



# THE UNIVERSITY *of* EDINBURGH

## Edinburgh Research Explorer

### **Book review: India and the Indianness of Christianity. Essays on understanding - historical, theological, and bibliographical - in honor of Robert Eric Frykenberg**

**Citation for published version:**

Harding, C 2012, 'Book review: India and the Indianness of Christianity. Essays on understanding - historical, theological, and bibliographical - in honor of Robert Eric Frykenberg' *The Journal of Ecclesiastical History*, vol 63, no. 1, pp. 102-103., 10.1017/S0022046911002491

**Digital Object Identifier (DOI):**

[10.1017/S0022046911002491](https://doi.org/10.1017/S0022046911002491)

**Link:**

[Link to publication record in Edinburgh Research Explorer](#)

**Document Version:**

Publisher final version (usually the publisher pdf)

**Published In:**

*The Journal of Ecclesiastical History*

**Publisher Rights Statement:**

© Harding, C. (2012). Book review: India and the Indianness of Christianity. Essays on understanding - historical, theological, and bibliographical - in honor of Robert Eric Frykenberg. *The Journal of Ecclesiastical History*, 63(1), 102-103. 10.1017/S0022046911002491

**General rights**

Copyright for the publications made accessible via the Edinburgh Research Explorer is retained by the author(s) and / or other copyright owners and it is a condition of accessing these publications that users recognise and abide by the legal requirements associated with these rights.

**Take down policy**

The University of Edinburgh has made every reasonable effort to ensure that Edinburgh Research Explorer content complies with UK legislation. If you believe that the public display of this file breaches copyright please contact [openaccess@ed.ac.uk](mailto:openaccess@ed.ac.uk) providing details, and we will remove access to the work immediately and investigate your claim.



# The Journal of Ecclesiastical History

<http://journals.cambridge.org/ECH>

Additional services for *The Journal of Ecclesiastical History*:

Email alerts: [Click here](#)

Subscriptions: [Click here](#)

Commercial reprints: [Click here](#)

Terms of use : [Click here](#)



---

***India and the Indianness of Christianity. Essays on understanding – historical, theological, and bibliographical – in honor of Robert Eric Frykenberg.*** Edited by Richard Fox Young. (Studies in the History of Christian Missions.) Pp. xi+283 incl. 2 ills. Grand Rapids, Mi-Cambridge: Eerdmans, 2009. £29.99 (\\$45) (paper). 867 0 8028 6392 8

Christopher Harding

The Journal of Ecclesiastical History / Volume 63 / Issue 01 / January 2012, pp 102 - 103  
DOI: 10.1017/S0022046911002491, Published online: 05 December 2011

Link to this article: [http://journals.cambridge.org/abstract\\_S0022046911002491](http://journals.cambridge.org/abstract_S0022046911002491)

**How to cite this article:**

Christopher Harding (2012). The Journal of Ecclesiastical History, 63, pp 102-103  
doi:10.1017/S0022046911002491

Request Permissions : [Click here](#)

## Reviews

---

*India and the Indianness of Christianity. Essays on understanding – historical, theological, and bibliographical – in honor of Robert Eric Frykenberg.* Edited by Richard Fox Young. (Studies in the History of Christian Missions.) Pp. xi + 283 incl. 2 ill. Grand Rapids, MI-Cambridge: Eerdmans, 2009. £29.99 (\$45) (paper). 867 0 8028 6392 8

*JEH* (63) 2012; doi:10.1017/S0022046911002491

It has been the long-standing concern of Robert Eric Frykenberg, Professor Emeritus of History and South Asian Studies at the University of Wisconsin-Madison and author of *Christianity in India: beginnings to the present* (Oxford 2008), to tackle three problems in particular where academic and popular perceptions of Indian Christianity are concerned: the notion that it is a foreign religion in India, for the most part a legacy of European colonialism; a tendency to focus upon the activities of western missionaries, often subjecting them to superficial and distorted interpretation in the service of some broader, vogueish analysis; and the lack of close, theologically- and linguistically-informed attention to how Indians have experienced, understood, and developed Christian ideas and practices on the subcontinent. The fifteen essays in the present volume, addressing the theme of 'understanding', attest both to Frykenberg's own success in applying more rigorous and more Indocentric approaches to Indian Christianity and to his enormous role in inspiring and facilitating the scholarship of others. A warm biographical essay by Richard Fox Young is followed by pieces homing in on Indian agency and expertise, with Daniel Jeyaraj, Fox Young and Chandra Mallampalli looking at South India, Peter B. Andersen at the Santals, and Avril A. Powell at Agra; on the complexities of Hindu-Christian understanding (Geoffrey A. Oddie and John B. Carman); on the nuances of western mission thinking and strategy (Brian Stanley on the 'cult' of Henry Martyn, Wilbert R. Shenk on the (mis)use of the Ancient Churches model, and Michael Bergunder on denominational shifts amongst Indian Christians); and on the dilemmas raised for Indian Christians by Indian nationalism (Gunnel Cederlöf) and later by independent nationhood (Judith M. Brown, on the Nehruvian era). Two concluding essays, by Rosemary Seton and Martha Lund Smalley, remind us of the incredibly rich range of source materials available to modern historians in this area, and will be of great practical use to researchers getting started in this area or seeking to expand their horizons. Some of the contributors here are offering revisions or extensions of previously published material, and none seek to critique or to criticise Frykenberg's approach. But this is a volume that coheres very well indeed, honouring

Frykenberg by renewing his challenge to students and scholars alike to tackle the vivid richness of Indian Christianity on its own complex terms.

UNIVERSITY OF EDINBURGH

CHRISTOPHER HARDING

*Paradise in antiquity. Jewish and Christian views.* Edited by Markus Bockmuehl and Guy G. Stroumsa. Pp. xi+260. Cambridge–New York: Cambridge University Press, 2010. £55. 978 0 521 11786 9

*JEH* (63) 2012; doi:10.1017/S0022046911001783

What comes through in this beautifully produced volume of fourteen essays is not only the many significances of the idea of paradise in ancient Jewish and Christian sources, but also the diversity of modern scholarly interests in the theme. Here only the briefest synopses may be offered. After a wide-ranging introduction by Guy Stroumsa, the book is divided into two parts, the first consisting of six essays on Second-Temple Judaism and the period of Christian origins; the second containing seven more on reinterpretive traditions in the following centuries of late antiquity. Based on a linkage between gardens and kings in the Old Testament, Joachim Schaper discovers royal messianic concepts in the garden references in John xix.38–41. Maren R. Niehoff shows how Philo used the methods of Homeric scholarship (including allegory) to overcome difficulties in the biblical account of paradise. Richard Bauckham concludes that paradise in Pseudo-Philo's *Biblical antiquities*, as in 2 *Baruch*, is understood to have been removed to a heavenly location after the sin of Adam and Eve. Martin Goodman notes Josephus' failure to mention paradise as among the locations of *post-mortem* existence in the notions of his contemporaries, and thus posits that the conception found in Luke xxiii.43 must have been yet in its infancy at that time. Grant Macaskill expounds the three New Testament passages (2 Corinthians xii.4; Luke xxiii.43; Revelation ii.4 [cf. xxii.1–5]) in which the word 'paradise' is used and expounds their significance for Christian Christology and eschatology. Through a comparison with several other early (Gnostic) sources, Simon Gathercole establishes that *Gospel of Thomas* 50 reflects an effort to teach 'methods of passing guardian figures blocking heavenly ascent'. In the initial chapter of part II, Sabrina Inowlocki argues that Tertullian's exposition of the 'law of paradise', as containing *in nuce* the later Law of Moses (*Adversus Iudaeos* 2), is a redeployment of a Jewish tradition in order to subvert it. Yonatan Moss surveys late antique reflections (some, surprisingly, anticipating aspects of modern linguistics) on the original language of paradise. Menahem Kister shows how access to the tree of life was contemplated in Jewish sources as coming through Torah and circumcision, and finds a parallel in Christian appeal to eucharist and baptism. From a phrase in *Genesis Rabbah*, and with reference to a number of ancient and modern texts, Galit Hasan-Rokem offers a reflection on sex as the temporary reminiscence of paradise. Gillian Clark learnedly explores how Augustine the Christian appraised pagan conceptions of the human afterlife, depicted in 'Edenic' terms in Virgil, Cicero and the Platonists. Emille Perreau-Saussine explains how Augustine's city of God/city of man distinction and his anti-chiliasm eschatology work out in a realistic programme for earthly politics. Markus Bockmuehl explores assumptions that paradise still existed in the physical world, along with long-standing attempts to locate it, while showing as well that 'Jews and