

1 **Sleep-related crash characteristics: Implications for applying a fatigue**  
2 **definition to crash reports**

3

4

5 AJ Filtress\*, K Armstrong, A Watson, SS Smith

6

7 Queensland University of Technology (QUT), Centre for Accident Research and Road Safety –

8 Queensland (CARRS-Q)

9 \*Corresponding author:

10 Ashleigh Filtress, Ph.D.

11 CARRS-Q, Queensland University of Technology, K block, 130 Victoria Park Road, Kelvin Grove,

12 Queensland, 4059, Australia

13 Tel: +61 7 31387713

14 Fax: +61 7 3138 0111

15 Email: [Ashleigh.filtress@qut.edu.au](mailto:Ashleigh.filtress@qut.edu.au)

16

1 **Abstract**

2 Sleep-related (SR) crashes are an endemic problem the world over. However, police officers report  
3 difficulties in identifying sleepiness as a crash contributing factor. One approach to improving the  
4 sensitivity of SR crash identification is by applying a proxy definition post-hoc to crash reports. To  
5 identify the prominent characteristics of SR crashes and highlight the influence of proxy definitions,  
6 ten years of Queensland (Australia) police reports of crashes occurring in  $\geq 100$ km/h speed zones  
7 were analysed. In Queensland, two approaches are routinely taken to identifying SR crashes. First,  
8 attending police officers identify crash causal factors; one possible option is 'fatigue/fell asleep'.  
9 Second, a proxy definition is applied to *all* crash reports. Those meeting the definition are  
10 considered SR and added to the police-reported SR crashes. Of the 65,204 vehicle operators involved  
11 in crashes 3,449 were police-reported as SR. Analyses of these data found that male drivers aged 16-  
12 24 years within the first two years of unsupervised driving were most likely to have a SR crash.  
13 Collision with a stationary object was more likely in SR than in not-SR crashes. Using the proxy  
14 definition 9,739 (14.9%) crashes were classified as SR. Using the proxy definition removes the  
15 findings that SR crashes are more likely to involve males and be of high severity. Additionally, proxy  
16 defined SR crashes are no less likely at intersections than not-SR crashes. When interpreting crash  
17 data it is important to understand the implications of SR identification because strategies aimed at  
18 reducing the road toll are informed by such data. Without the correct interpretation, funding could  
19 be misdirected. Improving sleepiness identification should be a priority in terms of both  
20 improvement to police and proxy reporting.

21 **Key words:** driver sleepiness, driver drowsiness, driver fatigue, proxy definition, surrogate fatigue  
22 measures

23

24

## 1   **1   Introduction**

2   Every year driver fatigue or sleepiness is responsible for countless crashes the world over (Akerstedt  
3   2000). Using a case controlled approach the population attributable risk for driving when sleepy is  
4   reported to be 19%, meaning that cessation of all driving when sleepy would result in a 19%  
5   decrease in the total number of crashes (Connor *et al.* 2002). The impact of such crashes for those  
6   involved can be devastating, as sleep-related (SR) crashes are highly likely to be fatal or to result in  
7   serious injury (Connor *et al.* 2002). However, there are several barriers faced by road safety  
8   authorities, each of which makes reducing the prevalence of driver sleepiness a difficult problem to  
9   address. First, when compared to other causes of driving impairment such as alcohol and drugs, SR  
10   impairment can be hard to identify. Enforcement officers report difficulty in identifying driver fatigue  
11   (Radun *et al.* 2013). This is influenced both by a lack of objective and reliable tests for sleepiness  
12   analogous to those available for alcohol or drugs (Pack *et al.* 1995), but also through deficiencies in  
13   officer training in the identification of SR crashes (Radun *et al.* 2013). The number of reported SR  
14   crashes is underestimated within crash data (Akerstedt 2000). Some road safety authorities address  
15   this issue by using proxy definitions of fatigue to supplement police reporting.

16   Proxy definitions are designed to be applied to all police-reported crashes as part of a post-hoc  
17   analysis to improve the sensitivity of SR crash identification. The Australian Transport Safety Bureau  
18   (ATSB) has developed a recommended proxy definition, and five of the eight Australian jurisdictions  
19   have incorporated their own proxy definition into standard practices. Within Queensland, Australia,  
20   the attending police officer is responsible for identifying the causes of any crash; as part of this  
21   process officers have the option of attributing one of the causes to 'fatigue/fell asleep'. There is  
22   currently no standard methodology for identifying 'fatigue/fell asleep' as a crash causal factor. All  
23   roadside police officers attend a basic crash investigation course as part of their training. In the  
24   event of a serious incident (fatal or serious injury) trained crash investigators from the Forensic  
25   Crash Investigation unit will attend. These officers specialise in identifying crash causal factors and  
26   will take steps beyond roadside investigation (e.g. checking shiftwork rosters, telephone records and

1 bank statements) to identify how long a person has been awake and driving for, if they suspect  
2 fatigue. To supplement this, the Queensland proxy definition is applied post-hoc by the State  
3 Government Department of Transport and Main Roads. This definition states that sleepiness is a  
4 contributing factor in all single-vehicle crashes in  $\geq 100\text{km/h}$  speed zones which occur between 2pm  
5 to 4pm and 10pm to 6am, or where a vehicle leaves the roadway with the driver not attempting to  
6 avoid the crash. The process of applying a proxy definition is a desk-based exercise outside of the  
7 remit of the police. When reporting fatigue crashes road safety authorities either use police-  
8 reported SR crashes alone or use proxy identified in addition to the police-reported SR crashes.

9 The content of proxy definitions have some grounding in scientific research (e.g. single vehicle run  
10 off the road crashes are most likely to be SR (Horne and Reyner 1995b, Pack *et al.* 2006)). However,  
11 there has been some criticism that proxy definitions are too narrow (Crummy *et al.* 2008) and that  
12 they only capture a specific subset of SR crashes (Armstrong *et al.* 2013).

13 Despite their limitations, proxy definitions are being actively used by road safety authorities so it is  
14 vital to understand the implications this has on crash statistics. This is particularly important when it  
15 is considered that road safety authorities will use crash statistics from their own jurisdictions to  
16 inform future investment in road safety. In deciding whether to invest in measures to reduce driver  
17 fatigue, road safety authorities are likely to first consider if SR crashes are prevalent in their  
18 jurisdiction and second to identify which drivers are most at risk. With such crucial decisions being  
19 made based on region-specific data, the implications of how the data is processed and interpreted  
20 should be fully understood.

21 The aim of this paper is twofold: First, to characterise SR crashes in high speed zones ( $\geq 100\text{km/h}$ )  
22 and the vehicle operators involved in them. Second, to demonstrate the implications of using proxy  
23 definitions for estimates of the prevalence and characteristics of SR crashes.

## 1   **2   Method**

### 2    2.1   *Crash data*

3   Queensland police-reported crashes of motorised vehicles occurring in 'high' ( $\geq 100$  km/h) speed  
4   zones between 1<sup>st</sup> January 2000 and 31<sup>st</sup> December 2009 were examined. Ten years of crash data  
5   provides sufficient scope for identifying general trends, and permits meaningful comparisons  
6   between SR and not sleep-related crashes (not-SR). Police crash reports detail all police attended  
7   crashes which occur on a public road, and where any of: a person was killed or injured, a vehicle  
8   towed, or greater than \$2500 of damage to property other than vehicles was incurred. Crashes  
9   resulting from medical conditions and deliberate acts are excluded. Police crash reports detail  
10  vehicle operator characteristics and crash characteristics, as well as crash causal factors identified by  
11  the reporting Queensland Police Services (QPS) officer.

### 12  2.2   *Sleep-related classification*

13  Three analysis approaches were taken to the classification of SR crashes.

14  First, all crash reports where the contributory factor "fatigue/fell asleep" was noted by the police  
15  officer were classified as SR. The remainder of the crash reports were classified as not-SR.

16  Second, all crash reports regardless of police officer classification were subject to the Queensland  
17  proxy definition of fatigue. Following the Queensland proxy definition, all crashes in  $\geq 100$ km/h zones  
18  which occur between 2pm to 4pm and 10pm to 6am, in which a single vehicle was involved, or  
19  where the vehicle leaves the roadway with the driver not attempting to avoid the crash, were  
20  classified as SR. The remainder of the crash reports were considered as not-SR.

21  Finally, all crash reports with either a police or proxy classification of SR were considered to be SR.

22  The remainder of the crash reports were considered as not-SR. This approach is commonly taken by  
23  road authorities who use proxy definitions.

### 1 2.3 Statistical analysis

2 Examination of vehicle operator and crash characteristics was undertaken to identify any significant  
3 differences between SR and not-SR crashes. A range of characteristics were considered, those most  
4 interesting in terms of differences between SR and not-SR are reported in the current paper.

5 Characteristics not presented include: vehicle type, number of occupants, lighting conditions,  
6 atmospheric conditions and road surface conditions. Categorical data were analysed using Chi-  
7 square ( $\chi^2$ ) tests with Cramer's V ( $\phi_c$ ) as an estimate of effect size. As suggested by Aron (2012), a  
8 Cramer's V of less than .10 was considered to be a small effect size, between .10 and .30 moderate,  
9 and more than 0.30 a large effect size. Analysis was undertaken three times following three different  
10 methods of identify SR crashes: (1) police-reported; (2) proxy definition; and, (3) combination of  
11 police-reported and proxy definition.

12 A significance level ( $\alpha$ ) of .001 was used due to the use of multiple tests and a large sample size.

13 Accordingly, adjusted standardised residuals outside  $\pm 3.29$  were considered significant. In order to  
14 include vehicle operator characteristics as variables of interest, the main unit of analysis was the  
15 drivers/riders involved in crashes during the period, rather than crashes per se. All statistical  
16 analyses were conducted using IBM SPSS 19.0 statistical software.

### 17 **3 Results**

18 Overall, there were 65,204 vehicle operators (drivers and riders) involved in crashes on high speed ( $\geq$ )  
19 100km/h) Queensland roads during the 10 year period of interest. Using police report alone, 3,449  
20 (5.3%) crashes were classified as SR. Using the proxy definition alone 9,739 (14.9%) crashes were  
21 classified SR. When police-reported and proxy definition were combined, a total of 11,477 (17.6%)  
22 crashes were classified as SR. Half ( $n = 1,738$ ) of the police-reported crashes did not meet the proxy  
23 definition.

1     3.1   *Police-reported sleep-related crash characteristics*

2     The proportion of police-reported SR crashes including each vehicle operator and crash  
 3     characteristic of interest is displayed in Table 1. Vehicle operators involved in police-reported SR  
 4     crashes were significantly more likely to be male, aged 16-24, provisional licence holders and have  
 5     illegal blood alcohol concentration (BAC), compared with those in not-SR crashes. Police-reported SR  
 6     crashes were more likely to be serious, single-vehicle crashes involving hitting a stationary object  
 7     and where the vehicle overturned. Intersections and traffic control were significantly less likely to be  
 8     a factor in SR than not-SR crashes. SR crashes were significantly more likely to occur at weekends  
 9     and between the hours of 10pm and 6am.

10    **Table 1: Vehicle operator and crash characteristics for police-reported sleep-related and not sleep-**  
 11    **related crashes**

Variable	Sleep-related	Not sleep-related	
<i>Vehicle operator characteristics</i>			
Male gender	76.8%	69.4%	$\chi^2(1) = 81.44, p < .001, \phi_c = .04$
Aged 16-24	34.5%	25.9%	$\chi^2(2) = 128.23, p < .001, \phi_c = .05$
Provisional licence	22.2%	14.8%	$\chi^2(3) = 165.49, p < .001, \phi_c = .05$
Illegal BAC	7.7%	4.5%	$\chi^2(1) = 89.66, p < .001, \phi_c = .04$
<i>Crash characteristics</i>			
Severity (fatality/hospitalisation)	43.5%	31.8%	$\chi^2(4) = 227.64, p < .001, \phi_c = .06$
Nature - Hit stationary object	56.7%	26.6%	$\chi^2(1) = 1455.82, p < .001, \phi_c = .15$
Nature – overturned	24.4%	14.4%	$\chi^2(1) = 297.68, p < .001, \phi_c = .07$
Intersection	3.5%	14.9%	$\chi^2(1) = 329.48, p < .001, \phi_c = .07$
Traffic control	0.6%	5.1%	$\chi^2(1) = 136.97, p < .001, \phi_c = .05$
Single vehicle	81.4%	46.0%	$\chi^2(1) = 1511.10, p < .001, \phi_c = .15$
Time of day (10pm to 6am)	38.9%	12.3%	$\chi^2(1) = 3197, p < .001, \phi_c = .15$
Time of day (2pm – 4pm)	13.7%	14.7%	$\chi^2(1) = 3.35, p = .067, \phi_c = .01$
Day of week (weekend)	36.8%	27.1%	$\chi^2(1) = 146.50, p < .001, \phi_c = .05$

12    3.2   *Proxy identified sleep-related crash characteristics*

13    The proportion of proxy definition identified SR crashes including each vehicle operator and crash  
 14    characteristic is displayed in Table 2. Involvement of single vehicle and the time of day are not  
 15    included as these are components of the proxy definition. As with police-reported, there is a greater

1 prevalence of young (aged 16-24 years), provisional licence holders and illegal BAC involvement in SR  
2 crashes. Furthermore, SR crashes were more likely to involve hitting a stationary object and for the  
3 vehicle to overturn than not-SR crashes and to occur at the weekend. However, in contrast to police-  
4 reported, there was no significant difference in the involvement of males and SR crashes were not  
5 more severe than not-SR crashes. Additionally, using proxy definition the involvement of  
6 intersections and traffic control were just as likely in SR as not-SR crashes.

7



1 **Table 2: Vehicle operator and crash characteristics for proxy identified sleep-related and not sleep-**  
 2 **related crashes**

Variable	Sleep-related	Not sleep-related	
<i>Vehicle operator characteristics</i>			
Male gender	78.5%	75.4%	$\chi^2(1) = 4.73, p = .030, \phi_c = .04$
Aged 16-24	38.1%	31.5%	$\chi^2(2) = 33.68, p < .001, \phi_c = .10$
Provisional licence	25.5%	19.6%	$\chi^2(3) = 26.68, p < .001, \phi_c = .09$
Illegal BAC	11.0%	5.0%	$\chi^2(1) = 43.32, p < .001, \phi_c = .11$
<i>Crash characteristics</i>			
Severity (fatality/hospitalisation)	41.9%	44.8%	$\chi^2(4) = 6.46, p = .167, \phi_c = .04$
Nature - Hit stationary object	69.1%	53.5%	$\chi^2(1) = 178.23, p < .001, \phi_c = .23$
Nature - overturned	30.7%	19.2%	$\chi^2(1) = 60.48, p < .001, \phi_c = .13$
Intersection	3.3%	3.7%	$\chi^2(1) = 0.41, p = .521, \phi_c = .01$
Traffic control	0.1%	1.0%	$\chi^2(1) = 10.74, p = .001, \phi_c = .06$
Single vehicle	NA	NA	
Time of day (10pm to 6am)	NA	NA	
Time of day (2pm – 4pm)	NA	NA	
Day of week (weekend)	40.0%	34.2%	$\chi^2(1) = 12.58, p < .001, \phi_c = .06$

3

4 **3.3 Combined police-reported and proxy identified sleep-related crash characteristics**

5 Table 3 shows vehicle operator and crash characteristics when police-reported and proxy definition  
 6 are used in combination. Using this approach the same differences were observed as for police-  
 7 reported alone. SR crashes are significantly more likely to involve males, drivers aged 16-24,  
 8 provisional licences holders and illegal BAC. SR crashes were more likely to be serious, single vehicle,  
 9 involve hitting a stationary object and the vehicle overturning. They were more likely to occur at  
 10 weekends and between 10pm and 6am or 2pm-4pm. Conversely, SR crashes were significantly less  
 11 likely to occur at intersections or areas with traffic control. There is some bias in this comparison as  
 12 time of day and single vehicle crashes are included in the proxy definition.

13

1 **Table 3: Vehicle operator and crash characteristics for combined police-reported and proxy**  
 2 **definition identified sleep-related and not sleep-related crashes**

Variable	Sleep-related	Not sleep-related	
<i>Vehicle operator characteristics</i>			
Male gender	74.8%	68.7%	$\chi^2(1) = 167.96, p < .001, \phi_c = .05$
Aged 16-24	33.9%	24.7%	$\chi^2(2) = 435.15, p < .001, \phi_c = .08$
Provisional licence	20.5%	14.1%	$\chi^2(3) = 711.99, p < .001, \phi_c = .11$
Illegal BAC	11.2%	3.2%	$\chi^2(1) = 1404.82, p < .001, \phi_c = .15$
<i>Crash characteristics</i>			
Severity (fatality/hospitalisation)	37.4%	31.3%	$\chi^2(4) = 188.94, p < .001, \phi_c = .05$
Nature - Hit stationary object	62.0%	20.8%	$\chi^2(1) = 8100.73, p < .001, \phi_c = .35$
Nature – overturned	30.8%	11.4%	$\chi^2(1) = 2893.28, p < .001, \phi_c = .21$
Intersection	5.8%	16.2%	$\chi^2(1) = 855.54, p < .001, \phi_c = .12$
Traffic control	0.8%	5.7%	$\chi^2(1) = 506.54, p < .001, \phi_c = .09$
Single vehicle	94.6%	37.5%	$\chi^2(1) = 12621.47, p < .001, \phi_c = .44$
Time of day (10pm to 6am)	51.9%	5.2%	$\chi^2(1) = 19861, p < .001, \phi_c = .38$
Time of day (2pm – 4pm)	32.6%	12.9%	$\chi^2(1) = 3634.35, p < .001, \phi_c = .16$
Day of week (weekend)	36.2%	25.8%	$\chi^2(1) = 527.22, p < .001, \phi_c = .09$

3 **4 Discussion**

4 The current work identified young (16-24 years of age), novice (within two years of licensure) drivers  
 5 to be over-represented in SR crashes in high speed zones ( $\geq 100\text{km/h}$ ). This was the case for both  
 6 police-reported and proxy identification and is in line with previous research (Horne and Reyner  
 7 1995b, Pack *et al.* 1995, Connor *et al.* 2002, Sagaspe *et al.* 2010). Using three approaches to crash  
 8 data this paper demonstrates that a proxy definition can change the significance of crash  
 9 characteristics. In this case, analysis of data categorised by proxy definition found no significant  
 10 difference in the proportion of crashes that involved male drivers, nor differences in the severity of  
 11 SR compared to not-SR crashes. In contrast, both characteristics were more prevalent in SR crashes  
 12 compared to not-SR crashes identified from police-reported fatigue. The use of a proxy definition  
 13 also had implications for understanding the situational context of SR crashes. Specifically, road  
 14 infrastructure features (intersections and traffic control) surrounding the crash were significantly

1 less likely to be associated with SR than not-SR crashes in police-reported fatigue, whereas there was  
2 no difference between SR and not-SR in proxy identified fatigue.

3 Police-reported SR crashes were significantly more likely to be severe than not SR crashes, this  
4 would be expected as case control comparison has demonstrated that SR crashes are more likely to  
5 be fatal or to result in serious injury (Connor *et al.* 2002). However, the same difference was not  
6 reported using the proxy identified data. Serious crashes in Queensland are attended by the Forensic  
7 Crash Investigation unit who undertake a thorough investigation. This can include seeking additional  
8 information beyond that at the crash scene, such as details about the prior circumstances (e.g.  
9 previous sleep and shift work pattern). These additional details facilitate the Forensic Crash  
10 Investigation unit to make more informed decisions as to crash causation. In contrast the proxy  
11 definition is limited to information about the crash itself. It is possible that applying a proxy  
12 definition has greatest value for not severe crashes and is somewhat redundant in its application to  
13 severe crashes. Another noticeable difference between SR and not SR comparison for police-  
14 reported and proxy identified was for male drivers. Previous research has reported that male drivers  
15 are overrepresented in SR crashes (e.g. Horne and Reyner 1995b). However, while this was the case  
16 for the police-reported data it was not for proxy identified. It is not clear why this difference  
17 occurred; it is possible that police may be expecting males to be overrepresented in SR crashes  
18 which may introduce bias in police reporting.

19 Within Queensland, attributed crash cause is not limited to a primary factor; this allows crash data  
20 analysis to consider implications for co-occurring causal factors. Regardless of analysis approach,  
21 illegal BAC was more often present in SR than in not-SR crashes. Driving simulator research has  
22 demonstrated that the combination of alcohol and sleepiness results in greater impairment than the  
23 additive effect of either alone (Horne *et al.* 2003, Banks *et al.* 2004). Specific consideration of  
24 combined sleep and alcohol related crashes may be warranted. Furthermore, driving simulator  
25 research has also demonstrated that sleepiness amplifies impairment from other crash causal

1 factors e.g. distraction, (Anderson and Horne 2006). However, it is not clear how readily police will  
2 report fatigue in co-occurrence with other causal factors. Therefore, the genuine impact of sleep on  
3 road safety may be much greater than estimated here. Future research should consider police  
4 officer attitudes towards reporting fatigue as a co-occurring causal factor and characteristics of SR  
5 crashes co-occurring with another causal factor (e.g. illegal BAC) in comparison to those attributed  
6 to either factor in isolation.

7 It could be considered that the current analysis provides some support for the proxy definition as  
8 two proxy features - single vehicle involvement and occurring between 10pm and 6am - were both  
9 more prevalent in SR crashes compared with not-SR crashes within the police-reported analysis.  
10 However, crashes between 2pm and 4pm are also included in the proxy definition and did not show  
11 a greater prevalence in the police-reported. Furthermore, while the police are not involved in  
12 applying the proxy definition it is possible that they may be aware of the common features of SR  
13 crashes identified from scientific literature. This may introduce bias if police judgment is not  
14 completely independent from the proxy definition. In both the police-reported and proxy analysis  
15 colliding with a stationary object was significantly more prevalent in SR than not-SR crashes and had  
16 one of the largest effect sizes. Collision with something in clear sight has previously been reported as  
17 a feature of SR crashes (Horne and Reyner 1995a) and is one of the most common outcomes of self-  
18 reported SR incidents (Armstrong *et al.* 2013). These findings provide some evidence for potential  
19 benefit of the inclusion of collision with a stationary object in proxy definitions, a feature which has  
20 also been reported by others (Crummy *et al.* 2008).

21 Police-reported SR crashes were significantly less likely to occur at intersections and on roads with  
22 traffic control. This finding is in line with previous studies reporting SR crashes as most prevalent on  
23 featureless roads (Horne and Reyner 1995b). However, there is no difference between SR and not-SR  
24 for either of these crash features within proxy identified data. It is possible that this discrepancy is  
25 caused by low specificity of the proxy definition. However, self-report of SR crashes and near-misses

1 demonstrate that SR incidents are common in urban city areas (Sagaspe *et al.* 2010, Armstrong *et al.*  
2 2013). Therefore, it is possible that police officers have low sensitivity in their reporting and are  
3 failing to correctly identify sleepiness when crashes occur at intersections and areas of traffic  
4 controls.

5 In lieu of an accurate objective measure to identify SR crashes increased investment in enhancing  
6 both police and proxy SR crash identification is vital. In general the criteria within proxy definitions  
7 are grounded in scientific evidence, but not all associated risk factors are considered. For example  
8 one of the factors which substantially increases the risk of a SR crash is driving after five hours or less  
9 sleep (Connor *et al.* 2002), and yet, this information is neither routinely collected by police nor  
10 incorporated into proxy definitions. Furthermore, much of the research proxy definitions draw on  
11 was not originally intended for the purpose of developing a proxy definition. Also, it has been shown  
12 that using SR criteria with police officers at crash scenes identifies a greater prevalence of SR  
13 crashes than the post-hoc application of proxy definition criteria to crash data (Horne and Reyner  
14 1995b).

15 Currently, prevalence of police-reported SR crashes in Queensland is lower than would be expected  
16 from previous research (Horne and Reyner 1995b, Connor *et al.* 2002) providing strong evidence  
17 that police need assistance and/or specialised training in SR identification. Using a proxy definition  
18 increased the prevalence of SR crashes to 18%. While this proportion is closer to that obtained from  
19 high-quality case control investigation (Connor *et al.* 2002) it is still an estimate of SR crashes.  
20 Approximately half of the police-reported SR crashes did not meet the proxy definition, suggesting  
21 that proxy definitions are only identifying a subset of SR crashes (Armstrong *et al.* 2013). The  
22 accuracy of proxy definitions is particularly uncertain as they do not closely reflect drivers subjective  
23 reports of SR crashes (Armstrong *et al.* 2013) and have been criticised for being too narrow (Crummy  
24 *et al.* 2008).

1 It is acknowledged that findings are limited to crashes that were reported to the police. Additionally,  
2 the ability of either the police or the proxy definitions to accurately identify fatigue accurately was  
3 not validated. There is potential for inconsistency in reporting between individual police officers and  
4 particularly between those crashes attended by the Forensic Crash Investigation unit and those not.  
5 Serious crashes (fatal or serious injury) are attended by trained crash investigators. Furthermore, for  
6 serious crashes detailed information may be sought about the circumstances prior to the crash (e.g.  
7 prior sleep). The specialist training and additional information is likely to improve the ability to  
8 accurately recognise fatigue. In contrast, the Forensic Crash Investigation unit does not attend low  
9 severity crashes. As enforcement officers report difficulty in identifying fatigue as a crash casual  
10 factor (Radun *et al.* 2013) and without the additional training and information of the Forensic Crash  
11 Investigation unit it is possible fatigue identification in less serious crashes may not be as accurate.  
12 The data considered were only from Queensland Australia, it is unknown how comparable the  
13 findings are to other jurisdictions. Furthermore, analysis was limited to high speed crashes as this is  
14 a requirement of the proxy definitions. Future work may wish to consider if characteristics of SR  
15 crashes in slower speed zones are comparable to those found in high speed zones.

#### 16 4.1 Conclusion

17 In conclusion, this study demonstrates that, regardless of police, proxy, or combined analysis  
18 techniques young drivers (aged 16-24) and provisional licence holders (within the first two years of  
19 licensure) are overrepresented in SR crashes compared to not-SR crashes. This group has the  
20 potential to benefit most from interventions to reduce driver sleepiness. Critically, the manner in  
21 which crash data are processed can influence both the prevalence and dominant characteristics  
22 attributed to SR crashes. The use of a proxy definition increases the proportion of all crashes  
23 identified as SR, however, there is a lack of tangible proxy definitions evaluations to verify their  
24 efficacy. In general proxy identified SR crashes have similar characteristics to police identified SR  
25 crashes, however, there are some subtle differences. Regardless of the limitations, proxy definitions  
26 are currently being used. Understanding this influence is important because strategies to reduce the

1 road toll are informed by such data, without correct interpretation funding could be misdirected.  
2 Improving sleepiness identification should be a priority in terms of both improvement to police and  
3 proxy reporting. Emphasis should be placed on both more accurate quantification of SR crashes but  
4 also development of interventions to limit the occurrence of SR crashes. There is a need for more  
5 accurate measurement of the true nature and extent of the role of sleepiness in crashes.

## 6 **5 Acknowledgements**

7 The authors wish to thank Queensland Department of Transport and Main Roads for providing the  
8 data.

9

## 10 **References**

- 11 Akerstedt, T., 2000. Consensus statement: Fatigue and accidents in transport operations. *Journal of*  
12 *sleep research* 9 (4), 395-395. DOI: 10.1046/j.1365-2869.2000.00228.x
- 13 Anderson, C., Horne, J., 2006. Sleepiness enhances distraction during a monotonous task. *SLEEP* 29  
14 (4), 573.
- 15 Armstrong, K., Filtness, A.J., Watling, C.N., Barraclough, P., Haworth, N., 2013. Efficacy of proxy  
16 definitions for identification of fatigue/sleep-related crashes: An Australian evaluation.  
17 *Transportation Research Part F: Traffic Psychology and Behaviour* 21, 242-252.  
18 DOI:10.1016/j.trf.2013.10.002
- 19 Aron, A. (2012). *Statistics for Psychology* 6th Edition: Pearson.
- 20 Banks, S., Catcheside, P., Lack, L., Grunstein, R.R., Mcevoy, R.D., 2004. Low levels of alcohol impair  
21 driving simulator performance and reduce perception of crash risk in partially sleep deprived  
22 subjects. *SLEEP* 27, 1063-1067.
- 23 Connor, J., Norton, R., Ameratunga, S., Robinson, E., Civil, I., Dunn, R., Bailey, J., Jackson, R., 2002.  
24 Driver sleepiness and risk of serious injury to car occupants: Population based case control  
25 study. *Bmj* 324 (7346), 1125. DOI: <http://dx.doi.org/10.1136/bmj.324.7346.1125>
- 26 Crummy, F., Cameron, P.A., Swann, P., Kossmann, T., Naughton, M., 2008. Prevalence of sleepiness  
27 in surviving drivers of motor vehicle collisions. *Internal medicine journal* 38 (10), 769-775.  
28 DOI: 10.1111/j.1445-5994.2008.01629.x
- 29 Horne, J., Reyner, L., 1995a. Driver sleepiness. *Journal of sleep research* 4 (s2), 23-29.  
30 DOI: 10.1111/j.1365-2869.1995.tb00222.x
- 31 Horne, J., Reyner, L., Barrett, P., 2003. Driving impairment due to sleepiness is exacerbated by low  
32 alcohol intake. *Occupational and environmental medicine* 60 (9), 689-692.  
33 DOI:10.1136/oem.60.9.689
- 34 Horne, J., Reyner, L.A., 1995b. Sleep related vehicle accidents. *Bmj* 310 (6979), 565-567. DOI:  
35 <http://dx.doi.org/10.1136/bmj.310.6979.565>
- 36 Pack, A.I., Maislin, G., Staley, B., Pack, F.M., Rogers, W.C., George, C.F., Dinges, D.F., 2006. Impaired  
37 performance in commercial drivers: Role of sleep apnea and short sleep duration. *American*

1 journal of respiratory and critical care medicine 174 (4), 446-454.  
2 DOI: 10.1164/rccm.200408-1146OC

3 Pack, A.I., Pack, A.M., Rodgman, E., Cucchiara, A., Dinges, D.F., Schwab, C.W., 1995. Characteristics  
4 of crashes attributed to the driver having fallen asleep. Accident Analysis & Prevention 27  
5 (6), 769-775. DOI:10.1016/0001-4575(95)00034-8

6 Radun, I., Ohisalo, J., Radun, J., Wahde, M., Kecklund, G., 2013. Driver fatigue and the law from the  
7 perspective of police officers and prosecutors. Transportation research part F: traffic  
8 psychology and behaviour 18, 159-167. DOI:10.1016/j.trf.2013.01.001

9 Sagaspe, P., Taillard, J., Bayon, V., Lagarde, E., Moore, N., Boussuge, J., Chaumet, G., Bioulac, B.,  
10 Philip, P., 2010. Sleepiness, near-misses and driving accidents among a representative  
11 population of french drivers. Journal of sleep research 19 (4), 578-584. DOI: 10.1111/j.1365-  
12 2869.2009.00818.x

13  
14  
15  
16