Competition between a toxic and a non-toxic *Microcystis* strain under constant and pulsed nitrogen and phosphorus supply

Saara Suominen[1†], Verena S. Brauer[2,3,4†], Anne Rantala-Ylinen[1], Kaarina Sivonen[1] and Teppo Hiltunen[1*]

[1]Department of Food and Environmental Sciences / Microbiology and Biotechnology

P.O. Box 65, 00014 University of Helsinki, FINLAND

[2]Department of Aquatic Microbiology, Institute for Biodiversity and Ecosystem Dynamics, University of Amsterdam, P.O. Box 94248, 1090 GE Amsterdam, THE NETHERLANDS

[3]Groningen Institute for Evolutionary Life Sciences, University of Groningen, Nijenborgh 7, 9747 AG Groningen, THE NETHERLANDS

[4]Present address: Aquatic Microbiology, Biofilm Centre, University of Duisburg-Essen, Universitätsstr. 5, 45141 Essen, GERMANY

[†] Equal contribution

[*]Corresponding author teppo.hiltunen@helsinki.fi

Running head: Genotype dynamics in experimental *Microcystis* populations

Keywords: algal toxins, Droop model, harmful cyanobacteria, nutrient limitation, microcosm, *Microcystis aeuruginosa,* plankton dynamics, resource pulses, quantitative PCR

Abstract

The toxicity of a harmful algal bloom is strongly determined by the relative abundance of non-toxic and toxic genotypes, and might therefore be regulated by competition for growth-limiting resources. Here, we studied how the toxic *Microcystis aeruginosa* strain PCC 7806 and a non-toxic mutant compete for nitrogen and phosphorus under constant and pulsed nutrient supply. Our monoculture and competition experiments show that these closely related genotypes have distinct nutrient physiologies and that they differ in their ability to compete for nitrogen and phosphorus. The toxic wild type won the competition under nitrogen limitation, while the non-toxic mutant dominated under phosphorus limitation. Pulses of both nitrogen and phosphorus increased the dominance of the toxic genotype, which lead to an even faster competitive exclusion of the non-toxic genotype under nitrogen pulses and to coexistence of both genotypes under phosphorus pulses. Our findings indicate that the genotype level dynamics driven by resource competition can be an important factor in determining cyanobacterial bloom toxicity.

Introduction

The harmful blooms of microalgae and cyanobacteria (harmful algal blooms, HABs) that often form in eutrophic freshwater and estuaries are among the most eye-catching and problematic microbial populations found in nature (Paerl and Otten, 2013; Brooks et al., 2015). These microbial mass occurrences are of great societal relevance because they threaten the production of drinking water and the recreational use of water bodies. It has been predicted that global change will further increase the risk and intensity of HABs due to human-induced eutrophication (O'Neil et al., 2012; Mantzouki et al., 2015), global warming (Paerl and Huisman, 2008, 2009), increased water column stratification (Jöhnk et al., 2008), and rising CO_2 levels (Verspagen et al., 2014).

Although HABs are often dominated by a single species, they harbour substantial genetic diversity and can vary considerably in toxicity. It has been shown that the toxicity of a bloom depends to a large extent on the relative proportions of toxic versus non-toxic or less toxic strains or genotypes of the same species (e.g. Park et al., 1998; Chorus et al., 2001; Briand et al., 2002; Wiedner et al. 2002; Welker et al., 2003; Huisman et al., 2005). The difference in toxin production level between genotypes can cover several orders of magnitude and exceeds by far the within-genotype variability in toxin production caused by environmental factors (Sivonen and Jones, 1999; Rohrlack et al., 2001; Carrillo et al., 2003). Several studies have indicated that the temporal and spatial distribution of toxic and non-toxic genotypes within natural blooms could be explained as the result of resource competition. For instance, Kardinaal et al. (2007) demonstrated in laboratory experiments that a toxic genotype of the harmful cyanobacterium *Microcystis aeruginosa* was displaced by a non-toxic type under light limitation. The authors suggested that the transition from toxic to non-toxic *Microcystis* genotypes during the duration of a bloom could be explained by the development of high biomass concentrations toward the end of the bloom, which

increases self-shading and enhances competition for light. Furthermore, van de Waal et al. (2011) demonstrated that the same non-toxic strain of *Microcystis* outcompeted the toxic strain in CO_2-limited conditions. Yet, HABs are also known to be affected by limitation of nutrients, in particular, nitrogen and phosphorus. If toxic and non-toxic genotypes differ in their competitive ability for these two nutrients, the type of nutrient limitation that arises might strongly influence the toxicity of a bloom. Nitrogen and phosphorus limitation may occur towards the end of blooms, but these have also been observed during earlier phases (Moisander et al., 2003; Walve and Larsson, 2007; Davis et al., 2009). Earlier periods of nutrient limitation may be interrupted by pulses of nutrient supply, for example, when wind-induced mixing of the water column enhances the diffusive inflow of nutrients from deeper water layers (Kononen et al., 1996; Stal et al., 1999; Davis et al., 2009). In fact, it has been argued that in natural systems such fluctuations in nutrient availability are the rule rather than the exception (e.g. Grover, 1988, 1991; Padisák, et al., 1993; Sommer 2002). Thus, if toxic and non-toxic genotypes also differ in their abilities to exploit nutrient pulses, the intensity of nutrient fluctuations might represent an additional important factor that influences how the toxin content of the bloom develops.

In this study, we used controlled microcosm experiments to investigate the competition between a toxic and a non-toxic strain (hereafter interchangeably also referred to as genotypes) of the harmful cyanobacterium *Microcystis aeruginosa* for nitrogen and phosphorus under both constant and pulsed supply. First, we measured several growth parameters for each genotype in replicated monocultures. Second, we investigated the competition between both genotypes under constant nutrient supply and under different kinds of nutrient pulses in replicated continuous and semi-continuous cultures. We also applied a parameterized Droop model to study the competition for phosphorus under constant and pulsed conditions in more detail with the help of numerical computer simulations.

Methods

Microcystis strains and culture maintenance:

We investigated the competition between two axenic strains (hereafter genotypes) of *M. aeruginosa*: the toxic (microcystin-producing) wild type (WT) PCC 7806, obtained from the Pasteur Culture Collection in Paris, and the non-toxic mutant genotype (M), provided by Prof. E. Dittmann. The mutant genotype was originally generated from the PCC 7806 by inserting a chloramphenicol resistance cartridge into the *mcyB* gene involved in microcystin biosynthesis (Dittmann et al., 1997). Axenic pre-cultures of both genotypes were grown at 25 ± 1°C in a 250 mL Erlenmeyer flask containing 40 mL of Z8 growth medium (Kotai, 1972). Z8 growth medium was prepared with analytical grade water (ELIX®, Merck Millipore, Billerica, MA, USA). Stock cultures of the mutant genotype also contained 5 µg chloramphenicol mL^{-1} (Dittmann et al., 1997).

Total Microcystis *cell densities:*

The *Microcystis* populations in our study exhibited a linear relationship between cell density and optical density (OD), as shown previously (Briand et al., 2012). We therefore established a standard conversion formula to estimate cell density as a function of OD. To achieve this, cell numbers of live samples from a chemostat culture at steady state were counted with a hemacytometer counting chamber using a compound microscope (Zeiss Axioskop 2 plus, Oberkochen, Germany). OD was measured at the wavelength 750 nm (UV-1800 spectrophotometer, Shimadzu, Japan). In the range of OD values that we observed in our experiments (0.01–0.25), the cell density of *Microcystis* (cells mL^{-1}) could be reliably estimated according to the following linear regression equation: density (cells mL^{-1}) = OD_{750} × 4 × 10^7 ($N = 7$; $R^2 = 0.949$).

Relative genotype proportions:

We sampled our microcosms every 1-3 days, depending on the experiment, with sterile syringe (chemostats) or pipette (batch cultures). Note that not all the samples were analyzed in the end. We used quantitative real-time PCR (qPCR) for quantifying genotype proportions in our experimental samples. We followed previously published general protocols for the *Microcystis* system (Briand et al. 2009, 2012; Kurmayer and Kutzenberger, 2003). In our study, DNA was extracted using the DNeasy Plant Mini Kit (Qiagen). Extractions were diluted 10-fold for qPCR, which was used to estimate the proportion of the mutant genotype. All cells in the culture were quantified with previously described primers and a probe for an intergenic spacer in the phycocyanin (PC) gene (Briand et al., 2009, 2012; Kurmayer and Kutzenberger, 2003). The primers and the probe used to quantify the mutant strain targeted the inserted chloramphenicol resistance cassette in the *mcyB* gene (Briand et al., 2012). The probes were labeled with the fluorescent reporter dye FAM (6-carboxyfluorescein) at the 5' end and the amidite Black Hole Quencher-1 (BHQ-1) at the 3'end. qPCR was performed with Applied Biosystems 7300 RealTime PCR Systems (Life Technologies). The PCR reactions contained 10 µl of the PerfeCta FastMix® II supermix with ROX™ (Quanta Biosciences), 200 nM of forward and reverse primers, 100 nM of probe and 5 µl of template DNA in a total volume of 20 µl. The PCR was performed with a 2-step PCR program. The PCR program included initial denaturation for 3 min at 95 °C, followed by 40 cycles of 15 s at 95 °C and 1 minute at 60 °C. All PCR reactions were performed in triplicates, including negative reactions not containing DNA template and a positive control containing 50% mutant cells, which was used to normalize results. The fluorescence threshold value was manually set to 0.15 in all qPCR runs while baseline values were determined automatically. The proportion of mutant strain related to all cells was determined using the ΔCt method first developed by Briand et al. (2008) for *Planktothrix agardhii* and subsequently used for *M. aeruginosa*

(Briand et al., 2009, 2012; Sabart et al., 2010). Further details of the qPCR protocol can be found from the supplementary information file.

Monoculture parameters:

As a first step, we used monoculture experiments to determine several growth parameters for each genotype. These parameters allow to make predictions about the outcome of competition in mixed culture, which can then be compared to the results from the competition experiments. The monoculture parameters will also be used to parameterize a variable-internal-stores model of competition.

Realized maximum specific growth rate: For each genotype, the maximum specific growth rate, μ_{max}, was determined in semi-continuous cultures (n = 6) on N-limited and P-limited growth medium, respectively. Cultures of 100 mL were inoculated with very low cell density and grown in 250 mL Erlenmeyer flasks for three days. Every day, 10% of the culture was replaced with fresh growth medium and the cell density, N_t, at time point t was determined. The maximum specific growth rates in N-limited and P-limited growth medium, $\mu_{max,N}$ and $\mu_{max,P}$, were calculated as the mean of the two growth rates calculated between the two time intervals as $\ln(N_{t+1}/N_t)/(t) + d$, where d represents the dilution rate of 0.1 day^{-1}.

Critical nutrient concentrations: In order to measure the critical resource concentration for nitrogen, R^*_N, and phosphorus, R^*_P, each genotype was grown separately in chemostats (n = 3) for approximately three weeks until it reached a steady state. The R^*_N and R^*_p values of each genotype were then determined as the residual nutrient concentration in the nitrogen- and phosphorus-limited steady state, respectively. Nutrient analysis was based on triplicate samples of 50 mL that were taken from the steady state cultures and centrifuged at 8000 × g

and 4°C for 5 minutes in order to remove *Microcystis* cells. The supernatant was then filtered through a 0.22 µm filter with *Supor*® membrane (Merck Millipore, Billerica, MA, USA) and stored at –20 °C. Analyses of N and P were conducted at Lammi Biological Station (University of Helsinki) with the following methodology: total dissolved nitrogen and phosphorus were analyzed by flow injection analysis (FIA) colorimetry (Quikchem8000, Lachat Instruments, Hach Company, Loveland, CO, USA) using the alkaline persulfate oxidation method (QuikChem®METHOD 10-107-04-1-I, Lachat Instruments, Hach Company, Loveland, CO, USA) for nitrogen concentrations and the alkaline persulfate digestion method (QuikChem®METHOD 10-115-01-1-S, Lachat Instruments, Hach Company, Loveland, CO, USA) for phosphorus concentrations, respectively.

Minimum nutrient quota: The minimum quotas for nitrogen and phosphorus, $Q_{min,N}$ and $Q_{min,P}$, of each genotype was determined as the intracellular nutrient concentration measured from cells obtained from each chemostat on two separate days, one week apart, when the culture had reached steady state. 50 mL of culture was collected and centrifuged at 10 000 × g and 4 °C for 5 minutes. The supernatant was removed from the cells and 3 mL of type-2 analytical grade water (ELIX®, Merck Millipore, Billerica, MA, USA) was used to resuspend the cells. A volume of 1.5 mL of the cell solution was collected into a 2 mL tube and stored at –20 °C. Nutrients were analysed at a later stage as described in the paragraph above on critical nutrient concentrations.

Maximum nutrient uptake rates: To measure the maximum phosphorus uptake rate, 50 mL of a P-depleted culture was added in 500 ml of growth medium containing 25 µmol L^{-1} of phosphate. The reduction in dissolved phosphorus concentration was then monitored after 0, 2, 4, 6 and 24 hours. Plotting the external phosphorus concentrations versus time revealed an

initial linear phase so that the maximum P-uptake rate was estimated by linear regression as the absolute value of the slope. Unfortunately, due to technical problems, the experiments to measure the maximum uptake rate of nitrogen failed so that this rate could not be determined.

Maximum nutrient quota: Maximum intracellular nitrogen and phosphorus quotas, $Q_{max,N}$ and $Q_{max,P}$, were determined by culturing cells in 250 mL Erlenmeyer flasks containing Z8 culture medium with nitrogen and phosphorus in non-limiting concentrations (Kotai 1972). Cultures were grown for three days before cells were collected for nutrient measurements. 50 mL of the sample was centrifuged at 8000 × g and 4 °C for 5 minutes. The supernatant was removed as precisely as possible, and cells were washed three times with 50 mL of type-2 analytical grade water and the sample was stored frozen in –20 °C. Nitrogen and phosphorus concentrations were analysed at a later stage as described for critical nutrient concentrations. Uptake rate and nutrient quota parameters are based on values obtained from a single microcosm.

Half-saturation constant: The half-saturation constant for phosphorus uptake for each genotype, K_i, was estimated by optimizing the numerical solution to the model described in the methods section further below (eq. 1–3). The model was first solved by using the function lsoda of the R-package deSolve, which automatically switches between stiff and non-stiff integration methods (Soetaert et al., 2010). The model predictions were then fit to the data from the monoculture experiments by minimizing the residual sum of squares with the help of the Broyden-Fletcher-Goldfarb-Shanno algorithm of the function optim in R (version 3.0.3). Half-saturation constants for nitrogen uptake could not be determined because of the missing estimates of the maximum nitrogen uptake rate.

Design of competition experiments:

We investigated the competition between the toxic and non-toxic strain under N- and P-limitation and three different nutrient supply regimes: **i)** Competition experiments under constant supply were conducted in chemostats (continuous cultures) of 470 mL culture volume with a constant dilution rate of 0.1 day^{-1} ("continuous supply"). The set up and maintenance of the chemostats followed the same methodology as described previously (Fussman et al., 2000; Hiltunen et al., 2013), and all containers used during the experimental procedures were washed with 2% HCl. Chemostat cultures were started as follows: both genotypes were grown in monocultures into steady state, cell densities were enumerated and then both genotypes were mixed in equal proportion. **ii)** Competition experiments under pulsed nutrient supply were run as semi-continuous cultures, using 1000 mL Erlenmeyer flasks that contained 500 mL of culture. For the experiments with short pulse intervals, 10% of the culture was replaced every third day with fresh growth medium ("3-day-interval-pulse"). **iii)** For the experiments with a single large pulse, 10% of the mixed culture was replaced on the first day with fresh growth medium ("single-pulse"). Subsequent replacements occurred every third day, where 10% of the mixed culture was replaced with fresh growth medium devoid of nitrate or phosphate, respectively. Experiments were carried out in Z8 culture medium without chloramphenicol and with varying nitrogen (N) and phosphorus (P) concentrations, depending on the type of nutrient limitation and supply regime. An overview of the different types of experiments and their corresponding nutrient supply concentrations and supply regime is given in Table 1. In the two different pulsed experiments, the total amount of limiting nutrient provided during the course of the experiment was the same. All experiments were replicated at least three times and were initially inoculated at a 1:1 ratio of toxic versus non-toxic strain cells. Light was unidirectional, with 90-100 µmol photons m^{-2} s^{-1} intensity. Furthermore, in all experiments,

the light intensity measured at the backside of the culture vessels was 35 µmol photons m^{-2} s^{-1} or higher, which indicates that light availability within the culture was growth-saturating (Hesse et al., 2001; Huisman et al., 2002). Light intensity was measured with a model LI-250 light meter (LI-COR, Lincoln, NE, USA).

Statistics:

We used Student's *t*-test to investigate the effect of genotype identity on the different nitrogen and phosphorus parameters, and we used a repeated measures ANOVA (RMANOVA) to investigate the effects of growth medium and supply regime on *Microcystis* cell density. All analyses were performed with PASW statistics (SPSS Inc. Chicago IL, v. 20.0) software.

Mathematical model and numerical simulations:

Many phytoplankton species take up nutrients such as nitrogen and phosphorus in excess when these resources are abundant and store them intracellularly until periods of low nutrient availability arise. Therefore, we use a variable-internal-stores model ("Droop-model") in order to investigate the effect of nutrient fluctuations on the competition between two *Microcystis* genotypes (Droop, 1973). This model has been analyzed previously by Grover (1991) and will therefore be explained here only in brief. The model assumes a spatially homogeneous habitat, such as a well-mixed chemostat. The population density of a specific genotype, N_i, increases with a certain specific growth rate, μ_i, and it decreases with a constant rate, D, the chemostat dilution rate. The specific growth rate of a genotype depends on its intracellular phosphorus pool, Q_i, which increases with the specific uptake rate, v_i, and decreases due to cell division.

The phosphorus concentration in the water, R, increases due to a constant inflow of phosphorus from the supply vessel and decreases due to chemostat dilution and uptake by phytoplankton cells. The dynamics of N_i, Q_i and R in the chemostat are then given by

$$\frac{dN_i}{dt} = \mu_i(Q_i)N_i - DN_i \quad (1)$$

$$\frac{dQ_i}{dt} = \nu_i(R, Q_i) - \mu_i(Q_i)\, Q_i \quad (2)$$

$$\frac{dR}{dt} = D(R_{in} - R) - \sum_{i=1}^{2} \nu_i(R, Q_i)\, N_i \quad (3)$$

Here, R_{in} defines the supply concentration of phosphorus. The specific growth rate of strain i, μ_i, is a saturating function of the internal phosphorus quota, and is given by

$$\mu_i = \mu_{max,i}' \left(1 - \frac{Q_{min,i}}{Q_i}\right), \quad (4)$$

where $\mu_{max,i}'$ denotes the maximum specific growth rate of strain i and $Q_{min,i}$ denotes the persistence quota, i.e. the phosphorus concentration inside the cell of strain i at which growth ceases (i.e. where $\mu(Q_{min}) = 0$). Note, that the maximum specific growth rate, $\mu_{max,i}'$, is never reached because phosphorus quotas do not increase infinitely. Instead, the realized maximum specific growth rate, $\mu_{max,i}$, which is reached at the point where the phosphorus quota is at its maximum, $Q_{max,i}$, is always lower. The phosphorus uptake rate of strain i, v_i, is given by

$$\nu_i = \nu_{max,i} \left(\frac{R}{K_i + R}\right) \left(\frac{Q_{max,i} - Q_i}{Q_{max,i} - Q_{min,i}}\right), \quad (5)$$

where K_i describes the half-saturation constant of genotype i for phosphorus uptake. Thus, v increases with the external phosphorus concentrations as described by the Michaelis-Menten-

function and it decreases with increasing intracellular phosphorus quota. For each genotype, the model parameters were measured in monocultures, except for the half-saturation constants for phosphorus uptake, K_i, which were estimated by the curve-fitting method as describe above. The parameterized model was then used to investigate the competition for a large number of different phosphorus pulse heights and pulse frequencies numerically. In total, simulations were run for 251 × 351 = 88101 different combinations of pulse height and pulse period in the range of 10^{-2} (= 0.01) and $10^{0.5}$ (= 3.16) µmol P L^{-1} and of 10^{-2} (= 0.01) and $10^{1.5}$ (= 31.6) days. Note that to be comparable with the experimental results, the model simulations were not run until the final outcome of competition was observed, but they were stopped after 40 days. The observed genotype frequencies at this time point were categorized and the result was drawn on the plane of pulse height and frequency (Fig. 2).

Results

Monocultures:

Nitrogen parameters: The monoculture experiments revealed that the toxic and the non-toxic *Microcystis* genotype differed in their growth and resource utilization traits. Under nitrogen-limited conditions, the critical nitrogen concentration, R^*_N, of the toxic genotype measured in chemostats at steady state was clearly lower than that of the non-toxic strain (*t*-test: $t(6) = 7.56$, $p < 0.001$). The toxic genotype also exhibited a higher maximum growth rate, μ_{max} (*t*-test: $t(10) = -3.81$, $p = 0.003$). Even though we do not have replication required for statistical testing, it appears that the WT also had a lower minimum nitrogen quota, $Q_{min,N}$, and a higher maximum nitrogen quota, $Q_{max,N}$, compared to the non-toxic genotype (Table 2). Unfortunately, we do not have estimates for the maximum nitrate uptake rate because the uptake experiments failed due to technical problems. Consequently, it was also not possible

306 to estimate the half-saturation constant for nitrate uptake, K_N, with the help of curve fitting, as
307 the two parameters are interdependent.
308
309 *Phosphorus parameters:* Under phosphorus-limited conditions, the critical phosphorus
310 concentration, R_P^*, of the toxic genotype measured in chemostats at steady state was higher
311 than of the non-toxic genotype (*t*-test: $t(3) = –5.0$, $p = 0.015$). The toxic genotype also had a
312 higher maximum specific growth rate than the non-toxic genotype (Grover, 1990, 1991; *t*-
313 test: $t(10) = –2.56$, $p = 0.028$). In contrast, the non-toxic strain had a higher maximum uptake
314 rate for phosphorus, higher maximum phosphorus quota, and a slightly lower minimum
315 phosphorus quota.
316
317 ***Competition dynamics:***
318 *Nitrogen-limitation*: The replicated competition experiments under nitrogen-limitation
319 revealed very consistent results. Under constant supply, the total cell density remained
320 constant throughout the experiment (Fig. 1A). Yet, the relative frequency of the toxic
321 genotype gradually increased until it reached 1 after approximately 40 days.
322 Correspondingly, the relative frequency of the non-toxic genotype decreased until it was
323 washed out within the same time period. Thus, under constant nitrogen supply, the toxic
324 genotype clearly outcompeted the non-toxic genotype. When nitrogen was supplied in pulses
325 every three days, the total cell density increased in the beginning of the experiments and
326 reached a constant density after 15 days. The relative frequency of the toxic genotype showed
327 a steep increase within the first six days of the experiment, followed by a more moderate rise
328 until it completely dominated the culture after 24 days. By definition, the relative frequency
329 of the non-toxic genotype exhibited the opposite pattern. When nitrogen was supplied as a
330 single large pulse at the beginning of the experiments, the dynamics of the total cell density

showed a hump-shaped curve (Fig. 1C). The relative frequency of the toxic genotype rose steeply in the beginning and reached 100% after 9 days, while the non-toxic genotype was washed out.

Phosphorus limitation: The total cell density in the experiments with constant phosphorus supply remained constant throughout the experiments and did not differ from the experiments with constant nitrogen supply (Fig. 1A,D; average cell density during the experiment, N-limitation: $6.43 \pm 0.49 \times 10^6$ cells mL^{-1}; Fig. 3D; P-limitation $6.31 \pm 0.39 \times 10^6$ cells mL^{-1}; RMANOVA $F_{1,5} = 0.034$, $p = 0.860$). Yet, the relative genotype frequencies showed considerable variation between replicates. Although the critical phosphorus concentrations measured in monocultures suggested that the non-toxic genotype should win the competition, three competition experiments showed that the non-toxic genotype increased in relative frequency or outcompeted the toxic mutant, while two competition experiments showed coexistence of both genotypes at approximately equal frequencies. Yet, the replicate experiments showed consistent results in the pulsed experiments. In the 3-day-interval-pulse experiments, the total cell density remained constant throughout the experiment and did not differ from the constant supply experiment. Both genotypes coexisted at approximately equal densities for 27 days. (Fig. 1E). In the single-pulse experiments, the total cell density showed a hump-shaped curve, and both genotypes coexisted again at approximately equal densities (Fig. 1F).

Rate of competitive exclusion:

As described in the previous section, the nutrient supply regime affected the rate of competitive exclusion, whereby the effect depended on the type of nutrient limitation. We therefore plotted the natural logarithm of the ratio of mutant to wild type relative frequencies

versus time, and calculated the rate of competitive exclusion from the slope of the linear regression line (see e.g. van de Waal et al., 2011). In the nitrogen-limited experiments, the rate of competitive exclusion increased with pulse intensity, being slowest under constant supply and fastest when a single large nitrogen pulse was given (Tab. 3; Fig. 1A–C). In the phosphorus limited experiments, competitive exclusion was reversed and was fastest under constant supply, while pulsed phosphorus supply considerably slowed down competitive exclusion (Tab. 3, Fig. 1D–F).

***Model predictions concerning competition for phosphorus*:**

Because the phosphorus-limited experiments did not provide very clear results, we also investigated competition under phosphorus limitation with the help of numerical simulations using the growth parameters for each genotype measured in monoculture. The results observed after 40 days show that the non-toxic genotype wins the competition under very short pulse intervals and low pulse height in the lower left corner of Figure 2. Because the results are visualized in a log-log plot, the dominance of the non-toxic genotype is actually confined to a rather small parameter space of nearly-constant phosphorus supply. The dominance region of the non-toxic genotype extends further as a fine, narrowing, diagonal band towards the upper right corner of the graph, but then bends off beforehand and continues rising more slowly with increasing oscillations. To the upper left side of this stripe extends a large region of longer pulse intervals but relatively high pulses, where both genotypes are able to coexist for the period of 40 days. In the lower right corner of the graph, the pulses are too seldom and too low so that both genotypes are washed out before the end of the experiments.

Discussion

Our study demonstrates that closely related genotypes of one species can have distinct nutrient physiologies. Our study also shows that these physiological differences can have consequences for the growth and competition between these genotypes, which eventually may have a profound impact on the functioning and the toxicity of blooms in nature. We here discuss the physiological and theoretical background and the ecological implications of these results.

Physiological differences of toxic and non-toxic genotypes

Genetically, the non-toxic mutant genotype used in our study differed from the toxic wild type genotype only due to the deletion of the *mcyB* gene. Transcription of *mcy*-genes has been shown to be stimulated by light (Kaebernick *et al*., 2000; Tonk *et al*., 2005) and a number of recent studies suggest that adaptation to high light conditions and oxidative stress protection might be the primary role of microcystin (Zilliges *et al*., 2011; Makower *et al*., 2015; Meissner, Steinhauser & Dittman, 2015), though also other functions have been suggested (Kaplan *et al*., 2012). Interestingly, however, our monoculture experiments reveal that the toxic and the non-toxic genotype show significant differences also in other traits, which do not seem to be directly linked to the cellular functions of microcystins that have so far been described. The toxic genotype appeared to have a higher maximum specific growth rate, μ_{max}, than the non-toxic genotype in both types of growth media (see Tab. 1). Yet, this is in disagreement with Hesse *et al*. (2001) and Briand *et al*. (2012), who did not find any difference between the two genotypes. The toxic genotype also had higher maximum quotas for nitrogen, $Q_{max,N}$, and phosphorus $Q_{max,P}$, which suggest that it can store more nutrients and that it can maintain high uptake rates over a longer time period (Tab. 1; Grover, 1991). The non-toxic genotype had a lower critical phosphorus concentration, R_P^*, a lower minimum

405 phosphorus requirement, $Q_{min,P}$, and a higher maximum phosphorus uptake rate, $v_{max,P}$, which
406 suggest that it can deal better with constantly low phosphorus concentrations and that it can
407 better exploit small phosphorus pulses. One possible explanation for this result is that
408 microcystin production is costly in terms of ATP, and thus also in terms of phosphorus,
409 because the corresponding gene cluster and enzyme complex need to be maintained active
410 (Bickel, Lyck & Utkilen, 2000). However, Briand et al. (2106) found in their experiments
411 with the same strains (WT and mutant) under monoculture and co-culture conditions that the
412 mutant which is not able to produce microcystin, produces higher concentrations of the
413 remaining cyanopeptides. In the light of this finding, interpreting the cost of microcystin
414 production is not so straight forward.

415 It is surprising that the toxic genotype also had a lower minimum nitrogen quota, $Q_{min,N}$, and a
416 lower critical nitrogen concentration, R_N^*, than the non-toxic genotype. Yet, this result has to
417 be taken with care, because the very high R_N^*-values compared to other studies (Brussaard &
418 Riegman, 1998; Wilken et al., 2013) indicate that something else might have been limiting
419 growth during these measurements as well. In fact, one would expect the toxic genotype to
420 have a higher nitrogen demand because the production of microcystins is costly in terms of
421 nitrogen (e.g. Long et al 2001; Downing *et al*., 2005; van de Waal *et al*., 2009, 2010).

422 We do not yet have a clear explanation for the physiological differences found in our study,
423 Yet, it is known that the deletion of the *mcyB* gene has various consequences for the cell, e.g.
424 for pigmentation and cellular structure (Hesse *et al*., 2001), but also for the expression of
425 other genes and proteins, which are related to photosynthesis and respiration, energy-
426 metabolism or carbon-nitrogen metabolism, to name a few (Alexova *et al*., 2011; Zilliges *et*
427 *al*., 2011; Makower *et al*., 2015). Thus, the intracellular effects of microcystin production
428 seem manifold, and it is therefore likely that it has side-effects on other phenotypic traits as
429 well.

430

431 ***Competition in pulsed habitats***

432 Our competition experiments show that the distinct nutrient physiologies of the toxic and the
433 non-toxic genotype discovered in the monoculture experiments also have important
434 consequences for their population dynamics. Our results are largely in agreement with
435 common resource competition models (Tilman, 1982; Grover, 1991, 1997). Under constant
436 nutrient inflow competition was won by the affinity-specialist (sensu Sommer, 1984), i.e. by
437 the genotype which had the lowest R^*-value for the limiting nutrient (Tab. 1; Fig. 1A and D).
438 Interestingly, the toxic and the non-toxic genotype exhibited a trade-off in the competitive
439 ability for nitrogen and phosphorus, which is also commonly observed between
440 phytoplankton species (Edwards, Litchman & Klausmeier, 2011). On the one hand our results
441 are consistent with Vézie *et al*. (2002) and Lei *et al*. (2015) who found higher growth rates of
442 the mutant genotype and a non-toxic strain under phosphorus limitation. On the other hand
443 our results are inconsistent with Vézie *et al*. (2002) and Briand *et al.* (2012) who found that
444 the mutant genotype, rather than the wild type, was growing faster under N-limitation, and
445 Lei *et al*. (2015) did not observe a clear difference. One reason for this discrepancy might be
446 that these studies used batch cultures rather than continuous or semi-continuous cultures,
447 where the dominant species or genotype in the competition does not need to be the affinity-
448 specialist. Another reason might be that all three experiments differed in the degree of N-
449 limitation, and that we cannot assure that N-limitation in our experiments was absolute.

450 Under pulsed nutrient inflow resource competition theory predicts that the growth-specialist
451 (sensu Sommer, 1984), i.e. the species with the highest maximum growth rate, μ_{max}, wins the
452 competition under small (and frequent) nutrient pulses, while the storage specialist (sensu
453 Sommer, 1984), i.e. species with lowest Q_{min}, highest Q_{max} and highest v_{max}, wins the

competition under large (and unfrequent) nutrient pulses (Grover 1991, 1997). Our monoculture and competition experiments together suggest that the toxic-genotype was the growth- as well as the storage-specialist for both nitrogen and phosphorus (Tab. 1; Fig. B,C,E,F). Thus, under nitrogen limitation, we did not observe a trade-off in the competitive ability under constant and pulsed nutrient inflow. Under phosphorus limitation, however, this trade-off seemed to be existent. Here, the non-toxic genotype was the superior competitor under constant phosphorus inflow (Tab.1, Fig 1D). Under pulsed phosphorus inflow we did not observed a full reversal of competitive dominance, but the non-toxic genotype no longer outcompeted the toxic genotype. Instead, both genotypes coexisted for the duration of the experiment (Fig. 1E,F). Moreover, our simulation results indicate that the dominance of the toxic genotype would further increase with higher phosphorus pulse intensity (results not shown). This result is in agreement with the general observation, that phytoplankton species show a trade-off between the competitive ability under constant and variable phosphorus limitation (Edwards, Klausmeier & Litchman, 2013).

Previous studies with toxic and non-toxic *Microcystis* strains have demonstrated distinct competitive abilities under light carbon, nitrogen and phosphorus limitation (Kardinaal *et al*., 2007; Van de Waal *et al*. 2011; LeBlanc Renaud *et al*., 2011; Briand *et al*., 2012; Lei *et al*., 2015). Yet, as Briand *et al*., (2012) and Lei *et al*. (2015) conducted their studies in batch cultures competition for nitrogen and phosphorus in continuous or semi-continuous culture has not been investigated before. At first sight, our experiments suggest that phosphorus limitation might favor the dominance of non-toxic genotypes, and that microcystin production does not provide a clear benefit under P-limitation. As P-limitation should not affect the reducing power of cells to the same extent as C- or N-limitation (Sterner and Elser, 2002), this results is in line with the hypothesis that microcystins are beneficial under oxidative stress (Zilliges *et al*., 2012, Makower *et al*., 2015; Meissner *et al*., 2015). Yet, it has

to be pointed out that the competitive dominance of the mutant genotype under constant phosphorus limitation was rather fragile and seemed to be limited to a very low parameter range of nearly constant conditions, as rather small nutrient pulses already enabled the toxic genotype to coexist. (Fig. 1D, Fig. 2). It therefore remains an open question whether such highly constant conditions occur in natural freshwater systems and whether phosphorus limitation can really mitigate bloom toxicity.

Nutrient limitation in natural blooms

Our experiments suggest that toxic *Microcystis* genotypes might be better competitors under nitrogen limitation than non-toxic genotypes, while (constant) phosphorus limitation favors non-toxic genotypes. This result is consistent with several field studies showing that low N:P ratios seem to favor toxic *Microcystis* genotypes over their non-toxic counterparts (Davis et al., 2009; Rinta-Kanto et al., 2009, Gobler et al., 2016). Furthermore, higher microcystin concentrations have been linked to low N:P ratios in four reservoirs in the United States (Harris et al., 2016), indirectly indicating higher frequencies of toxic genotypes. However, our results do not explain why the relative frequency of toxic genotypes has been found to increase with increasing N concentrations (Yoshida et al., 2005; Davis et al., 2010).

Acknowledgements

We thank Lyudmila Saari and Matti Wahlsten for technical assistance, Prof. Elke Dittmann for providing the mutant *Microcystis* strain and Riitta Ilola and Jaakko Vaininpää for nutrient analysis and Jouni Jokela for advising with the analysis. We also thank Johannes Cairns for editing the language. This work was funded by University of Helsinki three-year grant (2015–2018) to T.H. and Academy of Finland (project #106993 to T.H.).

503 **References**

504 Alexova R, Haynes PA, Ferrari BC, Neilan BA. (2011) Comparative protein expression in
505 different strains of the bloom-forming cyanobacterium *Microcystis aeruginosa*. Mol
506 Cell Proteomics, 10, M110.003749.

507 Bickel H, Lyck S, Utkilen H. (2000) Energy state and toxin content: experiments on
508 *Microcystis aeruginosa* (Chroococcales, Cyanophyta). Phycologia, 39, 212-218.

509 Briand JF, Robillot C, Quiblier-Lloberas C, Bernard C. (2002) A perennial bloom of
510 *Planktothrix agardhii* (Cyanobacteria) in a shallow eutrophic French lake:
511 limnological and microcystin production studies. Arch Hydrobiol, 153, 605-622.

512 Briand E, Gugger M, François JC, Bernard C, Humbert JF, Quiblier C (2008) Temporal
513 variation in the dynamics of potentially microcystin-productin strains in a bloom-
514 forming *Planktothrix agardhii* (cyanobacterium) population. Appl Environ Microbiol,
515 74, 3839-3848.

516 Briand E, Escoffier N, Straub C, Sabart M, Quiblier C, Humbert JF (2009) Spatiotemporal
517 changes in the genetic diversity of a bloom-forming *Microcystis aeruginosa*
518 (cyanobacteria) population. ISME J, 3, 419-429.

519 Briand E, Bormans M, Quiblier C, Salençon MJ, Humbert JF. (2012) Evidence of the cost of
520 the production of microcystins by *Microcystis aeruginosa* under differing light and
521 nitrate environmental conditions. PLoS One, 7, e29981.

522 Briand E, Bormans M, Gugger M, Dorrestein PC, Gerwick WH (2016). Changes in
523 secondary metabolic profiles of *Microcystis aeruginosa* strains in response to
524 intraspecific interactions. Environ Microbiol 18, 384-400.

525 Brooks BW, Lazorchak JM, Howard MD, Johnson MVV, Morton SL, Perkins DA, et al.
526 (2015). Are harmful algal blooms becoming the greatest inland water quality threat to
527 public health and aquatic ecosystems? Environ Toxicol Chem, 35, 6-13.

528 Brussaard CPD, Riegman R (1998). Influence of bacteria on phytoplankton cell mortality
529 with phosphorus or nitrogen as the algal-growth-limiting nutrient. Aquat Microb Ecol
530 14, 271-280.

531 Carrillo E, Ferrero LM, Alonso-Andicoberry C, Basanta A, Martín A, López-Rodas V,
532 Costas E (2003) Interstrain variability in toxin production in populations of the
533 cyanobacterium *Microcystis aeruginosa* from water supply reservoirs of Andalusia
534 and lagoons of Doñana National Park (southern Spain). Phycologia, 42, 269-274.

535 Chorus I (2001) Environmental factors and microcystin levels in waterbodies. In:
536 *Cyanotoxins – Occurrences, Causes, Consequences* (Ed. I. Chorus), pp. 159-177.
537 Springer-Verlag, Berlin, Germany.

538 Davis TW, Berry DL, Boyer GL, Gobler, C. J. (2009) The effects of temperature and
539 nutrients on the growth and dynamics of toxic and non-toxic strains of *Microcystis*
540 during cyanobacteria blooms. Harmful Algae, 8, 715-725.

541 Davis TW, Harke MJ, Marcoval M, Goleski J, Orano-Dawson C, Berry DL, et al. (2010)
542 Effects of nitrogenous compounds and phosphorus on the growth of toxic and non-
543 toxic strains of *Microcystis* during cyanobacterial blooms. Aquat Microb Ecol, 61,
544 149-162.

545 Dittmann E, Neilan BA, Erhard M, Von Döhren H, Börner T. (1997) Insertional mutagenesis
546 of a peptide synthetase gene that is responsible for hepatotoxin production in the
547 cyanobacterium *Microcystis aeruginosa* PCC 7806. Mol Microbiol, 26, 779-787.

548 Dittmann E, Fewer DP, Neilan BA (2011) Cyanobacterial toxins: biosynthetic routes and
549 evolutionary roots. FEMS Microbiol Rev, 37, 23-43.

550 Downing TG, Meyer C, Gehringer MM, Van de Venter M. (2005) Microcystin content of
551 *Microcystis aeruginosa* is modulated by nitrogen uptake rate relative to specific
552 growth rate or carbon fixation rate. Environ Toxicol, 20, 257-262.

553 Droop MR (1973) Some thoughts on nutrient limitation in algae. *J Phycol*, 9, 264-272.

554 Edwards KF, Klausmeier CA, Litchman E (2011) Evidence of a three-way trade-off between
555 nitrogen and phosphorus competitive abilities and cell size in phytoplankton. Ecology,
556 92, 2085-2095.

557 Edwards KF, Klausmeier CA, Litchman E (2013) A three-way trade-off maintains functional
558 diversity under variable resource supply. Am Nat, 182, 786-800.

559 Fussmann GF, Ellner SP, Shertzer KW, Hairston Jr NG (2000) Crossing the Hopf Bifurcation
560 in a live predator-prey system. Science, 290, 1358-1360.

561 Gobler CJ, Burkholder JM, Davis TW, Harke MJ, Johengen T, Stow CA & Van de Waal D.
562 B. (2016). The dual role of nitrogen supply in controlling the growth and toxicity of
563 cyanobacterial blooms. Harmful Algae, 54, 87-97.

564 Grover JP (1988) Dynamics of competition in a variable environment: experiments with two
565 diatom species. Ecology, 69, 408-417.

566 Grover JP (1990) Resource competition in a variable environment: phytoplankton growing
567 according to the Monod's model. Am Nat, 136, 771-789.

568 Grover JP (1991) Resource competition in a variable environment: phytoplankton growing
569 according to the variable-internal-stores model. Am Nat, 138, 811-835.

570 Grover JP (1997) *Resource Competition*. Chapman & Hall, London, United Kingdom.

571 Grover JP (2011) Resource storage and competition with spatial and temporal variation in
572 resource availability. Am Nat, 178, E124-E148.

573 Harris TD, Smith VH, Graham JL, van de Waal DB, Tedesco LP, Clercin N (2016).
574 Combined effects of nitrogen to phosphorus and nitrate to ammonia ratios on
575 cyanobacterial metabolite concentrations in eutrophic Midwestern USA reservoirs.
576 Inland Waters 6, 199-210.

577 Hesse K, Dittmann E, Börner T (2001) Consequences of impaired microcystin production for
578 light-dependent growth and pigmentation of *Microcystis aeruginosa* PCC 7806.
579 FEMS Microbiol Ecol, 37, 39-43.

580 Hiltunen T, Jones LE, Ellner SP, Hairston NG (2013) Temporal dynamics of a simple
581 community with intraguild predation: an experimental test. Ecology, 94, 773-779.

582 Huisman J, Matthijs HCP, Visser PM, Balke H, Sigon CAM, Passarge J, et al. (2002)
583 Principles of the light-limited chemostat: theory and ecological applications. Antonie
584 Leeuwenhoek 81, 117-133.

585 Huisman J, Matthijs HCP, Visser PM, eds. (2005) Harmful Cyanobacteria. Springer Aquatic
586 Ecology Series 3, Springer, Dordrecht, The Netherlands.

587 Joehnk KD, Huisman JEF, Sharples J, Sommeijer BEN, Visser PM, Stroom JM (2008)
588 Summer heatwaves promote blooms of harmful cyanobacteria. Glob Chang Biol, 14,
589 495-512.

590 Kaebernick M, Neilan BA, Börner T, Dittmann E (2000) Light and the transcriptional
591 response of the microcystin biosynthesis gene cluster. Appl Environ Microbiol, 66,
592 3387-3392.

593 Kardinaal WEA, Tonk L, Janse I, Hol S, Slot P, Huisman J, Visser PM (2007) Competition
594 for light between toxic and nontoxic strains of the harmful cyanobacterium
595 *Microcystis*. Appl Environ Microbiol, 73, 2939-2946.

596 Kononen K, Kuparinen J, Mäkelä K, Laanements J, Pavelson J, Nommann S (1996) Initiation
597 of cyanobacterial blooms in a frontal region at the entrance to the Gulf of Finland,
598 Baltic Sea. Limnol Oceanogr, 41, 98-112.

599 Kotai J (1972) Instructions for preparation of modified nutrient solution Z8 for algae.
600 Norwegian Institute for Water Research, Oslo. 69, 5.

601 Kurmayer R, Kutzenberger T (2003) Application of real-time PCR for quantification of
602 microcystin genotypes in a population of the toxic cyanobacterium *Microcystis* sp.
603 Appl Environ Microbiol, 69, 6723-6730.

604 Lei L, Li C, Peng L, Han BP (2015) Competition between toxic and non-toxic *Microcystis*
605 *aeruginosa* and its ecological implication. Ecotoxicology, 24, 1411-1418.

606 Long BM, Jones GJ, Orr PT (2001) Cellular microcystin content in N-limited *Microcystis*
607 *aeruginosa* can be predicted from growth rate. Appl Environ Microbiol, 67, 278-283.

608 Makower AK, Schuurmans JM, Groth D, Zilliges Y, Matthijs HC, Dittmann E (2015)
609 Transcriptomics-aided dissection of the intracellular and extracellular roles of
610 microcystin in *Microcystis aeruginosa* PCC 7806. Appl Environ Microbiol, 81, 544-
611 554.

612 Mantzouki E, Visser PM, Bormans M, Ibelings BW (2015) Understanding the key ecological
613 traits of cyanobacteria as a basis for their management and control in changing lakes.
614 Aquat Ecol, 1-18 10.1007/s10452-015-9526-3

615 Meissner S, Steinhauser D, Dittmann E (2015) Metabolomic analysis indicates a pivotal role
616 of the hepatotoxin microcystin in high light adaptation of *Microcystis*. Env Microbiol,
617 17, 1497-1509.

618 Moisander PH, Steppe TF, Hall NS, Kuparinen J, Paerl HW (2003) Variability in nitrogen
619 and phosphorus limitation for Baltic Sea phytoplankton during nitrogen-fixing
620 cyanobacterial blooms. Mar Ecol Prog Ser, 262, 81-95.

621 O'neil JM, Davis TW, Burford MA, Gobler CJ (2012) The rise of harmful cyanobacteria
622 blooms: the potential role of eutrophication and climate change. Harmful Algae, 14,
623 313-334.

624 Padisák J, Reynolds CS, Sommer U eds. (1993) *Intermediate Disturbance Hypothesis in*
625 *Phytoplankton Ecology*. Developments in Hydrobiology 81, Kluwer Academic
626 Publishers, Dordrecht, The Netherlands.

627 Paerl HW, Huisman J (2008) Blooms like it hot. Science, 320, 57-58.

628 Paerl HW Huisman J (2009) Climate change: a catalyst for global expansion of harmful
629 cyanobacterial blooms. Environ Microbiol Rep, 1: 27-37.

630 Paerl HW, Otten TG (2013) Harmful cyanobacterial blooms: causes, consequences, and
631 controls. Microb Ecol, 65, 995-1010.

632 Park HD (1998) Temporal variabilities of the concentrations of intra- and extracellular
633 microcystin and toxic *Microcystis* species in a hypertrophic lake, Lake Suwa, Japan
634 (1991-1994). Environ Toxicol Water Qual, 13, 61-72.

635 Reynolds CS (1993) Scales of disturbance and their role in plankton ecology. Hydrobiologia,
636 249, 157-171.

637 Rinta-Kanto JM, Konopko EA, DeBruyn JM, Bourbonniere RA, Boyer GL, Wilhelm SW
638 (2009) Lake Erie *Microcystis*: relationship between microcystin production, dynamics
639 of genotypes and environmental parameters in a large lake. Harmful Algae, 8, 665-
640 673.

641 Rohrlack T, Henning M, Kohl J-G (2001) Isolation and characterization of colony-forming
642 *Microcystis aeruginosa* strains. In: *Cyanotoxins – Occurrences, Causes,*
643 *Consequences* (Ed. Rohrlack, T., Henning, M., & Kohl, J. G.), pp. 152-158. Springer-
644 Verlag, Berlin, Germany.

645 Sabart M, Pobel D, Briand E, Combourieu B, Salençon MJ, Humbert JF, Latour D (2010)
646 Spatiotemporal variation in microcystin concentrations and in the proportions of
647 microcystin-producing cells in several *Microcystis aeruginosa* populations. Appl
648 Environ Microbiol, 76, 4750-4759.

649 Sivonen K, Jones GJ (1999) Cyanobacterial toxins. In: Toxic cyanobacteria in Water: A
650 Guide to their Public Health Consequences, Monitoring and Management (Eds I.
651 Chorus and J. Bartram), pp. 41-111. Spon, London, United Kingdom.

652 Soetaert KER, Petzoldt T, Setzer RW (2010) Solving differential equations in R: Package
653 deSolve. J Stat Softw, 33, 1-25.

654 Sommer U (1984) The paradox of the plankton: fluctuations of phosphorus availability
655 maintain diversity of phytoplankton in flow-through cultures. Limnol Oceanogr, 29,
656 633-636.

657 Sommer U (2002) Competition and coexistence in plankton communities. In: *Competition*
658 *and Coexistence* (Eds. U. Sommer & B. Worm), pp. 79-108. Ecological Studies, Vol.
659 161, Springer-Verlag, Berlin.

660 Stal LJ, Staal M, Villbrandt M (1999) Nutrient control of cyanobacterial blooms in the Baltic
661 Sea. Aquat Microb Ecol, 18, 165-173.

662 Sterner RW, Elser JJ (2002) *Ecological Stoichiometry: the Biology of Elements from*
663 *Molecules to the Biosphere*. Princeton University Press, Princeton, NJ, USA.

664 Tilman D (1982) *Resource Competition and Community Structure*. Princeton University
665 Press, Princeton, NJ, USA.

666 Tonk L, Visser PM, Christiansen G, Dittmann E, Snelder EO, Wiedner C, et al. (2005) The
667 microcystin composition of the cyanobacterium *Planktothrix agardhii* changes toward
668 a more toxic variant with increasing light intensity. Appl Environ Microbiol, 71,
669 5177-5181.

670 Van de Waal DB, Verspagen JM, Lürling M, Van Donk E, Visser PM, Huisman J (2009) The
671 ecological stoichiometry of toxins produced by harmful cyanobacteria: an
672 experimental test of the carbon-nutrient balance hypothesis. Ecol Lett, 12, 1326-1335.

673 Van de Waal DB, Ferreruela G, Tonk L, Van Donk E, Huisman J, Visser PM, Matthijs HC
674 (2010) Pulsed nitrogen supply induces dynamic changes in the amino acid
675 composition and microcystin production of the harmful cyanobacterium *Planktothrix*
676 *agardhii*. FEMS Microbiol Ecol, 74, 430-438.

677 Van de Waal DB, Verspagen JM, Finke JF, Vournazou V, Immers AK, Kardinaal WEA, et
678 al. (2011) Reversal in competitive dominance of a toxic versus non-toxic
679 cyanobacterium in response to rising CO_2. ISME J, 5, 1438-1450.

680 Verspagen JM, Van de Waal DB, Finke JF, Visser PM, Van Donk E, Huisman J (2014)
681 Rising CO_2 levels will intensify phytoplankton blooms in eutrophic and hypertrophic
682 lakes. PLoS One, 9, e104325.

683 Vézie C, Rapala J, Vaitomaa J, Seitsonen J, Sivonen K (2002). Effect of nitrogen and
684 phosphorus on growth of toxic and nontoxic *Microcystis* strains and on intracellular
685 microcystin concentrations. Microb Ecol, 43, 443-454.

686 Visser PM, Ibelings BW, Bormans M, Huisman J. (2015) Artificial mixing to control
687 cyanobacterial blooms: a review. Aquat Ecol 1-19 doi: 10.1007/s10452-015-9537-0

688 Walve J, Larsson U (2007) Blooms of Baltic Sea *Aphanizomenon* sp. (cyanobacteria)
689 collapse after internal phosphorus depletion. Aquat Microb Ecol, 49, 57-69.

690 Welker M, Von Döhren H, Täuscher H, Steinberg CE, Erhard M (2003) Toxic *Microcystis* in
691 shallow lake Müggelsee (Germany): dynamics, distribution, diversity. Arch
692 Hydrobiol, 157, 227-248.

693 Wiedner C, Nixdorf B, Heinze R, Wirsing B, Neumann U, Weckesse J (2002) Regulation of
694 cyanobacteria and microcystin dynamics in polymictic shallow lakes, Arch
695 Hydrobiol, 155, 383-400.

696 Wilken S, Verspagen JMH, Naus-Wiezer S, van Donk E, Huisman J (2013). Comparison of
697 predator-prey interactions with and without intraguild predation by manipulation of
698 the nitrogen source. Oikos 123, 423-432.

699 Yoshida M, Yoshida T, Takashima Y, Kondo R, Hiroishi S (2005), Genetic diversity of the
700 toxic cyanobacterium *Microcystis* in Lake Mikata. Environ Toxicol, 20, 229–234. doi:
701 10.1002/tox.20102

702 Zilliges Y, Kehr JC, Meissner S, Ishida K, Mikkat S, Hagemann M. et al. (2011) The
703 cyanobacterial hepatotoxin microcystin binds to proteins and increases the fitness of
704 *Microcystis* under oxidative stress conditions. PLoS ONE, 6, e17615.

705 **Legends**

706 **Table 1.** Nutrient supply concentrations and supply regimes of the different competition
707 experiments. * Please note that these supply rates of the limiting nutrient are only for the
708 beginning of the experiment. After the start of the experiment we did not provide any of the
709 limiting nutrient (N or P).

710

711 **Table 2.** Nitrogen and phosphorus parameters of the toxic and the non-toxic *Microcystis*
712 genotypes. Values marked with [a] were estimated by curve fitting. The maximum nitrogen
713 uptake rate, $v_{max,N}$, and the corresponding half-saturation constant, K_N, were not determined
714 due to technical problems.

715

716 **Table 3.** Rates of competitive exclusion in the six different competition experiments. Rates
717 (cells mL^{-1} day^{-1}) are calculated as the slope of the linear regression of the relative frequency
718 of the non-toxic mutant versus time. Significant positive slopes indicate competitive
719 exclusion of the wild type by the mutant; significant negative slopes indicate competitive
720 exclusion of the mutant by the wild type. Non-significant slopes indicate coexistence.
721 Significant slopes values ($p < 0.05$) are marked in bold.

722

723 **Figure 1.** Relative frequencies of the non-toxic wild type strain (red line, filled symbols) and
724 the non-toxic mutant (blue line, closed symbols) during competition for nitrogen (panels
725 A–C) and phosphorus (panels D–F) at different levels of nutrient fluctuations: (A, D)
726 nutrients supplied continuously, (B, E) nutrients pulsed at 3-day-intervals, (C, F) single large
727 nutrient pulse at the beginning of the experiments. Triangles with green dotted line show total

728 *Microcystis* densities (cells mL^{-1}). Symbols represent means of four replicate microcosms
729 (except in A, $n = 5$), and vertical bars show standard error of the mean.

730 **Figure 2.** Simulation results showing the outcome of competition between the toxic
731 *Microcystis* wild type PCC 7806 and the non-toxic *mcyB*-deficient mutant genotype for
732 different periods and heights of phosphorus pulses. Note that to be comparable with the
733 experimental results, the graph shows the state of competition after 40 days rather than the
734 equilibrium outcome.

735

736

737

738

739

740

741

742

743

744

745

746

747

748

749 **Table 1**

Type of experiment	N-supply concentration, $R_{in,N}$ (µmol/L)	P-supply concentration, $R_{in,P}$ (µmol/L)	N:P-supply ratio	Pulse height (µmol N or P)	Pulse period (days)
Continuous supply (chemostat)					
N-limited	105	26.25	4	-	-
P-limited	192	3	64	-	-
3-day-pulse (semi-continuous culture)					
N-limited	105	26.25	4	10.5	3
P-limited	160	2.5	64	0.25	3
Single pulse (semi-continuous culture)					
N-limited	1050*	26.25	40*	105	28
P-limited	160	25*	6.4*	2.5	28

750

751

752

753

754

755

756

757

758

759

760 **Table 2**

Parameter	Description	Unit	WT	M
Nitrogen				
R_N*	critical resource concentration	µmol L^{-1}	32.08	37.08
$\mu_{max,N}$	realized maximum specific growth rate	day^{-1}	0.549 ± 0.039	0.472 ± 0.036
$v_{max,N}$	maximum nitrogen uptake rate	fmol $cell^{-1}$ day^{-1}	n.d.	n.d.
K_N	half-saturation constant for nitrogen uptake	µmol L^{-1}	n.d.	n.d.
$Q_{min,N}$	minimum intracellular nitrogen content	fmol $cell^{-1}$	8.019	8.506
$Q_{max,N}$	maximum intracellular nitrogen content	fmol $cell^{-1}$	18.92	16.36
Phosphorus				
*Rp**	critical resource concentration	µmol L^{-1}	0.073 ± 0.016	0.03 ± 0.0
$\mu_{max,P}$	maximum specific growth rate	day^{-1}	0.448 ± 0.040	0.398 ± 0.026
$v_{max,P}$	maximum phosphorus uptake rate	fmol $cell^{-1}$ day^{-1}	1.853	2.272
K_P	half-saturation constant for phosphorus uptake	µmol L^{-1}	3.004[a]	3.004[a]
$Q_{min,P}$	minimum intracellular phosphorus content	fmol $cell^{-1}$	0.285	0.273
$Q_{max,P}$	maximum intracellular phosphorus content	fmol $cell^{-1}$	1.880	1.210

761

762

763

764

765 **Table 3**

Resource supply regime	Limiting nutrient	n	Slope*	S.E.	*t*-value	*p*-value	Outcome of competition	Fig.
Constant	N	5	**–0.11**	0.001	–12.8	<0.0001	WT wins	1A
Constant	P	4	**0.012**	0.004	3.14	0.005	MT wins	1B
3-day pulse	N	4	**–0.144**	0.015	–9.80	<0.0001	WT wins	1C
3-day pulse	P	4	–0.001	0.002	–0.59	0.559	Co-existence	1D
Single pulse	N	4	**–0.541**	0.038	–14.1	<0.0001	WT wins	1E
Single pulse	P	4	0.004	0.002	1.77	0.087	Co-existence	1F

766