

DAMAGES **UNDER** **MALAYSIAN** **TORT LAW** **CASES AND COMMENTARY**

Mohd Altaf Hussain Ahangar

SWEET & MAXWELL ASIA

Damages under Malaysian Tort Law: Cases and Commentary

Mohd Altaf Hussain Ahangar

LLB, LLM, PhD (India)

Professor

Ahmad Ibrahim Kulliyah of Laws
International Islamic University Malaysia

SWEET & MAXWELL ASIA



THOMSON REUTERS

Published in 2009 by
Sweet & Maxwell Asia
a division of 'The Thomson Corporation (M) Sdn Bhd (441723-A)
No **17**, Jalan PJS **7/19**
46150 Petaling Jaya, Selangor, Malaysia

Affiliated Companies

AUSTRALIA

Thomson Legal and Regulatory Limited
100 Harris Street
Pyrmont, Sydney
Australia, NSW 2009

CANADA

Carswell
One Corporate Plaza
2075 Kennedy Road
Scarborough, Ontario M1T 3V4

HONG KONG

Sweet & Maxwell Asia
a division of The Thomson
Corporation Hong Kong Ltd
25/F, Island Place Tower
510 King's Road, North Point
Hong Kong

SINGAPORE

Sweet & Maxwell Asia
80 Robinson Road
#15-00
Singapore 068898

NEW ZEALAND

Brookers
PO Box 6343, Auckland

UNITED KINGDOM/EUROPE

Sweet & Maxwell Ltd
100 Avenue Road
London NW3 3PF

UNITED STATES OF AMERICA

West Group
PO Box 64526
St Paul, Minnesota 55164-0526

ISBN 978-967-5040-22-1

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced or transmitted in any form or by any means, or stored in any retrieval system of any nature without prior written permission, except for permitted fair dealing under the Copyright Act 1987.

Application for permission for other use of copyright material including permission to reproduce extracts in other published works shall be made to the publishers.
Full acknowledgement of the author, publisher and source must be given.

The author has asserted his moral right under the Copyright Act 1987,
to be identified as the author of this publication.

© Mohd Altaf Hussain Ahangar

Cover design by Edward Goh

Printed by Swan Printing Sdn Bhd
Lot 5249, Jalan BS 7/1, Kawasan Perindustrian Bukit Serdang
43300 Seri Kembangan, Selangor

Contents

<i>Preface</i>		<i>vii</i>
<i>Table of Cases</i>		<i>xiii</i>
<i>Table of Statutes</i>		<i>xvii</i>
 <i>Chapter 1</i>		
Introduction		1
1.2 Restitutio in integrum principle.....		1
1.3 Damages must be claimed "once and for all".....		3
1.4 If one act of the defendant violated two distinct rights of the plaintiff, he can bring successive actions in respect of those rights.		5
1.5 Successive actions for violations of two distinct rights by one act are an abuse of judicial process if the issues could have been settled in the first action.....		7
1.6 Continuing injury.....		10
 <i>Chapter 2</i>		
Kinds of Damages		17
2.2 Contemptuous damages.....		17
2.3 Nominal damages.....		19
2.4 Exemplary damages.....		24
2.4.1 Oppressive, arbitrary or unconstitutional action by the servants of the government.....		27
2.4.2 Defendant's conduct calculated by him to make a profit for himself which may well exceed the compensation payable to the plaintiff.....		29
2.5 Aggravated damages.....		31
2.6 General damages.....		35
2.7 Special damages.....		36
 <i>Chapter 3</i>		
Damages for Personal Injury		39
3.2 Non-pecuniary loss.....		39
3.2.1 Pain and suffering.....		39
3.2.2 Loss of amenities.....		40
3.3 Pecuniary loss.....		50
3.3.1 Loss of earnings.....		50
3.3.2 Present law in Malaysia.....		51
3.3.2.1 Loss of future earnings.....		51
3.3.2.2 Good health.....		51

3.3.2.3	Earning by his own labour or gainful activity.....	53
3.3.2.4	Earnings from illegal sources in cases of personal injury.....	55
3.3.2.5	Multiplier.....	57
3.3.2.6	Living expenses.....	63
3.3.2.7	Increment in salary.....	68
3.3.2.8	Loss of earning capacity.....	71
3.3.2.8	Maintaining the dichotomy between pre-trial loss of earnings and post-trial loss of earnings.....	76
3.4	Loss of support.....	79
3.5	Reasonable expenses.....	81
3.5.1	Treatment at a private hospital.....	81
3.5.2	Nursing care.....	84
3.6	Undeductible sums.....	86
3.7	Inflation.....	89

Chapter 4

Damages for Death	91
4.2 Dependency claims.....	91
4.2.1 Dependant.....	91
4.2.1.1 Widow whose marriage was a customary marriage and not registered under s 22(4) of the Law Reform (Marriage and Divorce) Act 1976.....	92
4.2.1.2 Grandparents as dependants.....	96
4.2.1.3 Adopted child can be a dependant provided he is legally adopted.....	98
4.2.1.4 Brother - Not dependant.....	99
4.2.2.1 Loss of support.....	100
4.2.2.2 Multiplier.....	103
4.2.2.3 Multiplicand.....	111
4.2.2.4 Contingencies of life.....	113
4.3 House-keeping expenses.....	118
4.4 Bereavement.....	121
4.5 Estate claims.....	121
4.5.1 Claim for loss of future earnings for the lost years by unemployed deceased.....	121
4.5.2 Claim for loss of future earnings for the lost years of employed deceased.....	123
4.5.3 Pain and suffering.....	125
4.5.4 Funeral expenses.....	126

Chapter 5

Damages for Property Destruction/Loss.....127

5.1 Introduction

 5.1.1 Any damage to property illegally acquired does not entitle a person to claim damages.....127

5.2 Destruction of property.....133

5.3 Damage to property.....133

 5.3.1 In cases of damage to property, the cost of repairs is to be assessed at the earliest date, when, having regard to all the circumstances, they could reasonably be undertaken, rather than the date when the damage occurred.....134

 5.3.2 While awarding damages for damage to property, the court has discretion to award damages on the reinstatement principle or diminution in value principle or both.....143

Chapter 6

Damages for Defamation.....149

6.2 Estimation of damages for defamation depends on the judge's discretion but the amount awarded has to be reasonable under the circumstances.....149

6.3 In order to limit the size of awards, the courts now favour global award.....157

6.4 In awarding damages, the plaintiff's standing in society is a relevant factor which the court takes into consideration.....160

6.5 Assessment of damages for defamation depends on numerous factors.....163

6.6 A corporation can be awarded damages for loss of goodwill or loss of income but not for mental distress or illness.....167

6.7 Aggravated damages for defamation must be reasonable.....169

6.8 Damages in cases of defamation can be quantified.....172

6.9 In a defamation action, the plaintiff is entitled to the award of interest on the damages ordered to be paid.....174

6.10 Global awards in defamation cases.....177

6.11 Global awards in defamation also means one award against all tortfeasors.....179

Chapter 7

Damages for Economic Loss.....183

7.2 Consequential economic loss.....183

7.3 Pure economic loss.....185

 7.3.1 Special relationship.....189

 7.3.2 Pure economic loss can be claimed if there is an assumption of responsibility by the defendant.....191

 7.3.3 Pure economic loss caused by breach of statutory duties by governmental bodies can be claimed provided there is no indeterminacy in relation to amount, time and class. . . .194

7.3.4	Pure economic loss can also be claimed in deserving cases although there is neither reliance upon the skill of the defendant by the plaintiff nor assumption of responsibility by the defendant to the plaintiff.....	198
7.3.5	Defective product economic loss.....	201
7.3.6	Pure economic loss resulting from defective products can be claimed provided there is a special relationship between the plaintiff and the defendant or it is just, fair and reasonable to allow it.....	211
<i>Appendix</i>		217
<i>Index</i>		229