A COMPARATIVE APPROACH

Zaleha Kamatuddin

Arreword Kin Mohamed Suffian

STRICT LIABILITY IN CRIMINAL LAW A COMPARATIVE APPROACH

Zaleha Kamaruddin Foreword by Tun Mohamed Suffian

Kulliyyah of Laws International Islamic University Kuala Lumpur



No part of this book may be reproduced in any form without permission in writing from the publisher, except by a reviewer, who may quote brief passages in a review to be printed in a magazine or newspaper.

First edition, 1988

Published by Nurin Enterprise No. 40 Jalan Kemuja, Off Jalan Bangsar, 59000 Kuala Lumpur. Peti Surat 11552, 50750 Kuala Lumpur. 203-2740112/2740113.

Printed by Usaha C & L Sdn. Bhd.

Say, "If I am astray, I only stray to the loss of my own soul: but if I received guidance, it is because of the inspiration of my Lord to me. It is He who hears all things, and is (ever) near."

(The Holy Qur'an, Surah Al-Saba verse 50)

Specially dedicated to my MOTHER with love, prayer and hope that Allah grant her soul eternal peace.

FOREWORD

In law the basic principle is that no act is criminal unless there is mens rea i.e. committed with a guilty mind. But during the last 100 years or so the world has become crowded and life complicated and it has become necessary to regulate many kinds of activities that if left unchecked would cause great inconvenience and harm to fellow human beings. And that is why the lawmaker has made many acts criminal even if committed without mens rea. Examples are acts concerning the sale of food and drugs, the supply of intoxicating liquor, safety at work, control of weights and measures and the like. Such strict-liability offences (as they are called) which affect a large number of usually law-abiding citizens are the less serious road traffic offences created because of the need to reduce congestion and accidents on our roads in crowded towns and cities. In these cases all the prosecutor needs to prove is only the actus reus i.e. the guilty act without the need to prove mens rea.

Chapters in learned books and umpteen articles have been written by scholars on the modern concept of strict liability. This book is however a departure from most – because here we have a comparative study of the concept as it exists in secular law on the one hand and on the other in *syariah* i.e. Muslim law which is basically divine law to which Muslim jurists later added man-made law.

In Malaysia where there is growing awareness of and interest in the *syariah*, this book is most welcome.

K.Lumpur Date: 6/10/88 Tun Mohamed Suffian, (former Lord President, Federal Court, Malaysia)

PREFACE

This book was largely based on my dissertation submitted as partial fulfilment for Master of Comparative laws in International Islamic University.

It is the aim of this book to highlight the lacunae in the common law concept of strict liability. Strict liability is a technical area of the law. Its apparent simplicity is complicated by many inconsistencies and anomalies within many of the statutory offences that form the bulk of its manifestations. I therefore offers shariah as solution to the problems manifested by strict liability.

The chapter on case-study of strict liability offences and its solution in shariah are based on discussions, interviews and conversations with persons knowledgeable in this area such as Dr. Ata'Al-Sid, Dr. Mahmud Saedon, Ustaz Hashim Mehat and other shariah lawyers.

The comparative study presents many challenges especially in Chapter III, where all the cases involving strict liability are modern cases arising out of the modern technological era. Since shariah has not been practised totally by any muslim country, therefore no examples could be relied on. I therefore quote the general principles found in the Holy Qur'an and Sunnah in support as solutions.

I am indebted to many people who have generously contributed to the completion of this book. My special thanks goes to En. Baharudin Harun for his time and advice. I am indebted to my husband. Manaf and my sons, Mu'az and Irfan who never fails to provide me with the love and warmth that helped to lessen the pressure of the task of accomplishing this work.

Finally, I am very conscious of my shortcomings and imperfections, and I leave it to those more competent than me to give the subject a comprehensive treatment.

Kulliyyah of laws International Islamic University Kuala Lumpur

Zaleha Kamarudin

TABLE OF CONTENTS

FOREWORD	v
PREFACE	vi
CONTENTS	vii
TABLE OF CASES	ix
TABLE OF STATUTES	xv
ABBREVIATIONS	xviii

CHAPTER	I.	THE CONCEPT OF STRICT LIABILITY	3
	Α.	Introduction	
	В.	Historical Background	
	C.	Definition of Strict Liability i. The Concept of Strict Liability in Common Law	
		i. The Concept of Strict Liability in Malaysia	
CHAPTER	11.	THE CONCEPT OF ISLAMIC 17 CRIMINAL LAW AND ITS APPROACH TOWARDS STRICT LIABILITY OFFENCES	
	А.	The Concept of Islamic Criminal Law i. Introduction	
		ii. Islamic Justice iii. The Legal Element of Crime in Shāri'ah	
	В.	Classification of Crimes i. Hudud	
		ii. Qisās iii. Ta'āzir	
	C.	The Position of Strict Liability Offences in The Shari'ah 1. The Element of Intention	
		 Penal Punishments (Ta'āzir) in Public Interest 	

CHAPTER	III.	CASE STUDY ON SOME STRICT LIABILITY OFFENCES AND ITS APPROACH IN SHĀRI'AH	37
	A.	Offences Related to Intoxicating Liquor	
	В.	Offences Related to Trades	
	C.	Offences Related to Possession of Firearms and Illegal Drugs	
	D.	Other Offences	
CHAPTER	IV.	CONCLUSION	87
	Α.	Justification of Strict Liability Offences	
	В.	Critiques of Strict Liability Offences	
	C.	Possible Solutions	
	D.	Solutions in Shāri'ah	
BIBLIOGRAPH	ΗY		115
APPENDIX			121

APPENDIX

viii