

Masthead Logo **University of Tennessee, Knoxville**
Trace: Tennessee Research and Creative Exchange

Doctoral Dissertations

Graduate School

5-2018

Lay Spirituality, Crusading, and Reform in the Sermons of Jacques de Vitry

Lydia Marie Walker
University of Tennessee

Recommended Citation

Walker, Lydia Marie, "Lay Spirituality, Crusading, and Reform in the Sermons of Jacques de Vitry." PhD diss., University of Tennessee, 2018.
https://trace.tennessee.edu/utk_graddiss/4933

This Dissertation is brought to you for free and open access by the Graduate School at Trace: Tennessee Research and Creative Exchange. It has been accepted for inclusion in Doctoral Dissertations by an authorized administrator of Trace: Tennessee Research and Creative Exchange. For more information, please contact trace@utk.edu.

To the Graduate Council:

I am submitting herewith a dissertation written by Lydia Marie Walker entitled "Lay Spirituality, Crusading, and Reform in the Sermons of Jacques de Vitry." I have examined the final electronic copy of this dissertation for form and content and recommend that it be accepted in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy, with a major in History.

Jay C. Rubenstein, Major Professor

We have read this dissertation and recommend its acceptance:

Robert J. Bast, Thomas E. Burman, Maura K. Lafferty

Accepted for the Council:

Dixie L. Thompson

Vice Provost and Dean of the Graduate School

(Original signatures are on file with official student records.)

Lay Spirituality, Crusading, and Reform in the Sermons of Jacques de Vitry

A Dissertation Presented for the
Doctor of Philosophy
Degree
The University of Tennessee, Knoxville

Lydia Marie Walker

May 2018

Copyright © 2018 by Lydia M. Walker

All rights reserved

Acknowledgements

First and foremost, I would like to express my thanks to my advisor, Prof. Jay Rubenstein for continual encouragement, productive criticism, and sound advice which guided this project to its completion. I would also like to thank my committee members Prof. Robert Bast, Prof. Maura Lafferty, and Prof. Thomas Burman for their cogent advice and ongoing support. I have to thank also the graduate students, faculty, and financial supporters of the Marco Institute at the University of Tennessee for creating a supportive community of medieval scholars.

I would also like to thank the faculty and students of Department of History at Ghent University, who provided an intellectually engaging environment during my Fulbright year in Belgium. Thank you especially to Prof. Steven Vanderputten and Dr. Michiel Verweij for their support of my Fulbright application and helpful advice. I also have to thank my fellow Jacques de Vitry enthusiasts, Dr. Jan Vandeburie, Dr. Jessalyn Bird, and Dr. Brenda Bolton whose encouraged me to study this fascinating bishop. My work is indebted to their own incisive scholarship.

My research was made possible through the generous financial support of the Fulbright Foundation, the University of Tennessee Humanities Center, the American Academy of Rome, the W.K. McClure Scholarship for the Study of World Affairs, The Hill Museum and Manuscript Library, the Marco Institute, and the Department of History at the University of Tennessee-Knoxville. I would also like to thank the helpful librarians and staff at UTK's Hodges Library, the Bibliothèque Royale de Belgique, Ghent University Library, the Bibliothèque du Séminaire de Namur, the Université de Liège - Bibliothèque Générale de Philosophie et Lettres, the Openbare Bibliotheek Brugge, the Musée Provincial des Arts Anciens du Namurois, the Vatican Library, the Bodleian Library, the British Library, and the John Rylands Library.

Lastly, I have to thank my friends and family, especially my sister, for her unwavering support throughout this process.

Abstract

Thirteenth-century papal reforms tied together crusading endeavors, clerical reform, the eradication of heresy, proper ecclesiastical governance, and the management of Christian-Jewish relations into a vision of a global Christendom. But it was men like Jacques de Vitry, a prominent preacher and Bishop of Acre, who strived to make these ideals a reality. He was involved in the key events and intellectual trends of the later twelfth and early thirteenth century. Trained at the University of Paris, Jacques worked among the female religious communities in the Southern Low Countries, preached against heresy and for crusade, and travelled to the Holy Land where he served as the bishop of Acre and participated in the Fifth Crusade. This dissertation examines his multifaceted work as a valuable lens into the various arenas he participated in. Based upon a programmatic examination of Jacques' sermon collections in their manuscript context, this project reveals development in their form, and the expansion of their content to suit later readers' needs. Second, it reconstructs in detail several aspects of Jacques' thought, which in turn influenced the broader academic discussions in the Middle Ages. It argues that Jacques' message, just as his life, depended on an affirmation of collaboration between the sexes, whether between clerics and holy women or husbands and wives. This work, therefore, evaluates the relationship between clerics and holy women and notions of clerical masculinity. Through situating these relationships within the context of reported violence against holy women at the Siege of Liège, this investigation examines the possible impact of violence and trauma on Jacques' investment in these communities and his understanding of gender. This dependence on women to assist his message by embodying and transmitting it can be seen, as well, in his involvement in the Fifth Crusade. Therefore, it traces connections between gendered pastoral care and crusade propaganda in the twelfth and thirteenth century to reveal the interest of both men and women in policing and defining gendered boundaries within the context of war. This dissertation, therefore, uncovers the vital relationship between crusade initiatives and a specifically gendered pastoral care in the early thirteenth century.

Table of Contents

Introduction.....	1
Medieval Sermons in the High Middle Ages: Describing and Proscribing a Transitional Moment.....	2
Editions of Jacques de Vitry’s Works.....	5
Bridging the Historiographical Divide.....	8
Chapter One: From Anxiety to Action and Back Again: Constructions of Gender in Thirteenth-Century Pastoral Works	16
The Case of the Genoese Women	16
Learning to be (Religious) Men at a Time of War.....	22
Parisian Prostitutes and Proving Clerical Manhood.....	28
Real Men Preach.....	40
The Mirror of Men: Mala Mulier.....	44
Readers of Exempla	50
Conclusions.....	53
Chapter Two: Dialogue and Dependence: Clerics and Holy Women.....	56
The Siege of Liège and the Care of Women	56
Jacques and Lutgard.....	59
The Gender of Holiness	71
Jacques and Marie.....	80
Conclusions.....	99
Chapter Three: The Officium of Recruitment: Jacques de Vitry and Preaching the Albigensian Crusade	102
What Preachers Do, What Preachers Say: Historiographical Problems in the Study of Crusade Preaching	104
Preaching the Albigensian Crusade	107
“Forward then soldiers of Christ!”: The Message of War against Heretics.....	116
“By means of those contemporary saints”: Holy Women vs. “Good Women”	126
Conclusions.....	136
Chapter Four: Collective Penance, Procession, and Preaching during the Fifth Crusade.....	137
Performative Penance and Crusade in the Thirteenth Century	139
Lost in Translation?: Miscommunication, Misinformation, or Misunderstanding in Crusade Preaching	145
Women, Men, and Even Children: Jacques de Vitry’s Application of the Universal Crusade.....	152
Enemies from Within.....	154

Women Crusaders and Crusaders' Common Women	159
Penitential Procession during the Fifth Crusade	164
God's First Born and Most Special Daughter	176
Conclusions	178
Chapter Five: Working Together at the End of the World: Jacques de Vitry's Use of Apocalyptic Thought	181
Jacques' Ad status Sermons	182
Harbingers of the Last Days	189
Great Expectations	193
Adversaries at the End of the World	195
Preaching Crusade, Preaching the Apocalypse	201
Conclusions	206
Conclusions	208
Bibliography	212
Vita	245

List of Abbreviations

- Ad Status* Jacques de Vitry, *Sermones vulgares vel ad status, Tomus I*, ed. Jean Longère, CCCM 225 (Turnhout: Brepols, 2013)
- AASS J. Bolland and others, *Acta Sanctorum*, 3rd ed., 68 vols (Paris: Palmé, 1863-1925)
- CCCM Corpus Christianorum Continuatio Medieualis (Turnhout 1971–)
- H.Occ.* Jacques de Vitry, *Historia Occidentalis*, in *The Historia Occidentalis of Jacques de Vitry: A Critical Edition*, ed. John Frederick Hinnebusch (Freiburg, Schweiz: Univ. Press, 1972)
- H.Or.* Jacques de Vitry, *Historia Orientales*, ed. Jean Donnadiou (Turnhout: Brepols, 2008)
- Lettres* Jacques de Vitry, *Lettres de Jacques de Vitry*, ed. Robert B.C. Huygens (Leiden: B.J. Brill, 1960)
- PL* J-P. Migne, *Patrologiae cursus completus: series latina*, 221 volumes (Paris: Migne, 1861-64)
- VCM* Thomas de Cantimpré, *Vita Christinae mirabilis*, ed. by J. Pinius, in AASS, 24 July, V, pp. 637-60
- VLA* *Thomas de Cantimpré, Vita Lutgardis Aquiriensis*, ed. by G. Henschen, in AASS, 16 June, III, pp.187-209
- VMO* Jacques de Vitry, *Vita Mariae Oigniacensis*, in CCCM 252, ed. by R.B.C. Huygens (Turnout, Brepols, 2012)
- VMO-S* Thomas de Cantimpré, *Vita Mariae Oigniacensis, Supplementum*, in CCCM 252, ed. by R.B.C. Huygens (Turnout, Brepols, 2012)
- Vulgares* Jacques de Vitry, *Sermones Vulgares*, in *Analecta novissima spicilegii Solesmensis: altera continuatio 2*, ed. Jean Baptiste Pitra (Paris, Tusculana: 1888)

Introduction

God, the just punisher of the wicked, the lord of vengeance, whipped the whole world so that it would be humbled by various punishments, the Moors in Spain, heretics in Province and Lombardy, schismatics in Greece—everywhere false brothers are allowed to rise up against us.¹

Famed crusade preacher and Bishop of Acre, Jacques de Vitry (d.1240), wrote these ominous words of God's retribution for the loss of Jerusalem in the *Historia Occidentalis*, written in the last decades of his career. But this was not just rhetorical flourish of a seasoned preacher. Jacques had first-hand experience in almost all of these “various punishments,” in the later twelfth and early thirteenth century. He was trained at the University of Paris in the intellectual circle of Peter the Chanter. He not only supported the Beguine movement, but served as the confessor to Mary of Oignies. He preached against heresy during the Albigensian Crusade and for the Fifth Crusade, and travelled to the Holy Land where he served as the bishop of Acre and participated in the Siege of Damietta (1218). Later, he served as Cardinal and Bishop of Tusculum and after his death he was buried at Oignies. Amidst these many responsibilities, he still found time to compose the *vita* of Mary of Oignies, letters, two histories, and over 400 sermons.² Jacques' life in many ways epitomizes the active religious life that would later be championed by the mendicant orders. At the heart of this dissertation is a new investigation into

¹ This remark addressed at length in Chapter Four. Jacques de Vitry, *Historia Occidentalis*, I, 73-74 edited in *The Historia Occidentalis of Jacques de Vitry: A Critical Edition*, ed. John Frederick Hinnebusch (Freiburg, Schweiz: Univ.-Verl, 1972), cited from here forth as *H. Occ.*: '[D]eus, ultionum dominus, mundum uniuersum uariis molestiis affligendo flagellauit, in Hyspania mauros, in Prouincia et Lombardia hereticos, in Grecia scismaticos, ubique falsos fratres contra nos insurgere permittendo.'

² Jacques de Vitry, *Historia Orientales*, ed. Jean Donnadieu (Turnhout: Brepols, 2008), cited as *H. Or.*; Jacques de Vitry, *Lettres de Jacques de Vitry*, ed. Robert B.C. Huygens (Leiden: B.J. Brill, 1960), Jacques de Vitry, *Sermones vulgares vel ad status*, Tomus I, ed. Jean Longère, CCCM 225 (Turnhout: Brepols, 2013); Jacques de Vitry, *Sermones Vulgares*, in *Analecta novissima spicilegii Solesmensis: altera continuatio 2*, ed. Jean Baptiste Pitra (Paris, Tusculana: 1888); Jacques de Vitry, *Vita Marie de Oegnies*, ed. Robert B.C. Huygens, CCCM 252 (Turnhout: Brepols, 2012), cited as *VMO*. Longère's sermon edition will be cited as *Ad status*, and Pitra's edition as *Vulgares*.

Jacques' multifaceted career and diverse writings, especially his sermons, as a window onto the movements he helped shape, including lay female spirituality, reform, and crusade in the East and West.³

Medieval Sermons in the High Middle Ages: Describing and Proscribing a Transitional Moment

Jacques de Vitry occupied a transitional moment in history. The evolution in sermon literature at the end of the twelfth to the beginning of the thirteenth century has been characterized as a shift from theologically complex exegesis to pithy, entertaining stories, from matins among religious orders to masses focused on serving an increasingly diverse laity. The emerging Dominicans and Franciscans would later perfect and broadly disseminate these techniques.⁴ Scholars have also pointed to this period as marking a transition in reading characterized as turning from meditative and monastic reading towards more consultative or scholastic reading.⁵ Such binary descriptions broadly typify the variations in preaching and reading practices, but the creation of new institutions and technologies does not require the eclipse of the old. As Steven Vanderputten has shown, reform was not marked by radical change, but as a process more accurately described as waves of ongoing reforms that crystallized over several generations.⁶ Likewise, and perhaps in conjunction with these reforms, reading habits did

³ Jean Donnadiou's recent portrait of Jacques' life together with the brief biography of Jacques by Philipp Funk, remain the only two monographs focused on Jacques de Vitry, Donnadiou, *Jacques de Vitry. Entre l'Orient et l'Occident : l'évêque aux trois visages* (Turnhout : Brepols, 2014); Funk, *Jakob von Vitry: Leben Und Werke* (Hildesheim: Gerstenberg, 1973).

⁴ Mark A. Zier, "Sermons of the Twelfth Century Schoolmasters and Canons," in *The Sermon*, ed. Beverly Mayne Kienzle (Turnhout: Brepols, 2000), 325-51; Beverly Mayne Kienzle, "Introduction," in *The Sermon*, ed. Beverly Mayne Kienzle (Turnhout: Brepols, 2000), 155; Nicole Beriou, "Les Sermon Latins Après 1200," in *The Sermon*, 366; Cole, *Preaching the Crusades*, 5-6.

⁵ Ivan Illich characterizes this shift as a "fleeting but very important moment in the history of the alphabet, when after centuries of Christian reading, the page suddenly transformed from a score for pious mumbler into an optically organized text for logical thinkers," *In the Vineyard of the Text: A Commentary to Hugh's Didascalicon* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1993), 2.

⁶ Steven Vanderputten, *Monastic Reform as Process Realities and Representations in Medieval Flanders, 900-1100* (Ithaca: Cornell University Press, 2013), 9.

not undergo instantaneous metamorphosis. Manuscript evidence instead suggests multiple styles of reading were practiced simultaneously. The “waves of ongoing reform” appeared to be cresting in the early thirteenth century, marked by a new vigor. This could be described as a type of corporate restructuring. To legitimize the numerous operational modifications of the ecclesiastical enterprise from the papal seat to parish pew, self-ascribed reformers employed the language of reform and renewal to lend legitimacy to these changes. Pastoral care and preaching in particular was a centerpiece of this conversation. Therefore, Jacques de Vitry corpus reflected and contributed to the ongoing restructuring program.⁷

Jacques trained under the guidance of Peter the Chanter at the University of Paris, and embraced Peter’s vision of a new pragmatic focus on pastoral care, defined as the various ministries espoused by the canons of the Fourth Lateran council and directed towards the spiritual health of the Church and its members, including preaching, administration of the sacraments, and the care of the sick and poor. This approach focused on reforming the clergy so that they might serve as virtuous shepherds to lead their flocks.⁸ Jacques promulgated the tenets of the IV Lateran canons throughout his career, blaming lax and depraved leadership of the church for the rise of heretical movements. In his estimation, the feigned appearance of righteousness set in contrast with the vices of the clergy, seduced the laity into heretical beliefs.⁹ New expectations were also placed on the laity. Papal policy now mandated regular participation in confession and mass. These initiatives emphasized the need for skilled preachers who could facilitate the new requirements. Clergy needed now not only to set a pious example for the laity,

⁷ John W. Baldwin, *Masters, Princes, and Merchants: The Social Views of Peter the Chanter and His Circle* (Princeton: Princeton University Press), 18; Jessalynn Bird, “The Construction of Orthodoxy and the (De)construction of Heretical Attacks on the Eucharist in Pastoralia from Peter the Chanter’s Circle in Paris,” 49.

⁸ Bird, “Religious Role in a Post-Lateran World,” 210.

⁹ *Ibid.*, 48.

a consistent feature of reform rhetoric, but also to implement practical changes like speaking in the vernacular rather than preaching in Latin.¹⁰ In other words, while the reform agenda emphasized better ways to serve and guide the laity so that they may better serve the Church, ultimately stricter lines between the laity and clergy were drawn.¹¹ Outer appearances needed to reaffirm these distinctions. The council mandated simple linen garments for the clergy when outside of the church. As Maureen C. Miller explains, behind these decrees were debates over clerical status that sought to distinguish the clergy from the laity, elevating the former over the latter by means of a humble appearance.¹² At the same time that the laity was increasingly excluded from the liturgy, devotional practices like processions to reliquary shrines, became “more prolific and expansive.”¹³ As reform policies worked to clarify and bolster the institutional authority of the Church, more informal and affective forms of authority, like the mystical visions of holy women and relics, gained in prominence.¹⁴

In general, late twelfth- and early thirteenth-century papal policies sought to demarcate lay from religious, orthodox from heretic, Jew from Christian, and to classify and rank the religious groups themselves.¹⁵ For example, it was only in the twelfth century that distinctions occurred within the religious community, as monastic and secular groupings crystallized.¹⁶ These programs built upon previous efforts. The eleventh-century Gregorian reform, for example, sought, through the prohibition of simony and clerical marriage, to extricate the Church from the

¹⁰ Norman P. Tanner, S.J.; ed. *Decrees of the Ecumenical Councils, vol. 1, Nicaea I to Lateran V* (Washington, D.C.: Georgetown University Press, 1990), Canon 71, p. 267-71.

¹¹ Caroline Walker Bynum, *Jesus as Mother: Studies in the Spirituality of the High Middle Ages* (Berkeley, CA: University of California Press, 1982), 9.

¹² Maureen C. Miller, *Clothing the Clergy: Virtue and Power in Medieval Europe c. 800-1000* (Ithaca : Cornell University Press, 2014), 37-38.

¹³ Tekippe, “Pilgrimage and Procession,” 707.

¹⁴ Coakley, *Women, and Men, and Spiritual Power*, 3.

¹⁵ R. I. Moore, *The Formation of a Persecuting Society: Power and Deviance in Western Europe, 950-1250* (New York: Blackwell, 1987), 6-9.

¹⁶ Snijder, *Monastic Communication*, 26.

control of secular rulers. This ever-present rhetoric of reform throughout the twelfth century implies a less than satisfactory implementation of it, or perhaps the continual raising of expectations. From this milieu of reform that heterodox groups such as the Waldensians emerged.¹⁷ However, the Church's clarion call for reform also belies a system coping with social and economic changes that were outside of its grasp. The reforms of the Fourth Lateran Council arose within a context of and in response to ongoing challenges of heresy, new fervent devotion among the laity, ever-persistent crusading endeavors, and a more urban society dependent on a market economy.¹⁸ Especially after the loss of Jerusalem in 1187 there was more attention focused on crusading endeavors. The explicit inclusions of prayers on behalf of crusading worked to increase enthusiasm among the non-knightly class.¹⁹ Sermons, both in content and layout, reflect these social and economic changes as their authors and later scribes tried to make sense of and direct the chaotic world around them, but they also served as a catalyst for these changes.

Editions of Jacques de Vitry's Works

The process of editing and transcribing Jacques de Vitry's enormous literary output is ongoing. Editions are now available of his histories, letters, and his *vita* of Mary of Oignies. Despite his reputation as a preacher, however, his sermons remain largely unedited. Guided by

¹⁷ Malcolm Lambert, *Medieval Heresy Popular Movements from the Gregorian Reform to the Reformation*. 3rd ed. (Malden, MA: Blackwell Publishing, 2002), 36-7. R.I. Moore suggests that heretical groups were not only reacting in frustration to the Gregorian Reform for not keeping the vigor of its original goals, but that some groups were also upset at the Reform's attempts to intervene in every aspect of life, *Formation of a Persecuting Society*, 19.

¹⁸ For examinations on the anxiety that the market economy created see: Lutz Kaelber, *Schools of Asceticism: Ideology and Organization in Medieval Religious Communities* (University Park: Pennsylvania State UP, 1998); Lester K. Little, *Religious Poverty and the Profit Economy in Medieval Europe* (Ithaca: Cornell UP, 1978). Details in Jacques' *vita* of Marie and his sermons have been identified as implicitly denouncing the Cathars, Kienzle, "Preaching the Cross," 25; Coakley, *Women, Men, and Spiritual Power*, 68.

¹⁹ Amnon Linder, *Raising Arms: Liturgy in the Struggle to Liberate Jerusalem in the Late Middle Ages* (Turnhout, Belgium: Brepols, 2003), 3; Gary Dickson, "The Genesis of the Children's Crusade (1212)," in *Religious Enthusiasm in the Medieval West: Revivals, Crusades, Saints* (Aldershot: Ashgate Variorum, 2000), 1-52.

the previously mentioned two central focuses, gender or crusade, scholars have mostly published selections of Jacques' sermons regarding women or crusaders. This dissertation includes substantial archival research in order to offer a more comprehensive and systematic approach to Jacques' body of sermons and also to address readership and use.

Jacques' *Letters* are available in a critical edition prepared by R.B.C. Huygens, published in 1960. This edition is based on five different manuscripts dating from the thirteenth to fourteenth centuries. Huygens notes that in several of these manuscripts the *Letters* travelled with Jacques' *Historia Orientalis* and/or his *Historia Occidentalis* as well as other crusade oriented texts. Huygens also served as the editor for the 2012 edition of *Vita Marie de Oegnies* which is based on 30 manuscripts, 16 of which date to Jacques' own lifetime. A translation of the *vita* was published in 2006, edited by Anneke Mulder-Bakker.²⁰ The critical edition of the *Historia Occidentalis* with a detailed English introduction, by John Frederick Hinnebusch was published in 1972. This edition relies on 24 manuscripts dating from the thirteenth to the seventeenth centuries.²¹ Jacques' more popular *Historia Orientalis* exists in 124 manuscripts dating from the second half of the thirteenth century to the sixteenth century, but the 2008 edition with a facing-page French translation by Jean Donnadiou relies on one sixteenth-century copy of a lost manuscript reportedly written during Jacques' lifetime.

Jacques de Vitry wrote over 400 sermons which he divided into four categories, covering basically every occasion or season imaginable.²² The *Sermones dominicales (de tempore)*, the lengthiest of the collections, includes 193 sermons for the liturgical year, organized

²⁰ Anneke B. Mulder-Bakker, ed. *Mary of Oignies: Mother of Salvation* (Turnhout: Brepols, 2006).

²¹ Hinnebusch donated a collection 142 microfilmed manuscripts to the Hill Museum and Manuscript Library.

²² For a list of Jacques de Vitry's sermons by collection and incipit see: J.B. Schneyer, *Repertorium der lateinischen Sermones des Mittelalters, für die Zeit von 1150-1350, III: Autoren: I-J*, Münster, 1971 (*Beiträge zur Geschichte der Philosophie und Theologie des Mittelalters. Text und Untersuchungen*, 43/3), p. 179-221.

chronologically. The *sermones sanctis* (105) were composed to accompany the various feast days and the saints'-days, while the 75 sermons of the *sermones vulgares (ad status)* were arranged by the intended audience including lay and religious, men and women. Lastly the 26 sermons of the *sermones feriales (communes, quotidiani)* present exegetical treatment of Genesis. Apart from the *sermones dominicales* published in a defective edition in 1575, there exist only selective publications of this rich body of material.²³ Thomas Crane published an edition of Jacques' *exempla* or short sermon stories, which were often placed at the end of the sermons, but also traveled separately in numerous manuscripts.²⁴ Monica Sandor argues that these *exempla* ought to be addressed within the context of the sermons.²⁵ This is a salient approach for understanding the context of their original composition, but given that the *exempla* traveled independently and authors borrowed heavily from them, a strict adherence to this approach overlooks how readers actually used these stories. Jessalyn Bird published a critical transcription of Jacques' "Sermon to Pilgrims," and Christopher Maier transcribed and translated two of Jacques' *ad status* sermons addressed to crusaders in *Crusade Propaganda and Ideology*.²⁶ In addition, Carolyn Muessig published a Latin edition and English translation of a selection of Jacques' sermons pertaining to women.²⁷ Most recently, Jean Longère published a critical edition of thirty of the *ad status* sermons relying on ten manuscripts dated from the thirteenth to sixteenth centuries. This publication includes sermons addressed to various religious orders and ranks, but not the ones directed to the laity. We have a piecemeal approach, but to

²³ *Sermones in epistolas et evangelia dominicalia totius anni*, ed. Damianus a Ligno (Antwerp, 1575; repr. Venice, 1578).

²⁴ Jacques de Vitry, and Thomas Frederick Crane, *The Exempla or Illustrative Stories from the Sermones vulgares of Jacques de Vitry* (London: Publication for the Folk-lore Society, 1890).

²⁵ Monica Sandor, "The Popular Preaching of Jacques de Vitry," (Ph.D. Diss., University of Toronto, Centre for Medieval Studies 1993), vi.

²⁶ Jessalyn Bird, "James of Vitry's Sermons to Pilgrims," *Essays in Medieval Studies* 25 (2008): 81-113.

²⁷ See footnote 11.

understand the sermons, they need to be placed in their broad context. Jacques' career crossed geographical boundaries from France to Acre, but just as these areas were not homogeneous, neither was the reception of his corpus. The degree to which extant manuscripts of Jacques' works reflect his close involvement with ecclesiastical affairs in the Low Countries remains an open question worthy of investigation.

This large corpus of sermons is thought to have been written at the end of Jacques' life and at the request of brothers in Oignies. As such, Jacques was able to draw upon his numerous experiences while writing it, from supporting the *mulieres religiosi* (beguines) in the Southern Low Countries and preaching against heretics in southern France, to his experiences as Bishop of Acre and as a participant in the Fifth Crusade.²⁸ Therefore, this collection of sermons, and Jacques' pastoral writings in general, reflect his understanding of the needs of an increasingly diverse society, and can be viewed as the culmination of a life in service to them. The surviving manuscripts of Jacques' sermons, in turn, show how communities of scribes, compilers, and readers interacted with these texts. While many insightful studies have made selections of these sermons available in Latin editions, none of them has investigated the manuscripts as historical artifacts or explored how later scribes amended the collections.²⁹

Bridging the Historiographical Divide

There is a burgeoning renaissance in studies of the later crusades, bringing well-deserved attention to Jacques' works, but scholars continue to compartmentalize his life, largely focusing

²⁸ Jacobus, and Jean Longère, *Sermones Vulgares vel Ad Status. I, 1* (Turnhout: Brepols, 2013), xxiv; Donnadiu, *Jacques de Vitry*, 247.

²⁹ For recent work using this approach which examines the longview of the functionality of manuscripts and their communicative function see the excellent study by Tjamke Snijders, *Manuscript Communication: Visual and Textual Mechanics of Communication in Hagiographical Texts from the Southern Low Countries 900-1200* (Turnhout, Brepols, 2015).

on either his role in the crusades or his involvement with the beguine movement.³⁰ By examining Jacques' career and works more holistically, this dissertation addresses several key questions in both medieval gender and crusade history.

New research initiatives into the topic of crusading masculinities, spearheaded by Matthew Mesley, Katherine J. Lewis and Natasha Hodgson, have begun to explore notions of medieval manhood in the sources for crusading.³¹ While Jennifer Thibodeaux and Ruth Mazo Karras' investigations point to the possible continuities and transformations in these ideas of masculinity that occurred for medieval clerics.³² There remains, however, disagreement on how to define masculinities in the Middle Ages, and scholars continue to grapple with how these definitions ought to be applied differently to clerics and laymen.³³ The reforms of the eleventh and twelfth century mandated chastity for all clerics, and the effect of these changes upon concepts of gender remain the subject of debate. The work of Jacqueline Murray and Dyan Elliot show that the imposition of chastity on men led in some cases to vitriolic attacks against women.³⁴ Ruth Mazo Karras revealed how clerical chastity transformed men's understanding of

³⁰ A growing interest in this crusade can be seen in: Jessalynn Lea Bird, Edward Peters, and James M. Powell, *Crusade and Christendom: Annotated Documents in Translation from Innocent III to the fall of Acre, 1187-1291* (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2014) and E. J. Mylod, Guy Jacob Perry, Thomas W. Smith, and Jan Vandeburie, eds., *The Fifth Crusade in Context: The Crusading Movement in the Early Thirteenth Century* (New York, NY: Routledge, 2017).

³¹ Their work based off a recent conference in Zurich will be published by Routledge, July 2018.

³² Jennifer D. Thibodeaux, *The Manly Priest: Clerical Celibacy, Masculinity, and Reform in England and Normandy, 1066-1300* (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2015); Ruth Mazo Karras, *From Boys to Men: Formations of Masculinity in Late Medieval Europe* (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2003); see also Andrew Holt, "Between Warrior and Priest: The Creation of a New Masculine Identity during the Crusades," in *Negotiating Clerical Identities: Priests, Monks and Masculinity in the Middle Ages*, ed. Jennifer D. Thibodeaux (Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan, 2010), 185-203.

³³ Christopher Fletcher, "The Whig Interpretation of Masculinity? Honour and Sexuality in Late Medieval Manhood," *What Is Masculinity?: Historical Dynamics from Antiquity to the Contemporary World*, eds. John Arnold and Sean Brady (Hampshire: Palgrave Macmillan, 2011), 61.

³⁴ Jacqueline Murray, "The law of sin that is in my members: The Problem of Male Embodiment," in *Gender and Holiness: Men, Women, and Saints in Late Medieval Europe*, Samantha J.E. Riches and Sarah Salih, eds. (New York: Routledge, 2002), 9-22; Dyan Elliot, *Fallen Bodies: Pollution, Sexuality, and Demonology in the Middle Ages*, (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 1999), 8.

their own masculinity, as these men sought to cast their new battles against lust as an equivalent or even superior masculine virtue.³⁵ She argues that it was not the absence of lust through castration, old age, or other means, but rather the ongoing struggle against lust that was integral to the conception of clerical masculinity.³⁶ Chapter One's explores Jacques' treatment of gender, including clerical masculinity, in the context of his education under the tutelage of Peter the Chanter at the University of Paris (c. 1185) to his ordination (c.1208). It reveals how he formulated an elaborate ideological system for understanding men and women, fashioned to serve his crusade and reform agendas. Rather than a consistent attack on the evils of women, Jacques employed an array of women in his pastoral literature to correct audiences and to bolster the manliness of lay and religious men. The work of feminist scholars like Judith Butler has taught us to see gender as performed, and historians of medieval Europe have applied this notion to our understanding of medieval masculinities.³⁷ Jacques' works adds to this conversation, revealing that the performance of proper masculinity depended on and was demarcated by the performance of proper femininity.³⁸

Jacques de Vitry remains essential to explorations into the real and imagined relationship between clerics and the lay holy women during the rise in lay piety in the twelfth and thirteenth-centuries. As Caroline Walker Bynum has argued, the high medieval period was marked by a

³⁵ On the *vir/virtus* connection see: Kirsten A. Fenton, "Ideas and Ideals of Secular Masculinity in William of Malmesbury," *Women's History Review*, 16:5 (2007) 758.

³⁶ Ruth Mazo Karras, "Thomas Aquinas's Chastity Belt: Clerical Masculinity in Medieval Europe," *Gender & Christianity in Medieval Europe: New Perspectives*, eds. Lisa M. Bitel and Felice Lifshitz (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2008), 54.

³⁷ Judith Butler, *Gender Trouble: Feminism and the Subversion of Identity* (New York: Routledge, 1999); JoAnn McNamara, "The *Herrenfrage*: The Restructuring of the Gender System, 1050-1150," in *Medieval Masculinities*, edited by Clare A. Lees (Minneapolis, University of Minnesota Press, 1994), 3-29; Ruth Mazo Karras, *From Boys to Men: Formations of Masculinity in Late Medieval Europe* (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2003).

³⁸ This arguments builds on Tanya Stabler Miller's investigation into the prominent place of women in the masculinity of pastoral theologians in medieval Paris, "Mirror of Scholarly (Masculine) Soul: Scholastics, Beguines, and Gendered Spirituality in Medieval Paris," in *Negotiating Clerical Identities: Priests, Monks and Masculinity in the Middle Ages*, ed. Jennifer D. Thibodeaux (Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan, 2010), 238-64.

new religious significance for the body, coinciding with a wave of particularly somatic female spirituality.³⁹ The flourishing of trade and industry in the Southern Low Countries created a particular urban environment from which new forms of lay piety emerged.⁴⁰ John W. Coakley suggests, therefore, that this relationship lent clerics charismatic authority.⁴¹ Scholars have closely examined Jacques' relationship with Marie of Oignies, but Chapter Two highlights Jacques' connection to a different holy woman, Lutgard of Aywières.⁴² In Jacques' letters, local histories, and in his fellow hagiographer, Thomas of Cantimpré's record of Lutgard's life, we find reports that when Jacques and Thomas struggled to live up to standards of clerical chastity, they turned to Lutgard as their special intercessor. By bringing together epistolary evidence and hagiographical accounts, this chapter reexamines the relationship of clerics and holy women. Additionally, by placing Jacques' experience within the context of the Siege of Liège (1213), this chapter shows how violence, and violence against women in particular, shaped his development of this gendered pastoral care.

Jacques' role ministering to beguines, however, was not detached from his career as a crusade preacher. As Christina Roukis-Stern suggests, there is connection between "his esteem for female spirituality and crusade," but she does not elaborate on this claim.⁴³ Likewise, Beverly

³⁹ Caroline Walker Bynum, "Female Body," in *Fragmentation and Redemption: Essays on Gender and the Human Body in Medieval Religion* (New York: Zone Books, 1991), 181-238.

⁴⁰ Anneke B. Mulder-Baker, "Holy Women and Their Biographers in the Thirteenth-Century," in *Living Saints of the Thirteenth Century: The Lives of Yvette, anchoress of Huy; Juliana of Cornillon, Author of the Corpus Christi Feast; and Margaret the Lame, anchoress of Magdeburg*, ed. Anneke B. Mulder-Baker (Turnhout, Brepols, 2012), 9-10.

⁴¹ John W. Coakley, *Women, Men, and Spiritual Power: Female Saints and Their Male Collaborators* (New York: Columbia University Press, 2006), 3.

⁴² Carolyn Muessig, *The Faces of Women in the Sermons of Jacques de Vitry* (Toronto: Peregrina Publication, 1999); Monica Sandor, *The Popular Preaching of Jacques de Vitry* (thesis), Toronto: University of Toronto, Centre for Medieval Studies, 1993.

⁴³ Christina Roukis-Stern, "A Tale of Two Dioceses: Prologues as Letters in the Vitae authored by Jacques de Vitry and Thomas de Cantimpré," *Negotiating Community and Difference in Medieval Europe: Gender, Power, Patronage, and the Authority of Religion in Latin Christendom*, edited by Katherine Allen Smith and Scott Wells (Brill, 2009), 39.

Mayne Kienzle, arguing for the centrality of the cross in crusade sermons, mentions that in the *vita*, “the cross links Marie’s personal devotion with the crusade, as her visions confirm the righteousness of battle against heresy, as well as the theology of pilgrimage and martyrdom that underpinned the crusades.”⁴⁴ Chapter Three turns to this aspect of Jacques’ career, his role in recruitment for the Albigensian Crusade. His activity received detailed mention from the chronicles of William of Puylaurens and Peter of les Vaux-de-Cernay’s. Their reports show the strong connections between the discourse of holy women and holy war. While scholars have investigated Jacques’ involvement in the Fifth Crusade, this contribution overlapped with his preaching for the Albigensian Crusade.⁴⁵ The work of Brenda Bolton, Jessalyn Bird and Jan Vandeburie have offered important contributions to understanding Jacques’ works within the wider setting of crusade and the Fourth Lateran reforms.⁴⁶ This chapter adds to their work by exploring Jacques’ involvement on two crusading fronts, as well as investigating what his works can tell us about the diverse participation of women.

Despite the efforts of scholars like Helen Nicholson and Natasha Hodgson, the scholarship on crusading and medieval warfare predominantly remains associated with male

⁴⁴ Beverly Mayne Kienzle, “Preaching the Cross: Liturgy and Crusade Propaganda,” *Preaching and Political Society: From Late Antiquity to the End of the Middle Ages*, ed. Franco Morenzoni (Turnhout: Brepols, 2013), 28.

⁴⁵ Historians of crusade and Islam have emphasized Jacques’ promotion of the Fifth Crusade and his treatment of Islam in the *Historia Orientalis*, see: John Tolan, *Saracens: Islam in the Medieval European Imagination* (New York: Columbia University Press, 2002); Penny Cole, *The Preaching of the Crusades to the Holy Land, 1095-1270* (Cambridge, Mass: Medieval Academy of America, 1991); Brett Whalen, *Dominion of God Christendom and Apocalypse in the Middle Ages* (Cambridge, Mass: Harvard University Press, 2009); Christoph Maier, *Crusade Propaganda and Ideology: Model Sermons for the Preaching of the Cross* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2000); Megan Cassidy Welch, “‘O Damietta’: War, Memory and Crusade in Thirteenth-Century Egypt,” *Journal of Medieval History* 40:3 (2014): 346-60.

⁴⁶ Jessalynn Lea Bird, “The Religious Role in a Post-Lateran World: Jacques de Vitry’s *Sermones ad Status* and *Historia Occidentalis*,” in *Medieval Monastic Preaching*, ed. Carolyn Muessig (Leiden: Brill, 1998): 209-230; Jessalyn Bird, “The *Historia Orientalis* of Jacques de Vitry: Visual and Written Commentaries as Evidence of a Text’s Audience, Reception, and Utilization,” *Essays in Medieval Studies* 20 (2003): 56-74; Brenda Bolton, “Faithful to Whom: Jacques de Vitry and the French Bishops,” *Revue Mabillon* 70:9 (1998): 53-72; Jan Vandeburie, “‘Sancte fidei omnino deiciat’: Ugolino dei Conti di Segni’s Doubts and Jacques de Vitry’s Intervention,” *Studies in Church History* 52 (June 2016): 87-10.

activities.⁴⁷ As Christoph Maier observed in 2004, there remains a lack of scholarship examining women's wide-ranging activities in the crusades, both on the battlefield and especially on the home front, and over a decade later this remark remains true.⁴⁸ The thirteenth-century crusading activities in which Jacques engaged, however, offer a unique vantage point for readdressing women's involvement in the crusades. From his rise to the papacy in 1198 to his death in 1216, Innocent III's pontificate would be punctuated by a number of failed attempts to regain the Holy Land. He instituted a system of taxes to fund crusading endeavors and set forth dynamic preaching campaigns that stressed the vital connection between moral probity, the capture of Jerusalem, and salvation. Constance M. Rousseau and James Powell have noted that these papal innovations, which emphasized liturgical, financial, and penitential support for crusade, enabled both sexes to participate in crusade in newfound ways.⁴⁹ Innocent III relied heavily on the church hierarchy and designated preachers like Jacques de Vitry to get this program to the people. Chapter Four, therefore, examines Jacques' involvement in the Fifth Crusade, looking at the influence these new papal initiatives had on crusading propaganda, especially the involvement of women. This chapter, therefore, expands our understanding of crusade participation and it redefines the characterization of crusade propaganda by highlighting the investment that both men and women had in policing gender performances, including being signed with the cross.

⁴⁷ The most recent overview is found in Helen Nicholson, "Women's Involvement in the Crusades," in *The Crusader World*, ed. Adrian Boas (New York: Routledge, 2016), pp.54-67.

⁴⁸ Christoph Maier, "The Roles of Women in the Crusade Movement: A Survey," *Journal of Medieval History* 30 (2004): 64.

⁴⁹ Constance M. Rousseau, "Home Front and Battlefield: The Gendering of Papal Crusading Policy (1095-1221)," *Gendering the Crusades*, eds. S. B. Edgington and Sarah Lambert (Cardiff: University of Wales Press, 2001): 36-37; James M. Powell, "The Role of Women in the Fifth Crusade," in *The Horns of Hattin*, ed. B. Z. Kedar (Jerusalem, 1992), 295; Barbara Newman, "Introduction," in *The Collected Saints' Lives: Christina the Astonishing, Lutgard of Aywières, Margaret of Ypres and Abbot John of Cantimpré*, eds. Barbara Newman, and Margot H. King (Turnhout: Brepols, 2008), 17. Rita Tekippe also points out that just as the liturgy increasingly began to exclude the laity, procession became more prolific and expansive, "Pilgrimage and Procession: Correlations of Meaning, Practice, and Effects," in *Art and Architecture of Late Medieval Pilgrimage in Northern Europe and the British Isles*, eds. Sara Blick and Rita Tekippe (Boston: Brill, 2005), 1:707.

The success of Jacques' calls to crusade grew out of his effective appeal to apocalyptic ideas.⁵⁰ Scholars of crusade thought and apocalypticism have begun to call attention to these connections. Penny Cole and Brett Whalen, for example, provide valuable analysis of a selection of Jacques' sermons and their apocalyptic overtones, revealing a new universalizing mission not seen in previous crusade writings.⁵¹ John Tolan views Jacques as representative of the apocalyptic Christian hopes fueled by the Mongol conquests in the thirteenth-century.⁵² Chapter Five adds to these insightful discussions through a careful examination of how Jacques used apocalyptic passages across his letters, histories, and sermons to communicate directives on crusade and reform. By investigating Jacques' focus on apocalypticism, this chapter elaborates on Jacques' consistent use of gendered rhetoric that imagined men and women laboring in specialized, and yet always collaborative roles, even at the end of the world.

This dissertation bridges scholarly conversations between the history of crusading and the study of medieval gender. Jacques' message, just as his life, depended on an affirmation of collaboration between the sexes, whether between clerics and holy women or husbands and wives. This demonstration demonstrates how is elaborate ideological system for understanding men and women, served his reform and crusading agendas. Therefore, this dissertation offers new insights on Jacques' life and thought, including our knowledge of clerical masculinity, the relationship of clerics and holy women, and our understanding of crusade participation. By applying current questions in gender studies to Jacques' work, and by focusing on his fascinating

⁵⁰ Tolan, *Saracens*, 201; Cole, *Preaching of the Crusades*, 124; Whalen, *Dominion of God*, 150.

⁵¹ Cole, *Preaching of the Crusades*, 124; Whalen, *Dominion of God*, 150.

⁵² Tolan, *Saracens*, 201.

pastoral materials to reevaluate accepted theories on medieval crusading and reform, this work makes important interventions in both scholarly fields—gender studies and crusade history.

Chapter One: From Anxiety to Action and Back Again: Constructions of Gender in Thirteenth-Century Pastoral Works

The Case of the Genoese Women

Shortly after the election of Honorius III, on July 31, 1216, Jacques de Vitry was consecrated in Perugia as the Bishop of Acre, a strategic port city, located in modern day Israel.⁵³ Jacques would spend the month of September waylaid in Genoa during his travels to his see. Not prone to idleness, Jacques spent this time promoting crusade through his preaching. Through what we can imagine were theatrically charged and rhetorically astute performances, he successfully wooed his audiences, especially, surprisingly, noblewomen.⁵⁴ In a letter dated to November 4, 1216, he explained that during his stay the citizens of Genoa had left to fight with a neighboring city, confiscating all the horses, including Jacques'.⁵⁵ This newly elected bishop seized this inconvenient delay as an opportunity to preach to the women and the few men who had remained, resulting in many of the wealthy noble women receiving the sign of the cross. This eager response was not only a boon for the crusading cause, it was, in Jacques' view, just recompense for being delayed. Accordingly, he boasted: "The men took my horses, and I signed their wives with the cross."⁵⁶ Jacques' possessions had been confiscated for use in local disputes;

⁵³ Hinnebusch, *H. Occ.*, 6.

⁵⁴ See Brenda M. Bolton, "Message, Celebration, Offering: The Place of Twelfth- and Early Thirteenth-Century Liturgical Drama as 'Missionary Theatre,' in *Studies in Church History* 35 (1999), 89-103.

⁵⁵ Jacques de Vitry, *Lettres*, I.145-52: 'Postquam vero applicui Ianue, cives eiusdem civitatis, licet me benignè recepissent, equos tamen meos, vellem nollem, in obsidionem cuiusdam castris secum duxerunt: hec est enim civitatis consuetudo, quod quando in exercitum vadunt ubicumque equos reperiunt, cuiuscumque sint, secum ducunt. Mulieres autem in civitate remanserunt, ego vero interim feci quod potui, verbum enim dei multis mulieribus et paucis hominibus frequenter predicavi.'

⁵⁶ *Ibid.*, 152-4: 'Multitudo autem mulierum divitum et nobilium signum crucis recepit : cives mihi equos abstulerunt, et ego uxores eorum cruce signavi.'

therefore, he swayed their women and sons towards a more righteous warfare.⁵⁷ He goes on to describe how from the early dawn until late into the night these women eagerly listened to his words and made their confessions to him.⁵⁸ Without reservation, Jacques informs his readers that he was adept with the ladies, gaining their trust and enticing them toward his righteous cause in their husbands' absence.⁵⁹ When the men came back, returning Jacques' horses, and "discovering their wives and sons had received the sign of the cross, they heard the words of the preacher and accepted the cross with great fervor."⁶⁰ These men, whom Jacques described as "powerful, rich, strong in arms, and bellicose," with the necessary ships and knowledge of the regions, were of practical use in financing and fighting battles, but it was the rich noblewomen who were key at this stage of the conquest.⁶¹

Jacques' nuanced understanding of societal norms for gendered behavior, made explicit in this reported interaction with the men and women of Genoa, was formed long before his appointment to Acre.⁶² What on the surface appears as womanizing braggadocio—Jacques

⁵⁷ This episode perhaps reflects the continuance of competing masculinities between laymen and religious men in the post-Gregorian reform era, see Maureen C. Miller, "Masculinity, Reform, and Clerical Culture: Narratives of Episcopal Holiness in the Gregorian Era," *Church History* 71:1 (2003), 28.

⁵⁸ Jacques de Vitry, *Lettres*, I.154-57: 'Adeo ferventes et devote errant, quod vix a summo mane usque ad noctem permittebant me quiscere, vel ut aliquod verbum edificationis a me audirent, vel ut confessiones suas facerent.'

⁵⁹ This appears to echo motifs of the chivalric romances that frequently featured a triad of wife, husband, and knight/lover. Jacques would have likely been familiar with the popular tales of the troubadours including Chrétien de Troyes's tales of Yvain and Gawain, and Lancelot.

⁶⁰ Jacques de Vitry, *Lettres*, I.157-60: 'Postquam autem cives ab exercitu reversi sunt equos meos michi reddiderunt et invenientes mulieres cum filiis signum crucis accepisse postquam verbum praedicationis audierunt signum crucis cum magno fervore et desiderio receperunt.'

⁶¹ *Ibid.*, 165-70: 'Sunt autem homines illi potentes et divites et strenui in armis et bellicosi, habentes copiam navium et galearum optimarum, nautas habentes peritos qui viam in mari noverunt et in terram Sarracenorum pro mercimoniis frequenter perrexerunt, nec credo quod sit aliqua civitas, que tantum possit iuvare ad succursum terre sancte.' This letter is briefly treated also by James Powell, "Role of Women in the Fifth Crusade," 294-301. See also Nicholson, "Women's Involvement in the Crusades," 54-67

⁶² Often overlooked, masculinity is a key component of gender. Exceptions include: Murray, "Problem of Male Embodiment," 9-22; Megan Cassidy Welch, "Order, Emotion, and Gender in the Crusade Letters of Jacques de Vitry," in *Gender and Emotions in Medieval and Early Modern Europe: Destroying Order, Structuring Disorder*, ed. Susan Broomhall, (New York: Routledge, 2016), 35-49; Sharon Farmer, *Surviving Poverty in Medieval Paris: Gender, Ideology, and the Daily Lives of the Poor* (Ithaca: Cornell University Press, 2002).

flexing his oratorical muscles—cannot be fully understood without first stepping back to contextualize his perceptions of gender, particularly his own. Jacques de Vitry’s role as the confessor to mystic Marie D’Oignies and author of her *vita* remains an important avenue for study of the dynamic relationships of clerics to holy women, and the study of gender constructions in the Middle Age.⁶³ He championed Marie’s lay religious life, and he claimed that she offered him counsel, encouragement, and inspiration. An investigation of gender dependent on Marie’s *vita* in isolation, however, risks seeing only an image of an ideal holy woman, and consequently projecting those expectations and behaviors to all women. Jacques himself advised that people should revere but not imitate Marie for her healings, prophecies, and extreme and eventually fatal asceticism.⁶⁴ Perhaps because of this this singular focus on Marie, studies have overlooked the value of Jacques’ writing for this study of masculinity.⁶⁵ Jacques’ work, therefore, remains an under-utilized source for investigating the long-lasting effects of clerical reforms on gender as a whole.

The imposition of chastity on all clerics during the eleventh and twelfth-century reforms challenged perceptions of masculinity, as many scholars have noted.⁶⁶ Jacqueline Murray and

⁶³ Coakley, drawing on the work of André Vauchez, has inspected this relationship through the theory of “informal and institutional power.” He concludes that Jacques, as representative of the institutional power, appropriated “the effects of [Marie’s] spiritual gifts that he does not possess,” *Women, Men, and Spiritual Power*, 86; See also Carolyn Muessig, *Faces of Women*; Monica Sandor, *The Popular Preaching of Jacques de Vitry* (thesis) (Toronto: University of Toronto, Centre for Medieval Studies, 1993).

⁶⁴ This ideology can also be seen in the works of the preacher Eustace of Arras (1225-91) who cited the examples of Mary Magdalene and Saint Katherine of Alexandria as exceptional women, *non imitanda sed veneranda*, Clarie M. Waters, *Angels and Earthly Creatures: Preaching, Performance, and Gender in the Later Middle Ages* (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2004), 22. Jocelyn Wogan Brown argues that in the work of clerics like Jacques and Thomas holy women became rhetorical abstractions, telling us very little about actual women, “Chaste Bodies: Frames and Experiences,” *Framing Medieval Bodies*, eds. Kay, Sarah, and Miri Rubin (Manchester: Manchester University Press, 1994), 24. Regarding *Ancrene Wisse*, Wogan-Browne notes that despite the literary repertoire of chaste women, whose mantra seems to declare: “the best virgin, is always a dead virgin,” one cannot ignore the love and respect the author shows towards his audience, 24.

⁶⁵ As Miller states clerical masculinity must be explored in a wide range of genres to examine the impact of Gregorian Reforms, “Narratives of Episcopal Holiness,” 50.

⁶⁶ Miller, “Narratives of Episcopal Holiness,” 26-27; Kirsten A. Fenton, *Gender, Nation and Conquest in the Works of William of Malmesbury* (Woodbridge, UK: Boydell Press, 2008), 4; Tracy Adams, “Make Me Chaste and

Dyan Elliot have argued that this reform led to the clerics' projection of their own personal anxiety onto women, whom they portrayed in vitriolic attacks as dangerous and polluted.⁶⁷ From a slightly different angle, Ruth Mazo Karras has suggested that chastity became elevated to a masculine virtue, and thus the clerics' struggle against lust—often cast in martial terms—displayed their continued virility, reinforcing their strength, self-control, and perseverance.⁶⁸ Jacques' description and proscriptions of gendered behavior for men and women reveals a continuation of some of these anxieties, but in his case, they do not produce a heightened misogyny.⁶⁹ Rather, as this chapter will show, Jacques employs all sorts of women in his pastoral literature to correct, assist, and prove the manliness of lay and religious men alike—including himself.

Modern approaches to medieval gender, especially of women, can lead to anachronistic and evaluative interpretations. The either/or narrative of female oppression or empowerment imposes modern assumptions on medieval experience, leading to the estimation that behavior deemed as exclusively “modern” were only outliers.⁷⁰ Although a patriarchal system reinforced

Continent, But Not Yet: A Model for Clerical Masculinity?” in *Masculinities and Femininities in the Middle Ages and Renaissance*, ed. Frederick Kiefer (Turnhout: Brepols Publishers, 2010), 3-4.

⁶⁷ Jacqueline Murray argues that the dissonance between the ideology of masculinity and lived experience of men's disobeying bodies (evidenced by nocturnal emissions and lustful feelings), resulted in episodes of anxiety for medieval religious men. Murray, “Problem of Male Embodiment,” 12; “Masculinizing Religious Life,” *Sexual Prowess, the Battle for Chastity and Monastic Identity*, eds. P. H. Cullum and Katherine J. Lewis (Cardiff: University of Wales Press, 2005), 24; Dyan Elliot, *Fallen Bodies*, 8.

⁶⁸ She stresses that it was not the absence of lust through castration, old age, or other means, but rather the ongoing struggle against lust that was integral to the conception of clerical masculinity: Ruth Mazo Karras, “Thomas Aquinas's Chastity Belt,” 54.

⁶⁹ For example, Cynthia Ho's investigation of the dead in Jacques' *exempla* concluded that the presentation of women's bodies revealed a certain anxiety over feminine words as a subversive power, since female sins featured were more often associated to speech, “Corpus Delicti : The Edifying Dead in the Exempla of Jacques de Vitry,” in *Medieval Sermons and Society: Cloister, City, University*, ed. Hamesse, Jacqueline (Belgium: Brepols, 1998), 216.

⁷⁰ In one such example addressing women's participation in confession, Dyan Elliot notes: “[medieval] men, socially enabled, could search the world. Women, socially hobbled, could search their souls,” “Women and Confession: From Empowerment to Pathology” in *Gendering the Master Narrative: Women and Power in the Middle Ages*, eds. Mary Carpenter Erler and Maryanne Kowaleski (Ithaca: Cornell University Press, 2003), 36. Ruth Mazo Karras suggests the “woman as agent must be balanced with their oppression,” *Common Women: Prostitution and Sexuality in Medieval England* (New York: Oxford University Press, 1998), 8.

gendered expectations, the evidence points to the likelihood that both men and women—like the Genoese women—often enthusiastically supported these directives, and sought to maintain these gendered expectations. This seems especially true when gender intersects with class politics. As the work of Sharon Farmer reveals, the gendered expectations of men and women of lower status, especially those unable to work, differed greatly from those of elite men and women.⁷¹ The importance of the varieties of religious men—from monks, clerics, priests, and bishops—deserve closer examination.⁷² Gender was an evolving category, part of a web of hierarchical ideologies.⁷³ Therefore, the presence of a plurality of gender constructs in medieval sources, or even by the same author—as we will see in Jacques’ works—should not be dismissed as outliers.⁷⁴ As this chapter will show, notions of gender fluidity are not exclusively the stuff of postmodernity.

To explore these notions in a thirteenth-century clerical context, this chapter will consider the development of Jacques’ perceptions of gender, including clerical masculinity. Therefore, it will cover the period from Jacques’ education under the tutelage of Peter the Chanter at the University of Paris (c. 1185) to his ordination (c.1208). Together with his work among female religious groups in the bishopric of Liège (1208-c.1212)—the focus of the next chapter—we will

⁷¹ Farmer cautions that gender “must be placed in a grid of difference,” *Surviving Poverty*, 41.

⁷² An exception is Thibedeaux’s *Manly Priest*. See also John Tosh, “The History of Masculinity: An Outdated Concept,” *What Is Masculinity?: Historical Dynamics from Antiquity to the Contemporary World*, eds. John Arnold and Sean Brady (Hampshire: Palgrave Macmillan, 2011), 24.

⁷³ Citing Patricia Hill Collins, Cordelia Beattie explains that using a concept of the “matrix of domination” accounts for the multiple ways that people experience gender, race, class, sexuality depending on their position in all of those categories,” “Introduction: Gender, Power, and Difference” in *Intersections of Gender, Religion and Ethnicity in the Middle Ages*, eds. Cordelia Beattie and Kirsten A. Fenton (New York : Palgrave Macmillan, 2011), 2. See also Miri Rubin, “The Person in the Form: Medieval Challenges to Bodily Order,” *Framing Medieval Bodies*, eds. Kay, Sarah and Miri Rubin (Manchester: Manchester university press, 1994), 100-122.

⁷⁴ When confronted by portrayals of women that do not fit these reactionary notions of this clerical masculine anxiety, as seen in the works of Jacques de Vitry and Caesar Heisterbach, Murray gestures towards their experience with laity which she suggests set them apart from their cloistered brothers. Murray, “Problem of Male Embodiment,” 17.

draw together the various contextual threads that influenced Jacques' preaching to the Genoese women. Jacques' works reveal that he possessed a nuanced and astute understanding of how to maneuver effectively within gendered systems of honor and shame. As John Baldwin notes, moral theologians, like Jacques were not passive observers of their world, but "their analyses were preparatory to protest and reform."⁷⁵ As a socially evolving, performative, and proscriptive category, gender was implicitly and explicitly part of these reformers' analysis and plan of action.⁷⁶ Since the concepts of masculinity and femininity remain interdependent, this inquiry will incorporate both to show that, in the political, social, and religious upheavals of the late twelfth and early thirteenth centuries, Jacques de Vitry formulated—and was himself fashioned by—a specific ideological understanding of men and women, which he then he used to advance what he saw as the end goals of pastoral care: reform and crusade.⁷⁷

⁷⁵ Baldwin, *Masters, Princes, and Merchants*, xiv.

⁷⁶ My approach aligns with Elizabeth L'Estrange and Alison Moore who explain gender as a "socially constructed, performative and changing heuristic or hermeneutic category, which determines and allows us to find latent meaning in behaviors, texts, images, and social structures," "Introduction," *Representing Medieval Genders and Sexualities in Europe: Construction, Transformation, and Subversion, 600-1530* (Burlington, VT: Ashgate Publishing Group, 2011), 3. John Tosh cautions, however, that scholars should not focus on culture to the extent that they disconnect their work from political, economic, and physical realities. Ideology, however, is not entirely separate from "political, economic, and physical realities," especially as clearly evidenced by reform and crusade initiatives, Tosh, "The History of Masculinity," 25.

⁷⁷ Bird has investigated this web of dependent definitions as seen in Innocent III and Peter the Chanter's circle as they sought to confront and define heresy, resulting in the demarcation of learned and popular orthodoxy. I suggest dependent definitions of gender were part of this equation, "The Construction of Orthodoxy," 49.

Learning to be (Religious) Men at a Time of War

Jacques de Vitry learned the machismo of preaching while a student in Paris.⁷⁸ His extended intellectual family was formidable.⁷⁹ Educated at the University of Paris as part of Peter the Chanter's (d. 1197) circle, reform and pastoral care became central to his worldview.⁸⁰ This network of influential students has been characterized by John W. Baldwin for their likeminded concern for practical morality.⁸¹ Of the three key scholarly activities—lecturing, debating, and preaching—Peter the Chanter emphasized preaching as the most important element because it served to protect the whole church from heresy.⁸² This emphasis on theological training placed in the service of the spiritual well-being of the greater community is evident in the careers of his students.⁸³ Whether in the classroom, in the pulpit, or on the battlefield, they employed their training through diverse writings and distinguished careers.⁸⁴

⁷⁸ Scholars have agreed that masculinity was not strictly defined by sex or procreation, but it was also measured through one's clothing, wealth, proficiency at acts of violence, work, and ability to maintain one's household. Derek Neal, *The Masculine Self in Late Medieval England* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2008), 90; Kirsten A. Fenton, "Gendering the First Crusade in William of Malmesbury's *Gesta Regnum Angelorum*," in *Intersections of Gender, Religion and Ethnicity in the Middle Ages*, eds. Cordelia Beattie and Kirsten A. Fenton (New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2011), 129; Murray, "Masculinizing Religious life," 24-5.

⁷⁹ The exact birthdate for Jacques is unknown and we do not have much information about his family, but we can suppose that he came of a family of some means in that Jacques had enough wealth to donate inherited property to the Abbey of Trois-Fontaines for an annual income with the stipulation that if he died, entered a monastery, or obtained an ecclesiastical prebend, the Abbey no longer had to support him, J.F. Benton, "Qui étaient les parents de Jacques de Vitry?" *Le Moyen Âge* 70 (1964), 46-7.

⁸⁰ We do not know much information about the actual details of his education in Paris. Pierre Feret, *La Faculte de Theologie de Paris, Pierre Feret, La Faculté de Théologie de Paris et Ses Docteurs les Plus Célèbres* Vol. 1 (Paris: Picard, 1894), 238.

⁸¹ For a discussion the legacy and overlapping values of this generation and the next see Spencer E. Young, *Scholarly Community at the Early University of Paris: Theologians, Education, and Society, 1215-1248* (New York: Cambridge University Press, 2014).

⁸² Baldwin, *Master, Princes, and Merchants*, 90-1; The criticisms of John of St. Giles, among others, against scholars pursuing education only for their own academic prestige confirm that this generation did not uniformly accept the mission-minded view of this practical morality, Young, *Scholarly Community at the Early University of Paris*, 2-3, 6.

⁸³ This view of reform also targeted the teachers themselves, as Jacques de Vitry repeatedly advises that the preacher must first live well before teaching others, and that many preachers edify with their words and but destroy with their example, *Ad status*, XIX.13, XXI.1, XXI.6.

⁸⁴ Baldwin, *Master, Princes, and Merchants*, 14.

Jacques began his studies in Paris around 1185, which coincided with the pinnacle of the career of Peter the Chanter, who was appointed to his eponymous office of cantor at Notre Dame in 1183. Part of the last generation of students to know Peter the Chanter personally, Jacques showed his esteem for his teacher explicitly in both the *Historia Occidentalis* in which he dedicated a chapter to eulogizing him and in his references to him in his *exempla*.⁸⁵ This intellectual pedigree and the successful inculcation of reform-minded values characteristic of Peter's circle is apparent in all of Jacques' works, especially his sermons. Peter considered preaching the principal function of the theologian. Unfortunately, only one of the Chanter's sermons has been identified. This absence of direct witnesses to Peter's preaching makes the large model sermon collections of Jacques an important source of evidence to investigate how this circle of theologians interpreted Peter's message for audiences outside the University of Paris.⁸⁶ But Jacques' sermons also allow us to reflect on how these men understood their own clerical masculinity, conceived within a system of implicit and explicit honor codes and nurtured in the context of ongoing crusading activities of the twelfth and thirteenth centuries.

The crusade indeed would have shaped much of Jacques' worldview. His training in Paris coincided with several central crusading events such as the loss of Jerusalem in 1187, the truce between Saladin and Richard I of England, and the capture of Constantinople by Latin crusaders in 1204. For authors of ecclesiastical history, the fall of Jerusalem became a landmark event. For example, the history of Saint Nicholas d'Oignies, a house of regular canons founded in 1187 by Giles of Walcourt, begins by noting that "God permitted the most holy kingdom of Jerusalem with the Christians dwelling there, compelled by their countless sins, to be vanquished and

⁸⁵ Jacques de Vitry, *H. Occ.*, 94-101.

⁸⁶ Baldwin, *Master, Princes, and Merchants*, 36.

cruelly and violently massacred by a certain wicked Saladin, king of the Saracens and most cruel tyrant.”⁸⁷ It asserts that Jacques, who joined the small priory c. 1208, had been a student in Paris when news arrived of Saladin’s capture of Jerusalem (1187).⁸⁸ Jacques himself began his *Historia Occidentalis* decriing the state of the Church of Jerusalem: “the first born and special daughter of God, stripped of her garments of glory which were mangled by various villains, had remained almost naked.”⁸⁹ Time, and one’s place in it, was framed by the fortunes of Jerusalem.⁹⁰

Along with his fellow students, such as Gerald of Wales, Robert Courçon, and Fulk of Neuilly, crusading initiatives fostered Jacques’ enthusiastic promotion of crusade and shaped his subsequent career. The lives of these men demonstrate that Peter the Chanter’s circle extended its message of crusade as dependent on reform throughout the West as well as into the Crusader States. Gerald of Wales (b. 1146), the archdeacon of Brecon and occasional court chaplain of Henry II, served as a liaison to the people of Wales.⁹¹ Saladin’s capture of Jerusalem led to Gerald’s preaching tour in 1188, joining Baldwin, the Archbishop of Canterbury, to garner

⁸⁷ *Historia foundationis uenerabilis ecclesia beati Nicholai Oigniencensis ac ancillae Christi Mariae Oigniencensis*, ed. Edmond Martène and Ursin Durand in *Veterum scriptorum et monumentorum historicorum, dogmaticorum, moralium amplissima collectio*, VI (Paris: Montalant, 1729), col. 327: ‘Tempore illo quo permisit Deus sanctissimum regnum Ierosolymorum cum Christianis ibi habitantibus, peccatis eorum innumerabilibus exigentibus, debellare, et ipsos crudeliter et hostiliter trucidare per quemdam Sarracenorum regni impium Salhadinum et crudelissimum tyrannum’

⁸⁸ *Ibid.*: ‘ . . . etiam studente in sacra theologia in civitate Parissiensis reverendissimo patre nostro domino Jacobo de Vitraco. . . .’; Benton, “Qui étaient les parents de Jacques de Vitry?” 40; Donnadieu, *Jacques de Vitry*, 25-6. The history of Oignies also claims erroneously that Francis of Assisi had begun his preaching at this time, showing the chronicles creative structuring of time and desire to associate itself with such events.

⁸⁹ Jacques de Vitry, *H. Occ.*, 73: ‘primogenita et specialis eius filia, iherosolimitana ecclesia, glorie sue uestimentis exuta, que, uariis carnificibus lacerate, fere nuda remanserat’ See Chapter Four for a more detailed discussion of this passage.

⁹⁰ See Silvia Schein, *Gateway to the Heavenly City : Crusader Jerusalem and the Catholic West (1099-1187)* (Burlington, Vt.: Ashgate, 2005).

⁹¹ Peter W. Edbury, “Preaching the Crusade in Wales,” in *England and Germany in the High Middle Ages*, eds. Alfred Haverkamp, Hanna Vollrath, and Karl Leyser (London: German Historical Institute London, 1996), 222; Baldwin, *Masters, Princes, and Merchants*, 41.

support throughout Wales for the Third Crusade.⁹² Local events connected to the crusade. Gerald, for example, blamed Henry II's political downfall, occasioned by his rebellious sons' alliance with the Capetian dynasty, on the king's refusal to assist the Patriarch of Jerusalem, thereby "forsaking God and by God forsaken" for his role in the loss of the Holy Land.⁹³ These accusations about Christian failures in the East only grew after the Third Crusade. Fulk of Neuilly (d.1202), an already popular reform preacher from France, was commissioned by Innocent III in 1198 to preach crusade with the assistance of Benedictine and Cistercian monks and regular canons.⁹⁴ Innocent's frustration with the lack of support for crusading among the elites and the embarrassing redirection of the Fourth Crusade led him to conclude that divine favor had turned away from wealthy knights and nobles and embraced the poor.⁹⁵ While his preaching activities and death are recounted briefly in Geoffroy de Villehardouin's *Chronicle of the Crusades*, Jacques' *Historia Occidentalis* provides our only biographical details.⁹⁶ Like Jacques, Robert Courson's illustrious career as a theologian was propelled by preaching crusade against heretics in the West. Innocent III dispatched Robert to France to preach crusade against heretics in 1213, eventually attracting enemies there for the local bishops considered his excessive emphasis on potentially volatile issues such as usury.⁹⁷ Robert was later dispatched to the front lines of the crusade by Honorius III, where he would die from illness outside of

⁹² Edbury, "Preaching the Crusade in Wales," 221.

⁹³ Gerald of Wales notes how the Patriarch came to England in 1183 seeking support, "humbly requesting, but in vain," since the King "merely despised this messenger and was therefore himself also despised; and forsaking God and by God forsaken (for his glory which thus far had grown continually, from this time forth was turned to shame)." Giraldus of Wales, *The Autobiography of Gerald of Wales*, ed. and trans. Harold Edgeworth Butler (Rochester, NY: Boydell Press, 2005), 86.

⁹⁴ Cole, *Preaching of the Crusades*, 87.

⁹⁵ James M. Powell, *Anatomy of a Crusade: 1213-1221* (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 1990), 7.

⁹⁶ Jacques de Vitry, *H. Occ.*, VI 89-90.

⁹⁷ Baldwin, *Masters, Princes, and Merchants*, 22-3.

Damietta in 1219.⁹⁸ These men's career trajectories similarly evolved in concert with their role in crusading initiatives, and their particularly reform-minded approach to such endeavors.

Easily the most influential student of Peter the Chanter was Lotario dei Conti di Segni, later Pope Innocent III. While elected as subdeacon by Gregory VIII months after the capture of Jerusalem in 1187, Lotario does not make mention in his writings or sermons of this or other political events that were plaguing the papacy.⁹⁹ As Pope Innocent III, however, his policies, letters, and councils reveal a deep concern for crusading endeavors in the East and West.¹⁰⁰ He depended heavily on fellow Parisian trained men—like Jacques de Vitry—to enact his directives towards colonization and reform.¹⁰¹ Crusading failures, especially the loss of Jerusalem, shaped these men's efforts at diplomacy, their estimation of Western leadership, and their formulation of pastoral care. A man's willingness to redress the losses of 1187, therefore, became a factor for the proscription and description of proper manhood.

But, as noted a second front had opened where clerics and knights alike could demonstrate their manhood. This homegrown enemy, the Cathars, was even more like than Islam to produce anxiety. While modern scholars disagree over the existence of organized heretical groups in the Latin West, the belief in this threat and the fears that it inspired had resounding

⁹⁸ Cole, *Preaching of the Crusades*, 109. Chapter Three further addresses the connections between Robert and Jacques' careers.

⁹⁹ John C. Moore, *Pope Innocent III (1160/61-1216) : To Root Up and To Plant* (Leiden ; Boston: Brill, 2003), 12, 23-24. His spiritual writings like *The Misery of the Human Condition*, align with the practical theology or active religious life, characterizing Peter the Chanter's circle.

¹⁰⁰ Ibid., 44-5. For a macro view of these efforts see also Robert I. Burns, "Christian-Islamic Confrontation in the West: The Thirteenth-Century Dream of Conversion," *The American Historical Review*, vol. 76, no. 5 (Dec. 1971), 1386-434.

¹⁰¹ For example, after the Fall of Constantinople, Innocent III requested masters and scholars be sent to Greece. Young, *Scholarly Community at the Early University of Paris*, 29-30. Young notes that this activity shows papal esteem for the masters, but it should be noted that Innocent III knew several of these men personally, therefore institutional preference likely intersected with personal rapport.

consequences.¹⁰² As Innocent III and Peter the Chanter's circle confronted the possibility of dangerous heterodoxy, a new refined approach to defining orthodoxy was needed.¹⁰³ They considered Catharism an organized and growing threat in Italy and Languedoc.¹⁰⁴ To oppose it, they favored public disputations, written refutations, and preaching campaigns, which in turn led to violent and indiscriminate repression during the Albigensian Crusade (1209-1229). Arguably more so than the threat of Islam, anxiety about this dualist heresy influenced papal policy. Crusading indulgences were expanded,¹⁰⁵ and policies were aimed to increase local efforts towards guiding lay spirituality through sound pastoral care.¹⁰⁶ The reputation for Cathar leadership, the *perfecti*, the moral uprightness, and the promise of heaven they offered through the deathbed ritual known as *consolamentum* made them formidable competition at the pulpit.¹⁰⁷ The Cathars' perceived successes, therefore, threw an embarrassing spotlight on the ineptitude of the local clergy.¹⁰⁸

The model of debate and persuasion only provided a partial solution to the problem of heresy. Crusades against Islam provided another working framework for the papacy and theologians to address it, offering moral precedent and a system of spiritual rewards for the use

¹⁰² R.I. Moore, *The War on Heresy: Faith and Power in Medieval Europe* (Cambridge: The Belknap Press of Harvard University Press, 2014), 261; Malcolm Barber notes, despite disagreements over its date of arrival or development, Catharism had a continuous impact on the Latin West from 1140s to 1320s, *The Cathars: Dualist Heretics in Languedoc in the High Middle Ages* (New York: Pearson, 2013), 5.

¹⁰³ Bird, "Construction of Orthodoxy," 49. As Bernard of Clairvaux asserted, the chief benefit of education for the Church was in "refuting her opponents and instructing the simple" Wei, *Intellectual Culture in Medieval Paris: Theologians and the University, c.1100-1330* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2012), 60.

¹⁰⁴ While later questioning the motives of the leaders of the crusade, namely Simon of Montfort, Innocent III's call to crusade in southern France stressed that followers of heresy ought to be attacked more "more fearlessly even than Saracens," cited in Barber, *Cathars*, 127 (PL 215, col 1353-8).

¹⁰⁵ See Ane Bysted, *The Crusade Indulgence: Spiritual rewards and the Theology of the Crusades, c. 1095-1216, History of Warfare* v. 103 (Leiden: Brill, 2015).

¹⁰⁶ Spencer points to the fact that the institutionalization of theology at the University of Paris coincided with perception of heresy as an ever increasing threat, Young, *Scholarly Community at the Early University of Paris*, 26.

¹⁰⁷ Barber, *Cathars*, 115.

¹⁰⁸ *Ibid.*, 64-6.

of violence against this localized threat in Christian lands.¹⁰⁹ For Jacques, preaching against heresy would be his first direct involvement in crusading endeavors, a seemingly natural step given his education in Paris.

Jacques, in fact, may have encountered heterodox thinkers before even leaving Paris. The Cathar *Book of Two Principles* offers a refutation of a certain William, likely William of Auvergne, the Bishop of Paris and professor of theology and therefore could have crossed Jacques' desk. Similarly, Ivo of Narbonne and Caesar of Heisterbach both report stories of Cathars at the University of Paris.¹¹⁰ Whether to acquire or refute this theology, it appears the University of Paris was recognized as the center for theological education by Catholics and supposed heretics alike. The perception of enemies on numerous fronts, both in the East and West, shaped Jacques' understanding of the importance of theology and preaching, not only for the edification and education of both the clergy and laity, but as a spiritual weapon in these fraught battles. The loss of Jerusalem and rising fears of amorphous heretical groups in the West, reminded Jacques of the devastating consequences of the clergy's failure.

Parisian Prostitutes and Proving Clerical Manhood

For theologians, crusading losses had magnified the moral failures of men, therefore, a morally upright and academically robust clergy was needed to assuage the indignation of God. As Jacques recalls, however, the very place of their education was rife with dangerous moral pitfalls. He made these observations in the *Historia Occidentalis*, which he wrote around 1221

¹⁰⁹ Innocent III also relied on Roman Law as in the decretal *Vergentis* issued to Viterbo, equating heresy with treason, thereby employing the penalties of loss of land and disinheritance of all future generations; although this later punishment was left out in his extension of this order to Languedoc in 1200, Barber, *Cathars*, 139.

¹¹⁰ Barber, *Cathars*, 94.

towards the end of his career.¹¹¹ Not a conventional history, Jacques presents a religious and moral narrative setting key moments in a recent and often personal past. He describes all the prevailing forms of religious life, including the newly formed Franciscans. He begins, however, with his well-known description of the University of Paris, describing a “dark time” when the city was full of vice and criminal activity: “But at that time, like a mangy goat or a diseased sheep, with a clergy more dissolute than the rest of the populace, it corrupted by its bad example the many visitors who poured in from everywhere, swallowing up its inhabitants and dragging them down with itself into the depths.”¹¹² But then, in the late twelfth century, Philip Augustus initiated several construction projects to improve and expand his seat of administration, including expanding the walls of Paris to include the schools.¹¹³ Even more students now flocked to Paris, seeking excellence in learning, but also attracted by the legal protections Philip Augustus had afforded scholars.¹¹⁴

Students came from a variety of cultural, economic, and linguistic backgrounds, a diversity which created tension. Jacques noted that divisiveness among students was delineated by regional affiliations, among which gendered insults featured prominently.¹¹⁵ Each group attracted its own slander, and these insults cast light on the intersection between masculinity and ethnicity:

¹¹¹ For a discussion on the dating of this text see Hinnebusch, *H.Occ.*, 16-20.

¹¹² Jacques de Vitry, *H.Occ.*, 91: ‘Tunc autem amplius in clero quam in alio populo dissoluta, tamquam capra scabiosa et ouis morbida, pernicioso exemplo multos hospites suos undique ad eam confluentes corrumpibat, habitatores suos deorans et secum in profundum demergens.’

¹¹³ John W. Baldwin, “Masters at Paris from 1179-1215: A Social Perspective,” in Robert L. Benson and Giles Constable (eds), *Renaissance and Renewal in the Twelfth Century* (Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press), 140.

¹¹⁴ Young, *Scholarly Community at the Early University of Paris*, 23-24; Baldwin, “Masters at Paris,” 142.

¹¹⁵ Jacques de Vitry, *H.Occ.*, 92. By 1249, there appears a clear division at the university where students were categorized into four nations, including : France, Picardy, Normandy, and England, but these divisions likely were developed earlier, Wei, *Intellectual Culture*, 111-2.

Their diversity of origin gave rise to mutual hostility, envy, and detraction, and they rudely hurled a multitude of insults and slanders at each other, saying that the English drank too much and had tails, the French were arrogant, comfort-loving, and effeminate, the Germans were hot-tempered and coarse in their pleasures, the Normans silly and boastful, the Poitevins treacherous and friends of Fortune. They saw the Burgundians as brutish and stupid, and condemned the Bretons as lightweight and frivolous, often taunting them about Arthur's death. They called the Lombards greedy, malicious, and cowardly¹¹⁶; the Romans seditious, violent, and gnawing the hand that feeds them; the Sicilians overbearing and cruel; the Brabants bloodthirsty, provocative, marauders, and rapists; the Flemings self-indulgent, extravagant, devoted to feasting, and soft as butter and lazy.¹¹⁷

These regional stereotypes range from the monstrous tails to commonplace vices. Jacques gives them a patina of scientific support by drawing on humoral theory. Climate and the balance of the four humors lead to specific personality traits—colder climates were thought to cause more restrained personalities in their inhabitants while the warmer regions resulted in reckless and hot-tempered people. This reflects students' overlapping identities based “faculties, nations, and colleges” despite the University of Paris increasing cohesive identity as an institution.¹¹⁸

But as seen in the influential explanation of sexual difference found in Isidore of Seville's *Etymologies*, regional elements intersected with gender. According to the theory of humors, feminine traits were associated with softness and wetness, while masculine traits, with hardness and dryness.¹¹⁹ Several of these students' accusations against various groups comprise

¹¹⁶ Possible reference to their losses in 1101 as the vanguard in the Battle of Mersivan in what would later be known as “the crusade of the faint-hearted,” ADD

¹¹⁷ Jacques de Vitry, *H.Occ.*, 92: ‘Non solum autem ratione diuersarum sectarum uel occasione disputationum sibi inuicem aduersantes contradicebant, sed pro diuersitate regionum mutuo dissidentes, inuidentes et detrahentes, multas contra se contumelias et oprobrias impudenter proferebant, anglicos potatores et caudatos affirmantes, francigenas superbos, molles et muliebriter compositos asserentes, teutonicos furibundos et in conuiuuiis suis obscenos dicebat, normanos autem inanes et gloriosos, pictauos proditores et fortune amicos. Hoc autem qui de Burgundia erant brutos et stultos reputabant. Britones autem leues et uagos iudicantes, Arturi mortem frequenter eis obiciebant. Lombardos auaros, malitiosos et imbelles ; romanos seditiosos, uiolentos et manus rodentes ; siculos tyrannos et crudeles ; brabantinos uiros sanguinum, incendiaros, rutarios et raptores ; flandrenses superfluos, prodigos, comessationibus deditos, et more butyri molles et remissos, appellabant. Et propter huiusmodi conuitia, de uerbis frequenter ad uerba procedebant.’

¹¹⁸ Wei, *Intellectual Culture*, 122.

¹¹⁹ Isidore of Seville's *Etymologiae IX* in *Woman Defamed and Woman Defended: An Anthology of Medieval Texts*, eds. Alcuin Blamires, Karen Pratt, and C. William Marx (New York : Oxford University Press 1992), 43.

characteristics associated with effeminacy, such as cowardice, pleasure-seeking, immorality, softness, and uncontrolled behavior.¹²⁰ Cowardice, or a reluctance to engage in physical violence, in theory ought not to have been an issue for these students. After all, canon law had forbade clergy from shedding blood. But the number of accounts praising the bravery of fighting bishops and priests in *chansons* and chronicles, outside of the approved military orders, speak to the perpetuation of models that combined martial and Christian values.¹²¹ These masculine ideals, especially the exercise of violence, remained ingrained in the outlook of these young, volatile men. The students' accusation against the French as "arrogant, comfort-loving, and effeminate," likely would have included Jacques, who was born near Reims. Indeed Thomas of Cantimpré made similar accusations in his supplement to Marie D'Oignies' *vita*, claiming Jacques had returned from Acre only to become distracted from his pastoral duties by honors and gifts in Rome, soothed by peace and quiet while poor souls were headed to hell.¹²²

While the *Historia Occidentalis* draws a highly moralized, stylized portrait of Paris, Jacques likely drew on his own experiences as a student.¹²³ His generation of scholars directly

¹²⁰ As Thibodeaux points out, the same language to describe manliness—such as hardness and strength—was used inside and outside of the cloister, and likewise unmanliness was associated with womanly softness and weakness, *Manly Priest*, 17. Grace Jantzen notes the association of moral and intellectual inferiority to women as a legacy of Aristotle's belief that women were malformed men, *Power, Gender, and Christian Mysticism* (New York: Cambridge University Press, 1995), 107.

¹²¹ Helen Nicholson, *Medieval Warfare: Theory and Practice of War in Europe 300-1500* (New York, NY: Palgrave Macmillan, 2008), 64; Katherine Allen Smith also notes the coterminous development from 1050-1250 of the hybrid *lorcati* saints whose penitential armor "formed a spiritual bond between monks and warriors," "Saints in Shining Armor: Martial Asceticism and Masculine Models of Sanctity, ca. 1050-1250," *Speculum* 83 (2008), 601; for a discussion of perpetuation of fighting churchmen in an English context see: Craig M. Nakashian, *Warrior Churchmen of Medieval England, 1000-1250: Theory and Reality* (Rochester, NY: Boydell Press, 2016).

¹²² Thomas of Cantimpré, *VMO-S*. English translation by Hugh Feiss OSB in *Mary of Oignies: Mother of Salvation*, ed. Anneke Mulder-Bakker (Turnhout: Brepols, 2006), 161-3. It is not unlikely that Thomas would have read Jacques' letter recounting crusade losses addressed to Honorius III and John of Nivelles which ends in one version noting that he desired to "end his life in peace and tranquility," Jacques de Vitry, *Lettres*, VIb.277-80: 'Ego autem iam debilis et confractus corde in pace et tranquillitate vitam mean finire desidero.'

¹²³ We can see geographical specificity in his version of the vision of the teacher Serlo of Wilton who reportedly has a vision of a former student suffering eternal punishments for spending so much time on "letters of sophistry and

preceded and precipitated the organizational changes at the university, culminating in Gregory IX's promulgation in the bull *Parens scientiarum* (1231).¹²⁴ This bull confirmed the privileges, position, and pastoral purpose of its scholars as the "chief vehicles whereby Christian doctrine would be disseminated to the entire universal church."¹²⁵ The university of the late twelfth and early thirteenth-century, however, was still a work in progress, as competing schools disagreed over fees, curriculum, and teaching positions.¹²⁶ Jacques alludes to these troubles in his diatribe, attacking those pursuing education for their own personal gain, "knowledge was puffing them up, charity was not edifying them."¹²⁷ Echoing Peter the Chanter, Jacques declared that knowledge was not good for its own sake, but rather it was only valuable if it was directed towards the betterment of society.¹²⁸ In a sermon aimed at scholars, Jacques describes this scholarly vanity as the product of a false sense of masculinity. Expounding on Ezek. 16.17, he likens vain scholars to "those who make golden images and fornicate with them." Scholars are like men who ruin virgins, destroying their wisdom and their heart's integrity, they "hold an image and not the truth because these things seem manly, but they are made effeminate through their vanity and reduced to nothing."¹²⁹ Here Jacques ruthlessly challenges knowledge and

vain curiosities." Jacques places this episode in the meadow of St. Germain de Paris, noting that he saw Serlo's pierced hand while residing in Paris, Jacques de Vitry, *Exempla*, XXXI, 12.

¹²⁴ For a detailed study on the *Parens scientiarum* generation and the legacy of Peter the Chanter's circle see: Young, *Scholarly Community at the Early University of Paris*.

¹²⁵ *Ibid.*, 1. As Baldwin notes masters' like Peter the Chanter and Alan of Lille had to establish the legitimacy of their new role in society by crafting an "old" lineage of education harkening back to Greece and Rome, Baldwin, "Masters at Paris," 161-2.

¹²⁶ Constant J. Mews, "Communities of Learning and the Dream of Synthesis," *Communities of Learning: Networks and The Shaping of Intellectual Identity in Europe, 1100-1500*, eds. C. J. Mews and John N. Crossley (Turnhout: Brepols, 2011), 111; Baldwin, "Masters at Paris," 159-61; Wei, *Intellectual Culture*, 87-9.

¹²⁷ Jacques de Vitry, *H. Occ.*, 93 : 'Theologie doctores, supra cathedram Moysi sedentes, scientia inflabat, quos caritas non edificabat.'

¹²⁸ This attitude was shared by both monastic and regular authors of the twelfth century. For example, in his sermons on the *Song of Songs*, Bernard of Clairvaux also distinguished between those who want knowledge to help others and those, "who long to know for the sole purpose of knowing, and that is shameful curiosity," and Hugh of St. Victor criticized the vanity of those who were proud of their own knowledge, Wei, *Intellectual Culture*, 61-62.

¹²⁹ Jacques de Vitry, *Ad status*, XL.3.111-115: 'Vel 'ymagines masculinas facit,' quia sicut masculus uirginem corrumpit, sic tu sapientiam et cordis tui integritatem per uanam gloriam corrupisti, habens ymaginem, non ueritatem, quia uirilia uidentur sed per uanitatem effeminantur et ad nichilum rediguntur.'

elitism as true masculine traits of scholars, but his treatment of clerical chastity shows an understanding of the chasm between regulations and reality.

Clerical celibacy was, of course, not an innovation in the late twelfth century. Evidence for ecclesiastical regulations for clerical celibacy date to fourth- and fifth-century councils, but it was not until Gregorian Reform that monastic ideals of abstinence began to be enforced.¹³⁰ These efforts are usually seen as an attempt to eliminate clerical dynasties, and in part they were. But they also formed part of larger reform initiatives designed to distinguish clergy from the laity and to distinguish different types of clerics from another—both clarifying and ranking their spheres of power.¹³¹ Perhaps inadvertently, these reforms also set two of the basic forms of religious vocation—monks and parish priests—at odds. Scholars like Jennifer D. Thibodeaux have pointed out that many priests and their communities resisted the “manly celibate model” fundamental to the reform movement, which in turn moved beyond clerical marriages to attempts at regulating men’s comportment and appearance.¹³² Some churchmen expressed their resistance through written defenses of clerical marriage, while others kept their wives, obstinately refusing to conform to the new restrictions despite the threats of excommunication.¹³³ But the resistance also came from the communities supposedly suffering under the care of such incontinent priests. In one case, a community famously burned a reformer alive in Cambrai.¹³⁴ As the liturgy and consecration of the sacraments was performed for the benefit of the community, so it seems these

¹³⁰ Thibodeaux, *Manly Priest*, 2-3; Julia Barrow, *The Clergy in the Medieval World: Secular Clerics, Their Families and Careers in North-Western Europe, c. 800-C. 1200*, (Cambridge, United Kingdom: Cambridge University Press, 2015), 71-72; Charles A. Frazee, “The Origins of Clerical Celibacy in the Western Church,” *Church History*, 57 (1988), pp. 108; Maureen C. Miller, “Masculinity, Reform, and Clerical Culture,” 27-28.

¹³¹ Scholars point out that the Gregorian Reform neither invented or achieved the ideal of clerical chastity, but rather was an age “where the full force of the decisions taken by earlier councils was to be felt,” Helen Parish, *Clerical Celibacy in the West: c.1100-1700* (Farnham: Ashgate, 2010), 9; Miller, “Narratives of Episcopal Holiness,” 27.

¹³² Thibodeaux, *Manly Priest*, 7; Parish, *Clerical Celibacy*, 105; Miller, “Narratives of Episcopal Holiness,” 28.

¹³³ Thibodeaux, *Manly Priest*, 87; Parish, *Clerical Celibacy*, 105.

¹³⁴ Parish, *Clerical Celibacy*, 105.

communities had a stake in their priests' right to exercise shared symbols of masculinity in marriage and procreation.

The *Historia Occientalis* shows us that students training for these future ecclesiastical positions often rejected the celibate component of their clerical masculinity. While elevating their minds with the study of theology, grammar, and logic, they earned reputations for the base treatment of their bodies.¹³⁵ As newcomers, they came into conflict with the residents of the city. One particularly violent episode resulted in the royal confirmation of the students' legal protections. After a tavern brawl that led to the deaths of several students, Philip Augustus issued a charter in 1200 confirming their legal protection due to clerical status, protecting their bodies by placing them under ecclesiastical jurisdiction.¹³⁶ Students were clerics, but not yet ordained or part of a specific ecclesiastical community. By the time of Jacques' life, this association was fairly well entrenched. As Julia Barrow explains, from at least the eleventh century, education rather than ordination had come to define the clergy.¹³⁷ Jacques and his fellow students occupied a legal liminal space under the protection of Church, but they did not need to live under the same obligations as priests. Therefore, they could more easily dodge the punishments meted out by secular authorities.¹³⁸ Such legal latitude offered students stability and security, but it also gave

¹³⁵ While depicting the vices of students, these behaviors were not contained to this interim period before many would be ordained. Church councils from the eleventh through thirteenth centuries continued to prohibit clerics from frequenting taverns, usury, hunting, using weapons, keeping concubines, and abandoning their parish. These prohibitions reveal the continued chasm between reformist ideals and reality, Ross William Collins, "The Parish Priest and His Flock as Depicted by the Councils of the Twelfth and Thirteenth Centuries," *The Journal of Religion*, 10.3. (1930), pp. 313-32.

¹³⁶ Baldwin, "Masters at Paris," 142. Baldwin emphasizes that this allowed students to be sheltered from the world so that they could focus on their studies, but it would have also gave license for misbehavior.

¹³⁷ Barrow, *Clergy in the Medieval World*, 67.

¹³⁸ Young, *Scholarly Community at the Early University of Paris*, 24.

them an implicit license for misdeeds including fighting, drunkenness, frequenting brothels, and keeping concubines.¹³⁹

In this supposed hotbed of sin, Jacques reports, prostitutes often questioned the manhood of clerics who refused their services¹⁴⁰:

If by any chance the clerics refused to go in, the prostitutes would not hesitate to shout after them, accusing them of being sodomites; because that foul and abominable vice conquered the city, like an incurable leprosy and untreatable poison, to such an extent that it was considered creditable for someone to keep one or more mistresses openly.¹⁴¹

Jacques cleverly presents an admission of the continued practice of clerical concubinage while simultaneously providing a traditional justification for marriage—the prevention of deviant sexual desires. After Lateran I (1123) dissolved clerical marriages among the major orders, suggesting these women become the *ancillae* of the Church, documents began to identify priests' wives (*uxores*) as concubines.¹⁴² At the same time, vocal opponents to these prohibitions defended marriage as a natural good which protected men, lay and religious, from the unnatural sin of sodomy. Thus they accused monastic reformers of being sodomites.¹⁴³ Through the prostitutes' accusations, Jacques shows the continued belief in the salubrious effects of

¹³⁹ The Paris Statutes of 1215 did include provisions attempting to regulate the clerics conduct, including prohibitions against drinking and luxurious clothing, Wei, *Intellectual Culture*, 95-96.

¹⁴⁰ For a discussion of medieval prostitution and the difficulty posed by concubinage for canon lawyers, see: James A. Brundage, "Prostitution in the Medieval Canon Law," in *Sisters and Workers in the Middle Ages* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1989) pp. 79-99.

¹⁴¹ Jacques de Vitry, *H.Occ.*, 91 : 'Qui, si forte ingredi recusarent, confestim eos sodomitas post ipsos conclaimantes dicebam. Illud enim fedum et abominabile uitium adeo ciuitatem, quasi lepra incurabilis et uenenum insanabile, occupauerat, quod honorificum reputabant, si publice teneret unam uel plures concubinas.'

¹⁴² These prohibitions repeated the declarations previously stated at the Synod of Pavia (1022) that stated the children of clergy were to be treated as serfs of the church, and the Synod of Rome (1051) that declared wives of the clergy as *ancillae* of the Church, Parish, *Clerical celibacy in the West*, 95-7; Thibodeaux, *Manly Priest*, 54. Thibodeaux also notes that William of Malmesbury warned his students that prostitutes could "emasculate their mental vigor," a notion perhaps reflected in Jacques' account clerics' refusal to employ the prostitutes, 27 and 87.

¹⁴³ Thibodeaux, *Manly Priest*, 98-99. Thibodeaux also suggest these accusations might not be entirely polemical rhetoric as many secular clerics perceived that "monastic reformers refused to persecute sodomites, while simultaneously prohibiting clerical marriage," 101.

heterosexual relationships for lay and religious men.¹⁴⁴ Additionally, Jacques' complaints reveal the pervasive suspicion of sodomy associated with celibate lifestyles.¹⁴⁵ While the ecclesiastical legislation had sided with the sentiments of the reformers, public opinion may have preferred clerics to be guilty of natural, masculine sins with respectable women, rather than the sickness of sodomy.

Canon law, however, continued to permit previously married men to become priests and Jacques related the role of marriage before taking holy orders as viable prevention of aberrant sexuality.¹⁴⁶ In a sermon directed to clerics Jacques addressed the issue of clerical abstinence, explicating Daniel 3:28, in which the three friends recused from the fire represent clerics whose passions must be burned away. He warns that whoever merely suppressed their desires without entirely snuffing them out, risks their passions erupting forth "in sexual activity that is against nature."¹⁴⁷ He explained that it is for this reason that it is better for a man to take a wife than to burn (1 Cor. 7.9) before he ascends to holy orders for "it is better to be safe in the city of Segor for a short while than to be endangered on a mountain."¹⁴⁸ The reference to Segor here comes from the story of Lot, who departed Segor and dwelt with his two daughters in a mountain top cave, where he would drunkenly committed incest (Gen. 19.30). Jacques again ranks the sin of

¹⁴⁴ Their very profession as prostitutes, seemingly delegitimizing their accusations, in fact made these women more reliable judges of virility. Common women were also used to prove or disprove alleged cases of impotency as a reason for annulment, Fletcher, "Whig Interpretation of Masculinity," 64. See also Karras, *Common Women*. On the validity of testimony of the poor and lower classes, Farmer notes in her investigation of the posthumous miracles of St. Louis IX (1226-70) that poor witnesses were subjected to bodily tests because their testimony would be trusted less than those from elite classes, *Surviving Poverty*, 50.

¹⁴⁵ Seen also with monastic communities, Thibodeaux, *Manly Priest*, 101.

¹⁴⁶ The longstanding belief that prostitution, while denounced by the church, was thought to prevent greater evils, Brundage, "Prostitution in the Medieval Canon Law," 98.

¹⁴⁷ Jacques de Vitry, *Ad status*, XIV.3.49-50: 'Unde plerumque contingit quod fomes cohibitus, non siccatus, perniciosus ebullit in eum usum qui est contra naturam.'

¹⁴⁸ *Ibid.*, 54-7: 'Probet igitur seipsum homo, antequam ad sacros ordines accedit, I Corinthiorum VII, quia melius est nubere quam uri, melius saluari Segor ciuitate modica quam in monte periclitari.'

clerics' and would-be clerics' marriages as lesser offense than what he considers deviant sexual practices. Of course, a cleric's choice to acquire a mistress did not necessitate rumors of sodomy or the dangers of incest, but Jacques provides these dangers as the mitigating factor.

These examples should be read in the context of the increasing focus on sodomy in both moral treatises and vernacular literature during the eleventh and twelfth centuries. While such charges were hurled at kings and counts, it was the sexuality of clerics—whose chastity had been legislated somewhat recently—that drew the most suspicion and moved the conversation regarding sodomy from moral delinquency to a legal crime.¹⁴⁹ Jacques' account exemplifies how notions of sodomy, associated with and often blamed upon foreignness, new learning, and urbanism, were often targeted at the University of Paris.¹⁵⁰ While the accusation of sodomy could cover a multitude of behaviors including heresy, in Jacques' presentation it is defined by the clerics' refusal to engage in heterosexual sex. While the University of Paris was the target of such accusations, its teachers composed formal tracts outlining the grave hazards of sodomy. Peter the Chanter's popular *Verbum abbreviatum* “provided the most complete compilation of arguments in favor of active condemnation and persecution of sodomy.”¹⁵¹ This work was well enough known that Jacques was likely familiar with it. In 1203, Innocent III began carrying out some its programs by ordering an investigation into the practice of sodomy among the clergy in Mâcon. The decrees of the Fourth Lateran Council similarly attempted to extend the judiciary

¹⁴⁹ Peter Domain's radical *Liber Gomorrianus* (1049) focused on the threat of sodomites among the clergy and while Pope Leo did not fully embrace Peter's urgent call to actively seek out and reform offenders, his arguments were employed by later authors, Burgwinkle, *Sodomy, Masculinity, and Law in Medieval Literature: France and England, 1050-1230* (New York: Cambridge University Press, 2004), 53.

¹⁵⁰ Ibid., 47. Burgwinkle also points out that accusations of sodomy “reveals how fragile the social structures and subject positions founded on this fantastical notion of Law really are,” 15.

¹⁵¹ Ibid., 32; Baldwin, *The Language of Sex: Five Voices from Northern France around 1200* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1994), 44; John Boswell, *Christianity, Social Tolerance, and Homosexuality: Gay People in Western Europe from the beginning of the Christian Era to the Fourteenth Century* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1980), 277.

reach of the Church to private behavior.¹⁵² Perhaps it was not only the threat of dishonor caused by the prostitutes' taunts that would have persuaded clerics to take a mistress, but the fact that rumors of sodomy could lead to public censorship by ecclesiastical and secular authorities. The keeping of a mistress was a lesser, and perhaps safer sin than the emasculating charge of sodomy. Additionally, by pointing to the clerics' defamation by prostitutes, Jacques successfully shifts the gaze away from the students' misdeeds to their own defamation by such scandalous accusations.

The Parisian prostitutes in the *Historia Occidentalis* threatened not just reputations but also impinged on spatial boundaries—directly so. Jacques explains that the scarcity of teaching space led to classes taking place above the brothels: “The masters would be lecturing above while the whores practiced their shameful profession below. The prostitutes would be quarreling with each other and their pimps in one part of the house while the clerics argued and disputed in the next room.”¹⁵³ This image of congested and contested space was perhaps intended to be humorous, but it also presented Jacques' readers with a polluted social order, in which the clerics' reputations were disparaged.¹⁵⁴ The other aspects of the clerics' masculinity—including their chastity—would not have outweighed the potential damage caused by the slander of sodomy.¹⁵⁵ The need for clerics to constantly reassure themselves about their own virility

¹⁵² Burgwinkle, *Sodomy, Masculinity, and Law*, 32; Boswell, *Christianity, Social Tolerance, and Homosexuality*, 277.

¹⁵³ Jacques de Vitry, *H. Occ.*, 91 : ‘In una autem et eadem domo scole erant superius, prostibula inferius. In parte superiori magistri legebant; in inferiori meretrices officia turpitudinis exercebant. Ex una parte meretrices inter se et cum lenonibus litigabant; ex alia parte disputantes et contentiose agentes clerici proclamabant.’

¹⁵⁴ Roberta Gilchrist notes that space is fundamental to the construction of gender and in the social classification of bodies, as space reproduces social order and its boundaries were guarded, “Medieval Bodies in the Material World,” *Framing Medieval Bodies*, eds. Kay, Sarah, and Miri Rubin (Manchester: Manchester University Press, 1994), 49.

¹⁵⁵ As Elliot notes, “The clergy who had struggled so hard to attain its new level of ritual purity, continued to be particularly sensitive to external sources of defilement,” *Fallen Bodies*, 65.

suggests that their honor remained grounded in normative masculine honor. While not entirely defined by it, this estimation of one's manhood included heteronormative sex.

Jacques' description of this chaotic cityscape fits the atmosphere of sectarianism that characterized the university in the late twelfth-century. But religious authors also used notions of Paris rhetorically to mean more than the geographical city. As John D. Cotts has shown in his careful analysis of the correspondence of John of Salisbury and Peter of Celle, "Paris," *schola*, and *disciplina* could be pregnant with other meanings.¹⁵⁶ Jacques' juxtaposition of clerics and prostitutes might have been simply rhetorical, relying on the trope of the city as a place of vice.¹⁵⁷ And even the image of the brothel provides an opportunity for moral and philosophical uplift. For it also serves as the backdrop to a celebration of the career of Peter the Chanter. After lamenting the dark times in Paris, Jacques concludes, "Nevertheless, the Lord kept for himself a few honest and God-fearing men among them, who did not stand in the path of sinners, and did not sit with the others in the chair of pestilence."¹⁵⁸ He then begins his presentation of the great works of Peter the Chanter.¹⁵⁹ The juxtaposition of clerics, prostitutes, and the infestation of sodomy, thus confirms the need for later reforms championed by Peter and Jacques himself.¹⁶⁰ For Jacques, the scholastic brothel functions as a *rue Pigalle avant la lettre*. It offered the stark contrast when set next to his high praise of his beloved mentor and teacher. Jacques, therefore, likely drew upon (and embellished) his own experience of university life, taking the practical

¹⁵⁶ John D. Cotts, "Monks and Clerks in Search of the *Beata Schola*: Peter of Celle's Warning to John of Salisbury Reconsidered," *Teaching and Learning in Northern Europe, 1000-1200*, eds. Sally N. Vaughn, and Jay Rubenstein (Turnhout: Brepols, 2006), 277.

¹⁵⁷ See: Little, *Religious Poverty and the Profit Economy*. Jan Vandeburie argues that, viewed from the framework of Jacques' failures at the Fifth Crusade, Jacques de Vitry's criticism of Paris, mirrors his own vices and vanity, "'A Scabby Goat?' A View of the Student Life in Paris c. 1200," Presented at the Medieval and Early Modern Festival, University of Kent, Canterbury (June 2017).

¹⁵⁸ Jacques de Vitry, *H.Occ.*, 93 : 'Paucos tamen inter eos dominus sibi reliquerat uiros honestos et timoratos, qui in uia peccatorum non steterunt, et in cathedra pestilentie cum aliis non sederunt.'

¹⁵⁹ As Baldwin notes it was these masters who "possessed full authority over their students," "Masters at Paris," 143.

¹⁶⁰ Jacques de Vitry, *H.Occ.*, 91.

predicaments of scarce classroom space, bellicose students, and heckling prostitutes, to place Paris in a larger cosmic battle of good versus evil in which Peter is envisioned as Moses figure leading his students, including Jacques, to the Promised Land.¹⁶¹

Real Men Preach

As much as the young student Jacques may have wanted to fight on the crusade, the bishop Jacques could not. But he could preach, a style of battle for which his instruction had trained him.¹⁶² While we do not know the exact dates for Jacques' education, the title *magister* confirms his reception of his license to teach.¹⁶³ After his ordination in 1210, documentary evidence shows he was active in diocese of Liège from 1211-1216, during which time he entered a community of Augustinian canons in Oignies (1211).¹⁶⁴ Jacques reports that it was the rumors of the miracles and piety of the laywoman Marie D'Oignies which led him to this region, and he credits her with his decision to secure a license to preach.¹⁶⁵ Jacques composed her *vita* in 1213 at the request of Bishop Fulk of Toulouse, revealing his desire to promote these communities of women as legitimate, but also his effort to use her life as an instrument against heresy.¹⁶⁶

¹⁶¹ Ibid.

¹⁶² Fletcher suggests the use of the term "masculinity" is inadequate as it is anachronistic and not found in the sources, but instead recommends talking about "manhood." I use these both terms to talk about characteristics associated with being male, "Whig Interpretation of Masculinity," 61-2. Smith points out that the language of war "served as a lingua franca" for warriors and monks as well as other ranks of churchmen, "Saints in Shining Armor," 576. See her in depth treatment of this idea in *War and the Making of Medieval Monastic Culture* (Rochester, NY: Boydell Press, 2011).

¹⁶³ Benton, "Qui étaient les parents de Jacques de Vitry ?" 40. The *L'Historia Foundationis Ecclesae Beati Nicolai Oigniacensis* states Jacques was at the University of Paris when Jerusalem was captured in 1187, *HNFO*, 169.

¹⁶⁴ Hinnebusch, *H. Occ.*, 4; Benton, "Qui étaient les parents de Jacques de Vitry?" 40; Édouard Poncelet, *Actes des princes-évêques de Liège. Hugues de Pierrepont: 1200-1229* (Bruxelles: Palais des Académies, 1941).

¹⁶⁵ Hinnebusch, *H. Occ.*, 4. Evidence shows he confirmed a convent in Aywieres in 1211, Ursmer Berlière, "Jacques de Vitry ses relations avec Abbayes d'Aywieres et Doorezeele," *Revue bénédictine* 27 (1910), 185-6.

¹⁶⁶ See Walter Simons, *City of Ladies Beguine Communities in the Medieval Low Countries, 1200-1565* (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2001). Brenda Bolton addresses the practical concerns of these communities to exercise their vision of holiness given the fiscal constraints and limited capacity of convents, "Mulieres Sanctae," *Women in Medieval Society*, Eds Brenda Bolton and Susan Mosher Stuard (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 1976): 141-58; Simons, "Beginnings: Naming Beguines in the Southern Low Countries, 1200-1250," *Labels and Libels: Naming Beguines in Northern Medieval Europe*, eds. Böhringer, Letha,

Together with Fulk of Toulouse, Jacques preached against heretics this very same year, leading to his election as Bishop of Acre shortly after the death of Innocent III.¹⁶⁷ Preaching and composing preaching materials were a large part of how Jacques climbed the ecclesiastical ladder and gained his fame. Jacques had become widely known for his preaching campaigns, and his own estimation of preaching reveals that he considered the responsibilities of the pulpit to be of utmost importance. The public performance of sermons provided an arena to display erudition, status, and the power of persuasion—all markers of medieval manhood¹⁶⁸

Like his beloved mentor, Jacques not surprisingly saw preaching as central to the pastoral mission, but he went even further by identifying preaching as an expression of masculine identity. He did not attempt to disassociate the clerical life from secular notions of virility by elevating chastity and spiritual perfection, as was common. Instead, he saw in his clerical duties a hawkish outlet for these masculine impulses. For example, in a sermon addressed to clerics, Jacques interprets divine preaching as a sword (*ferrum*) that cuts down the thickets (Is. 10:34).¹⁶⁹ He notes that preachers who do not burn with passion will not kindle others, leaving them unable to create or feed their spiritual sons and daughters (with reference to Hosea 9.14).¹⁷⁰ While Jacques attributes to preachers the ability to impregnate, give birth and

Jennifer Kolpacoff Deane, and H. Van Engen (Turnhout: Brepols, 2014), 18; Kienzle, “Preaching the Cross,” 28; Roukis-Stern, “The Tale of Two Dioceses,” 37; Bynum, “Female Body,” 195.

¹⁶⁷ Hinnebusch, *H. Occ.*, 5.

¹⁶⁸ For an examination on gender and rhetoric see: Jill Ross, “The Dazzling Sword of Language: Masculinity and Persuasion in Classical and Medieval Rhetoric,” in *The Ends of The Body: Identity and Community in Medieval Culture*, eds. Jill Ross and Suzanne Conklin Akbari, (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 2013): 153-74.

¹⁶⁹ Jacques de Vitry, *Ad status*, IX.1.10-13: ‘*Ferro* quidem diuine predicationis *subuertuntur condensa saltus*, id est infructuosa multitudo radice mala succisa in bonam terram transplantatur.’ This echoes Gregory the Great’s *Moralia* on Job 28.2: “the iron is taken out of the earth,” quoted also in the opening passage of the *Pariens scientiarum* of 1231, Wei, *Intellectual Culture*, 105-7.

¹⁷⁰ *Ibid.*, 21-6: ‘*Quidem tamen ita steriles sunt quod doctrina sua sterilitatem non auferunt: qui enim non ardent, non incendunt. . . ut scilicet filios spirituales non gignant et, si generent, unde nutriant non habeant eo quod ubera eorum arentia sint, quia humore gratie carent.*’ See also his sermon to theologians and preachers where he expounds on Ez. 47.8, noting that sinners are “*steriles et ponderosos*,” *Ad status*, XX.1.20.

nurse, his reference to preaching as *ferrum* and his stress on the passion of fiery sermons distinguishes his calling as a distinctly masculine one. This image of preaching as parallel to sexual potency is made even more explicit an *exemplum*. Here Jacques compared preaching to the conjugal obligations of a husband to his wife. A preacher who neglects his duty to preach, he explained, was like a stupid and wicked man (*stulto et malicioso*), who in hatred for his wife castrated himself (*genitalia sibi abscidit*), thus “he injured himself first before he harmed others.”¹⁷¹ This allegory, in which the *ecclesia* is imagined as bride, implicitly alludes to generative power of the preacher to bear fruit, and his responsibility to guard against the infidelity of his wife, who in her dissatisfaction might turn to the open arms of heretics. In other words, the pastor’s duty to the Church was as a husband to his wife.¹⁷²

This theme of the Church as mystical bride aligns with other prominent theologians and preachers. Bernard of Clairvaux’s *Sermons on the Canticle of Canticles*, for example, interpreted the Lover and Beloved as representatives of the spiritual union of man with God. For Bernard, the bride was the Church and the groom Christ, and this interpretation served to instruct men on the advantages of a heavenly spouse over an imperfect earthly one, and impress the need for prudent living and careful study to achieve this union.¹⁷³ Pope Innocent III’s *On the Four Kinds of Marriage* (1191-98) continued this theme, emphasizing mystical marriage as superior to

¹⁷¹ Jacques de Vitry, *Exempla*, XXII, 7: ‘Si enim propter odium et indignationem [prelatus] subtrahat populo predicationem, similis est cuidam stulto et malicioso homini qui, in odio uxoris sue, genitalia sibi abscidit et ita prius sibi quam aliis nocuit.’ Also fascinating in that this emphasizes the conjugal responsibilities of husbands to their wives.

¹⁷² For examination on this role exercised by kings and monks fashioned as protectors of the kingdom, see Dawn Marie Hayes, “Christian Sanctuary and Repository of France’s Political Culture: The Construction of Holiness and Masculinity at the Royal Abbey of Saint-Denis 987-1328,” *Holiness and Masculinity in the Middle Ages*, eds. P. H. Cullum and Katherine J. Lewis (Cardiff: University of Wales Press, 2005), 127-42.

¹⁷³ John Bugge, *Virginitas: An Essay in the History of a Medieval Ideal*, 90; Bernard of Clairvaux, *Sermons on the Canticle of Canticles*, trans. Ailbe J. Luddy (Ann Arbor, Mich: University Microfilms International, 1978); Wei, *Intellectual Culture*, 61. For the counterarguments, which saw Christ—not the bishop—as the only bridegroom of the Church see: Thibodeaux, *Manly Priest*, 88-93.

corporeal marriage.¹⁷⁴ Jacques, however, applied this motif to pastoral responsibilities: “the prelate who leaves the people in error shall be punished more than everyone else, for his blood will be sought by the hand of all.”¹⁷⁵ This echoes the obligations of abbot to his monks in the Rule of Saint Benedict: “Let the Abbot always bear in mind that at the dread Judgment of God there will be an examination of these two matters: his teaching and the obedience of his disciples.”¹⁷⁶ Jacques transformed these duties and spiritual ramifications of a father to his children to that of a husband to his wife.¹⁷⁷ Instead of depicting this as a mystical marriage, Jacques presented sex as a necessary responsibility of marriage and a useful metaphor for a preacher’s relationship with the Church.¹⁷⁸ This example suggests Jacques did not separate his masculine identity from concepts of sexually virility, and but rather in this case, he embraced the idea of the preacher’s relationship to the community as matrimonial, the connection indissoluble.¹⁷⁹

Jacques’ preacher imagined as an obstinate and foolish husband, however, chooses castration over his matrimonial obligations. The reference to genitalia and castration was more than just an evocative image. Used as a common penalty, including for sexual offenses,

¹⁷⁴ Innocent III, *On the Four Kinds of Marriage*, in *Spiritualität Heute und Gestern I* [Analecta Cartusiana 35] (Salzburg: Institut für Angelistik und Amerikanistik Universität Salzburg, 1982), 13.

¹⁷⁵ Jacques de Vitry, *Exempla*, XXII, 8 : ‘Et prelati, qui populum errore relinquit, plus omnibus aliis punietur, quia sanguis omnium manu eius requiretur.’

¹⁷⁶ *Rule of St. Benedict* 2:6: ‘Memor semper abbas quia doctrinae suae vel discipulorum oboedientiae, utrarumque rerum, in tremendo iudicio Dei facienda erit discussio.’ <http://www.benediktiner.de> Accessed on Oct. 26, 2017.

¹⁷⁷ Compare this with the maternal imagery and the metaphor used by “Augustine, Gregory, Caesarius of Arles...that the preacher is the ‘mother of souls,’” Nicole Bérou, “The Right of Women to Give Religious Instruction in the Thirteenth Century,” in *Women Preachers and Prophets through Two Millennia of Christianity*, eds. Kienzle, Beverly Mayne Kienzle and Pamela J. Walker (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1998), 140.

¹⁷⁸ He does refer to spiritual wives and children in a sermon to preachers and theologians where he says that the wives in Jeremiah 29.5-6, Leah and Rachel, represent the active and contemplative lives or the two Testaments, from which sons and daughters are chastely produced and the sinners of either sex are to be turned to God, whether appointed as greater and perfected “sons” or by the lesser and incomplete “daughters,” Jacques de Vitry, *Ad status*, XXI.17.

¹⁷⁹ In other stories, Jacques notes affairs with priests, with one leading an illegitimate child, therefore metaphors of priests’ virility also had literal examples in the community, *Exempla*, 88, 97.

castration was a punishment that would have been known to audiences, even witnessed by them, making the notion of self-castration even more powerful.¹⁸⁰ Consequently, a cleric's refusal to preach, in Jacques' opinion, was as emasculating and as publicly shameful as castration.¹⁸¹ Instead of elevating the chastity of preachers, Jacques frames preaching itself as an act of virility, and therefore a potential source of honor or humiliation.

The Mirror of Men: Mala Mulier

Marriage symbolism, such as Jacques incorporated, reached a turning point during Innocent III's papacy. The rise of mendicant preaching increased the frequency of public messages regarding marriage. Message in turn influenced social practice, in particular regarding the legal application of concepts of consummation and indissolubility.¹⁸² David D'Avray relates this transformation to the rise of clerical celibacy that resulted in less empathetic attitudes towards adulterous men and stricter enforcement of the ideals of marriage.¹⁸³ While these events are coterminous, it appears that clerical chastity and sacramental marriage were part of a much larger web of reform initiatives that sought to move theological ideas, including prohibitions on usury, investiture, and simony, "out of the ivory tower and into the world of power politics."¹⁸⁴ Jacques' presentation of the priest as husband to the church as examined in the following

¹⁸⁰ Stefan Meysman, "Degrading the Male Body: Manhood and Conflict in the High-medieval Low Countries," *Gender and History* 28.2 (August 2016): 367-86. Thibodeaux, *Manly Priest*, 34; Klaus van Eickels, "Gendered Violence: Castration and Blinding as Punishment for Treason in Normandy and Anglo-Norman England," *Gender and History* 16.3 (2004), 588. Besides punishment, castration would also have been familiar to Jacques' audience as an agricultural practice.

¹⁸¹ This focus on evaluation of the corporeal body would have also contrasted with the Cathar's rejection of marriage and the body. While their leaders boasted less attachment to their physical bodies and refused to eat food created through copulation (eggs, milk, and meat), here we have a strong reprimand against rejection of the body, Barber, *Cathars*, 25.

¹⁸² David D'Avray, *Medieval Marriage: Symbolism and Society*, (New York: Oxford University Press, 2008), 91.

¹⁸³ D'Avray admits there can be no concrete evidence to prove this claim, *Ibid.*, 91.

¹⁸⁴ *Ibid.*, 104.

examples, therefore, was part of larger thirteenth-century preaching trends, found also in mendicant sermons, that favored marriage symbolism.¹⁸⁵

In one such sermon Jacques described a place in France where bacon was hung and the newly married men took a vow and if they can keep it for a whole year they can bring “home the bacon.”¹⁸⁶ He explained that alas the bacon had remained untouched for ten years. While this punchline appears at first glance as a preliminary story to chastise argumentative and fickle wives or naïve newlyweds, Jacques instead concluded this moral tale by lamenting how few men “cleave to their wives in faith and love as Jesus instructed.”¹⁸⁷ Even in stories of *malae mulieres*, it is often the husband’s failures that are the target of censure. For example, Jacques reported that there was a wife who had been beaten by her husband for being too opinionated, specifically over the best way to cook a rabbit.¹⁸⁸ To seek her vengeance, she petitioned the king, who had fallen gravely ill. She explained to him that “her husband is the best doctor, but he conceals and hides his wisdom and he never wants to help someone unless forced through fear and beatings.”¹⁸⁹ Despite the husband’s continued pleas denying that he was a doctor, the king heeded the wife’s advice. Thus, Jacques explains, this *mala mulier* achieved her retribution as

¹⁸⁵ Unfortunately, D’Avray does not include sermons of regular canons in his assessment of these trends, leaving a lacuna in his assessment of marriage sermons.

¹⁸⁶ Jacques de Vitry, *Feriales et Communes* in the *Faces of Women*, 155 : ‘Aliquando transiui per quandam uillam in Franciam ubi suspenderant pernam seu bachonem in platea hac condicione ut qui vellet iuramento firmare, quod uno integro anno post contractum matrimonium permansisset cum uxore, ita quod de matrimonio non penituisset, bachonem haberet.’

¹⁸⁷ Ibid., 155: ‘Ecce quam pauci hodie uxoribus adherent fide et dilectione sicut instituit Dominus noster Iesus Cristus qui est benedictus in secula seculorum.’

¹⁸⁸ Jacques de Vitry, *Exempla*, CCXXXVII, 99.

¹⁸⁹ Ibid.: ‘Habeo maritum qui optimus est medicus, sed celat et abscondit sapientiam suam nec nunquam vult aliquem iuvare nisi timore et verberibus inductus.’

her husband was beaten repeatedly.¹⁹⁰ While the woman's wickedness is part of this tale, it is the husband's own excessive violence over trivial culinary preferences that led to his demise.

Jacques often highlighted in his moral tales the charitable acts of virtuous women, set in contrast with their husband's less honorable behavior. Sometimes this sacrificial love could be mistaken for impropriety. For example, Jacques explained that there was a noble woman who was "very compassionate to the sick and especially to the lepers," but her husband, a powerful and noble knight, despised them and would not allow them near his home.¹⁹¹ While her husband was away, the noble woman encountered a leper wailing at the threshold, but he refused to accept her charity unless she let him inside. Although she feared her husband would kill her and the leper, she eventually carried the leper into the house. The leper still refused nourishment, "unless first she took him into the very bedroom of her husband and into his very bed."¹⁹² Jacques noted that the woman, "since she was filled completely with the spirit of piety and compassion" acquiesced to his demands and even covered his leprous body with a fur blanket.¹⁹³ The husband then returned from hunting and although his wife tried to dissuade him from entering their bedroom and discovering the leper in his bed, he burst in angrily only to back out, telling the wife, "You have done so well in preparing my bed in the best way but where did you find such perfumes? The whole room is covered with such a sweet odor that it seemed to me that

¹⁹⁰ Ibid.: 'Unde rex precepit eum fortiter verberari. Et cum nec si induci posset iterum verberatus tandem a conspectu regis ejectus est, et ita mala mulier verberari fecit maritum suum.'

¹⁹¹ Jacques de Vitry, *Exempla*, XCV, 44: 'Novi quondam nobilem dominam que valde compatiebatur infirmis et maximo leprosis. Vir autem eius miles, potens et nobilis a Deo, abhominabatur leprosos, quod eos videre non poterat nec eos infra septa domus sue intrare permittebat.'

¹⁹² Ibid.: 'Cumque rogaret ut refectionem reciperet, nullo modo acquiescere voluit, nisi prius in propria camera viri sui et in lecto eius domina ipsum ferret, ibi enim desiderabat quiescere antequam manducaret.'

¹⁹³ Ibid.: 'Cumque illa sicut tota spiritu pietatis et compassionis affluebat gemitus et lacrimas leprosi ferre non posset, tandem victa precibus eum in lecto suo quiescere fecit, pulvinar suum sub capite eius subponens et coopertorio grisio corpus leprosi tegens.'

I am in heaven.”¹⁹⁴ When she revealed to him the miraculous disappearance of the leper, the husband, “by the merits of his wife turned to God and began to lead a life no less religious than his wife.”¹⁹⁵ Jacques praised the woman’s willingness to disobey her husband, even risking the appearance of scandal, for the sake of obedience to God.¹⁹⁶

Outside the bonds of marriage, Jacques utilized the voice of women to address the faults of men more generally. In one humorous episode, he detailed how the innocence of a “poor small woman” served to rebuke a corrupt judge. The lowly woman was told that she would not receive justice from a certain vain judge unless his hands were greased: “So the woman innocently, only understanding what was said literally, approached the judge with pig oil . . . [and] with everyone watching, she began to smear his hands.” She explained to the bewildered judge that she sought justice from his aptly greased hands, and the judge “blushed because he was watched and ridiculed by all,” his shame exposed by the oblivious woman.¹⁹⁷ Thereby Jacques offered strong criticism against the unrighteous behavior of powerful men, safely delivered through the words of seemingly ignorant and powerless women.¹⁹⁸

¹⁹⁴ Ibid., 45: ‘Modo benefecisti que lectum meum optime preparasti, sed miror ubi tales species aromaticas reperisti quibus tota camera ita respersa est odore suavitatis quod visum est mihi quod fuerim in paradiso.’

¹⁹⁵ Ibid.: ‘...et meritis uxoris sue ita ad Deum conversus ducere cepit vitam non minus religiosam quam uxor.’

¹⁹⁶ Such example recall the biblical story of Abigail’s aide to David and his men in defiance of her husband Nabal’s wishes (1 Sam. 25).

¹⁹⁷ Jacques de Vitry, *Exempla* XXXVIII, 15: ‘Audivi de quodam iudice iniquo et venali, cum pauper muliercula jus suum ab ipso optinere non valeret, dixit quidam mulierei, “Judex iste talis est quod, nisi manus eius unguantur, nunquam ab ipso justicia optinetur.” Mulier autem simpliciter, et ad litteram quod ille dixerat intelligens, cum sagime seu uncto porcino ad consistorium iudicis accedens, cunctis videntibus, manum eius ungere cepit. Cum autem queret iudex, “Mulier quid facis?” Respondit: “Domine, dictum est mihi quia, nisi manus vestras unxissem, justiciam a vobis consequi non possem.” At ille confuses erubuit eo quod ab omnibus notaretur et irideretur.’

¹⁹⁸ For a succinct discussion on the polemical fears of female authority in preaching or correcting men, rooted in their belief in their inferiority and natural sinfulness see: Beverly Mayne Kienzle, “The Prostitute Preacher: Patterns of Polemic against Medieval Waldensian Women Preachers,” in *Women Preachers and Prophets through Two Millennia of Christianity*, eds. Kienzle and Walker (Berkeley, CA: University of California Press, 1998).

Jacques' use of these imaginary women drew upon the biblical trope of the weak confounding the strong (1 Cor 1:27). Jacques' use of Ezekiel 23 in a model sermon regarding the prophecy of Olla and Oliba reveals his efforts to highlight shared weakness between the clergy and laity. The prophet Ezekiel explains that the Lord spoke to him regarding the fate of Samaria and Jerusalem through a metaphor of two whoring sisters. Olla, the elder sister, represents Samaria, with Jerusalem, represented by Oliba, the younger sister. Both had prostituted themselves to Egypt, but God rescued them and their illegitimate sons and daughters. The sisters later forgot their vows to God and returned to their previous vices. Olla committed fornication with her numerous Assyrian lovers, and consequently the Lord gave her over to them to be killed by the sword. Oliba in turn sought to out-do her sister's adulterous acts and walked proudly in her sister's footsteps.¹⁹⁹ Therefore, the prophecy concludes, the younger sister and her offspring will also perish at the hands of her lovers. It describes their fates in grueling detail. In this way, "all women may learn not to commit the same crime as those."²⁰⁰ Jacques asserts that with this prophecy God, through Samaria/Olla and Jerusalem/Oliba, was referring to the "the laity and clergy. . . [and] through the story of these two sisters certainly God wants us to understand the weaknesses (*effeminatos*) are in both sorts of men and on that account, they are called by the name feminine (*femineo*)".²⁰¹ Jacques passes over the connection to the inherent wickedness of women stated explicitly in Ezekiel to focus on universal weakness of men, clerics and laity, admonishing them to consider their mutual frailty.²⁰² As Miller has judiciously pointed out, an

¹⁹⁹ Compare with Jacques' use of a similar trope in his exempla of an unfaithful wife whose husband redeems once but she departs again, Jacques de Vitry, *Exempla*, CCLIX.

²⁰⁰ Ezekiel 23:48, 'Discent omnes mulieres ne faciant secundum scelus earum.'

²⁰¹ Jacques de Vitry, *Exempla*, XVI, 5-6 : 'Per has utique duas sorores intelligere voluit effeminatos in utroque populo et idcirco nomine femineo appellantur.'

²⁰² I have found limited references to these sisters by other authors but the following two offer an interesting contrast. Rupert of Deuz (b. 1075) interpreted Olla and Oliba as representing women who killed God's prophets in the Old and New Testament: 'Pulchre ad hunc sensum accedit quod et apud oollam id est samariam mulier iezabel priores prophetas interfecit et apud oolibam id est hierusalem mulier herodias nouissimum prophetarum et plus

important aspect of the Gregorian Reform was the “competition between clerical and lay males over degrees of maleness,” leading inadvertently to a rise in misogynistic discourse.²⁰³ But here Jacques does not pit lay and religious men against each other, or capitalize on the opportunity to denigrate women’s understood inclination to sin. Instead, like the weak women of his *exempla*, these biblical sisters point to men’s *feminitas*.

While a champion of Fourth Lateran reform program, Jacques’ exegesis of Ezekiel corresponds to the defense for clerical marriage found in the *Treatise on Grace* (c.1102-1110) by the Norman Anonymous. This treatise argued for the similarity between religious and lay men as they were made from the same sinful seed of Adam and, therefore, marriage was necessary for their protection from unnatural lusts and achievement of manly honor.²⁰⁴ Taken with Jacques’ somewhat sympathetic approach to clerics taking concubines to avoid charges of sodomy in Paris, this serves as further evidence that despite a renewed effort at clerical reforms, “lay discourses of masculinity remained hegemonic.”²⁰⁵

Jacques’ construction of masculinity in his pastoral literature emphasized the obligations of husbands to their wives and clerics to their Church. The rules of a good spouse, therefore, remained a standard for both religious and laymen, and the censorious wife served to reprimand

quam prophetam iohannem occidit,’ *Commentaria in duodecim prophetas minores, Zachariam*, 2.737.10, *Library of Latin Texts Online-A* (Brepols, 2017). And Anthony of Padua (b.1195) interpreted the sisters as symbolizing the desire of money and luxury in a sermon on the conversion of St. Peter ‘Sorores peccatoris sunt molles cogitationes mentis, quae ex semine diabolicae suggestionis oriuntur, de quibus Ezechiel XXIII: Duae mulieres filiae unius matris fuerunt; et fornicatae sunt in Aegypto. Nomina earum, Oolla maior, et Ooliba soror eius minor. Duae sunt speciales cogitationes, quibus hodie maxime mens peccatoris corrumpitur, scilicet cupiditas pecuniae et delectatio luxuriae, quae sunt velut duae sorores fornicariae. Item, uxor peccatoris, mundi vanitas,’ *Sermones festivi, sermo in conuersione beati Pauli*, 2.6.88.21, *Library of Latin Texts Online-B* (Brepols, 2017).

²⁰³ Miller, “Narratives of Episcopal Holiness,” 28.

²⁰⁴ Thibodeaux, *Manly Priest*, 95; Anne Llewellyn Barstow, *Married Priests and Reforming Papacy: The Eleventh-Century* (New York: E. Mellen Press, 1982), 121. Murray explains that twelfth and thirteenth reforms sought to synthesize monastic and cleric life, and that this privileging of chastity threatened to obscure gender difference throughout society, “Masculinizing Religious Life,” 26

²⁰⁵ Miller, “Narratives of Episcopal Holiness,” 28.

and ridicule both types of faithless husbands.²⁰⁶ In these episodes, therefore, the loss of manhood, as seen in castration and oath-breaking, underlines a worldview in which social expectations of men hinge on their obligations to women. These examples also suggest that Jacques was addressing and at the same time exploiting a certain instability and insecurity of his male audiences. By using guileless, weak, and in many cases, voiceless women, Jacques criticized male audiences for falling short of Christian ideals—highlighting their own *feminitas*. By aligning Christian virtues with secular notions of masculinity or *virtus*, Jacques' sermons combined the varied expectations of honorable manhood to stress being a good husband as its most essential and unifying standard. If Jacques' imaginary women primarily serve as mirrors to men's shortcomings, there remains an ambiguous tension with his dedication to the communities of real women he ministered to, and reportedly relied upon.²⁰⁷

Readers of Exempla

By looking briefly at readership of these pastoral materials, the contradictory treatments of women across Jacques works can be, to a degree, reconciled. While these sermon collections served to educate religious men, their indirect audience was the communities they served, both lay and religious. Several religious orders acquired Jacques' sermon literature. The manuscripts' production and distribution in the Southern Low Countries, for example, followed the networks created by old Roman and medieval roads connecting Oignies, Namur, Huy, Liège, Brabant, and

²⁰⁶ Neil, *Masculine Self*, 100.

²⁰⁷ This is noted also in Thomas of Cantimpré's *exemplum* which shows evidence of a combined devotional and scholastic reading practices aimed towards pastoral care while also including holy women who are "narratively present, but only as object," Robert Sweetman, "Thomas of Cantimpré: Performative Reading and Pastoral Care," in *Performance and Transformation: New Approaches to Late Medieval Spirituality*, Eds. Mary A. Suydam and Joanna E. Ziegler (New York: St. Martin's Press, 1999), 154.

Laon.²⁰⁸ Not surprisingly, communities of canons regular feature largely in the record. Jacques began as a Augustinian canon regular himself, and sent copies of his sermons to friends in Oignies. Canons, in contrast to monks, self-identified as teachers whose vocation required that they edify others through word and example. Jacques' pastoral works, however, have also been identified as originating in the libraries of the Benedictines, Cistercians, Premonstransians, Carthusians, and lesser known orders like the Crutched Friars, suggesting their popularity across monastic communities. These religious houses were interested particularly in copying Jacques' sermons rather than his histories.²⁰⁹

Looking specifically at copies of the *exempla*, we see that these stories concluded the *ad status* sermons but also traveled separately, and later generations added detailed table of contents to these sermon stories. More so than any other collection of Jacques' sermons, scribes sometimes copied only sections or just the *exempla* alone.²¹⁰ For example, Harley MS 463 is a late thirteenth-century manuscript originally housed in the priory of St. Mary and St. John the Baptist of Lanthony near Gloucestershire, and was composed around the time Godfrey Gifford bishop of Worcester visited (1276). It contains 24 folios with 215 of Jacques' *exempla* laid out for easy consultation, including red rubrics displaying short subtitles citing the central character or theme of the narrative, making it easier for readers to find the specific *exempla* or particular topics they were seeking.²¹¹

²⁰⁸ These are also the same regions where the Beguines first were established: Huy, Liège, Nivelles, Oignies, Liège, and Borgloom, and Sint-Truiden, Simons, *City of Ladies*, 45.

²⁰⁹ I have found 26 extant manuscripts which either include a complete collection of Jacques' sermons or selections of sermons, and only six manuscripts that contain his histories.

²¹⁰ In the manuscripts I have consulted, Jacques' four sermon collections most often were each copied individually as complete volumes, either stand alone or as composite collection, with the exception of individual sermons—most often from the *ad status* collection—extracted and copied into another compilations.

²¹¹ Compare this to Liège MS 54, a fifteenth-century composite text from the Benedictine Abbey of St. Trond, which includes “*exempla diversa*” (f. 252) and selections of Jacques *exempla* (f. 296r). Each small narrative story begins with a red initial placed after the subtitle which is underlined in red. There are no marginal notations.

These religious houses were part of larger networks as well as secular communities, and it appears that Jacques' role in pastoral care especially as a preacher, remained a driving force in copying his work. Therefore, these sermons which champion the virtues of celibacy and encourage men to love their wives were read by both cloistered men and canons serving lay communities. The diversity of messages—with their seemingly ambiguous treatment of women—likely contributed to their popularity as different readers could search these stories and find stories that suited their needs.²¹² Regardless, the manuscript tradition suggests that the treatment of women, whether guileless or wicked, served as an effective mirror to powerful men, reflecting their moral deficiencies back at them.

While Jacques often relied on humorous examples of men's moral failures exposed by guileless women, men's failure to protect women came with very serious consequences not only for the lives of women, but also for the reputations of men. For example, the numerous accusations of effeminacy that reforming monks and clerics hurled at one another included a failure to protect women under their care. The reformer Arnulf, the bishop of Lisieux, attacked Gerald the Bishop of Angouleme (1102-1136) for his complicity in the rape of an abbess by an archdeacon under his authority. Calling this rape an act of incest, Arnulf employed the accusation to stress Gerald's inability to live up to masculine standards of self-control and proper governance.²¹³ Seen also in the *vita* of the same period, authors praised armored religious men for their ability to fight manfully to protect their spiritual sons and daughters. In the case of Stephen of Muret, his hagiographer notes that the women's protection alone "attests and

²¹² Muessig, *Faces of Women*; Muessig, "Jacques de Vitry's *Sermones Feriales et Communes*: Text and Context," in Hermand, Xavier, and Jacqueline Hamesse, *De L'Homélie au Sermon: Histoire de la Prédication Médiévale : Actes du Colloque International de Louvain-la-Neuve* (Louvain-la-Neuve: Institut d'Études Médiévales de l'Université Catholique de Louvain, 1992): 61-7.

²¹³ Thibodeaux, *Manly Priest*, 32.

demonstrate the proof’ of their protector’s holiness.²¹⁴ As we will see in the next chapter, the work of Jacques and his contemporaries show a pervasive anxiety over men’s failure to protect women—especially holy women—from defilement.

Conclusions

From the taunts of prostitutes and school boys to the moralizing tales of wives and husbands, masculinity and femininity remained part of a web of hierarchical ideologies.²¹⁵ The masculinity of clerics was not created apart from deep-seated notions of virility, as they too, like knights, needed to defend their honor, show prowess, and cultivate status among their peers. Cultural context, life stage, geography, and status all impinged on masculine identity.²¹⁶ As Derek Neal suggests, medieval male social behavior was about amicability between men in mutually sustaining relationships, but Jacques’ treatment of masculinity here has shown that notions of medieval womanhood also played an important role in the demarcation and definition of a “real man,” even a real man pledged to celibacy²¹⁷ Jacques presented clerical masculinity as fundamentally connected to a cleric’s responsibility to fight for the honor of his Lady, the Church. Preaching, in his view, exemplified this virile role, and successful preaching reaffirmed popularity, authority, and power—as he had discovered through his own experiences. Jacques intuited that whether religious or lay, masculinity was a multifaceted category that needed to be

²¹⁴ Stephen of Lissac, *Vita Stephani de Mureto*, PL 204, col 1073, discussed in Smith, “Saints in Shining Armor,” 592.

²¹⁵ Cordelia Beattie explains, citing Patricia Hill Collins, that using a concept of the “matrix of domination” accounts for the multiple ways that people experience gender, race, class, sexuality depending on their position in all of those categories,” “Introduction: Gender, Power, and Difference,” 2. See also Rubin, “Person in the Form,” 100-22.

²¹⁶ J.E. Riches and Sarah Salih, “Introduction,” in *Gender and Holiness: Men, Women, and Saints in Late Medieval Europe* (London: Routledge, 2002), 3-4; Jacqueline Murray, “Masculinizing Religious Life,” 24.

²¹⁷ Neal suggests that masculinity depended on the agreement of other men: “Being a man meant being present, visible, accepted among and interacting with a community of other males in the formal and informal structures of a man’s immediate community.” Especially insightful is his approach to the “social world as scaffolded by service,” which avoids strict and one-dimensional hierarchical labels such as merchant, noble, priest, and peasant, *Masculine Self*, 7, 24.

proven, confirmed, and reinforced over time. Rather than episodes of crisis or moments of anxiety, the intersectional quality of masculinity therefore suggests that as a category it was fundamentally unstable.²¹⁸ As his portrayal of Paris reveals, the manhood of clerics could be undermined and ridiculed, even by women of ill-repute, confirming that continuous struggle—and losses—against lust was an essential component of maintaining clerical masculinity. In only three years, Jacques went from preaching against heretics in France to arriving in Acre as a newly consecrated bishop (1216). It was in this new role in a far-off land, that Jacques would try and prove himself on the most masculine of battlefields—the crusades.

For Jacques lust was a universal test, a point which he illustrates meaningfully in a story of the Devil’s nine daughters.²¹⁹ Each daughter, disfigured with blackened skin, a scabbed body, and a putrid stench, embodied a vice matching the class of her soon-to-be husband:

The Devil married his daughter Simony to the prelates and clergy, Hypocrisy to the monks and heretics, Rape to the soldiers, Usury to the burghers, Trickery to the merchants, Sacrilege to the farmers refusing to pay the tithe to the ministers of the church, Dishonest Work to the laborers, and Rich Arrogance and Unnecessary Clothing was married to the women. The ninth daughter, Lust, did not want to be married to any one class, but gave herself to all like a vile harlot.²²⁰

Like the *ad status* sermons they accompany, this *exemplum* demarcates society—largely gendered male—by profession, pinpointing their unique moral pitfalls associated with their

²¹⁸ Rubin suggests this anxiety is underlined by the body’s biological diversity, “Person in the Form,” 110.

²¹⁹ Augustine of Hippo’s notion of lust identified it as a disorderly mental emotion that can overwhelm reason and ought to be overcome by the will in this life and will eventually be fully stamped out in the next, *The City of God against the Pagans*, vol. 4, The Loeb Classical Library (Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 1957), 14.3.

²²⁰ Jacques de Vitry, *Exempla*, CCXLIV, 101-2: ‘Ex his autem filiabus octo maritavit totidem generibus hominum, symoniam prelatis et clericis; ypocrisim monachis et falsis religiosis; rapinam militibus; usuram burgensibus; dolum mercatoribus; sacrilegum agricolis, qui decimas Deo sacratas auferunt ecclesiarum ministris; fictum servitium operariis; superbiam et superfluum habitum mulieribus. Nonam autem, id est luxuriam, nulli voluit maritari, sed tanquam meretrix improba omnibus generibus hominum se prostituit, omnibus commiscens, nulli generi hominum parcens.’

occupations.²²¹ But he presented lust as the great equalizer, connected here with both men and women.²²² As the following chapter on Jacques' relationship with holy women will show, while the battle against lust was construed as universal, the individual manifestation of this vice was imagined along gendered and class-based lines. Rather than an either/or narrative of female oppression or empowerment, the interdependent relationship of clerics and holy women reveals a more complicated view of gender identity marked by codependence. Jacques' connection to the famous holy women of the Southern Low Countries bolstered his cache as a preacher, but their affection for him also affirmed his integrity as a man.

²²¹ Particular vices pertaining to status also appears in the story of a priest who absolved sins pertaining to each profession in his congregation, but no one would admit to being a usurer, *Exempla*, CLXXIX, 206-7.

²²² See also Innocent's *On the Misery of the Human Condition*. In this work Innocent explains that the enormity of lust permeates every age, both sexes, and undermines all classes of man even priests. Innocent III, *De miseria humane conditionis* 1.3, 1.17, 1.24, 2.24; trans. Margret Mary Dietz, *On the Misery of the Human Condition*, ed. Donald R. Howard (New York: The Bobbs-Merrill Company, Inc., 1969): 7, 19, 27, 50.

Chapter Two: Dialogue and Dependence: Clerics and Holy Women

The Siege of Liège and the Care of Women

After completing his university education in Paris, Jacques received ordination (c. 1210), and began to serve in the diocese of Liège.²²³ In May 1212, the city of Liege was sacked. Triggered by a conflict over a minor comital succession in Moha between Louis II, Count of Loon, ally to the Bishop of Liège, and Duke Henry I of Brabant, the ally of the king of France, the duke attacked the city with armed knights, including a contingent under the Duke of Limbourg and Count of Gueldre. While some of the citizens escaped, the city was plundered relentlessly for five days.²²⁴ Some reports suggest for every knight, 30 commoners of Liège died.²²⁵ In retaliation the Bishop of Liège, Hugh of Pierrepont would later gather his allies in support of Louis II, Count of Loon, and in the autumn this militia army pursued and brutally defeated the Brabantines at the Battle of Steppes in Montenaken.²²⁶ After a peace agreement was signed and Moha was annexed to Liège.

Among his activities at this time, Jacques supported female communities who were patronized by the very counts involved in this dispute.²²⁷ He refers to these women's harrowing experiences in his *vita* of Marie d'Oignies. During the siege, he writes, these women were driven to extreme acts to prevent their own rape: "Those who could not flee to the churches threw

²²³ Hinnebusch, *H. Occ.*, 4-5. From 1211-1216, Jacques de Vitry served in the diocese of Liège.

²²⁴ Claude Gaier, *Art et Organisation Militaires dans La Principauté de Liège et dans Le Comté de Looz au Moyen Age* (Brussels : Académie Royale de Belgique, 1968), 255.

²²⁵ *Ibid.*, footnote 2.

²²⁶ John France, *Western Warfare in the Age of the Crusades, 1000-1300* (Ithaca: Cornell University Press, 1999), 166.

²²⁷ His signature appears in 1211 on a charter of the duke of Brabant, on behalf of the convent of Aywieres and between 1214-16 he assisted in the foundation of Cistercian nuns at Epinleau, near Mons, Berlière, "Jacques de Vitry, ses relations avec les abbayes d'Aywières et de Doorezeele," 185-7.

themselves in the river, considering it better to die than incur harm to their chastity. Some even jumped into dung-filled sewers and preferred to be extinguished in stinking dung heap than to be despoiled of their virginity.”²²⁸ On one notable occasion one of these “brides of Christ” took her attacker down. Jacques depicts how one of the holy women (*una sanctarum mulierum*) was struggling in the river when two men dragged her onto their boat so that they might rape her, however: “she preferred to be drowned in the river than be raped. So she leapt from the boat into the waves. The vigor of her jump overwhelmed the boat, and at once the two men were drowned. But that virgin, by the grace of God, reached the bank with the river obeying her, without harm to her body or spirit.”²²⁹ Despite Jacques’ triumphant report, most likely many women neither escaped nor killed themselves, but rather suffered brutal violations at the hands of the knights of Brabant.²³⁰ Jacques, whether he sought refuge in a church or fled with other citizens, saw the aftermath, heard accounts of these brutal acts, and most likely ministered to the victims of this deadly siege.

The graphic images from the siege featured in the *vita* would have confirmed the righteousness of the Hugh of Pierrpont’s brutal retribution on the knights of Brabant—not mentioned by Jacques. Reportedly, over 3000 of these knights were defeated, and the bishop continued to viciously plunder the area for days. While one would imagine that reports of the rape of holy women would have only intensified the rhetoric of war, as seen in crusading

²²⁸ Jacques de Vitry, *VMO*, Prologus, 5.110-4: ‘Que enim ad ecclesias confugere non poterant in fluvium se proiciebant, magis eligentes mori quam dampnum castitatis incurrerent, quedam etiam in stercorarias sentinas prosilientes malebant extingui fetore quam spoliari virginitate.’

²²⁹ *Ibid.*, 121-5: ‘Maluit interim fluvio submergi quam corrumpi: navi prosiluit inter undas, dumque navis ex impetu salientis mergeretur, simul illi duo mersi perierunt, illa vero per gratiam dei sine dampno corporis et anime obsequente fluvio ad ripam pervenit.’

²³⁰ As the Chronicle of Liège notes: “Inter Brabantinos sunt flores et inter Leodienses dolores,” *La chronique Liégeoise de 1402*, ed. Eugène Bacha (Commission Royale d’Histoire: Brussels, 1900), 152; see also Ferdinand Henaux, *Histoire du pays de Liège*, Vol. 1 (J. Desoer, 1856), 169.

rhetoric, it is striking that Jacques choose to deny it. These events occurred shortly before Jacques' activity preaching crusade against heretics and his composition of the *vita* of Marie D'Oignies (1213). The siege and the subsequent battle, therefore, were a stark introduction for Jacques to the atrocities of war, and violence inflicted upon women, some of whom were likely under his pastoral care. His pastoral work (sermons, *exempla*, and *vita* of Marie) reflects a certain understanding of gendered violence against women, developed in the shadow of the events in Liège.

The best window to Jacques' thought on gender is not Marie d'Oignies, the usual starting point for studies of this topic, but rather his relationship with another holy woman, Lutgard of Aywières.²³¹ Different sources and perspectives allow us to evaluate their relationship, including Thomas of Cantimpré's hagiography, local histories, and Jacques' own letters.²³² Additionally, Jacques' correspondence with Lutgard allows us to balance challenging hagiographical accounts with the epistolary evidence of his continued relationship with the broader community of women. This is not to dismiss his relationship with Marie. By Jacques' account, Marie's visions, healings, prophecies, and her fatal asceticism, made her an exceptional woman whose exclusive path was set apart.²³³ By placing his relationship with another holy woman in the spotlight,

²³¹ For recent studies on this dynamic relationship see: Coakley, *Women, Men, and Spiritual Power*; Muessig, *Faces of Women*; Sandor, *Popular Preaching of Jacques de Vitry*.

²³² Carolyn Muessig moved beyond the *vita* of Marie, to examine Jacques' treatment of women as reflected in selections largely drawn from his *feriales et communes* sermons, where Muessig confronted Jacques' contradictory treatment of women, *Faces of Women*; idem, "Jacques de Vitry's *Sermones FERIALES ET COMMUNES*: Text and Context," 201.

²³³ Jacques de Vitry, *VMO*, 1.2.54-60: 'Nec hoc dixerim ut excessum commendum, sed ut fervorem ostendam. In his autem et multis aliis, que privilegio gratie operata est, attendat lector discretus quod paucorum privilegia non faciunt legem communem: eius virtutes imitemur, opera vero virtutum eius sine privato privilegio imitari non possemus.' This ideology can also be seen in the works of Eustace of Arras (1225-91) who cited the examples of Mary Magdalene and Saint Katherine of Alexandria as exceptional women, *non imitanda sed veneranda*, Waters, *Angels and Earthly Creatures*, 22.

however, we may balance these claims of unique virtue and highlight the larger community of holy women, the recipients of these clerics' pastoral care.

The interactions, both real and imagined, between clerics and holy women offer a valuable avenue to investigate the flexibility of gendered constructions, showing an important interplay between gender ideology and perceptions of holiness.²³⁴ In Thomas of Cantimpré's *vita*, Lutgard served as an essential intermediary in the achievement of clerical chastity.²³⁵ In other words: while for Jacques, real men preach, for Thomas real men preach with the help of holy women.

Jacques and Lutgard

In the spring of 1240 Lutgard of Aywières, "rapt in ecstasy," watched Jacques' soul depart for heaven.²³⁶ After telling her he had spent three nights and two days suffering for his sins in purgatory, she replied: "why did you not tell me immediately after your death, so that your punishment could be remitted by our sisters' prayers?"²³⁷ The ghostly Jacques explained

²³⁴ Scholars have lamented that "real" holy women are not recoverable from these biased texts, suggesting that through the work of clerics like Jacques and Thomas they became rhetorical abstractions, telling us very little about actual women. Jennifer N. Brown, "Marie D'Oignies: The *Vita* of Jacque de Vitry," *Three Women of Liège: A Critical Edition of and Commentary on the Middle English Lives of Elizabeth of Spalbeek, Christina Mirabilis and Marie d'Oignies* (Turnhout: Brepols, 2008), 249-50; Wogan Browne, "Chaste Bodies," 24. Regarding Ancrene Wisse, Wogan-Browne notes that despite the literary repertoire of chaste women, whose mantra seems to declare: "the best virgin, is always a dead virgin," one cannot ignore the love and respect the author shows towards his audience.

²³⁵ Karras notes that in accounts of medieval men freedom from lust most often was a gift of grace rather than the success of self-control, "Thomas Aquinas's Chastity Belt," 65.

²³⁶ Thomas of Cantimpré, *Vita Lutgardis*, 3.1.5: 'Sub eodem fere tempore ille venerabilis et Deo dignus Jacobus, quondam Acconensis Episcopus, tunc vero Romanae Curiae Cardinalis, de quo superius fecimus mentionem, in vigilia SS. Philippi et Jacobi Romae ab hoc seculo transivit. Quarto ergo die depositionis ejus, id est in festo Crucis, pia Lutgardis rei nescia, (utpote tringinta diaetis a loco in Brabantiae scilicet partibus constituta) rapta est ad excessum mentis in coelum et vidit quoniam eadem hora anima dicti Episcopi delata est in paradisum.'

²³⁷ *Ibid.*: 'Cui spiritus piae Lutgardis in coelo congratulans, dixit: O reverendissime Pater, nesciebam te defunctum: Tu autem quando a corpore recessisti? Et ille: Quarta jam dies est: nam tribus noctibus et duobus diebus in purgatorio jam exegi. Mox illa cum admiratione quaesivit: Et quare, inquit, immediate post mortem mihi superstiti non indicasti, ut poena tua Sororum nostrarum orationibus solveretur? Et ille, Noluit, inquit, Dominus contristari te ex poena mea: sed peracto purgatorio ex liberatione et glorificatione mea te potius consolari.'

that God did not want to disturb her. This supernatural story recorded by Thomas of Cantimpré in Lutgard's *vita* emphasizes her surprising spiritual authority. As the intermediary for Jacques, she and her community could call upon God to release him almost immediately from purgatorial punishments. Thomas concludes this vision, declaring: "May that vile slanderer blush for shame—he who said and wrote that people who record the fantastic visions of dear little women should be considered profane!"²³⁸ Jacques expressed similar anger with certain undisclosed men who disbelieved these women's experiential form of piety. In the prologue of Marie's *vita*, Jacques rebuked these doubters who "like rabid dogs, barked against customs different than their own," and thus invented new names to call these women.²³⁹ The accusations and name-calling Jacques and Thomas alluded to was most likely the ongoing public suspicion that these women were feigning their religious fervor.²⁴⁰ In 1216, Jacques traveled on these women's behalf and saw the newly appointed Pope Honorius III in Perugia, gaining verbal permission for the beguines in Flanders, France, and the Empire to live together in community.²⁴¹ Thomas and Jacques' work (among others) strived in part to ensure that these women would not be slandered and would be enabled through ecclesiastical protections to live out their spiritual ideal.

²³⁸ Ibid., 3.1.5: 'Erubescat ille vilissimus obtreceptor, qui dixit et scripsit debere profanos intelligi, qui muliercularum scriberent phantasticas visiones. Hoc notare voluit dictum Jacobum venerabilem, qui beatae feminae Mariae deOignies vitam beatissimam eleganti sermone conscripsit,' The "insignificance" perhaps has to do with Lutgard's unusual parentage since her mother was a noble and her father was a merchant.'

²³⁹ Jacques de Vitry, *VMO*, Prologus, 4.89-91: 'canina rabie contra mores sibi contrarios oblatrantes, et cum non haberent amplius quid facerent, nova nomina contra eas fingeant. . . .' Jacques also notes accusations of Dominican and Cistercians against these women in his *exempla*. See also Vera von der Osten-Sacken, "Dangerous Heretic or Silly Fools? The Name 'Beguine' as a Label for Lay Religious Women of Early Thirteenth-Century Brabant," in *Labels and Libels Naming Beguines in Northern Medieval Europe* (Turnhout: Brepolis, 2014), 99-116.

²⁴⁰ In a sermon, Jacques describes the various female religious groups he encountered and their different vernacular names, including *beguina*, *papelarda*, *humiliate*, and *bizote*. For a discussion of the history and problems of naming beguines see Simons, "Naming Beguines in the Southern Low Countries," 13.

²⁴¹ Jacques de Vitry, *Lettres*, I.76-81: 'Obtinui preterea ab ipso, et litteras cum executoribus et protectoribus impetravi, ut liceret mulieribus religiosis non solum in episcopatu Leodinensi, sed tam in rego quam in imperio in eadem domo simul manere et sese invicem mutuis exhortationibus ad bonum invitare . . .'; Bolton, "Mulieres Sanctae," 148.

One of these dear little women was Lutgard of Aywières was born in Tongeren in 1182. Her parents, a noblewoman and burgher, committed her to a beguinage in Sint-Truiden at the age of twelve, where she met Christina the Astonishing (1150-1224). Christina had earned her epithet for her miraculous resurrection during her own funeral mass, and for her gift of prophecy. Most notably, she predicted the loss of Jerusalem in 1187.²⁴² Thomas of Cantimpré composed Christina's *vita* after writing Marie D'Oignies's *Supplementum*. There he recounted Christina's extreme ascetic practices such as rolling in fires, climbing into ovens, and generally running amok throughout her community, terrifying onlookers with her wild appearance and unpredictable acts of self-harm.²⁴³ Despite what might appear as unlikely bedfellows—erratic female ascetics and powerful counts—Christina's own patron was Count Louis II of Looz, who had sided with Bishop Hugh of Pierrepont against Duke Henry I of Brabant during the Siege of Liège.²⁴⁴ Thomas of Cantimpré noted somewhat reluctantly that Christina the Astonishing was even called upon to hear this count's deathbed confession.²⁴⁵ Thomas further recounted how the count lay prostrate before Christina and confessed all his sins. Mixing orthodox intention to such transgressive behavior, the Count, according to Thomas, “did this not for absolution, which she

²⁴² Thomas of Cantimpré, *VCM*, XXIV.32 : ‘Sed et multo ante tempore prædixit, quod terra Sancta Jerusalem Saracenis impiis subderetur. Cumque venisset dies, quo a Solahadino m, rege Persarum, capta fuit Jerusalem, cum sepulchro Domini et Cruce Christi, ipsa in castro de Loen posita, rei eventum cognovit in spiritu. In quo facto vehementer exultans, rogabatur a præsentibus causam tantæ exultationis edisterere. Recte, inquit, exulto, quia Christus Dominus hodie cum angelis lætabundus exultans occasionem dedit, qua humani generis multitudo salvetur.’

²⁴³ Jacques de Vitry also mentions this in the *vita* of Marie, *VMO*, Prologus, 8.200-8 : ‘Vidi etiam aliam, circa quam tam mirabiliter operatus est dominus, quod cum diu mortua iacuisset, antequam in terra corpus eius sepeliretur, anima ad corpus revertente revixit et a domino obtinuit ut in hoc seculo vivens in corpore purgatorium sustineret. Unde longo tempore ita mirabiliter a domino afflicta est, ut quandoque se volutaret in ignem, quandoque in hierme in aqua glaciali diu moraretur ; quandoque etiam sepulchra mortuorum intrare cogebatur.’

²⁴⁴ Newman, *Collected Saints' Lives*, 30.

²⁴⁵ Thomas of Cantimpré, *VCM*, XXXIII, 44: ‘Hic idem Luduicus comes cum in extremis ageret, [cujus jam vita sancti animam gravissimis purgatorii pœnis cum tradi videret,] Christinam ad se vocari fecit, eam obnixius postulans, ut secum usque ad horam sui obitus remaneret. Qua favente benignius, comes omnes qui cum eo erant, secedere jubet a thalamo; Christinam autem solam secum retinuit in conclavi. Nec mora: comes virtute, qua potuit, erexit se, et supplex ante pedes Christinae toto corpore factus, ei omnia peccata sua ab anno ætatis suæ undecimo usque ad diem illam cum maximis lacrymis recitavit.’

had no power to give,” but rather because he had sought her prayers.²⁴⁶ By entering Sint-Truiden, Lutgard, consequently, had become connected to women known for their extreme asceticism, but also for their political connections.²⁴⁷

At the age of 24 Lutgard was elected as prioress in what had become a Benedictine community of nuns. She refused this honor and chose instead to be part of the Cistercian order where she could focus on contemplation and avoid positions of authority. Although she originally chose a Flemish speaking house, Herkenrode, on the advice of Christina the Astonishing and John of Lierre, she moved to the French-speaking house in Aywières. They advised that because of her ignorance of French, she could avoid leadership and dedicate her time to contemplation.²⁴⁸ From this home in Aywières, she attracted people through her extreme asceticism and miracles until her death in 1246.²⁴⁹

Jacques likely would have met Lutgard during his tenure at Oignies, while he was supporting the communities of beguines in the region. His closeness to Lutgard and continued connection to these communities of women, is shown in his letters from Acre. Of the seven remaining letters of Jacques de Vitry²⁵⁰, several include multiple versions to suit his different

²⁴⁶ Ibid., : ‘Et hoc non pro indulgentia, quam dare non potuit, sed ut magis ad orandum pro eo, hoc piaculo moveretur.’ As part of the penitential system, confession had to be canonically granted, and therefore like preaching, the right to grant confession was forbidden to women.

²⁴⁷ Characteristic of the thirteen-century Southern Low Countries, communities developed around these holy women who largely came from upper class families, Mulder-Baker, “Holy Laywomen,” 11-2.

²⁴⁸ Interestingly, among her many miracles, she momentarily understands French. Thomas of Cantimpré, *VLA*, 4.40 : ‘Illa autem casso labore fugere nitebatur: retenta tamen ea rogabant, ut expectaret piam Lutgardem; quæ etsi ei ad consolationem loqui non posset, tamquam Teutonica, pro ea tamen Dominum exoraret: erat autem mulier penitus Gallica. Nec mora pia Lutgardis adducta, ad remotum locum cum muliere secessit: sensit enim in spiritu supra modum feminam tribulatam. Mirari omnes ac ridere cœperunt, quomodo ignotæ sibi invicem linguæ in colloquio convenirent. Postquam ergo ibidem diutius consedissent, surrexit mulier, ad plenissimam spei fiduciam revocata; et reversa in locutorium Monialibus dixit: Cur dixistis istam sanctissimam Dominam esse Teutonicam, quam prorsus Gallicam sum experta?’ For a discussion of Lutgard and language see: Alexandra Barrett, “Language and the Body in Thomas of Cantimpré’s *Life of Lutgard of Aywières*,” *Cistercian Studies Quarterly* 30 (1995): 339-47.

²⁴⁹ Newman, *The Collected Saints Lives*, 10-2.

²⁵⁰ One letter, numbered as letter III in Huygen’s edition has been disputed, Welch, “Order, Emotion, and Gender,” 36.

addressees, including Pope Honorius III, the masters of Paris, and close friends like John of Nivelles and Lutgard. In one of these letters, which was written in two parts during the fall and winter of 1217, there remains a version addressed to the masters of Paris (IIa), namely William of the Pont des Arches, Ralph of Namur, Alexander of Courcon, and Philip the Archdeacon of Noyon, and a version for Lutgard of St. Trond, “his most spiritual friend,” and the Abbey of Aywières (IIb).²⁵¹ Although medieval letters were meant for a larger audience, intended to be copied, shared, and read aloud, the personal elements remained. As Cassidy-Welch notes, “they are at once intimate and entirely public.”²⁵² Jacques expressed this sentiment at the outset of the letter: “Minds joined by the Holy Spirit cannot be separated by geographical distance, but the minds of friends are impressed by the seal of love. They do not slip away easily from the memory because of the interval of time.”²⁵³ The first part of this letter described his journey on the sea to Acre and the latter half is dedicated to recounting his travels in Sidon, Tyre, and Syria. He depicted his arduous journey to the East, mentioning numerous dangerous storms, but also relating lighthearted moments, such as when he and the other pilgrims watched dolphins play.²⁵⁴ Details of the natural world, however, are limited. Instead, he focused on the people he encounters, especially their religions. He characterized the diversity in beliefs that he had found in Acre as a monster with nine heads. Each head, he said, departed from the “true religion” in some particular way. The second half of the letter emphasizes his successful work preaching the

²⁵¹ Jacques de Vity, *Lettres*, II.7-10: ‘Domine Ligardi de sancto Trudone, amice sue spiritualissime, et conventui de Awiria I(acobus), divina miseratione Acconensis ecclesie minister humilis, ascendere *de uirtute in uirtutem*, donec videant *deum deorum in Syon*.’ Each version of this letter only survives in one copy: Universiteitsbibliotheek Gent MS 554 contains letter IIb along with four other letters, while a fragment preserved in a single folio 245v. in Bruxelles, Bibl. Royale MS 7487-91 contains only IIa. See Longère, *Ad Status*, xix; G. Duchet-Suchaux, *Jacques de Vitry: Lettres de la Cinquième Croisade*, 12-3.

²⁵² Cotts, “Monks and Clerks in Search of the *Beata Schola*,” 270; Welch, “Order, Emotion, and Gender,” 37.

²⁵³ Jacques de Vitry, *Lettres*, II.11-3: ‘Mentes quas spiritus coniunxit, locorum diversitas non disiungit : que autem caritatis sigillo mentibus amicorum imprimuntur, non facile temporis intervallo a memoria labuntur.’

²⁵⁴ *Ibid.*, 106-8: ‘Salutantes insulam Cypri, per pisces maximos, qui sequebantur et precedebant navem nostram et circa eam ludendo saliebant.’

cross to men and women, Christians and Saracens, through Tyre, Beirut, and Tripoli. Unlike other letters, both remaining versions include the same content with only a special request added on to the version written to Lutgard requesting that she “pray for him and especially for his chaplain and most faithful associate, John of Cambrai.”²⁵⁵

Another letter dated to March 1220 remains in three versions: addressed to Pope Honorius III (VIa), and to John of Nivelles (VIb), and the abbess of Aywières (VIc).²⁵⁶ This letter detailed the dramatic siege and eventual capture of Damietta. Recounted also in the work of Oliver of Paderborn, these losses were significant, with corpses piled throughout the city.²⁵⁷ In the letter addressed to John of Nivelles, Jacques took a more personal tone, concluding with sorrow: “I am weak and broken-hearted, and I desire to end my life in peace and tranquility.”²⁵⁸ While the content of these lengthy crusade letters will be addressed more closely in the following chapter, it is important here to note here that these letters served to inform his friends and ecclesiastical leaders of his journey, garnering their support and prayers, but they also helped strengthen connections between Acre, Paris, Rome, and Aywières. Like other crusade preachers, Jacques connected the moral behavior in the West with the effort to regain the Holy Land. Therefore his letters served as a call to live lives that would gain God’s favor and ensure his blessings. Because letters were modeled on oratory, they offered a source for preaching, again

²⁵⁵ Ibid., 449-52: ‘Orate pro me et pro meis et specialiter pro capellano meo, fidelissimo socio meo, Iohanne videlicet de Cameraco.’ As Sweetman notes, the sources on the beguines show their role in the communal care of the dead through their purgatorial piety, Sweetman, “Thomas Cantimpré,” 621.

²⁵⁶ Versions of Letter VI remains in the following manuscripts: Both Paris, BNF lat 5695, Paris and Sainte-Geneviève, 3489 contain VIb, Universiteitsbibliotheek Gent MS 554 contains VIc, and London, Add. 25440 contains VIb, Huygens, *Lettres*, 13.

²⁵⁷ Oliver of Paderborn, *Historia Damiatina*, in *Die Schriften des Kölner Domscholasters, späteren Bischofs von Paderborn und Kardinalbischofs von S. Sabina Oliverus*, ed Hermann Hoogeweg (Tübingen: Litterarischer Verein in Stuttgart, 1894).

²⁵⁸ Jacques de Vitry, *Lettres*, VIb.277-80 : ‘Ego autem iam debilis et confractus corde in pace et tranquillitate vitam mean finire desidero.’ For a discussion of emotion and gender in this letter see Welch, “Order, Emotion, and Gender,” 35-49.

joining Jacques' communities of the East and West.²⁵⁹ Lutgard and the women of Aywières, were evidently an important part of this far-flung community.

While Jacques letters show us his social connections, they provide very little detail on the character of these ties, especially as it pertains to his relationship to Lutgard. For that we must turn to Jacques' friend Thomas of Cantimpré's hagiographical work. Born in 1200 in Lewes, near Brussels in the Duchy of Brabant, the Dominican Thomas of Cantimpré authored numerous hagiographies, largely of the holy women and men in the Low Countries, and he also wrote the encyclopedic work of science, *De natura rerum*.²⁶⁰ He explains in his a work of *exempla*, *Bonum universale de apibus* (or Book of Bees), that his entrance into the religious life was an act of purgatorial piety in fulfillment of a promise made by his father, who had himself undertaken a penitential pilgrimage to Jerusalem.²⁶¹ While on this pilgrimage his father—a knight who reportedly served under Richard the Lionheart on the Third Crusade—came to a place called Black Mountain, where he met a hermit. The hermit ordered his father to entrust his son to the priesthood for the remission of his sins.²⁶² Thomas dutifully obeyed his father's desire, but claimed to have nightmares of his father suffering purgatorial punishments whenever he missed saying a mass for him.²⁶³ His father's penance may have compelled Thomas to enter religious life, but his admiration for Jacques de Vitry appears to have shaped that path. At the conclusion of his time at the cathedral school in Cambrai (1206-1217), he witnessed Jacques' preaching.

²⁵⁹ Welch, "Order, Emotion, and Gender," 37.

²⁶⁰ For a discussion of what his *exemplum* reveal about performative reading see: Sweetman, "Thomas of Cantimpré: Performative Reading and Pastoral Care," 133-67.

²⁶¹ Newman, *Collected Saints' Lives*, 4; Robert Sweetman, "Thomas of Cantimpré, *Mulieres Religiosae*, and Purgatorial Piety: Hagiographical *Vitae* and the Beguine 'Voice,'" in *A Distinct Voice: Medieval Studies in Honor of Leonard E. Boyle, O.P.*, eds. Jacqueline Brown and William P. Stoneman (University of Notre Dame Press, 1997), 610.

²⁶² Thomas of Cantimpré, *VMO-S*, 132.

²⁶³ Sweetman, "Thomas of Cantimpré, *Mulieres Religiosae*, and Purgatorial Piety," 611.

Thomas, in his supplement to the *vita* of Marie D'Oignies, recalled how he was greatly moved, when he was barely fifteen years old, after watching Jacques preach in Lotharingia.²⁶⁴ It was after this moment that Thomas appears to have modeled his life on Jacques by becoming an Augustinian canon (1216-17), and through his lifelong support of holy women in the Southern Low Countries.²⁶⁵

Thomas entered the house of regular canons at the Abbey of Cantimpré who had adopted the rule of Augustine and the constitutions of Saint-Victor.²⁶⁶ This intellectual influence of the Victorines on both Thomas and Jacques is especially apparent in their treatment of mysticism. Jacques, for example, borrowed metaphors and structure from Richard of St. Victor's *Mystic Arc* in his organization of Marie's *vita*, which Thomas then added to with his *Supplementum*.²⁶⁷ Thomas later entered the newly established Dominican Order in Leuven in 1232. Other than leaving temporarily to gain further training under Albert Magnus in Cologne and at the Dominican *studium* of St. James in Paris, Thomas would ultimately remain in Leuven where he was made subprior and confessor (1240).

Thomas not only mirrored Jacques' education and involvement with these holy women, he similarly credited a holy woman as the catalyst for his success in his vocation. For example, as Jacques attributed his desire to preach to Marie, Thomas regarded Lutgard as his own spiritual mother, inspiring him to join the Dominican Order.²⁶⁸ Jacques had obtained a finger relic of

²⁶⁴ Thomas of Cantimpré, *VMO-S*, IV. 27. Col. 0676D: 'Nondum enim annorum quindecim ætatem attigeram, cum vos necdum Præsulem in Lotharingiæ partibus prædicantem audiens, tanta veneratione dilexi, ut me solius nominis vestri lætificaret auditus: ex tunc mecum vestri amor individuus perseverat.'

²⁶⁵ Simons, *City of Ladies*, 39; Henri Platelle, *Les exemples du "Livre des abeilles": Une vision médiévale* (Paris: Brepols, 1997), 11-7.

²⁶⁶ Platelle, *Livre des abeilles*, 14-5; Newman, *Collected Saints*, 4.

²⁶⁷ See Miriam Marsolais, "Marie d'Oignies: Jacques de Vitry's Exemplum of an Ideal Victorine Mystic (unpublished master's dissertation, Berkeley Graduate Theological Union, 1988), cited in Jacques de Vitry, *VMO*, 107, footnote 12.

²⁶⁸ Margot King argues that although he knew Lutgard personally, he viewed her life as a spiritual type to inspire

Marie, whereas Thomas, although he begged for years—even before her death—for Lutgard’s entire right hand, gained only a finger relic in exchange for writing the life of Hadewijch of Brabant.²⁶⁹ Of course, Thomas and Jacques’ hagiographical accounts have their limitations as historical sources. Nevertheless, letters and chronicles show these *vitae* were built on actual friendships.²⁷⁰ Taken together with the hagiographies, these sources implicitly and explicitly reveal the criticisms surrounding the novelty of these women’s religious lifestyles—including their relationship with clerics—and, they offer valuable insight on how clerics had decided to frame their own careers in relation to these women.²⁷¹

What we know of Thomas’s relationship to Jacques comes largely from the supplement he wrote to Jacques’ *vita* of Marie. This *Supplementum* was composed at the request of the canons in Oignies and sent to Giles the prior.²⁷² It served to bolster the renown of Marie D’Oignies by adding numerous miraculous deeds, edifying the religious community in Oignies, but it was also framed by an urgent request for Jacques to return to Oignies from Rome. He feared that Jacques, distracted by the vain honors of Rome, had neglected his duty to the region, asserting that: “the souls in Lotharingia—a place which we surely believe the supreme pontiff,

others, “The Dove at the Window: The Ascent of the Soul in Thomas de Cantimpré’s “Life of Lutgard of Aywières,” in *Medieval Religious Women* 3.1 (1995): 226-7.

²⁶⁹ Thomas of Cantimpré, *VLA*, 3.19.Col.261B: ‘Annis pluribus ante mortem ejus plures Moniales & conversos Fratres instanter rogaveram, [scriptor qui petierat olim sibi dari manum mortuæ,] ut si contingeret, sicut heu! contigit, me in morte piæ Matris Lutgardis non esse præsentem; manum ejus abscissam mihi, ob sacram ejus memoriam, reservarent: & in hoc licentiam venerabilis Hawidis ejusdem loci Abbatissæ obtinueram. Ut autem feminarum natura est, celandi penitus celare non posse, secundum illud vulgare proverbium.’

²⁷⁰ Sweetman argues that Thomas: “wrote what he saw and, despite the demonstrable maleness of his vantage point, saw his heroines truly,” Sweetman, “Thomas Cantimpré, *Mulieres Religiosae*, and Purgatorial Piety,” 621.

²⁷¹ Sweetman, “Thomas Cantimpré, *Mulieres Religiosae*, and Purgatorial Piety,” 607. For a discussion of hagiography as a source for the history of women see Jane Tibbets Schulenburg, *Forgetful of Their Sex: Female Sanctity and Society, ca. 500-1100* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1998); Michel Lauwers, “Expérience béguinale et récit hagiographique: À propos de la “Vita Mariae Oigniencensis” de Jacques de Vitry (vers 1215),” *Journal des savants* (1989), 61-103.

²⁷² Sweetman, “Thomas of Cantimpré, *Mulieres Religiosae*, and Purgatorial Piety,” 617; Thomas of Cantimpre, *VMO-S*, Prologus, I.col 0666E.

the legate of Christ, sent him back to from the East—are headed to hell without his counsel or help.”²⁷³ Like the correspondence of John of Salisbury and Peter of Celle, which employed notions of Paris to express multivalent messages, here Thomas used Rome to critique Jacques’ ambition and success. Thomas’s account elevated these women, but he also created a narrative of dependence in which he reminded Jacques that he owed his fame and prosperity to these holy women and by extension to the region of Lotharingia.

In Thomas of Cantimpré’s *vita* of Lutgard, he presented her as Jacques’ intercessor. He noted that Jacques was struggling with inappropriate feelings for a religious woman, likely Marie D’Oignies.²⁷⁴ Reportedly, Jacques had even set aside his preaching to console this woman as she lay sick. Considering Jacques’ own *exempla* on the responsibility of preaching, this was a serious dereliction of his duty.²⁷⁵ Thomas was quick to clarify that Jacques’ feelings were not lust, but it was still an “all too human love (*amore . . . nimis humano*).” He asserted that Lutgard interceded on Jacques’ behalf, demanding that God free him from this temptation.²⁷⁶ But when her prayers were not answered, God told her that, “the man for whom you pray for is fighting against your prayers.” Lutgard, impatient with this delay, cried to God: “What are you doing, O most just and courteous Lord? Either separate me from yourself or liberate the man for whom I pray, even if he is not willing.”²⁷⁷ Thomas depicts this prayer not as a demure plea, but rather a forceful, self-

²⁷³ Thomas of Cantimpre, *VMO-S*, col 675C: ‘Romanæ Curiaē Sedem Præsul obsidet, obsidet Cardinalis: Scripturis studet, ut audio; quiete fovetur; & in partibus Lotharingiaē (quibus ut certissime credimus, a summo Pontifice Christo Legatus a partibus Orientis remissus est) animæ destitutæ consilio vel auxilio tendent ad inferos.’

²⁷⁴ Ibid., *VLA*, 2.1.3.col 0244A: ‘Cum Magister Jacobus de Vitriaco ut ipse refert in libro vitæ B. Mariae de Oignies, ipsius venerabilis feminae precibus praedicationis gratiam accepisset; factum est ut religiosam quamdam mulierem languentem in lecto, non turpi amore, sed nimis humano diligeret.’ Although this religious woman is supposed by some scholars to be Marie, Thomas does not mention what happened to her and in fact, Marie had died before Jacques departed.

²⁷⁵ Ibid.: ‘Hujus igitur consolationi intentus assidue, praedicationis officium segniter omittebat.’

²⁷⁶ Ibid., col 0244A: ‘Pia ergo Lutgardis, vinculum cordis ejus et dolos diaboli in spiritu sentiens, aggressa est in multis lacrymis pro eo Dominum deprecari.’

²⁷⁷ Ibid., col 0244B: ‘Cumque nihil proficeret orando, et Dominum super hoc argueret ut crudelem, respondit Dominus: Orationibus, inquit, tuis in contrarium homo nititur, pro quo petis: Haec dicens, distulit Dominus quod

assured command. She gives God an ultimatum: either end their mystical connection or rescue Jacques. By leveraging her own intimate relationship with God, Lutgard was victorious. Immediately Jacques saw the true danger of his feelings, and shortly after he was elected bishop of Acre, allowing distance and duty to cure his “all too human love.”²⁷⁸

This episode reads like a scene from a romance, in which a lady demands from her knight proof of his fealty and devotion, probably deliberately so. Bynum suggests the more emotive language of women’s piety was due in part to exposure to troubadours’ songs and courtly stories of lovelorn knights, tales that gave them a “vocabulary of feelings” not found in scholastic writings to which men would have been more accustomed.²⁷⁹ Lutgard’s account, however, was mediated by her hagiographer Thomas, who was not lacking this technical “vocabulary of feelings.”²⁸⁰ In fact, the shared understanding—between author and audience—of the popular tropes found in romances would make this episode even more compelling and memorable for the reader. Thomas thus artfully and deliberately painted Lutgard as Jacques’ advocate, a teacher who helped him overcome his battle with lust. Additionally, while not naming Marie, this passage acknowledges a certain anxiety and public suspicion surrounding Jacques’ relationship with her and likely other holy women. Other thirteenth-century authors employed angels and divine grace to help religious men fight against their lustful feelings.²⁸¹ But Thomas made a

petebatur implere. Quod ut vidit pia Lutgardis, impatientius agens, Domino magnis vocibus inclamavit: Quid est, ait, quod agis benignissime ac justissime Domine? aut separa me a te, aut hominem pro quo peto libera, etiam non volentem.’

²⁷⁸ Ibid.: ‘Mira res! Nulla mora inter rogatum et factum penitus intervenit, sed prorsus et protinus liberatus, Liberatori suo et ejus famulae benedixit; sensitque aperti oculis post liberationem periculum, quod ante, humano amore caecatus, videre non poterat. Nec grande post haec tempus excessit, cum idem venerabilis Jacobus ad Episcopatum Acconensem in transmarinis partibus est electus.’

²⁷⁹ Bynum, “The Female Body,” 196.

²⁸⁰ Adams suggests that clerics constructed an alternative identity reflective of their “lost love” seen in the devotional literature which allowed them a “way of imagining their sexuality that allowed an emotional relationship with women” to be combined with their pursuit of wisdom, “Make me Chaste,” 4. For this link between Mariology and clerical celibacy see also Elliot, *Fallen Bodies*, 114.

²⁸¹ Karras, “Thomas Aquinas’ Chastity Belt,” 61-62.

woman the voice of virtue, and by her spiritual strength, scandal was avoided through private correction.

In another episode Lutgard helped Thomas overcome his own challenges with another “all too human feeling,” namely his consternation over hearing “disturbing” confessions. Thomas asserted that while serving as the bishop’s deputy he was tasked with hearing confessions. As he explained: “I began this duty with great fear in my heart, and when my ears were troubled outwardly by what I heard, I became agitated inwardly with the stirrings of temptation.”²⁸² The challenge of confessors’ decorum was not a unique problem. Jacques recounted confessors whose harsh reaction to private testimonies, made the laity less likely to confess greater sins, even reprimanding one confessor who “after the sins were confessed would spit in their face, hating the sinner whom he ought to have attracted with compassion.”²⁸³ Thomas, struggling with maintaining his virtue, followed Jacques’ example and sought Lutgard’s help. After she prayed for him, she explained to him that “Christ will be your protector and defender.”²⁸⁴ Thomas confessed that after this he was cured, mostly: “I discovered the truth of Lutgard’s prophecy—even though I have often been unbearably shaken at other times, when I was not busy hearing confessions. But when I perform my office, the more unclean the things

²⁸² Thomas of Cantimpré, *VLA*, 3.38.col 0251F: ‘Ego autem, licet indignus, cum ad Ordinem Presbyteri aetate juvenis accessissem, nondum me in Praedicatorum Ordine constituto, indebite et super vires, in Confessionibus audiendis vices habere Episcopi sum compulsus. Hoc autem cum in magna cordis formidine inchoassem, coepi vexatis exterius auribus ex auditu, internis tentationum stimulis agitari.’ Dyan Elliot has pointed out that Thomas reported numerous confessions from women, but only one from a man, suggesting that this anxiety was not just about hearing licentious testimonies but mostly likely immoral confessions of women, *Fallen Bodies*, 46.

²⁸³ Jacques de Vitry, *Exempla*, LXIII, 25: ‘De quodam alio audivi qui confitentibus peccata solebat in faciem conspuere et abominari peccatores quos compatiendo atrahere debuisset.’

²⁸⁴ Thomas of Cantimpré, *VLA*, 3.38.col 0251F: ‘Maximo ergo timore et horrore correptus, ad piam Lutgardem, sicut ad specialissimam mihi matrem, accessi, et ei gravamen meum dolore tactus aperui. Quae compassa mihi in orationem se dedit; et rediens, cum magna fiducia dixit: Revertere, fili, in locum tuum, et laborem debitum animabus curandis impende; aderit tibi Christus protector et doctor: qui et in Confessionibus audiendis a jaculis inimici te potenter eripiat, et in defectu scientiae quem vereris addet gratiam ampliorem.’

that I hear, the less they bother me and the less I am shaken in hearing them.”²⁸⁵ It is worth nothing that untoward details related to him during confession only left him “less shaken.”

Lutgard alleviated temptation. She did not eliminate it.

Both Thomas and Jacques portray men at odds with their lustful bodies. Jacques addressed the struggles of nameless clerics of Paris, fumbling to align the standards of masculinity to their clerical lives. His vision of preaching as a salient marker of their masculinity, came with the looming threat of emasculation if they failed to perform. Thomas’s hagiographical work reveal that these battles were also personal. Lives that on one hand were to be supposed to be characterized by chastity and peace, including Jacques’, were also clouded by internal warfare over lust, feelings of inadequacy, and fear of failure. But rather than demonize their temptations, both Jacques and Thomas made it an explicit and exemplary point: in their struggles, rescue came through the intervention of holy women.

The Gender of Holiness

The presentation of Lutgard’s intercessory work stood at odds with many medieval gender stereotypes of women as inherently prone to lust, serving as dangerous snares on men’s path to salvation.²⁸⁶ Far more typical is Gerald of Wales, who dedicated five chapters of his *Gemma Ecclesiastica* to the treachery women posed to the virtue of men. He featured stories of women throwing themselves indiscriminately at kings, monks, soldiers, and priests. Gerald

²⁸⁵ Ibid., col 0252A: ‘Mira res; et licet ego ipsemet de meipso cum verecundia referam, ad laudem tamen Christi et ancillae ejus, quod factum est non tacebo. Ab illa igitur die, quamdiu injuncto officio usus sum usque in praesens, quo sedecim anni fluxerunt medii, prophetiam piae Lutgardis in me veracissimam sum expertus: etsi extra tempus, quando audiendis confessionibus non eram intentus, frequenter intolerabiliter sum vexatus. Et quanto immundiora fuerint quae audio, tanto minus ea curo, minusque moveor audiendo.’

²⁸⁶ This notion was stridently forwarded by the fifth-century theologian, Jerome who in turn greatly influenced medieval ideas about sex, marriage, and the body, Peter Brown, *The Body and Society* (New York, Columbia UP, 1988): 367-70; Jerome, *Against Jovinian* 1.47; Murray, *Love, Marriage, and Family*, 288.

cautioned against even looking at women who “rob you of God, rob you of heaven, and lead us to damnation should not be called our friends but rather our dread enemies.”²⁸⁷ But even in Gerald’s extreme view, women occasionally could overcome their nature. For example, he claimed that a nun, overcome by her lust for a cleric, had dreamt that the cleric appeared as a giant, and therefore “assuming manly courage, she ran and grabbed a scythe. . . and cut the youth in two, killing him.” Thus, she bravely cured her lust.²⁸⁸

The potential for the female body to pollute religious men appears also in Jacques’ *exempla*. For example, relying on the *Vitae Patrum*, he related the story of the hermit who carried his mother across a river, wrapping her in fabric to avoid becoming polluted by her touch.²⁸⁹ When the mother questioned this strange treatment by her own son, he replied, “Do not be surprised mother, for the flesh of women is fire.”²⁹⁰ While this story points to women’s inherent destructive potential for temptation, Jacques more often focused on actions of women. In one of his stories, Bernard of Clairvaux’s sister visited her brothers (all monks at Clairvaux) but was scorned because of her luxurious clothing (*pompa magna et ornatu superfluo*). Bernard and the others refused to see her. The sister, concluding that “if the brothers despise me for my flesh, let the servants of God not despise my soul,” repented by setting aside her ornate dress and entering a convent.²⁹¹ The sister’s flesh (*carnis*) was equated with her ornate attire—both representing her excess materiality. While her flesh (*carnis*) was despised like the hermit’s mother, the religious life offered the sister a way to be stripped of her gender’s excesses.

²⁸⁷ Gerald of Wales, and John J. Hagen, *The Jewel of the Church: A Translation of "Gemma ecclesiastica" by Giraldus Cambrensis* (Leiden: Lugduni Batavorum, 1979): 137.

²⁸⁸ *Ibid.*, 170. This echoes Perpetua’s masculine transformation.

²⁸⁹ Jacques de Vitry, *Exempla*, C, 46-47.

²⁹⁰ *Ibid.*, 47: ‘Non mireris, mater, caro enim mulieris ignis est.’

²⁹¹ Jacques de Vitry, *Exempla*, CCLXXIII, 114: ‘Si despiciunt fratres mei carnem meam, non despiciant servi Dei animam meam, et deposito ornatu exteriori, postea religione vixit.’

While at times relying on the same tropes of the *mala mulier*, Jacques warned of the danger of such gendered stereotypes. In his *vita* of Marie, Jacques continually described those who disdained the words of holy women, or judged Marie’s unique role in advising priests as against ecclesiastical policy, comparing these “readers of Gratian” to the Pharisees who mocked the Lord.”²⁹² Elsewhere he decried the actions of overzealous Dominican friars for their rash treatment of these women.²⁹³ He asserted that when the Dominican monks had arrived in the Low Countries, they began preaching and receiving confessions, especially from the nuns and virgins living in communities together. Because of the confession of “weaknesses and temptations from certain women,” the preachers decided these holy communities were brothels.²⁹⁴ Jacques similarly claimed that an important Cistercian leader, after hearing rumors about holy women called “*beguinae seculares*,” asked God in prayer about the character of these women. It was divinely revealed to him that they were in fact “firm in the faith and efficacious in their works.”²⁹⁵ Even for Jacques himself, rumors both positive and negative had to be verified in person. The *History of the Foundation of St. Nicholas of Oignies* reported that:

Jacques came to find out if what he had been hearing from others about the devotion of our earliest days was evident also in our deeds. He did not trust our reputation—since a reputation sometimes works through lying—until he saw with his own eyes. And he

²⁹² Jacques de Vitry, *VMO*, 104.

²⁹³ The countesses of Flanders and the Dominicans advocated for a more regulated religious life, Mulder-Bakker, “Holy Laywomen,” 16.

²⁹⁴ Jacques de Vitry, *Exempla*, LXXX, 36: ‘Quedam autem ex dictis mulieribus infirmitates et temptations suas et fragilis nature lapsum sub confessionis sigillo ostenderunt illis tanquam viris ut eorum orationibus specialius juvantur. Illi vero temerarie non solum suspicati sunt alias esse tales sed in diversis tam clericorum quam laicorum congregationibus, qui predictae religioni moribus suis valde dissimili detrahunt, predicaverunt memoratas sanctarum virginum congregationes potius esse prostibula quam conventus religiosos et ita paucarum defectus in omnes diffundentes, quantum in ipsis fuit religionem Deo et Deuni timentibus approbatam infamantes, multos scandalizaverunt.’

²⁹⁵ *Ibid.*, CCLXXIX, 116: ‘Vidi quemdam valde religiosum Cisterciensis ordinis monachum, qui adhuc de monachis superstes erat, cum audiret quod multi et magni viri de statu hujusmodi mulierum male sentirent et contra eas latrare non cessarent, rogavit Deum ut ostenderet ei cujusmodi mulieres essent quas beguinas seculares nominabant, et accepto divinitus responso, invenirentur in fide stabiles et in opere eificaces, tantum post modum eas diligebat quod earum detractoribus semper opponebat se.’

discovered that not even half of what was happening had been told him, just as when the Queen of Sheba marveled at the magnificent Salomon [1 Kings 10].”²⁹⁶

This small community of regular canons would remain closely associated with the Marie D’Oignies, but regardless of this carefully fostered association and the work of clerics like Jacques and Thomas, women’s communities continued to be targets of suspicion.²⁹⁷

Perhaps these exempla about Lutgard suggest that she was not viewed as “feminine” at all. By overcoming her inherently lustful nature, one might argue, she, like Gerard’s nun, exhibited masculine traits.²⁹⁸ Alison Moore concurs that in the thirteenth-century hagiographies of Liège, men typically move away from masculine ideals, while women move towards them, but for both the process of transformation is central rather than a static gender identity.²⁹⁹ In these narratives, asceticism is often cast as warfare in which men and women are both active soldiers. Moore stresses that rather than inversion of gender, these examples reveal one stage on the path towards unity with God, as they move away from a sexual identity altogether towards sanctity and mystical union.³⁰⁰ The Church Father, Origen in fact had proposed that gender was introduced only after the Fall.³⁰¹ These ideas would suggest both a gender continuum and an

²⁹⁶ *Historia foundationis uenerabilis ecclesia beati Nicholai Oigniacensis*, col 329: ‘In odore praeterea boni nominis filiorum Dei de semotis accurens uenerabilis et reverendus pater bonae memoriae dominus Jacobus Tusculanus et Acconensis episcopus ac sedis apostolicae cardinalis, probaturus si quod hominum insonuerat auribus super devotione nostri status primitivi, fides operibus exhiberet: non famae, quae quandoque laborat mendacio, creditit, donec ipse oculis suis vidit et probavit quod media pars sibi non fuerat nuntiata, sicut olim regina Saba mirata magnificentiam Salomis.’

²⁹⁷ Sharon Farmer, “Low Country Ascetics and Oriental Luxury: Jacques de Vitry, Marie of Oignies, and the Treasures of Oignies,” in *History in the Comic Mode : Medieval Communities and the Matter of Person*, eds. Rachel Fulton Brown and Bruce W Holsinger (New York: Columbia University Press, 2007), 205-7.

²⁹⁸ Karras, “Thomas Aquinas’s Chastity Belt,” 56.

²⁹⁹ Alison Moore, “Convergence, Conversion, and Transformation: Gender and Sanctity in Thirteenth-Century Liege,” *Representing Medieval Genders and Sexualities in Europe: Construction, Transformation, and Subversion, 600-1530* (Burlington, VT: Ashgate Publishing Group, 2011), 35.

³⁰⁰ Moore, “Convergence, Conversion, and Transformation,” 43.

³⁰¹ This was an extension of Origen’s notion of the strict duality of the postlapsarian world, see Gerard E. Caspary, *Politics and Exegesis: Origen and the Two Swords* (Berkeley and Los Angeles: University of California Press, 1979); for the implications of this ideology on the Church Fathers see Susanna Elm, *Virgins of God : The Making of Asceticism in Late Antiquity* (New York: Clarendon Press: Oxford University Press, 1994), 376-7.

eventual absence of gender in sanctity. For Jacques and Thomas holy women may have fought like men, but the amazing aspects of their holiness remained connected to their identity as women. In other words, holiness was not without gender even when they were continuously defying those expectations.

Jacques attempted to balance these varied factors in his own preaching. Drawing on a classical comparison, he juxtaposed the virgin (*virgo*) with the warrior (*virago*), who fights her own nature to protect her spiritual integrity.³⁰² While both sexes were admonished to fight against evil, there is a special emphasis placed on women's responsibility to resist vice:

Just as when an army is destroyed and put to flight, the soldier resists manfully who turns towards the enemy and returns to battle So too when the army of humanity, especially women, is assaulted and trodden down by the devil, that woman is rightly commended who resists bravely...and overcomes the devil by fighting him.³⁰³

In some cases, Jacques presented this fight as brutal. In his *exempla*, he included an episode in which a beautiful nun was seized by a powerful and rich lord, who had founded the monastery. When she asked her captors why he chose her among the other women, they explained it was for her beautiful eyes. The nun, rejoicing, then ripped out her eyes exclaiming, "Behold the eyes he desired, take them so that he may leave me in peace and not take away my soul!"³⁰⁴ Here again it is the man who is prone to lust, but it is still the woman's responsibility to destroy her femininity—in the form of her beauty—to preserve her salvation, thus transitioning on the gender continuum towards masculine.

³⁰² Jacques de Vitry, *Sermo communis de uirginibus et aliis mulieribus*, in Muessig, *Faces of Women*, 1.9, 166: 'Unde et uirgo quasi uirago dicitur eo quod tyranno nature et motibus sensualitatis uiriliter resistit, dum in carne supra carnem uiuit.'

³⁰³ Ibid., 3.6, 180: "Sicut ergo confecto exercitu et in fugam uerso, miles ille, qui ad hostes conuertitur et ad pugnam reuersus, uiriliter resistit, merito commendatur, ita exercitu humani generis et maxime mulierum, a diabolo confecto et conculcato, merito mulier illa commendatur que aliis succumbentibus fortiter resistit, et diabolum pugnando deuicit."

³⁰⁴ Jacques de Vitry, *Exempla*, LVII, 22: "Ecce oculi quos desiderat ferte illi ut me in pace dimittat et animam mihi non auferat," et ita perditis oculis carnalibus, spiritualis oculos seruat.

Thomas also portrayed Lutgard as fighting manfully, and indeed fighting men. Her rejections of men often required force, such as when she “manfully repulsed” a knight who stubbornly loved her. When her polite “no” was not sufficient she repelled him bravely with abusive speech.³⁰⁵ But this soldier was not dissuaded. Thomas recounted how the rejected knight intent on having her, intercepted Lutgard “with a crowd of attendants trying to take her.”³⁰⁶ But while riding away on horseback, Lutgard escaped by wrenching herself violently from the hands of the men, and was guided back home through the dark woods by an angel. When she arrived back early in the morning, Lutgard’s nurse assumed she had been raped: “Surely that man violently overwhelmed you tonight?”³⁰⁷ Since the crowd saw Lutgard carried away, Thomas explained, they assumed what “usually happens in such cases” and shouted that the soldier was a rapist.³⁰⁸ These accusations alone terrified the soldier, who stopped harassing the virgin and ran away. Because of all the commotion, Thomas admitted, people still had suspected that Lutgard was despoiled.³⁰⁹ Just as the denials of rape during the Siege of Liège, the public opinion sided with what “usually happens in such cases.” In both cases we see a persistent ambivalent discourse that strived to present holy women as brave guardians of their own chastity, while implicitly admitting to men’s’ failure to protect them.

Thomas also included an explicit endorsement for physical violence by other women, moving beyond Jacques’ advice to veneration rather than copy these holy women. Reportedly,

³⁰⁵ Thomas of Cantimpré, *Vita Lutgardis*: 1.1.4.col 0237F: ‘Sed et alius quidam juvenis, in armis Miles strenuus, Lutgardem, Deo jam sincerius inhaerentem nihilominus adamavit. Hic cum multis jam annis renitentem animo procaretur; illa eum decenter primo, et postmodum serius avertebat. Cumque videret Militem in stultitia pertinacem, ab ea illo in tempore contumeliosus sermonibus est repulsus.’

³⁰⁶ Ibid., 1.1.5: ‘iter arriperet: cui juvenis obvius cum turba satellitum eam rapere nitebatur.’

³⁰⁷ Ibid.: ‘Quam ut nutrix vidit, suspicata raptum, dixit: Numquid te juvenis ille hac nocte violenter oppressit?’

³⁰⁸ Ibid., 1.1.5: ‘Servi enim ejus, ut viderunt praecedenti vespere juvenem super se cum manu valida venientem, fugerunt; et ut in talibus mos est, inclamaverunt juvenem ut raptorem.’

³⁰⁹ Ibid.: ‘Occasione igitur hujus clamoris et fugae, in suspicionem hominum innocens puella devenit.’

the abbot of Sint-Truiden lined up the nuns to kiss them, and although Lutgard tried to refuse, the crowd pushed her forward and he kissed her.³¹⁰ However, Jesus placed his hand of mercy in the way so that “she did not feel the violence of this act” and did not even “feel the festering of even the first carnal stirring.”³¹¹ Unlike Thomas and Jacques, Lutgard’s chastity was not portrayed as an inward struggle, but rather as an external battle against lustful men. Likewise, he employed this episode to offer an insightful aside on how all women should rebuff the advances of men:

You as well, virgin, whether you are a bride of Christ or any woman who loves chastity, should flee men as Lutgard did. . . . If anyone wishes to importune you with a supposedly holy kiss, if anyone tries to put his hand on your breast, your bosom, or any other part of your body, give him spittle instead of a kiss and let your fist meet his groping hand. Nor should you defer to any cleric or person of rank in such matters, because it is just as lawful to protect the chastity of the mind as the life of the body, even with a blow. Look upon such a one not as a servant of Christ, but of Satan; not spiritual but animal; not a follower of modesty, but indeed the vilest lecher.³¹²

Thomas offered Lutgard as a prime example for all women to imitate, suggesting that women go from verbal to physical violence. Lutgard refused the abbot, but she did not meet his lips with her fist because Christ’s hand rescued her. Thomas, however, did not assume divine intervention would save all his readers. Instead, he recommended behaviors more typically associated with masculine aggression, such as spitting and hitting, to protect physical integrity.³¹³

³¹⁰ Ibid., 1.2.21.col 0241C: ‘Medio autem tempore accidit, ut Abbas S. Trudonis, Pater scilicet spiritualis ipsius monasterii S. Catharinae a generali Concilio Lateranensi veniens, cum processione a Monialibus exciperetur. Facta autem oratione in Ecclesia conventum totum ad Capitulum evocavit, et ut minus caute inter simplices est moris, osculum singulis dedit. Cumque ad Priorissam Lutgardem ventum esset, ut Abbati osculum daret, illa constanter renuit. Sed omnium in joco, manibus tenta, violentiamque passa, sustinuit.’

³¹¹ Ibid.: ‘Sed summae benignitatis Jesus misericordiae suae manum ita mediam posuit, ut nec primi motus contagium in viri osculo senserit.’

³¹² Ibid., col 0241E-F: ‘Tu ergo Virgo, sponsa utique Christi, aut amatrix quaelibet castitatis, cum Lutgarde fuge tales: flagitium abhorresce. Si quis te quasi ad sanctum osculum sollicitare voluerit; si quis manu ad sinum, ad ubera, vel ad partes reliquas appropinquare tentaverit, sputum pro oculo reddas, et pugnum obvium contrectanti: nec Clerico in hoc deferas vel personae: quia castitatem mentis etiam verbere tueri licet, sicut corporis vitam. Talem, inquam, non arbitreris servum Christi, sed satanae; non spiritualem, sed animale; non pudicitiae sectatorem, sed revera vilissimum leccatorem.’

³¹³ William Malmesbury’s work also reveals a distinction between women’s exercise of legitimate violence, in protection of one’s morality, and illegitimate violence, in pursuit of power, Fenton, *Gender, Nation, and Conquest*, 33.

While “elite” virgins had a variety of tools for preserving their chastity, other less saintly women, in Jacques’ presentation, had to rely on godly husbands or masters to punish infidelities. For example, using an animal metaphor, Jacques recounted how a man had singed the tail of his beautiful cat who continually strayed to the neighbor’s home. Thus the cat, seeing “its own shame and disfigurement, remained in its master’s home next to the hearth.”³¹⁴ Jacques concluded that in the same way, masters ought to dress their maidservants in modest, cheap clothing to keep them—like the disfigured cat—domesticated.³¹⁵ The beauty and honor embodied by a woman’s hair was central to another story where a husband, after discovering his wife was having an affair with a priest, cut her hair into a tonsure with a razor. Jacques concluded the story exclaiming: “Blessed be that husband!”³¹⁶ While Jacques elsewhere decried indiscriminate violence against women and especially against unborn children, he repeatedly emphasized in his sermon stories men’s responsibility for the bodily and spiritual well-being of their wives.³¹⁷

Noble women also, Jacques suggested, were responsible for the virtue of their servants.³¹⁸ He recalled a powerful noble woman whose female servant offered to procure a lover for her, “who is honest and beautiful, and worthy to be loved.”³¹⁹ The noblewoman gathered her household to witness the violent beating of the servant who was then cast out of the window,

³¹⁴ Jacques de Vitry, *Exempla*, CCIX, 87: ‘Cui dominus caudam combussit et pellem ex magna parte depilavit, unde videns se turpem et deformatam in domo domini sui juxta ignem remansit.’

³¹⁵ Ibid., 88: ‘Ita huiusmodi ancilla pannis vilibus et abjecta in domo debet retinui.’

³¹⁶ Ibid., CCX, 88: ‘Unde audivi de quodam qui, cum invenisset uxorem suam cum sacerdote, abscidit ei capillos in rotundum supra aures et cum rasorio fecit sibi amplam coronam, [et] dicens: "Tales debent esse sacerdotisse." Benedictus sit homo ille.’

³¹⁷ Jacques blames husbands for causing their wives’ miscarriages through drunkenness and continued intimacy during their pregnancy, blaming them for the damnation of their unborn children, *Exempla*, CCXXVI and CCXXIX, 94-5.

³¹⁸ For a discussion of Jacques de Vitry and Guilbert of Tournai’s treatment of the matron’s responsibility for the spiritual well-being of the whole household, including chastity see Farmer’s *Surviving Poverty*, 112.

³¹⁹ Jacques de Vitry, *Exempla*, CCLII, 106 : ‘Domina, talis diligit vos, qui multum probus est et pulcher et dignus amari.’

falling into the river below, thus setting a virtuous example for the whole household. Therefore, the responsibility to exert violent methods to protect the integrity of women extended beyond the authority of men, as Jacques advised: “If from the start such women manfully resisted such types of old women and shameful men, they would not be so brazen.”³²⁰ Thus implying as it were, that women—perhaps women who had confessed to Jacques—had asserted that the circumstances of their indiscretions were outside their control. But Jacques’ sermon stories reject such a notion, women’s forceful action—or as it were inaction—would bear the full responsibility and blame for their loss of virtue.³²¹

Just as Thomas admitted to the suspicions of Lutgard’s rape, Jacques described the economic and social ruin caused by false rumors of immodesty, ruining women’s opportunities for marriage.³²² In one incident, he explained that when a woman sought justice for rape, the judge set up a trap to disprove her claim. After giving her a fee as restitution for her molestation, the judge sent someone to rob her. When the woman fought off her attacker, the judge determined her claim of rape had been false since she would have just as bravely fought off her previous attacker.³²³ Whether false claims were in fact made, the message reveals women’s claims of molestation or denials of it were fundamentally suspect. To prove themselves as virtuous women, they were expected to violently fight off attackers. Despite this ambivalent attitude to violence against women, a certain “righteous violence”—whether by the hands of

³²⁰ Ibid.: ‘Si enim mulieres huiusmodi vetulis et impudicis hominibus a principio viriliter resisterent non haberent tantam audaciam.’

³²¹ Jacques also had hands on experience with noble women’s marital issues as seen in a letter from Honorius III that commanded Jacques and the patriarch of Jerusalem to look into the kinship ties between Alice the Queen of Cyprus and Bohemond of Antioch who were married in the fourth degree, Pierre-Vincent Claverie, *Honorius III et l’Orient (1216-1227): étude et publication de sources inédites des Archives vaticanes (ASV)* (Boston, Brill: 2013): #150, 477.

³²² Jacques de Vitry, *Exempla*, CCLXXXI.

³²³ Ibid., CCLV, 107: ‘Redde pecuniam juveni, si enim prius ita fortiter repugnasses et clamares nunquam opprimere te potuisset, sed tu plus diligis pecuniam quam castitatem.’

women themselves or by their pious husbands—recurred consistently in Jacques’ pastoral literature as a legitimate means to protect the integrity of the female body.

Jacques and Marie

In his *vita* of “the precious pearl” Marie D’Oignies (1177-1213), Jacques himself looms large, at times obscuring who or what this *vita* is really about. John W. Coakley suggests that clerics like Jacques sought out these relationships with holy women because there were “desirable aspects of Christian experience that the institutional authority could not guarantee to clerics,” namely the affective elements of the faith.³²⁴ He concludes that Jacques, as representative of the institutional church, appropriated “the effects of [Marie’s] spiritual gifts that he does not possess.”³²⁵ But Marie as a holy woman was hard to categorize.³²⁶ Like the clerics she counseled, her type of lay-religious vocation kept her within the world. Jacques’ *vita* seems to work on one level to define and possibly legitimize this type of spiritual ideal.³²⁷ By “gathering up the fragments lest they be lost,” Jacques presented an exemplar of lay sanctity, unlike classically defined saints.³²⁸ Jacques explained that the impetus for composing Marie’s *vita* was in part to combat heresy. Reportedly while in exile, Fulk, Bishop of Toulouse had visited the diocese of Liège and observed these female communities, reportedly even meeting Marie.³²⁹ Toulouse was of course a city famously associated with the Albigensian Crusade. In

³²⁴ Coakley, *Women, Men, and Spiritual Power*, 3.

³²⁵ *Ibid.*, 68-71.

³²⁶ She appears to fit between two categories of female saints established by Schulenburg, those of the early Middle Ages (500-1100) whose “access to sainthood came essentially through worldly power, high status, public office, and social and economic prominence” and those of the late Middle Ages, characterized for the mystical traits, *Forgetful of Their Sex*, 60.

³²⁷ Mulder-Baker disagrees that this work would have ever been intended to support canonization or encourage a cult, “Holy Laywomen,” 30.

³²⁸ Mulder-Baker argues that these writings functioned similarly as relics and most importantly became part of the history of salvation, *Ibid.*, 30-1.

³²⁹ Hinnebusch, *H. Occ.*, 5; Berlière, *Monasticon belge*, I, 452. Jacques describes this visit and the effect Marie had on the Bishop in the *VMO*: 90-1.

1211, Jacques was commissioned by a papal legate, Raymond, Bishop of Uzès, to preach crusade against the Albigensians in France and Lotharingia. While working in this capacity, Marie died and Jacques composed her *vita*.³³⁰ Jacques, addressing Bishop Fulk's request, explained:

Even though you say that it is helpful for you and many others if you could preach to the public against the heretics of your province those things which God accomplishes in the persons of modern saints in our days, nevertheless, I do not agree to commend in writing the miraculous powers of those women who are still alive and their works, because this would in no way be able to be sustained."³³¹

But how can the life of a woman whose unconventional form of piety would only receive verbal approval from the papacy in 1216, fight heresy? Perhaps Jacques acknowledged that Marie's life combatted heresy as the most aggressive possible defense against this charge. Marie then became the contemporary champion the embattled church needed.³³²

Like all hagiographers, Jacques tried to show how his subject was marked from childhood with signs of sanctity—for example, with girlish experiments in asceticism. Marie's life, however, followed a typical trajectory for a wealthy urban family of Nivelles. She was literate, suggesting a basic education, skilled with a spindle, and her parents arranged her marriage at the customary age of fourteen.³³³ Marie eventually asked her husband, John, to live in a chaste marriage, and with his consent and despite the scorn from family, they worked together at a leprosarium in Williambroux.³³⁴ Eventually she moved to Oignies. In the final

³³⁰ Hinnebusch, *H. Occ.*, 5. Marie D'Oignies died June 23, 1213.

³³¹ Jacques de Vitry, *VMO*, Prologus, 229-34: 'Licet autem tu diceris valde tibi et multis aliis esse commodum si contra hereticos provincie tue ea, que deus in sanctis modernis in diebus nostris operatur, in publicum posses predicare, ego tamen non acquievi earum que adhuc vivunt virtutes et opera scripto commendare, quia nullo modo sustineret.' Details in Jacques' *vita* of Marie and his sermons have been identified as implicitly denouncing the Cathars, Kienzle, "Preaching the Cross," 25; Coakley, *Women, Men, and Spiritual Power*, 68.

³³² This work influenced subsequent accounts of holy women including Yvette of Huy and Juliana of Cornillon, Mulder-Bakker, "Holy Laywomen," 33.

³³³ Jacques de Vitry, *VMO*, I.1-2.

³³⁴ *Ibid.*, 2. Jacques never makes it clear whether this marriage was consummated but as other scholars have noted, Jacques did not pass up an opportunity to praise a virgin, suggesting that Marie's marriage might have been consummated, Brown, "Chaste Erotics," 82.

years, she lived as an “informal recluse” connected to St. Nicholas of Oignies, the same Augustinian convent that Jacques had entered.³³⁵ John’s consent to this arrangement was a sign of both piety and pragmatism. His brother was Master Guido, chaplain of the church of Williambroux, who served the beguines in Nivelles, making this type of lay religiosity familiar and valued.³³⁶ The choice of a holy life did not negate her role as a mother, albeit as a spiritual one. For example, when Marie experienced episodes of painful cold, she scoured her mind for the cause. She discovered that her purgatorial pain was partially “because she had been very negligent in correcting her sons and her own family.”³³⁷ These *filios* refer to her religious community. The role of motherhood, therefore was not cancelled by her chaste marriage, but came with even greater responsibilities and otherworldly tortures. While her marriage made Marie a relatable holy woman for lay audiences, Jacques cautioned his readers from the outset that Marie’s life is not a path for all women: “what is a privilege for a few does not make a rule for many.”³³⁸

Jacques recounted Marie’s life as marked by regular acts of extreme asceticism. This included secret self-mutilation by cutting and binding her body,³³⁹ excessive weeping, and

³³⁵ Mulder-Baker, “Holy Women and Their Biographers,” 2; On the community’s association to Marie’s holiness and the creation of reliquaries by Hugh of Oignies to house Marie’s relics see Farmer, “Low Country Ascetics and Oriental Luxury,” 207-14.

³³⁶ Newman, *Marie of Oignies*, 105, see footnote 106.

³³⁷ Jacques de Vitry, *VMO*, II.3.227-32: ‘Revelabat autem ei beatus Petrus et penas et penarum causas: vehementi enim calore torquebatur eo quod mundum et voluptates seculi nimis ardentem amasset, aliquando frigore maximo cruciatur eo quod pigra ad bonum fuerit, et maxime quia filios suos et propriam familiam nimis negligenter correxit.’

³³⁸ *Ibid.*, I.54-60: ‘Nec hoc dixerim ut excessum commendem, sed ut favorem ostendam. In his autem et multis aliis, que privilegio gratie operata est, attendat lector discretus quod paucorum privilegia non faciunt legem commune: eius virtutes imitemur, opera vero virtutum eius sine private privilegio imitari non possemus.’

³³⁹ On her cutting see: Jacques de Vitry, *VMO*, 1.7.241-6: ‘Fervore enim spiritus quasi inebriate, pre dulcedine carni agni paschalis carnes suas fastidens frustra non modica cum cutello resecauit, que pre verecundia in terram abscondit, et quia nimio amoris incendio inflammata carnis dolorem superavit, unum de seraphim in hoc mentis excessu sibi assistentem aspexit.’ On the connection between female spirituality and physicality see Caroline Walker Bynum, *Holy Feast and Holy Fast: The Religious Significance of Food to Medieval Women* (Berkeley, University of California Press, 1987); Giles Constable, *Attitudes Toward Self-Inflicted Suffering in the Middle Ages*, The Ninth Stephen J. Brademas Sr., Lecture (Brookline, Mass.: Hellenic College Press, 1982), 7-28.

prolonged fasts contributing to the disfigurement of her body.³⁴⁰ The predictable final result was an early death at the age of 36. Upon her death, Jacques reports, Marie was so emaciated that when her sisters washed her body: “her spine touched her belly and the bones of her back seemed to lie under the skin of her stomach as if under a thin linen cloth.”³⁴¹ But her extreme life came with extraordinary privileges, including prophetic visions, healing powers, knowledge of divine mysteries, and an advisory role with priests and clerics, including Jacques.³⁴² As Barbara Newman suggests these women, who were not allowed to preach, could exercise their influence on men through their prayers and advice.³⁴³

Prior to introducing himself into the narrative, Jacques recorded several episodes which emphasized Marie’s assistance to clerics and priests. He situated Marie’s role with these men in the context of her extraordinary ascetic behavior, only acceptable “when her manner of life passed beyond the boundaries of human reason and she had been left by herself with special privilege from God.”³⁴⁴ Jacques’ emphasis on Marie’s unique qualities as a women, then set the stage for his account of their own relationship.

³⁴⁰ On the disfigurement of her stomach, likely from kwashiorkor syndrome caused by the lack of protein, see, *Ibid.*, 1.8.268-74: ‘Quandam die, dum corpus comedendo reficeret, vidit hostem antiquum Invidia tabescentem, et cum non haberet amplius quid faceret insultabat ei, dicens, ‘Ecce o gulosa, nimis imple te!’ Ipsa enim longis confecta et coartata ieiuniis quandoque laborabat manducando et modico cibo stomachum frigidum et constrictum quasi ciberia respuentem tumescendo dolebat.’

³⁴¹ *Ibid.*, II.13.1654-7: ‘Cum autem a morte lavaretur ejus sacrum corpusculum inventa est ita attenuata et infirmitate ieiuniisque confecta, quod dorsi eius spina ventri ejus contigua erat et quasi sub tenui panno lineo, sub ventris eius pellicula ossa dorsi ejus apparebant.’

³⁴² Marie’s gift for intercessory prayer seemed particularly relevant for some readers. A copy of the vita of Marie D’Oignies found in Brussels II 700 includes a small note sewn in that petitions for prayers on behalf of a deceased sister: “Obiit in Hoeden soror Anna Huefers monialis prophessa pro qua petuntur orationes nostrae,” Brussels Royal Library, II 700, 91f.

³⁴³ Newman, *Collected Saints’ Lives*, 13. As Bérou notes, from 1180-1235 “theologians addressed the question of the right to speak in the church in a more comprehensive way than before,” this included the types of speech and their assignment to circumstances and gender, “Women Giving Religious Instruction,” 137.

³⁴⁴ Jacques de Vitry, *VMO*, II.4.599-600 : ‘Unde tantam postea prerogativam libertatis obtinuit quod nemo iam audebat dicere : “Cur ita facis?” dumque rationem humanam ejus vita excederet, quodam speciali privilegio, deo sibi relicto, omnia iudicabat sed a nemine iudicabatur.’

Jacques, returning to the Siege of Liège mentioned already in the prologue, explained how Marie had consoled John of Nivelles after the attack. Marie reportedly had a divine forewarning about the siege before the news had reached Oignies. She witnessed demons, “bloody as if after battle,” returning from the devastation of Liège “with a proud and ostentatious noise, threatening even greater things with a proud expression.”³⁴⁵ Right after this vision, messengers brought the news of the destruction, stating that “churches had been plundered, the women violently attacked, and citizens were killed.”³⁴⁶ Their teacher and spiritual father, John of Nivelles, brokenheartedly grieved at the thought that “the holy virgins, whom he had brought to the Lord by preaching and example were perhaps attacked violently, just as certain men were falsely reporting, but just like a concerned father, he doubted the news.”³⁴⁷ Jacques commended John, because his devastation was over the harm done to the churches and the destruction of souls, rather than because of the stolen items, noting that: “as father, he wept for his sons, the patrons of the churches, as the friend of the bridegroom he wept for the virgins, whom he had betrothed, chaste, to the chaste bridegroom.”³⁴⁸ But Marie rescued this man from his inconsolable grief. She assured John that despite the circulating reports, God had in fact preserved the holy virgins from defilement. She does not note whether they lived or died. The absence of Marie’s own despair or shock at these rumors, Jacques asserted, proved Marie’s

³⁴⁵ Ibid., II.3.355-9: ‘Alia die vidit maximum iniquorum spirituum exercitum, qui quasi post prelium cruentati cum superbo et pomposo strepitu de vastatione civitatis Leodiensis revertentur et adhuc maiora mala elato vultu comminabantur.’

³⁴⁶ Ibid., 361-2: ‘ecclesias spoliatas, mulieres vi oppressas, cives interfectos, universa civitatis bona hostes rapuisse referebant.’

³⁴⁷ Ibid., 365-70: ‘[M]agister Iohannes de Nivella, qui cum rumores pessimos percipisset mente consternatus incomparabiliter doluit, et maxime quia de sanctis virginibus, quas ipse per predicationem et exemplum domino acquisierat, ne forte vi oppresse fuissent, sicut quidam mentiebatur, paterna sollicitudine dubitabat.’

³⁴⁸ Ibid., 370-7: ‘Non multum de temporalium amissione doluit qui semper temporalia tanquam stercorea reputavit, sed ecclesiarum violationem, animarum destructionem vir sanctus, omni virtutum gemma specialiter et excellenter exornatus, inconsolabiliter lugebat: pater filios plorabat, patronus ecclesias, amicus sponsi virgines, quas casto sponso castas exhibere desponderat.’

divine premonition, since everyone knew how much she loved these holy virgins.³⁴⁹ While the brothers of Oignies feared the rumors of attacks, Marie remained tranquil, “as if she had been granted certainty about the holy virgins’ peace and incorruptibility.”³⁵⁰

Taken together with Jacques’ account in the prologue, these reports confirm the resounding impact of the Siege of Liège on him, and in particular the violence against holy women. Jacques admitted to the death of the city’s citizens. He confessed readily to the desecration of the churches. But Jacques adamantly refused to acknowledge the rape of the holy women. It appears that in an attempt to erase orally-circulating claims, he presented a story of triumph where virgins bravely overpowered their attackers or suffocated their chaste bodies in dung heaps.³⁵¹ Most importantly, they preserved their purity for their Bridegroom. Likely, just as John of Nivelles, Jacques feared that those he had brought to the Lord, “by preaching and example” were left without protection. Particularly striking is Marie’s insistence that her own dear friends were not raped. Situated within his account of Marie’s spiritual qualities, namely the seven gifts of the Holy Spirit, Jacques styled Marie’s comforting disavowals of rape as a sign of her piety.³⁵² The specter of these rape victims seemingly could not simply be jettisoned from the narrative, rather they had to be addressed repeatedly, so that they could be willfully denied.

³⁴⁹ Ibid., 377-81: ‘Ancilla vero Christi, auditis rumoribus non multum turbata est, et mirabantur qui cognoscebant, quanta affectione diligeret virgines pudicas, que in civitate Leodii Christo devote serviebant, ipsa autem a domino et premunita erat et preventa.’

³⁵⁰ Ibid., 379-90: ‘Cumque fratres de Oegnies more clericorum valde timerent, eo quod diceretur, quod hostes in partes eorum venirent; ipsa in omnibus iis imperturbata permanebat et absque timore, sanctis angelis eam consolantibus et in terra pacem bonæ voluntatis hominibus nuntiantibus. Magnam vero pacem et quietem circa domum de Oignies sentiebat, quasi in spiritu certificata, et de pace suorum et de incorruptione sanctarum predictarum virginum.’

³⁵¹ Jacques de Vitry, *VMO*, Prologus, 5.110-4. See footnote 221.

³⁵² As Mulder-Bakker shows, “The historical circumstances are not incidental . . . the actual course of history is instrumental; the pious woman intervenes in historical reality and shapes her personal identity and holiness by means of factual circumstances, “Holy Laywomen and Their Biographers,” 32.

As noted earlier, Thomas of Cantimpré's *vita* of Lutgard asserted that Jacques struggled with improper feelings for a holy woman. In that episode, it was Lutgard's intercession that released him from this earthly attachment. In Jacques' own account of Marie's life, he describes a "certain man's" affections for Marie, but neither names himself or includes Lutgard. This scene occurs in a section depicting Marie's abundance of the seven heavenly virtues. Under the section on fortitude, Jacques depicted Marie's special love for preachers, whose feet she would grasp and kiss.³⁵³ He then explained that he was the answer to Marie's prayers, as she had pleaded to God for her own personal preacher.³⁵⁴ Jacques portrayed their relationship as symbiotic. He would preach and she would pray for him, comparing their relationship to St. Martin praying for Hilary, while the latter preached.³⁵⁵ Jacques' description of Marie's body at death may have served to further undermine suspicions of impropriety. She had, Jacques said, "dried out" from her continual ascetic practices removing the possibility of carnal stirrings, noting that "thus did that young female drummer, as it were, dry out her body as if stretched between two arms of one cross."³⁵⁶ This drummer alludes to another Mary, Miriam the Old Testament prophetess who "took a drum in her hand" leading the women through the parted Red Sea (Ex. 15:20).³⁵⁷ In Jacques' description of the little drum, however, Marie becomes both drummer and drum.³⁵⁸

³⁵³ Jacques de Vitry, *VMO*, II.4.652-6: 'Adeo autem predicatorum et fideles animarum pastores diligebat, quod pedes eorum post predicationis laborem mira affectione constringens, etiam ipsis invitis vel diu osculari oportebat vel pre anxietate cum se subtraherent clamabat.'

³⁵⁴ *Ibid.*, 656-61: 'Multis autem lacrymosis suspiriis, multis orationibus et ieiuniis a domino instantissime postulando obtinuit, ut meritum et officium prædicationis, quod in se actualiter exercere non poterat, in aliqua alia persona dominus ei recompensaret et quod sibi dominus pro magno munere unum predicatorem daret.'

³⁵⁵ *Ibid.*, 666-8: 'Nam pro ipso, singulis diebus dum esset in labore predicandi, domino et beate Virgini dicendo Ave Maria centies supplicabat, sicut predicante Hylario Martino orabat.'

³⁵⁶ *Ibid.*, 126: 'Adeo autem corpus suum juvenula illa tympanistria, quasi inter duo crucis ligna extendendo, desiccaverat, quod numquam per plures annos, primos etiam libidinis motus contra se insurgere senserat.'

³⁵⁷ For analysis on these musical metaphors see also Bruce W. Hollinger, *Music, Body, and Desire in Medieval Culture: Hildegard of Bingen to Chaucer* (Stanford, Calif.: Stanford University Press, 2001).

³⁵⁸ Interestingly Jacques used this type of musical metaphor for female mortification elsewhere. In a sermon addressed to virgins, Jacques cited Apoc. 14.4 in which the virgins are said to follow the Lamb singing, *Sermo communis de virginibus*, 1.17, in Muessig, *The Faces of Women*, 59: 'Cytharizare dicuntur in cytharis suis quia carnem suam pro Christo mortificant et deuota cora super lignum extendunt.' These examples also display Jacques'

Women's bodies, like an instrument, had to be transformed before they could be used or in Jacques' case, before they could partner with clerics.

Jacques appears to have built a case to justify the propriety of Marie's dealings with men, including Jacques himself. Not only was she physically transformed, emptied of carnality associated with her sex, but also her innocence made her forget that she was unique in this blissful state. As Jacques asserted: "from her great trust that she had towards men, from the abundance of her innocence and pure simplicity she thought them to be like her."³⁵⁹ It is Marie's presumed naivety that sets the stage for a "certain man's" impropriety:

For this reason, when one of her close friends clasped her hand from an excess of spiritual affection because he was very close to her, although in his chaste mind he thought no evil—he felt the first sexual stirrings rising up against him. She knew nothing about this and when she heard a voice from heaven saying 'Do not touch me' she did not understand what it meant.³⁶⁰

This command points to yet another Mary, as Christ said to Mary Magdalene after his resurrection: *noli me tangere* (John 20:17). In a fascinating reversal, it is Marie taking the role of Christ and Jacques—the role of the woman who must be rebuked. Unlike Jacques' account of public embarrassment of clerics by the prostitutes of Paris discussed in the previous chapter, he emphasized here the merciful privacy of the man's chastisement in this scene: "Truly gentle God has compassion on our weaknesses and he did not wish to confound him with shame before the holy woman, but as though he were jealous, he wished to guard the chastity of his friend."³⁶¹

understanding of the four humors and the connection of women's wet and cold nature leading to their weaker status and propensity to vice.

³⁵⁹ Jacques de Vitry, *VMO*, 126: 'Ex quo tantam fiduciam etiam inter homines habebat, quod omnes sibi similes ex abundantia innocentie et pura simplicitate aestimabat.'

³⁶⁰ Ibid.: 'Unde cum quidam eius familiaris amicus ex nimio spiritualis affectionis excessu manum eius aliquando stringeret, licet casto animo nihil turpe cogitaret, sensit tamen tamquam homo ex illa nimia vicinitate primos motus sibi insurgere. Cumque illa prorsus hoc ignoraret, audivit vocem ab excelso, scilicet *noli tangere me*, nec tamen intellexit quid significaret.' For a discussion on medieval men's struggle with nocturnal emissions and unwanted erections, including this example, see: Murray, "Problem of Male Embodiment," 9-22.

³⁶¹ Jacques de Vitry, *VMO*, II.5.798-801: 'Deus enim mitis, et nostris infirmitatibus compatiens, noluit illum coram sancta muliere verecundia confundere, volebat tamen, tamquam zelotes amicæ sue castitatem custodire et illum

When Marie shared the message she had heard, the man understood it was directed at his carnal stirrings, “and thereafter he guarded himself more carefully against such temptations, and he withdrew from her presence, giving thanks that God did not want to disclose his weakness.”³⁶²

Marie’s contrived simplicity provided an elegant way out of an awkward situation.

While Jacques did not name himself as this tempted man, he seems the most likely candidate. Jacques had recently graduated with his master’s title (1193), entering the community of Augustinian canons at the monastery of Saint Nicholas near Cambrai. He was young and inexperienced in ministry, making the attention from Marie a new and, one would imagine, exhilarating experience. As noted, he prefaced this scene by explaining Marie’s fondness for preachers, asserting that it was her answered prayers that brought Jacques to her. Like the *noli me tangere* scene, Marie’s grasping and kissing of the preachers’ feet also echoes the prostitute who kissed and washed Jesus’ feet, her long hair traditionally associated with Mary Magdalene. Drawing on these parallels, Jacques rebuked—as Jesus did to Judas—those suspicious of Marie’s physical devotional practices. But the juxtaposition of Marie’s kissing of feet with the grasping of Marie’s hands by this “certain man,” also admits to a parallel in excessive physical affections.³⁶³ Just as Lutgard’s rebuke of the bishop’s kiss of peace, these examples show a certain unease with the boundaries, or rather blurred boundaries, between holy women and religious men.

propter imminetia pericula castigare.’ Brown points out that God in this episode is both compassionate about male lust and jealous for Marie’s chastity, “Chaste Erotics,” 80.

³⁶² Ibid., 801-5: ‘Unde cum illa diceret ei: “Audivi nunc quamdam vocem, sed quid significet prorsus ignore, scilicet, *noli tangere me*,” ille, quid hoc esset intelligens, et sibi de cetero diligentius cavet et domino, qui ejus infirmitatem detegere noluit, gratias agens recessit.’

³⁶³ For other interpretations of this scene see: Jennifer N. Brown, “The Chaste Erotics of Marie d’Oignies and Jacques de Vitry,” *Journal of the History of Sexuality* 19.1 (January, 2010), 74-93; Baldwin, *Language of Sex*, 8-10, 86-7.

As for Lutgard's possible role in rescuing Jacques from his excessive affection for a "certain woman," seen in her *vita*, Jacques mentioned in the introduction of the *vita* of Marie that he would refrain from writing about holy women still living. This would have included Lutgard. Elsewhere in the *vita* of Marie, Jacques includes Lutgard but she is not named. For example, he describes Marie's assistance to a certain young woman in the monastery of the Cistercians who tried to kill herself, and her deathbed visit from a certain holy woman seeking prayers.³⁶⁴ Both of these moments are reported in Lutgard's *vita*. Regardless, this scene offers important insight on the challenges of clerical chastity and threat of public humiliation.³⁶⁵ Just as Thomas's scene of Lutgard's intercession for Jacques, Jacques' account of a cleric's unwanted "stirrings" for Marie acknowledged how lust challenged clerics, and the public suspicion over the propriety of their close relationships with holy women.

The importance of private correction contrasts with one of Jacques' moral tales about an affair between a monk and matron. Jacques showed with this story that the potential risks of such impropriety went beyond personal corruption. The story begins with a monk, serving as the treasurer and guardian of a well-respected monastery, who often met and discussed religious matters with a religious matron who assisted the church "both day and night."³⁶⁶ The Devil, envious of their purity and reputations, transformed their spiritual love into carnal love.³⁶⁷ The couple eloped, stealing goods from both the monastery's treasury and from the matron's

³⁶⁴ Jacques de Vitry, *VMO*, I.9.31 and II.12.106.

³⁶⁵ Contrast this to several episodes in the *exempla* of monks eloping with women, see for example, Jacques de Vitry, *Exempla*, CCLXXXII.

³⁶⁶ Jacques de Vitry, *Exempla*, CCLXXXII, 117: 'Accidit quo quedam honesta et religiosa matrona frequenter ad ecclesiam veniens die ac nocte devotissime Domino serviebat. Quidam autem monachus custos et thesaurarius monasterii magnum nomen religionis habebat et revera ita erat. Cum autem in ecclesia frequenter de hiis que ad religionem pertinent mutuo loquerentur. . .'

³⁶⁷ *Ibid.*: 'Cum autem in ecclesia frequenter de hiis que ad religionem pertinent mutuo loquerentur, diabolus invidens honestati et fame eorum immisit eis vehementes temptationes, ita quod amor spiritualis conversus est in carnalem.'

husband. When the monks and the husband discovered the theft, they set out and captured the couple. The actions of the illicit couple had far-reaching consequences: “they disgraced all religious people because the damage caused by their shame and the encouragement to sin was worse than the sin itself.”³⁶⁸ The Virgin Mary herself drove home this lesson. She appeared to the couple while they were begging for forgiveness and upbraided their folly, saying that while she could intercede on their behalf for their crimes, correcting the greater damage to the larger community might be impossible. Their sins had tarnished the reputation of religious persons before the entire community, and such damage was irreparable.³⁶⁹ Shockingly, the Virgin Mary demanded that demons, who were unable to refuse her commands, to fix the disgrace.³⁷⁰ Although they tried to resist, the demons eventually came up with a plan. They restored the stolen goods from the monastery, returned the matron along with the stolen items, back to her home.³⁷¹ Then, the demons feigned the appearance of the monk and matron, taking their place in prison.³⁷² When news of this wonder spread, everyone gathered at the prison where the demons publicly announced that they had tricked everyone from the very start. The demons thus masked the sins of the monk and nun, making it appear that they were innocent. Everyone then begged the monk and matron to forgive them, and so Jacques concludes: “Behold how great the infamy

³⁶⁸ Ibid., 118 : ‘Tantum autem fuit scandalum per totam regionem et ita omnes infamabant religiosas personas quod longe majus dampnum fuit de infamia et scandalo quam de ipsorum peccato.’

³⁶⁹ Ibid.: ‘“Remissionem,” inquit, “peccati vobis obtinere a filio meo possum, sed quid possum facere do tanto scandalo ? Vos enim fetere fecistis nomen religiosarum personarum, coram omni populo, ita quod de cetero religiosus personis non credetur; hoc est enim quasi dampnum inrecuperabile.”’

³⁷⁰ Ibid.: ‘Tandem orationibus earum pia Virgo devicta compulit demones qui hoc procuraverant venire, injungens eis quod sicut religionem infamaverant, ita quod infamia cessaret procurrarent illi.’

³⁷¹ Ibid.: ‘Vero cum non possent ejus imperiis resistere, post multas anxietes et varias cogitationes, reperta via quomodo cessaret infamia, restituerunt nocte monachum in ecclesia et archam fractam sicut prius etiam quam matrona aperuerat clausurunt et ferraverunt et pecuniam in ea reposuerunt, et in camera sua et in loco ubi nocte orare solebat mulierem posuerunt.’

³⁷² Ibid., 119: ‘et currentes ad carcerem viderunt monachum et mulierem in compedibus, sicut prius eos dimiserant; sic enim videbatur eis quod unus demonum transfiguraverat se in speciem monachi, et alius in speciem mulieris.’

and scandal and immeasurable damage the Devil would have been able to procure against religious persons, if not for the Blessed Mary's intervention."³⁷³

Jacques cited a similar episode in the *vita* of Marie. While Marie lay dying she was consoled by mystical visitations made by her dead friends. He reported that one such ghost was a certain man who was being greatly tortured in purgatory. This man had been a chaste monk but he had become "a stumbling block to many and a disgrace to the monks," when he abandoned his vows and returned to the world.³⁷⁴ Ignoring ecclesiastical reprimand, he added to this dishonor by marrying a woman who had been a chaste nun.³⁷⁵ He told Marie: "he was now suffering above all because he had wounded the Church of God through this scandal."³⁷⁶ Similar accusations swirled around the lay holy women too. For example, a Dominican monk claimed that the Ida of Louvain feigned sickness when she actually was pregnant with her confessor's child.³⁷⁷ The domino effect of this sort of transgression could potentially undermine the reputation of a religious house or even religion more broadly construed. In such cases, the laity might become susceptible to the seemingly pious lives of heterodox groups. Private sin was considered less dangerous than those with broader consequences. The public shame of such misdeeds was not about personal embarrassment or status alone: it was about undermining the

³⁷³ Ibid.: 'Ecce quantum infamiam et scandalum atquo inestimabile dampnum dyabolus contra religiosas personas procurasset nisi Beata Virgo succurrisset.'

³⁷⁴ Jacques de Vitry, *VMO*, II.12.1506-15: 'Quidam etiam petiturus auxilium ab ancilla Christi in infirmitate illa apparuit ei, qui maximo cruciatu in purgatorio torquebatur: ipse enim aliquando et speciem et nomen habuit religionis, et in statu se ostendebat perfectionis, post hec vero cum multorum scandalo et religionis obprobrio revertens ad seculum contraxit cum quadam, que diu similiter perfectionis vitam ostenderat, que primam fidem irritam fecit; super omnia autem se cruciari dicebat quia ecclesiam dei scandalizando leserat.'

³⁷⁵ Ibid.: 'et religionis obprobrio revertens ad seculum, contraxit cum quadam, que diu similiter perfectionis vitam ostenderat, que primam fidem irritam fecit.'

³⁷⁶ Ibid.: 'Super omnia autem se cruciari dicebat, quod ecclesiam Dei scandalizando leserat.' Other holy lay women addressed this particular type of scandal such as the anchoress, Yvette of Huy who called out a priest for sleeping with a women in the church building," Mulder-Bakker, "Holy Laywomen and Their Biographers," 23.

³⁷⁷ Mulder-Bakker, "Holy Laywomen and Their Biographers," 17. Compare this with the Dominican confessor who accused a community of holy lay women of being a brothel, Jacques de Vitry, *Exempla*, CCLXXIX, 116.

institutional authority that the priest represented. Jacques' inclusion of this episode on one hand admits the potential dangers of women's association with their priests, but also served as an example of how private correction could preserve the credibility of the Church. The beguines were under scrutiny from Dominicans, and rumors of impropriety threatened these women's own precarious status. Such rumors, however, also had the potential to destabilize male religious authority in the eyes of larger community.

Marie's inability to understand the message, "do not touch me" is also telling. Feigned ignorance provided a means of rebuking Jacques without humiliating him, but sits in sharp contrasts with Thomas's presentation of Lutgard who violently rebuked men. It does, however, align with the occurrences in the *exempla* where the actions of unwitting women revealed the vices of men. While Marie also exercised violence to protect her virtue, Jacques portrayed this viciousness as most often against herself though her extreme ascetic acts like when she cut "a large piece of her flesh with a knife."³⁷⁸ However, this is congruent with both Thomas's and Jacques' assignment of lust as an internal battle specific to men rather than the more common attribution to women. Looking at Jacques' direct asides to his reader also helps elucidate this dichotomy.

Jacques paused throughout Book One's account of Marie's exterior life to draw attention briefly to specific moral lessons pertinent to his readers.³⁷⁹ He directs two to women, two to men, and one as a general address. In the latter, contrasting Marie's austerity, he chastised men's vanity, asserting that: "those who lay about in your covers and sleep in ivory beds, who use soft

³⁷⁸ Jacques de Vitry, *VMO*, I7.241-6, see footnote 331. On the *virginitas deformitate defensa* topoi see Schulenberg, *Forgetful of Her Sex*, 153; and Constable, *Attitudes Toward Self-Inflicted Suffering*, 7-28.

³⁷⁹ I am including here five direct addresses he makes to his readers that are set apart from the narrative of Marie that emphasize this work and Marie as a living example.

fabrics, you will die and be buried in your pleasures. You live your days in good fortune, but in a instant you will descend to the utmost hell, where ‘maggots will be the bed under you and worms your covering.’³⁸⁰ Among his two admonitions aimed at men, one rebukes lustful men seeking extramarital affairs. After describing Marie’s chaste husband, John, he proclaims: “Let the wretched men blush and tremble who pollute themselves outside of marriage with illicit affairs, when these two blessed young people abstained from licit embraces for the Lord and conquered the passions of fervid adolescence with the fervor of ascetic life.”³⁸¹ In other words, if John could refrain from sex with his lawful wife, should not young married men be satisfied without adulterous affairs?³⁸² The other brief direct address to male readers decries those who came late to acknowledging Marie’s special piety and missed out on her miracles.³⁸³ In contrast, Jacques’ comments to his female readers focused mainly on vanity and ostentation. Contrasting Marie’s flimsy garments which were revered as relics, he admonished women who adorn their “cadavers” by adding tails to their garments, strutting around as if they were a temple, when they actually look debased and bestial.³⁸⁴ His single rebuke specifically to virgins reprimands their ability to cause lust, something Marie successfully trampled underfoot: “May miserable and foolish virgins pay attention and lament, they who light the fire of lust with their libidinous songs and make embers burn with their breath and consequently, alienated from the songs of the

³⁸⁰ Jacques de Vitry, *VMO*, I.10.609-13: ‘Ve vobis qui lascivitis in stratis vestris et dormitis in lectis eburneis, qui mollibus utimini, in voluptatibus vestris mortui et sepulti, qui ducitis in bonis dies vestros, sed in puncto ad inferni novissima descendetis, ubi subter vos tinea sternetur et operimentum vestrum erunt vermes.’

³⁸¹ *Ibid.*, I.3.87-90: ‘Erubescant et paveant infelices, extra matrimonium illicitis sese commixtionibus polluentes, cum ii ambo beati juvenes, a licitis amplexibus pro Domino abstinentes adolescentie ferventis impetum fervore religionis superaverunt.’

³⁸² See D’Avray, *Marriage Sermons*.

³⁸³ Jacques de Vitry, *VMO*, I. 13.759-64: ‘Non solum autem in vultu eius ex intuitu multi devotionis gratiam hauriebant, sed ex mutua colloctione aliquibus stillabat dulcedinem, et non solum spiritualiter in corde, sed sensibiliter quasi mellis saporem suscipiebant in ore. Audient duri et tardi ad credendum et murmurabant.’

³⁸⁴ *Ibid.*, I.11.645-50: ‘Quid ad hec dicitis, superflue mulieres et pompose, que vestimentorum multiplicitate cadavera vestra ornatis et caudatis vestris vestibis vos degeneres et bestiales ostenditis, circumornate ut similitudo templi? Vestimenta vestra comeduntur a tineis et fetent vestimenta sancte mulieris habentur pro reliquiis et redolent.’

angels, they die in their vanity. Their laughter turned to tears, their joy into eternal pain, their songs into weeping [James 4.9].”³⁸⁵ In this world view, men inherently and universally battle with lust; virgins simply cause it.

Shortly after the episode describing the cleric’s manly stirrings towards Marie, Jacques described how Marie assisted his charismatic preaching. He explained that when “he had neither experience nor practice,” and he was greatly dissatisfied with his bookish sermons.³⁸⁶ Marie noticed Jacques’ depressed attitude. But he was too embarrassed to share his failures, made all the worse by people’s polite but empty praise. Marie then shared with him a vision of a man “covered with an overabundance of hair” accompanied by a harlot, “adorned as if with glittering rays,” who would encircle him, flirting and occasionally throwing sunbeams at the man.³⁸⁷ Jacques interpreted this vision as signifying the superfluity in his sermons, symbolized by the abundance of hair, and the harlot denoted his problem with pride. The empty compliments he had received for his lackluster sermons, were represented by the fleeting sunbeams that only offered him false consolation. This erotic vision of the preacher accompanied by a dancing harlot who gives him vain and fleeting pleasure from her luminescence, aligns with Jacques’ notion of

³⁸⁵ Ibid., I.10. 553-8: ‘Attendant hec et lugeant miserabiles et fatue mulieres, que lascivie sue cantilenis ignem libidinis accendunt et anhelitu suo prunas ardere faciunt et idcirco a cantu angelorum aliene in vanitate sua pereunt, quarum risus in luctum, gaudium in dolorem eternum, cantus convertetur in ululatum’

³⁸⁶ Ibid., II. 6.81-78: ‘Dum verbum dei, licet indignus, laicis simplicibus predicare inciperem et necdum exercitium seu consuetudinem faciendi sermonem ad populum haberem, semper mihi metuens ne forte sermone imperfecto deficerem multa mihi undecumque colligebam, multis vero congregatis quidquid in mente habebam in medium proferre volebam: *totum enim spiritum suum profert stultus, sapiens vero reservat in posterum*. Cumque tanta prodigalitate meipsum confunderem, ad me post sermonem revertens, quasi quoddam mentis tedium, eo quod inordinate et incomposite multa mihi dixisse videbar, incurrerem.’

³⁸⁷ Ibid., II.6.889-98: “‘Vidi’”, inquit, “similitudinem quasi hominis nubilosus, superfluitate capillorum cooperti, quedam autem meretrix subornata, quibusdam quasi radiis splendida, eum blande intuendo circuibat. Facto autem pluries circulo, unum de radiis suis versus eum proiciens, partem tenebrarum effugabat.” Ad hanc eius parabolam, me triplici morbo laborantem statim certissime deprehendi. Capillata enim superfluitas michi tristitiam generabat, meretrix vero subornata, id est elatio, radiis adulationis miserabile michi solatium conferebat. Quibus te laudibus, o sancta mulier, referam nescio, que secretorum dei conscia, hominum cogitationes non frustra tibi dominus aperiebat, sed orationibus tuis virtutem medendi languoribus conferebat.’

preaching as an act of virility. As seen in his *exempla* of the bad preacher who castrates himself, Jacques employed metaphors of sexual intimacy—whether the licit bride, the Church, or harlots. Here again, Marie is the vessel, seemingly unaware of men’s passions or the meaning of her own visions, but this again serves to protect Jacques from public embarrassment. Marie remained crucial in helping clerics like Jacques, soothe their insecurities and navigate their relationships with women, both real and imagined.

While Marie was presented as naïve about the lusts of men, against demons Jacques depicted her as a sly warrior. He recounted several episodes where her prayers and fasting caused demons to flee, often from monks and holy women. Her piety violently and graphically tormented demons. For example, when a demon continued to harass her, Marie “fasted for forty days with tears and prayers.”³⁸⁸ At the end of the fast, the demon “suffered such terrible punishment from an angel of Christ, so that he appeared to have vomited forth all his bowels and wretchedly carried his entrails around his neck.”³⁸⁹ The demon then asked Marie for his penance.³⁹⁰ Notably, Jacques explains that Marie did not answer the demon before asking for advice from a trusted master who suggested casting the demon into the desert until Judgement Day.³⁹¹ Jacques shows the supernatural strength of Marie’s individual penitential acts, while maintaining that these dynamic battles occur under the charge of trusted men.

³⁸⁸ Ibid., I.9.493-5: ‘Tunc illa, se ipsam amplius domino immolans, diebus quadraginta cum lacrimis et precibus nichil penitus manducans ieiunavit, interpolate tamen ut bis vel ter in ebdomada reficeretur.’

³⁸⁹ Ibid., 495-500: ‘In fine vero ieiunii teterrimus ille spiritus relicta virgine ad ancillam Christi cum dolore et confusione coactus est venire, miserabiliter ab angelo Christi religatus et punitus, ita quod videbatur, quasi visceribus evomit omnia interiora sua super collum suum miserabiliter deportare.’

³⁹⁰ Ibid., 502-5: ‘Tunc ille gemens et supplicans ut eius miseretur et ei penitentiam iniungeret Christi amicum deprecabatur: dicebat enim se coactum esse ut quicquid ei iniungeret facere oporteret.’

³⁹¹ Ibid., 505-9: ‘Tunc illa, sicut nichil unquam de se presumebat nec aliquid sine consilio facere volebat, vocavit sibi quemdam familiarem magistrum de quo confidebat. Cui cum ille consuleret ut eum in desertum mitteret, ut nulli unquam usque ad diem iudicii nocere posset, supervenit quidam alius satis utrique familiaris et privatus’

Like the previously examined *exempla* in which Jacques used “weak” women to address the faults of men, Marie’s guilelessness in her battles served to uncover the folly of the men around her. For example, Marie was gently admonished by a priest for her loud crying fits on Good Friday.³⁹² Jacques explained that Marie, “always modest and, with the simplicity of a dove, tried to obey in all things,” left the church since she could in no way cease crying, and prayed that God would show the priest that he could not restrain the Holy Spirit.³⁹³ Then, during the mass, the priest was then struck with such a crying spell, “almost suffocating him,” to the extent that “his tears not only drenched his clothes, but the book and altar linens were dripping wet.”³⁹⁴ The priest was barely able to complete the mass.³⁹⁵ Long after the event Marie told him, “Now you have learned from experience that it is not in man’s power to restrain the intensity of the spirit.”³⁹⁶ Throughout the *vita*, Jacques confirmed Marie’s orthodox behavior: she respects the sacraments, makes confession regularly, prays for those in purgatory, performs manual labor, and ardently desires to go on pilgrimage, even wanting to participate in crusade. But this scene shows a careful balancing act between Marie’s obedience to men, especially ecclesiastical authorities, and her right as a prophet to reprove them.³⁹⁷ This balancing act was also reflective

³⁹² Ibid., I.5.139-44: ‘Quadam autem die ante parasceven, cum iam imminente Christi passione maiori lacrimarum imbre cum suspiriis et singultibus se domino mactare inchoasset, quidam de sacerdotibus ecclesie ut oraret cum silentio et lacrimas cohiberet quasi blande increpando hortabatur.’

³⁹³ Ibid., 144-50: ‘Illa vero, sicut verecunda semper erat et omnibus columbina simplicitate obedire satagebat, impossibilitatis sue conscia egressa clam ab ecclesia in loco secreto et ab omnibus remoto se abscondit, impetravitque a domino cum lacrimis ut predicto sacerdoti ostenderet quod non est in homine lacrimarum impetum retinere, quando flante spiritu vehementi fluunt aque.’

³⁹⁴ Ibid., 150-6: ‘Cum igitur sacerdos ille die eodem missam celebraret, aperuit dominus et non fuit qui clauderet, emisit aquas et subverterunt terram : tanto enim lacrimarum diluvio submersus est spiritus eius, quod fere suffocatus est, quantoque reprimere impetum conabatur, tanto magis lacrimarum imbre non solum ipse, sed et liber et altaris linteamina rigabantur.’

³⁹⁵ Ibid., 159-61: ‘Post singultus multos, multa inordinate et cum interruptione pronuntians a naufragio tandem vix evasit, et qui vidit et cognovit testimonium perhibuit.’

³⁹⁶ Ibid., 161-6: ‘Tunc vero longo tempore post misse completionem ancilla Christi revertens, miro modo acsi presens adfuisset quecumque acciderunt sacerdoti impropere retulit : “Nunc”, inquit, “per experientiam didicistis quod non est in homine impetum spiritus Austro flante retinere.”’

³⁹⁷ In the *Supplementum*, Thomas of Cantimpré also show her educating men on the sufferings of Purgatory, Sweetman, “Thomas Cantimpré,” 618.

of the increased scholarly debates on types of appropriate speech made in church and who exactly was permitted to exercise it.³⁹⁸ Denied the right to preach, divinely inspired women like Marie retained the right of prophecy.³⁹⁹

For those women not gifted with prophecy, mystical union offered a means for women to transcend the prohibitions of her gender.⁴⁰⁰ For example, Marie reportedly witnessed the widow of a merchant from Williambroux, suffering in purgatory. Although in her widowhood, she had guarded her daughters' chastity for the "Bridegroom", she still suffered for her part in her husband's ill-gotten profits. When her chaste daughter, Margaret of Williambroux, heard about this vision, she and her fellow sisters prayed for her mother. Marie then had a second vision of the widow, who had been released from purgatory with a new brilliant appearance, and "holding in her hands, what seemed to her to be the book of life, she read the deeds of the Highest Teacher to the scholars."⁴⁰¹ This remarkable vision stands in sharp contrast with St. Paul's admonition against women teaching men.⁴⁰² It appears that for Marie, and her hagiographer, bending these rules was appropriate, if it occurred in other-worldly contexts.⁴⁰³ Marie, as portrayed by Jacques

³⁹⁸ Bériou, "Women Giving Religious instruction," 137. For comparison with the papally approved prophet, Hildregard of Bingen, see Miriam Rita Tessera's discussion of gender and prophecy in, "Philip Count of Flanders and Hildegard of Bingen: Crusading Against the Saracens or Crusading against Deadly Sin," *Gendering the Crusades*, eds. S. B. Edgington and Sarah Lambert (Cardiff: University of Wales Press, 2001): 84.

³⁹⁹ Bériou, "Women Giving Religious instruction," 139; for a brief analysis of Marie of Oignies and Christina the Astonishing singing as a form of preaching see: Carolyn Muessig, "Prophecy and Song: Teaching and Preaching by Medieval Women," in *Women Preachers and Prophets through Two Millennia of Christianity*, eds. Beverly Mayne Kienzle and Pamela J. Walker. 1998. Berkeley: University of California Press, 1998), 146-158.

⁴⁰⁰ Moore, "Convergence, Conversion, and Transformation," 43.

⁴⁰¹ Jacques de Vitry, *VMO*, II.3.259-72: 'Nam maritus eius mercator fuerat et quedam more mercatorum per fraudem acquisierat, quosdam etiam de familia ducis Lovaine in hospitio receperat, qui de iniuste acquisitis multa in domo sua expendebant ; et quia de huiusmodi nondum perfecte restaurationem fecerat, dicebat se adhuc in purgatorio detineri. Margarete de Willambroc, et eius sororibus, multas ei orationes acquisierunt et pro posse restitutionem fecerunt. Unde non multum post anima vidue, vitro purior, nive candidior, sole splendidior apparuit ancille Christi cum iam ad eternas epulas gaudens et gratias agens invitata ascenderet, et quasi librum vite, ut ei videbatur, in manibus tenens summi magistri facta scholaris legebat.'

⁴⁰² 1 Tim. 2:12: 'I do not permit a woman to teach or to assume authority over a man.'

⁴⁰³ Schulenberg, *Forgetful of Their Sex*, 2.

de Vitry and Thomas of Cantimpré, exhibited masculine traits in battling demons, and reproofing men, but these feats were made all the more extraordinary by her identity as a woman.

Although sanctity is often displayed through the overturning of gender roles: “gender affects sanctity and sanctity affects gender.”⁴⁰⁴ As Bynum has argued, the high medieval period was marked by a new religious significance for the body which coincided with a wave of particularly somatic female spirituality.⁴⁰⁵ Women’s social roles as caregivers in childbirth and hospice care, were likewise transferred to their bodily spiritual experiences.⁴⁰⁶ Theologians and prelates, like Jacques and Thomas, found this sort of piety useful in fighting Catharism’s notion of the body as evil. Additionally, Jacques presented “bodily integrity as being a particular feature of female sanctity.”⁴⁰⁷ Rather than their holiness displacing their gender, it was their gender that offered this sought-after type of spirituality.⁴⁰⁸ In Marie’s last testament she gifted a piece of bodice lace “with which she was girt” and a linen kerchief that “she wiped her tears with” to Jacques.⁴⁰⁹ These intimate gifts, associated with her femininity, point not only to her gift of holy tears, but serve as a reminder of her feminine corporeal body. Jacques’ relationship with Marie depended on two central and integrated attributes—her holiness and embodied womanhood. Over ten years after her death (c. 1226), the body of Marie of Oignies, was exhumed and transferred to a new church. Jacques returned to Oignies to consecrate this new

⁴⁰⁴ Riches and Salih, “Introduction,” 5.

⁴⁰⁵ Bynum, “Female Body,” 182.

⁴⁰⁶ Jacques includes numerous examples of women caring for the poor, lepers, and burials, for example see Exempla: XCIII, XCV, CVII, but also occasions where sons are tasked with the burial of their mothers, see CXC VII, 82.

⁴⁰⁷ Muessig, “Paradigms of Sanctity for Thirteenth-Century Women,” 96.

⁴⁰⁸ In contrast Muller-Baker sees the ceremony for placing a woman into an anchorhold as a transition to genderless state: “the sinful human female was transformed into a new (genderless) person, free of sinfulness and the limitations of the human existence,” “Holy Laywomen,” 25.

⁴⁰⁹ Jacques de Vitry, *VMO*, II. 10.1346-9: ‘Et quia quando reverteretur nesciebat, testamentum suum facere destinavit, relinquens michi corrigiam qua cincta erat et sudarium lineum quo lacrimas exergebat et quedam alia modica, auro tamen et argento michi cariora.’

church that would house not only Marie, but eventually Jacques' own body in 1241.⁴¹⁰ Jacques donated silver, numerous jewels, relics, and silk gathered during his tenure as bishop of Acre, enabling the construction of exquisite reliquaries, including one for a relic of Marie, by the talented Hugh of Oignies. This visual program connected Oignies to the Holy Land, linking the sphere of Marie and the communities of beguines she represented to Jacques' activities in the East. Consequently, Jacques explicitly and carefully curated the arch of his career and its memorial, in relation to his beloved Marie.

Conclusions

Although an autocratic patriarchal system certainly reinforced gendered expectations, both men and women sought to maintain certain gendered expectations, valuing *virtus* even when exhibited by women.⁴¹¹ Holy women like Lutgard and Marie could wield manly strength and disfigure their femininity in protection of their virginity, while the fragility of the poor, uneducated, or simple women served as the foil to chastise men. When Jacques and Thomas point to women's weakness, they do so not to advance simplistic notions of women's inherent inferiority but instead to reveal their vulnerability, especially at the hands of violent or unscrupulous men. Jacques' presentation of men and women was both descriptive and prescriptive. Jacques developed his expectations of gender within longstanding notions on the nature of men and women. Influenced by his own experiences, Jacques then used these notions to persuade, teach, and motivate audiences to action.

⁴¹⁰ Mulder-Bakker, *Marie of Oignies*, 10.

⁴¹¹ This seems especially true when gender intersected with class politics. As the work of Farmer reveals, the gendered expectations of men and women of lower status, especially those unable to work, differed greatly from those of elite men and women. She cautions that gender "must be placed in a grid of difference, *Surviving Poverty*, 41."

Both Jacques and Thomas's advice gestures toward a certain understanding of gender, power, and violence. Men, clerical and lay, fought internally for their chastity, to varying degrees of success. But for women the battle was considered external and the onus was also placed on them to prevent their own molestation.⁴¹² These examples concur with Karras's assessment that the ongoing inward struggle was essential for clerical masculinity. However, both Jacques and Thomas required help from a holy woman to meet these standards. Both suggest it was through the intercessory prayers and advice of Lutgard and Marie that these men succeeded in their mental struggles for chastity. But these women's holiness depended on an external fight to remain physically untouched by sins associated with her sex. It appears that the struggle for chastity was not an essential component of her femininity, but of her holiness.⁴¹³ For both, their struggles and spiritual transformation, nevertheless, remained gendered.

As the next chapter turns to the preparations and execution of various crusading endeavors, Jacques' carefully cultivated connections to the women of the Low Countries needs to be remembered. In the *vita* of Marie, he stressed this connection, crediting her with rousing him to preach against heretics, and claiming she prophesied his involvement in the crusades. Holy women were presented as an ideal model for women's enthusiastic support of crusade.⁴¹⁴ As Jacques preached in Genoa before heading East to begin his new role as Bishop of Acre, he did more than carry Marie's memory with him. Jacques wore the relic of Marie's finger in a

⁴¹² Elliot asserts that rape disallowed women from becoming nuns, noting that Thomas Aquinas concluded that you could not guarantee there was no pleasure in the act, *Fallen Bodies*, 48.

⁴¹³ Bynum, "Female Body," 197.

⁴¹⁴ For more on the mobility of holy women see: Jeroen Deploigie and Katrien Heene, "Collete's Travels: The Discursive Framing of the Mobility of Women in Saints' Lives from the Low Countries," *Itinernaria* 8-9 (2009-10): 15-55.

reliquary amulet around his neck.⁴¹⁵ The wealthy noblewomen who gazed upon Jacques and were swayed by his words were likely also looking at her.⁴¹⁶

⁴¹⁵ Jacques credited this relic with a miraculaous rescue of his belongings, especially his books, from destruction during his sea journey to Milan, *Lettres*, I.34-46.

⁴¹⁶ Thomas of Cantimpré reports that this amulet was later gifted to Pope Gregory IX (1227–41). Vandeburie, “*Sancte fidei omnino deiciat*,” 88; Farmer, “Low Country Ascetics and Oriental Luxury,” 209-10.

Chapter Three: The Officium of Recruitment: Jacques de Vitry and Preaching the Albigensian Crusade

In the early thirteenth century, Jacques de Vitry went from being a minister in Oignies to a famous preacher, Bishop of Acre, and participant in the Fifth Crusade.⁴¹⁷ But this meteoric rise did not follow a direct or obvious route. Jacques recruited men to fight in the west, before being called to his new position in Acre. These military engagements included a number of ongoing activities, including crusading movements in Spain, Languedoc, and the infamous Children's Crusade (1212).⁴¹⁸ The papal legate Raymond, Bishop of Uzès commissioned Jacques to preach crusade against the Albigensian heresy in 1211.⁴¹⁹ Jacques traveled through France and Lotharingia recruiting men to fight against heretics, and he was reportedly very adept at his mission. As Humbert of Romans recalled, Jacques' preaching in France "captivated the entire region to the extent that no other record of such an awakening exists before or after."⁴²⁰

About fifteen years after these preaching campaigns, Raymond VII of Toulouse and Louis IX of France would sign the Treaty of Paris (1229) signaling the end of this crusade, but Jacques' involvement in this affair would come much earlier.⁴²¹ The same year Jacques was recruiting men to fight in the West, Innocent III was turning his attention and resources to the East. In 1213, the Pope issued a letter calling for a new crusade aimed at regaining the Holy

⁴¹⁷ Hinnebusch does not give a complete sentence to this transition, *H. Occ.*, 5; Baldwin, *Master, Princes, Merchants*, 38; Donnadiu, *Jacques de Vitry*, 169-75.

⁴¹⁸ For a discussion on the relationship of these events and the beginnings in relation to the *pueri* movement see: Dickson, "The Genesis of the Children's Crusade (1212)," 1-52.

⁴¹⁹ Hinnebusch, *H. Occ.*, 5; Baldwin, *Master, Princes, Merchants*, 38; Donnadiu, *Jacques de Vitry*, 169.

⁴²⁰ Humbert de Romans, *De dono timoris*, ed. Christine Boyer, CCCM 218 (Turnhout: Brepols, 2008), 4: 'Magister Iacobus, uir sanctus et literatus, primo canonicus regularis deinde episcopus Aconensis, postmodum cardinalis et episcopus Tusculum, predicando per regnum Francie et utens exemplis in suis sermonibus, adeo totam Franciam commouit quod non extat memoria aliqua ante uel post sic mouisse.'

⁴²¹ Barber, *Cathars*, 157.

Land (*Quia maior*); stipulating the end of indulgences for those participating in Iberian and Occitan wars, and two years later the Fifth Crusade would begin.⁴²² Commissioned by Robert Courçon, Jacques began preaching for this new crusade in France in 1214. His involvement in both crusades, against heresy in the West and Islam in the East, likely overlapped. His accomplishments led to his election as bishop of Acre, the functioning capital of the Frankish Kingdom of Jerusalem, whose see had fallen vacant in 1213.⁴²³ Against this backdrop, his close friend, the ascetic Marie d'Oignies, died in 1213. Jacques composed her *vita* and dedicated it to Bishop Fulk of Toulouse, ground zero for the war on heresy.

Consecrated in Perugia in the summer of 1216, Jacques arrived in Palestine later that fall. All signs pointed to Jacques' upward career trajectory continuing in this new environment. But only four years later this talented and ambitious preacher who had "captivated France" would confess to a close friend: "I am weak and broken-hearted, and I desire to end my life in peace and tranquility."⁴²⁴ Shortly afterward, Jacques de Vitry resigned as Bishop of Acre.⁴²⁵

While scholars have investigated Jacques' involvement in the Fifth Crusade, this chapter and the next, presents an investigation of Jacques' involvement in crusading activities on two fronts. This chapter will look at William of Puylaurens and Peter of les Vaux-de-Cernay's accounts of Jacques' activities in the Albigensian Crusade, along with Jacques' model sermons addressing the Cathars. Then, returning to Jacques' composition of Marie D'Oignies's *vita*, it

⁴²² Innocent III, *Quia maior*, *PL*, 216: 817-21; Matthew E. Parker, "Papa et pecunia: Innocent III's Combination of Reform and Fiscal Policy to Finance Crusades," *Mediterranean Historical Review* 32.1 (2017): 7.

⁴²³ Hinnebusch, *H. Occ.*, 5-6. The date of the election and confirmation remain unknown, but Jacques reports that he was consecrated on Sunday, July 31, *Lettres*, I.70-2: 'Ipse autem die dominica post electionem eius in summum pontificem consecratus est; ego autem proxima sequente dominica episcopalem suscepi consecrationem.'

⁴²⁴ Jacques de Vitry, *Lettres*, VI.b, 277-80: 'Ego autem iam debilis et contractus corde in pace et tranquillitate vitam mean finire desidero.' For a discussion of emotion and gender in this letter see Welch, "Order, Emotion, and Gender," 35-49.

⁴²⁵ Baldwin, *Master, Princes, Merchants*, 39.

will reexamine its possible role in the fight against heresy. As Barbara Newman observes, Jacques “perceived a clear continuity between his championship of the staunchly pro-clerical beguines and his later work as a crusade preacher,” but this continuity has not been treated at length.⁴²⁶ Just as the last two chapters established Jacques’ perception of gender roles as integral to understanding his activities among the holy women in the Southern Low Countries and his particular vision of reform, this approach offers new insight on how a *vita* could be understood as a weapon. By examining these two arenas of war together, the following will also compare and contrast what we know about Jacques’ preaching in two very different contexts. This investigation sheds light on the experiences, expectations, and strategies developed during the Albigensian Crusade that Jacques carried to his new position in Acre.

What Preachers Do, What Preachers Say: Historiographical Problems in the Study of Crusade Preaching

A central problem with investigating the history of crusade preaching remains the disjunction between what was said and what was done. Authors of chronicles and letters recounted the style and drama of the event, noting at times fiery performances accompanied by miracles, conversions, and people taking the cross.⁴²⁷ Narrative accounts of preaching campaigns, however, did not aspire to record what exactly was said.⁴²⁸ When chroniclers included accounts of medieval sermons, they did so to convey the sense of what was said and to interpret the outcome of the affair, rather than to present readers with actual spoken words. For example, the multiple versions of Urban II’s call for crusade at the 1095 Council of Clermont,

⁴²⁶ Newman, *Collected Saints Lives*, 17. Christina Roukis-Stern, examining the prologue of the *vita* of Mary D’Oignes, points out that Jacques frequently connects holiness with the women of Liege and heresy with male stubbornness. She also suggests that there is connection between “his esteem for female spirituality and crusade” but she does not elaborate on this claim, “A Tale of Two Dioceses,” 39.

⁴²⁷ Cole, *Preaching of the Crusades*, x-xi.

⁴²⁸ Cole explains that it is difficult to know if papal directives regarding preaching were actually carried out, *Ibid.*, x.

with their famously varied content, show that even when the affair was of great importance, verbatim renderings were not the goal. Similar themes do appear in all the surviving versions of his sermon—including the liberation of Eastern Christians and the capture of Jerusalem, the offer of indulgences, and the need to fight on behalf of Christ as *milites Christi*. All these accounts were written, however, after 1099, and hence in the shadow of the unlikely capture of Jerusalem. These speeches, therefore, reveal less about the actual words said at Claremont and instead present a sense of what the event was, and perhaps what it needed to be, in the aftermath of the First Crusade.⁴²⁹

While authors of later crusade accounts aligned themselves with the successes of the First Crusade, things had changed in the late twelfth and early thirteenth century. Instead of the famous charismatic individuals like Bernard of Clairvaux leading the charge, Innocent III employed an army of preachers including Oliver of Paderborn, Robert Courçon, and Jacques de Vitry, to propagate his message and gather support.⁴³⁰ While Jacques' preaching campaigns had a less seismic impact than Urban's call to crusade, they are better documented through chronicles, letters, and model sermons. Jacques' more ancillary role in a later failed crusade—a more typical experience for crusade preachers—offers historians the opportunity to better reconstruct such activities. The sources, however, still do not offer a clear record of what exactly was said in the moment.

Jacques' letters assert that his preaching moved men, women, and even children to take the cross.⁴³¹ He communicated the dynamic energy of his delivery and the perceived

⁴²⁹ Jonathan Riley-Smith, *The First Crusade and The Idea of Crusading* (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 1986), 17.

⁴³⁰ Cole, *Preaching of the Crusades*, 109.

⁴³¹ Jacques reports are discussed in detail in chapter four.

righteousness of his cause, but the actual words are absent in these descriptions. Brenda Bolton points out that these preaching campaigns were highly orchestrated events combining “visual imagery and liturgical spectacle.”⁴³² In other words, it took more than Jacques’ words to move crowds. Jacques’ collections of model sermons, however, do not include this sort of narrative detail.⁴³³ They serve a very different purpose: providing tools for the composition of sermons. More akin to composition books, these manuals present a template for proper form by including a wealth of orthodox exegetical content—relevant passages from the Bible and the Church Fathers pertaining to the specific liturgical day when the sermon was preached or to which estate was addressed, all supported by numerous and varied *exempla*. They were never used or intended as scripts. As a result, neither the narrative accounts that describe preaching, nor sermon collections that served as resources for preachers, provide anything close to verbatim transcriptions of oral sermons.

The modern desire for accurate recordkeeping, moreover, overlooks what our medieval authors wanted to record and why. In general, narrators describing preaching events sought to communicate the charisma of the preacher and the miraculous results of their work, lending divine legitimacy to their enterprise. Model sermons, by contrast, move away from the celebrity of individual preachers and aim at providing canons, the work-a-day preachers whom most ordinary Christians would encounter, with serviceable tools to meet new reform agendas. Both these audiences ought to be kept in mind: preachers and the imagined audiences they might preach to. Sermon literature thus offers a window onto the perceived values and concerns of

⁴³² Bolton, “Faithful to Whom,” 58.

⁴³³ Monica Sandor’s summation of medieval sermons still rings true: “Sermons have long been the stepchildren of medieval historiography, for they are often trite, wordy, repetitive, and make no claims to originality in their theological thinking,” “Popular Preaching of Jacques de Vitry,” vii.

authors, scribes, compliers, and readers, if not a complete overview of the pageantry and theater that necessarily accompanied these events.⁴³⁴ Mindful of these limitations, we turn to investigate Jacques' role preaching for crusade.

Preaching the Albigensian Crusade

The contentious events of the Albigensian Crusade have been explored in detail through centuries of scholarship. Recent work has called into question what had been a fairly secure narrative, including the most fundamental problem of whether an organized counter-church had arisen in Southern France at all.⁴³⁵ We do know at the Council of Tours (1163), Pope Alexander III mandated the confiscation of goods of heretics associated with the regions of Gascony, Albi, and Toulouse.⁴³⁶ And the Third Lateran Council (1179) stressed the obligation of princes to suppress heresy, marked by feigned religiosity, and denials of the Eucharist, baptism, marriage, and general denigration of the priesthood.⁴³⁷ Localized debates and periodic burnings of those condemned as heretics occurred in Cambrai (1077), Soissons (1114), and Liège (c.1135).⁴³⁸ And in November of 1207, Innocent III extended the crusading indulgence to those fighting heresy in a letter to Phillip II.⁴³⁹ In the twelfth and thirteenth century, papal discourse on heresy gathered together such events and the different local religious movements into a unified coherent whole that could fit into their narrative of the orthodoxy's battle against what the inquisitors of

⁴³⁴ Powell, *Anatomy of a Crusade*, 62.

⁴³⁵ Moore, *The War on Heresy*; Mark Gregory Pegg, *A Most Holy War: The Albigensian Crusade and the Battle for Christendom* (Oxford ; New York: Oxford University Press, 2008); John H. Arnold, *Inquisition and Power: Catharism and the Confessing Subject in Medieval Languedoc* (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2001). For an assessment of the historiography and current state of this debate see John H. Arnold, "The Cathar Middle Ages as a Methodological and Historiographical Problem," in *Cathars in Question*. Ed. Antonio C. Sennis (Woodbridge : Boydell & Brewer, 2016): 53-78.

⁴³⁶ Damian Smith, *Crusade, Heresy, and Inquisition in the Lands of the Crown of Aragon (c. 1167-1276)* (Boston : Brill 2010), 172.

⁴³⁷ Barber, *Cathars*, 29.

⁴³⁸ Moore, *War on Heresy*, 7.

⁴³⁹ *PL* 215, col 1246-8.

Languedoc would call “Catharism.”⁴⁴⁰ Similar approaches had coalesced varieties of apparent non-Christian “others”—whether heretics, Jews, Muslims, or Eastern Christians—into simplified caricatures, pliable for the needs of propaganda.⁴⁴¹ The orthodox discourse on the “Cathars” belongs to this legacy of biased scrutiny, adding to the difficulty of teasing apart fact from fiction. Regardless, the aggressive actions spearheaded by the papacy and local aristocracy—led by Simon of Montfort—were presented as a righteous fight with the promise of spiritual and territorial gains.

Jacques’ source for the current state of affairs in Toulouse very likely was Bishop Fulk of Toulouse himself. Appointed to this see in 1205, Fulk organized a group committed to the eradication of heresy, going as far as ordering the removal of Raymond, Count of Toulouse. When this plan was flatly rejected by the community, Fulk commanded the clerics to leave the city.⁴⁴² During this self-imposed exile, the bishop visited the diocese of Liège in 1211, where he preached crusade and observed the female lay communities.⁴⁴³ At that time Jacques likely heard Fulk’s own bitter testimony on the poverty of his see and the recalcitrance of the count who—in his view—was unwilling to put an end to the pervasive growth of heresy among his own flock. Jacques reported that this visit consoled the exiled bishop, it also likely served to recruit Jacques to join the cause.

⁴⁴⁰ Moore, *War on Heresy*, 70; Peter Biller, “Goodbye to Catharism,” in *Cathars in Question*, ed. Antonio Sennis (York: York Medieval Press, 2016): 276-7.

⁴⁴¹ For an examination on this legacy in art see: Debra Higgs Strickland, *Saracens, Demons, and Jews: Making Monsters in Medieval Art*. (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 2003).

⁴⁴² Mulder-Bakker, *Marie of Oignies*, 41. On Fulk’s ascension from a son of a wealthy Genoese merchant, to troubadour, to bishop see: R. Lejeune, “L’Évêque de Toulouse, Foulquet de Marseille et la principauté de Liège,” (Mélanges Félix Rousseau, Brussels: 1958): 433-48.

⁴⁴³ Jacques de Vitry, *VMO*, 90-91; Hinnebusch, *H. Occ.*, 5; Berlière, *Monasticon belge*, I, 452; Bolton, “Fulk of Toulouse: The Escape that Failed,” in *Church, Society, and Politics*, ed. Derek Baker (Oxford: Blackwell, 1975), 89.

Our access to Jacques de Vitry's role as part of this enterprise comes to us through two contemporary chronicles. The first of these is by William of Puylaurens (c. 1200-1275), who served in the household of Bishop Fulk of Toulouse as well as that of his successor, Raymond de Folgar, and eventually served as the personal chaplain to count, Raymond VII. Consequently, his contemporary account of the Albigensian Crusade was based on a combination of his own experiences and those of eye-witnesses.⁴⁴⁴ This chronicle covers the course and aftermath of the crusade from the perspective of someone intertwined with the affairs of the bishopric. As such William viewed crusade as the consequence of heresy, but he was not above criticizing crusaders' behavior too.

In contrast, Peter of les Vaux-de-Cernay's *Historia Albigensis* written between 1212-1218, focuses more on the experiences of the aristocracy, which it presents in glowing terms. Peter was a Cistercian monk whose abbey in Les Vaux-de-Cernay (d. 1218) had strong ties with the family of Simon de Montfort. His uncle, Guy, abbot and eventually Bishop of Carcassone, took him on preaching campaigns, even joining Simon de Montfort and the crusaders for a period.⁴⁴⁵ Like William, Peter's partisan account presents events he was personally invested and engaged in, and both accounts refer to different aspects of Jacques' participation.⁴⁴⁶

In these chronicles three successive events attest to the failure of ecclesiastical leaders to fight heresy with words. First, the Cistercian Peter of Castelnau and Ralph the Monk arrived as a

⁴⁴⁴ William Arnold Sibly and Michael D. Sibly, tr., *The Chronicle of William of Puylaurens: The Albigensian Crusade and Its Aftermath* (Rochester, NY: Boydell Press, 2003), xx-xxiii; Guilelmus de Podio-Laurentii, *Chronique*, edited in *Chronica magistri Guillelmi de Podio Laurentii: text édité, traduit et annoté*, edited by Jean Duvernoy (Paris, Éditions du Centre national de la recherche scientifique, 1976).

⁴⁴⁵ William Arnold Sibly and Michael D. Sibly, tr., *The History of the Albigensian Crusade: Peter of les-Vaux-de-Cernay's Historia Albigensis* (Woodbridge: The Boydell Press, 2002), xxiii-xxv; Peter of les Vaux-de-Cernay, *Hystoria albigensis*. 3 vols., edited by Pascal Guébin and Ernest Lyon. (Paris: Société de l'Histoire de France, 1926-1939).

⁴⁴⁶ The only other contemporary, William of Tudela's *Song of the Cathar Wars*, does not mention Jacques de Vitry, *The Song of the Cathar Wars: A History of the Albigensian Crusade*, tr. Janet Shirley (Ashgate 2000).

papal legates to Toulouse (1203). Then, Bishop Fulk of Toulouse was appointed to a morally and financially bankrupt see (1205). Finally, Bishop Diego of Osma and Dominic of Guzman came from Spain to preach and participate in debates with heretics in the region (1206-7). These events foreground the murder of Peter of Castelnau by a vassal of Count Raymond VI of Toulouse (1208), leading to Innocent III's call for a crusade.⁴⁴⁷ Both accounts describe a systemic failure of the local clergy to control their flock, and highlight the need for the very type of reforms suggested and embodied by Diego and Dominic. But both accounts ultimately point unapologetically to the necessity of violence.

William of Puylaurens briefly noted the spiritual and financial poverty of the bishopric at Toulouse that Fulk inherited and the challenges Peter of Castelnau faced as he pressured the Count of Toulouse to expel heretics in his territories. He then turned directly to Bishop Diego and Dominic, who would establish the Dominican Order in 1216. He described the humble style they adopted upon their arrival noting that they began their work without a mounted escort, but “by walking barefoot from place to place to the scheduled debates.”⁴⁴⁸ William did not directly describe other approaches to the problem of heresy in this region, but the grandiose deficiencies of those who tried before Diego and Dominic appears implicit.

Peter of les Vaux-de-Cernay gives greater detail about the aggressive style of the newly appointed papal legates. Facing the community's heresy, Peter explained that they used threats to scare their audiences into rejecting heresy and expelling heretics from their community by

⁴⁴⁷ Barber, *Cathars*, 3. William of Puylaurens does not focus on this event as pivotal even though it directly precedes the call to crusade, whereas Peter of Vaux-de-Cernay stressed this murder as the main catalyst.

⁴⁴⁸ William of Puylaurens, *Chronica*, VIII: ‘. . . ceperunt aggredi, non pomposa aut equestri multitudine, sed calle pedestrico, ad indictas disputationes, de castro in castrum, nudis plantibus et pedibus.’

threatening the loss of their possessions and the fury of their kings and princes.⁴⁴⁹ While characteristically eager to praise the crusaders and their mission, even Peter admitted to the deficiency of this approach, observing that those who renounced their beliefs out of fear easily returned to their heretical behaviors.⁴⁵⁰ He noted that the heretics themselves were quick to accuse their own clergy of immoral behavior. Peter explicitly contrasts this to Diego's approach, noting that the bishop directly advised the legates to adopt a more humble preaching style, reflective of an apostolic simplicity.⁴⁵¹

This concern over pious appearances is furthered evidenced by William's account of the debate at Pamiers. When Bishop Fulk asked Pons Adhemar of Roudeille why he continued to shelter heretics, he responded "we were raised with them, and we have our relatives among them, and we can see that they live virtuously."⁴⁵² Both William and Peter's accounts point to the attraction of the heretics' self-evident virtue to familial ties within the community, and to the resulting failure of the local clergy and papal legates to persuade audiences in any lasting way. But even the new, preferred methods espoused by Bishop Diego and Dominic failed. As William of Puylaurens explained: "Heresy had grown to such an extent, with the approval of the magnates of the region, that it was less successful to provoke learned men to preach against it, than to exercise armed force."⁴⁵³ In even harsher terms, Peter of Vaux-de-Cernay wrote that

⁴⁴⁹ Peter of les Vaux-de-Cernay, *Historia*, 1.7: '... servis servilem incutientes timorem, minantes eis rerum depredationem, regum ac principum dedignationem intonantes, hereseos abjurationem, hereticorum expulsionem eis persuaserunt.'

⁴⁵⁰ Ibid.: '... sicque ipsi non virtutis amore, set secundum poetam cessabant peccare mali formidine pene; quod manifestis indicii demonstrarunt: nam statim, perjuri effecti et miserie sue recidivum patientes, in conventiculis suis ipso noctis medio predicantes hereticos occultabant. Heu! Quam difficile est a consuetudine velli!'

⁴⁵¹ Ibid., 1.21: 'Memoratus autem episcopus adversus hujusmodi perplexitatem salubre dedit consilium, monens et consulens ut, ceteris omissis, predicationi ardentius insudarent et, ut possent ora obstruere malignorum, in humilitate procedentes, exemplo Pii Magistri facerent et docerent, irent pedites absque auro et argento, per omnia formam apostolicam imitantes.'

⁴⁵² William of Puylaurens, *Chronica*, VIII.4b: '[S]umus enim nutriti cum eis, et habemus de nostris consanguineis inter ipsos et eos honeste vivere contemplamur.'

⁴⁵³ Ibid., X. 4b: 'Cumque iam tantum heresis excrevisset, magnatibus terre consentientibus, quod non tam studiosos

heresy had become a sort of pernicious family tradition as fathers' passed heretical beliefs to their sons.⁴⁵⁴ Crusade against heresy, therefore, was presented by both authors as inevitable.

Jacques did not have a large role in the Albigensian Crusade, but both accounts assert that his recruitment efforts were essential. Peter of les Vaux-de-Cernay described how in the autumn of 1211, Jacques had accompanied William the Archdeacon of Paris on a recruitment campaign in northern France and Germany: "Inflamed with the zeal of faith, traveling through France and even Germany through the whole winter, they signed an incredible number of the faithful to Christ's army with the symbol of the cross on their breast: after God, those men were foremost in promoting the business of the faith in those regions."⁴⁵⁵ Preaching crusade did not exclude more hands-on roles for churchmen. Peter noted how William the Archdeacon played an important role in building siege machines, even organizing men to collect wood and guiding the craftsmen.⁴⁵⁶ When the reinforcements arrived that winter, Peter praised William and Jacques' role for bringing about military successes: "I cannot set out in detail of how from that time onwards God in his mercy began wondrously to advance His business."⁴⁵⁷ Chroniclers viewed the recruitment campaigns, and thereby the efforts of recruiters like Jacques, as key to victory.

Peter of les Vaux-de-Cernay mentioned Jacques' activities only once more. He explained that when his uncle, Guy the Bishop of Carcassone brought new recruits in 1214, the recruits had been signed with the cross by both his uncle and Jacques de Vitry.⁴⁵⁸ Peter did not mention a

in se posset acuere quam armatam manum militie exercere'

⁴⁵⁴ Peter of les Vaux-de-Cernay, *Historia*, 1.8: ' . . . hujus heretice pravitatis, a patribus in filios successive veneno supersticiose infidelitatis diffuso'

⁴⁵⁵ *Ibid.*, 3.285: ' . . . qui, zelo fidei succensi, Franciam immo et Alemanniam, circuentes, tota hieme illa incredibilem fidelium multitudinem ad Christi militiam signo crucis in pectoribus signaverunt: isti siquidem duo principue post Deum prenotatum fidei negotium in partibus Gallicanis et Teutonicis promoverunt.'

⁴⁵⁶ *Ibid.*, 3.175.

⁴⁵⁷ *Ibid.*, 306: 'Et quia non possemus omnia singillatim exprimere, quomodo videlicet misericors Deus a diebus illis negotium Suum cepit mirabiliter promoveri'

⁴⁵⁸ *Ibid.*, 508.

change in Jacques' focus—at this time, however, Jacques would have also begun preaching for crusade to regain Jerusalem. Peter did mention, the damage Innocent III's new venture was causing to the Albigensian Crusade. He previously complained that the sudden focus on crusading in the East, meant that barely any crusaders were being signed with the cross to fight against heretics.⁴⁵⁹ Innocent III had in fact begun directing his army of preachers elsewhere; and in his bull, *Quia maior* (1213), he revoked the privileges for crusaders in Spain and Languedoc.⁴⁶⁰ But the multiple crusades were in competition for participants, as seen in the Abbot Gervais of Prémontré's letter to Innocent III (1216) complaining that the Fifth Crusade was at risk of failure since potential crusaders to Egypt were being diverted to Languedoc.⁴⁶¹

William of Puylaurens gives us some sense of how Jacques's responsibilities must have been torn between the need to combat heretics and the need to fight Muslims. He mentioned Jacques' service in the Albigensian Crusade once, but this detailed episode suggests a reflection on events long after this campaign. He reported that in 1217, Jacques had joined Bishop Fulk of Toulouse to preach the cross in France. The date suggests that this preaching would have been for the new crusade directed to regain Jerusalem, given that Jacques had been consecrated as the Bishop of Acre in 1217, but William explained that their preaching resulted in new recruits who participated at the siege of Toulouse in the following Spring.⁴⁶² In exchange for the new recruits, Simon of Montfort donated to Bishop Fulk the *castrum* of Verfeil on the condition that if he

⁴⁵⁹ Ibid., 442: ' . . . sicut enim jam diximus, jam quasi in oblivionem venerat negotium fidei propter novam predicationem legati quem dominus papa miserat in Franciam pro negotio sancte Terre ideoque fere nulli signabant se cruce contra hereticos pestilentes.'

⁴⁶⁰ *PL* 216.col 817-21; Barber, *Cathars*, 154.

⁴⁶¹ Gervase writes to Pope Innocent III, 1216, *Crusade and Christendom*, 136; Bolton, "Jacques de Vitry and the French Bishops," 69.

⁴⁶² William of Puylaurens, *Chronica*, XXVIII.10a: 'Et in illa predicatione multos crucesignaverunt, qui venerunt in illa obsidione Tholose verno tempore subsequenti, cum quibus et episcopus ad exercitum est reversus.'

was ever involved in warfare there the bishop would furnish him with one armed knight.⁴⁶³ This agreement shows the material gains at stake for preachers in recruitment of soldiers, and perhaps points to Jacques' simultaneous work in both enterprises in the East and West.

William of Puylaurens was well aware of Jacques' whole career, describing him as "master Jacques de Vitry, a man of outstanding honor, learning and eloquence, who later became Bishop of Acre and then a cardinal of the Church of Rome."⁴⁶⁴ Furthermore, William included a personal exchange between Jacques and Bishop Fulk. Apparently, Jacques told Bishop Fulk of Toulouse that St. Saturnin came to him in a dream. In this vision, the saint told Jacques that he had once been the first Bishop of Toulouse, and then commanded Jacques to preach against his people. Jacques then asked Bishop Fulk of Toulouse if St. Saturnin was in fact the first bishop of Toulouse, since he claimed he did not know.⁴⁶⁵ Jacques' assertion that the bishop was a husband married to his church and responsible for her fidelity, imagery explored in the previous chapter, offers another way to interpret this vision as one husband giving permission to another man to correct his bride. Since William had served in Bishop Fulk of Toulouse's household, it is not unlikely that Fulk would have shared stories about his various conversations. In Peter of les Vaux-de-Cernay we see Jacques actively and successfully engaged in recruitment of soldiers as part of a team of preachers canvassing northern France and Germany, but in William of

⁴⁶³ Ibid., 'Cui comes Symon donavit in helemosinam eiusque successoribus episcopis Tholosanis perpetuo castrum Viridisfolii cum cunctis villis et forciis que erant sub eiusdem castri dominio, in quibus erant XX foci vel infra, nichil sibi retento, nisi quod si contingeret fieri sibi bellum campestre ab aliquo in terra sua, episcopus militem unum armatum sibi in illo prelio exhiberet.'

⁴⁶⁴ Ibid., XXVIII. 9b: '. . . cum quibus fuit magister Iacobus de Vitriaco, vir magne honestatis, litterature et eloquentie, qui postea fuit episcopus Aconensis, deinde in Romana Ecclesia cardinalis.'

⁴⁶⁵ Ibid., 9b-10a: 'De quo etiam audivi eundem dominum Tholosanum episcopum referentem quod ab eo audiverat sibi iniunctum fuisse per visionem in sompnis a beato Saturnino Tholosano prothopresule, ut contra suum populum predicaret, et hoc episcopo refferebat, querens ab eo an, quod ipse ignorabat, fuerit aliquando Tholose pontifex nomine Saturnunus.' Jacques' ignorance of this saint seems strange, since the story of St Saturnin was well known, but perhaps he was employing a feigned ignorance, as seen in Marie's *vita*.

Puylaurens, Jacques plays more of an ideological role, lending his charisma to the confirmation of the cause.

The difference in how William of Puylaurens and Peter of Vaux-de-Cernay presented Jacques' role in the Albigensian Crusade was also the result of hindsight. Peter of Vaux-de-Cernay stopped his chronicle—likely because of his own death—in 1218, while William of Puylaurens' account covered events up to the 1270s. Peter described Jacques' recruitment activities on more occasions than William, but he focused on the outcomes and stressed the necessity of the activity rather than the reputation of the preacher—a detail typical for the crusade preachers of this age.⁴⁶⁶ William's glowing description of Jacques with this inclusion of a prophetic dream, speaks to the likelihood that William—or perhaps the chronicle's redactors—emended his work in the fourteenth century to incorporate a more complete view of Jacques' illustrious career, which had already come to an end when he died in 1240.⁴⁶⁷ Jacques' writings—which often praised Bishop Fulk of Toulouse—were widespread. The brothers in Oignies had removed Jacques' tibia for veneration.⁴⁶⁸ Peter's account further knits the lives of Fulk and Jacques, two famous preachers of the Albigensian Crusade, together. Therefore, Jacques' own fame in life and death added credibility to the crusade, providing divine permission—a message from one sainted bishop through another more recently venerated one—for Bishop Fulk's role in the violence executed against members of his own flock.⁴⁶⁹

⁴⁶⁶ Cole, *Preaching of the Crusades*, 82.

⁴⁶⁷ The earliest surviving manuscript of William of Puylaurens's chronicle is MS Latin 5212 in the Bibliothèque nationale in Paris, dated to the second or third decade of the fourteenth century, Sibly, *Chronicle of William of Puylaurens*, xvii.

⁴⁶⁸ Led by Société archéologique de Namur and the Fondation Roi Baudouin, there have been DNA investigations of this bone, the remains in Jacques de Vitry's bone box, and mitres. See CROMIOSS (Études croisées en Histoire et en sciences exactes sur les mitres et les ossements de l'évêque Jacques de Vitry), <http://www.lasan.be/la-recherche/projet-cromiooss/79-jdv-livre-ses-premiers-secrets>. The results of this study will be presented in Brussels, November 2018.

⁴⁶⁹ William was also familiar with Jacques' own high praise of Bishop Fulk, not only in his dedication of the vita of

“Forward then soldiers of Christ!”: The Message of War against Heretics

After hearing the news of his own legate Peter of Castlenau’s murder, Innocent III issued a letter on March 10, 1208 that was sent to Philip Augustus in Lyon, and likely to other regions. Peter of les Vaux-de-Cernay also copied this letter into his account of the war.⁴⁷⁰ This murder became the catalyst for war, and subsequently the reason for Jacques de Vitry’s involvement. William of Puylaurens and Peter of les Vaux-de-Cernay both recount a range of preachers’ activities leading up the decision to launch the crusade against heretics, including planned debates with leaders of the heterodox communities—including Waldensians and Cathars. When Jacques became involved in this affair, his work as a preacher served different purposes from his predecessors’. The quest of learned preachers to change the minds of heretics had transformed to a mission to recruit men to fight those same heretics, now thought to be hopelessly recalcitrant. Preaching against heresy now meant rousing audiences to commit themselves to war against neighbors. Innocent III’s letter about this event can help reveal the messages Jacques de Vitry and other preachers likely used to convince men from northern France and Germany to invest themselves in the affairs of Languedoc. But Jacques’ message had a chance to evolve. In his *sermones feriales et communes*, composed during his tenure as the cardinal of Tusculum (1229-1240), he returns to the theme of the heresy, albeit by that point in an entirely new environment.

Innocent III’s letter lays out in rhetorically rich detail the devious murder of his legate, Peter of Castlenau, by a vassal of Count Raymond VI. Interpreted as martyrdom, Innocent presented Peter’s death as the clearest evidence that heretics were not only damning souls

Marie, but also in the *Historia Occidentalis* which was composed around 1219-1221. For a discussion of the dating of this work based on internal evidence see Hinnebusch, *H.Occ.*, 16-20.

⁴⁷⁰ Peter of les Vaux-de-Cernay, *Historia*, 3.56-65.

through unorthodox beliefs but were willing to kill those trying to correct them. As he stressed: “In fact these are the sorts of destructive men that not only work to steal our possessions, but to kill us; they not only sharpen their tongues to destroy our souls, they raise their hands to destroy our bodies.”⁴⁷¹ The threat of heretical belief alone was insufficient to garner support. Indeed, heretics had apparently been living in the south of France for decades without causing undue troubles. Jacques had to show that heresy had resulted in, and would poise a real violent threat to their own communities. The letter anathematized Count Raymond VI and voided all oaths of fealty previously made to him. It encouraged men to attack the count and dispossess him of his lands. Only then could new leadership effectively eradicate heresy in the Toulousain region. While leaving the door slightly ajar for Raymond’s possible repentance, Innocent spent much more time and mustered numerous biblical citations to show that those who might die in battle would have their sins remitted and earn eternal life.

The pope’s exhortation to battle rested on a call for vengeance defined as an act of obedience to God and as a way to suitably serve him.⁴⁷² Tapping into a well-established understanding of the Muslim enemy as deserving of hellfire and God’s wrath, he added: “In whatever way God reveals to you, strive to abolish this treacherous heresy, pursue them more fearlessly than the Saracens—since they are more evil.”⁴⁷³ Given the circulation of this letter, those commissioned by Innocent III to preach certainly relied on his arguments. It is not difficult

⁴⁷¹ Peter of les Vaux-de-Cernay, *Historia*, 3.61: ‘Hujusmodi siquidem pestilentes non tantum jam nostra diripere, sed nos perimere moliantur, nec solum ad perimendas animas linguas acuunt, verum etiam ad perdendum corpora manus extendunt, perversores animarum effecti et corporum peremptores.’

⁴⁷² *Ibid.*, 64: ‘. . . occasionem tamen in hoc articulo vobis tribuit Sibi acceptabiliter serviendi.’ For a recent discussion of the changes in crusade propaganda in the thirteenth century see Valentin L. Portnykh, “‘L’Argument Vassalique’ au Service de la Prédication des Croisades en Terre Sainte (fin XIIe-XIIIe siècles), *Medieval Sermon Studies*, 61.1 (2017): 59-72.

⁴⁷³ Peter of les Vaux-de-Cernay, *Historia*, 3.64: ‘. . . quibuscumque modis revelaverit vobis Deus, hereticam inde studeatis perfidiam abolere, sectatores ipsius, eo quam Sarracenos securius quo peiores sunt illis’

to imagine Jacques preaching some of Innocent's sentiments verbatim: "Forward soldiers of Christ! Forward brave recruits to the Christian army! Let the groan of universal holy church move you, let pious zeal inspire you to vindicate such an injury against your God."⁴⁷⁴ In the absence of the focal point of Jerusalem—understood in the rhetoric of the time as the patrimony of Jesus and therefore rightly belonging to Christians alone—Innocent III pointed to the unjust death of his legate as a crime against God.⁴⁷⁵ Instead of, for example, the desecration of holy places found in Urban II's call to the First Crusade, Innocent III used the desecration of a holy man's body as deserving of retribution and warranting indulgences for those willing to mete out God's justice.

Jacques' own surviving sermons addressing the Cathar heresy were written at the conclusion of the Albigensian Crusade, but they show a continuity with much of Innocent III's ideology. Jacques directly addressed the Cathar heresy in two sermons within a collection of twenty-six model sermons, the *sermones feriales et communes*, compiled in 1230 and preserved in four manuscripts. All of these manuscripts originate from the Southern Low Countries and Liège.⁴⁷⁶ Muessig asserts that this collection's exegetical style confirms Jacques' desire to distill the biblical exegesis found in Peter Comestor's *Historia Scholastica* to novice preachers and to confront dualist heresy like the Cathars.⁴⁷⁷ These twin goals were likely intertwined and are

⁴⁷⁴ Ibid.: 'Eia, igitur, Christi milites! Eia, strenui militie christiane tirones! Moveat vos generalis ecclesie sancte gemitus, succendat vos ad tantam Dei vestri vindicandum injuriam pius zelus!'

⁴⁷⁵ See also the previous decretal issued to Viterbo that equated heresy with Roman laws against treason, justifying the confiscation of property and land, Barber, *Cathars*, 139.

⁴⁷⁶ Two of these manuscripts are housed in the Bibliotheque royale de Belgique, MS 1122-1124 (C) and MS 9682-9699 (D), and one at the University of Liège, MS 347 (L). These three date to the fifteenth century, while the fourth, MS 268 (B) housed in Brugge's Stedelijke Openbare Bibliotheek is the earliest dating from the thirteenth-fourteenth century. According to Carolyn Muessig's careful philological work, L and B have a common source and in turn C was developed through some combination of L and B. Lastly, D appears to be copied from Muessig, "Jacques de Vitry's Sermones Ferialis et Communes," 61-2. This type of philological work has only been done for this collection and the *sermones ad status*.

⁴⁷⁷ Muessig, "Jacques de Vitry's Sermones Ferialis et Communes," 64; Muessig, "Audience and Sources," 190-6.

reflect the settlement of the Albigensian Crusade in 1229. This agreement required Count Raymond VII to fund the salaries of professors of theology to be established in Toulouse.⁴⁷⁸ Despite the failure of biblical exegesis to convince heretics before 1208, Jacques had not lost faith in its capacity to serve as a bulwark.

A selection of Jacques' *sermones feriales et communes* directly address heresy. This collection as a whole is based on an exegetical account of Genesis (1:1-31 and 2:1-7).⁴⁷⁹ The first fourteen—the *feriales*—present a treatment of the seven days of creation, corresponding to sermons for each day of the week. The remaining eleven—the *communes*—remain focused on Genesis, but are sermons applicable to any day. The last two of these *communes* sermons specifically address heretical beliefs. Jacques calls them the *Patarini*.⁴⁸⁰ The *Patarini* were originally associated with the eleventh-century Milanese supporters of Gregory VII, but this name fell out of use, reappearing seventy years later in association with heresy.⁴⁸¹ Given the content of the sermon, Jacques did not have the earlier use in mind, but rather as his contemporary Stephen of Bourbon, he likely considered the Albigensians, Cathars, Patarenes, and Bulgars different designations for the same heresy.⁴⁸² While the structure is consistent, these sermons are twice as long as the others in this collection.⁴⁸³

⁴⁷⁸ Barber, *Cathars*, 139.

⁴⁷⁹ Some of these sermons appear Muessig, *Faces of Women*; Muessig, *The Sermones Ferialis et Communes of Jacques de Vitry: A Critical Edition of Sermons 10 and 11 on Animals, Part II*. *Medieval Sermon Studies* 48 (2004): 45-56; Muessig's Ph.D. dissertation includes the first fourteen sermons: *The "Sermones Ferialis" of Jacques de Vitry: A Critical Edition*, University of Toronto, 1993.

⁴⁸⁰ Jacques de Vitry, *Sermones Ferialis et Communes*, in Muessig, "Jacques de Vitry's *Sermones Ferialis et Communes*," 74.

⁴⁸¹ Bernard Hamilton argues that after 1179 this name referred only to Cathars, "Who were the Patarenes?" in *Contra Patarenos* (Boston: Brill 2004): 4.

⁴⁸² Cited in Biller, "Goodbye to Catharism," 275.

⁴⁸³ Muessig has transcribed significant sections of these sermons in "Jacques de Vitry's *Sermones Ferialis et Communes*," and is preparing an edition of this collection for the *Corpus Christianorum*.

Innocent III's letter relied on the immediacy of Peter of Castelnau's death, fashioned as martyrdom, to invigorate his call to crusade. In contrast, Jacques' sermons juxtaposed refutation of Cathar beliefs with a discussion delineating the fundamentals of orthodoxy as regards humanity's fall from grace and redemption. Always unswerving in his esteem for his own vocation, Jacques begins by proclaiming the paramount importance of the preacher in eschatological terms:⁴⁸⁴ "Nevertheless the preacher ought to cry out and never stop for the favor of, or in fear of, others. Pray, therefore, that just as the general resurrection at the end of time will happen at the sound of a trumpet, the souls deadened in sins today might rise up at the sound of preaching."⁴⁸⁵ Jacques used the role of the preacher as a way to address original sin at the beginning of time and simultaneously judgment at the end.

The theme of the sermon, drawn from Genesis 3:24, recounts the cherubim standing guard at the door of Paradise, armed with a spinning and flaming sword aimed at keeping a fallen Adam away from the Tree of Life.⁴⁸⁶ Jacques draws on the image of the sword as a necessary instrument of spiritual and temporal justice, including in the fight against heresy. He interpreted the sword as *flaming* so that "love burns away all passions, the fire of the Holy Spirit consumes the desires of this life, and the sword of God slices up all harmful things."⁴⁸⁷ This violent image of God wielding a sword models for his readers the proper way to "all handle harmful things"—including heretics. Jacques then expounded that the sword is "the word of God" representing the

⁴⁸⁴ See chapters two and three.

⁴⁸⁵ Jacques de Vitry, *Sermones FERIALES ET COMMUNES*, in Muessig, "Jacques de Vitry's *Sermones FERIALES ET COMMUNES*," 82: 'Nichilominus tamen clamare debet predicator et non cessare fauore aliquorum uel timore. Orate igitur Dominum ut sicut ad uocem tube fiet generalis resurrectio in fine, ita hodie ad tubam predicationis resurgant anime mortue in peccatis.'

⁴⁸⁶ Genesis 3.24: 'And he cast out Adam: and placed before the paradise of pleasure Cherubims, and a flaming sword, turning every way, to keep the way of the tree of life.'

⁴⁸⁷ Jacques de Vitry, *Sermones FERIALES ET COMMUNES*, in Muessig, "Jacques de Vitry's *Sermones FERIALES ET COMMUNES*," 82: 'Flammeus gladius ut incendatur affectus per caritatem, ut scilicet igne Spiritus Sancti concupiscencie huius uite exurantur, et gladio uerbi Dei omnia noxia precindantur.' This last word may actually be praescindantur.'

Old and New Testaments.⁴⁸⁸ A central tenet attributed to the Cathars was the denial of the unity of the Old and New Testaments. Jacques, therefore, established the validity of violence against “harmful things,” and then defined as chief among these things, those that would deny the word of God as consisting of both Old and New Testaments.

Jacques then transitioned to the problems of the fallen human condition, building toward his treatment of the solution in Christ’s salvific work. This approach sets the stage for a sharp contrast to heretical beliefs, but also accentuates the debt humanity owes to God to protect his church.⁴⁸⁹ Taking a more emotive or oratorical tone, Jacques detailed the visible infirmities of old age: “The eyes are cloudy, the nose runs, teeth decay, hair falls out, ears fail, head trembles, appetite slows, back curves, memory is thrown into confusion. . . . Not only is man broken in body, but he is broken in his spirit and wounded in his heart.”⁴⁹⁰ Noting also the pain and pollution of birth, Jacques emphasizes the utterly broken state of humanity through the whole arch of one’s life: “We enter this life wretched, we go through it guilt-ridden, we leave it condemnable.”⁴⁹¹ The only hope, Jacques explained, is Christ.⁴⁹² Building on the notion of righteous violence in the image of the sword, Jacques takes his audience from the Fall of Man to a vivid image of their personal suffering, to show the complete inability of humanity to rectify the damage of the fall and the salvific power of Christ’s physical life and passion. Humanity is forever indebted to God. With these points established, Jacques set the stage for his description

⁴⁸⁸ Ibid.: ‘Gladius enim uersatilis dicitur uerbum Dei, quia secat ex utraque, Veteris scilicet et Novi Testamenti.’

⁴⁸⁹ Jacques was likely familiar with Innocent III, *On the misery of the human condition*.

⁴⁹⁰ Jacques de Vitry, *Sermones Feriales et Communes*, in Muessig, “Jacques de Vitry’s *Sermones Feriales et Communes*,” 82: ‘Caligant oculi. Fluunt nares. Putrescunt dentes. Defluunt crines. Surdescunt aures. Tremit caput. Languet gustus. Statura curuator. Memoria oblivione turbatur. . . . Non solum autem percussus est homo in corpore, sed et percussus est in anima et uulneratus in corde.’

⁴⁹¹ Ibid., 72: ‘Ingressus in hanc uitam mierabilis, progressus culpabilis, egressus dampnabilis.’

⁴⁹² Ibid.: 73: ‘Tanta enim fuit superbia in Adam quod cum esset homo, uoluit esse Deus; et tanta fuit in Christo humilitas quod cum esset Deus, uoluit fieri homo. Adam per inobedientiam peccauit, et Christus factus obediens usque ad mortem satisfecit. Per cibum uetitum perditus est mundus, per cibum concessum est reparatus.’

of the heretics' dualistic beliefs and salacious behavior. This structure amplifies the perception of the heretics' notions as diametrically and willfully opposed to the "true religion," and consequently confirms their fate as inevitable and irredeemable.

Jacques did not compose a new argument about the Cathars or craft a new approach for preachers to try to convert them. He noted in the introduction that these arguments were sufficient to use against the heretics who are uneducated. The content, however, suggests these sermons were not intended to confront actual heretics, but to justify their destruction.⁴⁹³ He listed the already common orthodox notions of Cathar beliefs: their denial of Christ, the Virgin Mary, and the sacraments, their dualistic belief in two primordial principles, and the practice of the *consolamentum*.⁴⁹⁴ He also accused them of wicked, deviant, and unmanly behavior such as incest, sodomy, and homosexuality:

To thoroughly weaken the ecclesiastical censure, they return those disposed to sin, they offer the chance to be indulged here and there, by alleging that it is no less a sin to be joined with their wife, than with their sister or mother, nor even worse, they consider the vice of sodomy as "natural" sex, moreover they are indulgent, soft, and womanish, just as it is said in the Apocalypse [9.8], 'They will have the hair of women.'⁴⁹⁵

Elsewhere Jacques showed his concern with these types of gendered vices, casting sodomy as a vice that had conquered Paris and as the prime insult against clerics. But here he reaches for these common rhetorical slanders to hurl at heretics. In other words, their pernicious deviant belief beget deviant sexual behavior which threatened to undermine the moral integrity of the whole community. Moreover, his reference to the Apocalypse, connects these heretics to the

⁴⁹³ Ibid., 76: 'Hec autem dicta sufficient contra quosdam Patarenos, qui sibi scioli uidentur.'

⁴⁹⁴ Muessig, "Jacques de Vitry's *Sermones FERIALES ET COMMUNES*," 74.

⁴⁹⁵ Jacques de Vitry, *Sermones FERIALES ET COMMUNES*, in Muessig, "Jacques de Vitry's *Sermones FERIALES ET COMMUNES*," 77: 'Unde censuram ecclesiasticam penitus enervando, pronos ad peccandum reddunt, et occasionem passim luxuriandi prebent, asserendo non minus esse peccatum in uxore quam in sorore uel matre, nec maius reputant sodomiticum uitium quam naturale concubitus, et immo luxoriosi, molles et effeminati adherent eis, sicut in Apocalypsi dicitur quod habeant capillos mulierum.'

frightening locusts summoned by the fifth trumpet, which were likened to charging horses, having the faces of men, the hair of women, and the teeth of lions.⁴⁹⁶ This reference would have resonated particularly well with crusaders, as the scripture foretells that these locusts will torment “those not signed by the cross” so cruelly that they will ask for death. Innocent III focused on the specific need to avenge the murder of Peter of Castelnau as a righteous act of vengeance defined as an act of obedience to God. Jacques, however, presented heretical beliefs more broadly as acts of heightened aggressive violence to the dignity of Christ and the Virgin Mary, associating them with the aberrant sexual behavior with apocalyptic overtones.⁴⁹⁷

But this purely argumentative, sacramental approach was not without shortcomings. Like Peter of les Vaux-de-Cernay and William of Puylaurens, Jacques admitted that learned men had failed to overcome heretical errors through argumentation. Jacques explained, “It is not our intention, nor is it shown in the course of the sermon, to respond to all of their follies, especially when various Catholic teachers have already tried, nor will it offer as much to those who are obstinate.”⁴⁹⁸ The sermon continues with a bleak acknowledgement of necessity of raw force:

If the power of secular authorities, which justly carries a sword, had not imposed the remedy, heretics would have occupied almost the whole world. Just as a burning house is destroyed lest it catch other houses on fire, so it is necessary to destroy one heresiarch lest others are drawn into their error.⁴⁹⁹

⁴⁹⁶ Apoc. 9.4-8: ‘And it was commanded them that they should not hurt the grass of the earth, nor any green thing, nor any tree: but only the men who have not the sign of God on their foreheads. And it was given unto them that they should not kill them; but that they should torment them five months: and their torment was as the torment of a scorpion when he striketh a man. And in those days men shall seek death, and shall not find it: and they shall desire to die, and death shall fly from them. And the shapes of the locusts were like unto horses prepared unto battle: and on their heads were, as it were, crowns like gold: and their faces were as the faces of men. And they had hair as the hair of women; and their teeth were as lions.’

⁴⁹⁷ Muessig notes this arguments aligns with the theme in the *ad status* sermons to crusaders as vassals of Christ, “Jacques de Vitry’s *Sermones FERIALES ET COMMUNES*,” 74.

⁴⁹⁸ Ibid., 77: ‘Non est intentionis nostre, neque tenor sermonis patitur ad omnes eorum insanias respondere, presertim cum contra eorum perfidiam catholici doctores varios tractatus ediderunt, nec multum quantum ad eos qui obstinati sunt profecerint.’

⁴⁹⁹ Ibid.: ‘Unde nisi secularis potestas, que non sine causa gladium portat, apposuisset remedium, iam fere occupassent totum mundum. Sed sicut una domus succensa quandoque diruitur ne alie succendantur, ita expedit extirpare unum heresiarcham ne alii petrahantur in errorem. Planta quidem amouetur ab orto propter sterilitatem,

The theme of swords in this presentation moves from literal, to metaphorical, then back again to literal—from the flaming sword of the angel standing guard at the gate to the Tree of Life, to the sword symbolizing the Old and New Testaments that brings about the salvation of a fallen humanity, to the sword of secular power commissioned to take part in this cosmic battle of good versus evil. Innocent III’s letter left a door open for the conversion of the count, but Jacques was writing shortly after the Treaty of Paris had marked the conclusion of this crusade. Jacques had himself witnessed the implementation of the secular authorities’ sword, and these sermons appear to reiterate its usefulness. Efforts to change heterodox practice would continue to rely on the secular sword. Most notoriously, Gregory IX’s bull issued in 1231 called for unrepentant heretics to be killed.⁵⁰⁰ Jacques’ choice to “not respond to all of their follies,” and instead to focus on depicting the heretics’ incendiary behavior and violent aggressions against God, reflects a sort of matter-of-fact attitude about this militant strategy.

The failure to convince heretics through words is also revealed in one of Jacques’ *exempla*. Jacques reports that while preaching against the Albigensians, he had failed to convince a heretic through his words, and so resorted to exposing him by other means. Someone in his entourage then demanded that the heretic make the sign of the cross.⁵⁰¹ Jacques explains, “That little fox, wanting to get around this challenge in his outward appearance, started to make the sign of the cross but he was not able to finish it the Christian soldiers watching rose up against the heretics, who had been revealed with manifest and visible error.”⁵⁰² The body of the

membrum a corpore propter contagionem, lupo ab ovili propter occisionem.’

⁵⁰⁰ Muessig notes Jacques’ possible influence on papal policy and the development of the ideology of the Inquisition, “Jacques de Vitry’s *Sermones FERIALES ET COMMUNES*,” 78-9.

⁵⁰¹ Jacques de Vitry, *Exempla*, XXVI, 9: ‘Memini quodam tempore, cum in terra que dicitur Albigensium coram multis militibus contra quosdam hereticos disputarem, et eos contra nos conclamantes auctoritatibus aperto, ut intelligere possent laici, convincere non possemus, quidam ex nostris dixit heretico ut se crucis signo signaret.

⁵⁰² *Ibid.*: ‘Vulpecula illa, volens amfractuose in apparentia ambulare, signum crucis inchoans non perficiebat, licet a

heretic remains central to exposing his true character. As Cynthia Ho has noted, Jacques often uses the body as the clearest sign of the state of the soul. Jacques' failure to convince the heretics through words suggests more than obstinacy on their part. Rather, heretics have a certain inherent quality made manifest in their bodies. Heretics are therefore predisposed, almost physically so, to resist preaching, and their bodies suffer just punishment through the crusaders' actions against them. While this episode implies choice for the heretic to change his mind, it also suggest a certain inevitability about the heretics' fates.

Jacques' sermons continue the narrative tradition of preachers trying to convince heretics of their errors, even though that approach had actually been abandoned in favor of crusade, inquisition, and violence. He had recruited men to fight after other preaching attempts had failed to bring about desired results. His sermons continued that ideological mission by furthering a discourse that promoted the notion that warfare against the Church's perceived enemies was righteous, rewarded, and required. But heresy also served as a useful educational tool. Jacques found it obligatory to first set forth the orthodox tenets regarding the Fall and Redemption, before condemning the heretics. He had to define and clarify orthodoxy to refute heterodoxy. Therefore, through a sort of negative theological argument, heretical beliefs offered a valuable contrast for a detailed discussion—and likely refinement—of orthodox belief.⁵⁰³ Jacques suggested his argument was adequate for unlearned heretics, but these sermons hint at the ideological approach he likely used in recruiting soldiers. Jacques likely refined and elaborated this approach to be applicable to his contemporary readers, namely novice clerics.

principio facere videretur, quod advertentes milites christiani insurrexerunt in eos visibili et manifesto errore deprehensos.'

⁵⁰³ Jessalynn Bird, "The Religious's Role in a Post-Lateran World: Jacques de Vitry's *Sermones ad Status and Historia Occidentalis*," in *Medieval Monastic Preaching*, ed. Carolyn Muessig (Leiden: Brill, 1998): 229.

“By means of those contemporary saints”: *Holy Women* vs. “*Good Women*”

While not mentioned in the chronicles of the Albigensian Crusade, Jacques claimed that the *vita* of Marie D’Oignies that he dedicated to Bishop Fulk of Toulouse was conceived as part of this enterprise. Reportedly, Fulk considered that it would be “helpful for you and many others to preach to the public against heretics in your province by means of those contemporary saints in whom God works in our days.”⁵⁰⁴ Marie is one of the contemporary saints about whom Jacques was preaching. In 1216, Jacques would bring this *vita* along with a relic of Marie to the papal curia in Perugia where he wanted to address Pope Innocent III regarding the status of the religious lay women and the needs of the crusaders.⁵⁰⁵ While the relationship between Jacques and Bishop Fulk can be confirmed by William of Puylaurens’ chronicle and Jacques’ other works, how this *vita* could function—as he claims—to fight heresy remains less clear.

What exactly were the heretical teachings Jacques was responding to? An answer to the question demands first that we define Cathar beliefs, or perceived Cathar beliefs, with precision. Cathar ideology changed over time, but some consistent features emerge from the words that orthodox theologians attributed to them. Fundamentally, Cathars were thought to hold a different notion of the problem of evil than orthodox teachings. They believed the incongruities in the Old and New Testaments could be explained if the God of the former were evil and the God of the latter benevolent. Cathars considered the two fundamental principles of life—good and evil—to be expressed through the binary relationship of spirit and flesh. The Fall caused spirits to be trapped in flesh. The goal of religious practice was to restore them to pure spirit form. Therefore,

⁵⁰⁴ Jacques de Vitry, *VMO*, Prologus, 229-34. See footnote 323.

⁵⁰⁵ *Ibid.*, *Lettres*, I.75-83; Bolton, “Mulieres Sanctae,” 145; Bolton, “Jacques de Vitry and the French Bishops,” 65-6.

Cathars reportedly engaged in ascetic practices, rejected marriage, and fasted to escape the kind of material corruption that they associated with the Catholic Church. Their leaders, a spiritual elite known as good men or good women—called the *perfecti* by inquisitors—could administer a form of last rites known as the *consolamentum*—a laying on of hands intended to enable followers to escape the world of flesh and enter the world of spirit. The demonstrable purity of their leadership was of prime importance and the central attraction of these groups, contrasting to the questionable behavior of their local clergy whom they described in apocalyptic terms as the beast of Revelation.⁵⁰⁶ Whether communities in Languedoc believed all, some, or none of these tenets, ecclesiastical leadership was evidently threatened by what they understood to be a popular and competing set of beliefs that placed an uncomfortable spotlight on the moral deficiencies within their ranks.⁵⁰⁷

The role of women in these new lay religious movements—orthodox or heterodox—was conspicuous.⁵⁰⁸ Cathar noblewomen in particular were considered integral to growing and maintaining networks among the Toulousian, Albigeois, and Carcassès families.⁵⁰⁹ Women could themselves become *perfecta*. They could teach, and when men were not readily available, they could administer the *consolamentum*.⁵¹⁰ In one inquisitor's account, the unusual sacerdotal

⁵⁰⁶ For a summary on the orthodox notions of Cathar thought see: Barber, *Cathars*, 90-115.

⁵⁰⁷ Moore suggests the label “heretic” was a rhetorical label and in fact those deemed heretics actually embodied broader political and social issues of the twelfth and thirteenth centuries, *War on Heresy*, 9, 27. Mark Gregory Pegg argues Catharism was an “invention of late nineteenth-century scholars of religion and history,” adding that the continuance of scholarship that does not accept this appears “closer to soapbox moralism than scholarly analysis,” “The Paradigm of the Catharism; or, the Historians’ Illusion,” in *Cathars in Question*, ed. Antonio C. Sennis (Woodbridge : Boydell & Brewer, 2016), 21.

⁵⁰⁸ The blame for heresy spreading could also be pointed at noblewomen. As Farmer points out Jacques de Vitry and Gilbert of Tournai commonly held matron’s responsible for the spiritual welfare of their children and household, *Surviving Poverty*, 112.

⁵⁰⁹ Barber, *Cathars*, 43.

⁵¹⁰ Anne Brenon, “The Voice of Good Women: An Essay on the Pastoral and Sacerdotal Role of Women in the Cathar Church,” in *Women Preachers and Prophets through Two Millennia of Christianity*, Kienzle and Walker (Berkeley, CA: University of California Press, 1998), 114. Brenon notes that the teaching of women was more “catechistic rather than a truly pastoral function,” 126.

role of women stemmed from a belief, reminiscent of Origen, that souls had no gender: “the only difference between men and women is in their flesh which is the work of the devil. So that, when the souls of men and women leave their bodies, there is no difference between them.”⁵¹¹ Women were also central in the protection of heretics. In William of Puylaurens’ chronicle of the debate at Pamiers with some Waldensians, he describes how the sister of the Count of Foix openly protected the heretics. A brother rebuked her saying: “Go thread your spindle! It can be no business of yours to speak in such type of meeting.”⁵¹² There were also repeated claims attacking the manhood of heretical men as homosexuals and effeminate, seen in Jacques’ sermon too. These accusations could be tied to this anxiety over their elevation of women, assuming that an inversion in the proper order of gender roles in one area, like administering sacraments, consequently emasculated men, leading to all kinds of deviant behavior.⁵¹³ As we saw in the prostitute’s heckling the clerics, Jacques’ works reveal concern over accusations of effeminacy and the dangers of women’s speech. Rumors of men’s deviant sexual behavior perhaps became a telltale sign that women’s behavior had gone unchecked. While orthodox leaders saw women’s increasing activities in these communities as especially reprehensible, the women’s apostolic calling continued to attract followers, not unlike the Beguine communities in the north.

Reading the *vita* of Marie D’Oignies through the lens of these orthodox notions of Cathar belief, the relevance of Marie’s life to the Albigensian Crusade becomes more apparent. Not only does she appear as a bridge between holy woman and priestly authority,⁵¹⁴ but she also

⁵¹¹ Ibid., 119.

⁵¹² William of Puylaurens, *Chronicle*, VIII.4a: ‘Ite, domina, filare colum vestram! Non interest vestra loqui in huiusmodi concione.’

⁵¹³ Peter of Vaux-de-Cernay’s chronicle repeatedly portrays heretics as “other” with unmasculine traits, Natasha Ruth Hodgson, “Constructing Masculine ‘Others’ in Albigensian Crusade Narratives,” as presented at the International Medieval Congress, July 5th, 2017.

⁵¹⁴ Coakley, *Women, Men, and Spiritual Power*, 214-5.

reconciles the admirable qualities of a “good woman” or *perfecta* and a traditional orthodox saint. Some of Marie’s qualities would clearly be unacceptable to a Cathar follower. For example, she favored, helped, and obeyed clerics even in her correction of them. She venerated all of the sacraments and feast days—at times outdoing incompetent priests. On one occasion in the village of Lenlos, for instance, she took it upon herself to ring the church bells for the feast of St. Gertrude after the priest of the church, which was dedicated to that very saint, forgot to do so.⁵¹⁵ Her ascetic practices of fasting, binding, and cutting would seem sympathetic to a dualistic negation of flesh. Her bodily tortures, however, served as vehicle for purgatorial piety, thus elevating the role of her physical body.

On the other hand, there are aspects of the *vita* that appear sympathetic to those attracted to the Cathars. Although of noble birth she chose to labor with her hands, evidenced by her work in a leprosarium and her practice of sewing while singing the Psalms. She did not take religious vows, and she chose to live in chaste marriage. She desired to have a mendicant life, although she was stopped by her friends’ “copious tears.”⁵¹⁶ She healed men through the laying on of hands, including Lambert the cleric and Gueric the priest of Nivelles.⁵¹⁷ Her anomalous behavior with men suggests a certain understanding of a rough gender equality, or blurring of

⁵¹⁵ Jacques de Vitry, *VMO*, II.8.1138-54: ‘Unde cum esset aliquando in ecclesia Sancte Gertrudis in villula que dicitur Lenlos, et quoddam festum sancte virginis Gertrudis in crastino esse deberet et sacerdos eiusdem ville festum illud non adverteret, ipsa, in animo suo sentiens sollempnitatem imminere, non iam se porterat continere. Cumque sacerdos non compareret vel alius campanas, sicut fieri solet in festorum dierum vesperis precedentibus, pulsaret, ipsa de loco suo surrexit et campanas prout potuit pulsare cepit: “Cur,” inquit, “tamquam sit festum pulsatis, cum non habemus in consuetudine, nisi sit festum, hac hora pulsare?” Tunc illa, verecunda et pavida: “Ignoscite michi,” inquit, “domine, magnum enim festum, sed nescio cuius, est hac nocte: iam enim hanc ecclesiam gaudio sentio esse repletam,” Tunc sacerdos, aperto calendario, reperit quod die crastina deberet esse festum sancte Gertrudis.’

⁵¹⁶ *Ibid.*, II.2.85-92: ‘Cum enim suis valdedixisset et iter in tali habitu cum sacco suo et cithara pauperula Christi arripere vellet, tantus dolo tantusque fletus amicorum suorum, qui eam in Christo diligebant, factus est, quod ipsa, sicut viceribus compassionis affluebat, non potuit sustinere. Coartata igitur ex duobus, desiderium habens fugere et mendicare cum Christo, preelegit remanere propter fratres et sorores, quibus eius absentia intolerabilis videbatur.’

⁵¹⁷ *Ibid.*, II.3.330-3: ‘Alius etiam sacerdos, vir humilis et devotus et pater eius spiritualis, magister Guido de Nivelles, postquam manu sua Christi ancilla tetigit inflationem periculosam, quam habebat in gutture, perfecte curatus est.’

distinctions, not unlike the inquisitor's description of the Cathar notion of genderless souls. Above all, her piety was visible. As Jacques noted: "Reading the unction of the Spirit in her face, as if they were reading from a book, they knew that power came from her."⁵¹⁸ She listened to sermons frequently and lived their words in her actions.⁵¹⁹ She did not shy away from chastising impure priests, whom Jacques denounced in her vita as: "friends of the traitor Judas, who again crucify Christ as much as they can, and regard the blood of the covenant as polluted. With polluted hands, with immodest eyes, a venomous mouth, and impure heart, they irreverently approach the sacrament that must be venerated."⁵²⁰

The Cathar's virtuous life and the sacrament of the *consolamentum* appear to have been the two most appealing features that would have attracted new members to the Cathars.⁵²¹ Jacques certainly presented Marie as an alternative, orthodox option for this first enticement. He also portrayed Marie as very concerned with easing or in some cases ending purgatorial suffering. On one occasion, Marie had multiple visions of a multitude of hands outstretched before her, which God revealed as: "souls of the dead, tortured in purgatory, who were asking for prayer for their sentences that would soothe their sufferings as if with a precious ointment."⁵²² Additionally, her own preparation for death, is comparable to descriptions of Cathar practice. Jacques noted that after three days and nights of ecstatic mystical singing, Marie joyfully

⁵¹⁸ Ibid., I.13.697-702: 'Adeo autem ex plenitudine cordis eius facie illius Spiritus sancti gratia resultabat, quod multi ex solo eius aspectu spiritualiter reflecti ad devotionem et lacrimas provocabantur, et in vultu eius quasi in libro unctionem Spiritus sancti legentes, virtutem ex ea procedere cognoscebant.'

⁵¹⁹ Ibid., II.4.641-7: 'Divinis autem scripturis prudens discretaque mulier sufficienter instructa erat, nam frequenter divinos sermones audiebat, verba sacre scripture conservans et conferens in corde suo: ecclesie enim sancte frequentans limina, sacra pectori mandata condebat sagaciter. Et quoniam intellectus bonus omnibus facientibus eum, quod devote audiebat devotius opere complere satagebat.'

⁵²⁰ Jacques de Vitry, *VMO*, II.7.1048-54: '. . . lude proditoris sociis, qui Christum iterum, quantum in se est, crucifigunt et sanguinem testamenti pollutum ducunt, qui manibus pollutis, oculis impudicis, ore venenato, corde impuro dum ad reverendum sacramentum irreverenter accedunt'

⁵²¹ Barber, *Cathars*, 115.

⁵²² Jacques de Vitry, *VMO*, I.9.361-4: 'Cui responsum est domino quod defunctorum anime, que torquentur in purgatorio, orationum suarum suffragia postulant, quibus quasi precioso unguento dolores earum mulcebantur.'

prepared for her death. She moved her bed in front of the altar and proclaimed that she would not eat again.⁵²³ Marie's death by starvation is not far afield from what orthodox clerics believed about the *perfecti*, who reportedly would die from severe fasting after receiving the *consolamentum*. But Marie's visions of those in purgatory or released from Purgatory by her prayers stressed the bodily presence after death. A large part of Marie's spiritual role in the community, however, provided comfort for the dying.⁵²⁴ Her *vita*, consequently, reflected and responded to the allure of new lay religion movements—an apostolic life and more surety for one's salvation.

Jacques presented Marie as a paragon of outward moral integrity, a key characteristic that was thought to have attracted followers to Cathar practices. At the same time, her life confirmed the salvific power of the sacramental system, which new religious lay groups actively contested. While giving credence to the criticisms against the Church for its moral laxity, her *vita* exemplified unquestioning obedience to the Catholic Church. The *vita* of Marie, therefore, has a complicated legacy. It appealed to those criticizing ecclesiastical leadership, while it also served as the living testimony that a certain charismatic power was still part of the Church. The role of women in heretical communities also suggests the need felt by lay women for female exemplars of orthodox piety. Marie's life, as Jacques imagined it, could have had a role in fighting heresy. It tapped into the popular interest in a particular type of spectacular piety, while also attempting to confine it within more orthodox boundaries, and perhaps attempting to stretch those

⁵²³ Ibid., II.11.1472-8: 'Elapsis autem tribus iubilationis diebus lectum suum in ecclesia coram altari fecit preparari, et ad se reversa vocatis fratribus dixit: "Precesserunt lamentationes dum lugerem pro peccatis, precessit carmen dum exultarem et iubilarem pro eternis; eccoe sequitur ve infirmitatis et mortis. Nunquam manducabo de cetero, nunquam de cetero legam in hoc libro. . . .'"

⁵²⁴ Communities sought out their beguines for hospice care and for prayers for the dead, Simons, *City of Ladies*, 80; see also Christine Guidera, "The Role of the Beguines in Caring for the Ill, the Dying, and the Dead," in *Death and Dying in the Middle Ages*, eds. Edelgard E. Dubruck and Barbara I. Gusick (New York: Peter Lang, 1999): 51-72.

boundaries too.⁵²⁵ As Jacques attested “in this way, many who are not moved by commands are stirred to action by examples.”⁵²⁶ Jacques needed exemplars like Marie to outshine his competitors during his preaching campaign around Toulouse.

Although Marie and the Cathars practice superficially similar forms of lay piety, Marie wanted them defeated. According to Jacques, Marie foresaw these events: “Three years before men had been signed with the cross against heretics in Provence, she said that she saw crosses descending abundantly from heaven on a multitude of men. At that time, there had been no mention of these heretics in our regions.”⁵²⁷ Furthermore, God often “complained [to Marie] saying that he had violently lost almost that whole land, and had been thrown out like an exile from those regions.”⁵²⁸ Caesarius of Heisterbach’s *Dialogus miraculorum* recounts a series of visions of crosses in the air coinciding with crusade preaching in 1214, suggesting a congruence with the details of Marie’s vision.⁵²⁹ Additionally, Thomas of Cantimpré’s account of Lutgard of Aywières notes that the Virgin Mary had commanded her to fast for seven years to assuage the anger of her son “who is crucified by heretics and bad Christians, and spat on again.”⁵³⁰

Marie’s vision of crusade confirmed the righteousness of the cause but also attempted to assuage anxiety over dying on crusade. Crusade indulgences offered the promise of forgiveness

⁵²⁵ As Janzten explains mystic women desired to be orthodox but they also pushed the boundaries, *Power, Gender, and Christian Mysticism*, 158.

⁵²⁶ Jacques de Vitry, *VMO*, Prologus, 27-8: ‘. . . multi enim incitantur exemplis qui non moventur preceptis.’

⁵²⁷ *Ibid.*, II.7.969-73: ‘Unde tribus annis antequam homines signarentur contra hereticos Provinciales, dixit quod videret cruces super hominum multitudinem de celo copiose descendentes. Nulla tamen adhuc in partibus nostris fiebat mentio de illis hereticis’

⁵²⁸ *Ibid.*, 973-5: ‘. . . et tamen frequenter in spiritu quasi conquerendo dominus dixerat quod terram illam forte totam amiserat et quod de partibus illis quasi exul eiectus erat.’ This description is very similar to how Jacques described Bishop of Fulk’s own exile from Toulouse.

⁵²⁹ Heisterbach cites Oliver of Cologne as one of his sources, suggesting Jacques would have heard these stories too, William J. Purkis, “Memories of Preaching for the Fifth Crusade in Caesarius of Heisterbach’s *Dialogus miraculorum*,” *Journal of Medieval History*, 40:3, 333.

⁵³⁰ Thomas of Cantimpré, *VLA*, II.1. col 0243F: ‘Ecce, inquit, ab hæreticis et malis Christianis rursus crucifigitur Filius meus, rursus conspuitur. Tu ergo assume tibi lamentum, et jejuna annis septem continuis ut quiescat ira Filii mei, quæ generaliter imminet orbi terræ.’

for confessed sins that soldiers committed while fighting, but even with later expansions to financial supporters, this was never a guarantee that a crusader's death counted as a martyrdom or would result in complete absolution.⁵³¹ Marie's visions, recorded by Jacques, however contrast with this theological view, and instead confirm popular notions that death on crusade meant a quick entry into heaven.⁵³² For example, after the battle in 1211 at Mongausy, Marie saw holy angels carrying the souls of those slain to heaven without purgatory.⁵³³ At another time, she has a vision of a man who had been signed with the cross but died before he could go on his pilgrimage. She witnessed demons preparing to receive him, but Marie prayed for the man and afterwards the Lord revealed to her that a great portion of his purgatorial suffering had been relieved just by his desire to go.⁵³⁴ Jacques' own sermons to crusaders sought to clarify the nuances of the crusader indulgence as outlined in papal bulls, however, he did similarly stress that merit would be gained despite the results of the battle.⁵³⁵ Jacques' inclusion of Marie's miracle stories shows a tension between detailing the theological features of the crusaders' indulgence, and at the same time, leaving the door open to miraculous Roland-esque redemptions on the battlefield.

⁵³¹ Jay Rubenstein, *Armies of Heaven : The First Crusade and the Quest for Apocalypse* (New York: Basic Books, 2011), 24-25; James Brundage shows how thirteenth-century canonists clarified the various obligations and rewards attached to the crusader, suggesting an accepted consensus: *Medieval Canon Law and the Crusader* (Madison: University of Wisconsin Press, 1969), 64-6, 113-4.

⁵³² Brundage asserts the popular understanding that "the crusade indulgence wiped away the blot of sin altogether," but the works of theologians like Thomas Aquinas reveal increasing theological attention to questions on the vow's quality and function, *Medieval Canon Law*, 151-3. For a detailed survey in how indulgences were preached see: Bysted, *Crusade Indulgence*, 246-75.

⁵³³ Jacques de Vitry, *VMO*, II.7.974-82: 'Quando autem sancti Christi martyres, qui zelo crucifixi a longinquis partibus ut Christi dedecus vindicarent devenerant ad locum qui dicitur Monsgaudii, ibidem ab inimicis crucis Christi interfecti sunt, ipsa, licet per tanta terrarum spacia remota esset, vidit sanctos angelos gratulantes et interfectorum animas absque aliquo purgatorio ad superna gaudia deferentes.'

⁵³⁴ *Ibid.*, 997-1000: 'Et licet homo ille morte preventus peregrinationem suam non perfecisset, magna pars purgatorii, eo quod voluntatem haberet nec stetit pereum, eidem cruce signato dimissa est, sicut sancte mulieri dominus revelavit.'

⁵³⁵ Bysted, *Crusade Indulgence*, 273; Jacques de Vitry, *Ad cruce signatos*, II, in Maier, *Crusade Propaganda and Ideology*, 117.

While not intending to bear arms, Marie did desire to join this crusade.⁵³⁶ Amused by the thought, Jacques and her friends asked what she would do if she could go, to which Marie replied: “There I would honor my Lord by confessing his name where so many impious men have blasphemously denied him.”⁵³⁷ Marie’s visions and crusading enthusiasm lent charismatic authority to ideology forwarded by Innocent III and his crusade preachers. While thirteenth-century papal bulls and sermons spoke of the fight to regain the Lord’s patrimony, using the language of vassalage, these captivating miracle stories were also an important part of crusade propaganda.⁵³⁸

When Bishop Fulk of Toulouse requested the *vita* of Marie and suggested to Jacques that it would be useful to preach against heretics “by means of those contemporary saints,” it was not the type of preaching characterized by Bishop Diego and St. Dominic, who sought to change the minds of the heretics. Rather it was probably the sort of preaching that Jacques had engaged in when he preached to orthodox communities for recruitment of soldiers and to affirm and educate the faithful in their beliefs. The example of contemporary saints—like Marie—would have confirmed to his audiences that the Holy Spirit was still active in the Church, and it had not become, as the heretics reportedly argued, the seat of the Antichrist.⁵³⁹

⁵³⁶ Megan McLaughlin discusses the depiction of women warriors in the Middle Age noting the thin line between astonishment coupled with amusement and outright hostility towards women who engaged in battle in “The Women Warrior: Gender, Warfare, and Society in Medieval Europe,” *Women’s Studies* 17 (1990): 193-209.

⁵³⁷ Jacques de Vitry, *VMO*, II.7.985-8: ‘Cumque quasi ridendo ab ea quereremus quid illic, si pervenisset, faceret: “Saltem”, aiebat illa, “dominum meum honorarem illic nomen eius confitendo, ubi totiens impii abnegaverunt eum blasphemando”.’

⁵³⁸ For a recent discussion of the changes in crusade propaganda in the thirteenth century see Valentin L. Portnykh, “L’Argument Vassalique’ au Service de la Prédication des Croisades en Terre Sainte (fin XIIe-XIIIe siècles), *Medieval Sermon Studies*, 61.1 (2017): 59-72.

⁵³⁹ Likely influenced by Joachite thought, Marie’s vision of the future promised that the Holy Spirit would be visiting soon and would send to the Church new laborers, Jacques de Vitry, *Vita*, trans. King, 120.

While we do not know whether Jacques explicitly used examples from the life of Marie or her prophecies in his recruitment campaigns, we do know that he wore a relic of her finger when he traveled. One way or another, she was part of his performance. Peter of Vaux-de-Cernay's chronicle adds to our understanding of the effect of such liturgical objects had on audiences.⁵⁴⁰ He reports that during the Battle of Muret, Bishop Fulk of Toulouse arrived wearing a miter and holding a wooden crucifix. The knights began to dismount and venerate the cross. Another bishop, Peter said, feared that this display of piety would delay the battle. This bishop snatched the cross, climbed to higher ground, and blessed them all at once promising glory and martyrdom, free from punishments of purgatory as long as they were repentant and made confession, or least had sincerely intended to confess as soon as the battle was over.⁵⁴¹ While in this episode the collective piety was suppressed, it was likely that the men were repeating habits of behavior learned at mass or repeated when preachers like Jacques recruited them.⁵⁴² The presence of such objects was evocative, albeit also potentially distracting. Jacques' own surviving crozier, miters, and relics allow us to glimpse similar moving moments of display during the Fifth Crusade.

⁵⁴⁰ This type of liturgical action on the battlefield was customary as seen also in previous crusades and the use of or discovery of relics—such as the Holy Lance at the Siege of Antioch—influenced soldiers' behavior, David S. Bachrach, *Religion and the Conduct of War, c. 300-1215* (Rochester, NY: Boydell Press, 2003), 114-7.

⁵⁴¹ Peter of les Vaux-de-Cernay, *Historia*, 3.461: 'Dum igitur comes et milites nostri mutuo loquerentur et de bello tractarent, ecce episcopus Tolosanus advenit, habens mitram in capite, in manibus vero vivifice lignum crucis; mox nostri ceperunt descendere de equis et singuli crucem adorare. Episcopus autem Convenarum, vir mire sanctitatis, videns quod in ista adoratione crucis a singulis nimia fieret mora, arripiens de manu Tolosani episcopi lignum crucis ascendensque in locum eminentiorem, signavit omnes, dicens, "Ite in nomine Jhesu Christi! Et ego vobis testis sum et in die Judicii fidejussor existo quod quicumque in isto glorioso occubuerit bello absque ulla purgatorii pena statim eterna premia et martyrii gloriam consequenter, dummodo contritus sit et confessus vel saltem firmum habeat propositum quod, statim peracto bello, super peccatis de quibus nondum fecit confessionem ostendet se sacerdoti.'"'

⁵⁴² Bachrach shows continuity of religious activities on the battlefield such as confession, sermons, and communion reported at the Battle of Muret, *Religion and the Conduct of War*, 144-7.

Conclusions

Armed with the arguments of Innocent III, Jacques informed soldiers of the urgent need to fight against heretics, while simultaneously—and likely deliberately—educating audiences in orthodox tenets of their own faith, as reflected in the model sermons he later wrote. He composed the *vita* as part of this mission to fight heresy, showing audiences and ecclesiastical leaders that there was an orthodox, obedient version of the new forms of lay piety. Jacques' success in garnering support through the recruitment of soldiers to fight in the Albigensian Crusade confirmed the viability of his approach, a mindset he would take to his new position as the Bishop of Acre at the commencement of a new competing crusade. While he had hoped to return to France again to continue gathering support and fighting for the rights of poorer crusaders whom he had signed with the cross, the newly elected Pope Honorius III sent him East to Acre.⁵⁴³ Just as the crusade against heresy revised the ideology of traditionally endorsed battles for Jerusalem, the recruitment for the Fifth Crusade would refashion familiar oratorical approaches and shape new strategies to gather collective support from eager lay audiences and their sometimes reluctant secular leaders. Jacques was at the center of this enterprise, and recent successes in Spain and Languedoc had likely bolstered his resolve. It likely seemed all but guaranteed to Jacques that the Fifth Crusade would lead to the recapture of Jerusalem. And it was this heightened confidence in himself and this mission that would make the failures of the Fifth Crusade that much more devastating.

⁵⁴³ For a discussion of Jacques' frustration with the bishops in France who seemed to side more with their royal patron, than the pope see, Bolton, "Jacques de Vitry and the French Bishops," 53-72.

Chapter Four: Collective Penance, Procession, and Preaching during the Fifth Crusade

Innocent III's preparation for this crusade reveals his pragmatic approach—he knew it wouldn't be easy. His efforts to negotiate peace with leaders in the West, to expand the crusader vows, to administer taxes, and to appoint like-minded preachers to recruit soldiers all show he was well aware of the common pitfalls of past crusading endeavors.⁵⁴⁴ This venture, however, would be plagued by the central problem of all of Innocent's crusading endeavors—lack of consistent secular leadership and necessary support on the ground.⁵⁴⁵ Honorius III had made an agreement with Frederick II to lead this crusade in 1217, but the German Emperor would not leave for a decade. Whether his delays were diplomatic strategy or justified by his own succession problems, the pope and the crusade's leaders kept on expecting his departure.⁵⁴⁶ From the west, Duke Leopold VI of Austria and King Andrew of Hungary led the Rheimish and Frisian crusaders, who joined the leadership in the east—John of Brienne, King of Jerusalem, the masters of the military orders, Count Bohemond IV of Tripoli, King Hughes of Cyprus, Raoul of Merencourt, the patriarch of Jerusalem, and Jacques de Vitry, the newly appointed Bishop of Acre.⁵⁴⁷ This informal body of leaders cycled in and out over the campaign's four years largely because of “departure or death,” often leaving Cardinal Pelagius of Albano, the papal legate of

⁵⁴⁴ Innocent used taxation not just as a revenue source but “to incentivize Christians into taking the cross,” Parker, “*Papa et pecunia*,” 2. For the problems facing clergy tasked with the implementation of these changes see: Jessalyn Bird, “Crusaders’ Rights Revisted: The Use and Abuse of Crusader Privileges in Early Thirteenth-Century France,” in *Law and the Illicit in Medieval Europe*, ed. Ruth Mazo Karras (University of Pennsylvania Press, 2008): 133-48.

⁵⁴⁵ The standard work on the Fifth Crusade remains: Powell, *Anatomy of a Crusade*. A growing interest in this crusade can be seen in: Bird, Peters, and Powell, eds. *Crusade and Christendom* and E. J. Mylod, Guy Jacob Perry, Thomas W. Smith, and Jan Vandeburie, eds., *The Fifth Crusade in Context : The Crusading Movement in the Early Thirteenth Century* (New York, NY : Routledge, 2017).

⁵⁴⁶ Powell, *Anatomy of a Crusade*, 112-3; Jarslov Folda, *Crusader Art in the Holy Land: From the Third Crusade to the Fall of Acre, 1187-1291* (Cambridge UP, 2005), 117; On the reasons for Frederick's delay and sincerity of his crusader vows see: David Abulafia, *Frederick II: a Medieval Emperor* (New York: Oxford University Press, 1988), 132-7.

⁵⁴⁷ For arrival and departure dates see: Powell, *Anatomy of a Crusade*, 117.

the crusader army, to fill this gap.⁵⁴⁸ The crusaders' main success was the capture of Damietta (1219), but because of disagreements over its control and the dire lack of reinforcements, this promising victory would become the cause of defeat. Moreover, the continued expectation that Frederick II would arrive, led to the rejection of a generous truce offered by al-Kamil Nasir al-Din Muhammad (1180-1238 CE), the sultan of Egypt.⁵⁴⁹

While his hopes for military successes failed to materialize, Innocent III's expansive programs revolutionized crusade propaganda, recruitment, and pastoral care. For Jacques de Vitry, these sorts of advancements were of little solace without the Holy Land. Building on the earlier examination of recruitment during the Albigensian Crusade, this chapter turns to Jacques' role in the Fifth Crusade, a campaign marked by a new emphasis on performative penance and collective participation. When Pope Innocent III ordered men and women alike to support the crusade through liturgical, financial, and penitential activity, Jacques responded by outlining the practical sacrifices and moral purity of the whole community, including men and women, as essential preparations for the Fifth Crusade. As shown in the previous chapters, Jacques' message, just as his life, depended on an affirmation of collaboration between the sexes, whether between clerics and holy women or husbands and wives. This dependence on women to assist his message by embodying and transmitting it can also be seen in Jacques' involvement in the Fifth Crusade. Therefore, this chapter will show in part how Jacques articulated a significant place for women and the family in the otherwise masculinized world of crusade. In addition, the emphasis on collective guilt and collective participation reveals how pastoral concerns influenced crusade

⁵⁴⁸ Powell has shown that the men who actually led the troops stayed the shortest time, *Anatomy of a Crusade*, 116. King Andrew, for example, return only after a few months, seeming more interested in collecting relics than crusade, Folda, *Crusader Art*, 111.

⁵⁴⁹ Al-Kamil offered a thirty year truce that included the return of Jerusalem, with its walls reconstructed, and the return of the True Cross and prisoners from the Battle of Hattin, Folda, *Crusader Art*, 114; Al-Adil would die August 31, 1218, Powell, *Anatomy of a Crusade*, 145.

preaching, but this influence ran both ways. Jacques distilled crusading ideology through his popular sermons that focused on the dangers of the proximate neighbor and the self rather than distant Muslim forces.⁵⁵⁰ Crusading also left its mark on pastoral care.

Performative Penance and Crusade in the Thirteenth Century

From his rise to the papacy in 1198 to his death in 1216, Innocent III's pontificate would be punctuated by a number of failed attempts to regain the Holy Land. Planning for the Fourth Crusade commenced in 1198, but with succession to the English throne contested and continued war between England and France, Innocent III was bereft of secular rulers to lead the charge.⁵⁵¹ As mentioned previously, this young pope studied in Paris in the circle of Peter the Chanter, and he often appointed similarly trained clerics and fellow classmates to enact his policies. His crusading program was, consequently, grounded in a particular belief that moral preparation of the hardscrabble many would outweigh the power and wealth of the few. He instituted a wide-ranging financial system of taxes that would fund local crusaders without sufficient support, and launched a dynamic preaching campaign that stressed the vital connection between moral probity, the capture of Jerusalem, and salvation. This approach successfully garnered support, but lay activity was not easily controlled, nor did it sway the much-needed leaders—secular and ecclesiastical—to step up into leadership roles or to respect the terms of crusaders' privileges. The failures of the Fourth Crusade, resulting in the sack of Constantinople (1204), suggests a discrepancy between the papal vision of universal conformity and the secular leaders' domestic

⁵⁵⁰ As Cole notes, it is difficult to distinguish actual crusading sermons from those in which crusade is merely employed as metaphor, *Preaching of the Crusades*, 175; Powell, *Anatomy of a Crusade*, 62.

⁵⁵¹ Powell, *Anatomy of a Crusade*, 6; Powell astutely rejects the old notion that Innocent intended this to be a papal crusade, but rather that the absence of a steady leader was the “failure of a process that both Innocent and Honorius had opened to the broadest possible participation of the leaders of Latin Europe,” *Anatomy of a Crusade*, 109.

agendas.⁵⁵² And the doomed Children's Crusade (1212), served as a stark reminder of the dangers of unchecked lay fervor.⁵⁵³ Disheartened but not dissuaded, Innocent III persevered in his commitment to liberate the Holy Land. Consequently, in the build up to the Fourth Lateran Council, he would establish a number of reform initiatives that intended to impose his "vision of a Christian society organized for the *negotium crucis*."⁵⁵⁴ The Fifth Crusade would serve as an important testing ground for these designs. This time Innocent would get it right.

As part of this systematization, penitential processions became a more systematized component of crusading preparations and practice. While the unsatisfactory conclusion to the Third Crusade (1197) helped to spur the Fourth Crusade, and the death of the legate Peter of Castelnau served as a catalyst for the call to arms during the Albigensian Crusade, the Fifth Crusade sprang from no immediate emergency.⁵⁵⁵ Without a crisis to draw upon, the focus on collective participation and collective responsibility, orchestrated through public procession and penance, served as a useful tool to create a sense of universal crisis in a world where the threat of hell was real and the hope of heaven slim. Though walking in the footprints of his predecessors, Innocent's approach to liturgical drama was also reflective of his attitude towards crusade writ

⁵⁵² Ibid, 6; On the Fourth Crusade see Johnathan Phillips, *The Fourth Crusade and the Sack of Constantinople* (London: Jonathan Cape, 2004).

⁵⁵³ Dickson, "Genesis of the Children's Crusade," 42.

⁵⁵⁴ Christoph Maier, "Mass, the Eucharist and the Cross: Innocent III and Relocation of the Crusade," in *Pope Innocent III and His World*, ed. John C. Moore (Brookfield, VT: Ashgate, 1999), 352.

⁵⁵⁵ In tracing the rise of the Children's Crusade in 1212 with the processions ordered by Innocent III for the crusade in Spain, Dickson argues that the liturgical cycle is "inherently incapable of generating mass revivalist enthusiasm." A explicit crisis can spur people to action, such as the loss of the True Cross at the Battle of Hattin in 1187. This in turn caused an evolution from mandated liturgical processions, to the mobilization of crowds of *pueri* outside of clerical control, Dickson, "Genesis of the Children's Crusade," 42.

large.⁵⁵⁶ Crusading, in its promotion, preparation, and execution was to be a collective enterprise, including men and women, and central to its ideology was spiritual reform.⁵⁵⁷

The performative nature of penance and piety in connection to warfare has a long history prior to the crusading endeavors of the thirteenth century, including a range of military and kingship rites in ancient and medieval warfare.⁵⁵⁸ Penitential processions in the First Crusade, as Bernard McGinn has shown, were used in moments of crisis to seek God's favor, such as at the battle of Antioch in 1097. He suggests that to reconcile the distance between the ideals of piety and the realities of soldiers mired in sin, rituals were created to codify the cycle of sin, repentance, and deliverance, only made manifest after victory.⁵⁵⁹ The victory of the First Crusade justified and reinforced these activities. Losses experienced after the First Crusade did not shake the belief in the efficacy of these processions; instead, the elevation of penitential actions reinforced it. For example, after the loss of the True Cross at Hattin (1187) prayers or clamors to liberate the Holy Land become a fixed component of the office and mass, and the Cistercian General Council (1188-9) added supplications for the Holy Land to the daily conventual mass.⁵⁶⁰ And it was only after 1187 that intercessory liturgies became mandated.⁵⁶¹ Cecilia Gaposchkin has demonstrated the ongoing significance of these rituals, accenting their eschatological character. She notes that in the later half of the twelfth century, the more apocalyptic features of

⁵⁵⁶ Susan Twyman, "The Romana Fraternitas and Urban Processions at Rome," in *Pope, church, and city: Essays in honour of Brenda M. Bolton*, eds. Frances Andrews, Christoph Egger, and Constance M. Rousseau (Boston, MA: Brill, 2004), 217; Maier, "Mass, the Eucharist and the Cross," 355; on Innocent III's use of liturgical drama for missionary purposes in Poland see: Bolton, "Message, Celebration, Offering," 89-103.

⁵⁵⁷ Constance M. Rousseau explains that prior to the thirteenth century the crusade was narrowly defined as a masculine military service, but afterwards the emphasis on the liturgical, financial, and penitential support for crusade enable both sexes to participate, "Home Front and Battlefield," 39.

⁵⁵⁸ Bernard McGinn, "*Iter Sancti Sepulchri*: The Piety of the First Crusaders," in *Essays in Medieval Civilization*, eds. Bede Karl Lackner and Kenneth R. Philip (Austin, TX: 1978), 38.

⁵⁵⁹ *Ibid.*, 50-1.

⁵⁶⁰ Linder, *Raising Arms*, 2-3.

⁵⁶¹ Maier, "Mass, the Eucharist and the Cross," 352.

crusader devotion had become “subordinated to penitential and devotional ideals.”⁵⁶² The focus of these rituals had turned increasingly inward connecting moral health, not only of the crusader but the whole Christian community, to military victory.

The military success of the battle of Las Navas de Tolosa on July 16, 1212 further confirmed the effectiveness of Innocent III’s new pragmatic tactics.⁵⁶³ Aware that King Alfonso VIII of Castile was planning an attack against Muslim forces the week after Pentecost, the Pope selected the Wednesday after Pentecost—May 16, 1212—for a large scale intercessory procession in Rome.⁵⁶⁴ Echoing the famous sevenfold litany established by Gregory the Great, Innocent III ordered all women, clergy, and laymen to walk barefoot from different locations. The women led by nuns were to walk from Santa Maria Maggiore with its cross before them, the men led by the Hospitalliers were to walk from Santa Anastasia with the cross of St. Peter before them, and lastly the clergy led by the monks and canon regulars, were to walk from Santi Apostoli with the cross of the Fraternity before them.⁵⁶⁵ Meeting at the Lateran, they would collectively hear a sermon before they departed to different locations for segregated masses.⁵⁶⁶ Innocent specified that the women were to wear humble clothing and that during their procession, they were to pray, weep, and wail.⁵⁶⁷ He encouraged penitential processions of men and women whose prayers might move God to “remove the shame of this confusion by liberating

⁵⁶² M. Cecilia Gasposchkin, “From Pilgrimage to Crusade: The Liturgy of Departure, 1095–1300,” *Speculum* 88, no. 1 (January 2013): 78; for a discussion of the inclusion of the capture of Jerusalem (1099) into rites, hymns, calendars, and official liturgies see: *Ibid.*, “The Echoes of Victory: Liturgical and Para-liturgical Commemorations of the Capture of Jerusalem in the West,” *Journal of Medieval History* (2014): 1-23.

⁵⁶³ Maier points out that Innocent III’s theology of crusade was not innovative, rather it was his application of “practical consequences for this theological position” as it pertains to the crusader indulgences “radically influenced crusading propaganda,” “Mass, the Eucharist and the Cross,” 355-9.

⁵⁶⁴ Maier, “Mass, the Eucharist and the Cross,” 352; Antonio Garcia y Garcia, “Innocent III and the Kingdom of Castile,” in *Pope Innocent III and His World*, ed. John C. Moore (Brookfield: Ashgate, 1999), 339-40.

⁵⁶⁵ Maier, “Mass, the Eucharist and the Cross,” 353.

⁵⁶⁶ Twyman, “Romana Fraternitas and Urban Processions,” 219.

⁵⁶⁷ *PL* 216.col 698-9, trans. Bolton in *Crusade and Christendom*, 83.

from the hands of the pagans that land in which he completed all the sacraments of our redemption.”⁵⁶⁸ He instructed that during these processions alms from the whole community (*clerici et laici, viri et mulieres*) were to be collected to assist the Holy Land.⁵⁶⁹ The Eucharistic elements of this event—as “one, long, drawn out mass”—emphasized crusading as a spiritual act.⁵⁷⁰ It also created and displayed unity of the participants and their collective support for the crusade in Spain. But it also served to reinforce the spiritual power of Rome, its ecclesiastical hierarchies, and its leader—Innocent III.⁵⁷¹ Three months later, the Almohads were roundly defeated—a victory the Pope claimed was largely due to the May procession.⁵⁷²

Similar processions were later mandated in the *Quia maior* (1213), to be conducted monthly, involving separate processions of men and women, praying for the liberation of the Holy Land, and we know similar events were conducted by Honorius III in 1217 and by Gregory IX in 1240.⁵⁷³ In this environment of heightened sentiment (and likely the central motive for it), donations from men and women were to be collected in centrally placed trunks. In addition, after the kiss of peace, daily prostrations (by both men and women) were required, while clerics sang Psalms 78 and 68 over them. All of these activities stressed collective and performative piety; the support for the crusade, according to papal proscription, must be seen and heard by all. This choreographed emotion aimed at inspiring a genuine affective response. During the period of the

⁵⁶⁸ *PL* 216.col 820: ‘[C]um devota orationum instantia postulantium ut misericors Deus auferat a nobis hoc confusionis opprobrium, liberando terram illam in qua universa redemptionis nostrae sacramenta peregit de manibus paganorum.’

⁵⁶⁹ *Ibid.*, 821: ‘In illis autem ecclesiis in quibus conveniet processio generalis, truncus concavus statuatur tribus clavibus consignatus, una penes honestum presbyterum, alia penes devotum laicum, et tertia penes aliquem regularem fideliter conservandis, in quo clerici et laici, viri et mulieres, eleemosynas suas ponant in terrae sanctae subsidium convertendas secundum dispositionem eorum quibus haec fuerit sollicitudo commissa.’

⁵⁷⁰ Maier, “Mass, the Eucharist and the Cross,” 355.

⁵⁷¹ For an examination of the diverse uses of procession in the Latin East see: Christopher MacEvitt, “Processing Together, Celebrating Apart: Shared Processions in the Latin East,” *Journal of Medieval History* 43, no.4 (2017): 455-69.

⁵⁷² Maier, “Mass, the Eucharist and the Cross,” 353.

⁵⁷³ *PL* 216.col 817-21, trans. in *Crusade and Christendom*, 111; Maier, “Mass, the Eucharist and the Cross,” 354.

Fifth Crusade, such processions occurred not only in moments of conflict, but also as a proscriptive pattern of proper behavior, used repeatedly during a wide range of events from the blessing of siege machines to bolstering morale. The rituals, proven so successful during the First Crusade, were employed to confirm and to call upon this sacred cycle, reminding the participants of the dependability of the system.

Fundamental to the success of these newly mandated processions were new crusading incentives. Papal policy opened the way for would-be crusaders, who were too poor or weak to fight, to commute their vows by donating funds in exchange for a portion of the crusader indulgence. While previous papal initiatives under Eugenius III, Alexander III, and Gregory VIII offered partial indulgences to those who financially supported crusading, Innocent III formalized these policies to support local crusaders.⁵⁷⁴ Innocent III's *Post miserabile* (Aug. 13, 1198) made provisions for indulgences to be granted to those who will fight, for those who will provide for those to fight on their behalf, as well as for those who can only give aid towards the enterprise in proportion to their means and devotion.⁵⁷⁵ He repeated these stipulations in the *Quia maior* in 1213.⁵⁷⁶ The Fourth Lateran Council clarified and expanded these developing components of crusade fundraising, including prohibitions against trade with Muslims.⁵⁷⁷ In an

⁵⁷⁴ Parker, "Papa et pecunia," 6.

⁵⁷⁵ Roger of Hoveden, *Chronica magistri Rogeri de Houdene*, ed. William Stubbs (London, 1870), 4.74: 'De Dei ergo misericordia, et Beatorum Apostolorum Petri et Pauli auctoritate confisi, et illa quam Deus nobis, licet indignis, ligandi et solvendi constulit poteste, omnibus qui laboram hujus itineris in personis propriis subierint et expensis, plenam peccatorum suorum, de quibus oris et cordis egerint poenitentiam, veniam indulgemus, et in retributione justorum salutis aeternae pollicemur augmentum. Eis autem, qui non in propriis personis illuc accesserint, sed in suis tantum expensis, juxta facultatem et qualitatem suam, viros idoneos destinaverint, illic saltem per biennium mortuos; et illis similiter qui, licet in alienis expensis, in propriis tamen personis assumptae peregrinationis laborem impleverint, plenam suorum concedimus veniam peccatorum. Hujus ergo remissionis volumus esse participes juxta quantitatem subsidii, ac praecipue secundum devotionis affectum, qui ad subvectionem illius terrae de bonis suis congrue ministrabunt.'

⁵⁷⁶ *PL* 216.col 817-21; Powell, *Anatomy of a Crusade*, 20-1.

⁵⁷⁷ Tanner, Canon 71, 267-71. The canons of the Fourth Lateran were interconnected. For example, as Parker notes, Canon 21 requiring yearly confession was a prerequisite for receiving the crusade indulgence, "Papa et pecunia," 7; Tanner, *Decrees of the Ecumenical Councils, vol. 1*, Canon 21, p. 245.

effort to send only suitably prepared soldiers to fight in this crusade and increase financial support, Innocent III rewarded those who undertake ancillary roles. Constance M. Rousseau and James Powell have noted that these papal innovations, which emphasized liturgical, financial, and penitential support for crusade, enabled both sexes to participate.⁵⁷⁸ Such wide-ranging participation in crusading, whether fiscal or physical, formed part of a strategic program, rooted in the framework of liturgy, intended to rally all Christians towards the cause of crusade.⁵⁷⁹

Lost in Translation?: Miscommunication, Misinformation, or Misunderstanding in Crusade Preaching

The pope's formalization of the expansion of crusade indulgences to financial supporters did not outline exactly how local preachers were supposed to adjudicate between those who should fight and those who should pay (not to mention those wanted to fight but were not equipped for the task). Correspondence between the papacy and its dioceses, which sought clarification on the details of Innocent's tactics, offers key evidence for the haphazard execution of these mandates. For example, Innocent III's response to Hubert Walter, archbishop of Canterbury, sought to clarify discrepancies by deciphering between temporary or lasting impediments to fighting—like infirmity or poverty—and distinguished between the intention of the vows as either in defense of the Holy Land or as a proscribed penance:

Therefore, if any taker of the vow is useless for fighting, although he is able to make the journey, it is better for him to redeem his vow than incur expenses, and this should apply also to the penitent who is too delicate to make the pilgrimage enjoined on him; but it should not apply to the penitent who, although unable to fight, is able to travel. Careful discrimination must be used about these things, lest the salvation of souls or the profit of the Holy Land be endangered.⁵⁸⁰

⁵⁷⁸ Rousseau, "Home Front and Battlefield," 36-7; Powell, "The Role of Women in the Fifth Crusade," 295; Newman, "Introduction," in *The Collected Saints' Lives*, 17. Tekippe also points out that just as the liturgy increasingly began to exclude the laity, procession became more prolific and expansive, "Pilgrimage and Procession," 707.

⁵⁷⁹ Bolton, "Jacques de Vitry and the French Bishops," 58; Linder, *Raising Arms*, xvi.

⁵⁸⁰ "Letter of Innocent III to Hubert Walter, archbishop of Canterbury, 1200," in *Crusade and Christendom*, 50.

In regard to women seeking to participate, Innocent III explained:

Let those who do not wish to stay behind accompany their husbands if they are going; but others, unless they happen to be rich and able to take soldiers with them at their expense, should redeem the vow they have made, the rest being persuaded earnestly to provide for the help of the Holy Land according to their means.⁵⁸¹

The correspondence does not suggest it was unusual for women to be signed with the cross, but rather that they were a target of the preaching campaigns. Innocent adds that on the occasion of a remittance of a vow, witnesses must confirm that the impediments are sincere, and that if later they are found to be false, their absolution would be nullified. In a follow-up letter, further clarifications were made on who can absolve vows, what exactly constituted “useless for fighting,” and if this declaration on women meant that men no longer needed to seek permission from their wives to leave.⁵⁸² The multiplication of difficulties in construing the expanded crusader vows and partial indulgences, indicates the difficulty of keeping pace with the papal attempts to provide clarifications.

This was the sort of problem Jacques would have faced in recruitment: the disparity in how different classes of people experienced and understood their vows. Written after the Fourth Lateran Council, the letters of Gervase, the Abbot of Prémontré, to Innocent III and to Honorius III, complained that the powerful French magnates had delayed their departure with little concern for spiritual penalties, leaving those “lesser persons, that is burgesses and rustics” to wait in despair.⁵⁸³ Additionally, there was confusion over how exactly the crusader tax would be applied: “everyone inferred that those who had taken the cross had been promised that the

⁵⁸¹ Ibid.

⁵⁸² “Innocent III’s reply to Hubert Walter’s further inquiries, September 1201,” in *Crusade and Christendom*, 51-2.

⁵⁸³ Gervase of Premontré, *Epistolae*, in C.L. Hugo, ed., *Sacrae antiquitatis monumenta historica, dogmatica, diplomatica* (Étival, 1725) 1.3 and 7; Trans. in *Crusade and Christendom*, 135-6.

money. . . would be paid out for the expenses of the poor who had taken the sign of the cross.”⁵⁸⁴ Men willing to sacrifice their lives, were left without the promised “money, counsel, and leadership.”⁵⁸⁵ These letters between popes and the provinces reveals that the calls to crusade failed to clarify the nuances of the vows. It is not surprising that mandated devotional processions and fervent crusade preaching were not the venues for careful delineation of how exactly one would later fulfill a vow, specifics left to be inferred by both the preacher and the would-be crusader. Unprepared priests, therefore, had to sort out the individual circumstances for those they had signed with the cross, including women. And those who had taken vows needed to wait for those priests to sort out answers, with hope of salvation weighing in the balance. As some men sought to capitalize on changes to the vows, seeing perhaps a loophole to avoid actually undertaking a penitential pilgrimage, the zeal of those “useless for fighting”—the poor, weak, or female—repeatedly had to be moderated and negotiated. Nevertheless, despite this confusion, these complaints demonstrate that performative “crusade rallies” generated wide-ranging support. The choreographed, affective rituals in fact worked.

Innocent III dispatched his army of crusade preachers throughout France and Germany, and they reported back that recalcitrant nobles and their loyal bishops were impeding their progress, but the evidences also suggests that the zeal of these legates themselves led to crusaders’ misgivings. Crusader privileges granted those signed with the cross freedom from taxation, protection of their property, and access to interest free loans.⁵⁸⁶ Reformers like Robert Courçon used this as an opportunity to preach against all forms of usury.⁵⁸⁷ Those attempting to

⁵⁸⁴ Ibid., 139.

⁵⁸⁵ Ibid.

⁵⁸⁶ Bird, “Crusaders’ Rights Revisted,”134-6.

⁵⁸⁷ As Parker notes: “the papacy simultaneously was attempting to respond to popular outrage against the perceived ubiquity of simony and greed, though it seems that the poniffs were unaware that it was mostly they themselves who fostered this perception through the ever-increasing financial needs of the curia,” Parker, “*Papa et pecunia*,” 2.

avoid their creditors easily exploited these rights, encroaching on secular jurisdiction over taxation, military service, and money-lending. For example, the French chronicler, William the Breton (c. 1165 – c. 1225) complained that the papal legate Robert had signed people of all ages and even those in poor health with the cross to the chagrin of the nobles.⁵⁸⁸ William reported that Robert’s sermons had overstepped propriety by attacking the laxity of clerics and usury, and thus he had alienated the wealthy nobles who were essential for a successful crusade.⁵⁸⁹ Clearly, not everyone was on board with Holy War as dependent on Innocentian reforms that seemingly dismissed—or more likely targeted—the status quo. Despite Innocent III’s own reform-minded vision, Robert’s detractors—namely Peter, bishop of Paris, and Guérin, bishop of Senlis—succeeded in having him removed from his post at the Fourth Lateran Council.⁵⁹⁰ Perhaps in hopes of removing him from the volatile situation on the home front, Honorius III dispatched Robert to accompany the French crusaders as their spiritual rector. In the winter of 1219, Robert would die from illness outside of Damietta.⁵⁹¹

With Robert gone, Innocent III reportedly selected another like-minded crusade enthusiast—Jacques de Vitry—to take his place in preparing crusaders and defending their rights, but these plans would not come to be. Abbot Gervase wrote to Honorius III in the aftermath of Robert of Courson’s dismissal as the legate to France. He explained that he had been eagerly waiting for his presumed replacement, Jacques de Vitry, when he learned that

⁵⁸⁸ Bolton, “Jacques de Vitry and the French Bishops,” 63; Cole, *Preaching of the Crusades*, 128.

⁵⁸⁹ Cole, *Preaching of the Crusades*, 128.

⁵⁹⁰ Baldwin, *Masters, Princes, and Merchants*, 22-23; Bolton, “Jacques de Vitry and the French Bishops,” 63; Bird, “Crusaders’ Rights Revisted,” 136; Cole, *Preaching of the Crusades*, 128. Cole emphasizes Robert’s overreaching behavior as cause for his dismissal, while Bolton presents Innocent III as more sympathetic to Robert’s situation but constrained by the unrelenting complaints of the French clergy.

⁵⁹¹ Cole, *Preaching of the Crusades*, 109; Bird, “Crusaders’ Rights Revisted,” 141. Honorius III had already appointed Cardinal Pelgus as legate for the entire army.

Jacques had already been dispatched to Acre.⁵⁹² Jacques had traveled to Perugia in 1216 to receive consecration from Innocent. But the pope died the day before his arrival. In a letter, Jacques recounted that he had arrived to find that people had stolen the papal vestments in the night, and the pope's decaying, almost naked body was abandoned in the church.⁵⁹³ Such an indecorous scene must have made for an inauspicious backdrop to meeting with Pope Honorius III.⁵⁹⁴ As noted in the previous chapter, it was on this occasion that Jacques gained verbal permission for the beguines in Flanders, France, and the Empire to live together in community.⁵⁹⁵ He had also sought to use this opportunity to address the abuses committed against those he had signed to the cross:

Since the defense of the crusaders was entrusted to the priests in the Kingdom of France, [Honorius III] did not want to give me special authority so that I might be able to defend them. It is said that he did this at the instigation of certain men who aspired to the legation to the kingdom of France. After getting advice from my friends and companions, I did not want to leave unless I was able to protect the crusaders, who were oppressed almost completely by taxes and exactions. Some here had even been imprisoned. Otherwise, they would no longer listen to my preaching, but rather they will spit in my face if I were not able to protect them according to what was promised to them in sermons.⁵⁹⁶

Jacques had expected to return to his work preaching in France and championing the rights of crusaders—as Gervase had hoped.⁵⁹⁷ He was partly concerned for the crusaders' welfare, but

⁵⁹² Gervase of Premontr , *Epistolae*, 1:7; Trans. in *Crusade and Christendom*, 138. Honorius III would send Simon, the archbishop of Tyre, but Gervase would complain that was hesitant to enforce crusaders' privileges, Bird, "Crusaders' Rights Revisted," 138.

⁵⁹³ Jacques de Vitry, *Lettres*, I.61-5: 'Post hoc veni in civitatem quandam que Perusium nuncupatur, in qua papam Innocentium inveni mortuum, sed nundum sepultum, quem de nocte quidam furtive vestimentis preciosis, cum quibus sci<licet sepeliendus> erat, spoliauerunt; corpus autem eius fere nudum et fetidum in ecclesia relinquerunt.'

⁵⁹⁴ Honorius III was elected July 24,th1216 and Jacques was consecrated the following Sunday, July 31. See footnote 414.

⁵⁹⁵ Jacques de Vitry, *Lettres*, I.76-81, see footnote 233; Bolton, "Mulieres Sanctae," 148.

⁵⁹⁶ Jacques de Vitry, *Lettres*, I.81-90: '. . . quia in prelati in regno Francie comissa fuerat crucegnatorum defensio, noluit michi dare specialem potestatem ut eos defendere valerem. Hoc autem fecit, ut dicitur, quorundam consilio, qui ad legationem regni Francie aspirabant; ego vero, habito cum amicis et sociis meis consilio, nolui redire nisi crucegnatos, qui fere ubique tallis et aliis exactionibus opprimuntur, quorum etiam corpora passim incarcerantur, valerem defendere: aliter enim verbum predicationis non reciperent, sed magis in faciem meam conspuerent, si eos, secundum quod promissum est eis in predicationibus, protegere non valerem.'

also his personal reputation was at stake. Then, seemingly undermining this line of argument, Jacques lists excuses for why it was actually better for him to not return, citing the difficulties of traveling to France in winter and his need for respite before beginning the challenging work ahead of him. Many thousands of crusaders were preparing to leave, he asserted, and thus he needed to leave France behind to prepare their way.⁵⁹⁸ These justifications, written after decisions were made, perhaps were an attempt to convince both the writer and the reader that he had taken the right course of action—and that it was outside of his control.

Jacques' visit to Honorius III demonstrates that crusade preaching was not consistently accompanied by clear directives or explanations, certainly not in collaboration with the opinion of the nobles who were expected to lead the enterprise. Something had been lost in translation from papal mandates to local crusade preaching. Those whom Jacques had signed with the cross expected financial support and they expected to leave, but he was making promises that he was not in the position to keep.⁵⁹⁹ Honorius III certainly worked to implement Innocent's crusading plans, and his ongoing correspondence signifies a close interest in the affairs in Acre.⁶⁰⁰ But the treatment of Jacques de Vitry and Robert of Courçon shows that Honorius was also compelled to smooth over the unforeseen difficulties caused by the fundraising initiatives. To that end, he began to deploy some of Innocent III's army of preachers to the actual battlefield.

⁵⁹⁷ Bolton, "Jacques de Vitry and the French Bishops," 65.

⁵⁹⁸ Jacques de Vitry, *Lettres*, I.90-7: 'Preterea, cum ad partes Francia venissem, hiems esset et statim in Quadragesima proxima iterum arripere iter me oporteret, unde parum possem proficere et multum oporteret me laborare; et quia ex labore continuo me valde debilitatem sentiebam, preelegi aliquantum quiescere, ut laborem exercitatus ultra mare valerem sustinere, maxime quia multa milia cruce signatorum iam transierunt, quos oportebit me consolari et detinere.'

⁵⁹⁹As Bird notes: "unless they possessed the resources to lodge appeals, crusaders' theoretical rights to protection of person and possessions depended almost purely on the pleasure and effectiveness of the local secular and ecclesiastical authorities ultimately charged with defining and enforcing crusader privileges," "Crusaders' Rights Revisted," 144.

⁶⁰⁰For letters to or involving Jacques de Vitry see Claverie, *Honorius III et l'Orient*: #33, #52, #53, #71, #72, #82, #83, #105, #119, #131, #132, #134, #150.

Jacques provides us with the most detailed reasoning for why the battlefield of the Fifth Crusade (1217-1221) would be at Damietta. In a letter, he explained that Jerusalem's lack of water, mountainous terrain, and well-fortified strongholds made a summer attack too difficult so instead, the leaders aimed at the source of Saracen power—Egypt. This fertile, flat, and wealthy area, he explained, was also home to sacred sites—Jesus lived there with the Virgin Mary during the flight to Egypt (Matthew 2:13–23), it was home to the many Desert Fathers, and it was the only place on earth that the balsam tree grew—the source of the chrism. Moreover, he added, Christians living in servitude outnumbered their Muslim captors.⁶⁰¹ Jacques focused on detailing Damietta's strategic advantages and sacramental pedigree, but it was in fact a well-fortified city protected by three robust walls, a large moat, and a tactically placed chain tower. Known for its brutal summer heat, Damietta sat along the predictable, but dangerous Nile River.⁶⁰² Al-Kamil, son of the aging brother of Saladin, Al-Adil Sayf al-Din Abu Bakr I (1196–1218) controlled this area.⁶⁰³ Jacques neither suggests any long-term plans for how exactly the capture of Damietta would lead to the capture of Jerusalem, nor shows an understanding of family politics within the Ayyubid dynasty.⁶⁰⁴ Nevertheless, Jacques arrived in Acre in the fall of 1216. He would have only a year to make preparations for this new enterprise.

⁶⁰¹ Jacques de Vitry, *Lettres*, IV.8-56.

⁶⁰² Jacques described the seasonal flooding, the problem of brackish water, and the presence of crocodiles, *Lettres*, IV.99-2: 'In hoc autem flumine vidimus monstra quedam que *cocodrilli* nuncupantur, gallice autem *cocatriz*, que hominibus et equis insidiantes quicquid dentibus suis attingunt devorant'; Powell, *Anatomy of a Crusade*, 140-1.

⁶⁰³ Westerners knew Al-Adil by the name Saphadin. Ibn al-Athīr, 'Izz al-Dīn, D. *The chronicle of Ibn al-Athīr for the crusading period from al-Kāmil fi'l-ta'rīkh* (Burlington, Vt.: Ashgate, 2006).

⁶⁰⁴ Powell, *Anatomy of a Crusade*, 164.

Women, Men, and Even Children: Jacques de Vitry's Application of the Universal Crusade

While William of Breton complained of the broader use of the crusader vow, for Jacques, signing women, men, and even children with the cross was cause for joy.⁶⁰⁵ We saw this pride in Jacques' account of preaching in Genoa, where the noble women's ardent response to his call to crusade shamed their husbands into taking the cross.⁶⁰⁶ And this sort of collective reaction only continued. In a letter recounting his travels to Acre, Beirut, Tyre, and Sidon, Jacques interweaves descriptions of his visits to sacred sites in these cities with preaching to the communities.⁶⁰⁷

These calls aimed not just at inspiring Christians to personal conversion, but also actually converting Muslims.⁶⁰⁸ Jacques asserted that among the numerous crimes in Acre, there were Christians who had refused baptism to their Muslim slaves in order to keep them in servitude.⁶⁰⁹ Thus, Jacques began preaching to these slaves with an interpreter and as a result they converted, made confessions, and were signed with the cross: "I gave the sign of the cross to most of the former slaves, exhorting them to prepare their weapons and other things that could be used in defense of the Holy Land."⁶¹⁰ Moreover, this audience of Muslim slaves included women: "the women who had received the cross, I exhorted them to give some of their money—according to

⁶⁰⁵ On William the Breton's complaints see Bolton, "Jacques de Vitry and the French Bishops," 63; Cole, *Preaching of the Crusades*, 128.

⁶⁰⁶ See Chapter One.

⁶⁰⁷ Such as in Beirut, where Jacques reports that he saw the place where the Caaninite women ran after the Lord for the crumbs that fall from the master's table (Matthew 15:27), *Lettres*, II.320-1.

⁶⁰⁸ On Jacques treatment of Muslims in the *Historia Orientalis* which relied on Byzantine versions of the Life of Muhammad, see Jean Donnadieu. "La representation de l'islam dans l'*Historia orientales*. Jacques de Vitry historien," *Le Moyen Age* 114 (2008): 487-508.

⁶⁰⁹ Kedar notes that, despite the occasional conversion of slaves, no sustained efforts at preaching to the Muslims occurred at this time, Benjamin Z. Kedar, *Crusade and Mission: European Approaches toward the Muslims* (Princeton, N.J.: Princeton University Press, 1988): 78.

⁶¹⁰ Jacques de Vitry, *Lettres*, II.218-20: 'Ego vero signum sancte crucis fere omnibus dedi iniungens eis ut arma et alia ad succursum sancte terre pertinentia prepararent.'

their means—to support the war effort.”⁶¹¹ This advice echoes Innocent III’s response to Hubert Walter inquiry on women signed with the cross, which clarified that if not joining their husbands or wealthy enough to command an army, they could redeem their vow through financing crusade according to their means. Jacques shows that—at least in the case of these slave women—some sort of explication accompanied calls to crusade. But it also suggests that the collective approach to crusader vows became a missionizing strategy, the call to crusade and the call to conversion had become one and the same.⁶¹² Reportedly, visions of the Virgin Mary and Jesus participated spectrally in these missionizing calls to crusade, as the Muslims reported: “the Blessed Virgin had told [these Muslims] that unless they became Christians they would die miserably and soon when the Christians came and were victorious.”⁶¹³ Jacques decried Christian masters for refusing baptism to their slaves, but by combining the cause for their conversion with the ideology of impending Holy War, Jacques simply placed a different type of yoke on them.

Propelled by his successes in Acre, Jacques continued his journey from Tyre to Beirut where he preached and made the sign of the Cross for “women, men, and even children, as well as the lord of the city and his knights.”⁶¹⁴ Then he went on to Byblos where the bishop “received the sign of the Cross, as did the city ruler and the entire population.”⁶¹⁵ At Chastel-Blanc he preached to the Templars who gave him safe passage to Tortosa, where he would celebrate mass and after preaching, would baptize two Muslims.⁶¹⁶ Jacques portrayed whole communities, men

⁶¹¹ Ibid., 220-2: ‘. . . mulieribus vero crucesignatis iniunxi ut secundum facultates suas ad opus exercitus de pecunia sua darent.’

⁶¹² Whalen notes that contemporaries viewed missions not as an alternative to crusade, but rather “a peaceful adjunct to it,” *Dominion of God*, 157.

⁶¹³ Jacques de Vitry, *Lettres*, II.227-9 : ‘Dicebant enim eis, ut asserunt, beata Virgo, quod nisi christiani fierent, in proximo advenientibus christianis et victoriam optinentibus misera morte perirent.’

⁶¹⁴ Ibid., 327-30: ‘Postquam autem aliquot diebus moram feci in civitate Berrithi et eis verbum dei predicavi, omnibus signatis tam mulieribus quam viris et etiam parvulis, signato domino civitatis cum militibus eius’

⁶¹⁵ Ibid., 334-7: ‘Erat autem civitas illa valde corrupta et episcopus loci pauperrimus, sed liberalis et humilis, qui cum domino civitatis et universo populo signum crucis recepit.’

and women, the powerful and poor, and even newly converted Muslim men and women, as eagerly preparing for the crusade, certainly a sharp contrast to the disorganized delays in the West.

But Jacques' successful preaching tour would be cut short. While in Margat, he received news from Ralph of Merencourt, the Patriarch of Jerusalem, that he must return to Acre because the pilgrims were arriving. Jacques concluded the letter describing his preaching efforts and his journey listing the reasons that victory was inevitable: the Christians outnumbered the Saracens, the Saracens were divided among themselves;⁶¹⁷ further east Christians led by Prester John were already defeating Muslims.⁶¹⁸ The patriarch of the Maronites had submitted to the Catholic Church, therefore in Jacques' opinion: "many heretics in the Eastern regions and Saracens would easily be converted to God if they heard the doctrine of salvation."⁶¹⁹ His own preaching campaign, signing anyone and everyone to the cross, had roused the necessary collective support for the crusade. The twin goals of his preaching, to convert audiences to Catholic belief and to urge them to prepare for the crusade had apparently succeeded.

Enemies from Within

Jacques also expressed doubts about the culture of the crusader states. His exhortations in his letters confirm his disdain for leaders, crusaders, and residents of the Frankish settlements

⁶¹⁶ Ibid., 364-5: 'In qua ecclesia postquam missam celebravi, facto sermone ad populum duos Sarracenos baptizavi.'

⁶¹⁷ In 1218, al-Adil, Saladin's younger brother, died in Syria leaving the empire divided among the sons. Al-Kamil received Egypt, Powell, *Anatomy of a Crusade*, 145.

⁶¹⁸ Jacques de Vitry, *Lettres*, II.398-401: 'Multi autem reges christiani habitantes in partibus Orientis usque in terram presbyteri Iohannis, audientes adventum cruce signatorum, ut eis veniant in auxilium movent guerram cum Sarracenis.'

⁶¹⁹ Ibid., 441-6: 'Patriarcha ver Maronitarum cum archiepiscopis et episcopis suis et populo Maronitarum sibi subdito relictis omnibus erroribus obedientie sancte et catholice Romane ecclesie se subdidit et multi tam de hereticis in partibus orientalibus commanentibus quam de Sarracenis, si sanam doctrinam audirent, facile, ut credo, ad dominum converterentur.'

whose allegiances and behaviors were, in his opinion, questionable.⁶²⁰ They were reluctant to convert their Muslim slaves, the city was full of brothels, and those born there—the *Pullani*—did not keep their marriage vows or respect the word of God.⁶²¹ Moreover, as is often the case for Jacques, the relationships between husbands and wives stood as an indicator of just how disordered a society was: “Every single day and night murders happen as often in the open as in secret: men slit their wives’ throats in the night when they are displeased with them, while wives in a traditional way, kill their husbands with poisons so that they can marry someone else.”⁶²² Jacques’ invective reminds us of his primary role as a priest and preacher, but also confirms his fundamental premise that crusade and reform were interdependent enterprises.

Jacques’ criticism against crusaders was not without merit. Leading up to the Fifth Crusade, the infighting between Bohemond IV and Levon II over Antioch included alliances with az-Zahr the prince of Aleppo.⁶²³ During the crusade, both Jacques and Oliver of Paderborn reported that Christian traitors repeatedly informed the Sultan al-Kamil of crusaders’ plans.⁶²⁴ And the two major victories—taking the chain tower and the capture of the city—were followed by infighting, delays, and inadequate reinforcements. While the crusaders’ declared enemy was the Muslims, the more pernicious adversary continued to be themselves.

⁶²⁰ Folda, *Crusader Art*, 108.

⁶²¹ Jacques de Vitry, *Lettres*, II.169-73: ‘Inveni preterea homines de terra natos qui *Pullani*, quod gallice dicitur *Poulains*, nuncupantur: hii soli ad curam et ad iurisdictionem meam se pertinere fatebantur, vix autem inveniebatur unus de mille qui matrimonium suum legitime vellet custodire: non enim fornicationem credebant esse mortale peccatum.’

⁶²² *Ibid.*, 190-4: ‘Fiebant autem singulis fere diebus et noctibus homicidia tam manifesta quam occulta : viri de nocte suas iungulabant uxores cum eis displicerent, mulieres ex antiqua consuetudine venenis et potionibus maritos suos ut aliis nubarent perimebant.’

⁶²³ Folda, *Crusader Art*, 108; Bernard Hamilton, *The Latin Church in the Crusader States: The Secular Church* (London: Variorum Publications, 1980): 221.

⁶²⁴ Powell, *Anatomy of a Crusade*, 161, 189.

Jacques would later rely on these themes to craft his *exempla*. These short narrative stories, were placed at the end of his sermons and highlighted moral lessons concerning the salvation of one's soul, and also aimed at the religious health of the whole community.⁶²⁵ Jacques' personal experiences would have left him in little doubt that the decisions of kings, counts, and papal legates were particularly influential to crusading. However, stories of common people allowed Jacques to criticize the specific failings of rulers through the use of a more generalized common denominator. In these *exempla*, therefore, Jacques insists on the connection between one's own actions and the consequences for the Christian community. This message was relevant for both kings and merchants.

In the *exempla* that feature crusading themes, we often find the misdeeds of Christians—including a butcher, a smith, and a meddling wife—serving the enemies' goals. In one tale, a butcher was selling pilgrims spoiled meat.⁶²⁶ After the Muslims captured him, he tried to reason with the sultan, "There is not a year in which I will not kill more than one hundred of the crusaders, to whom I sold old and fetid boiled meat and spoiled fish."⁶²⁷ The implicit lesson is clear: the butcher's behavior made him a servant of the Sultan and hence God's enemy. Thus

⁶²⁵ For example, British Library, MS Harley 463, a late thirteenth-century copy, was originally housed in the priory of St. Mary and St. John the Baptist of Lanthony near Gloucestershire, the period of this manuscript's composition aligns with the time in which Godfrey Gifford bishop of Worcester visited (1276). In the episcopal registers, Gifford noted the laxity of the community in which canons were heading into the towns without permission, and their finances were in such a bad state that their creditors had put a lien on the holy vessels. Gifford implemented a detailed overhaul of the priory's administration and finances, and exhorted the canons to stop frequenting the towns and to attend mass more regularly. Harley 463 both fits this program of reform and confirms the opinion that Jacques' *exempla* served the needs of clerical education as mandated by the Fourth Lateran Council; *A Catalogue of the Harleian Manuscripts in the British Museum*, 4 vols (London: Eyre and Strahan, 1808-12), II (1808), no. 463; John William Willis Bund, ed., *Episcopal Registers, Diocese of Worcester: Register of Bishop Godfrey Giffard, September 23rd, 1268, to August 15th, 1301* (Oxford: James Parker and co., 1902): 87, 1276.

⁶²⁶ Jacques de Vitry, *Exempla*, CLXIII, 70: 'Intellexi preterea cum essem in partibus transmarinis quod quidam christianus, qui in Acconensi civitate carnes coctas et pulmenta corrupta peregrinis vendere consueverat, captus est a Sarraconis, et rogavit ut duceretur ad soldanum.'

⁶²⁷ Ibid., 71: "Non est annus in quo plus quam centum de hostibus vestris peregrinis non occidam, quibus carnes coctas veteres et fetidas et pisces corruptas vendo." Quod audiens soldanus ridere cepit et eum abire permisit.'

anyone who worked for their own profit above the spiritual wellbeing of the community became, in effect, a servant of the Devil. In comparison, the unscrupulous smith had engineered a scheme in which he would secretly drive a nail into the hoof of the pilgrims' or crusaders' horse and then have an agent down the road offer to purchase the lame horse for a low price.⁶²⁸ Here again Jacques decries profits obtained by Christians through the exploitation of crusaders and pilgrims, highlighting the danger of one's own depravity. The account of the hapless wife presents how family members could also hinder the crusade. The wife desperately tried to block the door of her house so that her husband could not attend crusade preaching, but he escaped through the roof and still took the cross.⁶²⁹ Instead of focusing on the Muslim enemies, these stories highlight the true stumbling block to crusaders—namely, deceitful or misguided Christians.⁶³⁰

The exploitation of pilgrims and crusaders by fellow Christians was a real threat, but on the other hand, Jacques also cautioned against excessive zeal, suggesting perhaps a desire to restrain the fervor stoked by his own sermons. In a story regarding a crusader who fasted on bread and water, Jacques explained that while fighting weakly, his fellow crusaders had to repeatedly rescue him. Jacques exhorted his reader: “you ought not tempt God, but rather you ought to do what among you is predicated upon reason and then you can properly die for

⁶²⁸ Ibid, CXCIII, 80: ‘De quodam maledicto marescallo equorum audivi quod, cum ferraret equos peregrinorum et transeuntium, scienter illos inclavabat vel etiam acum in pede equi latenter figebat. Cumque peregrinus per unum vel duo miliaria processisset et equus fortiter claudicaret abibat obviam hominem quem marescallus in strata premerat qui dicebat peregrino: "Amice, equus tuus inutilis factus est, vis illum vendere ut saltem pro corio et ferramentis pedum aliquid recipias et totum non amittas?"’

⁶²⁹ Ibid., CXXII, 56: ‘Nam et ego cum aliquando in quadam villa predicarem, quidam, uxore sua dissuadente, ad sermonem cum aliis noluit venire; cepit tamen quasi ex curiositate de solatio per fenestram inspicere et quid ego dicerem latenter ascultare. Cumque audisset quod per crucis compendium, absque alia penitentia, tantam indulgentiam obtinerent quantamque plerumque obtinent qui per annos lx jejunant et portant cilicium, nihil enim amplius potest remitti quam totum.’

⁶³⁰ Folda addresses these sermon stories, suggesting these stories might have discouraged potential crusaders, *Crusader Art*, 109.

Christ.”⁶³¹ Piety ought to be checked by reason and pragmatism, so that the crusaders can die for Christ because of fighting rather than fasting.⁶³²

Jacques’ approach to crusading comes into sharp relief when placed next to idealistic crusader hymns circulating at the same time. For example, a thirteen-century manuscript, Cambridge Trinity B. 1.1 from the Cistercian Abbey of Buildwas in Shropshire, England, includes a rhyming hymn added on a slip after a gloss on Lamentations.⁶³³ It appears to be a variation on the crusader hymn also found in the *Gesta Regis Henrici Secundi Benedicti Abbatis* (The Chronicle of the Reigns of Henry II and Richard I).⁶³⁴ Roger of Hoveden, English chronicler and participant in the Third Crusade, recorded this hymn that was composed by the cleric Berthier of Orléans, who had possible ties with the French court.⁶³⁵ The hymn’s provenance suggests it had already spread widely in its own time and Cambridge Trinity B. 1.1 shows that it continued to circulate in the thirteenth-century.

This later version adds to the beginning verse linking it more explicitly to Lamentations, and it includes additions to the chorus which refer to the Holy Spirit. It reads: “The army follows the banner, the sign of the cross, which does not withdraw but advances in the power of the Holy Spirit.”⁶³⁶ This hymn emphasizes the debt owed to Christ and the desecration of the cross by the

⁶³¹ Jacques de Vitry, *Exempla*, LXXXV, 38-9: ‘Non enim Deum temptare debetis sed facere quod in vobis est previa ratione et tunc secure pro Christo mortem potestis suscipere.’

⁶³² In another long exemplum criticizing tournaments, he clarifies that while the tournaments lead to committing numerous mortal sins, God does not prohibit fighting altogether. Referring to Luke 3:14, Jacques explains that when the soldiers asked John the Baptist what they should do, he did not prohibit their fighting, as long as they received and were satisfied with their wages, Jacques de Vitry, *Exempla*, CXLI, 63-4.

⁶³³ Cambridge, Trinity, B 1.1, f. 206r; Deirdre Jackson, Nigel Morgan and Stella Panayotova (eds.), *Illuminated Manuscripts in Cambridge : A Catalogue of Western Book Illumination in the Fitzwilliam Museum and the Cambridge Colleges*. Part 3, France, vol 1, c.1000-c.1250 (London: Harvey Miller Publishers, 2015), vol. 1. no. 17; Jennifer Sheppard, *The Buildwas Books: Book Production, Acquisition and Use at an English Cistercian Monastery, 1165-c.1400* (Oxford : Oxford Bibliographical Society, Bodleian Library, 1997), no. 42, pp. 215-9.

⁶³⁴ *History of the Conquest of England by the Normans*, trans. Augustin Thierry (London, D. Bogue, 1825): 126-7.

⁶³⁵ Christopher. Tyerman, *God's War a New History of the Crusades* (Cambridge, Mass.: Belknap Press, 2008): 388-9.

⁶³⁶ Cambridge, Trinity, MS 1, f. 206r: ‘Lignum crucis / signum ducis / sequitur exercitus, / quod non cessit / sed

“new Philistines” who were the precursors of the antichrist. It assures the reader that for those who want to be crusaders, but have no money, the body of Christ shall be sufficient sustenance as they fight to defend the faith. It exhorts its readers to take up the cross and die for the one who died for them. This message would resonate with the manuscript’s Cistercian audience, who identified themselves as the true soldiers of Christ, as Katherine Allen Smith’s work has shown.⁶³⁷ This more spiritualized and idealized understanding of crusade suited the ascetic vision of the Cistercians. Jacques’ *exempla*, however, reveal a more fatalistic edge. Soldiers are advised to keep their piety in check, and preaching exposes moral character rather than changes it. Jacques’ *exempla*, therefore suggest a vision of a preacher, whose idealism had been worn down through failed efforts to reform Christians’ character.

Women Crusaders and Crusaders’ Common Women

Jacques’ reports of women’s enthusiastic response to crusade during his preaching tour stands in contrast with the common tropes of meddling wives who attempted to prevent husbands from taking the cross, which were popular fodder for sermon stories, including Jacques’ own *exempla*.⁶³⁸ His preaching campaigns, however, show that women responded enthusiastically to his message, in some cases even more so than men. This crusade propaganda was successful among women in part because it was tilling already fertile ground. Women had long been taking the cross and making vows of pilgrimage to the Holy Land. Women served in multiple capacities from financial supporters, writers of propaganda, and just as most men, they served ancillary roles on the battlefield—carrying water, filling ditches, and providing spiritual

processit / in ui sancti spiritus.’

⁶³⁷ Smith, *War and the Making of Medieval Monastic Culture*.

⁶³⁸ I have found works on this topic that employ Jacques, rely on his *exempla* or his account of the Genoese women in his letters, for example: Natasha Hodgson, *Women, Crusading and the Holy Land in Historical Narrative* (Rochester, NY: Boydell Press: 2007); Powell, “Role of Women,” 294-301.

support through their prayers.⁶³⁹ As Maier and Nicholson have shown, the account of the Cistercian nun from the monastery of Montreuil-sous-Laon, Margaret of Beverley (d.1215), represents men's ideal of women's involvement in crusade.⁶⁴⁰ As recorded by her brother the Cistercian Thomas of Froidmont, Margaret took the cross and journeyed to the Holy Land where she would be captured during the Battle of Hattin (1187). Thomas detailed how his sister carried water to soldiers during Saladin's siege of Jerusalem (1187), fought along side the soldiers in defense of the city, and suffered in prison, from which she was eventually ransomed in 1191.⁶⁴¹ Her role was thus marked by ancillary support and self-sacrifice. This type of ideal is also illustrated in an episode found in the *Itinerarium Peregrinorum et Gesta Regis Ricardi*. It reports that a woman, diligently working day and night to fill ditches during the siege of Acre, was struck by a rock thrown by a Turk. As she lay dying from her wounds, she begged her husband to leave her body in the ditch so that even in death her dead body could contribute to their important work.⁶⁴²

These ancillary roles on the battlefield can be seen also in the Fifth Crusade. As Jacques' fellow crusade preacher, Oliver of Paderborn, author of the *Siege of Damietta*, notes women carried bread, wine, and stones to crusaders.⁶⁴³ Women also fought. The anonymous *Gesta obsidionis Damiete* reported that al'Kamil's forces tried to burn a bridge that connected the crusaders' camps and get into the besieged city. This attempt failed and most of the Muslims

⁶³⁹ While a lot of scholarly attention remains on the 1st-3rd Crusade and the works of Catherine of Sienna in the fourteenth century, more remains to be done on women's role in the Fifth Crusade. See for example, Susan Edgington & Sarah Lambert, *Gendering the Crusades* (New York: Columbia University Press: 2002); ADD

⁶⁴⁰ Nicholson, "Women's Involvement in the Crusades," 60; Maier, "Roles of Women in the Crusade Movement," 64-7.

⁶⁴¹ Maier, "Roles of Women in the Crusade Movement," 64-5.

⁶⁴² William Stubbs, *Itinerarium peregrinorum et gesta regis Ricardi* (London: Longman, 1864): I.50.101.

⁶⁴³ He also notes that Christian and Muslim women were employed to grind corn for the crusaders during the long siege, Powell, *Anatomy of a Crusade*, 142.

fled, but the women reportedly killed those trapped in the camp. These victims were then decapitated and their heads tossed into the sultan's camp.⁶⁴⁴ In addition to the already gruesome display, the Muslims' death at the hands of women added a demoralizing component to the psychological terror.

Jacques de Vitry's own amusement and surprise at Marie D'Oignies' desire to go on crusade, suggests that, even so, he considered such women were more suited to devotional or inspirational support. In her *vita*, he proscribed as much. But there appear possible connections between crusading fervor and this new surge of female piety from which Marie D'Oignies, Christina the Astonishing, and others.⁶⁴⁵ As Henri Platelle notes, "Perhaps there was a secret link between the heroic atmosphere created by these frequent appeals to holy war. . .and this momentum towards cloisters and perfection."⁶⁴⁶ In the context of crusade, we see women directing their piety more towards the *vita activa* rather than an enclosed *vita contemplativa*. In this milieu of female spirituality and the crusading atmosphere of the post-Fourth Lateran world, therefore, it is not surprising that this new wave of devotion would take aim at the Lord's inheritance, namely Jerusalem. The strategic program of Innocent III included women in the Latin west as important targets for these collective and performative preaching campaigns.⁶⁴⁷ In turn, this opened up a public space for them to use one of the few rhetorical weapons that society

⁶⁴⁴ Powell, *Anatomy of a Crusade*, 161; *Gesta obsidionis Damiete*, 110; While later associated prominently in the Western imagination with Turks, as Palmira Brummett observes: "As a symbol of victory, justice, and masculine honor it [the severed head] transcends the boundaries of time, ethnicity, region, and religion," *Mapping the Ottomans: Sovereignty, Territory, and Identity in the Early Modern Mediterranean* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2015), 191.

⁶⁴⁵ Platelle, *Livre de Abeilles*, 12.

⁶⁴⁶ Ibid, 12: 'Peut-être d'ailleurs y a-t-il un lien secret entre le climat héroïque créé par ses fréquents appels à la guerre saint . . . et cet élan vers les cloîtres et la perfection.'

⁶⁴⁷ Powell, "Role of Women," 295.

allowed them (their emotions) to increase excitement about the crusade at a time when there really was no sense of immediate crisis.

Despite these types of support in the East and West, male authors spent much more extended time blaming women, as the source of men's sexual sins, for setbacks in battle. The previous chapter revealed that Jacques' sermons reflect a wide-range of sanctity as available to virgins, widows, and the married. Even so, he presented the virtue of bodily integrity, as "a particular feature of female spirituality."⁶⁴⁸ While in her life Marie offered counsel and encouragement to Jacques, her sanctity was primarily displayed on her body through her extreme asceticism.⁶⁴⁹ It's ironic that even a thinker subtle as Jacques could readily embrace the most common of binary of paradigms, Mary vs. Eve.

This emphasis on bodily integrity speaks to the degradation of women who worked as "professional sinners," namely prostitutes. Just as in the *Historia Occidentalis* which castigated university leaders for the proximity of brothels to classrooms, Jacques noted that Acre was filled with houses of prostitution. Because they "paid higher rents for rooms than others, not only the laity but even ecclesiastics and some monks hired out their lodgings to the public prostitutes throughout the city."⁶⁵⁰ As in Paris, the proximity of prostitutes to consecrated men was an indicator of a city's depravity.

The removal of such women from crusading camps was part of penitential preparations for previous crusades and after crusading losses, seen also in Jacques' account of the siege of

⁶⁴⁸ Muessig, *Faces of Women*, 96.

⁶⁴⁹ Coakley, *Women, Men, and Spiritual Power*, 11, Coakley notes that while the key medium for holy women like Marie is through revelations, their sanctity is displayed on their bodies.

⁶⁵⁰ Jacques de Vitry, *Lettres*, II.201-5: 'Erat autem prostibulis passim repleta civitas : nam quia meretrices carius hospitia quam alii conducebant, non solum laici, sed persone ecclesiastice et quidam regulares in publicis scortis hospitia sua per totam civitatem locabant.'

Damietta.⁶⁵¹ Pelagius, the papal legate, repeatedly instituted fasts, moral reforms, and public acts of penance to bolster morale and seek God's favor for the crusaders.⁶⁵² On one such occasion, Jacques explained that the idle men had fallen into numerous sins, which threatened the outcome of the crusade. But he also noted with satisfaction how preaching had brought the soldiers to acts of penance: "having been visited by the Lord inwardly and stirred by the sermons of divine preaching, returning to the heart and doing penance, confessing their sins they are truly changed into new men, because in God's estimation the army of the Lord appears as a cloister of monks."⁶⁵³ These "soldier monks" under the spiritual leadership of Pelagius commenced to address the vices of the camp including gambling, stealing, and murder, but the first target for these revivalist reforms was the prostitutes. Jacques explains:

Therefore, all of those men suddenly kindled by a spiritual fervor and adopting a sounder plan, compelled the common prostitutes to depart from the army. If they found any prostitutes after the appointed time and the assigned day, they had them beaten through the middle of the camps and they often stamped a brand on their foreheads with a hot iron.⁶⁵⁴

Because these prostitutes embodied the crusaders' misdeeds, their punishment absolved the men of their sin. The public nature of this event, parading or processing the prostitutes through the middle of the camp and branding them, is noteworthy. Like the intercessory processions of 1212, where the tears and prayers of women were displayed in Rome, the bodies of common women in Damietta also took on the penance of the whole community. In both examples, women

⁶⁵¹ See James A. Brundage, "Prostitution, Miscegenation and Sexual Purity in the First Crusade," in *Crusade and Settlement: Papers Read at the First Conference of the Society for the Study of the Crusades and the Latin East, and Presented to R. C. Smail*, ed. P. W. Edbury (Cardiff: University College Cardiff Press, 1985), 57-65.

⁶⁵² For example, Oliver of Paderborn, *Historia Damiatina*, 13.182-5.

⁶⁵³ Jacques de Vitry, *Lettres*, VII.151-5: '. . . interius enim a domino visitati et divine predicationis sermonibus animati, *reverientes ad cor* et penitentiam agentes, confitentes peccata sua *mutati sunt in virum alterum* adeo quod exercitus domini respectu eius quod ante fuerat quasi claustrum monachorum videretur.'

⁶⁵⁴ *Ibid.*, 156-60: 'Confestim igitur fervere spiritus accensi et saniori usi consilio omnes publicas meretrices ab exercitu recedere coegerunt, si quas autem ultra terminum prefixum et diem assignatum reperiebant, per medium castrorum faciebant fustigari et plerumque ferro calido adurentes cauterium in frontibus imprimebant.'

participated, willingly or not, in public penance and the promotion of crusading ideals. Directly after these reforms, Jacques noted that men commenced fortress construction and anticipated victory. At this time, Pelagius also had two Syrian prophecies copied and read aloud which heightened the hope of victory.⁶⁵⁵ These prophecies reported of a distant King in the East who would aid the Christians and defeat the Muslims. In the cycle of sin, repentance, and deliverance, Jacques set the stage with all the proper components of repentance assuring his readers that the third step, deliverance, must be on the horizon. But only three months after writing this letter the crusaders would surrender on August 29, 1221.⁶⁵⁶

Penitential Procession during the Fifth Crusade

Although the line between the conventions of writing and actual convictions of piety are difficult to tease apart, the history of penitential acts during crusades suggests that soldiers took seriously the influence that religious rites had on their performance in battle and the assurance of salvation it offered them.⁶⁵⁷ Likewise, Oliver's account shows continuity with the function of these acts: to lift morale, foster unity, and enact discipline. This narrative reinforced the legitimacy of the cycle of sin, repentance, and deliverance, which recalled both biblical victories and previous crusading successes such as the Siege of Antioch, the central battle of the First Crusade. There, Frankish leaders mandated a number of penitential acts: women were removed from the camp, three days of fasts and almsgiving were ordered, and processions and masses

⁶⁵⁵ Oliver of Paderborn, *Siege of Damietta*, 205; Jacques de Vitry, *Lettres*, VII.218-471; Powell, *Anatomy of Crusade*, 178. On these prophecies see: Jean Richard, "The *Relatio de Davide* as a source for Mongol History and the Legend of Prester John," in *Prester John, the Mongols, and the Ten Lost Tribes*, eds. Charles F. Beckingham and Bernard Hamilton (Brookfield, VT: Variorum, 1996), 148; Barbara Roggema, "The Legend of Sergius-Baḥīrā: Some Remarks on its Origin in the East and Traces in the West" in *East and West in the Crusader States: Context, Contacts, Confrontation*, eds. Krijnie Ciggaar and Herman Teule (Leuven: Peeters, 1999), 122.

⁶⁵⁶ Oliver of Paderborn, *Siege of Damietta*, 218; Powell, *Anatomy of Crusade*, 189.

⁶⁵⁷ Bachrach, *Religion and the Conduct of War*, 128.

were conducted.⁶⁵⁸ In preparation for a battle during this siege bishops, priests, and monks dressed in their white vestments and moved among the troops. The white garments distinguished the status of the priest from the soldier, as liturgical guidebooks required, and it emphasized their power as mediators with God and personal sanctity.⁶⁵⁹ By merging expectations of liturgical space with military action, this account depicts a dramatic image of temporal and spiritual power aligned towards a common goal. These penitential acts, confirmed by victory, established a model for behavior, but also set a standard for how one would write about Christian warfare. Participants in the Siege of Damietta, like their chronicler, had very big shoes to fill.

In the *Historia Damiatina*, Oliver of Paderborn records five special processions. In most of these occurrences, the processions were led by either the patriarch or the papal legate, Pelagius, carrying a cross with the bishop and clergy praying and singing Psalms.⁶⁶⁰ These always resulted in minor or major victories in battle. In a particularly notable scene regarding the capture of the chain tower, recorded in both Oliver of Paderborn's history and a letter of Jacques de Vitry, fighting and processions overlapped in ways that echo the Siege of Antioch. The crusaders had set up camp on a small island facing Damietta, guarded by a chain tower. The chain went across the Nile, blocking the crusaders passage up river.⁶⁶¹ They had to take control of this tower to have any chance of capturing the city, but the tower sat almost on the water's edge, making a land attack difficult. Led by the Duke of Austria, the Hospitalliers tried to take the tower on July 1st using ladders but these were torched with Greek fire—they needed a device

⁶⁵⁸ Fulcher of Chartres, *Chronicle*, 1:XV-XXIII.

⁶⁵⁹ Mandates for separate attire and the restriction on clerics bearing arms can be seen in 6th century. The connection between priestly clothing and their virtues is emphasized in the Romano-German Pontifical established in Mainz (950-62), with Urban II later emphasizing the importance of priestly garments in the *Decretum*, Miller, *Clothing the Clergy*, 86.

⁶⁶⁰ See for example, Oliver of Paderborn, *Historia Damiatina*, 54.

⁶⁶¹ Powell, *Antomy of a Crusade*, 140.

more suitable for the Nile.⁶⁶² Therefore, they connected two ships together to create a barge-like siege device (see figure 1).⁶⁶³ They also equipped the top with animal hides to guard from Greek fire.⁶⁶⁴ After this was completed (August 18), they “made a procession barefoot to the Holy Cross, humbly deploring for divine help so that the affair might be free from all envy and empty boasting.”⁶⁶⁵ When the battle began a week later the processional acts did not end. Oliver explains that during the battle, on the bank of the crusader camp, “the Patriarch threw himself prostrate in the dust before the wood of the Cross; the clergy, standing barefoot, garbed in liturgical robes, shouted to heaven.”⁶⁶⁶ They watched in dismay as the enemy covered the ladder with oil and lit it on fire. Next, after the Duke of Austria’s standard bearer fell to his death, the crusaders “got down from their horses threw themselves down in supplication, striking their hands together; their faces wet with tears of sorrow.”⁶⁶⁷ Their acts of penance worked, as Oliver reports: “for the people’s devotion and the lifting of their hands to heaven, divine kindness raised the ladder, the tears of the faithful extinguished the fire, and thus our men, with renewed vigor manfully fought with the defenders of the tower.”⁶⁶⁸

⁶⁶² Oliver of Paderborn, *Historia Damiatina*, 11.179-81; Jacques de Vitry, *Lettres*, VI.126-31; Powell, *Anatomy of Crusade*, 143.

⁶⁶³ A thirteenth-century manuscript of Matthew Paris’ *Chronica Majora* provides a bas-de-page illustration of the this siege machine, Cambridge, Parker Library, MS 1611, f. 59v

⁶⁶⁴ Powell, *Antomy of a Crusade*, 141.

⁶⁶⁵ Oliver of Paderborn, *Historia Damiatina*, 11.182: ‘Sexta igitur feria ante festum sancti Bartholomei nudis pedibus cum devotione gentis nostre ad sanctam crucem processionem fecimus. Ubi implorato humiliter auxilio divino, ut res omni careret invidia et vana iactantia’ Sermons, confession, and communion also occurred prior to siege battle in Lisbon, Bachrach, *Religion and the Conduct of War*, 133.

⁶⁶⁶ Ibid., 13.183: ‘Iacuit patriarcha ante lignum crucis prostratus in pulvere, stans nudis pedibus clerus indutus legitimis stolis clamavit in celum.’

⁶⁶⁷ Ibid., 13.184: ‘Christiani de equis descendentes ad supplicationes se prostraverunt complois manibus, rigatis vultibus dolorem, quem pro illis habuerunt, qui discrimen sustinuerunt in fluminis profundo, et totius Christianitatis dispendium protestando.’ Compare this to Raymond of Auguilers’ report of Antioch in which men wept and beat their chests, walking barefoot in processions before battle.

⁶⁶⁸ Ibid.: ‘Ad hanc populi devotionem et elevationem manuum in celum levavit scalam divina pietas, extinxerunt ignem fidelium lacrimae, et sic nostri resumptis instrumentis viriliter pugnaverunt.’



Figure 1: The Siege of Damietta in Matthew Paris, *Chronica maiora* II, Cambridge, Parker Library, MS 016II, f. 59v

Jacques records this event in a letter to Pope Honorius III noting that “because the Frisians did not put their trust in their strength alone, but [instead] put their hope in God, they fasted and lamented in processions before they attacked the tower with the aforementioned instrument.”⁶⁶⁹ He cites Psalm 78: *they cried unto the Lord that he have pity on his people, lest the heathen say where is their God*, and explained that the soldiers were now motivated by the tears and prayers of the pilgrims and were strengthened in the Lord in the midst of the hail of fire, swords, arrows, and stones.⁶⁷⁰ This particular Psalm was a central component in the Holy Land clamors for crusaders, a fixed component of the Mass and Office after the loss of Hattin.⁶⁷¹ Jacques’ inclusion of it likely enhanced the liturgical signification of this scene for his readers. He reported that in the end, ten crusaders were able to kill 250 Muslims.⁶⁷² There appears to be a narrative continuity with the memory of Antioch: penance leads to victory, men process barefoot, soldiers are given the courage to continue fighting, but the intensity of the performed piety is ratcheted up a notch at Damietta. As recorded by Oliver, the Patriarch lay in the dust, men got off their horses amid the battle to cry and beat their hands, holy tears extinguished flames. In Damietta battle and penitential acts merge more spectacularly into one.

Through liturgy soldiers in the East could share the experience of crusading with the home front in the West. In Europe, daily intercessory prayers and monthly processions kept the goal of regaining the Holy Land a present concern.⁶⁷³ Innocent III’s program of piety did in fact

⁶⁶⁹ Jacques de Vitry, *Lettres*, IV.133-6: ‘Et quia predicti Frisones de virtute sua non presumunt, sed *in deo spem suam totam ponunt*, factis processionibus, premissis ieiuniis cum lacrimis et orationibus turrem cum instrumento predicto invaserunt.’

⁶⁷⁰ Ibid., 146-50: ‘Nostris vero residuum scale combuste turri applicantes lacrimis et orationibus peregrinorum vegetati et in domino confortati per medios ignes et gladios et sagittas et lapides in turrem prosilientes quosdam ex Sarracenis interfecerunt.’

⁶⁷¹ Linder, *Raising Arms*, 4.

⁶⁷² Jacques de Vitry, *Lettres*, IV.161-4: ‘. . . nostri vero debitas deo gratias retulerunt et precipue eo, quod tantum decem ex nostris in turrem prosilientes, sicut dictum est, CC et L quibusdam occisis superaverunt.’

⁶⁷³ For how space can be made a sacred place see: Clare A. Lees and Gillian R. Overing, “Anglo-Saxon Horizons: Places of the Mind in the Northumbrian Landscape,” in *A Place to Believe In: Locating Medieval Landscapes*, eds.

have repercussions on the battlefields of Egypt, as acts of penance became reservoirs of spiritual fortitude from which participants could draw on in battle preparations and during moments of crisis and failure. Jacques de Vitry and Oliver of Paderborn employed this shared language to make sense of events and perhaps to cement their place in crusade history through establishing strong resemblances with previous victories.

The remarkable victory over the chain tower contrasts with the bleak capture of the Damietta. While reports that St. George had miraculously scared away the Muslims circulated in the crusader camps, in fact al-Kamil and his men had already departed Damietta.⁶⁷⁴ Shortly after the crusaders captured the chain tower, al-Kamil's father Al-Adil died in Syria, leaving Syria, Egypt, and Iraq under the control of his three sons. Family rivalries left Al-Kamil without the guarantee of his brothers' support, and rumors of conspiracies against him circulated in Damascus.⁶⁷⁵ Although Damietta sat defenseless, disease ravaged the crusader camps and relentless storms drove people to panic. They were in no shape to take an offensive stance. After an extended stalemate, the crusaders attacked on November 5th but there would be little fighting. A more dreadful threat than visions of St. George or armed crusaders had already defeated the inhabitants of Damietta, namely starvation. The population of Damietta reportedly went from 60,000 to 10,000 in nine months.⁶⁷⁶ Citizens piled the bodies between the second and third wall, but eventually people became too weak to bury their dead. Crusaders found the dead littered throughout the streets and even still lying in their beds, next to those barely alive. Oliver depicted a particularly gruesome scene: "infants hanging at the breast of their mothers trying to nurse in

Clare A. Lees and Gillian R. Overing (University Park, PA: Pennsylvania State University Press, 2006), 6.

⁶⁷⁴ Powell, *Anatomy of Crusade*, 150.

⁶⁷⁵ *Ibid.*, 145.

⁶⁷⁶ Jacques de Vitry, *Lettres*, VI.104-9: ' . . . plusquam sexaginta milia Sarracenorum infra muros civitatis inclusi remanserunt. Post novem vero menses, videlicet mense Novembris in nonis eiusdem mensis, capta civitate vix tria milia Sarracenorum invenimus, inter quos vix centum sani remanserant qui possent defendere civitatem.

the embrace of one dead.”⁶⁷⁷ Jacques claimed the vanquished Muslims had run away in cowardice and fear, but there can be no doubt that this scene also left the victors in a profound state of horror.⁶⁷⁸

It took over four months of cleaning before Pelagius and the patriarch could enter in procession (Feb. 2, 1220).⁶⁷⁹ Despite the acknowledged emotive power of penitential procession, it was unlikely that this ceremony could erase the memory of the sights, sounds, and smells of this “bloodless victory over a dying city.”⁶⁸⁰ But as Oliver reported, there were spiritual victories in this destitution. He explained that Jacques baptized Muslim children taken as captives at Damietta.⁶⁸¹ Jacques expounds on this activity in a letter stating that after the city’s capture, four hundred Muslims were used to ransom back Christian captives and others were sold to Christians as slaves.⁶⁸² But thanks to his money and efforts he kept the very young, of which 500 were baptized. He explained: “those that I did not keep, I entrusted to my friends to be raised and educated in the Scriptures for the service of God.”⁶⁸³ In the closing of a copy sent to John of

⁶⁷⁷ Oliver of Paderborn, *Historia Damiatina*, 37.236: ‘. . . infantes ad ubera matrum pendentes inter amplexus morientium oscitabant.’

⁶⁷⁸ Jessalynn Bird and Debra Birch note James’ focus on the penitential quality of pilgrimage and the need for reform consistently appears in his histories and sermons on pilgrimage written after his experience in Damietta, Bird, “Religious Role in a Post-Lateran World,” 93; Debra J. Birch, “Jacques de Vitry and the Ideology of Pilgrimage,” in *Pilgrimage Explored*, ed. J. Stopford, (Woodbridge, Suffolk: York Medieval Press, 1999), 93.

⁶⁷⁹ Jacques de Vitry, *Lettres*, VI.114-20: ‘. . . invenimus mortuorum cadavera super terram, eo, quod pauci vivi qui remanserant ex Sarracenis tot mortuos sepelire non poterant, quod fetorem et aeris corruptionem vix aliquis poterat sustinere. Purgata autem civitate dominus legatus et patriarcha cum clero et universo populo, accensis candelis et luminaribus, cum hymnis et canticis, cum laudibus et gratiarum actione in die Purificationis beate Marie processionaliter ingressus est civitatem.’

⁶⁸⁰ Powell, *Anatomy of Crusade*, 162.

⁶⁸¹ Oliver of Paderborn, *Historia Damiatina*, 33.229: ‘Acconensis episcopus ex te primitias aminarum Deo solvit parvulos tuos, qui in te reperti sunt ab ipso vitales, etiam morti proximos baptismatis unde sacramentaliter mundando.’

⁶⁸² Jacques de Vitry, *Lettres*, VI.139-43: ‘De captivis vero Sarracenis, quos in civitate cepimus, quadringentis melioribus et ditioribus retentis ut captivos nostros facta commutatione cum ipsis recuperare possemus, alios omnes eo, quod sumptuosum esset nimis tot homines pascere, vendidimus christianis ut servirent eis in perpetuum’

⁶⁸³ *Ibid.*, 144-9: ‘. . . exceptis parvulis, quos ego cum labore magno et expensis feci reservare. Quibus baptizatis plusquam quingenti, ut credo, post baptismum ad dominum *primitie deo et agno* transierunt Alios autem preter illos quos retinui quibusdam amicis meis ut eos nutrent et litteris sacris ad cultum dei imbuerent commisi.’

Nivelles, Jacques added: “We have sent you two infants who were saved when Babylon was burnt, as well as some silk cloth and other letters.”⁶⁸⁴ Medieval authors had associated Babylon with the city of Cairo and Egypt in general, and as a metonymic term for non-Christian regions broadly defined.⁶⁸⁵ Jacques confirms these associations, adding echoes from the destruction of Babylon in Revelation 18.8: “And she shall be burnt with the fire: because God is strong, who shall judge her.” These brief episodes deserve more attention. As John Gillingham notes: “Historians of warfare tend to focus on the fighting itself, not its aftermath, and when they have thought of the plunder they have rarely given much attention to human beings.”⁶⁸⁶

These symbols of penance and procession would have been a language that their enemies readily understood. The use of spectacle in battle—whether it be shouts, banners, or processions—was part of a language shared across enemy lines.⁶⁸⁷ In a letter to Henry II after the loss of Jerusalem in 1187, it is reported that, as part of rituals of purification of the Dome of the Rock, Saladin ordered that the cross be removed and publicly beaten for two days as it was carried throughout the city.⁶⁸⁸ This symbol of pollution, like the women in Antioch or the prostitutes in Damietta, was removed and paraded through the city. Both Muslim and Christian armies recognized religious processions not as passive prayers but as aggressive military acts.

The processions and corporate penance, however, failed to bring lasting victory. King John had departed the camp, Frederick II once again delayed his arrival, and without proper

⁶⁸⁴ Ibid., 280-3: ‘Misimus vobis duos parvulos de incendio Babylonis extractos cum quibusdam pannis sericis et litteris aliis.’

⁶⁸⁵ Andrew Scheil, *Babylon under Western Eyes: A Study of Allusion and Myth* (University of Toronto Press, 2016), 258-62.

⁶⁸⁶ John Gillingham, “Crusading Warfare, Chivalry, and the Enslavement of Women and Children,” in *The Medieval Way of War: Studies in Military History in Honor of Bernard S. Bachrach*, ed. Gregory I. Halfond (New York, Routledge: 2015), 134.

⁶⁸⁷ For example, Oliver reports that after the standard bearer fell to his death and the banner was captured the “Babylonians shouted madly disturbing the air with their clamor, *Siege of Damietta*, 171.

⁶⁸⁸ *Letters from the East*, #46 (1188) Terricus to Henry II, 84.

reinforcements or strong leadership, the crusaders would not be able to retain their tenuous hold on Damietta.⁶⁸⁹ In the effort to maintain morale and discipline, Pelagius instituted camp reforms, including the abovementioned expelling of the prostitutes and the translation of the Syrian prophecies which he were read aloud in the camp. Jacques copied these prophecies and each of them confirm that the Christians would succeed.⁶⁹⁰ For example, regarding the Muslim prophecy he notes:

Accordingly, in the past year a certain book of great authority among the Saracens came into our hands. Moreover, a certain astrologer of theirs, whom the Saracens considered as a great prophet, had written this book with the greatest zeal from the beginning of their law. Moreover, he predicted among many other things how long their law should last, which just as it had begun by the sword, thus was going to die by the sword.⁶⁹¹

While these prophecies promised victory, here Jacques emphasized victory through obliteration, similar to his writings on how to handle heretics. This cynical attitude contrasts with his enthusiastic reports of converting Muslims slaves in Acre four years earlier, including women whom he signed with the cross. This battle-weary bishop, now complained of Muslims converts who had defected “judging the life of Christians as excessively harsh and difficult for themselves, because among them anything pleasing was permitted, would not remain with us for a long time, but they would return to the customary filthiness of the pagans, departing from us

⁶⁸⁹ Powell, *Anatomy of Crusade*, 177-8.

⁶⁹⁰ As Bird points out, authors like Oliver and James “drew on Byzantine, eastern Christian, and patristic polemics and prophecies when formulating their perceptions of Islam, Bird, “Crusade and Conversion after the Fourth Lateran Council (1215): Oliver of Paderborn’s and James of Vitry’s Missions to Muslims Reconsidered,” *Essays in Medieval Studies* 21 (2004): 23. On the transmission of Greek and Arabic, a legacy Jacques inherited, see: Marie-Therese D’ Alverny, “Translations and Translators,” in *Renaissance and Renewal in the Twelfth Century*, eds. Benson, Robert Louis, Giles Constable, Carol Dana Lanham, and Charles Homer Haskins (Cambridge, Mass: Harvard University Press, 1982), 459.

⁶⁹¹ Jacques de Vitry, *Lettres*, VII.500-6: ‘Anno siquidem preterito liber quidam Sarracenorum magne apud ipsos auctoritatis in manus nostras devenit. Hunc autem quidam eorum astrologus, quem prophetam magnum Sarraceni reputant, a principio legis eorum cum summo studio scripserat. Predixit autem inter alia multa quanto tempore lex eorum permanere deberet et que sicut gladio inceperat, ita gladio peritura erat.’

secretly.”⁶⁹² Even worse, Christians were converting to Islam, but could not return, as Jacques explained:

When the Sultan of Egypt had received many men from the aforementioned apostates, not forgetting their faithlessness and fickleness of spirit, he cleverly used them sending them to more remote parts of his kingdom, whence they were never able to return; but indeed those are considered worthless men among the Saracens . . . they reproached them because just as they were bad Christians, thus they would never observe the law of the Saracens well. ⁶⁹³

Instead of an image of Muslim men and women eagerly converting after hearing Jacques’ moving sermons, here he portrays conversion as treason and the converted as untrustworthy. Jacques uses the verb *transeo* here for both the Christian and Muslim conversions, which gives a sense of changing sides, rather than *converto* which implies transforming or changing. *Transeo* in this context appears to imply a changing of loyalties more than a changing of religious beliefs, in other words converts are traitors. Jacques’ suspicion and dejection contrasts with the zeal of a special visitor to the camp. Francis of Assisi had arrived to the camp during the prolonged stalemate in the late summer of 1219. He brazenly preached the crusaders’ defeat, and famously visited the Sultan’s camp seeking his conversion.⁶⁹⁴ Jacques reported that during this visit al-Kamil secretly asked Francis to pray for him so that he could “embrace the religion most pleasing to God.”⁶⁹⁵ Francis would fail to convert the Sultan but elaborations on this episode would become an important part of the Franciscan institutional memory.⁶⁹⁶ Given the weight that

⁶⁹² Ibid., 109-14: ‘De Sarracenis autem frequenter ad nos aliqui spontanei pertransibant, qui tamen christianorum vitam duram nimis et artam iudicantes eo, quod inter suos quicquid libebat licebat, diutius nobiscum manere non sustinebant, sed ad consuetas inmundicias paganorum revertebantur a nobis occulte recedentes.’

⁶⁹³ Ibid., 114-25: ‘Cum autem soldanus Egyptius multos ex predictis apostatis recepisset, infidelitatem eorum et animi levitatem non ignorans astute eis usus est mittens eos ad remotiores regni sui partes, unde nunquam reverti valerent; ipsi autem adeo vies inter Sarracenos habebantur . . . eis improperabant quod sicut mali Christiani fuerant, ita Sarracenorum legem nunquam bene observarent.’

⁶⁹⁴ Jacques de Vitry, *Lettres*, VIb.256-64: ‘Magister vero illorum, qui ordinem instituit, cum venisset in exercitum hostium nostrorum pertransire non timuit et cum aliquot diebus Sarracenis verbum dei predicasset, modicum profecit.’ See also, Powell, *Anatomy of Crusade*, 158-9.

⁶⁹⁵ Ibid., 264-9: ‘Soldanus autem, rex Egypti, ab eo secreto petiit ut pro se domino supplicaret quatinus religioni, que magis deo placeret, divinitus inspiratus adheret.’

⁶⁹⁶ See John Tolan, *Saint Francis and the Sultan: The Curious History of a Christian-Muslim Encounter* (New York:

Jacques placed in prophecies, he must have recalled the prediction of Francis during later defeats. Perhaps this episode confirmed Jacques' notion that conversion of the Muslims was increasingly unlikely, at least for the adults. Jacques' largest number of Muslim converts would remain the approximately 500 enslaved Muslim children "saved" from Damietta,

While Pelagius tried to hold the soldiers together as they waited for King John's return, al-Kamil's brothers decided to join forces to march on Egypt in late August. The crusaders' delays meant they were now at the mercy of the Nile's flooding season. The Muslims took this opportunity to open the flood gates—inundating the crusaders' camps.⁶⁹⁷ Oliver reported that the crusaders, considered it better to live or to die in battle, than to drown in such a flood, and so they surrendered August 29th, 1221.⁶⁹⁸ Just as the initial victory over Damietta was the result of famine, their loss of it by deluge would rob them of the glories of the battlefield.

With the crusade in shambles, Jacques was eager to leave his post. He returned to Italy the year after their defeat, and left again in 1225 as part of the entourage of Isabella, wife of Frederick II. He would not return to Acre.⁶⁹⁹ In his letter dated March 1220, before the crusade even ended, Jacques expressed his overwhelming grief at the ongoing losses, wishing to end his life in peace and quiet.⁷⁰⁰ A letter from Honorius III (March 6, 1224) confirms how in the years following the losses at Damietta, Jacques had given up any hope of victory. He had always preached collective responsibility for the welfare of the crusade, but in this letter the pope turns this ideology toward Jacques:

Oxford University Press, 2009).

⁶⁹⁷ Powell, *Anatomy of Crusade*, 189.

⁶⁹⁸ Oliver of Paderborn, *Historia Damiatina*, 77.274: 'Ipso vero die decollationis sancti Johannis baptiste hora quasi duodecima nostra pars ciborum ac pabuli inopia sed aquarum copia graviter pressa elegit, honestius esse feliciter vivere vel fortiter in bello mori, quam turpiter in diluvio perire.'

⁶⁹⁹ Hinnebusch, *H. Occ.*, 6-7.

⁷⁰⁰ Jacques de Vitry, *Lettres*, Vlb.277-80: 'Ego autem iam debilis et confractus corde in pace et tranquillitate vitam mean finire desidero.'

Although like a good soldier of Christ you have fought the good fight up till now and you have carried out the work of the Gospel admirably, with the enemy not yet surrendering anything to you, we have heard that, as if worn out, you want to quit, thinking that what remains to be done has been accomplished, hoping for it, you decide you are free for your native soil. We cannot fail to grieve about this, because unless he has fought legitimately, he cannot be crowned, and unless the work is completed, one rarely gets paid. Yet you have come to hope the reward for completing the struggle and the work quickly and with good fortune, such that you no longer merit, what you have already earned.⁷⁰¹

Honorius III then promised that Frederick II was on the way to the Holy Land, and that Jacques' presence would be "as usual very advantageous."⁷⁰² Calling on his authority as pope and the promises of eternal reward, he admonished Jacques to stay in the East. This letter echoes the rhetoric Jacques employed for his own preaching campaigns. He too had promised financial support and heavenly rewards to crusaders, and he had boasted successes signing men, women, and even children to the cross. He also reported that Muslims were converting, and all it would take is sound preaching to bring Eastern Christians to submit to Rome. But missionizing had not replaced the primary goal of regaining the Holy Land. Jacques' own failures and the intense memories of piles of putrid corpses in Damietta, likely made these papal promises even more suspect. Jacques was determined to return. Perhaps he did not intend to quit the cause altogether. His pastoral materials composed in the last decades of his life, suggest that if he had to choose between the goals of crusade and reform, he would commit himself to the latter.

⁷⁰¹ Claverie, *Honorius III et l'Orient*, #82, 396: 'Cum tamquam bonus miles Christi hactenus bonum certamen certaris et opus evangeliste laudabiliter egeris quod nondum tibi cedentibus hostibus quasi fessus desideras sicut audivimus, cessionem et reputans actum dum quid superstat agendum vacare disponis ad solum aspirando natale, non possumus graviter non dolere, quia, cum non nisi qui legitime certaverit coronetur et merces raro nisi completo jam opere debeatur, incomparabile premium certaminis et laboris in brevi feliciter consumandi pro modico desinis expectare quod, dum quasi mereri desistis, forsitan demeris.'

⁷⁰² Ibid., 396: 'ubi tua erit presentia more solito plurimum oportuna...' Frederick II finally departed in 1227, see "The Emperor's Crusade, 1227-1229," in *Crusade and Christendom*, pp. 237-265; John La Monte, J., & Jerome Merton Hubert (trans.) *The Wars of Frederick II against the Ibelins in Syria and Cyprus* (New York: Columbia UP, 1936).

God's First Born and Most Special Daughter

Jacques de Vitry began his history of the West by looking East to Jerusalem—a place he would never reach. He wrote the *Historia Occidentalis* after the disasters of the Fifth Crusade, but before his commencement of his position as the Cardinal of Tusculum (1229).⁷⁰³ Jacques' treatment of Jerusalem at the beginning of this work reflects the repeated struggle—particularly after failed crusades—to reconcile the glaring contradictions between the promised triumph of the Latin Christian Church with the continued spread of Islam.⁷⁰⁴ For example, Gregory VIII's *Audita tremendi* (1187) attributed the losses not just to internal dissensions in the Holy Land but also more generally, as the result of collective sin of the “Christian people.” In other words, the East and the West shared the blame, meriting God's just punishment.⁷⁰⁵ Not surprisingly, clerics like Jacques focused on sin as the prime catalyst for this catastrophe rather than any failure in battle stratagems.⁷⁰⁶ His presentation of the Jerusalem, however, also reflects his effort to make sense of his defeat in Damietta.

⁷⁰³ Hinnebusch notes this work can only be dated from internal evidence, depending largely on the descriptions of the Dominican and Franciscan communities, see *H. Occ.*, 16-20. While Jacques likely began this work c. 1218, Jean Donnadiu suggests that Jacques was still editing it up to 1225. Donnadiu explains that Jacques began the *Historia Orientales* while the bishop of Acre in 1221-22, but continued adding components up to c.1223/24, *H. Or.*, 10-12.

⁷⁰⁴ In the twelfth and thirteenth centuries, there appears a novel combination of the established concepts of collective guilt and righteous punishment to explain Christian losses. There are two notions of guilt in Gratian's *Decretum* which later commentators such as Rufinus (c. 1164) attempted to reconcile: personal and collective guilt. The treatment of collective guilt in the *Decretum* initially referred to the actions of prelates, but Huguccio's *Summa* of 1188, which synthesized the decretal teachings, extended this collective responsibility for sin to everyone. Clark notes that, although there are precedents for collective guilt in theology, the twelfth and thirteenth centuries mark “the period when canonists developed a doctrine of collective responsibility,” Peter D. Clarke, “A Question of Collective Guilt: Popes, Canonists and Interdict c. 1140-1250,” *Zeitschrift der Savigny-Stiftung für Rechtsgeschichte, Kanonistische Abteilung*, 116 (1999): 107; see also *Ibid.*, Clarke, *The Interdict in the Thirteenth Century a Question of Collective Guilt* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2007).

⁷⁰⁵ Gregory VIII. *Audita tremendi*, in *The Crusades: A Reader*, eds. S. J. Allen, and Emilie Amt (Peterborough, Ont: Broadview Press, 2003), 163-4.

⁷⁰⁶ *The Chronicle of the Third Crusade* asserts: “Then the Lord's hand was aroused against his people—if we can properly call them his, as their immoral behavior, disgraceful lifestyle, and foul vices had made them strangers to Him,” *The Chronicle of the Third Crusade: A Translation of the “Itinerarium peregrinorum et gesta Regis Ricardi,”* trans. Helen J. Nicholson (Brookfield, VT: Ashgate, 1997), 23. Compare this with Gerald of Wales more ambivalent description God's judgment in the fall of Jerusalem: “In this very same year God in his judgment, which is never

Jacques emphasized Jerusalem's vital role for the spiritual and temporal welfare of a unified Christendom. He begins by asserting that the *Ecclesia* of Jerusalem is God's "first born and most special daughter" who had been "stripped of her garments of glory which were mangled by various villains."⁷⁰⁷ He also conceived Jerusalem as the Church's mother, asserting that "the head and the mother of the faith is Jerusalem, just as Rome is the head and the mother of the faithful."⁷⁰⁸ This feminine image of Jerusalem appeared in contemporary works which began to combine Paul's distinction between the earthly and the heavenly Jerusalem, the former a bondswoman, and the latter a free mother (Gal. 4:26).⁷⁰⁹ Other crusade authors found this imagery particularly useful for comparing the distant violations of Jerusalem to the rape of Christian women.⁷¹⁰ Although Jacques' reference to a stripped *ecclesia* aligns with this popular trope, he does not linger on this gendered violence, perhaps having witnessed enough of it first hand. He focused instead on the metaphor of the body, namely the head's relationship to the limbs as being emblematic of the connection between East and West:

As hitherto, I think the pain of the head flows out to the limbs and as a master shows his anger and indignation by various punishments of lashings, so because, I think after the Holy Land came into the hands of the wicked ones, compelled by our sins, so God, the just punisher of the sins, the lord of vengeance, whipped the whole world so that it would be humbled by afflicting it with various punishments, the Moors in Spain, heretics in Province and Lombardy, schismatics in Greece—everywhere false brothers are allowed to rise up against us.⁷¹¹

unjust but sometimes difficult to understand, permitted Saladin, the leader of the Egyptians and of the men of Damascus, to win a victory in pitched battle and so seize the kingdom of Jerusalem," *The Journey through Wales*, 74.

⁷⁰⁷ Jacques de Vitry, *H. Occ.*, I.73.7-9: ' . . . primogenita et specialis eius filia, iherosolimitana ecclesia, glorie sue uestimentis exuta, que, uariis carnificibus lacerate, fere nuda remanserat.'

⁷⁰⁸ *Ibid.*, 15-6: 'Caput enim mater fidei est Iherosolima, sicut Roma est caput et mater fidelium.'

⁷⁰⁹ The feminization of Jerusalem has a long tradition in the Hebrew Bible, New Testament, and patristic writings and the feminization of Jerusalem in crusade writings provides evidence for the connection of crusade to reform and also important changes in exegesis, David Morris "The Servile Mother: Jerusalem as Woman in the Era of the Crusades," *Remembering the Crusades: Myth, Image, and Identity*, eds. Nicholas Paul, and Suzanne M. Yeager (Baltimore: Johns Hopkins University Press, 2012), 180-1.

⁷¹⁰ Morris, "The Servile Mother," 174. See also Petrus Blesensis, *Tractatus Duo: Passio Raginaldi principis Antiochie ; Conquestio de dilatione vie Ierosolimitane*, ed. R.B.C. Huygens (Turnhout: Brepols, 2003), 83.

⁷¹¹ Jacques de Vitry, *H. Occ.*, I.73-4: 'Adeo enim dolor capitis in membra redundabat, et uariis flagellorum molestiis iram et indignationem suam dominus indicabat, quod, postquam in manus impiorum terra sancta, peccatis nostris

In this corporeal image, problems in the West are the visible symptoms of the welfare of Jerusalem. Notably, Jacques does not single out the sins of Jerusalem's inhabitants as particularly blameworthy—as he did in the *Historia Orientalis*⁷¹²—rather it is *peccata nostrae* which led to the loss of Jerusalem.⁷¹³ This work does not return to the concerns of Jerusalem, but this brief treatment reveals his persistent belief—seemingly reconfirmed by failure—in the intertwined affairs of reform and conquest.⁷¹⁴ In Jacques' experience, the *peccatis nostris* that led to defeat in Damietta included French nobles who attacked crusaders' privileges, leaders who delayed sending reinforcements, and idle crusaders whose sins flowed with the same temerity as the Nile. But with this corporeal image of the world, Jacques presented and perhaps took comfort knowing that the Latin Christians' neglect of the East would not go unpunished.

Conclusions

The Fourth Lateran Council outlined the responsibilities for those like Jacques who accompanied crusaders, stating: “the priests and clergy who shall be in the Christian army shall minister with prayer and exhortation, teaching by word and example.”⁷¹⁵ This chapter has shown

exigentibus, deuenit, iustus ultor scelerum, deus, ultionum dominus, mundum uniuersum uariis molestiis affligendo flagellauit, in Hispania mauros, in Prouincia et Lombardia hereticos, in Grecia scismaticos, ubique falsos fratres contra nos insurgere permittendo.’

⁷¹² Jacques de Vitry, *H.Or.*, I.96.7-9, 20-23: ‘ . . . quanto maiori zelo dilecta est a Domino, tanto frequentius peccatis habitantium in ea exigentibus flagellata est et variis casibus exposita . . . Sic redemptor noster Terra sancta cui super omnes alias amoris sui contulit prerogativam, sordes et inquinamenta peccatorum removendo, peccatores in ea commorantes affligit, flagellat, et eiicit.’

⁷¹³ Andrew Jotischky examines Matthew Paris' use of Jacques' section on the Jacobites from the *Historia Orientalis* as a way to understand the submission of the Jacobite patriarch to Rome, “Penance and Reconciliation in the Crusader States: Matthew of Paris, Jacques de Vitry and the Eastern Christians,” in *Retribution, Repentance, and Reconciliation*, ed. Kate Cooper and Jeremy Gregory (Rochester, NY: Boydell, 2004), 74-83.

⁷¹⁴ One of the few occasions he mentioned Jerusalem again in the *Historia Occidentales* references 1 Kings 2:36. This passage refers to the story of Semei who promised God that he would stay in Jerusalem but when his servants left, he pursued them. God punished Semei's oath breaking with death. Jacques employed this passage as part of an exhortation to encourage the monks of the Val-des-Choux to remain committed to their vows of poverty and contemplation within the cloister—implicitly suggesting it was in fact their very own Jerusalem, XVII.6-20.

⁷¹⁵ Innocent III, *Ad liberandum*, 227-71; trans. in *Crusade and Christendom*, 129.

that preaching and procession served as one means through which this mandate was followed, and both men and women eagerly responded. Jacques was no stranger to orchestrating the affective piety of his listeners, but crusade preaching was part of a larger context of performative acts. More than a reflection or expression of ideology, it appears that these rituals and the reporting of them met certain needs.⁷¹⁶ The repeated participation in and the recording of these performative acts conveyed the necessary sanctity when surety of one's moral character, especially of soldiers and their leaders, was ambiguous at best. Just as Oliver and Jacques' reports of Damietta merged the performance of penance and battle, the language of war, penance, and Jerusalem were inextricably bound together.

Jacques' sermons reveal that these notions of crusade, intertwined with Christian identity and reform, moved beyond the battlefield and into the pew. His sermon for the end of Lent, *Laetare Jerusalem*, demonstrates how spiritual Jerusalem was understood in militaristic terms:

There is one heart and one mind among the multitude of believers. Therefore, let us not be divided by schisms and heresies nor by ambitions or contentions, but let us understand this in itself: let us love each other, let the one carry the burdens of the other to the building of the spiritual Jerusalem, as if bound together into one battalion against our enemies, lest the devil finds a gateway within us. But let us be frightening to our enemies, so that as battle line of a castle ordered and grouped together, we may establish a solemn day in the woods (Ps.118:27). For those who approach the fight in one accord easily obtain victory.⁷¹⁷

⁷¹⁶ Kathleen Ashley, "Moving Subjects of Processional Performance," in *Moving Subjects. Processional Performance in the Middle Ages and the Renaissance*, eds. Kathleen Ashley and Wim Hiisken (Atlanta, GA: Rodolpi, 2001), 15; in the same collection C. Clifford Flanigan, "The Moving Subject: Medieval Liturgical Processions in Semiotic and Cultural Perspective," 38.

⁷¹⁷ Jacques de Vitry, *Sermones Dominicales*, in *Sermones in epistolas et evangelia dominicalia totius anni*, 285: 'Multitudinis enim credentium erat cor unum et anima una. (Acts 4:32) Non ergo dividamur per scismata vel heareses, nec per emulationes vel contentiones, sed idipsum sapiamus, invicem nos diligamus, alter alterius ad edificationem spiritualis Hierusalem onera portemus, quasi in cuneum unum contra inimicos nostros constringamur, ne diabolus introitum in nobis inveniatur, sed simus inimicis nostris terribiles, ut castorum acies ordinata et conglobati in unum constituamus diem solemnem in condensis (Ps. 118:27). Qui enim unanimiter pugnam aggrediuntur, victoriam de facili consequentur.'

This Lenten sermon's heavy militaristic imagery presents the whole church as an army ready for battle. This semantic shift from real to spiritual combat perhaps reflects Jacques' own retreat from actual Holy War. Once effective in his calls to crusade, he had retreated to the safety and familiarity of inciting audiences to strictly spiritual battles. Just as Jacques' *exempla*, this liturgical sermon reveals the "cognitive impact of crusading culture upon the self-definition of Christendom."⁷¹⁸ Innocent III's collective call to crusade connected Christian piety and liturgy to the outcome of holy warfare. Jacques' sermons reveal these connections had become commonplace, at least to the extent that crusading, subtracted from actual warfare, could serve as a lens through which both regular and lay people could understand morality. These various ideological strands, as the next chapter will prove, were intimately connected to and expressed by means of Jacques' perception of God's imminent eschatological plan. In other words, the importance of the earthly and spiritual Jerusalem, rested on its integral role for the Last Days.

⁷¹⁸ Dickson, *Genesis of the Children's Crusade*, 45.

Chapter Five: Working Together at the End of the World: Jacques de Vitry's Use of Apocalyptic Thought

Through his sermons, Jacques de Vitry distilled papal directives on collective participation in crusading to a wide range of people. Whether by means of financial support, military might, or pious prayers, he portrayed each person as having a vital part to play. The call to retake Jerusalem, however, relied on and was embedded in a specific understanding of the present and future. Jacques relied on apocalyptically charged Scriptures to communicate present collective action, mapping the shared roles in crusading and reform agendas onto what he understood as their larger significance for the imminent Last Days. Jacques interpreted his age as edging ever closer to its conclusion. Through his works, especially his histories and sermons, Jacques sought to explain how certain prophecies had been fulfilled by past successes and failures, giving credence to future plans, and encouraging present action. His *ad status* sermons, organized according to the sermons' intended audience, such as widows, lepers, clerics, and crusaders, offers different eschatological messages to each audience.⁷¹⁹ This chapter examines Jacques' application of apocalyptic imagery to these diverse social groups, each of which he envisioned as having a particular role to play in an end-times narrative. It surveys four of Jacques' works—the *Historia Occidentalis*, the *Historia Orientalis*, his letter collection, and selections of the *ad status* sermons—with an emphasis on Daniel 7-12, Matthew 24, and the book of Revelation. Each of these selections includes apocalyptic visions marked by persecution of the faithful and characterized by the central role of the Temple. For example, Matthew 24:15 predicts the destruction of the Temple, citing Daniel's prophecy (9:27) of the appearance of the

⁷¹⁹ Jean Longère, *Oeuvres Oratoires de Maitres Parisiens au XII Siècle: étude historique et doctrinale* (Paris: Études Augustiniennes, 1975), 31-3.

abomination of desolation. In Revelation, John's visions take place in the heavenly Temple, presenting a different vantage point of the end times. Taken together, these passages serve to validate Old Testament prophecies, thereby also bolstering the visions yet to come.

Jacques applied these biblical passages in different ways when addressing different audiences, simultaneously condemning those whose moral failures made them agents of the Antichrist and to affirm that all people—including women—did in fact have important parts to play in God's wider plan. He emphasized the influence that all people had on the movements most crucial for defining spiritual life in the thirteenth century, namely reform and crusade. His background allowed him to approach this topic from multiple perspectives. Jacques supported pious laywomen while serving as a prior in the Diocese of Liège (1210). He preached against the Albigensians in France (1211-13), and participated at the siege of Damietta (1218-20). Jacques' own experiences offered a unique vantage point of these movements, and consequently his sermons reflect a vision in which reform and crusade are woven together in the tapestry of eschatological time.⁷²⁰

Jacques' Ad status Sermons

After resigning his see at Acre, Jacques began composing a large collection of model sermons. During this time, Jacques was working for the bishop of Liège, Hugues de Pierrepont (1226-1229) and serving as the cardinal bishop of Tusculum (1229-40).⁷²¹ The directives of the

⁷²⁰ Jessalyn Bird has examined the influence of biblical exegesis on preachers and participants of the Fifth Crusade, while Jan Vandeburie discusses at length the eschatological context of Jacques de Vitry's *Historia Orientalis*. Taken together, the rising eschatological urgency seen in the promotion and accounts of the Fifth Crusade is underscored, Bird, "Preaching and Narrating the Fifth Crusade: Bible, Sermons and the History of a Campaign," in *The Uses of the Bible in Crusader Sources*, eds. Elizabeth Lapina and Nicholas Morton (Boston: Brill, 2017), 316-40; in the same collection, Jan Vanderburie, "'Consenescentis mundi die vergente ad vesperam': James of Vitry's *Historia Orientalis* and Eschatological Rhetoric after the Fourth Lateran Council," 341-60.

⁷²¹ Longère, *Ad status*, xxiv; Hinnebusch, *H. Occ.*, 7.

Fourth Lateran Council had promoted evangelization of the laity to combat heresy, emphasizing the importance of preaching to a wider range of audiences. In alignment with these trends, Jacques crafted a new method of exhortation, evidenced by his greater use of *exempla*, his crafting of sermons targeted at intended audiences rather than primarily based upon the liturgical calendar, and his inclusion of more personal experiences of ministering to the laity.⁷²² These sermons largely combine visions of the End Times with one's hope for salvation in order to incite his audience to action.⁷²³ Such an approach aligns with contemporary trends for inciting as well as understanding the outcomes of crusading. As Whalen has shown, Innocent III used Joachite thought, especially his emphasis on reunion with the Eastern Church, to justify the capture of Constantinople.⁷²⁴ Jacques employed similar tactics to promote the Fifth Crusade, and to conceptualize its failure. His experiences signing men, women, and children with the cross, however, revealed to him that the religious message contained in Revelation could stir diverse audiences.⁷²⁵

Jacques' frequent use of apocalyptic passages in these sermons speaks to his confidence in their utility.⁷²⁶ His judgment in these matters would have been taken seriously by contemporaries. Thomas of Cantimpré, in his supplement to the *vita* of Mary of Oignies, recalled

⁷²² Monica Sandor, "Jacques de Vitry- Biography," in *De L'Homélie au Sermon: Histoire de la Prédication Médiévale: Histoire de la Prédication Médiévale: Actes du Colloque International de Louvain-la-Neuve* (9-11 juillet 1992), ed. Xavier Hermant and Jacqueline Hamesse (Louvain-la-Neuve: Institut d'Études Médiévales de l'Université Catholique de Louvain, 1993), 55; Mark A. Zier, "Sermons of the Twelfth Century Schoolmasters and Canons," 338; Hinnebusch, *H. Occ.*, 6.

⁷²³ Zier, "Sermons of the Twelfth Century Schoolmasters and Canons," 325-51. The medieval sermon serves as "religious discourse, it has moral purpose, often seeking to rebuke, or to move to repentance, penance, or reform. Ultimately its purpose is eschatological and soteriological, for it is concerned with the end of time and the listeners' salvation", Kienzle, "Introduction," in *Sermon*, 155.

⁷²⁴ Whalen, *Dominion of God*, 127.

⁷²⁵ Beriou, "Les Sermon Latins Après 1200," 367.

⁷²⁶ "[T]he sermon, both belonging to and differing from its liturgical/ritual context, desires to be efficacious and to transform," Beverly Mayne Kienzle, "Medieval Sermons and Their Performance: Theory and Record," in *Preacher, Sermon, and Audience in the Middle Ages*, ed. Carolyn Muessig (Leiden: Brill, 2002), 92.

his experience of watching Jacques preach in Lotharingia when Thomas was barely fifteen years old.⁷²⁷ Vincent Beauvais remarked that while Jacques was preaching against the Albigensians in France, “he called forth with the charm and sweetness of eloquence many countless men to take up the sign of the cross.”⁷²⁸ Humbert of Romans included Jacques in a list of wise and pious men who used exempla in their sermons, stating that “through preaching and using exempla in his sermons throughout the kingdom of France, he captivated the entire region to the extent that no other record of such an awakening exists before or after”.⁷²⁹ But the memory of Jacques’ skill remains in the manuscript copies of his sermons.

One sign of Jacques’ enduring reputation is his by-line. Most sermon collection do not bother to identify author.⁷³⁰ Many of the composite collections include numerous anonymous sermons, but the scribes continued to connect the authority of Jacques to these works. In this feature, he stands in good company revealing his stature as a preacher. His sermons were bound together with the likes of Augustine of Hippo, Bernard of Clairvaux, Jean Gerson, and Bernard of Sienna. In some cases Jacques is the only named author within a collection of otherwise anonymous sermons.⁷³¹ Whether scribes only copied two of his sermons or a whole collection, they consistently attributed the work to Jacques. Sometimes they only referred to him by the title “magister,” while later scribes listed his ecclesiastical positions as Bishop of Acre and Cardinal

⁷²⁷ Thomas of Cantimpré, *VMO-S*, IV. 27. Col. 0676D: ‘Nondum enim annorum quindecim ætatem attigeram, cum vos necdum Præsulem in Lotharingiæ partibus prædicantem audiens, tanta veneratione dilexi, ut me solius nominis vestri lætificaret auditus: ex tunc mecum vestri amor individuus perseverat.’

⁷²⁸ Vincent Beauvais, *Speculum Historiales*, Monumenta Germaniæ Historica, SS, XXIV, 165-6: ‘Ipse crucem contra Albigenses in Francia predicans, eloquii suavitate atque dulcedine multos atque innumerabiles ad signem crucis accipiendum provocavit.’

⁷²⁹ Humbert de Romans, *De dono timoris*, ed. Christine Boyer, CCCM 218 (Turnhout: Brepols, 2008), 4. See footnote 418 for the Latin.

⁷³⁰ Anonymous sermon collections need to be explored more closely to look for unattributed sermons by Jacques de Vitry, but it is telling that he is named even in collections of anonymous works.

⁷³¹ See for example University of Liège, MS 54.

and Bishop of Tusculum. Perhaps memory of the details of his career had faded.⁷³² Even so, his name preserved some rhetorical force, its mention a signal to readers of a collection's status and purpose. "Jacques de Vitry," in sum, had become synonymous with a certain type of pastoral care that later generations could align themselves with.

The *sermones ad status* collection contains 75 sermons directed to 28 different estates. This includes religious and lay categories (canon regulars, nuns, prelates, etc.) as well as categories based on age, sex, and occupation (rulers, merchants, scholars, crusaders, lawyers, widows, etc.). Jacques also included categories for the sick and dying, and the old and the young.⁷³³ Medieval historians employed these formulae in categorizing people by function, as seen in the idealized three-fold system of *oratores*, *bellatores*, and *labores*. Religious authors developed this framework, also reflected in art and literature, to serve as a rhetorical tool to discuss how society ought to theoretically function, of course with the *oratores* taking the leading role.⁷³⁴ For medieval thinkers a person, or *persona*, was identified by what they did. In other words, *persona* designated one's central function or role versus the modern idea of one's

⁷³² For example, Brussels 508, f. 242v. : 'Venerabilis magisteri ac doctoris Iacobi de Vitriaco cardinalis sancte Ecclesie romane ac episcopi Arconensis,' MS Brussels 3772, 1r. : 'Incipit tabula sermonum uulgarum quos composuit reuerendus in Christo pater ac domnus magister Iacobus de Vitriaco, predicator excellentissimus canonicus regularis, prius Aconensis episcopus postea uero episcopus Tusculanensis et Sedis apostolice cardinalis.'

⁷³³ Jacques de Vitry, *Ad status*, *Prol.*, 6.90-104: 'Aliter enim predicandum est maioribus, aliter mediocribus, aliter minoribus. Aliter prelatibus, aliter simplicibus sacerdotibus, aliter canonicis secularibus et aliis clericis, aliter scholaribus, aliter monachis albis, aliter monachis nigris, aliter canonicis regularibus, aliter fratribus predicatoribus, aliter fratribus minoribus, aliter heremitis, aliter templariis, aliter fratribus Christi militie astrictis, aliter hospitalariis, aliter monialibus. Aliter infirmis et leprosis, aliter afflictis, aliter dolentibus de morte propinquorum. Aliter peregrinis et cruce signatis uel signandis, aliter principibus et militibus. Aliter mercatoribus, aliter burgensibus et feneratoribus, aliter agricolis et aliis qui propriis manibus secundum uarias artes operantur. Aliter mulieribus, id est uirginibus, uiduis et coniugatis. Aliter liberis, aliter seruis et ancillis. Aliter etiam pueris. Sicut auxiliante Domino ex sequentibus sermonibus, quos predicto modo ordinare proponimus, plenius apparebit.'

⁷³⁴ Georges Duby, *The Three Orders: Feudal Society Imagined* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1980); Not every scheme included *labores* as seen in Alan of Lille, while Humbert of Romans also included place and wealth in his divisions of society, Birgit van den Hoven, *Work in Ancient and Medieval Thought: Ancient Philosophers, Medieval Monks and Theologians and Their Concept of Work, Occupations and Technology* (Amsterdam: J.C. Gieben, 1996), 219-20.

essential being.⁷³⁵ This discourse, however, had more to do with contested spheres of authority by ecclesiastical leadership and secular leadership than addressing the role of the actual “workers,” or the pragmatic affairs of society writ large. The expanded categories that Jacques implemented maintains the focus on collective or group. As Caroline Walker Bynum asserts the twelfth-century religious writing shows “a great concern with how groups are formed and differentiated with each other, how roles are defined and evaluated, how behavior is conformed to models,” and how these groups complemented the whole.⁷³⁶ Another crusade-minded writer, Robert the Monk, for example, included in his chronicle of the First Crusade a straightforward depiction of roles, unified in their cause: soldiers fought, priests and clergy wept and prayed, women lament and bury the dead.⁷³⁷ More than just theoretical or formulaic tropes, categorization and labels had very real consequences. As Jennifer Kolpacoff Deane explains this was “an era deeply concerned with defining status, maintaining order, and preventing slippage between what is and what appears to be.”⁷³⁸ Reality did not always fit neat categorization, as was the case with the beguines. The religious lay life of these women was marked with a certain fluidity that neither fit with nuns or laywomen. For those that suspected them of heresy, labels became a tool of persecution.⁷³⁹

Jacques’ *sermones ad status* however, present both continuity with formulaic tropes, but also a broadening of social categories that reflects his concern with defining and ordering a

⁷³⁵ Illich, *In the Vineyard of the Text*, 25.

⁷³⁶ Bynum mentions Jacques de Vitry’s *Historia Occidentalis* as part of this drive to understand each role and how each role complements the whole, *Jesus as Mother*, 85, 94-5.

⁷³⁷ Matthew Mesley notes the gendered expectations of these roles, “Episcopal Authority and Gender in the Narratives of the First Crusade,” in *Religious Men and Masculine Identity in the Middle Ages*, ed. P.H. Cullum and Katherine J. Lewis (Woodbridge: Boydell and Brewer, 2013), 98.

⁷³⁸ Jennifer Kolpacoff-Deane, “From Case Studies to Comparative Models: Würzburg Beguines and the Vienne Decrees,” *Labels and Libels: Naming Beguines in Northern Medieval Europe* (Brepolis, 2014), 54.

⁷³⁹ *Ibid.*, 76.

changing society, and his approach to pastoral care. While all of Jacques' 30 categories could broadly be distributed into the former three-fold plan, it is worth noting which branches he concentrated and elaborated on. He multiplied the branches of the *labores* and *oratores*, adding specific trades such as butchers, farmers, and merchants, and types of monastic orders and secular clerics. He placed secular leadership and martial roles in a generic category of "rulers and soldiers," and only added to that category *crucesignatos*. These emphases reflect the Fourth Lateran reform agenda, which focused on preaching to the laity, reforming the behavior of the clergy, and promoting crusade. But it also suggests a certain leveling of the spiritual playing field.⁷⁴⁰ Each segment of society, in Jacques' view, had its own virtues and vices, and likewise its own potential for spiritual perfection. Jacques' *sermones ad status* therefore, present both continuity with formulaic tropes, but also a broadening of social categories that reflects his concern with defining and ordering a changing society, and his approach to pastoral care.

The opportunity to preach to an audience made up of only one type of estate, especially when several of the categories can overlap, would have been impractical.⁷⁴¹ Instead, as Jacques notes in the prologue of the sermon collection, he expected a preacher to consider sermons like medicine for the body, and thus "as a doctor of souls, they must inspect and pay attention to the qualities and customs of their listeners with careful consideration."⁷⁴² Jacques' categories further reveal a nuanced understanding of an ever more variegated society, one that he perceived in need of sermons with points of emphasis on disparate elements of pastoral care. For example, in a sermon addressed to lepers and other sick people, Jacques relies on James 5:11, which looks to

⁷⁴⁰ This can also be seen in his *Historia Occidentalis* in which he applies the adjective *religiosus* more broadly, even including pious Muslims. Sandor, *Popular Preaching of Jacques de Vitry*, 172.

⁷⁴¹ The sermons conducted after the Roman processions were segregated by sex, Twyman, "The Romana Fraternitas and Urban Processions at Rome," 219.

⁷⁴² Jacques de Vitry, *Ad status*, *Prol.*5.85-87: 'Ita necesse est ut medicus animarum cum omni circumspectione consideret et aduertat qualitates et mores auditorum.' See also Sandor, *Popular Preaching*, 180.

Job as an exemplar of perseverance that lead to God's mercy.⁷⁴³ While envisioning sickness as a penitential test, Jacques places the focus on the promise of eventual restoration in the world to come rather than the causes of such an illness.⁷⁴⁴ The lepers' unique physical challenges are therefore met with corresponding scriptural passages and individualized guidance. While Jacques asserts that each role has its own unique challenges and snares for vice, the spiritual health of the whole community is of primary concern for the preacher with each member having a particular role to play. Despite the collective focus characteristic of Jacques' own thought, later scribes inserted certain sermons from the collection and copied them into other larger sermon collections.⁷⁴⁵ Thus while the *sermones ad status* was the most innovative of the four collections, as a complete copy it was not the most popular of them.

Jacques' *ad status* sermons, while aiming at specific estates, contain a message of collective responsibility characteristic of both reform and crusade efforts. As discussed in the last chapter, Innocent III's call for crusade, which encouraged not only military service but also liturgical and financial support, speaks to his vision of crusading as a cooperative enterprise.⁷⁴⁶

⁷⁴³ He compares the word to a soothing oil: "Orate igitur dominus ut hoc precioso ungento hodie uulnerum vestorum dolor mitigetur," Brussels MS 3772, 139 v. For an investigation Jacques de Vitry, Guilbert of Tournai and Humbert of Roman's sermons to lepers see: Nicole Bériou and François-Olivier Touati, *Voluntate Dei leprosus : Les Lépreux entre Conversion et Exclusion aux XII e et XIII e Siècles* (Spolète : Centro italiano di studi sull'alto medioevo, 1991).

⁷⁴⁴ Elma Brenner, "The Leperous Body in the Twelfth- and Thirteenth-Century Rouen," in *The Ends of the Body : Identity and Community in Medieval Culture*, eds. Jill Ross and Suzanne Conklin Akbari (Buffalo: University of Toronto Press, 2013), 254-5.

⁷⁴⁵ For example: the fifteenth-century Brussels MS II.462 includes both a sermon from the *sancti* collection on the consecration of the altar and two from the *sermones ad status* addressed to virgins and holy women. The manuscript originates from the library of the Regular Brothers in Tungris (eastern Belgium and southern Netherlands) in the diocese of Liège. A composite work of 20 separate texts, this work is singularly focused on sermon literature, most of which is anonymous. While the catalogue notes folios 1v-27v as "Sermones in communi sancti," on folio 21r a red subtitle reads: "Sermo Iacobi de Vitriaco de virginibus" (f. 21r) followed by sermons "de virginibus electis ac aliis sanctis mulieribus" (f. 26v). The next red subtitle notes: "In dedicatione altaris sermo Iacobi de Vitriaco," (f. 28r-31v). This last sermon is listed in the modern catalogue. The catalogue (#1691) only lists "*In dedicatione altaris sermo Iacobi de Vitriaco*" which may explain why Longère's does not mention this manuscript in his edition. Van den Gheyn, *Catalogue des manuscrits de la Bibliothèque Royale de Belgique* (Brussel: Henri Lamertin 1901-1948) 3: 216-7.

⁷⁴⁶ Innocent III's agenda shines through much of Jacques de Vitry's writings, Bird, "James of Vitry's Sermons to Pilgrims," 81; Powell, *Anatomy of a Crusade*, 20; Bird, "Prophecy and the Crusade(s) of Frederick II"

Coupled with the expansion of the indulgence from soldiers to donors those who financially supported soldiers on campaign, Innocent encouraged penitential processions of men and women whose prayers might move God and lead to crusading victories. Many of Jacques' sermons reflect these ideas as he sought to clarify how each rank or estate had particular spiritual value and specific responsibilities, both in the present and final age. The characterizations of Jacques' preaching paints an image of a skillful orator, who legitimized a novel style of preaching and successfully communicated a vision for crusading and reform. Although the generic character of model sermons obscures their actual delivery and reception, they are, nevertheless, a rich source to access the challenges the preacher faced and the perceived anxieties of their audiences—including eschatological concerns.⁷⁴⁷

Harbingers of the Last Days

Scholars are now beginning to understand the connection between Jacques' apocalyptic ideas and his crusade appeals.⁷⁴⁸ For example, John Tolan views Jacques as representative of the apocalyptic Christian hopes fueled by the Mongol conquests in the thirteenth century. Rumors of the possible conversion of infidel rulers to Christianity led Jacques and his contemporaries to vacillate between hope and despair. Penny Cole provides valuable analysis of a selection of Jacques' sermons, noting that his writing and that of his contemporaries, Robert of Courcon and Oliver of Paderborn, all have apocalyptic overtones. Brett Whalen builds on this insight further

(Forthcoming). The author thanks Jessalyn Bird for providing a copy of this forthcoming article which extensively examines the impact of prophecy on the crusades of Frederick II.

⁷⁴⁷ Powell, *Anatomy of a Crusade*, 58; Jaques Berloiz and Marie Anne Polo de Beaulieu, "The Preacher Facing a Reluctant Audience According to the Testimony of Exempla," *Medieval Sermon Studies* 57 (2013): 25-6; William J. Purkis, "Memories of Preaching the Fifth Crusade in Caesarius of Heisterbach's *Dialogus miraculorum*," *Journal of Medieval History* 40:3 (2014): 338-9; Carolyn Muessig, "Heaven, Earth and the Angels: Preaching Paradise in the Sermons of Jacques de Vitry," in *Envisaging Heaven in the Middle Ages*, ed. Carolyn Muessig and Ad Putter (New York: Routledge, 2007), 57.

⁷⁴⁸ Tolan, *Saracens*, 201; Cole, *Preaching of the Crusades*, 124; Whalen, *Dominion of God*, 150.

by arguing that the works of Oliver of Paderborn and Jacques de Vitry, particularly their employment of prophecy, reveal a new universalizing mission not seen in previous crusade writings.

Both these strands of thought, crusade and apocalypse, likewise bear the hallmark of wider developments in contemporary social thought and theology.⁷⁴⁹ The thirteenth century saw important shifts in the apocalyptic tradition, such as the appearance of commentaries on prophecies like the Sibylline Oracles and Pseudo-Methodius, as well as the widespread influence of the categorization of history into three ages by Joachim of Fiore, who had perceived himself to be living at the end of the second age, the flowering of the third age just before him.⁷⁵⁰ Therefore, when discussing biblical prophecy, authors sought to intertwine their approaches with innovative readings of the end times. Jacques, however, acknowledged competing forms of prophetic knowledge.⁷⁵¹ Consequently, he prescribed a path characterized by a certain distrust of astrologers and confidence that the Holy Spirit was speaking through pious lay people, particularly women. For example, in a model sermon directed to scholars, Jacques cautions against reliance on astronomers “who are accustomed to predict many things which will not come to pass, just as doctors promise many things and disappoint many people”.⁷⁵² In the

⁷⁴⁹ See for example: Maier, *Crusade Propaganda and Ideology*; Beverly Mayne Kienzle, *Cistercians, Heresy, and Crusade in Occitania, 1145-1229: Preaching in the Lord's Vineyard* (Rochester, NY: Boydell Press, 2001); William J. Purkis, *Crusading Spirituality in the Holy Land and Iberia, c.1095-c.1187* (Woodbridge, U.K.: Boydell Press, 2008).

⁷⁵⁰ Bernard McGinn, *Visions of the End: Apocalyptic Traditions in the Middle Ages* (New York: Columbia UP, 1998), 145. See also Anne A. Latowsky, *Emperor of the World: Charlemagne and the Construction of Imperial Authority, 800-1229* (Ithaca, Cornell University Press, 2013); Marjorie Reeves, *The Influence of Prophecy in the Later Middle Ages: A Study in Joachimism* (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1969); Alfred J. Andrea, “Innocent III, the Fourth Crusade, and the Coming Apocalypse,” in *The Medieval Crusade*, ed. Susan J. Ridyard (Woodbridge, Suffolk: Boydell Press, 2004), 97-106.

⁷⁵¹ For insight on the connections between science, Christian thought, and prophecy in the late medieval and early modern period see Laura Ackerman Smoller, *History, Prophecy, and the Stars: The Christian Astrology of Pierre D'Ailly, 1350-1420* (Princeton, N.J.: Princeton University Press, 1994).

⁷⁵² Jacques de Vitry, *Ad status*, XVI.15.153-356: ‘Vnde multa dicere solent astronomi que non contingent, sicut medici multa promittunt et multos fallunt, quorum precepta preceptis dominicis in multis contraria esse uidentur.’

prologue of the *vita* of Mary of Oignies, on the other hand, he chastises “the sensual men” (1 Cor. 2.14) who dismiss prophets, and spurn Paul’s admonishment: “Extinguish not the spirit; despise not the prophecies” (1 Thes. 5: 19-20). Instead these men “extinguish the spirit as much as they can and spurn the prophecies; they despise spiritual people as if they were either insane or idiots; and they deem prophecies or revelations of the saints to be fantasies or dreams”.⁷⁵³ The despised and disrespected prophets he refers to here would have included pious lay women like Mary of Oignies.

Jacques’ works reflects an awareness of biblical and extrabiblical prophecies. As the last chapter noted, he also copied prophecies from a supposed Muslim astrologer in a letter sent from Damietta.⁷⁵⁴ Still, these works were not adopted whole cloth, but were redacted into his own eschatological framework. Similarly, in order to defend the piety of Marie D’Oignes, Jacques stressed in the *vita* that the Holy Spirit continued to descend like oil which “flows from the head down the beard, and from the beard down the hem of the garment [Ps. 132.2], even to the fringes, that is to the saints of the last days”.⁷⁵⁵ Lay religiosity was frequently viewed with suspicion of heresy, but it also offered the potential for renewal and reform. The *vita* defended Mary of Oignies and other women as being the “fringes” of the last days, and consequently Jacques presented the gift of prophecy as the principal evidence of their legitimacy. Jacques,

⁷⁵³ Jacques de Vitry, *VMO*, Prologus, 248-52: ‘Ipsi vero spiritum quantum in se est extinguunt et prophetias spernunt, qui spirituales quosque quasi insanos vel ydiotas despiciunt et prophetias sive sanctorum revelationes tanquam fantasmata vel somniorum illusiones reputant.’

⁷⁵⁴ Ibid., *Lettres*, VII. Also recorded in Oliver of Paderborn, *Historia Damiatina*, 231. For insight on where these prophecies came from, see Barbara Roggema, “The Legend of Sergius-Bahīrā,” 107-23.

⁷⁵⁵ Ibid., *VMO*, Prologus, 252-7: ‘Manus autem domini non est abbreviata, nec fuit aliquod tempus ab initio, in quo Spiritus sanctus in sanctis suis non operaretur mirabiliter, vel manifeste vel occulte: unguentum enim, quod descendit a capite in barbam et a barba in oram vestimenti, etiam usque ad fimbrias, id est ad sanctos ultimi temporis descendet.’ While drawing on Psalm 133, this also echoes the apocalyptic imagery of the pouring out of God’s spirit as described in Joel 12:28. Bird also notes that in the *Historia Occidentalis* Jacques deplores the state of the Church and suggests that God seeks alternative witnesses, speaking through demoniacs, and even using women as an example of proper penance, “Religious Role in a Post-Lateran World,” 210.

therefore, was eager to embrace visions of pious lay women which, within this cosmology, revealed the proximity of the end times.

While embracing women like Marie, as a genuine prophetess, Jacques understood the very act of pious women seeking religious life, as emblematic of the Last Days. In a sermon addressed to the Cistercians, Jacques notes:

These women are like the virgins of the Sunamite [1 Kings 1:1-4], who warmed David in his old age, this is in those days in the twilight of the world, the old age of the Church, just as it is written: *And my old age is plentiful in mercy* [Ps. 91:11]. Great is the mercy of God, with the world sliding into old age and the love of many growing cold, the Lord provides for the young women so that when they flee the world, as if a fire, can find a variety of monasteries, at which they might find refuge from the shipwreck of the world and its various dangers.⁷⁵⁶

Jacques had fought for the protection of the beguines and their mendicant lifestyle, and he praised the mendicant life as “Christian perfection” regardless of lay or clerical status.⁷⁵⁷ But in this sermon, chaste and virtuous women fleeing out of the world and into cloister signals the “old age of the Church.” This image of chaste and cloistered women was, perhaps, more suitable for his intended male audience of Cistercians, but Jacques’ acknowledged and praised the variety of religious life—mendicant and monastic. Nevertheless, Jacques argued not only for the validity of their piety, but also for their role as harbingers of the Last Days. Just as Jacques’ *ad status* sermons classify listeners into different social orders, his conception of the last days involved various duties suited to the audience’s own estate. Jacques’ eschatological framework, therefore, envisioned active participation of the whole community, including both men and women.

⁷⁵⁶ Jacques de Vitry, *Ad status*, XXVIII.2.51-58: ‘Hae sunt uirgines Sunamite que calefaciunt regem Daudid, III Regum I, in sua senectute, hoc est diebus istis in uespere mundi et senectute Ecclesie, sicut scriptum est: *Et senectus mea in misericordia uberi*. Magna enim est Dei misericordia, quia mundo uergente in senium et refrigescente caritate multorum Dominus prouidit iuueniculis ut de mundo tamquam de incendio fugientes, diuersa monasteria reperiant, ad que de naufragio mundi et variis periculis confugiant.

⁷⁵⁷ Carolyn Muessig, “Audience and Preacher: *Ad Status* Sermons and Social Classification,” in *Preacher, Sermon and Audience in the Middle Ages*, ed. Carolyn Muessig (Leiden: Brill, 2002), 269-70; Sandor, “Jacques de Vitry,” 53-4; Longère, *Ad status*, viii.

Jacques' earthly vision attempted to clearly define and delegate proper roles, similarly so such systems of social classification later flourished in Dante's vision of Paradise which assigned each type of Christian virtue a particular place in heaven.

Great Expectations

A closer examination of the specific biblical passages that Jacques drew upon from Daniel, Matthew, and Revelation shows that eschatological expectations informed his approach to each estate or occupation, including preachers like himself. For example, in a sermon drawing on Ezekiel 3:1-3⁷⁵⁸ directed at theologians and intellectuals, Jacques presents the study of Scripture as a physical exercise. He explains that just as God ordered Ezekiel to eat the scroll, so too should theologians and preachers draw the Holy Scriptures into themselves through reading, meditating, chewing, and ruminating upon them.⁷⁵⁹ While encouraging these practices, Jacques also cautions against those who presume to understand the Scriptures and suggests that they are obscure by design. The passage in question is drawn from John's vision of the throne-room of heaven. It describes the room as filled with twenty-four elders and four winged creatures continuously worshipping the one seated on the throne, who holds a scroll in his right hand. Jacques cites the elder's response to John, who fears there is no one who can open the scroll:⁷⁶⁰ "The book of holy scripture is called '*involutus*', that is obscure, which was 'sealed' by Isaiah and 'closed' as it said in Revelation 5.3: No one can open it, except *the lion from the tribe of*

⁷⁵⁸ Ez. 3:1-3: "Et dixit ad me fili hominis quodcumque inveneris comede, comede volumen istud et vadens loquere ad filios Israhel et aperrui os meum et cibavit me volumine illo et dixit ad me fili hominis venter tuus comedet et viscera tua complebuntur volumine isto quod ego do tibi et comedi illud et factum est in ore meo sicut mel dulce."

⁷⁵⁹ Jacques de Vitry, *Ad status*, XIX.3.54-55: "'Volumen comedere' est sacras Scripturas legenda, meditando, masticando et ruminando sibi incorporare."

⁷⁶⁰ Revelation 5:5: "Et unus de senioribus dicit mihi ne fleveteris ecce vicit leo de tribu Iuda radix David experire librum et septem signacula eius."

Judah.”⁷⁶¹ Jacques employs this passage to suggest that the true clarity of the Scripture will not be made manifest until the end days. Citing Gregory the Great, he adds that Scripture remains obscure “lest it would be revealed to those unworthy,” but also “so that it might be explained in multiple ways as God marvelously planned.”⁷⁶² Here Jacques repeats the famous sentiment of St. Jerome: “The apocalypse of John has as many mysteries as words . . . manifold meanings lie hidden in its every word.”⁷⁶³ This multiplicity of possible meanings, however, does not imply an exegetical free-for-all. . Instead, the various meanings might be found among different exegetes that build upon one another’s works: “*Many people shall pass over, and knowledge shall be multiplied* [Dan. 12.4], which means it will be multiplied, because we ‘are just like dwarves on top of the shoulders of giants’.”⁷⁶⁴ Lastly, obscurity serves the purposes of reform since it combats laxity: “character is not refined, unless idleness is eliminated. For, just as a sword collects rust thus also the soul collects rust, unless it is exercised through honest employment.”⁷⁶⁵ In this sermon, eschatology marks the boundaries of exegetical knowledge since the scroll shall remain sealed until the last days. Rather than this limitation producing apathy, Jacques encouraged action. He chose to emphasize the corporeality of the preacher’s task. By blending the roles of preacher and prophet, Jacques invested the role of the preacher with eschatological significance, in what he perceived to be a pivotal age.

⁷⁶¹ Jacques de Vitry, *Ad status*, XIX.5.81-3: ‘Liber autem sacre Scripture dicitur ‘inuolutus’, id est obscurus, qui ab Ysaia ‘signatus’ et in Apocalypsi V dicitur ‘clausus’, quem nemo aperire potest, nisi *leo de tribu Iuda*.’

⁷⁶² Ibid., 86-92: ‘Voluit autem Dominus obscure loqui in Scripturis, ne uilicerent et ne aperirentur indignis et inuestigantes gratius inuenirent. Vnde in Parabolis XXV: *Gloria Dei est celare uerbum et gloria regum inuestigare sermonem*. Et aliam causam obscuritatis Scripturarum assignans Gregorius ait, Plerumque in sacro eloquio aliquid obscure dicitur, ut Deo mirabiliter dispensante multipliciter exponantur.’

⁷⁶³ St. Jerome, *Letter to Paulinus*, 53: 9, <http://www.newadvent.org/fathers/3001053.htm> (Accessed on March 17, 2018).

⁷⁶⁴ Jacques de Vitry, *Ad status*, XIX.5.93-5: ‘Teste autem Daniele XII: *Transibunt plurimi et multiplex erit scientia*, id est multiplicabitur, quia nos ‘quasi nani sumus super humeros gigantum.’

⁷⁶⁵ Ibid., 108-10: ‘Non enim elimatur ingenium, nisi eliminetur otium. Sicut enim ferrum colligit rubiginem, ita anima, nisi exerceatur per occupationem honestam.’

Adversaries at the End of the World

Biblical prophecy not only provided guidelines for those operating within Christendom, but it also served to identify the Church's enemies. Jacques' interpretation of the *abomination of the desolation* in Daniel 9:27 presents a valuable example of his ecclesiological and eschatological readings. Also quoted in Matthew 24:15 and Mark 13:14, this charged biblical phrase occurs as part of a series of Daniel's visions. After proving himself a reliable interpreter of King Nebuchadnezzar's dreams, Daniel received visions about the fate of the people of Israel and the city of Jerusalem. One of the visions predicts a period of seventy weeks during which Jerusalem will be restored, and then ultimately destroyed again, culminating in the presence in the Temple of the *abomination of the desolation*. In the *Historia Orientalis*, this passage appears twice; once in reference to the Jews and once in a condemnation of Muhammad. After his discussion of theological differences among the Essenes, Sadducees, and Samaritans, Jacques explains that Gog and Magog, who were enclosed beyond the Caspian mountains by Alexander the Great, "during the time of the Antichrist will be led out and return to the Holy Land".⁷⁶⁶ Jacques contends that a remnant of the Jews will be saved, but that their punishment for killing Christ is manifest in their dispersal and captivity as predicted in Daniel 9:27.⁷⁶⁷ He aligns the prophecy of Daniel with the plight of the Jews, confirming their guilt; whereas, when he applies imagery from Daniel to Muhammad, he imagines the Temple as Jerusalem and Muhammad's presence as evidence of the coming of the final days. Jacques describes Muhammad, drawing on

⁷⁶⁶ Jacques de Vitry, *H.Or.*, LXXXII.43-6: 'Maxima autem pars eorum seorum habitat in illis partibus orientis in quibus infra Capsios montes rex Macedonum Alexander eos fertur inclusisse, qui temporibus Antichristi educendi sunt et ad Terram sanctam reducendi.'

⁷⁶⁷ *Ibid.*, 103-7: 'Hanc autem ultimam eorum captivitatem predixit Daniel propheta his verbis: *Civitatem et sanctuarium dissipabit populus cum duce venturo et finis eius vastitas et post finem belli, statuta desolatio et deficiet hostia et sacrificium et in templo erit desolationis abominatio et usque ad consummationem et finem perserverabit desolatio.*'

other passages, as “another antichrist” and “first born of Satan” (1 John 2:18) and the “angel of light” (2 Cor. 11:14).⁷⁶⁸ Drawing on past attempts to use prophecy to make sense of Islamic conquest found in Pseudo-Methodius, he explains that Muhammad remains the source of the Church’s greatest tribulations⁷⁶⁹:

Nor do I think that from the infancy of the early church up to its old age and decrepitude, certainly up to the time of the sons of perdition, was there or will there be a greater *abomination of the desolation* or a greater scourge will have oppressed the holy church of God than the destructive poison of the detestable error which the ancient serpent vomited through the mouth of the pseudo-prophet and his successors to great a number of people for already six hundred years.⁷⁷⁰

Jacques’ characterization of Muhammad and his apocalyptic tone largely echoes Innocent III’s *Quia maior*, calling for a combination of crusade and reform. Innocent III identified Muhammad as a pseudo-prophet and the beast of the Apocalypse whose end was fast approaching, as predicted by John in the book of Revelation.⁷⁷¹ The twelfth-century mystic and theologian Joachim of Fiore had also focused on the appearance of multiple false prophets and antichrists, citing I John 2:18, but he explained that these function as harbingers of the real and final Antichrist: “Just as many pious kings, priests, or prophets preceded the one Christ, who was the king, priest, and prophet; thus many unholy kings, pseudo-prophets, and Antichrists precede the one Antichrist who will feign to be king, priest, and prophet.”⁷⁷² Jacques does not draw upon the

⁷⁶⁸ Ibid., IV.11-4: ‘Seductor autem ille qui dictus est Mahometus, quasi alter *antichristus* et *primogenitus Satane filius*, tanquam Satan in *angelum lucis* transfiguratus, ira Dei magna et indignatione maxima sustinente et inimico generis humani cooperante’ For an assessment of Jacques’ treatment of Islam in the *Historia Orientales*, see Donnadieu, “La representation de l’islam,” 487-508.

⁷⁶⁹ McGinn, *Visions of the End*, 71-2.

⁷⁷⁰ Jacques de Vitry, *H.Or.*, IV.22-8: ‘Nec puto quod ab infantia primitive Ecclesie usque ad senectam et senium eiusdem, videlicet usque ad tempora filii perditionis, maior fuerit vel futura sit *abominato desolationis* vel maius flagellum Ecclesiam sanctam Dei oppresserit, quam execrabilis erroris venenum pestiferum quod serpens antiquus per os pseudoprophete et successorum eius in tanta populorum multitudine iam fere per sexcentos annos evomuit.’

⁷⁷¹ Innocent III, *Quia maior*, PL, 216.col 817 : ‘Sed ex tunc quidam perditionis filius, Machometus pseudopropheta, surrexit, qui per saeculares, illecebras et voluptates carnales multos a veritate seduxit; cujus perfidia etsi usque ad haec appropinquat, cujus numerus secundum Apocalypsin Joannis intra sexcenta sexaginta sex clauditur, ex quibus jam pene sexcenti sunt anni completi.’ See also Tolan, “Apocalyptic Fears and Hopes Inspired by the Thirteenth-Century Crusades,” *Saracens*, 194-213.

⁷⁷² Joachim of Fiore, *Il Libro delle Figure*, ed. Leone Tondelli, Marjorie Reeves and Beatrice Hirsch-Reich

complex imagery or multilayered patterns devised by Joachim—concepts likely too difficult to translate into his preaching—or share his optimistic view of Jewish-Christian relations in the spiritual Third Age, marked by a new understanding of the Old and New Testaments.⁷⁷³ Jacques, however, similarly applies apocalyptic passages to make sense of the plight of the Jews and the rise of Islam, confirming their roles as adversaries of the Church.

Jacques' treatment of internal threats against the Church also reveals the importance of his apocalyptic framework. He thought that Christian clerics were bringing about the Apocalypse, too. Shortly after his ordination, he left the ranks of the diocesan clergy and entered the monastery of St Nicholas at Oignies (c.1216). Over twenty years later, he resigned as bishop of Acre in order to return to Europe (c.1228).⁷⁷⁴ Both of these departures may reflect disappointment or dissatisfaction with the world of ecclesiastical and political affairs. Jacques' direct experience with the challenges of priestly and episcopal leadership could explain his sharp invective and application of apocalyptic passages in sermons directed towards canons and prelates. In a sermon on the *thema* —“You priests of the Lord are to be called ministers of our God” (Isa. 61:6) — he rails against the “servile and histrionic clerics” who follow behind the prelates like a tail “hiding the tracks of their evil conversion with the words of excuses.”⁷⁷⁵ He admonishes these clerics as sycophants, who readily tell the prelates whatever they desire to hear, esteeming the prelates' luxurious clothing and gourmand tastes. He compares the prelates to the Babylonian idol Bel (Dan. 14:3-4) who was placed in the temple and worshiped by the

(Turin:Società Editrice Internazionale, 1953), plate XIV, lines 9-55: ‘Ut autem multi reges pii, pontificem vel prophete precesserunt unum Christum, qui fuit rex et ponifex et propheta: ita multi reges impii et pseudoprophete et Antichristi precedunt unum Antichristum qui se esse simulabit regem et pontificem et prophetam.’

⁷⁷³ Robert E. Learner, *The Feast of Saint Abraham: Medieval Millenarians and the Jews* (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press. 2001).

⁷⁷⁴ Hinnebusch, *H.Occ.*, 4-7.

⁷⁷⁵ Jacques de Vitry, *Ad status*, VI.4b.188-191: ‘Trahunt post se pomposi prelati longam caudam clericorum famulorum et hystrionum, qui uestigia male conuersionis eorum tegunt uerbis excusationum, adulantes dominis suis, dicentes malum bonum et bonum malum.’

king. Jacques then inveighs against their unjust ascendancy to their position and adds: “[They] certainly are in the place of ecclesiastical rank not by merit, by title not by divine will, by false station not by a matter of truth, just as Dagon at the ark, just as *the abomination of the desolation* in the holy place (Dan. 9:27).”⁷⁷⁶ In Jacques’ estimation, the unholy idol situated in a holy place, whether Muhammad in Jerusalem or the corrupt prelates in the Church, correspond with these strongly apocalyptic passages. He therefore anticipated multiple forms of the Antichrist, both inside and outside of the Church, in contrast with Joachim who predicted two nearly simultaneous antichrists at the end of the Second Age, one external to the church and one within it. Similarly, in another sermon addressed to clerics and secular canons, Jacques cites Revelation 13:1, which was directed at Muhammad in the *Historia Orientalis*. Drawing on Numbers 18:5: “Keep guard over the sanctuary and over the altar, so that there may never again be wrath on the sons of Israel”, Jacques decries the practice of holding multiple benefices:

It is clear from these previously quoted passages that the aforementioned ministers of the Antichrist do not keep watch over the defenses of the sanctuary. Equally those who greedily retain multiple church benefices, who cannot worthily keep watch in the defenses of the sanctuary, are just like the beast of many heads. Regarding these people it is written in Apocalypse 13: *I saw a beast coming up out of the sea, having seven heads. . . .* From which it happens against the order of nature that the same man is the head of one church and a member of that very same one: the father of one and the son of the same one, while a deacon in one church and a simple canon in another, in which the deacon is a simple canon in the first church!⁷⁷⁷

⁷⁷⁶ Ibid., 200-4: ‘De quo scriptum est: *Sepulcrum patens est guttur eorum. Qui cum adhuc uiuerent, in loco sancto erant, in loco scilicet ecclesiastice dignitatis, numero non merito, nomine non numine, falsa positione non rei ueritate, tanquam Dagon iuxta archam, tanquam abhominatio desolationis in loco sancto.*’

⁷⁷⁷ Jacques de Vitry, *Ad status*, X.10.229-39: ‘Patet igitur ex predictis quod predicti ministri antichristi non excubant in custodiis sanctuarii. Pari modo qui plura beneficia ecclesiastica auare retinent, tanquam belue multorum capitum, in custodiis sanctuarii digne excubare non valent. De quibus in Apocalypsi XIII: *Vidi bestiam de mari ascendentem, habentem capita septem.* Quidam enim non solum septem sed multo plura capita habent, dum in diuersis ecclesiis sub diuersis prelatibus multa beneficia optinent. Ex quo accidit contra nature ordinem quod idem est caput unius et membrum eiusdem: pater unius et eiusdem filius, dum decanus in una ecclesia et simplex canonicus in alia, in qua decanus est qui simplex canonicus est in prima!’

Jacques utilizes the familiar image of the seven-headed dragon from Revelation to chastise the practice of holding multiple benefices. It is an ecclesiological observation, but it has eschatological implications. Those leaders with multiple benefices cannot guard against attacks from the enemy, thus proving themselves to be ministers of the Antichrist, perverting the ecclesiastical order. Jacques applied passages from Daniel and the Apocalypse to both the outsiders (the Jews and Muhammad) and the insiders (prelates and canons), as evidence of the presence of multiple forms of the Antichrist. Consequently, Jacques reminded his audience of both present anxieties and the larger cosmic battle taking place in which both reform and crusade were central theatres of war.

As previously mentioned, Innocent III drew connections between the danger of Christian sin and the threat of Muslim enemies, underscoring the penitential component of the crusade.⁷⁷⁸ Perhaps in response to this directive, Jacques' attention remained on both enemies within and outside of the Church. Likewise, prophetic passages corresponded equally to malevolent bishops and to Muhammad. In a sermon directed to pilgrims, Jacques goes as far as to state that: "we fear the sins of Christians more than the forces of Saracens. For our sins make them [the Saracens] powerful."⁷⁷⁹ This focus on Christian sin, at times, eclipses the condemnation of Muslim enemies. For example, in the *History of the East*, Jacques uses Matthew 24:11-12, which reads: "And many false prophets will arise and lead many astray. And because of the increase of lawlessness, the love of many will grow cold." This passage appears in both a discussion of Muhammad and also in an account of the sins of the inhabitants of the Holy Land, with more

⁷⁷⁸ Innocent III, *Quia Maior*, PL, 216:821. These characteristics are also in the work of Phillip of Oxford. Powell, *Anatomy of a Crusade*, 52. Likewise, Cole notes the anonymous *Brevis ordinancio de predicacione crucis* presents crusade as one part of the penitential process. Cole, *Preaching of the Crusades*, 124.

⁷⁷⁹ Jacques de Vitry, *Sermones ad peregrinos*, in Bird, "James of Vitry's Sermons to Pilgrims," 99: 'Magis autem timemus de peccatis christianorum quam de viribus sarracenorum. Peccata enim nostra faciunt eos potentes.'

vitriol directed against the latter than the former. Within a long tirade against the Holy Land's inhabitants he calls them:

[P]roud, haughty, puffed up, insolent, quarrelsome, biting at one another, sowing discord among brothers, wicked, soothsayers and impious, angry and unjust, lethargic with laziness and idleness, insatiable in their greed, weighed down by drunkenness and intoxication, reeking of luxury and filthiness, robbers, plunderers, murderers, men of blood, and traitors.⁷⁸⁰

As he does in his treatment of the Jews, in which he credits their dispersal as just punishment for killing Christ, Jacques lists the sins of the inhabitants of the Holy Land as an explanation for the crusaders' losses. Jacques likewise blamed the crusaders' moral failings for their losses at Damietta.⁷⁸¹ He describes at length both the deaths of Christians in battle and the cause of these losses, namely their sins against God and the Church:

But in that stormy and dark time, falsely named pilgrims had *corrupted their own pathways* [Gen. 6.12] beyond measure and fallen from sin into sin. They had set aside fear of God, *and those who were in filthiness, becoming dirtier still* [Rev. 22:11]. Everywhere indulgent ones were carousing and idle ones were drinking [Rom. 13:13]. They hurt one another and disparaged one another. These quarrelsome, profane, traitors maliciously disturbed the work of Christ and impeded the advance of Christ's army. They showed neither obedience nor reverence to the prelates, but disdain the sword of the Church, they considered the sentences of excommunication to be worthless.⁷⁸²

Jacques' assessment of the camp reveals a mentality in which the goals of crusade and reform merged. By placing greater emphasis on how the sins of Christians, rather than the stratagems of

⁷⁸⁰ Jacques de Vitry, *H.Or.*, LXX.21-6 : '[S]uperbi, elati, inflati, contumeliosi, seditiosi, invicem mordentes, inter fratres discordiam seminantes, malitiosi, sortilegi et sacrilegi, iracundi et iniqui, desidia et ignavia torpentes, avaritia insatiabiles, crapula et ebrietate pregravati, luxuria et immundicia fetidi, fures, raptores, homicide, viri sanguinum et proditores'

⁷⁸¹ As Jessalynn Bird and Debra Birch note Jacques' focus on the penitential quality of pilgrimage, and the need for reform consistently appears in his histories and sermons on pilgrimage written after his experience in Damietta. Bird, "Religious Role in a Post-Lateran World," 210-1; Birch, "Jacques de Vitry and the Ideology of Pilgrimage," 93. For the place of Damietta in the remembrance of crusade, see Megan Cassidy Welch, "'O Damietta,'" 346-60.

⁷⁸² Jacques de Vitry, *Lettres*, VII.37-46 : 'In illa autem tempestate et tenebroso tempore falsi nominis peregrini supra modum *corruperant vias suas* corruentes de peccato in peccatum, divino timore postposito, *et qui in sordibus erant, adhuc sordescabant* passim luxuriantes commensationibus et ebrietatibus vacantes, invicem mordentes atque invicem detrahentes, seditiosi, prophani et proditores, Christi negotium maliciose perturbantes et Christi exercitus impediennes promotionem; prelatibus autem neque obedientiam neque ullam exhibebant reverentiam, sed gladium ecclesiasticum contempnentes excommunicationis vilipendebant sententias.'

the enemy, determined the outcome of campaign, Jacques displays a union of ecclesiological and eschatological interpretations of prophecy.⁷⁸³

Preaching Crusade, Preaching the Apocalypse

While penitential concerns persist in Jacques' sermons, he uses these moral themes to emphasize the martial duties of the crusaders. Jacques demands that they fight the dangers of the world by taking the cross. In one crusade sermon, he characterizes the cross as "the last plank in a shipwrecked world, the tree of life, scales of justice, scepter of royal power, crown of the king, imperial throne, the shade tree, rod of correction, the supporting staff, the banner made red by the blood of Christ, by the sight of which we are inspired to fight".⁷⁸⁴ The martial role of the crusader, however, works in conjunction with the role of the preachers. In a different sermon addressed to pilgrims, Jacques portrays crusaders as one of three types of defenders of the faith (citing Rev. 12:4), "*The dragon swept the third part of the stars; the first part defends the faith with the word like the scholars against the heretics, the second part defends the faith with the sword like the soldiers of Christ, the third part defends neither with the word nor with the sword and they are the devil's part.*"⁷⁸⁵ In this tripartite plan, as well as in his treatment of crusaders and virgins, each social class has a role to play in defending the faith in the twilight of their "shipwrecked world".

⁷⁸³ The context for this emphasis includes the development by canonists of a doctrine for collective responsibility in the twelfth and thirteenth centuries, Clarke, "A Question of Collective Guilt," 105.

⁷⁸⁴ Jacques de Vitry, *Sermon II*, in *Crusade Propaganda and Ideology*, 108.12: 'Hec est suprema tabula mundo naufraganti, vite lignum, iustitie libra, sceptrum regni, regum diadema, thronus imperialis, arbor obumbrationis, virga correctionis, baculus sustentationis, vexillum Christi sanguine rubricatum, quo viso ad prelium incitatur.'

⁷⁸⁵ *Ibid.*, *Sermon I*, in *Crusade Propaganda and Ideology*, 91.11: 'Nam teste Iohanne Apoc. [xii,4]: *Draco traxit tertiam partem stellarum, una pars que fidem deffendit verbo sicut doctores contra hereticos, alia que fidem deffendit gladio sicut Christi milites, tertia que nec verbo nec gladio, et isti sunt pars diaboli.*'

Not every use of apocalyptic passages by Jacques resounds with such urgency. The passage Revelation 1:15, which reads: “And his feet like unto fine brass, as in a burning furnace and his voice as the sound of many waters,” is part of a lengthy description of the Son of Man in John’s heavenly vision. In a sermon addressed to the canons, Jacques applies this passage to the *thema* Ecclesiastes 2:4: “I made myself great works, I built myself houses, and planted vineyards, I made gardens, and orchards, and set them with trees of all kinds, and I made myself ponds of water, to water therewith the wood of the young trees.” He approaches this passage allegorically, noting that the “ponds of waters are the various collections of teachings and lamentations; ‘trees of the forest’ symbolize the peasants and coarse brothers who the Lord yet still waters, while they support the works of the more spiritual brothers.”⁷⁸⁶ He then expounds Job 29:6: “When I washed my feet with butter.” Here the feet symbolize the “simple *conversi* who work with their hands and who are assigned to lower jobs, sustaining the others.” The butter represents preaching thick with warnings “so that if anyone is cut by the sharpness of the paths, he may be healed.”⁷⁸⁷ He concludes that “these feet, in as much as they are able, ought to imitate gold, which is to say ‘the elders,’ whence in Apocalypse [1:15] *His feet are like fine brass*. Indeed brass imitates gold.”⁷⁸⁸ Jacques reads this passage allegorically in order to confirm Church hierarchy and the pastoral responsibilities within it. He chooses to stress proper behavior between inferiors and superiors, rather than emphasizing the appearance of the Son of Man or

⁷⁸⁶ Jacques de Vitry, *Ad status*, XXXII.13.248-51: ‘Piscinas aquarum,’ id est uarias collectiones doctrinarum et lacrimarum; ‘ligna silvarum’, homines agrestes et fratres rudes quos tamen Dominus irrigat, dum supportant onera spiritualium fratrum.’

⁷⁸⁷ *Ibid.*, 259-63: ‘Pedes simplices sunt conversi, qui laborant manibus et inferioribus deputati sunt operibus, alios sustentantes. Hii igitur lauandi sunt butiro, quia teste Gregorio ‘voce crebre ammonitionis quasi infusione pinguedinis’ debent perfundi, ut sanetur si quid asperitate uiarum fuerit laceratum.’

⁷⁸⁸ *Ibid.*, 263-6: ‘Hii autem pedes, in quantum possunt, assimilari debent auro, id est maioribus, unde in Apocalypsi I: *Pedes eius similes auricalco*. Auricalcum quidem auro assimilator.’

eschatological hopes. In this example Jacques seems more interested in combining passages with podiatric references, than adding apocalyptic notions to the sermon.

Jacques also cites this same passage—Revelation 1:15—in a sermon addressed to the brothers of a military order. He elucidates the knights’ position in battle by viewing them through an apocalyptic lens. The ranking of the knights in battle had been interpreted spiritually in Raymond d’Aguilers’ account of the First Crusade.⁷⁸⁹ Comparing these two interpretations highlights both their differing contexts and the evolving character of crusade. Canon of the cathedral of Le Puy, Raymond d’Aguilers had served as the chaplain within the household of one of the central leaders of the First Crusade, Count Raymond of Toulouse. Count Raymond’s army also included the visionary Peter of Bartholomew, whose claims led to the discovery of the Holy Lance, but also to his own ordeal by fire.⁷⁹⁰ Raymond d’Aguilers recorded Peter Bartholomew’s visions, the last and most ambitious of which compared the five wounds of Christ to the five ranks of crusaders.⁷⁹¹ Christ praises the vanguard for fighting in the most dangerous position in *imitatio Christi*: “The first rank are not afraid of spears, or swords, or any type of torment. That order is similar to me. For I came to Jerusalem, not hesitating over swords and lances, clubs, sticks, and in the end not even the cross.”⁷⁹² The second rank, the rear guard, is likened to the apostles who followed Christ, and the third, who furnish weapons and supplies, represent “those who, when they saw me hanging on the cross, suffering from my passion, beat their breasts

⁷⁸⁹ Raymond D’Aguilers, *Le “Liber” de Raymond D’Aguilers*, ed. John Hugh and Laurita L. Hill (Paris: Paul Geuthner, 1969), 113-5.

⁷⁹⁰ Rubenstein, *Armies of Heaven*, 213-19, 256-62.

⁷⁹¹ On the context of this radical vision, its interpretation, and the outrage it attracted see: Rubenstein, *Armies of Heaven*, 252-62.

⁷⁹² Raymond D’Aguilers, *Le “Liber,”* 113: ‘Primus ordo est non formidantium tela, vel gladios, nec aliquid genus tormenti. Ordo iste michi similis est. Ego enim veni Ierusalem, gladios et lanceas, fustes, et baculos, demum et crucem non dubitavi. Moriuntur pro me, ego qui pro eis mortuus sum. Et ego sum in eis, et ipsi sunt in me.’

crying out against the injustice happening to me.”⁷⁹³ The greater the distance from the battlefield, however, the further the men are from Christ to the extent that they even become his enemies. The final ranks, in fact are not ranks of soldiers at all, but men who refuse to fight. Therefore, the fourth rank, who hide in their houses, is likened to Christ’s crucifiers, while the fifth, avoiding the battle altogether, correspond to Judas and Pontius Pilate.⁷⁹⁴ Only those willing to throw themselves into the fray merit Christ’s praise and those who refuse are equated with his crucifiers. Peter Bartholomew’s vision exposes his negligible concern for battle tactics and presents a one-dimensional message—those who fight are brave and those who refuse are traitorous cowards.

Jacques’ explanation of rankings of crusade participants preserves an important place for those in supporting roles. For these soldiers, however, the rankings are associated with apocalyptic ages:

Just as the stronger knights are placed in the vanguard of the army and in the rearguard, and in the middle the weaker knights are placed; thus also in the early church God arranged the strongest soldiers, that is the apostles and holy martyrs; in the end similarly, in the time of the Antichrist, there will be very strong knights who undergo the worst tribulations. Whence in Proverbs [15:25] it says: 'And he will make the widow's boundaries firm', that is the Church, bereaved of the visible presence of her spouse: for he will strengthen his last knights in the time of the Antichrist with patience and constancy, as it says in the Apocalypse [1:15]: 'His feet were like brass glowing in a furnace', that is to say, those last faithful ones in the time of the Antichrist will be like brass, because they

⁷⁹³ Raymond D’Aguilers, *Le “Liber,”* 114: ‘Secundus ordo est eorum qui in subsidio prioribus sunt, atque eos a tergo custodiunt, ad quos etiam illi refugere possunt. Hi vero apostolic sunt similes, qui me sequebantur, mecumque manducabant. Tercius ordo est illorum qui lapides et tela prioribus ministrant. Hi vero similes illis sunt qui cum viderent me in cruce positum, de passione mea dolentes, pectora sua percuciebant, iniuriam michi fieri proclamantes.’

⁷⁹⁴ Raymond D’Aguilers, *Le “Liber,”* 114: ‘Quartus quidem ordo est, eorum qui videntes bellum surgere, se domibus intrudunt, atque ad negocia sua convertuntur, non credentes in virtute mea victoriam consistere, sed in hominum improbitate. Hi tales similes illis sunt, qui dixerunt: reus est mortis, crucifigatur, quia se regem fecit, et Dei filium se dixit. Quintus autem ordo est, eorum qui cum belli clamorem audiunt de longe speculantes, tribuunt. Et non solum pericula pro me, verum etiam pro fratribus subire nolunt. Sed sub specie cavendi alios volentes pugnare, vel pugnatoribus arma ministrare, secum ad speculandum invitant. Hique Iude proditori et Pontio Pilato iudici similes sunt.’

will be cooked in the furnace and in the fire of tribulation, and they will be purged just as brass, which while it burns, is adorned with a purer color.⁷⁹⁵

Jacques explains that each soldier has a position suited to his abilities and with special relevance for the last days. This does not mean he considers his audience to be the actual “last knights,” but rather they should aspire to behave like them. The knights of the final age will undergo the hardest trials, which will serve to purify them. Jacques’ image of the soldiers corresponds to the apostles and martyrs of the early church, not for their surety of martyrdom, but for their steadfastness during tribulations. Next, he suggests that the weaker knights mark the second age, characterized by increasing vices in the Church. Therefore, they “are placed in the middle of the army for in that time, during which the filth of vices flows to the middle of the ship just like the backwater that flows to the lowest hull; for we are among those who will reach the end of the age,”⁷⁹⁶ This final comment presumes that his audience is in fact the knights of the second age, who although presently mired in sin, will usher in the final age.

Both Peter Bartholomew as represented by Raymond D’Aguillers and Jacques de Vitry seemed to have viewed the crusade as an expedition rife with apocalyptic significance. The invective found in Raymond d’Aguillers’ account against those not serving on the front line is absent in the sermon of Jacques, who values even the weakest knights, even if he scolds their inclination towards self-preservation:

⁷⁹⁵ Jacques de Vitry, *Vulgares*, XXXVIII: 414 : ‘Sicut in prima parte exercitus et in ulteriori ponuntur milites fortiores, et in medio infirmiores, ita in primitiva Ecclesia fortissimos milites Deus ordinavit, id est apostolos et sanctos martyres; in fine autem, in tempore Antichristi, erunt valde fortes qui maximas sustinebunt tribulationes. Unde in Parab. XV: *Et firmos faciet terminis viduae,*’ id est Ecclesiae, visibili praesentia sponsi viduae: ultimos enim milites suos tempore Antichristi patientia et constantia firmabit, in Apocal. I dicitur: *Pedes eius similes aurichalco, sicut in camino ardente,*’ id est ultimi fideles in tempore Antichristi erunt similes aurichalco, quia camino et igne tribulationis decoquentur, et purgabuntur tanquam aurichalcum, quod dum incenditur, puriori colore decorator.’

⁷⁹⁶ Jacques de Vitry, *Vulgares*, XXXVIII: 414: ‘In medio autem exercitus debiliores ponuntur hoc enim in tempore isto, in quo ad medium navis, quasi ad sentinam sordes defluunt vitiorum; nos enim sumus, in quos fines saeculorum devenerunt.’

Nevertheless, the weak and infirm brothers should not despair, if with a willing spirit they act according to ability of their own strength. Matthew 26[:41]: *For the spirit is willing, but the flesh is weak.* 1 Kings 30 [1 Sam. 30:24], those who remain with the baggage and those who fight in battle receive the same portion, provided that those who stay with the baggage, only guard the baggage, to protect themselves.⁷⁹⁷

Here Jacques suggests equality in the reward, despite inequality in ability or position. While both Jacques and Raymond praise bravery and loyalty, Jacques' sermon reflects an evolution in crusading, which had come to be characterized by greater professionalization and specialization in the thirteenth century. Jacques employs apocalyptic imagery to confirm proper hierarchy and incite his audience to correct behavior appropriate to their position. Although the apocalyptic tradition provided urgency for reform in general, it appears that it was especially necessary for envisioning the role of crusaders in the larger scheme of God's plan. It is difficult to know whether Jacques actually consider his own time as positioned on the edge of a literal apocalypse, or whether he had he abandoned such ideas after the loss of Damietta. Nevertheless, Jacques chose to use such rhetoric for model sermons, showing that he still considered it an effective means to inspire action, even if it could not guarantee victory.

Conclusions

The interpretation of apocalyptic passages provides a valuable avenue for understanding how medieval authors sought to apply the changing notions of crusade and social orders to their conception of both current events and the last days. Jacques de Vitry's histories and sermons reveal the interdependence between reform and crusade, in which moral failings can lead to crusaders' losses and prelates can be ministers of the Antichrist. This investigation has shown

⁷⁹⁷ Ibid.: 'Non tamen desperare debent fratres infirmi et debiles, dum prompt animo faciunt juxta virium suarum possibilitatem. Matth. XXVI: 'Nam spiritus promptus est, licet caro infirma.' I Reg XXX, eamdem portionem recipient, qui ad sacinas remanent, et qui in praetium pugnant, dum modo sacinas custodiant, id est se ipsos qui ad sacinas remanent.'

not only the prominence of apocalyptic thought in Jacques' vision of crusade and reform, but also the perceived efficacy of biblical prophecy to incite audiences to act. Perhaps the flexibility of apocalyptically charged passages, containing multiple roles in the drama of the end times, were especially suitable for preachers addressing an increasingly diverse audience. While the inward focus on the weight of sin looms large, the apocalypse was more than a tool to incite reform, it was also an event, one yet to occur but imminent. Jacques stressed collective responsibility and encouraged action, but he did not neglect to remind his audiences of the larger cosmic plan in which otherworldly forces were at work. As Jacques' use of Revelation 12:14 illustrates, he envisioned a role reserved not only for preachers and crusaders, but also for the dragon of the Apocalypse.

Conclusions

The reforms of the Fourth Lateran Council tied together crusading endeavors, clerical reform, the eradication of heresy, proper ecclesiastical governance, and the management of Christian-Jewish relations into a vision of a global Christendom. But it was men like Jacques de Vitry, those serving as intermediaries, legates, bishops, and preachers, that took these initiatives and tried to communicate them to their audiences, attempting to make reform ideals a reality. Jacques' sermons, copied generation to generation, remain a physical manifestation of these efforts. These sermons had the effect of crystalizing in the imagination of his audience categorical distinctions between orthodoxy and heresy, Christian and infidel, clergy and laity, the saved and the damned. Jacques' own life reveals how he imagined the various components of reform as interconnected and dependent on an equally interrelated society. A reoccurrence component of this vision of a correctly ordered society, was properly defined, proscribed, and performed gender roles.

Jacques and Thomas of Cantimpré's hagiographies show their effort to be understood as "real men" and righteous priests, suggesting continued and varied influence of the legislative mandates on clerical chastity. To this end, Jacques casted preaching in particular, and pastoral responsibilities in general as the most honorable of masculine traits. Thomas of Cantimpré's record of Lutgard's life, points to a distinct reliance on holy women as their special intercessors when struggling with the standards of clerical holiness. These men depended on holy women, but this relationship did not come without risks. Jacques aligned himself with Marie's particular form of charismatic piety, while also attempting to discredit suspicions of improper behavior with these women, behavior he himself was accused of in the *vita* of Lutgard. Instead of

castigating these women as temptresses, Jacques envisioned proper clerical masculinity as dependent on the support of these holy women.

The alliance between clerics and holy women adds to our understanding of the complexities of clerical masculinity, but also offers important insight on their understanding of gender and in the context of violence. The *vita* of Marie Oignies, repeatedly denied the rape of women at the Siege of Liège, suggesting a willed erasure of orally-circulating claims. This discourse on the possible rape of the holy women sheds light on the equivocal notion in medieval discourse: women bore the responsibility to protect their own integrity while remaining the most vulnerable to such violation. Marie's denial of rape in order to assuage the fears of John of Nivelles, however, hints at another attempt to obfuscate clerical failings to live up to another commonly accepted standard of masculinity—the protection of women.

Marie D'Oignies assisted Jacques personally as his inspiration and supporter, but her constructed *vita* also helped him fight heresy. By comparing the orthodox perception of Catharism, especially Cathar women, to the *vita* of Marie Oignies, we saw that this saint's life explicitly addressed the Church's gravest concerns regarding the perceived attraction to heretical groups. Therefore, together with Innocent III's mandated penitential processions and the expanded crusader indulgences, Jacques relied on the examples of contemporary saints, namely Marie, to preach holy war. The *vitae* of the holy women of the Low Countries also reflect their context of holy war. Marie prophesied battles, eagerly desired to participate, interceded for soldiers, and enacted miracles for those dying in battle. Marie's visions and crusading enthusiasm lent charismatic authority to crusading ideology forwarded by Innocent III and his army of crusade preachers. While thirteenth-century papal bulls and crusade sermons spoke of

the fight to regain the Lord's patrimony, using the language of vassalage, the lives holy women were also an important component of crusade propaganda.

Jacques' relationship to these women did not cease when Marie died, nor did he stop writing to his interlocutors in the Low Countries when he departed thousands of miles away to Acre, the capital of the Latin Kingdom of Jerusalem. Rather, epistolary evidence shows that Jacques maintained connections with these regions while away. He sent relics to Oignies from the East, such as his own miters and rings, and a portable altar from the Holy Land. He also wore Marie's relic, heightening the appeal to his moving sermons. These objects reveal how Jacques sought to enhance his rhetoric with material artifacts from his journeys. They created a sense of proximity and urgency—and of sacred belonging—for the crusade that he preached from afar.

When Pope Innocent III ordered men and women alike to support the crusade through liturgical, financial, and penitential activity, Jacques responded by outlining the practical sacrifices and moral purity of the whole community, including men and women, as essential preparations for the Fifth Crusade. He articulated a significant place for women and the family in the otherwise masculinized world of crusade and colonization. Jacques and Oliver of Paderborn's accounts of the capture of the chain tower in Damietta and the disastrous siege, show women's varied and vital roles on the battlefield. The range of women's participation reflected their ambiguous status in medieval society at large. Nevertheless, men and women were invested in policing gender performances, including participation in war. Jacques drew on such an investment when preaching as seen in his experience with the women of Genoa, whose own crusade fervor compelled their husbands' participation.

Jacques' promotion of crusade depended on his view of the end times. His use of apocalyptic texts shows his understanding of each component of Christian society and its

collective responsibility to reconquer and colonize the Holy Land. Jacques embraced apocalyptic passages as opportunities to prescribe proper behavior to all levels of society, and to identify internal and external threats to the Church. This eschatological urgency is heightened in his sermons addressed to crusaders, but Jacques still envisioned each status as instrumental to the success of reform and crusade. Notions of eschatology and apocalypse, therefore, shaped his understanding of these interconnected goals, while also serving as a vehicle to spur his audience to action.

Jacques identified enemies at each battle he participated in, from heretics in Languedoc to Saracens in Damietta, but he repeatedly recognized the most destructive adversary as Latin Christians who placed their individual desires above the Church's collective goals. This recurrent theme in Jacques' writings suggests an attempt to both acknowledge individual pastoral concerns and the needs of changing urban society, while simultaneously proscribing unity and collaboration for the purposes of moral reform and crusading initiatives. But Jacques' own career, evolving from an energetic and zealous preacher to despondent pragmatist, exposes the danger of such a frame of mind. If Jacques embraced his own urgent proscriptions of collective responsibility for crusade, as the sources suggest, then the failures of Damietta meant collective guilt and disappointment. Jacques' departure from Acre, despite the admonitions of Honorius III, clearly points to the impact of such loss. But his writings at the end of his career suggest although downtrodden, he had not lost hope. Jacques' sermons perhaps were not only a way to continue his ardent dedication to pastoral care, but also perhaps a mechanism to cope with his own trauma or regret. Composing hundreds sermons in the twilight of one's years, was perhaps the most fitting penance for such a celebrated, but also disenchanting, preacher.

Bibliography

Manuscripts Cited

Bruxelles, Bibl. Royale MS 7487-91

Bruxelles, Bibl. Royale MS 508

Bruxelles, Bibl. Royale, MS 3772

Bruxelles, Bibl. Royale, II 700

London, British Library, MS Harley 463

Cambridge, Trinity, B 1.1

Cambridge, Parker Library, MS 1611

Ghent, Universiteitsbibliotheek Gent MS 554

Liège, Université de Liège, MS 54

Primary Sources

Augustine of Hippo, *The City of God against the Pagans*. The Loeb Classical Library.

Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 1957.

Barber, Malcolm, and A. K. Bate. *Letters from the East: Crusaders, Pilgrims and Settlers in the 12th-13th Centuries*. Burlington, VT: Ashgate, 2010.

Beauvais, Vincent. *Speculum Historiales*. Monumenta Germaniae Historica, SS, XXIV.

Bernard of Clairvaux. *Sermons on the Canticle of Canticles*. Trans. Ailbe J. Luddy. Ann Arbor, Mich: University Microfilms International, 1978.

Bird, Jessalynn Lea, Edward Peters, and James M. Powell, eds. *Crusade and Christendom: Annotated Documents in Translation from Innocent III to the Fall of Acre, 1187-1291*. Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2014.

- Blesensis, Petrus. *Tractatus Duo: Passio Raginaldi principis Antiochie ; Conquestio de dilatione vie Ierosolimitane*. Ed. R.B.C. Huygens. Turnhout: Brepols, 2003.
- La chronique Liégeoise de 1402*. Edited by Eugène Bacha. Commission Royale d'Histoire: Brussels, 1900.
- The Chronicle of the Third Crusade: A Translation of the "Itinerarium peregrinorum et gesta Regis Ricardi."* Translated by Helen J. Nicholson. Brookfield, VT: Ashgate, 1997.
- Claverie, Pierre-Vincent. *Honorius III et l'Orient (1216-1227) : étude et publication de sources inédites des Archives vaticanes (ASV)*. Boston, Brill: 2013.
- Episcopal Registers, Diocese of Worcester: Register of Bishop Godfrey Giffard, September 23rd, 1268, to August 15th, 1301* (Oxford : James Parker and co., 1902).
- Fulcher of Chartres, *Cronica*. In *The First Crusade: The Chronicle of Fulcher of Chartres and Other Source Materials*. Translated by Edward Peters. Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 1998.
- Gregory VIII, pope, *Audita tremendi*. In *The Crusades: A Reader*, edited by S. J. Allen, and Emilie Amt, 163-64. Peterborough, Ont: Broadview Press, 2003.
- Giraldus of Wales. *The Autobiography of Gerald of Wales*. Edited and translated by Harold Edgeworth Butler. Rochester, NY: Boydell Press, 2005.
- Gerardus of Wales and John J. Hagen. *The Jewel of the Church: A Translation of "Gemma ecclesiastica" by Giraldus Cambrensis*. Leiden: Lugduni Batavorum, 1979.
- Gervase of Premontré, *Epistolae*. In *Sacrae antiquitatis monumenta historica, dogmatica, diplomatica*, edited by C.L. Hugo. Étival, 1725.
- Guilelmus de Podio-Laurentii. *Chronique*. In *Chronica magistri Guillelmi de Podio Laurentii: text édité, traduit et annoté*. Edited by Jean Duvernoy (Paris, Éditions du Centre national

- de la recherche scientifique, 1976); translated in *The Chronicle of William of Puylaurens: The Albigensian Crusade and Its Aftermath. Chronica*. Edited by William Arnold Sibly & Michael D. Sibly. Rochester, NY: Boydell Press, 2003.
- History of the Conquest of England by the Normans*. Translated by Augustin Thierry. London, D. Bogue, 1825.
- Historia foundationis uenerabilis ecclesia beati Nicholai Oigniacensis ac ancillae Christi Mariae Oigniacensis*. Edited by Edmond Martène and Ursin Durand in *Veterum scriptorum et monumentorum historicorum, dogmaticorum, morialium amplissima collectio*, VI (Paris: Montalant, 1729).
- Humbert de Romans. *De dono timoris*. Edited by Christine Boyer, CCCM 218. Turnhout: Brepols, 2008.
- Ibn al-Athīr, ‘Izz al-Dīn, D. *The chronicle of Ibn al-Athīr for the crusading period from al-Kāmil ft’l-ta’rīkh*. Translated by D.S. Richards. Burlington, Vt.: Ashgate, 2006.
- Innocent III, pope, *On the Four Kinds of Marriage*. Translated by Eugene J. Crook. Salzburg: Institut für Angelistik und Amerikanistik Universität Salzburg, 1982.
- Innocent III, pope, *On the Misery of the Human Condition*. Translated by Margret Mary Dietz, and edited by Donald R. Howard. New York: The Bobbs-Merrill Company, Inc., 1969.
- Isidore of Seville’s *Etymologiae IX* in *Woman Defamed and Woman Defended: An Anthology of Medieval Texts*. Edited by Alcuin Blamires; Karen Pratt; C. William Marx, 43-45. New York : Oxford University Press 1992.
- Itinerarium peregrinorum et gesta regis Ricardi*. Translated by William Stubbs. London: Longman, 1864.

- Jacques de Vitry, and Thomas Frederick Crane. *The Exempla or Illustrative Stories from the Sermones vulgares of Jacques de Vitry*. London: Publication for the Folk-lore Society, 1890.
- Jacques de Vitry. *The Historia Occidentalis of Jacques de Vitry: A Critical Edition*. Edited by John Frederick Hinnebusch. Freiburg, Schweiz: Univ.-Verl, 1972.
- Jacques de Vitry. *Historia Orientales*. Edited by Jean Donnadieu. Turnhout: Brepols, 2008.
- Jacques de Vitry. *Jacques de Vitry: Lettres de la Cinquième Croisade*. Translated by G. Duchet-Suchaux. Turnhout, Brepols, 1998.
- Jacques de Vitry. *Lettres de Jacques de Vitry*. Edited by Robert B.C. Huygens. Leiden: B.J. Brill, 1960.
- Jacques de Vitry. *Sermones in epistolas et evangelia dominicalia totius anni*. Edited by Damianus a Ligno. Antwerp, 1575; repr. Venice, 1578.
- Jacques de Vitry. *Sermones Vulgares*. In *Analecta Novissima Spicilegii Solesmensis: Altera Continuatio 2*, edited by Jean Baptiste Pitra. Paris, Tusculana: 1888.
- Jacques de Vitry. *Sermones vulgares vel ad status, Tomus I*. Edited by Jean Longère. CCCM 225. Turnhout: Brepols, 2013.
- Jacques de Vitry. *Vita Marie de Oegnies*. Edited by Robert B.C. Huygens. CCCM 252. Turnhout: Brepols, 2012.
- Jacques de Vitry. *Vita Marie de Oegnies* translated in *Mary of Oignies: Mother of Salvation*. Edited by Anneke B. Mulder-Bakker. Turnhout: Brepols, 2006.
- Joachim of Fiore, *Il Libro delle Figure*. Edited by Leone Tondelli, Marjorie Reeves and Beatrice Hirsch-Reich. Turin: Società Editrice Internazionale, 1953.

- Newman, Barbara and Margot H. King *The Collected Saints' Lives: Christina the Astonishing, Lutgard of Aywières, Margaret of Ypres and Abbot John of Cantimpré*. Edited by Barbara Newman, and Margot H. King. Turnhout: Brepols, 2008.
- Oliver of Paderborn, *Historia Damiatina*. In *Die Schriften des Kölner Domscholasters, späteren Bischofs von Paderborn und Kardinalbischofs von S. Sabina Oliverus*. Edited by Hermann Hoogeweg. Tübingen: Litterarischer Verein in Stuttgart, 1894.
- Peter of les Vaux-de-Cernay, *Hystoria albigensis*. Edited by Pascal Guébin and Ernest Lyon. Paris: Société de l'Histoire de France, 1926-1939.; *The History of the Albigensian Crusade: Peter of les-Vaux-de-Cernay's Historia Albigensis*. Translated by William Arnold Sibly and Michael D. Sibly. Woodbridge: The Boydell Press, 2002.
- Anthony of Padua, *Sermones festiui*, *Library of Latin Texts Online-B*. Brepols, 2017.
- Poncelet, Édouard, ed. *Actes des princes-évêques de Liège. Hugues de Pierrepont: 1200-1229*. Bruxelles: Palais des Académies, 1941.
- Raymond D'Aguilers. *Le "Liber" de Raymond D'Aguilers*. Edited by John Hugh and Laurita L. Hill. Paris: Paul Geuthner, 1969.
- Rupert of Deuz, *Commentaria in duodecim prophetas minores* *Library of Latin Texts Online-A*. Brepols, 2017.
- Roger of Hoveden, *Chronica magistri Rogeri de Houdene*. Edited by William Stubbs. Vol. III. Rolls Series. London, 1870.
- Stephen of Lissac, *Vita Stephani de Mureto*, *PL* 204, col 1073.
- Norman P. Tanner, S.J.; ed. *Decrees of the Ecumenical Councils, vol. 1, Nicaea I to Lateran V*. Washington, D.C.: Georgetown University Press, 1990.
- Thomas of Cantimpré. *Vita Mariae Oigniacensis, Supplementum*. AASS, 23 June, XXV, 572–81.

Thomas of Cantimpré. *Vita Lutgardis Virgine in Aquiriae Brabantia*. AASS, June 16 (1897) 3: 189-210.

Thomas of Cantimpré, *Christina the Astonishing*, in *Thomas of Cantimpré : The Collected Saints' Lives: Abbot John of Cantimpré, Christina the Astonishing, Margaret of Ypres, and Lutgard of Aywières*. Edited by Barbara Newman and Margot H. King. Turnhout, Belgium: Brepols, 2008.

William of Tudela. *Chanson de la croisade albeigoise*. In *The Song of the Cathar Wars: A History of the Albigensian Crusade*. Translated by Janet Shirley. Brookfield, VT: Ashgate, 2000.

Secondary Sources

A Catalogue of the Harleian Manuscripts in the British Museum. London: Eyre and Strahan, 1808-12), II (1808).

Abulafia, David. *Frederick II: a Medieval Emperor*. New York: Oxford University Press, 1988.

Adams, Tracy, "Make Me Chaste and Continent, But Not Yet: A Model for Clerical Masculinity?" In *Masculinities and Femininities in the Middle Ages and Renaissance*, edited by Frederick Kiefer, 1-29. Turnhout: Brepols Publishers, 2010.

Andrea, Alfred J., "Innocent III, the Fourth Crusade, and the Coming Apocalypse." In *The Medieval Crusade*, edited by Susan J. Ridyard, 97-106. Woodbridge, Suffolk: Boydell Press, 2004.

Arnold, John H., "The Cathar Middle Ages as a Methodological and Historiographical Problem." In *Cathars in Question*, edited by Antonio C. Sennis, 53-78. Woodbridge : Boydell & Brewer, 2016.

- Arnold, John H. *Inquisition and Power : Catharism and the Confessing Subject in Medieval Languedoc*. Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2001.
- Ashley, Kathleen, "The Moving Subjects of Processional Performance," In *Moving Subjects. Processional Performance in the Middle Ages and the Renaissance*, edited by Kathleen Ashley and Wim Hiisken, 7-34. Atlanta, GA: Rodolpi, 2001.
- Bachrach, David Steward. *Religion and the Conduct of War, c. 300-1215*. Rochester, NY: Boydell Press, 2003.
- Baldwin, John W. *The Language of Sex: Five Voices from Northern France around 1200*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1994.
- Baldwin John W., "Masters at Paris from 1179-1215: A Social Perspective." In *Renaissance and Renewal in the Twelfth Century*, edited by Robert L. Benson and Giles Constable, 138-72. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press.
- Baldwin, John W. *Masters, Princes, and Merchants; The Social Views of Peter the Chanter & His Circle*. Princeton: Princeton University Press.
- Barber, Malcom. *The Cathars: Dualist Heretics in Languedoc in the High Middle Ages*. New York: Pearson, 2013.
- Barrett, Alexandra. "Language and the Body in Thomas of Cantimpré's *Life* of Lutgard of Aywières." *Cistercian Studies Quarterly* 30 (1995): 339-347.
- Barrow, Julia. *The Clergy in the Medieval World: Secular Clerics, Their Families and Careers in North-Western Europe, c. 800-C. 1200*. Cambridge, United Kingdom: Cambridge University Press, 2015.
- Barstow, Anne Llewellyn. *Married Priests and Reforming Papacy: The Eleventh-Century*. New York: E. Mellen Press, 1982.

- Beattie, Cordelia, "Introduction: Gender, Power, and Difference." In *Intersections of Gender, Religion and Ethnicity in the Middle Ages*, edited by Cordelia Beattie and Kirsten A. Fenton, 1-11. New York : Palgrave Macmillan, 2011.
- Bennett, M. "Military Masculinity in England and Northern France c.1050-c.1225." *Masculinity in Medieval Europe*, edited by D.M. Hadley, 71-88. New York: Longman, 1999.
- Benton, J.F. "Qui étaient les parents de Jacques de Vitry ?" *Le Moyen Âge* 70 (1964), 46-47.
- Feret, Pierre. *La Faculte de Theologie de Paris : Moyen-age*. Vol. 1. Paris: Picard, 1894.
- Berlière, Ursmer. "Jacques de Vitry ses relations avec Abbayes d'Aywieres et Doorezeele." *Revue bénédictine* 25 (1908) : 185-193.
- Berlière, Ursmer, ed. *Monasticon Belge*, I. Liège: Maredsous, 1890.
- Berloiz, Jacques and Marie Anne Polo de Beaulieu. "The Preacher Facing a Reluctant Audience According to the Testimony of Exempla." *Medieval Sermon Studies* 57 (2013): 16-28.
- Bériou, Nicole, "The Right of Women to Give Religious Instruction in the Thirteenth Century." In *Women Preachers and Prophets through Two Millennia of Christianity*, edited by Beverly Mayne Kienzle and Pamela J. Walker, 134-45. Berkeley: University of California Press, 1998.
- Bériou, Nicole, "Les Sermon Latins Après 1200." In *The Sermon. Typologie des Sources du Moyen Age Occidental*, edited by Beverley Mayne Kienzle, 363-447. Turnhout: Brepols, 2000.
- Bériou, Nicole and François-Olivier Touati. *Volúntate Dei leprosus : Les Lépreux entre Conversion et Exclusion aux XII e et XIII e Siècles*. Spolète : Centro italiano di studi sull'alto medioevo, 1991.

- Biller, Peter, "Goodbye to Catharism?" In *Cathars in Question*, edited by Antonio Sennis, 274-304. York: York Medieval Press, 2016.
- Birch, Debra, "Jacques de Vitry and the Ideology of Pilgrimage." In *Pilgrimage Explored*, edited by J. Stopford, 79-93. Woodbridge, Suffolk : York Medieval Press, 1999.
- Bird, Jessalynn Lea, "The Construction of Orthodoxy and the (De)construction of Heretical Attacks on the Eucharist in *Pastoralia* from Peter the Chanter's Circle in Paris." In *Texts and the Repression of Medieval Heresy*, edited by Caterina Bruschi and Peter Biller, 45-61. Woodbridge, Suffolk, UK: York Medieval Press, 2003.
- Bird, Jessalynn Lea. "Crusade and Conversion after the Fourth Lateran Council (1215): Oliver of Paderborn's and James of Vitry's Missions to Muslims Reconsidered." *Essays in Medieval Studies* 21 (2004): 41-66.
- Bird, Jessalynn Lea, "Crusaders' Rights Revisited: The Use and Abuse of Crusader Privileges in Early Thirteenth-Century France." In *Law and the Illicit in Medieval Europe*, edited by Ruth Mazo Karras, 133-48. University of Pennsylvania Press, 2008.
- Bird, Jessalynn Lea. "James of Vitry's Sermons to Pilgrims." *Essays in Medieval Studies* 25 (2008): 81-113.
- Bird, Jessalynn, "Preaching and Narrating the Fifth Crusade: Bible, Sermons and the History of a Campaign." In *The Uses of the Bible in Crusader Sources*, edited by Elizabeth Lapina and Nicholas Morton, 316-340. Boston: Brill, 2017.
- Bird, Jessalynn. "Prophecy and the Crusade(s) of Frederick II." (Forthcoming).
- Bird, Jessalynn Lea, "The Religious Role in a Post-Lateran World: Jacques de Vitry's *Sermones ad Status* and *Historia Occidentalis*." In *Medieval Monastic Preaching*, edited by Carolyn Muessig, 202-29. Leiden: Brill, 1998.

- Bolton, Brenda. "Faithful to Whom: Jacques de Vitry and the French Bishops." *Revue Mabillon* 70:9 (1998): 53-72.
- Bolton, Brenda, "Fulk of Toulouse: The Escape that Failed." In *Church, Society, and Politics*, edited by Derek Baker, 83-93. Oxford: Blackwell, 1975.
- Bolton, Brenda, "Message, Celebration, Offering: The Place of Twelfth- and Early Thirteenth-Century Liturgical Drama as "Missionary Theatre." *Studies in Church History* 35 (1999) : 89-103.
- Bolton, Brenda, "Mulieres Sanctae." In *Women in Medieval Society*, edited by Brenda Bolton and Susan Mosher Stuard, 141-158. Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 1976.
- Boswell, John. *Christianity, Social Tolerance, and Homosexuality: Gay People in Western Europe from the beginning of the Christian Era to the Fourteenth Century*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1980.
- Brenner, Elma, "The Leperous Body in the Twelfth- and Thirteenth-Century Rouen." In *The Ends of the Body : Identity and Community in Medieval Culture*, edited by Jill Ross and Suzanne Conklin Akbari, 239-59. Toronto ; Buffalo: University of Toronto Press, 2013.
- Brenon, Anne, "The Voice of Good Women: An Essay on the Pastoral and Sacerdotal Role of Women in the Cathar Church." In *Women Preachers and Prophets through Two Millennia of Christianity*, edited by Beverly Mayne Kienzle and Walker, 114-133. Berkeley, CA: University of California Press, 1998.
- Brown, Jennifer N. "The Chaste Erotics of Marie d'Oignies and Jacques de Vitry." *Journal of the History of Sexuality* 19.1 (January, 2010): 74-93.

- Brown, Jennifer N. "Marie D'Oignies: The *Vita* of Jacque de Vitry." In *Three Women of Liège: A Critical Edition of and Commentary on the Middle English Lives of Elizabeth of Spalbeek, Christina Mirabilis and Marie d'Oignies*, edited by Jennifer N Brown, 247-288. Turnhout: Brepols, 2008.
- Brown, Peter *The Body and Society*. New York, Columbia University Press, 1988
- Browne, Jocelyn Wogan, "Chaste Bodies: Frames and Experiences." In *Framing Medieval Bodies*, edited by Sarah Kay and Miri Rubin, 24-42. Manchester: Manchester University Press, 1994.
- Brummett, Palmira, *Mapping the Ottomans: Sovereignty, Territory, and Identity in the Early Modern Mediterranean*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2015.
- Brundage, James. *Medieval Canon Law and the Crusader*. Madison: University of Wisconsin Press, 1969.
- Brundage, James A., "Prostitution in the Medieval Canon Law." In *Sisters and Workers in the Middle Ages*, edited by, 79-99. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1989.
- Brundage, James A., "Prostitution, Miscegenation and Sexual Purity in the First Crusade." In *Crusade and Settlement: Papers Read at the First Conference of the Society for the Study of the Crusades and the Latin East, and Presented to R.C. Smail*, edited by P. W. Edbury, 57-65. Cardiff: University College Cardiff Press, 1985.
- Bugge, John. *Virginitas: An Essay in the History of a Medieval Ideal*. Dordrecht. The Hague : Martinus Nijhoff, 1975.
- Burgwinkle, William E. *Sodomy, Masculinity, and Law in Medieval Literature : France and England, 1050-1230* New York: Cambridge University Press, 2004.

- Burns, Robert I. S.J. "Christian-Islamic Confrontation in the West: The Thirteenth-Century Dream of Conversion." *The American Historical Review*, vol. 76, no. 5 (Dec. 1971): 1386-1434.
- Butler, Judith. *Gender Trouble: Feminism and the Subversion of Identity*. New York: Routledge, 1999.
- Bynum, Caroline Walker. *Fragmentation and Redemption: Essays on Gender and the Human Body in Medieval Religion*. New York: Zone Books, 1991.
- Bynum, Caroline Walker. *Holy Feast and Holy Fast: The Religious Significance of Food to Medieval Women*. Berkeley, University of California Press, 1987.
- Bysted, Ane. *The Crusade Indulgence : Spiritual Rewards and the Theology of the Crusades, c. 1095-1216, History of Warfare*. Leiden: Brill, 2015.
- Casparly, Gerald E. *Politics and Exegesis: Origen and the Two Swords*. Berkeley and Los Angeles: University of California Press, 1979.
- Clarke, Peter D. *The Interdict in the Thirteenth Century a Question of Collective Guilt*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2007.
- Clarke, Peter D. "A Question of Collective Guilt: Popes, Canonists and Interdict c. 1140-1250." *Zeitschrift der Savigny-Stiftung für Rechtsgeschichte. Kanonistische Abteilung*, 116 (1999): 104-146.
- Coakley, John W. *Women, Men, and Spiritual Power: Female Saints and Their Male Collaborators*. New York: Columbia University Press, 2006.
- Cole, Penny. *The Preaching of the Crusades to the Holy Land, 1095-1270*. Cambridge, Mass: Medieval Academy of America, 1991.

- Collins, Ross Williams. "The Parish Priest and His Flock as Depicted by the Councils of the Twelfth and Thirteenth Centuries." *The Journal of Religion*, 10.3. (1930): 313-332.
- Constable, Giles. *Attitudes Toward Self-Inflicted Suffering in the Middle Ages*. The Ninth Stephen J. Brademas Sr., Lecture. Brookline, Mass.: Hellenic College Press, 1982, pp. 7-28.
- Cotts, John D., "Monks and Clerks in Search of the *Beata Schola*: Peter of Celle's Warning to John of Salisbury Reconsidered." In *Teaching and Learning in Northern Europe, 1000-1200*, edited by Sally N. Vaughn and Jay Rubenstein, 254-277. Turnhout: Brepols, 2006.
- D'Avray, David. *Medieval Marriage: Symbolism and Society*. New York: Oxford University Press, 2008.
- D'Alverny, Marie-Therese, "Translations and Translators." In *Renaissance and Renewal in the Twelfth Century*, edited by Robert Louis Benson, Giles Constable, Carol Dana Lanham, and Charles Homer Haskins, 421-462. Cambridge, Mass: Harvard University Press, 1982.
- Deploigie, Jeroen and Katrien Heene. "Collete's Travels: The Discursive Framing of the Mobility of Women in Saints' Lives from the Low Countries." *Itinernaria* 8-9 (2009-10): 15-55.
- Dickson, Gary, "The Genesis of the Children's Crusade (1212)." In *Religious Enthusiasm in the Medieval West: Revivals, Crusades, Saints*, edited by , 1-52. Brookfield, VT: Ashgate Variorum, 2000.
- Donnadieu, Jean. *Jacques de Vitry. Entre l'Orient et l'Occident: l'évêque aux trois visages*. Turnhout: Brepols, 2014,

- Donnadieu, Jean. "La representation de l'islam dans l'*Historia orientales*. Jacques de Vitry historien." *Le Moyen Age* 114 (2008): 487-508.
- Duby, Georges. *The Three Orders: Feudal Society Imagined*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1980.
- Eickels, Klaus van. "Gendered Violence: Castration and Blinding as Punishment for Treason in Normandy and Anglo-Norman England." *Gender and History* 16.3 (2004) : 588-602.
- Edbury, Peter W. "Preaching the Crusade in Wales." In *England and Germany in the High Middle Ages*, edited by Alfred Haverkamp, Hanna Vollrath, and Karl Leyser, 221-234. London: German Historical Institute London, 1996.
- Edgington, Susan and Sarah Lambert, *Gendering the Crusades*. New York: Columbia University Press: 2002.
- Elliot, Dyan. *Fallen Bodies: Pollution, Sexuality, and Demonology in the Middle Ages*. Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 1999.
- Elliot, Dyan, "Women and Confession: From Empowerment to Pathology." In *Gendering the Master Narrative: Women and Power in the Middle Ages*, edited by Mary Carpenter Eler and Maryanne Kowaleski, 31-51. Ithaca: Cornell University Press, 2003.
- Elm, Susanna. *Virgins of God : The Making of Asceticism in Late Antiquity*. New York: Clarendon Press: Oxford University Press, 1994.
- Farmer, Sharon, "Low Country Ascetics and Oriental Luxury: Jacques de Vitry, Marie of Oignies, and the Treasures of Oignies." In *History in the Comic Mode : Medieval Communities and the Matter of Person*. Edited by Rachel Fulton Brown and Bruce W Holsinger, 205-222. New York: Columbia University Press, 2007.

- Farmer, Sharon. *Surviving Poverty in Medieval Paris: Gender, Ideology, and the Daily Lives of the Poor*. Ithaca: Cornell University Press, 2002.
- Fenton, Kirsten A. *Gender, Nation and Conquest in the Works of William of Malmesbury*. Woodbridge, UK: Boydell Press, 2008.
- Fenton, Kirsten A., "Gendering the First Crusade in William of Malmesbury's *Gesta Regum Angelorum*." In *Intersections of Gender, Religion and Ethnicity in the Middle Ages*, edited by Cordelia Beattie and Kirsten A. Fenton, 125-139. New York : Palgrave Macmillan, 2011.
- Fenton, Kirsten A. "Ideas and Ideals of Secular Masculinity in William of Malmesbury." *Women's History Review*, 16:5 (2007), 755-772.
- Flanigan, C. Clifford. "The Moving Subject: Medieval Liturgical Processions in Semiotic and Cultural Perspective," In *Moving Subjects. Processional Performance in the Middle Ages and the Renaissance*, edited by Kathleen Ashley and Wim Hiisken, 35-51. Atlanta, GA: Rodolpi, 2001.
- Fletcher, Christopher, "The Whig Interpretation of Masculinity? Honour and Sexuality in Late Medieval Manhood." In *What Is Masculinity?: Historical Dynamics from Antiquity to the Contemporary World*, edited by John Arnold and Sean Brady, 57-75. Hampshire: Palgrave Macmillan, 2011.
- Folda, Jaroslav. *Crusader Art in the Holy Land: From the Third Crusade to the Fall of Acre, 1187-1291*. Cambridge University Press, 2005.
- France, John. *Western Warfare in the Age of the Crusades, 1000–1300*. Ithaca: Cornell University Press, 1999.

- Frazer, Charles A. "The Origins of Clerical Celibacy in the Western Church." *Church History*, 57 (1988): 108-126.
- Funk, Philipp. *Jakob von Vitry: Leben Und Werke* (Hildesheim: Gerstenberg, 1973).
- Gaier, Claude. *Art et Organisation Militaires dans La Principauté de Liège et dans Le Comté de Looz au Moyen Age*. Brussels : Académie Royale de Belgique, 1968.
- Garcia y Garcia, Antonio, "Innocent III and the Kingdom of Castile." In *Pope Innocent III and His World*, edited by John C. Moore, 337-350. Brookfield, VT: Ashgate, 1999.
- Gasposchkin, M. Cecilia. "From Pilgrimage to Crusade: The Liturgy of Departure, 1095–1300." *Speculum* 88, no. 1 (January 2013): 44-91.
- Gasposchkin, M. Cecilia. "The Echoes of Victory: Liturgical and Para-liturgical Commemorations of the Capture of Jerusalem in the West." *Journal of Medieval History* (2014): 1-23.
- Gasposchkin, M. Cecilia. *Invisible Weapons : Liturgy and the Making of Crusade Ideology*. Ithaca: Cornell University Press 2017.
- Gheyn, Van den. *Catalogue des Manuscrits de la Bibliothèque Royale de Belgique*. Brussel: Henri Lamertin 1901-1948.
- Gilchrist, Roberta, "Medieval Bodies in the Material World." In *Framing Medieval Bodies*, edited by Sarah Kay and Miri Rubin, 43-61. Manchester: Manchester University Press, 1994.
- Gillingham, John, "Crusading Warfare, Chivalry, and the Enslavement of Women and Children." In *The Medieval Way of War: Studies in Military History in Honor of Bernard S. Bachrach*, edited by Gregory I. Halfond, 133-151. New York, Routledge: 2015.

- Guidera, Christine, "The Role of the Beguines in Caring for the Ill, the Dying, and the Dead." In *Death and Dying in the Middle Ages*, edited by Edelgard E. Dubruck and Barbara I. Gusick, 51-72. New York: Peter Lang, 1999.
- Hamilton, Bernard. *The Latin Church in the Crusader States : The Secular Church*. London: Variorum Publications, 1980.
- Hamilton, Bernard, "Who were the Patarenos?" In *Hugh Eteriano, Contra Patarenos* edited by Janet Hamilton, 1-23. Boston: Brill, 2004.
- Hayes, Dawn Marie, "Christian Sanctuary and Repository of France's Political Culture: The Construction of Holiness and Masculinity at the Royal Abbey of Saint-Denis 987-1328." In *Holiness and Masculinity in the Middle Ages*, edited by P. H. Cullum and Katherine J. Lewis, 127-142. Cardiff: University of Wales Press, 2005.
- Henaus, Ferdinand. *Histoire du pays de Liège*. Vol. 1. J. Desoer, 1856.
- Ho, Cynthia, "Corpus Delicti : The Edifying Dead in the Exempla of Jacques de Vitry." In *Medieval Sermons and Society: Cloister, City, University*, edited by Jacqueline Hamesse, 203-218. Belgium: Brepols, 1998.
- Hodgson, Natasha, "Constructing Masculine 'Others' in Albigensian Crusade Narratives." Presented at the International Medieval Congress, Leeds, July 5th, 2017.
- Hodgson, Natasha. *Women, Crusading and the Holy Land in Historical Narrative*. Rochester, NY: Boydell Press: 2007.
- Holisinger, Bruce W. *Music, Body, and Desire in Medieval Culture: Hildegard of Bingen to Chaucer*. Stanford, Calif.: Stanford University Press, 2001.
- Holt, Andrew "Between Warrior and Priest: The Creation of a New Masculine Identity during the Crusades." In *Negotiating Clerical Identities: Priests, Monks and Masculinity in the*

- Middle Ages*. Edited by Jennifer D. Thibodeaux, 185-203. Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan, 2010.
- Ilich, Ivan. *In the Vineyard of the Text: A Commentary to Hugh's Didascalicon*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1993.
- Jackson, Deidre, Nigel Morgan and Stella Panayotova, eds. *Illuminated Manuscripts in Cambridge : A Catalogue of Western Book Illumination in the Fitzwilliam Museum and the Cambridge Colleges c.1000-c.1250*. London: Harvey Miller Publishers, 2015.
- Jantzen, Grace. *Power, Gender, and Christian Mysticism*. New York: Cambridge University Press, 1995.
- Jotischky, Andrew, "Penance and Reconciliation in the Crusader States: Matthew of Paris, Jacques de Vitry and the Eastern Christians." In *Retribution, Repentance, and Reconciliation*, edited by Kate Cooper and Jeremy Gregory, 74-83. Rochester, NY: Boydell, 2004.
- Karras, Ruth Mazo. *Common Women: Prostitution and Sexuality in Medieval England*. New York: Oxford University Press, 1998.
- Karras, Ruth Mazo. *From Boys to Men: Formations of Masculinity in Late Medieval Europe*. Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2003.
- Karras, Ruth Mazo, "Thomas Aquinas's Chastity Belt: Clerical Masculinity in Medieval Europe." In *Gender & Christianity in Medieval Europe: New Perspectives*, edited by Lisa M. Bitel and Felice Lifshitz, 52-67. Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2008.
- Kedar, Benjamin Z. *Crusade and Mission: European Approaches toward the Muslims*. Princeton, N.J.: Princeton University Press, 1988.

- Kienzle, Beverly Mayne. *Cistercians, Heresy, and Crusade in Occitania, 1145-1229: Preaching in the Lord's Vineyard*. Rochester, NY: Boydell Press, 2001.
- Kienzle, Beverly Mayne, "Medieval Sermons and Their Performance: Theory and Record." In *Preacher, Sermon, and Audience in the Middle Ages*, edited by Carolyn Muessig, 89-124. Leiden: Brill, 2002.
- Kienzle, Beverly Mayne, "Preaching the Cross: Liturgy and Crusade Propaganda." In *Preaching and Political Society: From Late Antiquity to the End of the Middle Ages*, edited by Franco Morenzoni, 11-46. Turnhout: Brepols, 2013.
- Kienzle, Beverly Mayne, "The Prostitute Preacher: Patterns of Polemic against Medieval Waldensian Women Preachers." In *Women Preachers and Prophets through Two Millennia of Christianity*, edited by Beverly Mayne Kienzle and Walker, PAGES. Berkeley, CA: University of California Press, 1998.
- Kienzle, Beverly Mayne, ed. *The Sermon*. Typologie des Sources du Moyen Age Occidental. Turnhout: Brepols, 2000.
- King, Margot. "The Dove at the Window: The Ascent of the Soul in Thomas de Cantimpré's "Life of Lutgard of Aywières." *Medieval Religious Women* 3.1 (1995): 225-53.
- Kaelber, Lutz. *Schools of Asceticism: Ideology and Organization in Medieval Religious Communities*. University Park: Pennsylvania State University Press, 1998.
- Kolpacoff Deane, Jennifer, "From Case Studies to Comparative Models: Würzburg Beguines and the Vienne Decrees." In *Labels and Libels: Naming Beguines in Northern Medieval Europe*, edited by L. Böhringer, J. Kolpacoff Deane, H. van Engen, 53-82. Turnhout: Brepolis, 2014.

- La Monte, John and Jerome Merton Hubert, trans. *The Wars of Frederick II against the Ibelins in Syria and Cyprus*. New York: Columbia UP, 1936.
- Lambert, Malcolm. *Medieval Heresy Popular Movements from the Gregorian Reform to the Reformation..* 3rd ed. Malden, MA: Blackwell Publishing, 2002.
- Latowsky, Anne A. *Emperor of the World: Charlemagne and the Construction of Imperial Authority, 800-1229*. Ithaca, Cornell University Press, 2013.
- Lauwers, Michel. "Expérience béguinale et récit hagiographique: À propos de la "Vita Mariae Oigniacensis" de Jacques de Vitry (vers 1215)." *Journal des savants* (1989): 61-103.
- Learner, Robert E. *The Feast of Saint Abraham: Medieval Millenarians and the Jews*. Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press. 2001.
- Lees, Clare A. and Gillian R. Overing, "Anglo-Saxon Horizons: Places of the Mind in the Northumbrian Landscape." In *A Place to Believe In: Locating Medieval Landscapes*, edited by Clare A. Lees and Gillian R. Overing, 1-26. University Park, PA: Pennsylvania State University Press, 2006.
- Lejeune, R. "L'éveque de Toulouse, Foulquet de Marseille et la principauté de Liège." *Mélanges Félix Rousseau*. Brussels, 1958, pp. 433-48.
- Linder, Amnon. *Raising Arms: Liturgy in the Struggle to Liberate Jerusalem in the Late Middle Ages*. Turnhout, Belgium: Brepols, 2003.
- Little, Lester K. *Religious Poverty and the Profit Economy in Medieval Europe*. Ithaca, NY: Cornell University Press, 1978.
- Longère, Jean. *Oeuvres Oratoires de Maitres Parisiens au XII Siècle: étude historique et doctrinale*. Paris: Études Augustiniennes, 1975.

- MacEvitt, Christopher. "Processing Together, Celebrating Apart: Shared Processions in the Latin East." *Journal of Medieval History* 43, no.4 (2017): 455-69.
- Maier, Christoph, *Crusade Propaganda and Ideology: Model Sermons for the Preaching of the Cross*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2000.
- Maier, Christoph, "Mass, the Eucharist and the Cross: Innocent III and Relocation of the Crusade." In *Pope Innocent III and His World*, edited by John C. Moore, 351-360. Brookfield, VT: Ashgate, 1999.
- Maier, Christoph. "The Roles of Women in the Crusade Movement: A Survey." *Journal of Medieval History* 30 (2004): 61-82.
- McGinn, Bernard, "*Iter Sancti Sepulchri*: The Piety of the First Crusaders." In *Essays in Medieval Civilization*, edited by Bede Karl Lackner and Kenneth R. Philip, 33-71. Austin, TX, 1978.
- McGinn, Bernard. *Visions of the End: Apocalyptic Traditions in the Middle Ages*. New York: Columbia UP, 1998.
- McLaughlin, Megan. "The Women Warrior: Gender, Warfare, and Society in Medieval Europe." *Women's Studies* 17 (1990): 193-209.
- McNamara, JoAnn, "The Herrenfrage: The Restructuring of the Gender System, 1050-1150." In *Medieval Masculinities*, edited by Clare A. Lees, 3-29. Minneapolis, University of Minnesota Press, 1994.
- Mesley, Matthew, "Episcopal Authority and Gender in the Narratives of the First Crusade." In *Religious Men and Masculine Identity in the Middle Ages*, edited by P.H. Cullum and Katherine J. Lewis, 94-111. Woodbridge: Boydell and Brewer, 2013.

- Mews, Constant J., "Communities of Learning and the Dream of Synthesis." In *Communities of Learning: Networks and The Shaping of Intellectual Identity in Europe, 1100-1500*, edited by Constant J. Mews and John N. Crossley, 109-35. Turnhout: Brepols, 2011.
- Meysman, Stefan. "Degrading the Male Body: Manhood and Conflict in the High-medieval Low Countries." *Gender and History* 28.2 (August 2016): 367-86.
- Miller, Maureen C. *Clothing the Clergy: Virtue and Power in Medieval Europe c. 800-1000*. Ithaca : Cornell University Press, 2014.
- Miller, Maureen C. "Masculinity, Reform, and Clerical Culture: Narratives of Episcopal Holiness in the Gregorian Era." *Church History* 71:1 (2003), 25-52.
- Miller, Tanya Stabler, "Mirror of Scholarly (Masculine) Soul: Scholastics, Beguines, and Gendered Spirituality in Medieval Paris." In *Negotiating Clerical Identities: Priests, Monks and Masculinity in the Middle Ages*. Edited by Jennifer D. Thibodeaux, 238-64. Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan, 2010.
- Moore, John C. *Pope Innocent III (1160/61-1216) : To Root Up and To Plant*. Leiden ; Boston: Brill, 2003.
- Moore, R.I. *The Formation of a Persecuting Society: Power and Deviance in Western Europe, 950-1250*. New York: Blackwell, 1987.
- Moore, R.I. *The War on Heresy: Faith and Power in Medieval Europe*. Cambridge, Mass.: Belknap Press, 2012.
- More, Alison, "Convergence, Conversion, and Transformation: Gender and Sanctity in Thirteenth-Century Liege." In *Representing Medieval Genders and Sexualities in Europe: Construction, Transformation, and Subversion, 600-1530*, edited by Alison More and Elizabeth L'Estrange, 33-48. Burlington, VT: Ashgate, 2011.

- Morris, David, "The Servile Mother: Jerusalem as Woman in the Era of the Crusades." In *Remembering the Crusades: Myth, Image, and Identity*, edited by Nicholas Paul, and Suzanne M. Yeager, 174-194. Baltimore: Johns Hopkins University Press, 2012.
- Mulder-Baker, Anneke B, "Holy Women and Their Biographers in the Thirteenth-Century." In *Living Saints of the Thirteenth Century: The Lives of Yvette, anchoress of Huy; Juliana of Cornillon, Author of the Corpus Christi Feast; and Margaret the Lame, anchoress of Magdeburg*, edited by Anneke B. Mulder-Baker, 1-42. Turnhout, Brepols, 2012.
- Murray, Jacqueline, "The law of sin that is in my members: The Problem of Male Embodiment." In *Gender and Holiness: Men, Women, and Saints in Late Medieval Europe*, edited by Samantha J.E. Riches and Sarah Salih, 9-22. New York: Routledge, 2002.
- Murray, Jacqueline, "Masculinizing Religious Life: Sexual Prowess, the Battle for Chastity and Monastic Identity." In *Holiness and Masculinity in the Middle Ages*, edited by P. H. Cullum and Katherine J. Lewis, 24-42. Cardiff: University of Wales Press, 2005.
- Muessig, Carolyn, "Audience and Preacher: *Ad Status* Sermons and Social Classification." In *Preacher, Sermon and Audience in the Middle Ages*, edited by Carolyn Muessig, 255-276. Leiden: Brill, 2002.
- Muessig, Carolyn, "Audience and Sources in Jacques de Vitry's *Sermones FERIALES ET COMMUNES*." In *Medieval Sermons and Society: Cloister, City, University*, edited by Jacqueline Hamesse, 183-202. Belgium: Brepols, 1998.
- Muessig, Carolyn. *The Faces of Women in the Sermons of Jacques de Vitry*. Toronto: Peregrina Publication, 1999.

- Muessig, Carolyn, "Heaven, Earth and the Angels: Preaching Paradise in the Sermons of Jacques de Vitry." In *Envisaging Heaven in the Middle Ages*, edited by Carolyn Muessig and Ad Putter, 57-72. New York: Routledge, 2007.
- Muessig, Carolyn, "Jacques de Vitry's *Sermones FERIALES ET COMMUNES*: Text and Context." In *De L'Homélie au Sermon: Histoire de la Prédication Médiévale : Actes du Colloque International de Louvain-la-Neuve*, edited by Xavier Hermand and Jacqueline Hamesse, 61-82. Louvain-la-Neuve: Institut d'Études Médiévales de l'Université Catholique de Louvain, 1992.
- Muessig, Carolyn, "Paradigms of Sanctity for Thirteenth-Century Women." In *Models of Holiness in Medieval Sermons: proceedings of the International Symposium (Kalamazoo, 4-7 May 1995)*, edited by Beverly Mayne Kienzle, 85-102. Louvain-la-Neuve : Fédération internationale des Instituts d'études médiévales, 1996.
- Muessig, Carolyn, "Prophecy and Song: Teaching and Preaching by Medieval Women." In *Women Preachers and Prophets through Two Millennia of Christianity*, edited by Beverly Mayne Kienzle and Pamela J. Walker, 146-158. Berkeley: University of California Press, 1998.
- Muessig, Carolyn. "The *Sermones FERIALES ET COMMUNES* of Jacques de Vitry: A Critical Edition of Sermons 10 and 11 on Animals, Part II." *Medieval Sermon Studies* 48 (2004): 45-56.
- Mylod, E.J., Guy Jacob Perry, Thomas W. Smith, and Jan Vandeburie, eds. *The Fifth Crusade in Context : The Crusading Movement in the Early Thirteenth Century*. New York, NY : Routledge, 2017.
- Nakashian, Craig M. *Warrior Churchmen of Medieval England, 1000-1250 : Theory and Reality*. Rochester, NY: Boydell Press, 2016.

- Neal, Derek. *The Masculine Self in Late Medieval England*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2008.
- Nicholson, Helen. *Medieval Warfare: Theory and Practice of War in Europe 300-1500*. New York, NY: Palgrave Macmillan, 2008.
- Nicholson, Helen. "Women's Involvement in the Crusades." In *The Crusader World*, ed. Adrian Boas, 54-67. New York: Routledge, 2016.
- Osten-Sacken, Vera von der, "Dangerous Heretic or Silly Fools? The Name 'Begaine' as a Label for Lay Religious Women of Early Thirteenth-Century Brabant." In *Labels and Libels Naming Beguines in Northern Medieval Europe*, edited by Letha Böhringer, Jennifer Kolpacoff Deane, and H. Van Engen, 99-116. Turnhout: Brepolis, 2014.
- Parish, Helen. *Clerical Celibacy in the West: c.1100-1700*. Farnham: Ashgate, 2010.
- Parker, Matthew E. "Papa et pecunia: Innocent III's Combination of Reform and Fiscal Policy to Finance Crusades." *Mediterranean Historical Review* 32.1 (2017): 1-23.
- Pegg, Mark Gregory. *A Most Holy War : The Albigensian Crusade and the Battle for Christendom*. New York: Oxford University Press, 2008.
- Pegg, Mark Gregory, "The Paradigm of the Catharism; or, the Historians' Illusion." In *Cathars in Question*, edited by Antonio C. Sennis, 21-52. Woodbridge : Boydell & Brewer, 2016.
- Phillips, Johnathan. *The Fourth Crusade and the Sack of Constantinople*. London: Jonathan Cape, 2004.
- Platelle, Henri. *Les exemples du "Livre des abeilles" : Une vision médiévale*. Paris: Brepols, 1997.
- Portnykh, Valentin L. "L'Argument Vassalique' au Service de la Prédication des Croisades en Terre Sainte (fin XIIe-XIIIe siècles)." *Medieval Sermon Studies*, 61.1 (2017): 59-72.

- Powell, James. *Anatomy of a Crusade: 1213-1221*. Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 1986.
- Powell, James, "The Role of Women in the Fifth Crusade." In *The Horns of Hattin: Proceedings of the 2nd Conference of the Society for the Study of the Crusades and the Latin East, Jerusalem and Haifa, 2-6 July, 1987*, edited by B. Z. Kedar, 294-301. Jerusalem: Yad Izhak Ben-Zvi, Israel Exploration Society, 1992.
- Purkis, William J. *Crusading Spirituality in the Holy Land and Iberia, c.1095-c.1187*. Woodbridge, U.K.: Boydell Press, 2008.
- Purkis, William J. "Memories of Preaching for the Fifth Crusade in Caesarius of Heisterbach's *Dialogus miraculorum*." *Journal of Medieval History* 40:3 (2014): 329-45.
- Reeves, Marjorie, *The Influence of Prophecy in the Later Middle Ages: A Study in Joachimism*. Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1969.
- Riches, J.E. and Sarah Salih eds. *Gender and Holiness: Men, Women, and Saints in Late Medieval Europe*. London: Routledge, 2002.
- Richard, Jean, "The *Relatio de Davide* as a source for Mongol History and the Legend of Prester John." In *Prester John, the Mongols, and the Ten Lost Tribes*, edited by Charles F. Beckingham and Bernard Hamilton, 139-158. Brookfield, VT: Variorum, 1996.
- Riley-Smith, Jonathan. *The First Crusade and The Idea of Crusading*. Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 1986.
- Roggema, Barbara, "The Legend of Sergius-Baḥīrā: Some Remarks on its Origin in the East and Traces in the West" in *East and West in the Crusader States: Context, Contacts, Confrontation*, edited by Krijnie Ciggaar and Herman Teule, 107-123. Leuven: Peeters, 1999.

- Ross, Jill, "The Dazzling Sword of Language: Masculinity and Persuasion in Classical and Medieval Rhetoric." In *The Ends of The Body: Identity and Community in Medieval Culture*, edited by Jill Ross and Suzanne Conklin Akbari, 153-174. Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 2013.
- Roukis-Stern, Christina, "The Tale of Two Dioceses: Prologues as Letters in the *Vitae* Authored by Jacques de Vitry and Thomas de Cantimpre." In *Negotiating Community and Difference in Medieval Europe: Gender, Power, Patronage, and The Authority of Religion in Latin Christendom*, edited by Katherine Allen Smith and Scott Wells, 33-48. Leiden: Brill, 2009.
- Rousseau, Constance M., "Home Front and Battlefield: The Gendering of Papal Crusading Policy (1095-1221)." In *Gendering the Crusade*, edited by Susan B. Edgington and Sarah Lambert, 31-44. New York: Columbia University Press, 2002.
- Rubenstein, Jay. *Armies of Heaven: The First Crusade and the Quest for Apocalypse*. New York: Basic Books, 2011.
- Rubin, Miri, "The Person in the Form: Medieval Challenges to Bodily Order." In *Framing Medieval Bodies*, edited by Sarah Kay and Miri Rubin, 100-122. Manchester: Manchester University Press, 1994.
- Sandor, Monica. "The Popular Preaching of Jacques de Vitry." PhD diss., University of Toronto, Centre for Medieval Studies, 1993.
- Sandor, Monica, "Jacques de Vitry- Biography." In *De L'Homélie au Sermon: Histoire de la Prédication Médiévale: Histoire de la Prédication Médiévale: Actes du Colloque International de Louvain-la-Neuve (9-11 juillet 1992)*, edited by Xavier Hermand and

- Jacqueline Hamesse, 53-59. Louvain-la-Neuve: Institut d'Études Médiévales de l'Université Catholique de Louvain, 1993.
- Scheil, Andrew. *Babylon under Western Eyes: A Study of Allusion and Myth*. University of Toronto Press, 2016.
- Schein, Silvia. *Gateway to the Heavenly City : Crusader Jerusalem and the Catholic West (1099-1187)*. Burlington, VT.: Ashgate, 2005.
- Schneyer, J.B. *Repertorium der lateinischen Sermones des Mittelalters, für die Zeit von 1150-1350, III: Autoren: I-J*. Münster, 1971. *Beiträge zur Geschichte der Philosophie und Theologie des Mittelalters. Text und Untersuchungen*, 43/3, p. 179-221.
- Schulenburg, Jane Tibbets. *Forgetful of their Sex: Female Sanctity and Society, ca. 500-1100*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1998.
- Sheppard, Jennifer. *The Buildwas Books: Book Production, Acquisition and Use at an English Cistercian Monastery, 1165-c.1400*. Oxford : Oxford Bibliographical Society, Bodleian Library, 1997.
- Simons, Walter. *City of Ladies Beguine Communities in the Medieval Low Countries, 1200-1565*. Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2001.
- Simons, Walter, "Beginnings: Naming Beguines in the Southern Low Countries, 1200-1250." In *Labels and Libels: Naming Beguines in Northern Medieval Europe*, edited by Letha Böhringer, Jennifer Kolpacoff Deane, and H. Van Engen, 9-52. Turnhout: Brepols, 2014.
- Smith, Damian. *Crusade, Heresy, and Inquisition in the Lands of the Crown of Aragon (c. 1167-1276)*. Boston: Brill, 2010.
- Smith, Katherine Allen. "Saints in Shining Armor: Martial Asceticism and Masculine Models of Sanctity, ca. 1050-1250." *Speculum* 83.3 (July 2008): 572-602

- Smith, Katherine Allen. *War and the Making of Medieval Monastic Culture*. Rochester, NY: Boydell Press, 2011.
- Smoller, Laura Ackerman. *History, Prophecy, and the Stars : The Christian Astrology of Pierre D'Ailly, 1350-1420*. Princeton, N.J.: Princeton University Press, 1994.
- Snijders, Tjamke. *Manuscript Communication: Visual and Textual Mechanics of Communication in Hagiographical Texts from the Southern Low Countries 900-1200*. Turnhout, Brepols, 2015.
- Strickland, Debra Higgs. *Saracens, Demons, and Jews: Making Monsters in Medieval Art*. Princeton: Princeton University Press, 2003.
- Sweetman, Robert, "Thomas of Cantimpré: Performative Reading and Pastoral Care." In *Performance and Transformation: New Approaches to Late Medieval Spirituality*, edited by Mary A. Suydam and Joanna E. Ziegler, 133-167. New York: St. Martin's Press, 1999.
- Sweetman, Robert, "Thomas of Cantimpré, *Mulieres Religiosae*, and Purgatorial Piety: Hagiographical *Vitae* and the Beguine 'Voice.'" In *A Distinct Voice: Medieval Studies in Honor of Leonard E. Boyle, O.P.*, edited by Jacqueline Brown and William P. Stoneman, 606-628. University of Notre Dame Press, 1997.
- Vanderputten, Steven. *Monastic Reform as Process Realities and Representations in Medieval Flanders, 900-1100*. Ithaca: Cornell University Press, 2013.
- Tessera, Miriam Rita, "Philip Count of Flanders and Hildegard of Bingen: Crusading Against the Saracens or Crusading against Deadly Sin." In *Gendering the Crusades*, edited by Susane B. Edgington and Sarah Lambert, 77- 93. Cardiff: University of Wales Press, 2001.

Rita Tekippe, "Pilgrimage and Procession: Correlations of Meaning, Practice, and Effects." In *Art and Architecture of Late Medieval Pilgrimage in Northern Europe and the British Isles*, edited by Sara Blick and Rita Tekippe, 1: 693-751. Boston: Brill, 2005.

Thibodeaux, Jennifer D. *The Manly Priest: Clerical Celibacy, Masculinity, and Reform in England and Normandy, 1066-1300*. Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2015.

Tolan, John. *Saint Francis and the Sultan: The Curious History of a Christian-Muslim Encounter*. New York: Oxford University Press, 2009.

Tolan, John. *Saracens: Islam in the Medieval European Imagination*. New York: Columbia University Press, 2002.

Tosh, John, "The History of Masculinity: An Outdated Concept." In *What Is Masculinity?: Historical Dynamics from Antiquity to the Contemporary World*, edited by John Arnold and Sean Brady, 17-34. Hampshire: Palgrave Macmillan, 2011.

Twyman, Susan, "The *Romana Fraternitas* and Urban Processions at Rome." In *Pope, Church, and City: Essays in honour of Brenda M. Bolton*, edited by Frances Andrews, Christoph Egger, and Constance M. Rousseau, 205-21. Boston, MA: Brill, 2004.

Tyerman, Christopher. *God's War a New History of the Crusades*. Cambridge, Mass.: Belknap Press, 2008.

Hoven, Birgit van den. *Work in Ancient and Medieval Thought: Ancient Philosophers, Medieval Monks and Theologians and Their Concept of Work, Occupations and Technology*. Amsterdam: J.C. Gieben, 1996.

- Vandeburie, Jan. “‘A Scabby Goat?’ A View of the Student Life in Paris c. 1200.” Presented at the Medieval and Early Modern Festival, University of Kent, Canterbury, June 17-18, 2017.
- Vandeburie, Jan, “‘*Consenscientis mundi die vergente ad vesperam*’: James of Vitry’s *Historia Orientalis* and Eschatological Rhetoric after the Fourth Lateran Council.” In *The Uses of the Bible in Crusader Sources*, edited by Elizabeth Lapina and Nicholas Morton, 341-360. Boston: Brill, 2017.
- Vandeburie, Jan. “‘*Sancte fidei omnino deiciat*’: Ugolino dei Conti di Segni's Doubts and Jacques de Vitry's Intervention.” *Studies in Church History* 52 (June 2016): 87-10.
- Waters, Clarie M. *Angels and Earthly Creatures: Preaching, Performance, and Gender in the Later Middle Ages*. Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2004.
- Wei, Ian P. *Intellectual Culture in Medieval Paris : Theologians and the University, c.1100-1330*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2012.
- Welch, Megan Cassidy. “‘O Damietta’: War, Memory and Crusade in Thirteenth-Century Egypt.” *Journal of Medieval History* 40:3 (2014): 346-60.
- Welch, Megan Cassidy, “Order, Emotion, and Gender in the Crusade Letters of Jacques de Vitry.” In *Gender and Emotions in Medieval and Early Modern Europe: Destroying Order, Structuring Disorder*, edited by Susan Broomhall, 35-49. New York: Routledge, 2016.
- Whalen, Brett. *Dominion of God Christendom and Apocalypse in the Middle Ages*. Cambridge, Mass: Harvard University Press, 2009.
- Young, Spencer E. *Scholarly Community at the Early University of Paris: Theologians, Education, and Society, 1215-1248*. New York: Cambridge University Press, 2014.

Zier, Mark A. "Sermons of the Twelfth Century Schoolmasters and Canons." In *The Sermon*.

Typologie des Sources du Moyen Age Occidental, edited by Beverley Mayne Kienzle,

325-351. Turnhout: Brepols, 2000.

Vita

Lydia Marie Walker grew up in Sparks, Nevada, before her family moved to Lordstown, Ohio where she completed high school. She earned her BA (*summa cum laude*) at Cornerstone University in Grand Rapids, Michigan where she majored in History and minored in English and Greek. She continued her education at Western Michigan University, earning an MA in Medieval Studies with her thesis entitled, “Riccoldo da Monte Croce’s *Ad Nationes Orientales: A Study of a Fourteenth-Century Dominican Missionary Manual*,” and MA in Comparative Religion. She was also awarded the All-University Graduate Research and Creative Scholar award in 2011. She then went on to her doctoral studies in History at the University of Tennessee-Knoxville. During this time, she was awarded a Fulbright scholarship, spending a year in Belgium based at Ghent University, followed by a year with a Humanities Center Fellowship at the University of Tennessee, where she completed her PhD in History May 2018. Her work examines Latin Christian polemics and what they reveal about the formation of gender and religious identity in the context of thirteenth-century crusading movements. Her research interests include religious identity, gender and crusade, violence, and preaching in the twelfth and thirteenth centuries.