

1 **A research agenda for a people-centred approach to energy access in the urbanizing global south**

2 Vanesa Castán Broto, Development Planning Unit, University College London

3 Lucy Stevens, Practical Action

4 Emmanuel Ackom, Technical University of Denmark and UNEP DTU Partnership

5 Julia Tomei, Institute of Sustainable Resources, University College London

6 Priti Parikh, Iwona Bisaga, UCL Civil, Environmental & Geomatic Engineering

7 Long Seng To, Low Carbon Energy for Development Network, Loughborough University

8 Josh Kirshner, Department of Geography, University of York

9 Yacob Mulugetta, Department of Science, Technology, Engineering and Public Policy, University
10 College London

11

12 **Corresponding author:** Vanesa Castán Broto, Bartlett Development Planning Unit, University College
13 London, 34 Tavistock Square, London, WC1H9EZ, UK. Email: v.castanbroto@ucl.ac.uk

14

15 **Abstract**

16 Energy access is typically viewed as a problem for rural areas, but people living in urban settings also
17 face energy challenges that have not received sufficient attention. A revised agenda in research and
18 practice that puts the user and local planning complexities centre stage is needed to change the way we
19 look at energy access in urban areas, to understand the implications of the concentration of vulnerable
20 people in slums and to identify opportunities for planned management and innovation that can deliver
21 urban energy transitions while leaving no one behind. Here, we propose a research agenda focused on
22 three key issues: understanding the needs of urban energy users; enabling the use of context-specific,
23 disaggregated data; and engaging with effective modes of energy and urban governance. This agenda
24 requires interdisciplinary scholarship across the social and physical sciences to support local action and
25 deliver large-scale, inclusive transformations.

26

27

28

29 The majority of people without access to electricity and clean fuels live in rural areas.¹ Nevertheless,
30 energy access challenges in urban areas are also significant and attract policy attention. Over 880 million
31 people live in slums in developing regions, in households that suffer multiple deprivations in urban
32 services, space and security of tenure.² Such households routinely lack access to a reliable and affordable
33 supply of electricity and clean fuels. About 105 million people lack electricity in urban areas in sub-
34 Saharan Africa alone.³ In countries like Malawi, Mozambique, Rwanda or Tanzania less than half of the
35 urban households have access to an electricity connection.² People living in urban areas face specific
36 energy challenges, including: unreliability of energy services, lack of affordability, lack of access to
37 microfinance and insecurities related to tenure issues and the erroneous perceptions of slums.⁴

38 Progress towards global objectives for universal energy access has been disappointing since the UN
39 Secretary-General launched them in 2011. According to the Global Tracking Framework,³ 1.05 billion
40 people worldwide did not have access to electricity in 2014, down from 1.06 billion in 2012. The access
41 rate increased 0.27% per year, which is not sufficient to achieve the goal of universal electrification by
42 2030. The figures for access to clean cooking are even more discouraging: over 3 billion people still
43 lacked access to clean fuels and technologies in 2014. With a rate of improvement of 0.46% a year, the
44 goal of achieving universal access to clean fuels and technologies by 2030 seems unachievable.

45 The challenge of achieving universal access to modern energy services in urban areas highlights the
46 strong linkages between two Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs), SDG7 (Affordable and Clean
47 Energy) and SDG11 (Sustainable Cities and Communities). Both SDGs can be advanced simultaneously
48 through forms of inclusive urban planning that promote energy sustainability and resilience. This requires
49 two changes in policy approaches.

50 First, policies need to address the lack of installed capacity for energy access and limited availability of
51 clean fuels, particularly in sub-Saharan Africa.⁵ Addressing this persistent challenge will require a
52 substantial amount of public finance while recognising a diversity of feasible provision models.^{6,7}
53 Progress has concentrated in Asia, where multi-actor efforts in the context of industrialisation have
54 improved the rates of energy access in urban areas. For example, in Indonesia, a national-level
55 programme including governmental institutions, businesses and consumers facilitated a large shift from
56 kerosene to Liquefied Petroleum Gas (LPG) and contributed directly to the alleviation of extreme
57 poverty.^{8,9} In Sub-Saharan Africa, in contrast, energy access rates remain stagnant. Energy access rates
58 have even worsened in countries such as the Democratic Republic of the Congo and Angola.

59 Second, there is a need to challenge dominant paradigms of energy provision. Unfortunately, the
60 assumption that urbanisation is akin to an extension of the electricity grid has long dominated debates of
61 energy access in urban areas. This assumption puts a disproportionate emphasis on electrification at the
62 expense of understanding the need for fuels and technologies for clean cooking.^{10,11} Moreover, this
63 assumption obscures the complex ways in which energy access barriers manifest in urban areas and, in
64 particular, the specific limitations that emerge in sub-serviced, informal or peri-urban areas.¹²⁻¹⁶
65 Delivering sustainable energy access in urban areas requires a multidimensional understanding of users'
66 needs within diverse urban contexts.

67 These two policy changes call for a renewed research agenda on universal access to sustainable energy in
68 urban areas. In this Perspective, we outline such an agenda, and frame progress towards sustainable
69 energy as a complex, multi-dimensional challenge in the next section. Delving deeper into why the global
70 energy challenge continues to haunt contemporary societies in the age of urbanisation, we then analyse
71 barriers to energy access in urban areas. Finally, alongside a discussion of policy implications, we outline
72 the contours of an interdisciplinary research agenda that considers users' needs, explores data gaps and

73 prioritises systems of governance that can deliver urban energy services in a sustainable and equitable
74 manner.

75 **Universal energy access is a multidimensional challenge**

76 One of the greatest obstacles in achieving progress towards energy access is the dominance of a
77 technocentric approach in policy and decision making. Energy provision is routinely thought of as a
78 technical challenge, exclusively dependent on achieving economies of scale sufficient to extend grids or
79 market chains. Most often, energy access is erroneously represented as a binary phenomenon, in which
80 we can identify the precise moment after which energy needs are fully met.^{4,17,18} This leads to definitions
81 of energy access that are ‘too modest’ and do not reflect the multiple dimensions of energy demand.¹⁹

82 The energy ladder model dominates debates on urbanisation and energy access. This model assumes that
83 urbanisation enables households to move up the energy ladder because households rationalize the use of
84 energy, adopting cleaner and more expensive fuels as their income increases.²⁰ As a result, energy access
85 in urban areas is most often treated as a homogeneous process of fuel adoption and grid expansion.
86 Empirical evidence has long shown, however, that households use multiple fuels simultaneously.²¹ More
87 recently, the model has been redefined to focus on energy services rather than just fuels.²² Nevertheless,
88 the energy ladder model lacks explanatory power to explain why low income urban populations cannot
89 access the services they need.

90 Instead, energy access should be understood as part of a progressive process of wellbeing improvement.
91 Access is not only dependent on the supply of electricity and fuels. The Global Tracking Framework
92 already recognises, for example, that clean cooking depends both on the fuels and the technologies
93 employed in cooking. Additional evidence shows that energy services also depend on the built
94 environment, such as the space available for cooking, ventilation and illumination within buildings and
95 available appliances.²³ From street lighting to the maintenance of greenspaces, energy access is closely
96 linked to the development of the built environment and public space. In slums access to energy is directly
97 linked to livelihood opportunities, so investment in energy services is a key driver of development.²⁴

98 Rather than prioritising the delivery of a predetermined model of energy supply, programmes for
99 sustainable energy access should focus on delivering the types of service provision that will meet people’s
100 aspirations. Recent calls to focus on the productive uses of energy and the linkages to income generation
101 activities²⁵ highlight that achieving the SDG7 requires examining the socio-economic conditions and
102 perspectives of those who lack energy access. Addressing energy access from a people’s perspective
103 involves location-specific interventions engaging communities in energy planning activities.^{4,18} Energy
104 access also depends on community involvement to develop business models that integrate technical
105 concerns with institutional frameworks and user preferences.²⁶⁻²⁸

106 For example, more than half of the urban population in Rwanda lacks access to the electricity grid. While
107 over 65% of the households were connected to the grid in Kigali in 2011, only 17% of the households had
108 a grid connection in other cities in the country.³ Renewable energy technologies may provide an
109 alternative to facilitate energy access. Some users of solar home systems in rural and peri-urban Rwanda
110 require energy for in-household use only (e.g. lighting, mobile phone charging), while others require
111 higher levels of access to power small businesses and bigger appliances, such as welding machines.¹⁸
112 User needs are addressed in performance contracts, called *imihigo*, which provide an official framework
113 for achieving development goals at all levels of the country’s administration, including at the household
114 level. Each year, households sign official commitments, including commitments to improve energy
115 access. The source of energy is then chosen depending on the resources available, their safety and
116 affordability.

117 Energy access is linked to other basic services such as water and sanitation, and depends on programmes
118 to upgrade the built environment.^{29,30} Significant gains can be made through interventions in urban areas,
119 even in countries where there have been clear advances in energy access. In Ghana, about 1.7 million
120 people gained access to electricity every year from 2012 to 2014. Huge rolling blackouts, however, have
121 compromised these advances, particularly for poorer households lacking backup systems. This case calls
122 for research looking beyond infrastructure coverage to examine, for example, how poverty and energy
123 access are correlated in urban areas and how to ensure supply reliability in poorer households.³¹

124 The planning challenge is to provide electricity, cleaner fuels and technologies in rapidly growing urban
125 and peri-urban areas within complex and often undefined institutional frameworks and ever growing
126 demands for infrastructure.¹² Inclusive energy planning processes can support the recognition of the
127 unmet needs of the urban poor whilst simultaneously acknowledging the urgency of shifting aspirations
128 among those whose energy uses are already unsustainable.^{3,32}

129 **Challenges in urban areas**

130 Energy access is embedded within multiple tiered deprivation processes faced by the urban poor.
131 Changes to underlying factors, such as upgrades in the built environment, tenure status, access to decision
132 making processes, or market access to key appliances, may have as much impact on people's energy
133 access as any improvement in generation capacity or fuel supply. Three key reasons support the case for
134 looking at energy access in urban areas: the prevalence of misunderstandings about energy access in
135 urban areas; the concentration of vulnerable people in urban areas, especially in slums; and potential
136 opportunities for planned management and innovation in business models at the local level.

137 On-the-ground evidence of the challenges of energy access in urban areas is scant, and there have been
138 few efforts to document these experiences and compare them systematically. The Global Network on
139 Energy for Sustainable Development (GNESD) and the Poor People's Energy Outlook (PPEO) are two
140 pioneering efforts to develop a people-centred perspective on energy access which engage with the
141 specific challenges of urban areas. GNESD is a UNEP-funded network that has studied energy access in
142 urban areas since the mid-2000s, with regional studies in Kenya, Thailand, Brazil, Senegal, South Africa,
143 Argentina, and India. The Poor People's Energy Outlook (PPEO) is an annual report funded by the UK
144 Department for International Development and Practical Action since 2010. Both programmes have
145 influenced policy making at the international level, for example, in the development of the Multi-Tier
146 Framework to assess energy poverty.³³

147 GNESD found that informal settlements are often subserviced and residents may have precarious
148 structures of home ownership and limited access to both livelihood opportunities and institutions that can
149 address their needs and concerns. Data produced at the national level rarely include slum areas which are
150 often seen by governments (national and municipal) as illegal settlements.^{3,23} When data can be accessed,
151 the needs of the urban poor may be underestimated because of the exclusion of informal settlements in the
152 processes of documentation and planning. Problems in slums are 'invisible' when government officials do
153 not acknowledge their needs or even their existence. On the one hand, local governments may lack
154 capacity to respond to the needs of informal settlements. On the other hand, urban development practices
155 regularly ignore or misrepresent their existence, which may lead to conflicts over land and violence.³⁴

156 Access to electricity in such conditions, for example through off-grid systems, may have transformative
157 impacts both in terms of directly improving the lives of people at the household level, and enabling them
158 to be recognised as urban citizens through the provision of services. Here again, communities and
159 cooperative societies play a key role in providing business alternatives which can help implement and
160 deliver direct improvements in energy access to the urban poor.^{26,35}

161 The GNESD team analysed the barriers to energy access in urban areas, from both the supply side and the
162 demand side.¹⁸ Some of the barriers identified in the study relate to lack of planning; in countries such as
163 Kenya and Senegal, electrification has rarely been part of development planning. Further, lack of capacity
164 within local governments translates into an absence of planning at the institutional level. Often, citizens
165 distrust government institutions and public utilities and associate their practices with corruption,
166 carelessness, and lack of interest to implement sound solutions.

167 Barriers also emerge from the intersection of energy issues and urban social processes. For example, high
168 upfront costs and lack of proof of residence often lead to unauthorized means to access energy, whether
169 this is renting backyards to poor families in South Africa, connecting through neighbours in Thailand,
170 renting out electricity as a means of income generation in Kenya, or with the proliferation of unsafe
171 connections in India and Senegal. In the context of a total lack of access, improvisation may be the only
172 alternative open to the urban poor,³⁶ but has consequences in terms of the quality of service, its safety, and
173 the distribution of responsibilities (e.g. the urban poor may end up paying more for the same service). Key
174 urban issues, such as lack of tenure or proof of address, continue to determine energy access.

175 The last PPEO report, launched in October 2016, focused on national energy access planning.³⁷ PPEO's
176 case studies in cities like Maputo, Mozambique, show the limitations of a grid-based understanding of
177 energy access in urban areas.³⁸ Services do not always reach all urban areas, particularly in sub-serviced
178 areas and unplanned neighbourhoods. Even when households have access to an electricity grid this is not
179 an automatic guarantee of energy access since the service may be of poor quality and intermittent. Urban
180 citizens may not be able to use the service because they cannot afford it or because they are not aware of
181 how to use it. New energy services may be inappropriate to support certain cultural practices, or may
182 overlap with other fuels that already meet energy needs.

183 The PPEO provides evidence for the need to disaggregate energy access data alongside social variables.
184 For example, gender is a key variable to understand energy access. Energy services shape possibilities for
185 women to access other urban services, such as sanitation services in ill-lit public spaces, and livelihood
186 opportunities. Women may benefit from access to energy but there is little information about how access
187 to energy (or lack of thereof) affects women's labour and time. Data collected at the household level
188 rarely reflects women's needs and aspirations. As a result, energy policies targeting women are the
189 exception, rather than the norm. Other factors like age, disability, ethnic group, or sexual orientation may
190 also influence how energy access affects everyday life.

191 Another misunderstanding is the idea that large energy utilities are better able to contribute to the
192 economy because they support large industrial and business areas. This does not recognise that the
193 economies that support the urban poor are often characterised by a diversity of small enterprises which
194 provide diverse local social and economic benefits. Access to energy at a scale targeted to support small
195 enterprises can create direct livelihood opportunities for people living in slums. Often, small businesses
196 and NGOs may also be effective in advancing context-based innovations. Alongside local governments,
197 the private sector and civil society may also support action to facilitate access to sustainable energy.^{27,28}

198 Both PPEO and GNESD are examples of a growing body of people-centered research on energy access in
199 in urban areas, attending both at the manifestation of energy challenges in urban contexts and the
200 opportunities to advance global goals through local governance processes.

201 **Urgent research agendas**

202 Achieving universal access to sustainable energy is an urgent challenge but progress against timescales
203 has been slow at best. In urban areas there is space for cautious optimism, as rapid urbanisation opens up
204 opportunities for investment and improved service delivery.

205 The integration of urban development and energy planning agendas is a policy priority. Such integration
206 requires understanding the multi-scalar nature of energy challenges and how they manifest in urban areas.
207 There needs to be far greater consideration of often-ignored issues in energy policy including the needs of
208 the urban poor for clean cooking, and for better grid and off-grid electricity access, in terms of supplies
209 and appliances that will meet household needs and support productive uses and community facilities. It
210 also requires an inclusive policy agenda to diversify the voices that intervene in energy planning. Policy-
211 makers should find the means to include the views of non-experts and disadvantaged communities in
212 decision-making process, to understand their actual energy needs and how to meet them within present
213 constraints.

214 Additional research is needed both to improve data collection and challenge long-held assumptions about
215 energy access. We propose three questions to guide an emerging agenda of research. First, achieving the
216 SDGs requires a true understanding of people's needs, their perspectives and aspirations. The research
217 question is: 'what are the users' needs in specific contexts?' The question calls for a deep engagement
218 with people's aspirations while understanding the structural constraints that shape such aspirations.
219 Second, there is an urgent need to improve the types of energy knowledge and data available. The
220 question is: 'Do we have the appropriate information to address energy access questions?' There is a
221 chronic lack of data about energy use and demand, particularly for the urban poor living in rapidly
222 urbanising areas. Ongoing challenges include improving survey designs to allow data disaggregation and
223 combine quantitative data with in-depth analyses from qualitative studies. Third, in urban areas, different
224 types of actions may be effective to address context-specific constraints. The question is: 'what is the
225 match between government policies for energy access and the needs of the urban poor?' Specifically, to
226 what extent do existing systems of delivery suit people's needs? Do planning systems address noticeable
227 deficiencies in service delivery? These questions invite a reconsideration of resource distribution and
228 institutional participation in energy planning, as well as people's representation in decision making
229 processes.

230 The research questions and policy recommendations outlined here emphasise models of energy delivery
231 that recognise users' needs in context. These questions highlight the importance of socially inclusive
232 action and applied interdisciplinary research to achieve broader transformations towards universal energy
233 access in urban areas.

234 **References**

- 235 1 Ahlborg, H. & Hammar, L. Drivers and barriers to rural electrification in Tanzania and
236 Mozambique – Grid-extension, off-grid, and renewable energy technologies. *Renewable Energy*
237 **61**, 117-124, doi:<http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.renene.2012.09.057> (2014).
- 238 2 UN-Habitat. World Cities Report. (UN-Habitat, Nairobi, 2016).
- 239 3 World Bank and International Energy Agency. Sustainable Energy for All 2017 - Progress toward
240 Sustainable Energy. (World Bank/International Energy Agency, Washington DC, 2017).
- 241 4 Singh, R., Wang, X., Mendoza, J. C. & Ackom, E. K. Electricity (in) accessibility to the urban
242 poor in developing countries. *Wiley Interdisciplinary Reviews: Energy and Environment* **4**, 339-
243 353 (2015).
- 244 5 Bazilian, M. *et al.* Energy access scenarios to 2030 for the power sector in sub-Saharan Africa.
245 *Utilities Policy* **20**, 1-16, doi:<http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.jup.2011.11.002> (2012).

246 6 Glemarec, Y. Financing off-grid sustainable energy access for the poor. *Energy Policy* **47**,
247 **Supplement 1**, 87-93, doi:http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.enpol.2012.03.032 (2012).

248 7 Onyeji, I., Bazilian, M. & Nussbaumer, P. Contextualizing electricity access in sub-Saharan
249 Africa. *Energy for Sustainable Development* **16**, 520-527,
250 doi:http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.esd.2012.08.007 (2012).

251 8 Andadari, R. K., Mulder, P. & Rietveld, P. Energy poverty reduction by fuel switching. Impact
252 evaluation of the LPG conversion program in Indonesia. *Energy Policy* **66**, 436-449,
253 doi:http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.enpol.2013.11.021 (2014).

254 9 Budya, H. & Yasir Arofah, M. Providing cleaner energy access in Indonesia through the
255 megaproject of kerosene conversion to LPG. *Energy Policy* **39**, 7575-7586,
256 doi:http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.enpol.2011.02.061 (2011).

257 10 Bhattacharyya, S. C. Energy access programmes and sustainable development: A critical review
258 and analysis. *Energy for Sustainable Development* **16**, 260-271,
259 doi:http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.esd.2012.05.002 (2012).

260 11 Rehman, I. H. *et al.* Understanding the political economy and key drivers of energy access in
261 addressing national energy access priorities and policies. *Energy Policy* **47**, **Supplement 1**, 27-
262 37, doi:http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.enpol.2012.03.043 (2012).

263 12 Kemausuor, F., Obeng, G. Y., Brew-Hammond, A. & Duker, A. A review of trends, policies and
264 plans for increasing energy access in Ghana. *Renewable and Sustainable Energy Reviews* **15**,
265 5143-5154, doi:http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.rser.2011.07.041 (2011).

266 13 Melo, V. D. The Production of Urban Peripheries For and By Low-Income Populations at the
267 Turn of the Millennium: Maputo, Luanda and Johannesburg. *Journal of Southern African Studies*
268 **42**, 619-641, doi:10.1080/03057070.2016.1196955 (2016).

269 14 Jenkins, P., Robson, P. & Cain, A. Local responses to globalization and peripheralization in
270 Luanda, Angola. *Environment and Urbanization* **14**, 115-127, doi:10.1177/095624780201400110
271 (2002).

272 15 Nielsen, M. Inverse governmentality: The paradoxical production of peri-urban planning in
273 Maputo, Mozambique. *Critique of Anthropology* **31**, 329-358, doi:10.1177/0308275x11420118
274 (2011).

275 16 Jimenez-Redal, R., Parker, A. & Jeffrey, P. Factors influencing the uptake of household water
276 connections in peri-urban Maputo, Mozambique. *Utilities Policy* **28**, 22-27,
277 doi:10.1016/j.jup.2013.11.003 (2014).

278 17 World Bank and International Energy Agency. Sustainable Energy for All 2015 - Progress
279 towards sustainable energy. (World Bank/International Energy Agency, Washington DC, 2015).

280 18 GNESD. Energy access realities in urban poor communities of developing countries: assessments
281 and recommendations. (DTU/UNEP, Copenhagen, 2015).

282 19 Bazilian, M. & Pielke, R. Making Energy Access Meaningful. *Issues in Science and Technology*
283 **29**, 74-78 (2013).

284 20 van der Kroon, B., Brouwer, R. & van Beukering, P. J. H. The energy ladder: Theoretical myth or
285 empirical truth? Results from a meta-analysis. *Renewable and Sustainable Energy Reviews* **20**,
286 504-513, doi:https://doi.org/10.1016/j.rser.2012.11.045 (2013).

287 21 Masera, O. R., Saatkamp, B. D. & Kammen, D. M. From Linear Fuel Switching to Multiple
288 Cooking Strategies: A Critique and Alternative to the Energy Ladder Model. *World Development*
289 **28**, 2083-2103, doi:https://doi.org/10.1016/S0305-750X(00)00076-0 (2000).

290 22 Sovacool, B. K. Conceptualizing urban household energy use: Climbing the “Energy Services
291 Ladder”. *Energy Policy* **39**, 1659-1668 (2011).

292 23 WHO. Report on Global Urban Health. (WHO, 2016).

293 24 Parikh, P., Chaturvedi, S. & George, G. Empowering change: The effects of energy provision on
294 individual aspirations in slum communities. *Energy Policy* **50**, 477-485,
295 doi:http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.enpol.2012.07.046 (2012).

296 25 Brew-Hammond, A. Energy access in Africa: Challenges ahead. *Energy Policy* **38**, 2291-2301,
297 doi:http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.enpol.2009.12.016 (2010).

298 26 Schillebeeckx, S. J. D., Parikh, P., Bansal, R. & George, G. An integrated framework for rural
299 electrification: Adopting a user-centric approach to business model development. *Energy Policy*
300 **48**, 687-697, doi:http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.enpol.2012.05.078 (2012).

301 27 Chaurey, A., Krithika, P. R., Palit, D., Rakesh, S. & Sovacool, B. K. New partnerships and
302 business models for facilitating energy access. *Energy Policy* **47**, 48-55,
303 doi:http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.enpol.2012.03.031 (2012).

304 28 Sovacool, B. K. Expanding renewable energy access with pro-poor public private partnerships in
305 the developing world. *Energy Strategy Reviews* **1**, 181-192,
306 doi:https://doi.org/10.1016/j.esr.2012.11.003 (2013).

307 29 Smajgl, A., Ward, J. & Pluschke, L. The water–food–energy Nexus – Realising a new paradigm.
308 *Journal of Hydrology* **533**, 533-540, doi:http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.jhydrol.2015.12.033 (2016).

309 30 Vieira, A. S. & Ghisi, E. Water-energy nexus in low-income houses in Brazil: the influence of
310 integrated on-site water and sewage management strategies on the energy consumption of water
311 and sewerage services. *Journal of Cleaner Production* **133**, 145-162,
312 doi:http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.jclepro.2016.05.104 (2016).

313 31 Aglina, M. K., Agbejule, A. & Nyamuame, G. Y. Policy framework on energy access and key
314 development indicators: ECOWAS interventions and the case of Ghana. *Energy Policy* **97**, 332-
315 342, doi:http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.enpol.2016.07.012 (2016).

316 32 Satterthwaite, D. & Sverdluk, A. Energy access and housing for low-income groups in urban
317 areas. in *Energizing sustainable cities* (eds A. Grubler & D. Fisk) 73-94 (Routledge, 2013).

318 33 Bhatia, M. & Angelou, N. Beyond connections: energy access redefined. Executive Summary.
319 *IBRD/WB, Washington, D. C* (2015).

320 34 Watson, V. African urban fantasies: dreams or nightmares? *Environment and Urbanization* **26**,
321 215-231, doi:10.1177/0956247813513705 (2013).

322 35 Amanor, K. S. & Chichava, S. South-South Cooperation, Agribusiness, and African Agricultural
323 Development: Brazil and China in Ghana and Mozambique. *World Development* **81**, 13-23,
324 doi:10.1016/j.worlddev.2015.11.021 (2016).

325 36 Silver, J. Incremental infrastructures: material improvisation and social collaboration across post-
326 colonial Accra. *Urban Geography* **35**, 788-804, doi:10.1080/02723638.2014.933605 (2014).

327 37 Practical Action. 2016 Poor People’s Energy Outlook (Rugby, UK: Practical Action Publishing,<
328 http://dx. doi. org/10.3362/9781780449357, 2016).

329 38 Castán Broto, V., Stevens, L. & Salazar, D. Energy Access and Urban Poverty- Energy and
330 Everyday Life in an Informal Settlement in Maputo, Mozambique: Poor People's Energy Briefing
331 4. (Practical Action, Rugby, 2015).