

Scottish Episcopal Institute Journal

Volume 3.4
Winter 2019
ISSN 2399-8989

Liturgical Revision in the Scottish Episcopal Church

Curated by John Reuben Davies and Nicholas Taylor

Preface on Behalf of the College of Bishops

MARK STRANGE 5

Foreword by the Convener of the Liturgy Committee

JOHN REUBEN DAVIES 6

Towards Renewal of the Scottish Liturgy: Some Principles

NICHOLAS TAYLOR 8

Revision, Resourcing and Representation:
Contemporary Trends in Liturgical Provision

BRIDGET NICHOLS 18

Language and Inclusion

ALISON JASPER 36

Intercessions and the Scottish Liturgy

DAVID JASPER 49

The Lord's Prayer in the Eucharist

NICHOLAS TAYLOR 57

The 'Peace' in the Liturgies of the Scottish Episcopal Church

JOHN REUBEN DAVIES 65

- The Theology of the Eucharistic Prayer:
The 1982 Liturgy of the Scottish Episcopal Church
DAVID JASPER 79
- Issues in Eucharistic Theology
NICHOLAS TAYLOR 86
- The Fraction and the Distribution
NICHOLAS TAYLOR 101
- Worship with Care: The Pastoral Dimension of Liturgy
ARMAND LÉON VAN OMMEN 108
- Season of Creation: A Time to Pray and Act
RACHEL MASH 124

The Scottish Episcopal Institute Annual Lecture 2019

- Their Pattern and Their King:
The Gospel of Matthew as a Model for Christian Formation
PAUL FOSTER 131

Book Reviews

- CHRISTIAN C. SAHNER. *Christian Martyrs under Islam: Religious Violence and the Making of the Muslim World*
Reviewed by NICHOLAS TAYLOR 145
- ANDREW RUMSEY. *Parish: An Anglican Theology of Place*
Reviewed by JENNIFER HOLDEN 146
- GEORGE CORBETT, ed. *Annunciations: Sacred Music for the Twenty-first Century*
Reviewed by ANN LOADES 149

CHRISTINE SCHENK. *Crispina and Her Sisters: Women and Authority in Early Christianity*

Reviewed by NICHOLAS TAYLOR 154

DAVID JASPER. *Heaven in Ordinary: Poetry and Religion in a Secular Age*

Reviewed by MICHAEL HULL 155

A special request regarding the late Professor Donald M. MacKinnon

Dr André Muller, who is working on an intellectual biography of Professor Donald M. MacKinnon (1913–94), would be very interested to hear from anyone who knew the Scottish philosophical theologian, or heard him lecture or preach, or corresponded with him, or has any information about him. Dr Muller may be contacted via email (mulan398@gmail.co.nz) or post (14a Arnot Ave, Clouston Park, Upper Hutt, 5018, New Zealand).

Enquiries

Enquires to the Revd Dr Michael Hull
Scottish Episcopal Institute
21 Grosvenor Crescent
Edinburgh EH12 5EE
Scotland-UK
0131 225 6357
dos@scotland.anglican.org

Disclaimer

The opinions, beliefs and viewpoints expressed by the authors in the *Scottish Episcopal Institute Journal* do not necessarily reflect the opinions, beliefs and viewpoints of the Scottish Episcopal Church, the General Synod of the Scottish Episcopal Church or the Scottish Episcopal Institute.

Copyright

The author of each article published here owns his or her own words. The articles in the *Scottish Episcopal Journal* may be freely redistributed in other media and non-commercial publications as long as the article is not abridged, edited or altered in any way without the express consent of the author. A redistributed article may not be sold for profit or included in another medium or publication that is sold for profit without the express consent of the author. The articles in the *Scottish Episcopal Journal* may be included in commercial publication or other media only if prior consent for republication is received from the author. The author may request compensation for republication for commercial use.

Revised Friday 20 December 2019

The 'Peace' in the Liturgies of the Scottish Episcopal Church

JOHN REUBEN DAVIES

Research Fellow in History in the School of Humanities of the
University of Glasgow
Convener, Liturgy Committee of the Faith and Order Board

The 'Peace' in the Eucharist has its origins in the Græco-Roman kiss, an everyday public gesture of greeting in classical antiquity. The kiss has had a continuous history as a gesture of greeting in many parts of the European continent and is gaining increasing currency as a form of greeting again in Great Britain.

The kiss of ancient Græco-Roman culture nevertheless communicated at a deeper level than a simple greeting; for it was closely tied up with a person's standing in society. The kiss was exchanged in public only among those of comparable social status. But in order to avoid any abuses there were laws and restrictions governing when kisses were to be offered. When a kiss was exchanged in public it was seen either as a formal kiss of greeting to public officials to show reverence and loyalty or as a sign of a close blood relationship. 'The closer persons were in social rank, respect, and friendship', Edward Phillips has argued, 'the closer they were allowed to approach the mingling of *pneumata* (spirit) through a kiss on the mouth'.¹ Those who were considered inferior and who did not share the same spirit as others, such as slaves, were not allowed to engage in this gesture.

The kiss was not so common among the Jewish people in the time of the Old Testament. In both Græco-Roman society and the Old Testament, familial kisses were the most common and suitable. Because the Christian community constituted a new familial structure, Paul and Peter encourage Christians to greet each other with a holy kiss. They likely did not invent the holy kiss; rather it is a reiteration of the practice that was probably used by Jesus and his disciples. Paul and Peter simply extended it to their communities. Christians, whether slave or free, were no longer strangers but shared a special bond in Christ that allowed them to offer the holy kiss to one another without being criticized. This holy kiss therefore differed from the secular kiss.

¹ L. Edward Phillips, *The Ritual Kiss in Early Christian Worship*, Joint Liturgical Studies 36 (Cambridge: Grove Books, 1996), p. 6.

The holy kiss in the first century set Christians apart from non-Christians, enhancing the bond initiated in baptism and allowing the spirit to be shared with other Christians. Thus, according to Michael Foley, the holy kiss in the first century ‘was a well-established Christian ritual, that is, a practice with distinct religious meaning for those within the church’.²

The earliest extant witness to the kiss of peace as it was used explicitly in the eucharistic liturgy is from the First Apology of Justin Martyr, writing to the Roman Emperor Antoninus between 147 and 154.³ In his description of the Eucharist as it was celebrated at Rome we find the kiss after ‘the prayers’ (αἱ εὐχαί), and before the preparation of the bread and the cup.

[65.1 ...] καί, κοινὰς εὐχὰς ποιησάμενοι ὑπὲρ τε ἑαυτῶν καὶ τοῦ φωτισθέντος καὶ ἄλλων πανταχοῦ πάντων εὐτόνως ὅπως καταξιωθῶμεν, τὰ ἀληθῆ μαθόντες, καὶ δι’ ἔργων ἀγαθοῖ πολιτευταὶ καὶ φύλακες τῶν ἐντεταλμένων εὐρεθῆναι, ὅπως τὴν αἰώνιον σωτηρίαν σωθῶμεν, [65.2] ἀλλήλους φιλήματι ἀσπαζόμεθα, παυσάμενοι τῶν εὐχῶν. [65.3] ἔπειτα προσφέρεται τῷ προεστῶτι τῶν ἀδελφῶν ἄρτος καὶ ποτήριον ὕδατι κεκραμένον·

[65.1 ...] and, after earnestly saying prayers for ourselves and the one who was enlightened and all others everywhere that, having learnt the truth, we might be judged worthy also to be found through our deeds people who live good lives and guardians of what has been commanded, so that we might be saved in the eternal salvation, [65.2] we cease from prayer and greet one another with a kiss. [65.3] Then there is brought to the president of the brothers bread and a cup of wine mixed with water.⁴

The earliest witness that the kiss of peace came at the end of the Lord’s Prayer is Tertullian’s treatise on (the Lord’s) Prayer (Tertullian lived in North Africa, c. 160–c. 225). When they had been fasting, Christians (in Carthage at least) had developed a custom of omitting the kiss of peace after

² Michael P. Foley, ‘The Whence and Whither of the Kiss of Peace in the Roman Rite’, *Antiphon* 14:1 (2010), 45–94 (p. 50).

³ For the date of Justin’s *Apologies*, see *Justin, Philosopher and Martyr: Apologies*, ed. and trans. by Denis Minns and Paul Parvis, Oxford Early Christian Texts (Oxford: OUP, 2009), p. 44.

⁴ Justin, *First Apology*, 65.1–3, *ibid.*, pp. 252–53.

the Lord's Prayer. Tertullian called the kiss the *signaculum orationis*, 'the seal of the prayer', like the seal of a letter.

Alia iam consuetudo inualuit: ieiunantes habita oratione cum fratribus subtrahunt osculum pacis quod est signaculum orationis.

Still another custom has become prevalent: when they are keeping a fast, after joining in the prayer along with the brethren, they withhold the kiss of peace, which is the seal of the prayer.⁵

In the same section Tertullian asked,

Quae oratio cum diuortio sancti osculi integra? Quem domino officium facientem impedit pax? Quale sacrificium est a quo sine pace disceditur?

What prayer is unmutated when divorced from the holy kiss? Whom does the peace hinder in the performance of his duty to the Lord? What sort of sacrifice is that from which one retires without the peace?⁶

A little earlier in the treatise, in relation to the ending of the Lord's Prayer, Tertullian used the phrase *assignata oratione*, meaning, 'when the prayer has been sealed'.⁷

Commenting on the 'holy kiss' enjoined by Paul in Romans 16:16, Origen (c. 185–c. 254, like Tertullian, also writing in North Africa) commented that,

⁵ *De oratione*, §18, ed. and trans. by Ernest Evans (London: SPCK, 1953), p. 23.

⁶ *Ibid.* Because it ignored the dominical precept that fasting must be done secretly (Matt. 6. 16–18) Tertullian went on to warn those who were following the custom of withholding the kiss of peace, 'Quaecumque ratio sit, non erit potior praecepti obseruatione quo iubemur ieiunia nostra celare: iam enim de abstinentia osculi agnoscimur ieiunantes' ('Whatever the reason may be, it cannot be more important than the observance of the precept by which we are commanded to conceal our fasts: for it is at once evident that we are fasting, if we abstain from the kiss').

⁷ *Ibid.*, §16, p. 21.

Ex hoc sermone, aliisque nonnullis similibus, mos ecclesiis traditus est ut post orationes osculo se inuicem suscipiant fratres

From this precept, and several similar ones, the custom has been handed down to the churches that after the prayers the brethren shall receive a kiss from one another in turn.⁸

This evidence could therefore lead us to conclude that when the Lord's Prayer was introduced into the Eucharist, it came with the ritual kiss of peace attached, its *signaculum*, or seal of approbation.

In a letter to the Bishop of Gubbio in 416, Pope Innocent I instructed that, rather than the *pax* being given to the people, or the priests giving each other the *pax* before the Mysteries are consecrated,

post omnia, quae aperire non debeo, pax sit necessario indicenda, per quam constet populum ad omnia quae in mysteriis aguntur atque in ecclesia celebrantur, praebuisse consensum, ac finite esse pacis concludentis signaculo demonstrantur.⁹

the *pax* ought to be done after all the things which I ought not to disclose, by which it may be manifest that the people have given their consent to everything which is done in the mysteries and celebrated in church, and to demonstrate that they are finished by the *signaculum* of the concluding *pax*.

⁸ Origen, *Commentaria in Epistolam B. Pauli ad Romanos* (Latin translation by Rufinus), X, 22 (*Patrologia graeca* [Patrologiae cursus completus: Series graeca], ed. by J.-P. Migne, 162 vols (Paris, 1857–1886), XIV (1862), cols 1282–83. Paul also enjoins a 'holy kiss' (φίλημα ἁγία) in I Corinthians 16. 20, II Corinthians 13. 12, I Thessalonians 5. 26. See C. E. B. Cranfield, *A Critical and Exegetical Commentary on the Epistle to the Romans*, 2 vols (Edinburgh: T&T Clark, 1975–79), II, p. 796. Also note I Peter 5. 14, 'Greet one another with a kiss of (charitable) love. Peace be to all of you who are in Christ' (ἀσπάσασθε ἀλλήλους ἐν φιλήματι ἀγάπης. Εἰρήνη ὑμῖν πᾶσιν τοῖς ἐν Χριστῷ).

⁹ *Sancti Leonis Magni Romani Pontificis Opera Omnia*, vol. 3, ed. by Pietro & Hieronymo Ballerini, *Patrologiae cursus completus, series Latina* 56 (Paris: J.-P Migne, 1865), col. 515.

And so, the kiss ‘was the “seal” of the eucharistic prayer for Innocent, just as it was the “seal” of prayer for Tertullian’, argued Phillips, ‘because the intercessions were, by Innocent’s time, part of the eucharistic prayer.’¹⁰

The ‘Peace’ in the Scottish Liturgy

The ‘Peace’ first became an official part of the Scottish Liturgy in 1929. Before that, precedent for its retention in reformed English liturgy was provided by the first prayer book of Edward VI (1549). At the conclusion of the Lord’s Prayer (which follows the anaphora), the Priest says,

The peace of the Lorde be alwaye with you.
The Clerkes. And with thy spirite.

The Priest. Christ our Pascall lambe is offred up for us, once for al, when he bare our sinnes on hys body upon the crosse, for he is the very lambe of God, that taketh away the sines of the worlde: wherefore let us kepe a joyfull and holy feast with the Lorde.

Here the priest shall turne hym toward those that come to the holy Communion, and shall saye.
 You that do truly and earnestly repent you of your synnes [...]

The non-jurors’ rite of 1718 reintroduced the ‘Peace’ in the same position. After the anaphora, the prayer for the Church, and the Lord’s Prayer,

Then shall the Priest turn to the People, and say,
 The peace of the Lord be always with you.
Answer. And with thy spirit.
Priest.

Christ, our Paschal Lamb, is offered up for us, once for all, when he bare our sins in his body upon the Cross; for he is the very Lamb of God, that taketh away the sins of the world: Wherefore let us keep a joyful and holy feast unto the Lord.

Then the Priest shall say to all those that come to receive the Holy Communion,
 YE who do truly and earnestly repent you of your sins [...]

¹⁰ See Phillips, *op. cit.*, p. 28.

In Bishop Thomas Rattray's, 'Order for celebrating the Sacrifice of the Holy Eucharist' (essentially a scholarly exercise, based on the Liturgy of St James), after the Priest has washed his hands at the Offertory, the Deacon turns to the people, and says with a loud voice,¹¹

Let none of those who ought not to join in this Service stay.

Let none have ought against any one.

Let none come in Hypocrisy.

Salute one another with the holy Kiss.

*And let the Clergy salute the Bishop, or officiating Priest; and the Laity one another, the Men the Men, and the Women the Women.
Then the Priest being turned to the People shall say,*

The Peace of God be with you all.

Answ. And with thy Spirit.

Then the Deacon shall say,

Let us present our Offerings to the Lord with Reverence and godly Fear.

This is the actual Kiss of Peace. There then follow two biddings of peace after the Consecration, one immediately after the doxology and great Amen of the anaphora (*Then the Priest shall turn to the People, and say, Peace be with you all. Answ. And with thy Spirit* [p. 119].)

A significant point for what follows, and for arguments elsewhere in this issue, there then follows an intercession for the world, at the end of which is the Lord's Prayer.¹² The Lord's Prayer is followed with another

¹¹ *The Ancient Liturgy of the Church of Jerusalem* (London, 1744), pp. 113–22. This English rendering of a Greek liturgy has been characterized by Peter M. Doll as 'at once plainly Anglican yet also deeply Orthodox' ("The Reverence of God's House": The Temple of Solomon and the Architectural Setting for the "Unbloody Sacrifice", in *Anglicanism and Orthodoxy: 300 Years After the "Greek College" in Oxford*, ed. by Peter M. Doll (Oxford: Peter Lang, 2006), pp. 191–223 (200)). W. D. Kornahrens, ('Eucharistic Doctrine in Scottish Episcopacy, 1620–1875' [unpublished PhD Thesis, University of St Andrews, 2008], pp. 132–33) has argued that Bishop Rattray intended the 'Order' for actual use, probably in his private chapel at Craighall.

¹² See Taylor, 'The Lord's Prayer', 57–64; and Jasper, 'The Intercessions', 49–56, in this edition.

bidding of Peace (p. 120) in the same way, and then there is a prayer which could be paralleled to the prayer of humble access.

Scottish Liturgy 1929

The 'Scottish Liturgy' of the *Scottish Book of Common Prayer 1929* is the first official rite of the Episcopal Church in which the 'Peace' appeared. After 'The Consecration', the prayer for 'the whole state of Christ's Church', and the Lord's Prayer, the 'Presbyter' breaks 'the consecrated Bread; and silence may be kept for a brief space'.

Then shall the Presbyter say:

The peace of the Lord be with you all;*

Answer. And with thy spirit.

Presbyter. Brethren, let us love one another, for love is of God.

* "The peace of the Lord be with you always" *may be used instead.*

"Brethren, let us love one another ..." *may be omitted; and, when it is used, "Beloved" may be substituted for "Brethren".*

The significant development in the direction of the Mass of the Roman Rite was that the Fraction was now to take place immediately after the Lord's Prayer (the rubric to break the bread at the words of institution remained, but became optional), and the 'Peace' was to follow the Fraction. The Prayer for the Church (the equivalent of the Intercessions) had been moved from the Offertory to follow immediately after the Prayer of Consecration in the Scottish Communion Office of 1735/1743.¹³

Scottish Liturgy 1970

The Liturgy 1970 (later published as *The Scottish Liturgy 1970*) was the first liturgical revision to take place after Resolutions 73–76 of the Lambeth Conference 1958 prepared the way for such work, asking for conservation

¹³ *The Communion Office for the Use of the Church of Scotland as far as concerneth the Ministration of that Holy Sacrament: Authorized by K. Charles I Anno 1636. All the Parts of this Office are ranked in the natural Order (1743);* see Philip A. Lempriere, *The Scottish Communion Offices of 1637, 1735, 1755, 1764 and 1889* (Edinburgh: Grant, 1909).

of ‘the doctrinal balance of the Anglican tradition’, while taking into account ‘present liturgical knowledge’.¹⁴

In the Scottish Liturgy of 1970, after the Prayer of Consecration and the Lord’s Prayer, the Fraction took place in the same way as in the rite of 1929.

THE FRACTION

Here the Celebrant shall break the Bread.

C. The peace of the Lord be always with you.

P. And with thy spirit.

C. Beloved, let us love one another, for love is of God.

All We do not presume to come to this thy Holy Table, O merciful Lord ...

Before 1970, the ‘Peace’ in the official Scottish Liturgy not only followed the consecration, the Lord’s Prayer and the fraction, but was also a prelude to the general confession. In 1970 (which appears to have been influenced by the initial revision of the Roman *Ordo Missae* in 1965) the general confession was moved to the Preparation at the beginning of the rite (in a pattern that closely resembles the Roman *Ordo Missae* of 1965, including *Introibo ad altare Dei*, ‘I will go unto the altar of God’, etc.). The ‘Peace’ was also separated from the Intercession, which was moved from its place between the Prayer of Consecration and the Lord’s Prayer to its current position between the Creed and the Offertory.¹⁵ The ‘prayer of humble access’ seems to do the work given to the general confession at this point in the previous rites.

Scottish Liturgy 1982

¹⁴ ‘[The Book of Common Prayer — The Holy Communion Service](#)’ (resolution 76); also ‘[The Book of Common Prayer — Prayer Book Revision](#)’ (Resolutions 73–75); (accessed 8 November 2019).

¹⁵ The *Missale Romanum* of 1965 was not a new edition of the Missal, but a set of provisional revisions made by the Instruction *Inter Oecumenici* (1964). The Prayer of the Faithful, absent since the fifth century, was re-introduced after the Creed.

The 'Peace' in the Scottish Liturgy 1982 can be in one of two positions; either as the second action of the 'Preparation', immediately after the 'Welcome'; or immediately before 'The Liturgy of the Sacrament: The Taking of the Bread and Wine', following straight on from either the 'Intercession' or the 'Confession and Absolution', if the latter has not been used as part of the 'Preparation' at section 5. There is no rubric about ceremonial; no action is enjoined; and it is only by inference or custom that 'We meet in Christ's name' is said by the presiding celebrant and not by another minister.

When the 'Peace' comes at the beginning of the rite the liturgy runs as follows.

PREPARATION

1 Welcome

Father
 Grace and peace to you from God our
 and the Lord Jesus Christ.

Amen.

2 Peace

or at 16

We meet in Christ's name.
Let us share his peace.

One might infer that this pattern, and the Pauline greeting of the 'Welcome', were based on insights gained from reading the section on 'The Greeting and Kiss of Peace' in Dix, *The Shape of the Liturgy*.¹⁶ Dix quoted Hans Lietzmann:¹⁷

¹⁶ Gregory Dix, *The Shape of the Liturgy*, 2nd edn (London: A&C Black, 1945), pp. 105–10. For the Pauline greeting, see Romans 1. 7; I Corinthians 1. 3; II Corinthians 1. 2; Ephesians 1. 2; Philippians 1. 2; Colossians 1. 2; I Thessalonians 1. 1; II Thessalonians 1. 2; Philemon 3.

¹⁷ Dix, *op. cit.*, p. 107, note 7, where Dix was translating from Lietzmann's original German edition, *Messe und Herrenmahl: eine Studie zur Geschichte der Liturgie*, *Arbeiten zur Kirchengeschichte* 8 (Bonn: A. Marcus & E. Weber, 1926), pp. 229.

Now a picture becomes alive before us. We are among the assembled Christians at Corinth. A letter of the apostle is being read aloud [2 Cor. 13:10–13] – it is drawing to its conclusion – another exhortation to amendment of life, to love and peace and unity. Then the solemn words ring out: “Salute one another with the holy kiss! All the saints in the Christian Church salute you also with a kiss” – and the Corinthians kiss one another. “The grace of our Lord Jesus Christ and the love of God and the fellowship of the Holy Spirit be with you all!” – “And with thy Spirit” is the response of the people. The epistle is concluded and – the Lord’s Supper begins.¹⁸

‘This overstrains the evidence a good deal’, commented Dix, ‘but it probably represents something like the truth’.¹⁹

This position, at the opening of the rite, logically suggests that all present are ‘saints’ — that is, the baptized — who will be participating in the Holy Communion. In the Apostolic Tradition it is baptism that first allows a person to ‘pray with the faithful’, to exchange the kiss of peace, to offer gifts at the Eucharist, and to receive the communion. One is now a member of the celebrating community, actively embodying the faith.²⁰

‘Nothing prevents us from placing the *Kiss of Peace* at the *beginning* of the service’, wrote Gianfranco Tellini in 1998.²¹ He went on to explain,

In this position, the *Kiss of Peace* emphasises the continuing unity, from Eucharist to Eucharist (from self-offering to self-offering), of the baptised community. It is instrumental in creating from the very beginning a feeling of togetherness. It also points symbolically to the truth that, in the Eucharist, the *Body of Christ* that was scattered as grains over the mountains is gathering to *receive* the *Body of Christ* in order to *become* once

¹⁸ The quotation here is taken from Hans Lietzmann, *Mass and Lord’s Supper: A Study in the History of the Liturgy*, trans. by Dorothea H. G. Reeve, with Introduction and Further Inquiry by Robert Douglas Richardson (Leiden: E. J. Brill, 1979), p. 186.

¹⁹ Dix, *op. cit.*, p. 107, note 7.

²⁰ *The Apostolic Tradition*, 21. 25–6; see Paul F. Bradshaw et al., *The Apostolic Tradition: A Commentary*, Hermeneia series (Minneapolis, MN: Fortress Press, 2002).

²¹ Gianfranco Tellini, *A Single, Holy, Living Sacrifice*, Theological Institute of the Scottish Episcopal Church Occasional Paper No. 7, 2 parts in 1 (Dunblane, 1995–98), II, p. 80.

and more truly the *Body of Christ* – his living presence in the world. In our Church, there is no provision for catechumens or official penitents to be dismissed. It seemed therefore appropriate to allow for the *Kiss of Peace* to be placed in our Liturgy at the *beginning* of the service (if so wished).²²

The ‘Peace’ in the *Scottish Liturgy 1982* is always part of the pre-Eucharistic liturgy, either acting (as we have already seen) as a preparation for the Liturgy of the Word, or as a bridge between the Liturgy of the Word and the Liturgy of the Eucharist. The headings show that it is not, unlike all the revised rites of the Church of England, part of the Liturgy of the Eucharist.

In the second position, where the ‘Peace’ comes immediately after the Intercessions (and the Confession and Absolution, if that option is chosen), it follows an Eastern pattern and understanding, supported to a certain extent by Origen, who analysed prayer as praise, thanksgiving, confession, petition, and praise again at the end.²³ John Chrysostom emphasized communal unity, effected by means of the kiss, as well as reconciliation, based on Christ’s injunction in Matthew 5. 23–24.

32 When we are about to participate in the sacred table, we are also instructed to offer a holy greeting. Why? . . . We join souls with one another on that occasion by means of the kiss, so that our gathering becomes like the gathering of the apostles when, because all believed, there was one heart and one soul. **33** Bound together in this fashion, we ought to approach the sacred mysteries. Hear what Christ says: ‘If you are offering your gift at the altar, and there remember that your brother has anything against you, go first to be reconciled to your brother and then offer your gift.’ [Matthew 5. 23–24] He did not say: ‘First offer’; He said: ‘First be reconciled and then offer.’ When the gift is set before us, let us, therefore, first become reconciled with one another and then proceed to the sacrifice. **34** But there can be another mystical meaning of the kiss. The Holy Spirit has made us temples of Christ. Therefore when we kiss each other’s mouths, we are kissing the entrance of the temple. Let no one,

²² Ibid., pp. 80–81.

²³ Origen, *De Oratione*, 33. 1: ‘and after thanksgiving it seems to me that one ought to be a bitter accuser of one’s own sins before God, and to ask first for healing so as to be delivered from the state that leads to sin, and secondly for remission of what is past’ (trans. by Eric George Jay, *Origen’s Treatise on Prayer* (SPCK: London, 1954), pp. 216–17).

therefore, do this with a wicked conscience, with a mind that festers beneath the surface. For the kiss is a holy thing, St Paul says: 'Greet one another with a holy kiss.'²⁴

In his mystagogical catechesis, commenting on I Peter 5. 14, Cyril of Jerusalem related the kiss of peace to forgiveness, telling his neophytes that the kiss of peace 'reconciles souls to each other', promising to them that 'injuries will be wiped from every memory'. The kiss of peace, then, both does the reconciling and also forms and signifies the reconciliation, a reconciliation that is (as in John Chrysostom's instruction) derived from Matthew 5. 23–24.²⁵

The formula

The Latin rites share a similar formula for the Peace: *Pax domini sit semper uobiscum. R. Et cum spiritu tuo* ('Let the peace of the Lord be with you always. R. And with thy spirit'). The Greek rites reflect I Peter 5. 14, *Priest: Εἰρήνη (ὑμῶν) πᾶσιν, People: Καὶ τῷ πνεύματι σοῦ* ('Peace be with all (of you): And with thy spirit'). In both cases, the 'Peace' comes from the Priest to the people, who then share it back (here there may be something of Luke 10. 5–6).²⁶

In the *Scottish Liturgy 1982* (supported by the evidence of the *Experimental Liturgy 1977*) the initiative may lie with the presiding presbyter, but it is the gathered people of God who offer the peace of Christ. There is a distinct and definite shift in the balance and dynamic of the liturgical assembly. The presiding priest is apparently not *in persona Christi*, and the assembly is the body of Christ.²⁷

Experimental Liturgy 1977

THE PEACE

14 All Stand

²⁴ John Chrysostom, *Catechesis ultima ad baptizandos*, 11. 32–34 (trans. by Paul W. Harkins, *St John Chrysostom: Baptismal Instructions*, Ancient Christian Writers 32 (London, 1953), pp. 171–72).

²⁵ Cyril of Jerusalem, *Catechesis mystagogica* V, 3; *Patrologiae cursus completus*, Series Graeca 33 (Paris: J.-P. Migne, 1886), 1111/1112.

²⁶ 'Whatever house you enter, first say, "Peace to this house!" And if anyone is there who shares in peace, your peace will rest on that person; but if not, it will return to you.'

²⁷ In fact, there is very little, if anything, in the 1982 rite that suggests that the presiding priest is to be understood as acting *in persona Christi*.

Priest: We meet in Christ's name: let us share his peace.

All: Peace be with you.

The congregation greet one another according to local custom

Scottish Liturgy 1982

We meet in Christ's name.

Let us share his peace.

The position

Although the *Scottish Liturgy 1970* retains the 'Peace' in the same place as the 1549 Prayer Book, the non-juring rite of 1718, and *Scottish Liturgy* of the 1929 Scottish Prayer Book, I would argue that it is, nevertheless, out of step with those rites, and even with the current Roman *Ordo Missae* (especially when the Roman Canon is used), for it divorces the 'Peace' from the Intercession and the penitential rite. There are very sound theological reasons for having the 'Peace' immediately after the Lord's Prayer and the Fraction. Jeremy Driscoll, has written of the Sign of Peace in the Roman *Ordo Missae*,

Then the priest greets the assembly with the very words of our risen Lord. "The peace of the Lord be with you always" he says [...]. Then the priest [or Deacon] directs the people, "Offer each other the sign of peace". And all the members of the assembly turn to those immediately near them and offer the same greeting of the risen Lord. This is a ritual exchange, not a practical greeting. It is part of what we have called the serious play of ritual.²⁸

The idea of recognizing the risen Lord in the breaking of the bread, like the disciples on the road to Emmaus, and in the greeting of the risen Lord, 'Peace be with you', is indeed a powerful one. But, with the exception of the 1970 rite, the 'Peace' in the liturgies of the Scottish Episcopal Church has had a continuous significance both as a kind of sealing of intercessory prayer, and as a form of mutual recognition within a gathered community, linked also to reconciliation. To move the 'Peace' back to the Roman position would now disrupt a consistent meaning.

²⁸ Jeremy Driscoll, *What Happens at Mass: Unfolding the Meaning of the Church's Eucharist* (Leominster: Gracewing, 2013), p. 123.

Questions to consider

A process of liturgical renewal and revision in the Scottish Episcopal Church would therefore need to consider various questions. We might begin with the following:

Should there still be an option for the position of the 'Peace'?

If not, should the 'Peace' be at the beginning of the whole liturgical action, or at the mid-point?

If the latter, does the formula, '*We meet in Christ's name: Let us share his peace*', make sense in the middle of the rite?

Should the people be encouraged to stand during the Intercession so that the 'Peace' is more obviously connected to the prayers? (It would also discourage sitting and encourage greater brevity in the Intercession.)

Should there be words, such as, 'Let us greet one another with a sign of peace'?

Should there be rubrical guidance on how the 'Peace' is to be done?