

Chapman University

Chapman University Digital Commons

History Faculty Articles and Research

History

3-2020

Review of *Colonialism and the Jews*

Shira Klein

Follow this and additional works at: https://digitalcommons.chapman.edu/history_articles



Part of the [Cultural History Commons](#), [History of Religion Commons](#), and the [Jewish Studies Commons](#)

Review of *Colonialism and the Jews*

Comments

This review was originally published in *The Journal of Modern History*, volume 92, issue 1, in 2020.
<https://doi.org/10.1086/707266>

Copyright

University of Chicago Press

Colonialism and the Jews. Edited by *Ethan B. Katz, Lisa Moses Leff, and Maud S. Mandel.* The Modern Jewish Experience. Edited by *Deborah Dash Moore and Marsha L. Rozenblit.* Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 2017. Pp. x+360. \$90.00 (cloth); \$40.00 (paper); \$39.99 (\$39.99).

The anthology *Colonialism and the Jews* seeks to reveal the importance of colonialism in Jewish history and to bring attention to Jews within colonial studies. The editors—Ethan Katz, Lisa Leff, and Maud Mandel—take as their starting point the fact that up until very recently, historians barely explored how Jews interacted with overseas empires. Scholars grounded in modern Jewish studies preferred to analyze Jews within the framework of the nation-state—the Jews of Germany, France, and so forth. Where historians of the Jews did talk of colonialism, most assumed that Europeans brought progress to the Jews of North Africa and the Middle East. This was a simplistic claim, the editors explain, advocating more careful research. The other case in which historians have engaged with the study of empire was in the case of Zionism, where a hot debate developed between those who accuse Zionism of being a colonial endeavor and those who claim it was not. To talk about colonialism and Jews only in the context of Zionism, say the editors, is to flatten the topic. The premise of this anthology is that Jewish studies could merit greatly from considering how Jews interacted with empire. Empire not only transformed the fate of Jews in the colonies, it shaped the identities of Jews in Europe, too.

Just as historians of the Jews have skirted the topic of colonialism, so too historians of colonial studies have shied away from researching Jews. The editors explain this phenomenon through Jews' small numbers (in Europe and in the colonies) and because Jews usually held minority status in imperial settings, often with a different legal standing than the bulk of colonial subjects. Again, the editors argue that students of empire have much to gain from including Jews in their explorations. Jews enrich the field by defying simplistic binaries endemic to the study of the colonies. "Jews were neither exactly masters nor victims of colonial exploitation," write the editors (11).

In more recent years, scholars have begun to fill the lacuna of how Jews interacted with overseas empires. These include historians like Sarah Abrevaya Stein, Emily Gottreich, and Richard Parks, to mention just a few. The editors regard this anthology as inspired by, complementing, and developing their work.

This anthology comprises an introduction and fourteen chapters divided into three parts. Part 1 examines Jews as agents or subjects of empire. The first two essays, by Colette Zytnicki and Susannah Heschel, examine how Jewish scholars in the French and German academies viewed their brethren in North Africa and the Middle East in the nineteenth and early twentieth centuries. They show that Jewish thinkers, like non-Jewish academics, assumed the backwardness of "orientals," but unlike their Christian colleagues, they regarded Jews in North Africa as mediators or emphasized linkages between Judaism and Islam. In the next essay, Adam Mendelsohn traces the extent to which two groups of colonial actors—British Jews returning from Australia and wealthy Asian Jews who moved to England—reshaped British Jewry. Frances Malino, author of the following chapter, traces the lives of North African—and Ottoman-born teachers of the Alliance Israélite Universelle, positing that although they internalized Europeans' orientalism, they defied the Alliance by advocating for women's freedom. Israel Bartal follows with an essay comparing Jews' situation in the Russian empire to their coreligionists' lives in the French empire.

Part 2 examines how Jews navigated colonial politics. Ethan Katz's essay surveys influential French Jewish policy makers, revealing that they advocated reform for Algerian Muslims, even as they accepted the basic assumptions of colonialism. The next essay, by Tara Zahra, portrays Zionism as a form of eastern European "emigrant colonialism," part

of a broader set of aspirations by eastern Europeans to settle abroad. Zionism is also the focus of David Feldman's essay, which argues that the British Labour Party's support for Jewish nationalism before the 1980s stemmed from imperial interests. In the next chapter, David Schroeter dispels the myth that the Moroccan sultan Mohammed Ben Youssef insisted on protecting Jews from the antisemitic Vichy regime, uncovering that his gestures to Jewish leaders had more to do with maintaining his role as a national leader in an imperial context. Maud Mandel's essay examines Jews in Tunisia, showing the role that international Jewish organizations—particularly the World Jewish Congress—played in defining Jewish life in the colony.

Part 3, the final portion of this book, showcases some of the debate on whether Zionism was a colonial movement or not. Derek Penslar argues that even though it had the characteristics of a colonizing movement, Zionism—and Israel from 1948—differed from other colonizers and, in fact, also took the shape of an anticolonial movement and a post-colonial state. Joshua Cole and Elizabeth Thompson both respond to Penslar, the former suggesting that Zionism was not all that different from other examples of colonizing states, and the latter arguing that if one looks not solely at intellectual discourse (as she states Penslar does) but at facts on the ground, one sees very little of the anticolonialism Penslar describes.

While it showcases valuable research, this anthology focuses almost exclusively on intellectual and political history, with little social or cultural history (the exception being Malino's article). The sources employed in most of the essays are the writings of intellectuals, policy makers, and organizations. What about ordinary people engaging in the day-to-day realities of colonialism? What about primary sources such as memoirs, oral histories, novels and poetry, children's literature, paintings, family correspondence, or newspaper advertisements? Such "soft" sources are mostly missing from this volume. Including social history, particularly that of colonized Jews, would have helped shed light on what the editors call "the ambiguities of colonial Jewish *life*" (2). What *did* that life look like? How did colonialism affect the daily routines of, say, a colonized Jewish housekeeper or store owner or school pupil? Additionally, this anthology is less inviting to undergraduates and to the public. Foreign language phrases sometimes go untranslated (56, 102), and somewhat dense paragraphs on postcolonial and anticolonial theory (Penslar's and Cole's essays) will be lost on a lay reader.

These critiques notwithstanding, the editors have produced an impressive volume. It not only enriches our understanding of Jews and colonialism in the Francophone empire and as regards Zionism; it also provides inspiration for those interested in how Jews interacted with other imperial settings—in the West Indies, for instance, or in Italian or German colonial holdings. The questions raised by the editors and authors will help others articulate their research projects. In this respect, it is hard to imagine a future work on the topic of Jews and empire that will not reference this volume.

SHIRA KLEIN

Chapman University