

Medical Papers and Journal Articles

School of Medicine

2019

# P450 oxidoreductase deficiency: A systematic review and meta-analysis of genotypes, phenotypes and their relationships

Benjamin Dean

Georgina L. Chrisp

Maria Quartararo The University of Notre Dame Australia, maria.quartararo@nd.edu.au

Ann M. Maguire

Shihab Hameed

See next page for additional authors

Follow this and additional works at: https://researchonline.nd.edu.au/med\_article

Part of the Medicine and Health Sciences Commons

This article was originally published as:

Dean, B., Chrisp, G. L., Quartararo, M., Maguire, A. M., Hameed, S., King, B. R., Munns, C. F., Torpy, D. J., Falhammar, H., & Rushworth, R. L. (2019). P450 oxidoreductase deficiency: A systematic review and meta-analysis of genotypes, phenotypes and their relationships. *Journal of Clinical Endocrinology and Metabolism, Early View Online First*.

Original article available here: https://doi.org/10.1210/clinem/dgz255

This article is posted on ResearchOnline@ND at https://researchonline.nd.edu.au/med\_article/1106. For more information, please contact researchonline@nd.edu.au.



## Authors

Benjamin Dean, Georgina L. Chrisp, Maria Quartararo, Ann M. Maguire, Shihab Hameed, Bruce R. King, Craig F. Munns, David J. Torpy, Henrik Falhammar, and R Louise Rushworth

This is a pre-copyedited, author-produced version of an article accepted for publication in the *Journal of Clinical Endocrinology and Metabolism* following peer review.

The version of record: -

Dean, B., Chrisp, G.L., Quartararo, M., Maguire, A.M., Hameed, S., King, B.R., Munns, C.F., Torpy, D.J., Falhammar, H., and Rushworth, R.L. (2019) P450 oxidoreductase deficiency: A systematic review and meta-analysis of genotypes, phenotypes and their relationships. *Journal of Clinical Endocrinology and Metabolism, Online First*. doi: 10.1210/clinem/dgz255

available online at: https://doi.org/10.1210/clinem/dgz255

# P450 oxidoreductase deficiency: A systematic review and meta-analysis of genotypes, phenotypes and their relationships

Benjamin Dean<sup>1</sup>, Georgina L Chrisp<sup>1</sup>, Maria Quartararo<sup>1</sup>, Ann M. Maguire<sup>2,3</sup>, Shihab Hameed<sup>3,4,5</sup>, Bruce R King<sup>6,7</sup>, Craig F Munns<sup>2,3</sup>, David J Torpy<sup>8</sup>, Henrik Falhammar<sup>9,10,11</sup> & R. Louise Rushworth<sup>1</sup>

<sup>1</sup> School of Medicine, Sydney, The University of Notre Dame Australia, Darlinghurst, NSW 2010, Australia

<sup>2</sup> The Children's Hospital, Westmead, NSW, Australia

<sup>3</sup> The University of Sydney, Medical School, NSW, Australia

<sup>4</sup> Sydney Children's Hospital, Randwick, NSW 2031, Australia

<sup>5</sup> University of New South Wales, School of Women's and Children's Health, Kensington, NSW

2031, Australia

<sup>6</sup> John Hunter Children's Hospital, NSW 2310, Australia.

<sup>7</sup>University of Newcastle, Callaghan, NSW 2308, Australia.

<sup>8</sup> Endocrine and Metabolic Unit, Royal Adelaide Hospital and University of Adelaide, North Terrace,

Adelaide, SA 5000, Australia

<sup>9</sup>Department of Endocrinology, Metabolism and Diabetes, Karolinska University Hospital, 171 76 Stockholm, Sweden

<sup>10</sup> Department of Molecular Medicine and Surgery, Karolinska Institutet, 171 76 Stockholm, Sweden

<sup>11</sup> Menzies School of Health Research and Royal Darwin Hospital, Tiwi NT 0810, Australia

DISCLOSURE SUMMARY: The authors have nothing to disclose.

Abbreviated Title: P450 oxidoreductase deficiency

Key Terms: congenital adrenal hyperplasia, adrenal insufficiency, disorders of sexual development,

maternal virilisation, mutation, skeletal malformation

## **Corresponding Author:**

ç cef

## B. Dean

School of Medicine, Sydney

The University of Notre Dame, Australia

160 Oxford St,

Darlinghurst, NSW 2010

Australia

Telephone: +61 2 8204 4450

Facsimile: +61 2 9357 7680

Email: Benjamin.Dean1@my.nd.edu.au

## Abstract

## Context

P450 oxidoreductase deficiency (PORD) is a rare genetic disorder that is associated with significant morbidity. However there has been limited analysis of reported PORD cases.

## Objective

To determine, based on the cohort of reported PORD cases, genotype-phenotype relationships for skeletal malformations, maternal virilisation in pregnancy, adrenal insufficiency and disorders of sexual development (DSD).

## **Data Sources**

PubMed and Web of Science from January 2004 to February 2018.

## **Study Selection**

Published case reports/series of patients with PORD. Eligible patients were unique, had biallelic mutations and their clinical features reported.

## **Data Extraction**

Patient data were manually extracted from the text of case reports/series. A malformation score, representing the severity of skeletal malformations, was calculated for each patient.

## **Data Synthesis**

Of the 211 patients published in the literature, 90 patients were eligible for inclusion. Over 60 unique mutations were identified in this cohort. Four groups of mutations were identified, through regression modelling, as having significantly different skeletal malformation scores. Maternal virilisation in pregnancy, reported for 21% of patients, was most common for R457H mutations. Adrenal insufficiency occurred for the majority of patients (78%) and was typically mild, with homozygous

R457H mutations being the least deficient. DSD affected most patients (72%) but were less common for males (46XY) with homozygous R457H mutations.

## Conclusions

Recei

PORD is a complex disorder with many possible mutations affecting a large number of enzymes. By analysing the cohort of reported PORD cases, this study identified clear relationships between genotype and several important phenotypic features.

## Introduction

The enzyme P450 oxidoreductase (POR) contains 680 amino acids and is encoded by the POR gene on chromosome 7 (1). POR transfers electrons from reduced nicotinamide adenine dinucleotide phosphate (NADPH) to 50 microsomal P450 enzymes, which are important in steroidogenesis (e.g. CYP17A1, CYP19A1, CYP21A2), cholesterologenesis (e.g. CYP51A1) and drug metabolism (e.g. CYP3A4), and to several non-P450 enzymes (2).

P450 oxidoreductase deficiency (PORD) is a rare autosomal recessive variant of congenital adrenal hyperplasia (CAH) arising from homozygous or compound heterozygous POR mutations. While the steroid fingerprint was first described in 1985 (3), the genetic defect was not defined for 20 years (4,5). Over 100 cases have now been reported, with most occurring in neonates and children. Patients with PORD have a range of skeletal malformations, glucocorticoid deficiency and disorders of sexual development (DSD). More than 50 different POR mutations have been identified, including missense, nonsense, insertion, deletion, duplication, splice site and frameshift mutations. Homozygous null mutations appear to be lethal (6,7).

A single pair of POR mutations can impair a large number of enzymes that rely on POR for electron transfer. Impairments in enzymes involved in cholesterol synthesis (CYP51A1 and squalene epoxidase) and retinoic acid metabolism (CYP26 isozymes) are believed to cause skeletal malformations (7). Loss of function of CYP17A1 is associated with DSD, specifically male undervirilisation (due to decreased androgen production) and female virilisation (due to utilisation of a backdoor pathway for androgen synthesis in fetal life) (2,7,8). Impairments to placental CYP19A1 may result in virilisation of the pregnant mother (8). Although one pair of POR mutations can impair all of these enzymes, each enzyme is typically affected to a different extent (depending on the locations of the POR mutations), resulting in high variability of the clinical presentation of PORD.

Skeletal malformations in PORD affect the face (midface hypoplasia), cranium (craniosynostosis), hands and feet (arachnodactyly, talipes), large joints (radiohumeral synostosis), femurs (bowing, fractures), and other areas (e.g. scoliosis, pectus excavatum). The severity of these features can be assessed using a scoring system developed by Krone et al. (7), which used data on 30 patients. However, there has been limited analysis of the relationship between different pairs of POR

Downloaded from https://academic.oup.com/jcem/advance-article-abstract/doi/10.1210/clinem/dgz255/5673513 by The University of Notre Dame user on 17 December 2019

mutations and skeletal malformation severity. Two previous studies mainly focused on patients with certain racial backgrounds (Japanese and Caucasian) only (6,7), limiting the range of mutations for analysis. The aims of this study were to analyse skeletal malformations in the entire published PORD cohort and to analyse maternal virilisation in pregnancy, adrenal insufficiency, hormone concentrations, blood pressure and DSD, with particular reference to genotype-phenotype relationships.

## Methods

#### **Case identification**

PORD case reports and series were identified by systematic PubMed and Web of Science searches conducted on 9 March 2018. A broad search term was used for both databases: "P450 oxidoreductase" AND ("deficiency" OR "deficient" OR "mutation"). As shown by Figure 1, 382 articles were identified, with a further 3 articles identified from scanning reference and citation lists. After duplicate articles were removed, 259 articles were screened for eligibility. Articles were excluded if they were published before 2004 (i.e. before PORD was formally identified) or if they did not contain any clinical data on patients. Forty-seven articles remained after exclusions, containing a total of 236 patients, with 211 of these having biallelic POR mutations (confirmed PORD cases). Patients were excluded if: i) insufficient clinical information was provided, ii) mutations were identified in other article (i.e. the patient was a duplicate). At the end of this process, 90 unique patients with PORD were identified from published articles.

The Preferred Reporting Items for Systematic Reviews and Meta-Analyses (PRISMA) guidelines were followed (9). Quality assessment tools such as the Newcastle-Ottawa Scale (10) were not considered appropriate to be used since they were not developed to evaluate case reports or series. Table 1 summarises the number of patients that were included in and/or excluded from each article.

#### **Data Collection**

For each of the 90 uniquely identified PORD patients, all supporting text was reviewed in the corresponding published article and relevant clinical data were collected and organised into a dataset. Specifically, data were collected on nationality, karyotype, mutation type and clinical features relating to blood pressure, hormone concentrations, skeletal malformations, maternal virilisation in pregnancy, adrenal insufficiency and DSD. All collected data were reviewed to ensure consistent terminology (e.g. club foot and talipes were recorded as the same feature). As patients with PORD may present with DSD, sex was assessed based on karyotype, which was reported for 81 patients.

## **Hormone concentrations**

Serum hormone concentrations and normal reference ranges were collected from reported data for each patient, where available, for the following hormones: progesterone, pregnenolone, 17hydroxyprogesterone (170HP), corticosterone, deoxycorticosterone (DOC), dehydroepiandrosterone (DHEA), cortisol, aldosterone and androstenedione. Each serum concentration was classified as low, normal or high based on the reported normal reference range.

### Malformation score calculation

Each individual skeletal malformation was categorised into one of six "domains" of skeletal malformations in PORD (7): 1) midface hypoplasia, 2) craniosynostosis, 3) hand and feet malformations, 4) large joint synostosis, 5) femoral bowing or 6) additional malformations. For each patient, a score was calculated for each domain using the criteria developed by Krone et al. (7). Finally, for each patient, the domain scores were summed to give the total "malformation score" (maximum score of 16). A higher malformation score indicated greater skeletal malformation severity.

A validation study was performed to assess the appropriateness of calculating the malformation score based only on data from published reports. This consisted of a sub-analysis of data on 16 patients. For these patients, the published article provided details of the skeletal

abnormalities as well as the "true" malformation score (as calculated by the articles' authors using Krone et al.'s (7) criteria) (7,36,38).

One article in the data collection (Homma et al. (18), which contained 7 unique PORD patients), did not provide data on skeletal malformations at a domain level, but instead reported whether the patient's overall skeletal malformations were absent, mild, or severe. In order to utilise these data, the categories were mapped to malformation scores of 0, 2 and 12, respectively. This mapping was based on Krone et al.'s (7) system, where absent, mild and severe malformations were defined by score ranges of 0, 1-4 and 9-16, respectively.

Demographic characteristics of patients were evaluated using Chi squared tests for categorical variables and t-tests for continuous variables. When the median was used, range was displayed. Where variances were unequal, the Welch statistic was used to determine significance. A p-value < 0.05 was considered significant.

### Genotype-phenotype analyses

Genotype-phenotype analyses were undertaken for different pairs of POR mutations and i) skeletal malformation severity, ii) maternal virilisation in pregnancy, iii) adrenal insufficiency and iv) DSD.

## Skeletal malformations

For the skeletal anomalies, an examination of the relationship between each pair of POR mutations and the calculated malformation score for each patient was undertaken. Pairs of POR mutations with similar malformation scores were grouped together by: i) categorising each individual mutation as an R457H, A287P, apparent null (frameshift, nonsense, deletion, insertion, duplication and splice site mutations – that is, major loss of function mutations) or "other" mutation (missense mutations other than R457H and A287P), ii) forming groups based on each possible pairing of these categories, and iii) comparing the sample means of the malformation scores of each group. Malformation scores were also reviewed manually, and it was noted that four missense mutations were associated with low malformation scores (C569Y, G539R, L577R, Y326D).

Four distinct groups (groups A-D) were identified (Figure 2), which contained 84% of patients in the cohort (76/90 patients). The remaining 16% were excluded from further analysis of skeletal anomalies. Confidence intervals were calculated for the mean malformation scores of groups A-D by fitting the data with a zero-inflated negative binomial (ZINB) model and performing a parametric bootstrap. The ZINB model accommodated for groups having several malformation scores of zero, which occurred when patients had no skeletal malformations. Groups with non-overlapping 95% confidence intervals for the mean malformation score were regarded as significantly different (53). The modelling was conducted in R using the pscl package (54-56).

## Maternal virilisation

For the evaluation of maternal virilisation in pregnancy, data on POR mutation pairs and the presence of maternal virilisation were collected. Pairs of POR mutations were divided into eight groups (based on different combinations of R457H, A287P and null mutations): 1) R457H/R457H, 2) R457H/other (where "other" denotes missense mutations other than R457H and A287P), 3) R457H/null, 4) A287P/A287P, 5) A287P/other, 6) A287P/null, 7) other/null, 8) remainder. Chi-squared tests were used to compare the proportion of cases of maternal virilisation in pregnancy in each group.

## Adrenal insufficiency

For the evaluation of adrenal insufficiency, data on POR mutation pairs and peak cortisol after ACTH stimulation were collected. Cortisol concentrations were converted to SI units (nmol/L). Adrenal insufficiency was defined by a peak cortisol after ACTH stimulation of less than 500 nmol/L (57). Pairs of POR mutations were divided into two groups: i) both missense mutations or ii) one or more null mutations present. The mean peak cortisol concentration was compared between the two groups using a t-test. Within the missense mutation group, the mean peak cortisol concentration of R457H/R457H mutations was compared to other missense combinations using a t-test.

#### Disorders of sexual development

For the evaluation of DSD, data on POR mutation pairs and the presence of DSD were collected. Male (46XY) and female (46XX) datasets were constructed (based on karyotype) and the POR mutation pairs within each dataset were divided into eight groups: 1) R457H/R457H, 2) R457H/other, 3) R457H/null, 4) A287P/A287P, 5) A287P/other, 6) A287P/null, 7) other/null, 8) remainder. Chisquared/Fisher tests were used to compare the proportion of DSD cases between males (46XY) and females (46XX) and between each mutation group. The incidence of ovarian cysts was also calculated for female (46XX) patients.

## Results

#### **Patient demographics**

Of the 90 unique patients in the cohort, 42 were collected from four larger studies (5,7,16,18), while the remaining 48 patients were collected from 30 smaller studies. Twenty-four nationalities were represented in the cohort, with Japan (29%), United States (7%), Britain (6%) and Germany (6%) being the most common. Eighteen patients had no nationality reported; however, of these, 8 were Caucasian and 4 were Bedouin. The majority (86%) of patient reports were published before 2014. Blood pressure was reported for 15 patients, with 12 patients (80%) being normotensive and 3 patients (20%) being hypertensive. Karyotype evidence, available in 81 patients, showed that the number of affected females (46XX, n=46) and males (46XY, n=35) were not significantly different ( $\chi^2_1 = 1.49$ , p > 0.05). There was also no significant difference between the malformation scores of males (46XY) and females (46XX).

#### Incidence of different skeletal malformations

Data on individual skeletal malformations was available for 83 patients. A skeletal malformation was reported in 84% (n=70) of patients: 71% (n=59) had midface hypoplasia, 65% (n=54) had craniosynostosis, 61% (n=51) had hand and feet malformations, and 69% (n=57) had large joint synostosis. These proportions were not significantly different from one another. However, they were

significantly different to the proportion of patients with femoral bowing (25%, n=21, p < 0.001). Most patients (81%, n=67) had skeletal malformations across multiple domains (median 4, range 0-6). All 6 domains were affected in only 10% (n=8) of patients. Figure 3 shows the incidences of these skeletal malformations stratified by severity (using Krone et al.'s (7) classification). The most frequently reported feature having the greatest severity was bilateral fixed radiohumeral synostosis (n=40, 48%).

#### **Incidence of different POR mutations**

Data on the pair of POR mutations were available for all 90 patients. Of these, 57 pairs were uniquely different. Corresponding to the 90 pairs of POR mutations, there were 180 individual POR mutations in total (one for each allele), of which 63 were uniquely different. Seventy-two percent (n=129) were missense mutations and 28% (n=51) were apparent null mutations. The most common individual mutations were R457H (n=45, 25%) and A287P (n=43, 24%) (Figure 4). The proportions of missense (72%) and null mutations (28%) were not significantly different to theoretical proportions of 67% and 33%, respectively, given that PORD is an autosomal recessive disorder with homozygous null mutations assumed to be lethal.

#### **Hormone concentrations**

Relative to normal reference ranges, patients in the cohort had high serum concentrations of progesterone (100%, 18/18 patients), pregnenolone (100%, 3/3 patients), 17OHP (96%, 47/49 patients), corticosterone (83%, 5/6 patients) and DOC (70%, 7/10 patients). Serum concentrations were variable for DHEA (10 patients: 5 low, 5 normal, 0 high), baseline cortisol (34 patients: 3 low, 30 normal, 1 high), aldosterone (13 patients: 1 low, 10 normal, 2 high) and androstenedione (24 patients: 8 low, 12 normal, 4 high).

#### Validation study

The validation study, focusing on skeletal malformations, demonstrated that 11 out of 16 patients had a calculated malformation score (based on data presented in published articles) that was equal to the true score (as stated by the articles' authors). The scores deviated by  $\pm 2$  for two patients (Figure 5).

In these cases, it appears the researchers used more information in their calculation than was explicitly stated in the articles. However, as these differences were relatively small (malformation score ranges from 0-16), and they were approximately symmetric with no obvious bias, the calculated malformation score appeared to be a good estimator of the true score.

## Genotype-phenotype analyses

### Skeletal malformations

Skeletal malformation analysis was done in 10 patients in group A, 12 in B, 16 in C and 38 in D. Eight of the 10 patients (80%) in group A, and 3 of the 12 patients (25%) in group B, had malformation scores of zero (no skeletal abnormality). In contrast all patients (100%) in group D had skeletal malformations in multiple domains (median number of affected domains = 5, range = 2-6). The mean malformation score of groups A-D increased from 0.8, 3.5, 7.5 to 9.2, respectively.

The fit of the ZINB model was deemed to be appropriate based on Pearson's goodness-of-fit test. The coefficients in the zero-inflation component of the model were statistically significant (p-value < 0.001). The 95% confidence intervals for groups A, B and D demonstrated that there was a significant difference between the group means (Figure 6).

## Maternal virilisation

Maternal virilisation was reported for 21% (n=19) of mothers during their pregnancy. This occurred with the highest incidence when one or more of the mutations was R457H (Figure 7). The incidence was higher for R457H/R457H mutations (67%) than R457H/null mutations (27%), but this difference was not significant. Maternal virilisation also occurred in 22% and 27% of cases with A287P/A287P and other/null mutations, respectively. Outside of these groups, maternal virilisation in pregnancy was rare or unobserved.

#### Adrenal insufficiency

Peak cortisol after ACTH stimulation was reported for 54% (n=49) of patients. Adrenal insufficiency, based on peak cortisol less than 500 nmol/L, was present for 78% (n=38) of patients. The majority (76%, n=29) of these patients had peak cortisol concentrations between 250 and 500 nmol/L. The mean peak cortisol for patients with a pair of missense mutations (415 nmol/L, n=21) was not significantly different to patients with one or more null mutations (435 nmol/L, n=28). However, the mean peak cortisol for patients with R457H/R457H mutations (520 nmol/L, n=8) was significantly different to patients with other missense mutations (351 nmol/L, n=13), as suggested by Figure 8.

## Disorders of sexual development

DSD were present for 72% (n=65) of patients. Of the 81 patients where a karyotype was reported (46 females (46XX) and 35 males (46XY)), DSD were present for 78% (n=36) of females (46XX) and 60% (n=21) of males (46XY). These proportions were not significantly different. For both sexes, there was no significant difference in the proportion of patients with DSD across the following groups: 1) R457H/R457H, 2) R457H/other, 3) R457H/null, 4) A287P/A287P, 5) A287P/other, 6) A287P/null, 7) other/null, 8) remainder. However, for patients with R457H/R457H mutations, the proportion of females (46XX) (7/7, 100%) and males (46XY) (2/5, 40%) with DSD were significantly different (Fisher test, p-value < 0.05). Ovarian cysts were reported for 39% (n=18) of females (46XX) and occurred across a range of mutations.

## Discussion

By using data from more than 30 articles on 90 individual patients from 24 nationalities, this study reports the distribution of skeletal abnormalities, maternal virilisation, adrenal insufficiency and DSD in the largest number of unique PORD patients to date. The results demonstrate that there is no specific skeletal anomaly, or group of anomalies, that are characteristic of PORD and that malformations can be either widespread or localised to particular parts of the skeleton. Malformations affect the face, cranium, large joints, and hands and feet in equal proportions. The severity of skeletal

malformations varies according to the distribution of POR mutation pairs. Maternal virilisation in pregnancy is most common among patients with R457H mutations. Adrenal insufficiency appears to be similar for null and missense mutations, although R457H/R457H mutations are associated with milder adrenal insufficiency. DSD were common in patients with PORD, across all types of mutations, but were less common in males (46XY) with R457H/R457H mutations. Statistical modelling demonstrated a number of new genotype-phenotype relationships, recognition of which may assist in inferring the underlying genotype in affected children, especially in situations where genotype analysis may not be available.

PORD patients were found to have a characteristic hormonal profile. Serum concentrations were typically elevated for progesterone, pregnenolone, 17OHP, corticosterone and DOC, but were variable for DHEA, baseline cortisol, aldosterone and androstenedione. These results are consistent with previous reports (58). Patients were typically normotensive at the time of investigation, but 20% of patients were mildly hypertensive, most likely secondary to elevated DOC (7). Recognition of these characteristics may be helpful to clinicians when considering a diagnosis of PORD.

Skeletal malformations were identified in 84% of patients with PORD, which is consistent with previous reports (59). This study showed that the severity of these anomalies was different for different pairs of POR mutations. The least severe skeletal malformations were associated with a select group of missense mutations (C569Y, G539R, L577R, Y326D). This was followed by homozygous R457H mutations, which were, in turn, less severe than other combinations of R457H and A287P mutations. This provides evidence refuting the earlier assumption that R457H mutations (including homozygotes) tended to produce more severe skeletal malformations than A287P mutations (25). In PORD, the skeletal malformations are thought to arise from impairments to CYP51A1, squalene epoxidase and CYP26 isozymes, although the pathophysiology of skeletal phenotypes is not yet fully understood. The skeletal malformations of PORD are indistinguishable from those of Antley-Bixler syndrome (ABS) (5) but, unlike PORD, ABS does not present with disordered steroidogenesis or DSD.

Maternal virilisation in pregnancy was reported for 21% of mothers, with the highest incidence found when the infant had an R457H mutation. This is consistent with studies showing that

the R457H mutation abolishes the activity of aromatase (CYP19A1) (60), which interferes with the conversion of fetal adrenal derived DHEA and DHEAS to oestrogen. Three cases of maternal virilisation in pregnancy also occurred for I444fsX449 mutations, suggesting that this frameshift mutation also diminishes aromatase activity. The A287P mutation has little effect on aromatase activity (supporting activity remains about 100%) (6), and maternal virilisation in pregnancy was less commonly observed for this mutation.

Adrenal insufficiency was present in the majority of patients with PORD (78%). Most cases were mild, with severe cases being infrequent. As such, many patients would be asymptomatic of adrenal insufficiency under normal conditions, but may not produce sufficient cortisol when exposed to physiological stress such as systemic infection. This study, which is the largest analysis of adrenal insufficiency in PORD, found no significant difference between most genotypes, except for R457H/R457H mutations which were associated with milder adrenal insufficiency. The assertion that adrenal insufficiency cannot be predicted by genotype (7) appears to be true in most cases, but not all.

DSD were present for 72% of patients, which is consistent with previous reports (59). For R457H/R457H mutations, DSD were less common in males (46XY) than females (46XX), suggesting that androgen synthesis is mildly decreased in males (46XY) but markedly increased in females (46XX) (6). The latter may be due to mutant POR having high residual activity in the backdoor pathway for androgen synthesis in fetal life (7). Ovarian cysts were reported for 39% of females (46XX) and occurred across a range of mutations. Ovarian cysts in PORD are thought to arise from two mechanisms: i) impaired production of oestrogen resulting in upregulation of gonadotropins, and ii) impaired production of meiosis-activating sterol, which is important for meiotic resumption and oocyte maturation (8).

Although the genotype-phenotype relationships in PORD are complex, the results from this study may help to predict a patient's genotype from their physical findings and may be beneficial in certain clinical settings. For example, a Japanese patient with minor skeletal abnormalities suggests homozygous R457H mutations. This is considerably more likely if the mother was virilised during pregnancy. Alternatively, a non-Japanese patient with minor skeletal malformations suggests a pair of missense mutations involving C569Y, G539R, L577R, Y326D.

This study has two main limitations. Firstly, it used data extracted from case reports, rather than clinical review of affected patients. As such, it relies on accurate and complete descriptions being provided in each report. While the results are supported by the findings of the validation study, some inaccuracies may be present. Secondly, the cohort of patients reviewed in this study may not be representative of the entire range of abnormalities in patients with PORD. Severe cases of PORD are likely to be detected and diagnosed, whereas less severe cases may go unnoticed (25). Indeed, Miller et al. (1) suggested that PORD may actually be fairly common, but that most of the affected patients have mutations that have minimal or no impact. In addition, patients from underdeveloped areas may not be fairly represented in the cohort (due to a lack of reporting) and this may be contributing to an apparent overabundance of R457H and A287P mutations (from Japanese and Caucasian populations). Given these issues, the results from this study are more generalisable to patients who have historically been diagnosed with PORD and treated. However, given that the evidence base for this disorder is affected by duplications of cases (59), the identification of only unique cases for analysis strengthens the new information provided by this study.

The results of this study suggest at least two areas of future research. Firstly, there can be considerable variation in the skeletal phenotype for the same pair of POR mutations. For example, Homma et al. (18) describe two R457H homozygotes with no skeletal anomalies (malformation score 0), while But et al. (28) describe one R457H homozygote with severe skeletal malformations (malformation score 9). This difference may be due to the presence of undetected mutations on the POR gene or an unidentified factor that also contributes to the skeletal phenotype. Indeed, Burkhard et al. (59) suggested that other genes may contribute to the physical manifestations of PORD. An analysis of patients with the same POR mutations but different phenotypes may be helpful in further understanding this issue. Secondly, rather than performing a genotype-phenotype analysis using an overall malformation score (as done in this study), further analysis could instead focus on specific skeletal features (e.g. radiohumeral synostosis). This may assist in determining the reason for the presence of certain features in some patients but not others.

In conclusion, this study identified and collected data on 90 unique PORD patients and demonstrated that PORD can cause a number of malformations. The presentation of PORD in patients

appears to be highly variable, possibly leading to missed or delayed diagnoses (48). Genotypephenotype relationships for skeletal malformations, maternal virilisation in pregnancy, adrenal insufficiency and DSD were identified. Further analysis of this type, using data on the other abnormalities found in PORD patients, may assist in the elucidation of this complex and highly variable disorder.

Accepted Manuscrit

# References

- 1. Miller WL, Agrawal V, Sandee D, Tee MK, Huang N, Choi JH, Morrissey K, Giacomini KM. Consequences of POR mutations and polymorphisms. Mol Cell Endocrinol. 2011;336(1-2):174-179.
- Pandey AV, Fluck CE. NADPH P450 oxidoreductase: structure, function, and 2. pathology of diseases. Pharmacol Ther. 2013;138(2):229-254.
- 3. Peterson RE, Imperato-McGinley J, Gautier T, Shackleton C. Male pseudohermaphroditism due to multiple defects in steroid-biosynthetic microsomal mixed-function oxidases. A new variant of congenital adrenal hyperplasia. N Engl J Med. 1985;313(19):1182-1191.
- 4. Fluck CE, Tajima T, Pandey AV, Arlt W, Okuhara K, Verge CF, Jabs EW, Mendonca BB, Fujieda K, Miller WL. Mutant P450 oxidoreductase causes disordered steroidogenesis with and without Antley-Bixler syndrome. Nat Genet. 2004;36(3):228-230.
- 5. Huang N, Pandey AV, Agrawal V, Reardon W, Lapunzina PD, Mowat D, Jabs EW, Van Vliet G, Sack J, Fluck CE, Miller WL. Diversity and function of mutations in p450 oxidoreductase in patients with Antley-Bixler syndrome and disordered steroidogenesis. Am J Hum Genet. 2005;76(5):729-749.
- 6. Fukami M, Nishimura G, Homma K, Nagai T, Hanaki K, Uematsu A, Ishii T, Numakura C, Sawada H, Nakacho M, Kowase T, Motomura K, Haruna H, Nakamura M, Ohishi A, Adachi M, Tajima T, Hasegawa Y, Hasegawa T, Horikawa R, Fujieda K, Ogata T. Cytochrome P450 oxidoreductase deficiency: identification and characterization of biallelic mutations and genotype-phenotype correlations in 35 Japanese patients. J Clin Endocrinol Metab. 2009;94(5):1723-1731.
- 7. Krone N, Reisch N, Idkowiak J, Dhir V, Ivison HE, Hughes BA, Rose IT, O'Neil DM, Vijzelaar R, Smith MJ, MacDonald F, Cole TR, Adolphs N, Barton JS, Blair EM, Braddock SR, Collins F, Cragun DL, Dattani MT, Day R, Dougan S, Feist M, Gottschalk ME, Gregory JW, Haim M, Harrison R, Olney AH, Hauffa BP, Hindmarsh PC, Hopkin RJ, Jira PE, Kempers M, Kerstens MN, Khalifa MM, Kohler B, Maiter D, Nielsen S, O'Riordan SM, Roth CL, Shane KP, Silink M, Stikkelbroeck NM, Sweeney E, Szarras-Czapnik M, Waterson JR, Williamson L, Hartmann MF, Taylor NF, Wudy SA, Malunowicz EM, Shackleton CH, Arlt W. Genotype-phenotype analysis in congenital adrenal hyperplasia due to P450 oxidoreductase deficiency. J Clin Endocrinol Metab. 2012;97(2):E257-267.
- 8. Idkowiak J, O'Riordan S, Reisch N, Malunowicz EM, Collins F, Kerstens MN, Kohler B, Graul-Neumann LM, Szarras-Czapnik M, Dattani M, Silink M, Shackleton CH, Maiter D, Krone N, Arlt W. Pubertal presentation in seven patients with congenital adrenal hyperplasia due to P450 oxidoreductase deficiency. J Clin Endocrinol Metab. 2011;96(3):E453-462.
- 9. Moher D, Liberati A, Tetzlaff J, Altman DG. Preferred reporting items for systematic reviews and meta-analyses: the PRISMA statement. Ann Intern Med. 2009;151(4):264-269.
- Wells GA, Shea B, O'Connell D, Peterson J, Welch V, Losos M, Tugwell P. The 10. Newcastle-Ottawa Scale (NOS) for assessing the quality of nonrandomised studies in meta-analyses. 2019;

http://www.ohri.ca/programs/clinical\_epidemiology/oxford.asp.

- 11. Arlt W, Walker EA, Draper N, Ivison HE, Ride JP, Hammer F, Chalder SM, Borucka-Mankiewicz M, Hauffa BP, Malunowicz EM, Stewart PM, Shackleton CH. Congenital adrenal hyperplasia caused by mutant P450 oxidoreductase and human androgen synthesis: analytical study. *Lancet.* 2004;363(9427):2128-2135.
- 12. Adachi M, Tachibana K, Asakura Y, Yamamoto T, Hanaki K, Oka A. Compound heterozygous mutations of cytochrome P450 oxidoreductase gene (POR) in two patients with Antley-Bixler syndrome. *Am J Med Genet A*. 2004;128a(4):333-339.
- 13. Wudy SA, Hartmann MF, Draper N, Stewart PM, Arlt W. A male twin infant with skull deformity and elevated neonatal 17-hydroxyprogesterone: a prismatic case of P450 oxidoreductase deficiency. *Endocr Res.* 2004;30(4):957-964.
- 14. Shackleton C, Marcos J, Arlt W, Hauffa BP. Prenatal diagnosis of P450 oxidoreductase deficiency (ORD): a disorder causing low pregnancy estriol, maternal and fetal virilization, and the Antley-Bixler syndrome phenotype. *Am J Med Genet A*. 2004;129a(2):105-112.
- 15. Shackleton C, Marcos J, Malunowicz EM, Szarras-Czapnik M, Jira P, Taylor NF, Murphy N, Crushell E, Gottschalk M, Hauffa B, Cragun DL, Hopkin RJ, Adachi M, Arlt W. Biochemical diagnosis of Antley-Bixler syndrome by steroid analysis. *Am J Med Genet A*. 2004;128a(3):223-231.
- 16. Fukami M, Horikawa R, Nagai T, Tanaka T, Naiki Y, Sato N, Okuyama T, Nakai H, Soneda S, Tachibana K, Matsuo N, Sato S, Homma K, Nishimura G, Hasegawa T, Ogata T. Cytochrome P450 oxidoreductase gene mutations and Antley-Bixler syndrome with abnormal genitalia and/or impaired steroidogenesis: molecular and clinical studies in 10 patients. *J Clin Endocrinol Metab.* 2005;90(1):414-426.
- 17. Fukami M, Hasegawa T, Horikawa R, Ohashi T, Nishimura G, Homma K, Ogata T. Cytochrome P450 oxidoreductase deficiency in three patients initially regarded as having 21-hydroxylase deficiency and/or aromatase deficiency: diagnostic value of urine steroid hormone analysis. *Pediatr Res.* 2006;59(2):276-280.
- Homma K, Hasegawa T, Nagai T, Adachi M, Horikawa R, Fujiwara I, Tajima T, Takeda R, Fukami M, Ogata T. Urine steroid hormone profile analysis in cytochrome P450 oxidoreductase deficiency: implication for the backdoor pathway to dihydrotestosterone. J Clin Endocrinol Metab. 2006;91(7):2643-2649.
- 19. Williamson L, Arlt W, Shackleton C, Kelley RI, Braddock SR. Linking Antley-Bixler syndrome and congenital adrenal hyperplasia: a novel case of P450 oxidoreductase deficiency. *Am J Med Genet A.* 2006;140a(17):1797-1803.
- 20. Scott RR, Gomes LG, Huang N, Van Vliet G, Miller WL. Apparent manifesting heterozygosity in P450 oxidoreductase deficiency and its effect on coexisting 21-hydroxylase deficiency. *J Clin Endocrinol Metab.* 2007;92(6):2318-2322.
- 21. Dhir V, Ivison HE, Krone N, Shackleton CH, Doherty AJ, Stewart PM, Arlt W. Differential inhibition of CYP17A1 and CYP21A2 activities by the P450 oxidoreductase mutant A287P. *Mol Endocrinol.* 2007;21(8):1958-1968.
- 22. Hershkovitz E, Parvari R, Wudy SA, Hartmann MF, Gomes LG, Loewental N, Miller WL. Homozygous mutation G539R in the gene for P450 oxidoreductase in a family previously diagnosed as having 17,20-lyase deficiency. *J Clin Endocrinol Metab.* 2008;93(9):3584-3588.
- 23. Nakamura N, Adachi M, Machida J, Okuzumi S. Foot anomalies in Antley-Bixler syndrome: three case reports. *J Pediatr Orthop B.* 2008;17(5):241-245.

- 24. Ko JM, Cheon CK, Kim GH, Yoo HW. A case of Antley-Bixler syndrome caused by compound heterozygous mutations of the cytochrome P450 oxidoreductase gene. *Eur J Pediatr.* 2009;168(7):877-880.
- Sahakitrungruang T, Huang N, Tee MK, Agrawal V, Russell WE, Crock P, Murphy N, Migeon CJ, Miller WL. Clinical, genetic, and enzymatic characterization of P450 oxidoreductase deficiency in four patients. *J Clin Endocrinol Metab.* 2009;94(12):4992-5000.
- 26. Iijima S, Ohishi A, Ohzeki T. Cytochrome P450 oxidoreductase deficiency with Antley-Bixler syndrome: steroidogenic capacities. *J Pediatr Endocrinol Metab.* 2009;22(5):469-475.
- Idkowiak J, Malunowicz EM, Dhir V, Reisch N, Szarras-Czapnik M, Holmes DM, Shackleton CH, Davies JD, Hughes IA, Krone N, Arlt W. Concomitant mutations in the P450 oxidoreductase and androgen receptor genes presenting with 46,XY disordered sex development and androgenization at adrenarche. *J Clin Endocrinol Metab.* 2010;95(7):3418-3427.
- 28. But WM, Lo IF, Shek CC, Tse WY, Lam ST. Ambiguous genitalia, impaired steroidogenesis, and Antley-Bixler syndrome in a patient with P450 oxidoreductase deficiency. *Hong Kong Med J.* 2010;16(1):59-62.
- 29. McGlaughlin KL, Witherow H, Dunaway DJ, David DJ, Anderson PJ. Spectrum of Antley-Bixler syndrome. *J Craniofac Surg.* 2010;21(5):1560-1564.
- 30. Fukami M, Nagai T, Mochizuki H, Muroya K, Yamada G, Takitani K, Ogata T. Anorectal and urinary anomalies and aberrant retinoic acid metabolism in cytochrome P450 oxidoreductase deficiency. *Mol Genet Metab.* 2010;100(3):269-273.
- 31. Tomalik-Scharte D, Maiter D, Kirchheiner J, Ivison HE, Fuhr U, Arlt W. Impaired hepatic drug and steroid metabolism in congenital adrenal hyperplasia due to P450 oxidoreductase deficiency. *Eur J Endocrinol.* 2010;163(6):919-924.
- 32. Herkert JC, Blaauwwiekel EE, Hoek A, Veenstra-Knol HE, Kema IP, Arlt W, Kerstens MN. A rare cause of congenital adrenal hyperplasia: Antley-Bixler syndrome due to POR deficiency. *Neth J Med.* 2011;69(6):281-283.
- 33. Fluck CE, Mallet D, Hofer G, Samara-Boustani D, Leger J, Polak M, Morel Y, Pandey AV. Deletion of P399\_E401 in NADPH cytochrome P450 oxidoreductase results in partial mixed oxidase deficiency. *Biochem Biophys Res Commun.* 2011;412(4):572-577.
- Soneda S, Yazawa T, Fukami M, Adachi M, Mizota M, Fujieda K, Miyamoto K, Ogata T. Proximal promoter of the cytochrome P450 oxidoreductase gene: identification of microdeletions involving the untranslated exon 1 and critical function of the SP1 binding sites. J Clin Endocrinol Metab. 2011;96(11):E1881-1887.
- 35. Puiu M, Pienar C, Chirita EA, Arghirescu S, Popa C, Micle I. A Case of Antley Bixler Syndrome: Diagnosis and Outcome. *Acta Endo (Buc).* 2012;8(3):479-484.
- Guaragna-Filho G, Castro CC, Carvalho RR, Coeli FB, Ferraz LF, Petroli RJ, Mello MP, Sewaybricker LE, Lemos-Marini SH, D'Souza-Li LF, Miranda ML, Maciel-Guerra AT, Guerra-Junior G. 46,XX DSD and Antley-Bixler syndrome due to novel mutations in the cytochrome P450 oxidoreductase gene. *Arq Bras Endocrinol Metabol.* 2012;56(8):578-585.
- 37. Sanchez-Garvin D, Albaladejo S, Ezquieta B, Corripio R. Disorder of sex development as a diagnostic clue in the first Spanish known newborn with P450 oxidoreductase deficiency. *BMJ Case Rep.* 2013;2013.

- Reisch N, Idkowiak J, Hughes BA, Ivison HE, Abdul-Rahman OA, Hendon LG, Olney AH, Nielsen S, Harrison R, Blair EM, Dhir V, Krone N, Shackleton CH, Arlt W. Prenatal diagnosis of congenital adrenal hyperplasia caused by P450 oxidoreductase deficiency. J Clin Endocrinol Metab. 2013;98(3):E528-536.
- Boia ES, Popoiu MC, Puiu M, Stanciulescu CM, David VL. Antley-Bixler syndrome: surgical management of ambiguous genitalia - a case report. *Med Princ Pract.* 2014;23(4):384-386.
- 40. Oldani E, Garel C, Bucourt M, Carbillon L. Prenatal Diagnosis of Antley-Bixler Syndrome and POR Deficiency. *American Journal of Case Reports*. 2015;16:882-885.
- 41. Ghazle HH, Newcomb PM. Sonographic Diagnosis of Antley-Bixler PORD-Type Syndrome. *Journal of Diagnostic Medical Sonography.* 2015;31(2):93-98.
- 42. Koika V, Armeni AK, Georgopoulos NA. Delayed diagnosis of disorder of sex development (DSD) due to P450 oxidoreductase (POR) deficiency. *Hormones (Athens).* 2016;15(2):277-282.
- 43. Parween S, Roucher-Boulez F, Fluck CE, Lienhardt-Roussie A, Mallet D, Morel Y, Pandey AV. P450 Oxidoreductase Deficiency: Loss of Activity Caused by Protein Instability From a Novel L374H Mutation. *J Clin Endocrinol Metab.* 2016;101(12):4789-4798.
- 44. Bonamichi BD, Santiago SL, Bertola DR, Kim CA, Alonso N, Mendonca BB, Bachega TA, Gomes LG. Long-term follow-up of a female with congenital adrenal hyperplasia due to P450-oxidoreductase deficiency. *Arch Endocrinol Metab.* 2016;60(5):500-504.
- 45. Tzetis M, Konstantinidou A, Sofocleous C, Kosma K, Mitrakos A, Tzannatos C, Kitsiou-Tzeli S. Compound heterozygosity of a paternal submicroscopic deletion and a maternal missense mutation in POR gene: Antley-bixler syndrome phenotype in three sibling fetuses. *Birth Defects Res A Clin Mol Teratol.* 2016;106(7):536-541.
- 46. Nakanishi K, Yamashita A, Miyamoto T, Takeguchi R, Furuya A, Matsuo K, Tanahashi Y, Kawamura M, Sengoku K. P450 oxidoreductase deficiency with maternal virilization during pregnancy. *Clinical and Experimental Obstetrics & Gynecology*. 2016;43(6):902-904.
- 47. Woo H, Ko JM, Shin CH, Yang SW. Two cases of Antley-Bixler syndrome caused by mutations in different genes, FGFR2 and POR. *J Genet Med.* 2016;13(1):31-35.
- 48. Bai Y, Li J, Wang X. Cytochrome P450 oxidoreductase deficiency caused by R457H mutation in POR gene in Chinese: case report and literature review. *J Ovarian Res.* 2017;10(1):16.
- 49. Song T, Wang B, Chen H, Zhu J, Sun H. In vitro fertilization-frozen embryo transfer in a patient with cytochrome P450 oxidoreductase deficiency: a case report. *Gynecol Endocrinol.* 2017:1-4.
- 50. Khadilkar KS, Jagtap V, Lila A, Bandgar T, Shah NS. Cytochrome P450 Oxidoreductase Deficiency: Novel Cause of Ambiguity with Primary Amenorrhea. *Indian J Endocrinol Metab.* 2017;21(2):360-362.
- Lantigua H, Rubio N, Rodriguez-Buritica D, Khan A, Yafi M. Cytochrome P450
   Oxidoreductase Deficiency PORD: A case report. *Eur J Pediatr.* 2017;176(11):1483-1484.
- 52. Oh J, Song JS, Park JE, Jang SY, Ki CS, Kim DK. A Case of Antley-Bixler Syndrome With a Novel Likely Pathogenic Variant (c.529G>C) in the POR Gene. *Ann Lab Med.* 2017;37(6):559-562.

- 53. Julious SA. Using confidence intervals around individual means to assess statistical significance between two means. *Pharmaceutical Statistics*. 2004;3(3):217-222.
- 54. *R: A Language and Environment for Statistical Computing* [computer program]. Vienna, Austria2016.
- 55. *pscl: Classes and Methods for R Developed in the Political Science Computational Laboratory* [computer program]. United States Studies Centre, University of Sydney. Sydney, New South Wales, Australia2017.
- 56. Zeileis A, Kleiber C, Jackman S. Regression Models for Count Data in R. *Journal of Statistical Software.* 2008;27(8):25.
- 57. Husebye ES, Allolio B, Arlt W, Badenhoop K, Bensing S, Betterle C, Falorni A, Gan EH, Hulting AL, Kasperlik-Zaluska A, Kampe O, Lovas K, Meyer G, Pearce SH. Consensus statement on the diagnosis, treatment and follow-up of patients with primary adrenal insufficiency. *J Intern Med.* 2014;275(2):104-115.
- 58. El-Maouche D, Arlt W, Merke DP. Congenital adrenal hyperplasia. *Lancet.* 2017;390(10108):2194-2210.
- 59. Burkhard FZ, Parween S, Udhane SS, Fluck CE, Pandey AV. P450 Oxidoreductase deficiency: Analysis of mutations and polymorphisms. *J Steroid Biochem Mol Biol.* 2017;165(Pt A):38-50.
- 60. Pandey AV, Sproll P. Pharmacogenomics of human P450 oxidoreductase. *Front Pharmacol.* 2014;5:103.

2 cer

Downloaded from https://academic.oup.com/jcem/advance-article-abstract/doi/10.1210/clinem/dgz255/5673513 by The University of Notre Dame user on 17 December 2019

**Table 1** Number of patients included and/or excluded from each article in the data collection.

**Figure 1** Flow-chart demonstrating the PubMed and Web of Science search strategy for identifying patients with PORD.

Figure 2 Grouping of pairs of POR mutations used in the analysis of skeletal malformations.

**Figure 3** Frequency of patients with different skeletal malformations (stratified from lowest to highest severity) in a sample of 83 patients.

Figure 4 Frequency of different POR mutations in the cohort of 90 patients (180 alleles).

Figure 5 Differences between the calculated and true malformation scores in a sample of 16 patients.

**Figure 6** Mean malformation score and 95% confidence interval for groups A-D. The shaded regions correspond to mild (lightest), moderate and severe (darkest) malformations, respectively. Group A: pairs of missense mutations involving C569Y, G539R, L577R, Y326D, but not R457H or A287P. Group B: R457H/R457H. Group C: (R457H/A287P) / Other. Group D: (R457H/A287P) / Null.

Figure 7 Frequency of maternal virilisation in pregnancy for different pairs of POR mutations.

**Figure 8** Peak cortisol after ACTH stimulation for R457H/R457H mutations compared to other missense combinations.

2 CeRt

| Table | 1 |
|-------|---|
|-------|---|

| Reference   | Number<br>of<br>patients | Duplicates | Lacking<br>patient<br>data | No POR<br>mutations | Other<br>mutant<br>genes | Included patients |
|---|--------------------------|------------|----------------------------|---------------------|--------------------------|-------------------|
| Fluck, Tajima, Pandey, Arlt,<br>Okuhara, Verge, Jabs,<br>Mendonca, Fujieda, Miller (4)  | 4                        | 0          | 0                          | 1                   | 0                        | 3                 |
| Arlt, Walker, Draper, Ivison,<br>Ride, Hammer, Chalder,<br>Borucka-Mankiewicz, Hauffa,<br>Malunowicz, Stewart,<br>Shackleton (11)                     | 3                        | 0          | 0                          | 0                   | 0                        | 3                 |
| Adachi, Tachibana, Asakura,<br>Yamamoto, Hanaki, Oka (12)   | 2                        | 0          | 0                          | 0                   | 0                        | 2                 |
| Wudy, Hartmann, Draper,<br>Stewart, Arlt (13)   | 1                        | 0          | 0                          | 0                   | 0                        | 1                 |
| Shackleton, Marcos, Arlt,<br>Hauffa (14)  | 2                        | 2          | 0                          | 0                   | 0                        | 0                 |
| Shackleton, Marcos,<br>Malunowicz, Szarras-Czapnik,<br>Jira, Taylor, Murphy,<br>Crushell, Gottschalk, Hauffa,<br>Cragun, Hopkin, Adachi, Arlt<br>(15) | 6                        | 6          | 0                          | 0                   | 0                        | 0                 |
| Huang, Pandey, Agrawal,<br>Reardon, Lapunzina, Mowat,<br>Jabs, Van Vliet, Sack, Fluck,<br>Miller (5)  | 32                       | 0          | 0                          | 17                  | 1                        | 14                |
| Fukami, Horikawa, Nagai,<br>Tanaka, Naiki, Sato,<br>Okuyama, Nakai, Soneda,<br>Tachibana, Matsuo, Sato,<br>Homma, Nishimura,<br>Hasegawa, Ogata (16)  |                          | 0          | 0                          | 2                   | 0                        | 8                 |
| Fukami, Hasegawa, Horikawa,<br>Ohashi, Nishimura, Homma,<br>Ogata (17)  | 3                        | 0          | 0                          | 0                   | 0                        | 3                 |
| Homma, Hasegawa, Nagai,<br>Adachi, Horikawa, Fujiwara,<br>Tajima, Takeda, Fukami,<br>Ogata (18)   | 22                       | 15         | 0                          | 0                   | 0                        | 7                 |
| Williamson, Arlt, Shackleton,<br>Kelley, Braddock (19)  | 1                        | 0          | 0                          | 0                   | 0                        | 1                 |
| Scott, Gomes, Huang, Van<br>Vliet, Miller (20)  | 1                        | 0          | 0                          | 0                   | 1                        | 0                 |
| Dhir, Ivison, Krone,<br>Shackleton, Doherty, Stewart,<br>Arlt (21)  | 11                       | 0          | 11                         | 0                   | 0                        | 0                 |
| Hershkovitz, Parvari, Wudy,<br>Hartmann, Gomes, Loewental,<br>Miller (22)   | 4                        | 0          | 0                          | 0                   | 0                        | 4                 |
| Nakamura, Adachi, Machida,<br>Okuzumi (23)  | 3                        | 3          | 0                          | 0                   | 0                        | 0                 |
| Ko, Cheon, Kim, Yoo (24)  | 1                        | 0          | 0                          | 0                   | 0                        | 1                 |
| Fukami, Nishimura, Homma,<br>Nagai, Hanaki, Uematsu, Ishii,   | 35                       | 23         | 12                         | 0                   | 0                        | 0                 |

| Numakura, Sawada, Nakacho,      |    |    |    |   |    |    |
|---------------------------------|----|----|----|---|----|----|
| Kowase, Motomura, Haruna,       |    |    |    |   |    |    |
| Nakamura, Ohishi, Adachi,       |    |    |    |   |    |    |
| Tajima, Hasegawa, Hasegawa,     |    |    |    |   |    |    |
| Horikawa, Fujieda, Ogata (6)    |    |    |    |   |    |    |
| Sahakitrungruang, Huang,        | 4  | 0  | 0  | 0 | 0  | 4  |
| Tee, Agrawal, Russell, Crock,   |    |    |    |   |    |    |
| Murphy, Migeon, Miller (25)     |    |    |    |   |    |    |
| Iijima, Ohishi, Ohzeki (26)     | 1  | 0  | 0  | 0 | 0  | 1  |
| Idkowiek Melunowiez Dhir        | 1  | 0  | 0  | 0 | 1  | 0  |
| Deigeh Szerreg Czennik          | 1  | 0  | 0  | 0 | 1  | 0  |
| Kelsen, Szarras-Czaplik,        |    |    |    |   |    |    |
| Hughes, Shackleton, Davies,     |    |    |    |   |    |    |
| Hughes, Krone, Artt $(27)$      | 1  | 0  | 0  | 0 |    |    |
| But, Lo, Shek, Tse, Lam (28)    | 1  | 0  | 0  | 0 | 0  | 1  |
| McGlaughlin, Witherow,          | 2  | 0  | 2  | 0 | 0  | 0  |
| Dunaway, David, Anderson        |    |    |    |   |    |    |
| (29)                            |    |    |    |   |    |    |
| Fukami, Nagai, Mochizuki,       | 2  | 0  | 2  | 0 | 0  | 0  |
| Muroya, Yamada, Takitani,       |    |    |    |   |    |    |
| Ogata (30)                      |    |    |    |   |    |    |
| Tomalik-Scharte, Maiter,        | 1  | 1  | 0  | 0 | 0  | 0  |
| Kirchheiner, Ivison, Fuhr, Arlt | -  | -  |    |   | Ŭ. | -  |
| (31)                            |    |    |    |   |    |    |
| Herkert Blaauwwiekel Hoek       | 1  | 0  | -0 | 0 | 0  | 1  |
| Veenstra-Knol Kema Arlt         | 1  | Ŭ  | Ň  | 0 | 0  | 1  |
| Kerstens (32)                   |    |    |    |   |    |    |
| Idkowiak O'Riordan Reisch       | 7  | _1 | 0  | 0 | 0  | 6  |
| Malunowicz Collins              | '  |    | 0  | 0 | 0  | 0  |
| Kerstens Kohler Graul-          |    |    |    |   |    |    |
| Neumann Szarras-Czannik         |    |    |    |   |    |    |
| Dattani Silink Shackleton       |    |    |    |   |    |    |
| Maiter Krone Arlt (8)           |    |    |    |   |    |    |
| Fluck Mallet Hofer Samara-      | 2  | 0  | 2  | 0 | 0  | 0  |
| Boustani Lager Polak Moral      |    | 0  | 2  | 0 | 0  | 0  |
| Pandey (33)                     |    |    |    |   |    |    |
| Soneda Vazawa Fukami            | 3  | 3  | 0  | 0 | 0  | 0  |
| Adachi Mizota Eujiada           | 5  | 5  | 0  | 0 | 0  | 0  |
| Mixemoto Ogata (34)             |    |    |    |   |    |    |
| Krone Deisch Idkerrick          | 20 | 10 | 1  | 4 | 0  | 12 |
| Nione, Reisch, Idkowlak,        | 50 | 12 | 1  | 4 | 0  | 15 |
| O'Noil Viizoloor Smith          |    |    |    |   |    |    |
| MacDanald Cala Adalaha          |    |    |    |   |    |    |
| NacDonald, Cole, Adolphs,       |    |    |    |   |    |    |
| Barton, Blair, Braddock,        |    |    |    |   |    |    |
| Collins, Cragun, Dattani, Day,  |    |    |    |   |    |    |
| Dougan, Feist, Gottschalk,      |    |    |    |   |    |    |
| Olegory, Haim, Harrison,        |    |    |    |   |    |    |
| Olney, Hauffa, Hindmarsh,       |    |    |    |   |    |    |
| Hopkin, Jira, Kempers,          |    |    |    |   |    |    |
| Kerstens, Khalifa, Kohler,      |    |    |    |   |    |    |
| Maiter, Nielsen, O'Riordan,     |    |    |    |   |    |    |
| Koth, Shane, Silink,            |    |    |    |   |    |    |
| Stikkelbroeck, Sweeney,         |    |    |    |   |    |    |
| Szarras-Czapnik, Waterson,      |    |    |    |   |    |    |
| Williamson, Hartmann,           |    |    |    |   |    |    |
| Taylor, Wudy, Malunowicz,       |    |    |    |   |    |    |
| Shackleton, Arlt (7)            |    |    |    |   |    |    |
| Puiu, Pienar, Chirita,          | 1  | 0  | 0  | 0 | 0  | 1  |
| Arghirescu, Popa, Micle (35)    |    |    |    |   |    |    |

| Guaragna-Filho, Castro,       | 1  | 0  | 0 | 0 | 0            | 1        |
|-------------------------------|----|----|---|---|--------------|----------|
| Carvalho, Coeli, Ferraz,      |    |    |   |   |              |          |
| Petroli, Mello, Sewaybricker, |    |    |   |   |              |          |
| Lemos-Marini, D'Souza-Li,     |    |    |   |   |              |          |
| Miranda, Maciel-Guerra,       |    |    |   |   |              |          |
| Guerra-Junior (36)            |    |    |   |   |              |          |
| Sanchez-Garvin, Albaladejo,   | 1  | 0  | 0 | 0 | 0            | 1        |
| Ezquieta, Corripio (37)       |    |    |   |   |              |          |
| Reisch, Idkowiak, Hughes,     | 20 | 19 | 0 | 0 | 0            | 1        |
| Ivison, Abdul-Rahman,         |    |    |   |   |              |          |
| Hendon, Olney, Nielsen,       |    |    |   |   |              |          |
| Harrison, Blair, Dhir, Krone, |    |    |   |   |              | ¢        |
| Shackleton, Arlt (38)         |    |    |   |   |              |          |
| Boia, Popoiu, Puiu,           | 1  | 1  | 0 | 0 | 0            | 0        |
| Stanciulescu, David (39)      |    |    |   |   |              |          |
| Oldani, Garel, Bucourt,       | 1  | 0  | 0 | 0 | 0            | 1        |
| Carbillon (40)                |    |    |   |   |              |          |
| Ghazle, Newcomb (41)          | 1  | 0  | 0 | 0 | 0            | 1        |
| Koika, Armeni, Georgopoulos   | 1  | 0  | 0 | 0 | 0            | 1        |
| (42)                          |    |    |   |   |              |          |
| Parween, Roucher-Boulez,      | 1  | 0  | 0 | 0 | 0            | 1        |
| Fluck, Lienhardt-Roussie,     |    |    |   |   |              |          |
| Mallet, Morel, Pandey (43)    |    |    |   |   |              |          |
| Bonamichi, Santiago, Bertola, | 1  | 0  | 0 | 0 | 0            | 1        |
| Kim, Alonso, Mendonca,        |    |    |   |   |              |          |
| Bachega, Gomes (44)           |    |    |   |   |              |          |
| Tzetis, Konstantinidou,       | 3  | 0  | 2 | 0 | 0            | 1        |
| Sofocleous, Kosma, Mitrakos,  |    |    |   |   |              |          |
| Tzannatos, Kitsiou-Tzeli (45) |    |    |   |   |              |          |
| Nakanishi, Yamashita,         | 1  | 0  | 0 | 0 | 0            | 1        |
| Miyamoto, Takeguchi,          |    |    | - | - | -            |          |
| Furuya, Matsuo, Tanahashi.    |    |    |   |   |              |          |
| Kawamura, Sengoku (46)        |    |    |   |   |              |          |
| Woo, Ko, Shin, Yang (47)      | 1  | 0  | 0 | 0 | 0            | 1        |
| Bai, Li, Wang (48)            | 1  | 0  | 0 | 0 | 0            | 1        |
| Song, Wang, Chen. Zhu, Sun    | 2  | 0  | 0 | 1 | 0            | 1        |
| (49)                          | -  |    | - | - | Ĭ            | <b>_</b> |
| Khadilkar Jagtan Lila         | 1  | 0  | 0 | 0 | 0            | 1        |
| Bandgar Shah (50)             | 1  | Ŭ  | Ŭ | Ĭ | <sup>o</sup> | 1        |
| Lantigua Rubio Rodriguez-     | 1  | 0  | 0 | 0 | 0            | 1        |
| Buritica Khan Vafi (51)       | 1  | Ŭ  | Ŭ |   | , v          | 1        |
| Oh Song Park Jang Ki Vim      | 1  | 0  | 0 | 0 | 0            | 1        |
| (52)                          | 1  | 0  |   |   | 0            | 1        |
|                               | 1  | 1  | I | 1 | Total        | 90       |
|                               |    |    |   |   | rotar        | 20       |







## Skeletal malformation

advance-article-abstrate/ doi/10.1210/clinem/dgz255/5673513 by The Un









Mutations (maternal/paternal alleles)

advance-article-abstra Absent N Preseclinem/dgz255/5673513 by The Un



\_