View metadata, citation and similar papers at core.ac.uk
brought to you by CORE
provided by UNM Open Journals Portal (The University of New Mexico)

# Book Reviews

*Ruidoso: The Carmon Phillips Collection*. By Lyn Kidder. Images of America series. (Charleston, S.C.: Arcadia Publishing, 2014. 127 pp. 200 halftones. $21.99 paper, ISBN 978-1-4671-3185-8.)

*Lincoln*. By Ray John de Aragon. Images of America series. (Charleston, S.C.: Arcadia Publishing, 2013. 127 pp. 195 halftones, map, bibliography. $21.99 paper, ISBN 978-1-4671-3056-1.)

*Towns of Lincoln County*. By John LeMay. Images of America series. (Charleston, S.C.: Arcadia Publishing, 2010. 127 pp. 203 halftones, map, bibliography, index. $21.99 paper, ISBN 978-0-7385-7908-5.)

*Ruidoso and Ruidoso Downs*. By Lyn Kidder and Herb Brunell. Images of America series. (Charleston, S.C.: Arcadia Publishing, 2009. 127 pp. 186 halftones, bibliography. $21.99 paper, ISBN 978-0-7385-7069-3.)

For most historians, Lincoln County history is largely the history of the Lincoln County War (LCW). In recent years books about the county's towns and residents have begun to appear. The Images of America local history series has made a substantial contribution to Lincoln County by producing four photographic books of the area.

*Towns of Lincoln County* is the broadest, covering Lincoln, the Hondo Valley, and "Mountain Villages and Mining Towns" through its hodgepodge of images. Lincoln itself garners the most attention. In "Mountain Villages and Mining Towns," White Oaks, Carrizozo, Corona, and Capitan are included, although

Capitan is slighted. Significant attention is given to Peter Hurd of San Patricio but none to internationally known Chicano artist Luis Jimenez of Hondo. Most photographs are from the Historical Society of Southeast New Mexico in Roswell, ignoring those at the Lincoln County Historical Society in Lincoln. Many resources went unused such as Frank Magnan's *Ruidoso Country* (1994).

*Lincoln* is also a welcome addition. It includes a chapter on the arrival of European Americans, the LCW, a potpourri chapter, and then a focus on the Billy the Kid legend in comic books, children's books, and films. Although it includes a bibliography, no book by Frederick Nolan is mentioned, even his *The West of Billy the Kid* (1998), the most complete photographic record of the LCW. *Lincoln* includes more Hispanos and Hispanas than the other books, although mostly from the post-1870 era. Although he says Lincoln grew and prospered after the LCW, his photos do not treat Lincoln as a town after 1880 (p. 8). Likewise, not a single caption tells us where his photographs can be found and too often approximate dates of photos are missing. The book also includes alleged new photos of Billy.

*Ruidoso and Ruidoso Downs* provides the best history of the group. Organized around key events of the development of these two towns, it was written by Lyn Kidder and long-time local photographer Herb Brunell, who lived much of this history. Over a decade ago, Brunell amassed numerous photographs from locals. Likewise, the authors benefitted from the collection of Carmon Phillips, the most important Lincoln County photographer in the twentieth century. Although they too failed to use the photographic collection of the Lincoln County Historical Society, they did at least utilize a wide array of collections. Unfortunately, the personal collections of the towns' Hispana/os have not been accessed.

*Ruidoso, The Carmon Phillips Collection* is a sampling of some of Phillips's 6,000 photographs. Donated to the Hubbard Museum of the American West in Ruidoso Downs, about half have now been scanned and it is from these that the book's photographs were selected. Locals helped identify and date Phillips's unlabeled photographs. This book is both a history of Ruidoso and Ruidoso Downs as well as a history of a major southeastern New Mexico photographer. Phillips's excellent work as a photographer is revealed. The authors also benefited from the Hubbard Museum's exhibit on Phillips organized by David Mandel, Adele Karolik, and Philip Collins, which opened in fall 2013. The book includes a chapter on the Old Mill, the oldest structure in Ruidoso, dating back to 1868, and which the Phillips family refurbished after World War II and ran as a tourist operation. The book also features chapters on the rise of the skiing industry and town businesses. The text helps to explain the historical development of the towns.

Taken together these books constitute a major advance in the history of Lincoln County, moving us away from a narrow focus on the LCW and the town of Lincoln. Like the resource book *Lincoln County Tells Its Stories* (2012) and Roberta Haldane's book on White Oaks, a more complete picture of the county is finally emerging.

*Cynthia E. Orozco*
*Eastern New Mexico University, Ruidoso*

---

*Pueblo Indians and Spanish Colonial Authority in Eighteenth-Century New Mexico*. By Tracy L. Brown. (Tucson: University of Arizona Press, 2013. viii + 237 pp. 13 halftones, maps, tables, notes, bibliography, index, about the author. $55.00 cloth, ISBN 978-0-8165-3027-4.)

This book is a study of the Pueblo communities under Spanish rule in the eighteenth century. Written with clarity and conviction (although the author has a tendency for repetitiveness when espousing her arguments), the four main chapters of the book are dedicated to discussing the ways in which Pueblo politics, economics, spirituality, and intimate relations changed after the Spanish conquest. According to Brown, the Spanish invasion did not lead to a radical loss of Pueblo cultural practices (the author makes a very good point when she wonders whether the Pueblos saw the arrival of the Spaniards as the most important event in Pueblo history). Brown believes that Pueblo cultural survival was due to the fact that state power in New Mexico was weak. However, one could argue that this was also the case in many, if not most, areas of the Spanish Empire in the New World. As in New Mexico, *alcaldes mayores* and *doctrineros*, or missionaries, were the only representatives of Spanish authority who the immense majority of Natives under Spanish rule ever saw. In this regard, despite its remoteness and frontier character, the situation in New Mexico does not seem to be all that unique.

Although this study is mostly based in documentary evidence from the published Spanish Archives of New Mexico, the author also makes very good use of archaeological studies of pre-contact Pueblo communities, especially for comparative purposes between the pre-colonial and colonial periods. Brown's understanding of Pueblo reactions to Spanish invasion and colonization is nuanced and sophisticated. Her work contradicts previous studies from the 1960s and 1970s which argued that Pueblo culture was "frozen into extreme conservatism" as a result of contact. Brown's study convincingly shows that, in reality, Pueblo people incorporated a variety of Spanish beliefs and practices that contributed to modifying Pueblo culture and society. However, like the most recent

historiography of the encounter of Europeans and Native Americans, Brown's study contends that the Spanish failed to completely impose their values and practices upon the Pueblo people. The Pueblos were able to pick and choose which values they were willing to incorporate into their own culture. For example the system of rule that the Spanish imposed upon Pueblo communities was simply incorporated into the traditional Pueblo system of governance. Caciques and their assistants in reality continued to govern Pueblo communities, because they would direct the actions of the Native governors installed by the Spaniards. Likewise, while the Spanish presence brought a hardening of Pueblo class and gender divisions, Spanish class and gender notions were not adopted indiscriminately by the Pueblos. Although Spanish authorities tried to impose their patriarchal beliefs and their ideas of what constituted proper marriage, Brown concludes that they were only partially successful.

Spanish colonization also brought an increase in labor demands and Brown suggests that, by and large, the Pueblos were able to accommodate these new demands by using traditional mechanisms. In regard to land ownership, she observes that "Pueblo land tenure practices were not severely disrupted or destroyed by Spanish contact, as occurred in so many other areas in the New World" (p. 99). However, the contrast that the author establishes between what happened in New Mexico and in other areas under Spanish control is not convincing, not only because Brown bases her understanding of what happened in those areas on just one study which is, in reality, a study of gender ideologies in colonial Cuzco, but also because the Pueblo case seems very similar to what happened to many indigenous communities under Spanish rule. Spanish authorities envisioned Indian communities being sustained by communal landholding and this guaranteed the survival of Indian landownership.

The author has made excellent use of the sources available in the New Mexican archives to convey a clear sense of the status of Pueblo people under Spanish rule, but this study would have been more complete if the author had made use of the documentation from the Archives of the Indies in Seville, Spain. The richness of this repository would have surely helped expand and elaborate upon many of the arguments advanced in this book.

*Alejandro Cañeque*
*University of Maryland*

*The Art and Legacy of Benardo Miera y Pacheco: New Spain's Explorer, Cartographer, and Artist.* Edited by Josef Diaz. (Santa Fe: Museum of New Mexico Press, 2014. 151 pp. 51 color plates, 16 halftones, maps, selected bibliography, credits, index. $34.95 cloth, ISBN 978-0890-13585-3.)

In this well-illustrated book, Josef Diaz brings together five authors who draw an intriguing picture of the life of Benardo Miera y Pacheco, a Spaniard who made his way to New Spain, ultimately settling in New Mexico and producing maps, altar screens, and devotional images. Following an introduction by the editor, Thomas Chavez assembles an overview of Miera's life, explaining that other than his birth in north central Spain in 1713, little is known about Miera's early life. By the early 1740s, however, records indicate that he was living in northern Mexico, married, the father of two sons, and a captain in the militia. By 1754 he had moved to Santa Fe, New Mexico, and was working under the governor, producing regional maps and other artwork. Miera's contributions to the cartography of New Mexico are analyzed comprehensively in Dennis Reinhartz's chapter. Miera created maps of the New Mexico region between 1747 and 1779, with twelve maps now assigned to his authorship. This research is important for understanding the evolution of the cartography of New Mexico.

Next, Charles Carrillo examines Miera's documentation of the location and cultural characteristics of indigenous groups. This information appears as illustrative images on his maps and Carrillo demonstrates the accuracy of Miera's ethnographic work by comparing his depictions with nineteenth-century photographs of the same indigenous groups. Miera's artistic skills were evident in other formats and media as well. Robin Farwell Gavin and Donna Pierce evaluate Miera's *retables* (altar screens) one of which is extant in the sanctuary of Cristo Rey Church in Santa Fe. Using comparative visual analysis, the authors speculate that, as a result of his early experiences in Spain—perhaps viewing local church art—Miera's work adapted international Baroque style into the evolving religious art style of New Mexico. Continuing this stylistic discussion in the next chapter, William Wroth examines eighteenth- and nineteenth-century *santeros* (devotional images). Tracing broad regional influences, he discerns Miera's limited direct influence on later artists of these distinctive art forms.

The inclusion of a list of illustrations as well as a one-or-two page outline of Miera's life and major works would have strengthened this book and made it easier to follow the authors' discussions and arguments. Nevertheless, the authors provide informative overviews and appraisals of Miera's work for the general reader and identify opportunities for further scholarly research on the history of cartography and visual art production of eighteenth-century New Mexico. *The Art and Legacy of Benardo Miera y Pacheco* contributes to the understanding

of the impact and legacy of Miera's work and offers significant insights into the ebb and flow of the life of an immigrant from Spain who, while living at the supposed periphery of eighteenth-century New Spain, was at the center of an emerging and vibrant visual culture of New Mexico.

*Magali Carrera*
*University of Massachusetts, Dartmouth*

---

*Taos: A Topical History*. Edited by Corina A. Santistevan and Julia Moore. (Santa Fe: Museum of New Mexico Press in association with the Taos County Historical Society, 2013. 349 pp. 36 halftones, resources for Taos history, about the contributors, index. $34.95 cloth, ISBN 978-0-89013-582-2, $24.95 paper, ISBN 978-0-89013-597-6.)

*Taos: A Topical History*, as its subtitle suggests, is not a comprehensive survey. The book's essays focus primarily on political history and less on the social, economic, and cultural history of Taos, with the greatest emphasis on the eighteenth and nineteenth centuries. The topics covered include the following: the geologic and archaeological prehistory of the Taos area; trails, land grants, and the trade economy; sheepherding, weaving, and bison hunting; warfare and uprisings (the 1847 Revolt, the Battle of Cieneguilla, the Taos Mutiny of 1855, Taos in the American Civil War); Taos Pueblo and acequia culture; religious practices and religious conflicts; sacred places and ceremonies; and (very cursorily) the twentieth-century Taos art community and writings about Taos.

Overall, the book serves as a good introduction for those unfamiliar with these aspects of Taos history, particularly in terms of helping readers understand why Taos has spearheaded so many of the political and religious revolts in New Mexico history. However, there is too much space allotted to political history and warfare and some repetition of admittedly key historic personages and events that could have been eliminated. As is true of most anthologies of essays written by multiple authors, some of the essays are standouts and others are not. Most of the essays are descriptive; a few provide analyses that allow the reader to understand the contesting nature of historical events and perspectives and the complexities of the interactions of Taos's predominant cultures of Pueblos, Hispanos, and other Native groups.

Here are some of the standouts: Charles C. Hawk's "Caminos Antiguos: Trails into the Taos Valley" is an eye-opening presentation of the historic challenges presented by Taos's difficult terrain; Elizabeth Cunningham's and Skip Miller's "Taos's Early Trade Economy" is a fascinating study of the economic interactions of the Plains Indians that converged on Taos with the Pueblos and

the Spanish government, and the trade fairs that made Taos such an important center of economic exchange in the eighteenth and early nineteenth centuries; Alberto Vidaurre's "1847: Revolt or Resistance?" uses revisionist scholarship to make a convincing case for understanding the Pueblo and Hispano revolt against the U.S. government's takeover of New Mexico as a form of legitimate resistance; Vernon Lujan's "Taos Pueblo: A Personal Journey Through Time" is a moving testimony of his family's work and life experiences, both inside and outside the pueblo, over the course of the twentieth century; and John Nichols's "'Sin Agua, No Hay Vida': Acequia Culture" is a lively and insightful memoir about his travels from innocence to experience as a member of his local acequia association that provides a refreshing examination of the water wars in northern New Mexico history. The book also provides a useful bibliography.

*Lois P. Rudnick*
*University of Massachusetts, Boston*

---

*River of Hope: Forging Identity and Nation in the Rio Grande Borderlands.* By Omar S. Valerio-Jiménez. (Durham, N.C.: Duke University Press in cooperation with the William P. Clements Center for Southwest Studies, Southern Methodist University, 2013. xiv + 369 pp. 19 halftones, maps, 10 tables, notes, bibliography, index. $99.95 cloth, ISBN 978-0-8223-5171-9, $26.95 paper, ISBN 978-0-8223-5185-6.)

Omar Valerio-Jiménez's important *River of Hope: Forging Identity and Nation in the Rio Grande Borderlands* presents a dramatic history of the Tamaulipas-Texas border region. The book begins with the founding of the Colonia de Nuevo Santander in the mid-eighteenth century and extends through the crucial decades after 1848, when the Treaty of Guadalupe-Hidalgo ceded the land north of the river to the United States. Valerio-Jiménez writes a rich narrative about a society with fissures created by gender and social inequities, colonialism, national policies, and local concerns.

The book emphasizes how three states and local residents linked their hopes to the waterway. The Rio Grande towns of Reynosa, Camargo, Mier, Revilla, Laredo, and Refugio (renamed Matamoros in 1826)—built between 1750 and the 1820s—formed an intricate part of the Spanish plan to colonize the forty-nine indigenous groups in the region. The colonial state plotted missions and towns, but mercantile policies limited river trade. In the Mexican era the government supported free trade and constructed a major port in 1823. The port at Matamoros connected the region to European and American markets—smuggling flourished.

Once Texas became an independent nation, the area was disputed between nations. It became a bi-national space crossed by the river in 1848. As early as 1850, cities had grown on the Texas side, opposite the colonial and Mexican-era towns and cities that existed. The area developed its own floating population of workers who moved back and forth over the border. Bi-national trade became embedded in the region's economy.

North of the Rio Grande, Tejanos expected to exercise their full rights of citizenship, yet many lost land and political power where Anglo Americans gained sovereignty. Tejanos' experiences depended, to some degree, on the class and gender positions they held. Valerio-Jiménez carefully delineates the daily resistance Tejanos used to protest and subvert the multiple political and legal exclusions they experienced from the American judicial and economic systems. In 1859 Juan Cortina, a Tejano elite, engaged in civil protest and organized others to act against the civil injustices and the policies that produced land loss. The movement enabled Tejanos to express their dashed expectations concerning American citizenship. Cortina became a Borderlands hero.

The book emphasizes the rapid emergence of border identities focused on local place. In the late colonial era, people identified with their town, and then with other river towns, the province of Nuevo Santander, other northern provinces, and finally with New Spain. As Tejanos engaged in the political and social life of the United States, new identities also emerged among those who embraced their status as U.S. citizens, Mexican citizens, and proud *fronterizos* (Borderlands residents).

Valerio-Jiménez's study makes a significant contribution to a notable body of work that represents the border through transnational histories. The book offers an excellent analysis of the familial, social, and historic ties that have defined this Borderland. It also identifies the nineteenth-century origins of Tejanos' civil rights and labor struggles that, in some cases, continue to the present.

*Lisbeth Haas*
*University of California, Santa Cruz*

---

*Making Aztlán: Ideology and Culture of the Chicana and Chicano Movement, 1966–1977*. Juan Gómez-Quiñones and Irene Vásquez. Contextos series. (Albuquerque: University of New Mexico Press, 2014. xxxii + 460 pp. 28 halftones, chronology, notes, bibliography, index. $45.00 paper, ISBN 978-0-8263-5466-2.)

The Chicana and Chicano Movement has long been a subject of fruitful scholarship and theoretical study spawning hundreds of monographs, journal articles,

reminiscences, biographies, films, conference papers, and lectures. Remarkably, this book is the first to comprehensively analyze the exciting and complex ideas and forces in the turbulent years that were the height of this movement. *Making Aztlán* is a master work co-authored by one of the pioneers of Chicana/o history, Juan Gómez-Quiñones. It is not a narrative history but a theoretical, in-depth critical view of the many currents that flowed out of the youthful energies of the 1960s and 1970s.

*Making Aztlán* is a nuanced and highly sophisticated study of the Chicana and Chicano Movement (CCM in their shorthand). Fundamentally, as they say in the preface, the authors see this movement as "an affirmation of humanist culture in the broadest sense of the phrase" (p. xxiii). In this vein the authors develop a number of paradigms and theories that help us to understand the heterogeneous ideological, cultural, and socio-economic elements that were the CCM. Fundamentally the authors see the CCM as both a civil rights movement and a movement for social and cultural affirmation.

One important concept forming the book is that of *conyuntura*, the coming together of many forces, ideas, traditions, organizations, individuals, and cultures. The heterogeneous and diverse result reflected a wide spectrum of political and ideological orientations and identities that sometimes appeared in conflict or in contradiction. One example of this is the cultural nationalist opposition to the Marxist-inspired CCM factions. The authors refuse to accept easy stereotypes and categories and are sensitive to the nuances and complications of reality. Writing about the Chicana movement, for example, the tendency has been to describe the split in pro-feminist vs. traditionalist camps. The authors delve into the documents and find no easy characterization that truly captures the Chicana movement.

There are thirty-nine chapters in this book and each one is a critical examination of an aspect of the movement: the struggle over identities, organized labor including the United Farm Workers (UFW), the land movement in New Mexico, the student movement, the police, the Catholic Church, art, music, dance, film, literature, electioneering, and many other aspects. The kaleidoscope of topics goes far beyond the simplistic textbook summary of the traditional four big leaders of the movement: Cesar Chavez, Reies Tijerina, Corky Gonzales, and José Angel Gutiérrez. In fact the outstanding thing about this book is that it is primarily about the thousands of Chicanas and Chicanos who struggled to achieve recognition, respect, and civil rights.

Because the book is not just a theoretical analysis but also a critical assessment of the movement, the authors are not afraid to note the failures and weaknesses of organizations, tactics, and leadership. The major shortcoming they see was "the lack of an explicitly and widely accepted critique of the dominant

society" (p. 337). The authors criticize many activists' skepticism of intellectuals and ideological positions which in turn led to the acceptance of subjective and inexperienced movement leaders. The ultimate weakness was the gradual distancing of some CCM activists from the struggles of the masses of *la raza*, a kind of elitism. Nevertheless the authors are convinced that for all its diversity, and apparent contradictions and confusions, the Chicana and Chicano Movement led to dynamic and positive changes that are still being felt. The CCM evolved, they believe, from its idealistic, male-centered emphasis to more ideological and female-led sensibilities and organizations.

Finally, this book cannot be read without doing some homework. It presupposes a basic knowledge of the Chicana and Chicano Civil Rights Movement and challenges the reader to re-envision traditional tropes about the past and future. In the end this is a major contribution, not only of the book, but of the movement itself.

*Richard Griswold del Castillo*
*San Diego State University*

---

*Indian Resilience and Rebuilding: Indigenous Nations in the Modern American West*. By Donald L. Fixico. The Modern American West series. (Tucson: University of Arizona Press, 2013. xi + 284 pp. 18 halftones, maps, notes, bibliography, index, about the author. $65.00 cloth, ISBN 978-0-8165-1899-9, $30.00 paper, ISBN 978-0-8165-3064-9.)

In his latest assessment of Indian and non-Indian relations, Donald Fixico purports to "address the [so-called] Indian problem, but as part of a greater story of nation rebuilding, and Indians reinventing themselves as an elemental part of the process" (p. 5). Adaptation is the operative term, and the author frames this process by examining the development of what he perceives as distinctly tribal political economies that have formed in conjunction with, and are circumscribed by, a nation-building process wherein "postmodern tribal governments look very much like those of the U.S. government and its constituent state governments" (p. 7). The book consists of two thematic divisions—resilience and rebuilding—through which Fixico attempts to trace the evolution of these adaptive strategies that he sees as characterizing indigenous creative existence in the twenty-first century.

Resilience, as described in the first four chapters, entails a history of American Indian survival against federal policies aimed at eradicating or radically altering their political existence. As an Oklahoma Seminole-Creek citizen, Fixico is personally motivated to chronicle the devastating impact of the allotment

policy, which had particularly profound implications for those Indians removed from the east in the first half of the nineteenth century. Yet, land alienation and the restrictions of smaller reservations ultimately catalyzed a deeper connection to homeland for some Indians, and as compulsory boarding schools sought to aggressively extinguish tribal culture, certain individuals used the tools of western education to forge new concepts of indigenous patriotism. Fixico argues that subsequent policies of tribal reorganization, termination, and relocation were predictable for some Indians whose cyclical worldviews prepared them for thinly disguised efforts to recycle old government policies of assimilation.

The process of nation rebuilding that Fixico describes in the remainder of the book follows the historical continuum of a new Indian leadership adapting to a changing world in the twentieth century. From the pan-Indian activism concurrent with the Civil Rights movement, tribal governments effectively modernized as certain federal policymakers (notably, Pres. Richard Nixon) selectively advanced policies of self-determination that defined new parameters of tribal authority. Through greater control of natural resources, and the phenomenal ascent of Indian gaming, many tribes forged a new political economy that has not merely allowed them to survive, but to temper new and enduring identities.

A word of caution: while Fixico's optimism seems blinding at times, he acknowledges what has been lost to indigenous peoples and that the future is always uncertain. Some critics will argue that this is a history of the neoliberalization of tribal governments rather than one of creative adaptation. Such criticism could have been more readily deflected had Fixico engaged certain critical scholarship on indigenous identity and adaptation, such as Tom Holm's *The Great Confusion in Indian Affairs* (University of Texas Press, 2005) and Stephen Cornell's vast lexicon on indigenous nation building. However, the topical arrangement of the book does provide a viable introduction to the proverbial "Indian problem," as well as a reasonable summary of how indigenous peoples are capable of exercising agency rather than assuming the victim slot.

*Samuel R. Cook*
*Virginia Tech*

---

*Edmund G. Ross: Soldier, Senator, Abolitionist*. By Richard A. Ruddy. (Albuquerque: University of New Mexico Press, 2013. xv + 328 pp. 18 halftones, notes, bibliography, index. $39.95 cloth, ISBN 978-0-8263-5374-0, $29.95 paper, ISBN 978-0-8263-1671-4.)

Most of us know about Sen. Edmund G. Ross's pivotal vote to acquit President Andrew Johnson in the impeachment proceedings of 1868; Pres. John F.

Kennedy memorialized the act in his *Profiles in Courage*. New Mexicans might remember that Ross was governor of New Mexico Territory. There our knowledge ends. Retired photographer Richard Ruddy, in turning his hand to writing, has delivered the rest of Ross's life in a readable, well-researched biography that shows us a man so steadfast in his convictions that he risked his own life more than once and brought hardship upon his wife, Fannie, and their large family.

We first meet the teenaged Ross, who was already a committed abolitionist in a family of abolitionists. In 1855 the antislavery movement began delivering free-staters like the extended Ross family to Kansas where they could oppose any further extension of the plantation system. The following year, Edmund, Fannie, and their three children, one a newborn, left their comfortable life in Milwaukee for Bleeding Kansas, arriving during its most violent period.

It is a boon to a biographer when their subject is a prolific letter writer. In this case, Ross was a newspaperman, so while Ruddy did not always have access to details of his subject's life, Ross left behind his opinions and observations in the newspapers he ran in Kansas and New Mexico. Ruddy also drew on family letters and a daughter's biographical manuscript.

Ross joined the fighting in Kansas but did most of his fighting in print—he was a skilled writer—and in politics. Because the wages of a crusading journalist could scarcely support Ross's growing family, he began his lifelong struggle to earn a living. Even then Ross's conscience compelled him to mothball his newspaper and serve for three years in the Civil War. His courage in battle inspired a governor to appoint him to the U.S. Senate. Ruddy traces Ross's gradual shift in political sentiment and the impeachment vote the Kansas public considered a betrayal.

This decision plunged the Ross family into financial turmoil that led eventually to his move to New Mexico in 1883 and a new beginning. He quickly endeared himself to New Mexicans, who cheered his appointment as territorial governor in 1885. Said Ross, "[A]fter seventeen years of poverty and obscurity this vindication is worth a thousand times more to me than would be all the offices of the territory rolled into one and offered to me" (p. 224).

Ruddy lays out the political players and landscape in Kansas; Washington, D.C.; and New Mexico, and describes Ross's battles with the power brokers known as the Santa Fe Ring. Although he regards his subject as a modest man of principle, Ruddy does not shy from probing the one instance where Ross might have benefited from a bribe. He also notes the instances where Ross's stubbornness and unwillingness to compromise hindered his effectiveness. Ruddy set out to recover a lost bit of history, and he has accomplished that goal.

*Sherry Robinson*
*Albuquerque, New Mexico*

*Lincoln and Religion*. By Ferenc Morton Szasz with Margaret Connell-Szasz. Concise Lincoln Library Series. (Carbondale: Southern Illinois Press, 2014. xviii + 103 pp. 10 halftones, bibliography, index. $24.95 cloth, ISBN 978-0-8093-3321-9.)

Almost immediately following Abraham Lincoln's assassination on Good Friday, 1865, a cottage industry arose debating his faith, or lack of faith. As Ferenc Morton Szasz and Margaret Connell-Szasz argue in this volume (Connell-Szasz collaborated on and completed this book following her husband's death), the question of Lincoln's religion still vexes historians, and this volume ultimately concludes that Lincoln's faith remains an enigma.

The authors contend that Lincoln was profoundly shaped by two influences: the deism of the Enlightenment, and the King James Bible, which was ubiquitous in the nineteenth century, especially in the Ohio Valley. Young Lincoln, however, was no fan of frontier preachers, and he often entertained friends with his dead-on impersonations. Lincoln apparently admired C. F. Volney's deistical treatise, *The Ruins*, and probably wrote his own rationalistic treatise, which according to tradition was cast into a wood stove by a friend eager to preserve Lincoln's political future. In his run for Congress in 1846, Lincoln faced charges from his Democratic opponent, Methodist itinerant Peter Cartwright, that he was an infidel, although Lincoln won the election handily. The Szaszes note that Abraham and Mary Todd Lincoln were married by the Episcopal rector in Springfield, where they attended before switching to the First Presbyterian Church. The Episcopal connection brings up one of the most fascinating arguments in the book, namely that the Episcopal Book of Common Prayer as well as the King James Version jointly served as the inspiration for Lincoln's Gettysburg Address. Here the authors call on the scholarship of A. E. Elmore, who has analyzed the passages and the phrasing of the address.

The Szaszes cover Lincoln's dealings with various religious groups while in office, and they note that he was utterly disconsolate at the death of his son, Willie. Lincoln had what amounts to a dialectical understanding of God's workings; a kind of fatalism about God's inscrutable will and also a sense that human exertions could bend the course of history.

Lincoln has long occupied the role as founding father in the debates about American civil religion. *Lincoln and Religion* includes an entire chapter on that question. There is little new in this material, although the authors update some of the popular evocations of Lincoln, especially in numismatics. The volume also includes appendixes on historiography and relevant quotations from Lincoln.

Given the continuing controversy over Lincoln's religion—both secularists and the "Christian America" crowd seek to claim him as their own—this slim,

refreshingly concise book is unlikely to serve as the final word. Lincoln's faith was hardly orthodox, certainly not by the standards of many who want to claim him. But it is equally erroneous to suppose that he approached questions of ultimate meaning with anything less than the sober deliberation that characterized his judicious conduct as president during the crucible of the nation's moral crisis.

*Randall Balmer*
*Dartmouth College*

---

*The Road to Chinese Exclusion: The Denver Riot, 1880 Election, and Rise of the West*. By Liping Zhu. (Lawrence: University Press of Kansas, 2013. xiii + 326 pp. 38 halftones, maps, tables, notes, bibliography, index. $37.50 cloth, ISBN 978-0-7006-1919-1.)

Liping Zhu, author of *A Chinaman's Chance: The Chinese on the Rocky Mountain Mining Frontier* (1997), gives us another insightful study of the Chinese in the North American West. Although the previous study examines the Chinese in Idaho from the late nineteenth to the early twentieth centuries, Zhu's recent book brings our attention to their counterparts in Colorado and is focused on the anti-Chinese riot in Denver in 1880.

*The Road to Chinese Exclusion* offers a detailed account of the early history of the Chinese population in Colorado, which started in the late 1860s. A majority of this Chinese population came to coalesce in Denver. Many of them were invited and recruited by white political and business leaders to work in Colorado. They labored in the mines before moving into the service sector of the economy, especially the laundry business. Before long anti-Chinese sentiments intensified. Such sentiments reached a climax in the racial riot in Denver in 1880. Zhu's vivid retelling of the tragic event reminds us of the more than 150 anti-Chinese riots that took place throughout the West.

A superb local history, *The Road to Chinese Exclusion* also makes fruitful efforts in placing Colorado's increasing hostility toward the Chinese in the larger contexts of American national politics surrounding issues of race, sectional conflict, and the growing prominence of the West. Zhu argues that Chinese exclusion became the issue that "would most define the significance of the presidential election of 1880," a national political event that he analyzes in great detail (p. 113).

From that time on, the question of Chinese immigration was no longer a regional one but became the subject of heated national debates, which resulted in the passage of the Chinese Exclusion Act in 1882. Efforts to push Chinese

exclusion helped to unite the West and elevate western politicians to national prominence. Lucidly written and well researched, Zhu's study sheds valuable light on the extraordinary importance of the Chinese American experience for understanding the development of the United States in the late nineteenth century.

This book also has room for improvement. For example, a more comprehensive analysis of the socioeconomic backgrounds of Colorado's anti-Chinese forces, especially of the 3,000 rioters in the Denver riot of 1880, instead of merely condemning them as "the mob" or "hoodlums," would enrich our comprehension of the anti-Chinese movement in Colorado, other western states, and the rest of the nation (p. 178).

*Yong Chen*
*University of California, Irvine*

---

*Route 66: A Road to America's Landscape, History, and Culture.* By Markku Henriksson, foreword by Susan A. Miller. Plains Histories series. (Lubbock: Texas Tech University Press, 2014. xxiv + 268 pp. 48 halftones, suggested readings, index. $65.00 cloth, ISBN 978-0-89672-677-2, $39.95 paper, ISBN 978-0-89672-825-7.)

Many Americans would be surprised to know that the most recent history published on Route 66 was written by a Finn, but not those who know Route 66 and its audience today. It's just as likely that the 66 tourist in Tucumcari will be Japanese or German or Brazilian as an American.

We live in a world where Route 66 no longer belongs to Americans. Lufthansa has two-week package tours from Europe. Sweden has a chain of Route 66 restaurants. The Japanese Route 66 society meets in Tokyo. A Dutchman trademarked the Route 66 sign. Markku Henriksson, a scholar of American culture at the University of Helsinki, has written a history and travel guide to Route 66. It covers all the bases. As usual an author starts with a personal connection to 66, the song, the TV series. He draws upon lengthy drives down the road (here, in 1996 and 2002, making it somewhat dated).

Historians used to working with original sources often fret at reading popular historical narratives like this one. The subtleties and nuances which hide in documents and historical interviews are not usually fodder for popular writers. For an historian specializing in a subject, reading a book designed for a popular audience resembles watching the Olympics—as in a decathlon, where one knows the hurdles in advance: Cyrus Avery and the road's design; *Grapes of Wrath* quotes; interviews with the star of the *Route 66* TV series, Martin Milner;

and with Angel Delgadillo, the Arizona barber who launched the 66 revival movement.

Henriksson navigates these shoals well. He does an excellent job of filling in backgrounds on 66 cities, Fred Harvey, his Houses and his Girls, the Santa Fe Railroad, and many other key parts of the story. His sources for background history are all secondary, drawing on Tom Teague, Tom Snyder, Michael Wallis, and of course John Steinbeck.

Henriksson's approach is less a car-full than an omnibus: his wife's favorite flavors of ice cream and a picture his brother took join the history of Flagstaff. New Mexican readers may be puzzled by his inclusion of Taos, Zuni, and Hopiland as part of a discussion of Route 66, for this fabled road does not go anywhere near these fine places. And they might perk their ears up at his rendering of the song of the Jackalope: "a quiet Whee-up, oee–up under the full moon" (p. 181). How does he know?

Thorny questions for Route 66 historians remain, starting with: where, exactly, *is* Route 66? The extensive alignments of this most famous of roads have never been completely laid out. And how large is its dominion? Does Route 66 extend only to the edge of its roadway? Is it, as Michael Wallis claims, "the road and just a skoouch off?" Or the way the National Park Service defines it, as its original alignments and what can be seen from there?

Despite the celebrity of what Steinbeck called "America's Mother Road," plenty of research topics go untended: the precise details of the negotiation for its exact routing; the technology in grading the road; the vivid, lived-out experience of minority groups along the road; and similar to this, the experience of those displaced by the road, particularly in Native and Hispanic populations. Henriksson touches on these topics, with a particular interest in Native Americans. To delve more deeply one would consult interviews, government records, pamphlets, and other materials now emerging about the Native experience of Route 66. Some who come to this book as a guidebook might be disappointed, as many old 66 sites have vanished; fortunately, a number described as dead here have been resurrected by community groups. Route 66 is not a national park. It's not fixed in amber. It's a road to market and at the same time a legend. Someone's destination resort is someone else's Central Avenue. This tension between the road and its reflection, between documenting and reverencing 66, affects this book and so many others.

*David King Dunaway*
*University of New Mexico*

*Porter and Ike Stockton: Colorado and New Mexico Border Outlaws.* By Michael R. Maddox. (Flora Vista, N.Mex.: published by author, 2014. xii + 517 pp. 74 halftones, maps, appendix, notes, bibliography, index. $24.95 paper, ISBN 978-0-615-96493-5.)

Most New Mexicans are familiar with the Lincoln County War of the late 1870s. It was memorable and a "war" because it nominally had two sides locked in a succession of battles. But fewer people know that far worse violence plagued northern New Mexico during and shortly after the same period, first in Colfax County, then by 1880 in the San Juan country of northwestern New Mexico and southwestern Colorado. The "war" here was really anarchy, involving feuds among criminal families—mostly from Texas—including the Stocktons, the Eskridges, and the Coes, among others. The crimes involved ranged from livestock theft to outright murder, and the struggles were over abundant cattle and horses, with ready markets in mining camps, military posts, and Indian reservations—the economic turmoil aggravated by the approach of a railroad. The turmoil was fueled by abundant liquor and firearms, and ineffective or corrupt law enforcement, all egged on by irresponsible local newspapers. Michael Maddox brings this little-known period back to life.

Maddox organizes his story around the Stockton brothers, the short-tempered, murderous psychopath Porter and the more congenial but still felonious Isaac, although their prominence at the time was exaggerated by the authorities and others. In a well-established environment of stock rustling and general mayhem that drove honest citizens (there were some) out of the territory, the violence took on new dimensions with three murders on Christmas Eve 1880. Although Porter Stockton was not involved, a party of vigilantes thought he was, tracked him down, and murdered him in front of his family; his death was really a product of longstanding feuds among the quarrelling criminal families. This inspired Porter's brother Isaac to recruit "hardcase" allies in Texas and set out on a rampage of revenge. During the course of 1881 the younger Stockton garnered more press notice than Billy the Kid, and a reward for his capture equal to that posted for the Kid, who was a friend of Isaac. Isaac's own death late in 1881 brought the anarchy to an end, as most of the criminal element decamped for distant places.

The author has performed a truly prodigious amount of research—his notes and bibliography would more than do credit to a doctoral dissertation. Unfortunately, he could not resist the temptation to present everything he learned. His account is burdened with too many facts and incidents that range from the tangential to the irrelevant, and there are too many characters, some famous for their roles in events elsewhere, to keep track of. That said Maddox deserves the

thanks of any historian or antiquarian interested in this neglected phase of New Mexico's history. As he himself says, he hopes his wealth of facts and sources will be useful to others. It should be. Despite his digressions, Maddox spins a fascinating story.

*David A. Clary*
*Roswell, New Mexico*

---

*A Fateful Day in 1698: The Remarkable Sobaipuri-O'odham Victory over the Apaches and Their Allies*. By Deni J. Seymour (Salt Lake City: University of Utah Press, 2014. xiv + 270 pp. 106 halftones, line drawings, 10 maps, tables, graphs, appendix, references cited, index. $50.00 cloth, ISBN 978-1-60781-286-9.)

At dawn on 30 March 1698, over 500 Janos, Jocomes, Mansos, Sumas, and Apaches attacked the Sobaipuri-O'odham (or Pima) settlement at Santa Cruz de Gaybanipitea, in present-day southwestern Arizona. The attackers quickly took the village, forcing the inhabitants to take refuge in an adobe strong house. This too soon fell, but delayed the attackers so that Sobaipuri-O'odham warriors from nearby settlements were able to come to Santa Cruz de Gaybanipitea's aid. Seeing the two sides were now even, Capotcari, the principal captain of the Jocome, called for settling the fight through a contest of champions. Ten Sobaipuri-O'odhams fought six Apaches and four Jocomes and others. The O'odhams gained the upper hand in this fight, and the Apaches and their allies broke and fled, pursued by Sobaipuri-O'odham archers firing poisoned arrows. And there the battle has stood; but, in a historical, ethnological, and archeological tour de force, Deni J. Seymour adds significant breadth and depth to what turns out to have been a fateful day.

Seymour begins by transcribing and translating all relevant Spanish historical documents, reconciling them with the ethnohistorical record. With this she is able to find the general location of Gaybanipitea and, when combined with an analysis of projectile points and rock art, determine who the attackers were and why they attacked. She then takes us through the correlation of documentary "inputs" and archeological "implications" used to find the actual site of Gaybanipitea, before describing her investigation of the site and excavation of an adobe-walled structure, determined to be of indigenous construct with some colonial influences, and a housing area. Seymour considers the weapons—bows and arrows, war-clubs, lances, shields, and at least one firearm—and tactics used, to understand how the fighting unfolded, with special attention to projectile points, which can be located on the ground and provide much of the

evidence of the battle, and poisons. As a consequence of the battle, the Sobaipuri became unquestioned Spanish allies, albeit for their own ends, not colonial reasons, and differentiated from more mobile groups, especially Apaches, who would be viewed as traditional Pima enemies. Although many Janos, Jocomes, Sumas, and Mansos negotiated a peace with the Spanish in present-day Chihuahua, the rest were subsumed into the growing Apache population. Finally, Seymour's work reconnected Gaybanipitea's O'odham descendants, many of whom were unaware of their Sobaipuri origins, the battle, or where it occurred, with their historical past, with many visits to the excavation site.

*A Fateful Day in 1698* joins a growing corpus of scholarship illustrating the importance of war, conflict, and violence in the history of the Southwest. As sure as wind and water sculpted the terrain into mesas and arroyos, conflict and violence shaped the human terrain into peoples and nations. Seymour details one case of how this occurred, showing that 30 March 1698 did truly prove to be a fateful day in the history of the Southwest.

*Lance R. Blyth*
*U.S. Northern Command*
*Colorado Springs, Colorado*

---

*Oral History, Community, and Work in the American West*. Edited by Jessie L. Embry. (Tucson: University of Arizona Press, 2013. viii + 350 pp. 18 halftones, contributors, index. $30.00 paper, ISBN 978-0-8165-3017-5.)

This volume contains fifteen original essays on the uses of oral histories in western history, all of which originated from a seminar at the Charles Redd Center for Western Studies. Editor Jessie Embry argues that, because of the essays' utilization of oral sources, they increase understanding about the twentieth-century West, work, and community in the region, and histories of "neglected" people who rarely make it into the historical record. The collection succeeds on all counts.

*Oral History, Community, and Work* is organized into three sections. The first, "Reflections," contains three thought-provoking essays by Jessie Embry, Barbara Allan Bogart, and Laurie Mercier, respectively. All focusing on the uses of oral histories, these longtime practitioners ruminate, in their own ways, about how interviews can be used in anticipated and unexpected ways. For example Bogart shows how her publications and exhibits, based on local oral sources, changed or crystallized how communities narrated their own histories. Thus, she contends, historical fieldwork is more than just documentation, but a "two-way street." These introductory essays get at some of the most interesting and complex issues of using oral sources for historical work.

The second section includes essays on "neglected groups" whose histories come to life through oral histories. This varied and dynamic section contains work on labor by Round Valley Indians, Mexican Americans' recreation in a small agricultural town, the migrant labor of Ute and Mexican families, Japanese American communities in Colorado, the lives of African Americans and women in Las Vegas, the intimate story of one woman's final years in Alaska, the history of a nursing school in Ogden, Utah, and the political work of Utah's Eagle Forum. The essays by William Bauer, Skott Vigil, and Melanie Newport are particularly good, but each essay highlights the rich historical texture that oral histories make possible.

The final section, entitled "Essential Sources," is intended to showcase projects where oral histories are the only sources. The content of this section does not seem markedly different from that of the previous, but it does contain fascinating essays on isolated Mormon communities, downwinders' relationships with government monitors, and familial histories in southern Utah. The collection concludes with an especially strong afterward by Clyde Milner on historical memory.

Together these essays open up essential conversations about oral history: the values and hazards of working with living historical actors, the complicated dynamics of historical memory, and the alternative narratives oral history can offer. The collection promotes such conversations because the authors themselves approach oral histories in very different ways. Some use them as transparent historical sources, while others evaluate the processes of memory-making. Some are or become close with their interviewees, while others have to bridge massive difference in order to develop a basic working relationship. Because of these tensions, this book would work well in any number of classrooms, but scholars of the American West, labor, and modern U.S. history should all find this collection valuable.

*Jennifer L. Holland*
*University of Oklahoma*

---

*Cochise: Firsthand Accounts of the Chiricahua Apache Chief*. Edited by Edwin R. Sweeney. (Norman: University of Oklahoma Press, 2014. xiii + 220 pp. 17 halftones, map, bibliography, index. $49.95 cloth, ISBN 978-0-8061-4432-0.)

From 1861 to 1872 the renowned Chiricahua Apache chief Cochise fought tenaciously against U.S. expansion in the American Southwest. Right or wrong, his name was invariably linked to virtually all Indian-related violence along the rugged border region of Arizona, New Mexico, Sonora, and Chihuahua. That

said, when Cochise died in June 1874, New Mexico's superintendent of Indian affairs, Levi Dudley, opined that the event was a "calamity to the frontier" and to prospects for lasting peace.

Edwin R. Sweeney, author of several impressive monographs about the Chiricahua Apaches, offers an explanation to Dudley's enigmatic eulogy in his edited compilation of over fifty-five primary source documents. The collection not only provides a firsthand look into the life of Cochise and occasional glimpses into the indomitable leader's worldview, but also sheds light on nineteenth-century Borderlands history, federal Indian policies, the trials and tribulations of frontier troops, and the historical geography of southeastern Arizona and its periphery.

Sweeney begins each of the book's ten chapters with a brief introduction that explains the general thrust of the documents contained therein. On occasion, he introduces specific documents with an explanatory paragraph. Particularly impressive are the explanatory endnotes provided at the end of each document. Exhaustively researched the notes provide biographical information about the individuals mentioned in the document, relevant geographic data, and scholarly analyses about specific points or charges made.

The first set of documents examines the Bascom Affair at Apache Pass in February 1861, which marked the beginning of the "Cochise Wars." The documentary evidence provided shows conclusively that Cochise never forgot the treacherous treatment he received at the hands of Lt. George N. Bascom and that that specific episode of treachery shaped the Chiricahua leader's behavior for the remainder of his life.

Sweeney devotes nearly a third of the book to documents pertaining to "Cochise on the Offensive," which provide accounts of specific battles and Apache attacks on settlers. Taken primarily from reports by military personnel, this chapter is particularly revealing about everyday life on the Southwestern frontier and the determined efforts of frontier troops to overtake and capture Cochise—something they never accomplished despite over ten years of scouts, expeditions, campaigns, etc.

The next five chapters detail Cochise's activities in the late 1860s and early 1870s when, after nearly a decade of war, the Chiricahuas expressed interest in establishing peace with the United States. Meeting face-to-face with their longtime adversary for the first time, military officials offered interesting impressions of Cochise. Officials commented favorably on his strong leadership qualities, his intelligence, his honesty, and his impressive influence over the widely scattered Apache bands of Arizona and New Mexico. He was also suspicious and guarded in his dealings with military officials, an understandable response to the Bascom Affair. Of particular interest to readers interested in Chiricahua

culture and ritual is the account by Gen. Oliver O. Howard, who negotiated a peace treaty with Cochise in the fall of 1872.

The remaining chapters explore Cochise's final years and his efforts to live up to the terms of the treaty he had signed with General Howard. The documents provided show a leader who endeavored to fulfill his promises in hopes that the government would allow his people to remain on the Chiricahua Reservation in southeastern Arizona. The government kept its word until Cochise's death in 1874. Within two years, the Chiricahua Reservation closed and his people dispersed—a calamity that Cochise had fought so desperately to avoid.

*Thomas A. Britten*
*University of Texas, Brownsville*

---

*Life among the Indians: First Fieldwork among the Sioux and Omahas*. By Alice C. Fletcher. Edited and with an introduction by Joanna C. Scherer and Raymond J. DeMallie. Studies in the Anthropology of North American Indians Series. (Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press, 2013. xii + 418 pp. 13 halftones, 37 line drawings, map, musical examples, appendix, notes, bibliography, index. $65.00 cloth, ISBN 978-0-8032-4115-2.)

Meeting Omaha Natives Suzette La Flesche and her brother Francis in 1879 when they accompanied Ponca Chief Standing Bear to Boston fueled aspiring and pioneering ethnographer Alice Fletcher to begin her Native fieldwork. Especially interested in Native women, in September 1881 Fletcher arrived at the Omaha Reservation in Nebraska. Accompanied by Suzette, her husband Thomas Tibbles, and a small tribal party, Fletcher headed north for the Spotted Tail Agency, Dakota Territory. Fletcher had stayed one week when, upon receiving Hunkpapa Sitting Bull's surprise invitation, she detoured east to Fort Randall, where Sitting Bull was unjustly held under house arrest. Fletcher returned to the Omaha Reservation in November 1881 and remained there for four months with Suzette's family, the household of Joseph La Flesche.

Five years later in 1886 Fletcher commenced writing a lively first-hand narrative of her time among the Lakotas and Omahas. She relied closely on her extensive field notes and diaries and believed that Charles Scribner's Sons was interested in publishing her story. She revised the manuscript in 1887 but for unclear reasons neither Scribner's nor any company published it.

Fletcher wrote *Life among the Indians* for a non-Native audience and primarily wanted to challenge widespread Native stereotypes. Always the ethnographer, Fletcher included rich Lakota and Omaha cultural details, and as an Indian reformer, she rebuked Indian agency treatment of Natives. She divided

*Life* into two halves: Camping with the Sioux (fourteen chapters) and The Omahas at Home (twelve chapters).

Fletcher presents only Lakota accounts in Part One, primarily from her week at the Spotted Tail Agency, but she also adds an Elk dreamer performance and Ghost Lodge ceremony she witnessed at the Pine Ridge Agency on a separate trip in June 1882. On that same trip Fletcher again visited Sitting Bull's camp at Fort Randall, where spiritual leaders shared parts of a White Buffalo Ceremony. Part Two lacks the travel drama and ceremonies of the Lakota chapters; Fletcher instead emphasizes the domestic Omaha reservation life she witnessed among one faction: the educated, pro-allotment La Flesche family.

Fletcher's field notes and diaries from 1881–1882 are probably more important scholarly resources, but *Life Among the Indians* deserves attention because it reveals her empathy, sense of humor, and self-deprecating qualities, virtues which endeared her to Native people. Unlike in her formal anthropological writings, Fletcher took liberties to write as an attached observer, emphasizing human interest stories important to her and her Native informants.

*Life* also reflects Fletcher's early anthropological maturation. By 1887 she was six years removed from her first fieldwork. She had started to understand her own Eurocentric biases, and had embarked on her life-long and incomplete journey to understand the wisdom of Native cultures. The last three chapters address Fletcher and Omaha allotment, and these preface her primary failing, which was not about anthropology, but policy. Fletcher ignored tribal allotment critics, who understood that federal Indian land policies were always about stealing tribal lands. Like many, Fletcher thought she knew better, and that was tragic indeed.

*Dennis J. Smith*
*University of Nebraska, Omaha*

---

*The Montana Vigilantes, 1863–1870: Gold, Guns, and Gallows.* By Mark C. Dillon. (Logan: Utah State University Press, 2013. xx + 449 pp. 45 halftones, map, appendixes, bibliography, about the author, index. $34.95 cloth, ISBN 978-0-87421-919-7.)

The extensive vigilante activity in the territory of Montana during the 1860s has been studied and commented upon since the publication of newspaper editor Thomas J. Dimsdale's book *The Vigilantes of Montana* (1866). The volume under review, by Mark C. Dillon, an associate justice in the Appellate Division of the New York State Supreme Court, investigates this episode "through the prism of American legal history" and introduces a perspective which most readers will find novel and interesting (p. xix).

The volume offers a fairly traditional interpretation of the rise of Montana vigilantism, which it locates in the absence of formal and effective law enforcement mechanisms combined with the rapid creation of wealth and the relatively insecure methods of transporting that wealth by stagecoach and other overland conveyances. The author offers a full narrative of the 1863–1864 activities of the committee of vigilance in the mining area of Alder Gulch. He argues that the establishment of a territorial court in 1864 under the strong and capable leadership of Hezekiah Hosmer was one of the factors that contributed to the decline of vigilante activity. Dillon does a very fine job of tracing the persistence of vigilante activity in the Helena area from 1865–1870, and demonstrates that many of those involved in the earlier burst of vigilantism were instigators of subsequent activities. Vigilantism based in mining petered out around 1870, although a more ranching-based version of it emerged in the 1880s. Dillon demonstrates that the later vigilante leaders had roots in the events of the 1860s.

Although these sections of the book are crisply and engagingly written, Dillon's major contributions come toward the end of the volume. There he looks at the ways in which the vigilante groups practiced due process and the various legal procedures in which they engaged. He divides his treatment into three headings—arrests, trials, and sentencing. He does an excellent job of indicating for contemporary readers the ways in which these various legal processes and procedures were understood both by the legal community and by the public at large during the middle part of the nineteenth century. He emphasizes that our contemporary understandings of legal processes and procedures are actually fairly modern and often date from the mid to late twentieth century. However, even within the more underdeveloped legal context of the nineteenth century, Dillon finds that the Montana vigilantes often acted in ways inconsistent with the common legal norms of the day. For them, he states, the ends justified the means. They never understood, or really wanted to understand, that in the realm of due process, "the means and the ends are one and the same thing" (p. 388).

Dillon's focus on legal history means that other aspects of vigilantism that are more currently studied, such as the social realities behind discrete episodes of violence and lynching, are not really discussed in this volume. It is nonetheless an important contribution to the understanding of a significant aspect of the history of the American West.

*Robert M. Senkewicz*
*Santa Clara University*

*A Civilian in Lawton's 1899 Philippine Campaign: The Letters of Robert D. Carter.* Edited by Michael E. Shay. The American Military Experience series. (Columbia: University of Missouri Press, 2013. xiii + 197 pp. 23 halftones, notes, works consulted, index. $40.00 cloth, ISBN 978-0-8262-2008-0.)

Michael Shay's *A Civilian in Lawton's 1899 Philippine Campaign* is a useful book for scholars of the Philippine-American War and imperial wars in general. The civilian of the title, Robert Dexter Carter, was a young American of the 1890s, newly married and striving to gain a commission in the United States Army. His father, Robert Goldthwaite Carter, was a retired Army officer and Medal of Honor holder. The younger Carter could not acquire a commission immediately so he went to work as a civilian clerk in the Army's quartermaster branch and was stationed in the Philippines. Carter's father was friends with the American General Henry Lawton and so the son became a protégé, eating regularly with the Lawton family.

Carter wrote about his experiences in the Philippines with detail and insight in letters to his family and articles for magazines back home. These writings are fascinating and thoughtful and it is clear why Shay thought them worth publication. Carter talked of his fellow Americans, of Filipinos, of life in Manila, and of all else that took his fancy. Obviously his words were shaped for consumption, but they seem reasonably unvarnished. Carter is not a particularly sympathetic figure. He was a bit of a wretch: self-centered, resentful, racist, and callous. He repeatedly complained about his pay, deliberately got a Filipino civilian in trouble, hoped that junior officers he did not like would be punished, refused to socialize much, and threw around racist labels and ideas without restraint. Perhaps he was not much different than many young men of his times, but he did not remotely rise above the crowd. Carter's wretchedness does however add to the verisimilitude of the writings, a paradoxical but pleasing benefit.

The letters and articles are improved substantially by Shay's editing. Each chapter starts with an explanatory note that comments on the larger American enterprise and Carter's take on it. There are a range of pictures, thankfully included in the text rather than compacted in sections. Shay's introduction and summing up place Carter into the larger context with grace and precision. Shay does not shy away from the more unsympathetic parts of Carter's writings, a wise decision. More maps (the eternal cry of the military historian!) would have helped, but this is a small criticism.

Unfortunately, the letters conclude long before the end of the Philippine campaign or Carter's time there, ending in late 1899 just after Lawton's death. We thus do not see the imperial venture darken as the insurgent war stretched on and tempers on all sides frayed. The writings that are present, however, open

an intriguing window into the nascent American empire and insight into all such imperial efforts.

*David Silbey*
*Cornell University*

---

*Chronicling the West for* Harper's*: Coast to Coast with Frenzeny & Tavernier in 1873–1874*. By Claudine Chalmers. Vol. 12 in the Charles M. Russell Center Series on Art and Photography of the American West. (Norman: University of Oklahoma Press, 2013. xiv + 229 pp. 13 color plates, 119 line drawings, map, appendix, notes, bibliography, index. $45.00 cloth, ISBN 978-0-8061-4376-7.)

In *The Greater Journey: Americans in Paris* (2011), David McCullough relates the story of the numerous Americans who chose not to go West as pioneers but instead went to France to study art under the masters. In this book, writer Claudine Chalmers chronicles the adventures of two accomplished French artists who traveled across the Atlantic Ocean in the opposite direction—from France to America. The popular and influential New York publication *Harper's Weekly*, renowned for its Thomas Nast and Civil War woodcuts, hired Messrs. Paul Frenzeny and Jules Tavernier. Their assignment: to cross the United States and Territories—from New York to San Francisco—by train, horseback, stagecoach, and even hot air balloon, piloted by a French aeronaut. The purpose of their *reportage*, Chalmer explains, was to present *Harper's* readers with images entwining two story lines: "the nation's march west and the contrast between industrialized cities of the Eastern seaboard and the frontier's underdeveloped regions" (p. 14). The University of Oklahoma Press has brought together more than one hundred of these representative and detailed views in this handsome volume.

This engraved oeuvre is a sophisticated, valuable, and remarkably comprehensive visual documentary of America's vanishing frontier, circa 1873 and 1874. The artists visited New York, Pennsylvania, Missouri, Kansas, Indian Territory, Texas, Colorado, Nebraska, New Mexico (Acoma Pueblo), Utah, and California. These diverse places and landscapes are seen through the eyes of two intelligent and keen foreign observers. Many of the sketches were drawn as observed, but with an artist's eye. Others were crafted for their human interest or out of sympathy for their subjects: emigrants, settlers, townspeople, drovers, prospectors, soldiers, hunters, Mormons, Indians—men and women of European, Native American, Chinese, and African descent. Animals (wolves, dogs, buffalo, bears, birds, deer, antelope, pigs, oxen, cattle, mules, and especially horses) also figure prominently in their art.

These illustrations, which were boldly inscribed with the signatures of the artists, turned "FRENZENY & TAVERNIER" into household names. Indeed, by the time the two men reached Denver, the national reputation they came to enjoy as the special artists of "A Journal of Civilization," as *Harper's* dubbed itself, had already preceded them. By virtue of this recognition and the subsequent demonstration of their "joie de vivre and artistic gusto," as Chalmers puts it in her fine accompanying text, they were later readily welcomed into San Francisco's "emerging Bohemian crowd of artists and litterateurs" (p. 194). Their year-long sketching trip was an unqualified success for *Harper's* and for Frenzeny and Tavernier. On its happy conclusion in California, the two found themselves on top of the world; their careers made. They had changed the way the American public saw the West and the West had widened their horizons.

*Kevin Jon Fernlund*
*University of Missouri—St. Louis*

---

*The Searchers: The Making of an American Legend*. By Glenn Frankel. (New York: Bloomsbury, 2013. 408 pp. 34 halftones, notes, bibliography, photograph credits, acknowledgments, index, a note on the author. $28.00 cloth, ISBN 978-1-60819-105-5, $18.00 paper, ISBN 978-1-62040-065-4.)

This is an ambitious book with considerable research behind it. Glenn Frankel means to provide a deep context for one of John Ford's most admired Westerns—indeed, one of the most admired Westerns of all time—*The Searchers* (1956). The book's formal structure juxtaposes three case studies: an historical account of Cynthia Ann Parker, who was captured by Comanches in 1836 when she was nine and then "rescued" in 1860, by then the mother of three children, most notably the famous Comanche chief Quanah Parker; an account of Alan LeMay's novel *The Searchers*, published in 1954, concerning one man's unrelenting quest to find his niece after her abduction by Comanche raiders (paralleling James Parker's prolonged search for his niece, Cynthia Ann); and an account of the making of Ford's film based on LeMay's story. Frankel does a good job fleshing out each of his case studies, although his historical study is discursive particularly in detailing the life of Quanah Parker, which does not relate to anything in either the novel or the film. The section on LeMay is considerably shorter than the other two and essentially serves as a bridge between the search for Cynthia Ann Parker and Ford's *The Searchers*. But LeMay's novel is a shaky bridge. It is not an historical novel as such, and LeMay's extant papers contain no references to Cynthia Ann, although he was aware of James Parker's obsessive quest to find her. The reader would welcome something concrete to con-

nect history and film, but Frankel concedes well along in his book that "The fort scene [in the film] is one of the few moments in *The Searchers* where the shadow of Cynthia Ann Parker plainly hovers" (p. 300). Why, then, this extended exercise in establishing the historical precedent for a fictional construct? Perhaps because Ford's *The Searchers* sets a quintessentially Texas story in Monument Valley instead, the challenge of excavating its historical roots proved irresistible. Frankel's treatment of each of his case studies is rich in particulars, but the reader may wonder how knowing Cynthia Ann Parker's history enhances an understanding of Ford's creative achievement.

History students will find Frankel's close examination of the claims and counter claims around Cynthia Ann Parker's "redemption" of interest; and while the chapters devoted to Quanah Parker are superfluous to *The Searchers*, they are relevant to Frankel's concern with historical memory and permit him to investigate the consequences for Comanche and white alike of Cynthia Ann Parker's captivity over a century and a half ago. Students of western American literature will find the two chapters on Alan LeMay informative, if frustrating because of the absence of his files for *The Searchers*. Finally, students of John Ford's film may find the discussion of its making a tad gossipy, but that is due in part to Ford's own crusty dismissal of those who sought to penetrate his artistry and account for his cinematic legacy. The pieces that Frankel has assembled have their individual pleasures, then, but they do not make for an integrated whole. However illuminating the past can be, it is hard to shed much light by burrowing deeply into tangential matters.

*Brian W. Dippie*
*University of Victoria*