

GOLDSMITHS Research Online Article

Moore, James W. and Haggard, Patrick

Commentary on 'How Something Can Be Said About Telling More Than We Can Know: On Choice Blindness and Introspective Report'.

You may cite this version as: Moore, James W. and Haggard, Patrick. 2006. Commentary on 'How Something Can Be Said About Telling More Than We Can Know: On Choice Blindness and Introspective Report'. Consciousness and Cognition, 15, pp. 693-696. [Article]: Goldsmiths Research Online.

Available at: http://eprints.gold.ac.uk/6971/

COPYRIGHT

All material supplied via Goldsmiths Library and Goldsmiths Research Online (GRO) is protected by copyright and other intellectual property rights. You may use this copy for personal study or research, or for educational purposes, as defined by UK copyright law. Other specific conditions may apply to individual items.

This copy has been supplied on the understanding that it is copyright material. Duplication or sale of all or part of any of the GRO Data Collections is not permitted, and no quotation or excerpt from the work may be published without the prior written consent of the copyright holder/s.

Commentary on 'How Som etning Can Be Sail A bout Tenlig More Than WK now On Choir Bindness and no special Report.

€Can

A uthorstam est Moore* & PartikHaggard

A ddestribute CognireN euroscience,7Q u

eenSquare, ondonly C1N3AR

*A uhobrorepondenceEm alddess

vivm ooe@ udak Tel 207679

1128

A cknow tedgem entil his votew asupportebyan ESR and by ESR Cgan R ES0023157 to PH.

CM R Cstudenthingrant,

Everydayw cofeourel/esceptinatonsObetin gsw cdoanchechoicesw e

m aktruttow accurate the sinte specions? The six asquesion famously

takktabyN sibatndW storithesem inalit dell'elligm ordnanw evan

know V elbalpotom emplocesse (1977). The eidical notoun emplocesse (1977). The eidical notour employees (1977) is a circle of the eiden notour employees (1977). The eidical notour employees (1977) is a circle of the eiden notour employees (1977). The eiden notour employees (1977) is a circle of the eiden notour employees (1977). The eiden notour employees (1977) is a circle of the eiden notour employees (1977). The eiden notour employees (1977) is a circle of the eiden notour employees (1977) is a circle of the eiden notour employees (1977). The eiden notour employees (1977) is a circle of the eiden notour employees (

answ ew alhabuintospecionseconfibulitor y.

Despite the splash created by Nisbett and Wilson's article, and their proposed

pardigm fixinghehypohesinocoheent exachprogram m eem egedThis

is a situation that Johansson and colleagues have sought to address with their 'Choice

Blindness Paradigm' (CBP; see Johansson, Hall, Sikstrom, Tarning, & Lind, current

isue)

In line with Nisbett and Wilson's hypothesis, the CB Paugeshatunt specific

aeconfibulity/lohansorH_BlkstomandO skor2005/presented

pairpants liphotographs for dem affices, one of whithey had belooses

being more attractive. The 'chosen' photograph was then e peentothe

pairipanty hehadtofeijustatorisc hoosinghaphotograph.

U nbeknow nethopatipathtexperim entris netro dintsw appeche

Johansonatbundhatv herheypesentedt hepairpantphotographey

hachoiteathosen pain answouthevelne ssoft in the state of the state of

'choice'.

This study appears to be a neat demonstration of Nisbett and Wilson's hypothesis

Pairipantslaty of Ecclonfabultory explinat insorbin on Sochoic et le y hadroit fact

m adeThetengholfistudykishefatt hatnearm oradatydicerhe rafom havonfibultor, it has into specive epoil oeovelohansorHal Skstom Taringand Lindhisuceveilla **trainchonfibulitys:pot** deventern sofonerithindin gipaitubhthidh phlhat our justifications for 'real' choices may be based on the same processes agenere iustaions bronfibuliory choices A key issue is how far we should accept the conclusions of Johansson et al's study. It ticashaibuintospecionsælenche dfom realthin ay? The terature on the feature of voluntary action called 'agency' provides a psychological dom ainw heænoughpsychobgiaallatexitadd eshiconcen. A gencybroad/constredbehltintra atv lithænvionm erhtrough seleeneatechaion. A gencyinvolvespedineurabroceseb ciphys ial consequenceithænvionm erandaloxcharact enconscious pernocof adomontNV earherforelliconsci ousexpainceofigencybased on confibultory processific optoriday. ohanssonadongenuine, specifibilitism abrinematheprocesses fatomontal DaneW egneandolaguesppeatruggeltait ntospecionsonagencyae "...we are not intrinsically inform edobuow nauhorhip confibution! w its and notation usual privilegous perce pionsilianoughancheaions '. Support for this assertion comes from a w ew inesisconsciousnes(218)

chaptaripantw how ee

form inghatoionfat

num benfoure. W egneandW heats/1999; how e

pim edw liaracion edwartioughtiotper

heightneckenscofigencyevenw herheyhem selv

patularion Fuhern organicousense

chicalondin Foexam phaints with "utilisation behaviour" with a kew el

form echatonsiticated a biject their nvion ment v linear to nsious finencing

headoff heyecognisheadorkeis, houghteydonotxpeimæny

interior time akalM arce) 005/A thoughtea donw anoton solusly

intendeduct paint wile vehels softpos hocionalion siber

adon Forexam pB occartil) ed SalM oto, and Spinnte 2002 providence

fill by ingexam photopaintheyeardw limit storbehaviour

"...w httestdCUspotedrapptendknitest

onpulposeoneoner

dheeingdeskH epeelcheepplendati

Theexam inenskedw hyhe

estithqtetorm hat

ofigencycaroccuinvaious

was eating the apple. He replied "Well...it was there", "Are you hungry?" "No, was eating the apple. He replied "Well...it was there", "Are you hungry?" "No, was a bit", "Have you not just finished eating?" "Yes", "Is this apple yours?" "No". "And whose apple is it?" "Yours, I think", "So why are you eating it?" "Because it is here" (p. 293).

Thesexpeim entalndahicalxam plasippeato

provideonvincingevidencin

supportlichypohesistonfloutorintspe

oʻbn.

How evaluescates cepton st

he norm. For example, in Wegner and Wheatley's

studyty cagentpatipated hexpeim eat

ndgiverenvionm entalfect

coultbeaused industrials that the

rebriheenscofigencyw as

hight/ablthecaseofftionbehavio

uhrenieventsioningthe

fontilibelseuchcastin aybehecasth aturenseofigencyindeed

confloution/butonlyw herintosisourceoff nform abratem adeam biguous

(through the introduction of other possible causes as in Wegner & Wheatley's study),

ow herheyarin paiedaitheaseoth aibrbehaviour aibrbehaviour

2006 point that den ghon chatget includes a soft and the control of the control o

agencyflibidem onstitheilididfie undelyngm echanism s

W hadiactvilenchechattenorm alense ofigencyivallandeilbe!A

studybyFirchall 991 stuggeshatourense of gencym aybegenerated by

peparatryneundrocesschadlogeneratour voluntaryation Duringa

propertyproceduriFirdandrollaguestat ialkin utethe

supplem entarym obnezofieurosugiapkains Alaw curentivelsepains

repotednaving ugetom akepaitulum ovem ents, and linghet velney

actual, m addhem ovem enhalteypreviousle potechnugetperform This

realiggeshat the initial 'urge' is a normal accompaniment of the neural

processelsagementeacibiliteenseolog encyw ecaron Ebulibniy oudl

presum ablybeiggenedbysensoryfeedbackelfie advitte achadonw outl

herequizer beautiful ive explanation. However, Fried et al.'s result suggests that

are x pein coelet chargen cypreser to the face and any physical charge could.

The enseofigen cyseem to be based or internal from a brigen extra by the

neuraln echanism haitep on sible for the action. Fried et al's study agues gainst

aronfabulatory accountation ency.

A com putionaln odatin obrontellevelpedbyW obatndcollaguesee

W obak G haham an 1000 barvisw support has saiothatusense f

agencym aybeintospectvelyvallO rhiview, hecontentofonscious

aw aenesm ayindudeprediionsm adebyfeedforw artm odesw hithem otor

controllytem (Balkem only) ophast F162002) This outline explaint Fied

gs above; the patients' conscious intentions to move appeared to be based

orheam epicesesivoledihegenesionof hem ovem ent

A recentudy by Moore and Haggardip repirov idefulne uppositivities

haturenscofigencyintospecitelyall. Previoustudishavehow rhat

voluntnyadonsncheir Ectreperceivect bestogeheir het eta ris

actualhease(HaggardChk&Kabgers200 2)Thhabeertern ed

'intentional binding'. MooreandHaggardusedhindingbeew heher hebinding

effects adependents the activation currocal financial content of the content of t

hæfetvolccuB ym anjouhighepædita bjlofhæfettone)v e

show echaty heepediatelyw abjetations show echaty heepediatelyw abjetations show echaty heepediately abjetations

hebencellioneW heepediablidi eelew abwheev anouch

diff cheexentrated binding phenomenonis alterna repeatificense of

agencyhindinguggestprediiveom ponen tregencyTheenseofigency

appearist de acciliar i par predito notificen son consequence o formatique de la consequence della con

adon Redicon sectation of the section section of the section section of the section section

Thepituem eginghalutospecionsupro nateconfibulions heatheanse

ofgencytable ow every herheourceof fallacem overhe

internaliform above chave about out out magency internaliform above chave about out of magency internaliform above chave above

D ceCB Philtheform eduteofaseinw hid heatesw einto spectorifa

hisasem otratonsbation) aestallm adeable?

WeuggesCBP is and beant accollist individual multiple

CB Phethoire

haim adaideoideollunim pontiimke

Shapeophpiobunds

w hehennotfosistectrennot

Johansson's subjects could make sense of he

idatiabnionæfv ow aylitheyco

udbocephaneaiorhaney

m adedindhavehedesiedeschowinghef

a c that t e y ha d n t m d e d b

choos e)Theyw outhusceptificagencyA trnat

vellaeycould

confibutionew reasons Cheixion, which wou

dhetospecivelyedefisheir

adomsuccessTitherFalladon

office B Pexperim entronflowthin

isnexier method

method of 'sense-making' than accepting filedgency A convincing

efitionalistism w outbedem onstit

ordfieCB Pefedodecijons

regardingm oraluespexam plaThesew outbe

decionshatepesum ably

establendm oresitateonabulion.

A nobekeyisuægardinghællylofit

ospecioniheCBPhe

experim enterpairipantlynam of Therem ightea

Ealgorbehallfie

pairiparlitativ hilliteysuspeatm ism athbet

w eerhainteniomendistificits,

heyarenwill gradmaism uch the experim e

nteA gailhicoullbetsted

bygeingpairipantaistichoirehate

ofim orim potentiature, r

almatelbygivingpatipantadependentv

idencehataeinen bnsw 1

som ein esm icary.

How every chould be introduced the

access to one's reasons open ingn

adorandocestheenscofigencylef

ndudinginenionauthorhip,

conscious valudo or O.B. Pappear stillt

dheform endsonfaxesv here

haskint speat the ason for their case of the process of the original case of the original

w hitonfabutionsboutieensexigencyis ethin ichunusualiabns

ofim bigutjoin pain eNV egenealliknowabou ourow maionsw henw e

perform them through we can as be confused breakles epitres bout why we experim

hem Forexam phania brografy com monthink of tope die

justations rexcuses bourationly him of denying harve performed denying harve performed.

W hitw ew atom abaintoduatom lifeCBP as useful experim entalm abody e

suggetratavion hould be exercised the extra representation of the suggetratavion hould be exercised the extra representation of the suggetratavion hould be exercised the extra representation of the suggetratavion hould be exercised the extra representation of the suggetratavion hould be exercised the extra representation of the suggetratavion hould be exercised the extra representation of the suggetratavion hould be exercised the extra representation of the suggetratavion hould be exercised the extra representation of the suggetratavion hould be exercised the extra representation of the suggestratavion hould be exercised the extra representation of the suggestratavion hould be exercised the extra representation of the suggestratavion of the suggest

herzem anyinstraceofron abultory integer in Bruton abultory

intespeciendoesnoty oktorkpectation adonthlein A. keyisusfar

fitneseachist, and best characteist hetagest from Ebustion and b

differint normal coestom exception largen extremely defined and about to the contract of the c

voluntaryadon spebew em akthem How evere ason stordon reem obe

m oreognivelym alabbanduscepiblizet ospecivinfliences

Theileahatactreeasonsbraionm aybehi ddenhasibnghitosyin

psychobgy/Freudl92 3) w ew intranggestneposiblexplination w hyr easons

m aybem oem akabihangencyA gencyofini volvesdieuphenom enal

experimental in adortive clanditave lieuthenom enaltyperin coof

reasonsbrointheam ew ayR ahagurea sonsbrointholpeditivend

respective based on the am eigeneature of the artificial making processes that we see

understnetextenatvenlatetellow rbeca usav astrokbylehning; I

m akednexam inabrbecausem ybossaithadt dhoughtbw esbecausel

knewtiv outlim akehdhappySystem ateseach orthoprocessesw hithgiveusa

sensentgencyndorheprocesses w hit give is eason fordorbeginning,

afabngoosbehaviountegeld: B Pwpl styarim pontrytaithis

researchandw chopetanthed lithelyton heiterator between the

References

Baynell & Levyl 2006 The Feeling Doing Dec onstrain the

Phenom enobyyofA gencytiNSebanzandW Prinz (ed.) iordersof

VollarCam bridgeM AM ITPress

Balkem ou S. W option & FIC, D200 2A bnorm at the

aw aenesofabri Tiendis Cognite Sciences, 662,37242.

Boccadil elsain of & Spinter H2002 Ution behaviour

consequent bited M Asofning Cotes 8, 289308.

Freuck 1923) 'The ego and the id'. In Staches (continued and Editor) fie

CompteW orkoffigm und FreudVaN ew York: WWN orbn.

Finds at AM of a hys salk XV I im sorts pencess&

SpenceDD(1991F)undonabganisionofi um anupplem entry

m obrotestodiedbyekatahn utibalou matiN eurosained, 1,

36563666.

Johanson H. H. Kstom S& O ston A.

2005Falintedetect

m im athebet verintarion and outom diasim pl

edecijontskScience,

310,16119.

Haggard Chik Sk Kabgerd 2002 y ol

untaryadorandronscious

aw arnesN atureN euroscience5(43)82385.

M ace 1005 Theen scotigency as weres

andow neshipotations and

intenions h IR cestand NEtin,

(e ds) AgencyandSelAw areness

O x6dU niveri/Press

M const H aggard type Preditive and

infernjabnocesesubservahe

conscious w armesogoal lirotedadon.

NabatD&W stortRE(1977) Talligm one

hanw earknow V ebalpors

onm enaphrocessel Psychological Review 8,463,

31257.

W egndDM 2002ThdIsionofConsciousW I

Cam bidgeM AM ITPress

W egnaDM & W healby (1999)A pparentn enta

dausionsourceoffie

experiments/ALm ericanPsychology/4(7)

80492

W opher M & G hahram and 2000 C om putiona

phinoiphon ovem ent

neuroscienceN atueN euroscience12124217.