

1	Thermal imprinting modifies bone homeostasis in cold challenged sea bream (Sparus
2	aurata, L.)
3	
4	Ana Patrícia Mateus ^{1,2} , Rita Costa ¹ , Enric Gisbert ³ , Patricia I.S. Pinto ¹ , Karl B. Andree ³ ; Alicia
5	Estévez ³ ; Deborah M. Power ¹
6	¹ Centro de Ciências do Mar (CCMAR), Universidade do Algarve, Campus de Gambelas, 8005-
7	139 Faro, Portugal.
8	² Escola Superior de Saúde, Universidade do Algarve, Av. Dr. Adelino da Palma Carlos, 8000-
9	510 Faro, Portugal.
10	³ Institute for Aquaculture and Food Technology Research (IRTA), 43540 Sant Carles de la Ràpita,
11	Spain.
12	
13	Running title: Thermal imprinting affects bone
14	
15	Corresponding author:
16	Deborah M. Power, CCMAR, Universidade do Algarve, Campus de Gambelas, 8005-139 Faro,
17	Portugal. Email: dpower@ualg.pt
18	
19	Emails:
20	Ana Patrícia Mateus: apmateus@ualg.pt
21	Rita Costa: racosta@ualg.pt
22	Enric Gisbert: Enric.Gisbert@irta.cat
23	Patrícia Pinto: ppinto@ualg.pt
24	Karl Andree: Karl.Andree@irta.cat
25	Alicia Estévez: Alicia.Estevez@irta.cat
26	
27	Key words: Thermal imprinting, bone remodelling, development, phenotypic plasticity, stress
28	response, teleost fish.

29	Summary Statement
30	Variation in water temperature during early development in sea bream alters the response of adult
31	fish to a cold challenge and is associated with a change in whole animal physiology and bone
32	homeostasis.
33	
34	
35	
36	
37	
38	
39	
40	
41	
42	
43	
44	
45	
46	
47	
48	
49	
50	
51	
52	
53	
54	
55	
56	
57	
58	
59	
60	
61	
62	
63	
64 65	
65	

66 Abstract

67 Fish are ectotherms and temperature plays a determinant role in their physiology, biology and ecology and is a driver of seasonal responses. The present study assessed how thermal imprinting 68 69 during embryonic and larval stages modified the response of adult fish to low water temperature. 70 We targeted the gilthead sea bream that develops a condition known as winter syndrome when it 71 is exposed to low water temperatures. Eggs and larvae of sea bream were exposed to four different 72 thermal regimes and then the response of the resulting adults to a low temperature challenge was assessed. Sea bream exposed to a high-low thermal regime as eggs and larvae (HLT, 22°C until 73 74 hatch and then 18°C until larvae-juvenile transition) had increased plasma cortisol and lower 75 sodium and potassium in response to a cold challenge compared to the other thermal history 76 groups. Plasma glucose and osmolality were increased in cold challenge HLT fish relative to the unchallenged HLT fish. Cold challenge modified bone homeostasis/responsiveness in the low-77 78 high thermal regime group (LHT) relative to other groups and ocn, ogn1/2, igf1, gr and tra/β 79 transcripts were all down-regulated. In the low temperature group (LT) and HLT group 80 challenged with a low temperature, ALP/TRAP activities were decreased relative to unchallenged groups and bone calcium content also decreased in the LT group. Overall, the results indicate that 81 thermal imprinting during early development of sea bream causes a change in the physiological 82 response of adults to a cold challenge. 83

84 Introduction

85 Fish are ectotherms and their body temperature is in equilibrium with the external thermal conditions (Mozes et al., 2011). This means that changes in ambient water temperature directly 86 87 affect the cell cycle, metabolism, membrane fluidity and at the molecular level influence transcription, translation, post-translational processing and protein structure (Somero, 2010). The 88 89 overall effect of temperature is apparent as an overt change in whole animal physiology such as 90 growth rate, feeding rate and body composition (Clarke and Johnston, 1999; Greene and Selivonchick, 1987; Wang et al., 1987; Wiegand et al., 1988). Temperature therefore plays a 91 92 determinant role in fish physiology, biology and ecology and is a driver of seasonal responses 93 (Mozes et al., 2011; Somero, 2005). Gilthead sea bream (Sparus aurata L.) is eurythermal and in 94 the wild is exposed to a broad range of ambient water temperatures (11°C to 26°C) and behavioral 95 thermoregulation allows them to avoid temperature extremes (Davis, 1988).

96 Aquaculture production of the gilthead sea bream is concentrated in the Mediterranean, 97 from Turkey to Spain (FEAP, 2015) and since fish are caged they are unable to avoid seasonal 98 fluctuations in water temperature (Tattersall et al., 2012; Tort et al., 2011). Under aquaculture 99 conditions, a prolonged winter with water temperatures below 13°C often leads to mortality of 100 unknown aetiology in sea bream and not strongly associated with a specific pathogen (Padrós et 101 al., 1996; Sarusic, 1999) that has been termed Winter Syndrome or Winter Disease (Tort et al., 102 2011). This syndrome is a multifactorial condition associated with a high but transient (24 to 48 103 hours) rise in plasmatic levels of cortisol and triggers a classical stress response with the 104 associated secondary effects (Rotllant et al., 2000; Sala-Rabanal et al., 2003). A reduction in food 105 intake (Rotllant et al., 2000; Tort et al., 2004) or starvation (Ibarz et al., 2007; Ibarz et al., 2005; 106 Ibarz et al., 2003) occurs and fish affected by winter syndrome become lethargic. 107 Immunocompetence is also severely depressed (Berthe et al., 1995; Doménech et al., 1997; Tort 108 et al., 1998; Vargas-Chacoff et al., 2009), osmoregulatory capacity is impaired (Ibarz et al., 109 2010a) and histopathological changes occur in the liver, exocrine pancreas, digestive tract and muscle (Gallardo et al., 2003; Ibarz et al., 2010a; Ibarz et al., 2010b; Sala-Rabanal et al., 2003). 110 111 Despite the efforts to understand how fish cope with winter syndrome and the mechanisms underlying this disease, no consideration has been given to how variation in water temperature 112 113 during early ontogeny might modulate the response of fish to environmental stressors in adult 114 life, specifically to a cold water challenge.

Bone plays an important role in plasma ion homeostasis, is intimately linked to muscle growth and is essential for load bearing and movement (Hall, 2005). Nonetheless, the impact of temperature on bone is largely unexplored, although evidence exists that low temperature causes metabolic changes (in plasma ions and starvation) that can influence bone homeostasis (Doherty et al., 2015; Takagi, 2001; Vieira et al., 2013). However, the impact of winter syndrome on bone homeostasis and potentially calcium balance and malformations is unstudied.

Recently considerable interest has been focused on determining the impact of thermal 121 122 imprinting during embryonic and larval stages on the phenotypic plasticity of adult fish in part as 123 a response to growing concern about the likely impact of global warming (Somero, 2005; Wood 124 and McDonald, 1997). Thermal imprinting in early stages has a persistent effect on gene 125 expression in subsequent stages (Garcia de la Serrana et al., 2012; Johnston et al., 2009; Jonsson 126 and Jonsson, 2014; Scott and Johnston, 2012) and gene methylation and non-coding RNA have 127 been suggested to contribute to the effect of temperature on developmental plasticity (Bizuayehu 128 et al., 2015; Campos et al., 2014). Evidence has been gathered revealing that the thermal regime 129 during early development can influence the juvenile stress response (Auperin and Geslin, 2008; 130 Varsamos et al., 2006), muscle growth (Alami-Durante et al., 2007; Galloway et al., 1999; Garcia 131 de la Serrana et al., 2012; Johnston et al., 2009; Macqueen et al., 2008; Steinbacher et al., 2011), 132 and the incidence and character of skeletal deformities (Boglione and Costa, 2011). However, 133 little is known about how embryonic or larval temperature regimes affect the ability of fish to 134 cope with temperature changes in adult life. It is known that thermal imprinting in zebrafish 135 (Danio rerio) embryos induce modified thermal tolerance in juveniles exposed to higher than 136 normal culture temperatures (Schaefer and Ryan, 2006), but the effect of temperature during 137 development on the physiological response to cold in adults is unstudied. In addition, the impact 138 of early life temperatures on bone homeostasis have not previously been studied in adult teleost fish. Most of the studies that exist have looked at the effect of increased temperature on skeletal 139 140 development in species such as tilapia (Campinho et al., 2004), European sea bass Dicentrarachus 141 labrax (Koumoundouros et al., 2001), Atlantic salmon (Takle et al., 2005) and gilthead sea bream 142 (Boglione and Costa, 2011) or how it affects the incidence of malformations, an issue of 143 importance to aquaculture (Boglione et al., 2013; Koumoundouros, 2010).

144 Taking into consideration the role of temperature on thermal imprinting and subsequent 145 performance of juveniles and adults and the known vulnerability of the skeleton to temperature 146 induced changes in larvae (Divanach et al., 1996; Polo et al., 1991; Sfakianakis et al., 2011), we 147 hypothesized that early thermal history from embryogenesis through the larvae-juvenile transition 148 might influence the response of bone in adults to changes in water temperature characteristic of 149 winter. To test this hypothesis adult fish with different thermal histories were exposed to a cold 150 challenge typical of that experienced during winter. Since activation of the stress axis has 151 previously been reported in winter syndrome (Rotllant et al., 2000), we assessed the response of 152 adult fish with different thermal histories to a temperature drop by measuring plasma parameters 153 associated with the stress response. The impact of thermal imprinting on bone metabolism during 154 the temperature challenge was assessed by analysis of osteoblast and osteoclast activity by 155 measuring the enzymatic activity of alkaline phosphatase (ALP, Dimai et al., 1998) and tartrate 156 resistant acid phosphatase (TRAP, Persson et al., 1995), respectively, and determining the ash 157 and calcium content of bone and the abundance of transcripts associated with the bone matrix. To

assess if part of the effect of thermal imprinting occurred through modification of factors that regulate bone responsiveness, we analyzed the relative gene expression of regulatory factors like insulin-like growth factor 1 (*igf1*), glucocorticoid receptor (*gr*) and thyroid receptors in bone (*tra* and *trβ*). Overall the objective of the study was to assess if thermal regime during sea bream development could influence the physiological response of young adults to a cold water challenge.

164

165 Material and Methods

166 Early life programming

All the procedures of early life temperature treatments and stress challenge were performed at the Institute for Aquaculture and Food Technology Research (IRTA), St. Carles de la Ràpita, Spain, in a temperature-controlled seawater recirculation system (IRTAmarTM). All animal handling procedures were approved by the Ethics and Animal Care Committee (4998-T9900002) and complied with the guidelines of the European Union Council (86/609/EU), Spanish and Catalan Governments legislation.

173 Detailed information about the thermal imprinting experiments are provided in Garcia de 174 la Serrana et al. (2012). In brief, fertilized eggs of gilthead sea bream (fertilization rate = 92%) 175 were maintained at two different temperatures during embryogenesis, 18°C (low temperature, LT) 176 or 22°C (high temperature, HT) in two independent temperature-controlled seawater recirculation 177 systems. The two systems included two tanks of 2 m³, and each contained two incubators (30 L) containing 110 mL of fertilized eggs. At hatching, larvae from replicate incubators within each 178 179 temperature treatment were pooled, as no differences in hatching rate were observed, and they 180 were then subdivided to generate the four different temperature regimes (2 replicate tanks/group, 181 Fig. 1A). The temperature regimes were selected considering the two extreme temperatures of the 182 optimal range for early life development of gilthead sea bream (18 and 22°C) (Hough, 2010; 183 Mozes et al., 2011): i) 18°C from egg incubation through to hatching and up until larvae-juvenile 184 transition (low temperature, LT); ii) 22°C from egg incubation through to hatching and up until 185 larvae-juvenile transition (high temperature, HT); iii) 18°C from egg incubation up until hatching 186 and then 22°C until larvae-juvenile transition (low-high temperature, LHT); iv) 22°C from egg incubation through to hatching and then 18°C up until larvae-juvenile transition (high-low 187 188 temperature, HLT). All treatment groups of juvenile fish were then maintained for seven months 189 in duplicate 2 m³ tanks per group, in a semi-closed recirculating sea water system with 5-10% water renewal/week, under a constant water temperature regime (21-22°C). Juvenile fish were fed 190 five times per day at 3% (kg/kg fish) with a commercial diet (OptiBreamTM). 191

192 A relatively large stock of thermally imprinted fish (adult fish in which the eggs and 193 larvae were reared under different temperature regimes, approx. 700-900 per thermal regime) were generated and were used for several independent experiments (Garcia de la Serrana et al. 194 195 (2012); Mateus et al., in press). Fish used for the present cold challenge experiment were age 196 matched (7 months' post-hatch). Potential sex-related differences were not expected since the sea 197 bream is a hermaphrodite and during the first year mature as males (Pinto et al., 2006; Zohar et 198 al., 1978). However, significant differences in weight and length existed between fish from the 199 different thermal regimes (P < 0.001; Table 1). The biometric differences detected in the present 200 study between thermally imprinted fish were confirmed in a subsequent stress challenge 201 experiment performed with 9 months post-hatch sea bream from the same stock of fish (Mateus 202 et al., in press).

203

204 Cold challenge and sampling

205 To assess if thermal imprinting could modify the physiological response of young adult 206 sea bream subjected to a cold water challenge, duplicate tanks of fish from each thermal regime 207 (LT, LHT, HT and HLT) were randomly divided into two groups: the water temperature of the 208 control groups was 23.0±1.0°C and the cold challenge groups was 13.0±1.0°C (Fig. 1B). Water 209 temperature was progressively reduced at a rate of 1°C per day, until the target temperature, 13°C, 210 was attained. Sea bream (n=10/group/ tank, see Table 1 for data on body weight, length, condition 211 factor [K] and hepatosomatic index [HSI]) were exposed to reduced water temperature for 15 212 days. The circuit consisted of 200 L fiberglass tanks in a semi-closed sea water system at pH 7.5-213 8.0, 35-36‰ salinity and >80% oxygen saturation and maintained under a 12 h light/12 h dark 214 photoperiod. Fish were fed to satiation and this corresponded to approximately 3% body weight daily using a commercial diet (OptiBreamTM) for the control groups and 1% body weight daily 215 216 for the cold challenge since they would not eat more due to the cold stress. Uneaten food was 217 siphoned daily from the bottom of the experimental tanks.

For sampling, fish were sacrificed with an overdose (450 ppm) of 2-phenoxyethanol (Sigma-Aldrich, USA), blotted dry and blood collected from the caudal vein using a heparinized syringe, centrifuged at 10,000 rpm for 4 minutes at 4°C, and the plasma stored at -20°C. Haemal vertebrae (bone) were collected into RNA later for subsequent RNA extraction, enzymatic assays and calcium and mineral content analysis. Vertebrae samples were incubated overnight at 4°C in RNA later and then stored at -80°C until analyses.

224 Plasma analyses

Plasma cortisol (ng.mL⁻¹) was measured in duplicate using a validated radioimmunoassay (RIA, Rotllant et al., 2005). Plasma osmolality (mmol.Kg⁻¹) was determined using a vapor pressure osmometer (VaproWescor 5520, Utah, USA) and sodium (Na⁺) and potassium (K⁺) concentrations were determined by flame photometry (BWB Technologies, USA) and the results expressed in mM (n=10/group).

Plasma glucose (mmol.L⁻¹) and total calcium (Ca²⁺, mmol.L⁻¹) were measured with
glucose oxidase-peroxidase and o-Cresolphtalein colourimetric assays, respectively (Spinreact
1001190 and 1001061, Spain). Total protein (mg.mL⁻¹) was measured in diluted plasma samples
(1:40) using a colorimetric assay (#500-0006, BioRad, USA) and a standard curve prepared using
bovine serum albumin (Quick Start BSA Standard Set, #500-0207, BioRad, USA). Analysis of
the colourimetric assays was performed using a micro plate reader (Benchmark, BioRad, USA)
set at the appropriate wavelength (510 nm for glucose, 570 nm for Ca²⁺ and 595 nm for protein).

237

Bone TRAP and ALP activities

238 TRAP and ALP activities were measured as described in Guerreiro et al. (2013). Samples 239 of frozen vertebrae (n=10/group) were crushed and then 8-12 mg used for each assay. Two-240 hundred µL of 20 mM Tartrate in NaAc buffer (0.1 M, pH 5.3) was added to 8-12 mg of crushed 241 vertebra and used to determine the TRAP activity. To determine the ALP activity 200 µL of 0.1 242 M Tris-HCl (pH 9.5), 1 mM MgCl₂ and 0.1 mM ZnCl₂ buffer was added to 8-12 mg of crushed 243 vertebra. Each sample was assayed in duplicate and color was developed for 20 min at 24°C before 244 addition of $200 \,\mu$ L of the substrate para-nitrophenyl phosphate (pNPP, 5 mM). The reactions were 245 stopped by adding 200 µL of 2 M NaOH and the absorbance was measured at 405 nm. A standard 246 curve for para-nitrophenol (pNP) was included in each assay and used to establish the amount of product pNP produced (mM) and thus, enzyme activity. TRAP and ALP activities were 247 normalized using bone dry weight and expressed as nmol pNP.min⁻¹.mg⁻¹. 248

249 Calcium and ash content in bone

250 Individual crushed vertebrae samples (n=10/group), cleaned of muscle, were dried at 251 50°C until each registered a constant weight (to the nearest 0.1 mg) in three independent 252 measurements (approximate drying time 48 hours). Ash content in vertebrae was determined by 253 incinerating dried samples at 550°C for 14 hours and then cooling the ashes in a desiccator and 254 determining their weight (precision of 0.1 mg). The ash content was normalized by the dry mass 255 of bone and expressed as mg. Ashes were then digested for 24 hours with 70% nitric acid (200 256 μ l.mg⁻¹ ash) and their calcium content determined using an Agilent Microwave Plasma-Atomic Emission Spectrometer (MP-AES), model 4200 (Agilent Technologies, USA). Calcium 257 258 concentrations were measured in each digested sample, diluted 1:1000 in acidic water (5% nitric

acid), by comparison with a standard curve ranging between 0.5 and 10 ppm (parts per million)

- 260 of calcium (Agilent Calibration Mix Majors 6610030700). Running parameters for MP-AES were
- pump rate 15 rpm, sample uptake time 70 sec, rinse time 40 sec, stabilization time 15 sec, with 5
- replicate readings and the selected options "fast pump during uptake" and "rinse time fast pump"
- in mode "on". Calcium contents were measured at a wavelength of 393 nm and then expressed as
- 264 μ mol.mg⁻¹.

265 Analysis of gene expression by quantitative real-time PCR (qPCR)

266 Total RNA was extracted from crushed vertebrae (n=10/group) using a Maxwell 16 267 System (Promega, USA) and following the manufacturer's instructions. The concentrations and 268 quality of the extracted RNA were determined using a NanoDrop1000 Spectrophotometer 269 (Thermo Fisher Scientific, USA) and by electrophoresis on 0.8% agarose gels. To eliminate 270 genomic DNA the total RNA (2–9 µg) was treated with DNase using a DNA-free kit (Ambion, 271 UK). cDNA synthesis was carried out in a 20 μ L reaction volume containing 500 ng of DNase-272 treated RNA, 200 ng of random hexamers (Jena Biosciences, Germany), 100 U of RevertAid 273 reverse transcriptase (Fermentas, Thermo Fisher Scientific, USA), 8 U of RiboLockRNase 274 Inhibitor (Fermentas) and 0.5 mM dNTPs (GE Healthcare, Spain). The reaction mixture was 275 incubated for 10 min at 20°C followed by 50 min at 42°C and the enzyme inactivated by heating 276 for 5 min at 72°C.

277 Quantitative Real-Time PCR (qPCR) was used to analyze the mRNA expression of a suite 278 of genes characteristic of the bone matrix and associated with its activity, osteocalcin (ocn), and 279 mimecan/osteoglycin 1 and 2 (ogn1 and ogn2) and other genes indicative of a change in bone 280 tissue regulation, igf1, gr, $tr\alpha$ and $tr\beta$ (Collins et al., 1998; Moutsatsou et al., 2012; Sbaihi et al., 281 2007). Duplicate reactions for each individual cDNA were prepared in 15 μ L, containing 10 ng 282 of cDNA, 300 nM of each specific primer and 1 times final concentration of EvaGreen (Sso Fast 283 Eva Green Supermix, Bio-Rad Laboratories, USA). In the case of the reference gene, 18s, only 284 0.01 ng cDNA was used. PCR reactions were carried out in a StepOnePlus qPCR thermocycler 285 and data was analysed with StepOne software v2.2 (Applied Biosystems, UK). qPCR cycling 286 conditions were 30 sec at 95°C, 40 cycles of 5 sec at 95°C and 10 sec at 60°C followed by a final 287 melt curve between 60 and 95°C, which gave single products/dissociation curves in all reactions. 288 Specific primers for each transcript were designed using Primer Premier 5.0 software (Premier 289 Biosoft Int., CA, USA). Primer sequences, amplicon size, amplicon melting temperature, reaction 290 efficiency, R^2 and the accession number of genes are listed in Table 2. Standard curves relating 291 amplification cycle to initial template quantity (in copy number, calculated as in Vieira et al., 292 2012) were generated using serial dilutions of purified and quantified target amplicons. All 293 amplicons were sequenced to confirm qPCR specificity. Control reactions included a no-template 294 control and a cDNA synthesis control (reverse transcriptase omitted).

295 Several reference genes were tested (beta actin, ribosomal protein S18 and 18S ribosomal 296 RNA subunit) and 18s was selected as it did not vary significantly between cDNA samples of 297 vertebrae from adults used in the cold challenge experiment. Relative expression levels were 298 calculated by dividing the detected copy number of the target genes by the reference gene. Results 299 are expressed as Log2 Fold Change and were calculated relative to the control group, which was 300 defined as the experimental animals obtained from larvae maintained at 18°C from egg until the 301 larvae-juvenile transition, since this is the temperature regime frequently used for gilthead sea 302 bream larval rearing (Mozes et al., 2011). The comparisons made and the strategy for statistical 303 analysis is indicated below.

304 Statistical analysis

305 All statistical analysis was performed using the SPSS 22.0 software package (SPSS Inc., 306 Chicago, IL, USA) with statistical significance taken at P<0.05. No significant tank effects were 307 detected and the results for the samples from the duplicate tanks were pooled for statistical 308 analysis (student's t-test). Two-way analysis of variance (two-way ANOVA) was used to assess 309 the interaction between thermal history and the water temperature during the cold challenge 310 experiment for each of the parameters analyzed (biometric, plasma, vertebrae TRAP and ALP, vertebrae minerals and gene expression). Bonferroni adjustment was used for pairwise 311 312 comparisons to identify any significant differences between different thermal history groups 313 maintained at 23±1°C or between different thermal history groups exposed to a cold challenge 314 $(13\pm 1^{\circ}C)$ for each of the parameters analyzed. Any significant differences between fish from the 315 same thermal regime maintained at $23\pm1^{\circ}$ C or exposed to a cold challenge ($13\pm1^{\circ}$ C) was also 316 identified. Dunnett's pairwise comparison was conducted for qPCR results to identify any 317 significant difference between the control group (LT at 23±1°C) and the other groups. Log10 318 transformation of the data was used whenever necessary to achieve either normal distribution or 319 equal variance assumptions. Data is presented as mean \pm standard error of the mean (s.e.m.), 320 unless otherwise stated.

321 **Results**

322 Biometric parameters

323 Two-way ANOVA revealed that body weight and length of adult fish were affected by 324 thermal history (P<0.001), whereas condition factor K was affected by cold temperature challenge 325 (P<0.01, Table 1). HSI was affected by both thermal history and the temperature challenge 326 (P<0.001) and also by the interaction between both factors (P<0.01).

327 Fish from LHT group were significantly heavier and larger (P<0.001) than fish from other 328 thermal groups irrespective of water temperature. However, no significant covariation was

- detected between body mass and the other physiological parameters monitored. Fish exposed to
- a cold temperature challenge ($13\pm1^{\circ}$ C) for 15 days had a significantly higher HSI (P<0.01, LT
- and LHT; P < 0.001, HLT and HT) than those maintained at $23 \pm 1^{\circ}$ C irrespective of their thermal
- history. The condition factor K did not differ significantly between fish with the same thermal
- history maintained at $23\pm1^{\circ}$ C or exposed to $13\pm1^{\circ}$ C. The exception was the LT fish in which K
- was significantly (P < 0.05) lower in the cold challenged ($13 \pm 1^{\circ}$ C) group relative to the fish
- maintained at 23±1°C. No significant differences were found by the end of the experiment in the
- weight or length of fish from the same thermal history maintained at 23°C or exposed to 13°C for
- 337 15 days.

338 Characterization of the physiological response to cold stress

339 Plasma cortisol

340 Two-way ANOVA revealed that plasma cortisol levels were significantly affected by thermal history (P < 0.001), by temperature challenge (P < 0.001) and by the interaction between 341 342 these two factors (P < 0.001, Fig. 2). However, no significant differences in plasma cortisol concentrations were detected between LT, LHT, HT and HLT fish maintained at 23±1°C, 343 344 although values ranged between 60.3±16.6 ng.mL⁻¹ (HT) and 85.0±11.8 ng.mL⁻¹ (LHT; Fig. 2). 345 However, at 13±1°C HLT fish had significantly (P<0.001) higher levels of plasma cortisol 346 $(108.4\pm25.24 \text{ ng.mL}^{-1})$ relative to LT, LHT and HT fish, and LT fish had significantly (P<0.05) 347 higher levels of plasma cortisol (35.0±12.2 ng.mL⁻¹) relative to the LHT fish (1.5±0.36 ng.mL⁻¹). 348 The LT, LHT and HT fish exposed to a cold challenge $(13\pm1^{\circ}C)$ had significantly (P<0.01) lower 349 levels of plasma cortisol than the equivalent group of fish maintained at 23±1°C.

350 Plasma glucose

351 Two-way ANOVA revealed that the interaction between thermal history and temperature 352 challenge significantly (P=0.02) affected the concentration of plasma glucose (Fig. 2). 353 Comparison of plasma glucose levels of the LT, LHT, HT and HLT fish maintained at 23±1°C 354 revealed no significant differences between groups. Similarly, the plasma glucose concentrations 355 in LT, LHT, HT and HLT fish exposed to a cold challenge (13±1°C), did not differ. Comparison 356 of fish with the same thermal history revealed that the concentration of plasma glucose increased 357 significantly (P < 0.01) in the HLT group exposed to a cold temperature challenge (7.8±0.43) 358 mmol.L⁻¹) relative to those maintained at $23\pm1^{\circ}$ C (5.9\pm0.49 mmol.L⁻¹).

359 Plasma Na⁺, K^+ , protein and osmolality

360 Na⁺ and K⁺ plasma concentrations were significantly (P<0.05 and P<0.01, respectively) 361 affected by thermal history and the cold temperature challenge, whereas protein and osmolality 362 were only significantly (P<0.001 and P<0.05, respectively) affected by a cold challenge (Table 363 3). Plasma Na⁺ was also significantly (P < 0.001) affected by the interaction between both factors. 364 Plasma Na⁺, K⁺, protein and osmolality in LT, LHT, HT and HLT fish maintained at 23±1°C were 365 not significantly different (Table 3). Comparison of LT, LHT, HT and HLT fish exposed to a cold 366 challenge (13°C) revealed that the HLT fish had significantly (P<0.01) lower plasma Na⁺ and K⁺. 367 No significant differences were detected in the concentration of plasma Na⁺, K⁺, protein and 368 osmolality when they were compared to fish with the same thermal history maintained at 23°C or 369 exposed to a cold challenge $(13\pm1^{\circ}C)$. The exception was the HLT fish in which the concentration 370 of plasma Na⁺ and K⁺ was significantly (P<0.001 and P<0.01, respectively) lower in cold 371 challenged fish relative to those maintained at $23\pm1^{\circ}$ C. In the HLT group, plasma osmolality and 372 protein were significantly (P < 0.05) higher in the cold challenged fish relative to those maintained 373 at 23±1°C. Plasma calcium levels were not affected by thermal history or by a low temperature 374 challenge.

375

376 Characterization of bone metabolism in response to cold stress

377 TRAP and ALP activity in vertebrae

378 Two-way ANOVA indicated that a cold challenge significantly (P < 0.001) impacted on 379 the TRAP and ALP activities in bone, and that the ALP activity was also significantly (P < 0.01) 380 affected by thermal history (Fig. 3). Comparison of TRAP activity in the haemal vertebrae of the 381 LT, LHT, HT and HLT fish maintained at 23±1°C revealed no significant differences between 382 groups. The ALP activity in the vertebrae of LT and HLT fish was significantly (P=0.009) higher than the HT fish maintained at 23±1°C. The cold challenge (13±1°C) failed to cause a significant 383 384 difference in either ALP or TRAP activities when LT, LHT, HT and HLT fish were compared. 385 Comparison of fish with the same thermal history revealed that a cold challenge caused a 386 significant (P=0.001) decrease in the ALP activities of the LT and HLT groups relative to fish 387 maintained at 23±1°C. Similarly, the TRAP activity of the vertebrae of fish with the same thermal 388 history that were exposed to a cold challenge was significantly (P<0.01) lower in the LT, HLT 389 and HT groups relative to those maintained at 23 ± 1 °C. No significant differences in the 390 TRAP/ALP ratio (data not shown) were detected in fish with the same thermal history that were 391 maintained at 23±1°C or exposed to a cold challenge of 13±1°C for 15 days.

392 *Calcium content in vertebrae*

Two-way ANOVA revealed a significant (P=0.02) effect of thermal history on the calcium content of haemal vertebrae (Table 4). Comparison of the calcium content in the vertebrae of the LT, LHT, HT and HLT fish maintained at $23\pm1^{\circ}$ C revealed no significant differences between groups. Comparison of LT, LHT, HT and HLT fish exposed to a cold challenge $(13\pm1^{\circ}C)$ revealed that the LHT fish had a significantly (*P*=0.03) higher calcium content than fish of the LT regime. No significant differences in ash content of vertebrae were detected in fish with the same thermal history that were maintained at $23\pm1^{\circ}C$ or exposed to $13\pm1^{\circ}C$ for 15 days (Table 400 4).

401 Gene expression in bone in response to cold stress

402 *Transcripts of the bone matrix in vertebrae*

403 Two-way ANOVA revealed that cold temperature challenge significantly (P < 0.01) 404 modified the expression of bone matrix transcripts, ocn and ogn1 (Fig. 4). No significant 405 differences in ocn, ogn1 and ogn2 were identified in the vertebrae of the LT, LHT, HT and HLT 406 fish maintained at 23±1°C. Transcripts of ogn1 and ogn2 were significantly (P<0.05) up-regulated 407 in vertebrae of HLT relative to the LHT fish at 13±1°C. In vertebrae of the cold challenged HLT 408 fish, *ocn* was significantly (P < 0.05) up-regulated relative to the HT fish. Comparison of vertebrae 409 from fish with the same thermal history indicated that a cold challenge caused a significant 410 (P < 0.05) down-regulation of *ogn1* and *ogn2* transcripts in the LHT fish, but no differences were 411 detected in any of the other groups. In the LHT and HT groups, a cold challenge caused a 412 significant (P < 0.05) down-regulation of *ocn* transcripts in vertebrae compared to the same group 413 maintained at 23±1°C. Comparison of gene expression in vertebrae from cold challenged LT, 414 HLT, LHT and HT fish with the LT group at 23±1°C (the temperature frequently used for larval 415 culture, Mozes et al., 2011), revealed significant (P < 0.05) down-regulation of transcripts for *ocn* 416 in the HT fish and *ogn1* in the LT and LHT fish.

417 *Transcripts of regulatory factors in vertebrae*

Two-way ANOVA revealed that when fish with different thermal histories were exposed 418 419 to a cold challenge, gr and igfl expression in vertebrae was modified due to a significant 420 (P=0.001) interaction between thermal history and low temperature challenge (Fig. 5). Similarly, 421 tra and tr β expression was affected by the significant interaction (P<0.01 and P=0.01, 422 respectively) that occurred between thermal history and the cold temperature challenge (Fig. 5). 423 Gr and $tr\alpha$ expression was also significantly (P<0.001) affected by temperature challenge. 424 Comparison of the transcript abundance of *igf1*, $tr\alpha$ and $tr\beta$ in vertebrae of LT, LHT, HT and 425 HLT fish kept at 23±1°C revealed they were similar irrespective of their thermal histories. In 426 contrast, gr was significantly (P<0.05) lower in vertebrae of the HLT fish relative to the LHT fish maintained at 23±1°C. In LT, LHT, HT and HLT fish exposed to a cold challenge (13±1°C), gr 427 and *igf1* expression in vertebrae was significantly (P < 0.01) lower in the LHT relative to HLT 428 429 fish.

430 Comparison of fish with the same thermal history exposed to a cold temperature challenge 431 revealed significant (P<0.05) down-regulation of gr, igf1, $tr\alpha$ and $tr\beta$ in vertebrae from the LHT 432 fish relative to the fish maintained at $23\pm1^{\circ}$ C. In the HT group, a cold challenge caused a 433 significant (P<0.05) down-regulation of gr and $tr\alpha$ in vertebrae relative to the same group 434 maintained at $23\pm1^{\circ}$ C.

435 Comparison of gene expression in vertebrae of the LT group maintained at $23\pm1^{\circ}$ C 436 (control fish) and the LT, HLT, LHT and HT fish that were exposed to cold challenge revealed 437 significant (*P*<0.05) down-regulation of *igf1* expression in the LT and LHT fish, significant 438 down-regulation of *gr*, *tra* and *trβ* in the LHT fish (*P*<0.05) and significant down-regulation of 439 *tra* in LT fish (*P*<0.05).

440

441 Discussion

442 This study is the first to investigate the effect of early thermal history on the response of 443 adult sea bream to a cold challenge and more specifically the potential change in bone activity 444 and the bones likely response to the endocrine system in fish from different thermal regimes. 445 When adult sea bream with different thermal histories were exposed to a cold water challenge 446 they had a different physiological response and overt differences in the stress axis was observed 447 during the study. Significant differences in plasma parameters like glucose, sodium, potassium, 448 osmolality, protein and cortisol occurred between the experimental groups even before cold 449 temperature exposure, suggesting that the early thermal regimes modified their physiology. The 450 HLT thermal regime had the greatest impact on plasma parameters and was significantly different 451 in adults of this group relative to the other thermal groups when they were challenged by a drop 452 in water temperature. The early thermal history also significantly influenced the responsiveness 453 of bone to a cold challenge (13±1°C) and fish from the LHT treatment was the most different 454 from the other groups. In the LHT fish, a cold challenge caused a reduction in the relative 455 abundance of the bone ECM transcripts, osteocalcin and osteoglycin and also transcripts linked 456 with bone responsiveness, suggesting thermal imprinting modified the bone.

457 Thermal challenge and somatic indexes

In line with previous reports, a decrease in water temperature was associated with a significant reduction in feed intake, which is one of the first signs of cold stress (Tort et al., 2004). However, in the present study irrespective of thermal history, the reduction in feed intake as a consequence of a drop in water temperature did not affect body weight or K, which was similar to the matched controls maintained at $23\pm1^{\circ}$ C. These results are in line with other studies of cold challenged sea bream, in which body weight was not affected by low water temperatures (Tort et al., 2004), although HSI was increased as a consequence of the failure to mobilize fat stores (Ibarz 465 et al., 2007; Ibarz et al., 2005). We propose that the maintenance of body weight and K in the 466 present study indicates that sea bream were able to adjust their metabolism to compensate for the 467 effects of a short-term (15 days) cold challenge as it has been shown for other fish (Hochachka 468 and Somero, 1984). Our results contrast with previous studies in which sea bream were unable to 469 maintain their body mass presumably because the water temperature in previous studies was 470 dropped to below 10°C and the fish totally stopped feeding (Ibarz et al., 2003). Overall, our results 471 suggest that thermal imprinting did not influence the capacity of the sea bream to compensate 472 their metabolism when water temperature was reduced.

473 Thermal challenge as a stressor

In the present study, the cortisol response at different time points during the experiment 474 475 was not established and so it was not possible to confirm if a drop in water temperature caused a 476 transient peak in cortisol as previously reported in the gilthead sea bream (Rotllant et al., 2000) 477 and the Atlantic cod (Gadus morhua, Staurnes et al., 1994). Furthermore, increased plasma 478 glucose (a secondary stress marker, Pottinger and Pickering, 1997) was only observed in the HLT 479 group when fish were exposed to 13°C for 15 days. However, the results from several previous 480 studies suggest that the development of hyperglycemia in response to a cold challenge is variable 481 in this species (Sala-Rabanal et al., 2003; Tort et al., 2004; Vargas-Chacoff et al., 2009). Notably, 482 the only group that was hyperglycemic in our experiments (the HLT group) was also the group 483 that had significantly higher plasma cortisol (108.4±71.4 ng.mL⁻¹). A positive correlation between 484 plasma cortisol and glucose has been previously reported in Atlantic cod under cold stress 485 (Staurnes et al., 1994). By the end of the cold challenge, a drastic reduction in plasma cortisol 486 occurred in the LT, LHT and HT groups relative to the same thermal group maintained at 23°C, 487 which is in agreement with the results of previous studies in the gilthead and silver sea bream 488 (Deane and Woo, 2005; Rotllant et al., 2000). The results of the present study indicate that in the 489 gilthead sea bream thermal imprinting modified the cortisol response in adults when they were 490 exposed to a cold challenge, presumably through modifications in the stress axis. In fact, in a 491 previous study, exposure to an acute stress challenge of slightly older fish (9 months old) from 492 the same population of fish revealed that thermal imprinting caused significant changes in the 493 central stress axis (Mateus et al., in press).

The reference resting values for plasma cortisol in gilthead sea bream are between 1-10 ng.mL⁻¹ and for chronic (around 33 ± 34.1 ng.mL⁻¹) and acute stress (162 ± 101.8 ng.mL⁻¹) (Tort, *et al*, 2011) are significantly higher. Surprisingly, plasma cortisol levels in fish maintained at 23°C under standard experimental conditions were those characteristic of a stress response. The elevated cortisol levels may have been a result of the acute stress of capture and handling (Laidley and Leatherland, 1988; Molinero et al., 1997) even though we endeavored to minimize stress during sampling. The results tend to suggest that the stress response in the 13°C challenged LT, 501 LHT and HT groups was suppressed, although the mechanism by which this occurred was not502 established in the present study and will be a target for future studies.

503 The present study confirmed the hypothesis raised by others (Beitinger et al., 2000; 504 Somero, 2005) that thermal history influences thermal tolerance in adult fish. To our knowledge, 505 only one other study has investigated the effects of thermal history on the thermal tolerance of 506 adult fish and it involved exposing zebrafish to high water temperatures (Schaefer and Ryan, 507 2006), but did not assess how the challenge modified physiological and endocrine systems. The 508 results of our study confirm the general notion that non-lethal stress in early life may modify 509 whole animal physiology and favor improved acclimation to stressors in later life (Jones, 2012). 510 However, the results of our study indicate that the characteristics and timing of the stress, in this 511 case temperature, may play a crucial role in determining the impact on adult physiology. For 512 example, the physiological response of the LHT and HLT groups of gilthead sea bream to a low 513 temperature challenge differed. At the end of the cold challenge, the HLT fish had higher glucose 514 and cortisol levels, while the LHT fish had a suppressed cortisol response that reached the resting 515 levels and plasma glucose levels were unchanged, which may suggest that LHT fish were more 516 apt at acclimating to a low water temperature. This supports the notion that embryonic stage may 517 be a critical window of increased susceptibility to temperature induced changes in fish 518 development (Scott and Johnston, 2012; Skjærven et al., 2011).

519

Thermal challenge and plasma parameters

A notable feature in the thermally imprinted fish was that in two independent experiments with 7 month old (present study) and 9 month old (Mateus et al. in press) thermally imprinted sea bream the results for the plasma chemistry under control conditions (23±1°C) were similar. This suggests that thermal imprinting caused a persistent physiological change that was not affected by age or time of year.

525 A drop in water temperature has previously been reported to produce an imbalance in 526 plasma chemistry, which can impact on a number of processes including metabolism and 527 osmoregulation (Donaldson et al., 2008; Ibarz et al., 2010b; Rotllant et al., 2000). Previous studies 528 have revealed that cold water challenge in gilthead sea bream caused an imbalance in plasma ions 529 and most notably a reduction in plasma calcium, sodium and potassium levels (Gallardo et al., 530 2003; Rotllant et al., 2000; Sala-Rabanal et al., 2003; Vargas-Chacoff et al., 2009) and a 531 significant increase in osmolality in juvenile turbot (Scopthalmus maximus, Imsland et al., 2003) 532 and in tilapia hybrids (Oreochromis mossambicus x O. urolepis hornorum, Sardella et al., 2004). 533 The modified plasma ion profile in cold challenged sea bream has been linked to a change in their 534 osmoregulatory capacity, resulting from a change in the morphology of the gill epithelium and a drastic reduction in gill, intestine and kidney Na⁺/K⁺-ATPase activity (Ibarz et al., 2010b). 535 536 Overall, the results for plasma chemistry in the present study suggest that thermal imprinting had 537 differing consequences for the osmoregulatory response to cold challenge in the gilthead sea 538 bream. In particular, the thermal regimes associated with least change in plasma chemistry in 539 response to a cold challenge was the LT and LHT group, while in contrast, the HLT group suffered 540 a significant reduction in plasma sodium and potassium levels and a significant increase in 541 osmolality relative to the matched group maintained at 23°C. The mechanism by which thermal 542 imprinting modified plasma chemistry was not established in the present study, but may result 543 from the changes induced by temperature in the developmental events occurring during embryo 544 and early larval development (Yúfera et al., 2011).

545 Plasma levels of total protein were also modified in fish exposed to a cold challenge and 546 the HLT and HT groups at 13°C had significantly higher plasma protein levels than those of fish 547 from the same thermal history maintained at 23°C. Field based (Guijarro et al., 2003; Vargas-Chacoff et al., 2009) and laboratory studies (Gallardo et al., 2003) have previously reported 548 549 increased total plasma protein concentrations during winter or under lower temperatures, 550 respectively, as a result of increased β_2 - and γ -globulins (Cataldi et al., 1998; Gallardo et al., 551 2003). In the present study, only total plasma protein was measured and it remains to be 552 established if the increase in protein was linked to an increase in the γ -globulins fraction as 553 previously reported (Gallardo et al., 2003). Nonetheless, the significant increase in plasma protein 554 in the HT and HLT group exposed to a cold challenge raises the possibility that early thermal 555 history may modify the immune response in adult fish (Bizuayehu et al., 2015).

556 Thermal challenge and bone homeostasis

557 To evaluate the impact of early thermal history on bone remodeling in adult sea bream 558 maintained under optimal culture temperatures (23°C), we focused on the mineral content, the 559 activity of the enzymes ALP and TRAP (Dimai et al., 1998; Persson et al., 1995), indicators of 560 osteoblast and osteoclast activity, respectively, and typical transcripts of the bone. Transcripts 561 included those encoding ECM proteins, such as osteocalcin (OCN), a protein extremely abundant 562 in the bone ECM that is a marker of late stage osteoblast differentiation, that is essential for 563 mineralization/remodeling (Fraser and Price, 1988; Karsenty and Oury, 2012; Lee et al., 2007) 564 and osteoglycin (OGN1/2), a small leucine-rich proteoglycan found in the extracellular matrix of 565 connective tissue, which is an osteoinductive factor in cows (Bentz et al., 1989; Iozzo, 1997) and 566 is associated with osteoblast differentiation (Kukita et al., 1990; Tanaka et al., 2012). Thermal 567 history did not substantially affect basal bone homeostasis in unchallenged gilthead sea bream as 568 the abundance of ECM transcripts and hormones receptors were similar in all experimental 569 groups. The exception was the ALP enzymatic activity, which was much lower in the HT fish, 570 suggesting their bone remodeling may be modified relative to the other fish, although the 571 reduction of ALP in HT was not linked to modified plasma cortisol, a factor known to suppress 572 ALP in humans (van Straalen et al., 1991).

573 The vertebral bone in gilthead sea bream from different thermal histories had a different 574 response to a cold challenge and the enzymatic activities of TRAP and ALP, and ECM and 575 hormone receptor transcript abundance were modified. The reduction in temperature associated 576 with cold challenge caused a simultaneous reduction in ALP and TRAP enzyme activity in fish 577 of LT and HLT groups. However, only fish from the LT group also had a decrease in bone calcium 578 content and a significant down-regulation of *ogn1*, which in other studies has been shown to be 579 indicative of modified bone remodeling in fish (Pombinho et al., 2004) and rat (Goto and 580 Tsukamoto, 2003). Although in the LHT group exposed to 13°C ALP and TRAP were not 581 significantly modified relative to the matched group at 23°C, ocn and ogn1/2 were significantly 582 down-regulated, which is in line with the results of previous studies on fasted sea bream (Vieira 583 et al., 2013) and type I diabetic mice (Botolin et al., 2005). These results may suggest that later 584 stages of osteoblast differentiation were suppressed, while earlier stages were unaffected. If the 585 changes observed in bone from fish with different thermal histories, arose from epigenetic 586 mechanisms was not established in this study. However, evidences exist that temperature during 587 early development causes epigenetic modulation in the genome in teleosts (Bizuayehu et al., 2015; 588 Campos et al., 2014). Furthermore, in Atlantic cod reared at different temperatures after hatching 589 the expression of miRNAs associated with bone activity was modified (Bizuayehu et al., 2015), 590 and suggests a possible mechanism by which early rearing temperature can influence adult bone.

591 Bone is an emerging endocrine tissue (Blair et al., 2008) and also a target for a number 592 of endocrine hormones, such as glucocorticoids, thyroid hormone and insulin like growth factor 593 that regulate its turnover (Robson et al., 2002). The effect of a cold challenge on the 594 responsiveness of bony tissue in ectotherms and particularly those with different early thermal 595 histories has never been studied. Candidate transcript abundance was similar in all experimental 596 groups at 23°C, suggesting thermal imprinting did not appear to modify basal bone metabolism 597 in adult sea bream. However, thermal imprinting changed the response of bone to a drop in water 598 temperature and *igf1*, associated with growth and bone turnover (Collins et al., 1998; Gabillard et 599 al., 2005; Ono et al., 1996), $tr\alpha$ and $tr\beta$, associated with bone resorption (Blair et al., 2008; Sbaihi 600 et al., 2007) and gr that mediates the effects of cortisol (Moutsatsou et al., 2012), were all 601 significantly down-regulated in the LHT group vertebral bone. These results suggest that a drop 602 in water temperature impairs the responsiveness of bone by repressing the transcription of these 603 genes (Abbas et al., 2012; Larsen et al., 2001) and that this in turn impairs bone remodeling 604 (Suzuki and Hattori, 2002). It would be of interest to directly measure the change in bone ECM 605 proteins to assess the impact of thermal history and cold challenge on vertebral bone mass, but 606 since neither antisera or assays are currently available for fish, this was not possible. Nonetheless, 607 an intriguing observation was that the groups with the most significant down-regulation of bone 608 matrix transcripts (LHT, LT and HT) also had the most notable down-regulation of gr, igfl, $tr\alpha$

- and $tr\beta$. Although a simultaneous decrease in TRAP and ALP activity was detected in HLT group,
- 610 no modification was identified in bone calcium content and ECM transcripts relative abundance
- 611 which may be justified by an unchanged endocrine response in the bone of fish of the HLT group.
- 612 This observation is in line with previous studies which have revealed that disruption of endocrine
- 613 signaling including thyroid (Sbaihi et al., 2007; Takagi et al., 1994) and cortisol in fish (Sbaihi et
- al., 2009) and mice (Sher et al., 2006) modifies bone cell responsiveness to regulatory factors.
- 615 Overall, although thermal imprinting failed to modify bone metabolism and responsiveness in
- optimal ambient water temperatures, it did modify the response of bone to a cold challenge. Future
- 617 studies should be directed at establishing the epigenetic mechanisms underlying this response.
- 618 List of symbols and abbreviations
- 619 GR, glucocorticoid receptor;
- 620 HLT, high-low temperature;
- 621 HSI, hepatosomatic index;
- 622 HT, high temperature;
- 623 IGF1, insulin-like growth factor 1;
- 624 K, condition factor;
- 625 LHT, low-high temperature;
- 626 LT, low temperature;
- 627 OCN, osteocalcin;
- 628 OGN, mimecan/osteoglycin.
- 629 pNP, para-nitrophenol;
- 630 pNPP, para-nitrophenyl phosphate;
- **631** TR α/β , thyroid receptors α or β ;

632 Acknowledgements

- 633 Authors are extremely grateful to G. Macià, M. Matas, S. Molas and M. Monllaó (IRTA) for their
- technical assistance in live prey production and gilthead sea bream larval and juvenile rearing and
- 635 to Vera Gomes (CCMAR) for assistance in MP-AES analysis and Elsa Couto for cortisol
- 636 radioimmunoassay.
- 637 Competing interests
- 638 The authors declare no competing or financial interests.
- 639 Authors' contributions

640 DMP conceived and planned the project. EG, AKB, and EA ran the trials with the fish and 641 the experimental sampling. RC was involved in sorting out samples, registering, changing 642 solutions and maintained all the material under appropriate conditions. APM performed the 643 practical work including plasma analyses and molecular biology. DMP and APM analyzed and 644 interpreted the data and drafted the manuscript. PP coordinated bone mineral content analyses. 645 PP, RC, EG, AKB and EA revised it critically for important intellectual content. All authors have 646 given their final approval of the version to be published.

647 Funding

648 This work was supported by the project Lifecycle EU-FP7 222719. PISP
649 (SFRH/BPD/84033/2012) and RC (SFRH/BD/81625/2011) were supported by the Science
650 Foundation of Portugal.

651 **References**

- Abbas, H. H., Authman, M. M., Zaki, M. S. and Mohamed, G. F. (2012). Effect of Seasonal
 Temperature Changes on Thyroid Structure and Hormones Secretion of White Grouper
 (*Epinephelus aeneus*) in Suez Gulf, Egypt. *Life Sci J.* 9, 700-705.
- Alami-Durante, H., Olive, N. and Rouel, M. (2007). Early thermal history significantly affects
 the seasonal hyperplastic process occurring in the myotomal white muscle of
 Dicentrarchus labrax juveniles. *Cell Tissue Res.* 327, 553-570. doi: 10.1007/s00441-006 0321-2
- Auperin, B. and Geslin, M. (2008). Plasma cortisol response to stress in juvenile rainbow trout
 is influenced by their life history during early development and by egg cortisol content.
 Gen. Comp. Endocrinol. 158, 234-239. doi: 10.1016/j.ygcen.2008.07.002
- Beitinger, T. L., Bennett, W. A. and McCauley, R. W. (2000). Temperature tolerances of North
 American freshwater fishes exposed to dynamic changes in temperature. *Environ. Biol. Fishes.* 58, 237-275. doi: 10.1023/A:1007676325825
- Bentz, H., Nathan, R. M., Rosen, D. M., Armstrong, R. M., Thompson, A. Y., Segarini, P.
 R., Mathews, M. C., Dasch, J. R., Piez, K. A. and Seyedin, S. M. (1989). Purification and characterization of a unique osteoinductive factor from bovine bone. J. Biol. *Chem.*264, 20805-20810.
- Berthe, F. C., Michel, C. and Bernardet, J.-F. (1995). Identification of *Pseudomonas anguilliseptica* isolated from several fish species in France. Dis. Aquat. Org. 21, 151. doi:
 10.3354/dao021151
- Bizuayehu, T. T., Johansen, S. D., Puvanendran, V., Toften, H. and Babiak, I. (2015).
 Temperature during early development has long-term effects on microRNA expression in Atlantic cod. *BMC Genomics.* 16, 305. doi: 10.1186/s12864-015-1503-7
- Blair, H. C., Zaidi, M., Huang, C. L. H. and Sun, L. (2008). The developmental basis of skeletal
 cell differentiation and the molecular basis of major skeletal defects. *Biol Rev.* 83, 401doi: 10.1111/j.1469-185X.2008.00048.x
- 678 Boglione, C. and Costa, C. (2011). Skeletal deformities and juvenile quality. In Sparidae: 679 Biology and aquaculture of gilthead sea bream and other species (ed. M. A. Pavilidis and 680 C. C. Mylonas), pp. 233-294. West Sussex: Wiley-Blackwell. doi: 10.1002/9781444392210 681
- Boglione, C., Gisbert, E., Gavaia, P., E Witten, P., Moren, M., Fontagné, S. and
 Koumoundouros, G. (2013). Skeletal anomalies in reared European fish larvae and
 juveniles. Part 2: main typologies, occurrences and causative factors. *Rev Aquacult.* 5,
 S121-S167. doi: 10.1111/raq.12016
- Botolin, S., Faugere, M.-C., Malluche, H., Orth, M., Meyer, R. and McCabe, L. R. (2005).
 Increased bone adiposity and peroxisomal proliferator-activated receptor-γ2 expression
 in type I diabetic mice. *Endocrinology*. 146, 3622-3631. doi: 10.1210/en.2004-1677
- Campinho, M., Moutou, K. and Power, D. (2004). Temperature sensitivity of skeletal ontogeny
 in *Oreochromis mossambicus*. J. Fish Biol. 65, 1003-1025. doi: 10.1111/j.0022 1112.2004.00505.x
- 692 Campos, C., Sundaram, A. Y., Valente, L. M., Conceição, L. E., Engrola, S. and Fernandes,
 693 J. M. (2014). Thermal plasticity of the miRNA transcriptome during *Senegalese sole*694 development. *BMC Genomics*. 15, 525. doi: 10.1186/1471-2164-15-525
- Cataldi, E., Di Marco, P., Mandich, A. and Cataudella, S. (1998). Serum parameters of
 Adriatic sturgeon *Acipenser naccarii* (Pisces: Acipenseriformes): effects of temperature
 and stress. *Comp. Biochem. Physiol., Part A Mol. Integr. Physiol.* 121, 351-354. doi:
 10.1016/S1095-6433(98)10134-4
- Clarke, A. and Johnston, N. M. (1999). Scaling of metabolic rate with body mass and temperature in teleost fish. J Anim Ecol. 68, 893-905. doi: 10.1046/j.1365-2656.1999.00337.x
- Collins, D., Woods, A., Herd, R., Blake, G., Fogelman, I., Wheeler, M. and Swaminathan,
 R. (1998). Insulin-like growth factor-I and bone mineral density. *Bone.* 23, 13-16. doi: 10.1016/S8756-3282(98)00066-0

- Davis, P. (1988). Two occurrences of the gilthead, *Sparus aurata* Linnaeus 1758, on the coast of
 Northumberland, England. J. Fish Biol. 33, 951-951. doi: 10.1111/j.1095 8649.1988.tb05545.x
- Deane, E. E. and Woo, N. Y. (2005). Cloning and characterization of the hsp70 multigene family
 from silver sea bream: modulated gene expression between warm and cold temperature
 acclimation. *Biochem. Biophys. Res. Commun.* 330, 776-783. doi:
 10.1016/j.bbrc.2005.03.039
- Dimai, H., Linkhart, T., Linkhart, S., Donahue, L., Beamer, W., Rosen, C., Farley, J. and
 Baylink, D. (1998). Alkaline phosphatase levels and osteoprogenitor cell numbers
 suggest bone formation may contribute to peak bone density differences between two
 inbred strains of mice. *Bone.* 22, 211-216. doi: 10.1016/S8756-3282(97)00268-8
- Divanach, P., Boglione, C., Menu, B., Koumoundouros, G., Kentouri, M. and Cataudella, S.
 (1996). Abnormalities in finfish mariculture: an overview of the problem, causes and solutions. Seabass and Seabream Culture: Problems and Prospects. 45-66.
- Doherty, A. H., Ghalambor, C. K. and Donahue, S. W. (2015). Evolutionary physiology of
 bone: bone metabolism in changing environments. *Physiology*. 30, 17-29. doi:
 10.1152/physiol.00022.2014
- Doménech, A., Fernández-Garayzábal, J., Lawson, P., García, J., Cutuli, M., Blanco, M.,
 Gibello, A., Moreno, M., Collins, M. and Domínguez, L. (1997). Winter disease
 outbreak in sea-bream (*Sparus aurata*) associated with *Pseudomonas anguilliseptica* infection. *Aquaculture*. 156, 317-326. doi: 10.1016/S0044-8486(97)00069-0
- Donaldson, M., Cooke, S., Patterson, D. and Macdonald, J. (2008). Cold shock and fish. J.
 Fish Biol. 73, 1491-1530. doi: 10.1111/j.1095-8649.2008.02061.x
- FEAP. (2015). European Aquaculture Production Report 2005-2014 (2016). Available from:
 www.feap.info/shortcut.asp?FILE=1402
- Fraser, J. and Price, P. (1988). Lung, heart, and kidney express high levels of mRNA for the vitamin K-dependent matrix Gla protein. Implications for the possible functions of matrix Gla protein and for the tissue distribution of the gamma-carboxylase. *J. Biol. Chem.* 263, 11033-11036.
- Gabillard, J.-C., Weil, C., Rescan, P.-Y., Navarro, I., Gutierrez, J. and Le Bail, P.-Y. (2005).
 Does the GH/IGF system mediate the effect of water temperature on fish growth? A review. *Cybium.* 29, 107-117.
- Gallardo, M. A., Sala-Rabanal, M., Ibarz, A., Padrós, F., Blasco, J., Fernández-Borras, J.
 and Sánchez, J. (2003). Functional alterations associated with "winter syndrome" in
 gilthead sea bream (*Sparus aurata*). Aquaculture. 223, 15-27. doi: 10.1016/S00448486(03)00164-9
- Galloway, T. F., Kjorsvik, E. and Kryvi, H. (1999). Muscle growth and development in Atlantic
 cod larvae (*Gadus morhua* L.), related to different somatic growth rates. *J. Exp. Biol.* 202,
 2111-2120.
- Garcia de la Serrana, D., Vieira, V. L., Andree, K. B., Darias, M., Estévez, A., Gisbert, E.
 and Johnston, I. A. (2012). Development temperature has persistent effects on muscle
 growth responses in gilthead sea bream. *PloS One.* 7, e51884. doi:
 10.1371/journal.pone.0051884
- Goto, A. and Tsukamoto, I. (2003). Increase in tartrate-resistant acid phosphatase of bone at the
 early stage of ascorbic acid deficiency in the ascorbate-requiring Osteogenic Disorder
 Shionogi (ODS) rat. *Calcif. Tissue Int.* 73, 180-185. doi: 10.1007/s00223-002-2040-3
- Greene, D. H. and Selivonchick, D. P. (1987). Lipid metabolism in fish. *Prog. Lipid Res.* 26, 53-85.
- Guerreiro, P. M., Costa, R. and Power, D. M. (2013). Dynamics of scale regeneration in seawater-and brackish water-acclimated sea bass, *Dicentrarchus labrax. Fish Physiol. Biochem.* 39, 917-930. doi: 10.1007/s10695-012-9751-9
- Guijarro, A., Lopez-Patiño, M., Pinillos, M., Isorna, E., Alonso-Gómez, A., Alonso-Bedate,
 M. and Delgado, M. (2003). Seasonal changes in haematology and metabolic resources
 in the tench. J. Fish Biol. 62, 803-815. doi: 10.1046/j.1095-8649.2003.00066.x

- Hall, B. K. (2005). Bones and Cartilage: Developmental and Evolutionary Skeletal Biology.
 London: Elsevier Academic Press. doi: 10.1016/B978-012319060-4/50000-2
- Hochachka, P. and Somero, G. (1984). *Biochemical Adaptation*. Princeton, New Jersey:
 Princeton Legacy Library.
- Hough, C. (2010). Manual of control of malformations in fish aquaculture. Science and Practice.
 In *Federation of European Aquaculture Producers* (eds. G. Baeverfjord, S. Helland and C. Hough). Luxembourg: RapidPRess.
- 766 Ibarz, A., Beltrán, M., Fernández-Borràs, J., Gallardo, M., Sánchez, J. and Blasco, J. (2007).
 767 Alterations in lipid metabolism and use of energy depots of gilthead sea bream (*Sparus aurata*) at low temperatures. *Aquaculture*. 262, 470-480. doi: 10.1016/j.aquaculture.2006.11.008
- Ibarz, A., Blasco, J., Beltrán, M., Gallardo, M., Sánchez, J., Sala, R. and Fernández-Borràs,
 J. (2005). Cold-induced alterations on proximate composition and fatty acid profiles of
 several tissues in gilthead sea bream (*Sparus aurata*). *Aquaculture*. 249, 477-486. doi:
 10.1016/j.aquaculture.2005.02.056
- Ibarz, A., Fernández-Borràs, J., Blasco, J., Gallardo, M. and Sánchez, J. (2003). Oxygen
 consumption and feeding rates of gilthead sea bream (*Sparus aurata*) reveal lack of
 acclimation to cold. *Fish Physiol. Biochem.* 29, 313-321. doi: 10.1007/s10695-004-33218
- Ibarz, A., Martín-Pérez, M., Blasco, J., Bellido, D., de Oliveira, E. and Fernández-Borràs,
 J. (2010a). Gilthead sea bream liver proteome altered at low temperatures by oxidative
 stress. *Proteomics.* 10, 963-975. doi: 10.1002/pmic.200900528
- Ibarz, A., Padrós, F., Gallardo, M. Á., Fernández-Borràs, J., Blasco, J. and Tort, L. (2010b).
 Low-temperature challenges to gilthead sea bream culture: review of cold-induced alterations and 'Winter Syndrome'. *Rev. Fish Biol. Fish.* 20, 539-556. doi: 10.1007/s11160-010-9159-5
- Imsland, A. K., Gunnarsson, S., Foss, A. and Stefansson, S. O. (2003). Gill Na+, K+-ATPase
 activity, plasma chloride and osmolality in juvenile turbot (*Scophthalmus maximus*)
 reared at different temperatures and salinities. *Aquaculture*. 218, 671-683. doi:
 10.1016/S0044-8486(02)00423-4
- **Iozzo, R. V.** (1997). The family of the small leucine-rich proteoglycans: key regulators of matrix
 assembly and cellular growth. *Crit. Rev. Biochem. Mol. Biol.* 32, 141-174. doi:
 10.3109/10409239709108551
- Johnston, I. A., Lee, H.-T., Macqueen, D. J., Paranthaman, K., Kawashima, C., Anwar, A.,
 Kinghorn, J. R. and Dalmay, T. (2009). Embryonic temperature affects muscle fibre
 recruitment in adult zebrafish: genome-wide changes in gene and microRNA expression
 associated with the transition from hyperplastic to hypertrophic growth phenotypes. J.
 Exp. Biol. 212, 1781-1793. doi: 10.1242/jeb.029918
- Jones, C. B. (2012). Robustness, plasticity, and evolvability in mammals: a thermal niche approach. New York: Springer Science & Business Media.
- Jonsson, B. and Jonsson, N. (2014). Early environment influences later performance in fishes.
 J. Fish Biol. 85, 151-188. doi: 10.1111/jfb.12432
- Karsenty, G. and Oury, F. (2012). Biology without walls: the novel endocrinology of bone.
 Annu. Rev. Physiol. 74, 87-105. doi: 10.1146/annurev-physiol-020911-153233
- Koumoundouros, G. (2010). Morpho-anatomical abnormalities in Mediterranean marine
 aquaculture. In *Recent Advances in Aquaculture Research* (ed. Koumoundouros, G.),
 125-148. Kerala, India: Transworld Research Network.
- Koumoundouros, G., Divanach, P., Anezaki, L. and Kentouri, M. (2001). Temperatureinduced ontogenetic plasticity in sea bass (*Dicentrarchus labrax*). *Marine Biology*. 139, 808 817-830. doi: 10.1007/s002270100635
- Kukita, A., Bonewald, L., Rosen, D., Seyedin, S., Mundy, G. and Roodman, G. (1990).
 Osteoinductive factor inhibits formation of human osteoclast-like cells. *Proc. Natl. Acad.* Sci. U.S.A. 87, 3023-3026. doi: 10.1073/pnas.87.8.3023
- Laidley, C. and Leatherland, J. (1988). Cohort sampling, anaesthesia and stocking-density
 effects on plasma cortisol, thyroid hormone, metabolite and ion levels in rainbow trout,

- Salmo gairdneri Richardson. J. Fish Biol. 33, 73-88. doi: 10.1111/j.1095-815 8649.1988.tb05449.x
 Larsen, D. A., Beckman, B. R. and Dickhoff, W. W. (2001). The effect of low temperature and 817 fasting during the winter on metabolic stores and endocrine physiology (insulin, insulin-818 like growth factor-I, and thyroxine) of coho salmon, *Oncorhynchus kisutch. Gen. Comp.* 819 *Endocrinol.* 123, 308-323. doi: 10.1006/gcen.2001.7677
- Lee, N. K., Sowa, H., Hinoi, E., Ferron, M., Ahn, J. D., Confavreux, C., Dacquin, R., Mee,
 P. J., McKee, M. D. and Jung, D. Y. (2007). Endocrine regulation of energy metabolism
 by the skeleton. *Cell.* 130, 456-469. doi: 10.1016/j.cell.2007.05.047
- Macqueen, D. J., Robb, D. H., Olsen, T., Melstveit, L., Paxton, C. G. and Johnston, I. A.
 (2008). Temperature until the 'eyed stage' of embryogenesis programmes the growth trajectory and muscle phenotype of adult Atlantic salmon. *Biology Letters.* 4, 294-298. doi: 10.1098/rsbl.2007.0620
- Mateus, A. P., Costa, R., Cardoso, J. C., Andree, K. B., Estévez, A, Gisbert, E. and Power,
 D. M. (2017). Thermal imprinting modifies adult stress and innate immune
 responsiveness in the teleost sea bream. *J. Endocrinol.* (in press).
- Molinero, A., Gómez, E., Balasch, J. and Tort, L. (1997). Stress by fish removal in the gilthead
 sea bream, *Sparus aurata*: A time course study on the remaining fish in the same tank. J.
 Appl. Aquacult. 7, 1-12. doi: 10.1300/J028v07n02_01
- Moutsatsou, P., Kassi, E. and Papavassiliou, A. G. (2012). Glucocorticoid receptor signaling
 in bone cells. *Trends Mol Med.* 18, 348-359. doi: 10.1016/j.molmed.2012.04.005
- Mozes, N., Papandroulakis, N., Vergara, J. M., Biswas, A., Takii, K. and Ntatsopoulos, A.
 (2011). Production systems. In *Sparidae: Biology and aquaculture of gilthead sea bream and other species* (eds. M. Pavlidis and C. Mylonas), pp. 169-198). Oxford: WileyBlackwell. doi: 10.1002/9781444392210
- 839 Ono, T., Kanzaki, S., Seino, Y., Baylink, D. and Mohan, S. (1996). Growth hormone (GH)
 840 treatment of GH-deficient children increases serum levels of insulin-like growth factors
 841 (IGFs), IGF-binding protein-3 and-5, and bone alkaline phosphatase isoenzyme. J. Clin.
 842 Endocrinol. Metab. 81, 2111-2116. doi: 10.1210/jcem.81.6.8964836
- Padrós, F., Tort, L. and Crespo, S. (1996). Winter disease in the gilthead sea bream Sparus aurata: some evidence of a multifactorial etiology, in: B. Chatain (Ed.), Seabass and seabream culture: problems and prospects: handbook of contributions and short communications presented at the International Workshop on "Seabass and seabream culture: problems and prospects" Verona, Italy, October 16-18, 1996 (pp. 305-307)
- Persson, P., Takagi, Y. and Björnsson, B. T. (1995). Tartrate resistant acid phosphatase as a marker for scale resorption in rainbow trout, *Oncorhynchus mykiss*: effects of estradiol17β treatment and refeeding. *Fish Physiol. Biochem.* 14, 329-339. doi: 10.1007/BF00004071
- Pinto, P., Teodosio, H., Galay-Burgos, M., Power, D., Sweeney, G. E. and Canario, A. V.
 (2006). Identification of estrogen-responsive genes in the testis of sea bream (*Sparus auratus*) using suppression subtractive hybridization. *Mol. Reprod. Dev.* 73, 318-329.
 doi: 10.1002/mrd.20402
- Pinto, P. I., Matsumura, H., Thorne, M. A., Power, D. M., Terauchi, R., Reinhardt, R. and
 Canário, A. V. (2010). Gill transcriptome response to changes in environmental calcium
 in the green spotted puffer fish. *BMC Genomics*. 11, 476. doi: 10.1186/1471-2164-11476
- Polo, A., Yufera, M. and Pascual, E. (1991). Effects of temperature on egg and larval development of *Sparus aurata* L. *Aquaculture*. 92, 367-375. doi: 10.1016/0044-862
 8486(91)90042-6
- Pombinho, A. R., Laizé, V., Molha, D. M., Marques, S. M. and Cancela, M. L. (2004).
 Development of two bone-derived cell lines from the marine teleost *Sparus aurata*;
 evidence for extracellular matrix mineralization and cell-type-specific expression of
 matrix Gla protein and osteocalcin. *Cell Tissue Res.* 315, 393-406. doi: 10.1007/s00441003-0830-1

- Pottinger, T. and Pickering, A. (1997). Genetic basis to the stress response: selective breeding
 for stress-tolerant fish. In *Fish stress and health in aquaculture* (Eds. G. K. Iwama, A. D.
 Pickering, J. P. Sumpter and C. B. Schreck),pp. 171-193. Cambridge, UK: Cambridge
 Univ. Press
- Robson, H., Siebler, T., Shalet, S. M. and Williams, G. R. (2002). Interactions between GH,
 IGF-I, glucocorticoids, and thyroid hormones during skeletal growth. *Pediatr. Res.* 52,
 137-147. doi: 10.1203/00006450-200208000-00003
- Rotllant, J., Balm, P., Wendelaar-Bonga, S., Pérez-Sánchez, J. and Tort, L. (2000). A drop
 in ambient temperature results in a transient reduction of interrenal ACTH responsiveness
 in the gilthead sea bream (*Sparus aurata*, L.). *Fish Physiol. Biochem.* 23, 265-273. doi:
 10.1023/A:1007873811975
- Rotllant, J., Guerreiro, P., Anjos, L., Redruello, B., Canario, A. V. and Power, D. (2005).
 Stimulation of cortisol release by the N terminus of teleost parathyroid hormone-related
 protein in interrenal cells in vitro. *Endocrinology.* 146, 71-76. doi: 10.1210/en.2004-0644
- Sala-Rabanal, M., Sánchez, J., Ibarz, A., Fernández-Borràs, J., Blasco, J. and Gallardo, M.
 (2003). Effects of low temperatures and fasting on hematology and plasma composition
 of gilthead sea bream (*Sparus aurata*). *Fish Physiol. Biochem.* 29, 105-115. doi:
 10.1023/B:FISH.0000035904.16686.b6
- 886 Sardella, B. A., Cooper, J., Gonzalez, R. J. and Brauner, C. J. (2004). The effect of
 887 temperature on juvenile Mozambique tilapia hybrids (*Oreochromis mossambicus x O.*888 *urolepis hornorum*) exposed to full-strength and hypersaline seawater. *Comp. Biochem.*889 *Physiol., Part A Mol. Integr. Physiol.*, 137, 621-629. doi: 10.1016/j.cbpb.2003.12.003
- 890 Sarusic, G. (1999). Clinical signs of the winter disease phenomenon in sea bream (*Sparus aurata*,
 891 L.). *Bull Eur Assoc Fish Pathol.* 19, 113.
- Sbaihi, M., Kacem, A., Aroua, S., Baloche, S., Rousseau, K., Lopez, E., Meunier, F. and
 Dufour, S. (2007). Thyroid hormone-induced demineralisation of the vertebral skeleton
 of the eel, *Anguilla anguilla*. *Gen. Comp. Endocrinol.* 151, 98-107. doi:
 10.1016/j.ygcen.2006.12.009
- Sbaihi, M., Rousseau, K., Baloche, S., Meunier, F., Fouchereau-Peron, M. and Dufour, S.
 (2009). Cortisol mobilizes mineral stores from vertebral skeleton in the European eel: an
 ancestral origin for glucocorticoid-induced osteoporosis? *J. Endocrinol.* 201, 241-252.
 doi: 10.1677/JOE-08-0492
- Schaefer, J. and Ryan, A. (2006). Developmental plasticity in the thermal tolerance of zebrafish
 Danio rerio. J. Fish Biol. 69, 722-734. doi: 10.1111/j.1095-8649.2006.01145.x
- Scott, G. R. and Johnston, I. A. (2012). Temperature during embryonic development has persistent effects on thermal acclimation capacity in zebrafish. *Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci.* U.S.A. 109, 14247-14252. doi: 10.1073/pnas.1205012109
- 905 Sfakianakis, D. G., Leris, I., Laggis, A. and Kentouri, M. (2011). The effect of rearing
 906 temperature on body shape and meristic characters in zebrafish (*Danio rerio*) juveniles.
 907 *Environ. Biol. Fishes.* 92, 197-205. doi: 10.1007/s10641-011-9833-z
- Sher, L., Harrison, J., Adams, D. and Kream, B. (2006). Impaired cortical bone acquisition
 and osteoblast differentiation in mice with osteoblast-targeted disruption of
 glucocorticoid signaling. *Calcif. Tissue Int.* 79, 118-125. doi: 10.1007/s00223-005-0297 z
- Skjærven, K. H., Olsvik, P. A., Finn, R. N., Holen, E. and Hamre, K. (2011). Ontogenetic
 expression of maternal and zygotic genes in Atlantic cod embryos under ambient and
 thermally stressed conditions. *Comp. Biochem. Physiol., Part A Mol. Integr. Physiol.* 159,
 196-205. doi: 10.1016/j.cbpa.2011.02.026
- Somero, G. N. (2005). Linking biogeography to physiology: evolutionary and acclimatory adjustments of thermal limits. *Front. Zool.* 2, 1-1. doi: 10.1186/1742-9994-2-1
- 918 Somero, G. N. (2010). The physiology of climate change: how potentials for acclimatization and
 919 genetic adaptation will determine 'winners' and 'losers'. *The J. Exp. Biol.* 213, 912-920.
 920 doi: 10.1242/jeb.037473
- Staurnes, M., Rainuzzo, J. R., Sigholt, T. and Jøgensen, L. (1994). Acclimation of Atlantic cod (*Gadus morhua*) to cold water: Stress response, osmoregulation, gill lipid

- 923 composition and gill Na-K-ATPase activity. *Comp. Biochem. Physiol. A Physiol.* 109, 413-421. doi: 10.1016/0300-9629(94)90145-7
- Steinbacher, P., Marschallinger, J., Obermayer, A., Neuhofer, A., Sänger, A. M. and
 Stoiber, W. (2011). Temperature-dependent modification of muscle precursor cell
 behaviour is an underlying reason for lasting effects on muscle cellularity and body
 growth of teleost fish. *The J. Exp. Biol.* 214, 1791-1801. doi: 10.1242/jeb.050096
- Suzuki, N. and Hattori, A. (2002). Melatonin suppresses osteoclastic and osteoblastic activities
 in the scales of goldfish. J. Pineal Res. 33, 253-258. doi: 10.1034/j.1600-079X.2002.02953.x
- Takagi, Y. (2001). Effects of starvation and subsequent refeeding on formation and resorption of
 acellular bone in tilapia, *Oreochromis niloticus*. *Zool. Sci.* 18, 623-629. doi:
 10.2108/zsj.18.623
- Takagi, Y., Hirano, J., Tanabe, H. and Yamada, J. (1994). Stimulation of skeletal growth by
 thyroid hormone administrations in the rainbow trout, *Oncorhynchus mykiss. J. Exp.* Zool. 268, 229-238. doi: 10.1002/jez.1402680308
- Takle, H., Baeverfjord, G., Lunde, M., Kolstad, K. and Andersen, Ø. (2005). The effect of
 heat and cold exposure on HSP70 expression and development of deformities during
 embryogenesis of Atlantic salmon (*Salmo salar*). Aquaculture. 249, 515-524. doi:
 10.1016/j.aquaculture.2005.04.043
- Tanaka, K.-i., Matsumoto, E., Higashimaki, Y., Katagiri, T., Sugimoto, T., Seino, S. and Kaji, H. (2012). Role of osteoglycin in the linkage between muscle and bone. J. Biol. *Chem.* 287, 11616-11628. doi: 10.1074/jbc.M111.292193
- Tattersall, G. J., Sinclair, B. J., Withers, P. C., Fields, P. A., Seebacher, F., Cooper, C. E.
 and Maloney, S. K. (2012). Coping with thermal challenges: physiological adaptations to environmental temperatures. *Compr Physiol.* doi: 10.1002/cphy.c110055
- 948 Tort, L., Pavlidis, M. and Woo, N. Y. (2011). Stress and welfare in sparid fishes. In *Sparidae:* 949 *Biology and aquaculture of gilthead sea bream and other species* (eds. M. Pavlidis and
 950 C. Mylonas), pp. 75-94. Oxford: Wiley-Blackwell. doi: 10.1002/9781444392210.ch3
- Tort, L., Rotllant, J., Liarte, C., Acerete, L., Hernandez, A., Ceulemans, S., Coutteau, P.
 and Padros, F. (2004). Effects of temperature decrease on feeding rates, immune
 indicators and histopathological changes of gilthead sea bream *Sparus aurata* fed with an
 experimental diet. *Aquaculture*. 229, 55-65. doi: 10.1016/S0044-8486(03)00403-4
- Tort, L., Rotllant, J. and Rovira, L. (1998). Immunological suppression in gilthead sea bream
 Sparus aurata of the North-West Mediterranean at low temperatures. *Comp. Biochem. Physiol., Part A Mol. Integr. Physiol.* 120, 175-179. doi: 10.1016/S1095-6433(98)10027 2
- van Straalen, J. P., Sanders, E., Prummel, M. F. and Sanders, G. T. (1991). Bone-alkaline
 phosphatase as indicator of bone formation. *Clin. Chim. Acta.* 201, 27-33. doi:
 10.1016/0009-8981(91)90021-4
- 962 Vargas-Chacoff, L., Arjona, F. J., Ruiz-Jarabo, I., Páscoa, I., Gonçalves, O., Martín del Río,
 963 M. P. and Mancera, J. M. (2009). Seasonal variation in osmoregulatory and metabolic
 964 parameters in earthen pond-cultured gilthead sea bream *Sparus auratus*. *Aquac. Res.* 40,
 965 1279-1290. doi: 10.1111/j.1365-2109.2009.02226.x
- Varsamos, S., Flik, G., Pepin, J.-F., Bonga, S. W. and Breuil, G. (2006). Husbandry stress
 during early life stages affects the stress response and health status of juvenile sea bass,
 Dicentrarchus labrax. Fish Shellfish Immunol. 20, 83-96. doi: 10.1016/j.fsi.2005.04.005
- 969 Vieira, F., Pinto, P., Guerreiro, P. and Power, D. (2012). Divergent responsiveness of the 970 dentary and vertebral bone to a selective estrogen-receptor modulator (SERM) in the 971 teleost Sparus aurata. Gen. Comp. Endocrinol. 179. 421-427. doi: 972 10.1016/j.ygcen.2012.09.018
- 973 Vieira, F. A., Thorne, M., Stueber, K., Darias, M., Reinhardt, R., Clark, M., Gisbert, E. and
 974 Power, D. (2013). Comparative analysis of a teleost skeleton transcriptome provides
 975 insight into its regulation. *Gen. Comp. Endocrinol.* 191, 45-58. doi:
 976 10.1016/j.ygcen.2013.05.025

- Wang, Y., Buodington, R. and Doroshov, S. (1987). Influence of temperature on yolk utilization
 by the white sturgeon, *Acipenser transmontanus*. J. Fish Biol. 30, 263-271. doi:
 10.1111/j.1095-8649.1987.tb05751.x
- Wiegand, M., Buchanan, L., Loewen, J. and Hewitt, C. (1988). Effects of rearing temperature
 on development and survival of embryonic and larval goldfish. *Aquaculture*. 71, 209-222.
 doi: 10.1016/0044-8486(88)90260-8
- Wood, C. M. and McDonald, D. G. (1997). *Global warming: implications for freshwater and marine fish.* Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Yúfera, M., Conceição, L. E., Battaglene, S., Fushimi, H. and Kotani, T. (2011). Early
 development and metabolism. In *Sparidae: Biology and Aquaculture of Gilthead Sea Bream and other Species, Biology and Aquaculture of Gilthead Sea Bream and other*Species, eds. M. Pavlidis and C. Mylonas), pp. 133-168. West Sussex: Wiley-Blackwell.
- Zohar, Y., Abraham, M. and Gordin, H. (1978). The gonadal cycle of the captivity-reared hermaphroditic teleost *Sparus aurata* (L.) during the first two years of life. *In Ann Biol Anim Biochim Biophys*, vol. 18, pp. 877-882: EDP Sciences.



993

994 Fig. 1. Schematic representation of the temperature regimes that gilthead sea bream were exposed 995 from egg fertilization to larvae-juvenile transition until the cold challenge. A: Four temperature 996 treatments (thermal groups) were generated, two with constant temperatures (LT, low temperature 997 [18-18°C] and high temperature, HT [22-22°C]) and two with variable temperatures during the 998 egg incubation phase and larval rearing (HLT [22-18°C] and LHT [18-22°C]). Fish from all 999 thermal groups were maintained at a common temperature (22±1°C) from the larvae-juvenile 1000 transition (when the body was covered with scales) for 7 months until the beginning of the cold 1001 challenge. B: The cold challenge was performed by randomly dividing each group of fish for a thermal regime into two groups. The control group was maintained in replicate tanks at 23°C and 1002 the cold group was maintained in replicate tanks at 13°C (n=10/thermal history group). Fish were 1003 1004 subjected to these temperatures for 15 days until sampling.





1007 Fig. 2. Cortisol and glucose plasma levels. The stress related parameters were analyzed in plasma 1008 samples from sea bream maintained in replicate tanks under control conditions (23°C, n=10/thermal history) or under a cold challenge (13°C, n=10/thermal history group) for 15 days. 1009 The cortisol levels are plotted in a Tukey box plot and whiskers graph (with '+' representing the 1010 mean) and the results of glucose are shown as mean±s.e.m. of the groups with different thermal 1011 history: LT (18-18°C); LHT (18-22°C); HT (22-22°C); HLT (22-18°C). Different letters indicate 1012 1013 significant differences exist for cortisol levels between fish with a different thermal history 1014 maintained at the same temperature. Cardinal (#) indicates significant differences exist on glucose

1015 levels between fish with the same thermal history maintained at different temperatures, 23°C or
1016 13°C. Two-way ANOVA; *P*<0.05.



1017

Fig. 3. Effects of low temperature challenge on biochemical markers of bone remodeling ALP
and TRAP, measured in vertebral bone of sea bream with different thermal histories in the control
(23°C, n=10/thermal history) and cold challenged group (13°C, n=10/thermal history group) 15
days after acclimation to the temperatures. The results of the replicate tanks/ treatment were
pooled for statistical analysis as no significant differences were found. The results obtained for
fish from each thermal regime, LT (18-18 °C); LHT (18-22 °C); HT (22-22 °C); HLT (22-18 °C)

- 1024 are represented. Different letters indicate significant differences exist for ALP activity between
- 1025 fish with a different thermal history maintained at the same temperature. Cardinal (#) indicates
- 1026 significant differences existed between fish with the same thermal history maintained under
- 1027 control conditions 23°C or exposed to a cold challenged, 13°C. The results are shown as
- 1028 mean±s.e.m. of para-nitrophenol (pNP) production (nmol pNP.min.mg⁻¹). Statistical significances
- 1029 (by Two-way ANOVA) were set at P < 0.05.







1031 Fig. 4. Relative expression of transcripts associated with the bone matrix: ocn, ogn1 and ogn2. 1032 Vertebral bone cDNA for each individual was analyzed by qPCR and normalized by the mean of 1033 18s expression: control group (23°C, n=10/thermal history) and cold group (13°C, n=10/thermal 1034 history group). Results for each thermal history group are expressed as Log2 Fold change relative to the LT group (thermal history 18-18°C) maintained at 23°C, defined as control and not 1035 1036 represented (corresponds to the base line with fold change=0); results are represented in a Tukey 1037 box plot: LT (18-18°C); LHT (18-22°C); HT (22-22°C); HLT (22-18°C). '+' represents the mean. The results of the replicate tanks/ treatment were pooled for statistical analysis as no significant 1038 1039 differences were found between them. Different letters indicate significant differences between 1040 the thermal groups maintained at the same temperature. Cardinal (#) indicates significant 1041 differences between fish with the same thermal history maintained under control conditions 23°C or exposed to a cold challenged, 13°C. Significant up-regulation or down-regulation relative to 1042 the control temperature (LT maintained at 23°C) is denoted by: * P<0.05, ** P<0.01, *** P<0.001 1043 1044 using Two-Way ANOVA.



1045

1046 **Fig. 5.** Relative expression of transcripts associated with endocrine responsiveness at low 1047 temperatures: *gr*, *igf1*, *tra* and *trβ*. Vertebral bone cDNA for each individual was analyzed by 1048 qPCR and normalized by the mean of *18s* expression: control group (23°C, n=10/thermal history) 1049 and cold group (13°C, n=10/thermal history group). Results for each thermal history group are

- 1050 expressed as Log2 Fold change relative to the LT group (thermal history 18-18°C) maintained at
- 1051 23°C, defined as control and not represented (corresponds to the base line with fold change=0);
- 1052 results are represented in a Tukey box plot: LT (18-18°C); LHT (18-22°C); HT (22-22°C); HLT
- 1053 (22-18°C). '+' represents the mean. The results of the replicate tanks/treatment were pooled for
- 1054 statistical analysis as no significant differences were found between them. Different letters
- 1055 indicate significant differences between the thermal groups maintained at the same temperature.
- 1056 Cardinal (#) indicates significant differences occurring between fish with the same thermal history
- 1057 maintained under control conditions 23°C or exposed to a cold challenge, 13°C. Significant up-
- 1058 regulation or down-regulation relative to the control (taken at the LT group maintained at 23°C)
- 1059 was denoted by: * P < 0.05, ** P < 0.01 using Two-Way ANOVA.

Table 1: Summary of body and liver weight combined (g), standard length (cm), HSI (%; 100 x [liver mass/body mass]) and condition factor (K; 100 x (body weight/total length³), of gilthead sea bream exposed to different thermal regimes during egg and larval stages and then maintained at the control temperature, $23\pm1^{\circ}$ C (n=10/group, control) or exposed to a temperature drop to $13\pm1^{\circ}$ C (n=10/group).

Thermal history	Weight (g)		Standard Length (cm)			HSI	К		
Water temperature	23°C	13°C	23°C	13℃	23°C	13°C	23°C	13℃	
LT (18-18°C)	$110.7\pm13.9^{\mathrm{a}}$	$100.3\pm6.8^{\rm a}$	14.7 ± 0.76^{a}	14.2 ± 0.55^{a}	1.6 ± 0.4	$2.2 \pm 0.4^{a^{***}}$	3.88 ± 0.33	$3.54\pm0.24^*$	
LHT (18- 22°C)	172.5 ± 21.4^{b}	179.1 ± 18.8^{b}	17.0 ± 0.93^{b}	$17.1\pm0.67^{\rm b}$	1.4 ± 0.2	1.8 ± 0.3^{b} **	3.62 ± 0.32	3.46 ± 0.24	
HT (22-22°C)	$149.0 \pm 16.9^{\circ}$	$143.2\pm21.8^{\rm c}$	$15.9\pm0.79^{\circ}$	$15.7 \pm 1.02^{\circ}$	1.5 ± 0.2	2.6 ± 0.3^{c} ***	3.83 ± 0.07	3.67 ± 0.28	
HLT (22- 18°C)	109.1 ± 21.7^a	$123.3\pm15.8^{\rm c}$	14.6 ± 0.98^{a}	15.1 ± 0.78 ^{ac}	1.3 ± 0.3	$2.2 \pm 0.3^{a^{***}}$	3.82 ± 0.22	3.67 ± 0.54	

1065 Different letters indicate significant differences exist for a given parameter between fish with a 1066 different thermal history maintained at the same temperature. Asterisks denote significant 1067 differences between fish with the same thermal history maintained at different temperatures, 23°C 1068 or 13°C: * P<0.05; ** P<0.01; *** P<0.001. The results are shown as mean±s.d.; Two-way 1069 ANOVA; P<0.05. 1070 Table 2: Primers used for gene expression analysis by quantitative RT-PCR. Gene name,

1071 accession number, primer sequence, amplicon length (bp), annealing temperature (T, °C) and

1072	qPCR efficiency (%) and I	R^2 are indicated for each prim	ner pair (F=forward and R=reverse	primer).
------	---------------------------	-----------------------------------	-----------------------------------	----------

Gene Name	Accession No.	Primer Sequence (5' to 3')	Amplicon (bp)	Т (°С)	Efficiency (%)	\mathbb{R}^2
		F: TCCGCAGTGGTGAGACAGAAG	150		99	0.991
ocn	AF289506	R: CGGTCCGTAGTAGGCCGTGTAG	150	60		
ar	DQ486890	F: CCATCACCTCTGCCGCATCTG	195	64	84	0 994
8,		R: CTGGAGGAACTGCTGCTGAACC	170	01		0.774
ogn1	KM603667	F: GAAGTCTCTCTTATTCACCTGT	138	60	100	0 997
0,000		R: CAAAGGGTCACTGAAGTATCCA	100	00		0.777
ogn2	KM603668	F: TGTTATTCTCCCATGGATCCTG	125	60	98	0.998
<i>Ugn2</i> KW005000		R: GATCCCCCGCTGCATCTGTGG		00		
iof1	AY996779	F: TGTCTAGCGCTCTTTCCTTTCA	84	60	100	0.995
u		R: AGAGGGTGTGGCTACAGGAGATAC				
tra	AF047467	F: GAGGCCGGAGCCAAACAC	124	60	102	0.988
		R: GCCGATATCATCCGACAGG				
trβ	AY246695	F: ACCGACTGGAGCCCACACAG	129	60	101	0.992
·		R: CCTTCACCCACGCTGCACT				
rps18	AM490061	F: AGGGTGTTGGCAGACGTTAC	164	60	96	0.994
		R: CTTCTGCCTGTTGAGGAACC				
β-	X89920	F: CCCTGCCCACGCCATCC	94	60	86	0.994
actin		R: TCTCGGCTGTGGTGGTGAAGG				
18s	(Pinto et	F: TGACGGAAGGGCACCACCAG	82	60	93.6	0.992
100	al., 2010)	R: AATCGCTCCACCAACTAAGAACGG				<i>.,,</i>

1073

Table 3: Changes in plasma total protein, sodium, potassium, osmolality and total calcium in
gilthead sea bream with different thermal histories maintained at 23°C or 13°C for 15 days.
Replicate tanks were used per treatment, but for statistical analysis the data / replicate were pooled
as no significant differences were detected (23°C, n=10/thermal history; 13°C, n=10/thermal
history).

Thermal History	Sodium (mM)		Potassium (mM)		Protein (mg.mL ⁻¹)		Osm (mmol.Kg ⁻¹)		Calcium (mmol.L ⁻¹)	
Water temperature	23°C	13°C	23°C	13°C	23°C	13°C	23°C	13℃	23°C	13°C
LT (18-18°C)	199.9 ± 3.76	187.1 ± 2.20 ^a *	3.0 ± 0.21	$\begin{array}{c} 2.6 \pm \\ 0.16^{ab} \end{array}$	24.1 ± 0.75	$\begin{array}{c} 26.4 \pm \\ 0.98 \end{array}$	364.4 ± 3.16	368.6 ± 6.79	4.2 ± 0.04	3.9 ± 0.28
LHT (18-22°C)	184.4 ± 6.04	$\begin{array}{c} 183.7 \pm \\ 4.02^a \end{array}$	2.7 ± 0.16	$2.1 \pm 0.18^{ab*}$	25.3 ± 0.64	27.5 ± 1.03	364.5 ± 4.84	361.1 ± 3.67	$\begin{array}{c} 4.0 \pm \\ 0.10 \end{array}$	4.0 ± 0.12
HT (22-22°C)	184.5 ± 2.99	$\begin{array}{c} 184.2 \pm \\ 2.39^a \end{array}$	2.7 ± 0.21	$\begin{array}{c} 2.7 \pm \\ 0.11^a \end{array}$	$\begin{array}{c} 23.9 \pm \\ 0.77 \end{array}$	$28.6 \pm \\ 1.03^{***}$	361.1 ± 5.59	$\begin{array}{c} 373.0 \pm \\ 6.18 \end{array}$	4.0 ± 0.15	$\begin{array}{c} 3.8 \pm \\ 0.15 \end{array}$
HLT (22-18°C)	198.6 ± 5.44	159.5 ± 3.91 ^b ***	2.8 ± 0.21	$2.0 \pm 0.12^{b**}$	24.7 ± 0.62	27.4 ± 0.92*	359.0 ± 3.35	374.6 ± 4.36*	4.0 ± 0.11	3.5 ± 0.24

1079 Different letters indicate significant differences exist for a given parameter between fish with a 1080 different thermal history maintained at the same temperature. Asterisks denote significant 1081 differences between fish with the same thermal history maintained at different temperatures, 23°C 1082 or 13°C: * P<0.05; ** P<0.01; *** P<0.001. The results are shown as mean±s.e.m.; Two-way 1083 ANOVA; P<0.05.

- **Table 4:** Calcium (μ mol.mg⁻¹) and ash (mg) content of vertebral bone of gilthead sea bream with
- 1085 a different thermal history exposed to control conditions (23°C, n=10/thermal history) or exposed
- 1086 to a temperature drop (13°C, n=10/thermal history group) for 15 days after acclimation to the 1087 conditions.

Thermal History	Calcium ((µmol.mg ⁻¹)	Ash (mg)		
Water temperature	23°C	13℃	23°C	13°C	
LT (18-18°C)	24.0 ± 0.86	20.6 ± 0.36^a	0.26 ± 0.015	0.29 ± 0.010	
LHT (18-22°C)	25.2 ± 1.63	26.3 ± 1.59^{b}	0.28 ± 0.015	0.31 ± 0.011	
HT (22-22°C)	22.4 ± 0.67	25.4 ± 1.48^{ab}	0.30 ± 0.012	0.29 ± 0.010	
HLT (22-18°C)	26.1 ± 1.88	25.2 ± 1.31^{ab}	0.29 ± 0.019	0.30 ± 0.008	

1088 Different letters indicate significant differences exist for calcium between fish with a different 1089 thermal history maintained at the same temperature. The results are shown as mean \pm s.e.m.; Two-1090 way ANOVA; *P*<0.05.

1091