



# DIGITAL ACCESS TO SCHOLARSHIP AT HARVARD

## Malaria Life Cycle Intensifies Both Natural Selection and Random Genetic Drift

The Harvard community has made this article openly available.  
[Please share](#) how this access benefits you. Your story matters.

<b>Citation</b>	Chang, H.-H., E. L. Moss, D. J. Park, D. Ndiaye, S. Mboup, S. K. Volkman, P. C. Sabeti, D. F. Wirth, D. E. Neafsey, and D. L. Hartl. 2013. "Malaria Life Cycle Intensifies Both Natural Selection and Random Genetic Drift." <i>Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences</i> 110 (50) (December 10): 20129–20134.
<b>Published Version</b>	<a href="https://doi.org/10.1073/pnas.1319857110">doi:10.1073/pnas.1319857110</a>
<b>Accessed</b>	February 19, 2015 4:07:25 PM EST
<b>Citable Link</b>	<a href="http://nrs.harvard.edu/urn-3:HUL.InstRepos:12872184">http://nrs.harvard.edu/urn-3:HUL.InstRepos:12872184</a>
<b>Terms of Use</b>	This article was downloaded from Harvard University's DASH repository, and is made available under the terms and conditions applicable to Other Posted Material, as set forth at <a href="http://nrs.harvard.edu/urn-3:HUL.InstRepos:dash.current.terms-of-use#LAA">http://nrs.harvard.edu/urn-3:HUL.InstRepos:dash.current.terms-of-use#LAA</a>

*(Article begins on next page)*

1 **Classification:** Biological Sciences

2 **Title:** The malaria life cycle intensifies both natural selection and random genetic  
3 drift.

4 **Short title** for mobile devices and RSS feeds: Selection and drift in the malaria  
5 life cycle

6 **Authors:** Hsiao-Han Chang<sup>a</sup>, Eli L. Moss<sup>b</sup>, Daniel J. Park<sup>b</sup>, Daouda Ndiaye<sup>c</sup>,  
7 Soulyemane Mboup<sup>c</sup>, Sarah K. Volkman<sup>b,d,e</sup>, Pardis C. Sabeti<sup>a,b,d</sup>, Dyann F.  
8 Wirth<sup>b,d</sup>, Daniel E. Neafsey<sup>b</sup>, and Daniel L. Hartl<sup>a</sup>

9 **Affiliations:**

10 <sup>a</sup> Department of Organismic and Evolutionary Biology, Harvard University,  
11 Cambridge, MA 02138;

12 <sup>b</sup> Broad Institute of MIT and Harvard, Cambridge, MA 02142;

13 <sup>c</sup> Faculty of Medicine and Pharmacy, Université Cheikh Anta Diop de Dakar, BP  
14 5005, Dakar Fann, Sénégal;

15 <sup>d</sup> Department of Immunology and Infectious Diseases, Harvard School of Public  
16 Health, Boston, MA 02115;

17 <sup>e</sup> School for Nursing and Health Sciences, Simmons College, Boston, MA 02115

18 **Corresponding author:**

19 Hsiao-Han Chang

20 BioLab 2105, 16 Divinity Avenue, Cambridge, MA 02138

21 Phone: 617-642-7897

22 e-mail: [hhchang@hsph.harvard.edu](mailto:hhchang@hsph.harvard.edu)

23 **Keywords:** *Plasmodium*, life cycle, genetic drift, selection efficiency

24 **Author contributions:**

25 H.-H.C. and D.L.H. designed research; H.-H.C. performed research; D.E.N.,

26 D.F.W., P.C.S., S.K.V., R.C.W., D.N. and S.M. contributed

27 reagents/materials/analysis tools; E.L.M., and D.J.P. processed the raw

28 sequence data; H.-H.C. analyzed data; and H.-H.C and D.L.H. wrote the paper.

29 **Abbreviations:** WF, Wright-Fisher

30 **Significance:** Genomic sequences of 159 isolates of the malaria parasite

31 *Plasmodium falciparum* exhibited highly unusual patterns of single-nucleotide

32 polymorphism. We hypothesized that these patterns might result from the

33 repeated bottlenecks in host–vector and vector–host transmission as well as the

34 intense competition between parasites within a single host. Computer simulations

35 of the malaria life cycle recapitulated the unusual patterns of polymorphism

36 observed. In the classical Wright-Fisher (WF) model in population genetics,

37 random changes in gene frequency caused by finite population size (random drift)

38 diminish the efficiency of natural selection. The trade-off between drift and

39 selection has been widely assumed to be robust to details of the life cycle. In the

40 malaria parasite, however, both selection and drift are simultaneously enhanced.

## 41 **Abstract**

42 Analysis of genome sequences of 159 isolates of *Plasmodium falciparum* from  
43 Senegal yields an extraordinarily high proportion (26.85%) of protein-coding  
44 genes with the ratio of nonsynonymous to synonymous polymorphism greater  
45 than one. This proportion is much greater than observed in other organisms. Also  
46 unusual is that the site-frequency spectra of synonymous and nonsynonymous  
47 polymorphisms are virtually indistinguishable. We hypothesized that the  
48 complicated life cycle of malaria parasites might lead to qualitatively different  
49 population genetics from that predicted from the classical Wright-Fisher (WF)  
50 model, which assumes a single random-mating population with a finite and  
51 constant population size in an organism with nonoverlapping generations. This  
52 paper summarizes simulation studies of random genetic drift and selection in  
53 malaria parasites that takes into account their unusual life history. Our results  
54 show that random genetic drift in the malaria life cycle is more pronounced than  
55 under the WF model. Paradoxically, the efficiency of purifying selection in the  
56 malaria life cycle is also greater than under WF, while the relative efficiency of  
57 positive selection varies according to conditions. Additionally, the site-frequency  
58 spectrum under neutrality is also more skewed toward low frequency alleles than  
59 expected with WF. These results highlight the importance of considering the  
60 malaria life cycle when applying existing population genetic tools based on the  
61 WF model. The same caveat applies to other species with similarly complex life  
62 cycles.

63 **body**

## 64 **Introduction**

65 Malaria, caused by the parasite, *Plasmodium falciparum*, is one of the  
66 major causes of death worldwide. To aid the development of vaccines and drug  
67 treatments for malaria, researchers have studied the *P. falciparum* genome and  
68 identified genes that are essential to malaria parasites as well as genes that are  
69 related to drug-resistance phenotypes using population genetic tools (1-6).

70 Researchers have also focused on particular genes related to drug resistance  
71 and characterized the evolutionary pathways of emerging drug resistance using  
72 *Escherichia coli* and *Saccharomyces cerevisiae* as model systems (7-10).

73 Malaria parasites have a complex life cycle with two types of host  
74 organisms — humans and female *Anopheles* mosquitoes. Malaria parasites are  
75 transmitted from mosquito to humans through the bite of an infected mosquito. In  
76 the human host, the parasite reproduces asexually multiple times, and the within-  
77 human population size increases from  $10-10^2$  at the time of infection to  $10^8-10^{13}$   
78 within a few weeks. When another female mosquito feeds on the blood of the  
79 infected human,  $10-10^3$  malaria gametocytes are transmitted back to the  
80 mosquito host, and these immature gametes undergo maturation, fuse to form  
81 zygotes, undergo sexual recombination and meiosis, and the resulting haploid  
82 cells reproduce asexually and form sporozoites that migrate to the salivary  
83 glands to complete the life cycle (11). These features of the malaria life cycle

84 pose potential problems when attempting to analyze population genetic data  
85 using simpler models of life history and reproduction.

86 Much of population genetics theory is based on the concept of a Wright-  
87 Fisher (WF) population (12, 13). In the WF model, the population size is constant,  
88 generations are non-overlapping, and each new generation is formed by  
89 sampling parents with replacement from the current generation. The major  
90 differences between the malaria life cycle and the WF model are that each  
91 malaria life cycle includes two transmissions, multiple generations of asexual  
92 reproduction, and population expansions and bottlenecks. Before population  
93 genetic inferences can be conducted through analysis based on WF assumptions,  
94 it is necessary to determine whether the malaria life cycle is sufficiently well  
95 described by the WF model. If the life cycle impacts features of population  
96 genetics, then inferences based on conventional interpretations of the WF model  
97 may need to be adjusted.

98 In a previous study based on only 25 parasite isolates, we observed two  
99 unusual patterns in the *P. falciparum* genome that had not been reported in any  
100 other organism (4). First, we observed synonymous and nonsynonymous site-  
101 frequency spectra that were more similar than expected given that  
102 nonsynonymous sites likely experience stronger selection. Second, almost 20%  
103 of the genes showed a ratio of nonsynonymous to synonymous polymorphism  
104 ( $\pi_N/\pi_S$ ) greater than 1. In *D. melanogaster* (14), fewer than 2% of the genes have  
105  $\pi_N/\pi_S$  greater than 1. Because nonsynonymous mutations result in changes to

106 amino acids, they are likely to have a deleterious effect and exist in low  
107 frequencies in the population or be completely eliminated. In other organisms, the  
108 nonsynonymous site-frequency spectrum is more skewed toward low-frequency  
109 alleles than the synonymous site-frequency spectrum; examples include humans  
110 (15-17), *Oryctolagus cuniculus* (18), *Drosophila melanogaster* (19), and *Capsella*  
111 *grandiflora* (20).

112         Potential explanations for these unusual patterns including sequencing  
113 error and annotation error could be ruled out, and dramatically relaxed or  
114 diversifying selection for almost 20% of protein-coding genes seems unlikely.  
115 Although selection on antigens could possibly explain the high prevalence of  
116 genes with  $\pi_N$  greater than  $\pi_S$ , the nonsynonymous site-frequency spectrum is  
117 skewed toward low frequency alleles, which is not what one would expect if  
118 frequency-dependent balancing selection explains the phenomenon. Because of  
119 the complexities of the malaria life cycle, we wondered whether the malaria life  
120 cycle itself could explain part of these unusual patterns. More recent work in *P.*  
121 *vivax*, a close relative with similar life history to *P. falciparum*, also revealed large  
122 numbers of genes with  $\pi_N/\pi_S$  greater than 1 (21), supporting the idea that factors  
123 common to *Plasmodium* species but different from most other species may cause  
124 allele-frequency patterns that deviate from WF expectations.

125         Although the behavior of the WF model is relatively robust to deviations  
126 from many underlying assumptions, there are examples in which the WF model is  
127 known to perform poorly. For instance, it was recently shown that the effect of

128 selection is increased relative to the WF model when the distribution of offspring  
129 number allows occasional large family sizes (22). While Otto and Whitlock (1997)  
130 define a “fixation effective population size,” they also emphasize that it is a  
131 function of the selection coefficient when population size changes in time (23).  
132 Their results highlight the importance of studying the effect of various  
133 reproductive mechanisms on basic evolutionary outcomes. Although there has  
134 been research on the evolution of drug resistance in malaria parasites, in both  
135 mathematical models and computational simulations (24-27), it has not been  
136 ascertained whether the underlying processes of random genetic drift, natural  
137 selection, and their interactions yield outcomes in the malaria life cycle that are  
138 congruent with those of the WF model.

139         Here, we sequenced 159 genomes of *P. falciparum* isolates from Senegal  
140 and studied the patterns of polymorphism. We find virtually identical site-  
141 frequency spectra for synonymous and nonsynonymous polymorphisms, and  
142 26.85% of the protein-coding genes exhibit  $\pi_N/\pi_S > 1$ . To investigate whether the  
143 life cycle could explain the observed unusual patterns of polymorphism, we used  
144 Monte-Carlo simulations to examine how the malaria life cycle influences random  
145 genetic drift, natural selection, and their interactions. First, we compared  
146 quantities from generation to generation between a malaria model and the WF  
147 model, including the number of mutant alleles after one generation and  
148 probability of loss. Second, we considered properties on a longer time scale,  
149 including time to fixation or loss, segregation time, and probability of fixation or



150 loss. Third, we simulated the site-frequency spectrum under a neutral model with  
151 the malaria life cycle. The flexibility of the simulation framework enables us to  
152 investigate various combinations of selection coefficients. Finally, we discuss the  
153 simulation results and suggest how the malaria life cycle could possibly lead to  
154 these unusual population genetic patterns.

155

## 156 **Results**

### 157 **Unusual patterns of genetic diversity**

158       Among genome sequences of 159 isolates of *P. falciparum* from Senegal,  
159 we calculated the ratio of nonsynonymous to synonymous polymorphism ( $\pi_N/\pi_S$ )  
160 for genes with synonymous polymorphism  $\pi_S$  greater than zero. Among 4395  
161 such genes, 1157 (26.85%  $\pm$  0.67%) exhibited a ratio  $\pi_N/\pi_S$  greater than 1. We  
162 also compared the synonymous and nonsynonymous site-frequency spectra, and  
163 found that they are indistinguishable (Mann-Whitney test,  $P$  value = 0.46) (Fig. 1).  
164 These results are consistent with an earlier report based on a much smaller  
165 sample size (4).

166

### 167 **Allele frequency change from generation to generation**

168       The forward-time Monte-Carlo simulation framework of the malaria life  
169 cycle is described in detail below (Fig. 2). The key parameters in the model are:  
170 the selective advantage or disadvantage of a mutant allele within the human host

171 per cycle of asexual reproduction ( $s_h$ ), the selective advantage or disadvantage  
172 of a mutant allele within the mosquito vector per cycle of asexual reproduction  
173 ( $s_m$ ), the transmission advantage or disadvantage of a mutant allele from the  
174 human host to the mosquito vector ( $t_m$ ) and from the mosquito vector to the  
175 human host ( $t_h$ ), the number of human hosts ( $N$ ), the number of mosquito vectors  
176 per human host ( $a$ ), the number of sporozoites and gametocytes transmitted  
177 between the vector and the human host ( $D$ ), the probability that a parasite  
178 undergoes replication in a given asexual cycle ( $P$ ), and the number of asexual  
179 generations that the parasite population remains at its maximum size (i.e. peak  
180 parasitemia) in the human host ( $e$ ). Using this model, we examined random  
181 genetic drift during the malaria life cycle by comparing the probability of loss of a  
182 selectively neutral mutant allele after one complete life cycle (regarded as one  
183 generation in the malaria model) with that after one generation in the WF model.  
184 In the malaria model, the probability of loss of a new neutral allele is as high as  
185 74%, whereas it is approximately  $e^{-1} \approx 37\%$  under the WF model ( $e^{-1}$  is the  
186 probability of observing 0 outcomes in a Poisson model with mean 1, which is the  
187 approximation of a binomial model with large  $n$  and small  $p$  where  $np = 1$ ; the  
188 latter is equivalent to the WF model). Moreover, while the average frequency is  
189 the same, the variance in the frequency of the mutation after one generation in  
190 the malaria model is higher than that in the WF model [5.71 (malaria) vs 1.00  
191 (WF)]. These discrepancies indicate that random genetic drift has much stronger  
192 effects in the malaria model.

193           In the case of a non-neutral allele, the probability of loss in the malaria  
194 model is greater than that in the WF model (Fig. 3A), irrespective of whether the  
195 mutation is beneficial or deleterious. Interestingly, the average number of copies  
196 of a mutant allele one generation after its occurrence is also more extreme in the  
197 malaria life cycle (Fig. 3B). On average, after one generation, beneficial alleles  
198 leave more copies than in the WF model, and deleterious alleles leave fewer  
199 copies, suggesting that selection works more efficiently in the malaria life cycle.  
200 This result is in contrast to that expected from existing population genetic theory.  
201 It is commonly thought that, when random genetic drift increases, the selection  
202 efficiency must decrease (28). The results in Fig. 3 imply that, in the malaria life  
203 cycle, random genetic drift and selection efficiency can increase simultaneously.

204           We tested whether the difference between the malaria life cycle and the  
205 WF model is sensitive to other parameters by varying the values of other  
206 parameters in the simulation including  $a$ ,  $e$ ,  $P$  and  $D$ . The results show  
207 differences in detail, but are qualitatively consistent (Fig. S1).

208

### 209 **Allele frequency change on a longer time scale**

210           We then considered properties on a longer time scale, including the  
211 segregation time (the average time until a mutation becomes fixed or lost in the  
212 population), the time to fixation, time to loss, and the fixation probability. We  
213 treated one complete life cycle as one generation in the malaria model and  
214 compared it with one generation in the WF model. The results indicate that the

215 segregation time in the malaria model is shorter than in the WF model (Fig. 4A).  
216 The mutations segregate on average for less than 8 generations in the malaria  
217 model, even when the selection coefficient is as high as 0.1, because of the  
218 enhanced genetic drift during the malaria life cycle. The shortening of the  
219 segregation time also indicates that a large proportion of segregating sites in the  
220 genome of malaria parasites are likely to be recently derived.

221         The time to fixation for beneficial mutations in the malaria model is shorter  
222 than that in the WF model when the selection coefficient is smaller than a  
223 threshold value, and longer for larger selection coefficients (Fig. 4B). When the  
224 selection coefficient is small, the time to fixation of beneficial mutations is shorter  
225 in the malaria model because, after a mutation becomes fixed in the population of  
226 parasites infecting one host, it benefits from a greater increment in allele  
227 frequency in each generation because of the transmission of multiple parasites  
228 between human and mosquito. However, in the simulation shown in Fig. 4B,  
229 because only the within-host selection coefficient ( $s_h$  or  $s_m$ ) is positive and the  
230 transmission coefficient ( $t_M$  or  $t_H$ ) is 0, there is no transmission advantage  
231 between hosts for a beneficial allele and this could lower the fixation time. Thus,  
232 when the selection coefficient exceeds a threshold, selection in the WF model is  
233 so efficient that fixation takes less time than in the malaria model in spite of the  
234 transmission of multiple parasites. Nevertheless, the probability of fixation of  
235 beneficial alleles in the malaria model is always smaller than that in the WF

236 model (Fig. 4C) owing to the enhanced random genetic drift and the stochastic  
237 nature of parasite transmission among hosts.

238 The time to loss for deleterious mutations in the malaria model is also  
239 shorter than that in the WF model (Fig. 4D), suggesting that purifying selection is  
240 more efficient in the malaria model and deleterious mutations are removed from  
241 the population very quickly, hence segregating mutations in the malaria parasite  
242 are less likely to be deleterious than mutations observed in other organisms with  
243 similar effective population sizes that evolve in accord with the WF model.

244 We examined whether these results are sensitive to values of parameters  
245 other than the selection coefficient by varying the values of the parameters  $a$ ,  $e$ ,  
246  $P$  and  $D$  in the simulation. The results are again qualitatively consistent and differ  
247 only quantitatively (Fig. S2).

248

## 249 **Preferential transmission**

250 It has been suggested that genetic factors influence the rate of conversion  
251 of gametocytes into male or female gametes (29). Because gametocyte  
252 differentiation is critical for forming zygotes in the mosquito host and successful  
253 transmission, transmission between hosts could be affected by mutations in the  
254 parasite genome. We therefore performed the simulations in which transmission  
255 probabilities could be altered by mutations.

256 When mutation only affects the transmission probability ( $t_m$ -only model in  
257 Fig. 5A), beneficial mutations have even shorter segregation times than when

258 selection occurs only in the host ( $s_h$ -only model), and deleterious mutations have  
259 slightly longer segregation times than in the  $s_h$ -only model (Fig. 5A). Fixation  
260 times for beneficial mutations in the  $t_m$ -only model and the  $t_m = s_h$  model are both  
261 shorter than in either the  $s_h$ -only model or the WF model (Fig. 5B), suggesting  
262 that transmission advantage or disadvantage is major determinant of the fixation  
263 time. The fixation probabilities for beneficial mutations in the  $t_m$ -only model and  
264 the  $t_m = s_h$  model are larger than in the  $s_h$ -only model, but still smaller than in the  
265 WF model (Fig. 5C). Among the three malaria models, the  $t_m = s_h$  model has the  
266 greatest efficiency for positive selection because it has higher probability of  
267 fixation and shortest time to fixation for beneficial alleles. All three malaria models  
268 show patterns that are qualitatively different from the WF model.

269

## 270 **Site-frequency spectrum**

271 We also simulated the site-frequency spectrum for neutral alleles when the  
272 sample size is 159, matching the number of genomes sequenced. The result  
273 shows that the malaria life cycle skews the site-frequency spectrum to the lower  
274 frequency alleles (Fig. 6). When interpreted in the WF framework, this skewing  
275 implies an increasing parasite population size. But in the simulations the parasite  
276 and host population sizes do not change; the skewing is entirely the result of the  
277 differences between the actual malaria life cycle and that assumed in the WF  
278 model. The difference is in part due to the population expansion within hosts in  
279 each generation; this makes estimation of parasite demographic history more

280 difficult than in other organisms, and a previous study may overestimate the  
281 population expansion (4). The simulation results also imply that intrinsic  
282 differences in evolutionary processes caused by the complex malaria life cycle  
283 alter the null distributions of tests of selection based on the site frequency  
284 spectrum (30-32). This emphasizes the importance of considering the  
285 complexities of the malaria life cycle when analyzing genomic data to infer  
286 demographic history and to identify genes under selection.

287

## 288 **Discussion**

289         We examined complete genome sequences of 159 malaria parasites from  
290 Senegal and observed that extraordinarily high proportion of genes (26.85% of  
291 4395 protein-coding genes) with  $\pi_N/\pi_S$  ratio greater than 1. We also observed that  
292 the site-frequency spectrum of polymorphisms was indistinguishable between  
293 synonymous and nonsynonymous sites in protein-coding genes. Our simulations  
294 demonstrate that both of these unexpected features in the data could result from  
295 the complex life cycle of malaria and its effects on allele-frequency change. In  
296 comparing the malaria life cycle with the classical WF model, we found that  
297 mutations in the parasite population segregate for a shorter time (Fig. 4A) and  
298 that, for deleterious alleles, the probability of loss is greater (Fig. 3B) and the time  
299 to loss shorter (Fig. 4D). These results suggest that purifying selection works  
300 more efficiently in the malaria life cycle. The malaria parasite shows evidence for  
301 efficient selection that affects base composition at synonymous sites and in

302 intergenic regions, supporting the inference that purifying selection is efficient.  
303 For example, there are significant differences between the C/G to A/T and the  
304 A/T to C/G site-frequency spectra in the genomes of malaria parasites from  
305 Senegal (4). Because purifying selection works so efficiently in the parasite life  
306 cycle, and the probability of loss is so high, most of the segregating mutations  
307 are either very new or very nearly neutral. A corollary result is that the expected  
308 difference between the synonymous and nonsynonymous site-frequency spectra  
309 is reduced.

310 In addition, because of the high efficiency of purifying selection in the  
311 parasite, sites with relatively small selection coefficients could nevertheless have  
312 their ultimate fate determined by selection whereas the same selection  
313 coefficients would segregate as nearly neutral in the WF model. This finding  
314 suggests that polymorphisms at synonymous sites, which are commonly thought  
315 to be effectively neutral or under weak selection, experience more efficient  
316 selection in the malaria parasite. Although both nonsynonymous and  
317 synonymous polymorphisms are expected to be reduced in frequency due to the  
318 enhanced efficiency of selection, one expects a greater effect on synonymous  
319 sites than on nonsynonymous sites because an increased efficiency of selection  
320 will have a greater effect on slightly deleterious alleles than on strongly  
321 deleterious alleles (Fig. S3). The upshot of a greater reduction in  $\pi_S$  than in  $\pi_N$  is  
322 an increased proportion of genes with  $\pi_N/\pi_S > 1$ . It should also be noted that  
323 *P. vivax*, which has a life cycle that is similar to that of *P. falciparum*, also shows



324 a large number of genes with  $\pi_N/\pi_S$  greater than 1 (21). The observed population  
325 genetic patterns are not likely to be due to the structure of the parasite population  
326 being divided between hosts. In a structured population with limited gene flow,  
327 the coalescence time and the level of polymorphism are expected to be higher  
328 than a random-mating population. However, because the structured population  
329 affects both synonymous and nonsynonymous sites, it does not increase  $\pi_N/\pi_S$  or  
330 decrease the expected difference between synonymous and nonsynonymous  
331 site-frequency spectra due to different levels of selective constraints.

332 In regard to positive selection, whether the efficiency of positive selection  
333 is higher or lower with the malaria life cycle depends on the selection coefficient.  
334 When the selection coefficient is small, the time to fixation for beneficial alleles is  
335 shorter than in the WF model. When a mutation increases both the selection  
336 coefficient and the transmission probability, or when a mutation increases only  
337 the transmission probability, the time to fixation in the malaria life cycle is less  
338 than in the WF model across the whole range of simulated selection coefficients.  
339 However, it should be noted that the probability of fixation in the malaria model is  
340 less than in the WF model owing to the enhanced random genetic drift. Otto and  
341 Whitlock (1997) have studied the probability of fixation of beneficial alleles in a  
342 model with cyclical changes in population size, and they emphasize the  
343 importance of the cycle time relative to the time scale of selection. While their  
344 model yields important insights (*e.g.*, the probability of fixation of a mutant allele  
345 depends on when in the population cycle the mutation occurs), the model does

346 not really apply to malaria owing to the natural population subdivision among  
347 hosts. In malaria, each infected host, and each infected vector, represents a  
348 separate local population or deme of parasites. The situation is further  
349 complicated by the fact that the selection coefficient may depend on events that  
350 take place in the host, in the host-vector transmission, in the vector, in the vector-  
351 host transmission, or in any combination of these stages.

352         Looking at the larger picture, random genetic drift and natural selection are  
353 two major forces that shape genetic variation. In standard population genetic  
354 models including the WF model, when population size increases, the influence of  
355 random genetic drift decreases and that of natural selection increases, and  
356 conversely (28). Our main finding reported in this paper is that, in the malaria life  
357 cycle, both random genetic drift and natural selection are intensified  
358 simultaneously. Because of the unique parasite features of multiple asexual  
359 generations, population expansion within hosts, and stochastic transmission in  
360 each iteration of the life cycle, natural selection and random genetic drift can both  
361 increase at the same time. The lack of any tradeoff between random drift and  
362 selection contrasts with classical theoretical population genetics, and it  
363 demonstrates the importance of taking the parasite life cycle into account when  
364 interpreting genomic sequence data. Many microbial populations and parasite  
365 species have population growth and population bottlenecks during their life  
366 cycles, and these species may be affected by similar dynamics. Our results also  
367 suggest that other parasite species that are transmitted among hosts with

368 population-size expansion within hosts may evolve in a way that is qualitatively  
369 different from the Wright-Fisher model. Caution is therefore in order when  
370 interpreting data based on standard population genetic methods in organisms  
371 with unconventional life histories.

372         Recombination is another important force in shaping genomic variation  
373 (33-36). In the malaria life cycle, mutation can happen in any asexual generation  
374 within host or vector, but meiotic recombination takes place only once per life  
375 cycle within the mosquito host. As well, the proportion of multiple infections  
376 differs among geographical locations, and therefore the level of inbreeding differs.  
377 Previous theoretical work has reported the effect of hitchhiking and partial selfing  
378 on genetic variation (37), modeled the hitchhiking effect of drug-resistant alleles,  
379 and demonstrated that selection and recombination cannot be decoupled in the  
380 malaria life cycle (27). While the observed level of linkage disequilibrium in the  
381 Senegal population is very low (4), the next step in the modeling will be to allow  
382 for the possibility of mixed infections in a multilocus model to examine the relation  
383 between transmission intensity and linkage disequilibrium.

384

### 385 **Comparison of malaria with WF across multiple generations**

386         It could be argued that the simulated malaria life cycle shows different  
387 effects of drift and selection from the WF model simply because we treat multiple  
388 asexual generations in one life cycle as one "generation." We therefore  
389 compared the probability of loss and the average number of mutations after

390 multiple WF generations with the model of the malaria life cycle (Fig. S4). The  
391 comparison makes it clear that, even if we increase the generation numbers in  
392 the WF model, the malaria life cycle gives qualitatively different results from the  
393 WF model. The change in probability of loss as a function of change in selection  
394 coefficient is consistently greater in the malaria life cycle.

395         The finding that the discrepancies between malaria and the WF model  
396 cannot simply be remedied by redefining a "generation" in malaria is somewhat  
397 reassuring. Malaria researchers traditionally regard a single malaria "generation"  
398 as the time between sexual cycles. If the number of asexual cell divisions  
399 between sexual cycles also had to be taken into account, then certain oddities  
400 would arise. For example, applying the same logic to humans would produce a  
401 generation time in males that is substantially longer than that in females owing to  
402 the larger number of germ-cell divisions in males.

403

#### 404 **An "effective $s$ " for malaria?**

405         The effective population size of a real population is defined as the  
406 population size of an ideal population that has the same level of random genetic  
407 drift as the population of interest (12). This concept is useful when the population  
408 under consideration deviates in specified ways from the WF model. In principle,  
409 one could try to define an "effective selection coefficient" in malaria and use this  
410 to make predictions or inferences from tools based on the WF model. The  
411 effective selection coefficient for malaria would correspond to that in an ideal WF

412 model that has the same population dynamics as in the malaria model. To  
413 evaluate the feasibility of this approach, we identified selection coefficients in the  
414 WF model that have the same probability of loss and average number of  
415 mutations as in the malaria model (Table S1). We found that it is not possible to  
416 fit these two properties at the same time, and hence an effective selection  
417 coefficient that holds for all aspects of the population dynamics does not exist.

418

### 419 **Comparison with selectively neutral conditions**

420 Besides comparing the absolute values of time to fixation or probabilities  
421 of fixation in the two models, we also examined the ratio of these quantities in the  
422 neutral case in the malaria model versus the WF model (Fig. S5). Fig. S5 shows  
423 that both the relative time to fixation of beneficial alleles and the relative time to  
424 loss of deleterious alleles are longer in the malaria model. This difference  
425 indicates that equal transmission probability among hosts reduces the fold-  
426 difference between the neutral and selective cases. However, for deleterious  
427 mutations, the absolute time to loss is probably more relevant than the relative  
428 values because most of deleterious mutations are lost within few asexual  
429 generations in the host in which the mutation happens, and therefore neutral  
430 transmission among hosts does not play an important role. Random genetic drift  
431 (and the probability of loss) is so high that even neutral mutations are quickly lost,  
432 and the fold-difference between deleterious mutations and neutral mutations is

433 smaller than in the WF model. Hence, this result also supports the conclusion of  
434 greater efficiency of purifying selection during the malaria life cycle.

435

436 In summary, this study used computer simulation to investigate the effect  
437 of the malaria life cycle on population genetic behaviors. The results suggest that  
438 both genetic drift and the efficiency of purifying selection are intensified by the  
439 malaria life cycle. Because these two properties typically cannot be enhanced at  
440 the same time in traditional models, this demonstrates the intrinsic differences  
441 between the WF model and the malaria life cycle. Furthermore, the site-  
442 frequency spectrum in the malaria model is more skewed toward low frequency  
443 alleles even if the host population size remains constant. Our study suggests that  
444 malaria life cycle itself leads to unusual patterns of polymorphism, and hence life  
445 cycle should be considered explicitly in order to study the evolution of malaria  
446 parasites or other organisms with similar life cycle through patterns of genetic  
447 diversity.

448

## 449 **Materials and Methods**

### 450 **Dataset and data processing**

451 A total of 159 isolates of *P. falciparum* from Senegal were sequenced and  
452 investigated in this study. Sample preparation method for each isolate is listed in  
453 Table S2. Genomic DNA was sequenced using Illumina HiSeq machines and  
454 sequence reads were aligned to the *P. falciparum* 3D7 reference genome (38)

455 from PlasmoDB version 9.0 (<http://PlasmoDB.org>) using Burrows-Wheeler  
456 Aligner (BWA) 0.6.2 (39) and the SAMTools version 0.1.18 (40). Genotypes were  
457 called from the reads for each isolate separately using the GATK Unified  
458 Genotyper version 2.1-13-g1706365 (diploid mode with hard-filtering of  
459 heterozygotes) (41) because calling genotypes jointly calls more heterozygous  
460 calls in error. Picard version 1.473 was used to strip preexisting alignment  
461 annotations from BAM files prior to realigning against our chosen reference  
462 sequence, the PlasmoDB v9.0 3D7 assembly. Sites with PHRED -style GQ  
463 scores above 30 and QUAL scores above 60 were kept. Repeat-rich sequences  
464 near the telomeres of each chromosome were excluded from the analyses (Table  
465 S3) (42). Highly variable *PfEMP1* (*var*) genes were excluded from the analyses  
466 because the reads from these genes are difficult to align to the reference genome  
467 correctly. Sequences were submitted to the NCBI Sequence Read Archives (SRA)  
468 under the accession numbers SRP000316, SRP000493, SRP003502,  
469 SRP007838, SRP007883, SRP007923, and SRP012397.

470

## 471 **Sequence analysis**

472 Nonsynonymous and synonymous polymorphism ( $\pi_N$  and  $\pi_S$ ) were  
473 calculated using the same method as described (4). For the analyses of  
474 synonymous and nonsynonymous site-frequency spectra and polymorphism, we  
475 only used codons where each of the three nucleotides has less than 20% missing  
476 data and less than two nucleotides are polymorphic.

477

478 **Simulation**

479 To simulate the evolution that takes into account the malaria life cycle, we  
480 used the following forward-time Monte-Carlo simulation framework (Fig. 2):

- 481 (i) Assume there are  $N$  human hosts and  $a \times N$  mosquito hosts, with  $D$   
482 parasites (sporozoites) transmitted from the mosquito host to the human  
483 host. The initial condition is the number of mutations in the initial parasite  
484 pool within each human host.
- 485 (ii) Within a human host, the probability of a parasite that carries a particular  
486 allele surviving from one asexual generation to the next is  $P \times (1 + s_h)$ ,  
487 where  $P$  is the probability that a parasite survives and undergoes a given  
488 round of replication and  $s_h$  is selection coefficient of the allele within the  
489 human host. Whether or not a parasite does or does not undergo a round  
490 of asexual reproduction is determined by the outcome of a Bernoulli trial.  
491 Each round of parasite replication creates two daughter cells. The  
492 maximum population size within a single human host is  $N_{eH}$ . After the  
493 population size reaches the maximum, it stays at the same population size  
494 for  $e$  additional WF generations.
- 495 (iii) The number of mosquitoes that obtain parasites (gametocytes) from each  
496 human host is based on multinomial sampling. If the mutation has a  
497 transmission advantage, the human host with the mutation has a  $(1 + t_m)$ -  
498 fold higher probability of transmitting gametocytes to mosquitoes.  $D$



- 499 parasites (gametocytes) are transmitted from the human host to the  
500 mosquito host during each bite.
- 501 (iv) Within a mosquito host, the probability of surviving from one generation to  
502 the next is  $P \times (1 + s_m)$ , where  $s_m$  is the selection coefficient of the allele  
503 within the mosquito host. As in step (ii) in the human host, whether or not  
504 a parasite survives and undergoes a round of replication is determined by  
505 the outcomes of a Bernoulli trial, and if parasites do reproduce, they create  
506 two daughter cells. The maximum population size within the mosquito host  
507 is  $N_{eM}$ . The population size increases until it reaches maximum size.
- 508 (v) The number of humans that acquire parasites (sporozoites) from each  
509 mosquito host is based on multinomial sampling. If the mutation has a  
510 transmission advantage, the mosquito host with the mutation has a  $[(1 +$   
511  $t_h)$ -fold] higher probability to transmit sporozoites to human individuals.
- 512 (vi) Repeat steps (ii) to steps (v) until the mutation becomes lost or fixed in the  
513 entire population. Steps (ii) to (v) correspond to a “generation” in the  
514 malaria life cycle model.

515

516 We repeated the simulation 500,000 times for each initial condition. Table  
517 S4 lists all the relevant parameters and their default values. Unless stated  
518 otherwise, the default values were used in the simulations. Note especially that,  
519 while each human host can transmit parasites to multiple uninfected mosquito  
520 vectors, and each mosquito vector can infect multiple uninfected human hosts,

521 the model does not allow for any human host to be multiply infected by different  
522 parasite lineages. In other words, the simulation model is one of complete  
523 inbreeding. We chose complete inbreeding as the default model to mimic  
524 populations as in Senegal, where most infections are of single parasite  
525 genotypes (43). When selection takes place in the host, mixed infections would  
526 make selection even more efficient, and therefore our finding of enhanced  
527 efficiency of purifying selection would be even stronger if mixed infections were  
528 allowed. Simulations were performed using custom code written in C. This is  
529 available from the authors by request.

530         The results of the WF models used for comparison were also obtained by  
531 simulations. In the malaria model, we treated one complete life cycle as one  
532 generation and compared it with one generation in the WF model. We used  
533 10,000 as the population size in the WF model because the default total parasite  
534 population size is 10,000 (10 transmitted parasites per host  $\times$  1000 hosts). The  
535 results of the WF models with population sizes  $10^3$ ,  $10^8$  and  $10^{11}$  are also shown  
536 in Fig. S6. They are not qualitatively different from those obtained assume a  
537 population size of  $10^4$  and hence do not significantly alter the results of  
538 comparing the WF model with the malaria model.

539

#### 540 **Site-frequency spectrum**

541         To obtain the null site-frequency spectrum that takes into account the  
542 malaria life cycle, we simulated mutations and kept track of them until they

543 became fixed or lost in the population. Then we sampled mutations weighted by  
544 the time that they remained segregating in the population. Mutations that remain  
545 in the population longer are more likely to be sampled. After a mutation was  
546 chosen, we randomly selected one time point during the interval that the mutation  
547 was segregating in the population, and at that time point sampled 159 parasites  
548 from 159 different human hosts, and recorded the allele frequency. To minimize  
549 the computational time for simulating new mutations, we first calculated the  
550 relative probabilities of different initial conditions, and combined the site  
551 frequency spectra according to their weighted average. Initial conditions with  
552 probability less than 1/1000 of the most probable conditions contribute little to the  
553 null distribution and therefore were ignored in the analysis (see Supplementary  
554 Method for more details.).

## 555 ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

556 We thank John Wakeley, Russell Corbett-Detig, Stephen Schaffner, and Danny  
557 Milner for their helpful discussion and suggestions. We thank Ananias Escalante,  
558 Matt Berriman, James Cotton, and Yuseob Kim for reviewing the MS and  
559 providing the valuable comments that greatly improved the MS. This study is  
560 supported by NIH grant AI099105 as well as by grants from the Bill and Melinda  
561 Gates Foundation, the ExxonMobil Foundation, and the NIH Fogarty International  
562 Center.

563

564

## 565 References

- 566 1. Mu J, *et al.* (2010) Plasmodium falciparum genome-wide scans for positive  
567 selection, recombination hot spots and resistance to antimalarial drugs.  
568 *Nat Genet* 42(3):268-271.
- 569 2. Van Tyne D, *et al.* (2011) Identification and functional validation of the  
570 novel antimalarial resistance locus PF10\_0355 in Plasmodium falciparum.  
571 *PLoS Genet* 7(4):e1001383.
- 572 3. Amambua-Ngwa A, *et al.* (2012) Population genomic scan for candidate  
573 signatures of balancing selection to guide antigen characterization in  
574 malaria parasites. *PLoS Genet* 8(11):e1002992.
- 575 4. Chang HH, *et al.* (2012) Genomic sequencing of Plasmodium falciparum  
576 malaria parasites from Senegal reveals the demographic history of the  
577 population. *Mol Biol Evol* 29(11):3427-3439.
- 578 5. Manske M, *et al.* (2012) Analysis of Plasmodium falciparum diversity in  
579 natural infections by deep sequencing. *Nature* 487(7407):375-379.
- 580 6. Park DJ, *et al.* (2012) Sequence-based association and selection scans  
581 identify drug resistance loci in the Plasmodium falciparum malaria parasite.  
582 *Proc Natl Acad Sci U S A* 109(32):13052-13057.
- 583 7. Lozovsky ER, *et al.* (2009) Stepwise acquisition of pyrimethamine  
584 resistance in the malaria parasite. *Proc Natl Acad Sci U S A*  
585 106(29):12025-12030.
- 586 8. Brown KM, *et al.* (2010) Compensatory mutations restore fitness during  
587 the evolution of dihydrofolate reductase. *Mol Biol Evol* 27(12):2682-2690.
- 588 9. Costanzo MS, Brown KM, & Hartl DL (2011) Fitness trade-offs in the  
589 evolution of dihydrofolate reductase and drug resistance in Plasmodium  
590 falciparum. *PloS one* 6(5):e19636.
- 591 10. Toprak E, *et al.* (2012) Evolutionary paths to antibiotic resistance under  
592 dynamically sustained drug selection. *Nat Genet* 44(1):101-105.

- 593 11. Kappe SH, Vaughan AM, Boddey JA, & Cowman AF (2010) That was then  
594 but this is now: malaria research in the time of an eradication agenda.  
595 *Science* 328(5980):862-866.
- 596 12. Wright S (1931) Evolution in Mendelian Populations. *Genetics* 16(2):97-  
597 159.
- 598 13. Fisher RA (1930) *The genetical theory of natural selection* (Clarendon  
599 Press, Oxford).
- 600 14. Langley CH, *et al.* (2012) Genomic variation in natural populations of  
601 *Drosophila melanogaster*. *Genetics* 192(2):533-598.
- 602 15. Torgerson DG, *et al.* (2009) Evolutionary processes acting on candidate  
603 cis-regulatory regions in humans inferred from patterns of polymorphism  
604 and divergence. *PLoS Genet* 5(8):e1000592.
- 605 16. Fujimoto A, *et al.* (2010) Whole-genome sequencing and comprehensive  
606 variant analysis of a Japanese individual using massively parallel  
607 sequencing. *Nat Genet* 42(11):931-936.
- 608 17. Li Y, *et al.* (2010) Resequencing of 200 human exomes identifies an  
609 excess of low-frequency non-synonymous coding variants. *Nat Genet*  
610 42(11):969-972.
- 611 18. Carneiro M, *et al.* (2012) Evidence for widespread positive and purifying  
612 selection across the European rabbit (*Oryctolagus cuniculus*) genome. *Mol*  
613 *Biol Evol* 29(7):1837-1849.
- 614 19. Lee YC & Reinhardt JA (2012) Widespread polymorphism in the positions  
615 of stop codons in *Drosophila melanogaster*. *Genome Biol Evol* 4(4):533-  
616 549.
- 617 20. Slotte T, Foxe JP, Hazzouri KM, & Wright SI (2010) Genome-wide  
618 evidence for efficient positive and purifying selection in *Capsella*  
619 *grandiflora*, a plant species with a large effective population size. *Mol Biol*  
620 *Evol* 27(8):1813-1821.
- 621 21. Neafsey DE, *et al.* (2012) The malaria parasite *Plasmodium vivax* exhibits  
622 greater genetic diversity than *Plasmodium falciparum*. *Nat Genet*  
623 44(9):1046-1050.
- 624 22. Der R, Epstein C, & Plotkin JB (2012) Dynamics of neutral and selected  
625 alleles when the offspring distribution is skewed. *Genetics* 191(4):1331-  
626 1344.
- 627 23. Otto SP & Whitlock MC (1997) The probability of fixation in populations of  
628 changing size. *Genetics* 146(2):723-733.
- 629 24. Hastings IM (1997) A model for the origins and spread of drug-resistant  
630 malaria. *Parasitology* 115 ( Pt 2):133-141.
- 631 25. Hastings IM (2006) Complex dynamics and stability of resistance to  
632 antimalarial drugs. *Parasitology* 132(Pt 5):615-624.
- 633 26. Antao T & Hastings IM (2011) ogoraK: a population genetics simulator for  
634 malaria. *Bioinformatics* 27(9):1335-1336.

- 635 27. Schneider KA & Kim Y (2010) An analytical model for genetic hitchhiking  
636 in the evolution of antimalarial drug resistance. *Theoretical population*  
637 *biology* 78(2):93-108.
- 638 28. Kimura M (1955) Stochastic processes and distribution of gene  
639 frequencies under natural selection. *Cold Spring Harbor symposia on*  
640 *quantitative biology* 20:33-53.
- 641 29. Talman AM, Domarle O, McKenzie FE, Ariey F, & Robert V (2004)  
642 Gametocytogenesis: the puberty of Plasmodium falciparum. *Malar J* 3:24.
- 643 30. Tajima F (1989) Statistical method for testing the neutral mutation  
644 hypothesis by DNA polymorphism. *Genetics* 123(3):585-595.
- 645 31. Fay JC & Wu CI (2000) Hitchhiking under positive Darwinian selection.  
646 *Genetics* 155(3):1405-1413.
- 647 32. Fu YX & Li WH (1993) Statistical tests of neutrality of mutations. *Genetics*  
648 133(3):693-709.
- 649 33. Charlesworth B, Morgan MT, & Charlesworth D (1993) The effect of  
650 deleterious mutations on neutral molecular variation. *Genetics*  
651 134(4):1289-1303.
- 652 34. Begun DJ & Aquadro CF (1992) Levels of naturally occurring DNA  
653 polymorphism correlate with recombination rates in *D. melanogaster*.  
654 *Nature* 356(6369):519-520.
- 655 35. Smith JM & Haigh J (1974) The hitch-hiking effect of a favourable gene.  
656 *Genetical research* 23(1):23-35.
- 657 36. Hill WG & Robertson A (1966) The effect of linkage on limits to artificial  
658 selection. *Genetical research* 8(3):269-294.
- 659 37. Hedrick PW (1980) Hitchhiking: a comparison of linkage and partial selfing.  
660 *Genetics* 94(3):791-808.
- 661 38. Gardner MJ, *et al.* (2002) Genome sequence of the human malaria  
662 parasite Plasmodium falciparum. *Nature* 419(6906):498-511.
- 663 39. Li H & Durbin R (2010) Fast and accurate long-read alignment with  
664 Burrows-Wheeler transform. *Bioinformatics* 26(5):589-595.
- 665 40. Li H, *et al.* (2009) The Sequence Alignment/Map format and SAMtools.  
666 *Bioinformatics* 25(16):2078-2079.
- 667 41. DePristo MA, *et al.* (2011) A framework for variation discovery and  
668 genotyping using next-generation DNA sequencing data. *Nat Genet*  
669 43(5):491-498.
- 670 42. Volkman SK, *et al.* (2007) A genome-wide map of diversity in Plasmodium  
671 falciparum. *Nat Genet* 39(1):113-119.
- 672 43. Daniels R, *et al.* (2013) Genetic surveillance detects both clonal and  
673 epidemic transmission of malaria following enhanced intervention in  
674 Senegal. *PloS one* 8(4):e60780.

675

676 **Figure legends**

677 **Fig. 1. Synonymous and nonsynonymous site-frequency spectra.**

678 Synonymous and nonsynonymous site-frequency spectra are very similar (Mann-  
679 Whitney test,  $P$  value = 0.46;  $n$  for synonymous and nonsynonymous sites are  
680 4091 and 8778, respectively). Singleton SNPs were excluded in this analysis to  
681 reduce the effect of sequencing errors.

682

683 **Fig. 2. Simulation diagram.** The simulation model is complete inbreeding  
684 because it does not allow for any human host to be multiply infected by parasite  
685 lineages from different mosquito vectors. The definitions of parameters are  
686 shown in the main text and Table S4.

687

688 **Fig. 3. Comparison of probability of loss and average number of mutations**  
689 **after one generation between the malaria life cycle and the WF model. (A)**

690 Probability of loss is greater in the malaria model. **(B)** Average number of  
691 mutations after one generation is more extreme in the malaria model except  
692 when the mutation is neutral.

693

694 **Fig. 4. Comparison of longer time scale properties between the malaria life**  
695 **cycle and the WF model. (A)** Segregation time is shorter in the malaria model.

696 **(B)** Time to fixation for beneficial alleles is shorter in the malaria model when the  
697 selection coefficient is smaller than threshold value ( $s = 0.01$  under the default  
698 settings), and is greater than in the WF model if the selection coefficient exceeds

699 the threshold. **(C)** Probability of fixation of beneficial alleles in the malaria model  
700 is smaller than in the WF model, due to greater effects of random genetic drift  
701 and stochastic transmission among hosts in the malaria life cycle. **(D)** Time to  
702 loss of deleterious alleles is shorter in the malaria model, suggesting highly  
703 efficient purifying selection in the malaria parasite.

704

705 **Fig. 5. Simulations for non-neutral transmissions.** In the " $s_h$ -only" model (red  
706 line), only  $s_h$  varies and transmission probabilities are all the same. In the " $t_m$ -  
707 only" model (yellow line), only  $t_m$  varies and  $s_h$  are all zero. In the " $t_m = s_h$ " model  
708 (blue line),  $t_m$  and  $s_h$  are the same. **(A)** In the  $t_m$ -only model, beneficial mutations  
709 have shorter segregation times and deleterious mutations have slightly longer  
710 segregation times than in the  $s_h$ -only model. **(B)** Fixation times for beneficial  
711 mutations in the  $t_m$ -only model and the  $t_m = s_h$  model are both shorter than in the  
712  $s_h$ -only model as well as in the WF model. **(C)** The fixation probabilities for  
713 beneficial mutations in the  $t_m$ -only model and the  $t_m = s_h$  model are larger than in  
714 the  $s_h$ -only model, but still smaller than in the WF model. **(D)** The time to loss for  
715 deleterious mutations is shorter in the  $s_h$ -only model and the  $t_m = s_h$  model than in  
716 the  $t_m$ -only model.

717

718 **Fig. 6. Allele-frequency spectrum of neutral alleles in the malaria model**  
719 **compared with WF.** The allele-frequency spectrum in the malaria model is more  
720 skewed toward lower frequency alleles than in the WF model.

721