

Media and The Religious Intolerance: A Framing Analysis of the Religious Intolerance in the Special Region of Yogyakarta Province, Indonesia

Inez Christyastuti Hapsari¹, Eriyanto²

¹Magister Student, Program of Communication Management Studies, Faculty of Social and Political Science, University of Indonesia, Jakarta, 10430, Indonesia.

²Lecturer, Program of Communication Management Studies, Faculty of Social and Political Science, University of Indonesia, Jakarta, 10430, Indonesia

*Corresponding author, email: inez.hapsari@gmail.com

Abstract

Since the foundation in 1945, Indonesia has never been declared as a particular state religion, and instead home to six beliefs. Nevertheless, the inequality number of followers in each religion leads to the majority and minority classification. Thus, it is challenging to prevent social friction in the form of religious intolerance, wherein the constitution mentioned, the freedom of religion and belief should be guaranteed as part of human rights. A mezzo study from The Wahid Institute (2014) showed unpleasant result; Special Region of Yogyakarta (DIY), which was well-known by its plurality and toleration, had 733,33 percent increasing religious intolerance incidents, led it to become the second-highest province with religious intolerance incidents. Therefore, this study aims to understand, why did the local media, *Kedaulatan Rakyat*, *Harian Jogja* frame the incidents as a mere law and crime events, by highlighting the violent aspects. The result found, the local media tend not to damage harmony and peace in DIY Province since they are reluctant to the figure of the Sultan.

Keywords: religious intolerance, human rights, mass media, news framing, Pan and Kosicki framing model.

1. Introduction

Since the foundation in 1945, Indonesia has never been declared as a particular state religion, and instead home to six beliefs. The inequality in the number of followers of each religion leads to the majority, and minority classification, with Moslem, consists of 87.2 percent, Christian 6.9 percent, Catholic 2.9 percent, Hindu 1.7 percent, Buddhist 0.7 percent, and Confucianism 0.05 percent of the population. (Indonesia.go.id. 2017).

However, the gap of the number of the religious adherents should not cause a crucial problem since the freedom of religion and is guaranteed as the essential human rights on the Indonesian Constitution, mainly in the chapter XA about the Human Rights, article 28E verse (2) which stated, “Each person has the right to embrace religion and worship according to his religion,” as well as the article 29 verse (2) which stated, “The state guarantees the independence of each population to embrace their respective religions and to worship according to their religion and believe”.

Nevertheless, the rising number of social frictions related to religion and beliefs is more worrying to the government and society. The frictions related to the religion comes in the form of the religious intolerance, which defined as “each difference, exceptions, restrictions or preferences based on religion or belief which aims to bring the loss or damage the recognition, enjoyment, or the implementation of the freedom and rights based on the equality.” (Dja’far, 2015)

One of the most horrifying cases is Special Region of Yogyakarta (DIY), a province in Indonesia, which is well-known for its toleration towards the plurality of the tribes, religions, races, and inter-class. A mezzo study from The Wahid Institute (2014) showed, in 2014, DIY was recorded as the second-highest province with religious intolerance incidents. During that year, the province has 22 religious intolerance incidents, increasing 733,3 percent from the previous year with three incidents.

As a note, the amount of religious intolerance event recorded by The Wahid Institute (2014) in DIY Province was 21. However, the researcher adds an incident in June 4, 2014—so the total of incidents becomes 22—when the National Police Chief (Kapolri) forbid the worship activity at home. It was a follow-up of the religious intolerance incident in DIY Province, which dated on June 1, 2014. On that day, there was a destruction of a worship building in Sleman Regency, DIY Province.

Against the toleration label, 2014 was the first time DIY Province placed on the top three positions for the religious intolerance issue. (The Wahid Institute, 2014) The incidents were covered by two local media; *Kedaulatan Rakyat*, the oldest mass media in DIY Province, and *Harian Jogja*, a local newspaper in DIY Province, which networks with Bisnis Indonesia, a media group in national level.

However, a prior research using media framing perspective and the Pan and Kosicki framing model found out those local media did not portray the religious intolerance incident in DIY Province in 2014 properly. Nevertheless, those local media tend to frame the religious intolerance incident as a mere law and crime events, by highlighting the violent aspects.

A further finding also found out that the chosen frame by the media correlated with the cultural realm of the society in DIY Province. It affected the local mass media to process sensitive events, such as the religious intolerance incidents in a certain way. One of them, is by covering it as news on its platforms.

Table 1: List of Religious Intolerance Incidents in DIY Province from January 1 December 31, 2014

NO	INCIDENTS	DATE	LOCATION	ACTOR	VICTIM
1	Fatwa that Syiah DIY is a misguided sect	January 5, 2014	DIY Province	Indonesian Ulema Council (MUI)	Rausyan Fikr Insitution
2	Rejection toward a Christian Church in Baciro	February 11, 2014	Baciro, Yogyakarta, DIY Province	Front Jihad Islam (FJI) and Baciro resident	People of the Yehuwa Church in Baciro
3	Spread of hatred toward Syiah sect	February 15, 2014	Yogyakarta, DIY Province	FJI	Syiah people and Iran Embassy
4	Assault based on religious motive	March 2014	Nitipuran village, Tamantirto, Kasihan, Bantul, DIY Province	Mass from Darussunnah <i>Pesantren</i>	Citizen
5	Threat to Darussunnah <i>Pesantren</i> closure	March 3, 2014	Nitipuran village, Tamantirto, Kasihan, Bantul, DIY	Citizen	Darussunnah <i>pesantren</i> , kindergarten, elementary school
6	Close of Darussunnah <i>Pesantren</i>	March 5, 2014	Nitipuran village, Tamantirto, Kasihan, Bantul, DIY Province	Bantul regency government	Darussunnah <i>Pesantren</i>
7	Intimidation from police to the church management	March 30, 2014	Widoro village, Balong, Girisubo, Gunungkidul, DIY Province	Head of the sectoral police (<i>Kapolsek</i>) in Girisubo, village chief of Balong	Protestant clergyman (<i>Pendeta</i>) Sujarno
8	Seal in the Kemah Injil Indonesia Church in Girisubo	April 6, 2014	Widoro village, Balong, Girisubo, Gunungkidul, DIY Province	FJI	Kemah Injil Indonesia Church in Girisubo
9	Omit of Kemah Injil Indonesia Church closure in Girisubo	April 6, 2014	Widoro village, Balong, Girisubo, Gunungkidul, DIY Province	Village apparatus in Balong and police in Balong	Kemah Injil Indonesia Church in Girisubo
10	Rejection toward Easter celebration for elderly (<i>Paskah Adiyuswo</i>) in Gunungkidul, DIY Province	End of April 2014	Gunungkidul, DIY Province	Islamic mass organizations in Gunungkidul, DIY Province	The organizer of Easter celebration (<i>Paskah Adiyuswo</i>)
11	Assault to the activist of Forum Lintas Iman (FLI) in Gunungkidul, DIY	May 2, 2014	Regional Representative Council (DPD) of Gunungkidul, DIY Province	FJI	Aminuddin Aziz (Chairman of FLI)

12	Assault to the activist of FLI in Gunungkidul, DIY Province	May 2, 2014	Police resort (Polres) building, Gunungkidul, DIY Province	FJI	FLI activist
13	Intimidation toward Christian people	May 2014	Gunungkidul, DIY Province	FJI	Christian people
14	Restriction to organize an open Easter celebration	May 2, 2014	Gunungkidul, DIY	FJI	Christian people
15	Dissolve the recitation organization event in Bantul, DIY Province	May 18, 2014	Ex-Elementary School Kadipiro IV Sumberan RT 09, Ngestiharjo village, Kasihan, Bantul, DIY Province	FJI	Recitation people of Majelis Ta'lim Raudhatul Jannah
16	Assault to the house of the Director of Galang Press printing in Sleman, DIY Province	May 29, 2014	Besi area, Kaliurang street, Sleman, DIY Province	FPI mass	Julius (the Director of Galang Press printing), Catholic people, a journalist
15	Destruction to the worship place building in Pangukan, Sleman, DIY Province	June 1, 2014	Pangukan Village, Tridadi, Sleman, Sleman, DIY Province	Intolerant people	People of Pantekosta Indonesia Church in Pangukan, Tridadi, Sleman, Sleman, DIY Province
16	Restriction from National Police Chief (<i>Kapolri</i>) to practice worship at home	June 4, 2014	Indonesian National Police (POLRI) headquarter in Jakarta	General Sutarman (<i>Kapolri</i>)	Christian people in Sleman, DIY Province
17	Criminalization of <i>Pendeta</i> Nico Lomboan	June 12, 2014	Sleman, DIY Province	<i>Polres</i> Sleman, DIY Province	<i>Pendeta</i> Nico Lomboan
18	Restriction to discussion organized by LKiS Foundation in Yogyakarta, DIY Province	October 27, 2014	Jogja National Museum, Yogyakarta, DIY Province	FPI	LKiS Foundation
19	Restriction to discussion organization	October 27, 2019	Jogja National Museum	<i>Polresta</i> Yogyakarta, DIY Province	LKiS Foundation s

2. Material and Method

This research is conducted using the media framing perspective and the Pan and Kosicki framing model, which highlighted four structures; syntax, script, thematic, and rhetoric. (Eriyanto, 2002: 295)

The analysis is applied to 21 news publications from *Kedaulatan Rakyat* and *Harian Jogja*, published from January 1 December 31, 2014, which mentioned 22 religious intolerance in DIY Province. The publication might be form of hard news or soft news. Nevertheless, the contain should encompass clear information which mentioned the event (or continuity of the event), actor, or victim—as depicted by the table above. Thus, if the publication did not mentioned those criteria, the researcher would not include it on the analysis.

After sort the publication, the researcher had 21 articles as follows:

- (i) *Kedaulatan Rakyat* has published 15 news articles, sourced from 11 religious intolerance incidents in DIY Province, during January 1 December 31, 2014;
- (i) *Harian Jogja* has covered six news articles, sourced from six religious intolerance incidents in DIY Province, during January 1 December 31, 2014.

Aside from analyzing the publication using Pan and Kosicki framing model, the researcher conducted depth-interview session with the Editor in Chief of *Kedaulatan Rakyat* and *Harian Jogja*, as well as with the representatives from the Indonesia Journalists Association (AJI) Yogyakarta, to gather more insight about what trigger, which encourages those local media to choose a particular frame in a religious intolerance incident.

3. Result and Discussion

3.1 News Framing of the Religious Intolerance in the Local Media

As stated by Scheufele (1999:104-105), framing is a concept associated with the discussion of the media effect. Traced back to history, during its fourth stage of development in 1980, framing is understood as a social construction process, combining both the media and the audience power to socially constructed the reality. The constructivism approach let the media and audience to focus on the meaning, which is more complicated than the message since it includes the invisible or the unspeakable meaning from the communicator. (Eriyanto, 2002:48)

The process starts from the bureaucratic organization of the media which produces the news in specific types of categories, and the selection of the potential newsworthy event, which contains the news value(s). Afterward, the media organization constructs the story through the identification and contextualization process, to make it ‘make sense’ by the audience, since the mapped of meaning related to the event is already provided. (Stuart Hall, et al. 1982:53-56)

Concerning the religious intolerance incidents in DIY Province during 2014, the local media such as *Kedaulatan Rakyat* and *Harian Jogja* also implemented a similar process. However, the type of news produced by those local media was different.

Assessing from the first two framing process, the bureaucratic organization of the media which produces the news in specific types of category, and the selection of the potential newsworthy event, the most obvious thing of the framing process from the two local media is the number of articles produces in the religious intolerance incidents.

In *Kedaulatan Rakyat*, 15 news articles sourced from 11 religious intolerance incidents came out in the form of the straight news, and classified, both as the momentary news and the development news, with seven from 15 of its articles placed within the rubric of ‘Law and Criminality’. Meanwhile, in *Harian Jogja*, six news articles sourced from six religious intolerance incidents came out in the form of the straight news, as momentary news, without covering the development of the events afterward.

Detailing on the four framing structure based on the Pan and Kosicki framing model to see the social construction process within the news production, it comes out that the articles in *Kedaulatan Rakyat* tend to: (i) highlight on the event happened and quoted the statement from the authoritative to ensure its objectivity, in the syntax structure, (ii) stress on the chronological of the event happened, and blurring the background of the problem and the identity of the perpetrators and victims by not giving a clear explanation towards the trigger of the event, in the script structure, (iii) accentuate the anonymity by using the pronouns, which stress on the nominal (not profile) of the perpetrators and victims, in the thematic structure, and (iv) implement a non-compromised tone towards the person who triggered the religious incidents event, whether

he is the perpetrators or the victim, and emphasizing on the impact on material object, making it looks like a mere law and criminality incident, in the rhetoric structure.

Meanwhile, the articles in *Harian Jogja* tend to: (i) present neutral tone by quoting the opinion from the authoritative or neutral party who attempted to reconcile the condition, in the syntax structure, (ii) blurring the background of the problem and the identity of the religious mass organization which became the perpetrators, by cueing on the religious clothes and attributes solely, in the script structure, (iii) glorifying the authoritative party through the use of a specific pronouns and stressing on the accentuate the anonymity by using the pronouns which stress on the nominal (not profile) of the perpetrators and victims, in the thematic structure, and (iv) implement a non-compromised tone towards the person who triggered the religious incidents event, in the rhetoric structure.

Comparing the publications from both the media, although *Kedaulatan Rakyat* and *Harian Jogja* still had lacked in publishing sensitive issues such as the religious intolerance on its news outlets, but *Harian Jogja* published the incidents better by giving clearer information related to the events and implement and presenting a neutral tone by quoting the opinion from the authoritative or neutral party who attempted to reconcile the condition.

3.2 The Cultural Realm of DIY Province which Impacted on the News Production

Discussing about the religious intolerance incidents in DIY Province, three representatives from AJI Yogyakarta, who became the interviewee for this research; Anang Zakaria (the chairman in 2016), Sarworo (a senior journalist), and Kresna said, the perpetrators of the religious intolerance incidents in DIY Province often did not come from the community. Nevertheless, it was the unscrupulous religious mass organization, which mobilize the mass to give pressure to the neighborhood. Therefore, the mass could support their act of religious intolerance. This situation happened, for example, in a rejection towards the religious worship activities at home and or the worship place.

Journalist, who do the coverage in the field, also understand the situation. However, the information cannot mention in the publication due to internal and external factors, as was said by Shoemaker and Reese (2002). In this context, the internal factor which influences the news production is the journalist's routine in doing the editorial process. Meanwhile, the external factors take form in the organization's pressure and restriction, also the pressure from the interest group—in this case, the unscrupulous religious mass organization.

Regarding the organization's pressure, both the Editor in Chief of *Kedaulatan Rakyat* and *Harian Jogja* revealed that the organizations are implementing the precautionary principle in publishing sensitive news. In an open discussion, the Editor in Chief of *Kedaulatan Rakyat* even stated that the mass media organization did not want to be attacked by the unscrupulous religious mass organization if *Kedaulatan Rakyat* mentioning the identity of the perpetrators. Thus, the media should blur the identity of the perpetrators by accentuating the nominal (not profile) of the perpetrators and victims. An almost similar treatment also implemented by *Harian Jogja*, by cueing its readers towards the identity, using the pronouns which mention the religious clothes and attributes of the perpetrators.

Aside from that, in order to secure a neutral tone, the mass media organization tend to quote the statement from the authoritative such as the Sultan or police, to reduce the potential of chaos due to the uncertainty situation related to the identity of the perpetrators and victims. However, analyzing the content of the statements, sometimes the authoritative figure also did not provide the reassuring condition which encourages the religious toleration but tends to deny the incidents and stating that DIY Province is still a province which protecting the plurality and toleration.

Within the mass media organization itself, there is a reluctance to publish the sensitive issue such as the religious intolerance incident in order not to damage the peace of the community, since the community put respect the most towards the Sultanate. Mundayat (2005:61-63) said, in DIY Province, where the community still adhere strongly to the traditional belief-systems called *kejawen* regard Sultan Hamengku Buwono, the Governor of DIY Province as the center of harmony between the macro cosmos of the universe and the microcosmos of the *Kraton* and its community, they believe that Sultan Hamengku Buwono is the appointed king who has the ability to maintain the harmony between the four essential pillars in DIY Province; Merapi Mountain, Tugu Yogyakarta, *Kraton*, and *Segara Kidul* (the Indian Ocean). While the Sultan's influence is strong among the social groups, he does command full respect in DIY Province

and beyond, especially among the Javanese people. Aside from that, *Kraton* also becomes the repository of cultural and political influence in the community. The potency of the traditional rulers and the belief-systems embodied to the Sultan and *Kraton* is most intense in the part of the city in and around the *Kraton*. Elsewhere, other influences have come to the fore.

Thus, instead of clearly publishing the religious intolerance as it is, or even criticizing the situation happened due to the religious intolerance incident, the local mass media choose to guard the peace by framing the situation as a mere law and criminality incidents solely. It gives an illusion that the situation in DIY Province remains peace and respectful, although, in fact, it is not. It is proven from the significant arising number of the religious intolerance incidents in DIY Province, which reached 733,33 percent.

4. Conclusion

In publishing the religious intolerance incidents in DIY Province, the local media tend to frame the incidents as a mere law and criminality incidents solely, and blurring important information regarding the roots of the problem and the identity of the perpetrators and victims. Although the treatment aims to maintain the peace and harmony in DIY Province, that kind of action gives an illusion to the community regarding the actual situation.

Reference

- Alamsyah, M. D. (2015, Januari 27). Retrieved from Intoleransi pada Era Jokowi: www.tempo.co/red/kolom/2015/01/02/1869/Intoleransi-pada-Era-Jokowi
- Eriyanto. (2002). Analisis Framing. Yogyakarta: LKis.
- Hall, S. e. (1982). Policing the Crisis: Mugging, the State, and Law, and Order. Hongkong: The Macmillan Press Ltd.
- Indonesia.go.id. (2019, August 7). *Indonesia*. Retrieved from Agama: <https://www.indonesia.go.id/profil/agama>
- Institute, T. W. (2014, March 2). *Laporan Tahunan Beragam, Berkeyakinan dan Intoleransi*. Retrieved from "Utang" warisan pemerintahan baru: <http://www.wahidinstitute.org/wi-id/laporan-dan-publikasi/laporan-tahunan-kebebasan-beragama-dan-berkeyakinan/270-laporan-kebebasan-beragamaberkeyakinan-dan-toleransi-the-wahid-institute-tahun-2014.html>
- Mundayat, A. A. (2005, August 7). *Rituals and Politics In New Order Indonesia*. Retrieved from A Study Discourse and Counter-Discourse in Indonesia: <https://www.semanticscholar.org/paper/Ritual-and-politics-in-new-order-Indonesia%3A-a-study-Mundayat/fafce92e7511ac498de749d045d0c8573ad15c55>