

On the concept of ‘definitive text’ in Somali poetry

MARTIN ORWIN

School of Oriental and African Studies

1. *Introduction: concept of text used here*

The concept of text is one central to the study of literature, both oral and written. During the course of the ‘Literature and Performance’ workshops organized by the AHRB Centre for Asian and African Literatures, the word text has been used widely and in relation to various traditions from around the world. Here I shall consider the concept of text and specifically what I refer to as ‘definitive text’ in Somali poetry. I contend that the definitive text is central to the conception of *maanso* poetry in Somali and is manifest in a number of ways. I look at aspects of poetry which are recognized by Somalis and present these as evidence of ‘the quality of coherence or connectivity that characterizes text’ (Hanks, 1989: 96). The concept of text understood here therefore is that of an ‘individuated product’ (Hanks, 1989: 97). Qualitative criteria both extra- and intra-textual will be presented to support this conception. On the intra-textual side, I, like Abondolo, take ‘inspiration from the intrinsic but moribund, or dead and warmed-over, metaphor of *text*, i.e. “that which has been woven, weave” (cf. texture) and see in texts a relatively high degree of internal interconnectedness via multiple non-random links’ (Abondolo, 2001: 6). This inspiration is rooted in Western European language, but I find strong resonance in a poem by Cabdulqaadir Xaaji Cali:¹

Iyo doonnanaystaye dabuub duugleh hadhitaanka
Iyo seben dawaaddeed khad taan qun ula daaweystey
Nudantayaan dacfaray saabintiyo dabaqyo seesaasha
Iyo tay digrii lagu helyey hidin digtuuraadda
Iyo taan hoggeed duur xulleba daadshey humintiisa
Waataan daabicin baryo’e maanta iyo deelka

(Cabdulqaadir, 1995: lines 147–52)

my poetic engagement the verse long lasting
 that will remain whose ink i befriended
 i mastered plaiting it as a wicker basket
 with its lid and holder
 the one awarded a degree and even a doctorate
 whose every metaphoric hole i learnt to stitch
 i’ve not made it public these last few days
 but now today and ‘d’²

(Orwin, 2001a: 23)

On the extra-textual side, arguments relating to composition, performance, memorization and the use of writing will be presented with a view to

¹ In this paper I shall use the Somali spelling of names unless I am referring to an author who has published under an anglicized spelling of his or her name. For the reader unfamiliar with the Somali orthography most sounds are pronounced more or less as in English apart from the following: *c* is the voiced pharyngeal fricative, the ‘ayn of Arabic, *x* is used for the voiceless pharyngeal fricative, *q* is used for the uvular stop which may be pronounced voiced or voiceless according to context, *kh* is the voiceless uvular fricative (only found in Arabic loanwords) and *dh* is the voiced retroflex plosive.

² This translation is printed here as in Orwin (2001a) where reasons for the typography may be found. The ‘d’ here refers to the alliterative sound and is thus a reference to the poem itself.

contributing to the discussion of issues dealt with in the workshops mentioned above. In support of these extra-textual issues I shall also consider some intra-textual characteristics with a view to contributing more widely to discourse on the concept of text and literary experience in general.

The Somali concepts will be presented through a consideration of the distinction between two types of poetry: *maanso* and *hees*.³ The contrasting characteristics of these two types of poetry do, I believe, provide strong evidence for assuming that Somalis have, and have had for some time, the concept of definitive text. Of course, in doing this I do not pretend to be telling the Somalis what they know already. Rather, in presenting the discussion in this way, I wish to show that I am not dealing with a conception based on the written word and imposed upon the material by a Western academic but with a concept intrinsic to the Somali understanding of *maanso*.

2. Features common to all Somali poetry⁴

All poetry in Somali, whether *maanso* or *hees*, is both metrical and alliterative. The metrical system in Somali is a fascinating, quantitative system in which there are a large number of patterns, each type of poetry following a particular one. The units patterned in Somali metre are vowels and consonants. The system as a whole is complex and beyond the scope of this article, so an example of a metrical pattern is presented here, namely the pattern used for *gabay* poetry of which the poem above by Cabdulqaadir is an example. In the following template the symbol \cup indicates a position which must be filled by a short vowel syllable, and the symbol $\cup\cup$ indicates a position which must be filled by either a long vowel or two short vowel syllables. The vertical line indicates the caesura found in the *gabay*, and the bracketed short vowel syllable at the beginning indicates an optional anacrusis.

(\cup) $\cup\cup$ $\cup\cup$ \cup $\cup\cup$ $\cup\cup$ \cup $\cup\cup$ | $\cup\cup$ \cup $\cup\cup$ $\cup\cup$ \cup

Further to the patterning of vowels, there must be two long vowels in the second part of the line and there is a constraint on syllable final consonants and the types of consonants which may occur between the two short vowel syllables when any position of the type $\cup\cup$ (other than the first) is rendered by two syllables.⁵

All poetry is also alliterative. That is, in each poem, each line or half-line, according to the genre, contains a word which begins with the alliterative sound. Such words must have some lexical content, i.e. nouns, adjectives, adverbs or verbs. There are some cases where alliteration may be changed or in which it is not used at all, but these are not often found and do not affect the arguments made here.

³ Note that the term *hees* used here is its 'traditional' usage. There is a type of poetry which in general is called *hees*, or more specifically *hees casri* 'modern *hees*' which we shall discuss later.

⁴ The term poetry here is being used without further discussion. Suffice it to say that there are linguistic and extra-linguistic features of utterances which dissociate such utterances from general discourse and which, having been dissociated, can be named as *gabay*, *heesta kebedda* and so on. The term poetry in English has no precise analogy in Somali, but I feel that its use here does not detract from the arguments I present.

⁵ For further information on these matters see, among others, Johnson, 1996 (and further references therein including those to the work of Cabdullaahi Diiriye Guuleed, with whom Johnson worked closely on these matters), Banti and Giannattasio, 1996; Orwin, 2001b; and Maxamed, 1976 (Maxamed wrote other articles on metrics after this one, which I regard as the most important, for further references to his work see Orwin, 2001b and Lamberti, 1986: 61–2). Aside from published sources, my own knowledge of Somali metrics was deepened by working with Maxamed Xaashi Dhamac 'Gaariye' in Hargeisa in 2001 to whom I am grateful.

3. *The distinction between maanso and hees*

The terms *maanso* and *hees* refer to two categories of Somali poetry, each individual type of poem in Somali may be said to belong either to the category of *maanso* or that of *hees*. To help the reader in the forthcoming discussion, we might initially describe *maanso* as poetry whose composer is known, which is composed prior to performance and which must be presented verbatim. On the other hand, *hees* (apart from *modern hees*, on which see below) is poetry which is generally performed in association with work or dance; the composers of *hees* are not generally known and there is not the expectation of verbatim performance. The reader may wish to consult Table 1 on p. 339 for further information at this stage. The distinction has been commented on in the literature on Somali poetry. As early as 1905, Kirk hints at the difference when he divides 'songs' into 'Gerar, Gabei, and Hes' (Kirk, 1905: 170). Andrzejewski and Lewis (1964) divide the poems in their book into three types, presenting them in different sections: classical poetry, traditional and modern songs.⁶ Although they do not use the terms *maanso* and *hees* specifically, the distinction they make may be couched in those terms and the types of poetry placed in their categories recognized in terms of *maanso* and *hees* by Somalis. The *gabay*, the *jiifto* and the *geeraar* are described as 'classical' and as being 'composed as conscious and studied works of poetic art which, if well received, win lasting fame for their authors' (Andrzejewski and Lewis, 1964: 47). Of the *buraambur*, the type of poetry which is only composed by women,⁷ they state: 'The place of the *buraambur* is somewhere between the three "classical" types already described, and the lighter and less elaborate poems' (Andrzejewski and Lewis, 1964: 49). Equally their treatment of the *heello* and modern *hees* reflects the status of these, which shall be discussed in more detail below. The traditional *hees* they describe as 'dance and work songs' (Andrzejewski and Lewis, 1964: 51) and state of them: 'The words of these songs are simple and lack the imagery found in the "classical" poems, while the lines vary greatly in length and are few in number. Their authorship is seldom known, and most of them appear to be of considerable antiquity.' (Andrzejewski and Lewis, 1964: 51). In a later work, Andrzejewski used another way of presenting verbal art, coining the terms 'time-bound' and 'time-free', the first term referring to 'items which can in some way be placed on the time scale, and the second ... those which cannot'. His 'time-bound' category coincides to a large extent with *maanso*, as is evident when he says: 'Poems within the time-bound stream have an important distinctive characteristic; their reciters are expected to memorize them verbatim, as accurately as possible, avoiding any improvisations or deletions, and are also bound by custom to give the name of the original oral author before each recital.' (Andrzejewski, 1985: 339).⁸

A further influential categorization was made by Johnson (1974: 26–46), who coined the term 'miniature genres' referring to a group of poetry types, which are associated with dance and which are 'employed most often by youth in circumstances where youth are to be found' (Johnson, 1974: 28). He discusses these types in relation to the development of the *heello* to which we shall return below.

⁶ They also have a section on religious poetry in Arabic. There is religious poetry in Somali also but this is a category which I shall not deal with here. I have written on religious poetry elsewhere (Orwin, 2001c). See also Kapteijns with Mariam Omar Ali, 1996 and Abdisalam Yassin Mohamed, 1977).

⁷ Apart from very few examples which are very specific and will not concern us here.

⁸ In the same work he also periodizes Somali poetry into the following: the Golden Era (the pre-colonial period), the Era of Fire and Embers (1899–1944), the Era of the Lute (1944–69) and the New Era (from 1969), (Andrzejewski, 1985: 339).

Said Sheikh Samatar (1982) mentions the distinction as follows: ‘Somalis divide their poetry into two general categories: poetry (*maanso*) and song (*hees* or *heello*). *Hees* are modern songs and have their origins roughly in the fourth decade of the twentieth century, while *maanso* is a more traditional form whose roots fade, as do other genres in the literature, into the penumbra of unrecorded times.’ (Said, 1982: 74). Here he restricts the term *hees* to the modern variety which developed out of the *heello* (see below) and does not discuss the work and dance songs, the traditional *hees*.⁹ Thus the way he presents the distinction is not analogous to the way I am presenting it here, but neither does it refute what I state here.

The two most extensive published discussions of *maanso* and *hees* are by Ahmed Adan Ahmed and Axmed Cali Abokor. Ahmed Adan states that: ‘Andrzejewski and Lewis classify *Maanso* according to form. This is basically the same approach that will be utilized here’ (Ahmed, 1984: 333). This is a reference to Andrzejewski and Lewis (1964): ‘The Somali classify their poems into various distinct types, each of which has its own specific name. It seems that their classification is mainly based on two prosodic factors: the type of tune to which the poem is chanted or sung, and the rhythmic pattern of the words.’ (Andrzejewski and Lewis, 1964: 46). However, it must be said that Andrzejewski and Lewis also state: ‘In addition to their distinctive prosodic features, types of Somali poems are further differentiated by their average length, their diction and style, and their range of subject matter; and while some poems are accompanied by hand-clapping or drumming, others are always recited without any accompaniment at all.’ (Andrzejewski and Lewis, 1964: 47). Returning to Ahmed Adan, in addition to the *gabay*, *geeraar*, *jiifto* and *buraambur*, he also includes in the *maanso* category the *wiglo* and *guurow*. In this he is following the clear categorization presented by Sheekh Jaamac who also includes *masafo*¹⁰ in his group of seven *maanso* types (see Jaamac, 1974: iv).¹¹ Ahmed Adan further states of the *heello* that it is ‘now the most utilized genre of *Maanso* throughout Somalia’ (Ahmed, 1984: 335). Thus for him *heello* is definitely a *maanso* genre and one would assume consequently that modern *hees* would be also.¹² Interestingly Sheekh Jaamac does not include *heello* or modern *hees* in his classification, which is divided up into *maanso* and *hees*, the latter of which is for him just *hees hawleed* and *hees cayaareed*, work song and dance song respectively. He gives good concise definitions of these two types of *hees*:

Hees hawleed waa heeska hawsha lagu qabto, hawshaasu hawl xoolaad ha ahaato ama hawl farsamo ha ahaatee.

Hees cayaareedna waa heeskii sacab ama jaanta loo tumo ama durbaan loo garaaco oo looga jeedo farax, maaweelo iyo madaddaalo iyo wixii la mid ah.

(Jaamac, 1974: iv)

⁹ Said Sheikh Samatar also uses the ‘function’ of a poem as a classificatory device when, for example, he states that he ‘wish[es] to limit the remainder of the discussion to three classical genres which are of vital concern to this study: the diatribe, the provocation and the curse’ (Said, 1982: 74).

¹⁰ The *masafo* and *jiifto* are very closely related types. See Banti and Giannattasio (1996: 89) and Orwin (2001b: 104–5) for some further details.

¹¹ Sheekh Jaamac also mentions the possibility of other *maanso* types: ‘Haddaba haw malayn inay intaas ku koobantahay. La arkee inay jiraan kuwa aannaan aqoon ama aanaan maqal.’ (Jaamac, 1974: v) [Though do not think that it [*maanso*] is restricted to that. It might be seen that there are those of which I do not know and have not heard.]

¹² Note that at the time of publication of his article, and I assume at the time of writing, the use of *heello* had declined and modern *hees* was the most popular form of *maanso*. It may be that he was using the terms somewhat interchangeably.

[Work song is the song to which work is undertaken, whether that work is with livestock or handicraft.

And dance song is the song with which clapping or footstamping is done, or for which a drum is beaten and which is intended for expressing happiness, amusement and entertainment etc.]

Axmed Cali Abokor (1993) provides yet a further slant to this issue: 'Each genre has its own aesthetic and social function, but some are regarded as higher in status than others. In this regard Somali oral poetry, particularly the northern pastoral poetry, is generally divided into two categories, classical and modern. Classical poetry is older and has a unified scansion system within each genre. The modern poem, called *heello*, resembles Indian song patterns, from which it is derived, and is not the concern of the present volume [*sic*]...' (Axmed, 1993: 19). Classical poetry he further divides into *maanso* and *heeso*¹³ categories. 'The *maanso* category, denoting serious poetry, includes the genres of *gabay*, *geeraar* and *jiifto*, all composed by male adults and all dealing with important political and social matters' (Axmed, 1993: 19). So here he contrasts the modern *heello* and subsequent modern *hees* with 'classical' poetry which, for him and unlike Andrzejewski and Lewis, is all poetry which is not 'modern' in form, i.e. not that which can be described as modern *hees* or *heello*. However, within his classical poetry he includes the *maanso* and *hees* categories. The most recent discussion on *maanso* in particular is that of Morin (1999). Setting the discussion of Somali poetry within the wider context of detailed discussion of other literary traditions in the eastern Horn of Africa, he presents the *maanso* as being defined primarily by its illocutionary intent: 'Le *maanso* définit le format d'un discours uniquement orienté vers la restauration des droits du groupe, ce que Zaborski a justement appelé sa «structure profonde»' (Morin, 1999: 133). He presents the *maanso* very much in its social context and sees its creator, the poet, as follows: 'Le *gabayaa* officiel n'est pas le démiurge créateur, détenteur du Verbe, instrument d'un quelconque dévoilement du Sens, mais un acteur engagé dans le combat collectif, dont le discours est instrumentalisé par le clan' (Morin, 1999: 135). There is not the space to go into all of Morin's arguments and ideas, but the interested reader is encouraged to read his work since it provides much detailed insight into poetry in the eastern Horn of Africa.¹⁴

From this review of the literature we can see that there is certainly agreement on a fundamental distinction within Somali poetry of a difference between *maanso* and *hees* and also that the modern *hees* is a category which does not seem quite to fit in very easily; I shall return to this matter below. Kapteijns (1999) reflects the differences in the ways people have regarded the categorization when she states: 'the reader must know of four fundamental ways of distinguishing oral texts from each other: (1) by genre, (e.g., whether the texts are poems or prose narratives); (2) by whether Somali society considers the genre to which a text belongs "prestigious" or "nonprestigious"; (3) by whether a text belongs to what Andrzejewski has called the "time-free" or "time-bound" stream; and finally (4) by period' (Kapteijns, 1999: 3).¹⁵ In her definition of oral texts Kapteijns includes folktales and proverbs as well as

¹³ *Heeso* is the plural of *hees*; the plural of *maanso* is *maansooyin*.

¹⁴ One important point that Morin makes, which is highly relevant here, is to provide an etymology for the word *maanso*: 'Emprunté à l'arabe *manzūm*, pour désigner la poésie, le terme générique *maanso* envisage un vers mesuré (*miisaan* ou *hal-beeq* [*sic*]), symétrique, relevant d'une équation numérique.' (Morin, 1999: 48). N.B.: 'hal-beeq' should read *hal-beeg*.

¹⁵ This last categorization is based on Andrzejewski's ideas on era of fire and embers etc. (see above).

poetry. She does not mention form specifically as a means of determining classification (or as a mark of classification), but mentions the ‘prestigious’ versus the ‘nonprestigious’ types, thus highlighting this as a basis for categorization over form. As we have seen, the use of this perspective as a means of categorization is mentioned by others and is one of the most important factors when considering the difference between *maanso* and *hees*. But what exactly does it mean and how is that difference manifest?

4. *Extra-textual characteristics of hees and maanso*

Axmed’s (1993) is the first major study of ‘traditional’ *hees*,¹⁶ although in his book he concentrates only on work songs (*hees hawleed*) and does not discuss dance songs (*hees cayaareed*) which still await more detailed study.¹⁷ In his book he presents the most extensive discussion of the characteristics which distinguish the traditional *hees* from *maanso*, presenting points we have mentioned above from the literature. In this section I shall describe the extra-textual characteristics and expand on these with regard to what they tell us about the idea of definitive text.

The contrasts to be discussed may be conveniently, if a little simplistically, presented as in Table 1:

TABLE 1.

<i>Hees</i>	<i>Maanso</i>
Poetry of women and younger men	Poetry of older men
Lesser status	Higher status
Associated with work and dances	Associated with serious commentary
Unknown composer generally	Known composer always
Open to change reasonably freely	Memorized and recited verbatim
Regarded more as entertainment	Regarded as more socially important
Generally short poems	Generally longer poems than <i>heeso</i>
Individual <i>heeso</i> may be joined together in a single performance	One poem is recited on its own at a time
A large number of constituent genres	Fewer constituent genres

As we can see from Table 1, the perception of the two categories revolves very much around the notion of status. *Hees* poems are performed by those who are politically and socially less powerful, namely women and younger men,¹⁸ whereas *maanso* poems are generally composed and performed by older men (as I understand it, this normally means men older than around their mid-thirties although in urban areas there are young people composing poems which are very much *maanso*). It may be assumed that it is the status of the person composing and/or performing that leads to the types of poems themselves being regarded as of greater or lesser status. The fact that *heeso* are associated with particular work and dance activities which are not undertaken by older men is also a corollary of the link between the status of the people who perform them and the status of the poems themselves, and shows the way in which the categorization is bound to status within the society. This contrast is reinforced, I suggest, by the way in which men perform *maanso* poetry.

¹⁶ See also Said (1992) for a collection of work songs.

¹⁷ For some information on some of the dance *hees* types see Johnson (1974: 26–46) mentioned below.

¹⁸ The precise status of children’s songs, although obviously not *maanso*, is something which still needs further investigation. At present I shall simply assume them to be part of the traditional *hees* category, which is my understanding at present.

Whereas with *hees* the performance is generally accompanied by activity whether work or dance, the performance of *maanso* traditionally involves nothing other than the reciter and the audience, and the manner of recitation is also significant. The performance of *maanso* is not something to which the reciter brings an affective contribution, rather the recital is such that the words are allowed to speak for themselves. This is not to say that a good clear voice or a reciter who is particularly adept at the traditional chant, known as the *luuq*, is not prized.¹⁹ But I would say a good reciter adds nothing more than a good frame adds to a painting. It is the words which are of primary importance as is the painting rather than the frame. In other words, the nature of the act of performing *maanso* is something which foregrounds the words themselves. It dissociates them from any particular activity, even to the extent of dissociating them from the performer—who is merely the vehicle for their presentation since he (or sometimes she) brings nothing more to the performance than the clear presentation of the words.

Knowledge of the composer is also related to the issue of status. Although *heeso* must have been composed by individual artists at some time in the past, these works have become part of the heritage of the people as a whole.²⁰ They may be performed without mentioning anything of their composition context and, as part of this general heritage, may be changed, something which is not possible with *maanso*. When the latter are performed the composer must be acknowledged and the reciter must present the poem verbatim, without change. It is these features which are central, from the extra-textual point of view, to the notion of definitive text in *maanso*. The idea of verbatim memorization has long been acknowledged in the literature on Somali poetry and is a feature which caused some controversy in the 1960s when Andrzejewski made it known to the wider, nascent world of oral literature studies at a time when the oral-formulaic theory was enthusiastically being hailed by some as defining oral poetry.²¹ Finnegan (1977: 73ff.) provides a useful discussion of this and, following a quotation from Andrzejewski and Lewis (1964: 45–6), concludes: ‘In this case, then, memorisation is indeed involved, and the concept of a “correct” version is locally recognised’ (Finnegan, 1977: 75). In other words, she accepts the idea of a ‘correct’ version, that which I am calling a definitive text. Of course, given the frailty of the human mind, one does find variations among performances of *maanso* poems, but these do not detract from the concept of a definitive text. Andrzejewski has, perhaps more accurately or more pragmatically, called this feature of *maanso* poetry ‘The goal of verbatim memorization’ (Andrzejewski, 1982: 74) and says of it: ‘Poetry reciters were expected to memorize and reproduce the oral text of a poem word for word; to delete, to substitute or to add any new material was discouraged. As a concession to the frailty of human memory some degree of deviation from this rule was acceptable provided that it was not attributable to the wilful intention of the reciter’ (Andrzejewski, 1982: 74).²² We see here that it is the concept that a poem *should* be recited verbatim that is the most important idea. In other words, the fact that variations may be found does not detract from the central concept of the goal of verbatim memorization which implies the presence of the conception of a definitive text in the minds of the Somalis. The fact that the composer of the poem must always be acknowledged supports this. Any definitive text

¹⁹ That is when the *luuq* is used, which is not always the case nowadays.

²⁰ This is not to say that *heeso* are no longer composed, they are; Johnson (1995) gives some examples.

²¹ The major work for this being Lord (1960).

²² See also Said (1982: 73), Johnson (n.d.) and Orwin (2000: 199–200) for some further discussion on these matters.

is the product of an individual who has created that text and with whom the text is forever associated through what Said calls 'an unwritten copyright law, no less strict than those observed in literate societies' (Said, 1982: 64). Said amusingly goes on to describe a situation he witnessed when a reciter claimed some lines as his own when they were not. This led to the reciter leaving 'town in a hurry rather than linger around to face the laughter and ridicule which were certain to greet him upon discovery of his unsuccessful antics' (Said, 1982: 67). This graphically illustrates the point and shows the seriousness with which this 'unwritten copyright law' is maintained by the Somalis. Related to this feature is the fact that *maanso* poems are recited as separate events rather than, as with *heeso*, a number of poems possibly being sung within a single, continuous performance.

We see from these extra-textual characteristics that the concept of the definitive text of a *maanso* poem is something well established in Somali cultural knowledge. I shall now go on to present some intra-textual characteristics which I suggest further support the notion of definitive text.

5. *Intra-textual characteristics*

In Orwin (2000) I presented a practical stylistic analysis of a poem by the poet Axmed Ismaciil Diiriye 'Qaasim' in which I showed that various aspects of language were used in such a way as to mould an aesthetic object which thereby communicated its 'message' in a powerful and engaging way. One aspect I suggested was that the poem presented itself as a coherent whole, opening with a metaphor embodying the theme of the poem and ending with a sense of resolution and closure. The whole was held together in a dynamic way by the 'relatively high degree of internal interconnectedness via multiple non-random links' to repeat Abondolo (2001) (see p. 334 above). This sort of poetic 'texture' is something which I have found to be present in other *maanso* poems and, although indigenous critical discourse does not articulate such features in the way I did in the analysis of Qaasim's poem, we do see a reflection of recognition of this type of structure present in Somali critical discourse on poetry. This is the idea of a *maanso* poem being constructed in three parts: *arar*, *dhexdhexaad* and *gebaggebo*, which we might translate as 'introduction', 'middle section' and 'end' respectively.²³ The expectation of these parts of a *maanso* poem implies the expectation of 'totality or coherence', a convention Culler recognized (1975: 171) in Western European lyric poetry. I am suggesting therefore that the way in which language is used in a *maanso* poem is such that it underpins the idea of it being a coherent and individuated definitive text. When this is considered along with the fact that each *maanso* poem is inherently associated with the composer who wrought that text, we see the bases for the concept of a definitive text.

The sense that a poem is a coherent whole in its own right is reflected in the way in which a poem may have a 'life' away from the immediate context of its composition. Said refers to this when he states that Somalis see: 'their verse in two senses: the immediate and the transcendental. While a poem commends itself for its sense of the immediate and the relevant, it derives its enduring validity from another quarter: from the fact of its permanency and its comforting qualities in an impermanent and uncomfortable environment' (Said, 1982: 58). He is stating that, for the Somalis, a *maanso* poem can be that 'individuated product' of Hanks and be so to the extent that it can be

²³ Much of what I have learnt about this has been from Maxamed Cabdullahi Riiraash a broadcaster and connoisseur of poetry in Djibouti to whom I am grateful.

meaningful not only in its original context, but in contexts further away in both time and space. When considering this approach to textual form in light of the distinction between *maanso* and *hees*, I see interesting potential similarities with the concept of autonomy of Western tonal art music discussed in Clarke (1996).

In his article, Clarke defines musical autonomy as ‘the notion of music emancipated from the service of song, dance or ritual, and thus able to be apostrophised as something possessing an essence and objectivity of its own’ (Clarke, 1996: 14). Within this essence and objectivity, meaning is manifest through the ‘internal discursive process’, an idea he bases on what he terms music’s *discursive function* (Clarke, 1996: 14) which he in turn bases on the famous *poetic function* of language proposed by Jakobson—whose idea is summed up in his famous *scriptum* ‘The poetic function projects the principle of equivalence from the axis of selection into the axis of combination’ (Jakobson, 1960: 358). In this way a piece of music ‘might evoke relationships *in absentia* with similar material from other works ... But through the more powerful rhetoric of its internal discursive processes, the work claims this dimension of significance for itself as part of the temporal unfolding of its own structure. Paradigmatic relationships now draw their significance primarily from within the work, and only secondarily from within a broader stylistic vocabulary’ (Clarke, 1996: 16). I suggest that in Somali *maanso* poetry it is possible that a similar process is found. Here the broader stylistic vocabulary is the language of poetry: the metrical and alliterative language and the use of imagery specific to the pastoralist way of life and the associated meanings that reference to that bring. Within a specific *maanso* poem, however, these stylistic requirements are not simply followed because they have to be, but are appropriated by the poet and used aesthetically to the extent that the ‘paradigmatic relationships now draw their significance primarily from within the work’ to repeat (Clarke, 1996: 16). This sums up the way I have described language as being used in Qaasim’s poem in Orwin 2000. Taking this further, Clarke presents the internal discursive process as part of the autonomy of music. Is it possible that the presence of the ‘internal discursive process’ in Somali *maanso* poetry is such that we may say similar things of that, especially as it is performed away from the service of any particular activity such as those to which *heeso* are performed? Note here the use of the word *perform*, since *maanso* poems must be understood as being originally composed within a specific context from which they derive their ‘sense of the immediate and the relevant’ quoted above from Said (1982: 58). In other words *maanso* poems may have the quality of autonomy in a manner similar to the autonomy of Western tonal music. The concept of autonomy is not to deny the essential link with the social, political (in the widest sense of the word) and cultural context in which any *maanso* poem is *composed* (a point made by Clarke in relation to music also, see Clarke, 1996: 17). Rather autonomy is a quality inherent in a *maanso* poem which allows it potentially to transcend (to use Said’s term) both the original context of its composition and the related context-specific expectations of listeners who are present at the time and place of its original composition and performance. In order for such transcendence to take place the *maanso* poem needs to be a self-contained entity, in other words a definitive text. I do not wish to push the analogy with autonomy in Western tonal music too far since the performers of this music do very much bring an affective contribution to their performance, and the writing of a score is important in both the process and presentation of composition of much of this music (see below on writing and Somali poetry). This discussion could be

couched in more literary terms based on ideas from a number of sources, but there is not the space to go into this at present. I bring these thoughts on autonomy into the discussion since music is a heard form of cultural expression, as is Somali poetry, and I feel that pursuing such possible similarities, in the spirit of the AHRB Centre's Literature and Performance workshops, may help us to a better understanding.

6. *The development of modern hees*

I have mentioned modern *hees* and its somewhat ambiguous situation within the *maanso* versus *hees* categorization in this discussion. Modern *hees* developed from the *heello* type of poetry, which itself developed out of *belwo*. The history of the *belwo* and the *heello* has been extensively treated by Johnson (1974), who discusses the important influences on the development of the *heello*. Firstly there was the urban setting in which it was performed and appreciated, a setting which furthermore saw men and women join together to perform and enjoy the poems, something frowned upon by some who in turn composed poetry against the new form (see, for example, *The Evils of the Balwo* in Andrzejewski and Lewis, 1964: 151–3). However, the form proved particularly popular and after initially being mostly love poetry, it began to reflect the political aspirations of the younger generation of urban Somalis, and in the 1950s the *heello* became the main vehicle for political comment in the struggle for independence. Its popularity was also enhanced by the fact that this poetry was performed to the new strains of Somali instrumental music²⁴ and was communicated through the new medium of radio. Remember that instrumental music had not been used by the pastoralists, apart from the use of, often makeshift, drums.²⁵ The *heello* was thus a type of poetry which was performed in a novel manner and which was the preserve of the younger generation, and to this extent shared *hees* characteristics. However, the lyrics were composed by known composers and could not be changed, thus, from the 'textual' point of view it displays characteristics of *maanso*. As the *heello* developed into modern *hees* different metres were used by poets including non-prestigious metres of traditional *hees*, work songs and dance songs. Maxamed Xaaji Dhamac 'Gaariye', for example, used the metre of a children's song, *maroodi cadhoole* 'elephant with tusks' in a poem on the very serious topic of nuclear weapons and the cold war.²⁶ Despite these traditional *hees*-like stylistic features, the poems can be long and are often carefully crafted to the extent that they display the qualities of the 'internal discursive process' mentioned in the previous section. So we see in modern *hees*, along with certain characteristics of traditional *hees*, the strong presence of characteristics of *maanso*. The features which have led me to assume the concept of definitive text in *maanso* are all present and so one may conclude that the idea of definitive text is as much a concept associated with modern *hees* as it is for types of poetry recognized as *maanso* before the development of modern *hees*. The fact that this type of poetry has the characteristics I have just outlined leads us to understand the somewhat varying way in which it has been categorized by others, as mentioned in the literature review above.

²⁴ This had developed quickly after the initial impetus of the founder of modern Somali instrumental music Cabdullaahi Qarshe (see Abdirahman, 2001).

²⁵ In the central and coastal regions of the Somali territories the *shareero* had been, and continues to be, used (see Giannattasio, 1988: 160).

²⁶ See Orwin and Maxamed (1997: 95–6) for details of this metrical pattern and an extract of another modern *hees* by Xassan Cilmi.

7. *Use of writing in Somali poetry*

The use of writing in the composition and publication of Somali poetry is a relatively recent phenomenon. Although the language was first written in an official script only in 1972, a number of people, both Somalis and non-Somalis, had used writing prior to this. I shall not present a history of the use of writing in Somali here, but shall describe instances of the way in which it has been and continues to be used both in transcription and in composition by Somalis. One of the first books to be published following the adoption of the official writing system was the collection of poems by Sayid Maxamed Cabdulle Xasan by Sheekh Jaamac Cumar Ciise (Jaamac, 1974). Sheekh Jaamac, prior to the publication of the book had spent some twenty years collecting and transcribing the poem texts from a number of sources, all of which are listed in the book (see pp. xiv–xv). What is interesting from our perspective is that there seemed to be no notion that writing down the poems implied loss of any sort. That is to say, the writing was something that was not in any way problematic to Sheekh Jaamac,²⁷ the poems were there, the people who knew the poems knew the definitive texts and these could then simply be transformed from ‘oral definitive texts’ into ‘written definitive texts’. The introspection and thought which has, quite rightly, gone into Western academe’s consideration of what it is to transcribe, and how to transcribe properly was simply not an issue in this case. This is a particularly interesting example in that Sheekh Jaamac, although highly educated inside his own culture, had no Western-style education and came into contact with Western styles of scholarship through his encounter with the anthropologist I. M. Lewis.²⁸ The transcription of poems composed ‘orally’ is something which happens today also and I have met a number of poets, both old and young, who, although they compose their poems ‘orally’ see nothing wrong in the writing down of these poems. We may see this as an indication of their conception of the poem as a definitive text which is independent of the medium through which the poem may be communicated: it is essentially the same artefact whether heard or read, spoken or written.

This independence of medium is something which is evident in the way some people compose their poetry also. Maxamed Ibraahim Warsame ‘Hadraawi’, perhaps the most well known and appreciated of living poets, always uses writing in the composition process, but still his poems, like all others, are *heard* by Somalis, not read. What is more, he does not remember

²⁷ As he mentions in his book, he originally wrote them down using the Arabic alphabet, and it was in 1972–73, with the help of Axmed Faarax Cali ‘Idaajaa’, that they were rendered in the new Somali script.

²⁸ Lewis wrote of this encounter: ‘One of my most fruitful encounters was with Aw Jama Umar Ise, who has become the justly celebrated oral historian of Sayyid Mohammed Abdile Hassan and his poetry (Ise, 1974 [= Jaamac 1974]). When I first met him in Las Anod District in the 1950s, Aw Jama was a typical Somali ‘bush’ *wadaad*, an itinerant sheikh of a somewhat fundamentalist disposition and extremely suspicious of me and my activities, moving as I did among the Dulbahante nomads, seeking information about their customs and institutions and writing down their genealogies. Like most un-Westernised Somalis whom I met, his initial assumption was that I was a British spy, and I found him somewhat menacing in early encounters I had with him. Some years later I met Sheikh Jama in Mogadishu and discovered that he had become a self-taught oral historian and was busy collecting the poetry of Sayyid Mohammed Abdile Hassan having received encouragement and equipment (a tape-recorder) from the much-respected commander of the Somali police force, General Mohammed Abshir (later imprisoned by his arch rival, President Siyad, and eventually one of the leaders of the Somali Salvation Democratic Front in the North Eastern Regions). Aw Jama explained to me that he had closely observed my ethnographic activities and, deciding that I was harmless, he had concluded that what I was doing was worthwhile, but could be done better by a native Somali speaker with knowledge of the religious background. I had thus inadvertently made a convert and we became friends and colleagues.’ (Lewis, 1999, ‘Afterword’: vi–vii).

the poems in his head, but reads them when performing them. This was also the case with Cabdulqaadir Xaaji Cali Xaaji Axmed²⁹ who used writing in the composition of some of his poems. His poem, *Samadoon* (see above) was one which I asked him about when I was translating it with his help (see Orwin, 2001a). He said that he had the idea for the poem after waking up one morning and that some of the imagery and general form of the poem was there and that he then went on to use writing in composing the poem. The writing process included editing as he went along and after its completion. This editing process is well recognized in the 'oral' composition process of *maanso* poetry. Another young poet, Cali Mooge Geeddi, told me in Djibouti in the summer of 1995 that when he had composed a poem he would recite it first to his wife who would comment on it before he made it public. Although a young poet, he did not use writing in the composition process at all. What is interesting is that the forms of poetry which are composed with writing and those which are composed orally are essentially not different from one another. It is true that Hadraawi and other modern poets such as Maxamed Xaashi Dhamac 'Gaariye' did and still do use innovative forms in their poetry, particularly modern *hees*, but this is not something associated with writing, rather I suggest it is the product of the development of the modern *hees* as a form in its own right. The only possible sign of the impact of writing in composition I see is the length of some of Hadraawi's recent poems, *Dabahuwan* for example is 803 lines long.³⁰ To summarize then, we see that writing has had an impact in the practice of poetry of a few people and in the fact that 'oral' poems can be written down, which 'protects' them from the vagaries of human memory.³¹

We can see from this brief discussion that the use of writing has slipped into the overall practice of Somali *maanso* poetry unobtrusively. I suggest that this is a reflection of the concept of the definitive text. The Somalis already had this concept prior to the use of writing and as the concept is one which is not dependent on medium of communication it allowed for writing to be easily adopted as simply another vehicle for the definitive text.

8. Conclusion

In this brief article I have presented arguments based on the way Somalis view their poetry. I hope to have shown the presence in Somali knowledge of *maanso* poetry of the concept of definitive text. I have looked at the extra-textual attitudes to *maanso* in contrast to those to traditional *hees*. I have also presented, albeit very briefly, ideas pertaining to intra-textual characteristics which support the concept of definitive text. These ideas have then been mentioned in light of the development of *heello* and modern *hees* and the use of writing in Somali poetry. By bringing in ideas from Clarke's work on autonomy in Western tonal music I hope to have shown that the idea of definitive text is one which may be considered from a wider perspective than just the Somali and that comparative work may help to bring a deeper understanding of the creative use of language in performed verbal art which is one of the aims of

²⁹ A gifted young poet, Cabdulqaadir was a good friend and a patient teacher to me for which I am grateful. He sadly died at the end of 2001.

³⁰ The text of this poem can be found at: <http://www.aftahan.com/hadraawi/dabahuwan.htm>

³¹ The act of writing of course does not legitimize a *maanso* text in its own right, the transcriber, just like the reciter, must be sure of the text he or she is writing down. Andrzejewski and Lewis, two very careful and trustworthy scholars, recognized the possibility that the texts they published in their book might, on further research, prove not to be recognized as definitive when they said: 'Although great care has been taken in obtaining reliable versions, we make no claim that the texts given in this book should be considered as authoritative' (Andrzejewski and Lewis, 1964: 46).

the Literature and Performance research project to which this article aims to be a contribution.

REFERENCES

- Abdirahman Yusuf 'Boobe'. 2001. 'The life, music and literary compositions of Abdillahi Qarshi (1924–1997)', in M. S. Lilius (ed.), *Variations on the theme of Somaliness: Proceedings of the EASS/SSIA International Congress of Somali Studies, Turku, Finland, August 6–9, 1998*. (Turku: Centre for Continuing Education, Åbo Akademi University), 432–41.
- Abdisalam Yassin Mohamed. 1977. 'Sufi poetry in Somali: its themes and its imagery', unpublished PhD thesis. London: School of Oriental and African Studies.
- Abondolo, D. 2001. *A poetics handbook: verbal art in the European tradition*. Richmond: Curzon.
- Ahmed Adan Ahmed. 1984. 'Maanso structure and content (an application of Guuleed's maanso scansion system to the meaning of "Dardaaran")' in T. Labahn (ed.), *Proceedings of the Second International Congress of Somali Studies, University of Hamburg August 1–6, 1983. Volume I. Linguistics and literature*. (Hamburg: Helmut Buske Verlag), 333–71.
- Andrzejewski, B. 1982. 'Alliteration and scansion in Somali oral poetry and its cultural correlates', *Journal of the Anthropological Society of Oxford*, 13/1, 68–83.
- Andrzejewski, B. 1985. 'Somali literature' in B. W. Andrzejewski, S. Piłaszewicz and W. Tyloch (ed.), *Literatures in African languages: theoretical issues and sample surveys*. (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press), 337–407.
- Andrzejewski, B. and I. M. Lewis. 1964. *Somali poetry: an introduction*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Axmed Cali Abokor. 1993. *Somali pastoral worksongs: the poetic voice of the politically powerless*. Uppsala: Uppsala University.
- Banti, G. and F. Giannattasio. 1996. 'Music and metre in Somali poetry' in R. J. Hayward and I. M. Lewis (ed.), *Voice and power: the culture of language in North-East Africa*. (London: School of Oriental and African Studies), 83–127.
- Cabdulqaadir Xaaji Cali Xaaji Axmed. 1995. *Samadoon*. London: unpublished MS.
- Clarke, D. 1996. 'Speaking for itself: how does music become autonomous?', *The Musical Times*, 137/1836, 14–18.
- Culler, J. 1975. *Structuralist poetics: structuralism, linguistics and the study of literature*. London: Routledge.
- Finnegan, R. 1977. *Oral poetry: its nature, significance and social context*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Giannattasio, F. 1988. 'The study of Somali music' in A. Puglielli (ed.), *Proceedings of the Third International Congress of Somali Studies*. (Rome: Il Pensiero Scientifico Editore), 158–67.
- Hanks, W. F. 1989. 'Text and textuality', *Annual Review of Anthropology*, 18, 95–127.
- Jaamac Cumar Ciise, Sheekh (ed.). 1974. *Diiwaanka gabayadii Sayid Maxamed Cabdulle Xasan*. Mogadishu: Wasaaradda Hiddaha iyo Tacliinta Sare.
- Jakobson, R. 1960. 'Closing statement: linguistics and poetics' in T. A. Sebeok (ed.), *Style in language*. (Cambridge, MA: Massachusetts Institute of Technology), 350–77.
- Johnson, J. W. 1974. *Heellooy heelleellooy: the development of the genre heello in modern Somali poetry*. Bloomington: Indiana University Press. [Republished as *Heellooy: modern poetry and songs of the Somali*, London: Haan Publishing, 1996.]
- Johnson, J. W. 1995. 'Power, marginality and Somali oral poetry: case studies in the dynamics of tradition' in G. Furniss and L. Gunner (ed.), *Power, marginality and African oral literature*. (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press), 111–21.
- Johnson, J. W. 1996. 'Musico-moro-syllabic relationships in the scansion of Somali oral poetry' in R. J. Hayward and I. M. Lewis (ed.), *Voice and power: the culture of language in North-East Africa*. (London: School of Oriental and African Studies), 73–82.
- Johnson, J. W. n.d. *The politics of poetry on the Horn of Africa: a case study in the dynamics of macro-level and micro-level tradition*. Bloomington: Folklore Institute, Indiana University. Unpublished MS.
- Kapteijns, L. with Mariam Omar Ali. 1996. 'Sittaat: Somali women's songs for the "Mothers of the Believers"' in K. W. Harrow (ed.), *The Marabout and the muse: new approaches to Islam in African literature*. (Portsmouth, NH: Heinemann and London: James Currey), 124–41.
- Kapteijns, L. with Maryan Omar Ali. 1999. *Women's voices in a man's world: women and the pastoral tradition in northern Somali orature, c. 1899–1980*. Portsmouth, NH: Heinemann.
- Kirk, J. W. C. 1905. *A grammar of the Somali language with examples in prose and verse and an account of the Yibir and Midgan dialects*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Lamberti, M. 1986. *Somali language and literature* (African Linguistic Bibliographies Vol 2, ed. by F. Rottland and R. Vossen). Hamburg: Helmut Buske Verlag.
- Lewis, I. M. 1999. *A pastoral democracy: a study of pastoralism and politics among the Northern Somali of the Horn of Africa*. 3rd edition. Hamburg: Lit Verlag (for the International African Institute).
- Lord, A. B. 1960. *The singer of tales*. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press.
- Maxamed Xaashi Dhamac 'Gaariye'. 1976. 'Miisaanka maansada', *Xiddigta Oktoobar* [The October Star] 17 January, 3.

- Morin, D. 1999. *Le texte légitime: pratiques littéraires orales traditionnelles en Afrique du nord-est*. Paris: Peeters.
- Orwin, M. 2000. 'A literary analysis of a poem by the Somali poet Axmed Ismaciil Diiriye "Qaasim"', *Bulletin of the School of Oriental and African Studies* 63/2, 194–214.
- Orwin, M. 2001a. 'Cabdulqaadir Xaaji Cali Xaaji Axmed' in Stephen Watts (guest ed.) and Daniel Weissbort (ed.), *Mother tongues: non English-language poetry in England (Modern Poetry in Translation, 17)*, 16–24.
- Orwin, M. 2001b. 'On consonants in Somali metrics', *Afrikanistische Arbeitspapiere* 65, 103–27.
- Orwin, M. 2001c. 'Language use in three Somali religious poems', *Journal of African Cultural Studies* 14/1, 69–87.
- Orwin, M. and Maxamed Cabdullaahi Riiraash. 1997. 'An approach to relationships between Somali metre types', *African Languages and Cultures* 10/1, 83–100.
- Said Ahmed Warsama. 1992. *Hees hawleddo: chansons de travail somaliennes*. Djibouti: I.S.E.R.S.T.
- Said S. Samatar. 1982. *Oral poetry and Somali nationalism: the case of Sayyid Mahammad 'Abdille Hasan*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Zaborski, A. 1974. 'Deep and surface structure in some systems of poetry', *Problemy Literatur Orientalnych*.