1

Physical activity for primary dysmenorrhea: a systematic review and meta-analysis of randomized controlled trials

Authors

Dr Gemma MATTHEWMAN MSc Birmingham, West Midlands, UK; University of Birmingham

Dr Alexandra LEE MB ChB Birmingham, West Midlands, UK; University of Birmingham

Ms Jaidev G KAUR MPharm Birmingham, West Midlands, UK; University of Birmingham

Dr Amanda J DALEY PhD Birmingham, West Midlands, UK; University of Birmingham

Structured abstract word count: 333

Main text word count: 3182

Corresponding author:

Dr Gemma Matthewman

Institute of Applied Health Research

University of Birmingham

Edgbaston

Birmingham

B15 2TT

gemmamatthewman@doctors.org.uk

The authors report no conflict of interest

Condensation: A systematic review and meta-analysis of randomized controlled trials of the effectiveness of physical activity as a treatment for primary dysmenorrhea

Short version of title: Physical activity for primary dysmenorrhea

Implications and Contributions

A. To determine whether physical activity can reduce pain in primary dysmenorrhea.

B. Increased physical activity reduced pain intensity by almost 2cm on the VAS scale and pain duration by almost four hours in primary dysmenorrhea.

C. This study provides improved and updated evidence that physical activity may be an effective treatment for primary dysmenorrhea.

Commented [GM1]: I've tried to make this more in keeping with the example they gave in the original email

Structured Abstract

Background: Primary dysmenorrhea is cramping abdominal pain associated with menses. It is prevalent, affects quality of life, and can cause absenteeism. Although evidence based medical treatment options exist, women may not tolerate these or may prefer to use non-medical treatments. Physical activity has been recommended by clinicians for primary dysmenorrhea since the 1930s, but there is still no high quality evidence on which to recommendation exercise as treatment. use.

Objective: We sought to determine the effectiveness of physical activity for the treatment of primary dysmenorrhea

Data sources: Systematic literature searches of Medline, Embase, Cochrane, Web of Science, CINAHL, PsycINFO, SPORTDiscus, PEDro, AMED, WHO ICTRP, Clinicaltrials.gov and OpenGrey were performed, from database inception to 24th May 2017. Google searches and citation searching of previous reviews was also conducted.

Study eligibility criteria: Studies were selected using the following PICOS criteria: Participants: non-athlete females experiencing primary dysmenorrhea; Intervention: Physical activity delivered for at least two menstrual cycles; Comparator: Any comparator; Outcomes: Pain intensity or pain duration; Study type: Randomized controlled trials.

Study appraisal and synthesis methods: Study quality was assessed using the Cochrane Risk of Bias Tool. Random effects meta-analyses for pain intensity and pain duration were conducted, with pre-specified subgroup analysis by type of physical activity intervention. Strength of the evidence was assessed using GRADE.

Results: Searches identified 15 eligible randomized controlled trials; totalling 1681 participants. Data from 11 studies was included in the meta-analyses. Pooled results demonstrated effect estimates for physical activity versus comparators for pain intensity (-1.89cm on Visual Analogue Scale, 95% CI -2.96 to -1.09) and pain duration (-3.92 hours, 95% CI -4.86 to -2.97). Heterogeneity for both these results was high and only partly mitigated by subgroup analysis. Primary studies were of low or moderate methodological quality but results for pain intensity remained stable during sensitivity analysis by study quality. GRADE assessment found moderate quality evidence for pain intensity and low quality evidence for pain duration.

Conclusion: Clinicians can inform women that physical activity may be an effective treatment for primary dysmenorrhea but there is a need for high quality trials before this can be confirmed.

Key words: Exercise, Menstrual Pain, Physical Activity, Primary Dysmenorrhea

Main text

Introduction

Primary dysmenorrhea is pain occurring with menses in the absence of underlying pathology, commonly referred to as period pains or menstrual cramps by the lay press and public.¹⁻⁴ Women may consider primary dysmenorrhea to be a normal physiological state rather than a disorder.⁵ However, studies consistently find it to be the most common gynaecological condition of adolescence,⁶⁻⁸ also affecting 60 - 76% of adult menstruating women.^{9,10} Severe symptoms are reported by $13 - 33\%^{11-13}$ of women with primary dysmenorrhea and absenteeism by 24 - 43%.¹³⁻¹⁵ Approximately one third of women with primary dysmenorrhea have seen a health professional because of this condition.^{16,17}

Standard, evidence based treatment is with non-steroidal anti-inflammatory medications (NSAIDs)¹⁸ or oral hormonal contraceptives.¹⁹ Other hormonal contraceptives may be helpful but the evidence for these is less robust.⁸ Some women may not be able to use medications, or may prefer to avoid them. No complementary therapies have any high quality evidence of effectiveness.²⁰⁻²⁷

There are plausible mechanisms by which physical activity may reduce pain in primary dysmenorrhea. Pain during menstruation is thought to be mediated by uterine prostaglandins, which stimulate myometrial contractions.⁸ Pain sensitization,⁸ psychosocial^{28,29} and cultural factors³⁰ may also play a role. Physical activity reduces stress,^{31,32} has anti-nociceptive properties,³³⁻³⁶ reduces levels of PGF2 $\alpha^{37,38}$ (the prostaglandin subtype most closely linked with primary dysmenorrhea).⁸ Intense exercise has significant impacts on the menstrual cycle, with female athletes found to

Commented [GM2]: This was added because one of the reviewers wanted this paragraph expanding. I have mentioned moderate and intense exercise as most of the evidence is about intense exercise which is probably physiologically different

have fewer ovulatory cycles and lower oestrogen and progesterone levels.³⁹ However, the effects of moderate exercise during the menstrual cycle are less well understood.⁴⁰ Physical activity has been recommended by clinicians for primary dysmenorrhea since the 1930s,^{41,42} and this advice is reiterated on popular^{1,3} and medical^{4,43} websites, as well as in patient information provided by the American College of Obstetrics and Gynecology.44 However, based on current evidence, the effectiveness of physical activity is uncertain,^{26,27,45} with even less known about which types of exercise might be beneficial or when these exercises should be performed. Four reviews of interventional studies of physical activity for primary dysmenorrhea have been published (two narrative reviews in 199845 and 200826 and two systematic reviews in 2010 and 2016).²⁷ Results from these reviews were inconclusive due to lack of primary studies.²⁷ The most recent systematic review published in 2016⁴⁶ deviates substantially from the Cochrane library guidelines and PRISMA reporting standards in a number of ways. The protocol was not registered, no inclusion criteria were reported for the types or length of intervention, no sample search strategy was provided, studies were excluded based on publication status and language, no information regarding excluded studies was reported, and no data regarding statistical heterogeneity was provided. Additionally, there appeared to be low return rates on the initial searches for potentially eligible studies and there are discrepancies in the methodological descriptions in different sections of the report. We performed scoping searches which identified a number of new trials since the searches of this previous review were performed. An updated review is therefore required.

Objective

7

Commented [AD3]: Isn't it four reviews if you include the 2016 review -

We sought to systematically review the evidence from randomized controlled trials (RCTs) of the use of physical activity as treatment for primary dysmenorrhea. We sought to perform subgroup analyses based on type of intervention, type of comparator, and whether participants were adolescents or adults.⁴⁷

Methods

This review was conducted in accordance with systematic review methodologies as per the Cochrane Handbook and has been reported in compliance with the PRISMA statement. It is based upon a prospectively registered protocol, available at: www.crd.york.ac.uk/PROSPERO/ (registration number 42017062202).⁴⁷

The search strategy was developed building on search strategies from previous similar reviews.^{26-28,32,33,48,49} The following databases were used: Medline, Embase, Cochrane Database of Systematic Reviews, Cochrane Central Register of Controlled Trials, Science Citation Index, Social Sciences Citation Index, CINAHL, PsycINFO, SPORTDiscus, PEDro, AMED, Conference Proceedings Citation Index, Social Sciences Conference Proceedings Citation Index, Social Sciences Conference Proceedings Citation Index, WHO International Clinical Trials Registry Platform, Clinicaltrials.gov and OpenGrey. Google searches and citation searching of previous reviews were also conducted.

Indexing terms (where possible) and text words (title, abstract, key words and text search) were used for "physical activity" and "dysmenorrhea" terms. Language, date or publication type restrictions were not applied. "Humans" filters were used on some databases with large return rates (e.g. Medline) to enable easier handling of search results. Validated RCT filters were used where required,⁵⁰⁻⁵² the inbuilt search filter was used for CINAHL. The Medline search strategy (see Appendix A) was piloted for sensitivity and specificity using studies found during the initial scoping searches.

No changes were required following piloting. Searches performed on other databases used the same text terms as the piloted Medline search, with index terms adapted for the specific database.

Eligibility criteria

Published and unpublished studies, in any language, were included where the following PICOS criteria were met:

- Participants: Non-athlete females with regular menstruation, experiencing primary dysmenorrhea (diagnosis as defined by report), not using hormonal contraception
- Interventions: Physical activity interventions delivered over two or more menstrual cycles; as a single intervention or as a co-intervention, in any setting and via any mode of delivery
- Comparators: Any comparator that did not involve physical activity, including active comparators and usual care or no treatment
- Outcomes: Pain intensity (most painful day or average pain intensity on days that pain was experienced) measured by a validated tool, or pain duration measured in hours
- Study type: RCTs

Athletes were excluded as those exercising at very high levels have different menstrual cycle characteristics to moderate or low level exercisers.³⁹ Hormonal contraception also significantly alters menstrual cycle physiology. Those with irregular menstruation are likely to have an underlying gynecological disorder and therefore consideration to excluding these women should be made in the primary studies. An author defined diagnosis of primary dysmenorrhea was used as the diagnosis is usually based on history and examination, with pelvic examination typically avoided in adolescents.⁵³

Title and abstract screening was performed independently by two reviewers and any discrepancies were resolved by consensus between the two reviewers. Full text screening for inclusion of eligible studies was completed by two independent reviewers; discrepancies were resolved by consensus between these reviewers. Study authors were contacted for missing information with a reminder sent after three weeks if there had been no reply. In total, 20 study authors were contacted for further information regarding 17 studies but only five replied.

Data extraction

The data extraction form was adapted from the Cochrane Good Practice Data Extraction form⁵⁴ and was piloted prior to use. Data from included studies was extracted for participants (setting, population, method of diagnosis, inclusion / exclusion criteria, sample size, age range), intervention (type of intervention, method, timing and frequency of delivery, duration), comparators (type of comparator, timing and duration), and outcomes (time point measured, measurement tool, mean, variance). Data extraction was completed by two independent reviewers using the full text copy and any supplementary information (protocols, correspondence from authors). The main publication was used as the reference and other sources were used to obtain any information that was not reported in the main study publication. Discrepancies were resolved by consensus between the two reviewers.

Assessment of risk of bias

The Cochrane Collaboration Risk of Bias Tool was used⁵⁵ with one adaption: "blinding of participants / personnel" was changed to "blinding to study purpose / group" as physical activity interventions do not allow complete blinding.^{26,56} Studies could therefore still be rated to be of high methodological quality despite being at high risk of bias. The main biases considered in the "other bias" section were recall bias, interviewer bias, contamination, the Hawthorne effect and the effect of cointerventions. Studies were assessed for quality at the study level by two independent reviewers using the Cochrane guidance.⁵⁰ Discrepancies were resolved by consensus. Quality assessment was used for descriptive purposes and sensitivity analysis only.

Data synthesis

Review Manager 5.3 (Revman) was used for statistical analyses. Meta-analyses of pain intensity and duration were performed as specified in the review protocol.⁴⁷ Where trials compared two physical activity interventions against one comparator, they were considered as two separate trials;⁵⁷⁻⁶⁰ the number of participants in the comparator group was evenly divided between the trials to avoid double-counting of comparators. The variance was adjusted accordingly where required. The final participant number (n) was not provided for three studies;⁶⁰⁻⁶² for these studies n was assumed to be the total randomized. Results for Ortiz 2015⁶³ were obtained from a graph; they did not specify the measure of variance so this was assumed to be standard deviation.

Results were combined using the weighted mean difference, as most studies reported pain intensity using a visual analogue scale (VAS) in centimetres and pain duration in hours. VAS is a 10cm, usually horizontal, line anchored by the phrases "no pain" and "worst pain imaginable" at each end. One study⁶⁴ used the McGill questionnaire,

which cannot be converted to VAS, so data from this trial could not be included in the meta-analysis. The remaining studies reported pain intensity using VAS in millimetres⁶³ and pain duration in days.^{62,65} These results were converted to centimetres and hours respectively before analysis. A correlation coefficient of 0.6 was used to estimate the standard deviation of the mean difference where this was not provided, based on the result obtained in an RCT of a physical activity intervention in a similar population.⁶⁶ Inverse variance methods were used for weighting in the meta-analyses. The random effects model was used as it was anticipated there may be a high degree of heterogeneity. I^2 was used to assess heterogeneity; an I^2 value greater than 50% was considered to indicate substantial heterogeneity.⁵⁰ Funnel plots were produced to look for publication bias.

Cluster RCTs could not be included in the meta-analyses as no intra-cluster correlation coefficient was reported in the eligible trials. Separate pooling of cluster RCTs was performed for pain duration but only one cluster randomized study reported pain intensity in a format that could be used. Subgroup analysis was not possible for comparator type as specified in the protocol due to insufficient primary studies. Subgroup analysis by age, which was also specified in the protocol, was not possible as most included studies did not provide enough detail on age ranges.

Strength of the evidence

The strength of the evidence was assessed by GRADE at the outcome level for pain intensity and pain duration using GRADE Pro / GDT. Two independent reviewers performed GRADE assessment with discrepancies resolved by consensus. A starting rating of high quality evidence was downgraded by one level for serious concerns (or

by two levels for very serious concerns) for risk of bias, inconsistency, indirectness, imprecision and publication bias.

Results

Searches were performed on 24th May 2017, resulting in 582 returns once duplicates were removed. The returns for individual databases are given in Appendix B. The PRISMA flow diagram, representing the flow of studies through the selection process, is shown in Figure 1. 69 articles were assessed at the full text stage, with 54 excluded at this stage. A list of studies excluded at this point can be found, with reasons for exclusion, in Appendix C.

Nine studies were only found in Persian or Mandarin. These papers were assessed with the assistance of native Persian and Mandarin speakers. Where the full text could not be located the study authors were contacted where possible. Two theses and one conference abstract could not be located by any method and were thus excluded at the full text stage.

Study characteristics

Fifteen RCTs, all published since 2011, met the review inclusion and exclusion criteria. This resulted in a total of 1681 participants across all included studies.^{57-65,67-76} Details of these studies are presented in Table 1. Included studies were small or medium sized single-centre trials from a range of countries but primarily Iran or India. Most studies recruited university students. Diagnosis of primary dysmenorrhea was usually based on clinical history,^{58,60-62,64,67,68,71-76} four studies performed a clinical examination for all participants,^{59,63,65,69} and three used ultrasound^{59,65,69} to exclude secondary causes. A range of physical activity interventions were used. These could

be categorised into: aerobic exercise,^{58,60,63,67,71,73,76} stretching exercises,^{59,61-64,67-69,74,75} yoga^{60,65,70,72} or Kegels exercises.^{57,58,63,76} Ortiz 2015 used a mixed intervention.⁶³ The majority of studies asked participants to perform exercises throughout the menstrual cycle, but not during menstruation.^{59,61,62,68,69,71,74} Reyhani 2013 asked participants to exercise by brisk walking for the first three days of menstruation.⁷³ Rakhshaee 2011 asked participants to perform yoga in the luteal phase of the menstrual cycle.⁷²

Synthesis of results

Meta-analysis of pain intensity (Figure 3) produced a pooled effect estimate of -1.89cm (95% CI -2.96 to -1.09), representing a statistically significant reduction in pain intensity for those in the intervention (physical activity) group relative to comparators. Heterogeneity was high ($I^2 = 95\%$).

Subgroup analysis by intervention demonstrated effect sizes of -1.29cm (95% CI -2.38 to -0.21, I^2 83%) for aerobic exercise interventions; -1.67cm (95% CI -2.70 to -0.63, I^2 94%) for stretching exercise interventions; -1.81cm (95% CI -2.37 to -1.61, I^2 0%) for yoga interventions; -1.68cm (95% CI -2.43 to -0.93, I^2 0%) for Kegels exercise interventions and -4.70cm (95% CI -5.15 to -4.25) for the single mixed intervention trial. Studies that could not be included in the meta-analysis demonstrated the same direction of treatment effect.^{64,69,71,72,75}

Meta-analysis of pain duration (Figure 4) produced a pooled estimate of effect of -3.92 hours (95% CI -4.86 to -2.97), representing a reduction in pain duration for those in the intervention (physical activity) group relative to comparators. Heterogeneity was high ($I^2 = 78\%$). Data from two cluster RCTs was combined with a similar pooled effect size of -3.34 hours (95% CI -4.15 to -2.53).

Subgroup analysis by intervention demonstrated effect sizes of -15.64 hours (95% CI -26.96 to -4.32, I^2 49%) for aerobic exercise interventions; -3.53 hours (95% CI -4.25 to -2.81, I^2 82%) for stretching exercise interventions; -6.74 hours (95% CI -13.4 to -0.03, I^2 32%) for yoga exercise interventions; and -21.00 hours (95% CI -38.70 to -3.30) for the single Kegels exercise intervention.

Four studies could not be included in the meta-analysis (WHY? and six further studies did not report on both pain intensity and pain duration in a way that could be utilised for pooled effect estimates (see Appendix E for reasons for exclusion from the meta-analysis).

Sensitivity analysis was performed for type of comparator and timing of intervention (not specified in protocol), with no significant change in the combined estimate of treatment effect. Funnel plot asymmetry was seen for both outcomes. Pain intensity did not demonstrate the classical funnel shape, possibly due to the heterogeneity of primary studies. The funnel plot for pain duration suggested publication bias. This is potentially due to selective outcome reporting as five studies included in the pain intensity meta-analysis did not publish data on pain duration, and most studies were found to be at a high risk of selective outcome reporting. However, results remained statistically significant when the smaller studies contributing to this asymmetry were removed.

Analysis of absenteeism was planned but this was only reported in one study with no measure of variance given. 62

Risk of bias of included studies

Commented [AD4]: I don't think you give a reason for the 6 but not the 4?

Most included studies were at high risk of bias in multiple areas of study design, or did not report sufficiently in order for a conclusion to be made about the risk of bias (see Figure 2). The randomization process was not fully described for most studies^{58,60-62,64,68,69,71,72,74-76} and allocation concealment was only performed in two studies.^{63,70} No studies reported blinding participants to study purpose or group and only one study reported blinding outcome assessors.⁶³ Most studies did not report how or when they measured pain intensity.^{57-61,63,65,68-70} Registered protocols were found for three studies,^{58,62,64,74-76} of which two proposed outcomes that were not reported in the final study.^{74,75} Selective outcome reporting is also suggested by the range of outcomes reported across studies. Results were sometimes reported incompletely;^{63,64,68,75} for example, Aboushady 2016⁶⁸ did not report post-intervention pain intensity in the control group. Most studies reported no loss to follow up.^{57,58,62,64,65,68-70,73-76} Those studies that did report loss to follow up did not use intention to treat analysis.^{59,63,72} The remaining studies did not report how many participants completed the intervention and follow up.^{60,61,71}

Most biases would be expected to affect the results such that they increased the magnitude of the treatment effect. However, when low quality studies were removed (Score < 3 on risk of bias assessment in Figure 2), there was an increase in the pooled estimate of treatment effect for pain intensity (from -1.89cm (95% CI -2.96 to -1.09) to -2.87cm (95% CI -5.10 to -0.63)). Only one study of moderate quality assessed pain duration with a non-significant estimate of treatment effect of -2.64 hours (95% CI -11.58 to 6.30) suggesting that the evidence for the effect of physical activity on pain duration is less reliable.

Comment

Main findings

This systematic review and meta-analysis suggests that physical activity may be an effective intervention for primary dysmenorrhea. However, these results should be interpreted with caution, as heterogeneity was high and only partially mitigated by sub group analysis. Studies were of low or moderate quality, mainly due to performance bias and potential selective outcome reporting. Nevertheless, results for pain intensity remained stable when low quality studies were removed providing some reassurance of the treatment effect observed. All studies demonstrated an improvement in pain (intensity and / or duration) with intervention, including those that could not be included in the meta-analysis. The overall assessment of the strength of evidence using GRADE showed moderate quality evidence for pain intensity and low quality evidence for pain duration (see Figure 5).

As well as considering the statistical significance and methodological quality of the results it is important to place these within a clinical context. No minimal clinically important difference (MCID) is available in the literature for pain intensity measured by VAS in primary dysmenorrhea, but the MCID in endometriosis is 1cm.⁷⁷ This suggests that the pooled estimate, at almost 2cm, is clinically significant. There are no reported values for the MCID for pain duration in primary dysmenorrhea or similar conditions.

Strengths and limitations

This review was conducted in accordance with systematic review methodologies as described in the Cochrane Handbook⁵⁰ and has been reported in compliance with the PRISMA statement⁷⁸. A prospective protocol was registered on PROSPERO, ensuring methods were specified *a priori*, unlike previous reviews.⁴⁷ Substantially more RCTs

were found in this review than all previous reviews.. Searches used in this review were also more comprehensive than previous reviews; covering more databases, and identifying grey literature, such as theses and conference proceedings that were not identified in previous reviews. All eligible studies that were not published in English were translated so that they could be considered for inclusion. In compliance with current best practice guidelines for systematic reviews, eligibility screening, data extraction, quality assessment and strength of evidence assessment were all performed by two independent reviewers. The meta-analyses for this review contain the largest number of RCTs to date, and assess both pain intensity and pain duration (only the former has been previously assessed by meta-analysis). Our review is also the first to include subgroup analysis by type of physical activity. Interrogation of the data using sensitivity analysis and Funnel plots was performed, which was not the case in previous reviews. This review is also the first to report on strength of the evidence using GRADE. This review is therefore the most complete, up to date and methodologically rigorous review of the effectiveness of physical activity interventions for primary dysmenorrhea.

Despite this the findings remain limited by the number of primary studies, trial sample size and the quality of included studies. No high quality trials were identified, and reporting of trial methodology was not always clear. Publication bias was suggested for pain duration. The results of this review are subject to high levels of heterogeneity, introducing some uncertainty about the effectiveness of physical activity. Heterogeneity appeared to occur because studies evaluated a wide range of physical activity interventions. Attempts to resolve this by conducting subgroup analysis were somewhat limited because of insufficient primary studies. Insufficient data from primary studies also prevented reporting of one of the pre-specified outcomes

Commented [AD5]: Who by? This is incomplete?

(absenteeism) and two of the pre-specified subgroup analyses (adolescents and adults, comparator type).

Comparison with existing literature

Increased physical activity was identified as a small protective factor against experiencing dysmenorrhea in a 2006 systematic review of observational studies (odds ratio (OR) of 0.89, 95% CI 0.80 to 0.99).²⁸ A non-systematic review of controlled trials published in 1998 also found a beneficial effect, but noted there was a paucity of methodologically robust studies to confirm this.⁴⁵ Interestingly, the review authors considered three trials to be randomized despite not being reported as such, and not being considered as such in other reviews.^{26,27} A non-systematic review in 2009²⁶ and a Cochrane library systematic review in 2010 (including both primary and secondary dysmenorrhea)²⁷ identified just one small RCT which demonstrated a beneficial effect of treadmill running.⁷⁹ This single trial had some methodological limitations and therefore the previous reviews concluded that there was insufficient evidence to recommend the intervention. The most recent systematic review found a beneficial effect of physical activity but similarly reported that included trials contained methodological flaws limiting the strength of their conclusions.⁴⁶

Conclusions and Implications

This review provides moderate quality evidence that physical activity may reduce pain intensity and low quality evidence that it may reduce pain duration in primary dysmenorrhea., Whilst physical activity is currently recommended in clinical guidelines for primary dysmenorrhea, more high quality studies are needed before this can be confirmed. Future trials should adhere to international reporting guidelines, and seek to minimise sources of bias. Trials that evaluate the optimum type and timing of physical activity interventions are also required.

Acknowledgements:

Sue Bayliss (University of Birmingham) for assistance with building the search strategy, Sayeed Haque (University of Birmingham) for assistance with statistical analysis, Natalie-Tyldesley-Marshall (University of Birmingham) for assistance with reviewing articles, Manadana Zanganeh (University of Birmingham) for assistance with translating and reviewing articles published in Persian, Zhaonan Wang (University of Birmingham) for assistance with translating and reviewing articles published in Mandarin.

References

- Uzoma K. Can exercising stop menstrual cramps? 2015; <u>http://www.livestrong.com/article/384938-can-exercising-stop-menstrual-cramps/</u>. Accessed 10th April, 2017.
- Wilkinson E. Exercise 'no aid' for period pain. 2009; <u>http://www.nhs.uk/news/2009/12December/Pages/Exercise-no-relief-for-period-pain.aspx</u>. Accessed 10th April, 2017.
- 5-Minute Workout: Relief from Cramps. 2017; <u>http://www.fitnessmagazine.com/workout/express/5-minute/moves-to-relieve-cramps/</u>. Accessed 10th April, 2017.
- 4. NHS Choices. Period Pain. 2016; <u>http://www.nhs.uk/conditions/periods-painful/pages/introduction.aspx#Treating</u>. Accessed 10th April, 2017.
- Wong LP. Attitudes towards dysmenorrhoea, impact and treatment seeking among adolescent girls: a rural school-based survey. *Australian Journal of Rural Health*. 2010;19:218 - 223.
- 6. Berkley KJ. Primary dysmenorrhea: An urgent mandate. Pain: Clinical Updates. 2013;21(3).
- Proctor M, Farquhar C. Diagnosis and management of dysmenorrhoea. BMJ. 2006;332(7550):1134 - 1138.
- 8. lacovides S, Avidon I, Baker FC. What we know about primary dysmenorrhea today: a critical review. *Human Reproduction Update*. 2015;21(6):762 778.
- Weissman AM, Hartz AJ, Hansen MD, Johnson SR. The natural history of primary dysmenorrhoea: a longitudinal study. *British Journal of Obstetrics and Gynaecology*. 2004;111(4):342 - 352.
- 10. Burnett MA, Antao V, Black A, et al. Prevalence of primary dysmenorrhea in Canada. *Journal* of Obstetrics and Gynaecology Canada. 2005;27(8):765 770.
- 11. Suvitie PA, Hallamaa MK, Matomaki JM, Makinen JI, Perheentupa AH. Prevalence of Pain Symptoms Suggestive of Endometriosis Among Finnish Adolescent Girls (TEENMAPS Study). Journal of Pediatric and Adolescent Gynecology. 2016;29(2):97 - 103.
- 12. Nooh AM, Abdul-Hady A, El-Attar N. Nature and prevalence of menstrual disorders among teenage female students at Zagazig University, Zagazig, Egypt. *Journal of Pediatric and Adolescent Gynecology*. 2016;29(2):137 142.
- 13. Esen I, Oğuz B, Serin HM. Menstrual characteristics of pubertal girls: A questionnaire-based study in Turkey. *Journal of Clinical Research in Pediatric Endocrinology*. 2016;8(2):192 196.
- 14. Banikarim C, Chacko MR, Kelder SH. Prevalence and impact of dysmenorrhea on Hispanic female adolescents. *Archives of Pediatric and Adolscent Medicine*. 2000;154:1226.
- 15. Agarwal A, Venkat A. Questionnaire study on menstrual disorders in adolescent girls in Singapore. *Journal of Pediatric and Adolescent Gynecology*. 2009;22:365.
- 16. Hewison A, Van den Akker OB. Dysmenorrhoea, menstrual attitude and GP consultation. British Journal of Nursing. 1996;5(8):480 - 484.
- 17. Hillena TIJ, Grbavac SL, Johnston PJ, Straton JAY, Keogh JMF. Primary dysmenorrhea in young Western Australian women: prevalence, impact, and knowledge of treatment. *Journal of Adolescent Health.* 1999;25(1):40 45.
- 18. Majoribanks J, Ayeleke RO, Farquar C, Proctor M. Nonsteroidal anti-inflammatory drugs for dysmenorrhoea. *Cochrane Database of Systematic Reviews*. 2015:CD001751.
- 19. Wong CL, Farquhar C, Roberts H, Proctor M. Oral contraceptive pill for primary dysmenorrhoea. *Cochrane Database of Systematic Reviews*. 2009(4):CD002120.
- 20. Smith CA, Armour M, Zhu X, Li X, Lu ZY, Song J. Acupunture for dysmenorrhoea. *Cochrane Database of Systematic Reviews*. 2016:CD007854.
- 21. Pattanittum P, Kunyanone N, Brown J, et al. Dietary supplements for dysmenorrhoea. *Cochrane Database of Systematic Reviews*. 2016:CD002124.

- 22. Proctor ML, Murphy PA. Herbal and dietary therapies for primary and secondary dysmenorrhoea. *Cochrane Database of Systematic Reviews*. 2001;3:CD002124.
- 23. Proctor ML, Hing W, Johnson TC, Murphy PA. Spinal manipulation for primary and secondary dysmenorrhoea. *Cochrane Database of Systematic Reviews*. 2001;4:CD002119.
- 24. Zhu X, Proctor M, Bensoussan A, Wu E, Smith CA. Chinese herbal medicine for primary dysmenorrhoea. *Cochrane Database of Systematic Reviews*. 2008;2:CD005288.
- 25. Proctor ML, Smith CA, Farquhar CM, Stones RW. Transcutaneous electrical nerve stimulation and acupuncture for primary dysmenorrhoea. *Cochrane Database of Systematic Reviews*. 2002;1:CD002123.
- Daley AJ. Exercise and primary dysmenorrhoea : a comprehensive and critical review of the literature. Sports Medicine. 2008;38(8):659 - 670.
- 27. Brown J, Brown S. Exercise for dysmenorrhoea. *Cochrane Database of Systematic Reviews*. 2010(2):CD004142.
- Latthe P, Mignini L, Gray R, Hills R, Khan K. Factors predisposing women to chronic pelvic pain: systematic review. BMJ. 2006;332:749 - 755.
- 29. Ju H, Jones M, Mishra G. The prevalence and risk factors of dysmenorrhea. *Epidemiologic Review.* 2014;36:104 - 113.
- 30. Faramarzi M, Salmalia H. Association of Psychologic and Nonpsychologic Factors With Primary Dysmenorrhea. *Iranian Red Crescent Medical Journal*. 2014; 16(8).
- 31. Josefsson T, Lindwall M, Archer T. Physical exercise intervention in depressive disorders: meta-analysis and systematic review. *Scandinavian Journal of Medicine and Science in Sports.* 2014;24(2):259 - 272.
- 32. Byrne A, Byrne DG. The effect of exercise on depression, anxiety and other mood states: a review. *Journal of Psychosomatic Research*. 1993;37(6):565 574.
- Geneen LJ, Moore RA, Clarke C, Martin D, Colvin LA, Smith BH. Physical activity and exercise for chronic pain in adults: an overview of Cochrane Reviews. *Cochrane Database of Systematic Reviews*. 2017:CD011279.
- Stagg NJ, Mata HP, Ibrahim MM, et al. Regular exercise reverses sensory hypersensitivity in a rat neuropathic pain model: role of endogenous opioids. *Anaesthesiology*. 2011;114(4):940 -948.
- 35. Bortz WM, Angwin P, Mefford IN. Catecholamines, dopamine and endorphin levels during extreme exercise. *New England Journal of Medicine*. 1981;305:466 467.
- 36. Colt EW, Wardlaw SL, Frantz AG. The effect of running on plasma beta endorphin. *Life Sciences*. 1981;28:1637 - 1640.
- Anderson SD, Pojer R, Smith ID, Temple D. Exercise-related changes in plasma levels of 15keto-13,14-dihydro-prostaglandin F2alpha and noradrenaline in asthmatic and normal subjects. Scand J Respir Dis. 1976;57(1):41 - 48.
- Rong Z, Shan F. The efficacy and mechanism of yoga treatment for primary dysmenorrhea suffered by female college students. *Journal of Physical Education Guangzhou*. 2013;20(6):115 - 119.
- Maïmoun L, Georgopoulos NA, Sultan C. Endocrine Disorders in Adolescent and Young Female Athletes: Impact on Growth, Menstrual Cycles, and Bone Mass Acquisition. Journal of Clinical Endocrinology and Metabolism. 2014;99(11):4037 - 4050.
- Stoddard JL, Dent CW, Shames L, Bernstein L. Exercise training effects on premenstrual distress and ovarian steroid hormones. *European Journal of Applied Physiology*. 2006;99:27 -37.
- 41. Clow AES. Treatment of dysmenorrhoea by exercise. *BMJ*. 1932;1:4 5.
- 42. Any Questions? Exercises for dysmenorrhoea. BMJ. 1960;1:71.
- 43. Smith RP, Kaunitz AM. Patient education: Painful menstrual periods (dysmenorrhea). Beyond the Basics 2017; https://www.uptodate.com/contents/painful-menstrual-periodsdysmenorrhea-beyond-the-basics. Accessed 10th April, 2017.

- American College of Obstetrics and Gynaecology. Dysmenorrhea: Painful Periods. 2015; <u>https://www.acog.org/Patients/FAQs/Dysmenorrhea-Painful-Periods</u>. Accessed 22nd November, 2017.
- 45. Golomb LM, Solidum AA, Warren MP. Primary dysmenorrhea and physical activity. *Medicine* and Science in Sports and Exercise. 1998;30(6):906 - 909.
- 46. Abaraogu UO, Tabansi-Ochiogu CS, Igwe ES. Effectiveness of exercise therapy on pain and quality of life of patients with primary dysmenorrhea: a systematic review with metaanalysis. *Turkish Journal of Physical Medicine and Rehabilitation*. 2016;62(4):346 - 354.
- 47. Matthewman G, Daley AJ, Bates E. A systematic review of randomised controlled trials of the effectiveness of increased physical activity as a treatment option in primary dysmenorrhoea. *PROSPERO*. 2017:CRD42017062202.
- 48. Mishra SI, Scherer RW, Snyder C, Geigle PM, Berlanstein DR, Topaloglu O. Exercise interventions on health-related quality of life for people with cancer during active treatment. *Cochrane Database of Systematic Reviews*. 2012:CD008465.
- 49. Proctor D, Murphy PA, Pattison HM, Suckling JA, Farquhar C. Behavioural interventions for dysmenorrhoea. *Cochrane Database of Systematic Reviews*. 2007:CD002248.
- 50. Higgins JPT, Green S. Cochrane Handbook for Systematic Reviews of Interventions. In: Higgins JPT, Green S, eds.: The Cochrane Collaboration; 2011.
- 51. Wong SS-L, Wilczynski NL, Haynes RB. Developing optimal search strategies for detecting clinically sound treatment studies in EMBASE. *Journal of the Medical Library Association*. 2006;94(1):41 47.
- 52. Eady AM, Wilczynski NL, Haynes RB. PsycINFO search strategies identified methodologically sound therapy studies and review articles for use by clinicians and researchers. *Journal of Clinical Epidemiology*. 2008;61(1):34 40.
- 53. Dysmenorrhoea. *NICE Clinical Knowledge Summaries* 2014; <u>https://cks.nice.org.uk/dysmenorrhoea#!backgroundsub</u>. Accessed 7th June, 2017.
- 54. Effective Practice and Organisation of Care (EPOC) Group. Data extraction form. *EPOC Rescources for Review Authors.* 2013.
- 55. Hartling L, Ospina M, Liang Y, et al. Risk of bias versus quality assessment of randomised controlled trials: cross sectional study. *BMJ*. 2009;339:1017.
- 56. Theou O, Stathokostas L, Roland KP, et al. The effectiveness of exercise interventions for the management of frailty: A systematic review. *Journal of Aging Research.* 2011;569194.
- 57. Kaur A, Gaurav S, Dhakshinamoorty P. Comparison of effect of fast and slow kegels exercises in reducing pain in primary dysmenorrhoea: experimental design. *Physiotherapy and Occupational Therapy Journal*. 2013;6(135 41).
- Nasri M, Barati AH, Ramezani AR. Comparison of aerobic training and pelvic floor muscle exercise on primary dysmenorrhea in adolescent girls. *Journal of Clinical Nursing and Midwifery*. 2016;5(3):53 - 61.
- 59. Saleh HS, Mowafy HE, Abd El Hameid AA. Stretching or core strengthening exercises for managing primary dysmenorrhea. *Journal of Womens Health Care*. 2016;5(1):1 6.
- 60. Siahpour T, Nikbakht M, Rahimi E, Rabiee MA. The effect of 8 weeks aerobic exercise and yoga on primary dismenorrhea. *Armaghane-Danesh, Yasuj University of Medical Sciences Journal* 2013:483.
- 61. Patel NS, Tanna T, Bhatt S. Effect of active stretching exercises on primary dysmenorrhea in college going female students. *Indian Journal of Physiotherapy and Occupational Therapy*. 2015;9(3):72 76.
- 62. Motahari-Tabari N, Shirvani MA, Alipour A. Comparison of the effect of stretching exercises and mefenamic acid on the reduction of pain and menstruation characteristics in primary dysmenorrhea: A randomized clinical trial. *Oman medical journal.* 2017;32(1):47 - 53.

- Ortiz MI, Cortes-Marquez SK, Romero-Quezada LC, Murguia-Canovas G, Jaramillo-Diaz AP. Effect of a physiotherapy program in women with primary dysmenorrhea. *European Journal* of Obstetrics Gynecology and Reproductive Biology. 2015;194:24 - 29.
- 64. Behbahani BM, Ansaripour L, Akbarzadeh M, Zare N, Hadianfard MJ. Comparison of the effects of acupressure and self-care behaviors training on the intensity of primary dysmenorrhea based on McGill pain questionnaire among Shiraz University students. *Journal of Research in Medical Sciences*. 2016;21:104.
- 65. Yang NY, Kim SD. Effects of a yoga program on menstrual cramps and menstrual distress in undergraduate students with primary dysmenorrhea: A single-blind, randomized controlled trial. *Journal of Alternative and Complementary Medicine*. 2016;22(9):732 738.
- 66. Ussher M, Lewis S, Aveyard P, et al. Physical activity for smoking cessation in pregnancy: Randomised controlled trial. *BMJ.* 2015:350.
- 67. Vaziri F, Hoseini A, Kamali F, Abdali K, Hadianfard M, Sayadi M. Comparing the effects of aerobic and stretching exercises on the intensity of primary dysmenorrhea in the students of universities of Bushehr. *Journal of Family and Reproductive Health.* 2015;9(1):23 28.
- 68. Aboushady RM-N, El-Saidy TMK. Effect of home based stretching exercises and menstrual care on primary dysmenorrhea and premenstrual symptoms among adolescent girls. *IOSR Journal of Nursing and Health Science*. 2016;5(2):10 17.
- 69. Shahr-Jerdy S, Hosseini RS, Eivazi M. Effects of stretching exercises on primary dysmenorrhea in adolescent girls. *Biomedical Human Kinetics*. 2012;4:127 132.
- 70. Yonglitthipagon P, Muansiangsai S, Wongkhumngern W, et al. Effect of yoga on the menstrual pain, physical fitness, and quality of life of young women with primary dysmenorrhea. *Journal of Bodywork and Movement Therapies*. 2017. http://onlinelibrary.wiley.com/o/cochrane/clcentral/articles/619/CN-01308619/frame.html.
- Sutar A, Paldhikar S, Shikalgar N, Ghodey S. Effect of aerobic exercises on primary dysmenorrhoea in college students. *IOSR Journal of Nursing and Health Science*. 2016;5(5):20 - 24.
- 72. Rakhshaee Z. Effect of three yoga poses (cobra, cat and fish poses) in women with primary dysmenorrhea: a randomized clinical trial. *Journal of Pediatric and Adolescent Gynecology*. 2011;24(4):192 196.
- 73. Reyhani T, Jafarnejad F, Behnam H, Ajam M, Baghaei M. The effect of brisk walking on primary dysmenorrhea in girl students. *Iranian Journal of Obstetrics, Gynecology and Infertility.* 2013;16(46):14 19.
- 74. IRCT201203118822N2. Comparative effectiveness of mefenamic acid capsules, ginger and stretching exercise on primary dysmenorrhea. In:2013.
- 75. IRCT2013071013940N1. Effect of accupressure on primary dysmenorrhea. In. Shiraz University of Medical S, trans2014.
- 76. IRCT2014042017362N1. The effects of two selected types of training on primary dysmenorrhea in adolescent girls. In:2014.
- 77. Gerlinger C, Schumacher U, Faustman T, Colligs A, Schmitz H, Seitz C. Defining a minimal clinically important difference for endometriosis-associated pelvic pain measured on a visual analog scale: analyses of two placebo-controlled, randomized trials. *Health and Quality of Life Outcomes.* 2010;8:138.
- Moher D, Liberati A, Tetzlaff J, Altman DG, The PRISMA Group. Preferred reporting items for systematic reviews and meta-analyses: The PRISMA statement. *Annals of Internal Medicine*. 2009;151(4).
- Israel RG, Sutton M, O'Brien KF. Effects of aerobic training on primary dysmenorrhea symptomatology in college females. *Journal of American college Health*. 1985;33:241 - 244.

Table 1 – Description of included studies

"Cycles" refers to menstrual cycles

Study	n	Participants	Intervention(s)	Comparator(s)	Outcome(s)	Results
Aboushady 2016 ⁶⁸	8 0	School / college students, Saudi Arabia (16–21yrs)	• Instructional sessions (Menstrual care, stretches); exercises at home, 20-30mins, 2x/day, 3d/w for 8wks	Menstrual care instructional session only	Pain duration Pain intensity via VAS	Statistically significant difference in pain duration Pain intensity only reported as pre/post-test
Behbahani 2016 ^{64,75}	1 2 0	Non-medical students, Iran (18– 25yrs)	 4wks educational classes (physiology, nutrition, exercises), "isometric exercises" at home for 4wks 	Acupressure during pain Ibuprofen 400mg 3x/day	Pain intensity via McGill questionnaire	Statistically significant reduction in pain intensity in exercise / acupressure groups compared to ibuprofen
Kaur 2013a ⁵⁷ Kaur 2013b	2 4	Hostel at Post- Graduate Institute, India (19–25yrs)	 Slow Kegels group: Hot pack, 90x Kegel exercises alt days, 5–10s hold; for 8wks Fast Kegels group as above, no hold 	Hot pack over lower abdomen for 10mins	Pain intensity via VAS	No statistically significant difference in pain intensity between slow Kegels and control Statistically significant reduction in pain intensity in fast Kegels compared to control
Motahari- Tabari 2017 ^{62,74}	1 2 2	Medical students, Iran (Age range not reported)	 15mins abdominal / pelvic stretching exercises, taught initially, 3x/wk; for 2 cycles 	Mefenamic acid 250mg 3x/day	Pain intensity via VAS Pain duration	No statistically significant difference in pain intensity or pain duration
Nasri 2016a ^{58,76} Nasri 2016b	45	High school pupils, Iran ("Teenagers")	 Aerobic group: 45mins observed "aerobic exercise", 3x/wk; for 8wks Kegel group: 15 mins Kegel exercises; 6s hold, 3x/day 	Usual care - "no exercise", advised no salty / fatty foods, no medications	Pain intensity via VAS Pain duration	No statistically significant reduction in pain intensity / duration between exercise groups Statistically significant reduction in pain intensity / duration compared to control
Ortiz 2015 63	1 9 2	Uni students, Mexico (18–22yrs)	 Stretches (inc Billig / Kegel), jogging, relaxation led / monitored by instructors; 50mins, 3x/wk; for 3 cycles 	Kept in courtyard; "walking, talking and standing"	Pain intensity via VAS	Statistically significant reduction in pain intensity
Patel 2015	$\begin{vmatrix} 1 \\ 2 \\ 0 \end{vmatrix}$	Students, India (17– 25yrs)	• 6 stretches; 2x/day, 3x/wk for 8wks	Usual care	Pain intensity via VAS	Statistically significant reduction in pain intensity

Study	n	Participants	Intervention(s)	Comparator(s)	Outcome(s)	Results
Rakhshaee 2011 ⁷²	1 2 0	Uni students, Iran (17–23yrs)	• 3 yoga poses / breathing techniques taught by booklet, for 20mins/day, luteal phase (14d) of 2 cycles	Usual care	Pain intensity via 0–3 scale Pain duration	Statistically significant reduction in pain intensity and pain duration
Reyhani 2013 ⁷³	9 0	Nursing/midwifery students, Iran (Age range not reported)	 30mins brisk walking (one training session), 1st 3d of menstruation; for 3 cycles 	Usual care	Pain intensity via VAS	Statistically significant reduction in pain intensity
Saleh 2016a ⁵⁹ Saleh 2016b	1 5 0	Women from outpatient clinic, Egypt (Age range not reported)	 Stretching group: 4 stretches, 10mins, 3x/d, 3x/wk; for 8wks Core strengthening group: 4 core strengthening exercises, 20mins, 4x/wk 	Usual care	Pain intensity via VAS Pain duration	Statistically significant reduction in pain intensity / pain duration in both intervention groups when compared to control
Shahr- Jerdy 2012	1 7 9	High school pupils, Iran (15-17ys)	• 6 stretches taught initially, 10mins, 2x/d, 3x/wk; for 8wk	Usual care - exercises taught to controls after study	Pain intensity via VAS Pain duration	Statistically significant reduction in pain intensity and pain duration
Siahpour 2013a ⁶⁰ Siahpour 2013b	6 0	Uni students, Iran (20–25yrs)	 Aerobic group: Aerobic dance for 60 mins, 3x/wk; for 8wks Yoga group: 60 mins yoga, 3x/wk; "trained" 	Usual care	Pain intensity via VAS Pain duration	Statistically significant reduction in pain intensity / pain duration between aerobic and yoga groups compared to control
Sutar 2016	1 0 0	Medical students, India (18–22yrs)	• Aerobic dance for 45mins, 3x/wk, for 8wks	Usual care	Pain intensity via VAS	Statistically significant reduction in pain intensity
Yang 2016 ⁶⁵	$\begin{array}{c} 1\\ 4\\ 0 \end{array}$	Nursing students, S Korea (20–23yrs)	• 60mins guided yoga, 1x/wk (poses, sun salutations, relaxation); for 12wks	Usual care - told not to do yoga	Pain intensity via VAS Pain duration	Statistically significant reduction in pain intensity No statistically significant reduction in pain duration
Yonglitthip agon 2017 70	3 4	Uni students, Thailand (18–22yrs)	 30mins yoga taught by booklet, 2x/wk; for 12wks Diary / weekly phone calls to check adherence 	Usual care	Pain intensity via VAS	Statistically significant reduction in pain intensity

Figure legends

Figure 1 - PRISMA flow diagram.

PRISMA flow diagram demonstrating flow of studies through identification process and eligibility screening *See Appendix C for further details

Figure 2 - Risk of Bias Summary

Summary of Risk of Bias of included studies

Figure 3 - Pain intensity meta-analysis

Random effects meta-analysis of pain intensity via VAS in cm

Figure 4 – Pain duration meta-analysis

Random effects meta-analysis of pain duration in hours

Figure 5 - GRADE evidence profile

Evidence profile for pain intensity and pain duration

Appendix A - Search strategies

Medline / Medline in Process searched 05/24/17:

1	exp Dysmenorrhea/ 3600				
2	dysmenorrh*.ti,ab. 4950				
3	(menstrua* adj2 pain).ti,ab. 720				
4	(menstrua* adj2 cramp).ti,ab.	. 7			
5	(period* adj2 pain*).ti,ab.	1372			
6	1 or 2 or 3 or 4 or 5	7684			
7	exp Exercise/ or exp Exercise	se Therapy/ 184201			
8	exp Physical Exertion/ or ex	p Physical Fitness/ 79696			
9	exp running/ or exp swimmi	ing/ or exp walking/81381			
10	exp tai ji/ or exp yoga/ 2	2941			
11	exp dancing/ or exp gardening	ng/ or exp sports/ 162811			
12	exercis*.ti,ab. 245761				
13	"physical activit*".ti,ab.	82503			
14	sport*.ti,ab. 57350				
15	stretch*.ti,ab. 62854				
16	fitness.ti,ab. 55378				
17	jog*.ti,ab. 2026				
18	running.ti,ab. 49262				
19	swim*.ti,ab. 32718				
20	(cycl* adj2 train*).ti,ab.	2065			
21	walk*.ti,ab. 93124				
22	yoga.ti,ab. 3190				
23	"tai ji".ti,ab. 25				
24	"tai chi".ti,ab. 1249				
25	pilates.ti,ab. 304				
26	"physical training".ti,ab.	5245			
27	"resistance training".ti,ab.	5278			
28	(athlete* adj2 train*).ti,ab. 4	4489			
29	"weight training".ti,ab.	914			
30	isometric*.ti,ab. 30361				
31	danc*.ti,ab. 5670				
32	7 or 8 or 9 or 10 or 11 or	12 or 13 or 14 or 15 or 16 or 17 or 18 or 19			
or 20	or 21 or 22 or 23 or 24 or 731463	25 or 26 or 27 or 28 or 29 or 30 or 31			
33	6 and 32 312				
34	randomized controlled trial.pt	t. 462560			
35	controlled clinical trial.pt.	94063			
36	randomized controlled trial.sh	n. 462560			
37	random allocation.sh.92576				
38	double blind method.sh.	147085			

39 single-blind method.sh. 24526 40 34 or 35 or 36 or 37 or 38 or 39 645852 41 (animals not human).sh. 6109803 42 40 not 41 571840 43 clinical trial.pt. 521341 44 exp clinical trial/ 803438 (clin\$ adj25 trial\$).ti,ab. 368228 45 46 ((singl\$ or doubl\$ or trebl\$ or tripl\$) adj25 (blind\$ or mask\$)).ti,ab. 161643 47 placebos.sh. 34931 48 placebo\$.ti,ab. 192528 49 research design.sh. 96076 50 43 or 44 or 45 or 46 or 47 or 48 or 491211208 1110374 51 50 not 41 52 51 not 42 562047 53 comparative study.sh.1809971 54 exp evaluation studies/ 232296 55 follow up studies.sh. 586124 56 prospective studies.sh. 456986 57 (control\$ or 31thlete3131ve\$ or volunteer\$).ti,ab. 3751440 58 53 or 54 or 55 or 56 or 57 5717430 59 58 not 41 4252943 60 59 not (42 or 52) 3578680 61 42 or 52 or 60 4712567 62 33 and 61 136

EMBASE searched 05/24/17:

- 1 exp Dysmenorrhea/ 9975
- 2 dysmenorrh*.ti,ab. 6530
- 3 (menstrua* adj2 pain).ti,ab. 993
- 4 (menstrua* adj2 cramp).ti,ab. 11
- 5 (period* adj2 pain*).ti,ab. 2026
- 6 1 or 2 or 3 or 4 or 5 13542
- 7 exp Exercise/ or exp Physical Activity/ 539709
- 8 exp Sport/ or exp Fitness/ 159023

9 exp dynamic exercise/ or exp isotonic exercise/ or exp anaerobic exercise/ or

exp static exercise/ or exp aerobic exercise/ or exp isokinetic exercise/ 16049

- 10 exp stretching exercise/ or exp aquatic exercise/ or exp isometric exercise/ 5696
- 11 exp stretching/ or exp muscle stretching/ or exp muscle training/ or exp resistance training/ or exp pelvic floor muscle training/ 29219
- 12 exp running/ or exp swimming/ or exp walking/ 123921
- 13 exp jogging/ or exp pilates/2023

14 exp tai ji/ or exp yoga/ 7329 15 exp dancing/ or exp gardening/ or exp sports/ 133605 16 exercis*.ti,ab. 316216 108960 17 "physical activit*".ti,ab. 18 sport*.ti,ab. 75241 19 stretch*.ti,ab. 66632 20 fitness.ti,ab. 61859 21 jog*.ti,ab. 2419 22 running.ti,ab. 59265 23 swim*.ti,ab. 38714 (cycl* adj2 train*).ti,ab. 24 2321 25 walk*.ti,ab. 124213 26 yoga.ti,ab. 4466 27 "tai ji".ti,ab. 49 "tai chi".ti,ab. 1729 28 29 pilates.ti,ab. 449 30 "physical training".ti,ab. 6938 31 "resistance training".ti,ab. 6242 32 (32thlete* adj2 train*).ti,ab. 5243 33 "weight training".ti,ab. 997 34 isometric*.ti,ab. 34963 35 danc*.ti,ab. 7125 36 exp health care quality/ 2478747 37 random:.tw. 1190652 38 clinical trial:.mp. 1442523 39 7 or 8 or 9 or 10 or 11 or 12 or 13 or 14 or 15 or 16 or 17 or 18 or 19 or 20 or 21 or 22 or 23 or 24 or 25 or 26 or 27 or 28 or 29 or 30 or 31 or 32 or 33 or 34 or 35 1005054 40 36 or 37 or 38 4188607 6 and 39 and 40 41 243 PsycINFO searched 05/24/17:

- 1 exp Dysmenorrhea/ 190
- 2 dysmenorrh*.ti,ab. 304
- 3 (menstrua* adj2 pain).ti,ab. 122
- 4 (menstrua* adj2 cramp).ti,ab.
- 5 (period* adj2 pain*).ti,ab. 229
- 6 1 or 2 or 3 or 4 or 5 617
- 7 exp Exercise/ or exp Aerobic Exercise/ 22140
- 8 exp Physical Fitness/ or exp Physical activity/ 35122
- 9 exp running/ or exp swimming/ or exp walking/ 7599

1

10 exp yoga/ 1407

11	exp dancing/ or exp dance therapy/ 93	38
12	exp sports/ or exp athletic training/ 22	2874
13	exercis*.ti,ab. 52521	
14	"physical activit".ti,ab. 26010	
15	sport*.ti,ab. 27171	
16	stretch*.ti,ab. 4142	
17	fitness.ti,ab. 12800	
18	jog*.ti,ab. 417	
19	running.ti,ab. 12473	
20	swim*.ti,ab. 8017	
21	(cycl* adj2 train*).ti,ab. 217	
22	walk.ti,ab. 6195	
23	yoga.ti,ab. 2052	
24	"tai ji".ti,ab. 5	
25	"tai chi".ti,ab. 443	
26	pilates.ti,ab. 55	
27	"physical training".ti,ab. 520	
28	"resistance training".ti,ab. 484	
29	(33thlete* adj2 train*).ti,ab. 797	
30	"weight training".ti,ab. 178	
31	isometric*.ti,ab. 1865	
32	danc*.ti,ab. 6309	
33	(control: or random*.tw. or exp treatment/	1218890
34	7 or 8 or 9 or 10 or 11 or 12 or 13 or 1	4 or 15 or 16 or 17 or 18 or 19
or 20	or 21 or 22 or 23 or 24 or 25 or 26 or 27	7 or 28 or 29 or 30 or 31 or 32
	150179	

35 6 and 33 and 34 23

CINAHL searched 05/24/17:

1 MH exercise OR MH exercise therapy OR MH physical exertion OR MH physical fitness OR MH locomotion OR MH exercise movement techniques OR MH recreation 48,339S14

AB dysmenorrh* OR AB "menstrual cramp*" OR AB "menstrual pain" OR
AB "period pain" OR AB "painful periods" OR AB "painful menstrua*" 858
TI dysmenorrh* OR TI "menstrual cramp*" OR TI "menstrual pain" OR TI

"period pain" OR TI "painful periods" OR TI "painful menstrua*" 573
4 KW dysmenorrh* OR KW "menstrual cramp*" OR KW "menstrual pain" OR
KW "period pain" OR KW "painful periods" OR KW "painful menstrua*" 15,172
5 2 OR 3 OR 4 1,147

6 AB "physical activit*" OR AB 33thlete33* OR AB (stretch* or isometric) OR AB (fitness or sport*) OR AB "physical training" OR AB "weight training"

OR AB "resistance training" OR AB (jog* or running or swim* or walk* or danc*) OR AB (yoga or "tai ji" or "tai chi" or pilates) 131,871

7 TI "physical activit*" OR TI 34thlete34* OR TI (stretch* or isometric) OR TI (fitness or sport*) OR TI "physical training" OR TI "weight training" OR TI "resistance training" OR TI (jog* or running or swim* or walk* or danc*) OR TI (voga or "tai ji" or "tai chi" or pilates) 97,173

- (yoga or "tai ji" or "tai chi" or pilates) 97,
 8 KW "physical activity" OR KW exercise 35
- KW "physical activity" OR KW exercise 356 OR 7 OR 8 182,705
- 9 6 OR 7 OR 8 18 10 1 OR 9 202,476
- 11 MH dysmenorrhea 1,025
- 11 Will dyshellornea 1,025
- 12 5 OR 11 1,566
- 13 10 AND 12 95

14 Limiters – Clinical Queries: Therapy – High Sensitivity 46

SPORTDiscus searched 05/24/17:

1AB dysmenorrh* OR AB "menstrual cramp*" OR AB "menstrual pain" ORAB "period pain" OR AB "painful periods" OR AB "painful menstrua*"1572TI dysmenorrh* OR TI "menstrual cramp*" OR TI "menstrual pain" OR TI"period pain" OR TI "painful periods" OR TI "painful menstrua*"60

3 KW dysmenorrhea OR KW dysmenorrhoea 35

4 1 OR 2 OR 3 190

5 AB "physical activit*" OR AB 34thlete34* OR AB (stretch* or isometric) OR AB (fitness or sport*) OR AB "physical training" OR AB "weight training" OR AB "resistance training" OR AB (jog* or running or swim* or walk* or danc*) OR AB (yoga or "tai ji" or "tai chi" or pilates) 420,655

6 TI "physical activit*" OR TI 34thlete34* OR TI (stretch* or isometric) OR TI (fitness or sport*) OR TI "physical training" OR TI "weight training" OR TI "resistance training" OR TI (jog* or running or swim* or walk* or danc*) OR TI (yoga or "tai ji" or "tai chi" or pilates) 272,594

7 KW "physical activity" OR KW exercise 20,595

- 8 5 OR 6 OR 7 556,573
- 9 4 AND 8 53

AMED searched 05/24/17:

1AB dysmenorrh* OR AB "menstrual cramp*" OR AB "menstrual pain" ORAB "period pain" OR AB "painful periods" OR AB "painful menstrua*"1202TI dysmenorrh* OR TI "menstrual cramp*" OR TI "menstrual pain" OR TI"period pain" OR TI "painful periods" OR TI "painful menstrua*"1303KW dysmenorrhea OR KW dysmenorrhoea116

4 1 OR 2 OR 3 195

AB "physical activit*" OR AB 35thlete35* OR AB (stretch* or isometric) 5 OR AB (fitness or sport*) OR AB "physical training" OR AB "weight training" OR AB "resistance training" OR AB (jog* or running or swim* or walk* or danc*) OR AB (yoga or "tai ji" or "tai chi" or pilates) 24,404 TI "physical activit*" OR TI 35thlete35* OR TI (stretch* or isometric) OR 6 TI (fitness or sport*) OR TI "physical training" OR TI "weight training" OR TI "resistance training" OR TI (jog* or running or swim* or walk* or danc*) OR TI (yoga or "tai ji" or "tai chi" or pilates) 19,137 KW "physical activity" OR KW exercise 15,600 7 5 OR 6 OR 7 8 36.091 4 AND 8 9 7 Cochrane searched 05/24/17: 1 "dysmenorrhea":ti,ab,kw (Word variations have been searched) 1188 2 MeSH descriptor: [Dysmenorrhea] explode all trees 465 3 "menstrual cramps":ti,ab,kw 27 "period pains":ti,ab,kw 4 5 "painful menstruation":ti,ab,kw 17 "menstrual pain":ti,ab,kw 6 174 7 1 or 2 or 3 or 4 or 5 or 6 1235 8 MeSH descriptor: [Exercise] explode all trees 18710 9 MeSH descriptor: [Exercise Therapy] explode all trees 10374 10 MeSH descriptor: [Physical Exertion] explode all trees 3389 MeSH descriptor: [Physical Fitness] explode all trees 11 2648 MeSH descriptor: [Running] explode all trees 1599 12 13 MeSH descriptor: [Swimming] explode all trees 407 MeSH descriptor: [Walking] explode all trees 14 3482 15 MeSH descriptor: [Sports] explode all trees 12907 16 MeSH descriptor: [Yoga] explode all trees 513 17 MeSH descriptor: [Tai Ji] explode all trees 343 18 MeSH descriptor: [Dancing] explode all trees 128 19 "35thlete35*":ti,ab,kw 57524 20 "physical activit*":ti,ab,kw 13568 21 sport*:ti,ab,kw 4824 22 stretch*:ti,ab,kw 2968 23 6049 fitness:ti,ab,kw 24 jog*:ti,ab,kw 318 25 running:ti,ab,kw 3623 26 swim*:ti,ab,kw 813 27 "cycl* train*":ti,ab,kw 129 28 walk*:ti,ab,kw 14632 29 yoga:ti,ab,kw 1449

30 "tai chi":ti,ab,kw 666

31 "tai ji":ti,ab,kw 355 32 pilates:ti,ab,kw 187 33 "physical training":ti,ab,kw 1083 34 "resistance training":ti,ab,kw 4765 35 "weight training":ti,ab,kw 310 36 isometric:ti,ab,kw 3299 danc*:ti,ab,kw 488 37 38 8 or 9 or 10 or 11 or 12 or 13 or 14 or 15 or 16 or 17 or 18 or 19 or 20 or 21 or 22 or 23 or 24 or 25 or 26 or 27 or 28 or 29 or 30 or 31 or 32 or 33 or 34 or 35 or 36 or 37 81187 7 and 38 39 40 Web of Science searched 05/24/17: TS=(dysmenorrh*) 3,781 1 2 TS=("menstrual cramp*") 72 3 TS=(menstru* NEAR/1 pain*) 634 TS=(period\$ NEAR/1 pain*) 811 4 5 4 OR 3 OR 2 OR 1 4,861 6 TS=("physical activit*") 120,487 7 TS=(36thlete36*) 346,079 8 TS=(sport*) 103,132 9 TS=(stretch*) 145,828 10 TS=(fitness) 104,942 TS=(jog*) 11 3,483 TS=(running) 408,116 12 13 TS=(swim*) 52,369 14 TS=(cycl* NEAR/2 train*) 3,333 15 TS=(walk*) 171,784 16 TS=(yoga) 3,304 17 TS=("tai ji") 61 18 TS=("tai chi") 1,945 19 TS=(pilates) 341 20 TS=("physical training") 5,087 21 TS=("resistance training") 6,810 22 TS=(36thlete* NEAR/2 train*) 5,548 1,330 23 TS=("weight training") 24 TS=(isometric*) 35,686 25 TS=(danc*) 15,569 25 OR 24 OR 23 OR 22 OR 21 OR 20 OR 19 OR 18 OR 17 OR 16 OR 26 15 OR 14 OR 13 OR 12 OR 11 OR 10 OR 9 OR 8 OR 7 OR 6 1,340,672 26 AND 5 231 27

PEDro searched 05/24/17:

1	dysmenorrh* AND exercise*	17
2	dysmenorrh* AND physical activit*	3
3	dysmenorrh* AND yoga	6
4	dysmenorrh* AND stretch*	28

Clinicaltrials.gov searched 05/24/17:

Condition: dysmenorrhoea OR "menstrual cramps" OR "menstrual pain" OR "period pain" OR "painful periods" OR "painful menstruation"

Intervention: "physical activity" OR exercise OR sport OR stretch OR fitness OR "physical training" OR "resistance training" OR "weight training" OR jogging OR running OR walking OR swimming OR yoga OR "tai chi" OR pilates (searches both tai ji and tai chi)

13

WHO ICTRP searched 05/24/17:

Condition: dysmenorrhea OR dysmenorrhoea OR menstrual cramps OR menstrual pain OR period pain OR painful periods OR painful menstruation Intervention: physical activity OR exercise OR sport OR stretch OR fitness OR physical training OR resistance training OR weight training OR jogging OR running OR walking OR swimming OR yoga OR tai chi OR pilates 11

OpenGrey searched 05/24/17:

Dysmenorrhea	1
Dysmenorrhoea	6
Menstrual + exercise 11	
Menstrual + sport	3
Menstrual + yoga	0
Menstrual + physical activity	0

Google searched 05/24/17:

Google was searched using the terms "dysmenorrhea" and "exercise"; all returns up to page 15 were reviewed at which point no new returns were being identified. This was repeated with the alternative spelling "dysmenorrhoea". The Menstruation Research website was also searched in greater detail

(menstruationresearch.org)

Appendix B - Database search returns

Database	Interface	Dates	Returns
MEDLINE and MEDLINE In Process	Ovid	1946 -	136
		05/24/17	
EMBASE	Ovid	1974 -	243
		05/24/17	
PsycINFO	Ovid	1806 -	23
		05/24/17	
Cochrane Database of Systematic Reviews (CDSR)	Cochrane Library	N/A	40 total*
Cochrane Central Register of Controlled Trials	Cochrane Library	1966 -	
(CENTRAL)	_	05/24/17	
CINAHL	EBSCO	1937 -	46
		05/24/17	
SPORTDiscus	EBSCO	1980 -	53
		05/24/17	
AMED (Allied and Complimentary Medicine	EBSCO	1995 -	7
Database)		05/24/17	
PEDro	NeuRA	1929 -	41
		05/14/17	
Science Citation Index	Web of Science	1964-	231 total*
		05/24/17	
Conference Proceedings Citation Index	Web of Science	1990 -	
		05/24/17	
Social Sciences Citation Index	Web of Science	1900 -	
		05/24/17	
Conference Proceedings Citation Index - Social	Web of Science	1990 -	
Sciences and Humanities		05/24/17	
Clinicaltrials.gov	National Institute of	То	13
	Health	05/24/17	
WHO ICTRP	WHO	То	11
		05/24/17	
OpenGrey	SIGLE	1993 -	21
		05/24/17	
Google	Google	N/A	42 new
Citation searching	N/A	N/A	1 new

SCI/CPCI/SSCI/SS-CPCI and CDSR/CENTRAL were searched simultaneously; there is therefore no individual return numbers for these databases.

Appendix C – Excluded studies with reasons for exclusion

A reference list of excluded studies can be obtained from the study authors

Study	Reason for exclusion	
Abbaspour 2006	No inclusion / exclusion criteria reported, no reply from	
-	authors	
ACTRN12613001195741	Registered trial and feasibility study, contacted authors who	
	have completed trial and are in process of publishing,	
	however unwilling to share any of data	
Anonymous 1945	Letter	
Anonymous 1960	Letter	
Anonymous 1993	Review	
Arora 2014	No inclusion / exclusion criteria reported, no reply from	
	authors	
Azima 2015a	Two arm trial which is also reported as 3 arm trial - see	
-	Azima 2015b below	
Azima 2015b	No inclusion / exclusion criteria in either of papers reporting	
	trial, protocol contains some inclusion / exclusion criteria but	
	does not specify regarding secondary dysmenorrhoea,	
	irregular menstruation or hormonal contraception	
Chaudhuri 2013	Some participants were athletes, also some had irregular	
	periods (from correspondence with author)	
Chien 2013	Non-randomized controlled trial	
Dehghanzadeh 2014	Before and after trial	
DeWitt 1981	Asked women about hormonal contraception but did not	
	specify whether these women were excluded	
El Refaye 2007	Thesis, no online abstract, unable to obtain full text through	
	inter-library loans, no contact details for authors	
Gamit 2014	Physical activity intervention for four weeks only	
Golub 1960	Non-randomized controlled trial	
Golub 1963	Before and after trial	
Halder 2012	Non-randomized controlled trial	
Haman1945	Before and after trial	
Harris 1955	Before and after trial	
Heidarianpour 2016	Menstrual characteristics, dysmenorrhoea considered but did	
-	not exclude secondary dysmenorrhoea	
Huang 2007	No inclusion / exclusion criteria reported, unable to find	
	contact details for authors	
Hubbell 1949	Non-randomized controlled trial	
IRCT2013071013940N1 Registered trial, results published in Behbahani 20		
IRCT2016103119024N2	Registered trial, unable to find published paper, contacted	
	authors and no reply; probably still ongoing as only registered	
	in 2016	
ISRCTN75567759	Registered trial and published protocol, mixed-methods study	
	with no randomization	
Jahromi 2008	Before and after trial	

Kang 2009	Thesis, unable to obtain full text through inter-library loans,
	no contact details for authors
Kanwal 2016	Physical activity intervention for one month only
Kashef 2014	Physical activity intervention for four weeks only
Khare 2016	Physical activity interevention for three weeks only
Kaur 2014	Unclear whether secondary causes excluded. No contact
	details for authors. Mentions randomization in abstract but in
	text participants are "taken at random"
Kumar 2013	No inclusion / exclusion criteria reported, unable to find
	contact details for authors
Locke 1999	Review
Locke 1999	Review
Lundquist 1947	Non-randomized controlled trial
Mahishale 2013	Physical activity intervention for one menstrual cycle only
Mahvash 2012	Unclear whether those on hormonal contraception or with
	irregular periods were excluded as no inclusion / exclusion
	criteria were given. No contact details found
Mathur 1986	Non-randomized controlled trial
Monika 2012	Hormonal contraception specifically provided to the groups
Motesharee 2013	Hormonal contraception / irregular periods not excluded
Nag 2013	No inclusion / exclusion criteria reported, unable to find
	contact details for authors. Unclear whether athletes included
	(although have excluded those already practicing yoga),
	whether those on hormonal contraception or with irregular
	periods were excluded.
Pazoki 2013	Pre-menstrual symptoms; dysmenorrhoea considered but did
	not exclude secondary dysmenorrhoea
Pazoki 2016	Pre-menstrual symptoms; dysmenorrhoea considered but did
	not exclude secondary dysmenorrhoea
Rani 2013	Hormone profiles assessed as outcome
Roozbahani 2015	Did not exclude secondary dysmenorrhoea
Rezvani 2013	Unclear whether women using hormonal contraception were
	excluded, no reply from authors
Rong 2013	Unclear whether athletes or women using hormonal
	contraception were excluded, unable to find contact details for
	authors
Shah 2016	No inclusion / exclusion criteria, no reply from authors
Steege 1993	Pre-menstrual symptoms; dysmenorrhoea considered but did
	not exclude secondary dysmenorrhoea
Thomas 2010	Physical activity intervention for 3 weeks only
Vaziri 2015	Menstrual symptoms assessed as outcome, unable to extract
	data about pain
Wilt 1976	Not specified whether those with secondary cause excluded,
	unable to obtain information from authors as no contact
	details
Yeknami 2015	No inclusion / exclusion criteria, no reply from authors

Appendix D - Risk of Bias Assessment

	Risk of	Justification
	Bias	
Random sequence	Low /	
generation	High /	
	Unclear	
Allocation	Low /	
concealment	High /	
	Unclear	
Blinding to study	Low /	Studies were considered at high risk of bias
group / study	High /	if they reported that no blinding was done, or
purpose	Unclear	blinding was not reported but the comparator
		group received no intervention.
Blinding of outcome	Low /	
assessment	High /	
	Unclear	
Incomplete outcome	Low /	
data	High /	
	Unclear	
Selective outcome	Low /	
reporting	High /	
	Unclear	
Other bias (observer	Low /	Studies were considered at high risk of bias
bias, recall bias,	High /	if one of these biases was present. If none of
contamination. co-	Unclear	these biases were adequately described studies
interventions.		were considered at unclear risk of bias
Hawthorne effect)		Interviewer bias - high risk if outcomes
		assessed during interview
		Recall bias – high risk if outcomes assessed
		more than one day after the end of
		menstruation
		Contamination – high risk if participants were
		from schools / colleges / individual courses
		unless cluster randomized
		Co-interventions $-$ high risk if there was a
		co-intervention or physical activity was
		performed in a group
		Hawthorne effect – high risk if physical
		activity was performed in a group or closely
		monitored setting

	Pain intensity	Pain duration	Absenteeism
Aboushady 2016	Only reported for	Included	Not reported
Behbahani 2016	Pain intensity reported via McGill questionnaire	Not reported	Not reported
Kaur 2013	Included	Not reported	Not reported
Motahari-Tabari 2017	Included	Included	No measure of variance given
Nasri 2016	Included	Included	Not reported
Ortiz 2015	Included, derived from graph	Not reported	Not reported
Patel 2015	Included	Not reported	Not reported
Rakhshaee 2011	VAS reported as 0 to 3 categorical scale	Included in cluster randomised meta- analysis	Not reported
Reyhani 2013	Included	Not reported	Not reported
Saleh 2016	Included	Included	Not reported
Shahr-Jerdy 2012	Cluster randomised; no other clusters to combine with	Included in cluster randomised meta- analysis	Not repeated
Siahpour 2013	Included	Included	Not reported
Sutar 2016	No measure of variance given	Not reported	Not reported
Yang 2016	Included	Included	Not reported
Yonglitthipagon 2017	Included	Not reported	Not reported

Appendix E - Reasons For Exclusion From Meta-Analysis