

CRITICAL REVIEW OF CONTEMPORARY PRACTICE IN INTERNATIONALISATION WITHIN THE HLST SUBJECT COMMUNITIES

Viv Caruana & Josef Ploner, Leeds Metropolitan University

Aims and scope of the critical review

This report identifies and critically reviews contemporary practice in the field of internationalisation within the HLST subject communities in order to inform curriculum development and pedagogy geared towards the development of international perspectives and global awareness. Drawing on current pedagogical literatures as well as staff and student consultations, it identifies a number of key points which reflect good practice in UK HLST curricula in the UK. Due to the broad disciplinary scope of the subject area in focus and the diversity of curricular activities across the UK, this critical review is selective rather than exhaustive and seeks to stimulate further discussion and research into this area. It will:

- offer a compact overview of the key themes emerging from the review, indicating effective practice in HLST internationalisation
- outline the methodology used to undertake this critical review
- contextualise 'internationalisation' within the wider HLST disciplinary realm
- provide further clarification of the identified key themes and discuss current trends and tendencies in HLST internationalisation
- identify gaps in research and practice linked to the internationalisation of HLST curricula

1) Examples of good practice

1.1) Curricular teaching and learning activities

- Encouraging international team- and group work activities and forms of assessment in the classroom to engage students in cross-cultural thinking and enhance problem solving skills
- Adopting more strategic approaches to the implementation of different pedagogies, the formation of cross-cultural groups and the assessment of cross-cultural skills developed from group work (Brookes & Becket, 2011)
- Balancing theoretical and practical aspects of learning and teaching in the curriculum (danger of over-emphasising one over the other)
- Making use of guest lectures by international and/or visiting academic staff, post-graduate researchers, practitioners and representatives of the industry
- Drawing on students' individual interests and existing international experience (e.g. travel, sports, work in hospitality businesses, etc.) and empowering students as autonomous learners and active contributors to the curriculum
- Drawing on existing international academic or working experience of staff

1.2) Extra-curricular teaching and learning activities

- Promoting and sponsoring international field trips to enhance students' contextual, international and interdisciplinary thinking and problem solving skills
- Encouraging students to attend or (co-)organise international summer-schools, post-graduate conferences and similar events to generate international knowledge exchanges and boost skills development at various levels
- Addressing current financial and demographic challenges to encourage greater student uptake of 'Internationalisation abroad' activities, either for study, work or volunteering (Brookes & Becket, 2011)
- Using international mega events (e.g. Olympic Games, international festivals, etc.) as basis for developing collaborations and knowledge-exchange across countries (De Haan & Sherry, 2011)

1.3) Networks and partnerships, international and 'at home'

- Promoting international work-placements with reliable third-sector partners as well as academic exchange programmes with overseas universities
- Engaging with professional bodies and associations (e.g. Tourism Society, Sport Associations, etc.) to foster knowledge exchanges between academia and industry relating to standards, practice, and broader research on an international scale
- Encouraging innovative 'community-based', 'experiential' and 'service-learning' activities with local partners emphasising aspects of cultural diversity and inter-cultural exchange in support of an 'internationalisation at home' agenda
- Using synchronous online learning facilities for collaboration with overseas departments/schools (e.g. video conferencing, skype, facebook, etc.)
- Fostering exchange of knowledge, experience and practice in internationalisation across the HLST disciplines and beyond

1.4) Internationalisation and graduate employability

- Promoting conceptual understanding of the international scope and global nature of HLST subjects amongst students and staff
- putting emphasis on transferable and required skills to equip students for work in globally operating HLST industries and enterprises
- Encouraging and conveying key abilities such as 'cross-cultural competences', 'cultural intelligence' or 'inter-cultural communication' amongst students and staff
- Developing integrated team- and group-work activities or forms of assessment that foster intercultural communication and awareness
- Strengthening and sustaining links to globally operating industry and private sector partners for work-placements, knowledge transfers and other forms of international collaboration
- Engaging alumni working in the industry to provide authentic information about international scope and nature of HLST profession and provide learning and training opportunities for students
- Providing comprehensive career guidance for students informing them of changing job requirements and promoting incentives for learning

- Creating stimulating formal and informal curricular spaces to develop students' personality, attitudinal attributes and sense of initiative

2) HLST curricula in the wider internationalisation context

2.1) Increasing student numbers

The last ten years have seen a gradual rise in student numbers in the HLST subject areas, especially in terms of post-graduate programmes. As for tourism, leisure, hospitality (and transport) related courses in the UK, the Higher Education Statistic Agency (HESA) reports a rise especially in postgraduate numbers from 1.235 in 2002/03 to 1.865 in 2009/10 (HESA, 2010; Guardian, 2011). HLST programmes and courses are offered in around 30 UK Higher Education Institutions (HEIs) and a number of overseas UK campuses.

2.2) Education for global industries

HLST-related programmes are particularly popular with students world-wide since the tourism, events, leisure and sport industries continue to thrive globally and are increasingly vital sources of income in countries of the Middle and Far East, Africa and South and Central America (Hall & Page, 2009; Mpofu, 2009; Gu & Hobson, 2008; Kishun, 2007). In India for example, the tourism and hospitality sector already makes up for around 6.23 per cent of the national GDP and 8.78 per cent of the total employment in the country, providing prolific employment opportunities for graduates (IBEF, 2011; Jauhari & Manaktola, 2009). Equally, the addressed subjects remain popular amongst students in the 'West' (Europe, Canada, the US and Australia) not least because in the currently unstable economic climate, tourism, leisure and hospitality are still considered as fairly 'resilient' and 'crisis-proof' industries.

2.3) HLST programmes in competitive international HE markets

With growing international competition not only in the HLST industries but also in the HE sector, internationalisation has become a major strategy for universities in the UK in terms of student recruitment in home and overseas countries (Brookes & Becket, 2011; Smith, 2009). Besides the US and Australian HE markets, HLST related programme offers have much increased in countries like China, India, Korea, Malaysia or the Middle East. Many European countries such as the Netherlands, Switzerland, Austria, Germany, France, Finland, Norway or Denmark offer HLST programmes in English language. In the light of international competition, the European Union's 'Bologna Process', growing 'Edu-migration' and an international 'war for talent' (Hobson, 2008), UK institutions are increasingly challenged to maintain and improve programme offers and delivery, especially in the face of public spending cuts and soaring student fees in the country.

2.4) Internationalised HLST curricula in the UK

For most UK institutions, the simplistic notion that 'internationalisation' is intrinsic to, or simply 'in the name' of HLST education, has been overcome and replaced by strategic curriculum design providing students (and staff) with cross-cultural competences and international perspectives that are required in globally operating markets (Brookes & Becket, 2011 for UK hospitality programmes). The work of the Higher Education Academy's HLST Network, together with many individual champions at UK HEIs has contributed much to this development.

2.5) Increasing diversification of the HLST subject community

The international HLST subject community is becoming increasingly diverse. In terms of tourism programmes in the UK, HEIs now provide everything from foundation programmes to PhDs, spanning from FE colleges to 'Russell Group' universities and thereby reaching out to students with widely differing intellectual abilities and career aspirations (Fidgeon, 2010). For example, programmes reach from hospitality management, hospitality studies, tourism studies, sustainable tourism, cultural tourism, recreation and leisure studies, events management, sport studies, sport management to quite specific courses in wellbeing management, spa and salon management, coaching science and many more. This variety reflects the disciplinary affiliation to a range of core subject areas such as Business and Management, Social Sciences, Cultural Studies, Health, or the Bio-Sciences.

2.6) The role of disciplines

Unlike conventional tendencies addressing 'internationalisation' solely as an overarching institutional agenda (in terms of recruitment, E&D policies, etc.), more recent approaches point at the necessity of engaging single disciplines more rigorously in internationalising the curriculum (Clifford, 2009). The prevailing notion of 'one size fits all' in terms of institutional curricula internationalisation is thus giving way for more differentiated approaches which take into account the specific contexts and requirement of subjects and disciplines. For the HLST subject community this is particularly important since it represent no clear-cut sets of disciplines but rather inter- and trans-disciplinary fields including business, management, coaching, geography, law, sociology or anthropology. Considering this complex make-up of the HLST subject community, curriculum design requires constant reflexivity and the balancing of personal, political, institutional and professional relationships (Jordan, 2008).

3) Discussion of key themes and examples of good practice

3.1) Managing diversity in the HLST classroom

The literature provides prolific evidence of a positive correlation between cultural diversity and innovative learning approaches in the classroom (Brookes & Becket, 2011), but also recognises that institutional, social and personal factors often limit the degree to which culture can inform effective curricular practice (Sulkowski & Deakin, 2009). In line with this observation, inadequate teaching is associated with practitioners who tend to stereotype particular student groups according to attitudes or particular learning styles (e.g. the 'Chinese learner', the 'German learner', etc.) which can have negative impacts on coherence, trust and team building within the classroom (e.g. for group-work). Hence, research suggests that institutions, faculties and departments should focus more intensely on innovative and integrating ways of 'managing diversity' in order to avoid segregation and stereotyping (Sulkowski & Deakin, 2009; Caruana & Ploner, 2010; Weaver et al., 2008; Stohl, 2007).

3.2) Balancing theory, student engagement and practice

The review reveals that international case-study approaches to HLST teaching are dominant and an effective means to convey the multi-faceted nature and global dimension of the subject to students. In this context, practitioners state that the students themselves contribute and represent 'the best (re)sources' and bring fascinating examples from their own personal, regional or international background into the classroom. It is also widely assumed that teaching

approaches encouraging the student voice can engender 'intellectual curiosity', confidence and 'autonomous thinking' as well as 'reflexivity' in that students are challenged to critically reflect on similar subject-related scenarios from different perspectives. This, in turn, widens their perspective and helps them to conceptualise particular problems in an international, intercultural and interdisciplinary context (Stergiou et al., 2008).

Despite its student-empowering and up-to-date nature, critics fear that case study-based teaching produces 'open knowledge' which lacks consistency as long as students are not conversant with the theoretical frameworks in which the data and information is to be made sense of, interpreted and applied. For example, L'Espoir Decosta and Grunewald (2011) argue that being entwined with various established disciplines as well as the global business sector, tourism studies has so far failed to organise itself so as to be recognised as a discipline. As such, it lacks those 'meta-theories' that underlie major disciplines such as anthropology, economics or psychology, an issue which particularly affects the quality and consistency of postgraduate research.

3.3) Work-based learning and study exchanges - 'Internationalisation abroad'

Linked to the critical issue of graduate employability in global HLST markets is the significance of fostering students' cross-cultural capabilities and skills through international placements, internships, volunteering, cooperative education and other opportunities. Despite the irrefutable benefits of international work-based learning, the number of work placements and internships offered at UK institutions is in gradual decline (Brookes and Becket, 2010). It is revealed that a significant number of UK students do simply not understand the value of gaining international experience. Other reasons for not making use of placements are that students are not successful in their applications, aim at completing their degree sooner, receive poor information/support, are financially restrained, or simply not interested in the offers in place (Aggett and Busby, 2011). This is confirmed by the consulted staff members who observe an increasing hesitation of students to participate in placements, exchanges or internships abroad mainly due to i) underestimation of the value of international work experience, ii) lack of confidence in terms of foreign language skills iii) financial restrains iv) fear of losing touch with peers and delaying studies iv) current part-time work commitments and housing contracts, as well as other reasons related to personal issues, family or relationships.

Despite the acknowledged benefits of gaining international experience, cross-cultural and/or language skills, etc., the literature suggests that UK students are even more reluctant in participating in international study-exchange programmes (Brookes & Becket, 2010). This negative trend is due to the same reasons mentioned above and confirms the notion that international work experience is valued more by employers than academic exchanges (Archer & Davison, 2008).

3.4) Community engagement as 'Internationalisation at Home'

Alternative formats of providing students with work experience and fostering cultural skills are 'community-based' or 'service learning' activities in the vicinity of universities. A good example of community-based course design is provided by Gretzel et al. (2011), who, reflecting on a project on tourism development in rural Texas, show that such activities help students to critically reflect on cultural diversity, transnational labour migration, and ethnic politics while developing managerial tools to sustainable tourism on a local scale. Although locally based and

executed, such projects are ‘international’ in scope because they refer to macro-political and global realities impacting on a community (e.g. labour migration patterns, minority issues, marginalisation). Combining interdisciplinary thinking (cultural theory, social theory, business and management, etc.) with active policy making and sustainable management, such Internationalisation at Home (IaH) initiatives equip students with a host of valuable transferable skills. Another excellent example of international practice relates to sport activities as a means fostering students’ engagement with local communities, such as engaging international coaching students in work with local and regional sports associations.

In terms of UK-based work placements, and in contrast to the belief that employers are looking for a highly skilled and culturally aware workforce, authors observe that in much Anglophone culture many hospitality firms are ‘training avoiders’ and mostly see education and training as ‘low level priorities’ (Lashley, 2010). Avoiding the subordination of placement students to ‘cheap workforce’ and educators to mere ‘suppliers’ meeting the needs of the industry, universities and departments are advised to be cautious in their choice of third-sector service businesses in order to guarantee good quality training and sustainable partnerships.

3.5) From partnerships to ‘communities of practice’

An important role in the academic and professional development of students is also attested to major UK-based and international professional bodies such as the Tourism Society who hold responsibility for driving up professional standards and development within the sector. Reflecting on the literature and staff feedback, it is important for universities to collaborate more intensively with professional bodies in order to broaden their international scope while keeping up with international standards and preparing students for a global industry. For the hospitality and sport industries, global business agencies such as IMG (International Management Group—the global sports, fashion and media corporation), or the International Hotel and Restaurant Association should be mentioned.

Considering the increasing internationalisation and diversification of the HLST subject community at all levels, some emphasise the need to promote sustainable ‘communities of practice’ which, from a university perspective, reach out to the professional world and, vice versa, engages professional bodies with current teaching and research activities (Jennings et al., 2009; Zehrer & Lichtmannegger, 2009). This is key, since research shows that there are discrepancies between existing programmes and what academics and industry professionals perceive as being important (Munar & Montaña, 2009; Ring et al., 2009; Barron et al., 2007) Ideally, such communities of practice are active, reflective, socially and culturally aware networks, including teachers, researchers, practitioners and students. By exchanging knowledge, experience and good practice, all involved stakeholders develop a sense of professional identity and belonging while successfully negotiating philosophical and technical aspects of the subject (Jennings et al., 2009; Shaw & Williams, 2009).

3.6) Extracurricular activities

Commensurate with valuable professional experience gained through placements and internships, field-based learning activities such as field trips and excursions are highly important components for enhancing students’ international experience (Goh and Ritchie, 2011; Gretzel et al. 2009; Weeden et al. 2011, Wright and Hind, 2011). Reflecting on an international fieldtrip

with tourism students, Gretzel et al. (2009) emphasise how relevant such activities are for overcoming the limitations of conventional teaching approaches and bestowing on students a sense of the cultural and inter-disciplinary dimensions of the subject. The 'fantastic' and 'unique' learning experience through international fieldtrips is equally underscored by consulted staff. It is widely agreed that international fieldtrips enhanced students' contextual and 'global' understanding of the subject considerably, foster interdisciplinary thinking, boost flexibility and creative problem solving, and raise individual motivation as well as team spirit. For teaching staff, in turn, field trips provide an opportunity to engage with their students in a much more relaxed and informal environment, and to increase their overall understanding of both the subject and the students they teach (Wright and Hind, 2011). However, with current spending cuts taking place at many UK HEIs, administrative hurdles as well as rigid risk/health and safety assessments, overseas field-based learning activities are increasingly written off the curriculum (Brookes & Becket, 2010). In terms of financial spending, particularly good practice is attested to universities which allocate a certain amount of received student fees for fieldtrips, excursions or other praxis-based learning activities.

Hosting summer schools in the UK and supporting students to attend abroad is another example of good practice in the international curriculum. Although receiving little attention in the literature, summer schools represent unique opportunities for broadening students' horizon and their formal and informal learning. For students, international summer schools represent excellent opportunities to meet and mingle with international peers, exchange subject-related knowledge and learning styles, and improve teamwork as well as language and presentation skills. Combined with excursions and work-based learning activities including visits to third-sector partners (e.g. tourism, sport or leisure institutions, organisations and businesses), summer schools also offer opportunities for initiating international collaborations, exchanges and lasting networks between international universities and private-sector partners.

Another way of stimulating and enhancing international perspectives among students is the provision of guest lectures by international academics and practitioners, who are in position to deliver authentic first-hand information, reflect on personal experiences and success stories which can have an inspiring effect on students (Zehrer & Lichtmannegger, 2008).

3.7) Web-based and virtual learning

The use of the internet and the ubiquitous availability of information and communications technology (ICT) at HEIs worldwide play a significant role in the internationalisation of the curriculum and reaches from online student recruitment activities, e-learning course provisions, to interactive course delivery and students project across national borders and continents (Schott & Sutherland, 2008). For lecturers, the internet provides the main source for gathering information or teaching material related to statistics, online media, case studies, etc.

The reviewed literature emphasises the importance of rethinking the relationship between students' digital and critical literacy and to find appropriate ways of employing online learning systems effectively in culturally diverse environments (Dunn & Marinetti, 2006; Rowai & Downey, 2010). The effective use of online teaching and learning material is particularly relevant in the context of distance and e-learning. Here, it is important for practitioners to develop and make use of material that recognises the wider social and cultural environment of the students

and to make sure that teaching resources and case studies are local, fit for purpose, culturally informed and do not simply represent the application of local standards into a different context.

Other innovative ICT technologies such as 'Second Life', which allows role-plays in virtual environments and can be useful for developing intercultural competences while providing professional training, are only gradually recognised (Corder & Mackay, 2010)

New learning and ICT technologies provide plentiful opportunities to engage in virtual interaction and knowledge exchange initiatives with overseas universities and departments. Synchronous and comparative learning activities, the sharing of course material, as well as the organisation of online student projects via 'Skype', 'Elluminate' or 'facebook' are useful means of widening students' and staffs' international outlook and can lead to further academic and industry collaborations with partners abroad (Isacsson & Gretzel, 2010; Liburd & Hjalager, 2010).

3.8) Internationalisation and graduate employability

A central theme emerging from the current literature and wider debate in the HLST subjects is graduate employability. In consideration of increasingly diverse, gradually expanding and shifting international and global HLST markets, it is a matter of fact that employers are looking for graduates with a strong international outlook and skills profile. In terms of an international tourism curriculum for example, scholars and practitioners emphasise that, beyond leadership, critical thinking, practical and networking skills, the conceptual understanding of the international nature of tourism products and markets is imperative for any student (Brown, 2006; Busby & Huang, 2012; Padurean & Maggi, 2011; Zehrer and Mössenlechner, 2009;)

Key abilities such as 'cultural intelligence' (Arora and Rohmetra, 2010), 'Intercultural sensitivity' (Barron and Dasli, 2010) as well as 'cross-cultural competencies', 'intercultural communication' (Butts, 2007) or 'cultural awareness' (Causin et al., 2011) are gaining momentum in curriculum design starting to promote 'internationalisation at home' as well as 'Internationalisation abroad' (Brookes and Becket, 2011). Considering the international nature of the HLST industries, growing global competition, changing market developments and increasing labour migration, it is not surprising that 'intercultural competence' or 'cross-cultural skills' are increasingly prioritised by employers (Hearn et al., 2007). To some extent, this trend may be linked to employers' legal precautions regarding any forms of racial, gender or other discrimination at the workplace.

Students' engagement with an international and diverse body of peers and staff in formal and informal curricula can contribute much to the development of 'creativity', 'personality', 'attitudinal attributes' and 'initiative'. Recent research shows that these qualities are very much sought after within the HLST industries and more prioritised by employers than subject knowledge or professional skills (Harkison et al., 2011; Nolan et al., 2010 for the hospitality sector).

The issue of future perspectives and employability for students also calls for a stronger engagement of international alumni who succeeded in pursuing a career in their field of study, and may provide valuable and authentic insights into the international dimensions, opportunities and limitations of their chosen professions (Liu et al., 2010; Weaver, 2009). Moreover, building up an active alumni network may provide international placement, internship, or job opportunities for motivated students.

4) Gaps in research and practice

4.1) Experience of home students

Whilst motivations, attitudes and experiences of incoming international students are fairly well explored in the literature, the opportunities and barriers for domestic students for gaining and cherishing 'international' experiences both 'at home' and abroad is still widely under-researched (c.f. Brown & Richards, 2011; Dunne, 2009; Jackson & Huddart, 2008). As recommended in section 3.1), this would call for approaches which do not isolate 'home' and 'international' as different cohorts, but draw on synergies and common grounds in the student experience (Caruana & Ploner, 2010; Mitsis & Foley, 2009)

4.2) Staff engagement

The ways in which staff (individuals, groups and networks) have shaped the internationalised curricula and the impact on them of teaching increasingly diverse student cohorts is, however, something which is little known about as yet (Jordan, 2008).

4.3) Overseas programme delivery

The literature reveals little to nothing about good practices (or issues) related to overseas HLST programme and course delivery. Since a number of UK universities are offering overseas programmes in the discussed subject areas (e.g. Middlesex, Nottingham, Leeds Metropolitan, Lancaster) this area needs further exploration. Comparisons with US and Australian HEIs, which have a wealth of experience in overseas HLST programme delivery, may be useful (Smith, 2008; Hobson, 2008).

4.4) Theoretical vs. vocational teaching and learning

A majority of studies tend to focussing on HLST internationalisation as a means to enhance employability opportunities for graduates through vocational education. Whilst this is certainly important, future research also needs to readdress the role of theories, epistemologies and/or conceptual understanding of HLST subjects within curricula (e.g. diverse cultural forms and philosophies of leisure, travel, or hospitality, etc.)

4.5) The role of international students for the HLST industries in the UK

Little is known about the effects of international students (and their visiting friends and relatives) on the local/regional tourism, leisure and hospitality sector. For example, UK practitioners could learn a lot from international students' destination choice and image (Liu & Ryan, 2011; Glover, 2011). Further research needs to explore synergies between international student mobility and UK HLST networks and the possibilities for collaborations with local/regional tourism boards, restaurants, leisure facilities; development and supply of information, sources, etc.)

4.6) Internationalising Sport Curricula

The presented critical review reflects a general lack of material relating to the internationalisation of sport-related curricula. As with tourism, hospitality or leisure studies, this gap relates to the broad disciplinary remit of sport courses in UK higher education, ranging from physical education, coaching, to sport management, sponsorship, law or sport psychology, etc., each of which with hugely varying international student contingencies. The few identified studies reveal that international and/or overseas partnerships and exchange programmes are

key components in providing international experiences for students and staff alike. For the UK, however, such are mostly confined to 'Commonwealth' and/or Anglophone countries such as the Australia, Canada, New Zealand or the US, offering a host of opportunities for collaborative projects and course delivery (e.g. on a collaborative UK-Australian project on the Olympic Games see De Haan & Sherry, 2011). Broadening the horizon through collaborations with other countries would be beneficial.

4.7) International post-graduate and/or research students

With increasing numbers of international post-graduate students in the UK, further research needs to address the expectations, motivations and experiences of this cohort more vigorously (see Ruhanen and McLennan, 2010; Ploner, 2011)

4.8) The informal curriculum

Last but not least, international students' 'informal', 'extended' or 'hidden' curricula are hardly addressed in the literature. Making sense of personal experiences and narratives relating to students' social environment/space, housing, friendships, relationships, etc. is particularly significant for a subject community conferring key ideas of service, soft skills, inter-personal communication, hospitality, and the like.

5) Methodology

The critical review comprises two complementary activities in order to capture literature and evidence of curriculum and pedagogic practice and research/evaluation of practice within subject communities.

5.1) Review of literature

- The literature review focusses on both published and 'grey' literature, defined as publications available in both print and electronic formats, but not controlled by commercial publishing interests and where publishing is not the principal driver. This strategy reflects that much of the useful and ground-breaking practice and research/evaluation of practice is available as conference proceedings, resources on university websites, as well as journal articles.
- The review focusses on identifying effective practice with some exploration of emergent issues, trends and barriers across the HLST subject communities, primarily in the UK context, although innovative practice beyond the UK sector is cited as appropriate. The review of published material is therefore confined to practice-based and research-based literature (e.g. descriptions, reflections on and evaluations of practice) rather than solely theoretical or conceptual pieces, published in scholarly peer-reviewed journals.
- The review of published literature is confined to subject-specific, peer-reviewed HE learning and teaching journals dating back to 2005 and excludes books and book chapters. The timeframe from 2005 to 2011 was chosen to guarantee currency while identifying emerging trends and tendencies relevant for the HLST subject community.

- The sources have been identified via key word searches of Google Scholar as well as other resource pages of key websites such as the HLST website itself or those of HE institutions with a traditionally strong HLST teaching and research agenda. Complementary to that, the review team has searched for relevant material within associations and networks focussing on Internationalisation more generally, such as CAPRI, CICIN and TIS. Appropriate educational research bibliographical databases and Open Educational Resource sites have also been trawled for relevant sources.
- Colleagues operating in the field have been approached either via appropriate mailing lists (HLST, CAPRI, TIS, ATHE) or personally in order to support the identification of relevant practice and research of practice across the UK sector. The review team received responses from 10 individuals based at 5 UK HEIs who forwarded highly relevant information, reaching from journal articles, research projects or presentations to personal narratives of engagement and activism in promoting internationalisation in the HLST subject areas.

5.2) Online forum, staff and student interviews/advisory meetings

- Complementary to the literature review, academic staff across the sector were invited to partake in an HLST online forum facilitated by Leeds Metropolitan's Carnegie Faculty to explore effective practice in the field (<http://www.all4carnegie.com/hlst/>). Due to scant mid-semester online participation, the review team decided to invite local university staff for advisory meetings, addressing the issue of internationalisation of the curriculum in the HLST subject areas. The decision to draw on local expertise was found appropriate since Leeds Metropolitan University is one among a few UK institutions to offer various programmes related to all addressed subject fields: Hospitality, Leisure (and Events), Entertainment, Sport and Tourism. In total, six lecturers took part in advisory meetings and contributed valuable information about effective 'international' practice in their teaching and research.
- The involved members of staff further assisted to invite students in order to explore aspects of internationalisation of the curriculum on behalf of the learners and to triangulate information provided by staff or identified in the reviewed literature. A small number of semi-structured interviews were thus held with students studying on HLST programmes at Leeds Metropolitan University.

6) References:

- Archer, W., & Davison, J. (2008). Graduate employability: The views of employers. London: The Council for Industry in Higher Education.
- Barron, P., Maxwell, G. et al. (2007). Careers in Hospitality Management: Generation Y's Experiences and Perceptions. *Journal of Hospitality and Tourism Management*, 14(2): 119-128.
- Barron, P. and M. Dasli (2010). Towards an understanding of integration amongst hospitality and tourism students using Bennett's developmental model of intercultural sensitivity. *Journal of Hospitality, Leisure, Sport and Tourism Education*, 9(2): 77-88.
- Black, K. (2004). A review of factors which contribute to the internationalisation of a programme of study. *Journal of Hospitality, Leisure, Sport and Tourism Education*, 3(1), 5-18.
- Busby, G. and R. Huang (2012). Integration, intermediation and tourism higher education: Conceptual understanding in the curriculum. *Tourism Management*, 33(1): 108-115.
- Caruana, V. and Ploner, J. (2010) Internationalisation and Equality and Diversity in Higher Education: Merging Identities. Report on a research project commissioned by the Equality Challenge Unit (ECU), UK. [online]. Available at: <http://www.ecu.ac.uk/publications/internationalisation-and-equality-and-diversity-in-he-merging-identities>, retrieved November 2011.
- Causin, G., Ayoun, B. et al. (2011). Expatriation in the Hotel industry: an exploratory study of management skills and cultural training. *International Journal of Contemporary Hospitality Management*, 23(7).
- Clifford, V. (2009) Engaging the disciplines in internationalising the curriculum. *International Journal of Academic Development*, 14(2), pp. 133-143.
- Corder, D. & U-Mackay, A. (2010). Integrating Second Life to enhance global intercultural collaborative projects. *ACM Inroads magazine* (special issue),1 (3).
- Dunn, P. and Marinetti, A. (2006). Beyond Localization: Effective Learning Strategies for Cross-Cultural E-Learning. In A. Edmundson (Ed.), *Globalized E-Learning Cultural Challenges*: 255-266. Hershey, Pennsylvania: Idea Group Inc.
- Dunne, C. (2009) Host Students' Perspectives of Intercultural Contact in an Irish University. *Journal of Studies in International Education*, 13(2): 222-239.
- Fidgeon, P. (2010). Tourism education and curriculum design: A time for consolidation and review? *Tourism Management*, 31(6): 699-723.
- Goh, E. and Ritchie, B. (2011) Using the Theory of Planned Behaviour to understand student attitudes and constraints toward attending field trips. *Journal of Teaching in Travel & Tourism*, 11 (2): 179-194.
- Gretzel, U., Jamal, T., Stronza, A., Nepal, S. (2009) Teaching International Tourism. An Interdisciplinary, Field-Based Course. *Journal of Teaching in Travel & Tourism*, 8(2-3): 261-281.

- Gu, H. and Hobson, P. (2008). The dragon is roaring... The development of tourism, hospitality & event management education in China. *Journal of Hospitality & Tourism Education*, 20(1): 20-29.
- Hall, C. M. and Page, J. (2009). Progress in Tourism Management: From the geography of tourism to geographies of tourism – A review. *Tourism Management*, 30: 3-16.
- India Brand Equity Foundation (IBEF) (2011). Tourism and Hospitality [online]. Available at: <http://www.ibef.org/industry/tourismhospitality.aspx>; retrieved 20 November 2011
- Isacsson, A. and U. Gretzel (2010). Facebook as an edutainment medium to engage students in sustainability and tourism. *Journal of Hospitality and Tourism Technology*, 2(1): 81-90.
- Jackson, E. and Huddart, T. (2008). Curriculum design based on home students' interpretation of internationalisation. *ARECLS*, vol. 7: 80-112.
- Jauhari, V. and Manaktola, K. (2009). Managing workforce issues in the hospitality industry in India, *Worldwide Hospitality and Tourism Themes*, 1(1): 19 - 24
- Jordan, F. (2008). Internationalisation in hospitality, leisure, sport and tourism higher education: a call for further reflexivity in curriculum development. *Journal of Hospitality, Leisure, Sport and Tourism Education*, 7(1): 99-103.
- Kishun, R. (2007). The Internationalisation of Higher Education in South Africa: Progress and Challenges. *Journal of Studies in International Education*, 11(3/4): 455-469.
- Liburd, J. and A. M. Hjalager (2010). Changing approaches towards open education, innovation and research in tourism. *Journal of Hospitality and Tourism Management*, 17(1): 12-20.
- Mitsis, A. and P. Foley (2009). Culturally-anchored values and university education experience perception. *International Journal of Educational Management*, 23(6): 484-504.
- Munar, A. and Montaña, J. (2009). Generic competences and tourism graduates. *Journal of Hospitality, Leisure, Sport and Tourism Education*, 8(1): 70-84.
- Mpofu, T. P. Z. (2009). An assessment of the impact of tourism globalization in Africa. *Journal of Business and Administrative Studies*, 1(2): 1-19.
- Nolan, C., E. Conway, et al. (2010). Competency needs in Irish hotels: employer and graduate perspectives. *Journal of European Industrial Training*, 14(5): 432-454.
- Ploner, J. (2011) A lonesome journey? Internationalisation and the postgraduate research student experience. *Assessment, Teaching and Learning Journal* (Leeds Met), 11 (Summer 2011): 134-147.
- Ring, A., Dickinger, A. et al. (2009). Designing the Ideal Undergraduate Program in Tourism : Expectations from Industry and Educators. *Journal of Travel Research*, 48(1): 106-121.
- Rovai, A. P. and J. R. Downey (2010). Why some distance education programs fail while others succeed in a global environment . *The Internet and Higher Education*, 13(3): 141-147.

- Schott, C. and K. A. Sutherland (2008). Engaging Tourism Students Through Multimedia Teaching and Active Learning. *Journal of Teaching in Travel & Tourism*, 8(4): 351-371.
- Shaw, G. and A. Williams (2009). Knowledge transfer and management in tourism organisations: An emerging research agenda. *Tourism Management*, 30(3): 325-335.
- Smith, R. A. (2008). Joint international hospitality management programs: the case of Cornell-Nanyang Institute of Hospitality Management, Singapore. *Journal of Hospitality & Tourism Education*, 20(1): 38-44.
- Stergiou, D., Airey, D. et al. (2008). Making sense of tourism teaching. *Annals of Tourism Research*, 35(3): 631-649.
- Stohl, M. (2007). We Have Met the Enemy and He Is Us: The Role of the Faculty in the Internationalization of Higher Education in the Coming Decade. *Journal of Studies in International Education*, 11(3/4): 359-372.
- Sulkowski, N. and Deakin, M. (2009). Does understanding culture help enhance students' learning experience? *International Journal of Contemporary Hospitality Management*, 21(2): 154-166.
- Weaver, A. (2009). Perceptions of job quality in the tourism industry: The views of recent graduates of a university's tourism management programme. *International Journal of Contemporary Hospitality Management*, 21(5): 579-593.
- Weaver, M., Vickerstaff, A. et al. (2008). Designing a Full-time Masters Programme for a Culturally Diverse Student Population. Hospitality, Leisure, Sport and Tourism Network [online]; available at: http://www.heacademy.ac.uk/business/resources/detail/BMAF_Publications/Case_Studies/Enhancing_the_International_Learning_Experience, retrieved November 2011.
- Weeden, C., J. Woolley, et al. (2011). Cruise and Learn: Reflections on a Cruise Field Trip. *Journal of Teaching in Travel & Tourism*, 11(4): 349-366.
- Wicaksono, R. (2008). Assessed mixed nationality group work at a UK University: Does it get results? *The Enhancing Series Case Studies: International Learning Experience*. Available at: http://www.heacademy.ac.uk/assets/bmaf/documents/publications/Case_studies/wicaksono.pdf, retrieved November 2011.
- Wright, R., Hind, D. (2011) International field trips – the Tourism & Entertainment Management field trip to The Gambia, West Africa. *Assessment, Teaching and Learning Journal* (Leeds Met), 11 (Summer): 83-92.
- Zehrer, A. and Lichtmanegger, S. (2008). The internationalization of tourism education - the case of MCI. *Journal of Hospitality & Tourism Education*, 20(1): 45-51
- Zehrer, A. and Mössenlechner, C. (2009) Key competencies of tourism graduates: the employers' point of view. *Journal of Teaching in Travel and Tourism*, 9(3): 266–287.