



University of Groningen

Duration of activity inestimable due to imprecision of the data

Dee, Michael W.; Kuitems, Margot

Published in:

Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences of the United States of America

DOI:

[10.1073/pnas.1914651116](https://doi.org/10.1073/pnas.1914651116)

IMPORTANT NOTE: You are advised to consult the publisher's version (publisher's PDF) if you wish to cite from it. Please check the document version below.

Document Version

Publisher's PDF, also known as Version of record

Publication date:

2019

[Link to publication in University of Groningen/UMCG research database](#)

Citation for published version (APA):

Dee, M. W., & Kuitems, M. (2019). Duration of activity inestimable due to imprecision of the data. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences of the United States of America*, 116(46), 22907-22907. <https://doi.org/10.1073/pnas.1914651116>

Copyright

Other than for strictly personal use, it is not permitted to download or to forward/distribute the text or part of it without the consent of the author(s) and/or copyright holder(s), unless the work is under an open content license (like Creative Commons).

Take-down policy

If you believe that this document breaches copyright please contact us providing details, and we will remove access to the work immediately and investigate your claim.

Downloaded from the University of Groningen/UMCG research database (Pure): <http://www.rug.nl/research/portal>. For technical reasons the number of authors shown on this cover page is limited to 10 maximum.



Duration of activity inestimable due to imprecision of the data

Michael W. Dee^{a,1} and Margot Kuitens^a

Ledger et al. (1) report some exciting findings from the well-known site of L'Anse aux Meadows (LAM) in Newfoundland. However, their eye-catching conclusion that "Norse activity at LAM may have endured for a century" is misleading and arises from a misinterpretation of the outputs of their chronological model, constructed in the program OxCal (2). To estimate the duration of Norse activity, they used OxCal's Span function, which produced a 2σ range (95% probability) of 0 to 195 y. This should not be regarded as evidence for a duration of "up to 195 y." In fact, the most probable outcome is that Norse activity was only a matter of years or even less. The reason the tail of the probability density

function extends so far is because of the inherent uncertainty in the data. That is, the analysis is hindered by the fact there are too few high-precision dates available. This point is easily demonstrated by simulating some radiocarbon dates (using OxCal's R_Simulate function) of comparable precision to those available from LAM. Even if all of the dates are simulated to come from the same calendar year, the Span function tends to produce a 2σ range that extends for more than a century. The situation is analogous to estimating the size of a crowd from an image made up of too few pixels. Resolving such periods of time on the basis of the data available is simply beyond the capability of OxCal.

1 P. M. Ledger, L. Girdland-Flink, V. Forbes, New horizons at L'Anse aux Meadows. *Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. U.S.A.* **116**, 15341–15343 (2019).

2 C. Bronk Ramsey, Radiocarbon calibration and analysis of stratigraphy: The OxCal program. *Radiocarbon* **37**, 425–430 (1995).

^aCentre for Isotope Research, University of Groningen, 9747 AG Groningen, The Netherlands

Author contributions: M.W.D. and M.K. wrote the paper.

The authors declare no competing interest.

This open access article is distributed under [Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-NoDerivatives License 4.0 \(CC BY-NC-ND\)](https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-nd/4.0/).

¹To whom correspondence may be addressed. Email: m.w.dee@rug.nl.

First published October 16, 2019.