing songs such as "it's time to clean up" like what my sister does to her kids. And they hate that and start to clean really quickly. Shocking them is a great way to get their attention. I mean they think you're crazy and they like that.

Research question 2 finds the perception of preparedness after participation in the Arts in Education workshop offered through a grant funding at the University of South Alabama. Overall, the participants in this study found the Arts in Education workshop to be beneficial. Fourteen of the 15 participants stated ways in which they have been able to utilize the knowledge gained in the workshop to creatively and effectively infuse music into their daily routines. Teacher 1 and Teacher 15 both felt that their experience in Arts in Education gave affirmation that the incorporation of music into lessons truly helped with classroom management and provided another avenue of instruction delivery. Teacher 9 stated, "I enjoyed the Arts in Education workshop and felt it showed me new ways to incorporate music that I would have never considered." Likewise, Teacher 10 affirmed she enjoyed her experience in the Arts in Education workshop and stated she "learned that music is a valuable tool or instrument to use with her children." Teacher 11 feels the most valuable part of participating in Arts in Education is letting go of the idea that students do not have to be quiet and still to learn. "Students learn when they are moving and having fun." Similarly, Teacher 12 revealed,

The workshop helped me see the importance of the different learning styles and how music helps all students to become involved and interested. It also helps those who might be academically challenged, and it might open a door and allow them to feel connected.

Teacher 3 feels like her Art in Education workshop experience really prepared her to make music part of the class. She believed that the Arts in Education workshop taught her how and when to integrate music. She said, "You have to be taught how to integrate or you will have trouble using music in your lessons." Besides the knowledge gained in the workshop, participants also received free materials and had opportunity to create materials for classroom use. Teacher 4 appreciated the free items she received for her classroom for attending the workshop. She said, "Being a new teacher I needed more items for my classroom and this workshop made this possible." Teacher 6 felt the Arts in Education workshop was "absolutely great!" She also loved the free items she received for her classroom, but believed collaborating with other teachers was the best part of the workshop. Teacher 2 gained new knowledge and insight from collaborating with other teachers just as much as listening to the presenters while in the workshop. She says she especially loves amazing her students with the rain stick she made from directions given by a fellow workshop attendee. She introduces the rain stick when she is teaching a unit on rainstorms because it "makes a great sound mimicking heavy rain." Teacher 8 felt as if Arts in Education workshop was geared more toward art than music during her specific seminar and finds it difficult to implement art because it is messy and requires lots of supplies, as well as being time-consuming. However, she did remember learning a few ideas for implementing music, and has found them to be quick and easy to incorporate.

Out of the 15 participants only one perceived her experience in the Arts in Education workshop to have no value. Teacher 7 stated that although she enjoyed the Arts in Education workshop, the workshop itself was not very effective. She said, "We enjoyed it and it was a fun thing but kind of silly in a way, my kids weren't going to learn from that and there is not time to fit it all in."

Research question 3 solicited from the participants the sources and resources for music and music-related activities that can be used to enhance their instruction. Data showed the most common resources for using music included digital sources, pre-made published materials, and songs created by teachers themselves.

*Theme 1: Digital sources.* With limited availability of musical instruments and other resources, teachers have had to become very creative and innovative in finding and using music resources that fits into their curriculum. Digital resources have become more commonplace, with literally thousands of songs and videos at teachers fingertips. Teacher 2 is amazed at what the internet has to offer. She said:

I just don't know how teachers in past years taught without internet help. I look online for music activities for every objective I teach just to see if there is something I can use musically to help my students academically.

Teacher 14 uses *School House Rock* and searches through YouTube to find fun interesting activities to use with his lessons. Teacher 6 uses the internet to find music activities to incorporate such as gonoodle.com or youtube.com. While teacher 11 and 14 use YouTube to search for songs that connect with the lesson objective, teacher 9 stated "YouTube is the best." Teacher 10 uses Pinterest as a great source for music activities that correlate with objectives being taught. She describes Pinterest as a website of ideas that teachers can post and share with other teachers. Both Teacher 12 and Teacher 13 love to use the search engine Google to find songs and activities for their students finding everything needed to engage their students for the lesson. Teacher 15 finds some of her activities from internet sources and YouTube but feels her experiences have further inspired her creativity of short-song writing. Teacher 7 uses a computer program called Flowcabulary, which is an interactive computer program covering every standard and using hip-hop songs to engage students and increase achievement. Teacher 7 stated, "On Friday when they take their test, they are singing it."

*Theme 2: Pre-made published materials.* Several of the participants discussed using published materials, usually CDs, as an easy way to enhance their curriculum with music. Teacher 6 uses the Wonders Reading program offered in her school curriculum, which introduces a sound or song every week that corresponds with what they are learning and has interactive smartboard activities with motions that go with it. Similarly, Teacher 11 identified the reading series Wonders as being a resource for music that helped her PreK students learn the alphabet. Teacher 1 discovered a great resource when she was asked to lead the Say No to Drugs campaign. She shared:

For the Say No to Drugs campaign, my school purchased the Mendez Foundation Too Good for Drugs curriculum, which included songs and dances to encourage students to stay away from drugs. My students, and those in other grades, enjoyed learning the songs and activities from this program. They walked away with some good thoughts to use when confronted with drugs or any conflict where a good choice should be made. And all from catch songs they couldn't stop singing.

Teacher 4 finds CDs such as multiplication rock very helpful when her students are trying to memorize their multiplication facts. "My students learn the multiples much faster with the songs. Parents like it too, because now they have a fun way to practice boring math facts with their kids," stated Teacher 4. Teacher 5 uses the songs included in the school curriculum but she also uses books from the library such as *Down by the Bay* or *Oh My Darlin' Clementine*. She divulged, "You can actually sing those books instead of just reading them." Teacher 10 relies on the internet to find many of her music resources. She finds most of her activities through Google or YouTube but her students love the phonics songs form The Learning Station songs. Teacher 15 also found a published program that helped her students remember new content material. The Piggy Back Song Book, which was a compilation of familiar tunes with changed lyrics, could be used to review a variety of concepts. She recalls when she discovered that particular resource:

One day early in my teaching career, I found a series of books called *The Piggy Back Song Book*. I was amazed as I looked through the book and saw so many familiar tunes, but with lyrics that reinforced concepts, I was teaching. Some of the songs helped the kids practice concepts like the months of the year and the days of the week. My favorite one reviewed the shapes and was sung to the tune of 'The Farmer in the Dell.' The song B-I-N-G-O was used several times, too.

Teacher 15 added that once she became familiar with the piggyback songs in her book, she began to write her own lyrics to other familiar tunes.

*Theme 3: Songs created by teachers themselves.* Many of the participants mentioned that being creative was very helpful in the implementation of music in the lesson. Teacher 3 said, "After 49 years of teaching, these songs just come out of your head." Likewise, Teacher 8 said, "The songs just come out of my head." She is creative and uses familiar tunes with whatever students need to master the objective. Teacher 14

uses ideas from colleagues, by teaming up with them to write lyrics that teach content material. He said:

I met with some teachers from freedom Academy, in New Orleans, and we talked about using chants to help push the objectives and give another view on how to reach different types of learners. That was another way I got my music material.

Teacher 15 recalls having a lot of fun with her grade-level colleagues as they wrote a song about the first lunar landing for their first grade students. She tells of that experience:

We knew we had to get our kids to remember that Neil Armstrong was the first astronaut to walk on the moon, and what he said when he stepped on the moon. So, we decided to write a song to the tune of Yankee Doodle, since the kids had just performed that song for PTA. So just imagine these lyrics and the tune Yankee Doodle. 'Neal Armstrong walked on the moon, he went there in a spaceship. He stuck a flag down in the ground because it was the first trip. The astronauts went to the moon just to see what they'd find. That's one small step for man and one giant leap for mankind.'

Teacher 6 has also created catchy chants so that students can recall information. She shared the following example:

I use music a lot. All the times I teach sight words. We say the word spell the word and I always make up a song to chant for them to sing along with it. Such as T-H-E, T-H-E T-H-E spells THE chant. And then I get to the point I do different tunes such as bingo and then I let them make up a tune to a sight word and we sing that word

## Summary

In summary, the participants in this study have had from three to 43 years of teaching experience in PreK through 5<sup>th</sup> grade classrooms. Data revealed that general classroom teachers use music in a variety of ways in their classrooms, including using music to engage students in classroom activities, to reinforce and increase retention of material that is being taught, and to increase student achievement. The data showed sufficient evidence to support the fact that 15 of the 15 participants find using music in their classroom to be effective not only for student achievement but for classroom behavior, to reinforce memorization skills and engage students in the lesson. Additionally, data showed that the majority of teachers who participated felt more prepared to implement music into their lessons once they completed the Arts in Education professional development. Not only did they gain knowledge of how to implement music but also loved the free items given for their classroom. Lastly, as illustrated in research question 3, teachers discussed several different avenues for obtaining activities and songs used to implement music in their classroom lessons. Many teachers use the internet but several were creative and produced their own songs or activities. The findings for this research are examined further in Chapter V.

# CHAPTER V-DISCUSSION

## Introduction

The use of music in elementary classrooms has become more commonplace as teachers realize the positive effects music can have on student learning. However, a large percentage of teachers feel ill-prepared to successfully integrate music, while adhering to stringent academic standards. This is due, in part, to the pressures of increased time spent teaching, remediating, and testing academic subjects. This study has shown the use of music to enhance rather than hinder academic progress. Teachers who attend arts integration workshops are taught creative ways to use music when they introduce new topics and when students are asked to memorize information. The purpose of this study was to explore how teachers integrate music and what resources were available to them. This chapter contains an overview of the study, with particular emphasis placed on the most important aspects of the findings. An interpretation of the findings is presented. Conclusions are drawn from the findings, and implications are made from the results of the analysis. Finally, recommendations for future research and practice are presented.

## Summary of the Study

The theoretical foundation for this study was Howard Gardner's Multiple Intelligences Theory, which has become a cornerstone for elementary teachers when planning effective instruction and methods of delivery that keep students engaged. Previous research has focused on classical music and brain-based learning, but few researchers have explored using music to enhance learning in an elementary classroom. Therefore, the purpose of this general qualitative study was to describe the perspectives of classroom teachers who participated in professional development regarding the integration of music into academic core subjects. To that end, there were three research questions that guided this study. They are:

RQ1: What are the experiences and perspectives of classroom teachers who have incorporated music into their general classroom curriculum? RQ2: How do general education teachers perceive their preparedness for integrating music into their curriculum after attending Arts in Education professional development?

RQ3: What resources do teachers use when searching for and implementing musical activities in their curriculum?

This study illuminated efforts to implement music into classroom lessons and what types of resources are used to enhance core curriculum. The results of this study indicated that classroom teachers understand the benefit of music when teaching new concepts, reinforcing already learned concepts, and to assist in transitional activities throughout a typical school day.

A qualitative methodology was employed for this study. Specifically, this study was a general qualitative inquiry exploring the use of music as an instructional tool and as a student engagement strategy. The participants were purposefully chosen in order to ensure that each volunteer met the criteria for participation. As is common with qualitative studies, data was collected via face-to-face, semi-structured interviews. These interviews lasted from 45 minutes to one hour. Interviews were transcribed and analyzed following a step-by-step process to code the data by themes.

# **Demographic Results**

A brief analysis of the demographic data of the participants will facilitate a better understand of the findings of this study. The fifteen participants, are all classroom teachers who have 1) attended Arts in Education professional development, and 2) have had experience with implementing music into their core curriculum. An analysis of the interview transcripts revealed that eight participants taught in rural schools, two in small neighborhood schools, three in large, inner-city schools, and two in private schools. Just as the types of school setting was varied, so was the family and school musical experiences of the participants. For instance, eleven of the participants vividly recalled growing up in a home environment that included music, while four did not recall music being a part of their lives growing up. Further, nearly half of the participants related attending a formal music education class during their elementary years of school.

# **Major Findings by Research Question**

#### **Research Question One**

The first research question asked participants to discuss how they incorporate music in instruction. Three themes emerged from the data collected about research question one, including: 1) Using music to engage students, 2) Using music to reinforce memorization skills, and 3) Using music as a behavior management tool.

Using music to engage students. In these findings, 10 of the 15 teachers interviewed stated they used music to engage their students and keep their attention focused on the lesson. Participants expressed how easy it is for students to have wandering minds and when they see students not participating, using music is a way to bring them back into the lesson. These findings are similar to the findings of Thomas and Arnold (2011), who posited that altering the instructional method when introducing new concepts can refocus students' attention. A comment made by teacher 11 captures the feeling expressed by a majority of the participants. She stated:

I think it energizes them, I think it helps them regroup, I think they buy into you more because you are trying to help them. I think they see you as a human not as a teacher that can't be approached and these days that is very important.

Likewise, Teacher 10 seemed to be speaking for the group when she said, "Actually my kids love music and if I put anything with music they are going to enjoy the activity and stay engaged. They are eager to start the next objective so they can sing the next new song.

Using music to reinforce memorization skills. The teachers in this study also discussed ways they use music to help students memorize information. Nine of the 15 participating teachers discussed using music as a method of enhancing memory skills. For these participants, their students were perceived to be more successful when they could recall information from a song as they were testing. This data supports the findings of neuroscientist Michael Posner of the University of Oregon. Posner found the use of music reinforces the ability of children to acquire literacy and numeracy skills (Posner, 2005). Those participants who teach pre-kindergarten and kindergarten children especially use music to teach and practice such concepts as letters of the alphabet, days of the week and months of the year. Similarly, participants who teach upper elementary age students (grades 3-5), shared positive experiences with using music to reinforce more abstract science concepts such as cell parts and grammar concepts such as parts of speech. Many of the participants demonstrated great enthusiasm when they shared their own jingles and chants they have written as instructional aids. One participant literally stood up during the interview as she recalled teaching her children about all there is to see in Washington DC through a song.

Using music as a behavior management tool. The third theme that emerged from the data for research question one focuses on using music to help students follow set routines and procedures in a classroom setting. Eight of the 15 teachers detailed ways in which music was beneficial when used to aid classroom management. Teachers gave many examples of how music was helpful in activity transition as well as provided a break for students to move during the lesson. Nearly all of the participants who stated they use music during transition times in the classroom have a particular 'clean-up song', but other uses of music for transition include chants to line up, gather for circle-time, or move from one activity to the next. One common thread among the participants with regard to using music for classroom management is that one needs to be aware of the needs of the students related to the demands of the classroom routine.

#### **Research Question Two**

Research question two asks what level of preparedness they had after attending the Arts in Education professional development. Results indicated that 14 of the 15 participants believed the Arts in Education professional development provided a positive experience of how to implement music into the core subject lessons. Workshop instructors taught how to teach using music within their lesson and provided examples of activities to take back to their classroom. During this workshop, participants collaborated with other teachers from different schools who shared knowledge of activities that were fun and beneficial for student achievement. Participants used phrases like "I felt

empowered", and "it gave me permission" when describing their reaction to receiving professional development on how to integrate the arts, specifically music, into their instructional routines. One of the 15 participants did not feel adequately prepared to be creative with music because she felt her time in the workshop was spent mostly learning visual arts integration ideas.

# **Research Question Three**

Research question three explored the resources teachers used for the music activities they incorporated into their lessons, and where the teachers located these activities. According to the data there were three common resources participants used to implement music into the lesson. These resources included 1) digital sources 2) published materials and 3) teacher-created materials.

**Digital resources.** It was not surprising that the results of this study revealed many of the participants located music activities through digital resources. Teachers found digital resources such as YouTube, Pinterest and Google to be very helpful when searching for a specific music activity to use with the lesson objective. One participant stated, "I just don't know how teachers in past years taught without internet help." YouTube offers an unlimited number of parody videos and songs that can serve as a springboard when planning lessons that integrate music. Pinterest was aptly described by one participant as a website of ideas on which teachers can post and share ideas with other teachers. The internet was not the only source of digital material for participants in this study though. Several of those interviewed mentioned having digital resources made available to them that were a part of published materials provided by their school systems.

**Published materials.** Published materials, according to the results of this study, provide a fair amount of lessons that already incorporate some form of music as a means to augment lessons. Participants became animated as they described using CDs and songs they found in resources books to teach literacy skills such as phonics and numeracy skills such as skip-counting. One teacher recalled how finding the Piggy Back Song book changed the way she delivered her instruction and revealed how students were able to remember content more readily. Often, music and musical activates are included in system adopted curricula. This provides music that is specific to the objective being taught and is helpful for students who struggle to connect the information delivered. Participants who use resources from published curricula found it to be a great help because it was already provided and they did not have to search. Besides digital resources and published materials, a third resource discussed in this study was teacher-created materials.

**Teacher-created materials.** The most animated discussions during the interview process were those centered around participants sharing songs and chants they created themselves. Participants who discussed creating their own activities stated that it was an easy process and with practice becomes an even easier task. Many times teachers just create lyrics to a familiar song. These lyrics have evolved from the lesson being taught and are created specifically for knowledge retention to recall information needed for testing. For example, one teacher shared her experience with writing lyrics to teach about space exploration and singing to the tune of Yankee Doodle. When another participant found the process of creating content specific lyrics he found the process to be so rewarding he declared:

Oh my, that was my first time to ever use music inside an activity and it was the first time I discovered I have to use this! It was exciting. At least once a week I'm going to have to do something and incorporate music or use music inside of my lesson.

# Conclusion

In the review of the literature, we learned that music became a part of the elementary education system in the early 1900s. However, in the years immediately following the soviet launch of the Sputnik satellite, formal music education all but disappeared in the elementary school system. Although music education is slowly making a comeback, due in part to ESSA's decree that all children will receive a "well-rounded education" (U.S. Department of Education, 2015). In the interim, teachers who adhere to Howard Gardner's Multiple Intelligences Theory (Gardner, 1993), coupled with brain-based research that shows the benefit of using music in the classroom (Posner & Rothbart, 2005), have found ways to infuse music once again. This study illuminated those experiences of teachers who rely on music for both instruction and student practice. Gibson & Ewig (2011) stated:

Integration of the arts has the potential to deepen our learning experiences, foster our relativity, and enhance our ability to make meaning in diverse ways through understanding different languages of the arts. If we better understand who we are, we are better equipped to develop a deeper understanding of the world and our role within it. (p.4)

Although many elementary school teachers do not decide what they teach, they do have a say in how they teach it. When they make the choice to include music as a means

of instruction or student practice, the students are the ones who benefit. This study showed that music can effectively be integrated into virtually any program. Further, teachers in this study unanimously agreed that music helps their students learn new concepts, stay engaged in lessons, and have fun when learning!

# Implications

This qualitative study explored the challenges faced by elementary teachers as they used music to enrich both instruction and learning. Implications can be made regarding theory and practice in education. Even though experienced teachers are reluctant to carry out music activities in their lessons due to insecurities caused by their own lack of knowledge and ability to sing, they are willing to sacrifice their pride and enter an uncomfortable place for the sake of student enrichment. Effective teachers understand the benefit of music integration and desire to implement music as a tool in their lesson so their students, who learn in different ways, can remember these musical activities or songs to help when testing.

**Theoretical implications**. Multimodal instruction has long been theorized to be an effective instructional practice. Howard Gardner's Multiple Intelligences Theory (Gardner, 2013), gave a name to this belief. In this study, 100% of the participants enthusiastically shared ways in which they use music to teach new concepts, practice skills, and just make learning more inviting. Jenson (2002) stated that music can be used to both relax and excite children and has been found to be effective for memory recall. Nonetheless, teachers can use music as a tool to reach those students who learn in different ways as expressed in Gardner's theory. Gardner has identified nine different kinds of intelligences such as verbal-linguistic, logical mathematical, visual-spatial, musical, naturalistic, bodily-kinesthetic, interpersonal intrapersonal and existential (Gardner, 2013). Implementing music has allowed teachers to reach students who would otherwise be disengaged or inattentive. When using music, struggling students have an avenue to feel successful when they find they can remember facts for a test because they have a song in their head to use as a form of reiteration. Colwell (2008) stated that musical intelligence is prevalent in school-age children and is an important factor in designing and implementing effective instructional practices. This research revealed that teachers who use music have students who enjoy school and forget they are learning.

According to Nolan (2009):

Arts integration allows teachers to engage many modes of learning simultaneously, includes all students in a creative and safe environment, and — for a few moments — has students forget they are learning and just be in the moment of the activities. The arts in their own realm bring beauty and expression to life. Teachers can address both math and musical concepts through enjoyable techniques designed to enhance student mastery. (p. 20)

**Practical implications**. This study extended the body of research investigating the benefits of using music as a part of the learning environment. The perceptions derived from the results of this study illustrate the need to offer more professional development opportunities to prepare teachers to effectively use music as a tool to enrich instruction. Teachers are interested in utilizing whatever is needed to enhance learning for their students and feel music implementation can be used as a tool within lessons, however, they lack direction on how to create activities and apply to the instruction.

Many participants in this study verbalized their insufficiencies in carrying a tune however, in the same breath they spoke of how students really do not care if their teacher can sing; they just want to sing. These participants shared how singing with their students made students happy, joyful and ready to learn however, teachers felt embarrassed to sing in front of their students. There is a major gap of deficiency in the college course of study to prepare teachers to use music in their lessons. Preparing college students in the area of elementary and childhood education to sing and match pitch would inspire confidence in teachers who would be more willing to use music in the academic lessons. This practice is more important for lower grade educators than any other age level. Many teacher education candidates have little training in music and singing, therefore, if teachers had direction on how to match pitch and carry a tune their skills would be sharpened and their ability would be enhanced. Although many believe they cannot carry a tune in a bucket, with practice and specific instruction they can refine their skills and become a better vocalist. Classroom teachers must believe they can be taught how to integrate music within the content area of instruction to be confident that they can do it.

Additionally, along with the need for more collegiate classes to be offered in the area of implementing music in the classroom within the curriculum for educational college programs of study this research showed the need for more professional development for existing teachers. The foundation of solid teaching in elementary school is built upon a teacher's knowledge of what is developmentally appropriate for their students. When teachers become aware of procedures and routines that extend the learning by keeping students engaged and on task, it is their duty to employ such

96

practices. The results of this study indicated that music can and should play an integral part in effective instruction for students of all ages.

## Recommendations

The findings of this study could potentially serve as a reference for both research and practice. Future studies might include a similar qualitative study completed with a population of teachers in a different geographical location. Because Arts in Education is offered to local teachers in the area of this study, these participants may have felt more prepared and equipped with ideas and creative ways to implement music into their lessons. Other teachers from schools of smaller towns might feel inadequate when implementing music especially if music was not a part of their childhood or college experiences. In addition, another potential topic of study could be one that compares music integration habits of those who attended arts integration workshops to those who did not attend. This study could include educators who grew up in a family with a musical background who were greatly involved in musical productions and activities paralleled with those who had no family music experience. Likewise, this study could include an investigation of similarities and differences of teachers of young and older age and evaluate those variations as well as, the use of observations of classroom activities which is not always possible when the researcher is in a position of working and not able to take off work.

Recommendations for future practice include making administrators and policy makers aware of the benefits of music integration for enhanced learning opportunities. This could lead to teachers being allowed to more effectively plan lessons using music as a tool. Many teachers feel unsupported by their administration and believe they are frowned upon by the administrator when using music in their lessons. They believe administrators want instruction time spent with structured lessons that don't include frivolous activities that waste instructional time. This support system must be in position so that teachers of all ages feel encouraged to plan and implement music in their instruction.

Another recommendation for future practices is to encourage and bring awareness to colleges and universities of the need for more arts integration courses to be required for teacher certification. This would ensure that all teachers have at least a foundational knowledge of how to integrate music effectively and still meet academic requirements. These classes could include the practice of creating songs where lyrics that match the objective would be infused with familiar tunes. Teachers who have the creativity to apply this practice find great success of capturing the attention of their students and with practice this creative task becomes easy and effortless. Along with enhancing teacher creativity this colligate plan of study should include classes to prepare teachers to develop and improve vocal skills so that they feel more confident when performing in front of their students. Many teachers in this study felt very inadequate when singing for their students and even refused to sing examples during the interviews. Classroom teachers have to believe they have the ability to learn and be trained how to incorporate music into the lessons. If the opportunity for vocal technique classes were available for teachers they could develop an ear to match pitch and feel more confident about singing for their students. Although the practice of matching pitch can be present at birth or not be present there is still hope for success when given specific techniques and instruction to make the quality of voice better.

One last recommendation for this study would be a study using a quantitative approach for a similar research. Although it is difficult to measure data for this type of study due to the fact that music is many times a non-tested subject, it could be accomplished using a quantitative approach of study with a possible survey questionnaire. By studying two separate classes, one with a teacher who implements music in the classroom lessons and one who does not, a comparison of test scores could be used as data to find which class showed the better scores. Student behavior could also be a factor incorporated into this study. When students enjoy learning they are better behaved. When they are better behaved they show engagement and willingness to learn. This would provide information and proof for administrators and educational leaders who are uneasy about unleashing teachers who want to use music as a tool in their lessons. Administrator support is of most importance with the challenges that come with incorporating music in the classroom lessons therefore, providing scholarly evidence will confirm unsure mindsets and viewpoints of educational leaders. Teachers understand that music captures the interest of students and provides connection to the objective being taught as well as the development of critical thinking skills. This study would afford verification for educational leaders to provide professional development with focus on strategies on how to incorporate music into the classroom.

# APPENDIX A - Placeholder Appendix Title

If there are tables included in your Appendices you may use the same formatting as seen in the other sections of your document. If you are inserting a .pdf, see instructions in the Guidelines.

Table A1.

Appendix Table Title Example (be concise)

Note: The note should be Times New Roman 8 pt. font. Be sure it is double spaced, if more than one line. Use Times New Roman font within the table as well. The table must fit within the required margins, if there is no way make the table fit within the required margins you will have to insert the table onto a landscaped page (see instructions in the USM Guidelines). If the table continues to a new page, type in the continued heading at the top of the next page. Continued heading = Table A1 (continued).

Table A1 (continued).

Note: If the table has a note, and continues to a second page (or beyond) the note only appears at the end of the table. Do not place the note at the end of each section of the table. If your table does not continue to another page, delete Table 1 (continued) and this note.



# Figure A1. Example figure title.

Use Figure notes to explain what this table is, add a citation for work that is not your own, etc. Use this for Photos, Figures, Graphs, etc. (the logo is the registered trademark of The University of Southern Mississippi).

To insert an additional appendix/appendices in this template follow these steps:

- Place your cursor between the last line of the content of this appendix and the "section break (next page)."
- 2. Click on "Page Layout"
- 3. Click on "Section Break (next page)."
- 4. Place your cursor at the top of the new page created by the last step and then click on "APPENDIX" in the style ribbon.
- 5. The last step will insert the new APPENDIX heading with the appropriate letter and will reletter the appendix that follows to correspond with this change.
- After APPENDIX A (or B, etc.) insert an "en dash" (CTRL+MINUS SIGN) and the new appendix title. Match the spacing shown at the top of the previous page (in the pre-built Appendix)

# APPENDIX B - Standard Consent Form



### INSTITUTIONAL REVIEW BOARD STANDARD INFORMED CONSENT

### STANDARD INFORMED CONSENT PROCEDURES

This completed document must be signed by each consenting research participant.

 The Project Information and Research Description sections of this form should be completed by the Principal Investigator before submitting this form for IRB approval.

Last Edited March 13th 2017

· Signed copies of the long form consent should be provided to all participants.

Today's date:4-19-2017

PROJE	CT INFORMATION	
Project Title: ALABAMA CLASSROOM TEACHER WORKSHOPS AND THEIR IMPLEMENTATION C		
Principal Investigator: Laurie Martin Shearer	Phone: 251-599-0313	Email: laura.shearer@eagles.usm.edu
College: Education	Department: Educat	tion Research and Administration
RESEA	RCH DESCRIPTION	

### 1. Purpose:

This study is being performed to gain undertanding of the opinions and perspectives of general classroon teachers who have been participants in arts integration workshops and used music as a tool to help students gain knowledge and increase retention in the lessons of core subjects. The results of this study can be used for future research as well as provide administrators with more tools to apply in decision making regarding music education in school systems. [Describe purpose of the investigation, why it is being performed and what use may be made of the results.]

#### 2. Description of Study:

Teachers who have participated in arts in education workshops will volunteer to participate in 1 hour interviews to contribute to literature in the area of implementing music into the curriculum of core subjects. Data will be collected from the interviews with the intention of understanding the perceptions and experiences of classroom teachers who implement music into the core subject lessons. [Describe the experimental procedure(s), including duration, amount of time required of the participants, number of participants, restrictions on normal activities, invasive techniques etc.]

#### 3. Benefits:

Participants may not benefit directly in this study but will contribute to the literature for knowledge and future research.[Describe any benefits that may occur to the participant or to others as a result of participation in the study, including all benefits or payments. If the potential for medical injury exists, identify treatment procedures or the absence thereof]

### 4. Risks:

This study will present minimal risks such as confidentiality and inconvenience of time, therefore anonymity will be provided and no penalty for cancelation or if participants decline to answer a question. Possible risks might include minimal social and psychological risks which might cause discontinuation of interview.

[Describe any known physical, psychological, social, or financial research-related risks, inconveniences, or side effects (expected and potential) and indicate what measures will be taken to minimize them. If the potential for medical injury exists, identify treatment procedures or the absence thereof.]

#### 5. Confidentiality:

So that individuals who participate in the study will be protected in future publications, pseudonums will be used. Every effort will be made to protect the identity of the participants. Names of participants will be changed along with the school in which they are employed. Protection of the anonymity and confidentiality with no personal identifying information will be revealed, so that the participant and their school will be identified. [Describe confidentiality procedures. Detail the extent, if any, to which confidentiality of records identifying the participant will be protected.]

### 6. Alternative Procedures:

NA

[Describe alternatives to participation that will be presented to participation in the study (generally another accepted course of therapy or diagnostic procedure etc.).]

#### 7. Participant's Assurance:

This project has been reviewed by the Institutional Review Board, which ensures that research projects involving human subjects follow federal regulations.

Any questions or concerns about rights as a research participant should be directed to the Chair of the IRB at 601-266-5997. Participation in this project is completely voluntary, and participants may withdraw from this study at any time without penalty, prejudice, or loss of benefits.

Any questions about the research should be directed to the Principal Investigator using the contact information provided in Project Information Section above.

### CONSENT TO PARTICIPATE IN RESEARCH

Participant's Name: Laura Martin Shearer

Consent is hereby given to participate in this research project. All procedures and/or investigations to be followed and their purpose, including any experimental procedures, were explained to me. Information was given about all benefits, risks, inconveniences, or discomforts that might be expected.

The opportunity to ask questions regarding the research and procedures was given. Participation in the project is completely voluntary, and participants may withdraw at any time without penalty, prejudice, or loss of benefits. Unless described above and agreed to by the participant, all personal information is strictly confidential, and no names will be disclosed. Any new information that develops during the project will be provided if that information may affect the willingness to continue participation in the project.

Questions concerning the research, at any time during or after the project, should be directed to the Principal Investigator with the contact information provided above. This project and this consent form have been reviewed by the Institutional Review Board, which ensures that research projects involving human subjects follow federal regulations. Any questions or concerns about rights as a research participant should be directed to the Chair of the Institutional Review Board, The University of Southern Mississippi, 118 College Drive #5147, Hattiesburg, MS 39406-0001, (601) 266-5997.

Include the following information only if applicable. Otherwise delete this entire paragraph before submitting for IRB approval: The University of Southern Mississippi has no mechanism to provide compensation for participants who may incur injuries as a result of participation in research projects. However, efforts will be made to make available the facilities and professional skills at the University. Participants may incur charges as a result of treatment related to research injuries. Information regarding treatment or the absence of treatment has been given

Explaining the Study

APPENDIX C



### INSTITUTIONAL REVIEW BOARD

118 College Drive #5147 | Hattiesburg, MS 39406-0001 Phone: 601.266.5997 | Fax: 601.266.4377 | www.usm.edu/research/institutional.review.board

### NOTICE OF COMMITTEE ACTION

The project has been reviewed by The University of Southern Mississippi Institutional Review Board in accordance with Federal Drug Administration regulations (21 CFR 26, 111), Department of Health and Human Services (45 CFR Part 46), and university guidelines to ensure adherence to the following criteria:

- · The risks to subjects are minimized.
- . The risks to subjects are reasonable in relation to the anticipated benefits.
- · The selection of subjects is equitable.
- Informed consent is adequate and appropriately documented.
- Where appropriate, the research plan makes adequate provisions for monitoring the data collected to ensure the safety of the subjects.
- Where appropriate, there are adequate provisions to protect the privacy of subjects and to
  maintain the confidentiality of all data.
- Appropriate additional safeguards have been included to protect vulnerable subjects.
- Any unanticipated, serious, or continuing problems encountered regarding risks to subjects must be reported immediately, but not later than 10 days following the event. This should be reported to the IRB Office via the "Adverse Effect Report Form".
- If approved, the maximum period of approval is limited to twelve months.
   Projects that exceed this period must submit an application for renewal or continuation.

PROTOCOL NUMBER: 17062001 PROJECT TITLE: Alabama teachers who participated in Arts Integration Workshops and their implementation of music into the core curriculum PROJECT TYPE: New Project RESEARCHER(S): Laura Martin Shearer COLLEGE/DIVISION: College of Education and Psychology DEPARTMENT: Educational Research and Administration FUNDING AGENCY/SPONSOR: N/A IRB COMMITTEE ACTION: Expedited Review Approval PERIOD OF APPROVAL: 06/28/2017 to 06/27/2018 Lawrence A. Hosman, Ph.D. Institutional Review Board APPENDIX E -



# **BALDWIN COUNTY PUBLIC SCHOOLS**

Building Excellence

## **OFFICE OF THE SUPERINTENDENT**

Eddie Tyler, M.Ed., Superintendent 2600-A North Hand Avenue Bay Minette, AL 36507 E-Mail: <u>etyler@bcbe.org</u> TEL: 251-937-0308 FAX: 251-580-1856

May 8, 2017

Attn: Laurie Shearer

Dear Mrs. Shearer:

I am in receipt of your request dated May 1, 2017, requesting approval to interview teachers in Baldwin County as part of your dissertation work. I am approving your request; however, interviews must be done on a volunteer basis only with the approval of the principal and teacher.

Sincerely,

Elli Ty

Eddie Tyler, M.Ed. Superintendent

lc



BOARD OF SCHOOL COMMISSIONERS Reginald A. Crenshaw, Ph.D., President - District 3 William C. Foster, Ed.D., Vice President - District 3 L. Douglas Harwell, Jr. - District 1 Don Stringfellow - District 2 Robert E. Battles, Sr. - District 4 SUPERINTENDENT Martha L. Peek

May 11, 2017

Ms. Laura Martin Shearer 5415 River Landing Drive Mobile, AL

RE: Permission to conduct research

Dear Ms. Shearer,

The Mobile County Public School System grants permission and approval for your research proposal, Alabama Classroom Teachers who Participated in Arts Integration Workshops and their Implementation of Music into the Core Curriculum. A copy of this letter should be presented to the principals and participants involved in order to assure them your research has been approved by the district. Approval is given, however, with the following stipulations:

- 1. Involvement by the principals and teachers is to be on a voluntary basis. You must advise your participants that they are not obligated to participate in your study.
- 2. You must comply with the Family Education Rights and Privacy Act.
- 3. Confidentiality must be guaranteed for all participants.
- 4. Approval for the above referenced study is granted for one year from the date of this letter.

Upon conclusion of the research, one completed copy of your study should be submitted to the MCPSS Division of Research, Assessment, Grants, and Accountability.

Best wishes to you as you continue your research efforts.

Sincerely,

Susan Hinton

Susan Hinton, PhD Executive Director Research, Assessment, Grants & Accountability

The mission of Mobile County Public Schools is to graduate prepared and productive citizens.

# ALABAMA CLASSROOM TEACHRS WHO PARTICIPATED IN ARTS INTEGRATION WORKSHOPS AND THEIR IMPLEMENTATION OF MUSIC INTO THE CORE CURRICULUM INTERVIEW PROMPTS

- 1. Tell me about your education background.
- 2. Did the music classes you took in college prepare you to use music or is it more form your experiences?
- 3. Did your family enjoy music /singing?
- 4. Was education valued by your parents? Did they complete college?
- 5. What is your philosophy of teaching? For instance, what do you believe to be the best way to make sure your students are learning?
- 6. What was your musical experience as a child? Can you tell me a musical memory from your childhood?
- 7. Did you have music in elementary school form a music teacher?
- 8. Did your teachers use music in their classroom lessons at the time?
- 9. Tell me how you use music in your position now.
- 10. Do you use music as a learning tool?
- 11. What types of musical activities or songs do you use in your classes?
- 12. Which of these do you find to be the student's favorite?
- 13. Will you demonstrate please?
- 14. How or where do you find the activities?
- 15. Please describe to me how these activities best help students.
- 16. Do you use jingle songs to help with learning a concept in your objective?
- 17. Do other teachers in your school use music in their instruction?
- 18. Do you think the teachers are intimidated? If so why? Or do they just not have the time to research and implement?
- 19. Share with me what you have taken away for the Arts in Education Workshop as far as music that you attended. Which do you consider to be most valuable?

### REFERENCES

- Abril, C. R., & Gault, B. M. (2006). The state of music in the elementary school: The principal's perspective. *Journal of Research in Music Education*, 54(1), 6-20.
  Retrieved from http://www.jstor.org/stable/3653452
- Babo, G. (2001). The influence of a formal public school instrumental music instruction on an eighth grade middle school student's reading and mathematics achievement (Doctoral dissertation). Retrieved from ProQuest. (3011645).
- Barcewicz, E. (2011). *Adolescents' use of music to achieve mood regulation goals* (Doctoral dissertation). Retrieved from ProQuest. (3489586).
- Barlow, B., & Hutchinson, J. (1962). *The missing parts of speech*. Nashville, TN: Shawnee Press.
- Barresi, A. L. (1981). The role of the federal government in support of the arts and music education. *Journal of Research in Music Education*, 29(4), 245-256. Retrieved from <u>http://www.jstor.org/stable/3345001</u>
- Barry, N. H., Gunzenhauser, M.G., & Raiber, M. A. (2003). Arts integration framework, research and practice, a literature review: Oklahoma A+ Schools. Retrieved from <u>https://www.scribd.com/doc/85425192/Arts-Integration-Book-Final</u>

Battling music education cuts (2004, April). Teaching Music 11(5), 13.

http://ehis.ebscohost.com.logon.lynx.lib.usm.edu/ehost/detail?vid=3&sid=4bf08a ea-9f6d-

4ff4a299aefae93a844c%40sessionmgr11&hid=7&bdata=JnNpdGU9ZWhvc3Qtb Gl2ZQ%3d%3d#db=aph&AN=14407727

- Ben-Shachar, M., Dougherty R. F., Deutsch, G. K., and Wandell, B. A. (2011). The development of cortical sensitivity to visual word forms. *Journal of Cognitive Neuroscience*. 23(9) 2387-2399.
- Bernhardt, P. E., Burns, J. P., Lombard, M. K., & Steeves, K. A. (2009). Transforming American educational identity after Sputnik. *American Educational History Journal*, 36(1), 71-87. Retrieved from

http://ehis.ebscohost.comlogon.lynx.lib.usm.edu

- Bhattacharya, J., & Petsche, H. (2001). Universality in the brain while listening to music. *Proceedings of the Royal Society Biological Science*, 268(1484), 2423-2433.
  doi:10.1098/rspb.2001.1802
- Bhattacharya, J., Petsche, H., & Pereda, E. (2001). Interdependencies in the spontaneous
  EEG while listening to music. *International Journal of Psychophysiology* 42, 287-301. Retrieved from
  <a href="http://www.sciencedirect.com.logon.lynx.lib.usm.edu/science/journal/01678760/4">http://www.sciencedirect.com.logon.lynx.lib.usm.edu/science/journal/01678760/4</a>

# <u>2/3</u>

- Bredekamp, S. (2014). *Effective practices in early childhood education: Building a foundation* (2<sup>nd</sup> ed.). Boston: Pearson.
- Brauchard, R., dufour, A., & Despres. O. (2004). Effect of musical expertise on visuo partial abilities: Evidence from reaction times and mental imagery. *Brain and Cognition 54*(2), 103-109.
- Bulkeley, W. (1991, November 25). Hard lessons: As schools crumble, Holyoke, Mass., voters reject tax increases-ethnic and generational splits are part of the reasons; so are distrusted officials-property owners feel burden. Wall Street Journal, p. A1.

- Burriss, K. G., & Strickland S. J. (2001). Review of research: Music and the brain in childhood development. *Childhood Education*, 78(2), 100-103. doi:10.1080/00094056.2002.10522714
- Campbell, P.S. (1998). Song in their heads: Music and its meaning in children's lives. New York. Oxford University Press.
- Catterall, J. S., & Waldorf, L. (1999). The Chicago arts partnerships in education: Summary evaluation. In E. B. Fiske (Ed.), Champions of change: The influence of arts on learning (pp. 47-62). Washington DC: Council of Chief State School Officers.
- Caulfield, R. (1999). Mozart effects: Sound beginnings? Infant and toddlers. *E-Journal Early Childhood Education Journal*, 27(2), 119-21. Retrieved from <a href="http://ehis.ebscohost.com.logon.lynx.lib.usm.edu">http://ehis.ebscohost.com.logon.lynx.lib.usm.edu</a>
- Center on Education Policy (2006). From the capital to the classroom: Year 4 of the No Child Left Behind Act. Retrieved from

http://www.cepdc.org/displayDocument.cfm?DocumentID=301

Choate, R. A. (1967). Music in American society: The MENC Tanglewood Symposium Project. *E-Journal Music Educators Journal*, 53(7), 38-40. Retrieved from <u>http://www.jstor.org.logon.lynx.lib.usm.edu/stable/3391019</u>

Choate, R. A., Fowler, C. B., Brown, C. E., & Wersen, L. G. (1967). The Tanglewood Symposium: Music in American society. *Music Educators Journal*, 54(3), 73.
Retrieved from <u>http://www.jstor.org.logon.lynx.lib.usm.edu/stable/3391187</u>

Clay, T. H. (1972). *Music education: Opinions of school administrators, parents and students.* (Unpublished doctoral dissertation). Miami University, Ohio.

- Cole, K. (2011). Professional notes: Brain-based-research music advocacy. *Music Educators Journal, 98*(1), 26-29. doi:10.1177/0027432111416574
- Colwell, C.M. (2008). Integration of music and core academic objectives in the K–12 curriculum: perceptions of music and classroom teachers. *Research in Music Education* 26(33), 33-41, doi: 10.1177/8755123308317954

Conrad, D. (2006). American music education: A struggle for time and curriculum. E-Journal Phi Kappa Phi Forum, 86(4), 31-34. Retrieved from <u>http://ehis,ebscohost.com.logon.lynx.lib.usm.edu</u>

- Courey, S., Balogh, E., Siken, J., & Paik, J. (2012). Academic music: Music instruction to engage 3<sup>rd</sup> grade students in learning basic fraction concepts. *Educational Studies in Mathematics*, 81(2), 251-278.
- Cox, J. (1989). Choral conducting: More than just a wave of the hand. *Music Educators Journal* 75(9). Retrieved from <u>http://www.jstor.org/stable/3400327</u>
- Creswell, J. W. (2013). *Qualitative inquiry and research design: choosing among five approaches.* Los Angeles: SAGE Publications

- Davenport, K. O. (2010). The effects of participation in school instrumental music programs on student academic achievement and school attendance (Doctoral dissertation). Retrieved from ProQuest. (34045669).
- The DANA Foundation. (2013). *Overview*. Retrieved from http://www.dana.org/aboutdana/
- Deere, K. B. (2010). *The influence of music education on academic achievement in reading and math* (Doctoral dissertation). Retrieved from ProQuest. (3425720).

Creswell, J. W. (2016).

- DeMoss, K., & Morris, T. (2011). How Arts Integration Supports Student Learning: Students Shed Light on the Connections. (Chicago Arts Partnership in Education). Retrieved from <u>http://www.capeweb.org/wpcontent/uploads/2011/05/support.pdf</u>.
- Dennis, D. V. (2017). Learning from the past: What ESSA has the chance to get right. *Reading Teacher*, 70(4), 395-400.

Denzin, N. K. (2001). Interpretive interactionism. London: Sage Publications.

- Denzin, N. K. & Lincoln Y. S. (1998). Strategies of qualitative inquiry. London: Sage Publications.
- Denzin, N.K. & Lincoln, Y. S. (2008). The sage handbook of qualitative research. London: Sage Publications.

Dudley, L., & Pecka, W. (1994). Math, science, whole language and music. *E-Journal Music Educators Journal*, 81, 48-55. Retrieved from http://www.jstor.org/stable/3398817

- Dunaway, J. (1987). Characteristics of successful high school choral programs. *The Choral Journal 28.*
- Duncombe, W., Lukemeyer, A., & Yinger, J. (2006). The no child left behind act: Have federal funds been left behind?\_doi: 10.1177/1091142107305220

Fischer, D.M. (2002). Strike out the band. Scholastic Scope, 51,22.

- Fletcher, R., & Hattie, J. (2011). *Intelligence and intelligence testing*. London: New York: Routledge
- Foran, L. M. (2009). Listening to music: Helping children regulate their emotions and improve learning in the classroom. *E-Journal Education Horizons*, 88(1), 51-58.

Retrieved from

http://www.eric.ed.gov/contentdelivery/servlet/ERICServlet?accno=EJ868339

- Fresne, J., & Vitulli, P. (2013). Arts in education, Department of Music, University of South Alabama, Mobile, Alabama. Retrieved from http://www.southalabama.edu/music/
- Gardner, H. (2011). *Frames of mind: The theory of multiple intelligences*. New York: Basic Books.

Gardner, H., & Mucinskas, D. (2013). Educating for good work: From research to practice. *British Journal of Educational Studies*. 61(4), 453-470. doi: 10.1080/00071005.2013.829210

Garner, R. (2004). Skills for a song. *Technology and Learning 24*(9). Retrieved from http://ehis.ebscohost.com.logon.lynx.lib.usm.edu/ehost/detail?vid=14&sid=4bf08 aea-9f6d-4ff4-a299 aefae93a844c%40sessionmgr11&hid=115&bdata=JnNpdGU9ZWhvc3QtbGl2ZQ

%3d%3d#db=aph&AN=12805874

- Gates, J. T. (1988). *Music education in the United States: Contemporary issues*. Tuscaloosa: The University of Alabama Press.
- Gerrity, K. W. (2009). No Child Left Behind: Determining the influence of policy on music education in Ohio. *E-Journal Bulletin of the Council for Research in Music Education, 179*, 79-93. Retrieved from

http://www.jstor.org/stable/40319001

Gewertz, C. (2001). Board sticks to teacher rebuke. Education Week, 20(21), 4.

- Glaser, B.G., & Strauss, A.L. (1967). *The discovery of grounded theory: Strategies for qualitative research*. New York: Aldine De Gruyter.
- Goldberg, M.R. (2001). Arts and learning: An integrated approach to teaching and learning in multicultural and multilingual settings. New York: Addison Wesley Longman.
- Green, E. A., (1961). The young composers 1961-1962. *Music Educators Journal*, 47(6), 56.

http://www.jstor.org/stable/3389434

- Greenslit, N. A. (2003). Mozartian music listening in the classroom: Its effect on the academic performance of junior high students in English, science and mathematics (Master's thesis). Retrieved from ProQuest. (1415067).
- Grimmett, H., Rickard, N., and Gill, A. (2010). A perilous path from proposal to practice: A qualitative program evaluation of a regional music program.Australian *Journal of Music Education*, 2, 52-65.
- Hemmel, A. M., & Gerrity, K. W. (2012). The effect of instruction on teacher perception of competence when including students with special needs in music classrooms. *Update: Application of Research in Music Education, 31*(1), 6-13. doi: 101177/8755123312457882
- Hobby, J. L. (2004). Strategies to address the effects of reduced funding for music education (Doctoral dissertation). Retrieved from ProQuest. (3120322).
- Hodges, D. A. (2000). Implications of music and brain research. *E-Journal Music Educators Journal*, 87(2), 17-22. Retrieved from <a href="http://www.jstor.org.logon.lynx.lib.usm.edu/stable/3399643">http://www.jstor.org.logon.lynx.lib.usm.edu/stable/3399643</a>

Huttenlocher, P.R. (1994). Synaptogenesis synapse elimination, and neural plasticity in human cerebral cortex. *Threats to optimal development: The Minnesota symposia on child psychology* 27, 35-53.

http://books.google.com/books?id=juPi1QSteRoC&printsec=frontcover&source= gbs\_ge\_summary\_r&cad=0#v=onepage&q&f=false

- Jensen, E. (2002). Teach the arts for reasons beyond the research. *Education Digest* 67(6), 47-53. Retrieved from <u>http://ehis.ebscohost.com.logon.lynx.lib.usm.edu</u>
- Johanningmeier, E. V. (2010). A nation at risk and Sputnik: Compared and reconsidered. American Educational History Journal, 37(2), 347-365. Retrieved from <u>http://ehis.ebscohost.comlogon.lynx.lib.usm.edu</u>
- Jacobs, V., Goldberg, M., & Bennett, T. (1999). Teaching core curriculum through the arts
- Jones, M. H., & Estell, D. B. (2007). Exploring the Mozart effect among high school students. *E-Journal Psychology of Aesthetics, Creativity, and the Arts, 1*(4), 219-224. doi:10.1037/1931-3896.1.4.219.
- Juslin, P.N., Liljestrom, S., Vastfjall, D., Barradas, G., & Silva, A. (2008). An experience sampling study of emotional reactions to music: Listener, music, and situation. *Emotion*, 8, 668-683. doi:10.1037/a0013505
- Keene, J.A. (1982). A history of music education in the United States. Hanover and London: University of New England.
- Kinderart (American Broadcasting Company). (1995). School house rock. [DVD].
  Available from http://www.kinderart.com. San Mateo, CA. Creative Wonders.
  Klingenstein, B. G. (2011). When the arts people left: Causes and consequences of the

*elimination of a music degree* (Doctoral dissertation). Retrieved from ProQuest. (3480833).

- LaPrise, R. (c. 1950). *The hokey pokey* [Recorded by the Ram Trio in 1949]. Nashville, TN: Acuff-Rose Music.
- Lee-Holmes, R. A. (2008). *A descriptive study of middle school teachers' current perspectives on and teaching practices for integrating music in public school curricula* (Doctoral dissertation). Retrieved from ProQuest. (3337473).
- Levy, H. (2008). Meeting the needs of all students through differentiated instruction:
  Helping every child reach and exceed standards. *The Clearing House*, *81*(4). 161-165. Retrieved through
  http://eds.a.ebscohost.com.lynx.lib.usm.edu/ehost/resultsadvanced?sid=720122f7-bf66-4bcb-b1f4-

99cececdb18c%40sessionmgr4003&vid=3&hid=4110&bquery=Meeting+the+nee ds+of+all+students+through+differentiated+instruction%3a&bdata=JmRiPWV1Z SZ0eXB1PTEmc210ZT11aG9zdC1saXZ1

- Litchtenberg, M. (2007). Stories from NEA members about NCLB: NCLB/ESA it's time for a change! Voices from America's Classrooms. (p. 82). Washington, DC: National Education Association.
- Longley, L. (1999). Gaining the arts advantage: Lessons from the school districts that value arts education.
- Macklis, K. (1989). 5<sup>th</sup> graders rap English elements. *The Reading Teacher*. 42(4). Retrieved from <u>http://www.jstor.org.lynx.lib.usm.edu/stable/20200137</u>

Major, M.L. (2013). How they decide: A case study examining the decision-making

process for keeping or cutting music in a K–12 public school district. *Journal of Research in Music 61*(5). doi: 10.1177/0022429412474313

- Mark, M. L. (2008). *A concise history of American music education*. New York: rowman & Littlefield Education.
- Mark, M. L., & Gray, C. L. (2007). A history of American music education. New York: Rowman & Littlefield Education.
- McLelland, M. (2005). The influence of instrumental music on student achievement in reading and mathematics (Doctoral dissertation). Retrieved from ProQuest. (3156552).
- Merriam, S. B., & Tisdell, E. J. (2016). *Qualitative research: A guide to design and implementation (4<sup>th</sup> ed.)*. San Francisco, CA: Jossey Bass
- Mixon, K. (2004). Three learning styles....Four steps to reach them. *Teaching Music*. *11*(4), 48-52.
- Newman, J., Rosenbaeh, J. H., Burns, K. L., Latimer, B. C., Matocha, H. R., & Vogt, E.
  R. (1995). An experiment test of "The Mozart Effect": Does listening to his music improve spatial ability? *Perceptual and Motor Skills*, *81*, 1379-1387.
- Nierman, A. (2014). Making connections to strengthen the profession. *Music Educators Journal*, *101*(1), 8-9. doi: 10.1177/00274321145040260.
- Noblit, G.W., Corbett, H.D., Wilson, B.L., & McKinney, M.B. (2009). Creating and sustaining arts-based school reform; the A+ schools program. New York: Routledge.

- No Child Left Behind Act of 2001. Public Law 107-110.107<sup>th</sup> Cong. 1<sup>st</sup> sess., 8 January, 2002.
- Nolan, K. (2009). Musi-Matics! Coin a phrase that links the arts with math instruction. *E-Journal Music Educators Journal 95*(3), 19-20. Retrieved from http://www.jstor.org/stable/30219205
- Overland, C. (2013). Integrated arts teaching: What does it mean for music education? *Music Educators Journal 100* (31). doi: 10.1177/0027432113497762
- Paramita, P., & Das, P. (2011). Gender difference in emotional intelligence and mental health among postgraduate students *Educational* Quest 2(2), 211-214).
- Parker, I. (2008). The time of music: The music of time. *Critical Quarterly*, *50*(3),43-76 doi: 10.1111/j.1467-8705.2008.00814.x.
- Parsad, B. & Spiegelman, M. (2012). Arts education: In public elementary and secondary schools. (NCSE 2012-012). Retrieved from U.S. Department of Education website:

http://nces.ed.gov/pubsearch/pubsinfo.asp?pubid=2012014rev

- Pearman, C. J., & Friedman, T. (2009). Reading and rhythm: Binding language arts and music in an academic notebook. *General Music Today 23*(1), 12-16. doi:10.1177/1048371309331610.
- Peet, L. & Vercelletto, C. (2016). ESSA signed into law: Legislation to ensure revenue for school libraries. *Library Journal*, 62(1), 12-14.
- Pepin, C. I. (1998), *Cultivating democratic educational reform: A critical examination of the A+ schools program* (Doctoral Dissertation). Retrieved from ProQuest. (9902467).

- Peterson, A. D. (2011). The influence of neuroscience on music education advocacy and philosophy. *Arts Education Policy Review*, *112*(4), 206-213. doi:10.1080/10632913.2011.592475
- Posner, M.I., & Rothbart M.K. (2005). Influencing brain networks: implications for education. *Trends in Cognitive Science*, 9(3), retrieved from http://www.sciencedirect.com.logon.lynx.lib.usm.edu/science/journal/13646613/9
  /3
- Press, M. R. (2006). Use music in the classroom, *Invention in School and Clinic*, 41(5), 307-309. Retrieved from <u>http://ehis.ebscohost.com.logon.lynx.lib.usm.edu</u>
- Rabkin, N., & Redmond, R. (2006). The arts make a difference. *Educational Leadership*, 63(5), 60–64.
- Randall, M. (2012). Putting music and classroom teachers side by side. *Teaching Music*, 20, 52. Retrieved from wccnafme.weebly.com
- Rauscher, F. H., & Hinton, S. C. (2006). The Mozart effect: Music listening is not music instruction. *E-Journal Educational Psychologist*, 41(4), 233-238. Retrieved from <u>http://ehis.ebscohost.com.logon.lynx.lib.usm.edu</u>
- Rauscher, F. H., Shaw, G. L., & Ky, K. N. (1993). Music and spatial task performance. *E-Journal Nature*, *365*(6447), 611. doi:10.1038/365611a0
- Rentner, D. S., Scott, C., Kober, N., Chudwsky, N., Chudowsky, V., Joftus, S., &
  Zabala, D, (2006). *From the capital to the classroom: Year 4 of the No Child Left Behind Act.* Washington, DC: Center on Education Policy.
- Rich, A. L. (1946). *Lowell Mason: The father of singing among the children*. ChapelHill, NC: The University of North Carolina Press.

Rice, D. (2009). Schoolhouse Rock rewind. *Education Matters* Retrieved from <u>http://aaeteachers.org/index.php/publications/education-matters-archive#2009</u>

Saarikallio, S., & Erkkila, J. (2007). The role of music in adolescents' mood regulation. *Psychology of Music*, 35, 88-109. Retrieved from http://lynx.lib.usm.edu/docview/1338109?accountid=13946

Sacks, O. (2007). Musicophilia. New York: Vintage Books.

- Shuler, S. C. (2012). Music education for life: Core music education: Students' civil right. *Music Educators Journal*, 98(4), 7-11. doi:10.1177/0027432112446912
- Spohn, C. (2008). Teacher perspectives on No Child Left Behind and arts education: A case study. Arts Education Policy Review, 109(4), 3-11. Retrieved from http://www.jstor.org.logon.lynx.lib.usm.edu/stable/3391019
- Steele, D. L. (1988). An investigation into the background and implications of the Yale Seminar on Music (Doctorial dissertation). Retrieved from ProQuest. (8908459).
- Stien, P., & Kendall, J. (2004). *Psychological trauma and the developing brain*.Binghampton, NY: Haworth Press.
- Strickland, S.J., (2002). Music and the brain in childhood development: Review of research. *Childhood Education*, 78(2), 100-103.

Thomas R. & Arnold, A. (2011). The A+ schools: A new look at curriculum integration. *Visual Arts Research 37*(72), 96-104. Retrieved from <u>http://ehis.ebscohost.com.logon.lynx.lib.usm.edu</u>

Thompson, W. F., Schellenberg, E. G., & Husain, G. (2001). Arousal, mood, and the Mozart effect. *Psychological Science*, 12, 248–251. http://ehis.ebscohost.com.logon.lynx.lib.usm.edu

- Tomlinson, C. A., (2014). One to grow on: Releasing the will to learn. *Educational Leadership*, 72(1), 86-87
- Underwood, E.B. (2000). An analysis of the achievement patterns of high school students who participate in instrumental music and those who do not participate in instrumental music (Doctoral dissertation). Retrieved from ProQuest. (99712120)
- United States Department of Education. (2010). *ESEA Reauthorization: A blueprint for reform*. Retrieved from http://www2.ed.gov/policy/elsec/leg/blueprint/index.html
- U.S. Department of Education. (2015). *Every Student Succeeds Act (ESSA)*. Retrieved from https://www.ed.gov/essa?src=rn.
- Vitulli, P., Santoni, S., & Fresne, J. (2013). Arts in education: Professional development integrating the arts and collaborating with schools and community. *International Journal of Pedagogies and Learning*. 8(1), 45-52. Retrieved from http://eds.a.ebscohost.com.lynx.lib.usm.edu/ehost/resultsadvanced?sid=720122f7-bf66-4bcb-b1f499cececdb18c%40sessionmgr4003&vid=2&hid=4110&bquery=arts+in+educatio n%3a+professional+development+integrating+the+arts+AND+collaborating+wit

h+schools+AND+community&bdata=JmRiPWV1ZSZ0eXBIPTEmc2l0ZT1laG9 zdC1saXZl

Walker, D. E. (1998). Teaching music: Managing the successful music program. New York: Schirmer Books. Waller, L., & Edgington, W. D. (2001). Using songs to help teach the civil war. Social Studies 92(4), 147-50. Retrieved from ehis.ebscohost.com.logon.lynx.lib.usm.edu

Wandell, B. (2008). What's in your mind? Nature Neuroscience, 11(4), 384.

- Winner, E., & Hetland, L. (2008). Art for out sake: School arts classes matter more that you think-but not for the reasons you think. *Arts Education Policy Review* 109(5).
- Willimgham, D. (2009). Why don't students like school? *American Educator 33*(1), 4-13. Retrieved from

http://www.aft.org/newspubs/periodicals/ae/spring2009/index.cfm

- Winner, E., and Hetland, L. (2008). Arts for our sake: School arts classes matter more than ever—but not for the reasons you think. *Arts Educational Policy Review 109* (5), 29–32.
- Yick-Ming, R.W. (1998). Music in education is education for life. *International Journal of Music Education 23*(107). doi: 10.1177/0255761405052402
- Zadina, J. (2014). *Multiple pathways to the student brain: Energizing and enhancing instruction*. New York, NY: Wiley.
- Zdzinski, S. F., Ogawa, M., Dell, C., Yap, C. C., Adderley, C., & Dingle, R. (2007).
  Attitudes and practices of Japanese and American music teachers towards integrating music with other subjects. *International Journal of Music Education*, 25, 55-70. doi:10.1177/0255761407074892